Not the Spice Trade: Australian Women’s Contribution to Educational Change in Pakistan

by

Margaret Mary Madden
BA, MEd, MTh

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Deakin University
March, 2011
I certify that the thesis entitled  Not the Spice Trade: Australian Women’s Contribution to Educational Change in Pakistan

submitted for the degree of  Doctor of Philosophy

is the result of my own work and that where reference is made to the work of others, due acknowledgment is given.

I also certify that any material in the thesis which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by any university or institution is identified in the text.

'I certify that I am the student named below and that the information provided in the form is correct'

Full Name  Margaret Mary Madden

Signed  Signature Redacted by Library

Date  August 24, 2011.
The last lines I put into this text are rightly about those people who helped to make this doctoral thesis a reality. I recognise that here it is possible to give particular mention to only some of those people but hope my humble acknowledgment conveys the depth of my gratitude to all those who have touched into my doctoral journey.

This thesis would not have been possible without the wise guidance, support and patience of my principal supervisor, Dr Jennifer Angwin. She persistently challenged me as educator, colleague and friend to bring to life insights into transnational experiences of teacher education from the Australians and Pakistanis whose stories were interwoven through ordinary and extraordinary circumstances. The good advice, critical insights and friendship given by my second supervisor, Dr. Geoff Shacklock, has been invaluable on both a researcher and a practitioner level, for which I am extremely grateful.

To each of the research participants I extend my gratitude for the generous manner in which they involved themselves in my research. My very deep appreciation lies with the five participants who so unreservedly entrusted to me the precious uniqueness of their stories and thus provided me the essence for my research.

For my friends and colleagues in Karachi and Australia who have given me technical assistance, coped with burned out computers, retrieved data from the seemingly lost outposts of cyber space and saw to the final formatting of my document, my most sincere thanks and admiration are yours.

My family members have been most loving, supportive and long suffering – having to share my short home visits to Australian with the constant attention demanded by the tome. My love and gratitude for this are immeasurable and hopefully the days ahead will make up for lost time and occasions.
Last and by no means the least I thank the members of my religious congregation, the Sister of Mercy, Brisbane, whose prayers, interest, encouragement and finances have enabled me to live and work in Pakistan and to undertake studies to the doctoral level. I owe a special thanks to the many sisters of the Melbourne congregation who provided me with the warmth of hospitality during my visits to Deakin University and work with my supervisors. To the women of my *home communities* in Karachi and Brisbane who bore the ups and downs of my thesis journey, cared for me in so many loving ways, believed in the work I was doing and have laughed and cried along the way, my gratitude and appreciation will last as long as my days.

Despite all the assistance provided to me by Dr Angwin and others, I alone remain responsible for the content of the following, including any errors or omissions which may unwittingly remain.
Contents

Acknowledgements .............................................................................................................. iv

Contents ........................................................................................................................ vi

List of Figures .................................................................................................................. xiv

List of Abbreviations ....................................................................................................... xv

Abstract ........................................................................................................................... xvii

Chapter 1: Introduction ...................................................................................................... 1

1.1 Background ................................................................................................................ 1

1.2 The Research Focus ................................................................................................... 1

1.3 The Story: The Seeding Ground of the Research ...................................................... 2

1.4 Being a Part of the Story ......................................................................................... 4

1.5 The Pilgrim’s Progress5 ............................................................................................ 8

Chapter 2: Had We Burned Down ................................................................................. 11

2.1 Introducing the Problem .......................................................................................... 11

2.2 Notre Dame Institute of Education: Its Worth and Fragility ................................ 12

2.3 Symbols of Realities ............................................................................................... 14

2.4 The Spark: A Teacher Education Institute ............................................................. 17

2.5 Framing the Problem: The Research Question ..................................................... 18

2.6 The Educational Context ....................................................................................... 21

2.6.1 Schooling in Pakistan ....................................................................................... 22

2.6.2 Notre Dame Institute of Education ..................................................................... 23

2.6.3 The MEd Programme ....................................................................................... 27

2.6.4 Winds of Change in Teacher Education in Pakistan ......................................... 28

2.6.5 NDIE’s Academic Credibility .......................................................................... 29

2.7 Global Trade in Tertiary Education ....................................................................... 30
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.7.4 Teacher Education</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.5 Continuing Professional Development</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.6 Teacher Professionalism</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.7 Leadership in Teacher Education</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4: Research Methodology</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Methodological Issues</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.1 Interpretative Research: A Case Study</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.2 Describing the Method</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.3 Three Minor Case Studies</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.4 The Interrogation</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 The Case Study using Qualitative Methodology</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Data Collection</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Participants</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Interpretation of Narrative</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 The Subaltern Voice</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 The Narrative Approach</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Story and Narrative</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4 Teachers’ Storied Understanding</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Data Collection and Analysis</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1 Methodological Stages</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2 Critical Incident Technique</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3 Representation of Experiences</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.4 Use of Images</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 The Stories and the Narrative of the Research</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.1 Voices without Words</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Stepping Inside the Problem</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 6 - Semi Structured Interview Schedule B ...............................................................294
Appendix 7: Ethics Approval ..................................................................................................296
List of Figures

Figure 1.1: Class 1 at a middle to upper class school ..................................................... 6
Figure 1.2: A Contrast: Class 1 at Baldia busti ............................................................... 6
Figure 1.3: Baldia busti home chores ............................................................................ 7
Figure 1.4: Children’s homes at Baldia busti ................................................................. 7
Figure 1.5: Can they hope for their future? .................................................................. 9
Figure 1.6: Is it worth sending me, a girl child, to school? ........................................... 10
Figure 1.7: Collecting recyclables: Labour versus education ....................................... 10
Figure 2.1: Illegal electrical connections or kundas ..................................................... 13
Figure 2.2: Karachi housing and recyclers ................................................................... 15
Figure 2.3: Karachi housing and Dhobi (washer folk) lines amidst rubbish .............. 15
Figure 2.4: Traffic and cart-wallas in Saddar, Empress Market .................................. 16
Figure 2.5: Regular street scene in Saddar area – outside the eastern wall of St. Patrick’s .................................................................................................................. 23
Figure 2.6: Passing the NDIE campus front gates ...................................................... 24
Figure 2.7: Sewerage lines outside the NDIE campus ................................................ 24
Figure 2.8: Inside St. Patrick’s High School campus ................................................... 25
Figure 8.1: NDIE Students at IDP Camp Thatta .......................................................... 244
Figure 8.2: Comparison of income sources (Break-up of sources of income on % basis) ......................................................................................................................... 249
Figure 8.3: NDIE graduates in various cities of Pakistan ............................................. 252
Figure 8.4: NDIE MEd graduates in various educational fields ................................. 255
Figure 8.5: Local spices: Students of NDIE ............................................................... 256
# List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACU</td>
<td>Australian Catholic University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADE</td>
<td>Associate Degree in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIE</td>
<td>Ali Institute of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AKESP</td>
<td>Aga Khan Education Services Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AKU-IED</td>
<td>Aga Khan University—Institute of Educational Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVI</td>
<td>Australian Volunteers International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA</td>
<td>Bachelor of Arts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEd</td>
<td>Bachelor of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-Teach</td>
<td>Bachelor of Teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBE</td>
<td>Catholic Board of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBCP</td>
<td>Catholic Bishops Conference of Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIT</td>
<td>Critical Incident Technique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPD</td>
<td>continuing professional development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CT</td>
<td>Certificate of Teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DBE</td>
<td>Diocesan Board of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECD</td>
<td>Early Childhood Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECE</td>
<td>Early Childhood Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ED-LINKS</td>
<td>Links to Learning: Education Support to Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFA</td>
<td>Education for All</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELD</td>
<td>Education and Literacy Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESR</td>
<td>Education Sector Reform</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESRA</td>
<td>Education Sector Reform Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESRAP</td>
<td>Education Sector Reform Action Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FATA</td>
<td>Federally Administered Tribal Areas (Pakistan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCE</td>
<td>Government College of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEC</td>
<td>Government Elementary Colleges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GPE</td>
<td>Graduate Professional Experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEC</td>
<td>Higher Education Commission—Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>Information and communication technologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Internally Displaced Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFCU</td>
<td>International Federation of Catholic Universities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IGCE</td>
<td>International Graduate Certificate in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISMA</td>
<td>Institute of the Sisters of Mercy of Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KU</td>
<td>Karachi University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEd</td>
<td>Master of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoE</td>
<td>Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MQM</td>
<td>Mohajir Qaumi Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NACTE</td>
<td>National Accreditation Council for Teacher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDIE</td>
<td>Notre Dame Institute of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NFWP</td>
<td>North West Frontier Province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OT</td>
<td>Oriental Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARE</td>
<td>Pakistan Association for Research in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCBC</td>
<td>Pakistan Catholic Bishops Conference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>Primary Teaching Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-STEP</td>
<td>Pre-Service Teacher Education Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rsm</td>
<td>Religious Sister of Mercy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAP</td>
<td>Social Action Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIDA</td>
<td>Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPDC</td>
<td>Social Policy and Development Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEDA</td>
<td>Sindh Teacher Education Development Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEP</td>
<td>Strengthening Teacher Education in Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTP</td>
<td>Tehrik-i-Taliban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VSO-UK</td>
<td>Voluntary Service Oversees</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract

This research is an example of a descriptive interpretative case study in the sociological domain where the problematic was an evaluative investigation of the contribution made by particular Australian women to the ongoing process of educational change in Pakistan. In its particular form, this interpretative research was a study of participants’ lived experiences within, thoughts about and feelings for a bounded situation (Swanborn 2010; Yin 2009; Stake 2000).

Universities of the first world have rapidly globalised the character of their student bodies through marketing their academic courses in developing countries and/or creating there, actual or virtual campuses and web-based faculties. While the process has added a transnational or export facet to the nature of tertiary education, most of the derived benefits do not reside in the poorer host country (Harvey 2009). I investigated a Teacher Education Institute that operates in a mode counter to the notion of exported education, in that it is based on an ideological framework of partnership where Pakistanis and Australians work as colleagues, the courses are designed within Pakistan, and the particular institute does not operate on a ‘for profit’ basis. My research developed interpretative descriptions of how this specific educational endeavour has set about changing teaching and learning processes.

I pursued the investigations using a narrative approach. The core narrative I generated from accounts of the hopes and goals, achievements and struggles of three Australian women were the Directors of Notre Dame Institute of Education (NDIE) in Karachi, who successively guided and taught the students throughout the first 20 years of the Institute’s existence. To strengthen its credibility, I used a secondary set of studies to critically interrogate the core narrative. These comprised three minor case studies of MEd graduates as they operated as professional educators. Thus, the research aimed to produce bipartisan perspectives on the contribution made by the Australian women to teaching and schooling in Pakistan. Repetitive throughout the components of the research was my use of the ‘critical incident technique’ (CIT) (Stromberg 2009; Larravee cited in Evertson & Weinstein 2006; Goodson & Sikes
The data gathered over a period of two years were written stories, personal interviews, photographic images, informal conversations and graduate participant workplace observation. My professional journal and research diary provided additional materials.

My research has offered a critique of the effectiveness of a particular approach to teacher education. In so doing, I provided an avenue through which the MEd graduates critically voiced differences in their professional work and lives that were consequences of their NDIE educational experiences. My research also offered them an opportunity to map the effectiveness of the changes they have made and are making to educational practice in Pakistan.

My analysis of the research narrative located the recurring themes of partnership, struggle, achievement and personal agency as the bases around which NDIE constructed and carried out its learning and teaching activities and the MEd graduates demonstrated in their teaching, administration and innovation of professional workplace activities. In juxtaposing the perspectives of the Australian women and the MEd Graduates, the commonalities and differences in the emerged themes, insights and meanings were compared and contrasted, and conformities and differences were exposed. Through this process, the research uncovered a new level of meaning in the Australians’ educational contribution in Pakistan. It has not only provided pointers for the future direction and planning of NDIE as a teacher education institute but also indicated that good quality teacher education can happen effectively within Pakistan through local-foreign partnerships that encourage and prepare the local professionals to contribute towards achieving necessary educational changes. In other words, the valuable spices of human resources remain to savour their own nation and its people.
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Background

The genesis of a research question is often like a tiny pebble in a shoe, gnawing away at the shod foot until the pebble’s intent is noted and action is taken to address the gnawing. I traced the origin of the grating pebble of my research questions concerning the role played by Australians in effecting change in learning and teaching methods in Pakistan to a confronting invitation by a young Pakistani man to help him facilitate access to schooling for some of the poorest of the children of Karachi. The story of this encounter narrated below (1.3) depicts confrontational aspects of my nagging quest to find a relationship of relevance between Pakistan’s need for a new generation of teachers and educational leaders and the efforts to assist in achieving this goal offered by some experienced Australian educators.

1.2 The Research Focus

A cursory knowledge of Pakistan depicts it as a third world country, in Frenchman Sauvy’s terms, a country that is nothing and wants to be something (Chaliand n.d.). I ascribe to the widely held view that education is a sure route mapping a way out of this condition with the logical conclusion that Pakistani teachers must therefore be imbued with the capabilities to redress the poor quality of their educational system and its inaccessibility for so many of the nation’s children. History records (Government of Pakistan 2009) that particularly in the past 20 years, numerous attempts have been made to redress the situation through local and foreign efforts. International aid agendas have had a strong focus on offering good quality educational opportunities to young and promising Pakistani students in foreign countries from where a large proportion never returned and Pakistan’s educational system remained unchanged. My interest focussed on finding out if and how foreign educators could contribute to the improvement of the education system by educating young Pakistani teachers on their home soil. In particular, I wanted to determine if the efforts of Australian teacher educators, including me, at the Notre Dame Institute
of Education (NDIE), Karachi, were enabling the Institute’s graduates to effect change in the teaching and learning processes in the schools and educational settings in which they worked.

My research direction was determined by underlying questions such as:

- Has the Australian educational experience any relevance for the Pakistani situation?
- Can good-quality teacher education be established through the efforts of the Australians working with Pakistanis?
- Can that quality be recognised and appreciated in the local setting?
- How can Pakistanis and Australians work as partners—learning from and with each other in a noncolonial type mode of operation?
- Is it possible for Eastern Muslims and Western Christians to blend their experiences, capabilities and cultural traditions for positive educational outcomes?
- Can a new cadre of professional teachers and educational leaders graduate from NDIE with the capabilities and commitment to effect change in the belief about and practice of learning and teaching in Pakistani classrooms?

The emergence of these questions and hence my research grew out of a critical encounter I experienced through my relationship with a young Pakistani man who sought my support and assistance to enable the children of a poverty-stricken community to have access to education. This story of the beginnings of my research follows.

