DEVELOPMENT IN PAPUA NEW GUINEA: various meanings in the context of logging in West New Britain


Submitted in fulfilment of a Master of Arts Degree by Research in the School of Australian and International Studies, Faculty of Arts, Deakin University, Victoria, Australia

March 1999
I certify that the thesis entitled

Development in Papua New Guinea: various meanings in the context of logging in West New Britain

submitted for the degree of

Master of Arts

is the result of my own research, except where otherwise acknowledged, and that this thesis in whole or in part has not been submitted for an award, including a higher degree, to any other university or institution.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS v

PREFACE viii

## ONE Various Meanings

- Culture and world view 7
- A villager’s voice 14
- Makapa 19
- Development in the context of Logging 23

## TWO Peoples of Pasismanua and development 35

- Exchange 40
- Environment and tradition in the Pasismanua region 49
- Life in Melanesia 54
- Areal cultures 63
- The community 70
- Governance and the community 72
- A development debate 77

## THREE Education 83

## FOUR Human development: understanding the other 99

- Notions of development: a new focus 104
- Development and reciprocity 109
- Self determination 112
- Sustainable and unsustainable development 120
- Good governance 125
- Labour and economy 128
- Vision and culture 136

## CONCLUSION 141

## BIBLIOGRAPHY 151
MAPS

MAP 1
Rainforest

MAP 2
Towns and hamlets in the discussion

MAP 2(a)
Dispersion of main hamlets in Pasismanua

ILLUSTRATIONS

FIGURE 1
Traditional integral agroforestry in Melanesia

APPENDIX
List of technical expressions
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people have helped in the marshalling of information and in deepening my understanding of Melanesia. My Supervisor, Dr. David Wetherell, exercised patience through several drafts of the writing. I thank him for his help. A major mover in the consultation process with peoples of tropical forests is Hartmut Holzknecht, through his association with the Resource Owner Involvement movement of the Forest Management and Planning Project in PNG. He worked through all the arduous issues mentioned in the thesis and has given me the benefit of his experience by conversation, letter and publications. It was much appreciated.

Two other people who offered timely advice were Mike Wood of James Cook University, and Robin Hide of the Research School of Asian and Pacific Studies, A.N.U. I am very grateful for their assistance and the use of their writings on the subject of Forestry initiatives in PNG. While they can take credit for the reliable data from their work, the conclusions are based on my own insights into the issues and I bear responsibility for any errors in judgement.

In Papua New Guinea, Ms. Miriam Joseph from the PNG Forest Research Institute was most helpful on current matters with Forestry generally and I thank her most sincerely. Harry Sakulas the Director of the Wau Ecology Institute also provided assistance.

The Very Revd. Bishop Michael Hough of "Islands" Anglican Diocese made some interesting comments and provided the Diocese’s point of view, as far as all the members of the Church can be represented with a single, coherent point of view. Canon Johnston in Melbourne assisted me to gain access to Diocesan material. In West New Britain, Craig and Linda Throop of the Summer Institute of Linguistics gave of their time to provide detailed information about the Kaulong people, and about the experience of living in the Pasismanua District for many years. Lloyd and Ruth Milligan from the Mangseng people, about a hundred and twenty kilometres east of Kandrian, gave some insights into their Linguistic work on the South Coast of the island. Max Henderson of the Pacific Heritage Foundation generously sent me materials describing the Baining’s forestry initiatives and the general situation in Papua New Guinea. Greg Mongi, previously of the National Alliance of Non Government Organisations (PNG) gave me information about government departments appropriate to the inquiry.

In AusAID, several workers in the Kandrian Gloucester Integrated Development Project ("KG Project") offered considerable assistance. Mike Lowe from the Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies at the ANU supplied the maps, his time during frequent bouts of sickness, and much current news on development in West New Britain. These maps were adapted by Trevor Pickles at Deakin University into a smart, relevant documents for the text of the Thesis, and his generous contribution needs to be acknowledged and praised. Garry Simpson, formerly of the "KG" Project, gave me advice at early stages. Rob Crittenden the Anutech Director of the Project...
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

was most helpful, and Peter Charlton was able to give me accurate details of government action and the Development Cooperation Treaty. I was most encouraged to talk to them and their insights were valuable. Ms. Grace Feka, the Development Officer for AusAID in Port Moresby, meticulously described the features of the new Organic Law on Provincial and Local Level Governments. Since details were hard to uncover, I am most grateful for her assistance. Ed Peek the AusAID S.A. Director gave assistance where he could.

Brian Dutram, Secretary for the Department of Provincial Affairs and Local Government in 1996, made some helpful suggestions.

Paul Chatterton of the Worldwide Fund for Nature offered some graphic stories of development activities and logging in the Pasismanua district, having recently hiked through the Pasismanua hinterland on a W.W.F. fieldtrip. Helen Rosenbaum of the Australian Conservation Foundation offered some helpful advice and encouragement. David Tibayne of the Australian Council for Overseas Aid made some suggestions too. Also in Australia, Dr. Christina Pavlides gave me the benefit of her archaeological fieldwork in the Arawe sub-region and was most generous. Her suggestions were much more helpful than she knows and I am seriously indebted to her. Professor Leslie Potter of the Geography Department, the University of Adelaide, generously gave of her time and advice as an editor, when she had no time. Her interest in one so little qualified in environmental transformation was heartening, coming from such an experienced fieldworker. Dr. Petranel Ferrao of the Hansen Research Institute, the University of Adelaide, was very helpful with advice and encouragement and I most sincerely thank her.

Hartmut Holzknecht of the Forest Management and Planning Project (PNG) stated that, apart from the anthropologists Jane Goodale and Ann Chowning, "no anthropological research has been carried out in either the central plateau or south coast regions". The reliance upon Jane Goodale and Ann Chowning in the thesis is relieved only by my own research and the work carried out by the Melanesian Institute for Pastoral and Socio-economic Research, Inc., during my period of employment with them. I was very happy to be associated with the Institute and I defer to their judgements on traditional matters in Melanesia. I remain especially indebted to the former Director, Dr. Ennio Mantovani, and look forward to further work of the staff of the Melanesian Institute on "grass roots" communities of the villages and towns of Papua New Guinea.

ABSTRACT

Development in Papua New Guinea... is research into village level issues of logging. In New Britain, nationals are offered royalties for cutting their rainforest. Information about ecology and biodiversity is usually late in coming, and such information to them does not appear to advance their development. This thesis offers the most specific method for dealing with small communities in Papua New Guinea, and confronts the issue of self development. It is posited that all other development must encourage self development in Papua New Guinea. Evidence brought here shows the need to make the Melanesian community central to development strategies.

To accomplish such a strategy, there is a need to consider Melanesian cultures. An explanation of world views ensues. The world views of people of the Pasismanua region, of New Britain's south coast, was compared broadly with Melanesian cultures and Melanesian development in a variety of circumstances. Consequently, the suggestions made are broadly applicable to situations where resources must be well monitored. There are many such situations in Pacific nations, which suggests that the thesis will be of use to a wide research community.

Since research is grounded in ethnographic as well as other research, this kind of study generates many other research questions, and the research is designed to lead to other studies. Certain aspects of the design become disclosed when the research has progressed. As well, the background of an expatriate researcher is intrusive, and must be mitigated by some form of participation in the host culture. This is a central tenet of the thesis. This participation increases sensitivity to culture and yields a circumspect consideration of the colonial issue. Occupied for many years by colonial powers especially Australia, all New Guinea including West New Britain shows the effects of colonisation. It also shows evidence of the new colonialism of cash-cropping, and of the destruction of biodiversity. This becomes a central theme, as does the position of this researcher as a participant in a global economic culture encroaching on and invited by Papua New Guinea.
PREFACE: a Room Full of Voices

The transcendental presupposition of every cultural science lies not in our finding a certain culture or any "culture" in general to be valuable but rather in the fact that we are cultural beings, endowed with the capacity and will to take a deliberate attitude towards the world and lend it significance... these phenomena have cultural significance for us and on this significance alone rests its scientific interest.

Max Weber, "Objectivity in Social Science and Social Policy"

There is a party going on in one large room. Everyone is talking, some in small groups, some in large. They are all trying to talk about the same thing. Some have the words in vogue, and some do not. Often, though, different speakers are at cross purposes, and do not even understand the terminology. Some assert that the other speaker has gotten right off the subject and is talking about something different. From time to time, one speaker will command others in an authoritative voice; the trouble is, many spurn that person’s authority. Indeed, some do not even seem to be aware of his or her existence, and go on with their own earnest discussion, talking faster and faster and faster.

In this figurative party, individual voices momentarily become audible. Some are speaking about the ecosystem, with words like eco-forestry, sustainability, vascular plants, canopy, and biodiversity. Most of the others pick up the terms eventually but avoid the people who started it. Others are discussing sawmills, downstream processing, profits and permits. Another speaks clearly about governance, social actors and the state. In the middle of the room, a group discusses Bongo Bongo land. This is lively and some speakers go into detail. Across the room, someone comments: “Who cares about Bongo Bongo?” One reaction to this is an admonition for him to show some respect. He in turn replies that there are important things going on outside Bongo Bongo, and the Bongo Bongo-ers [he mispronounces the terms] will just have to swim with the stream. He has many speeches ready about the third world, rescue packages and markets, which inspire hope in some and fear in others. Another man who is a good mixer states to all, “Well I was in Bongo Bongo and they bankrupted me. It is a difficult place”.

A quiet, determined voice says, “We are from Bongo Bongo”, and for the first time all turn their heads; but recognising that these people are only talking to lawyers, everyone soon returns to their own conversations and ignores them. Two people step over, talking to them earnestly. The Bongo Bongo people begin speaking warmly about these two. Several groups then ask if a “pass the parcel game” is going on at the party, and if there is money in the parcel. The Bongo Bongo people talk mostly in a language of their own. Some seem unable to speak to others and are treated coldly by the two men and their followers. Another voice chimes in with “social impact assessment”,

A room full of voices

"equity" and "collaboration". Someone else is using words about "Bongo Bongo" like indigenous, traditions and nations. The Bongo Bongo are oblivious to these people. Others try to use the Bongo Bongo language. They say that the fact that Bongo Bongo exists is the most important thing for the party. The "ecosystem" people say, "We have the facts, though". The "equity" person therefore talks more strongly about his facts. The man talking about rescue packages asserts that he has already given the greatest facts and that nothing else matters by comparison. There is a lot of talk about a policy and many respond by asking when development will come. Others respond by asking about funding and who got the money. There is then a general clamour about money.

Someone suddenly cries out, "Will someone please tell me what on earth is going on in this room?" In the hush that follows, someone puts up their hand and says, "I think I can explain this." The gaze of all fixes on the person, questioningly.

The room is the forum that exists about logging and development in Papua New Guinea. The argument is the confusion resulting from different goals. Those who spoke about biodiversity are scientists, many just visiting Papua New Guinea. The description of sawmills and similar matters are given by Non Government Organisations who try to create wealth for villagers and save or restore forests. The Food and Agriculture Organisation is also represented by that allusion. These same people are represented by those who try to speak "Bongo Bongo" words. Anthropologists and some Churches, as those who are articulate about cultures and groups in Papua New Guinea, figure as the lively discussion group in the middle of the room. The very articulate gentleman alludes to the World Bank; while those who censure him are the International Alliance of Indigenous Tribal Peoples and their allies among humanitarian groups; Churches are notably prominent as allies.

The insolvent man is the (larger or smaller) transnational corporation who espouses free trade and believes in the World Bank. He is in some ways akin to the logging companies, who are symbolised by the two friendly men. Those who ask about development are the villagers of Papua New Guinea. These same people raise a clamour about money and corruption, joined by urbanised Papua New Guineans, AusAID [the Australian Government aid organisation], the United Nations Organisation and various foreign aid bodies such as USAID, not to mention international NGOs.

"Bongo Bongo" is a euphemism for villagers who have inalienable land rights; and the various reactions to them are depicted. The advocates of "Bongo Bongo" people are various, but include different Churches in their official policies, some jurists, some free thinkers and indeed a large part of the public, at least in Papua New Guinea. The name, and the ignorance about, Bongo Bongo symbolise stereotypes made by people inside and outside the country, and they allude to the exclusion and condescension dealt out to village people. Bongo Bongo is as fictional as the stereotyped primitive villager, and the name is thought by this student to be thoroughly
A room full of voices

aborrent. Yet as shocking as it is to supporters of Papuans and New Guinean or islander people, Bongo Bongo is in the room.

The room is “development” in Papua New Guinea. Each group in the room has its goal, and the meanings are many. The room is filled with voices. The first chapter of this thesis gives an account of all the various speakers and writers about logging in its relation to development. It is called “Various Meanings”. So many people are outspoken that it was necessary to survey the range of references. My first job in this preface is to acknowledge that the controversies in logging made that “survey” a convoluted, tortuous endeavour. I had to site “development” in this cacophony because there is a hidden rhetoric in any one of the groups represented by those people at the party. The hidden rhetoric states that “This is the meaning of development in Papua New Guinea”. Such is the blandness of the assertions, in all my readings about development in Papua New Guinea, that a reader of their reports is expected to believe that what they say is axiomatic. Like people at a noisy party, there is plenty happening but not many people are listening to one another.

The second chapter describes the villagers and the meaning of their own dealings with loggers in south western New Britain. It defuses the “Bongo Bongo” myth, and shows that there are specific reasons for loggers’ success in PNG, because of villagers’ world view. It is thus for the purpose of observing the Fifth Directive Principle of the Constitution, that “Papua New Guinea should achieve development primarily through the use of Papua New Guinean forms of social, political and economic organisations”. The third chapter extends this theme into the modern institution of formal education, and shows how logging contributes to the emergence of social class. The fourth chapter describes the details of some actors, loggers, Government, NGOs, AusAID and Churches. These actors are depicted as being in a “tableau”, figuratively meaning that there is a drama about logging, such that these actors are suddenly centre stage of resource discussions in the Pacific rim zone. It is as if a camera was suddenly introduced into that figurative “room”, a camera that relayed details to the whole world. In that chapter, I appraise the movement of democracy in running forestry projects. This entails the discussion of self determination for villagers. I describe the passions that move people, especially village people. This is not because I feel or do not feel passion about development: it is because I am studying the room.

For the person in that room whom I have not yet explained is me. I have put up my hand, and I think that I can explain the party in the room. Like others in the room, I have my own rhetoric, which I define as “the rules that govern the art of speaking [writing] with propriety, elegance and force”. But unlike most of the people at the party, I am studying the room. For purposes of the study, I am not an advocate for villagers of the Pasismaua region, or of anyone else. I am certainly an outsider to PNG, though not to “development”. I have rhetoric because I am “endowed with the capacity and will to
A room full of voices
take a deliberate attitude towards the world and lend it significance". The following is a
study not an opinion, and in it I appraise the relationships between the occupants of the
conceptual space, "development". The conclusion therefore focuses on relationships.

This is not a history of the events of logging or development, or of the events in
which people have been involved in the South Pacific.

Instead, it is a sharpening of certain contexts. In these contexts, logging and
development, and events that affect people powerfully all appear. It is an altering of
focus.

Visual art describes events in terms of background, midground and foreground.
Cinematography most especially makes good use of the concepts. Focus can be made
on each one, to the exclusion of the others. Focus can even be made on all three, "pan-
focus".
The approach taken in this study focuses on particular issues which are normally left as
background or omitted altogether in other studies. The particular issues that are
explained in this study are culture, administration, and change. In the past, some saw
such issues as being peripheral, a civil or cultural context. The image is almost a
"setting" and passive. This in a modern context seems most unlikely. These are
mutually interactive and cannot be dealt with in isolation; administration and change
ramify back into culture, which is a part of the interaction and again contains the
changes, and in that sense "culture" somehow transcends ethnic (race) or material
culture. Culture is an ethnic cluster found on the map, but is also at another level, a
concept. That is, culture is also a "way of life". The issues mentioned encompass the
two senses of culture. The aim of this study is to explore the effect of culture,
administration and change on development.

This is a compensatory bias against the trend. This is being done because the
context has been played down so often that many people can no longer understand
events occurring in Papua New Guinea. To lose this context is to tell an isolated
incident, to falsely represent the pattern. To ignore the context is to lie.

It is not appropriate to create a "pan-focus" and include all relevant facts. This
would be far too extensive. Instead, the "background" will be "foregrounded", and vice-
versa. The pattern resulting from this may considered an empirical observation, i.e.
positivist: not from democratic process to government to policy and thence to village
life, but from village culture to elections to implementation to regional infrastructure.
For a study of small scope, larger contexts are played down. These include the global
context, and the ethical context. The works that have covered these matters are cogent
in their theory, and of great explanatory power. Some of those works are cited in the
study, but rather than devising a research plan that will explain too much, I have simply
adjusted the focus in the manner explained.

1 Weber op.cit. 1949 p.81, see p.i above.
A room full of voices

Such an adjustment of "focus" has been argued on many occasions by the global Alliance of Indigenous Peoples:

With the emergence of the new social, economic and political order introduced by the globalisation of world economy through GATT-WTO and Rio Convention, it may not be an exaggeration or an overstatement that these processes will lead to the intensification of exploitation and discrimination against the indigenous-tribal peoples and the local communities.  

... When our knowledge is discussed by outsiders, it invariably becomes incorporated into an alien classification system which denies our diversity and is then treated derogatively

... We indigenous peoples do not learn and develop our understanding of the world through abstract prescriptions but through practical experience ... the results of a multiplicity of activities and long-term observation which are largely tacit, embodying a multitude of skills and practicalities.

With regard to the "South" economic zone, it is vital to remember that the above quote is a voice of the "South", to not dismiss its cogency. That is why in this thesis I attempt to include the voice and viewpoint of the Kaulong and other peoples of south coast New Britain. For this purpose, survey data and geographical summaries are not reflective enough to explain "various meanings". Even anthropologists, who seem to spend long periods gaining understanding of villagers, have come under criticism. One of their critics, the ethnographer Dan Rose, has tried to start a whole new mode of inquiry. He complains that "We do not have an adequate understanding of our own culture of ethnographic inquiry ... We do not understand ourselves as living within a culture of anthropologists, a subculture within university life. We do not talk about this in profoundly self-critical ways and that is why I would like to comment on the formation of ethnography as a way of living differently - as a potent (sub)culture for conducting inquiry into culture".

This constitutes a change in emphasis, a change in the rules by which my explanation is accorded veracity. Of course, it follows the general rules of discourse;

---

A room full of voices

but the argument has inbuilt sensitivity to the voice of the “South”. More than that, I attempt to keep ecology, economy and politics in view at the same time.

On this last point, there is considerable debate about the nature of centralised states and the smaller societies, often peripheral to them and directly dependent on the sovereign state. Trade complexes and international situations also enter into the discussion even though they are beyond sovereign states. The members of Kaulong society are poised at the moment in the midst of all these factors. That means that an expatriate researcher such as myself may be decisively seen (and branded) as trying to study the “exotic”, or the “oriental”/non-western; a member of a colonising power, in this case the Commonwealth of Australia who ran the “Trust Territory” (Mandated) of New Guinea [including New Britain] having received it from the Germans in 1914, and Australian Papua (where residents were Australian Citizens), both until Independence in 1975. Similarly to Rose, Ekholm and Friedman had written of students of culture, that there is “a crying need for an anthropology that properly situates its object”. Their argument is that “the ethnographic object is itself a product of the transformative integration into the world system”, and that therefore the system as a whole must be understood. It is a relevant issue to the “Pasismanua” or south coast forestry areas of this present study, and their point is made clearly if uncompromisingly. When I visited the Province of West New Britain, I found there a general enthusiasm for commodities from Australia and Asia, a christian church, and a conventional dockside infrastructure at the metropolitan centre of Kimbe. Commerce to the average villager is represented by the “stores” filled with the aforesaid goods, wage-labour in the form of oil palm allotments (“blocks”), or copra ventures, or contracts for the few at Stettin Bay Lumber Company. However, there were many cultural matters that also took up large amounts of time at Mai and Buluma villages where I stayed.

Those cultural matters were sometimes blended with western forms, and yet many were clearly not western. Like the ethnographer of Dan Rose’s ideal anthropology, I found evidence of enormous support for a self sufficient economy. I also heard of frequent unrest and some violence. James and Achsah Carrier, studying Ponam society on Manus in meticulous detail, found these combinations the most outstanding factor in post-colonialism. James Carrier found evidence that colonialism changes PNG villages, but not really into the working poor, the proletariat, into “peasants”, or into an oppressed outpost of the National Capital. The form of interaction with capitalism he calls “articulation”. He notes that the activists from the nineteen seventies appeared to expect that westernisation was the inevitable consequence of

5 Ekholm, K., and Friedman, J. “Towards a global Anthropology”, in Friedman, J. and Ekholm, K. History and Underdevelopment pp.73-74.
6 loc. cit. p.62.
Other approaches took the strengths of societies into account, but did not evince the interrelations of villages with the wider society and with capitalist influences that were often global. The nature of a changing, and yet not western village society, was not truly disclosed by such studies - according to Carrier. The real reason was that, in his appraisal, interaction between village and the "west" was not described; in addition, what was the nature of the society as a whole, when such articulation occurred?

Nicholas Thomas also wrote about the dialogue or struggle that many Pacific peoples had with colonising governments and their allies, missionaries and traders. In a very dense and detailed analysis, the primary concept is "entanglement", promoting the notion of two parties, both colonisers and indigenous, actively making images of the other. As a student who had no authorisation or resources to wander about the hamlets of Pasismanua rainforests and talk to the residents, I yet had to account for the massive persuasions, compulsions and seductions of the West upon the general Arawe and Pasismanua regions. Colonisers, technologies, powerful images and negro soldiers of a titanic World War, Papua New Guinea nationhood and Independence, cash flows from transnational logging corporations, and christianity are all elaborated through the Thesis. Yet a central theoretical dilemma remains: how does an outsider, a metropolitan research student, describe authentic decisions of an autochthonous people? The initial answer is, as honestly as he can. This entails competence with the ethnographic detail and a grasp of wider socio-economic processes. Secondly, he will spectate as a traveller, a voyeur who appreciates the precarious images we project of other cultures; and in the contemporary world we are all looking at each other, so my transparency is fairer than most.

Thirdly, there is the modesty of well-attested evidence. This is supported by the participant observer method coming from a two year stay in PNG with subsequent visits. Again, this is much more than the majority of commentators from my country, commentators whose main flaw is that they have not critically appraised their evidence, which has a global/political source. I wonder if Vandana Shiva would discuss the ethnic crises of colonialism with such blanket terms if she had spent as much time in PNG as in India. Her wonderful papers and books are with good reason represented in

8 loc.cit. pp.121-124.
10 My studies give me the qualifications to do so, in fact. The “we” used in the text presumes an academic readers’ community; the “he” of the main text refers to myself as male and does not presume male students or anything like that.
the following thesis despite the fact that her epistemological position is different from mine; as Max Weber wrote:

It is certainly not that value-judgements are to be withdrawn from scientific discussion ... because in the last analysis they rest on certain ideals and are therefore “subjective” in origin ... Criticism is not to be suspended in the presence of value-judgements.\textsuperscript{12}

It seems much better, and a good deal more honest to this student, for researchers to be fully aware of the politics of their own background. This is doubly so in the case of heavily colonised peoples, and therefore it is good form for researchers to state their position in the work. I made few moral conclusions except those on general social implications of poverty, and on the competence of some researchers into PNG concerns. The extreme limitations of the following study, its bounding to an extremely small geographical and conceptual area, springs from my concern with competency for all people studying cultures from the Third World, and from my desire to make claims competently. One is not producing a “Ten Commandments”; it is not an intrinsic or fatal flaw in a researcher that s/he admits that s/he might be wrong, after all.

The veracity of a thesis on development needs to show evidence of dialogue with the people involved in “development”. Perhaps this student of PNG will be found to have too few ties with villagers in the district studied; or for another reason will be found, like the biblical guest at the wedding feast, to be too poorly attired for the “party” of the development-forum (and shown the door!). In any case, it is not against the rules to study the “room” and its inhabitants, though few have previously done so with much rigour. Yet the main point is that such a change in emphasis makes "policy" itself controversial, in Papua New Guinea. If the engine for policy making in Papua New Guinea is ineffectual, then changing the policy is not going to solve any problems. If alternatives are not tried, problems will remain. The view provided in this thesis comprises an alternative.

Many of the observations in this study were obtained via direct interaction with villagers, although these have been corroborated with published studies on the issues. The ethnographic mode, or the part of it called participant observation, entails an "I", whose senses are the method of recording, in the first instance. This comprises a primary source of data and not a secondary source, and accordingly deserves to be treated as first hand evidence. Such systematic records were taken during my stay in Papua New Guinea. A personal presence is part of the method. Much of the data presented here depended on the initial contact, although the interviews and observations

A room full of voices

were eventually compiled in *Young Melanesian Project: data analysis*¹³, with my assistance.

The data is thus very reliable. Events in Papua New Guinea will move according to the pattern suggested, not according to popular models in villagers' narratives, and not according to the models of purist economics. That is where the thesis begins.

---

CHAPTER ONE: VARIOUS MEANINGS

Trade in forest products should be based on non-discriminatory and multilaterally agreed rules and procedures consistent with international trade law and practices. In this context, open and free international trade in forest products should be facilitated.

Incorporation of environmental costs and benefits into market forces and mechanisms, in order to achieve forest conservation and sustainable development, should be encouraged both domestically and internationally. Non-legally binding Authoritative Statement...13.(a), (c), Rio “Earth Summit”, United Nations Conference on Environment and Development 1992.

... a new sort of enculturated student will be formed who will conceptualize fieldwork differently than now. Above all, their inquiry might well have to acquire a sort of narrative quality, that is, students will seek to place themselves in unfolding situations, to live through complex ongoing events - the stuff of stories...

Dan Rose, “Living the Ethnographic Life”

The purpose of this study is to make observations about a much discussed term in Papua New Guinea, “Development”. This discussion has been most apparent in projects involving logging or mining; and has come to the fore on New Britain island. In the forests of New Britain, economically powerful logging companies, with advanced processing and shipping facilities, are taking out trees at an alarming, in most cases unsustainable, rate. Prior to logging operations, regional ecologies are in almost every case poorly considered. Remuneration for the Melanesian villagers is often meagre and inequitable.

Many initiatives have been begun, especially since the end of the last decade, to take a balanced approach to renewable resources, including comprehensive legislation and decisive institution building, mainly through the Forestry Act (1991, gazetted 1992). However, few of the initiatives are being implemented in a sustained and methodical way, despite attempts to do so through “Community Area Plans”. The interest of logging companies is for the most part warmly welcomed by New Britain villagers. There are many letters to the newspapers confirming this, with analogous lobby groups supporting foreign business who set up logging ventures. These businesses are multi-million and billion dollar corporations and accomplished negotiators with great financial experience. They are multinational, often called transnational, corporations (TNCs), with a wry gaze on taxation cuts and capitalising on
price mark ups in the metropolitan markets of Asia. They know how to exploit the free trade regime. They foster the villager-led lobbies against reform of the industry; vitriolic campaigns against parliamentarians who attempt reform are conducted in the Capital, in order to stymie control from the central Government.

The point is that villagers are destroying their natural economic base, by cooperating with logging companies. The main problem therefore is the way in which this society regulate itself. Initially there are two researchers who commented on this subject, as it applies to such remote places as Pasismanua district. The first is Jane Goodale, the anthropologist who studied the Kaulong people of south coast in some depth. She states plainly, that “What is reflected in the exchange system is the independence and autonomy of the individual over anything resembling a social order. The self-developing Kaulong typically expresses little concern with any larger aggregate of people beyond a personal egocentric network of exchange relationships”.

This accounts in part for the cliques and lobby groups who are patronised by wealthy loggers. However, she also points out that, in conflict resolution, a decision “is based on the fundamental principle that normally it is more important to maintain the unity and solidarity of the affiliated group than to establish political dominance or priority of rights leading to fission.” Thus she establishes a distinct tension which villagers deal with, and this is despite the extreme form of independence as she described it.

There is a very important comparison with the work of Paul Sillitoe among the highland Wola on mainland PNG, who depicted exchange as the fundamental basis for regulating Oceanic societies. He believed that his evidence revealed Wola individuals to be without any monolithic institutions whatsoever, and he disagreed with those who depict Melanesian communities as group-oriented and altruistic. Sillitoe described Wola as totally independence- and fame-oriented, as Goodale did of the Kaulong. He answers the question about the regulation of Melanesian societies with the notion of exchange. That is, exchange is intrinsically a regulating principle, in the absence of the...

---

1 This was especially so during the Timber Rights Purchase era (1976 - 1992), when Companies bought the rights to cut trees and the Provincial Government abnegated all responsibilities for the resource. Therefore, between 1993, when the new Forestry Act was implemented to rescind Provincial Government authority and give the Forest Authority of PNG control, and the present, there have been villagers protesting that logging brings “development”, with the most strident appearing in the company-owned The National newspaper.
5 loc.cit.p.2.
state. Exchange is not incidental, but crucial to their functioning well, since little or nothing else will control individual autonomy.

On the one hand, to give encourages sociability because to exchange [people] must act considerately toward one another to engender the co-operation necessary for a two-sided transaction. But on the other hand [people] can also compete with one another when giving...

The information provided in this thesis does not resolve the difficulty in grasping what exchange means. It does however go part way towards explaining that people in Kaulong villages, especially young men, take on apparently macchiavellian profiles in their ambition to acquire "development". Whether exchange is an irreducible principle of social organisation is still a question that deserves more specific research; such a topic would comprise an excellent research question in a separate paper. From the literature of the region of New Britain described, it seemed impossible to affirm that the desire for group solidarity would override selfishness, even if such solidarity was an ancient tradition. Therefore some of the comments that follow are tempered with the knowledge that there is evidence for both egoism and for the primordial pull of fraternity and sorority. Therefore it appears that exchange lies somewhere in the middle.

Papua New Guinea villagers in the province of West New Britain have been studied intensively only by some anthropologists, publishing their work in anthropological journals for the most part, and by the aid agency of Australia, AusAID, who are currently involved in a long-term project. Informal interviews with current AusAID workers in New Britain yielded up to date facts, and insights, on development initiatives. A primary source of data comes from the Melanesian Institute survey in which this student took part. There are now publications by the churches in PNG largely as a result of the Melanesian Institute's projects. The main community organisation that has explored forestry on New Britain is the Pacific Heritage Foundation, whose writings are cited in the thesis for their insight. All these form a relatively small body of research; however, compared carefully with other research in Melanesia, this corpus can yield important insights on "development". There are gaps in the literature on development which this study can fill.

The emergence of Asian 'tiger' economies - the aggressive commercial success-stories of South Korea, Taiwan, Malaysia, Hong Kong and Singapore - and the guided...
democracies of countries such as Malaysia have been the focus of much attention in the world trade arena. Their expansionist business activity is a state-supported phenomenon; but the discussion about loggers from the "Asian tigers" tends to be most about which trees they cut, where the operations are on the map, and how many saleable logs they ship out. The effect which is not well described is the way in which many different people and many different cultures meet. Many NGOs look at both the forest economy and the human economy and are appalled at the trends especially the ecological devastation already caused. Despite this, there are renewed calls for more development, and business cliques have arisen among the villagers in many areas. A significant part of this phenomenon is travel into the Provincial capital of Kimbe or to the National Capital District of Port Moresby, for confirmation of contracts and an enjoyable holiday.

In the defined district of the study, the range of Kaulong in Pasismanua district of south coast New Britain, tradition or "custom" is still strong. People feel ties to their surroundings and to ancestors. In the region of the south coast, people outside of any town (there really is only one) depend on forest environments for at least half their nutrition. That is besides their customary bond, and also their aesthetic bond with the bush. According to Jane Goodale, who worked with the Kaulong more than any researcher, these are vibrant, living traditions. Kaulong speaking people live from two to fifty miles of Kandrian, in the middle of the south coast of West New Britain. The place is difficult to traverse because of the density of rainforest, very frequent flash floods (which wash out roads and destroy bridges) and a stony terrain right up to the cordillera with peaks at 4,000 and 6,000 feet. It is a majestic place and one of which they may justly be proud; but they are cash-poor and their socio-economic development has been neglected for fifty years, even when infrastructural support was possible.

As can be seen from Map 1, there is considerable declared interest in logging tracts in West New Britain province. Major logging camps are represented by inverted grey triangles, which occur approximately every ten to twenty kilometres along the

---

8 See "The last rainforest", Pacific Island Monthly Vol.65 No.10, October 1995, pp.52-54; see also loc.cit. pp.55-58; Duncan, R. Melanesian Forestry Sector Study 1995; also Henderson, M. Forest issues in Papua New Guinea. All these have great merit, for different purposes. However, they are not about the intersection and mutual penetration of cultures; they do not raise interest in the sociology of change in ethnic contexts.


10 A flight of about two hours; the plane trip to Kimbe is not long, but this would be an extraordinary event without the finance of loggers.
south coast. The red lines are roads built by foreign logging companies. There are few other major roads on the whole island.

At the lower centre of the map are the two logging areas designated as “Passismanua Inland LFA Timbers PNG”, and the “Passismanua Inland Extension Timbers PNG”, an area comprising a total of 73,580 hectares. That with the Kandrian Timber Investment’s area at the coast approximates to the range of villages and hunting zones of Kaulong people. “Asengseng” represents a part of Sengseng peoples, and overlaps groups who speak a different language. Pulia, Alimbit, and Andru Rivers are signified on some of the names of the logging areas. They are the rivers that flash flood and tear up any roads and bridges almost seasonally. The unmarked area in Map 1 is for the central massif of the Whitemans, that comprise the watershed collecting aerial moisture which inundates all the surrounding land. One can see the strategies of loggers and the advantage of their building networks in such a crowded business environment. Note that Stettin Bay/ SBLC in the east is the oldest logger. Of 1,300,000 cubic metres of logs available in the two “Pasismanua areas”, 270,000 were cut between 1993 and 1995 in Passismanua Inland, and the Extension area was not recorded\(^{11}\). To give further indications of the magnitude of the cut, Simpson states that in 1982, “West New Britain was estimated to contain about 25 percent of PNG’s commercial timber reserves, with most of this being located in the Kandrian and Gloucester districts”\(^{12}\). The Forest Inventory Mapping System records that of potential production forest, West New Britain had 708,200 hectares in 1975. Of that, 530,900 hectares has been logged\(^{13}\).

Map 2 portrays the main administrative centres, in a context of lowland tropical rainforest and montane wilderness. The real “centres” are the hamlets, depicted in Map 2 (a); Kaulong had about 5,000 to 6,000 speakers in 1994. The islands adjacent to Turuk Catholic Mission are opposite the township of Kandrian, and are in the deep harbour known as Moewehaffen that was used by German traders\(^{14}\). Human settlements should be appraised against the rainforests depicted in Map 1 and in the context of rugged and often flooded terrain. That second context is shown graphically in Map 2 (a) which depicts the population dispersed across 100 kilometres of rainforest.

At the time of writing, Papua New Guinea has been independent from colonial Australia for twenty two years. Set in half of the largest island in the world, PNG’s

\(^{11}\) In Filer editor op.cit.1997, p.248 (Appendix B).
\(^{12}\) loc.cit. p.17.
\(^{13}\) loc.cit. p.225.
\(^{14}\) Thanks to Michael Lowe and the “Global Positioning System” effected by satellite transmission, these maps are not only quite current, but accurate as well. Anutech from the ANU were agents for AusAID in WNBP. The physical details and the dispersed hamlets were beautifully set out by Trevor Pickles of Deakin University.
Principal Settlements, West New Britain

- Gloucester
- Umbi Village
- Angelek Village
- Kimbe
- Mai
- Kandrian
- Gasmata
The Languages of the Kandrian Inland Region

From Johnston, op.cit.
VARIOUS MEANINGS

closed forests comprise about three quarters of its land mass. Since lowland rainforest is the most accessible type, it bears the brunt of logging ventures. These maps are meant to graphically illustrate the ecological calamity thrust upon the Pasismanua district; and therefore the paradoxical situation of villagers consenting to the destruction of their forest habitat.

In fact, in this Thesis this district is appraised not by static maps but by a processual method. The system which is described is not at root an eco-system but a social system. It is though this geographical map is "re-mapped" through a different lens, as if seeing through infra-red light or some other means of seeing. The reader is asked to try to imagine Maps I and II with a conceptual focus. A map is a graphic of yellow colour (for example), with red and green lines – an artifice. This map (as in "I" and "II") does not explain matters because it does not explain the paradox. The Thesis is another artifice, consciously so; but the difference is that the processual map encompasses the ecological paradox: it maps the villagers' vision within the complex unfolding story of "development".

Experienced expatriates have stated that what is happening defies explanation, i.e. nobody likes what happens but a juggernaut of mistakes rolls on regardless. Consequently there is found a general depression about government initiative. Since AusAID is the activator of a development Treaty between Australia and PNG, they have authority to comment on implementation by the national Government. On several occasions in 1995 and 1996, field workers pointed out that funds for infrastructure had not come, and that the national Government allowed AusAID to take the brunt of responsibility for health and other areas of responsibility. The inertia is so striking to observers, and causes so much discussion among villagers, it is worth taking up that challenge. Very simply, what is this conjunction of political movements that escapes proper description?

This is not a critique of Governments, but a comment on expectations about "development" which are pervasive in Papua New Guinea and which dominate villagers' discussions (in strong contrast to more orthodox views of the NGOs already mentioned). The first goal is to put culture and world view as much on to paper as it is in the experience of people living in West New Britain. Anyone studying the issues of development in the context of logging currently owes a great debt to the work of the

Overseas Development Institute who instigated the Rural Forestry Development Network, and (for the Arawe general district) to the two foremost anthropologists of the South Coast region, Jane Goodale and Anne Chowning. There has also been a concerted effort to account for tradition and development by Zelenietz, Grant, and Saito at the westernmost end of the island. Goodale in particular looked at aspects of meaning and the constitution of persons among Kaulong, while Chowning has done comparative studies with comment on change among the Sengseng. These have all taken this study on the horticultural societies of Pasismanua in a clear direction, which revealed a need for sociological analysis in the midst of all the other studies of Papua New Guinea. There are few substantive compilations of these works anywhere else; nor is there much focus on meaning anywhere in the literature on Pasismanua, with the marked exception of Jane Goodale. Some of this is not analytical in the usual sense, but has its basis in analogues. The main analogy is between culture and administration which conforms to few stereotypes, but it is important to signal that the correlation has particular emphasis in the Thesis. In this way, the story of Papua New Guinea development and mal-development is told with a different slant.

CULTURE AND WORLD VIEW

This is an account of the procedures implemented to ensure the survival of some of the forests on New Britain island and of actions of local villagers in this situation. It


VARIOUS MEANINGS

is also a study of meanings. Meanings arise from individuals and social groups who attempt to grasp what happens around them and respond accordingly. In this case, they respond to hotly debated development initiatives. The how and why of their response is the subject of this Thesis. In this section an appraisal of culture will be seen to emphatically show that people are at cross-purposes because of culture. This in turn supports the main thesis that development “study” requires a shift in focus. The citations from James Carrier\textsuperscript{20} lend supportive theory to the views expressed here on “culture” in Papua New Guinea. Some ideas of Raff Carmen fit well with this radical view of entry into the cultural milieu of the developing country, although Carmen drew his data from intensive work in Africa\textsuperscript{21}. To offset this, the history of research on the Arawe culture area (a name given to the forested areas under study) is noted. Hartmut Holzknecht worked with Lae University of Technology in 1988-1989 to survey the districts of Pasismanua and other districts. This was for an environmental impact statement for a logging company\textsuperscript{22}. Compared to some NGO statements cited, Holzknecht’s work evinces the most relevant research. His comments are added to those of the long term anthropologist studying the Kaulong, Jane Goodale; and of all the data, Goodale’s and Holzknecht’s are therefore relied on most. Their studies were found to support my own research experiences in New Britain, which comprised six weeks’ field work and eighteen months’ subsequent data analysis with qualitative studies\textsuperscript{23}.

In the diversity of interpretations of the word “development”, there are at least three distinct cultures who each see things differently. There is a local culture, which is called Kaulong\textsuperscript{24}. These people are very like the adjacent Sengseng. Secondly, there is the metropolitan culture of loggers mostly from Malaysia; and thirdly, there are several NGOs of British and European origin, who operate in an international forum. (The PNG villagers don’t operate in an international forum, although they have many contacts, especially through logging.)

There also is a fourth set, that of other cultures from PNG, and in this district their presence is most strongly felt through the National government. The other indigenous cultures are distinct from Kaulong though they share a lingua franca, sport, radio and


\textsuperscript{22} Stettin Bay Lumber Company 1989b. \textit{Env. Study and Plan, Part Two: Scientific Reports.}(Reports 5.2, 6.3.A, 7.1.D, 10.3) Lae, Unitech Dev. and Cons. Pty.Ltd. and S.B.L.C.

\textsuperscript{23} The work, a survey of the Melanesian Institute, was published by them in 1997; see \textit{Point Series No.21.}

\textsuperscript{24} This information is from Goodale’s residency with them, based on her writings, 1985, 1995, op.cit.
other media, and many commodities imported through the metropolises of P.N.G. The National representative body *per se* is separate from locals in that an administrative culture operates with a predominantly cash economy and locals operate with predominantly exchange economies\(^2\). This comprises a fruitful topic for discussion, within the ambit of "development in Papua New Guinea".

West New Britain is a very young Province with its Capital at Kimbe on the north coast. Oil palm and coconut plantations for copra, with a little cocoa in some areas, are the only large exporting industries. Large numbers of internal migrants came onto leasehold "blocks" in the seventies, especially in the Lakalai districts of the north coast, implicating other cultures such as Tolai, Simbu, and a host of Sepik cultures in classic multicultural arrangements. This was an area in which I worked with a survey team in 1993. There was much discussion around the blocks and among local villagers about the migrations and about timber felling. Previously the region had been administered from Rabaul, through German (1884-1914) and Australian (1914-1975) administrations. Patrol Officers had visited and enforced Australian civil law, and Roman Catholic and Anglican missions had been established in West New Britain. Most districts had poor health and education services right up until 1990. Transport services are also poor.