1.3 The Story: The Seeding Ground of the Research

Joseph, a young Punjabi man in his mid-twenties, came to visit me at NDIE with a particular request on his mind. As I soon discovered, he was also determined not to leave before getting my positive response. I taught Joseph when he was studying Christian theology and subsequently met him intermittently, tutored him to complete his Bachelor of Arts (BA) degree and offered encouragement and guidance to his
teaching in a local Catholic busti\(^1\) school. Joseph’s family was comprised of poor, unschooled Punjabi farmers, and his familiarity with such a struggle for existence bred his basic aim in life: to make a difference amongst the poor and uneducated in Pakistan. Hence, threads of his story and my story became interwoven:

Joseph went to live in Baldia, one of the poorest and most violent areas of Karachi. Settlements of Hindu people who are ethnically part of the nomad people of interior Sindh cling to Baldia’s periphery. They wandered the desert areas with their animals and grew seasonal crops until the partition of India and Pakistan at which time they, like millions of other ethnic and religious groups, gradually migrated to Karachi and settled on encroached land. Sixty years hence, they remain housed in flimsy dirt-floored constructions of twigs and rags and they possess a few prized buffalo living with them for milk, fuel from their droppings and eventual sale. The women and girls draw water in buckets from the township pumps some two kilometres from their settlement and share intermittent electricity supplies when they illegally hook a kunda over someone else’s electrical wire. The men, women and children help to bring in the family’s meagre income as beggars, kindling gatherers or as bangle sellers (women and girls), while many of the men (and children) are drug peddlers. (Margaret, Personal Journal, September 2007)

In the midst of this little busti, and with the people’s interest and support, Joseph set out to bring some social change. With the male elders, he had drawn up a plan of action: Education and Social Awareness: A Movement for Freedom and Development. High on the agenda of this action plan was the establishment of a school that Joseph had opened just prior to his visit to me. The community elders agreed first, that the children would not go out to work for three hours during the day so that they could go to school, and second, that each family would contribute five rupees\(^2\) per month towards the running costs of the school and meagre living allowance for Joseph. As he recounted his story, I was beginning to see where my help would be sought, but…what to do?\(^3\) My reality as a white, Australian, first world, Christian woman in an Eastern, third world, Muslim country, rather than my abilities and experience as a teacher and teacher educator, held the dilemmas—what could I do; what should I do; what would I do?

---

\(^1\) Busti is the term used for a local poor or slum area.

\(^2\) At that point in history, 72 Pakistan Rupee were equivalent to an Australian Dollar.

\(^3\) This is a much-used Pakistani colloquialism, indicative of the crossroads of confusion that may govern any next step to be taken.
My first step was to go to the *busti* where I discovered the semblance of a schoolroom organised at one end of the area set aside as the Sacred Shrine. Measuring about 20 feet by 10 feet, the demarcating sapling poles supported the remnants of a *shamiana* patched with rags to form a roof:

Joseph had prepared the children to sing their counting and multiplying abilities, recite their reading chart and look eagerly and hopefully at me while fingering my whiteness. Hence Joseph’s intention was that my heart for children and education would want to guide their future schooling. They sat on the sandy ground that doubled as their writing tablet with the help of their fingers or twigs and seemed eager to learn and to show off their learning. The children’s behaviours evidenced that as a teacher, Joseph mirrored his own schooling of rote learning and mimicry. But he was both proud of what was beginning and lost as to where to go next from educational and financial perspectives.

At the beginning of my visit, the men stood around the outside of the classroom, giving the odd thump to any child who appeared to be noisy or bad mannered. Gradually the women emerged and joined me with the children. The babies were brought out, each to be handed over to me for their spot in the limelight. I left the little community with the promise that I would do something to help their fledgling school effort (Margaret, Personal Journal, September 1997).

Joseph and the *busti* community’s reflection on my visit I can but guess. However, revisiting the experience on my return to NDIE and the Mercy community, a series of questions, doubts, possibilities and options presented themselves. Could, would, why, how what of helping were our questions.

### 1.4 Being a Part of the Story

I knew that the Australian Mercies could competently guide and mentor Joseph through the process of setting up, organising and managing the school along with securing some financial assistance for the venture. Ostensibly our purpose in Pakistan was to educate teachers through formal courses and programmes at NDIE, yet the pull towards giving a positive response to Baldia was magnetic. Joseph’s

---

4 Four Australian Sisters of Mercy, a religious congregation of women in the Catholic Church, working and living together at NDIE.
request and the impoverished circumstances of the Baldia people (see Figures 1.1–1.4) pulled me beyond the core reason I had freely opted to come to Pakistan, and I knew I had no option but to respond positively. MacIntyre’s work (cited in Gough 1998, p. 120) suggests that I knew what I was to do because I was growing into or becoming part of the local educational story, which stretched beyond the walls of NDIE. What confronted me was the paradox between the beliefs and hopes the Australian women held in the teacher education processes they were implementing at NDIE and the hesitation and uncertainty regarding its relevance and adequacy for the task confronting teachers in the Pakistani reality.

The story of Joseph and the busti is not an isolated incident. He and his busti school have answered some of my questions as the teachers, the children and the parents continue creating its story and 60 percent of its 5th class male students move on to regular schools for their secondary education. I continue to question the relevancy and effectiveness of my contribution to Pakistani society as I walk the path of maintaining and further developing Pre-service, Masters and Continuing Professional Development programmes that are relevant for Pakistani teachers working in schools amongst the poor and the middle classes all over Pakistan. It is here, I argue, that my research finds its meaning and its worth.
Figure 1.1: Class 1 at middle to upper class school in Pakistan

Figure 1.2: A Contrast: Class 1 at Baldia busti school
Figure 1.3: Baldia busti home chores

Figure 1.4: Children’s homes at Baldia busti
1.5 The Pilgrim's Progress

A pilgrim’s progress, reflective of Bunyan’s seventeenth-century classical allegory, is an apt descriptor of my research experience. Unlike Bunyan’s pilgrim, Christian, I was not on a personal or religious salvific quest for the celestial city. However, I was a wayfarer on a journey in a foreign land (Encyclopædia Britannica Online. 25 July 2010) where I sought to find if and how the particular NDIE approach to teacher education in Pakistan was effective and what contribution Australian women educators made to that outcome. My rate of progress through the research pilgrimage was much slower than I initially intended. Obstacles are intrinsic to any researcher’s journey and my obstacles, although different in form, bore a similarity to Christian’s allegorical characters.

My hill of difficulty (Bunyan cited in Owens, 2003) was formed through the penetrating effects, at personal and professional levels, of Pakistan’s sociopolitical upthrusts of the last decade including the overthrow of its governing democracy by a military coup in 1999; world recognition as a seedbed for terrorism following the attacks on the United States of America (USA) in 2001; the assassination of the former Prime Minister, Benazir Bhutto, in 2007; and the instability of a shakily restored democratic government in 2008 (Aziz 2009). The increased infiltration of international and provincial borders by powerful insurgent and terrorist groups such as the Taliban and Al-Qaeda (Mir 2009) ensured the constancy in threat and action of bombings and target killings justified by the perpetrators on ethnic, sectarian, nationality and minority bases. My life and academic work in Karachi was challenging, rewarding and wonderful in so many ways, yet my lived reality has also been consistently pitted with days and weeks of violence, lack of safety and fear. In Sattar’s (2010) words:

The defining characteristic of the history of Karachi’s ethnic-slash-political violence is its complexity. Unlike the one-off reaction to Benazir’s death or the terrorist attacks here against foreigners in 2002, the city's indigenous carnage—which has flared up repeatedly since the 1980s—is perhaps the most confounding problem confronting Pakistan's government today. The

---

5 Acknowledgement of the original title as the allegory of John Bunyan published in 1678
country suffers from everything from electricity shortages and food and fuel price inflation to stalled talks with India and a total failure to manage natural disasters. But none of these problems present quite the same tangled mix of political incentives that Karachi does. (Sattar, Foreign Policy 2010)

Such circumstances, as described by Sattar, invaded my mental space for scholarly work and mitigated against my concluding the work in a tighter time frame while it enabled me to grow in my understanding of Pakistani society and its educational system. From this perspective, I argue that my research as reported in the subsequent chapters has depth to the credibility its insights offer to teacher educational processes in Pakistan and hence the children (see Figures 1.5–1.7) it is meant to serve.

Figure 1.5: Can they hope for their future?
Figure 1.6: Is it worth sending me, a girl child, to school?

Figure 1.7: Collecting recyclables: Labour versus education
Chapter 2: Had We Burned Down...

In this chapter, I label the research problem as an evaluative investigation of the relationship between the processes of teacher education established by Australian educators at NDIE and the resultant observable effects in the professional lives of NDIE Master of Education (MEd) graduates. I briefly establish the intent, location and design of the NDIE teacher education programme and its academic status in relation to degrees granted by University of Karachi (UofK) and Australian Catholic University (ACU); introduce some of its human and environmental elements; and establish the approach to the research process as a case study, using the interpretative narrative methodology.

2.1 Introducing the Problem

This dissertation investigated the professional lives and work experiences of teachers in Pakistan—a topic that had the potential to be overwhelming in scope and massive in data production. Such was not the case, as my study was sharply focussed on a unique face of teacher education. This face was characterised by the establishment of an educational institute based on an ideological framework of partnership where Pakistanis and Australians work as colleagues; students are both female and male, come from all provinces and territories of Pakistan, and share the same classes; academic awards are offered by both a local and a foreign university; the courses are designed within Pakistan; and NDIE does not operate on a ‘for profit’ basis. Although I have simply pinpointed unique features at this stage, I will elaborate and examine them further in the course of the research report.

At a time in history when universities of the ‘first world’ have rapidly globalised the character of their student bodies, marketed their academic courses, created virtual campuses and web-based faculties (Burbules & Torres 2000; Dickson 2009; Field 2005; Giroux 2000; Kazmi 2005; Smith 2002; Torin 2005; Wolf 2002) and thus given education a transnational character (GATE 1997; Garrett 2004; Masinde & Misande 2006; Vallack & Charleson 2007), I found the first decade of the twenty-
first century a pertinent moment for my case study to be undertaken. The NDIE teacher education courses in some aspects stand countercultural to this tertiary educational trend. NDIE remains a real campus. Its courses, which are of internationally recognised standards and meet the criteria for awards from both ACU and the University of Karachi, have been designed on-site through the shared expertise and reflexive learning of both Pakistani and Australian educators. Information and communication technologies (ICT) have become an integral tool for learning and teaching when electricity and telecommunication services are available. Through networking, the Institute has endeavoured to provide ongoing professional support to its graduate students working within Pakistan.

Through my case study (Cresswell 2007, 2008; Marshall & Rossman 2006; Noor 2008; Stake 2000, 2005; Yin 2003), I put forward a critique on the effectiveness of the NDIE approach to teacher education. To do this, I provided an avenue through which the MEd graduates could critically voice differences in their professional work and lives that are a consequence of their NDIE educational experiences. Further, my research offered them an opportunity to map the effectiveness of the changes they are making to educational practice in Pakistan.

2.2 Notre Dame Institute of Education: Its Worth and Fragility

*Consumed by fire* could be a fitting epitaph or perhaps a biblical reference to the prophet Elijah who was taken to the heavens in his fiery chariot when his work was done,6 or like Moses, it could be a message deep in meaning coming from the fiery bush7 as a maxim for an approach to teacher education. If the words marked the demise of NDIE, would the ashes of its story have been collected and preserved in an urn? In a Mosaic encounter, they could be seen to seek a meaning in NDIE’s journey to freedom or its exodus from a stagnant educational process and its constant encounters with joys, hardships and doubts. If prophetic, then the words point to a passionate action imbued with endless possibilities.

---

6 2 Kings 2:11–12
7 Exodus 3: 1–7
Devouring fires can find expression as both metaphor and reality at NDIE. A fire caused by an immeasurable bolt of electricity passing into the transformers on the fifth floor of the NDIE building early one morning was not something unexpected for me, having at the time resided in the country for some 14 years. To speak of Karachi’s electricity supply is a conundrum in itself. No supply, 110 volts, 500 volts, flaming wires, thousands of illegal *kunda* (Fig. 2.1), little maintenance, no upgrading—all such circumstances created through the good management of corrupt practices at every level over many years. As described by Spring (1998 p. 221), what the Western perspective names as corruption or crony capitalism, that is, insider deals between politicians, family members and corporations might in reality be a ‘product of the spirit that binds together many Asian societies’.

---

As described by Spring (1998 p. 221), what the Western perspective names as corruption or crony capitalism, that is, insider deals between politicians, family members and corporations might in reality be a ‘product of the spirit that binds together many Asian societies’.
2.3 Symbols of Realities

The manner and state of electricity provision is symbolic of many aspects of life in Karachi. The first capital of an independent Pakistan in 1947, the city has changed rapidly from a picturesque fishing town characterised by Anglo-Indian ease and architecture to a sprawling metropolis housing some of the wealthiest of the nation and the armed services as well as the bulk of the nation’s poorest of the poor. The fishing town infrastructure has had little difficulty in proving its inadequacy as a basis for the estimated 22 million people who currently inhabit the city. The trappings of a mega city are present in sections of its sprawl. Wide, well-paved roads are to be found in cantonment and defence housing areas along with bungalow housing to rival the best in the world. Shopping malls of international standards (except for the lack of parking provision) are appearing as part of the support structures in these areas, while the commercial sectors boast new, impressive buildings and corporate mission statements alongside the old and dilapidated businesses whose glory shone in a former era.

For the vast majority of people, the scenario for city life is quite different. Housed in poorly constructed and ill-maintained high-rise, the struggling middle class have road transport as their only option for accessing work and other facilities. Along with those who live in the busti areas and squat on the banks of rivers or on encroached land, they have to endure overcrowded and ill-maintained roads and transport vehicles. Buses and cars of all sizes and states of roadworthiness compete for road space with an unruly mass of bicycles, motorbikes, motorised rickshaws, donkey carts, camel carts, horse drawn tongas and pedestrians. Open drains, free running sewerage, stagnant waters along with the incessant noise of traffic horns of every stereophonic nature fill the audio and olfactory senses. Figures 2.2 to 2.4 concretise these verbal images of the local Karachi environment.