This was cursorily explored in Holzknecht’s survey of the socio-economic environment of the region, one of the few to ever be done\(^26\). There are three or four major language groups and many sub-divisions of these. They are all in the Whiteman family of Austronesian languages, a very common grouping in the Pacific. This adds to


\(^{26}\) *The socio-economic environment in the Talasea, Hoskins, Kapiura and Ania-Fulleborn Timber Area*, Report 5.3 of Scientific Reports, 1989 op.cit. This is a landmark report, since the *regional* characteristics had not ever been thoroughly done. He states that "No anthropological research has been carried out in either the central plateau or the south coast regions in the study area" (loc.cit.p.157). He also points out that there appears to be "a distinct ‘culture area’ covering southwest New Britain covering not only some similarity of languages but also traditional technology, art and craft forms..." (ibid.). He advises strongly that extrapolations be made from the works of Chowning and Goodale, and reports that there was still a paucity of reliable services across the region, 200 kilometres from east to west and forty miles across to the plateau. The Milligans were studying the Mangseng at the village of Ouba, however, some one hundred kilometres east of Kaulong territory; and they reported that Stettin Bay Lumber Company (S.B.L.C.) had constructed strong roads and set up good plantations which improved the conditions of the Mangseng. Not being in a position to assess the quality of this information, given to me personally in 1994, I observe that Holzknecht’s reports were completed before June, 1989, specifically for the use of S.B.L.C. In "The Socio-economic Environment..." he clearly set out the types of services which are lacking. Subsequent reports from Aus AID and the Anglican Bishop of the Islands Diocese bear out the claim that villagers right across the south were given little or nothing.
the strong localism and nationalism, in distinction to foreign investors with a preference for the English language. (English is not a *lingua franca* in West New Britain.) There are two towns on this part of the south coast, Kandrian and Gasmata. There was not much shipping there except copra and mission supplies, until recently. There is a High School and now a Vocational School at Kandrian. Kandrian has a population of about three or four hundred permanent residents.27

Some time in the 'twenties the Pasismanua was visited by E.W.P. Chinnery 28 and later by J.A. Todd 29, both government anthropologists. Todd’s research is fairly systematic. Later on, Chowning and Goodale went there as a pair, one to Kaulong and one to Sengseng. Goodale writes of this enterprise:

We had expected to find significant cultural and social differences between the two communities, but we did not. Much of what is said here about Kaulong-speakers is also true for Sengseng-speakers, at least as far as our interpretations of these cultures can be said to reflect their reality. What we did find in this first short trip was quite provocative: unlike other Melanesian peoples of whom we had knowledge, and to cite the most obvious, the Kaulong and Sengseng hunt with twenty-foot blowguns, strangle widows on the death of their husbands, bind the heads of newborn infants, and consider marriage (and sexual activity) extremely dangerous for men. These traits are unusual for Melanesians.30

Since I cite both Chowning’s and Goodale’s work, the “ethnographic present” for Goodale was between 1962 and 1974, in 1962 and 1963-4 in the very remote district of Umbi31, and in 1967-8 and 1974 at the village of Angelek, quite close to the coast (and therefore closer to town and commerce). Goodale’s work specifically focussed on gender differences as perceived by the Kaulong 32; and some facets of this appear later in the thesis. In any case, the considerable span of her study, at least twelve years

27 Phone conversation with the Bishop of the Anglican “Islands” Diocese, Feb., 1997.
30 op.cit., 1995 p.x.
31 Located “approximately twenty miles, and three days’ walk, inland from the government post at Kandrian on the south coast”. loc.cit. p.ix.
32 loc.cit.p.x.
VARIous MEANINGS

diachronic study, comprises a basis for a hermeneutic narrative. Such circumspection is evident in the citations given in this thesis; her conclusions unite the key symbols of Kaulong culture\textsuperscript{33}, and it is hermeneutic, that is, “interpretative”, because with her discussion, in her own words, “I give voice to the meaning of the web strung by the Kaulong between the (human) clearing and the (animal) forest.”\textsuperscript{34} This is relevant to the context of logging ventures because in the thesis the concept of villager-owned timber processing is explained; Goodale’s circumspection directly set the tone for the study. The semantics are relevant simply because the villagers’ world view affects logging and loggers’ impact. Similar themes to Goodale’s have been used here, after consideration of many papers written by Chowning, consideration of informants in 1993 and 1994, and from conversations with experienced visitors to PNG from 1994 - 1997. Because a contact-time of 1974 is a worry to some readers, the reasons that Goodale’s writings are so useful are made very clear.

Seen by interest-groups mentioned here, the procedure and outcomes and the description of this region are expressed differently, depending on the people involved; and this is the matter of various meanings, in miniature. In terms of development, the situation requires a meta-analysis of culture, a way of dealing with many cultures. The description of their interaction requires a different kind of analysis - sociological analysis - and new complexities.

As well, there is considerable consensus, currently, about the rights of indigenous peoples. This is especially focused on the relation between people and traditional resources, between change and self-determination, and between economic advancement and regional poverty. The First Principal of the Rio Declaration\textsuperscript{35} is that human beings are at the centre of concerns for sustainable development. Principle 22 states that “Indigenous people and their communities, and other local communities, have a vital role in environmental management and development because of their knowledge and material practices”.\textsuperscript{36} This thesis covers the same point. Scant attention has been paid to the way in which this can happen in forests in Pasimmanua districts; in any case it has poor implementation. Suggestions will be made as to which public personae can take charge of this, implying the central place of the local community.

For this reason, too, Raff Carmen makes development out to be ethical in the first instance. He promotes the work of Cherrett and Heidenreich, who argue that the environment is “a real and pressing issue, but not in and of itself; it is a part of the crisis

\textsuperscript{33} loc.cit.pp.xii, 246-252.
\textsuperscript{34} loc.cit.p.xii.
\textsuperscript{35} Also called “The Earth Summit”, 1992.
\textsuperscript{36} Cited in Schoell, Hans-Martin editor, Development and environment in PNG: an overview, Point Series No.18.
of ongoing loss of control and ability to maintain place and community..." 37. He calls the process of regaining control and recreating the community "humanizing the landscape".

This student uncovered a broader notion of development than economic development, as a part of research done in rural areas and towns in West New Britain. I had an experience of a fully localised programme of study in P.N.G. in 1993-1994, during which I worked with P.N.G. nationals who were already three years into a Project, and was told to learn Pisin (the lingua franca). I had done a course on cassette for two months: when I got to Papua New Guinea, I was made to apply it among communities in highly interactive situations. I visited widely in New Britain on fieldwork, where I was introduced as a subordinate to the trainees of the Project, and mingled with the villagers and towns-people. I saw a kaleidoscope of images for a month, and on my return was asked by research staff to note studies and descriptions of those people I had met, and of others also who had been previously involved in the work. My ears rang with the sounds of singing in indigenous languages and Tok Pisin; my mind replayed images of two hundred people jammed onto public motor vehicle boats; my feet and various other parts ached with the pedestrian life (Pisin wokabaut) which all Melanesians seemed to live, my senses danced at the smell of lime and betel, of earth and flowers and humidity. Then I was told to keep in touch with the (local) Editor and send drafts to the (partly local) staff. Active field work was carried out by local villagers in each sample drawn. I was told stories, in English and Pisin, by sombre priests and sisters and community workers; and generally mistaken for a religious brother wherever I went.

There was no consultation about English; nor about Anthropological views; nor about development, and about very little else. As Hall and Kassam note:

> Internal organic intellectuals can be viewed as individual members of the powerless groups whose consciences and expertise has been raised through constant struggle. As for those intellectuals coming from outside the community, they are expected to be committed participants and learners organically integrated in the process that leads to militancy rather than detachment. 38

There was little militancy as such, but this localised programme was devolved to

---


38 Hall and Kassam 1985, 3797, in Carmen op. cit. p.52
village level, modelled on both trials and on a previous ten year project of community consultation and collaboration. Locals led and trained others to conduct a structured interview in *lingua franca*, with single respondents, two at a time, and focus groups. During my time with them, several of these “organic intellectuals” made their insights and experience available, describing their methods with some precision. Carmen claims that those who help must come in strictly on villagers’ terms:

> The West ... has to face up to the new Third World generations with a ‘decolonised’ mind and the realisation that, in order to be acceptable and accepted, it is necessary first to become literate in the culture, and the language, of ‘the other’.\(^{40}\)

Such a basis drove the Young Melanesians Project. On the choice of words, the educationist Lerner makes the following distinction:

In *consultation*, a professional with expertise ... interacts with a consultee... The problem with consultation is that both parties are not considered experts and the [consultee] may resist accepting advice... In *collaboration*, both the [professional] and [consultee] are assumed to bring equivalent levels of expertise to the problem situation, which leads to more open and successful interactions. The properties of both consultation and collaboration are merged in the concept of consultative collaboration.\(^{41}\)

It is the latter idea, "consultative collaboration", which can work for intellectuals from differing cultures and academic disciplines, and this collaboration is an outcome not just a process. The meaning of development in a West New Britain context is for people to experience their own political ascendancy under collaborative guidance or consultative collaboration.\(^{42}\) The questions which arise from this comprise the lion’s

---


\(^{40}\) Carmen op. cit. p.157.


\(^{42}\) Clearly there were elements of this in Ex-Commander Singirok’s triumph in engaging the electorate to spill the Prime Minister of PNG in March, 1997. “Consultative collaboration is known to be used in the work of Elizabeth Cox, who was with the East Sepik Women’s Council on a range of community works; the P.N.G.Trust which was working to empower locals through Paulo Freire’s methods of literacy; and the previous Tok Ples Pre-School Programme, which was a regionally based language and culture project, and arose at the time of Delpit and Kemelfield’s *Language, Culture and Self*
share of commentaries on development in democratic P.N.G. But the philosophical
underpinning does not seem to be explicit, and thus fairly weak in the literature. This
thesis exploits the lacuna in the literature, drawing heavily on the consultative rationale
of "Young Melanesians...". 43

A VILLAGER'S VOICE

Principle 5 of the U.N. Conference on Environment and Development (Earth
Summit) is one that is especially relevant to the problem of logging in Pasismanua,
WNBP. It states that "All states and all people shall cooperate in the essential task of
eradicating poverty as an indispensable requirement for sustainable development..."

To go back to the epigraph, there are clear indications that "multi-laterally agreed
rules and procedures" have been broken, and that "environmental costs and benefits"
have not been incorporated into market forces. There is no axiomatic direction for
research, knowing certain facts about "money in, logs out" as it were. Increasing the
distribution of information on the largest logging ventures in P.N.G. is very important
for a social (and international) study. However, the information is to be held up for
analysis, before perhaps later forming judgements about what is right. The judgements
themselves may be a subject for research, in a sociological study. In figurative style,
Weber wrote:

The fate of an epoch that has eaten of the tree of knowledge is that it must
know that we cannot learn the meaning of the world from the results of its
analysis ... it must rather be in a position to create this meaning itself. It must
recognise that general views of life and the universe can never be the products
of increasing empirical knowledge ..."44

Since the terms that have not been articulated are those of land-holders who
attempt their own solutions, logging acquires a set of meanings as land-holders
encounter others in their regional context. In this sense the basis is comparative, the
exposition of an encounter. The concepts used should not be in alien languages. Where
in development-studies are villagers' constructions of loggers, villagers' constructions
of development? There is an economic approach, and a political economy approach,
and I set out questions that test the shortcomings of those two viewpoints. This questioning comprises a different area of study, using some different concepts; therefore Jane Goodale’s approach to ethnography has been most helpful. The “increasing empirical knowledge” that Weber wrote about comes with a basis of knowledge or an epistemology.

Many NGOs take up a universalist stance, and peace in the Pacific, Greenhouse effect, indigenous peoples’ rights, rights of women and children, and many other matters become a point of comparison. Holzknecht lists quite precisely the actors in the tableau of Forestry Issues in Papua New Guinea. These are resource owners - permanent rights holders, temporary rights holders, leaders/entrepreneurs - and landowner companies who are locals acting as brokers for commercial investors; there is the State who operate the Forestry Authority and different levels of government; and there are logging companies who patronise a local clique. The NGOs operate with all actors but each NGO has a narrow goal. Such narrow foci do not easily generate a broad study of development by a process of dialogue.

While the global issues which NGOs tackle are of greatest significance, and while these are included and their publications cited here, there is patently a minimum of comments and critiques of development from these sources in this Thesis. That is quite deliberate. For one thing, there is a different critique that needs to be made. For another, there are more and more publications, notes, campaigns and movements on development as time goes on. They are too numerous to cite in any modest attempt to describe development, despite the weighty contribution they make to thinking and popular opinion in the ‘90s. In a similar vein, there is a huge body of literature on biodiversity, and many internal government reports and updates. I have had to engage the literature at certain points. The NGOs are mentioned mainly because of their general political significance.

All the others mentioned are strictly political in origin. Resource owners are dealing with the main game, the inclusion of outsiders into their inalienable rights; this is a trade off for perceived gains. The Forestry Authority has the duty of regulating the quantity and quality of cut with respect to the Public interest. As a statutory body, while it should be ubiquitous in Forestry industries, it is less political and acts as an agency;

---


yet it also is extremely sensitive to changes of government in PNG. The Provincial Government has now become less influential, but was heavily implicated in corruption before this year. Some Members were involved with the Land Owner Companies, which could at times lead to corruption and necessitated investigation into the complex web of influence and politics.\textsuperscript{47}

Since the National Government has a Member for every district and the district level of administration corresponds to the boundaries for the electorate for National Parliament, the Member has considerable influence over which foreign logging companies effectively gain access. With the dissolving of the Provincial Parliaments in 1994, National M.P.s are now bound to have more influence. The Minister for Forests has to take into account all the other parties. The logging companies are gaining rights to cut down the forests by persuading the landowners to sign contracts and then having them passed by governments. This legal process changes the politics by increasing foreign loggers' ability to gain legal and exclusive access to commerce. The inclusion of foreign loggers into forests on inalienable lands is strictly political, in the definition used for this study. All parties mentioned are therefore political in their intent, for the purpose of this description.\textsuperscript{48}

By contrast with the vision of NGOs, if the views of Kaulong villagers, Pasismanua district, are placed nearer the centre of the explanation, then the empirical evidence of the encounter emerges. This kind of empiricism allows research to break away from a register of previous and current research - a fresh research paradigm. Following the sequence of events in this way, the agitation and change is occurring in remote districts such as the Pasismanua, at the village level. The present study is about those changes and the people involved in change. Tensions arise when the voice from the village is heard, expressed by the question "Who controls local infrastructure? - Why?"

The nation has its own indigenous analysts, and many expatriate workers

\textsuperscript{47} T.Barnett, \textit{Commission of Inquiry into Aspects of the Forestry Industry} (1989), the first administrative thrust against commercial felony in logging industry.

\textsuperscript{48} That there is logging and other commerce in West New Britain villages is an economic matter. It is not immediately obvious that transnational financiers entered inalienable land by political sleight of hand. I am not discussing their right to commerce; what is relevant in New Britain villages is that villagers' inalienable land is being alienated as thoroughly as if the land had been sold. The destruction of natural habitat and soil structure is, substantially, a disenfranchisement. This is a new legal field and is much discussed by the International Alliance of Indigenous-Tribal Peoples of the Tropical Forest in \textit{Indigenous Peoples, Forests, and Biodiversity} (International Secretariat, London, n.d.), precisely because there is debate over the bounds of jurisdiction and over the definitions of rights.
sometimes employed by or collaborating with the Government as well. The Barnett Forestry Industry Inquiry (1989) was the report which put Papua New Guinea forests at the centre stage of the debate about forests among Pacific nations and interested NGO’s. As a representative of the Melanesian Environment Foundation put it, “What began with charges of fiscal impropriety ended as a litany of abuses, including corruption, bribery, non-compliance with contracts, violation of landowners rights and environmental crimes” 49. The ensuing Forestry Guidelines resulted, but the implementation has been poor, 50 exacerbated by contradictory government actions and by change-over of government at elections. Yet it must be remembered that there is still an active voice for democratic principles and for a comprehensive approach to forest management.

There are guidelines of the Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations (FAO), Enhancing People’s Participation (1995); yet to use that description implies taking a global perspective quite different from locals’ grasp of forestry issues. Agents of FAO constitute an important part of the NGOs active in Papua New Guinea, and these NGOs do work with locals in many districts. The series of briefing notes is a nationally based commentary, devolved to each country because general rules will not meet specific needs. Enhancing People’s Participation outlines a “menu” of options. This is useful. However, applying it entails the excision of much material; in fact, the “list” of matters to be delved into is complex. Enhancing People’s Participation leaves the reader to delve into a compendium of lists of “dos” and “don’ts”, without supplying any overall guiding principle. As a participant in the ongoing drama of environmental issues, on the other hand, the FAO influence is pervasive. Its literature is contemporary and well researched sociologically and economically. As well, the authors of Enhancing People’s Participation outline the matters which Holzknecht took up in a systematic and effective way in PNG. Its comment on participation of citizens in forestry activism is superbly relevant to, and appallingly absent in, New Britain until the past year or two:

It [nationals’ participation] requires a wise comprehension of national history and culture, good knowledge of social behaviour, excellent communication skills for intersectoral work, a generous dose of common sense, much field experience in specific attempts at promoting participation and at least some acquaintance with the extensive literature in the field.51

49 In Schoell op. cit., 1994 p. 143.
50 Holzknecht op. cit. 1996 p. 5.
Even among NGOs there may be difficulty and controversy for them to enter a village. Holzknech’s work is precisely in this context of logging in West New Britain and provides a very reliable model for development activities. Development became a roller-coaster ride in Papua New Guinea, and those who hold different world views cannot even define a project in the same way. This is shown by Mike Wood’s description of Makapa in Fly River Province. Different definitions were a constant source of misunderstanding in the huge area designated for the Makapa Timber Rights Purchase project. As the “Participation” document puts it:

only rarely can outsiders understand or even fully perceive these ways, which are at the heart of a local culture. Yet, too often outsiders tamper with them, and may even end up denying or suffocating what exists.

Giving attention to what already exists is vital, and this is important coming from that body which claims authority to advise all of them, the United Nations, and which has some authority outside national government. Thus there is a perennial “outsider-insider” tone to the situation. This in itself is interesting, but more interesting still is the fact that they concede that authority to village-level organisations. This tactic is necessary, since especially where the land is inalienable the local peoples claim authority, and act in ways which accordingly aim to fulfil their own hopes.

Actions of Melanesians will be given a place in the following argument, firstly

---


54 op.cit. p.9.

55 It is ironic that the International Alliance of Indigenous-Tribal Peoples favoured neither the FAO, or its descendant Forestry body, the International Panel on Forests (IPF). The Alliance writes that “there has been strong pressure from NGOs and indigenous peoples to insist both that the FAO was not the appropriate institutional home for forest policy-making ... [this] led to acceptance of the suggestion that some kind of open, inter-agency panel should be set up ... The Ad Hoc Intergovernmental Panel on Forests (IPF) is the result of this global compromise...” (Indigenous Peoples, Forest, and Biodiversity n.d. p.56). Subsequently (8/9/96, 11-22/3/96, and especially 9-29/9/96) the Alliance confronted the IPF with submissions sharply criticising the insight of the IPF and bemoaning the total lack of executive power by Members of the Indigenous Alliance. In the midst of these conferences of supervisory bodies, this writer keeps a wry sense of empiricism and requires of a global perspective that it indicates "whose global perspective ?" See Chapter Four of the Thesis.
because it is only beginning to be done; and secondly for the simple reason that things don’t make sense without that narrative. And making sense of things is the basic motive of research.

The discussion of local involvement is in some ways apposite to what Epstein has described as “ethnicity”. He says that “the sense of ethnic identity is always in some degree the product of the inner perception and outer response, of forces operating on the individual and group from within, and those impinging on them from without”. To say that Kaulong have an ambilineal or kindred system of descent or inheritance differs significantly from the axiomatic sets of actions which a member learns in order to deal with his or her own and other people. Kinship is not an issue to Kaulong but their behaviour towards other people is critical; ecology per se is not a subject of discussion for most Kaulong, but their relatedness to their land is a powerful aspect of life. Due to a range of inclusive approaches which Melanesians use to welcome outsiders, the concept of descent may be an anachronism secondary to the activity of exchange, as the work of Sillitoe and Weiner shows. But the point is that Kaulong accommodate the picture others have of themselves and become activists in their own development.

Epstein in the above quote was trying to broach the issue of interaction between groups, or the collision of differing ethnicities. One of his conclusions from a range of material (including New Britain people) was that one group becomes ethnically distinct, defined, and strong, as it interacts with other groups in a multicultural setting.

Culture also broaches the notion of an exchange mode of identity - for fame - and a multicultural mode of citizenship and competition - ethnicity. They are not poles apart; they co-exist. In the midst of these two modes, the meaning of development is not emptied. It is diversified. And because the U.N. deals with the blend of the two, not a Janus-face, its agencies may not know who precisely they are dealing with. Investors may not know who they are dealing with - does this correlate with the chronic compensation problems within the mining and other industries? NGOs including the Churches may be uncertain about who they are dealing with, especially considering the stark contrast between a village in Pasismanua and a government office in Kimbe or Moresby or the Forest Research Institute in Lae.

MAKAPA

Development in PNG has happened differently in different regions, largely

VARIOUS MEANINGS

dependent on specific resource industries. To give general guides for implementing projects is difficult since it requires cultural sensitivity for numerous cultures - an anthropological aspect. It also requires an analysis of the effect of culture on administrative decisions, that is, not just an appraisal of the executive in isolation from the culture in which it operates. The region of Makapa in Fly River (Western) Province provides a good example of a series of logging ventures that demonstrate the mistakes often made in administration where enormous amounts of money are involved. This section will therefore show how a community responds to promises of wealth from loggers. Michael Wood records a short history of these loggers and “Land Owner Companies” from 1991-1995, after intensive fieldwork in PNG. Such detail was considered confidential in the case of the Kaulong and was unavailable, but adjacent areas were described by Jill Grant, Dorothy Counts and Robin Hide in long term, comparable research. These all comprise a narrative of unbalanced development. By contrast, Hans-Martin Schoell’s (editor) Development and Environment in Papua New Guinea represents a wide ranging attempt to apprise a balanced approach to development. Hans-Martin Schoell’s sources were compiled during a three year study in the Melanesian Institute; they are evidence of villagers’ expressions, of the United Nations’ efforts, and of the World Council of Churches’ very strong activism in the Pacific. This anthology and its insights are highly regarded. The efforts of NGOs are also linked to development in a similar way to the World Council of Churches. All programmes of the NGOs cited are localised.

In an apposite commercial venture to the New Britain instance, Mike Wood’s recent study of a Timber Rights Purchase area (TRP) in Fly River (or Western) Province shows the number of actors that may be involved in the commerce of forestry in Papua New Guinea. In comparison to Pasismanua where loggers “successfully” took out large sections of forest, Makapa district 59 “represents a case where the actors ... failed to successfully co-operate and failed to impose a workable order on their often divergent understandings of the Makapa TRP”. A root-cause of many disputes in Makapa was “the legitimate (and illegitimate) powers and capacities of the agents involved to define events ... in a way that other actors are obliged to accept those definitions”. Behind this, again, were semi-legal contracts which left agreements open to challenge from competing loggers. the number and interests of parties in this

59 Near the Aramia River system of the Gogodala people.
61 loc.cit.p.2.
At the start of the Makapa event, the rights to timber was purchased by government; and there were worries about lack of representation. Each person received two kina upon signing. Some clans had multiple use of areas and signed more than once. This reality was later seized upon by rival loggers eager for a lucrative contract. Rimbunan Hijau from Malaysia (whose participation in Pasismanua forests is described in subsequent Chapters of this Thesis) bought the Rights, and was challenged a year later by the company Innoprise Corporation Sediran Berhad (ICSB) of Sabah Malaysia, who convinced Provincial Government authorities to give them the first rights. They submitted proposals to the Provincial Government and the national Department of Forestry early in 1991, through a recently bought company, Innovision (PNG) Pty Ltd. The Minister of Forests in the National government issued exemptions from the restrictive moratorium one day before it was due to be implemented on June 25, 1992. At that, supporters of Rimbunan Hijau (via its subsidiary) assaulted supporters of ICSB and the Provincial Minister of Forests at the Department of Forests’s headquarters.

Thus the problem of partial representative groups is highlighted. To confound matters further, the Minister of Forests insisted on increasing local processing of logs, from 15% as agreed to 50%. This shows how government attempted to manage affairs, but not helpfully, providing a source of confusion. Then the Premier of Fly River Province/ Western Province took the side of ICSB, illustrating again the principle that incumbents of public positions were implicated in the overall process of logging more than the legislators had envisioned. This shows what a broad trend emerges in development issues. It is a trend because these apposite “mistakes” seem to regularly recur.

By 1994, Innovision (ICSB, as above) had diminished the agreed annual cut, offered some share equity to landowners, and said it would process 56% of logs in Papua New Guinea, in exchange for an extended licence. This was in two proposals, October and November 1994. By April 1995, the new Minister Mr. Posai, coming in after the fall of Wingti’s government, put up Makapa again for re-tender! Threat of litigation followed. About that time, the whole protracted business gave opportunity for an interested party to challenge the legality of anyone’s claims, and Sir Danny Leahy’s company made a bid. Despite this, the project went ahead with ICSB/ “Innovision”,

---

62 loc.cit.p.4.
63 As unlikely as this seems, all this transpired between April and July, 1991, causing the said Minister to subsequently oppose all bids by the subsidiary company, “Niugini Lumber”, for the project. loc.cit. p.5.
64 loc.cit.p.7.
subject to large investments in local infrastructure. Meanwhile, Sino-PNG was another company that had been making claims to be able to give an integrated development package to Makapa (to the extent of US$1.2 billion). Mr. Philemon, The Acting Minister of Forests, gave them permission in July 1995 in the Makapa Extension Area. That area was likely to be 1.2 million hectares! As Wood comments, This “was an attempt by a politician to totally ignore the procedures of the Forestry Act and, at the margins of his legal power, locked the state into possibly binding obligations to Sino-PNG to give it access to unclearly specified forestry resources”.

It is important to see the competing interests and the meaningless organisation of “Timber Rights” and proposals from lumber companies to honour those rights. The first conclusion from the study of Makapa is that Sino-PNG came into events while Innovision was finalising negotiations. The “Makapa Extension Area” was poorly defined, since it was not even clear whether the “extension” included the original area claimed by Innovision. Thus the decision of the National Government on 3 June 1992, to offer Makapa to Innovision, thus in essence granting a contract, were made laughable by subsequent decisions. Secondly, individuals and groups repeatedly distorted the process of binding negotiations, causing matters that were highly irregular. Without encompassing all of the detail which Mike Wood gives in his paper, a claim by Niugini Lumber/ Rimbunan Hijau had been accepted for the Makapa area, authorised by the Executive Council of the Fly River Provincial Government on 18 October 1991, rescinding its previous decision to support Innovision. There were three large blocks adjacent to Makapa (“Wawoi-Guavi”) and the total area would have given Niugini Lumber 1,376,000 hectares in a unified set of concessions. That Executive Council also sought exemption for Niugini Lumber, from the national moratorium on logging then in place.

The third conclusion from all of this entrepreneurial excess is that there was no proper agreement among authorities, and the procedures allowed confusing competition from Land Owner Companies (“LOCs”) and loggers. It is in the context of this confusion that malpractice and injustice occurs. Much of Niugini Lumber’s success depended on forming Landowner Companies, despite the fact that there were only some village upgrades in return, with relatively small moneys going to landowners. Wood gives the example of Bamustu where, over a period of fifty years, they were obliged “to do no more than ‘upgrade or build’ the church; to build a water tank; to ‘study the possibility’ of building a community school and provide a dinghy for transport with no

---

65 loc.cit., pp.9-10.
67 ibid.
VARIOUS MEANINGS

mention of an engine" 69- and this out of profits from 1,376,000 hectares’ logged rainforest. Local participation in negotiating the contracts was poor 70, and neither Provincial nor National Governments attained rapport with the landowners. Leedom makes a similar comment about a logging project in the Sepik, showing that communication between the State and landowners was poor:

Forestry policies ... were ultimately of little relevance to resolving the specifically local problems ... logging proceeds as a function of the temporary balance of allegiances between the jumbled “class” of customary landowners and Sovereign Hill [transnational logging company]. 71

For forestry to be effective for development, he says, “the most important arena ... is not to be found in the formulation of additional policies, laws and institutions at the national level. Instead, the challenge ahead is to foster forms of social organisation and political culture, at the local level, which can more effectively safeguard the interests of local communities” 72. This foundation for development comes from the community and such an appraisal of development becomes a study of community “resources”, not natural resources.

DEVELOPMENT IN THE CONTEXT OF LOGGING

“Forms of social organisation and political culture” need to replace policy from the metropolitan “capital district”, in any further programming for village development. That is what the “Makapa” evidence shows in meticulous detail. Naturally, this guideline though very clear is asserted for forestry situations alone, until further evidence is amassed. Nevertheless, such evidence is beginning to accumulate. A major source on development programmes for management of resources is provided by the publication Papua New Guinea: Conservation Needs Assessment Volumes One and Two, from the Papua New Guinea National Government. Brown and Holzknecht’s article, on institutional and social conservation matters, gives specific and measurable guidelines for all resource development. In the present study these are applied to the Pasismanua districts since the insights are considered most relevant to development in

69 loc.cit.p.15. Further details of that contract are few, but Wood made it plain that infrastructure developments proposed were “minimal.” (ibid.).


71 ibid.
the logging context. The Melanesian Institute survey is also heavily cited in the following section, to draw out the data of this current study that included East and West New Britain. As a programme fully committed to the “grass roots” villagers, the data from the survey is weighted more than most sources and is first-hand evidence. An AusAID survey in the same region is by contrast not first-hand.

The epigraph from Dan Rose at the beginning of this Chapter, that “students will seek to place themselves in unfolding situations, to live through complex ongoing events”, brings out the point of change. Change requires work, and causes shock. To begin the study of Pasismanua, Jill Grant’s study of change in an adjacent district near Cape Gloucester, at the western tip of West New Britain Province, was cited. She described some ways in which Papua New Guinea communities became embroiled in aspects of a new high-profile cash economy. She found that the Kilenge people’s excitement at the prospect of change was tempered by their retrospective knowledge of distress. Some of the effects of “development” have been disastrous. These Kilenge may be compared to Kaulong, since “the Kilenge relied much more heavily on foraging and hunting for supplementing their garden produce” in the past, just as Kaulong do in the present. She notes, among other things, that “acceptance of the ideology of consumption can also have deleterious cultural and nutritional effects”.

If more people from the South Coast work in the towns, as Kilenge now do, mothers and children and the very old will have to do more work and will suffer from poor nutrition. If the infant mortality rate goes down, there remains the possibility that population growth will be high and accelerating, a situation for which the Kaulong are singularly unprepared.

Locals want control over the overall processes, and it is better to describe the action of villagers as initiatives and as reactions. Nicholas Thomas in *Entangled Objects* outlines in some detail the ways in which Pacific islanders may respond. The nature of their response may illustrate their own giving to the situation. Thomas showed how histories of cross-cultural contact may portray locals as objects of colonists’ designs, and this is not only as economic “pawns” but by telling Pacific stories in concepts which are specifically Western and colonial.

---

71 Holzknecht cooperated with this research, discussing the subject of the thesis. He has worked in the islands, in Morobe Province and elsewhere on resource development for over twenty years, and was the chief architect of the Working Papers of the “Resource Owner Component” of the Forest Management and Planning Project instigated by the Department of Environment and Conservation.

74 op.cit. 1987.
75 loc.cit. p.247.
76 loc.cit.p.253
77 loc.cit.pp.254-55.
VARIOUS MEANINGS

One way of retelling such stories is to view the process of dialogue especially the ways in which some South Coast peoples envisage such a dialogue. Such a tableau shows how locals in a district remote from the capital dealt with large issues of control, cash and development that suddenly confronted them. And what they lacked was integration of the enormous issues in a form they could handle. What was good development? And what is development?

Schoell articulates the integrated approach in a “sustainable development” model. This he summarises as three components, “viable natural environment”, “nurturing community”, and the “sufficient economy”. The idea behind all this is a balanced approach to development. Its strongest aspect is that of a contented, moral community linked harmoniously with biological nature. An aspect of this is whether, as one FAO Forestry Paper stated, “the growth of business activity in the economy generates both income and employment”. If as in PNG it does not, development is moribund. Logging may be likened to growth in a young person; or alternatively depicted as an accelerating cancer in the body social.

The nurturing community should not be homogenised in models which apply to all people in the same way. Many of the successes in development can be traced to a concomitant grasp of the kinds of communities that exist in Papua New Guinea. So too, most of the blunders, accidents, and outrages occurring from development in Papua New Guinea may be traced (within this sort of organic model) to the misapprehension of the kinds of communities that exist in Papua New Guinea.

Schoell explains that unity of purpose depends upon an agreed definition of good development. Such a unified and clear concept is precisely the subject of this section of the present study. Research among the ethnic groups of this study will show

---

78 Schoell loc.cit.1994, pp.301-2. In this publication, the “Equitable Social Environment” is portrayed graphically as the third major part of this “triumvirate”. This is not logical, according to the accompanying text, which describe the “interactions of society, economy and environment”. It seems to be a misprint. But the main point is that this is a figure, and what happens may not fit such an ideal precisely; each aspect affects the others and they affect it. It is an organic model, with feedback.


80 A skewed community-component affects all kinds of development, but the corollary is true: that the other face of biological annihilation is a depressed and decimated human community. Unbalanced economies make for spiralling biological dilemmas and unfair, immoral societies, according to the model.


82 op.cit.p.301.
that a good definition of development has people as an organic and integral part:

At the centre of this model, the area common to all three circles, is the well-being of the community and all the individuals who are its members, as well as the well-being of nature.\textsuperscript{83}

Charles Abugre in the case of Ghana puts it more bluntly:

We live in countries where people are dying in larger numbers than dolphins or elephants; where indigenous and sustainable lifestyles are being disrupted by loggers or large-scale transnational farming or mining; where poor and indigenous peoples face the manipulation of their production systems into greater and greater dependence on an unfair world market; where the social and traditional safety nets of people are being eroded by a market economy that is unreliable and capricious. Therefore, in our view, the urgency of saving the world’s environment lies in saving human beings from abject poverty alongside their natural resources.\textsuperscript{84}

While PNG’s case is not so urgent as the socio-economically deprived of Africa, there is still a problem of cash-poverty, especially with regard to health in the south coast\textsuperscript{85}. Rights and responsibilities in the case of poor countries were signalled by U.N. declarations about what people should do - in other words, deontological, “value-judgements”. The Bruntland Report in 1987 put it succinctly:

The basic needs of humanity - for food, clothing, shelter and jobs - must be met. This involves, first of all, paying attention to the largely un-met needs of the world’s poor, which should be given overriding priority. \textsuperscript{86}

\textsuperscript{83} ibid. There would also be some discussion among researchers as to whether “social environment” coincides precisely with “nurturing community”. However, I have represented Schoell’s research faithfully, adapted from the Bruntland Commission (op.cit.). Further discussion should ensue in PNG about the relationship between community well-being and nature, since the two are linked through a “bio-cosmic” view by Melanesian peoples. See Mantovani, E. ed. An Introduction to Melanesian Religions 1984.

\textsuperscript{84} Schoell loc.cit.p.308.

\textsuperscript{85} Across New Britain, cerebral malaria is endemic. With few aid posts (village health centres), malaria is exacerbated. With bridges regularly washed out, the health problem and isolation become synonymous. AusAID workers mentioned some aspects of this, and a former resident of many years, John Johnston, described the situation.

\textsuperscript{86} Bruntland Report p.43, in Schoell op.cit. 1994, p.299.
The increase in relative poverty often revolves around employment in PNG, and around the perception that graft is involved in promoting an elite. The pre-eminent Papua New Guinean problem is that the whole endeavour of developing their country falters badly under the welter of poor relationships and perceived social injustice.

In this perspective, the emphasis being on the way Melanesian communities tend to actually operate, analysis of the international market is a liability. As this study progressed it became apparent that there were few hindrances to the unbridled pursuit of profits; and moreover, that one of the virtues of any national government was its protective function, of standing between locals and exploitative systems. While the mistakes of the Papua New Guinea government(s) are often publicised, they have often sought to turn the eagerness of foreign investors to the advantage of Papua New Guineans. When governments hinder "free trade" they compensate for the cavalier methods and enormously powerful scope of transnational corporations. This has become crucial in the forestry debate. As the Brazilian NGOs, Greenpeace and others commented on the Earth Summit, "The TNCs [Transnational Corporations] extraordinary influence over the UNCED process akin to a sacred priesthood handing down its dictums from on high has led to a text which gives them free reign to pursue their activities without any accountability. The most vivid example of this dynamic was the repeated deletion of Agenda 21 references to Transnational Corporations." GATT itself, according to these NGOs, does little to halt environmental degradation. GATT cites free trade "as a 'key' to sustainable development." While judgements are not made here on the present epoch of burgeoning commercial freedom, it is clear that unrestrained mercantilism in forestry has made a complete mockery of the "equitable social environment" component of the organic sustainable development model.

There is an "equitable social environment" component of development, to support sustainability, with reference to all three components of sustainable development - the "viable natural environment", the "nurturing community", and the "sufficient economy". One cannot isolate one component, since in a New Britain village all three coincide; that is why they all intersect in the well being of community and nature, in this model. The intellectual models are themselves a useful analogy, but they are only a tool to appraise whether something is balanced, not merely expanding like the logging

---

89 Schoell loc.cit.p.264.
90 loc.cit.p.265.
ventures of Papua New Guinea. Balance with justice and well being should be regarded as a lodestar of development. In the integral model of development, justice is paramount.

The creators of the Constitution knew at least this much, demonstrating this in the very first Directive Principle of its Preamble:

Every person should be dynamically involved in the process of freeing himself or herself from every form of domination or oppression so that each man and woman will have the opportunity to develop as a whole person in relation with others.

For this reason, other actors become very important in remote regions such as Pasismuha, West New Britain Province. That is because social justice is a guiding paradigm for many of the NGOs. For example, the PNG Trust is interested in the Paulo Freire method of teaching literacy by using texts and discourse about social justice, relating technical learning of literacy to human rights. These courses are accessible and village-based, and empower people who would otherwise become clients of loggers, or mining ventures. AusAID has looked into the area under a renewable resources initiative for several parts of PNG. There was a study of Youth in the province, undertaken by the Melanesian Institute in 1993 at the request of the Churches. As well, the new religious movements, sweeping the Western Pacific for two decades and more, have arrived in WNBP. The New Tribes Mission (NTM) operate in especially remote regions and have many converts. They had little integration with south coast cultures, by all accounts, but with their American evangelism and the ability to provide services, they were a cogent force in 1993 when the Melanesian research team were making inquiries of youth. The "other actors" set the tone for the dynamic process of freedom (see First Principle, above). Development is like an icon with many rays of light trained upon it from all sides. Meaning appears differently depending upon the angle from which development is viewed and illuminated. The "context of logging in West New Britain" is thus loaded with meanings, nested in the general concept of development.

A conclusion to this kaleidoscopic array of actors is that there is no central and comprehensive guiding intelligence for development in the region.

Consequently, the Forestry Research Institute (F.R.I.), based in Lae, has been struggling for several years with these factors, and asks for dialogue so that events become acceptable through persuasion:

91 This was described to me by an information officer of the Trust, and is the main reason for its existence.
For forestry activities to be feasible and socially acceptable, they must be compatible with and integrated into rural development programmes ... in this respect, dialogue and cooperation between all parties at all levels must be ensured, especially where forests are tribally or communally owned.\(^{92}\)

While dialogue is crucial in the context of many social actors, the non-legally binding authoritative statement from the Global Summit loses all practical force because dialogue is not ensured. That is because because it is not binding.

Dialogue in the development of West New Britain rural areas began through survey work, one of the earliest being done by AusAID in their feasibility study in 1989-90. They found that hamlet dwellers wanted better clinics, better schools, and more roads. They also attempted to find out how people of the Kandrian-Gloucester region could better use their natural resources, resulting in a Vocational School and a Guest House project in 1993, when the Project was first implemented.\(^{93}\) These are based on Community Area Plans, detailing natural and social resources.

A survey by the Melanesian Institute in 1993, interviewing 1,630 young people\(^{94}\) over hundreds of hours, at Kimbe, plantations/blocks, villages peri-urban and rural, Gloucester, Mai, Buluma, Kandrian, and many islands in the West and South of the Province, revealed the following: (1) A clearly practical education which would be funded and therefore not a drain on family resources; (2) Vastly improved rapport with the older generation; (3) Careful consideration of the place of "youth" in the village; (4) Specific social and spiritual resources. These entail many lifestyle matters in the village, the decrease in highway robbery and better rapport with police, and religious training centres or general serious consideration for their religious feelings, as well as their

\(^{92}\) *FRI Newsletter* Sept.1993, p.10.

\(^{93}\) *Project Profiles* AIDAB 1993 p.27. Although Rob Crittenden, the Director of the "KG" Project, personally told me that the "KG" was agriculturally based, the list includes education, health, transport, shipping, women in development and management issues (ibid.).

\(^{94}\) A breakdown of the interviewees is:

- New Britain 405, Morobe 407, Oro/National Capital 404, Highlands/Southern Highlands 414
- Male: Female 811: 819
- Rural: Non-rural (various) 793 : 837
- Married : Single 354 : 1276

Fair representation of each category was accomplished through statistical weighting; see Zocca F and De Groot N eds. *Point S.No.21*, "YMP Data Analysis" 1997, Appendix I pp. 2-5.
desire for bible teaching.\textsuperscript{95}

Comparing it with the AusAID statements made in 1995 and 1996\textsuperscript{96}, there was an emphasis on making the village a base for resources. Youth wanted consideration of their recreational and social needs as well, not liking the isolation that came as a result of graduate unemployment. Big village-based projects centred on the particular location, and generally in the Pasismanua, were highly favoured in both studies. The impression was that infrastructure for schools and roads were notable for their absence; the feeling of being left out was strong in all the rural areas of the Melanesian Institute. Deprivation or the belief that they are deprived, is a cause of concern among youth in Papua New Guinea. Based on the data from different types of interviews, the background literature, and also based on two distinct studies, there is strong support for the belief that youth regard “development” as some sort of panacea in answer to this felt deprivation.

In particular, it was found that washed out roads were not repaired, and run-down school buildings (supplied by the logging companies) were not replaced. From the AusAID workers and the Anglican Church\textsuperscript{97}, it seemed that there was general depression about these things right across the south coast and its hinterland. Therefore the desires were also very strong and urgent. Craig and Linda Throop of the Summer Institute of Linguistics had been among the Kaulong through most of the eighties. They stated that these were the felt needs; and said that locals were beginning to wonder at the devastation caused when loggers were allowed in.\textsuperscript{98} The results of logging jolted villagers out of complacency about dealing with loggers and government.

In response to this need, Brown and Holzknecht make some general recommendations, in the *Conservation Needs Assessment* Volumes produced by the PNG Government\textsuperscript{99}. They urge the affected people to collaborate. This does not stop the influence of loggers on landowner councils (LOCs), of LOCs on the Member, of loggers on the Member, of the Member on Police, and so on. What Brown and Holzknecht recommend is concerted collaboration between many parties, and this could counter the networks arranged by loggers and their clients. These include NGOs and

\textsuperscript{95} E.Ibu, unpublished *YMP Report Booklet* 1994 p.11. Point (4) was a key aspect of her report.
\textsuperscript{97} The correspondence with the “Islands” Diocese of the Anglican Church, especially Bishop Michael Hough, occurred in February and March of 1997, with letters and phone conversations.
\textsuperscript{98} Personal interview, Summer Institute of Linguistics headquarters, Ukarumpa Papua New Guinea, 9 May 1994.
VARIOUS MEANINGS

Government; NGOs and local communities; logging companies and landowners; Government and landowners; Government and Government, vis. Environment and Conservation and Forestry Departments; scientists and Government; scientists and landowners. To this end, the authors wrote up six pro-forma questions about development activities, with the same idea as the Forestry Research Institute as quoted above:

1. Is the activity consistent with the objectives of the community or communities which will participate in or be affected by the proposed activity?

It is consistent with the short-term objectives of communities but longer term objectives are not even known by the instigators of logging. Therefore there are non-stated objectives, such as adequate horticultural and adequate hunting resources, which are adversely affected by the logging industry, and the manner in which it is conducted in Pasismanua.

2. Will the proposed activity create conflict at any level of the community (ies)? Will it result in increased socio-economic stratification?

From the work of Robin Hide, even at early stages of logging along the south coast region, stratification into elite and non-elite quickly transpires. In fact he states that LOCs “entail risks which could mean at worst the disenfranchisement of many traditional rightholders ... in short, the destruction of both customary livelihood and landscape”. There would be plenty of conflict especially among some “disenfranchised” young males.

It seems that the manner of distribution of benefits is a problem in many Melanesian communities.

3. Will benefits spread equitably from the proposed activity to different groups ... within the community (ies)?

There are gender-sensitive programmes in the education sector, and a guest House project in Kandrian, set up for the development of skills traditionally shown by women. There seems little need to doubt the representativeness of cultures in LOCs in

101 loc. cit. p.18.
Pasismanua, but few women seem to have much say. Many families will see few benefits and a few families will receive what are for villagers great economic and prestige advantages. Guest houses and women's literacy groups are development initiatives, but timber companies have had little involvement with these. Hide gives considerable evidence that agents and Directors of LOCs don't have to communicate with all landowners, and in fact some of the groups are so dispersed that meetings, and even an A.G.M., are almost impossible. This is related to the nature of the terrain which would not support such meetings unless proper transport and communications were first established. The implication is that the planning is poor and non-inclusive, since the original dispersed nature of the hamlets would seem to be a demographic adaptation to using the forest sustainably. From Hide's essay, it seems that there are communities that had no part of benefits from logging.

4. Is there a realistic plan to mitigate any foreseen negative impacts of the proposed activity?

There is negative evidence about this in almost every case. A study of the West Arawe Timber Area logging proposal, a Project Proposal, reveals the kind of Social Impact Statements made in New Britain. The Area is managed by Cakara Alam company. This statement, completed in 1990, reveals no realistic plan of mitigation. It is true that there were clauses about consultation, but since there was no adequate overseeing body in 1990, this is no assurance. Henderson of the Pacific Heritage Foundation, and Holzknecht in the Rural Development Forestry Network programme, both testify to loggers' poor ecological sensitivity. Holzknecht made considerable comment on mitigation as a major factor in planning. After a baseline study has been done, more collaboration must occur to regularly review impacts of logging not only on the ecology but also on the tenor of social life. In the West Arawe Timber Area logging proposal, the Description of land Tenure (Section 3.2) includes the following statement:

As is the case in Papua New Guinea, the land tenure system in the project area is extremely complex because of the types of land rights involved and the local topographical distribution of lands. In the first place, land rights have to be analysed at two distinct levels - those vested in the individual and those vested in

---

103 Project Proposal for the West Arawe Timber Area, by Cakara Alam/ General Lumber Sawmills, pp. 4-11, supplied by Papua New Guinea Forest Research Institute.

the patrilineage as a corporate body. ... [rights] of guardianship are reserved for the patrilineage as a group.

There is little evidence of any patrilineage, or of any monolithic corporate body whatsoever. While male entrepreneurs are the rule, these districts are mostly bilineal, inheriting rights from father's or mother's family and residing accordingly.

5. How much have local people participated in the design of the activity, and how representative of intra-community sociocultural diversity were these people?

Feasibility studies need to be vetted more closely. Little or no information has been proffered to villagers before signing contracts. In particular, there is no educational motive in what loggers do and that is critical. Participation is almost absent, or often bogus.

6. Has the project addressed all relevant socio-political issues and socio-economic issues that might impact the project?

There seems to have been little consideration about the risk of the reliance upon a single industry. In the past, many coffee-growers, for example, have been given little return when world prices slumped. The issue of self determination (according to the Fifth Directive Principle) is very important here. There have been a rash of complaints that economic support is temporary, that the political and administrative processes are poorly monitored, and that there is an ecological vacuum quickly filled with erosion, flooding and, consequently, health and social problems. This was described in great detail at the Environmental Awareness Workshop for NGOs which was a teaching and networking forum for just this purpose. No notable support is given to women by logging companies, and this may be regarded as a significant socio-political issue. It is poor development.

---

105 Hide op.cit.p.5. Some villagers were emphatic that inherited property including land came from the father's line and the mother's line.
106 My contacts in the heart of "Arabica" growers in the Asaro Valley, Eastern Highlands, tell me that now it has become critical with the drought. When I arrived in Goroka in 1993, coffee-prices slumped and there was little to save the average small grower. For villagers relying on round logs almost totally, with little or no domestic timber market, the prognosis is fairly hopeless.
107 National Alliance of Non Government Organisations (NANGO), Environmental Awareness Workshop for NGO's (31 August - 11 September 1992)
108 See Question 3. issues, above.
Dialogue is a viable plan, as the Forestry Research Institute pointed out. Within this dialogue, visitors must recognise local people's strong, active desire for development. It is the point of recognition that is critical. Here, the Western acumen of science meets the native sensitivity of the Melanesian villagers. Who wins? In such a tableau, it is helpful to recall that more or less the entire region is owned as an inalienable right of those being developed, or developing themselves.

The rights of Nationals here need to be seriously considered. There is a general right of national sovereignty, and tied funding especially from Australia is regarded by many nationals as an issue of contention. There are also rights of indigenous people which are widely recognised. After consulting Hartmut Holzknecht and several workers in the "Kandrian Gloucester Integrated Development Project" of AusAID, this thesis provides an argument for the use of regional and cultural factors in this consultation process. Evidence which has not been clearly compiled before shows that such considerations as community objectives, equity and participation have had little effect on executive decisions. Development in the context of logging needs to be facilitated by political leaders who are committed to consultation and who make great efforts to include all stake-holders, from the inception of a programme right to the conclusion, in an ongoing process. Therefore, the executive itself comes into the appraisal as an integral part of the thesis. How, in fact, does the government apply its policy in the light of development "primarily through the use of Papua New Guinea forms of social, political and economic organisations" (Fifth Directive Principle)?
CHAPTER TWO

PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

In this chapter some background of the central people in question, the Kaulong of the South Coast interior, West New Britain, is articulated, in order to see how the Fifth Directive Principle, to "achieve development primarily through the use of Papua New Guinean forms of social, political and economic organisations", is being applied to the social context. It is necessary to appraise their way of life with reference to primary sources, and to continue with Nicholas Thomas' argument about certain "struggles" that occur over control of trade in Pacific nations; a struggle between European colonialism and Pacific peoples' ability to confront, deny and inflect proceedings.

Nicholas asserts the presence of colonialism by examining events closer to empirical records. He concludes that the dialogue, the struggle, was and is a more apt way of looking at things:

While the profound asymmetries of colonialism cannot be overlooked, any theory which recapitulates the pioneers' ideology of vacant or passive spaces ... must falsely diminish the prior dynamics of local systems, their relative autonomy, and their capacity for resistance.

This chapter particularly in the first three sections will fill those "spaces" and examine the evidence for autonomy by the dynamics of local systems themselves. Local systems and their autonomy are particularly well covered by Jane Goodale and Ann Chowning. They are the main sources of information, which they found through many methods, with narratives, interviews and observations all important to their summative papers. Goodale wrote a major monograph on the Kaulong in 1995, based on twelve years of visitation to the field and thirty years' experience with the material from the Pasismanua. The context was colonial, and pre-independence. Kaulong people's actual adherence to customary usage was confirmed by Aus AID workers currently in the field, and by Christina Pavlides, who studied the Arawe exchange systems in 1987-88.

1 Thomas, N. Entangled Objects: exchange, material culture, and colonialism in the Pacific 1991, p.205.
3 The anthropologist Marsha Berman has studied Arawe islander society in depth, although her unpublished M.A. Thesis is not readily available through Australian Universities. Neither is it quoted in other sources, although Pavlides cites Berman several times. See Berman, M. The Arawe people of West New Britain: modern times in a traditional village Unpublished M.A. Thesis, Uni. of Amsterdam, 1982; Pavlides, C.
PEOPLES OF PÂSISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

Goodale’s work therefore dominates any study of the Pâsismanua peoples. Chowning by contrast showed a strong grasp of languages in New Britain, and had an interest in certain regional aspects of West New Britain. At present she remains one of the most experienced anthropologists in the world and her papers must be treated with respect. Matters associated with forestry and social changes were described by Craig and Linda Throop during an informal interview in 1994. The Throops are Summer Institute of Linguistics staff, who lived with the Kaulong people for over a decade.

The Kaulong are an Austronesian speaking Melanesian people of about 4,000 – 5,000 speakers4 living on the edge and in the midst of a tropical rainforest, which extends from Kandrian on the coast up to the limestone ridges leading up to the foot hills of the Whiteman range. They are swidden agriculturists and forage widely in their forest for up to 60% of their food in some districts 5. They grow taro which forms their staple, and raise pigs. Any substantial man will have three or four gardens where he cultivates taro and does growth magic to induce the nurturing spirits to make taro grow. There are similar peoples along the coast to about Gasmata in the East, and these are all called “Pâsismanua”6, the peoples of Man-o-War Passage. In the sixties Goodale and Chowning travelled there together to study parallel cultures, and Chowning’s description of the terrain is not impertinent:

The area had not been mapped ... but it can be stated that the highest villages are at an altitude of only about 457 metres. Higher than this is the unoccupied virgin forest that covers the Whiteman mountains. The broken terrain, upraised coral near the coast and limestone farther inland, is cut by numerous swift streams; an annual rainfall approaching 635 cm makes travel uncomfortable at

---

4 SIL figures 1994, and personal communication, C. and L. Throop, language workers among the Kaulong.
5 Goodale op. cit. 1995, p. 69.
6Pâsismanua (T Pisin Pâsismanua common spelling) is a region covering the districts inland from Arawe, to about Gasmata and perhaps including the Mangseng. The stretch is 100 k’s and 40 k’s wide, and “Kaulong” occupy 50 by 50 k’s of this NE of Kandrian (See Maps I and II, Chapter One). It includes some coastal groups although their subsistence base tends to contrast strongly with the inland people. Pâsismanua is therefore not a discrete culture, but a mix of similar cultures with cognatic or bilinear descent and who rarely had settlements with more than ten huts or dwellings. On the other hand, an inland people like Bao near the E.N.B. border might not be included, and the Gini/ Rauto region might be thought of as distinct from the people I am describing. Kaulong and Sengseng are Austronesian languages. Again, some distinctive traits of Pâsismanua (from here on always written as Pâsismanua) such as teeth-blackening are found as far as Maenge some 200 kilometres away.
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

best and actively dangerous when flash floods occur. The surprising isolation of the interior from outside influence probably owes as much to the nature of the terrain as to the reputation of the inhabitants (see Chinnery 1928, passim).7

Kaulong men are known for their use of blow-guns, of up to twenty feet in length, to hunt arboreal game, keep dogs for hunting pigs, and trap cassowaries. Women may also hunt and fish but men have a bigger technological repertoire for hunting. There is a strong sexual avoidance by men, to the point that they tend to marry late, for fear of sickness and the early advent of old age 8. The young acquire their acknowledged adulthood or “humanity”, by their success in establishing and maintaining exchange relationships, increasing their knowledge of a wider world and by participating in singing activities of many kinds 9. People establish a fulfilled humanity within the clearing and the hamlet in public activities. Goodale uses this concept from notions in Kaulong language itself, and her conclusions offer this as the central point of her interpretation of their culture. This is particularly marked by the term potunus, meaning “complete” and having the sense of “good”; the morpheme po means “all”. From Goodale’s account, the admission as “human” is the result of tests, wherein the community itself actually appraises each child’s development. Singing and appropriate modesty about displaying teeth demonstrate to the community that the stage of such “completion” has been reached10. This signifies that they have attained maturity and that they can be considered fully human in the fashion that villagers think proper. She also provides leverage to studies of development where she writes of the “cultural interpretation ... embedded in that central cross-cultural dialogue between informant and anthropologist”, and locates the efforts by both insiders and outsiders to communicate with each other, in a single endeavour:

to learn the underlying culturally constructed concepts of humanness and social order by which others express rules and strategies, beliefs and understandings of the world in which they live 11.

9 loc. cit. pp.124-5.
10 loc.cit., xi. In English itself, the etymology of the word “heal” presents an apposite semantic relation, since Old English hal, “whole”, hael, heal, and halig, holy, are related to each other.
11 loc.cit. p.5
To compare with the colonial phenomenon, the two parties may not have tried learning “concepts of humanness” at times, but certainly, Thomas argues, both indigenous and would-be colonists were actively setting agendas. There is a need to listen and understand in a way that was not so critical in previous decades because now there is a greater possibility of dialogue between customary usages and the Parliamentary or representative system of government.

In the ensuing narrative, there is a perspective taken that village cultures are robust; since there is evidence of dissolution of former values, the perspective has its own evidence and rhetoric. For each section, each source is vetted and appraised to give some idea of the source’s reliability, and to suggest its place in the heated discussions about forestry. Although there are biased reports, that does not preclude them from the discussion. History always has a recorder, and to have some sort of record is always good; the cultural or subjective bias is itself a lens which may indeed be vetted and appraised, just like any other artefact of a civilisation. In such a stratagem, the excesses of a Captain Cook or the enthusiasm of a Malinowski, or even the statements of Herodotus or Edward Gibbon Wakefield, may be callibrated in the hope (and not the certainty) that we can grasp a little of contemporary events and the views which people had of those events. That is why it is a strength to have a very circumspect account such as that of Jane Goodale. This is because she seems to have been aware from very early meetings with the Kaulong that people who are describing villagers, such as anthropologists, have their own culture.

This chapter is to adjust the focus to those “culturally constructed concepts of humanness and social order”. Such “concepts” among Kaulong villagers are explained, and these notions expanded to put development in the limelight. The ensuing parade of development melange is explained by the simple wish to find out what development is. That people have development may be a sign of the hegemony of the North economic zone, as Kennedy12 and Carmen 13 warn, but a broader definition is necessary. The “hegemony” view is after all most frequently announced from people of the “North”. Some of the peoples and nations who enter such new world orders do not see themselves so victimised, and the argument for villagers’ initiative must be articulated.

Keith Hinchcliffe suggested some time ago that it would be appropriate for policy makers to confer with anthropologists, particularly in P.N.G. “Few individuals have a well founded background in both economics and anthropology, and in most attempts to combine the two subjects either the economics or the anthropology is simply tagged on”14. In fact it would be better to look at a micro-issue and offer a perspective with

---

13 Carmen op.cit.1996.
14 Hinchcliffe, K. “Anthropology and economic policy making in Papua New Guinea”
some level of generality. And in fact, this comes to the very point of the sub-title, “various meanings in a West New Britain context”. Europeans and those of western culture may need it pointed out because those “various” are a hint or clue for an overarching or transcendent issue - that there are values, socially shared ones, in “development”; and that the values of locals did not in any clear sense include our rhetoric about development. In the past two or three decades, the two distinct values or systems have co-inhabited the region.

In a very real sense we are in uncharted waters. The Kaulong personal sense of individual “renown” as a lodestar is amplified by the very thing that is outside the grasp of tradition - a fiscal currency economy in an overarching institution (“Government”). That this renown is a real factor is attested to by the work of Annette Weiner in the Trobriands, and from the seminal study of Malinowski in the same region, as well as by the veteran anthropologist Andrew Strathern in the Highlands. A divide exists between metropolitan/ “western” values and villagers’ values everywhere. So, out in the Provinces, will we have small self-determined districts operating within one electorate: 800 hermetically sealed cultural “parentheses”? The shires and cantons of hidden valleys and fenced council jurisdictions? Or will it simply be glossed? That values, and therefore local laws, are involved in indigenous peoples’ control over resources, seems to have become a subject of great discussion. The issues are discussed at length in an anthology edited by Howitt et.al., and they defer to many international studies and development NGOs. In Australia this has been lately epitomised by the Mabo and Wik Judgements. While they provide a context in which New Britain events are magnified, it is sufficient to mention how local or district control is of interest to the international community in many ways. The part that people in the dispersed hamlets of Pasismanua play, in setting a tone for development, is the central thesis.

The interest of this thesis is that it is a narrative of modern and current events with various meanings, and uncharted waters. Inter esse, the origin of the word “interest”, means between two; by a convenient pun, on one hand, the development of inalienable land and the people identifying with that land must be done by Papua New Guinea.

Oceania XLVIII No.2 December ... 1977, p.122.
18 Strathern, A. The Rope of Moka ... (Cambridge University press, 1971)
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

ways, according to the Fifth Directive Principle; on the other hand, those governing the
nation administer laws by general decrees, with fiscal policies ever tightening the
guidelines.

Because Goodale is very clear on the fact that the individual has primacy over
group considerations, it is an important consideration in the following section. Two
important points are firstly that this egocentrism among members of Kaulong society
can override any sort of duty to the “government”, provincial or national; and, secondly,
that to consider the world view of Kaulong it is axiomatic that exchange is described. As
well, since exchange is at the root of most behaviour in Melanesia, this leads to the
ensuing discussion about exchange as a source of environmental awareness.

EXCHANGE

That there is a context of exchange ceremonies and valuables across the Pacific is
undisputed20. While Goodale used the words “independence” and “autonomy” to
describe Kaulong, Sillitoe pointed out that “partners must act considerately toward one
another to engender the co-operation necessary” for exchange21. The question to be
addressed is “What is the nature of exchange among modern Kaulong? What is the
concept by which these cultivators in south western New Britain relate to each other and
outsiders?” These questions then lead into the possibility of comparing a remote people
to others across Papua New Guinea, and to appropriate measures for developing
relevant aspects of people across this district. Precise theory comes from Chris
Gregory’s research on social gift-giving, both relevant and rigorous enough for
analysing ceremonial exchange22. This lays the groundwork for comparing the progress
of Pasismanua districts with other areas and a discussion of methods for working
closely with villagers. Bill and Scarlett Epstein have done work in both New Britain and
south Asia23, and they provided reliable models for examination of changes to village
life. The broader perspective offers insight into development in a West New Britain
context.

Each person in a Kaulong hamlet (called a bi in the Kaulong language) establishes
an ego-centred set of relationships and which contribute to “renown” mainly by the
exchange of gold-lip pearl shells24. This is so for both sexes. There is a crucial exchange

---

20 Sillitoe op.cit. 1979, pp.5-6.
21 ibid.
23 Epstein, A.L. Matupit: Land, Politics and Change among the Tolai of New Britain
(A.N.U Press, 1969); Epstein, T.S. Capitalism, Primitive and Modern (East Lansing,
Michigan, 1968).
of rare stones which are from an earlier culture and not actually produced by the present Kaulong. However, only men exchange the mokmok stones, as they are called, by far the most valuable exchange item and which are held in great reverence. They are used by the Arawe people in internal exchange and are known to originate in Kaulong territory. She describes them thus:

Mok mok stones are either round or oval in shape, measure about 2-3 cm in diameter and have a hole bored into their centre. The stone itself is of a marble like substance and is usually grey in colour.

Singa stones, which are large thick wheel shaped items...approximately 6-7 cm tall, and kulutul which are hollow cylindrical stones, around 3-4 cm in length, are both types of mok moks. Both items have a characteristic bored hole through their centre.

In Kaulong society, knowledge is displayed and people compete in comparing shells and in singing. Those who exchange are connoisseurs of shells, whose size, thickness, balance of configuration and other qualities are all weighed up, but there is no equivalence, no currency by which one can translate value into money:

They understood that coins were anonymous in that one man's coin equalled another man's coin of same denomination... Shells are not anonymous, each shell is distinct from every other shell so that X's shell cannot equal Y's shell and no two shells could ever equal one.

These shells can be compared one with another, against the background of acquired cultural knowledge, the connaissance of shells. Goodale goes on to say that whereas patupan, or the matching of shells, "establishes an agreed-upon level of social equality, commercial exchange is directly reflective of an established inequality between the transactors." She also mentions "the skilled transactor" who judges everything to a nicety. These are all in the context of the desirability of shells, as well as the desirability of cementing or augmenting one's position in the social network. There

26 Pavlides ibid.
27 Ibid.
were also exchanges with the adjacent peoples East and West. The importance of fame and a wider range of contacts could be underestimated; but the literature indicates that it is very pervasive in most aspects of social life.

A point of entry into the ideas is to look at the idea of goods and services, which have taken a distinct form in Melanesia for many thousand years. If goods or a service is exchanged for money, it is seen in terms of doing the receiver of the product/service some “good”. Chris Gregory claimed that the term “goods” was theoretically vague, and that it is clearer for some purposes to refer to the distinction between alienable and inalienable things. A commodity, by contrast, is necessarily an alienable thing. He used some basic Marxist tenets, where a primordial distinction for Marx was that between use-value and exchange-value. “In the course of time, therefore...” he wrote, “some portion at least of the products of labour must be produced with a special view to exchange. From that moment the distinction becomes firmly established between the utility of an object for the purposes of consumption, and its utility for the purposes of exchange. Its use-value becomes distinct from its exchange-value.” At this point, the concept of commodity becomes defined. A commodity is exchanged. It is an economic sense, and a narrow sense of economic activity. It becomes a quantitative measurement. “What makes [commodities] exchangeable”, said Marx, “is the mutual desire of their owners to alienate them”.

The portrait of a commodity is that of an alienable object which has a distinguishable exchange value. It is a quantity in relation to another quantity. Most things in Western cultures can fit the profile of alienable article. Any object may be; services may be; even sex gets an exchange value but hints at the sacred dimension - since there are inviolable personal aspects, which depend on a relationship, many would promote that as a gift, to some the ultimate gift related to life itself. That this is a convention is shown by the fact that it is in fact sold, under certain circumstances; those who say it is sacred proscribe the practice of selling sex under any circumstances. All this shows precisely that distinction between what is a gift and what

---

30 The evidence from the mid-eighties is given by Pavlides, op.cit and by Chowning op.cit 1988, for earlier periods. Chowning was especially sensitive to the wider patterns and she wrote a good overview.
31 Because the term “Goods” do not make any distinction between alienable and inalienable articles. See Gregory, C. Gifts and Commodities (Academic Press, 1982).
33 loc.cit. p.105.
34 I am indebted to Chris Gregory’s formulation here, that the quantitative relation demarcates the commodity, while the qualitative relation demarcates the gift. By this simple definition, shells are all gift no part commodity. See Gregory, C. Gifts and Commodities (Academic Press, 1982).
is a commodity.

In Papua New Guinea, however, there are constellations of exchange objects which are inalienable, to a greater or lesser degree. The legendary example is the Kula exchange in the Louisiade Archipelago and region, where objects may be passed on through a series of exchanges and still remain the article of the first possessor. Eventually other like objects are traded for, but to accrue a series of social advantages for acclaim and prestige. We gain insight from the meticulous work of Munn, A. Weiner, Damon and others in the Trobriands, enabling us to see that Kaulong shells have an exchange value, but a different one from commodities. It is not the shells’ comparative value which is central. It is the subjects, the people, who are measuring their renown. The shells are valued, very much so, but for their owner. There is no commodity market for shells. They are gifts.

To understand gifts, we need another paradigm than economics because there is no economic theory of gifts. If gift is reduced to commodity, price is seen as central. However, a gift - certainly in Papua New Guinea - is not a relating of objects, but a relating of subjects. A gift is not given for the object, but for the subject. A gift is a qualitative relation between subjects.

The profile of a gift is an inalienable item, prize-without-price, which is nevertheless “given” for the sake of the qualitative relation between the transactors. This seems to be the general paradigm for Papua New Guinean reciprocity.

This is the first reason that an exchange economy is conceptually different from a cash economy, because of the concept of the gift. Consequently, what is the perceived value of votes given to the Member and money handed out to the voters, for a people more used to ceremonial exchange and barter? What is the implication of contracts with loggers signed by villagers?

One of the various meanings of development in Papua New Guinea is the general notion that there is a constant relatedness between subjects, people; where the relationship between people is missing, there is a gap in the subjectivity of an individual, as a consequence of dysfunctional social relations: exchange was a powerful non-market, human endeavour. Goodale’s central thesis rests right here:

The meaning for which I searched among the Kaulong was the meaning of the culturally constructed category of being human.

---

35 See Fred Damon’s paper in J.and E. Leach op.cit.Ch.12.
36 James Weiner explains how this comes about. See p.33 below for representations of this in the Highlands.
37 op. cit.1995 p.xi.
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

In the sense in which Thomas\textsuperscript{39} indicated, in the myriad activities of Melanesians in New Britain and elsewhere, a single passion may be detected: the desire for a right relation to subjects (people) through the competent use of wealth and prestige items. The fact is that where relationships are broken, Melanesians feel it profoundly. Not surprisingly, there was no currency-exchange for shells among the Kaulong, and certainly not for mokmok. The activity of giving is an institution, and moreover presides over the public sphere: a public institution which affects both the way others see individuals and concomitantly the way each one sees him- or herself. Within Western nations such as Australia, giving is a private affair, perhaps an institution, but not by any means crucial. In the mercantilist, commodity rich North economic epoch, it is trade which is public and anything may be drawn into that alienable sphere.

This is not a classic Marxist apologetic, but a chance to see essential differences in culture; and which differences make for modes of self-presentation and competition that inflect and even confound normative economic development, for the sake of non-market institutions.

The cultural aesthetic inflects, or invades, development initiated largely by government because of a public institution of gift giving. Exchange of shells occurs without reference to the market sphere among the poididuan\textsuperscript{39} classification who are a strongly established kin group among Kaulong people. Nevertheless, the concept of gift as a working notion has not been destroyed by cash. It remains a public institution, and is easily as important as, if not more important than any other public institution.

Pavlides, Holzknecht, Craig and Linda Throop of SIL, and local residents all personally explained to me that traditional practices (dubbed custom, tok pisin kastam) are very strong across the South Coast. Potentially it can rival economic development as will be explained below.

Paul Sillitoe has explained this at length, with regard to misunderstandings outsiders have of Melanesian social processes:

In general all Melanesians mark important social events with an exchange of valuables: they exchange wealth at births, marriages, deaths, settlement of conflicts, religious rituals, and so on.\textsuperscript{40}

\textsuperscript{39} Goodale explained that in their myths "the apical ancestral person was merged with a male or cross-sibling pair who ... gave rise to the group of cognates associated with that place. ... These... lines of descent together encompass the group of cognates who consider themselves as poididuan or closely related kin ("brothers"), sharing a similarity of biogenetic substance not only with each other but also with a place and its resources." \textsuperscript{op.cit.1995} pp.112-113.

\textsuperscript{40} \textsuperscript{op.cit.1979} pp.1-2.
He points out that there may be a wide variety of objects which varies from place to place, but "these cultural variations ... do not hide the fact that exchange constitutes part of the common bedrock upon which all Melanesian societies stand. The fact that the exchange of things is commonplace throughout Melanesia suggests that the approach of this study ... may well provide insights into the fundamental concepts and processes upon which people throughout this part of Oceania have built their way of life". This means that the thrust of this thesis is to produce insights about development for all Melanesia, which comprises four nations, with others containing Melanesians (such as in the Torres Strait). Referring to the many formal studies of PNG and nearby countries, Sillitoe says Malinowski:

seized upon what he called reciprocity as a fundamental principle, and tried to see how it articulated and functioned with other elements to bring order to social life.

It is disconcerting to record that nearly fifty years passed before any more studies appeared which take exchange as their central problem.

On the one hand, to give encourages sociability because to exchange [people] must act considerately toward one another to engender the co-operation necessary for a two-sided transaction. But on the other hand [people] can also compete with one another when giving ...

Sillitoe plainly believes that exchange is the central organising principle of Melanesian societies, and is the fulcrum of social life. This idea needs to be engaged vis-a-vis development, but there are other principles. However, there is one comment that dovetails beautifully with Goodale's depiction of the Kaulong, with regard to shells:

The production of values is only desultory ... It is not the production of values which engages [people], but the time consuming activities of arranging, discussing, viewing, giving and receiving items in exchanges. This is consonant with their social exchange value ... because it is transacting with these items in the socially important exchanges that gives them worth and

---

41 loc.cit.p.2.
42 loc.cit. p.3.
43 loc.cit. pp.5-6.
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

His word “values” here means the economic value-adding of productive efforts of artisans, mainly. This would be apposite to our sense of “economic” value by labour-costs. It should not be confused with social and ideological “values”.

Singing is ubiquitous in Kaulong and people begin singing as infants. Goodale believes that “it is in the song performances that individuals display their knowledge in various categories, choosing what and how much to expose to challenge from others [she compares it to ‘showing your hand’ in poker] - and by so revealing their capabilities, to either gain or lose some degree of prestige and fame” 46. That is, knowledge is transacted for the purpose of ranking among all Kaulong exchangers, and for the purpose of renown. These two are related, since ranking often comes from acts that engender renown 47.

Certain motives, values and goals in life are culturally based; and development may offer ends which give the Kaulong promise of fame. A commitment to that new agenda is needed, unlike at Tabar Island, not too far from New Britain:

Ritualisation was seen as counter-productive to any attempt to integrate Tabar into the cash economy. Ritual ceremonies continue to dominate life to such an extent that one can generalise that Tabar has a limited commitment to development or to the cash economy.48

It is not hard to see why this happens. In the Pasismanua, people sing to gain and maintain identity. In their world view it is intrinsically satisfying. Goodale writes that “formal education of the young in the taxonomies of the physical and social environment is to a large extent encoded in the songs which both list and describe features of the natural world ... By learning to sing at a very early age the young men and women begin to acquire important knowledge of their world”49. If people find enough satisfaction in custom, they are not moved to change. On the other hand, it is apparent that individuals seeking fame will negotiate with outsiders if, again, their values do not inhibit them.

There is quite an important point to be made here: it is known that some peoples

46 op.cit.1995 p.197.
47 loc.cit.p.36
49 op.cit.1995, p.223.
adapted to trade and a modern economy, for example the Tolai in New Britain. There was prior experience among many peoples, such as the Motu and Siassi, with extensive and enduring trade; but among the Kaulong, those further in the bush “traded with the Miu to the west and the Sengseng in the east”, and even those near the coast “traded with the Gimi to the west and with Sengseng and Karore to the east” 51. It means that there is almost no evidence of coastal trade; it was “cross country” trade (which implies that trade across the Island was eminently probable). While certain commodities such as manganese oxide for teeth-blackening moved out of the Pasismanua, Goodale found no evidence that these were important. Chowning does give evidence that the Sengseng traded for desirable items to the coast52.

In any case, Kaulong knew how to trade beyond traditional lands. In the situation of independent PNG, their culture supports venturers who do profitable deals with strangers coming into their borders.

So these young people are actively encouraged to make exchange contacts to establish their renown. This is a clear insight into deals done with rich foreign entrepreneurs, looking for timber. Our mercantilist history may deceive us into thinking about exchange as strictly standardised transaction; whether Kaulong shells can be remotely considered transactable at all seems to be more to the point. The quid pro quo of our standard is a nice double pun for Anglo- Australians, with its allusion to a former currency (“Quid” was the epithet for a pound in English). “I am defining a valuable”, writes Goodale, “as an item whose intrinsic worth is uniquely recalculated at every event in which it changes hands”53. The spectacle is the valuable’s appearance, but the emphasis is on the relation between exchange partners. Our “quid” and their “quid” are differently defined by different contexts. Again, this recapitulates the rhetoric in my Thesis about various meanings - Kaulong “make a quid”, too, but what is its meaning? Much ink has been spilled on the subject of the Maori hao, “the equivalent” and the tohunga 54. The importance of the concept for the argument is that there are a variety of

---

53 Goodale op.cit.p.88, italics mine.
54 See Sahlins, M. Stone Age Economics , 1972; Best, E. “Maori Forest Lore”, Transactions of the New Zealand Institute 1909 Vol.XLII, 433-481; (1954) “Some aspects of Maori Myth and Religion” Dominion Museum Monographs No.1; (1954b) “Spiritual and Mental concepts of the Maori” Dominion Museum Monographs No.2; Thomas op.cit.1991. This is a wide ranging discussion about a sequence of explanations concerning a forest mauri, a vital entity protecting the well being of living things, as told by Tamati Ranapiri to an Aotearoa researcher named Best. Subsequently, it was written up in N.Z.Institute publications in 1909 and was mentioned by Best in Dominion Museum Monographs. The issue at stake was whether there was an economic or a religious transaction involved in the word hau. Sahlins wanted to remove any
possible ways in which money has been apprehended in the Pacific countries.

People give, as it were, to receive. This was the theme of Marcel Mauss’ book *The Gift*, published in response to the work of Malinowski himself. In *The Gift*, Mauss pursued a number of sources, including texts from medieval Europe, to show that there were beliefs about the power of giving that applied to many different cultures. His commentaries have often been disputed, but his acumen in recording was first-rate due to the rigor with which he scrutinised his material. In fact, Mauss emphasised many of his examples as rites, some of which are total prestations in which many kinds of articles are exchanged. This is apposite to the lutung, the “singing in the presence of pigs” which Kaulong perform together as a community. Pigs are raised with a child who designates it as a quasi-brother or sister. Yet it is pigs which may be sacrificed at the end of an all-night “sing-sing”, or lut-a-yu. In a total prestation of the Kaulong, pigs are sacrificed, their owners do not eat them, and the knowledge which people have in life is distilled into songs sung right through the night. To villagers, these are powerful things. Along this seaboard, customary usage is a source of life.

Giving is a personal and political act, performed in public view. The giver, as Mauss pointed out, can be regarded with more apprehension than the receiver, since it is often a consciously aggressive act. The capitulation of locals to outsiders is a relational thing to the locals, but locals may be commoditised, in the view of donors. As Thomas writes, there was/is a “crucial fragmentation of knowledge and interests on both sides, the struggles which always take place within both the metropolitan project … and the indigenous project”.

This is the second main reason that an exchange economy is conceptually distinct from a cash economy. In an exchange economy one becomes prestigious by giving, whereas in a cash economy one becomes great (in essence) by receiving. Maximisation of goods in Melanesia usually leads to redistribution. There is an aesthetic style of giver at the centre of the exchange economy, and not the goods or expectation of return, at the centre.

To give another example, in the Highlands James Weiner described a drawing done by a Southern Highlands informant for Clark, of a man covered in pearl shells
“...so that the man himself seems composed of shells” 58. This, in simple form, is an analogue of the person, and Weiner makes an argument that the completion of the person occurs through the repeated interactivity of locating the movable items, without which there is a loss or deficiency 59. It is another picture of exchange. It yields another image of the quid pro quo (above). “The drawing ‘shows’ that what appears as a single body or single skin” writes Weiner, “is constituted by the replicated and repetitive acts of detachment by other bodies, and that these tokens are themselves detachable and returnable” 60.

Goodale described the display of shells made by the big man Maklun, and the nature of his connaissance of shells and their owners 61. It is not clear whether Kaulong shell exchange is an “embodiment and reembodiment” 62 of either persons, other social actors, or the relationships mediated by shells. It is clear that shells are integral to relationships, and that it is not a semantic triviality to present a picture of a community which thinks that relationships comprise its origins. That is why property may suddenly come into flux in Melanesia; people are not attached to property but to the meaning and invention property brings to relations among people tied by kinship, work, exchange, and desire for fame.

ENVIRONMENT AND TRADITION IN REGIONAL PASISMANUA

There is a preliminary caution to describing villagers’ sensitivity to ecological issues. As Filer writes, “it is difficult to say whether or how these perceptions and evaluations relate to the Western ethics and politics of nature conservation.” 63 It is relatively easy to cite anthropological research at length, and to crusade for ecologically sustainable values on the basis of that research; since Kaulong perceptions may not relate to “conservation”, it is a more sophisticated and balanced research that explores: the details, firstly, of the various meanings, i.e. the perceptions and evaluations of villagers compared to outsiders; secondly, what happens when people with different world views meet. These cautionary remarks aside, there is clearly a rapport between Kaulong and their natural environment.

One of the matters that is proving to be clearly different in the South Coast/Pasismanua situation from plantations such as oil palm, and unlike many projects in Papua New Guinea, is the large amounts of land and hunting and fishing resources

58 op.cit.1995 p.xvii.
60 loc.cit. p.xvii.
61 op.cit.pp.131-134.
62 Weiner op.cit.
63 loc.cit.p.191.
which are still (apparently) available in the midst of logging projects.\(^{64}\) As it was for
many Tolai, no gardening land was lost. What people are developing in the Pasismanua
is large tracts of pristine forest, untapped marine life, and the various people and
cultures that live in the midst of these. In this case, strictly speaking, \textit{no land need be
given up at all}. There are few plantations as yet, and land is inalienable. Other districts
were affected quite differently than Pasismanua. While coffee has been extremely high-
risk as a single export crop from Goroka (and the slump of '92 - '93 devastated small
producers), and while some cash cropping and capital formation leads to land shortage
\(^{65}\), logging can leave some surplus agricultural land and reasonably provide a good
market return in the short term. However, it alters the whole state of the land due to the
ancient growth of the rainforest and its interlocking ecosystem. It is a more direct
annihilation of the land itself through a primary, not secondary, interference.

Since it is not shortage of land that is going to affect the Kaulong, but another
ramification of corporate business activity, the economic, cultural (and aesthetic) effect
of interacting with the forest, it is necessary to ascertain what is the human interaction
with the forest.\(^{66}\)

Firstly, there is very strong seasonal interaction with the forest, with the remote
villages gathering 60\% of their food from the forest, and peri-urban villages or those
bordering a road getting 40\% from the forest\(^{67}\). There are villages quite remote from
resource centres in Papua New Guinea, and they differ in character to village districts
adjacent to the towns, where residents have access to employment, consumer goods and
educational institutions\(^{68}\). Men and women range through the forest while gardenland
remains distinct.

Secondly, both male pigs and dogs are castrated, and Kaulong depend on wild
males to impregnate their bitches and sows. This gives them an additional, ongoing

\(^{64}\) Some informants from the Sepik on the other hand spoke of land shortage at home;
consequently, they were prominent among migrant workers on the multicultural
“blocks” for harvesting oil palm in West New Britain (personal discussions with
community workers and residents, Kapore oil palm blocks).

\(^{65}\) T.S.Epstein \textit{op.cit.} pp.170,173,176.

\(^{66}\) The forest is part of the human habitat. If Kaulong lived in town, that should be called
the environment too. The forest is their habitat, but the ecology of the forest is an
expatriate concept. The indigenous have a view of interrelatedness but it goes far
beyond that which scientists label “ecosystem”. Again, place (\textit{T.Pisin ples, asples place
of origin}) does not have the technical virtuosity of current science. It is just different.
When the word environment is used, ecology is not meant, but an experiential place
mediated by culture and language. Schwartz, in “Systems of areal integration”\textit{\textit{Anthropological Forum}} 1: 56-97 1963, by contrast decided that ecology is the cultural
adaptation to the environment, and not the physical environment itself.

\(^{67}\) Goodale 1995,p.69.

\(^{68}\) A.L.Epstein \textit{op.cit.}1969 pp..35-87.
dependency on the whole forest ecology. The men gain a large part of their self-image from hunting. Though they are thus linked to it, they maintain this core cultural contrast of clearing: forest by making the distinction between animals of the hamlet and those of the forest. They revert to the forest for hunting, and for peace and solace.69

They hunt birds, bats and tree animals with bamboo blow-guns three times the length of a man.70 In many kinds of hunting, they have spells to help them and they call the bats by “hidden names” so as not to bring down a collapse of the limestone caves where bats dwell. They spear fish and trap game birds and cassowaries. The taro spirits are thought to have eels as their pigs, and spells are made to get the spirits to reveal the eels. The close attraction to and commitment to their environment are illustrated by these things.

Among the Sengseng, thirdly, the evidence is overwhelming that the terrific variety in the diet owes much to the nearby forest, with wild yams being gathered year-round, and a variety of fruits and nuts with wild greens.71 Even while clearing a part of the forest for a garden, Kaulong catch many small mammals, snakes, frogs and insects.72 They also get raw materials and medicines from there, including bamboo, lizard skins and vine rope. They believe there are many spirits in sink holes and other places, all over their terrain. Again, Kaulong like solitude and the only really solitary place in village life is in the forest.73 Notwithstanding this, there is a clear distinction between forest and village clearing, and while one can move into the forest to get away from pressures, the forest is seen as non-human.74 There is a concept and tradition that their place is the bi, the hamlet, with its clearing; which is human.