---

9 In February 2010, Karachi’s population was estimated to be 180 million, that is, 60 times larger than it was in 1947 and increasing at an annual rate of 6 per cent. Its city area is approximately 1,600 sq miles (www.citymayors.com/statistics/largest-city-mayors-intro.html).
Figure 2.2: Karachi housing and recyclers

Figure 2.3: Karachi housing and Dhobi (washer folk) lines amidst rubbish
While the most sophisticated of technological facilities are accessible (although much in a pirated and poor quality form), sweet or potable water is not available on demand in homes and institutions in vast areas of the city. Where municipal water pipes are laid and still functioning, they are opened for only a few hours daily. Other areas are supplied at exorbitant prices by the ‘water tanker mafia’, while communal pumps and polluted streams are other avenues for obtaining this basic necessity of life. As blue skies over Karachi are a rarity, pollution, dust and humidity overarch this desert-like city for most of the year. Across so many of its dimensions, not least of which is the political, Karachi is a city lacking law and order. Its cultural mix, exacerbated by its majority illiterate population and emotive political and religious leaders create a volatile societal cocktail of mass unpredictability and violence. The geographic and demographic nature of the city enables individuals and groups to disappear or live an undetected presence while forming networks of contacts across the country and beyond its borders. Attacks of terrorism and political carnage are all too familiar to its citizens, and one of the biggest challenges for its city officials is managing the tensions and violence that often flare along ethnic and religious lines (Haq 2010).
2.4 The Spark: A Teacher Education Institute

Within this conglomerate of life, which unfolds like the changing scenes on a movie set,\(^{10}\) are the people of the majority and minority groups of the society who go about their daily lives in ways that hope to create a better future. It is also within this milieu that the needs and difficulties surrounding teacher education seek to be addressed. The establishment of NDIE as a Pakistani-Australian partnership in 1991 was envisioned long before that date by the leading Catholic educationalist, Bishop Anthony Lobo, as a practical step towards affecting a paradigm shift in the process and outcomes of teacher education in Pakistan (Edwards, Gilroy & Hartley 2002; Schuyler 1997; Weinstein, Tomlinson-Clarke & Curran 2004). As the principal of a large secondary school in Karachi and lecturer in education at Karachi University, Bishop Lobo knew firsthand the outcomes of poor quality teacher education. He carried to many countries around the world, his long-term dream of doing something practical to enable good quality teacher education to happen in Pakistan and particularly amongst the minority Christian community. His encounter with two Sisters of Mercy educators in Australia, Deirdre Jordan and Gabrielle Jennings, placed the first span in the bridge between his dream and its realisation. The Mercy Sisters were insistent that they would come to Pakistan on the basis of a partnership relationship with the Pakistan Catholic Bishops Conference (PCBC) and not on the premise that they would establish an Australian Mercy educational institution. The partnership negotiated by the two parties was couched in the following terms, which have not been altered:

Ownership, governance of and financial responsibility for the teacher education institute rests with the Pakistani people through the PCBC.

The Australian Sisters of Mercy give the contributed services of some of their experienced educators to fashion, guide and administer the institute through its initial stages of formation and establishment on a firm basis and then withdraw their presence. Their contribution is in the short term.

The essential role of the Australian Mercies lies in training the local Pakistani educators to take responsibility for the mission of the institute, its

---

\(^{10}\) An image coined by Sr. Catharine Ahern rsm (Religious Sister of Mercy) to describe her experiences of living in Karachi and working at NDIE for 13 years.
administration and ongoing development. Their contribution is for the long term but not their presence. (Jordon 1990)

So if the Institute had burned down after 18 years of existence, what options would have been available and what reasons would have lain behind a choice to continue or to leave it rest in its ashes? Basic to such a decisive scenario is the contribution NDIE has made and is continuing to make in creating in Pakistan a public place that is free enough to allow for teacher education and a space for its students to think and gain the skills that bring them to personal and professional growth (Fain cited in Perez, Fain & Slater 2004).

My interest in the Institute began in 1991 when I was invited by Beatrice, the founding Director, to teach a unit of the Bachelor of Education (BEd) course over a two-month time period. During that visit, the spark that caught my interest was kindled within the eagerness for learning that I saw in the students of that first cohort. In my estimation, it contrasted sharply with a general attitude among students I had taught at Australian Universities who took for granted their right to an education and coupled that with a rather nonchalant approach to their studies. NDIE offered me personal and professional challenges, as Pakistan was the first Asian and Muslim country I had visited and it starkly contrasted the well-ordered, clean and free Australian society to which I was accustomed. My sense of adventure became heightened with an eagerness to explore further the social, cultural, political and religious milieu of Karachi and the country. Professionally I grasped it as an opportunity to learn, to adapt to a different educational scenario and to contribute from my experience to the locally desired change in teacher education and subsequently the learning-teaching processes in Pakistani schools.

2.5 Framing the Problem: The Research Question

My research is a demonstration of how Australian Sisters of Mercy strove to work in partnership with Pakistani educators at NDIE in a nonexploitative way in order to effect educational change in a Pakistani context that strives to shake its colonial past and establish itself as a democratic Islamic republic. The research is entitled:
Not the Spice Trade: Australian Women’s Contribution to Educational Change in Pakistan.

NDIE has been established for two decades. Therefore, I contend that it is an opportune time to investigate the living experiences of such concepts as missionary, postcolonial partnerships; Islamic and Christian; national, international, transnational and global education as they are being redefined by the political, social and economic interactions between third/fourth and first world nations. The NDIE project operates counter to the global trends to trade tertiary education as an economic commodity (Burbules, Burbles & Torres 2000; Field 2002; Giroux 2000; Kazmi 2005; Smith 2002; Wolf 2002) and the nature and success of the Institute’s approach I sought to demonstrate through my research.

I began the investigation of the question by exploring the lives of the graduates of the NDIE MEd course, and in this way critically examined its construct, content and process. I undertook this through an interrogation of the critical stories the graduates told of their professional lives and work. This information was available in the demonstrations the graduates gave of their changed practices as they worked among the wider educational communities within Pakistan. I juxtaposed the graduates’ stories with those of the three Australian women who have been the directors of NDIE, guiding its formation and development over a 20-year period. Their insights into what has been created as a place and a space for learning and teaching and what they judge to be achievements, I enabled to emerge and stand beside the perspectives of their educational colleagues and former students.

Even with the best of intentions and attempts at working in partnership, East and West, Muslim and Christian, highly trained educators and untrained teachers are dichotomies that exist and in turn, fashioned the way in which the process and the outcomes of the NDIE project have been perceived. I acted on the assumption that an evaluation of the project, and most specifically of the MEd programme,¹¹ could be

¹¹ Throughout this dissertation, I use the word ‘programme’ when referring to the broad NDIE curriculum offered to the MEd participants and the word ‘course’ in relation to the specific course of studies outlined by both KU and ACU for their awards of MEd.
magnified and amplified and moved beyond statistical counting, tabling and labelling if the discourses of the graduates were spoken, captured, heard and dispersed.

My research took up a challenge from Spivak (1988) captured in her well-known and debated question regarding the subaltern’s ability not only to speak in her/his own voice but also to be heard. To find voice, for Spivak signalled a move beyond the subaltern state. As researcher, I invited the MEd graduates to recount in images and storied forms, their current professional lives and work. From these images and stories, I constructed a narrative through which I was able to listen critically to the voices of the graduates in the light of the contextual dichotomies along with the aims, content and processes of the NDIE MEd course. In this way, I brought into dialogue the relationship between the graduates as professional educators in their current situations and their experiences that began as BEd students and culminated as MEd graduates of NDIE. This resulting dialogue enabled me to identify an evaluative discourse regarding the MEd programme and its contextual relevance, to locate an informed future direction of the programme, to grasp the contribution of the Australian educators, and most importantly, it provided a forum to give voice to young Pakistani educators.

The first cohort of NDIE MEd students completed their course of studies in 1997 and by December 2010, the successful graduates numbered 88. As detailed below, the NDIE MEd programme is of three and a half years’ duration and the breadth of its units and research work allows its participants to be presented as candidates for the MEd degree at KU and the internationally recognised MEd degree at ACU. Faculty and students have participated annually in a review of the year’s course, and appropriate amendments in content and process have ensued. Since the 1999–2000 academic year, NDIE has regularly undertaken the ACU mandatory five-year curriculum review process, which facilitates a more thorough evaluation of the MEd course. The outcome of these processes resulted in commendations from the ACU for the scope, design and quality of the MEd course and the evaluation process designed by the NDIE faculty. Moreover, the University ratified changes in processes of delivery of the course proposed by the review committees and the

relicensing of the course for the five (5) year periods (2001–2005 and 2006–2011) (See Appendix 1). The continuing need for the Institute’s planned availability of both personnel and material resources, which are up-to-date and of high quality, is also acknowledged in the Review report.13

While such evaluations are a valid and necessary part of academic life, they have not listened intently to the voices that emerge from the lives of the graduates in action, each in her/his particular educational setting. I contend that the most telling of evaluative statements is made by the ongoing professional activity of the graduates. Capturing episodes of their biographies as graduates was a way of ‘getting back in’ to the MEd programme or ‘reentering it’, hence this allowed the question being studied to ‘impose its own authority on the sense that is made of it by the investigator’ (Walker 1976, cited in Goodson & Walker 1991, p. 104, 107). An important aim of the MEd programme is to prepare leaders in education who will be able to make a difference to the much beleaguered educational systems in Pakistan. This difference I have interpreted through the belief stated in the aims of the MEd programme that graduates will be professionals who are able to demonstrate their confidence and competencies rather than simply regurgitate educational theory and copy practices that they have observed or experienced throughout the course of their studies at NDIE. Their stories and images of what they perceived actually happened in their educator lives challenged me to look for multiple layers of meanings and glimpse the complexity of their experiences (Trotman 2008), and I subsequently used these to critique the MEd programme and its Australian input.

2.6 The Educational Context

Pakistan’s National Education Policy of 1998 acknowledged that since partition, the system of education has advanced ‘timidly’. Even though successive governments have had ambitious plans and proposals, the chasm between words and actions has

13 The NDIE-ACU Review Committees in Karachi consisted of current students and graduates of the MEd course, all teaching faculty members, two external academics, a graduate employer and the Director of NDIE. The Dean of ACU School of Education visited NDIE at the time of the Committee’s preparation of the Curriculum Review Report. The new curriculum was officially approved by the ACU Senate in July 2006 for a five-year period.
proved unbridgeable, and hence none of the educational master plans came to fruition. Small wonder then that in the time frame of the policy formulators of 1998–2010 (National Education Policy 1998), the acknowledged scenario for the future ‘is not very bright’. In its own reckoning, Pakistan’s current educational development is at more or less the same point from which it started over 60 years ago (Planning Commission 1999). The 2008 democratically elected national government was even more explicit in its critical admissions of the quality of teaching in the country:

Poor quality of teacher (sic) in the system in large numbers is owed to the mutations in governance, an obsolete pre-service training structure and a less than adequate in-service training regime. Presence of incompetence in such a huge quantity and permeation of malpractices in the profession have eroded the once exalted position enjoyed by teachers under the eastern cultural milieu. Teaching has become the employment of last resort of most educated young people: especially males. (Government of Pakistan 2009 p. 4)

2.6.1 Schooling in Pakistan

What occurs in the teaching-learning interplay in the schools of Pakistan is commonly perceived to be of poor quality. Such factors as high illiteracy rates, less than half the population under 12 years of age having access to schooling, corrupt practices in the administration of the educational system and lack of material resources all contribute to this situation. However, the overriding contributor to the poor performance of the education sector is the quality of teachers, most of whom are either untrained or have received a poor standard of professional teacher education. Successive National Education Policies14 and statements since the initial Education Plan of 1951 have addressed in words the crucial issues of teacher formation and practice. The 2009 National Education Policy reiterates its predecessors in stating categorically that ‘…the most significant action is required in improving the teaching resources and the pedagogical approaches teachers employ. The reform of teaching quality is of the highest priority’ (p. 42). While the records show that very little has

happened at the level of implementation of such policies, NDIE stands out as one significant effort to turn printed words of policy intentions into the reality of actions.

2.6.2 Notre Dame Institute of Education

The Catholic Bishops of Pakistan took one determined step towards improved teacher education in 1991. They established NDIE and invited Australian Sisters of Mercy to direct its foundation and early formation. This institute, situated in Karachi, (see Figs. 2.5–2.7 below) draws its students from throughout Pakistan, women and men, Christian, Muslim, Hindu, Parsi and others from amongst the minority people of the country. In the public forum, it has earned a reputation as an institute of excellence in the field of teacher education (NACTE Pilot Study Report 2010).

Figure 2.5: Regular street scene in Saddar area—outside the eastern wall of St. Patrick’s
Figure 2.6: Passing the NDIE campus front gates

Figure 2.7: Sewerage lines outside the NDIE campus
NDIE is a not-for-profit organisation and is registered in the Province of Sindh, Pakistan, under the Society’s Act of 1860 through the Karachi Archdiocesan Catholic Board of Education (CBE). The funding for the construction and setting up of the institute came from the German Catholic Bishops’ Funding Agency, Misereor, and the Bundesministerium für Wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung (Federal Ministry for Economic Co-operation and Development). These agencies continue to provide approximately one-third of the current operational costs of the Institute. As part of the private sector, NDIE is a fee-paying institution where 40 per cent of the income is derived from student fees and 50 per cent from donations (See Fig 8.1). Students’ fees are largely paid in the form of scholarships from such sources as the Italian Bishops’ Conference, which has provided annual scholarships for 10–12 BEd students and 4–6 MEd students from the CBE schools throughout Pakistan. Between 1998 and 2008, the Aga Khan Education Services-Pakistan (AKES-P) sponsors approximately 12 students per year from the Federally Administered Territorial Areas (FATA)\textsuperscript{15} of the north of Pakistan to participate in either the BEd or MEd programmes. Students are also sponsored from the private

\textsuperscript{15} FATA are the non-provincial areas of Pakistan, comprising largely the tribal and far northern areas of the country and are administered as territories by the federal government.
sector community schools and some scholarships come annually from the Australian Sisters of Mercy.

When opened in 1991, the 16 students were self-funded and 20 per cent of the institute’s finances came in the form of donations. After two years (1992–93), this ratio had changed markedly as student numbers for the BEd had doubled and likewise the demands for resources for the teacher education institution. Although the institute is still largely reliant on grants and sponsorship for its solvency, it is constructively working towards self-sufficiency. Its primary source of income is student fees and the earnings from the academic faculty’s involvement in facilitating the continuing professional development (CPD) of teachers and educational leaders in both the public and private sectors in and beyond Karachi. The number of full and partial self-funding students is gradually increasing, although the need for scholarship or sponsored funding for at least half the number of students will remain into the foreseeable future.

Until 1999–2000, volunteers, namely Australian Mercies and personnel from Australian Volunteers International (AVI) and Voluntary Service Overseas (VSO-UK), comprised 90 per cent of the academic faculty and administrative staff. In the ensuing years, that percentage has been reversed as the long-term plan to develop local faculty and leadership has been implemented. In 2009–10, NDIE MEd graduates comprised 71 per cent of the teaching faculty and held all the middle management as well as the Deputy Director positions, while the Director is one of only two Australians holding a full-time academic position at the institute.

With its status of an affiliated college of KU, NDIE has the right to conduct the courses and have its students awarded the university’s BEd and MEd certifications. Both these courses are of one-year duration of full-time study and their existing curricula are limited and outdated, with no clearly stated goals, objectives or desired learning outcomes for the participants. Many of the referred resources for the individual units are 20–50 years old, and assessment is limited to written examinations and assignment papers both of which encourage rote learning and the
unacknowledged copying of bookish or lecturer-provided notes (Faculty of Education 1996).

To address this curricula situation, NDIE took two specific steps. First, it designed and implemented its own curricula for the two teacher education programmes, both of which cover the areas required for the KU awards but are much more extensive in content, methodology, resource materials and desired learning outcomes. Second, NDIE sought a relationship with ACU essentially to ensure that the students received formal academic recognition proportionate to the scope and achievements demands of the NDIE programmes and that their awards would have an international acceptance. In 1995, ACU accepted the NDIE-designed one-year programme for pre-service professional teacher education titled ‘International Graduate Certificate in Education’ (IGCE) and licensed it as an ACU course. This award grants an advanced credit standing of one year for any Bachelor-level teaching degree at ACU (NDIE 2009). The NDIE MEd course has been licensed by ACU since 1996 as detailed below.

### 2.6.3 The MEd Programme

The Ministry of Education in Pakistan (MoE 1998) recognised a basic deterrent to the attainment of better quality teachers and schooling: the absence of arrangements for the training of leaders in education. In the public sector and to some extent in the private sector, administrators, supervisors and curriculum planners—whether in schools or universities—assume their positions through seniority or favour. Educational research, most particularly in classrooms and in curriculum development, has been miniscule and incentives and skills to move and change have remained largely undeveloped amongst the educational community. Cognisant of this situation, in the 1994–95 academic year, NDIE established its advanced degree programme, the MEd, with a particular focus on preparing educational leaders capable of bringing about relevant changes in local schooling, its administration and practices.
Persistent requests from a number of BEd graduates indicated a strong desire to further their studies, yet they did not want to do so at the local government colleges of education. Local leaders in education, especially in the Catholic sector, who had experienced the positive effects of NDIE BEd graduates in their schools, encouraged NDIE to further develop leadership skills in education through the teaching of an advanced degree. The vision of the then director of NDIE firmly believed that changes in the teaching-learning processes would happen most effectively from the primary school upwards, and she determined that the provision of a Masters Degree, which placed specific emphasis on leadership and primary education, would make a positive contribution to the educational scene (Schneider 1998).

The MEd at NDIE is a three-and-a-half year programme. The first two years comprise the MEd Preliminary (NDIE 2009), a part-time NDIE course designed to bridge the one-year deficit in the formal Pakistani education system, which excludes graduates with 15 years of formal schooling from enrolment in internationally recognised Masters level courses. Pakistan provides for 12 years of schooling plus two years of university education to gain a Bachelor’s Degree in Arts, Science, Commerce, Computer Science and the like. Those who add a one year BEd degree complete 15 and not the 16 years of formal education required for entrance into a recognised Masters Degree course.

2.6.4 Winds of Change in Teacher Education in Pakistan

A brief look at the history of teacher education in Pakistan shows varied examples of its organisational structure, management and financing. From the latter part of the 1960s to the mid-1970s, changes to the system inherited from India were made, most noticeably in the areas of curriculum and management. For example, Provincial Bureaux of Curriculum was set up, and teacher training institutions offering courses leading to the awards of Primary Teaching Certificate (PTC), Certificate of Teaching (CT) and Oriental Teacher (OT) were upgraded to colleges of elementary education. It was not until the 1990s that the next significant changes to the organisational structure of teacher education occurred and new institutions for pre-service and in-service emerged. The teacher education structure was accepted as diverse since each
province had a distinct organisational and administrative arrangement for its teacher education institutions. What became common was the pre-service curriculum that was followed, as found by the AED study of Teacher Training Institutions (2006), with varied degrees of understanding and expertise across the provinces.

From the 1990s onward, until the next wave of reform of teacher education began to be planned in 2005 (Clarke cited in Hathaway 2005), all provinces provided two paths by which an individual could acquire formal teacher qualifications. The first entailed undertaking one of two certificate courses offered at elementary colleges of education, while the second path led to a BEd awarded by a chartered university. The elementary colleges offered a one-year PTC, qualifying its recipients to teach grades 1 to 5. A Matriculation level pass was required for admission to this course while an Intermediate (year 12) level pass was the requirement for entrance to the one-year CT course, which qualified its graduates for teaching grades 6 to 8. The second pathway was for the secondary school teachers (grades 6 to 10) who were required to undertake a one-year BEd course from a college of education or a university department. A two-year Bachelor’s degree qualification was the requirement for enrolment.

As stated above, the completion of this second pathway equates with 15 rather than the standardised 16 years of formal schooling necessary for the undertaking of studies for an internationally recognised Masters qualification. (See Appendix 2 for a diagrammatic representation of the existing system of teacher education.) In an attempt to address this shortfall and provide graduates with the opportunity for international recognition of their degrees, NDIE chose to provide the Masters Preliminary course to bridge this gap.

2.6.5 NDIE’s Academic Credibility

How NDIE can prepare its students for Masters awards at both KU and ACU is a crucial academic and ethical question that I will briefly address. As an affiliated college, NDIE prepares students for the MEd award of the KU. This is a 10 unit
degree course, comprising eight papers, two pieces of research, a comprehensive viva voce and a viva voce for each of the pieces of research. Forty per cent of the grading for each unit is awarded by internal (that is, NDIE) assessment, while the remaining 60 per cent results from a university (external) written examination. The research and viva voce grades are negotiated through a 50–50 percentile arrangement between the NDIE and KU faculty who examine the students in these areas.

The ACU Award is an eight unit Masters course comprising six campus-based units and two field units. The latter two involve a piece of qualitative research (begun during the second year of the Masters Preliminary course) and the organisation, facilitation and evaluation of a segment of professional development in a relevant educational setting. As a quality assurance measure, NDIE students’ work is forwarded to Australia for peer assessment by ACU faculty members. The course work for ACU covers a much wider spectrum than does the KU syllabus (Faculty of Education 1996). Learning outcomes, reference materials, assessment requirements and processes for both courses are quite different with a higher level of performance by both the lecturers and the students required for the ACU award (NDIE 2009). In December 2010, 88 graduates of the NDIE MEd courses could be found working in various educational fields throughout Pakistan and beyond. Additionally, 37 students were enrolled over the three years of the Masters programme.

2.7 Global Trade in Tertiary Education

Beginning in the last decade of the twenty-first century, a vast growth has occurred in the trade of educational programmes by foreign universities in third world countries. I hold that this practice is a new form of the Western colonialism that robbed areas such as the subcontinent of its spices and its wealth for almost two centuries, beginning from the middle of the eighteenth century CE. Both commodities (spices and academic capabilities) were taken back to the homelands of the colonisers to increase their own wealth (Crush 2003; Findlay & Lovell 2001). This time around, the ‘spices’ being taken from a country such as Pakistan are the literate population,

16 These comprise (1) a thesis using qualitative research methodology and (2) a piece of extended piece of literature review on an educational topic of the student’s choice using the most current literature available.
the young intelligentsia and the wealth of the elite classes. The wealth extracted in financial terms prolongs the life term of the universities of the Western world. The scholarship and research of the Pakistani students contribute to the prowess of these foreign universities, and the workplace incentives offered help complete the ‘brain drain’ from the poorer countries to the richer, developed and largely Western world.

What Pakistan receives from such trading deals with universities from countries such as the US, Canada, Australia and the United Kingdom (UK) are pre-packaged educational curricula and courses with no adaptations for the local milieu. This arrangement is in accord with Pakistan’s Higher Education Commission (HEC)’s condition of registration of foreign university courses: ‘the syllabus and scheme of studies for students at offshore campuses are identical to the course contents of the on campus programmes’ (Foreign Collaboration, Criteria No. 5 2009). Offshore educational trade gives both scholarship winners and full fee-paying students educational and cross-cultural opportunities of varying qualities while it also produces a downside for the development of Pakistan’s educational system. For example, fewer students of high calibre enrol at the local universities, lesser numbers overall attend local universities resulting in smaller funding packages to help these universities to grow and develop as quality institutions, and there is a paucity in quantity and quality of research scholarship and supervision of novice researchers. In another analogy, the poor continue to get poorer.

However, NDIE’s relationship with ACU is different. It does reflect basic elements of transnational education in that international boundaries are crossed in that the learning and teaching activities occur in Pakistan (host country) while the university granting the awards is based in the home country, Australia (GATE 1997). I count as significant the fact that the IGCE and MEd courses were designed in Pakistan to cater for local needs and to present a challenge to the status quo of existing teacher education courses. The curriculum for each of the two courses was presented to ACU where they gained the approval of the Academic Council and Senate as ACU International Graduate Certificate and Masters level courses in 1995 and 1996, respectively, and hence ACU awarded NDIE a license to conduct the courses in Pakistan. ACU continues to receive no financial benefit from this arrangement. It
funds the administration of the courses, it uses its faculty members to provide quality assurance measures for the teaching and assessment processes and it does not employ the faculty of NDIE. In other words, NDIE is supported by ACU as part of its community outreach to the developing world. In this respect, I maintain that the ACU-NDIE relationship was built on a cross-border desire to strengthen the local Pakistani education system and not to contribute to what Bennett (2003) refers to as a two-tiered academic system of tertiary education where the institute that offers foreign degrees sets up a colonial elitist attitude towards local institutions offering similar awards. Khanu (2005) sees the transference of knowledge and skills that are not encultured as a new expression of imperialism that creates a dependency relationship where the host country relies on the home provider of the educational goods and services.

2.8 NDIE...Beyond the Spice Trade

Throughout the course of my research, I argue that the Australian women at NDIE endeavoured to raise a counter voice within this market discourse. Gabrielle Jennings, Mercy Sister and founding Director of NDIE, was emphatic that the venture be grounded in a working partnership of responsibility so that the Pakistanis and the Australians were connected through a sharing of power that also balanced accountability for the outcomes (Drath, Palus & McGuire 2010; Lawrence, Spears & Bennis 2004). The basis of the partnership lay in the relationship between the Catholic Bishops Conference of Pakistan (CBCP) and the Melbourne Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy, and subsequently in the cultural and educational exchanges that shaped and moulded NDIE into a teacher education institute (Beatrice interview 26 April 2000). The ultimate goals of the Australian women have been steadfastly twofold: to put into place a firmly established teacher education institute of excellence, operating in the confident and competent hands of Pakistani people and owned by them in spirit and reality, and equally importantly, to graduate teachers and educators with the skills and commitment to gradually accomplish pedagogical changes in the local schooling processes.
Therefore, in my research, I constructed a narrative about the efforts to bring these ideas and ideals to fruition, told from an Australian perspective and interrogated with insights from the professional lives of Pakistani graduates.

### 2.9 Partnership—Education and Mission

‘Uglolana – to sharpen each other…to walk together constantly, enriching each other in a collaborative search’. (Rahman 2000, p. 8)

The Bantu African term ‘uglolana’ is an apt descriptor for the hearts and minds that guided the founding processes of NDIE. Before any firm ‘yes’ was established between Bishop Lobo as spokesperson for the CBCP and the Melbourne Mercies, three Mercy Sisters\(^{17}\) visited the country in 1989 to ascertain if what they had to offer could help in the Pakistani context. The outcome of this visit was that the sisters would establish a teacher education institute and provide its initial leadership. A teacher education institute of excellence in the confident and competent hands of Pakistani people, an institute owned by the local people, was the ultimate goal (ISMA Archival Records 1989).

My research pursued the theme of partnership in depth to estimate its infiltration into almost every aspect of the desired outcomes particularly for the MEd programme graduates. Partnership here is taken to mean the relationship between and among the individuals and the groups who came together by mutual co-operation and accepted joint responsibility for the ongoing realisation of the NDIE project. It therefore includes such concepts as affiliation, collaboration, co-operation and collegiality (The American Heritage Dictionary 2000). While I made claims as an outsider inside the country, that to work in partnership is countercultural to Pakistan’s systemic structures, as a researcher I needed to find out if, where and how it had been an appropriate approach to improving the education and practice of some of its teachers. In the day-to-day operations of NDIE, the Australians, from their initial leadership of Gabrielle Jennings, have endeavoured to develop a relationship of educational and

---

\(^{17}\) Jan Geason, the then leader of Melbourne Mercy Congregation, Gabrielle Jennings and Bernadette Marks, a member of the Adelaide Mercy Congregation and eventually to become the first deputy director of NDIE.
working colleagues amongst all those involved in ensuring that the institute functions effectively. The Christian belief in the equality of each person before God and the dignity of his/her work contribution,\textsuperscript{18} whether that implies the manual labour of those with no literacy skills or the professional contributions of the well-educated, is the ideological basis on which the following have been established:

- Administrative framework
- Androgogical approaches in its classrooms
- Curriculum design
- Interpersonal relations between staff and students, Christians, Muslims, Hindus, Pakistanis and Australians, and males and females
- Financial framework
- Hidden curriculum

In other words, NDIE was established, and its organisational structure developed, on a framework of partnership, not only at the ownership and governance levels of the PCBC and the Australian Sisters of Mercy but also in the institute’s daily manner of functioning. How effectively partnerships have operated at NDIE was one level of my inquiry. But more importantly, if and how it has been a positive factor influencing the MEd graduates to be effective leaders of relevant educational change was of prime importance to my research. I critiqued these factors of partnership between people of the East and West, Southern and Northern countries in light of feminist postcolonial expositions of the voicelessness of the subalterns (for example, Spivak 1988, 93; Ahmed 1998; Gandhi 1998; Guha 1983; Jayawardena 1994; Chambers & Curti1996), human experiences as the fulcrum of learning for independence (for example, Freire 2004, 1996, 1985; Fals-Borda 1991; Roman 1997) as well as the critical narratives revealed through the stories of teachers and students (for example, Abbott 2008; Clandinin 2007; McNiff 2007; Webster & Mertova 2007; Clandinin 2005; Weiler & Middleton 1999; Polkinghorne 1988; Carspecken 1996; Naheed 1993; Connelly & Clandinin 1990).

During the research, I remained cognisant of the attitudes or values, sense of purpose or mission underpinning the Sisters of Mercy’s involvement in the NDIE project. It

\textsuperscript{18} Gaudiem et spes #26.
was in this domain that my story as educator, researcher and Sister of Mercy entered the research. As in most countries global south countries, humanitarian outreach through NGO-sponsored educational projects are dotted throughout Pakistan, such as the British Council, World Vision, United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), World Bank, US Agency for International Development (USAID) and, as stated above, foreign universities are marketing their courses as part of the globalisation of the education industry. While located within the general scope of these aspects of the educational milieu, I have argued that the Sisters of Mercy’s raison d’être in Pakistan has a uniqueness that is having a bearing on the outcome of the NDIE project.

Martin et al (2008), Beck & Kosnki (2006), along with Nias (1987) purport that innovation in education occurs if modifications to a teacher’s perspectives and sense of identity are both facilitated and sustained by sharing with others who are engaged in the struggle to create something new, talking through issues and ideas and finding common meaning in what they are doing. It is primarily this latter point that I wish to establish as a uniquely motivating force among the Mercies engaged in the NDIE project. These women share in common a mission or attitude towards life, expressed in Constitutional words such as:

```
We long to be women
who live justly
allow compassion to be called forth from
us rejoice in the diversity of our ministry
are enriched by the gift of one another.

…we awaken to a larger story as…Mercy, which has many faces
and knows no boundaries…continues to spring to life in new grounds.
(ISMA 2010, p. 13, 10)
```

Such ideals can remain inanimate words, captured in black and white on a page. On the other hand, I investigated if they have been the propellers that have built up honourable partnerships between ‘outsiders and insiders’ (Rahman 2000)—partnerships of educational colleagues rather than a new form of imposition of Western, Christian colonialism. Both male and female Christian missionaries came to the subcontinent with British colonialism and established schools to educate the
elite classes whose members then comprised the British Indian Civil Service and Military personnel (Kazi 1994). Many of these educational institutions still form the backbone of the better schools in Pakistan, operating on colonial administrative models and serving the elite classes.