There is an apposite example from the Maenge, some hundred miles east along the coast, who have a sensitivity to the state of the soil and its relation to productivity. (They have some similar rites and practices, for example teeth-blackening.) Indications of this are in Maenge expectations that leaf-fall increases fertility; the blackness of the soil and its contrast with the dryness of the primary forest soil; that certain trees are respected as producing soil fertility (ibid.); that rubbish heaps engender soil fertility; that spots subject to bird droppings make good gardens; and the etymological underpinnings of fertility, as where she writes that “decayed leaves are called lavuna from lavusa, rotten, when speaking of man and trees, or paganingana, a word which

70 loc.cit.p.71.
71 Chowning op. cit.1980,pp.10-11.
72 Goodale op. cit.1995 p.72.
73 loc.cit. p.73.
74 Goodale op. cit.1985,p.231.
76 loc.cit.p.242.
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

illustrates their function. It is derived from a verb *pagani* to give food ... and can be glossed as "food-giver". When Maenge perform the rite to give soul to the taro, Pagani is invoked."Pagani," she writes, "is a mythological character, one of the Masters of the taro and his name is derived from the verb *pagania* which means to give food ..." They are quite familiar with ecological principles although ecology is articulated through the "lenses" of their own linguistic culture.

Human interaction with rainforests has been extensively studied in Borneo, which may provide a useful comparison with the New Guinea example. Brookfield, Potter and Byron took up the issue of the impact of swidden agriculture on the environment. A survey of the literature for the region reveals, for example, a common resentment to shifting cultivators:

Almost a priori the modern forester uses a standard vocabulary on the subject, whether he is a commercial timberman, a government civil servant, or a member of an international organisation. Many soils men use a somewhat similar vocabulary.

The problem with this is that there is a huge range of peoples and practices under the rubric of "swidden", even in Borneo and the Malay Peninsula. Similarly, from place to place swidden practices are more, or less, destructive according to intensiveness and other matters. Nevertheless Brookfield, Potter and Byron point out that "The basis of sustainable shifting cultivation in its pure form is identical with that of a true sustainable forestry. The biomass is allowed to recover ..." In short, normative (pure) shifting cultivation is not "farming" and it requires ten years, at least in Kalimantan, Sarawak and Sabah, for the biomass to spontaneously readjust. It is necessary to look meticulously at "swidden" practices - not lightly called "slash-and-burn" - since criticism of them is sharp in some parts of their world. It is clear, however, that among the Kaulong, two factors are important: that the low population densities made for no pressure on land as far as we know, and that they often moved back to secondary forest and not pristine rainforest. In addition, it is also clear that the gardens

77 ibid.
78 loc.cit.p.247.
79 For this allusion I am indebted to Mantovani in the lectures of the Melanesian Institute cross-cultural Orientation Course, 1994.
80 Brookfield H., Potter L., and Byron, Y. *In place of the forest: Environmental and socio-economic transformation in Borneo and the eastern Malay Peninsula* 1995.
81 Spencer in Brookfield et.al. loc.cit.p.113.
82 loc.cit. pp.114 ff.
83 loc.cit.p.115.
84 loc.cit.p.120.
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

become reused and that half of new gardens do not touch primary forest.\textsuperscript{85}

Within used swidden sites, there are a number of other things which happen. One is simply to leave the shrubs or trees which will later provide food. A whole Kaulong village site, a \textit{bi}, remains a place to where people may return and enjoy the fruits of what earlier generations planned. Thus there are more intensively used sites, in the midst of rainforest which, as far as we know, remains pristine.

Clarke and Thaman\textsuperscript{86} give another key insight into the intensiveness of villagers' gardening. They found that, all over Papua New Guinea, deliberate cultivation of useful trees occurs in the midst of the rainforest. One response to this is to surmise that nothing is pristine! A more reasonable view is that stable, long-term rainforest has probably never been done apart from human society since primordial times. In fact, forests may have been supported by humans. The authors conclude that agroforestry has been a part of traditional economy for a long time. In their study from 1993, Clarke and Thaman "found 419 agroforestry species, almost all of which are present in Melanesia, that are planted or protected as integral components of agricultural systems ... Throughout Melanesia, the inhabitants have created intensely humanised landscapes"\textsuperscript{87}. The result of deforestation is that "an immense store of empirical knowledge about traditional agroforestry species and systems begins to be lost"\textsuperscript{88}. They go on to point out that "These practices and the trees used ... entail a humanisation, taming, or 'agriculturalisation' of the forest in conjunction with gardening short-term crops. Many of the practices are sophisticated, productive, and require little labour" \textsuperscript{89}. This is the importance of stories of the many stands of individual trees near Kaulong hamlets and the various inheritance laws that go with village life (see above this section for some details). It would in many cases be counter-productive to deal with land as a patrimony or usufructuary rights as a corporate matter; due credit goes to these ancient cultures who have built-in, value-added agroforestry. In Figure 1 opposite, the various species-groups are described in order to stress the widespread practices of forestry in rural Papua New Guinea (note the many ecological types included).

In sum, Kaulong hamlet dwellers are intensely aware of the forest, believing in the presence of spirits there. They depend on it and visit it often. "The Kaulong truly love the forest; it is full of an abundance of food found in and under the deep shade of

\textsuperscript{85} Primary growth and secondary growth gardens are about equal. It takes nine months of ongoing clearing to establish a garden.


\textsuperscript{87} loc.cit. 1997 p.123.

\textsuperscript{88} loc.cit.p.124.

\textsuperscript{89} loc.cit.p.127.
Strand forest (a mix of useful trees, including coastal Pandanus, Terminalia, Casuarina, Cordia, Thespesia, Calophyllum, Hibiscus and coconut)

Mangrove

Coconut

Agroforestry/orchard tree garden with a variety of species that, depending on region, might include Pandanus, Breadfruit, Gnetum, Tahitian chestnut, fig species, Canarium nuts, Polynesian ki-apple, Mapa apple, perfume trees, and other useful plants.

Enhanced fallow (Casuarina, Dodonaea, Brachilia, Canarium, Albizia, and others)

Savanna and grassland with other tilled garden beds of yams, sweet potato, manioc, American taro

Polycultural shifting garden of bananas, yams, sweet potato, aroids, manioc (tapioca, cassava), sugar cane, Hibiscus and amaranth spinach, and a large variety of other crops.

High-elevation forest with useful trees such as nut Pandanus (PNG). Habitat for useful wildlife.

Figure 1. Schematic representation of Pacific Island humanized landscapes. (Adapted from Barrau 1958, 1961.)

trees and in cool streams. Men and women both hunt and travel alone for long distances between hamlets.  

**LIFE IN MELANESIA**

The notion of *potunus*, complete humanity, becomes more resonant as we recall the size of the rainforest and the village isolation. Since hamlets are rather small and somewhat dispersed over the terrain, the backdrop of any village is dominated by the forest; but this is not where people become human. Goodale has emphasised the enormousness of the forest, precisely in the context of clearings. It has an effect on the cultural icons of fire, clearing, forest and singing. The pigs represent their ambivalent relationship to the forest. Though pigs are included in some activities, pigs’ tusks symbolise the wildness of the forest. “...key symbols,” writes Goodale, “...serve to remind Kaulong that the ‘humanness’ of the person is an achieved, not a given, condition of life.” There are general insights to be given here. Two sources of information on rainforests and people are the human geographers, and the ethnographers. Brookfield et al. have shown that swidden agriculture is “true sustainable forestry” on the basis of long study of south east Asian rainforests. Mary MacDonald has done many years ethnography, and worked with the Melanesian Institute. The work of the Institute is largely based on the relation between village world views and new cultures. Both these sources led the study into the problem of responses. That is why this section articulates people’s expectations. Expectations of Melanesians are often specific, and predictable.

The proceeding section also relies on some detailed ethnography, and the theory that arose from that research experience. Certain kinds of information could not be found anywhere else, and these anthropologists operated (and operate) at the height of their intellectual discipline. Theodore Schwartz developed a notion of interactive culture. James and Achsah Carrier, also working in Manus islands archipelago, arrived at a similar type of theory developing it further. Chris Gosden and Christina Pavlides, this time looking at the Arawe region (among other places), showed evidence that prehistoric West New Britain was part of an enormous network of traders with some common traits. The long discourse of all these things has been composed to disclose a radically different view of “isolated” or “remote” places like the Pasismanua. This

---

90 Goodale op.cit.1995 p.252.
91 op.cit.1980,p.141.
92 Kaulong allow tuskers to grow huge semi spiral tusks as valuable articles.
93 op.cit.1995 p.246.
94 op.cit.
synthesis will give a truncated form of the original research, necessarily, but offers reliable guidelines for uncertain times in PNG.

Kaulong people gain their sense of identity not from being naturally integrated into the forest, but in opposition to it. This is carefully documented by Goodale, who depicts the opposed “forest” and “clearing” as being at the heart of Kaulong activity. From this perspective, people cast the spells on other beings in their environment, from the position, or *incumbency*, as it were, of being more than animal. They are affected by the spirit world because they are more than animal. That is, some of the things that Europeans call “ecosystem”, are included as part of their worldview; but their worldview does not necessarily operate upon a scientific ethical system.

It is different.

So, in terms of generalising from one culture, if science is on the periphery (at best) of local thought, *what is the worldview, the cultural aesthetic, that holds the forest in awe, but wants human separation from the forest environment, and some transcendence?* First, what is the particular view? Goodale contrasts their view of the magnificent forest setting with their endeavour to become human:

Place (*bi-* ) is envisioned as a very small clearing surrounded by a threatening and ever encroaching forest, a clearing requiring constant human activity to maintain, else humanity itself is lost in the forested world.

In the same article she pointed out their first goal in life, to “surmount life’s greatest dilemma, how to achieve both self-development, fame and fortune in this world, and immortality in the future...”  

If they are not Melanesian ecologists, what is a general worldview of “P.N.G. ways”? If it is not ecology that people respect, what do they respect? What is the world view that marginalises science but has sensitivity to the environment? That must mediate the peril of the forest with a number of powerful cultural symbols? Mary McDonald is forthright on this “other way”:

... the magic, healing practices, and sorcery which have been the subject of so many ethnographic works on Melanesia are best seen as expressions of religious systems which focus primarily on life and participation in the power

---


*ibid.*
of life. Magic ... forges links between various aspects of human experience, by operating in a symbolic, not in a scientific manner. [certain images] evoke cleansing and reconstruction in the life of the patient and the community...

Life is experienced as cosmic and as communal in Melanesian cultures. Life is experienced in different relationships, particularly in the relationships to the land, to the ancestors, and to other persons. People are aware of the area in which they live, of their garden land, their fishing area, the forests where they hunt, their mountains and rivers, their fighting zones, and so on. Many groups have beliefs about spirits, called Masalai in Pidgin which inhabit and guard these areas. It is essential that people maintain the right relationship with the land if they are to obtain life ... from it, and so there are hunting and gardening rituals and various taboos to safeguard this relationship.98

McDonald’s comments sum up well some significant features of the Kaulong and Pasismanua. We see that Kaulong villagers connect with the physical ecosystem symbolically and not only by practical horticulture, according to Jane Goodale. Through the various descriptions that Goodale and others have given, it can be seen that local people experience relationships with their social, physical and spiritual environment. Kaulong and other Melanesian people would seem to strongly work to formulas and rigid methods. Their relations to the environment are specific, mediated by linguistic conceptualisations, and positive. (Relationships are often prescribed, and these relationships are posited as an appropriate means to an end.99) “Exchange is the language of politics”, says Goodale; and both men and women participate to gain renown100. It is a common enough goal described in the ethnographic literature101.

The pomidan (female pomidan is polamit) is the entrepreneur who gains formal honour among his or her neighbours, and this may be very strong for some women,
especially those who are themselves married to a pomidan. S/he organises more, travels more, is shown more respect; [men] may wear dreadlocks and red ochre on their face; above all they can provide more and can shame anyone with a great valuable that cannot possibly be matched, they take risks and succeed, and they appear strong and confident. They are the epitomy of the fame that all Kaulong desire in some measure.

These cultural goals are also the means for Life; cultural goals are perceived as being in inseparable union with environmental goals. The means to Life are seen as prescribed and axiomatic to lifestyle and that means particular actions are invested with tambu or sacrosanction. This is simply because of the worldview of life, as MacDonald explained so succinctly.

Another consideration is this whole matter of comparability. The question must be raised, “What do practices in Arawe-style culture have to do with general trends in Papua New Guinea development and lifestyle?” If the data from Pasismanua is not relevant to a much wider region, then study of Kaulong development is another village study, small in scope. The answer to this question registers whether regional study of the Western Pacific is viable, whether the only source of describing macro-economics is solely economic discourse; and we are able to find answers to the question from many of the published authors on the region.

Chowning has mentioned, in her large book on Melanesia, and in her article on acculturation, that it is difficult to generalise about Melanesian cultures. There is great variety even on the island of New Britain. However, she writes also that “The Sengseng and their neighbours share a behavioural complex that differs overall, though not in every detail, from those previously described for other parts of Papua New Guinea.” Again, she writes, “It seems probable that their [Arawe regional] culture occupied the whole western end of New Britain ... Their distinctive material culture includes artificial deformation of skulls; the use of blow-guns for hunting; wealth embodied in pierced stone disks, pearl shells, and pigs with circular tusks; tripartite shields decorated with carved spirals; and male dress with thick rolls of barkcloth around the waist...” The “KG” (Kandrian Gloucester) Project also decided to treat the District, all the way to the western Cape, as an administrative unit. (Of course, the Pasismanua complex of cultures and even the Gloucester to Gasmata [south west] district is distinct from Kaliai, Kove and Bariai on the north coast.)

104 An Introduction to the Peoples and Cultures of Melanesia 2nd Ed 1977, see Ch.1; and (1969) “Recent acculturation between tribes in PNG” JPac Hist 4, 27-40.
105 op.cit.1980,p.29.
106 ibid.
107 Hide op.cit.1990, p.4.
Filer assumes that there are common features to Melanesian lifestyles, in his article for *The Bougainville Crisis*. He compares resource remuneration “packages” of Bougainville with any other resource “packages” for mining in PNG, because of common reactions to them by Melanesian peoples. He also warns that “great care must always be exercised in the selection of local case studies to illustrate any general proposition about the relationship between customary landowners and their natural resources”. There is fairly good evidence that certain matters can be extrapolated to the region of the south west, and many other matters often apply to the whole country. There are viable comparisons with previous development studies. Three or four intensive studies, by Ben Finney, and Bill and Scarlett Epstein, comprise earlier attempts to blend anthropology and economics in the way that Hinchcliffe suggested. Scarlett Epstein’s work exemplifies the rigour with which such an approach can be accomplished, and helps to answer the question, “Can one group’s development be compared with another’s?” Kavanamur’s two articles in this section address that question.

Filer also writes that anthropologists “have written extensively ... about the relationship between ‘tradition’ and ‘development’, though few have given equal attention to both these topics”. The present study fits into the long progression of studies on culture, but refocusses development studies through the appraisal of culture. Through this, the approach used here will describe relatively untried options for development. And the response of poor villagers to entrepreneurial loggers, to governments, and to profoundly ethical NGOs is the same, with only a few exceptions. Thus there is evidence for common features right across PNG. The need to find such common features is raised by Keith Hinchcliffe, who says that “an effort must be made to transform the essentially micro perspective of this work to a macro

---

108 op.cit. 1990, pp. 84-94.
110 *The New Guinean Entrepreneurs* New Guinea Research Bull., No.27, N.G.Research Unit (ANU, Canberra, 1969);
112 Above, see introductory section to Chapter Two.
113 ibid.
114 The V. Rev. Bishop Michael Hough, of Kimbe, W.N.B.P., and other members of his church, assured me that those who put up any kind of objection to loggers in their Diocese were few - about two small districts.
level” 115, and he calls the ramifications of this, “aggregated anthropology” 116. Mantovani makes use of an aggregated anthropology. He has posited a Melanesian worldview, which he calls “biocosmic”117. It comprises unity with the spirit world, relationships through exchange of tangible articles, and responsibility for all events. This means that if something happens in nature or someone gets sick, then the community ascribes misfortune or illness to a rupture in relationships. Also, a general concept of black-skin as against white-skin race was described in detail by Lattas from his ten month stay among the bush Kaliai of north W.N.B.P. 118, and apart from his writings may well be under-reported. It fits in with the burgeoning nationalism in PNG.

All these comments imply that there is a certain kind of common culture across Papua New Guinea. The Counts’ 119 warnings about the Kaliai, and for that matter Andrew Lattas’ comments on bush-Kaliai culture, may be taken as some sort of indication as to what happens when the transnational economy meets a non market exchange system. Mistakes made in administration took the same basic form across the Provinces, and this also seems to indicate a common world view. Ergo, if all local cultures were so different, there would not logically be such uniformity in administrative aberrations; and the aberrations are almost without fail the same. There is, therefore, some similarity between all Melanesian cultures who have strong ties with customary law.

Naturally enough, the meeting of tradition with forces for change has been experienced in Papua New Guinea before! Kavanamur120, Ben Finney121, Bill Epstein, and T.Scarlett Epstein122 have been forerunners of various “feasibility studies” and other organised approaches to this problem; they are in turn the intellectual descendants of much Africanist work 123, the Institute of African and Oriental Studies, and the Schools of Cultural Anthropology on the North American Continent and elsewhere.

115 op.cit.p. 122.
116 loc. cit. p. 124.
117 See Mantovani, E. ed. An Introduction to Melanesian Religions Point Series No.6 (Goroka, The Melanesian Institute, 1984).
118 Lattas,A in Oceania Vol.63 No.1 (1992). He describes it as an ideology founded on myth; an objective appraisal of hereditary skin tone had little to do with it.
119 op. cit.
121 The New Guinean Entrepreneurs op.cit.
122Epstein, A.L., and Epstein, T.S. op.cits.
123 This was especially so for W.G.Groves who studied the “responsible government” approach of the British Empire, and the work of Africanists who had to devolve imperial governance to subject governments. See Groves, W.G. Native Ed and Culture Contact in New Guinea (OUP/ Melbourne Uni.Press, 1936, reprinted 1977)
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

Kavanamur outlined the various attempts that the Papua New Guinea Government made to promote the development of its peoples, and how each phase gave each its distinct meaning to the term. The meaning of development was situational, and meaning has itself evolved. Ben Finney showed how Bena Bena, Siane and others adapted to the circumstance of commercial coffee-growing, which advanced the fortunes of those who could build up capital through increasing their status as “big men”. A.L. Epstein extensively covered the ability of the Tolai of New Britain to adapt to plantation work, in this case among the Matupi, and work in the greater metropolitan, because their local resources enabled them to maintain the exchanges to which they were accustomed; especially they could depend on access to rich land in their traditional homelands of Matupi Island and the near environs. This was well supported by the advantage in trade from their micro-ecological area, the island. Scarlett Epstein showed how a traditional way of life needed to be harmoniously related to capital formation, stating that “the rate of social change will be inversely related to the ease with which new cash earning activities can be combined with the traditional way of life” or that change occurs without hindrance when wage labour is adapted to custom. Increasingly, corporate ownership was undermined by the need of one person or family to use capital assets during a period of “investment trial”. Notably, she cites parallels with African peoples whose strengths in the long run were transport and retail trading. These are areas in which Tolai, among whom she lived, are known to excel.

There is thus a basis for studying Pasismanua, with a consequent and reasonable expectation that it is relevant to New Britain, certainly mainland New Guinea, and to wherever people have the “biocosmic” worldview in Melanesia. “Thus a Melanesian religious system,” writes Darrel Whiteman, “must be understood in the light of this absolute value of pursuing abundant life.” Again, he points out that “When this is in focus, then the many religious activities of Melanesians make sense...” These things often do not have an exegesis by locals. Whiteman explains that Melanesians pursue life “concretely more than they do so philosophically or theologically”. That is, the islanders of Melanesia want empirical confirmation of rightness, of life. The venture comes under various names; from the 1880s one of the popular debates has been over the word mana, which was seen as a power that is conveyed by a medium, resulting in excellence. The main ingredient is its power to manifest.

125 T.S. Epstein op.cit.1968, p.169.
126 loc.cit.p.171.
127 loc.cit.p.71,169.
128 In Mantovani op.cit.p.96.
129 In Mantovani op.cit.p.96.
130 Codrington, R.M. “Religious Beliefs and practices in Melanesia” Journal of the
The concept of mana is an explanation of the difference between a stone used magically that “works” and an ordinary stone: of the difference between a medicinal potion that cures the patient and a potion that does not ... between a fisherman who brings home a successful catch and one who returns home empty-handed.131

The late Roger Keesing thought of it as being “efficacious, potent, successful, true” 132, and took Codrington’s view to task. Whatever we decide about it, mana describes the embeddedness of spiritual matters, or the embeddedness of values. And whatever we intuit as motivations or goals of the Kaulong in the New Era, the global economy, one thing is for sure: they will take notice of tangible rewards and have few doubts that it is the best (right ?) thing to do. The literature is crystal clear on this response of Melanesians. Their bio-cosmic attitude means that daily life is continuous with and not separate from religious activities – “bio” applying to all life.

In fact, it is interesting that the problem could have been predicted a decade or two ago, if the right consultation had been made. There is evidence that the entry of money into a system of exchanges has altered Papua New Guineans’ consciousness and money has become the sole object of exchanges, rather than relationships and the gutpela sindaun or “good life”. Money alone cannot sustain such a community. Outcomes from such an exchange cannot meet expectations. Previously, the strongest consciousness was to promote and regulate relationships. Exchange protocol still exists, but relationships in many instances are weakened rather than strengthened. The desire is there but not always the capacity 133.

The reason for describing their polarised view of forest clearing as inhuman:human, is that to them it is linked to the quest for midan (pomidan as explained above) status134. It is part of the same complex. Goodale is quite explicit about this focus, which she said she gained from long interaction with Kaulong in their own idioms:

The forest is controlled by spirits and wild things, while the hamlet clearing is entirely human-made and maintained. ... it can be dangerous, or it can be beautiful. The forest is where a person can be alone, in peace and silence. ... In

131 Whiteman op.cit., p.99.
132 ibid.
133 See Schoell 1994 and comments in the conclusion to the thesis.
134 See Goodale op.cit.1995, pp.247-250. Extreme terminology is used, as representing strong feelings of the Kaulong.
contrast, the hamlet clearing is where all activity that defines humanness takes place...

...The contrast between forest and clearing can be fully understood only if one accepts the Kaulong idea that being non-human (animal-like) is the natural state of people.\textsuperscript{135}

While the Western response is to look for other reasons, the village people's response is the simple proof that something works. In that case, if that were to happen, it is likely that in their view no more explanation would be needed, should clearance of pristine rainforest put cash in hand.

It is a difference.

This view is taken by Whiteman who explains that the "strong sensing" dimension of their being enters into all spheres of life, whether it is a development project, a new health centre, a new pastoral approach, etc., Melanesians want to see the results.\textsuperscript{136} For another example, there has been much discussion about the mok mok stones originating in the Alimbit River area\textsuperscript{137}; but their attraction would seem to lie in this very manifestation of power, that something will result from having and trading them, such that they are necessary in exchanges associated with marriage, and indicate the sanction of manslaughter\textsuperscript{138}; and these are both very powerful non-verbal statements.

The guidelines for Kaulong behaviour may allow for things which would not be on expatriates' agendas, things which Kaulong and others will do without a qualm. Added to this, as Goodale points out, "What is reflected in the exchange system is the independence and autonomy of the individual over anything resembling a social order. The self-developing Kaulong typically expresses little concern with any larger aggregate of people beyond a personal egocentric network of exchange relationships"\textsuperscript{139}. This is such a striking statement, it was included as part of the introduction to this study. Some people would see a more communitarian picture of locals, with the "men's houses" and "women's houses" in many cultures of P.N.G., such as we saw in West New Britain during the Melanesian Institute study, or such as was described of the Huli and many other Highlands societies\textsuperscript{140}, and the significance of siblingship and quasi-siblingship. In my research among Melanesian people, there is a belief in the larger network of individuals. However, there is more than one setting where the autonomy of individuals is important, and strongly independent people are absorbed by the system.

\textsuperscript{135} Goodale loc.cit. pp.251-252.  
\textsuperscript{136} op.cit.p.100, italics mine.  
\textsuperscript{138} Goodale op.cit.1995, p.89.  
\textsuperscript{139} op.cit.1995 p.88.  
\textsuperscript{140} Allen,M.\textit{Male cults and secret initiations in Melanesia} (Melbourne U.P.,1967)
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

The system is sometimes termed a teleonomy, where matters work out according to a pattern but neither the participants nor indeed anyone else has an intention to make it so.¹⁴¹

Such a teleonomy is at work across New Britain, both East and West. Large companies are offering lump sums to locals, who have been waiting fifty years for European style goods to trickle down from Government. The loggers don’t make them wait: they step onto the coral beach, Kina in fist.

The modus operandi of many Kaulong may be seen through Theodore Schwartz’ analysis of the Admiralty Islands group, in Anthropological Forum, 1963. Schwartz’s paper seemed to indicate that few regulatory mechanisms operate to stop certain big men. Schwartz posited a whole system of areal integration, or an "areal culture"¹⁴². Such a culture is without government and therefore can be termed a teleonomy, the most accurate and elegant notion of pre-colonial island systems; and this is an important discovery. One of the simple answers to questions about locals’ acquiescence is that exchange matters are not internally well-monitored.

AREAL CULTURES

In areal cultures, also, there is limited access to differential resources, and small ethnic groups operate within a nexus linked by trade relations. This nexus may be seen as the focus of study, within a district context. The distinct ethnicity was not based on language¹⁴³. The reason that this is compared to Pasismanua is that an areal integration is not kinship based, but (according to Schwartz) embedded in entrepreneurial activities over a wide area, i.e. areally based. Certain specialisations are a key to understanding the “culture”; any micro-ecology differentiates itself from other micro-ecologies; specialisation of production [or read procurement] is another factor making for distinct residential groups; and specialisation of access to people mitigates for “one-way” exchanges. The specialisations make for integration with no trace of a sovereign ruling body, or of a group identity as a whole.

Comparing briefly to Pasismanua, Pavlides found that exchanges between Arawe and Kaulong, Arawe and Kandrian, for example, were much more frequent than exchanges between Arawe and many peoples surrounding them.¹⁴⁴. Closeness to a

¹⁴² This is not a "culture area", such as that used by ethno-archaeologists. It is also not spelt the same as its homophone, "aerial", meaning to do with the air or transmitted through it.
¹⁴³ Schwartz op.cit. p.23.
¹⁴⁴ op.cit. 1988 p.65, 68.
trading partner was not a strong priority. The trade was specific, for certain goods unavailable from neighbours. In other words, specialisation of access played a part in exchanges across south western New Britain.

Nevertheless, this “Arawe regional culture” worked to the satisfaction of Melanesians living here. One might say that it was purpose-driven, and this is the significance: Arawe want specialised goods, not comestibles from the adjacent people. Therefore this was a similar system to Manus, an areal culture. Again, the malu bark belts come more from Kaulong (to Arawe Islands, almost 100 kilometres away!) than anywhere else, although they can be obtained “from almost any village in the Arawes region” 145. A relationship seems to be behind these things; and despite Goodale’s silence on other trade, it is easy to see that from the Kandrian region pigs, dogs, and dogs-teeth necklaces come. These are in turn traded with Siassi as valued items 146. It may well be that the malu trade was part of an arrangement whereby Arawe could procure mokmok, but only close inquiry would verify that.

In fact, the warlike relations between districts of the Admiralties prevented stronger ties; groups were inherently fissile, and this tendency was balanced by what Schwartz depicted as “integration”. In earlier days, in any case, no other kind of stability over time and space was possible, in this schema of Theodore Schwartz 147. His conclusion was that specialisation “provided the basis for a complex and all-pervading transactional nexus integrating, although not uniting, the archipelago and all its subdivisions” 148. He was writing about the Admiralty Islands, Manus and Dobu and others as an archipelago, but it also allows the possibility that smaller groups such as the Kaulong bi / hamlet in their own distinct region were part of a trading nexus.

The kinship system of Kaulong, which had little depth in genealogies, bears this out. It seems be generated through an ancestral cross-sibling pair 149, of no more than about five generations in depth. This compares well with the Manus areal cultures. There were small groups in a hamlet, or bi; members very commonly shifted. Similarly to Manus, “the underlying reason for [shifting residence] is conflict over shared resources and rights” 150. It is possible to show how insecurity is an inherent part of the complex symbol that comprises a bi. Goodale writes of the origin stories:

... a single male or a pair of cross-sex siblings emerged to begin what are referred to in tok pisin as the lain ... The first action of the ancestral male, in
the myth, is always to select and clear a piece of ground and thereby create a 
bi, a place. The preferred choice for a bi clearing is on the top or on a shoulder 
of a ridge, with a steep approach on three sides. A ficus tree is planted in the 
centre of the clearing if one is not already growing. When it grows tall, the 
ficus will serve as a defensive position in time of attack: women and children 
climb high into the tangle of aerial roots; while men, also in the tree branches, 
hurl spears down onto their enemies from their superior position.\footnote{65}

All across the Pasismanua there was fluid affiliation with cognates in dispersed 
hamlets. This was a viable ecological adaption and Goodale stated that gardens seem to 
be an unlimited good\footnote{152}, meaning there was no pressure on land. Schwartz thought that 
the Manus systems of areal integration were an important example of ecological 
adaptation. The Kaulong hamlet system is therefore a balanced system of forest usage 
which depends on dispersion of human population over wide areas. At least, Goodale 
appears to support the view that garden-land was an unlimited good\footnote{153}, and Schwartz 
was explicit that areal cultures integrated differential resources with widely dispersed 
groups\footnote{154}. Whether there were other factors because of the impact of German and 
Australian colonisation, we cannot easily say without further data.

The bilineal “kindred” inheritance\footnote{155} aids the fluidity, giving a number of options 
for residence and garden to many individuals. This means that mother or father hand on 
the heritage, and it implicates the whole extended family group of mother or father, 
potentially. A kindred system has been formally described as presenting \footnote{156} every family 
with a number of possibilities of affiliation from which to choose, generating “such 
fluidity in social alliance that structurally clean-cut or bounded units cannot be 
discerned.”\footnote{156} The hamlet is not merely a residence but an irreducible symbol of 
humanity and ethnic identity\footnote{157}. Fluidity and autonomy, but not isolation, mark out such 
groups\footnote{158}.

Matters work out, but it is not exactly the participants’ intentions that make it 
work out. That is the meaning of the word, “teleonomy”. Whereas a teleology is a 
designed outcome integral to its being, a teleonomy is an unintended outcome,

nonetheless integral to its being.

Gosden and Pavlides point out the evidence for wider trade relations in prehistory, concluding that “the Arawes can be seen as the point of junction between the Vitiaz Strait system and the trading systems of the south coast of West New Britain” \(^{159}\). The Arawes are still seen as currently having few relations with the somewhat distant Kaiong, especially of the interior ... except for the mokmok stone-categories, which are vital for bride price, according to the authors; and the other items which may support the mokmok trade. According to Schwartz’ model, such a participation may be an ineradicable part of the pattern, but not clear until the breadth of the system is acknowledged. He writes that “…I am not arguing for homogeneity of Melanesia with respect to integrative systems, but only for extensive and recurrent similarity across an environmental range as wide as the area affords” \(^{160}\). The environmental range is in this case Pasismanua, the terrain in the rainshadow of the main mountain range and containing the much-discussed rainforests; and Arawe Islands across to Siasisi who extended at least to Sio (north coast mainland).

A good summary of earlier trade was written by Chowning, who pointed out the significance of the smaller tambu shells and a road or trade-route across the Island north to south \(^{161}\). Chowning has said that “interior Sengseng greatly desired a number of objects available only on or near the coast, and a great deal of trade proceeded between the coast and the interior” \(^{162}\). In 1978, Sengseng remembered using stone axes, and still used obsidian for tattoos in the sixties, and these were not current in the rest of New Britain. While there were few economic necessities for trade in some parts of New Britain, there were certainly highly desirable objects for ceremonial or customary purposes. Ceremonial and other valued items caused interrelations between ethnic groups. It seems to have been occurring for centuries, maybe longer. Arawe/Gasmata/Siasisi has been closely examined as a “region” by Gosden and Pavlides, because they see the ocean as a connective environment rather than an isolating one. This applies to inland regions also, insofar as “mainland and island sites thus form two different aspects of one system, rather than two separate systems in connection…” \(^{163}\). Marriage is the ecological determinant of Pasismanua and Arawe relations, since mokmoks are integral

\(^{160}\) op.cit.p.59.
\(^{161}\) op.cit.1978. T.G.Harding’s Voyagers of the Vitiaz Straits... 1967 supports this work very well.
\(^{162}\) loc.cit.p.297.
\(^{163}\) Gosden, C. “Prehistoric social landscapes of the Arawe islands, West New Britain, PNG” Archaeology in Oceania Vol.24 No.3 1989, p.53.
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

to internal marriage exchange and consequently to cultural adaptation\textsuperscript{164} - this adaptation is to "an environmental range as wide as the area affords"\textsuperscript{165}. As Gosden and Pavlides write:

Here there has been tremendous conservatism in the areas with which exchange has been conducted, the sorts of items exchanged and the rituals in which exchanged items play a major role. It may well be that the overall structure of contact between people along the south coast of New Britain together with areas to the west, and the ritual life connected with it, has helped negotiate the changes brought about by colonialism.\textsuperscript{166}

Gosden and Pavlides state further that the Lapita Complex "may provide evidence of one super-community of immense scope stretching from island Papua New Guinea out to Tonga and Samoa and this was made a community through continual sea movements"\textsuperscript{167}, and that "similarities [in cultural artefacts] are maintained through time by contemporary changes in widely spread regions". Schwartz had cited Sahlins and Service's sequence of types of organisation in the Pacific. These include "dispersed networks" such as Manus, secondly unranked groups with a horizontally structured network, with little ecological dependence and with strong exchange principles, thirdly a hierarchical network sometimes called a ramage, and fourthly councils that form a monolithic political institution such as in traditional Samoa. His conclusion was that there was no "higher" and "lower" stage of social evolution. Jonathan Friedman and Kasja Ekholm are more blunt in their conclusion, that the " 'band-tribe chiefdom-state' schema [of anthropologists and archaeologists] was built up out of the ethnographic data of a colonized periphery"\textsuperscript{168}. As Friedman put it:

We have employed the term "regional system" because the processes of social reproduction in such systems are inter-societal. This implies that the

\textsuperscript{164} c.f. Pavlides op.cit.1988 p.69.
\textsuperscript{165} Schwartz above,op.cit.
\textsuperscript{166} op.cit.p.168. While the work done by Gosden, Pavlides and others continues to open up new vision for Pacific studies and archaeological anthropology, this writer wishes to acknowledge a system which had its roots in a culture which was in many ways similar to that which exists in south coast peoples today. No claim is made as to how to go about archaeological work in West New Britain; but as Gosden and Pavlides state, what is remarkable is the stability and depth (in time) of ceremonial usage among Kaulong and nearby ethnic groups.
\textsuperscript{167} op.cit.p. 168.
\textsuperscript{168} Ekholm, K. and Friedman, J. "Towards a global anthropology", in Friedman, J. and Ekholm, K. History and underdevelopment, p.64.
explanatory models must also be global. In order to understand the different ways in which specific areas have been transformed in the process of Western expansion, it is necessary ultimately to understand the regional transformational processes that precede and become articulated to the world system.\(^{169}\)

This puts the matter of dispersed settlements, areal cultures and customary matters in a different light altogether: these social groups may be in resistance to western forms. Alternatively, these social groups may be assisted in their conservatism by wealth coming from colonisers or traders from Western economies\(^{170}\). Either way, academics who pursue this approach hold that "primitive" and "tribal" societies are made primitive or tribal by the fact that capitalism dominates them. This was either through delayed social evolution, in the imperialist's view, that left them "savage", or through depictions of the noble primitives who were close to nature\(^{171}\).

What is notable about these researchers, attempting to look at matters on a wider, even global, social scale, was that, to them, primitiveness and the ("exotic") culture that went with it were a direct and axiomatic result of development. To them underdevelopment is paradoxically the result of development.

An areal culture makes development an alternative, not an axiom. Dispersed hamlets of acephalous societies should be taken as an intelligent response, that is, a valid ecological determinant. Kaulong are the way they are, for very good reasons, having had an integrative system beyond the grasp of economists with instrumentalist world views. As Vandana Shiva writes, "Conservation of biodiversity, therefore, involves the conservation of cultural diversity and a plurality of knowledge traditions. This plurality, in turn, is ecologically necessary for survival in times of rapid change and accelerated breakdown"\(^{172}\). Schwartz had showed that relations between different "ethnicities" were incomprehensible without the concept of a viable areal culture; Vandana Shiva showed that local communities are pitted against commerce, by the most basic paradigms\(^{173}\), that of local communities' biodiversity against global

---

170 Ekholm and Friedman give an example of this type of thing, in the Mekeo of Papua's relation to the Capital of PNG. loc.cit.p.65. I observe that considerable interactive study would be needed on the Mekeo to confirm or deny their suggestions.
171 loc.cit.p. 63.
173 loc.cit.p.120. Some aspects of Shiva's renunciation of globalisation are supported by this evidence of areal cultures, in Gosden and Pavlides op.cit.; however, other aspects, such as the total control of reproduction by commerce, do not fit with the research from
commercial uniformity. To her, trouble begins when interactive ethnic groups - like Pasismanua cultures - become organised by global commerce rather than self-organised.

The meaning of development as social improvement is challenged; it is challenged by those who see free trade as further colonisation, of the “South” by the “North”. The areal culture of West New Britain provides a context where the “deals” done between villagers and loggers are colonisation - in Shiva’s view: for Shiva, development is biogenetic colonisation. Areal cultures were ecologically sound, and logging could be interrupting this in two ways: by the homogenisation of vast diversity into secondary-growth, and by transformation of ceremonies into cash transactions.

James Carrier outlines what an articulation of the Manus system into modern times would be. He offers a fuller picture of an interactive Manus culture by describing the articulation of the village with the region. Articulation means that any village is linked to larger social, political and economic orders. His main contention is that locals do not operate in isolation and although outsiders may describe social progression/change, they rarely say what it is that locals do become. Like Thomas, he says that the trend in previous research was that “it assumes that the only consequence of Western influence worthy of notice is Westernisation” He emphasises that some aspects of life on the island of Ponam “remained relatively stable ... in a setting that was itself undergoing substantial change”. He cites Marx’s comment that capitalism makes a “world after its own image”, and says that in P.N.G. it has proven otherwise. In fact he goes on to say that such imagined encroachment of the West in fact takes “a form reflecting the dominant elements of village life, kinship and exchange”. In Shiva’s “third world” villages people are presumed to be on the one hand vulnerable to commercialisation, or on the other to be “left out” of developmental benefits.

By contrast, what marks out the Carriers’ studies is emphasis on the “blend” of old and new in PNG, a type of “localisation” - this being an objective of so many development projects - that has already occurred among locals, and which has caused change according to the preferences of PNG villagers. Unfortunately, this would mean that some of the difficulties of development must be put squarely at the feet of the villagers themselves, who are active participants in the process.

PNG. Nevertheless, the speed at which logging occurs in the Pasismanua shows that there must be extensive damage not just to forests but to biodiversity.

174 Carrier, J. “Approaches to articulation”, in Carrier, J. ed. History and tradition in Melanesian anthropology p.117
175 Entangled Objects op.cit. 1991.
176 loc.cit p.130.
177 loc.cits., pp.135, 138.
178 ibid.
179 op.cit.1997.
Values enter this story from a number of sources; kin, exchange and trade, individual renown, gender-sensitivity, and the very self or identity, the biocosmic outlook of Kaulong, and their own form of learning; another major source is that of the very cash economy linked to metropolitan life and democratic government; a third source is the Christian churches. With all the discussion about “values” and “meaning”, the statement of the Africanist Raph Carmen seems crucial, that “One of the primary tasks of the development ethicist will consist, therefore, of putting meaning back into development”\textsuperscript{180}, and again, that development “is a concept and an enterprise which is couched in human values. Those values cannot be reduced to the level of subsistence...”\textsuperscript{181}.

The perspectives of the last few sections revealed two associated values in Melanesia: mana or dynamic success for individuals; and the biocosmic grasp of existence. Compatible with these values in Melanesia is a conceptualisation of an inter-ethnic, regional system of integration which is enormously important when considering the ways of life and organisation prior to colonialism. Exchange is integral to Kaulong way of life, and there is some evidence that Kaulong advanced with a clear self-conscious view of their own destiny\textsuperscript{182}.

What has happened, then, that “development” is not a dynamic enough force in Pasismanua?

The answers to these questions will put a vibrant, interactive village community at the centre of development. There are two views that can give a pre-organiser and offer modes of understanding development. The first is on the community. The second perspective is on the cultivation of self-determination. These two views will be linked to the broader, interactive picture already given of Pasismanua.

THE COMMUNITY

The first concern is the notion of community. A recent paper by Larmour cites Elinor Ostrom’s examination of self management. Ostrom dealt with the management of resources and avoided the polarisation into centrality and privatisation\textsuperscript{183}. This means that there is not merely “business” or the market, and Government (or “the State”). If the community is involved in governance but is not acknowledged, then the community can be having an effect which is not traceable and may even eclipse government plans.


\textsuperscript{181} loc.cit.p.7.

\textsuperscript{182} Pearl shells actually increased exponentially in number due to outworkers who could obtain them away from home, Goodale op.cit. 1995.

\textsuperscript{183} Larmour op.cit.1996 p.5.
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

This turns out to be often the case in Papua New Guinea. The state *per se* need not be at the centre of resource management, according to her view, and Larmour points out that there are extrapolations here for Pacific countries. If there is a strong community base of management, "in some circumstances the best thing a weak state can do is keep out of the way" 184.

Which circumstances? Larmour uses the concept of "order" in society, and says that governance may be more than government direction, and may include "shared norms" and economic order in "market transactions"185. If there are thus official and unofficial actors, it may be that a weak state may govern effectively by the right mix, and this is Larmour's point. The circumstances in which self management occurs best are called "design principles" and are (1) to have clearly defined boundaries; (2) Rules for resource use to suit local conditions; (3) Participation in collective decisions; (4) Monitoring; (5) Graduated sanctions; (6) Conflict resolution mechanisms; (7) Government recognises users rights to organise186.

This section offers a few reliable guidelines for uncertain times in PNG, especially in the context of logging. There are ethnographic narratives involved in the explanation. Theory of programme development are in United nations and Food and Agriculture organisation publications187, but in this study a major source of theory is from ethnographic informants. This source has proven to be as reliable and challenging as any U.N. publication. Implementation of programmes is another aspect that must be addressed. AusAID had data for this, and the New Organic Law of PNG will be integrally involved in implementation. Reliability is the key note for erratic events in forestry.

Collaboration between many parties188 seems to apply here: self management has actually been tried in Papua New Guinea, in terms of the Timber Rights Purchase (TRP) Areas. Although these TRPs were subject to the Government supposedly negotiating with loggers, the Forestry (Private Dealings) Act 1971 gave landowners or landholders right of application to deal with loggers directly. After the Barnett Inquiry and the exposure of corruption, unsustainable logging, and elitism in the dispersion of funds or poor infrastructural support, 1987-1989, there was acrimonious debate; and things got worse before they got better. Post-1994, anomalous concessions were again made to

---

184 loc.cit.p.6
186 Ostrom 1990 p.90, in Larmour ibid.
188 See Brown and Holzknecht, op.cit.
logging companies from highest levels of government.

So how do the principles of International Studies apply to the relatively small region of Pasismanua in context of the single and measurable industry of timber products? This is a reason for having the present Thesis and must be soberly addressed.

Though the boundaries (Principle 1) are already clear in custom, usually, and participation is built into the Act (3), there is evidence that the community is not truly represented\(^\text{189}\). Principles 2 (local conditions) and 4 (proper monitoring) are in the plan but not being actively implemented in South Coast districts because of lack of funds, and possibly political will (personal communication with aid workers currently in PNG). There is little evidence of conflict resolution mechanisms (Principal 6) ... but they are all there once custom can be given the executive power of local governance. Since Ostrom’s design is for situations “in which the role of the state is particularly attenuated, but not completely absent”\(^\text{190}\), it may indeed apply to P.N.G.‘s regions.

Holzknecht states that “logging companies have functioned as ‘quasi-governments’ in certain areas, virtually a law unto themselves”\(^\text{191}\), and the “indirect rule”\(^\text{192}\) of colonial times was something P.N.G. saw much of. Therefore by ensuring the monitoring of ILG’s and local practices, there is hope, at least initially. There would appear to be a lot of work, first.

GOVERNANCE AND THE COMMUNITY

Larmour’s paper was in support of a general research theme to survey the relative importance of the nation-state, compared to market and community orders\(^\text{193}\). As he and many others have noted, the State was generally absent from Melanesia. Already given are many details of the kind of order by community and “market” or exchange forms of governance (not government)\(^\text{194}\). The nature of this was movement, in a series of relations which allowed for the weak link between institutions. Therefore, do PNG forms of social, political and economic organisation have dynamism in the broad economy? Is it the hamlet, the village, the pearl-shell? The data is inconclusive on the subject.

\(^{189}\) loc.cit.p.12.
\(^{190}\) In Larmour op.cit. 1996/1, “Research on governance in weak states...”, pp.6-7.
\(^{192}\) Larmour op.cit p.3.
\(^{193}\) loc.cit.p.7.
\(^{194}\) This is Larmour’s concept, of a tripartite interaction between state, community, and market institutions.
However it is true that all “productive resources of a place are shared equally by those who maintain their affiliation through visitation and care of a place.” There is an apical group that serves as a redistributor of certain kinds of wealth. The passage from *To sing with pigs is human*... is appropriate in full:

Kinsmen who belong to a place-affiliated group call each other *poididuan* and characteristically initiate and maintain *potupan* exchanges concerned with the equal distribution of shares of the common heritage. [What is common heritage outside the clearing? *Potupan* comprises the individual matching of shells for affirmation or reaffirmation of the said group.] Those ancestral places where the apical ancestor emerged from the ground or tree ... are far more than mere points of reference. They symbolise the core meaning of kinship and of being. Coming from the same place is the essence of sharing an identity not only with other people, but also with all the nonhuman resources of the place as well. There are strong emotional ties to the ancestral places, their associated trees, and the house-site mounds indicating the burial place of past affiliates ... A Kaulong usually traces and maintains a relationship with affiliates of no more than three or four ancestral places. Rarely does a Kaulong maintain or even know of all the ancestral places he or she could claim through grandparents.\(^{195}\)

The strong ties and the nonhuman resources give a hint that a collective sense of commons exists. Moreover, *poididuan* have a culture where sharing is mandatory - this is in the description of child-rearing, too. It is unclear whether this means that they will actually share moneys or just be open to potential challenge because of the sharing ethic. The other statement is that these same cognates exchange competitively, and these items are nonshared, such as “pigs and other personally created items\(^{196}\).

Do locals want these people to have the power to represent them? If so, who are other people to stop them?” The real question here is whether locals will know how to share responsibility and act cohesively, and whether they will want to. That they evince a certain individualism is attested to by Goodale, by Sillitoe and others. Goodale also describes the heart of kinship and being, the *poididuan* who actually have a *corporate* responsibility and operate largely on a *corporate* basis.

What was explained of Larmour’s “governance” approach (above) is based on a simple premise, that it “extends a simple opposition between ‘states’ and ‘markets’ by introducing a third ‘community’ term, and noticing that any actual organisation contains


a mix of all three." The question remains whether Melanesian communities resemble what we call communities or the amorphous thing dubbed "community" in much recent literature. Susan Kenny, in organising community activities for many years, describes the active and conservative liens of modern Australian notions:

When identified as the site of people's power, community can be seen to be a harbinger of radicalism. Community development thus becomes synonymous with community activism. In contrast, community is sometimes viewed as a milieu which is conservative, isolated and parochial. All these contributions identify community as a place where something happens, a locality or a neighbourhood.

In this approach the community is a site where relations of power are constructed and controlled.198

These are true for P.N.G. villages, insofar as there are great changes for many reasons, and people are ready to change; and because there is definable community governance in what they call Custom. It is this focus, on the constructed relations of power in hamlets and villages and clans of Melanesians, that needs to be examined a bit more carefully when planning and reviewing development. Community power is the germ of meaning. This is a powerful research tool for appraising governance across the Melanesian island states.

As some examples, a town in Papua New Guinea is literally more, or less, urban, depending on circumstances. The lovely town of Goroka, in the midst of the Asaro Valley in the Highlands, stops for a time to respect the dead Big Man, not for a day but for maybe a week. The highway in its western shopping area is blocked and all commerce stopped, not merely by strikes, but by a clan, one of whose youngsters was accused of theft and assaulted. A mentally disabled woman at the market is not just teased by children, but pursued at a run by a dozen people, watched by an appreciative crowd of three hundred adults, who laugh and hoot a falsetto "Hieu!" in perfect unison when she turns and fights. A religious brother with long hair and beard stands on his land rover arms akimbo, and a boy looks up the hill at him and cries "Jesus i kam pinis!" ("Jesus has come"), and all the people rush toward the spectacle.

All true stories. But what they keep reminding us of is that there is a community force in Papua New Guinea that transcends and therefore can override all forms of alien

197 "Models of Governance and development administration" (Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies Discussion Paper 96/2, ANU, see p. 8.
governance. The community force is intimately linked to culture. It is weakly linked to what Larmour (above) called the State. Maintaining public order is involved in all of these matters; moreover, these events involved relationships. If a weak state can harness this with any integrity, there remains the possibility of a powerful tool of governance. Though these are not governance issues in western countries, they illustrate the different attitude of PNG villagers towards public issues. In each case, the issues are decided in public, by a community. The community is executive in nature. Administrators ignore this at their peril.

The character of community life forms relations between “states” and “markets”.

Therefore in the meanings of “Development”, the New Organic Law is seen as an insightful and rather exciting denouement of change versus conservation in Papua New Guinea. There is little description of Government administration here; that comes better from Administrative College (Adcol) of P.N.G. The topic of setting up Government, an important topic, is scrupulously avoided in deference to revealing that rather obscured view, the view of the community cultivating its place in modern Papua New Guinea.

Will the new Organic Law work in terms of Orstrom’s (above) “design principles”? If we go through the points, in terms of my discussion, we find:

1. The provincial level administration includes members of local government; the corollary is that the National Member also takes a part in the Provincial Assembly; the boundaries of what is local and what, National jurisdiction, are blurred. Orstrom was writing about resource areas and may have been limiting her idea to a set of natural features and their management. Yet all these levels would seem to have some say in what happened to the clearly defined boundaries of the great forest ecosystem. The Provincial and therefore all levels of Government have a persona mixta.

2. Suiting resource use to local conditions can be negotiated through the new “Organic” link. But practices relevant to human survival will only occur when the rate and selectiveness of logging are sustainable, that is, when the merchantable forest resource has a “cutting cycle of 40 years” 199. In addition the limestone base and the shallow condition of soil superimposed through the rainforest in the Pasismanua will not take swathes of trees being cut, due to the chronically heavy rainfall. This is especially so near any ravines, the feeders to major rivers, and the major watercourses themselves. This is in fact a major point of the literature on logging the rainforests, as the NGO’s in Melanesian countries are acutely aware 200. The terrain here is crucial.

3. The participation angle is central to the writings of Holzknecht over the last six years or so 201, and was mentioned by Hide 202. We have to see how the representative

199 Taylor op.cit.1996 p.5. The length of the cycle is hotly debated.
process is implemented in W.N.B. and how Incorporated Land Groups deal with that, first. My own dealings with people from this area in 1994 gave me the impression that the allegiance of some people was clearly to loggers and they were using their influence to find acceptance for their logging patrons (and this is not unacceptable in a fully traditional code of ethics).

4. Monitoring can easily be done by Kaulong villagers, when supported, trained, and also subsidised appropriately for forest maintenance as a national source of both wealth and pride. The Treasury needs to open and deploy funds not liberally, but circumspectly and with advice from the local government and NGOs. Locals in any case handle local conditions of weather, travel, and malaria (!) better than any people could.

5. Sanctions do not seem to be graduated partly because the nature of some unscrupulous people led to an all-or-nothing stance on the part of the Minister. Few sanctions are implemented at the moment, according to workers who have recently come from that area. The chance exists for rigorous reform under the new Organic process, but this process will not be in place until up to 1997.

6. Conflict resolution is being attempted by the consensus embodied in the new tripartite system, of Organic Law\(^\text{203}\); but there appear to be few pragmatic measures being acted on in the Incorporated Land Groups. The conflict resolution skills of Melanesians and the skill of Kaulong in consensus is excellent. I am persuaded by their literature and way of life that they can be a most powerful regional force in this with more consensus than most European societies can muster. This would be more so with locals’ input into real representative government of the country.

7. The P.N.G. government can do little but capitulate to the users’ rights to organise. A Government Department, of Provincial and Village Affairs, was set up for this very purpose, and still was not enough to quell the discontent with villagers who felt neglected. All know that they ignore local organisations to their peril - and Bougainville is the epitomy of this centralisation maladministration.\(^\text{204}\)

The conclusion is that there are ways of handling self-management, according to

\(^{202}\text{op.cit. 1990.}\)

\(^{203}\text{The New organic law provides for a National Government who administer national policies and monitor implementation at all levels; Provincial Assemblies, non-elected, drawn from the ranks of Local and National Governments, with restricted responsibilities; Local Governments who are elected, who deliver services and contribute variously to the Provincial Assemblies, as well as undertaking district planning and budgeting functions. (AusAID data from Development Officer, Australian High Commission, Port Moresby, 29 Nov 1996).}\)

\(^{204}\text{Maladministration is a way of explaining a cultural syndrome, which I later explain as a confusion of appearance and event. See Chapter Four for the confusion of many points of view about development.}\)
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

Ostrom’s Principles, with many specific problems to tackle. Yet among the many writings on biodiversity, sustainable development and logging economics, the villagers’ point of view is less often published, whether in nationals’ or expatriates’ accounts of administration. Could this bear a direct relation to the fact that management of forests has been an unmitigated debacle?

A DEVELOPMENT DEBATE

There is one main point to be made, by way of conclusion. This is that there is a movement for self-determination, and in which the word “cultivation” should be operative. In line with this, Papua New Guinea ways need to be sustainable if the Fifth Directive Principle, that of “Papua New Guinea ways” is to be effected. The question that begs to be asked is according to the following reasoning: if they don’t sustain their forests, their school- and road-maintenance, their biodiversity and their democratic vision, then who else can do so and who has the RIGHT to do so? Is anyone else able or qualified in the highly specific environment? Taylor attempted to used interventionist rhetoric to aggressively critique the right of the state to take over customary rights. The U.N. Declaration of Indigenous Peoples Rights (1993) also contains several articles asserting the right of self-management of resources, in a similar vein to Ostrom.

Among the commentators on self-determination are the Africanists, some of whom have cultivated the philosophy after centuries of colonial and world market-influence. One of the more recent expositors of this is Raff Carmen, who states that “no equivalent term [‘development’] exists in the conceptual software of the cultures to which the model is being transferred”. He again refers to this in some of his broader summing up:

Interest in cultural aspects of development does not stop at revealing some religious or sociological traits relating to custom or folklore. It demands the recognition of the existence of, and the entering into dialogue with, countless manifestations of culture - or a coming together of ‘symbolic sites’. ... The West ... has to face up to the new Third World generations with a ‘decolonised’ mind and the realisation that, in order to be acceptable and accepted, it is necessary to become literate in the culture, and the language, of

205 op.cit.1996.
206 op.cit.
207 op.cit.1996 p.41.
PEOPLES OF PASISMANUA AND DEVELOPMENT

‘the other’.208

It is a well devised point although there is more to be said about third world views. The “colonised” aren’t generally interested in the history composed by colonisers and will give a spirited account of themselves at the first opportunity. In Australia, the burgeoning of Aboriginal history is testimony to this fact, and the Policy of Self Determination for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people has been its corollary. Nicholas Thomas’ discussion added to this by pointing out the conscious promotion of custom (kastom) by Islanders when they compared themselves to whites (papalagi, etc.). This is close to Carrier’s constant theme of the articulation within a region of any group’s culture and dialogue - when they interact with aliens, the boundary is renegotiated to exclude aliens. Again, summatively, Jane Goodale in the above quote set out on the path of learning “underlying culturally constructed concepts” 209. Therefore she and Chowning both pointed out the inflation of shell-wealth in Pasismanua because of villagers collecting pearl-shells when they worked in Manus. Indeed pearl-shells would have been at least as big a drawcard as wages. The researchers mentioned are all setting out to learn and apply culture to the economic and political situation. Must assistance be given this way?

Carmen poses the question, is Aid “development”? With major and lethal poverty debilitating half the world, is Aid an evolving tool in humanitarian work, or an enormous blunder? What is development? That is the major argument of Carmen’s recent book. He answers it in the following way:

[Development] is a concept and enterprise which is couched in human values. Those values cannot be reduced to the level of subsistence ... Development is not just about the necessities of life, nor about the diversity of choice of information and goods, but about wisdom and the good life.210

One person with practical knowledge of working with small groups in Melanesia was Samson Nua. Working with a pastoral teaching group in the Eastern Highlands, there was much discussion and theory about how to engage villagers in a relevant way. He espoused five or six principles of small-group programme development. These he had devised himself in his pastoral work mostly in highland towns. He is an initiated Simbu man with a powerful centred spirituality and a fervor for his own country211. The

209 To sing with pigs is human p.5.
210 op.cit.p.7.
211 This man also had a christian spirituality - in the context of Melanesian cultures that
principles arise in other critiques of third world countries. Samson Nua had them all in his head as a result of his interaction with villages and settlements and parishes, and intensive dialogue with expat. and national pastors.

Of the principles he espoused, the foremost is luksave, which means basically to understand, to investigate something, to observe. It is necessary to adjust programmes and to assess needs and for other reasons. He wrote that it "helps me as a pastoral worker working in different places, organizations, languages, cultures, and a people as a whole ... Well, it is a very difficult stage, but as we [proceed] with the programme which already existed, that helps us as a pastoral worker from one stage to another. Because some of the new ideas may be homologous to what already existed, the existing programme may help implement the new ideas." This is a most important point. It not only uses the principle of gradation (step-by-step), it also refers directly to context-sensitivity.

Lynne Hansen-Strain wrote about the extreme "field dependence" of Pacific Islanders. This means that many of them find any learning outside their usual way of life (meaning literacy, for some of them) extremely difficult; and this is more so for girls than for boys. That is the point made by Mr. Sam. It certainly could be integral to development plans in Papua New Guinea. He followed this point up by immediately speaking of stap wantaim na go wantaim, what may be termed the "with them" principle (literally, stay with them and go with them). By this he meant that a person attempting to start projects should stay with people, and really participate in lifestyle. He emphasised that the process takes time and it takes a lot of circumspection. Thus he meant that you "go" with them conceptually, intuitively. Stage one luksave is still in operation and stage two isn't a serial process but an increase in complexity for needs-assessment.

The principles are integrated with each other and each new level evokes not only another relation between concepts, but also a series of questions. Because of the nature of this approach, each question answered will be development; will be implemented the moment an answer comes. Once the groundwork has been done, you look at the programme. Your own skills/ expertise have a part to play, but without luksave you have not the basis for conceptual rapport with local people.

A third principle is to use their own vernacular; their language, and their expressions or regional concepts. This is very important in development of a village, and it has been applied here to the Kaulong, in order to show that principle. Another

---

accepted christianity - since he was a Franciscan candidate, working as a catechist.

212 Personal note of explanation, interview May 1994.

principle is to start small, and let it grow from modest foundations. There is another
point to all this: how much has been done on this score with development
organisations? What is the status of research and preparation in any discipline or
government department?

Firstly, there is consultation and negotiation by almost every mining company and
oil palm company. Secondly, there have been general moves since 1910 to understand
people, and most notable are government anthropologists, for example the high profile
Francis Edgar Williams in Papua 214 or the robust work of Kroeber in America.
E.W.P.Chinnery went through Pasismanua in the 1920s and J.A.Todd in the 1930s. Carmen
fulminates against aid organisers, but he forgets several traditions of study or
shows little awareness of their significance. One of these is Anthropology, and in
particular the “participant observation” method. Carmen is looking for another source of
authority, and stating that indigenous are that source. Maurice Bloch wrote the
apologetic for anthropologists, and explained that information in the field is embedded
in activity and all the senses. An ethnographer comes to a community, not as an expert
but as a child. 216

This fact has been poorly understood, and when taken in, it has not been well
retained by academics. In an age when patronising discourse flooded and floods the
literature and cultural icons, putting Pacific peoples into passive stereotypes, many
ethnographers (and not only them) enter a locale on the locals’ terms; learn the morphs
of their speech; learn culture from stage zero; and frequently become the butt of jokes.
The mode is the message; the ethnographer appeared to them to be interested in them, in
their values. So an anthropologist cannot just process information. S/he records, and
s/he interviews; but s/he experiences as well. Bloch talked about the imitation or
mimicry that a participant observer needed to do 217. There are “domains of knowledge”
which a child, or anthropologist, learns without any teacher. S/he unpacks such
knowledge en route and must keep unpacking. The problem is to define the concept

214 The famous example is “The Vailala Madness” and Other Essays, Schwimmer E.,
Editor (London, Hurst, 1976).
215 op.cits.
216 This was specifically and precisely the point made by the famous Anthropologist
Victor Turner in his paper Chihamba, the White Spirit. Manchester: Manchester
symbols he wrote that “we must be prepared to accept the fruits of simple wisdom with
grateful and not try to reduce them to their chemical constituents, thereby destroying
their essential qualities as fruits, and their virtue as food” (p.92). It is an apposite
principle to the whole experience of living in another culture than your own. Analysis
can occur (and he analysed ritual) but we “borrow” the lens of the other’s culture - no
instant wisdom, since the object of study is also the means of study! 217 1991 p.189.
from a constant mingling of information and sensation. The discipline remains poorly recognised because the object of study is also the instrument of study, and this reflexive subtlety gains little credence outside the social sciences, mainly due to a positivistic epistemology.

Culture involves a kind of repertoire and the study of it is a study of linked and interwebbed domains of knowing. Ethnography is all context.

Raff Carmen takes some meaningful initiatives mainly from Africa and arrives at conclusions. In between the two, he has skipped a fecund area of study, like most academics. There has been consciousness about “the other” for several decades especially in religious studies and anthropology. It appeared in spasms in linguistics, since the publication of the Sapir-Whorf hypothesis several decades ago. The theory, which Edward Sapir and Benjamin Whorf worked at independently of each other218, is basically that a language, its concepts and culture that arise co-eval with language, is at base untranslatable. We can never translate another culture into our own terms; or can only transfer some facets into our own culture. It was used in Linguistics and Anthropology for forty years. If we want to look at the world of the other, it behooves us to at least consider the work of those who made a profession out of it subject to (high and rigorous) standards.

What is needed in self-determination, in development, is an increase in complexity for holistic needs assessment. Holzknecht has outlined these approaches in several papers. The point of my Simbu friend’s teaching is that there needs to be a soaking up of the ways in which a people do things; and that even new material can be incorporated into the village if the method is used. Nothing is going to be simple, but it could be a responsive process. To respond, one has to listen. One kibung (community discussion) for a couple of nights will not suffice; a flurry of activity by experts does not usually amount to much in the long run - the point of Carmen’s Chapter on “Maldevelopment”. There are training mechanisms which have often been found to work. Nevertheless, this training appears to be partial, leaving a truncated form of development.

There is a further reason for the close analysis and for allowing local actors to initiate development; we would not, as outsiders, be getting a feel for village-life because we wanted to understand tradition. No. We would use this method in almost

218 Whorf, B. Language, thought and reality: selected papers Carroll, J.B. ed. New York, Wiley, 1956; Sapir, E. Language: an introduction to the study of speech. New york; Harcourt, Brace and World, 1921. For example, Sapir stated that “The worlds in which different societies live are distinct worlds, not the same world with different labels attached”. Quoted in Lyons, J. Introduction to theoretical linguistics 1968, p.432. Lyons called this “cultural overlap”, and disputed the point. loc.cit. Section 9.4.7, especially saying that “True bilingualism implies the assimilation of two cultures".
any situation to see what is conservative, what is changing, what is consciously modern or innovative, maybe what is dysfunctional. This is precisely the situation in even very remote areas of P.N.G. - a point made by the pastoral worker referred to. That is because people are not isolated, even in remote areas like the Pasismanua. They have developed links across Melanesia in the not-so-distant past. It remains to be seen whether such experiences and traditions encourage them to think beyond the hamlet or the district, to the nation and more.

Systemically, then, Melanesians like the Kaulong taro cultivators have no impediments to self-management; or to being educated for "development"; but sometimes, "it is not so much what you do but the way that you do it", as the saying goes. Noting such orientation of expats. as the "Peace Corps", from USAID, who stay in a village for many weeks as training, or the increasing presence of the National Volunteers, some steps have been made to increase the holistic complexity and develop rapport with communities. However, in this Chapter the emphasis was less on "they need", and more on "we need".

That is only part of the story. While there is certainly no systemic obstacle to self-management in this district, the evidence reveals ethical obstacles to success in self-management. It is a very important point and risks accusations of patronisation and value-judgements. We must have a way of speaking about the confusion and moral maelstrom which prevails in this sector. This includes letters with intensely personal tone written by nationals to PNG newspapers, the statements and discussions of locals and administrators, and the censure by environmentalists of the aggressive loggers and their backers. The variations-approach has now been completed, focussing on ethnic culture and world view. It did not stay with purely compatible views or a "synopsis". On the contrary, something of a tableau will be provided in the following pages; an exciting story but one which will (narrowly) focus on some major actors who generate, deflect or complicate development. The point is they appear publically as developers and this does make it complicated. Such a tableau is worth creating since it puts the research community in a better position to explore deeper insights into the Fifth Directive Principle (Papua New Guinea Forms...), at least in a West New Britain context.
CHAPTER THREE: EDUCATION

Jill Grant, writing of development in the westernmost tip of New Britain, pointed out that “the benefits of economic growth are not necessarily evenly distributed within society, but are often directed by, and for, elites”. Though this is not necessarily so for all places in Papua New Guinea, it has certain implications. For one thing, when the sums of money or extent of benefits are great, the contrast between haves and have-nots is extreme. This appeared to be so for Bougainville. For another, the situation helps to create acute competition for the upcoming young people. The object of the competition is to cultivate a patron who is in a position of influence; this is not unlike service traditionally given to senior relatives in order to be considered favourably for inheritance. Since the population is growing at an accelerating rate, due largely to lowered infant mortality and higher life expectancy, and since the population is weighted very heavily to people below thirty years of age, the perceived feelings of deprivation are much more acute than formerly.

The point of writing a chapter on “education” is to observe the changes it brings about for the better, and to offer insights into how traditional education and induction into Papua New Guinea communities worked in the past, and still work now. This chapter thus shows a problem rather than a programme for reform. Though the problem of “rascals” (highway robbers) is well advertised in PNG, that problem has not been systemically linked to other “youth” problems. They have been linked to class formation and corruption, but seldom to resource management crises. It is posited in the following section that lack of opportunities for school leavers (or school truants) exacerbates real, and imputed, deprivation. The deprivation is social as well as economic. The survey of young Melanesians by the Melanesian Institute from 1992 to came on the heels of a massive and prodigal Programme of national youth funding. The organisers of the target group did not handle disbursement matters well at all, and the rascals re-emerged too often. Data compiled here indicates the economic roots of youth’s desire for independence.

A simple observation, from all this, is that certain innovations and programmes were never implemented or not fully implemented. There were found to be a surfeit of sound ideas within PNG especially in “education”. These are cited. Programme inertia and inability to work in unison seem to indicate a lack of community participation. The wider community appears to be a good index of what is really happening in schools. The inextricable blend of culture and education that school children face (in all countries) thus led to a variety of sources, some from a single cultural group, others from national appraisals. The impressions thus formed may not be traced to one or two sources and are not the work of a commission for schools, or an NGO, for example. An attempt is made to discern broad “changes” in the society, and the “outlook” of the younger generations. The attempted social

1 op.cit.1987 p.57.
2 Filer op.cit.1990.
psychology of village “youth” came as a result of trying to get a broad picture. In some ways, that appraisal fails without a greater clinical training. This reservation aside, a summation of all these impressions came from hundreds of hours’ sitting with and listening to youth in structured and unstructured interviews.³

The customary view of children is almost uniformly that the more, the better - this is partly because of the view of prosperity, *gutpela sindaun*. It is not only economic, since there are strong parent-child bonds, as I observed them. However, the usefulness of obedient children is not overlooked. As Grant succinctly states, “Since children can help in the gardens and in other activities after they reach the age of 7 or 8, their parents perceive them as a productive asset”⁴. This is in the context of widely held attitudes that children are of the greatest importance in marriage. It has become widely known, since the Melanesian Institute survey in the ‘eighties, that very few marriages are considered authentic without children. In fact, it was considered an untrue marriage by 54% overall, and this figure is much higher in the Highlands ⁵.

There are large numbers of poorly trained, partially literate youth whose options for work and recreation are poor. This was researched by Morauta, and was represented in a later anthology ⁶. Because both school and work is often not local, there is a syndrome of people feeling isolated in areas remote from the capitals. As can be seen, this is now second- or third-generation, and has become integral to a youth culture with its gaze on the metropolitan or cosmopolitan lifestyle.

This is a key to a narrative on “PNG culture”. The influx of youths, both males and females, in towns is are largely seen as a problem. Strange as it may seem, the corollary is where, due usually to school, youth are absent from the village for crucial ceremonies and also do not build up relationships of trust and obligation with older people. These obligations are normative custom. Among Kilenge, this was having a bad effect on relationships and causing youth to miss essential ceremonies involving living grandparents and ancestors, known as *naulum* ceremonies ⁷. In addition, the system more often than not meant that locals viewed education as exotic. This is reported on by the Carriers at Ponam in Manus Province, where formal education had to be actively incorporated into local culture. Because it was not an integral part of island lifestyle, there was an effort in the village to ensure that education could be used by them and not become counter-productive ⁸. James

³ This student has been trained to do so. Much of the conversations were conducted in the vernacular, *Tok Pisin* or English. The results were corroborated by the official survey and other source material cited here.
⁴ op.cit.p.256.
and Achsah Carrier describe with great acumen the *activity* of locals; an alien education, as well as the phenomenon of youth consciously hungering for the excitement of town life, is the theme for this Chapter. Zelenietz and Grant 9, too, tell of how education in the best traditions of Australian and European schooling have been devalued to the Kilenge way of thinking, in contrast to the enthusiasm of earlier days. It is this context which is crucial, when reports are made of loggers offering infrastructure projects and sums of money to enterprising individuals. In fact, Kandrian appeared to have had fewer resources than most High Schools up until the 'nineties 10. It exacerbates the general isolation from mainstream development and its benefits.

The now better-informed youth of PNG are aware of this remoteness from resources. In the Melanesian Institute survey of 1992-3, the response to the question "What kind of learning do you want from school to help you to settle down well [for a good life] ?" was very strongly for a business, trade, or practically oriented education (Question A.2 Education section). This was more so from males than from females. While Literacy was seen as very useful from the school, the foremost thing which was in demand was Trade and Vocational Education (Question A.3). This was significantly more so for West New Britain than elsewhere. The implication is clear: that with many more younger people grasping the concept of health and development issues, there is an urgent need to develop projects at the level of the village, projects which capitalise on their skills, knowledge and understanding. This was true for the many youth with whom we worked in the Eastern Highlands, and Mr. Homambo Duwana of the Eastern Highlands Provincial Rehabilitation Committee stated plainly that their respect for other people would only be raised when they had self-respect and useful, paid work. He worked with "rascals" (bandits) to produce vegetables and chickens for the markets, in what must be some of the most remote places in the world.

A simple formulation of these dilemmas is to say that, so far, relative poverty is integral to development in Papua New Guinea. Churches and community workers have for several years been made aware of the relationship of youth unrest (and therefore deep unrest in villages overall) to development and the modernisation of Papua New Guinea. It was this growing awareness that led to cries for a comprehensive inquiry into youth with emphasis on gender issues 11. The disturbance among youth is obvious to everyone living in or who visits Papua New Guinea for any longer period. Yangpela Didiman (young farmers) movement, the Village Services Division of the Dept. Provincial Affairs, and the PNG Trust12 most especially, put this disturbance at the centre of their work. They

---

9 op. cit. 1986.
11 See Zocca op. cit.
12 "Papua New Guinea Integral Human Development Trust (PNG Trust)" operates specifically on the basis of empowerment espoused by Paulo Freire, with a goal of social awareness (personal communication from Information officer of PNG Trust).
relate youth activities to the village elders and thus to the whole community. There is a very interesting comment made by Alphonse Aime on the whole fallacy of calling a group "youth" and dealing with it in isolation from the village community. Coming from a Melanesian person who is aware of local custom, this seems an important idea. Neither those under thirty, or the elders, are central, but the processes by which they relate to each other.

When the relationships are weakened by the processes being interrupted, atrophied, or omitted, the structure of society changes and is often undermined. "Development" is linked to the set of communities and cultures that implement its goals. While goals are very often made by advisers with few connections to the district (at least few connections recognised by villagers), the community is an authentic source of development, as defined by the First Directive Principle of the Constitution's Preamble, namely, that "Every person should be dynamically involved in the process of freeing himself or herself from every form of domination or oppression so that each man and woman will have the opportunity to develop as a whole person in relation with others".

A thorough revamp of Further and Vocational Education sections has been called for by authors of the Education Sector Report 14. In the section on Non Formal Education, a previous system of Community Secondary Education was called for by Naihuwo Ahai of the National Research Institute. The inclusion of villages, especially in remote districts, is imperative; with a design for increasing the quantity and quality of females' education 15. In a very early attempt in the late 'forties to the early 'fifties the Director of Education, W.G. (Bill) Groves began to set in place a slower-paced educational development with regional centres. These centres were resource centres with sensitivity to local cultures, and the emphasis on schools was so low that Paul Hasluck, coming into power in the Menzies Government, discontinued the programme and dismissed Groves in 1958, with the support of the Territory Administrator. At that point, there was a decrease in complexity and even a winding up of comprehensive needs assessment. This is a term that distils Mr. Sam's principles of luk-save (insight), and of stap wantaim na go wantaim (context sensitivity through participant observation), which have already been explained 16. In the strong government-approach of the 'fifties, it was these two principles that were lacking from administration of the Territories. Instead of generating depth of insight, there was an increase in the number of schools - a quantitative conclusion. A ramification of this was the large number of academically qualified graduates (but few technically qualified) who distilled into the large Public Service of PNG. For two decades and more, this has been the great employment base for nationals who graduate.

People in Pasismanua competing with each other for reliable and lucrative positions are

---

15 Vulliamy op.cit.
forced antagonists in this general tableau. The attrition rates for High School students are very high, and there are clear statements from dropouts (called “pushouts”) that this is traumatic when they return to the village. Fabian Pok looked at the option of a “youth wage” to engage them in meaningful work. He argues against this in the context of the push-outs, stating that “it would be more appropriate to focus policy attention on youth education and upgrading of their skills.” The focus on youth as being of school age or learners, rather than as unemployed, seems worthy of serious consideration. After all, as “unemployed” they comprise a huge (more than one third of the population is below twenty) block of low-skill labour. As learners, they offer a rise in skill-base, in literacy and numeracy, and potentially in health practice and democracy.

There are two points to be made here. The first is that quality of life is as big an issue in PNG as anywhere else; and is referred to often by the term gutpela sindaun. The perceptions of locals about this “life” issue is guided by the language and idioms of their culture. So the quality of a development programme in terms of the whole lifestyle is vital. The issue is a cultural issue, even for logging projects and the remuneration that goes with them. Normative views of village living, and indeed axiomatic procedures and relationships, are as important as or more important than correct practice of modern democracy or sustainable forestry to PNG people.

The second point is that this applies to Pasismanua in precisely the way indicated in Chapter Two: they will not go on with plans that do not evince the good life. It is argued in this thesis that PNG villagers - the main subject of interest - will be active instigators and not passive recipients of “development”; for this reason, they will incorporate new activities and images. These they can and will invest with the same cogency as customary practices. Therefore there is a new enchantment happening, and some NGOs would suggest that villagers appear fixated, even mesmerised, with benefits from lucrative logging entrepreneurs. Pech’s Manub and Kilibob explained the high expectations nationals had, in districts from West Sepik all the way through to the coasts of New Britain, of European colonisers. Expectations is precisely the theme expounded in this part of the thesis, with massive empirical evidence that such expectations are Melanesian ones, appropriated by the young, and for a purpose that is adequately explained only with reference to Melanesian lifestyles. This is a key to understanding "Development" in PNG, since other nations also have corruption, and other developing nations also transform themselves under the influence of consumerist capitalism. Global marketing is not a real explanation of the changes that are now

---

16 See above Chapter Two, pp.103-105.
17 From Tenth Regional Youth Advisory Board Meeting of Christian Youth Council Rabaul, October 1993 p.12.
18 1991 Chapters Two, Five and Seven. For example, he writes: “... it appears that the old faith that the White man holds the key and must be induced to share it with his Black brothers is still quite generally adhered to, despite his widespread abdication of political power and churchly
For example, the leadership of Land Owner Companies is, according to Hide, “centred on a few young, well-educated men, allying themselves with both politicians ... and older leaders or spokesmen of lower-level social units such as clans” 19. This presents opportunities for the whole community as well. Traditionally, to ally oneself with an important man was status quo. The personalised networks were regularly established and maintained to enable someone to enhance the group. Therefore it was condoned and encouraged in Melanesian communities. While there may be some who are suitable for managing such affairs, there are now significant problems of representation of all members - if indeed all other customary land-holders were invited in the first place. As Lannour says, “leaving the distribution of benefits to flow ‘according to custom’ is to invite rip-offs and antagonisms”20. There is no systemic reason that every member should be or would be recognised and this is more likely where membership is widely dispersed. And with many young men at a loose end, and money coming into the hands of a few, power and wealth is being conspicuously concentrated into the hands of the few. The process is self-feeding. Hide states that it has led to “significant problems of organisation and communication”21.

The strongly cognatic kinship system and the fluidity of inheritance rights compound this general problem. Hide found that the agreements with the loggers were based on an understanding that they were patrilineal. This is a very misleading concept since the nature of society was not even lineal in the broad sense, certainly not based on patrimony at all, but relational22. The implications for land use, rent, and usufructuary rights or leasehold are enormous, because those not consulted or included may in a very real sense feel disinherited. And since there are doubts about the “lineal” status of Kaulong and Sengseng property, investors in products of the land would have to consult specific groups with great acumen, generating programmes from the emergencies that arose on the site. Holzknecht mentions “alternative project evaluation including mitigation and enhancement procedures, and making the most appropriate recommendations”, and also “implementation, monitoring and feedback” procedures 23. For Pasismanua it means that almost continuous consultation is needed with the Kaulong, with NGOs and with ethnologists and experienced aid workers. One may also wonder if the logging liaison people observed the rather “patriarchal” (as

19 op.cit.1990 p.17.
20 In Hide ibid.
21 loc.cit.pp.5-7.
22 Relational issues between affines are based on beliefs about physical substances, in many instances; and the processes in turn lead to the incorporation of strangers and children of exogamous men being fully acceptable in their father’s clan. See “Substance, siblingship and exchange: aspects of social structure in New Guinea”. Social Analysis No.11, October 1982, 3-33.
23 op.cit.1991 p.64.
distinct from “patrilineal”) behaviour of *pomidan* (big men), and made little distinction between inheritance and social control. Such big men gain prestige and wealth, but were not necessarily in charge of channelling land-wealth from one generation to the next generation. Nor is there evidence supporting the view that people deem themselves to be solely of a father’s or grandfather’s line: in fact the means of calculating their relatedness more closely resembles Western families who may inherit from either gender and whose personal relations may override protocol. That is, the issue of identity and the issue of inheritance are not through the father and his brothers. They are through mother’s people, father’s people, and a number of relational issues. The relational issues, bound up with values, have clashed with the repercussion of logging: relational issues actually encourage logging in its present form.

All this has its counterpart in the trouble with funds. There is a general need to include the (majority) younger generations in the Budget; moreover and more importantly, money needs to get to the people for whom programmes are designed. Conscious strictures are needed on disbursement of funds, in the context of the evaporation of grants to the National Youth Movement in the ‘eighties, and of the questionable benefits of “packages” as outlined by Filer.

Three ideas which should be pursued are planning, auditing, and local consultation. A major part of the planning process should be continuing local consultation, as Holzknecht outlines in *Towards a national forest plan*. Among his many points in that paper is the notion of involvement of locals, which “should not be seen so much as a public relations exercise, but rather to be carried out from a commitment to participatory decision making during the preparation of SIA (Social

---

24 For example, in a statement for the West Arawe TRP area, the following appears: "...rights of guardianship are reserved for the patrilineage as a group ... In such a patrilineal society, every male offspring has personal rights over his father’s land. These rights, together with secrets of garden... are inherited from the father. In cases where there is only one male offspring, he receives all rights of his father’s land ... Where there are two or more sons, a father usually divides his holdings equally among them before his death." (TRP proposal by Cakara Alam, pp.8-9, courtesy Forest Research Inst. of PNG). Compare Goodale's statement: "All productive resources of a place are shared equally by those who maintain their affiliation through visitation and care of a place. Daughters and sons benefit equally from their parents’ activities in relation to the establishment of these plants and persons representing the perpetual resources of the hamlet" (op.cit.1995 p.114, italics mine). The Cakara Alam agent wrote that "Daughters usually do not have any rights over land matters as they are considered their husband's responsibility [They confuse inheritance with descent, i.e. a daughter who could have a claim to land sends her husband along to discuss it. (?) Since spouses have, each, separate inheritance rights - from mother and father - whether a husband "manages" land or not, has nothing to do with "rights over land matters"]. A daughter may in exceptional cases inherit [land] and other property where there are no sons in the family..." (West Arawe TRP proposal, p.10). On the evidence of Goodale, who studied the region for thirty five years, and of others, the proposal is a bogus, heuristic engine for a timber claim by Cakara Alam.

25 op.cit.1990.

26 Fernando and Nen,eds.1991 pp.55 - 70,
Impact Assessment) and subsequent implementation of a project. In the plan should also be disbursement priorities at the earliest stages. For normative localised projects, this is precisely where the young could be trained, and taught skills for specific jobs in imminent or upcoming projects. Keeping an audit is a particularly difficult area in PNG, and a reliable system of quarterly review is recommended by Gary Simpson of AusAID. He further suggests that one good method is a Trust Account. Planning in these contexts is frequently difficult; and the question to ask is "What bearing does this have on development in relation to the massive exotic systems of industry and commerce?"

A meaning of development in PNG is the country's ability to meet the challenge of massive, monolithic industry focussed on resources. Does it meet it through education, the hope of our century? Does it claim strict sovereignty and block initiatives from outside if they cause problems? Is it a matter for nationalists from Moresby or a Capital? Or will the devolution of power to local Government, effected in the last four years, put initiative back in villagers' hands? And is it education that will cultivate some financial flair among nationals, so that they can cope with these situations? The answers to these matters will implicate procedures and lifestyles more than policies, because it is these things which impede development of the country, and not a lack of good and well-informed ideas.

The conclusion to all this is that there are specific training needs for technical matters, and while technical matters are standardised, none of the people are. There needs to be context-sensitive training in each Province and with regard to each culture/culture-area in Papua New Guinea. The long list of the technical matters which Simpson and McKillop give is important, but his region-specific formulation is most relevant to the present argument. The management support which he urges is integral to Papua New Guinea development projects. The local involvement, and the aggravating and frustrating managerial challenges are certainly a blend that bears the stamp of Papua New Guinea. New managers, both national and expatriate, need to have strong support and for quite long periods.

It would be much better, according to the evidence presented here, to engage with locals in projects that have a robust track record in P.N.G. Similarly, it clearly indicates that localising projects and actually negotiating methods to achieve goals yield effective results. The methods of insight, on-site participatory managers and sensitive review for mitigation would be essential. Such a project in Kandrian is the Guest House Programme, which encourages local women to use their traditional knowledge and management skills. Basil Peutalo also mentions five projects approved by the National government to further landowners' grasp of ecology, economy, and socially sustainable

---

27 loc. cit. p.65.
28 Simpson, G. and McKillop, R. *Public Admin, Planning and Budgeting in PNG* (Canberra, AIDAB 1994) p.44.
CHAPTER THREE: EDUCATION

tropical forest use. What this means is that there is a potential flood of good advice; Peutalo says, of the average villager:

S/he has experience of local situations relative to environment, conservation and/or the whole natural world but does not have the technical language to discuss with experts about it. S/he is not, by standard definition an environmentalist, forester, conservationist, or business person. If, therefore, s/he is to be involved in what we are on about ... s/he needs to be allowed into our knowledge, our vision plan, etc. 30

The central image here is of the observer-villager; a stereotype; a self-fulfilling prophesy. In this regard, Brown and Holzknecht not only suggest that local groups be screened to pre-assess their ability to really collaborate in conservation initiatives, but also that the relationships that sustain these matters become the central concern. They state that “PNG’s conservation agenda should be based on the identification of processes, methodologies, and working relationships that can best promote conservation. Landowners and NGOs should be introduced into the conservation planning process in the early stages, rather than consulted on an ad hoc basis” 31. That is, relationships are the source of Melanesian communities.