Have the Australian Sisters of Mercy continued this tradition or have they in fact created a different modus operandi? Is their way of operating at NDIE built on a ‘dependency of equals’ (Robert 1997) and sustained through interpersonal relations, which recognise that the locale of power is among the Pakistani people and not imported from Australia or assumed through the Church? Where power resides and how it operates was therefore an essential element for investigation in the course of my research, as it bridges the gap between the colonial interpretation of the Christian missionary and a praxis approach. Such an approach finds insiders and outsiders working side by side to improve the conditions of people living in the realities of the ‘third world’, with the responsibility for the improvement resting with the insiders (Roberts 1997). This is what Freire (Freier 2004; Freire & Faundez 1992) referred to as decolonising the shadow of colonialism that remains housed inside both the colonised and those who represent the colonists as they endeavour to work together in present-day situations.

Partnership and its relational manifestations was an important issue in my research because, I argued, the use and operation of collaboration in leadership, the curriculum and the operant hidden curriculum should be reflected in the professional practices of the MEd graduates. Where power or authority reside and how they operate were essential elements in uncovering the partnerships in learning that last (Martin et al 2008) at and beyond NDIE, as experienced in the lives of graduates of the MEd programme.

2.10 A Sisters of Mercy Portrait

The Sisters of Mercy is a religious congregation within the Catholic Church, founded in Ireland in 1831 by Catherine McAuley, a woman who dared to have a fresh look at her own milieu (Sullivan 2004, p. 3) in order to bring some change to it. She realised
that the social problems of the poor could not be solved by individual almsgiving but required organised efforts such as hostels, schools, orphanages, employment agencies and sale-of-work outlets. Above all, she recognised that they needed to be equipped with skills and power to help themselves and from these, a sense of their own dignity and self-worth would emerge. She became a wealthy heiress whose inheritance came from her friends, the Callaghans, who met and grew to admire her work among the poor, on their return to Ireland after many years in India at the extreme end of the eighteenth century. In the late 1820s, McAuley built and established the House of Mercy where she could offer practical help in terms of education, healthcare, shelter and skills training to those in need. This House was situated purposely at Dublin’s Baggot Street in the heart of the fashionable homes of the wealthy so that she might alert their social consciousness to the plight of those who lived with none of the societal privileges. As groups of young women joined her in this work, McAuley found herself in contention with influential segments of the hierarchy of the Catholic Church who ruled on the impropriety of such a community of women ‘…who walked about so freely in the back lanes of the slums, against all the social conventions of the day’ (Bourke 1989, p. 7). Friends within the church hierarchy advised her to form a religious congregation but McAuley had an aversion to certain aspects of convent life, particularly the enclosure rules and the restrictions, which had the potential to impose on the type of work she was doing among Dublin’s poor. Ultimately, opposition to her work from within the clerical section of the Church, some of whom believed that ‘…the unlearned sex could do nothing but mischief in trying to assist the clergy and considered McAuley a “parvenue” to be sneered at’ (Bourke 1989, p. 7) led her to accept the advice of her friends and form a religious congregation of women, the Sisters of Mercy. However, she refused to accept a rule that required any form of enclosure and the Sisters became known as ‘the walking nuns’, the first of their kind amongst the religious congregations of women in the Catholic Church to move freely amongst the people with whom they worked.
2.10.1 Religious Life in Australia: 1950s to 2000s

Being members of the Sisters of Mercy had a direct bearing on how each of the three Australian women who participated in my research came to be involved in the NDIE project in Karachi. We joined the Mercies in successive decades, Beatrice being the first in the 1950s and Julia the last in the 1970s. The 25 years spanning the mid-1960s to the early 1990s marked a period of enormous change in religious life in terms of its theological and conceptual understanding as well as its lived expression. These changes were outcomes of the renewal movement within the Roman Catholic Church as an outcome of the Second Vatican Council 1963–1968.\(^{19}\)

For those in the church eager for change, these were years of tremendous excitement. Religious women and men, not only in Australia but across the world, were significant leaders in this drive for *aggiornamento*.\(^{20}\) External changes saw women simplifying or discarding their habits of dress; theological and scriptural studies became available and embraced as necessities; convents lost their mystique and fortress-like aura and contemporary technologies and forms of communication and operating in day-to-day life were adopted. The Christian theology of religious life no longer saw holiness as achievable only by renouncing the world and withdrawing from its many social aspects to live a secluded life behind convent walls. Rather, the challenge was in being part of the world and endeavouring to make it a place where human dignity is respected and peace, freedom and justice are the social order. Perhaps even more significantly, religious women began to find their own voice in the church and society.

In convents and communities, the *will of God* was interpreted no longer as the sole prerogative of the superior or leader of the community but as resident in each person. This brought about a significant change in the social structure of community life, supported by insights from behavioural and social psychology especially regarding individuation, self-actualisation and holism. During a significant part of these

---

\(^{19}\) Vatican II or the 21\(^{st}\) Ecumenical Council of the Catholic Church met from October 1962 until December 1965 to make the Church’s life and teaching come alive and to bring them up to date (Rahner & Vorgrimler 1983, p. 524).

\(^{20}\) *Aggiornamento* literally means ‘bringing up to date’.
tumultuous years, Beatrice was the provincial leader of the Melbourne Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy, and Julia was in the initial stages of her formation as a Mercy and correspondingly redefining her professional life, its new expectations and responsibilities. For my part, I enjoyed the excitement and challenges that the newness of religious life brought, explored my potentials as a new teacher and was challenged through the opportunity of higher studies in education and theology in Canada.

2.10.2 The Church’s Understanding of the Mission: Post-Vatican II

The sacred scriptures of Christians contain the dictum *Go out to the whole world and preach the Gospel* (Matthew 28:19). From this dictum emerged a long and firm traditional practice, which saw the European church send missionaries all over the world, especially to poor nations, to convert the people from their judged-to-be-godless ways. Not only missionaries, but the traders and the capitalist world acted in like vein. Using the insights of the social sciences, especially anthropology, the Catholic Church’s position changed dramatically after Vatican II. A developmental perspective was adopted and, while missionaries continued to be sent to other countries, they had to be adequately prepared in the understanding of their role, be cognisant of the local culture and able to respect the local religious beliefs and practices. The missionary intent was not to be conversion but a standing with local people in their poverty, sickness, illiteracy and sharing professional skills and abilities to enable the local people and their country to develop into a self-sufficient nation in the emerging global view of the world.

2.10.3 The Formation of ISMA

The Institute of the Sisters of Mercy of Australia (ISMA) is the unified organisational structure of all members of the seventeen independent congregations of the Sisters of Mercy, situated across the states of Australia. It also includes members of the emerging indigenous congregation of Papua New Guinea. ISMA’s

---

21 This was evident in the documents emanating from Vatican II, particularly *Ad gentes* (decree on the Church’s missionary activity), *Gaudium et spes* (the Church in the modern world) and *Dignitatis humanae* (declaration of religious freedom).
president is elected by and from among all its members. While each congregation retains its local autonomy, the institute provides an avenue of collaboration and solidarity amongst all members for particular projects such as refugee services in Australia and overseas, hospitals and healthcare centres and educational institutions in Pakistan, Timor Leste and Balgo in Western Australia.

Australian Sisters of Mercy embraced the revived spirit within the Church in the wake of the 1960s Vatican Council. This was demonstrated as a spirit of urgency and practicality to go beyond the confines of what had been the traditional works. Perhaps we felt confined in Australia even though there was much work to do. But in the face of world misery and need, we realised there was much more to which we could contribute. The popular trend in religious circles was to go to South America but the trigger for the Mercies to look elsewhere came from a Catholic Bishop of Pakistan, Simeon Periera, and an exploratory visit to the country by a Sister of Mercy, Elizabeth Cloonan.\(^{22}\) Her report to ISMA stated simply but firmly that the Christians in Pakistan were desperately unsupported. They needed to know that someone stood beside them and believed in their human dignity so that they did not continue to see themselves as amongst the lowest of the low of the people of the earth, particularly in their own country.

The Australian Mercies became engaged in education and healthcare in Pakistan in 1989 at Gujrat in the Punjab Province and the next year, Peshawar, situated in Kyber Pakhtunkhwa, formerly the North-West Frontier Province. The option for a mission to Pakistan or any other country was not about whom we were going to convert; rather it was about beside whom we were going to stand. It was with similar purpose, or in Julia’s words ‘I had enough knowledge to know that as an educator I could make a contribution’ (Julia Interview 6 June 2001), that Australian Sisters of Mercy undertook the teacher education project in Karachi on behalf of the PCBC. Beatrice held the position of director from the opening of NDIE in October 1991 until March 1998 when Julia became the second director. I joined the NDIE staff in 1995 and succeeded Julia at the beginning of 2001.

\(^{22}\) Sr. Elizabeth Cloonan rsm who was the first female the ‘Vicar for Religious’ in the Archdiocese of Melbourne was commissioned to undertake a ‘look and see’ mission to Pakistan.
While common threads weaving their way through the three Australian women can be readily identified prior to their meeting to weft and warp the NDIE pattern, their stories as told through the incidents that we saw as impacting change in our lives demonstrated for me the uniqueness of each of us and our different angles on the perception of the common reality of Karachi.

2.10.4 Religious Life in Pakistan: 1990s

The changes and adaptations that had occurred in religious life in Australia were evident only in isolated incidents in Pakistan. For Beatrice:

_It was like going back 20 or 30 years in my experiences. I found the religious women subservient to the clergy. In some ways it was like playing out the 1960s again. You have various men’s religious orders disagreeing with the Bishops but that was not so for the women. They were subservient because that’s how it is! Women should be supportive......I got the impression that there was not enough nourishment for the development of freedom.... Yet there were some courageous women particularly who saw another way. So it seemed to me that we Mercies could be there to facilitate, help adjust, work with and among these religious by simply being ourselves rather than doing anything else_ (Interview 26 June 2000).

The Mercies coming to Pakistan also had to make a decision regarding the wearing of a religious habit and veil. Their discerned decision was to wear the dress of the local people as was our custom in Australia. While the wearing of the veil over the head is a pressure even amongst the Christian community, the Mercies decided to do so only on appropriate occasions as guided by the local people. Intentional in these behaviours was the inherent message that there was more than one way to be a religious woman and that did not always involve being locked into imposed cultural expectations.
2.11 From ‘Black Babies’ to Working Partnerships

Today, I easily sit at my computer and virtually experience people and cultures from any place on the globe. Yet my growth in consciousness of other people and their context was not a virtual move. While Australian Aboriginal people and European migrants were always parts of my childhood schoolrooms, my notion of people of different cultures came in the context of Catholic overseas missions. White missionaries left their homelands to go to countries such as Africa, the Pacific Islands, Papua New Guinea to convert the pagan people. As a child in school, I would help this process by giving donations to the missions—each penny could help towards the conversion/baptism and education of a black child. I could even ‘buy’ a black baby and sponsor his/ her education and healthcare.

From these experiences emerged my first notions of colour. People of colour were:

- Different to me
- Not as good or as fortunate as I was
- In need of white people’s help
- Not as good as white people in almost every way
- Were pagan and this was something that was evil and needed to be remedied for their own good
- Were poor and many in number
- Needed help to be shown a better way to live

The 1960–70s movement of Martin Luther King was my first real challenge to the information and attitudes I had assimilated over the years. I realised that these were people who had their own cultures, beliefs, spirituality and social organisation, but they had been shamefully treated by many white masters and mistresses.

In Pakistan I live as a member of a minority people in a country of the south. To be a northern country white, Western, Christian woman in a southern country coloured, Eastern, Islamic country is to experience prejudice from the minority and violence positions. To choose to continue to be in such an environment requires a constant reflexivity that plots the journey between helping the black babies and being in
partnership with local people in an educational endeavour. I have found the dynamics of the partnership as akin to a hanging mobile of many parts, which need to be strategically positioned for the structure to achieve the delicate balance. How such a balance has been and is being achieved was part of the investigative mission of my research. I hold that NDIE’s most highly educated graduates, the MEds, demonstrate how and what they have learned and experienced, if and when their learning has been diffused in the local context and if, as result, a difference is being made in Pakistan’s educational systems.

2.12 Design of the Research

Using a case study methodological approach (Creswell 2009; Flyvberg 2006; Stake 2006; Yin 2003, 2009), I developed interpretative descriptions of how a specific educational endeavour brought about changes in teaching and learning processes. I pursued the investigations using a narrative approach where I generated the core narrative from accounts of the hopes and goals, achievements and struggles of Australian women who, at the invitation of Pakistani people, have established and directed NDIE, guided and taught the students during different time spans throughout the first 20 years of the institute’s existence (Clandinin 2007; Elbaz-Luwisch 2007; McNiff 2007; Webster & Mertova 2007; Freidus 2002). In strengthening its credibility, I used a second set of stories to critically interrogate the core narrative. This comprised three minor case studies of MEd graduates as they critically examine the manner in which they operate as professional educators in correlation with their educational experiences at the MEd level at NDIE.

2.13 Questions Guiding the Research

The following questions have been a guided reference for action and reflexive practice while investigating the issues of this research:

- Has the NDIE MEd course effected changes in the theoretical understanding and educational practice of the MEd graduates? If so, have the Australian women contributed to this?
• Can the MEd graduates name and claim their own educational strategies as appropriate and relevant to their particular situations?
• What type of educational leadership is demonstrated by the Australian women and the MEd graduates?
• Do the graduates use their voices in educational forums in Pakistan?
• What type of voice do they give to present and future processes of education in Pakistan?
• Who listens to what they voice?
• Can practices of partnership be evident in the questions nominated above be used as probes into the underpinning query of my investigation, namely, the capacity of the MEd programme to contribute to bringing about appropriate change in education, particularly in the schools in Pakistan?

It is the story of the Pakistani context and the emergence of NDIE with its characters and dreams that I now enunciate.

2.14 Outline of the Thesis

I have presented my thesis in eight chapters. Chapter 1 presents the seed bed and focus for the research, while Chapter 2 states the research question and gives a succinct overview of the problem and the context in which it arose. A comprehensive account of the contextual realities as I perceived them and their impact on the research question is examined in the third chapter. Methodological issues and the details of the research process, including the limitations of the study, are presented in Chapter 4. Chapter 5 recounts the Australian women’s narrative, which is woven around themes I have identified through my critical analysis of their stories. The themes are the underpinnings of what I alleged to be their contribution to teacher education in Pakistan through their involvement at NDIE. In Chapter 6, local voices emerged as I constructed the narrative of the MEd graduates from the data gathered in the minor case studies, including the graduates’ own stories.