One can conclude that most of this is achievable. Locals from Pasismanua and from New Britain generally are not backward about wanting equitable processes of consultation. It is not lack of thought, but lack of resources that causes inertia. The name “Pasismanua”, the place of Man’o war harbour, reflects this. The great ships during the Wars, and indeed before that, were an image of the might and technology of Europe. Zelenietz and Saito mention the attractiveness of Americans for West New Britain residents, in comparison with the parsimonious Australians, during the Mandated Territory era 32. This does not refer to one item out of a list of development problems, but indeed to the general feeling that Papua New Guineans have toward a world that holds wealth and success - their goal from time immemorial - but not for themselves.

These people want “more”. It emerged strongly in the M.I. survey. And from other research, this time done among youth on the North Coast hinterland of mainland PNG, the transcript of a tape reads:

Juke: It depends on whether one has money; he who has money, he will do okay, and he

30 op.cit.
32 Zelenietz, M.and Saito, H. “Both sides now: anthropological reflections on Kilenge reminiscences
who has not money, he will not do okay. Those who are not doing okay, they will continue to live the [ways of the village]. And he who has more money, he can live in town.

[On school failure]
Zaka: *Sorry, nogat wok! {Sorry, we don’t have any work.}* You get raving mad [when you hear that]. I also went to town and tried to get a job, but it didn’t work out, but after I had finished school and [therefore] it was difficult for me just to make a garden [to live as a farmer], and if I were to go to the market [in Teptep] in front of other people’s eyes [i.e. to sell vegetables], then I would be ashamed as then some of them would say: “This educated man here, why does he come to market?” I would hence be very much ashamed, and that is how it is ... Why did the Papua New Guinea government not create lots of jobs for us young school-leavers? We have left our parents, that hurt, we have spent a lot of money, we have left our village to go to a distant place, and we have used up our parents’ money, and when shall we give the money back to our parents? How shall I who have after all completed school, help my parents so that they are doing well, how shall I feed my family? This is the big worry I have and I often think about it."

With more possibilities and more disappointments, it is not surprising that villagers’ vision is narrowed to the point of capitulating to the logging representative who steps into the village and puts the matter to them as *fait accompli*, so to speak. There are two points that explain the context of forestry in Papua New Guinea.

The first point is that the Forest Authority is under-resourced to monitor the subsequent situation rigorously. “Shortages of information, skilled personnel and funding” are big issues in governance especially in the implementation of the Forestry Guidelines34. Two or three aid workers in West New Britain from 1995-6 spoke to me about the lack of promised funding. The lag-time between promise and delivery has been two years in some places; and in lieu of government Forestry work, certain aid organisations and agencies are bearing the weight and cost of implementation of forestry projects and related infrastructure of basic services such as health. Many workers told story upon story of the dilapidated school buildings from structures originally built by loggers, the erosion of logged sites and the siltation from there and from log ponds. These illustrate the lack of clarity in administrating development in Forestry districts. The confusion described in the Makapa region of

---

Western Province shows the scramble for development in Papua New Guinea.

Therefore the gains made by the Forestry Research Institute and the National Forest Authority seem to be mitigated by the problem of chronic youth unemployment, and education towards elitism. Many others are well educated in an impressive system of Community Schools (Grades 1-6), but so far the outcome is rather elitist. There is another context in which these events become part of a pattern.

It is a larger pattern than fiscal planning, than ecoforestry, than trade, or even than human rights. It is this pattern which few if any publications, including the tabloids, have followed. Because they have not traced this constellation of forces, the face of this era is of that of foreign finance in numerous districts of Papua New Guinea (see Maps I and II above), and clear-felling or indiscriminate logging of the largest and most pristine forests in the Pacific zones. The pattern is that culture, rather than policy or democracy, guides behaviour most strongly.

The second point is that education and culture are linked in a peculiar way in Papua New Guinea. There is the issue of a relevant, culturally sustainable education process. There is also the issue of long-term outcomes, and the importance of youth maintaining their public persona in the villages of Papua New Guinea. When graduates are seen to be unemployed and of low status, there are strong reactions; and in a moral climate where tradition sways people’s thinking and orchestrates behaviour, such as West New Britain precisely, these reactions are magnified.36

On relevance in Education, Gibson and Iamo’s Community-School relations and the teacher (1992), almost alone among the literature, urges a closer interaction between teacher and the community to which s/he may be sent as a stranger. They advocate teachers being integrated completely into the community, and for training of teachers to be predominantly focused on this. Since the vast majority of community schools are near villages and their teachers are frequently from outside the district or from another Province, this would seem to be an intelligent method of dealing with the unique distribution patterns of new teachers, in Papua New Guinea. Teachers comprise a profession of aliens/internal migrants. Hansen-Strain describes the difference between “field-dependence” and “field-independence”, being apposite to the ability or non-ability to grasp facts out of context. This applies especially to concreteness of the setting in which something is learned. For

34 AIDAB op.cit. 1993 p.31.
35 Above, see “Makapa” section.
36 One can compare this with the problems among youth in the Highlands, and the acute problem of rascalism in the same region. Custom is very strong in the Highlands and there are more and more unemployed youth; there is a clear model of what males and females are supposed to be doing. There were multiple problems among youth in the Asaro Valley when I lived there.
one thing, females are much more field-dependent than males, needing a more thorough and detailed context to facts. For another, all Pacific peoples evince more field dependence, seen as a whole, than children in western schools such as those of Australia and New Zealand. This in itself should have vast repercussions on education in PNG. Yet the distributional context of teachers and induction processes into the profession also cry out for meticulous localisation processes. Localising a teaching position will not be enough; it would be better to revolutionise the whole curriculum to be suitable for villagers, the majority of whom actively prefer *Tok Pisin* to English as the *lingua franca*. Generally speaking, education needs much more relevance.

The general outcry about ecology and poor benefits from logging has been engendered not in the academic/intellectual scenario, but in the *moral* environment. Developers, aid workers and governments all ignore this at their peril. It is so crucial and must play a part in any social analysis of development in PNG. Confusion prevails where different moral paradigms co-exist. As is made very clear, the moral paradigms are not in this thesis because any exposition of logging needs moral protest. There is a surfeit of opprobrium against loggers already. Morality is involved because the human context of logging requires an analysis of the social life. One might include it as part of that "Social Impact Analysis" which Holzknecht so capably described\(^{38}\).

There are new ways of advancing oneself, and some are intimately connected with cash. The argument follows this fact to its empirical conclusion, that cash is meaningful.

Cash is meaningful in its manifestation, in its mode as signifier, and what it signifies is *mana* or the deeply felt desire for a good life. Carmen\(^{39}\) commented that development is "not just about the necessities of life, nor about the diversity of choice of information and goods, but about wisdom and the good life". Cash, coupled with the new networks for influence, challenges traditional authority, at times. In certain situations the new networks are countermanded by custom. While custom influences every person initially in this region, there is a recurring tension. It is a fecund area of research, having spawned a host of insightful papers\(^{40}\). These studies fit into the genre of change studies in the New Guinea political zone, arising out of and including the era of colonies and that event dubbed "centre-periphery" by Wallerstein and Friedman\(^{41}\). This fits into the general statement that there have been strongly worded papers about "development" with the colonised taking the brunt of compassion. While this has been useful in deconstructing colonialism, there are people in the third world who actively pursue their own goals and they do this by using the modern world system. This

\(^{38}\) Above, p.35.

\(^{39}\) op.cit.


is manifest in Papua New Guinea. People are quite open and transparent about it. Cash is patently desired by so many peoples who are marginalised in the cash economy. And when they emerge from a deal with what seems enormous amounts of cash, they are to all intents and purposes in control of the bridge to foreign power, and in control of mana. Mana means success.

There are two major forces for change across New Britain, as regards this or these world systems: they are the single influence of incoming foreign wealth, and the increase in population. The vast majority of the population is under thirty, and this accentuates the wealth differences and the increase in population. Since the evidence is that wealth is channelled rather than redistributed, the trend is toward an increase in aspirers and a relative decrease in "roads" to live a fulfilling life.

Margaret Jolly argues that there are rules by which - whether customary or innovative - people are marginalised from power and wealth in Papua New Guinea. There are broad reasons for this which aren't or can't be covered by legislation. Therefore, Jill Grant's statement, that "the benefits of economic growth are not necessarily evenly distributed within society, but are often directed by, and for, elites", re-emerges as a general guide for education in the context of a developing country trying to raise the standard of living.

The relative poverty, the contrast between experience and what they perceive to be benefits that youth have in developed countries, is the source of most of the problems. It compounds the difficulties experienced by young people in PNG at a crucial time in their lives. The cultural context enters into the shock of deprivation. There is a strong emphasis on the person and public presentation of the person. Most notable among Kaulong is the blackening of the teeth and the effacement of white and smiling teeth. To a fault, one does not show teeth among Kaulong, even to the point of covering the mouth in public. Some 200 kilometres or so around the coast, Michel and Francoise Panoff described in detail how people are inducted and initiated into adult status. They are cleansed and refined symbolically, and resurrected ritually with the power of ancestors. Without this renewal and rebirth, a young person has no "face", a powerful public recognition of the person. They have no acceptable persona without this induction; and become "rubbish men", persons of no worth.

Among young men, they have the highest rates of suicide in the Pacific, and in this regard far outweigh the female suicide which is frequently described. Among the Kilenge, West of Pasismanua and some 400 kilometres from Pomio where the Panoffs stayed, there is a definite process of initiation for both sexes to induct them into the ways of the ancestors. More precisely,
they must accept the bestowal of status from their grandparents at a crucial point in the ceremonies. Those who missed out were said to be quite estranged from society. Also among Kilenge, the parading of the aggressive bukomo masks reflects, in a different way, the “education” that Kilenge give to young people. I am referring to the “domains of knowledge” which locals unpack, in the context of all the other learning offered by a culture to all the senses. One learns the boundaries of behaviour and the moral culture of a people.

The insecurity of one’s place in society, and the vulnerability of a person, is highlighted by these South Coast practices. Among the Kaulong, people are not accepted without teeth-blackening. Goodale explains at great pains that there is a sense of inhumanity, of animality, to someone who is not fully potumus, “whole”. The other side of the positive aspect of wholeness is shame, and fear of shame. Epstein’s *The experience of shame in Melanesia...* (1984), describing shame’s public aspect and its comprehensive damage to a person, is a landmark text. Shame is a social force that pressures individuals and that is used by people to manipulate others.

The “positive” acts of effacement/ blackening of teeth, privacy and avoidance of sex, and humanisation of pigs in this district, is linked to its negative aspect of shame among these same people.

To those who question the detail about development in a logging context, the answer is that the approaches that don’t take culture as an integral factor, that don’t use the “integral human development” approach, simply have not had much success at all in Papua New Guinea. Shame is prevalent and found everywhere in Papua New Guinea as a result of "development". It occurs when a negative public aspect of a persona is comprehensively linked to the self-view or self-concept - a person's view of him- or herself directly reflects what others say about them. That is the essence of shame. Turner broaches the issue of social appraisal, in his recommendation for there to be a “humanistic coefficient”. As Turner explained this phrase of Znaniecki, “he emphasised the role of conscious agents or actors - an emphasis which his opponents were inclined to criticize as the ‘subjective’ point of view. It is persons as the objects of the actions of others, however, not as subjects, that meet his criteria for sociological data”. That indeed is the pressure put on someone who feels shame in Papua New Guinea.

Excessive shaming need not be happening to large numbers of young men and women everywhere in Melanesia; nor are the responses of youth uniform, by any means. However, where it


47 Zelenietz and Grant op.cit. 1980.


49 For this, see especially *The Ritual Process* by Victor Turner.


51 op.cit. 1975 pp. 32.
CHAPTER THREE: EDUCATION

does happen, there is little apparent in most Melanesian world views to re-accommodate them. 

*Rispek* can mean respect, or sometimes formal honour. A criticism of a notable administrator I knew was *em i no save rispektim man*, i.e., “he doesn’t respect people” meaning that is his habitual disposition. A lack of respect and money has devastating effects on the young, as the statements of the two Yupno men show. Such a broader vision is necessary to keep a balanced view of development. Education, instead of passing on information, engenders a way of processing such information. It is a source of change, not a conduit for facts that are incorporated into a traditional village.

In a world where an influx of money is a concrete event, the attitude of villagers towards a transnational company giving opportunities to enter this increasingly complex set of transactions is not only necessary: it is a rational act. In the wider region where high unemployment tempts young West New Britain men to rascism and alcohol- and marijuana-abuse, any form of public respectability and exoneration is a boon.

The Melanesian Institute study, called “Young Melanesians: alternatives for the future”, was an object lesson in delving into these possibilities for “youth” in the New Guinea region. It came from discussions with peers, in regions representing most rural areas as well as the new towns of PNG. In the course of interviewing over 1500 respondents, people were asked what they thought of helping out their village for no pay. More than half of the sample said that they certainly would help. Therefore, given my argument about there being poor career-paths for many people in Melanesia, it registers a difference.

The difference is that, instead of a pattern of downward spiral or enervation of development among the 97% of PNG people comprising its villagers, there is a contrapuntal pattern, a quite vigorous response against depression. (And if benefits are unevenly distributed, then systemically the economy is in fact depressed.) The counterpoint is a coming-to-grips-with relative poverty, a creative factor. That creative factor is based on the people of the country.

One key question was “Who controls local infrastructure, and why?” The syndrome is not just about nationals entering the Pan-Pacific and world economy. Morren, for example, calls for educational programmes, not just for villagers, but for natural resource professionals and planners, to change their world view in order to train them in “participatory” techniques. This is the nub of the

---

52 loc.cit.p.32.

53 I had to analyse the raw data from this as soon as it came in for the Research Team, and appraise it for general statistical trends for the Team to work on.

54 This is an interesting result, since these weren’t “Yes/ No” questions, and any response of more than 20% or 30% signified a clear trend; answers in the negative were comparatively few.

matter, because the answer to this syndrome is not patronisation - the lodestar of transnational logging companies there at the moment - but self-development.
CHAPTER FOUR: Human Development: understanding the other

An informant has given his impression of PNG people in their business dealings with foreigners. He remarked that he hated going into this country. Village landholders were too unreliable and there was too much violence. Since he was an executive of a Korean logging company, and since they operated in West New Britain, development in West New Britain provides insight into the impact of nationals on foreigners.

In the following pages several incidents will be described that show the attitudes of the different parties, when cultures clash. The interaction between those involved in village development in West New Britain attained crisis, not in an emotional sense but in a classic, formal sense. A crisis occurs where events approach the point of irrevocable social or personal change; That is the form of any crisis and the form can be applied to forestry situations in this region.

The informant was a sophisticated businessman who had made several trips to PNG and therefore felt that he spoke with authority. He thought of locals in remote areas as “primitive”, and described how, at least in the bush, no sustained effort was made to accommodate either him or his company. He was referring to resource security.

Another person I met in an informal setting was in the Eastern Highlands, in the Bena Bena lands; he was a very successful local businessman, who had set up many productive operations including an extensive market garden with regular deliveries of truckloads of vegetables to the capital, Goroka. One thing spoiled the venture, and that was intermittent feuds which had stopped all activity on several occasions. The matter which concerned him, consequently, was that he could not depend on his commercial base, for the simple reason that their patrimonial land had to be redistributed and this land was open to claim and counter-claim.

One thing that aggravated the gardener was that the tradition of spearing or combat by archery was being taken over by the use of guns of all shapes and sizes, and this had happened only since 1990 or after, probably only in ‘92 in his district. This deadly practice had destroyed any pretence at balance since hamlets could be overrun and people exiled or killed in moments, and possibly from a distance. Too many of his family had died, in too quick a sequence.

The market gardener’s solution was not unlike that of the logger-informant who depicted the others as “primitive”: the solution was to dissolve corporate inalienable property. When some land owners in West New Britain “had been trying for a long time to get the Government to the negotiating table”, they became extremely
desperate and "allegedly arranged for the Japanese logging manager to be murdered"1.

What these examples all allude to is the depth of feeling in Papua New Guinea about the treatment of, and deployment of land, and about real, empirical development. The relaxing of laws for inalienable lands would be the single most aggressive and far-reaching reform possible at this time. Nevertheless it would entail an almost total disregard for culture and identity. The resource security vouchsafed within the "guided democracies" of Asia may not be translated directly into Papua New Guinea forestry situations. The stability of "civitas" is in conflict with the regional, provincial, "humanitas" administration in Papua New Guinea2.

This chapter attempts to find a way of describing development. If it were stated that a village/ethnic culture could not mix with a modern political culture, there would be no explanation of the fact that PNG is full of examples of that very mixture3. Again, if political scientists asserted that ethnicity was behind the problem, i.e. that tribes are dragging political life into Melanesian anarchy, then there would be little to add. However, there is more to add.

Neither is the debacle of rainforest destruction merely biological or geographical, either. Although this study synthesises details from the geographical area facing the Solomon Sea, known as "Pasismanua", the crisis is not a biological crisis alone. The details assist the method but they do not define the study. What defines the study is a concept of the social life.

It is important to explore the boundaries of some ineffective classifications, such as tribe, class, or politics, boundaries which are constantly being breached during the course of development activity. The concept that defines the study is precisely that which describes the breaches. It explains ways of regularly structuring behaviour, ways that are predictable social items. A new way of describing the behavioural items - not "tribal" or "ethnic" items - is needed, since these items recur regularly and visibly. Victor Turner called these items "root paradigms", which emerged in times of change4.

---
2 See Rowan Callick's comments on stability in Kuerschner-Pelkmann, ed. Our trees and all the wildlife have gone opi.cit. pp.104-105.
3 See Carrier, J. op.cits.
4 Turner, V. Dramas, Fields and metaphors: symbolic action in human society 1974, pp.64, 65-67, 87. Turner had studied processual conflict in an African society, using the extended case method. Since access to village details were denied me for political reasons inside West New Britain, the present research owes something to a "case"
Although root paradigms are operative in a group’s members most of the time, it is during change, during heavy interaction between members, that such paradigms become visible. In this study, it is maintained that a rigorous description of the interaction between the various actors in “development” yields a new focus, and thus new “facts”.

Duty (or the deontological) does not define the area of this research. The groups who tell others, “You ought to be doing this!” will find others saying they ought to be doing something else. Ethical obligations, even the duty to maintain biodiversity, do not suffice to describe “development” in West New Britain. Following on from James Carrier’s theory of articulation, the following sections offer some empirical details of interaction. That will show that the object of study is a concept, rather than a region, or a culture. A simple means exists for drawing together disparate elements of this chapter, the single motif of interaction. Further complexities would be confusing because the research space carved out needed intellectual concentration. The study is limited to verifiable data on PNG, mostly from the south western region of New Britain. There are two prominent aspects to the study of interaction, reciprocity as a lifestyle or behavioural “paradigm”, and self determination for villagers.

On the second issue, for example, transnational logging companies are seen by villagers and by many NGOs as quite powerful; the realities of the situation were hinted at by the Korean man - that loggers need to satisfy certain market demands and that costs can only be covered by proceeding in a haphazard fashion through mixed-species rainforests. The forests are depleted at best, destroyed at worst. The venture “is driven by the urgent need to recover front-end expenses or sunk costs. It is this imperative that drives the logging frenzy in large-scale commercial operations”.

The extended case method is a narrative of structural tensions within one community; a case method [the Kaulong and vicinity] is here defined as a close bounded study with an option of wider application. The first way is dramaturgical in form, and has a time-line. The second way is obstructed from such a close dramatical description; yet the dramatic structure is there, in loggers, finance companies, “green” NGOs, government, and indigenous villagers - and a Master of Arts candidate! Therefore the term used is “tableau”, i.e. performers grouped in a dramatic scene. It is developed with the reasoning that the present data is a snapshot [see “Vision and Culture” section below, this chapter] bounded by a single moment in time, not a serial development or micro-history. Undoubtedly this has limited my scope, and further studies using a social drama of several seasons in the village are urgently needed. However, I am aware of this large research limitation.

6 See Kuerschner-Pelkmann op cit.; Henderson op.cit.
7 Cooke, F. “Contractors, traders and landowners in Lak”, in Filer, editor, The political
Human development

seen as a hectic, risky business, just as the Korean logger said. Success, and even personal safety, depend on many kinds of relationships. The market consumers, the majority from Japan, dominate and Japanese brokers orchestrate retail prices. “In sum,” writes Cooke, “producer companies in Papua New Guinea, even the seemingly all-powerful Rimbunan Hijau, enjoy nothing more than a subordinate position in a world raw log trade that is dominated by the appetites of the consumers.” Ergo, transnational logging companies are in fact not powerful. By a double-paradox, it is villagers who are setting trends and who exercise power, “double”, because this scenario should be ideal, self-development. They lose enormous rainforests and therefore develop poorly:

paradox one. International financiers control politics and violate the ecosystem, swindling land-holders; but remain at the whim of volatile capricious markets in east Asia. These transnationals have one opportunity and a large repertoire, so that a fluctuation in markets or consumer caprice makes or breaks them: paradox two. It is villagers who set the trends. It is villagers who develop themselves. They can choose; loggers cannot.

The publications on P.N.G. ecology are now increasing, and for a decade or more publications on the global economic and ecological situations have been at a premium. By contrast the inclusive approach, outlined in detail throughout this thesis, depicts villagers as acting from choices rather than reacting to economic ventures of others. In other words, is it appropriate for NGOs to “promote” villagers’ claims?

Nowadays, audiences in developed countries seem to listen to, for example, Greenpeace. They might listen to the World Bank representatives or to someone else. Certainly, the Government of PNG claims the right to rule. It is challenged at the village level! An important legal question is now being debated around the world, as to what indigenous people claim. Do indigenous people need backers or brokers? What authority has their own voice? In the context of West New Britain, hamlet dwellers are the inalienable owners/holders of all land. The Papua New Guinea situation appears to be unique in the whole world. In PNG there have never been “reservations” or enclosed economy of forest management in PNG (NRI Monograph 32, International Inst. for Environment and Development, 1997) p.113.

loc. cit. p.125.


loc. cit. p.111.

See for example Korten When corporations rule the world... 1996; Bourke/ FAO, Forest Paper o.83 Trade in Forest Products... 1988; also Whitmore and Sayer, eds. 
“missions” to which villagers have been confined. This has enormous repercussions; hamlet dwellers of Pasismanua are claiming that they have authority to speak, not an opinion to be considered in a civil fashion before returning to the “real” issue.

This is certainly how the International Alliance of Indigenous Peoples\(^\text{12}\) sees it: on the subject of an "international order" for forestry or conservation, the members write "Many feel that a premature forest instrument focused on technical forestry considerations to the exclusion of forests could do more harm than good. ... Previous international forestry initiatives such as the International Tropical Timber Agreement and the Tropical Forestry Action Plan had been widely condemned for ignoring indigenous peoples' rights and interests and promoting commercial logging and plantations on indigenous territories."\(^\text{13}\) From this evidence, problems arise from the complex boundaries because there is no self determination, to all intents and purposes, and concomitantly because indigenous ethnic groups have no recognition as nations within the states' law\(^\text{14}\). The “real” issue isn’t what experts decide in some world centre; neither is it what villagers reckon (the “bottom-up” method). The real issue is villagers speaking with authority, across the complex boundaries.

The means of study is therefore not “behaviourist”, observing actions solely from the materialistic and empirical point of view, nor “mentalist”, that is, explaining events as if they depended largely on individual actors’ psychologies\(^\text{15}\). Rather, the theory for study is primarily sociological, where the extreme edge of empiricism is eschewed for an analysis coming from the humanities.

\(\text{Tropical deforestation and species extinction 1992.}\)

\(^{12}\) This Alliance has given some general solutions, based on meticulous data from dozens of indigenous peoples worldwide, including those in Papua New Guinea. While the Secretariat is based in London, the Members have met in many different regions and have each offered data from their own experience and histories. In this context, “Rimbunan Hijau”, the Malaysian logger which owns more than half the logging projects in Papua New Guinea, merited a special mention in their Publication *Indigenous Peoples, Forests and Biodiversity* ...(n.d.).

\(^{13}\) *Indigenous Peoples, Forests, and Biodiversity* ... n.d. pp.56-57.

\(^{14}\) loc.cit.

\(^{15}\) As John Lyons wrote of language, many social events are “‘ready-made’, in the sense that they are learned by [natives] as unanalysed wholes and are clearly not constructed afresh on each occasion on which they are used” *Introduction to theoretical linguistics* 1975 p.416. Like Lyons, this student feels that little justification exists for “stimulus-response” descriptions of human behaviour outside certain specific situations. Further reference will not be made to any of those concepts that promote behaviourism.
NOTIONS OF DEVELOPMENT - A NEW FOCUS

It is known that developmental theorists\textsuperscript{16} recognise a certain passion about what goes on in one’s country. The political element that Goodale\textsuperscript{17} mentioned in Pasismanua exchange, and the radical solutions of the Bena Bena businessman, were not thoughtless reactions. It seems that what is inferred by outsiders may be different to that which comes from a village perspective.\textsuperscript{18}

To illustrate this grasp that Kaulong people have of the events currently going on in forest resources, Jane Goodale’s ethnographic and hermeneutic account is cited in the following sections. As well, there is much weight put on information proffered by individual citizens and those who worked in their villages. These sources are highly regarded. Such evidence seems to show quite reliably that anthropological studies and other forms of consultation must be done in remote regions, even where economic and resource matters are concerned.

There were Papua New Guinean ways of initiating development across Melanesia and they were called cargo cults\textsuperscript{19}. Some of these had very uncontroversial sectors such as trust funds and social infrastructure plans, for example at Pomio (on New Britain) which is still current\textsuperscript{20}. The incredulity of expatriates made them shortsighted, firstly to the empirical advantage of cults, and secondly to the one simple fact that they were organisationally sound. The majority of cargo cults had peak efficiency in their implementation, attested by popularity and the ability to keep the rules set by their organisers.

Two meanings often exist, that for a villager, and that for an investor or agency of government which is largely alien to that villager. The meaning of events may also validly be decided from the \textit{voyeur}’s point of view. As an outsider, that is the most

\textsuperscript{17} (1995) \textit{To Sing With Pigs is Human: the concept of person in Papua New Guinea.}
\textsuperscript{18} The truncated form of the economic discussion between outsiders and villagers comprises this thesis. This approach is deliberate because the subject of national/international economy requires more than a Masters Thesis. In any case, it has been covered by publications of NGOs and by United Nations agencies. This thesis by contrast magnifies a region for the purpose of changing the \textit{focus} of discussion.
\textsuperscript{19} For a thorough overview see the works of Vittorio Lanternari or Worsley’s \textit{The Trumpet Shall Sound.}
\textsuperscript{20} Bailoenakia,P. and Koimantea,F."The Pomio Kivung Movement" \textit{Point Series} no.2, 1
authentic meaning - a third meaning - a foreign researcher (one doing a thesis!) can see in the development of Papua New Guinea; researchers can work through a self-conscious process and consult local people. They can use the standard process of collaboration with experienced field workers and residents, even when such residents are not nationals.

For example, the results of interviews from West New Britain or other interviews conducted in PNG have been corroborated with Holzknecht’s several papers on New Britain and the processes of Resource Owner Involvement projects. Since he is a national, speaks two PNG languages fluently as well as Tok Pisin, has qualifications with experience in human resource training, and is a founding member of the Melanesian Environment Foundation, this present study has been adjusted in significant ways to accommodate such experience

For another example, during the literature survey done by the Melanesian Institute in 1993-1994, several qualities were sought in any of the citations, in order to provide a filter for hundreds of publications on PNG youth. The most critical parameters were that writers had some apperception of themselves as cultural beings, and that they evinced penetration of Melanesian worldviews. Apperception means that the study is put in a cultural, political context; description of Melanesia implies some grasp of exchange, the effect of kinship and often a consciousness of ancestors and animism among villagers. These and other aspects enabled the “Young Melanesians” team to calibrate each study against “landmark” studies whereby certain papers had strengths to an optimal degree and in others the qualities were absent. Such filters can be used by visitors to PNG and enable outsiders to benefit from others who have long had rapport in the village.

Yet another example of penetration was provided by Ennio Mantovani, who asked at the end of 1993 that data-trends be drawn out from the national survey, in order

---

21 Hartmut Holzknecht’s curriculum vitae is considerably longer than this and his commitment to land owners and well grounded research can only be described as spectacular. Nevertheless, it is not his impeccable qualifications that are my concern here, but the solid reliability of his work as research data.
22 Brother Andrew devised the regimen in consultation with the writer. Brother Andrew has at least forty years experience in PNG and is himself an ethnopsychiatrist. The calibrated list and the entire method are on record unpublished.
23 Then Director of the Melanesian Institute, an anthropologist with thirty years experience and fifteen years in the bush in the Highlands.
Human development
to corroborate it with the myriad publications on Melanesia. Triangulation is the
research technique of using data from another source even if it was originally devised
with a completely different perspective than your own study. What Mantovani was
doing was opening up some leverage by superimposing new data on the well
established studies. This may be termed “hunting” out trends from a database. In
review, the methods indicated give a visitor some authenticity in their study; they are
reflexive methods; and it depends, ultimately, on consultation with Melanesian
communities, whereby researchers accept their guidance.

So what was happening in the community? Change. Change draws out people’s
ethos and their aspirations. These aspirations are what Victor Turner, studying African
cultures, called root paradigms. They “have reference not only to the current state of
social relationships existing or developing between actors, but also to the cultural goals,
means, ideas, outlooks, currents of thought, patterns of belief ... they go beyond the
cognitive and even the moral to the existential domain, and in so doing become clothed
in allusiveness, implicitness, and metaphor - for in the stress of vital action, firm
definitional outlines become blurred by the encounter of emotionally charged wills...
Root paradigms emerge in life crises.”

A new focus in development-plans in Papua New Guinea would entail a whole
methodology for understanding “change”. One such attempt was made by Gillian Gorle,
who reviewed the themes of Papua New Guinean writers. She found that nationals
most commonly articulated strong concerns about outsiders gaining control of
resources, about high expectations for education and commensurate disappointment,

24 This database is now a published study, Zocca,F. and de Groot,N. “Young Melanesian
Project: data analysis”, Point Series No.21 (The Melanesian Institute, Goroka, Papua
New Guinea, 1997).

25 The much more detailed ethnology in Papua New Guinea has not yet been accounted
for in this thesis, though well-attested monographs such as Annette Weiner’s Women of
Value, Men of Renown have been cited, or perhaps Iteanu’s “The concept of the person
and the ritual system: an Orokaiva view”, or even back to F.E. William’s “The Vailala
Madness” in the heady colonial Papuan era. The most ethnologically over-written
peoples in the world cannot be encompassed by this one study. See F.E. Williams, “The
Vailala Madness” and other essays, Edited and with an introduction by Erik
Schwimmer. London, Hurst, 1976 ; A.Iteanu, in Man (the Journ. of the Royal
Anth.Inst.) Vol.25 (1990) No.1, 35-53; A. Weiner, Women of Value... (St. Lucia,

26 Turner, V.W. Dramas, Fields and metaphors ... 1974 p.64.

27 “The Second decade: the theme of social change in Papua New Guinean literature,
Human development

and about changes that led to strong socioeconomic differences - and thus social classes.
The evidence from letters to the newspapers shows that changes engendered hope and
also were very disturbing. Gorle's method, systematic review of published fiction,
poems, drama and letters, helped to show me that valuable research can be done in
Papua New Guinea through literature. Such rigorous study is a fillip to the
questionnaires or the study of primary production or trade or other ways of assessing the
condition of society; and is especially good for gauging the effects of change in social
conditions. It is a way of applying the research agenda laid out by Victor Turner and his
"paradigms". It also shows that development studies need to focus on change per se.

The need for such a new focus is there because a stable community is a root
paradigm for PNG: development is positive and meaningful if it maintains some of the
status-quo of relationships within and between hamlets, between generations, between
districts/ cultures, and between genders. Such development would be interpenetration
with dialogue. Filer has described this in strong terms in recent years28. A new focus is
needed on development.

It is a help that some developmental theorists recognise a certain passion about
what is going on in one’s own country! As Samson Nua (above, “A Development
Debate” section) pointed out, consultation is not just talk but insight (probably the most
apt paraphrase of lukasave). That is why W.G.Groves' educational initiative29 was an
important attempt to change the community, because it was holistic, i.e. attempted to
address several aspects of the society at once and in an integrated fashion. With all the

---

28 Filer, C. (1990) “The Bougainville rebellion, the mining industry, and the process of
social disintegration in PNG” in May, R., and Spriggs, M. eds. The Bougainville Crisis;
(1992) “The escalation of disintegration and the reinvention of authority” in Spriggs, M.,
social context of renewable resource depletion in Papua New Guinea” in Howitt, R.,
studies from Australasia, Melanesia and Southeast Asia.

29 The work of W.G.Groves, Native Education and Culture-Contact in New Guinea
(OUP/Melbourne U.P. 1936 Reprint 1977), remains unimplemented; this and the
strategy attempted after the War comprise the definitive beginnings of optimal
development as administrative philosophy for Melanesia. Donald Dickson in J. Griffin,
ed.’s P.N.G. Portraits gives a circumspect account of Groves in the political context.
However, this thesis emphasises that the period from 1975 to 1998 has been full of
cultural incidents which have not been interpreted as such, the cultural context being
ignored. This was true for the siphoning off of funds in the Youth Movement and
through Provincial Government pork barrelling, to name just two fiscal disasters. Here
the word “optimal” is deliberately emphasised since it represents a departure from many
visions of “development”; after Carmen, op.cit. 1996 pp. 7 ff.
grandiose programmes that have arisen over the years, few are asking questions about
the ethics of pace, the ethics of the maximum. WHAT IS THE OPTIMUM? This is a
question relevant to Papua New Guinea30.

The general phenomenon seems to need some summative term to help grasp the
process. Colin Filer reverts to a tok pisin expression in a similar attempt to the one
presented in this thesis, where he says “‘wanpela pinga i bruk insait long dispela
samting’ (one finger is broken in this matter)”. The clause refers to a person’s
embezzling their group’s wealth. Filer extends the figure of speech to a normative
process of regular social disintegration, where mining ventures include “packages” to
inalienable Papua New Guinean landholders31. Like the Panguna debacle, the overall
effect of logging insensitively “is an exponential accumulation of ‘bad feelings’ (as
expressed in the Tokpisin words wart and hevi) which must sooner or later have their
day of reckoning”32. In this way, mal feut is a concise term for a malaise that begins in
shining hope with public approval, and ends in widespread dissatisfaction and mistrust.
Such an expression accurately describes leadership in PNG public life, the more
powerful the leader the more accurate the depiction33.

The administrative slip-up is not malpractice. The term mal feut is deliberately
chosen for that which does not apply correctly and leads to ills - as if by bad luck. If
community power is the germ of meaning for development, has the administration built
up expectations, a political conceit, through their poor insight? A conceit is a witty,
happy, or ingenious thought or expression, and its positive sense is that of a concept
which provides insight34. The conceit is in this case the democracy of a “new nation”,

30 Robert D. Putnam (1993) gave examples of a single set of indicators of success in
local government in Italy, where localised programmes were initiated in the context of
high voter turnout, newspaper readership, membership in societies, Lions clubs and
soccer clubs. These comprised "social capital" (see Korten’s When corporations rule
the world 1995 pp.278-9), the non-market factor essential to success in development.
31 Filer op.cit.1990, pp.87-105
32 loc.cit.p.88.
33 Paias Wingti was impeached in 1994 with Julius Chan becoming Prime Minister on a
wave of triumphalism. Shortly after the Singirok crisis in March 1997, where the
Commander in chief of the PNG armed forces rebelled against Chan’s leadership on the
basis of national sovereignty when foreign mercenaries were hired, Bill Skate came into
the Prime Ministry on a burst of ethical rhetoric. Subsequently, Mr. Skate has been
accused of comprehensive corruption and bribery on the basis of damning video
evidence. While Skate’s position is secure now and he vehemently denied accusations,
one watches with cynical interest.
34 The use of the “conceit” was normative in the era of the poet John Donne, and in his
the planned self-rule by a unicameral Westminster system. A conceit is not a lie. It is not malfeasance.

If there is so much talk about customary landowners, why are customary landowners not happy? This question, implied throughout this study, needs a fresh perspective. An authentic answer to the question is not “malfeasance” (and this may surprise some people), but the epithet, *mal feut*.

**DEVELOPMENT AND RECIPROCITY**

Melanesians see *what they do and what happens to them in life* as reciprocal events. They are “biocosmic” in their orientation to the world, as was explained in the section “Life in Melanesia”. Melanesians have a sensitivity to their environment, but it *is not seen apart from their social environment*. What is wrong with one could be wrong with the other35. Filer bluntly states that “local people see and feel the transformation of their physical surroundings as the outward symbol of the damage done to their society”36. If exchange is the basis of sociality, *ergo* real physical things are integral to maintenance of a positive community. The point is that the “real physical things” are what “big men” present to their followers as their proof, not only that they are able, but also that they are **ethical**. It is reciprocity that defines the art of leadership, in the formal sense37.

Colin Filer’s proposition that reciprocity is a lived principal [“paradigm” c.f. Turner] to all Melanesians finds the assent of many anthropologists. Notable among these is Erik Schwimmer, to whom exchange was central38. Research among many Melanesian peoples has led the Melanesian Institute to teach this principle as well.

---

35 When a tiger-shark took three victims from near Sir of the Madang Bel people, one of the theories was that a big-man lacking rightful compensation for something, had called up a *masalai*. The other (unpleasant) theory was that the author, a visiting white man, had exercised his displeasure at something. How strictly they believe these things is not known, but the views are articulated repeatedly in Melanesian communities.
36 Filer loc. cit. 1990, p.95 ff.
37 This is thoroughly covered in the “Life in Melanesia” Section, and is integral to the Thesis.
Human development

Through the “Young Melanesians” or “Marriage and Family Life” Projects, and by many individual studies, the Melanesian Institute compiles and archives the distilled experience of social, pastoral and anthropological experience from earliest European contact to the present. It has brought together “people who have both experience in Melanesia and expertise in a particular academic field”⁹⁹⁸, and in this thesis has earned the right to offer insights into exchange and development. These impeccable sources lead this chapter on “Human Development” into its central point, that interaction between people of different cultures leads to misinterpretation of the others’ goals; and therefore that a grasp of development in Melanesian countries needs to make a research space greater than socio-economic theory currently provides.

As Fugmann explains, via the term lo in Madang:

Similarly, all life experiences are associated with the concept of lo, and are seen as the consequence of previous actions or behaviour. For instance, lightning, a falling branch, a rustle in the foliage of the forest, a swollen knee or the vigorous growth of a banana plant become meaningful within this framework of lo, because these events can always be understood as a result of earlier attitudes or ways of conduct... If lo is honoured, upheld and fulfilled, a secure and harmonious existence is guaranteed. ⁴⁰

This again has something to do with the much misunderstood “payback” which means reciprocity⁴¹ - and should be viewed as exchange. The insights over a hundred years show the deep-felt need for balance in Melanesian people, and to which Filer was obliquely referring. Schwimmer, describing single sex dances, the nonn in New Guinea, outlines a dance which “is composed of couples, thus expressing the widespread New Guinean view that the universe is made up of dualities, and that whatever is complete has two sides”⁴². Since Eric Schwimmer refers to the “universe”, and uses the phrase

⁴¹ Even violent reprisals are seen in the context of general reciprocity. Reciprocity is a root paradigm, not an inborn need of “primitives” to be violent. This is a critical distinction that needs to be made between “payback” and reciprocity.
⁴² Schwimmer, E. “Male couples in New Guinea”, in Herdt, R.(ed.)Ritualized
“whatever is complete”, he makes it clear that there is a strong link between the duality in dances and many other fundamental features of New Guinean cultures, in his view. He is not talking merely about dances: he is demonstrating that a root paradigm - complementary parts - influences the way that people think and act. “Papua New Guinea ways” should be a method of thinking about development, using such concepts as reciprocity.

The maligned “payback” seems to be the Western attempt to generalise from limited data, data that is closely strained through the fine mesh of Anglo culture and which therefore obscured the more accurate notion of “reciprocity”. Rather, exchange is a way of life unlike financial transactions in Sydney (or Moresby). A Melanesian agreement for the purposes of logging rights would focus on two-way relationships.

That there has been anarchy, formally sanctioned by custom, in what is now Papua New Guinea, is at odds with the basic idea of government, and "Policy". The form which that “anarchy” took was exchange; Sillitoe has given evidence that not only was exchange important, it was also the way in which the majority of Oceanic societies regulated the behaviour of their members.

Papua New Guineans need to be recognised as being high on the “grid” scale, in terms of Mary Douglas’ “group” and “grid” societies. “Group” means that the community is central and people identify with communal interests rather than the focus of some Western societies on individualism. “Grid” societies are depicted as those who always have a ranking, who are never left to their own measurement and always clearly defined, usually according to rank. Papua New Guineans are one of the most strikingly “grid” societies on record. With its inherent competitiveness in exchange, and the tendency to rank parallel institutions, persons, and products (nambawan, nambatu, nambatri), the Melanesian zone of the world was ripe for development-envy. And this kind of “Grid” community was defined, precisely, by exchange, not incidentally, but as the method of social organisation.

---

Homosexuality in Melanesia 1984, p.251.

Give and take..., 1979, and see Introduction to Chapter One, above.

Whereas people are expelled from an individualist, market oriented society, in many hierarchical societies such as in India, Nepal or Tonga an incompetent tends to go lower on the rungs, to be demoted but not to feel alienation or its attendant neuroses; there are other complexes for the “grid” inhabitant, namely envy if competition is present. See M. Douglas, Risk and Blame, pp. 218 ff.
SELF DETERMINATION

All these observations point to the need for a deeper understanding in those attempting to "develop" PNG. The question is whether and how they will develop themselves. If this seems a bland truism, consider that the solutions have been attempted before. In this section, it becomes clear that seriously and pragmatically using the notion of self determination saves the confusion caused by an imposed culture. The corollary is that Papua New Guineans are not so confused that they abandon Melanesian ways.