The narratives of the Australian women and those of the MEd graduates interrogated each other in Chapter 7, and the similarities and differences between the two
perspectives introduced around eight indicators of meaning making. Chapter 8 presents a succinct update of the contextual realities facing education in Pakistan in general and NDIE in particular, indicates areas for further development of NDIE and outlines valuable insights for teacher educators in Pakistan.
Chapter 3: Context of the Study

In this chapter, I detail the context in which the research was situated. My journal captures something of my experiences of the reality of my 16 years in Karachi. Through providing descriptive frames of geographical location, the historical emergence of the nation, its people, its ideology and its educational situation, I have established the broad frame into which fits the story of NDIE and my own part in its educational endeavours.

3.1 Introduction

No narrative, fictional or real can be told without a setting and a context in which the characters whether animate or inanimate weave together the thread to form the narrative. Williams and Chrisman (1994, p. 4) contend that texts hold a dialectical relationship with the constituents of both their social and historical contexts. A powerful example of this is found in Forster’s (1978) work, *A Passage to India*. ‘Not yet, not yet!’—a part of the textual composition assigned to the Indian Dr. M. Aziz and directed to the Englishman Mr. Fielding—is Aziz’s desperate plea that they not publicly acknowledge each other as friends. The appeal suggests many interpretations to the reader until the historical-political context of British colonialism and its social structures are placed in dialogue with the characters. If such does not occur, the inference that only in an India free of colonial rule can such social barriers have a hope of being broken, remains buried and unheard in the text.

Similarly, I argue that the text of this narrative study can hold no poignancy for the reader unless the very fact of the emergence and implementation of the NDIE teacher education programmes are established within both the wider and particular contexts of how and with what intent education has happened in Pakistan—a Pakistan that I have captured in a time frame spanning 60 years of postcolonial struggle to build a stable and secure nation.
3.2 Pakistan—A Storied Glimpse

While I made a geographer’s response to Bern’s inquiry as to my first impressions of Pakistan and Karachi, it’s what’s going on inside me that’s a stronger response…. I have never even imagined such a sea of faces—and all male—as when I walked out of those airport doors today. Pushing, yelling, grabbing at me and at each other…. Noise, noise and more noise is what I am overwhelmed by. I’m not sure if I can survive in this. It’s now 2am and the rickshaws, trucks, donkeys, dogs and men mixing the cement blocks are still going round and round this building. Will the noise and movement ever stop! (Margaret’s journal, 28 Dec. 1991)

As expressed above, my initial drive from the airport into Karachi city swamped me with the possibility that I might not survive long in the environment. The noise, the heat, the dust, the contents and stench of drains were just too much. One week later, along with somewhat neutralised olfactory senses, I hardly noticed the noise in general but just particular instances of it. So 16 years on, densely packed bazaars and markets, chaotic traffic, bomb explosions, gunfire, unchallenged overflowing sewers, the luxury experienced when electricity flows, coping with a foul and diseased water supply have come to be part and parcel of my everyday life in Karachi. They are partial but concrete descriptors of its physical and emotional context. They are not objective data. These lived experiences have shaped and threatened my personal and professional life in ways that find a resonance with aspects of Freire’s (1989) treatise on Learning to Question. His experience-based critique is that in oppressed, third world poverty situations, academic training can provide a safe haven in the realm of concepts, descriptions of reality, rather than a challenge to apprehend the concreteness of the reality. In agreeing with this position, I found that such intellectual escapism was an understandable pattern for both nationals and foreigners to adopt when trying to cope with the political, economic, cultural and religious exigencies that shape the everyday social experiences. The deeper challenge was: how does one make sense of them?

I thought the three of us (Australian Mercies) would die this morning. ..... Six police, five Kalashnikovs pouring into our little Suzuki van, no hope of help from others...and all for a few rupees! ... To what end? Is education worth my life? (Margaret’s journal, 4 Apr. 1998)
... living in constant civil war has changed each of us ... the Dawn\textsuperscript{23} says—Karachites have just adapted their lives to accommodate the violence. Bern and I were teaching during this afternoon’s outburst of gunfire ... we crouched below window level in my classroom ... 25 minutes later I, checked that we were all OK and then went on with the lesson. And we do it so automatically!!! If this happened in Brisbane, we would be all cordoned of...and receive counselling—probably even a few days off work. Talk to me about the teaching-learning environment. I’ve surreptitiously learned to live with terrorism and that’s pretty scary.... My being caught in the fissure dares me to find meaning and ‘translate the theory into practice.’ (Margaret’s journal, 6 Oct. 1997)

I loved every minute of today! All the MEds have passed their Karachi university exams—our first batch. ... Another milestone in NDIE’s journey to whatever is its future. (Margaret’s journal, 4 Dec. 1997)

The academic concepts of teacher education, whether Islamic or Western, can become both drained and energised in the living realities I have portrayed. However, I believe and am supported in this position by both Freire (1989, 2004) and Gramsci (1976 cited in Freire 1989), that the reality of a contextualised situation must challenge the concept or interpretation of meaning that is placed upon it. Reciprocally, the conceptual framework (in this case, teacher education) has the right to challenge the reality of the context (namely, political turmoil or existing classroom practices in Pakistani schools) and to mediate an understanding of why this is so and what life could be. Only when these two processes are occurring ‘in solidarity’ (Freire 1989) will the ‘right’ action be able to be taken and effective change result. A critical consciousness of the nature, character and effectiveness of the teacher education efforts at NDIE persisted as an overt and surreptitious stream of consciousness throughout my study.

There was a broader context of the nation of Pakistan within which the lived experiences recalled above in my journal extracts had to be located. The story of Pakistan becoming a nation provided a basic condition for my study. Yet more potently, the story described the structure in which the idealistic desire for a good education system and the actions taken to achieve such during the 63 years of building a nation-state were dialectically framed. A rereading of my journal extracts

\textsuperscript{23} The Dawn newspaper is one of the two major English medium newspapers published daily in Pakistan. My journal entry had cited neither its author nor date.
quoted above provided me a further entrance into an understanding of Pakistan’s endeavours to form itself as a people. It surprised me how violence emerged in the framed images through which I captured and made sense of the realities of Karachi, an assessment that Goodson (2009) affirmed in his descriptor of Pakistan as the most dangerous place in the world. While these estimations may say something about the extent of my capacities to live in and through such types of experiences and conditions, such was not the basic issue I alluded to here. The works of Goldberg (2003) offered me a crucial contextual insight into why so much violence has continued to thrive. He purported that people who perceive themselves at a loss cry out their frustrations and use violence to demand what they understand to be their basic rights. Weiner and Freedheim’s (2003) research indicated similarly that injustice leads people to a belief that they have a legitimate reason to be aggressive against others and their sense of being vulnerable leads to actions of violence in order to stave off the innate fear they have of being destroyed. In briefly examining Pakistan’s 60 plus years of nation-building, I have indicated some of the reasons for the violence bred through deprivation and, in so doing, exposed a reason why it continues to thrive into the second decade of the twenty-first century.

Pakistan is both a typical and unique South Asian country. Typical in that it is a land of natural geographical contrasts, where the human population is dense, the government is unstable, public debt has exploded, intra and international disputes are daily realities and poverty and illiteracy are the lot of the majority of the people. Like some other South Asian countries, Pakistan emerged as a nation-state in the post-World War II era.

3.2.1 A Nation in the Making

Unlike its close neighbours, India and Sri Lanka, when Pakistan was declared an independent country on 14 August 1947, its emergence was as one of the ‘nations without history’. Kazi (1994, p. 2) explains that ‘nations with history’ have evolved historically as culturally homogeneous or relatively homogeneous whereas ‘nations without history’ are entities created as nations from groups within or groups of ‘nations with history’. The group of Muslims within India were almost catapulted
into nationhood with only their religious beliefs to bind them together. This meant the new state was faced with the double task of nation-building and state-building (Cohen 2004). In real terms, Pakistan experienced major problems in its overall development, strikingly evident in its underdeveloped socioeconomic and political infrastructures, variety of ethnic groupings, religious minorities and rural-urban differences (Malik 2008). I contend that a brief examination of such ingredients can provide an essential insight into the contextual realities shaping the vision, policies and processes of Pakistan’s educational endeavours.

3.2.2 Descriptors of the Nation

Since its creation, Pakistan has worn the imperial capitalist labels of underdeveloped, developing, third world, country of the south, postcolonial and, more lately, terrorist state, as descriptors of its nationhood (Cohen 2004). Still photographs and moving picture frames, sound, symbols, words in voice or print have transcribed illiteracy, poverty, overpopulation, child labour, massive national debt, lack of industry and technology, nuclear capability, unsound political and social infrastructures, foreign aid grants and unrepayable International Monetary Fund loans as the hallmarks of third worldliness (Malik 2008). The mass media has been instrumental in the processes of interpretation and dissemination into the global human psyche, with their rudimentary understandings of the multi-dimensional nature of the descriptors. What Pakistan demonstrates is that moving beyond these realities is a long and difficult process.

The hopes were high for Pakistan as it emerged as a new nation in 1947. The dreams for what this new nation could achieve were declared in the famous (and now contentious) words of Muhammad Ali Jinnah before the first Legislative Assembly: ‘Pakistan should be a secular state where all the ethnic and religious groups live with full respect for each other’s beliefs and values’ (Jinnah cited in Ali 1970, p. 37). Pakistan was to be a nation where the Muslim people could live united in their Islamic belief but as separate ethnic provinces, free from the religious oppression they had experienced from Hindu-dominated India both prior to and during British colonial rule (Ahsan 1997). In fact, this new state as intoned by the Quaid was to be a
safe and free home for all members of minority ethnic and religious groups who would be equally Pakistani alongside the Muslim majority (Ahmed 1997). The words of nationalist ideology cannot create and sustain nationhood, a fact demonstrated most forcibly in any reading of current world news,²⁴ but putting into place effective political, social and economic infrastructures can. Even briefly captured frames of the 60-year story of Pakistan evidence the ebb and flow between national integration and disintegration and the inescapable effect this turmoil has had on the formation and role of the educational process.

3.2.3 A Locational Frame

Situated in Southern Asia, Pakistan’s border to the south is provided by the Arabian Sea. It is positioned between Iran and Afghanistan on the West, the People’s Republic of China in the North with India and the disputed territory of Kashmir forming its eastern border. With the exception of China, these are indeed troubled borders for Pakistan and an extended glimpse of the territory to include Bangladesh and Sri Lanka captures a subcontinent that is wracked with civil wars and international suspicions and disharmonies. A strategic strength for Pakistan is its control of the Khyber Pass and the Bolan Pass—the traditional invasion routes between Central Asia and the Indian Subcontinent.

At approximately 804,000 square kilometres in area, Pakistan is capped by some of the world’s highest mountain ranges and peaks in the north, fed by its flat Indus plain in the east, and burned in the west and south east by Balouchistan’s desert plateau and the Thar desert. Extensive natural gas reserves and some minerals provide natural sources of income and although it has a well-established textile industry, the country is essentially agricultural. Its main crops are wheat, tobacco, sugarcane, rice and cotton, the latter two being its leading exports on the world market. The limited availability of natural fresh water resources is exacerbated by both ownership disputes with its neighbour India and the pollution of the water supply through sewage, industrial and agricultural runoff leaving the majority of the population

²⁴ The Balkin States, Russian Provinces, Fiji, African Nations and Sri Lanka are examples of independent nation-states formed in the post-WWII era that have not achieved the goals of integration and cohesion fundamental to the achievement of nationhood.
without access to potable water. This, along with the limited availability of an electricity supply, ensures a constant hardship in living and working conditions during the steamy summers and blistering winters.

3.3 Pakistan’s People—A Captured Frame

Stenhouse, forty years ago, determined a process by which a person picks up, comes to know, understands and perhaps lives out what comprises one particular human tradition as distinct from another. As Stenhouse (1967, p. 4) elaborates the process, individuals learn as they listen to the gossip of the people, come to know the stories told around evening fires, stand on the fringe of the dances or religious rituals and assimilate tradition through knowledge of the language. In other words, knowing came through assimilation. My lived experiences reflect this position and have been challenged further by the educational imperative to understand the people with whom I have worked as an educator, to hear their stories as a researcher and not to be satisfied to know them in the manner of an observing tourist.

Statistics can offer one glimpse of the Pakistanis in their own country though these, too, are of questionable status, as reliable national and provincial databases are only beginning to be established. A uniform process for the gathering of such information does not exist. Drawing on the Social Policy and Development Centre (SPDC) statistics (2003), Pakistan’s population in 2003 was estimated as exceeding 142 million. In November 2010, as a result of an annual growth rate of over two per cent, the CIA World Factbook (2010) and the United Nations (2008) estimate Pakistan’s population to be approximately 185 million. The population continues to grow at almost two per cent annually (UNESCO 2007) and, with 38 per cent of the current population less than 14 years of age, the implications for achieving literacy and even some basic education for all are bordering on overwhelming (British Council 2009).

Ghafoor (1987) described the Pakistani people as a melting pot of diverse races and cultures who came into the subcontinent in successive waves of migration through the northwest passes and joined those who were endemic to the subcontinent. Aryans, Greeks, Turks, Persians, Afghans and Moguls settled the north and central
areas while the Arabs conquered the Sindh. As an aftermath of the division of the subcontinent in 1947, Pakistan comprises five distinct ethnic groups: Punjabi, Sindhi, Pashtun (Pathan), Baloch and Muhajir (immigrants from India and their descendents). Each of these groups has their distinctive cultural expressions, languages and lifestyles.

Although Urdu is the official language, in reality only eight per cent of the population comprise Urdu speakers while over 48 per cent speaks Punjabi as their first language. Likewise, approximately eight per cent of the population speaks English, which is the official lingua franca of the government ministries, the universities and also of the well-educated and elite classes (British Council 2009). In the NDIE environment, English is often the fourth or fifth language that students either speak or write.

More than 97 per cent of the population is Muslim with the Amadis, Hindu, Christians and other religious groups comprising the remaining three per cent (Government of Pakistan 2010). As an Islamic Republic, the tenets of Islam guide not only the religious practices but also the political, social, educational and, to some extent, the economic domains of life. It is Islam, too, which pastes over the labels that give identities of otherness to some Pakistani citizens (Bannerji cited in Roman & Eyre 1997). Such outsiders are faithed as non-Muslim or infidel, caste at the lowest level, sexed as women. For example, non-Muslim members of the civil service and defence forces are not eligible for high-ranking offices. The street sweepers and sewage drain cleaners, the lowest ranking jobs, are either Hindu or Christian.

From living within the old and crumbling section of Karachi city and working largely with people of the lower economic classes, I find it difficult to portray a picture of the upper one per cent of the population who have access to 20 per cent of the national income and are included in the overall 10 per cent who have assumed the

---

25 For example, since the 1970s and Z. A. Bhutto’s government, the official weekly holiday in Pakistan was the Muslim holy day, Friday. When Nawaz Sharif, the industrialist, gained power for the second time in 1997, he unilaterally declared Sunday as the official holiday to fit in with the majority of the countries of the capitalist world.
right to use 26.5 per cent of the national revenue. These people live amidst great opulence, pay little or no taxes and safeguard their wealth in institutions outside of Pakistan while 60 per cent of the nation lives on less than $2 a day and have access to no more than 3.9 per cent of the nation’s income (United Nations Development Programme [UNDP] 2009). The upper end of the emergent middle class enjoys some privileges near to those of the wealthy. It is the lower middle class that struggles to maintain their lifestyle as it is largely from this section of society that the taxes are drawn and the poor eek out or beg a means of survival.