To encourage self development, Social Impact Assessments need to be done in conjunction with Environmental Impact Assessments. Hartmut Holzknecht has the requisite experience in this field, especially of community consultation, and his work in viable forest management is described in this Section. Questions about such viability are subsequently raised. To some researchers, the rural people’s capitulation to commercial interests is provocative. Therefore a balanced view of self determination is attempted in this section of the study; Rod Taylor is a legal advisor with several years experience in Papua New Guinea, and is a strong advocate of self determination in Forestry matters. His contribution to the debate is valuable and must be appraised. Both current researchers in PNG and social scientists in other regions form a bedrock of research methods on "self determination". These are considered the best from both an empirical and from a theoretical point of view.

The range of views on self determination is extreme. Bernard Narokobi, writing about the separation of village and state, is provocative:

In my opinion, the State exists to exploit, to perpetuate itself and to justify its existence. The clan or a village exists, on the contrary, as long as it maintains its balance. There is no bureaucracy in the village to justify expenditure at all. There are no armed forces. There is no police force. The State, in theory, is is supposed to serve the people, but in practice ... operates on its own without regard to the general population.46

45 See Silltoc op.cits.  
46 Narokobi in Fugmann op.cit.1986, p.7. Bernard Narokobi is an active christian politician, a veteran in development for Melanesia, and an advocate of "The Melanesian Way". He is the most widely published Melanesian philosopher and the most reliable
In a similar vein, Brown and Brown expose the "underbelly" of development, in the context of their detailed scientific evaluation of human interaction with Brazilian forests:

effective use and saving of the resources rests in ultimate analysis with the local people who depend upon them...It is tragic that so many politicians, economists and international agencies regard these people as living in "unsustainable and predatory extractivist" or "poor rural" economies, and seem to want to disintegrate their systems of resource protection...for the immediate benefit of larger parasitic urban populations or specialized economic interests, often aimed at the export of superfluous items.47

Self determination, in the context of the exporter- and urbanist-ideology, means more than establishing Provincial capital districts. The entire State needs to be invested with the aim of participation. Operating on previous systems of participation, Melanesian communities have blocked development, demanded development, challenged the State, and fostered military groups in conscious independence of the State. Bougainville was merely one, extreme example of this.

Certainly what can be observed about Melanesian groups, as Gellner observed of Maghrebian nomads, is that they are "defined by near-universal male participation in organised violence"48. Given the fame of New Guinea clans for raids and long-term hostility, Gellner's idea may be applicable where he concludes that the modern state "can, must and does monopolise legitimate violence. In other words, it undercuts those political mutual-help associations which...are known as tribes."49 It fits PNG. Gellner

source of insight on "Papua New Guinea ways", vis-a-vis the Fifth Directive Principle of the Preamble to the PNG Constitution.
49 loc.cit.p.56. Tribe is an epithet singularly unsuited to Melanesia because of coresiding families' regular incorporation of other "name groups" into its own by marriage; see M.Fried's The notion of tribe and "Substance, siblingship and exchange..." by James Weiner. Still, the Gellner/ Khaldun thesis applies well, and Gellner points out the popular use of the term without committing himself to it - he is an anthropologist and is
Human development
depicts Ibn Khaldun as a sociologist. "The inhabitants of Spain," commented Ibn Khaldun, "especially have forgotten group feeling... since their country... is depleted of tribal groups." Gellner's summary is that "You could have communal, civic spirit, or you could have civilisation - but not both," to the extent that "the preconditions of civilisation and of cohesion are mutually antithetical... These two plants will not grow in the same soil." So this is not parallel to a Federal system (such as Australia), with centralised government opposing state government; rather the personalised, public mode of community in the village is opposed to the bureaucracy moved by the engine of cash economy.

Community power is the germ of meaning in Papua New Guinea. The old and the new ways are not separated and therefore not distinct; they each relate one to the other. In such an age, as Einar Sveinsson stated about the writing of Icelandic Sagas:

The [pagan] way of thinking it represents still had a strong hold over men's minds, and at the same time men were acutely aware of a great difference between their own time and the past.

In a more radical vein, Einar Sveinsson comments on the past culture of Iceland:

Abroad the mighty themselves, and following them the historians, cover the deeds of violence with the robes of Church or State by giving them the appellation of political necessity, by turning the crime into more or less lawful punishment; but in Iceland [of the Middle Ages] the idea of the state can hardly be seen for mere individuals. It is they who must take all this on their own shoulders.

Well aware of the difficulty of terminology, having for decades studied segmentary societies, whose boundaries shift according to circumstance. See Saints of the Atlas 1969.

Gellner loc.cit. p.19.

loc.cit. p.17. The citations of Khaldun all come from Saints of the Atlas, pp.1 - 23, by Ernest Gellner, who does not specify his source.

Working from Nigerian ethnography and elsewhere, Stanley Diamond expounded this same philosophy at length in his In search of the primitive: a critique of civilization (Transaction Books, New York, 1974).

The Age of the Sturlungs, 1966 pp.70 ff.

ibid.
In some ways, all this applies to modern Papua New Guineans. It is necessary to provide general statements so that “development” becomes a forum for humanity, for improving the human lot. Recognition of cultural difference should not blind us to our common heritage as human beings. And the evidence cited shows that some features are similar in many different societies. It also reveals substantial self determination among these societies, which is the main point of this present wide ranging research.

The discussion can be pruned down considerably by positing a systemic problem. Gary Simpson, former Director of the Kandrian Gloucester Integrated Development Project, stated that “Greater recognition must be given to the problem of achieving popular participation and equity in rural PNG”\(^56\). Another researcher who can give practical advice about the destructive aspect of poor participation is Hartmut Holzknecht, who has been involved with the Pasismanua districts (and elsewhere) for some years. In his work for the Unitech research team he found that services are abysmal\(^6\). He clearly found that they had high hopes for the logging industry. “The assumption is also that the logging project will bring them all a lot of money and will be the key to their wealth, improved lifestyle and improved health”\(^58\). Holzknecht’s first step has been to set up Social Impact Assessments (SIAs) in a proper consultative atmosphere. He defines SIAs as “a process of assessing the possible effects and functional impacts on communities of proposed interventions required for large-scale socio-economic change”\(^59\). He comments on the status quo for loggers’ SIAs:

Research is never begun early enough to allow proper baseline data to be collected (whether on various aspects of the environment or of the landholding groups).\(^60\)

Holzknecht cites examples of the poor practices in Pasismanua, stating that many SIA’s “are ‘thrown together’ by the project proponents themselves or by persons

\(^{56}\) Simpson, op. cit. in Filer ed. 1997, p.31.
\(^{58}\) loc.cit.p.58.
\(^{59}\) from Wildman 1988:31 in Holzknecht loc.cit.p.60.
\(^{60}\) loc.cit.p.61.
from their legal firms who are quite unqualified in doing this kind of work”. Henderson dubs this “a ‘search-and-replace’ exercise on the word processor”\textsuperscript{61}. Holzknecht gives a clear direction, based on a clear principle: a politically active approach that maintains respectful consultation with owners. Self-determination entails engagement, not leaving villagers to themselves.

The democratic initiative needs further research. Holzknecht insists on basing it on the political context. “Decision making generally can be characterized as being either predominantly technical or predominantly political; the same is able to be applied to SIA. Neither approach is value free”\textsuperscript{62}. He cites studies that highlight the full participation of indigenous peoples including Melser (1983), who looked at intangibles such as identity and attachment to community [“group!”]\textsuperscript{63}. Holzknecht emphasise the integral effect of Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs) and SIAs, and his recommendations comprise one of the best holistic programmes for Papua New Guinea.

Some researchers, as Carrier pointed out, thought that “Tribesmen were turned into peasants and big men into entrepreneurs (Finney 1973; Meggitt 1971)”\textsuperscript{64}. Because this has not happened in most of PNG, i.e. in villages where in fact most people live, the effects of colonisation though pervasive have been far from total, in some cases arguably being trivial. The problem with post-colonialism applied to Papua New Guinea is that villages evince a robustness of lifestyle. Carrier complains that studies have been done in PNG showing how “individuals shuttle back and forth between more village-oriented and more Western-oriented activities and realms, but they leave largely unexplored the ways that village society itself … is touched”\textsuperscript{65}. Another approach was to indeed look at indigenous processes, but to isolate these from villager interaction with the region\textsuperscript{66}. A third set of approaches observes the changes that occur through interaction - which is often dubbed “interpenetration” in this chapter - and effects of

\textsuperscript{61} Henderson op.cit. 1995 p.7.
\textsuperscript{62} op.cit.1991 p.62.
\textsuperscript{63}Melser,P. Assessing Social Impacts: a Practical Guide, in Holzknecht loc.cit.p.62. Holzknecht’s paper is a most circumspect analysis and with specific reference to Pasismanua and other districts of New Britain.
\textsuperscript{64} Carrier op.cit.1992. “Approaches to articulation”, p.119. The cross-references allude to Ben Finney’s Big men and business 1973, and Meggitt’s article “From tribesmen to peasants…” Anth. in Oceania, Hiatt and Jayawardena eds.
\textsuperscript{65} loc.cit.p.121.
\textsuperscript{66} loc.cit.pp.121-124.
capitalism on the third world. Yet it does not characteristically reveal what comprises a modern village. As Carrier puts it, "village societies often appear as little more than ill-understood entities hovering on the edge of Third World cities".

Since this theory leaves 97% of PNG citizens in bleak obscurity, the research community is left with a major problem: how do we describe development of the majority of citizens of PNG who are already in one sense "self determined"?

Carrier advocates studying the links between "commodity relations" of the national economy, and the "gift relations" of the precapitalist village sector. That is what the sections on gifts and exchange, in this Chapter and in Chapter Two, have done briefly. The word which Carrier uses to describe his own mistake is "misrecognition" [opposite to the "wrong focus", and the euphemism mal feut used in this thesis):

The classical anthropological elements of Ponam life that we saw were not very old ... they were altered in important ways by colonization.

Policy makers who view village people as passive recipients stumble precisely over the colonial fallacy. Those who implement initiatives in PNG need to look carefully at the ways people actually do things in villages. While certain things change, for example mortuary practices among the Kaulong, other things persist in some form or other, perhaps not "pristine", but certainly with a measure of control on the part of the colonised. This is because in one sense the villages are already self determined: to implement policy without acknowledging this is to clash with community power. The meaning of development in PNG is a medley of half-successes orbiting, albeit unaware, about a reliable centre of community power: a Melanesian experiment.

Holzknecht's most current study, for the Resource Owner Involvement project (ROI), is crucial in this regard. His paper bears on the issue of interpenetration, the crucial point since it integrates the "lone village" and the "colonial villain" ideal types into something more rigorous. A comprehensive approach to ROI, for even such micro-areas as Pasismanua, is complex, and Holzknecht has carefully trialled the steps with

---

67 The main proponent is Claude Meillassoux who wrote a very sophisticated marxist interpretation of colonialism called Maidens, Meal and Money (Cambridge U.P. 1981).
69 loc.cit. p.136.
locals to develop collaboration. Without going into all the details Holzknecht describes, it is important that he believes in the part that democracy still has to play in his own nation - since he is a citizen of PNG. In the contexts described in West New Britain, these are bold statements.

"An important task of SIA", he writes, "is the stimulation of active and real community participation in this developmental process". Monitoring by resource owners is crucial to the process of self-determination of villagers in the timber industries. Holzknecht describes a number of aims, among them responsible self-management with ongoing monitoring. One main point is that these are all context-sensitive, and they are all responsive to the communities involved.

Incorporated Land Groups (ILGs) are a legal entity within the legislative repertoire of Papua New Guinea, actually since 1974. Holzknecht writes that these "should not be confused with 'Landowner Companies' [which] are normal commercial companies ... for whom there is no requirement that there should be any customary relationship". An ILG lists members with the criteria for membership, and can review membership in a similar way to the customary flexibility. They are required to have transparent dealings before all members. "The Land Groups Incorporation Act", therefore, approaches the issue of control and management of land and resources in an innovative and constructive fashion without losing the strengths of customary resource tenure and use systems. For example, none of the above requirements interferes with the customary arrangement of temporary access rights to land and resources for certain individuals." On the other hand, whilst I was approached by someone from the "Arawe" culture area who appeared to be in tandem with logging company administration, he at no time mentioned Incorporated Land Groups or anything like it. But he did say that custom was strong; this would bode well for ILGs and localised

---

71 loc.cit. p.65.
72 The main point is that there is a clear methodology for development in the context of logging in Papua New Guinea. Here the research base for this approach is very broad, with a good "control" function, that is, comparison according to the scientific method, across a number of communities with resource developments. A deliberate choice has been made to give only an indication of the field of studies. See also Larmour, P. State, Society and Governance in Melanesia, Discussion Paper 96/1 "Research on Governance in Weak States in Melanesia" (Australian National Uni., RSPAS, 1996).
75 ibid.
control. As Hartmut Holzknecht says, “Some of the willy-nilly developments which have taken place in PNG society and which have preempted the proper authority of resource owners and their communities need to be reined in and brought under control by resource owners and their groups themselves”\textsuperscript{76}.

In a similar vein, Clement and Kabamdana wrote about participatory planning, for the National Forestry Action Programmes of the U.N.\textsuperscript{77} In their appraisal of development, they use the term “path”. Where development comes from the top down, it is linear, and when it comes from creative initiative of locals alone, they also call this “linear” (bottom up”). By contrast, a “path” is collaborative and "plays on the joint dynamics of the network of actors who are mutually supportive throughout this joint 'experiment'. The rationality of this procedural approach only emerges as it progresses”\textsuperscript{78}. The epigraph by Dan Rose on page one of this thesis - that “students will seek ... to live through complex ongoing events” - is precisely that point, that a study acquires a sort of narrative quality, and the conclusion is reached only through negotiating the differences which actors bring to the project. “Path” fits in nicely with the Pisin word rot, "road", which has precisely the sense of appraising the alternatives, and finding a way.

Taylor (1995)\textsuperscript{79} also has outlined the case for customary law to define the local public interest. He points out that "[Ministers] derive personal legitimacy from delivering goods and services to their electorate and have little interest in the wider legitimacy of government (Jackson 1992:82, Oh 1995:10)" \textsuperscript{80}. From his perspective, the comments of Narokobi, that “The State ... operates on its own without regard to the general population” \textsuperscript{81} are certainly true for Papua New Guinea. Development is exchange. Therefore the local public interest should be taken over by villagers in local processes, according to Taylor.

The \textit{United Nations Declaration of indigenous People's Rights} states that indigenous peoples are entitled to have “laws, traditions and customs, land-tenure

\textsuperscript{76} Holzknecht op cit.1995a p.5.
\textsuperscript{78} loc.cit. pp.57-8
\textsuperscript{79} Taylor,Rod “The State versus custom - regulating PNG’s timber industry”, in Filer,C. ed., op.cit. 1997; the present quotations and citations are from the original typescript.
\textsuperscript{80} loc.cit.p.16.
\textsuperscript{81} 1986 op.cit.
systems and institutions for the development and management of resources” recognised\textsuperscript{82}. Article 31 gives them “autonomy or self-government” rights.

For those reasons, because custom itself is an organiser of events, because of government weakness, the need for flexibility, and the possibility of empowering villagers, self-determination is an enormous issue, one of the first issues, to be broached by all PNG Governments. It should be discussed by them and all developmental organisations, with a view to decentralising governance by the State.

\textbf{SUSTAINABLE AND UNSUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT}

The section on sustainability reflects the complexity of the term itself. The first overall insight is that the biological context must go hand in hand with the human context. The second insight is that the technical nature of many sources and citations reveal an enormous scope for further research in the Pasismanua, regarding biodiversity and related study. The following discussion is steered away from the wealth of such data being compiled, and away from the pressing need for consideration of biological information being lost both from the books and from the world. One of the most well known logging companies, Rimbunan Hijau, is in this Section considered as a participant in the process of deforestation. The National Forestry and Conservation Action Programme provides much information on how such a logging company in PNG might be handled.

Logging must be sustainable in PNG. The sense of sustained yield, that which is an ecologically supportable method of taking out trees, is the sense here used\textsuperscript{83}. The regional ecology of the rainforest, creating what is called its micro-climate, and the differing life-cycles of species, make for a unique study in each zone and in each area. Pasismanua has lowland, hill- and montane forest, all with a crucial watershed that comprises a wetland, from the coral reefs to the mountain ecosystem. Upon this system the Kaulong are highly dependent. Sustainable yield on a 40-year cycle is difficult to practise. Yet Holzknecht also writes that “biological and forestry experts do not agree amongst themselves that such an approach is sustainable, nor if it can continue in this

\textsuperscript{82} Article 26.
\textsuperscript{83} c.f.Holzknecht op.cit 1995, pp.8-9.
way in perpetuity”\textsuperscript{84}.

The wider regional ramifications of logging (and other projects) are also associated with this, since the outflow of rivers in Pasismanua is enormous, with frequent flash floods in the rainy season. This can affect estuaries and reefs; and the erosion coefficient of logging in the limestone ridge geology is large, with the probability of chronic loss of topsoil and subsidiary effects on nearby forest, disastrous flooding, and therefore hunger and social disruption to the Kaulong people. If a logging-cycle of a certain number of years is posited, one must wonder at the different growth rates of loggable trees. A forty-year cycle (i.e. between cuts) was promoted, but there is “evidence of variable regeneration rates”\textsuperscript{85} between species. Most figures are taken from the perspective of the greater metropolitan. To say that Papua New Guinea can sustain a yield of 3.5m. cubic meters annually\textsuperscript{86}, and that the Industry gets as much - even if the figures are correct ! - may be useful to statisticians in Government, but it scarcely offers support to Forestry Officers watching Rimbunan Hijau trucks pulling the loads into Kamman or nearby. It is necessary to curb the loggers from stealing more than the agreed amount. Any apportionment of downsizing of logging will need to take account of the poor correlation between permitted, actual and sustainable cut levels\textsuperscript{87}. Actual may be more than permitted (theft), and permitted may be more than sustainable (mistakes or mismanagement).

There is a large conglomerate with sister-Companies, known as Rimbunan Hijau (Malay for green forest). It has been in the Kandrian districts for about five years and has caused a total transformation in the landscape in many areas, horrifying some of the church-workers who live and work there\textsuperscript{88}. An allied or supportive Malaysian company, Cakara Alam, is working up the coast towards Gasmata\textsuperscript{89}. One can hardly recapitulate the “curriculum vitae” of this Company but the rough outline includes ownership of 60 -

\textsuperscript{84} 1995b p.7.
\textsuperscript{85} Filer,C. in Filer, C. editor op.cit.1997, p.237.
\textsuperscript{86} Duncan op.cit., p.xiv.
\textsuperscript{87} The extraordinarily large controversy over permitted and sustainable, as opposed to actual cutting down of forests, is well covered by Colin Filer in “A statistical profile of the log export industry”, pp.217-227 in Filer,C. editor op.cit.1997. To Barnett the author of the Barnett Report that had originally criticised the industry, thought that 70-80 years was a more realistic cutting cycle. loc.cit. p.219.
\textsuperscript{88} A couple working among the Kaulong returned after a year’s break and were shocked at the stark transformation; personal communication from Craig and Linda Throop of the Summer Institute of Linguistics, 1994.
\textsuperscript{89} Personal communication from government workers in Pasismanua.
80% of all the logging done in PNG and that it established itself in 10 Provinces\(^\text{90}\); it owns the largest timber concessions in Malaysia\(^\text{91}\); some of the problems in the villages are that alcohol abuse increases, erosion occurs and drinking water is contaminated\(^\text{92}\), cultural sites are sometimes destroyed, prostitution has come on a large scale in some districts, and there has been an increase in disease because of destruction of the environment\(^\text{93}\). The transgressions against Forest Authority regulations are not merely commercial peccadilloes. There have been accusations of blatant deception. For example, the acting manager for Morobe Province for the Authority, Mrs. Agatha Pokatu, complained of Rimbunan Hijau’s underhanded actions on the Huon Gulf coastline, in September 1993. She had a shipload of unauthorised equipment sent back to Lae, and “was also upset that the landowner company ... had not informed her office of any dealings it had done or had engaged in, let alone complaints of environmental damages and benefits that were later channelled to her office”\(^\text{94}\). The complainants did exist but the LOC had evidently been funded by Rimbunan Hijau.

In addition, the Company organised a news conference with its national backers to protest against the new conservation laws. This was led by the Minister Posai’s brother, from Kandrian, and the news conference involved most of the logging areas or all, from Pasismanua. It had been largely enabled by Rimbunan Hijau’s hiring of a Queen’s Council and their flying village people over to Moresby to protest\(^\text{95}\). This was in addition to its frequent protests against environmental strictures, published in its own daily paper - The National is the Company’s paper, with the responsibility being held by Pacific Star Limited. Its major shareholder is Rimbunan Hijau and the Chairman is head of Rimbunan Hijau\(^\text{96}\). This is not to mention the dozens of aliases of the Company, in the guise of its numerous subsidiaries\(^\text{97}\). Sustainability, on evidence, does not seem to

\(^{90}\) Schoell op.cit.p.149. Filer disputes the size of its share, from his own statistics, but acknowledges Rimbunan Hijau’s dominance. In Filer op.cit.1997, pp. 212-217.


\(^{92}\) loc.cit. pp.41-2.

\(^{93}\) ibid.

\(^{94}\) Nen, T. “The dissidents’ dilemma in the Buhem-Mongi TRP Area”, in Filer op.cit. 1997, p.76.

\(^{95}\) Kuerschner-Pelkmann op.cit. pp.40, 108.

\(^{96}\) loc.cit., p.64.

\(^{97}\) Filer gives evidence of four (multi-million kina) subsidiaries, the most well known being Niugini Lumber Merchants, and other tenuous links with at least ten companies in which Rimbunan Hijau has a large, or majority, interest. Cakara Alam, the other major logger in New Britain, is among these. See op.cit. 1997 p.214.
be any part of this company's priorities.

Not only have letters for and against been published in the PNG papers; in Malaysia there has been trenchant criticism\textsuperscript{98}. Such criticism also applies in like measure to the businesses buying in Japan. In \textit{PNG Business} of October 1995, the Japanese Catholic Commission for Peace and Development strongly criticised the trade practices of loggers and others in the industry. Sister Yasuka Shimizu said that "the sad situation with PNG logs (and Solomon Islands) is that they are used in Japan for plywood and for concrete panels, and when the concrete is dry, the panels are removed and the timber either dumped or burnt. 'This practice is a waste of PNG's beautiful logs, which are the fruits of a thousand years. And this is why we are campaigning for Japanese consumers to reduce their imports of PNG logs from PNG.' "\textsuperscript{99}. Sister Yasuka Shimizu was angry that so little went to the owners. "'In reality, when the landowners receive their royalties, it would be an average of about K1 per cubic metre. When that log goes to Japan, the import price is around US$300. ... So in reality, only less than one per cent of the log price goes to the landowners, and this is the real cheating game that is still going on' "\textsuperscript{100}. In other words, the whole investment pattern from overseas is not sustainable.

Meanings have a completely different feel and form when there is consistent poverty and poor infrastructure, such as is expressed by "Log Without End", an owner from West New Britain:

... a feeling that perhaps all those forest owners like me who have been living among the evergreen forest the rest of our lives have about logging and critics of logging in our country. Where I come from, I view logging as a stepping stone to development and prosperity for our population. And I see (logging) as giving us sunshine.\textsuperscript{101}

And if this is not cogent to environmentalists, yet it is prevalent enough to make a politician think twice, as the following letter to \textit{Times of PNG}, 7th July 1994, shows:

\textsuperscript{98} Kuerschner-Pelkmann op.cit.pp.32-33, 42-43.
\textsuperscript{99} \textit{ibid.} p.1.
\textsuperscript{100} \textit{PNG Business} p.2.
\textsuperscript{101} In Filer op.cit.1996, p.295.
Human development

... The critics seem to be blind about the benefits the industry has done to Papua New Guinea and its people. Timber industry projects have brought roads, aid posts, schools and other infrastructures that directly benefit many remote areas of the country where development and delivery of basic services are unheard of... People in the rural areas who are mostly landowners have been neglected for a long time. They've been promised roads, aid posts and schools but all these remain as promises until forest developers arrived and turned these promises into reality.

The objective of this man's development is to get roads, aid posts and schools. These are all authentic cries for improvement and will be part of any plan for development (and "modernisation"). But what do Papua New Guineans mean, when they cry for such development? An aid post means the children won't be sick, the women won't be chronically neglected, malaria (including the lethal cerebral form of malaria in West New Britain), TB and AIDS can be checked. On the other hand, what about health education, without which AIDS and above all Tuberculosis will likely become epidemic, judging by its increase world wide? An aid post will give access and it's one step - but an aid post is poor substitute for a resident General Practitioner; or for a community health centre manned by such; or for a real base hospital for every district. So, what is the logging supporter asking for?

It seems fair to say, some of the logging supporter's requests would not generate sustainable development, even if they started it. Judging by the Madang youths' comments in chapter three, education can lead also to despair, for many. What is often in the papers is the purveyors of modern PNG culture talking to each other with one eye on their village audience and possibly their backers/ patrons. Thus the quote from The Times... seems to reveal an antagonist quite comfortable in debating the benefits of logging without ever directly addressing the criterion of sustainability.

Considering the poverty and hardship experienced in PNG especially by women and children, the complainants "formula" is understandable. Filer comments:

Are they really the dazed and disillusioned dupes of foreign pests and parasites, or are they willing partners in a process which makes perfect economic sense to people who believe that they have tried and failed in
Human development

all other efforts to achieve a reasonable increase in living standards?"\textsuperscript{102}

The human context demands that national or international NGOs show insight and understanding. The biological context of sustainable development goes hand in hand with the human context. That is why the "path" approach of the Food and Agriculture Organisation, “finding a road” in Tok Pisin, is by far the wisest approach.

GOOD GOVERNANCE

Questions about alternative forms of governance are raised in this section. Particular regard is given to Peter Larmour’s discussion of governance among Melanesian nations, because his perspective is informed by decades of political science, cultural analysis and relevant data on Pacific nations conducted by the Australian National University. The information covered in this section appears to show that self determination must be linked with good governance.

By way of illustration, the sense of central institutions is overpowering in Waigani of the National Capital District, and so is the sense of contrast with the rest of Port Moresby and indeed the whole country. The well-publicised “rascals” have a presence even here. Many people, especially women, are afraid in Port Moresby\textsuperscript{103}. Substantial areas of low grade housing contrast with the offices and housing of government workers and modern banking facilities, doubly so in the case of resorts. Outside observers would expect migrants and itinerant workers, especially with families, to shun the place. Despite this, shanty towns known as “squatter settlements” exist in many places, and not only are they self-supporting and socially accepted, as well there is a willingness to live in settlements that should make NGOs ask questions\textsuperscript{104}. The point is that villagers flock to towns, but rarely to be near to the seat of government. Colin Filer describes a “deep sense of distrust” between the village and the state, that he says existed between ethnic groups and now is “characteristic of

\textsuperscript{102} ibid.

\textsuperscript{103} If evidence is demanded for asserting the emotional state of PNG women, there are frequent articles and letters in the tabloids; and in innumerable informal conversations the topic was common in many parts of the country visited by this writer.

\textsuperscript{104} The author has also stayed in government housing at Gerehu Stage Three precinct in
relationships between individual leaders and many of their clients"\textsuperscript{103}.

Peter Larmour points out that governments are weak because of the "inability of state elites to act against strong resistance", and because they are "weak in relation to other socially powerful actors" or "in relation to corrosive social forces" \textsuperscript{105}. These points all fit Papua New Guinea. Governance models, he says, have not been common because "ideas about governance are antagonistic to, or decentre, the state as sovereign, external, and controlling"\textsuperscript{107}. Thus also, NGOs fill an executive gap in PNG.

One prominent organisation was Christensen Research Institute (C.R.I.), funded by outsiders with a stipend for local administration and an emphasis on international research. The land was leased from Madang islanders with their options on employing of islanders at C.R.I. It existed to promote the unique PNG biological life, scientific research, and biodiversity, although now is disbanded due to the backers pulling out. Peter Larmour traces the work of such NGOs to a direct interest by the World Bank in change on a large scale. He sees importance in "the new relationships the World Bank has been forming with non-government organisations. They find a similar vision: 'doubts about the capacity of third world governments [from Williams and Young 1994:99], a stress on civil society, and hostility to cultural traditions that are inconsistent with western ideas about rights and justice'"\textsuperscript{108}. To this student, such an influence appears to cast doubts on many organisations which claim ethical "high ground"\textsuperscript{109}.

The question is, "why does government need to be involved in all details of life?" Is it, in Australia, China, or anywhere? And why, subsequently, do we assume that "business" or "investment" or something similar, is the only alternative, substitute, or supplement to "government"? In PNG it is emphatically not, and the assertive, ignorant, contrary, non-aligned, unfair, anti-business, anti-bureaucracy mode in which a multitude of cultures fall, may just show that the negative construction put upon "barriers" to "development" are the cipher to blind Western eyes of a positive, robust political economy with thirty thousand years' spirituality that refuses to be

outer Port Moresby for two weeks, and writes from experience.
\textsuperscript{105} In Sekhran and Miller eds. op cit. p.198.
\textsuperscript{106} Larmour, P. Models of Governance and development administration, 1996/1 p.3.
\textsuperscript{107} ibid.
\textsuperscript{108} In Larmour, P."Governance ..." in Forster, M. ed., Governance and good government... 1995 p.20.
\textsuperscript{109} This was the nub of criticism of several NGOs in recent years.
overwhelmed or to be homogenised. Mal feut. This prises open a field of experience and study where the clues (and observe that every adjective describes what it is not) lead to a set of understandings.

Many of the stumbles of development in Papua New Guinea are, each, a synecdoche. A synecdoche is an element that may stand for the whole, not merely a symbol *per se* but a piece of a bundle of meanings. Such a synecdoche means that those who are experiencing the "whole thing", vis., the living culture, the modern Papua New Guinea culture(s), see why things happen the way they do, simply put, and why things don't happen the way they don't!

In Tok Pisin two sets of thinking is *tupela tingtong*, which is "doubt". That is the perfect sense of the etymology of the word "doubt", *in dubitum*, in two things. Doubt is encoded in the running of Papua New Guinea. No wonder foreigners cannot read the cipher! The cipher is a synecdoche to that which cannot be read by the foreigner's culture. The evidence suggests that there are indeed two levels of thinking, one at the top administrative level and the other at the local level of administration, where in complex interactions between Government, Council and villagers, no one is all that happy with development.

What has been distorting many plans is an ineffectual means of relating policy to any real situation where it would do citizens any good. Development of a project *in situ* is more relevant to the effective delivery of support for PNG people. Scarlett Epstein found that in India, the background of leaders led to different attitudes about policy, especially policy that affected the poor and reform that would help the poor. They also found that the culture of bureaucracy in India had a stifling effect on the actions of officials dealing directly with the public; that "reforms" were simply instructions to be obeyed and that the organisational structure tended to be pyramidal with virtually no option for what is now called "flattening" such a bureaucracy. It seems that such studies need urgently to be done, and could well augment the work of

---

109 Taken from the symbolism of Levi-Strauss' analysis of South American myth in *Le Cru et le Cuit (The Raw and the Cooked)*, 1964.


AusAID improving staff development\textsuperscript{113}. There is a general need, not to capitulate to all tradition, but to absorb the fairly certain trends in behaviour, into administrative culture.

The trouble is that governments have acted with narrow philosophies. Governance has come about with one or two outcomes in mind, when in fact there are many meanings to development. One crucial matter is that there are new issues involved with self determination, because the local economy - village markets, and town markets such as Kandrian - is drawn into many levels of an international economy\textsuperscript{114}. The other crucial matter is about local economy per se and some implications for women and non-market economy as a whole. This is precisely "work" without real markets\textsuperscript{115} [both economies operate on the so-called "dual economy" model], and the fact that women proud of such labour do not, on the whole, speak in Council or Parliament.

\textbf{LABOUR AND ECONOMY}

PNG has a large and active labour force. The question needs to be posed, "What effect can a more enabled and responsive labour force have on development?" In this section, gender matters are described because they affect the division of labour, although gender is by no means the only basis for the division of labour. Dealing with gender in this way provides fresh insight into development.

During the Melanesian Institute survey\textsuperscript{116}, observations were made on proxemic behaviour (the physical placement of people in relation to other members of society), and on New Britain villagers' statements about ideology. Gender was near the centre of these issues. Elizabeth Ibua wrote that "In three provinces... the relationship between males and females was not so rigid as in East/ West New Britain Provinces. This was very obvious when we had to brief the people about the research in in places like Kandrian. Women kept apart, would not mix with the men for the meeting. They also had 'Haus Bois' which are strictly for male and female are not to go near them..."\textsuperscript{117}

\textsuperscript{113} Profile of Activities 1996 p. 29.
\textsuperscript{114} See Holzknecht's lucid account of these matters in "Pro Bono Publico?..." in Filer, ed. op.cit. 1997.
\textsuperscript{115} By this is meant normative cash markets; in Melanesia non-cash markets were the normal places of exchange and other types were exceptional.
\textsuperscript{116} Zocca, F. and de Groot, N. op.cit.
Human development

Elizabeth had been a High School Principal, and a human rights activist who supervised the field work of “Young Melanesians: alternatives for the future”. For three years she collaborated with the Anthropologists, the Sociologist from La Trobe University, and trainers, in the compilation of a register of youth concerns. She is a dependable source of information on PNG villagers’ attitudes; and what she observed for Kandrian was a trend for young women to be assigned a narrow range of tasks. This is an attempt to see women’s contribution in a developmental context. These empirical trends were added to previous, published research on gender in West New Britain.

Participant observation of ethnographers was combined with retrospective analysis and theory that is usual in ethnographic fieldwork, and included surveys among the peoples involved (Kaulong and Sengseng). There was some publicity from the West New Britain Women’s Association, on work projects for village women. Assisting them were Marsha Berman and Paula van de Berg, both anthropologists, and AusAID workers. Villagers, led by businesswoman Angie Dunnas, secretary of the Association, had significant involvement.

Further studies of work habits and employment opportunities are urgently needed in PNG. Despite this gap in the literature, there is considerable chronological and analytical depth in this section. The bare statistics from “Young Melanesians” are highly reliable and yield helpful insights; Jane Goodale’s work, while “hermeneutic” in intent, is very accurate and detailed, and it is cited as a bona fide description of the lifestyle of forest dwellers in the Pasismanua environment. Among the development options subsequently considered, Arlyne Johnson’s work with the Integrated Conservation and Development programme, is described to show how complicated activities can be.

All Papua New Guineans are capable of producing for at least the local market while living in their own village. There are other industries open to someone in almost all villages, such as Public Motor Vehicles (including outboard motors on the seaboard). With assistance, the produce of local gardens, notably sweet potato and other root crops, could be exported much better as well; most of it, especially yam, is storable for longer than the shelf-life of green vegetables. On observation, market produce seems to be handled, transported and sold by women.

Footnote: Ron Martin’s “Small-scale community-based forestry: issues in the conservation of PNG’s biodiversity” actually gives a good perspective on the kind of hurdles to be overcome by these NGO projects. See Filer, C. editor op.cit. 1997 pp.269-292.
Human development

Many aspiring young men and women fall into the category of non-market workers. They have to wait to inherit land or for usufructuary rights, in many cases. The working children of Papua New Guinea are also the working poor. Most of those who are not in line for primogeniture, or who have fallen out of favour with the influential, are poor, work in gardens in remote places, and may have poor support in terms of Health, Education or Employment. The figures from the M.I. survey reveal that half of West New Britain people under 25 work in the gardens, and that only 3.5% of those interviewed were at school (considerably less than other regions). This is a very large proportion, compared with other countries having a progressive education system; and it sets the tone for the entire economy.

All these are what is meant by the term “shadow economy”. These all usually support women and are mutually supported. Schoell calls this the “informal sector”:

also called the “shadow economy”, [it] embraces in many developing countries more than half of the working majority and produces up to 40% of the Gross domestic product. These small and smallest entrepreneurs have their own rules of play. Much entrepreneurial potential could be developed in this field by offering appropriate training and support. All this is explained in detail by the internationally renowned economist Hernan de Soto in his book “The Other Path” (London, 1989).

An example of a successful attempt is the Visitor Programme supported by the West New Britain Women’s Association. Its centre-piece is a training workshop for managing a guest house. A book was produced, funded by AusAID, and the option had been taken up in West New Britain in several instances. It introduces the concept by stating that “We, women, are the managers of households and caretakers of families.

We have developed the skills required to carry out our responsibilities over many years
of experience. We have developed managerial skills and we have already been practising these skills for years. We are already experienced managers. But most of us are not aware of it. Wari lamo in his review comments that. “Culturally our visitors are our trading partners, far-away kinsmen, our acquaintances, or even foreigners from another country. There is a place for this category of people in a community and the community has its rules in mannerisms and the ways in which categories of visitors/guests are looked after.” These are culturally sustainable aspects of a programme to include women. People know these things because they own them. “Native” lore also has a perfect nuance for the sense used here, “autochthonous”, that which they cultivated in their spirit. From such a base, the guide of Samson Nua (in the “Development Debate” section) can be applied: samting bilong komyuniti/ samting bilong kastam (things of community and things of tradition).

The issue of attitudes of each sex toward the other was precisely covered in the Melanesian Institute survey of West New Britain - including Kandrian and nearby islands, Cape Gloucester, Kimbe and many outlying villages, peri-urban habitations and blocks/settlements. As part of the project, I attended a formal group discussion of young men in the roho or men’s house, in the fieldwork at West New Britain; and they plainly expressed disgust and anger at women’s ambitions to break with custom. It raises a perennial issue of what exactly to value in women’s ubiquitous labour; and what, precisely, are the ramifications of women’s aspirations for long-term development.

In such a social complex, described from the time of the first administrators and ethnographers, and by a host of others, the potential for unrest and strife during a time

---

123 ibid.
124 See the section, “A Development Debate”, above chapter two.
Human development

of change was always imminent. Among Kaulong, marriage is equated with sex, is
regarded as less human, and brings on death. Were a visitor to know this, and the fact
that widows had in the past been executed at their husband’s funeral, in pre-contact
days, a visitor would feel that customary “law” was regressive, and conclude that
development must take the path of equity and inclusiveness.

They would not know that it is women who pursue men, physically, explicitly
for courting, with violence and grievous bodily harm. When such a visitor also found
that women were regarded as inviolable and men who were aggressive toward a woman
was assumed to be committing rape, the visitor might have doubts. (It is unclear in
Goodale’s text whether this male implies strangers or includes hamlet members.) If it
was subsequently confirmed that, traditionally, he was killed as a malefactor against the
woman, what would the visitor recommend about development equity? Among many
West New Britain groups, aggressive courting by young women is the norm. Among
the Kaulong, there are special times when women can and are expected to clown
around, mocking the men, and from explanations and photos in Goodale’s
monograph, it is clear that they went to extremes of hilarity. Here it is an institution. A
woman from Lakalai on the north remarked that women are the origin of everything,
whereas men are the head of everything. Those who bring in reforms for equal
opportunity should consider these things.

For a feminist like Vandana Shiva, it is not just the interaction between men and
Human development

women that counts, i.e. sex. She equates industrialisation of farms as a “male”
development with special criticism of all plantations and broad-field agriculture. For
her, single seed crops or arboriculture abandon self-reliant ecology for the artifice of
farms. She writes, “It is this shift from the ecological processes of reproduction to the
technological processes of production that underlies both the problem of dispossession
of farmers and tribals and the problem of erosion.”

For Shiva, “biodiversity takes on
the significance of a struggle for self-reliance and decentralisation.”

The moment of
decision, whether to relinquish thousands of natural forest hectares to clear felling or
arboriculture, is one of the most poignant ecological crises in the Pacific.

The research so far is inconclusive on the power of women within their own
villages in the Pasismanua district. It is quite a large topic, suitable for a Masters or
Ph.D. in a separate paper; and bordering on a different Discipline. General research on
third world or other Melanesian women is inadequate to explain specific gender and
familial relations among the Kaulong people. Research does show, however, that there
is a positive feeling among the women there, as the interest of the West New Britain
Council of Women shows. They are ready to work to bring about specific development
objectives.

In a suitable comparison, Susana Taua’A described Western Samoan women’s
adaptations to change. She called the effort to modernise Samoan women the “liberal
feminist” approach, where facilities are increased for their benefit. A further stage, she
pointed out, was to ascertain that such a modernising movement did not disadvantage
women: this she called the “women in development” movement. This approach accords
with the emphasis of the present study, on the “meaning” of development: what does a
new school mean to a mother who does not see her child benefit from graduation?

Women in Development may indeed mean that “western” advantages are not brought
into play!

130 Shiva, V. et.al. Biodiversity... 1991, p.52.

131 ibid.

132 That is, is there violence mainly directed at females and is it associated with poor
economic opportunities? The distinction should be made between general domestic
violence or gender [class] violence. Rigorous research indicates that the subject has
little specific data; Jane Goodale (op.cits.) is very clear that, among Kaulong, some
women are quite powerful, that they are called polamit as the female equivalent of the
most powerful elite male pomidan, and that Kaulong women exercise power over men
through sanctioned violence at least at certain ceremonial occasions.

133 Women and development: a case study of Western Samoa (Master of Arts Thesis,
A third stage of inquiry confronts the problem of changing the relations that leave women powerless. Will a development venture help women to see the matters in a new way, and change men’s control over labour? In *Women and development: a case study of Western Samoa*\(^\text{134}\), Susan Tau’A shows that the women are interested in improving matters in pragmatic ways, and some of the menial jobs remained unchanged. There are reasons for thinking that in many contexts Melanesian women exercise a measure of control over events in the village that is far beyond the expectations of visitors\(^\text{135}\).

The Melanesian Institute work shows that this is a potentially explosive area of change. That third stage of inquiry is where women’s vision is encouraged even when it opposes men. The Indian thinker Vandana Shiva has articulated this “femmo-centric” rationale\(^\text{136}\), which remains an evocative option for planners in PNG. As Colin Filer commented, many of the features of political life in PNG may actually be “a masculine phenomenon. This is because village women have been excluded from many of the activities and decisions which men regard as central to their own pursuit of ‘development’, in much the same way that men traditionally excluded women from the dangerous business of dealing with supernatural powers [notably does not cite authority for this last one]....less attention has been paid to the question of whether village women now possess a gender-specific set of attitudes to ‘development’ which is more conducive to the practice of nature conservation, and whether they also have the capacity to put these ideas into practice without their menfolk\(^\text{137}\). Vandana Shiva plainly advocates listening to them, stating that “women from the Third World societies are often able to offer ecological insights that are deeper and richer than the technocratic

---

\(^{134}\) ibid.

\(^{135}\) There is more depth to this than is at first apparent. Annette Weiner described the place of women as of high status in the Trobriands; M. Strathern wrote a very broad commentary on the theme and appealed for a reconsideration of the issue; Chowning in (1989) “Sex, shit, and shame,” in Marshall, M. and Caughey, J. *Culture, Kin and Cognition in Oceania...* (Washington, American Anthropological Association) described how Lakalai women mock the men, and this may be seen as a custom or institution for equity, as strong as the *tubuan* or shell exchange or any other institution. I witnessed such mocking by a Lakalai woman, and it is very effective and at times rather hilarious. Goodale describes it among the Kaulong, as clowning (op. cit. 1995).

\(^{136}\) See for example *Discovering the real meaning of sustainability* (Dehra Dun, India, Research Foundation for Science and Ecology, n.d.).

\(^{137}\) op. cit. 1995, p.193.
recipes of international experts or the responses of men in their own societies\textsuperscript{138}. This seems very sound: it is only the implementation, in the context of West New Britain cultures, that is problematic\textsuperscript{139}.

One, brief example will suffice to show how local resources and strengths may be used in village development, the example of the Crater Mountain Wildlife Management Area. The Crater Mountain Wildlife Management Area comprises 2,700 square kilometres of primary forest at a range of altitudes, from about thirty to one hundred kilometres from Goroka in Eastern Highlands Province. Its two main objectives are to protect biodiversity, and to encourage sustainable use of the subsistence resources, as well as using them for generating income\textsuperscript{140}. The programme is heavily funded and has been since 1982\textsuperscript{141}. In 1994 it was gazetted as a national Wildlife Management Area\textsuperscript{142}.

There are three notable things, for the purposes of the comparison with the Kaulong situation. Firstly, the amount of cooperation between NGOs or expatriates was phenomenal, even model. Also, whereas Pasismanua gives access to shipping, Crater Mountain was famous in Goroka only for its obscurity and isolation from the metropole, justly so. This meant that well-funded NGOs could operate without commercial competition, keeping the attention of village leaders for long periods. Secondly, there was a graduated step-by-step process, as described in the section "A Development

\textsuperscript{138} Shiva, V. "Women, ecology and health", in Close to home... 1994, p.1.

\textsuperscript{139} Mantovani wrote candidly on the subject of men's feelings of insecurity, especially in a customary context. The summation of a study of Melanesian families and kinds of marriage of over ten years, his paper was written specifically to cover situations where development options for women raised problems and questions. In a traditional village many Melanesian women had a place in society bolstered by taboos and empowered with magic. The attrition of taboos have actually made females more, and not less, vulnerable. Pushing the rights of women tactlessly may be telling some men that women need to be given more power, at the very time when men see women as destructive. Ironically, men may see the empowerment of women through modern means as an attempt to make women what they already are, potentially dangerous!

Mantovani, M. (1993), Male-female relationships in Melanesia: a Pastoral Reflection, with particular reference to domestic violence (Special Publication for the Marriage and Family Life project, Occasional Paper No.8, Goroka, the Melanesian Institute).

\textsuperscript{140} Johnson, A. "Processes for effecting community participation in the establishment of protected areas", in Filer ed. op.cit. 1997, p.394.

\textsuperscript{141} It is an Integrated Conservation and Development (ICAD) project, assisted by the consortium of World Wildlife Fund, Nature Conservancy and the World Resources Institute. There are also nine other NGOs and foreign aid donors named. loc.cit. p.391. By Pasismanua reckoning, this amount of attention would be luxurious.

\textsuperscript{142} loc.cit.p.394.
Thirdly, the system is organised by parameters which assist the outsiders’ goals. The inclusive orientation of the programme makes it viable, not only here but also in New Britain, and that is positive. However, there are few explanations in Johnson’s account that give empirical evidence of those residents of the “Area” stating what they want. In other words, everything is contained in the expatriate’s plan. One can question whether ICAD can be open enough to villagers’ aspirations, with the expectations of more than a dozen major international NGOs/aid donors for “biodiversity conservation”. Ultimately, the Crater Mountain WMA system is a highly efficient model. Moreover, it is a recorded model with many of those features that Holzknecht called “mitigation”, with an appropriate and ethical monitoring guideline. However, what if ICAD is wrong? Or thought to be wrong by the Gimi and other societies involved? Secondly, her explanation of Crater Mountain WMA has all the formal elements of a laboratory experiment, with no interference, plenty of funding and a comparatively low amount of previous colonial influence. To put it in a different way, how many of the four and a half million PNG villagers can do what this programme did, without fifteen years of sympathetic aid workers and without a decade or more of consistent funding?

The demonstrably marvellous achievements of “Crater Mountain” need to be translated, implemented in poor and sometimes depressed villages where there are already “values” crises, unemployment, crime and commercial opportunities. Moreover, there appears to be a great need for programme vulnerability.

From this example, there is evidence that a more enabled and responsive labour force can offer motivation and hope to villagers, but this “enabling” will entail financial support and schemes good enough to be self-supporting.

VISION AND CULTURE

As an Introduction to this section, Victor Turner’s research guidelines on “root

---

143 These are very respectful of the community’s lifestyle, and entail needs assessment, training, organisational structure, leadership, management, resource mobilisation, and monitoring and evaluation.

144 op. cit. in Fernando and Nen eds. 1991, p.64.

145 This fits in with the concepts of luksave and stap wantaim, as outlined in the Section
paradigms" should be recalled. Some students would conclude a thesis on Pacific resource issues with a teleological statement - this will be useful. Others would conclude with the deontological - we are obliged to act ethically within this system. Turner's approach comes from a different angle and leaves some research "distance" between the student and his or her object of study. The point is that it shows root causes of what has been happening in Papua New Guinea. The concept is also a dispassionate measuring instrument in a scenario full of rhetoric and bias!

Weber's methodology of appraising culture, the "ideal type", is a concept that coincides with many common-sense notions; however, although culture is also at the centre of villagers' world view, research distance is maintained by the acknowledgement that a researcher is affected by cultural considerations, i.e. by apperception and scrutiny of one's own cultural, political bias. In the present research, these theorists were relied upon in order to avoid crusading - this, despite the preferences and ethics of this student on environmental issues.

Culture has been at or near the centre of this study, too, since it reveals certain behaviours of people involved in development in PNG. Admittedly, the concept was not a simple one, but this kind of study can be reproduced in other situations, relying on the rigour of a sociologist like Weber, and the brilliance of that circumspect student of culture, Victor Turner. The basis for this argument was sociological, not economic.

If there is ecological damage, why not just describe biodiversity, or take up the legal case of the indigenous? Because this is a study of meanings rather than meaningful discourse itself.

Sociological argument, based on social anthropology, is a logical system of explanation. "The quality of an event as a 'social-economic' event", wrote Weber, "is not something which it possesses objectively. It is rather conditioned by the orientation of our cognitive interest, as it arises from the specific cultural significance which we attribute to the particular event in a given case". He stated that "justification of the one-sided analysis of cultural reality from specific 'points of view' - in our case with respect to its economic conditioning - emerges purely as a technical expedient ...". This quality of events has been described, recapitulating the values of the actors and

"A Development Debate", above.
146 "Objectivity in Social Science and Social Policy", from Max Weber on the methodology of the Social Sciences p.64.
147 loc.cit.p.71, italics his.
voyeurs of logging in West New Britain. The result is a rigorous and, it is hoped, an original description.

There is indeed a way of knowing which relies on practical needs or physical needs. This might be called utilitarianism, or the practical way of knowing. If the facts were just the facts, it would be possible to bring about the teleological solution to "development". A purist economist would employ such a strategy. More of the current suggestions, however, would fall squarely under duty, values and ethics. This is deontological. "The teleological... sphere [by contrast] is that of means and ends, goods, values; the deontological is that of rules, laws, and obligations", writes the philosopher Hofstadter. "The two overlap, since there are rules concerning means-ends and goods, and there are values belonging to rules"148. There appears to be more to the situation than these two alone, however.

One of the meanings of Development in Papua New Guinea is that people feel (in our visceral sense, Ti Pisin "bel" meaning heart or insides) the rightness of things offered to them, and as well, of actions possible to them, in terms of reciprocity, balance in duality, and fairness. One of the tasks of social researchers is to penetrate a little into the Pasismanua culture and disclose an area of study. This area is myth and its result is vision. The resulting study-objective is neither teleological nor deontological. This grasp of narrative coming out of indigenous world view is what Bopp called their spirituality149. It is a third conceptual area. As research progressed, it became apparent that this conceptual field of study was necessary to take Papua New Guineans seriously. I weighed up the research risks and concluded that they were worth taking, considering the concept's explanatory power. The nuances of spirituality and their religious (and christian) allusions required too extensive a search and too deep an analysis for the present study. Consequently the notions suggested by that word have been reduced to cultural mitigations. Cultural mitigations are the subject of this thesis, in one sense.

The means by which "I" understand, that very means utilises "my" culture which is not Melanesian. One does not see objectively or transcendently... neither should we despair, though. Weber, in history and sociology, understood this very well where he wrote that "significance of a configuration of cultural phenomena and the

149 "The Spirituality and Cultural Foundation of People Centred Development", in Schoell op.cit.1994, pp.211-227. The concept requires a major study and should generate further questions to apply to Papua New Guinea, in a separate study. The
basis of this significance cannot however be derived and rendered intelligible by a system of analytical laws (Gesetzesbegriffen), however perfect it may be, since the significance of cultural events presupposes a value-orientation towards these events. The concept of culture is a value-concept\textsuperscript{1}\textsuperscript{150}. For the economic analyst, and to many sociologists, there is a different value concept. The cultural phenomena remain interruptions, at times, and the "cipher" remains as enigmatic as ever. In the present Thesis, the acknowledgement of culture comprises not a (passionate) feeling, but a powerful data-base.

The problem of reification is central to the story of development in a West New Britain context. In a moving set of components, any snap-shot must freeze the actors. That is the essence of reification. A story, even an iconic one such as a tableau, does not freeze everything into one still-life. The advantage of various meanings is that we use the imagination to build a picture or story out of the various. It may well be that our reifications, which Filer outlined, are inadequate to encompass the mode in which indigenous people develop themselves. Yet it is imagination which may well help Papua New Guinea find its way out of the development impasse in which she presently finds herself.

Or else, the paradigm may emerge of the two dancers as Schwimmer\textsuperscript{1}\textsuperscript{151} hinted, and the tropes we use (which Westerners mistakenly think are literal, not figurative) will prove inadequate. Two dancers operate in same sex couples by the principle of responding to the other - that is the step and the rule by which the duality operates. The rule is the Other. The give and take of a cosmic dimension could be articulated in the forms of their public life. All this speculation is not to predict, but to show that our discourse is, possibly, inadequate. Our tropes, snap-shots and distillations may not be such accurate pictures, and the highly edited videos may start to wobble at the edges.

The active choice on the part of a commentator on such matters directs the kind of significance seen by the commentator. Nothing is more meaningful than another thing because everything is relevant:

\textit{The transcendental presupposition of every cultural science lies not in...}

\textsuperscript{150}op.cit. p.76, italics his.

our finding a certain culture or any “culture” in general to be valuable but rather in the fact that we are cultural beings, endowed with the capacity and will to take a deliberate attitude towards the world and lend it significance... these phenomena have cultural significance for us and on this significance alone rests its scientific interest.  

Culture comprises a rich data-base. In this context, an ideal type is a deliberate analytical method. It is also a popular concept or an administrative term. Whether an ideal type is true is a matter of degree; but it is ideal and therefore is not, at base, empirical. As Max Weber wrote of “ideal types”:

An ideal type is formed by the one-sided accentuation of one or more points of view and by the synthesis of a great many diffuse, discrete, more or less present and occasionally absent concrete individual phenomena, which are arranged according to those one-sidedly emphasised viewpoints into a unified analytical construct (Gedankenbild) ... Historical research faces the task of determining in each individual case, the extent to which this ideal-construct approximates to or diverges from reality, to what extent for example, the economic structure of a certain city is to be classified as a “city-economy”.

Meanwhile, villagers, forestry officers, anthropologists, and policy makers all have ideal types. The difference for this research thesis is that its limits are defined and consciously used to explain that many genuine, altruistic and somewhat frustrated people know the social situations and personalities, are efficient in many cases, but lose the way to “development” because they are unaware of intricate labelling that goes on when two, or three, cultures interpenetrate.

---

152 loc. cit. p.81, italics his.
153 op cit. p.90 italics his.
CONCLUSION

There is no single answer to the issues of “development” in Papua New Guinea. It is enough to find our way through all the statements and counter-statements made inside and outside the country; and this highlights the axiomatic nature of development in the eyes of nationals. Despite the opening epigram (Chapter One) on free trade, there are terrific pressures put on locals by foreigners’ unhindered access to P.N.G. resources; and while “environmental costs and benefits” enter into the equation at that point, a prior issue emerged, that of self determination. The ensuing ethnological view made the statements from the Rio ecology summit quite problematic. They are problematic because environmental costs and benefits have been largely directed by more influential villagers. These villagers establish ties with loggers. At the fulcrum of this “gain” is the Papuan, New Guinean and Islander notion of a good life, especially with a display of wealth and demonstrably good relationships.

The information provided in this thesis does not resolve the difficulty in grasping what exchange means. It does however go part way towards explaining that people in Kaulong villages, especially young men, take on apparently macchiavellian profiles in their ambition to acquire “development”. Whether exchange is an irreducible principle of social organisation is still a question that deserves more specific research; such a topic would comprise an excellent research question in a separate paper.

Each chapter of the thesis could be expanded into a book. By contrast, the regional focus could be handled in a word-limit thesis. While the masses of literature on global hegemonies are insightful, and while we may have great respect for the Biological sciences operating under the scientific paradigm in an enormous new field of biodiversity, and although management itself is an area of great expertise in PNG, all these and other issues are not the point.

Instead, the point is to cite the material from Papua New Guinea and negotiate with the complexities to distil some meaning out of it all. Issues of meaning arise out of culture. Max Weber’s notions of the “ideal type” were behind much of the argument, for just this reason. For similar reasons, the FRI asserted that “dialogue and cooperation between all parties at all levels must be ensured ... especially where forests are tribally or communally owned”\(^1\). Ecology conceived in isolation from society is problematic. Once society becomes a conceptual tool, the argument becomes complex and changes.

\(^1\) op.cit.
Conclusion

from bio-science to humanities; and the concept of human science leads us from the local to the international, observed empirically because culture is also real, empirical.

Howitt et al. emphasise the multigenre nature of resource studies in the “geopolitics” of the Asia-Pacific, in a beautiful summary that guides their anthology. “First”, they write, “is the internationalisation of debates about environmental issues and human rights in general, and ecological sustainability and indigenous rights in particular”\(^2\). The main arguments about this are integral to the thesis’ regional focus. “Second”, they write, “are the new cultural politics of difference whose agenda of cultural diversity has increasingly interlocked with renewed global interest in biodiversity”\(^3\). There was no real scope to deal with biodiversity but the thesis does describe that “interlocking” phenomenon specifically for PNG. And then, “Third are issues of territority, sovereignty and representation inherent in the construction of indigenous identity”\(^4\).

“Finally, the ‘scale of politics of spatiality’ (Jonas 1994) indicate the multiple levels at which the issues need to be considered simultaneously”\(^5\). This multi-focus has been articulated with the actions and worldview of locals, and it ramifies into other levels, such as the changes from colonial times and how the society interacts with wider influences, for example.

Where many of the commentators have asked the question “how much development?” here the question “what kind?” has been asked. Who is being affected and what happens to the well-being of the community at large? The question is being asked more often lately, especially with respect to the First Directive Principle, that of integral human development.

Dick Avi, a theologian from Papua New Guinea and General Secretary of the Pacific Conference of Churches, has formulated the anxiety about the direction that development will take in his home country as follows:


\(^2\) op.cit. 1996 p.25.
\(^3\) ibid.
\(^4\) loc.cit., pp.25-6.
Conclusion

was about development or human development. There are more talks about economy, taxation, bank interest, loans, business, factories, buildings, copper, gold, oil, timber. One would like to ask, ‘Where are the human beings.’ What about their development? What is happening to their community?6

With this in mind, a number of issues in the Pasismanua district were examined, especially among the Kaulong, W.N.B.P. The highest mountains outside the mainland are here, and the deepest seas lie on the margins of this region; with the third largest tracts of tropical rainforest in the world concentrated in the country, the effects of 300 inches of rainfall per annum needs to be monitored in the wider impact zone (see Chapter Four). And with the loggers coming in and offering deals to national governments and locals alike, the situation is of great interest, especially to students of Pacific peoples.

There is avoidance of marriage by men, specifically in this region, to what can only be called an extreme degree. With women encouraged to engage in traditional exchange and openings for them to become polamit (big-women), there is a poignant moment for a Masters Candidate to examine the attitudes among research communities, concerning women’s contribution in Melanesian and other societies.

The small picture of one region in a small country, of closely knit people with strong and ancient traditions, had a purpose. That was to look at the meaning of development in a bounded community, for themselves. It interpretatively penetrates the clearly bounded communities whose identity is itself a source of isolation (ethnic isolation). These all encompass the same thing: a shift into an uncontrolled self. Somewhat prosaically, the Bena man who was being shot at from a distance (see Chapter 4), might be a kind of emblem of some development dilemmas in Papua New Guinea - control happens from a distance, and where power is not felt to be close to home any more, the things from the outside or overseas, are seen as cogent and desirable by that measure alone7 ... the things which are sought after most are exotic but they are deadly, and create a life of their own.

6 In Kuerschner-Pelkmann op.cit pp.19-20.
7 This was precisely what the Lutheran Youth Coordinator for Morobe Province commented about young people, that they were a “sponge”, as he put it, for anything, especially consumer goods, from outside P.N.G.
Conclusion

There is no blame put on anyone for events here described. This in itself is unusual among the literature. But as was stated above, it is better to ask not “how much development”, but “what kind”. With multiple or conflicting views of “development”, the question arises, dispassionately and politically, as to whether the villagers’ view, and villagers’ statements, have authority. This brought us again to the issue of a transaction of viewpoints.

There are Papua New Guinean strategies for giving the village an executive political voice; and in which the Fifth Principle of the Preamble (“Papua New Guinea Ways”) might or might not be fulfilled. That a “PNG Ways” concept appears in the very Constitution shows remarkable foresight for development. In an unusual and interesting book, Steven Levin looked at Pacific Constitutions as “power maps”. He concluded that the Preambles “reflect constitutional origins” 8, and encourage a way of thinking:

The process by which a constitution is elaborated is important both legally and symbolically. The selection of a particular procedure may depend on whether the proponents of a Constitution seek to introduce change or to provide an obstacle to change...9

As such, the overall Directive Principles of PNG appear very adventurous among the New Nations, as bold in liberal (in the full sense) as in traditional ways. It is a Constitution of which they can be very proud. Levin points out that it is of a different order than most Constitutions, “for its Preamble goes on to establish a series of ‘National Goals and Directive Principles’, ‘Basic Rights’, and ‘Basic Social Obligations’, all of these preceding the operative articles of the document. These ... establish the legal basis for, and the fundamental purposes of, the Constitution itself”10.

The staggering fact is that readiness to change was foremost in the design of the founding fathers [mothers?] of Papua New Guinea. It was not just a more thorough document, but an outstandingly self-conscious one. This means that the study of poor implementation - here dubbed mal feut - is profoundly important in the current political milieu.

9 loc.cit.p.64.
10 loc.cit.p.8, italics mine.
Conclusion

The previous point about “meaning” is linked in a similar way to the Independence or sovereignty of the nation. Year by year, Papua New Guineans celebrate their Independence on September 16th: is this the central ethos, the *instar omnium*, of Papua New Guineans? Or by contrast, is development the main ethos, to have each person “dynamically involved in the process of freeing himself or herself from every form of domination or oppression so that each man and woman will have the opportunity to develop as a whole person in relation with others”\(^\text{11}\)? People are now asking all over the nation, “What is the good of Independence when we remain as poor, isolated, sick, and neglected by governments as before?” That is precisely the inference from this Thesis, that although development provides the ethos, development is shoddy. Many things have been written in overseas media about PNG and most of them are only splintered reflections of the heart of the modern nation. At the heart is development and there is a heart problem. Implementation and the confusion of appearance and event, *mal feit.*, are the root of this thesis.

The narrative has brought out the deeper reasons for the failure of the implementation of the Five Principles. Although pejorative comment did not seem necessary, there is a perennial, underlying problem in communication within administrative and local government circles. Holzknecht, for example, recommended dialogue as the fundamental change in attitude or thinking within present development programmes\(^\text{12}\). This is echoed by Nicholas Thomas on a larger, vaguer scale, where he argued that there had been, from the beginning, a simple misunderstanding of processes linked to European contact.

Thus the ethic of this thesis is described by Carmen, that “One of the primary tasks of the development ethicist will consist, therefore, of putting meaning back into development”\(^\text{13}\). The first notion of the thesis is that community power relations are the germ of meaning for development in PNG, community being a site where relations of power are constructed and controlled\(^\text{14}\). PNG’s relationship to its own image is ambiguous, bifocal. This is why development is emptied of meaning, and increasing in anomie.

Another meaning is that there are situations thrust upon the third world, such as the Japanese hunger for timber and the power of logging companies who fell and sell it

\(^{11}\) First Directive Principle of the Preamble of the PNG Constitution.
\(^{12}\) op.cit. see opening Chapter.
\(^{13}\) op.cit., 1996 p.197.
\(^{14}\) after Susan Kenny op.cit.
Conclusion

to Japan. This is complicated by the IMF who lay injunctions upon the state of PNG not to allow ecological disaster, and by the World Wildlife Fund and others who also wish to educate about the ecological responsibility, as well as about these financial stalemates. Papua New Guinea should not harm their own resources but Papua New Guinea did not create this market. There are stern things which were excluded from the argument, since the issue was deliberately narrowed. This has been a description of the "point of harvest", not the "point of sale"! Some analysts evince a lot more concern about ethical responsibility, as where Kuerschner-Pelkmann says "The most effective and most credible way of helping to conserve the conservation of the rainforests is for the people in the industrial countries to change their lifestyle and their attitude towards consumption so that they no longer threaten the survival of humanity". The meaning of development is that the unity of the globe is leaving the ideal and becoming empirical, historical, immediate. Such a description of villagers' hamlets and their exchange relations with loggers is vividly empirical.

And with regard to such global unity, the Pasismanua problem enters the most current political and economic discourse. One of the latest theories is that all life grew with the Earth including all the atmospheric needs, linking inorganic with organic. Few other names have been found for this unity besides "Gaia". Well, what about people? That is a poignant question with which to conclude this study. Curiously enough, there is excellent reason to focus on Papua New Guinea in this regard. That is because of the biocosmic worldview which pervades the thought of all Melanesians in some way. And one need not assume that, if humanity invokes the Nemesis by disregarding its environment, the natural environment would therefore be optimal without people. (For one thing, in the absence of people there is no science and no "environment". It is unprovable.) People, too, were part of the Gaia metamorphosis. It makes no sense to be incredulous of this logic. One cannot have it both ways: either Gaia is a totally responsive superorganic system, or it is not. Carmen quotes Cherret and Heidenreich, who put it like this:

\[15\] op.cit.p.53.
\[16\] This researcher hopes that the essential shockingness of this remark is not lost on the Reader(s). Either the earth systems are total or they are not totally self-feeding. Nature has gone too far on the blue planet of Earth in human company to survive without human beings. If this engenders the notion of a spirituality, this researcher is not confounded, if it propagates a theme of human destiny or the numinous, the apologetic is the same: the logic is there in complete accord with the latest research.
Conclusion

At the grass roots, the environment is a real and pressing issue, but not in and of itself; it is a part of the crisis of ongoing loss of control and the ability to maintain place and community and therefore identity. History has repeatedly demonstrated the direct relationship between the collapse of environmental management and the collapse of community. The one will not long outlast the other.\textsuperscript{17}

This was covered in the body of the Thesis in the context of words like \textit{lo} and \textit{mana}, and described in as widely separated things as Politicians' tie to home, and single-sex dancing couples. \textit{The profoundest expression of human presence in the web of life in Melanesian regions does not come from any book, but from Papua New Guineans themselves and their cultural genius. Ennio Mantovani puts it this way:}

If we translate these "noble traditions" into today's language, we can say that good relationships to the environment is the foundation for health and well-being for the whole community and every individual in it, while abuse of the environment can only mean sickness and decay...

The Universal Melanesian law which regulates all relationships is reciprocity and this law ought to regulate the relationship with the environment as well.\textsuperscript{18}

Reciprocity is not just about giving parcels of food and other things, but relates to comparable notions in other religious traditions. Thus Mantovani's summary explains all the better, the depth of disturbance in Pasismanua communities at the moment:

Melanesian societies survived because their principles and values were undergirded by their religious beliefs. Often in the discussion for development we lose sight of this fact and talk and plan as if everything would depend on economic and political vision, however, Melanesian traditions remind us that what helped Melanesians to survive and develop was not their technology, but the religious dimension that undergirded it.\textsuperscript{19}

\textsuperscript{17} In Carmen op.cit., 1996 p.202.
\textsuperscript{18} In Schoell op.cit.p.343.
\textsuperscript{19} loc.cit.p.344.
Conclusion

Those unacquainted with the connections made between events in Papua New Guinea might deny a religious element to the ever-pragmatic nationals. But some patently practical endeavours are highly religious in nature. Schwimmer gives a fascinating account of the Mt. Lamington volcanic disaster, tracing through the grass roots feelings of victims to a biocosmic belief in the indivisibility of catastrophe, life and actions. There is a sound and systematic argument about the religious element, articulated by Pr. Gernot Fugmann's explanation of lo. It is integral to the argument of the Thesis, and has certain defining features. He mentions the myth of two brothers, known most popularly across North Coast New Guinea as “Manub and Kilibob” (and to New Britain in different names, e.g. Akro and Gagandewa). Fugmann explains it thus:

An analysis of such mythological heritage implies that the original paradisiac state was lost ultimately because of the conflict between the two brothers. Although the present life is experienced as a constant strenuous effort to set limits to the possible privations of life, paradise is thought to be within reach.

Fugmann shows how the real possibility of a fulfilled cosmic existence explains, to various degrees, different endeavours of Melanesian peoples. It was in this context that Fugmann described lo (above). His synopsis of the modern Melanesian is germane to the conclusion:

One of the deeper notions is the fundamental relatedness and interdependence within a cosmic community. Today biblical scholars are coming to realise and rediscover that this is an important biblical message long veiled and hidden in the traditional Western doctrine. For many centuries, a heretical doctrine has been taught by churches that nature is there to be dominated and exploited by humans. It is in this sense that theology needs exposure to conceptions of

23 In Mantovani op. cit. p.281.
Conclusion

traditional cultures in order to rediscover aspects of the biblical truth which have become blind spots in the course of history or in specific cultural contexts... Today the Melanesian worldviews are challenged by a host of competing opinions... Any urban situation reveals this underlying competitiveness and plurality of values and ideas confronting people today. 24

The connectedness of life (in the broad sense) and people is misinterpreted by outsiders. By contrast, modern Papua New Guineans fully understand the inference of the connection between life and people. It is the inference from any event that is generated by culture, and to Melanesians boundaries between the “parts” of life are not rigid, and not according to materialistic positivism.

Science posits the material connections (materialistic positivism), and Melanesians posit connections (bio-cosmic) between, say, horticulture and magic, or between wealth and morality - a different morality to Europeans. Science will not, by definition, conceive of the link between a volcano and previous actions, or between the incantations of a man in his garden and the success of the taro. Yet that is why development in Papua New Guinea has been frozen in a series of deals with loggers and others. Bernard Narokobi touches on this root paradigm, almost by accident, in the following quote:

If one goes into a library, one cannot find a book on Melanesian philosophy because there is no classification in the Dewey system or the American Library of Congress or in any other system, where there is a classification called Melanesian philosophy. ... That is the classification ideology we have to destroy. And if one wants to give freedom, respect and dignity to one’s own cultural values, one has to give them the authenticity given to every other culture...
If one wants to learn about the law, one has to look at customary law, and it is not law. On the one hand we have government against non-government, State against church, women against men, God against the devil, the rich against the poor, and we get compartmentalisation and division. We get alienation.

24 loc cit.p.294.
Conclusion

disintegration, and so on. And we ourselves are creating this problem. We prevent unity, but practise disunity.25

While acknowledging that he may unwittingly be speaking through his own Christian-inflected Melanesian background, the overall statement makes a profound point: that it is an artificial effort for many locals to treat many subjects separately whereas it is an artificial effort for many Westerners to do the opposite. Or rather, that it is axiomatic for most Europeans to keep matters discrete that are not scientifically proven to be linked. Notice his conclusion: prevent unity/ of the philosophy and world view, and practise disunity/ act out the selfish and "partial" in our groups.

For many a Papua New Guinean, the shift into the uncontrolled self is the corollary of the divided world that accompanied the new ways. Again, if the stratagem of this thesis was to look at local reactions instead of the multi-layered thing called development, there is a wealth of research and the citations are many. If the uncontrolled self is at the heart of development problems, then culture and meaning are integral to the solution and the argument is true. And if that culture is biocosmic, there is even more reason for us to look around at our relationships to, and comprehension of our total environment, and compare our thinking with theirs. As Ralph Waldo Emerson wrote:

[Humanity] is placed in the centre of beings, and a ray of relation passes from every other being to him [them]. And neither can man be understood without these objects, nor these objects without man. All the facts in natural history taken by themselves have no value, but are barren like a single sex. But marry it to human history, and it is full of human life.26

26 Barfield 1952 p.92.
Bibliography

AIDAB [AusAID], *Project Profiles, PNG/Australia* (C.of Australia, Canberra 1993)

Aime, A. *Catalyst* 20: 2 (1990), pp.190-193


AusAID *Profile of Activities* (C. of A., Canberra, 1996)

Bailoenakia, P. and Koimanrea, F. "The Pomio Kivung Movement", *Point Series No.2* (1) 1983

Barfield, O. *Poetic Diction* (London, Faber and Faber, 1952)


Berman, M. *The Arawe of West New Britain: Modern Times in a Traditional Village* (Master of Arts Thesis, University of Amsterdam, 1982)

Best, E. "Maori Forest Lore", *Transactions of the New Zealand Institute* 1909 Vol. XLII, 433-481

(1954) "Some aspects of Maori myth and religion", *Dominion Museum Monographs* No.1

(1954b) "Spiritual and mental concepts of the Maori" *Dominion Museum Monographs* No.2

Bourdieu, P. *Outline of a theory of Practice* (Cambridge U.P., 1977)


Bradley, C. *Tolai Women and Development* (University College London, Ph.D. Thesis 1982)

Bray, M. *Dropping out from Community Schools* (Education Research Unit Report No.49, 1984)

Brookfield, H., Potter, L. and Byron, Y. *In place of the forest: Environmental and Socio-economic Transformation in Borneo and the Eastern Malay Peninsula* Tokyo, United Nations University Press, 1995)
Bibliography


(1928) “Certain natives in south west New Britain and Dampier Straits”, Anthropological Report of the Territory of New Guinea, No.3 (Gov. Printer, Melbourne)


(1977) ed. An introduction to the cultures and peoples of Melanesia Second Ed. (Cummings; Menlo Park, California)


(1980) “Culture and biology among the Sengseng of New Britain”, Journal of the Polynesian Society” 89 (1), 7-31


Bibliography

Codrington, R.M. "Religious beliefs and practices in Melanesia", Journal of the Anthropological Institute 10 (1891):261-315


(1977) “Independence and the rule of money in Kaliai”, Oceania XLVIII No.1, September, 30-39

Counts, David Ol Siuri Bilong Laupu. (The tales aJLaupu) (I.A.S.E.R., Port Moresby, 1982)


Cox,E. editor Education: Participatory evaluation for community based education projects (Ed. Research Unit 1987, Special Report No.3)


Delpit,L. and Kemelfield,G. in King,P.et.al. eds. From rhetoric to reality... 15th Waigani Seminar 1985, Port Moresby

Diamond,S. In Search of the Primitive: a critique of civilization with a Foreword by Eric Wolf (New York, Transaction Books, 1974)


Duncan,R. Melanesian Forestry Sector Study International Development Issues No. 36 (AIDAB, Canberra 1995)

Education Sector Review (Education Department of PNG, Boroko 1999)

Bibliography


(1978) Ethos and Identity (London, Tavistock)


Epstein, T.S. Capitalism, Primitive and Modern (East Lansing, Michigan, 1968)


Filer, C. "The Bougainville rebellion, the mining industry, and the process of social disintegration in Papua New Guinea", in May, R. and Spriggs, M. eds. The Bougainville Crisis (Crawford House Press, Bathurst, 1990)


(1973) Big-Men and Business (Canberra, A.N.U. Press)

Firth, R. "The analysis of Mana: an empirical approach", Journal of the Polynesian Society 49 (1940): 483-510

Food and Agriculture Organisation/ U. N. Enhancing People's Participation (Rome, FAO Forestry papers, 1995)
Bibliography


Friedman, J. “Captain Cook, culture and the world system”, *Journal of Pacific History* Volume 20 No.4, Oct. 1985, 191-201


Fugmann, G. editor “Ethics and Development in Papua New Guinea”, *Point Series No.9* (The Melanesian Institute, Goroka, 1986)


Goodale, J. “The rape of the men and the seduction of women among the Kaulong and Sengseng of New Britain”. Paper presented at the Association of Social Anthropology in Oceania meeting, Washington, D.C.


(1985) “Pig’s teeth and skull cycles: both sides of the face of humanity”, *American Ethnologist* 12 (2), 228-244


Goodenough, W. “Kindred and Hamlet in Nakanai, West New Britain”, *Ethnology* Vol. 1 pp. 5-12


Gosden, C. “Prehistoric social landscapes of the Arawe Islands, West New Britain, PNG”, *Archaeology in Oceania* Vol. 24 No.3 (October 1989) 45-58

Gosden, C. and Pavlides, C. “Are islands insular?...” *Archaeology in Oceania* 29 (1994), 162-171
Bibliography


Hansen-Strain, L. "Educational implications of group differences..." *Pacific Studies* Vol 16 No.1, 1993

Henderson, M. *Forest Issues in Papua New Guinea*, Presentation at Oxford University 4 July, 1944 (Pacific Heritage Foundation)


Hinchcliffe, K. "Anthropology and economic policy making in Papua New Guinea", *Oceania* XL VIII No.2, December 1977, p.122


(1989b) "Studies on the impact on the environment in the Talasea, Hoskins, Kapiura and Ania-Fulleborn timber area", Report 6.3A of *Scientific Reports*, Unitech, Lae,


Bibliography


Ibua, E. Young Melanesians Project research report booklet (Draft, unpublished, 1993)

Ingold, T. Hunters, Pastoralists and Ranchers (Cambridge U.P., 1980)


Johnston, R. L. editor, Language, development and communication in New Britain (S.I.L., Ukarumpa, 1980)


Keesing, R. "A tin with the meat taken out", in Otto, T. editor, Pacific Island Trajectories: five personal views (Canberra, Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies/ ANU, 1993)

Kenny, S. Developing communities for the future: community development in Australia (Melbourne, Thomas Nelson Australia, 1994)

Kuerschner-Pelkmann, F., Trott, M. and Woelbrand, I. editors Our trees and all the wildlife have gone: the destruction of the tropical rainforests, media conflicts, and the struggle for a holistic human development in the Pacific Region (EMW, and supporters, Hamburg, 1995)
Bibliography


Lattas, A. “Skin, personhood and redemption: the double self in West New Britain cargo cults” Oceania Vol.63 No.1 (September 1992), 27-54


Lerner, J. Learning Disabilities (Boston, Houghton Mifflin, 1988)

Levi-Strauss, C. Le cru et le cruit (Paris, Plon, 1964)

Levin, S. Pacific Power Maps: an analysis of the Constitutions of Pacific Island Politics Working Papers Series, P.I.S. (Centre for Asia Pacific Studies in collaboration with the Social Science Research Institute, University of Hawaii at Manoa, 1982)


Malinowski, B. Argonauts of the Western Pacific (Prospect heights, ILL., Waveland Press, 1984; first published 1922)

Mandie, A. “Institutional and ideological control of gender in a transitional society”, in King, P. et al. editors, From rhetoric to reality (Fifteenth Waigani Seminar, 1985)


Bibliography


Megitt, M. “From tribesmen to peasants: the case of the Mae Enga of New Guinea”, in R.L. Hiatt and C. Jayawardena, editors, Anthropology in Oceania (Sydney, Angus and Robertson, 1971)


Mies, M. and Shiva, V. Ecofeminism (Melbourne, Spinifex Press, 1993)


(1985) “The social context of rape and related offences in Papua New Guinea”, Paper presented to a workshop on rape, Medical Faculty, U.P.N.G.


National Alliance of Non Government Organisations (NANGO) Environmental Awareness Workshop for NGO’s (31 August – 11 September 1992)


(1977) “Suicide and social control in New Britain”, Bijdragen Tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde 133, 44-62


Pavlides, C. Trade and Exchange in the Arawe Islands, West New Britain, Papua New Guinea (Honours Thesis, La Trobe University, 1988)

(1993) “New archaeological research at Yombon”, Archaeology in Oceania 28, 55-59

Pearl, M., Bechler, B., Allison, A., and Taylor, M. editors, Conservation and Environment in Papua New Guinea: establishing research priorities (Proceedings of a Symposium on
Bibliography

June 3, 1991; Honolulu, Hawaii; Government of P.N.G. and Wildlife Conservation International)

Pech, R. "Manub and Kilob: Melanesian Models for Brotherhood Shaped by Myth, Dream and Drama", Point Series No.16 (The Melanesian Institute, Goroka, 1991)


Pok, F. Paper from Tenth Regional Youth Advisory Board meeting of Christian Youth Council (Rabaul, October 1993)


Project Proposal by Cakara Alam (PNG) Pty.Ltd. to develop the West Arawe T.R.P. (69,000 hectares) 1990... [Courtesy Papua New Guinea Forest Research Institute]


(1965) The High Valley (Berkeley, University of California Press)

Rose, D. Living the Ethnographic Life Qualitative Research Methods Volume 23 (Newbury Park, California; Sage Publications, 1990)


(1972) Stone Age Economics (Tavistock Publications Ltd., Great Britain, 1972)


Sapir, E. Language: an introduction to the study of speech (New York; Harcourt, Brace and World, 1921)


Schwimmer, P. Exchange in the Social Structure of the Orokaiva (St.Martin's Press, 1973)

(1976) editor, "The Vailala Madness" and other essays... (London, Hurst)

(1977) "What did the eruption mean?" in Lieber, M. editor, Exiles and migrants in Oceania (University Press of Hawaii)
Bibliography


(n.d.) *Discovering the real meaning of sustainability* (Dehra Dun,India; Research foundation for Science and Ecology)

Siliitoe,P. *Exchange in Wola Society* (Australian National University, Canberra, 1979)


Simpson,G. and McKillop,R. *Public Administration, Planning and Budgeting in Papua New Guinea* (Canberra, AIDAB/ Commonwealth of Aust., 1994)


Strathern,A. *The Rope of Moka...* (Cambridge University Press, 1971)

Strathern, M. *The gender of the gift: problems with women and problems with society in Melanesia* (Cambridge University Press, 1988)

Swatridge,C. *Delivering the goods: education as cargo in Papua New Guinea* (Melbourne University Press, 1985)

Bibliography


Bibliography


Weiner, J. “Substance, siblingship and exchange: aspects of social structure in New Guinea”, *Social Analysis* No.11, October 1982, 3-33


Williams, F.E. “The Vailala Madness” and other essays, E. Schwimmer editor (London, Hurst, 1976)


Young, R.E. “Elite ideology in Papua New Guinea”, *Journal of Commonwealth and Comparative Politics* 16 (3) 1987: 272-287

Zelenietz, M. and Grant, J. “Kilenge Narogo: ceremonies, resources and prestige in a West New Britain society”, *Oceania* 51(2) 1980, 98-117


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACFOA</td>
<td>Aust. Council For Overseas Aid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANU</td>
<td>Australian National University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AUSAID</td>
<td>Australian Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOUGAINVILLE CRISIS</td>
<td>Civil War in Bougainville Prov. Papua New Guinea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEC</td>
<td>Department of Environment and Conservation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIRECTIVE PRINCIPLES</td>
<td>5 Directive Principles of PNG's Constit. Preamble</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIS</td>
<td>Environmental Impact Statement/ prelim. Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAO</td>
<td>(UN) Forest and Agriculture Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FMPP</td>
<td>Forest Management and Planning Project [GOV.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOREST AUTHORITY</td>
<td>Statutory Body to regulate Forestry [GOV.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRI</td>
<td>Forest Research Institute [GOV.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDEAL TYPE</td>
<td>Social term for commonly agreed concept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J.POL SOC</td>
<td>Journal of the Polynesian Society academic journ.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;KG&quot;</td>
<td>Kandrian Gloucestr Integrated Development Proj.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOC</td>
<td>Land Owner Company [private consortium]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MI</td>
<td>Melanesian Inst. for Pastoral &amp; Socio-econ.Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NANGO</td>
<td>National Alliance of Non Government Org. (PNG)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORGANIC LAW</td>
<td>&quot;Organic Law on Provincial &amp; Local Level Govs.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARADIGM</td>
<td>Conceptual Rule by which a matter is understood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PASISMANUA</td>
<td>&quot;Man'o War Passage&quot; WNB Province, in Tok Pisin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNG TRUST</td>
<td>P. N. G. Trust for Integral Human Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POINT SERIES</td>
<td>Main academic Annual Journal for Mel.Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RIMBUNAN HIJAU</td>
<td>Timber Merchant operating in PNG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSPAS</td>
<td>Research School of Pacific &amp; Asian Studies ANU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBLC</td>
<td>Stettin Bay Lumber Company, W.N.B. Province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIL</td>
<td>Summer Institute of Ling/Wycliffe Bible Translators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIS</td>
<td>Social Impact Statement/ preliminary research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRANSNATIONALS</td>
<td>International (Commercial) Corporations/ Traders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRP AGREEMENTS</td>
<td>Timber Rights Purchasing Ag., Gov.&amp; landowners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITECH</td>
<td>University of Technology of PNG, Lae.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UPNG</td>
<td>University of Papua New Guinea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WNBP</td>
<td>West New Britain Province, Papua New Guinea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WWF</td>
<td>World Wildlife Fund, or Worldwide Fund for Nature</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>