However, not to portray the colourful nature of the Pakistani people would be to do them a disservice. The vividness of the women’s clothing; the endless range of spices in the markets; the painted and highly decorated animals, buses, rickshaws, cars; the shamianas for weddings and celebrations all contribute a brightness to the environment that stands out in contrast to the struggle of the people. No matter what the economic circumstances, religious feasts, national days and major events in life are celebrated with much colour, great noise and endless hospitality.

3.4 Pakistan—An Ideological Frame

Instead of an un-Godly government, the Muslims could live their lives under the government of God.... The word Pakistan is commonly translated to mean God is one and alone. (Kaza 1994, p. 12)

Through reconstructing the Pakistani identity:

We will free ourselves from our present day hang-ups about the so-called Pakistan ideology and its confusing appeal to religion, which only has the effect of promoting vicious sectarian conflict. (Alvai cited in Mubarak Ali 2000, p. 4)

With the presentation of such dichotomous contentions, as a casual observer I have asked, ‘Why is this so?’ As a foreign resident in Pakistan I have asked, ‘How can this help explain my lived experiences?’ As an educator my question has been, ‘With these confusing messages, what role is education being asked to play?’ As a researcher I have posed the question, ‘How does this provide an insight into my
research question? In other words, I have argued that some uncovering of the ideological story of Pakistan was crucial to my research undertaking, because an ideological framework was what a particular group of people used for justifying their attitudes, goals and ways of life (George & Theodorson 1979, p. 195). Even a cursory glance at the quotations of Kaza and Alvai cited above suggest that some capturing of its ideological journey was able to provide a telling insight into Pakistan’s contextual realities prior to and during my research.

Since becoming a nation-state in 1947, Pakistan has been confronted with the enormous task of formulating its national identity, separate from India. Though sharing with India the ancient civilization of the subcontinent, Pakistan has resisted acknowledging these roots by excluding pre-Muslim history. For example, Pakistan has limited its own historical beginnings to the Arab conquest of Sindh in 713 CE and the Mughal history of India, and failed to admit the histories of its individual ethnic nationalities as integral to its collective history (Cavendish 2006; Philips 1963). While naming its global position within the Islamic political domain, Pakistan has otherwise struggled to express its own identity in observable and tangible ways, not only to itself, but to the rest of the world.

The effort of India in the 1940s to regain its independence from Britain was begun by the Hindus and Muslims together. As the anti-colonial movement progressed, the Muslim leaders, with the impetus from Central India, perceived the threat to their gaining political, social, economic and religious equality in a Hindu-dominated independent India. Therefore, when independence was gained in 1947, it was on the basis of the ‘two-nation theory’, which holds that Hindus and Muslims are two nations and therefore India needed to be partitioned (Kazi 1994, p. 41). As a result, the ideology of Pakistan in its early years was perceived in national rather than religious terms because it was the maintenance of a physically (East and West Pakistan) and ethnically divided nation, and not Islam, that was threatened (Cohen 2004). Jinnah, as founding father, was clearly seeing this danger when providing the ideological blueprint for the future nation, which stated that Pakistan should be a free nation for Muslim people but a secular state. Such an arrangement would safeguard
all the ethnic and minority groups, which comprised its basic elements. As Sayeed records:

Muslim League leaders almost invariably presented the concept of Pakistan as an Islamic state to the Muslim masses, whereas the dominant group among these leaders planned and expected that it would be a Muslim state, the politics of which would be liberal and modern though influenced by certain Islamic principles. The Muslim League leaders did not discuss the issues as to what would happen if there were a conflict between the principles or dictates of the Shariat (Islamic Law) and the requirements of a modern state. (1980, pp. 2–3)

With such confusion of ideological positions among its leaders, even between Jinnah and his Prime Minister, Liaquat Ali Khan, it was inevitable that when the latter came to full power on Jinnah’s death, the concept of Pakistan would be transformed from a Muslim to an Islamic state. This move culminated in the declaration of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan in 1956, thus ceasing to be a dominion of Britain. Subsequently, the tragedy of the civil war in East Pakistan and its severance from Pakistan to form Bangladesh in 1970 struck a heavy blow to the ideology of Pakistan. The ideal of Islam alone was incapable of sustaining a national unity amidst such ethnic diversity. Academics blamed the refugee Muhajirs, holders of the economic and political power since the late 1940s for ‘…conspiring since long to strike at the very roots of our nationhood’ (Mubarak Ali 2000, p. 2).

What I contend, and find support in this position through such local writers as Malik (2008), Mubarak Ali (2000), Kazi (1994), Sayeed (1980) and Yusuf (1980), is that throughout its 60 plus years, Pakistan’s national leaders have exploited religion to force their will on the people rather than enabling it to find its essence or vitality among the people of Pakistan. Liaquat Ali Khan used Islam to strengthen centralisation and curb provincialism. Zia-ul-Haq, during his military dictatorship, coined the phrase ‘geographical and ideological boundaries’ (Mubarak Ali 2000, p. 3). In doing this, Haq made his government responsible for the defence of the nation against both internal and external enemies. Liberal-minded and non-Muslim people could be declared in violation of Islamic ideology and thus enemies of the nation. In 1997, Nawaz Sharif’s government mandated the death penalty to the Blasphemy Law and the enforcement of the Shariat as the ultimate ‘civil’ law for all citizens (Baig
2001). Efforts and petitions of minority groups to successive governments have resulted in no repeals of these mandates (Shakir 2003).

Like any ideological state, Pakistan indoctrinates through the media and education. The Higher Education Commission, for example, has made Islamiyat and Pakistan Studies compulsory subjects at all levels of education from entry into primary school to graduation at university. Such a move allows successive governments to teach their own version of history and ideology. A current school textbook makes the following claims:

The struggle was for the establishment of a new Islamic state for the attainment of independence. It was the outcome of the sincere desire of the Muslims of the subcontinent who wanted Islam to be accepted as the ideal pattern for an individual’s life, and also as the law to bind the Muslims into a single community. (cited in Mubarak Ali 2000, p. 3)

As an outsider working inside Pakistan education, I have found that the indoctrination of such an identity leaves Pakistan on the horns of a dilemma—to reject the Islamic ideology is to take away Pakistan’s reason for separation from India. To accept it is to alienate, with a definite purpose, the non-Muslim minority citizens of Pakistan. Some scholars suggest that Pakistan should reconstruct its identity on the basis of territorial, rather than religious, nationalism. Perhaps this is a way of addressing Alavi’s view of Pakistan’s state of ‘vicious sectarian conflict’ (Mubarak Ali 2000).

3.5 A Political-Historical Frame

In 1978, Shar wrote of the 30 ‘wasted years’ of Pakistan’s nationhood, which had begun with the noblest sentiments and human urges but slipped soon after its birth. I found that his words, though anticipatory, illustrated the reason for the vicious sectarian conflicts that Mubarak Ali (2000) used for describing Pakistan’s state at the beginning of the twenty-first century. Shar (1978, p. 6) interpreted that in the initial years:
Power went to those who had still not developed an affinity to its soil and its people and were in utter seriousness and hurry to establish their sociopolitical and economic hegemony...all the scoundrels conglomerated to rule and regulate Pakistan and its society at their will and with impunity.

While I have made no claim of judgement on the scoundrel nature of those who have governed the country, I contend that some descriptive observations of the political leadership since 1947 support Shar’s (1978) position that the foundations for government were hastily laid. As a result, the practice of political leadership and direction for the country has remained as confused as its ideological position. By any standards, this indicates a recipe for disaster in terms of the development of a new nation. Particularly pertinent to my research was the political role that education was assigned by each successive government. As Kazi (1994) claimed, every government produced its own educational policy, and each of these policies had an established goal of national integration. I came to believe over my 16 years of residency in the country, that Pakistan’s history of political happenings is an essential element in the process of grasping why a state of national unity remains so illusive and why the expectation of affecting such unity has been placed at education’s doors by successive governments.

At its inception in 1947, Pakistan was a multi-ethnic nation-state residuary consisting of five major ethnic nationalities, Baluchi, Pathan, Punjabi, Siraiki and Sihdhi, along with almost 50 other ethno-lingual native groups. After partition, about four million Urdu-speaking Muslim refugees (Muhajirs) made their way to Pakistan and were settled mainly in Sindh. While Punjab, Sindh and East Bengal officially acquiesced to the formation of Pakistan, the Baluchi and Pathan leaders hesitated as they saw the dangers of a lack of agreed-upon foundations on which to build a political framework (Malik 2008).

Pakistan’s unity was further challenged not only by the reality and symbolism of the geographical separation of East and West Pakistan by Northern India and Kashmir/Jammu but also by the Muhajirs. The first Prime Minister, Liaquat Ali Khan, favoured these, his own people, and appointed them to the high-level positions in the new government services because of their educational standards and commercial acumen. As well, Khan declared Urdu (their language) as the lingua
franca of Pakistan (Sayeed 1980). The Muhajirs refused to assimilate with the indigenous cultures upon who they looked down. Scholars and ‘ordinary’ citizens of Pakistan name the greatest tragedy for Pakistan’s formative years as the shortness of the leadership period of Quaid-e-Azam, Muhammad Ali Jinnah. His death in 1948 still carries an air of suspected murderous inference (Ahmed 1997). Post Jinnah, Liaquat Ali Khan assumed political leadership for four years but failed to establish the crucial beginnings of a socio-political system that allowed for the mediation of ethnic tensions, patterns of participation in the firming of the nation by all ethnic nationalities and equality of distribution of resources (Dani 2008). Weiner (1972) has provided a helpful explanation of the necessary processes of political development. He noted that it is first concerned with:

The expanding functions of a political system, secondly with the new level of integration required to carry out these functions, and finally with the capacity of the political system to cope with these new functions of integration. (Weiner 1972, p. 72)

Coleman (cited in Kazi 1994) adds the edge that for positive political development, the distribution of resources must be such that they respond adequately to demands generated by the imperative of equality. That such principles were not adequately acted upon in its formative years has led to the political tragedy that Pakistan still lives out.

The last decade of the twentieth century witnessed Benazir Bhutto, the first woman Prime Minister, win general elections twice and have her government dismissed twice by two different presidents. Alternating with her governments were those of Nawaz Sharif and likewise his governments have been dismissed once by the president and then by the peaceful 1999 military coup of General Pervez Musharraf. All four civilian governments were dismissed for:

Corruption, nepotism and violation of rules in the administration of the government…so that the orderly functioning of the government has become impossible. (Ali 2007, p. 12)

Benazir Bhutto chose to live in exile from Pakistan for eight years, as jail sentences for corruption awaited her return to the country. Nawaz Sharif opted for exile in the
safe haven of Saudi Arabia rather than imprisonment for attempted murder and corruption in Pakistan for which he was to serve out two life sentences plus a 14-year sentence for his corrupt leadership and assassination attempts on the life of Pervez Musharraf. The latter’s period of military dictatorship continued through to the general elections scheduled for 2007 but eventually held in March 2008. From March 2007 until the general elections, which restored a democratically elected government 12 months later, the country and Musharraf’s presidency catapulted from crisis to crisis through a series of events, some orchestrated by him while others were beyond his control. These events as outlined by Ali (2008, 2007) included the following:

The sacking of the Chief Justice of Pakistan in March 2007 and Karachi’s subsequent eruption into open gun battles on the streets with the carnage leaving more than 50 people dead.

The standoff between the government and the clerics of the Lal Masjid in Islamabad lead to full-scale violence in July 2007.

An attempt on Benazir Bhutto’s life in Karachi (October 2007) and her eventual assassination in Rawalpindi (December 2007).

A judicially declared unconstitutional State of Emergency and taking of absolute power by the President (December 2007).

The return of Nawaz Sharif and the formation of an alliance for the restoration of democracy between The Muslim League—N, and the overwhelmingly victorious Pakistan Peoples’ Party of Benazir Bhutto after the March 2008 general election.

The resignation of Musharraf from presidency on 18 August 2008, rather than face threatened impeachment by the democratically elected government.

As Ali (1997, p. 11) claims, Pakistan continues to pay the price for the years of authoritarian rule that have:

Atrophied democratic institutions and opened up opportunities for a succession of short-sighted, self-aggrandizing and unscrupulous leaders and their coteries.

This broad brushstroke of Pakistan’s political context is where the MEd graduates of NDIE both ply their professional skills and effect changes. On the other hand, it is
one of the guiding threads (Freire & Faundez 1989) that help to explore and provide an answer to a question fundamental to my research: Why is Pakistan’s education system continuously afflicted by such a weak infrastructure?

3.6 A Colonial-Postcolonial Frame

Pakistan has a known history of 5000 years from the Indus Valley Civilisation (3000–1500 BCE) until the present. The Aryans, Alexander the Great, Saka-Parthians, Kushans and White Huns were among the rulers of the area throughout those years. An historical timeline reveals that the geographical area now known as Pakistan was part of India for only 711 years, out of which more than 500 years embraced the Muslim period, a 100 years the Mauryan (mostly Buddhist) era and a further 100 years saw British (Christian) dominance (Dani 2008, 1992). British rule began in the province of Sindh in 1842 and extended itself to the whole of the subcontinent by 1848 and for the first time the landmass and its people were under a foreign ruler, the colonial period. For the purposes of my research, I referred to the historical period of Pakistan’s nationhood, 1947 to the present, as ‘postcolonial’ (Rahim 1992). In so doing I am well-aware of the lack of consensus and often semantic quibblings that continue to occur regarding the definitions of ‘postcolonialism’ (Bhabhi 1994; Gandhi 1998; Prakash 1995; Said 1989; Spivak 1985). I used the term to signify two circumstances: first, as the historical marker of the end of British rule in the subcontinent and the partition of India and Pakistan, and second, to acknowledge that with the ending of colonial occupation, many aspects of political, civic, social and cultural life continued in an almost unchanged pattern as the new nation of Pakistan tried to establish its own postcolonial identity and systems. Aspects of British colonialism remain evident in the society of the twenty-first century in the attempts to establish a democratic government, the civil service and education systems, the exclusive clubs for the elite, the format of formal writing that reflects the Victorian era and the persistence of the upper and servant classes.

The theory of postcolonialism (Gandhi 1998) and its attempt to engage with a particular historical and social condition enabled me to conceptualise and interrogate the complex condition that persistently exists between Pakistanis and Westerners
linked in a particular educational endeavour, which strives to be a learning-teaching partnership that gives no credence to the superiority of white Westerners.

3.6.1 New Expressions of Colonialism

Marker (2003) observed that independence did not automatically bring prosperity and happiness to many of the former colonies of Europe. Rather the new states were caught into recreating the political structures that they knew as learned from the colonisers. Sociologically, some countries such as Pakistan retained the upper and lower classes and the resultant restrictions on status, education and employment. Hence, the illiterate, poorly educated, unskilled and semiskilled workers as well as the educated, high achievers, technically skilled and the wealthy are left vulnerable to a new form of colonialism. This involves the import and export of people, their abilities, their skills, their ambitions, their desperation for work and a better livelihood than that available to them in Pakistan.

The Muslim countries of Asia and the Emirates in particular benefit from semi- and unskilled Pakistani workers while Europe and the US gain an advantage from the import of the well-educated and elite citizens of Pakistan. Arif’s (n.d.) graphic representations of this export of human resources from Pakistan indicates that the country is being drained at both ends of its working and professional population. The corollary to this situation is that the countries of Saudi Arabia, UAE, Europe and the US continue to develop at fast and successful rates, whereas Pakistan continues to flounder in its development as a nation that is politically, economically and sociologically sound. Pakistan is continuing to be easily robbed of its ‘spices’. I argue that NDIE’s efforts work counter to this culture of drainage by demonstrating that good-quality education can be offered within Pakistan and that local people, and not only foreigners, can be the facilitators and leaders in such educational development.
3.7 An Educational Frame

3.7.1 The Formal Words for Education

If the educational system of a country is sound and meaningful, it will lead to the growth of a healthy and stable society. If it is weak and irrelevant it will strengthen the break-up process and add to the misery of the people.

Pakistan inherited a workable educational edifice at the time of independence in 1947…it was nevertheless a system bequeathed to us by foreign rulers. In changed circumstances, it was inadequate to meet the requirements of an independent state. It needed reappraisal and improvements…. Unfortunately, we could not devote much time to this important task. (Planning Commission 1999, p. 9)

The National Education Policy (1998) acknowledged that since partition, the system of education has advanced ‘timidly’. Even though successive governments have had ambitious plans and proposals, none have come to fruition. The 2009 National Education Policy concedes that some advances have been made in the development of education over the past decades but:

Education in Pakistan suffers from two key deficiencies: at all levels of education, access to educational opportunities remains low and the quality of education is weak, not only in relation to Pakistan’s goals themselves but also in international comparisons with the reference countries. (p. 13)

Jinnah established the priority role that education needed to play in the formation of the nation, convening the first education conference in 1947. Stern (2001) reiterated this stance, arguing from two perspectives on the centrality of education in any plan to achieve national development. First, he pinpointed the quantity and quality of education as vital influences on the economy, the workforce, the governance and the working of most institutions. Stern identified access to basic education for all segments of society, and not just the elite, as the second essential component of the development process of a country. In terms of documentation, Pakistan’s political leaders have endeavoured to carry out the directives of the Quaid and the insights of Stern (2001). Since 1947, there have been seven National Education Policies, eight Five-Year Plans and several nation schemes relating to education (SPDC 2003, p. 92).
In August 2009, the eighth National Education Policy was promulgated by the national government. Three major directions of the initial plan are still inherent in this latest policy, namely, the moulding of the system according to the teachings of Islam; the creation of a free and compulsory elementary education and an emphasis on technical and professional education. In 1951, a Six-Year National Plan for Education was drawn up at the second National Education Conference. Its lack of positive outcomes exposes the pattern of unconnected relationships between ‘theory and practice’ or ‘policy and implementation’, which has been the recurrent theme of Pakistan’s efforts to establish a worthwhile education system. Successive national educational objectives have been expressed in physical and financial terms but have been found to be unworkable because of their incompatibility with the prevailing socioeconomic realities’ (Planning Commission 1999). The chasm between word and actions has proved unbridgeable.

With such an inheritance, it was inevitable that at the beginning of the twenty-first century, the policy formulators for 1998–2010 (National Education Policy 1998) predicted that the scenario for the future was ‘not very bright’. In their own reckoning, Pakistan’s educational development was at more or less the same point from which it started well over 60 years ago (Planning Commission 1999). The plaguing problems of educational development remain multidimensional in nature, sealed by such political realities as the paucity of assigned basic funding (only 2.3 per cent of GNP); assigned funding not reaching the educational domain and half-hearted experiments in reform that have been undertaken with little or no preparation or spadework.

Further actions to redress this situation were framed in the federal government’s Education Sector Reform Action Plan: 2001–2005 (ESRAP). Its intent was to operationalise government policy statements and international commitments in the areas of poverty reduction, human development and improvements in the education sector (SPDC 2003). A most pertinent objective contained in the ESR was delineated as ‘Improvement in the quality of education through better teachers, upgraded teacher training options, curriculum and textbook reforms, and a competence based examination’ (ESR 2000, p. 37).
In 2003, NDIE was requested by the Ministry of Education, Government of Sindh, to assist in the professional development of 17,000 primary school teachers and 3,000 administrators in the government schools of four districts of Sindh (Thatta, Hyderabad, Khaipur and Sukkur). NDIE MEd graduates provided the staffing for this project, most particularly in the designing of professional development programmes; the training of Master Trainers and School Support Teams; production of classroom support materials and the monitoring and evaluation of all aspects of the project.

Overall, the ESRAP did not achieve its goals and extended its timeframe of accomplishment to 2009. This was anticipated by SPDC in 2003, noting as the primary problem the lack of co-ordination among the key stakeholders. ‘ESRAP is a centrally designed plan with insufficient recognition of the implementation and financing constraints and capabilities of the provincial and local governments’ (p. 95).

3.7.2 Named Problems

Research findings, coming from both private and government academic sectors, give common descriptors of the serious problems afflicting Pakistan’s education system. A weak infrastructure resulting in little progress towards universal education, low female to male ratio in attendance, textbooks that arrive towards the end of the school year, overloaded and outdated curriculum, poorly educated and minimally motivated teachers, a supervision system that pays little attention to educational quality, teaching methods based on rote learning, misuse of funds…are recorded accounts that resonate with my own experiences (National Education Policy 2009; White Paper 2007; Planning Commission 1999; Schneider 1997; Warwick & Reimers 1995). To all of these problems must be added the corruption of the public examination systems, which functions from Grade IX to University. The quality of the exam papers is inadequate in the eyes of educators who believe that a student’s assessment process involves more than the reproduction of learned answers to predictable questions (Memon, 2007). Cheating begins long before students enter the examination centre. Copies of papers are easily available prior to the exam date.
Proxy students are well remunerated for their efforts. Exam invigilators can be bribed into not noticing books and papers of prepared answers being used during the exam time (Khalid & Khan 2006; Dawn 2004, 2006). Markers of papers are easily bribed or provide the requested marks when their lives are threatened in very real ways. Rahat Saeed, third position holder in the 1999 Secondary School Certificate examination, astutely comments on her results ‘…it was very easy for the students to guess the test papers because the examiners generally do not deviate much from the papers set during the previous five years’ (Dawn 2000).

Such episodes leave the lingering question as to the worth of educational certification for many of Pakistan’s graduates. Its National Educational Policy (2009) boldly states:

> Overall, an oligarchy of a few reigns over the system and in combination with corrupt officials and their patrons, they have held the whole system hostage. Corruption in appointment processes further leads to lopsided student evaluation and the advancement of the undeserving. (p. 13)

A further poignant factor in this frame is that education and literacy are not isolated, but interrelated and complementary phenomena. Pakistan’s population has a devastating illiteracy rate of 37 per cent amongst the males and 64 per cent of the females (CIA World Factbook 2009). These figures hide further qualifying swings between different provinces, rural and urban, male and female populations, which amount to 54 per cent literacy for some urban male populations and seven per cent for rural females. However, the status of being literate is all too often granted to those who can ‘read’ some learned verses from the Holy Koran. A conservative estimate claims that 36 per cent of children attend primary school (UNDP-HDR 2003) for an average of three years and while 28 per cent enter secondary school, only 39 per cent of these students remain at school to complete Year 10 level (SPDC 2003). Allied to an annual population growth rate of over two per cent (CIA Factbook 2009), this estimated percentage of unschooled children can only be set for increase.
The formal education system currently trying to address these issues is multi-staged (see Appendix 2 for a diagrammatic representation of the current Pakistani education system.) The primary stage consists of five years (Grades I–V) and a middle stage (Grades VI–VIII). Mostly, it is automatic progression through these eight years of schooling. There is a two-year secondary stage (Grades IX–X) and a higher secondary stage (Grades XI–XII). A choice is associated with the undertaking of this latter stage, either at a higher secondary level in the secondary system or at the intermediate stage at a college or university. The Ninth Five-Year Plan for Education 1998–2003 contained a firm proposal to restructure the system to bring it into line with international practice by providing sixteen years for formal schooling to the completion of Bachelor level certification (National Education Policy 1998). While many educators welcomed such a move, strong protests have also come, particularly from the more conservative political parties, teacher associations, parents and segments of the College and University Professors Associations who resist change processes (Ashfaq 2010; Staff Reporter 2010, 2006). The process of change has stretched well beyond its planned time of implementation and began in most colleges and universities in 2010.

There are also numerous private and elite schools, some of which are part of other systems. Examples of such are the Catholic Education System, the AKES, Foundation Schools, Beacon House Schools, the Al Murtaza Community, Fatimyah Educational Network, The City Schools, the International Schools of America and the British. While many of these are elitist schools, the Catholic, the Community and to some extent the AKES systems work extensively in the poorest urban busti and rural village areas and cater to the Urdu-speaking population as well as providing more elite English medium schools. Most of the private school systems have allegiances with international universities in the UK, the US or Canada (for example, the Cambridge system), which guarantees entry into foreign universities for their successful graduates.

Households that send their children to elite English medium schools have been identified as those that incur a per-pupil education expenditure of more than Rs 12,000 per annum and own a car.
The Deeni Madaris, or religious institutions comprising mosques, and maktabs (schools attached to the mosque and providing elementary religious instruction mainly through the memorisation of the Holy Koran); madrassahs or Dar ul Uloom (concentrating more on advanced Islamic instructions and providing the formation and training of future Mullahas) and mohallas (community schools run by women, providing girls some basic education in the Holy Koran, Islamiyat and home management skills) are traditional institutions that have a widespread network throughout the country. In spite of their shortcomings and isolation from modern educational streams, the Deeni Madaris are honoured because they endeavoured to preserve original sources of Islamic teaching during the colonial period and have communicated this successfully from generation to generation (Planning Commission 1999). Some of the Deeni Madaris are termed as hot beds for the training of Jihadis and terrorist activities (Alvi 2009) and in 2001, the Musharraf government promulgated an ordinance to mainstream the madrassahs (inclusive of the Deeni Madaris/Dar ul Ulooms) in an attempt to counter-balance the narrow focus of their religious studies, the ignorance of the students in terms of general knowledge, literacy and numeracy and the militancy endemic in their educational training. The outcome of this legislative action shows some success especially in association with smaller madrassahs but its overall effectiveness is questionable (Shah 2004). In Islamabad, the tragic story of the radical Lal Masjid or Red Mosque, with its seminary for young men and Jamia Hafza Madressah for female religious students, provides the strongest evidence for the latter. Two Taliban-style religious leaders\(^{27}\) and brothers from Pakistan’s tribal areas endeavoured to set up vigilante Islamic courts to stamp out vice in Pakistan’s capital. They pressured their students to become suicide bombers in this movement to introduce full shariat law was suppressed. As Maulana Abdul Aziz proclaimed, ‘Our youth, male and female, will shake their (political leaders’) palaces with their suicide attacks’ (Dawn 6 Apr. 2007) if their demands for the establishment of 10 shariat courts (presided over by Abdul Aziz’s choice of clerics) and the closing down of video, music shops and bordellos were not met. Under orders of the president, the Pakistan army suppressed the Red

\(^{27}\) Abdul Aziz Ghazi and his brother Abdul Rashid Ghazi
Mosque movement and most of the 86 lives lost were young seminary and madrassah students who chose martyrdom rather than surrender.

Pre-schooling is deemed by the ESR Action Plan (2001, p. 30) as the vital link to improving both the access to and the retention rates in the schooling process as it orients the children towards learning and lays the foundations for their attitudes and dispositions towards leaning. The worldwide awakening regarding the importance of Early Childhood Development (ECD) and Early Childhood Education (ECE) that occurred in the last decade of the twentieth century touched Pakistan. Following the World Education Forum (UNESCO 2000), which focussed on childhood education and care as a priority goal for human development, Pakistan set up the National Plan of Action for Children and the Social Action Program (SAP) and identified ECE as a priority area in order to improve young children’s access to education and to orient them towards learning and schooling while providing worthwhile opportunities for their future success (Ministry of Education 2003). The implementation of these policies and plans has not been widespread.

Many private organisations established preschools in various parts of Pakistan, but most of these concentrate on the educational needs of the children and often do not address their psycho-social needs (Department of Education and Literacy & Teacher Resource Centre 1999). Rich-Orloff, Khan and Juma (2007) found that USAID-funded programmes to develop ECE were not sustainable, as weak systems had been put in place to facilitate the continuation of the programmes when the support was withdrawn. Overall, the report found a lack of understanding or commitment within the government and the schools to the ECE concept. The situation as Ghafoor and Farooq described in 1994 has changed little. Pre-schooling is carried out in a haphazard fashion mostly by untrained staff in nurseries, Montessori schools and kindergartens with the majority located in the private sector with few rural and urban public schools providing such facilities and kachi classes. The term ‘kachi’ is used in the public sector for the pre-primary classes where children are not registered as school attendees (unadmitted kachi) but they are the younger family members who accompany their older siblings to school for the day (ESR 2001).
Fifty-three Special Education units are scattered throughout the country (Government of Pakistan Statistics 2005) and in the 1980s both KU and the Allama Iqbal Open University introduced training for special education teachers. Statistics strongly suggest that very few institutions barely touch the surface of the needs for special education.

Technical and vocational education is available through many public and private institutions although they are in no way adequate to serve the needs of the many seeking application. Girls may undertake this training after completion of Grade V while boys’ entry follows the completion of Grade VIII.

3.7.4 Teacher Education

The primary concern of teacher education in an Islamic state is the enhancement of man’s (sic) spiritual nature. The ultimate aim ...should be to help in the realisation of complete submission to the will of Allah. In this perspective, the major objective of teacher training should be to ensure that competent professionals have ideological commitment, content competence, and pedagogical excellence ...in 1) subject matter; 2) internalised values, beliefs, morals; 3) transfer of knowledge; 4) strength of character to inspire students (Planning Commission 1999).

Many factors are responsible for shaping the quality of teacher education—factors ranging from ideological and sociological needs to the existing structure of the education system and the plethora of theories and practices related to teaching and learning. In line with the National Education Policy (2009), my local experience holds that population pressure has provided the prime impetus to directing educational practices. The plight of millions of uneducated Pakistani children and adults is known on the world stage, and aid has been offered by many foreign countries and NGOs. Often the subsequent local actions taken have been knee-jerk reactions to external pressures from the World Bank, UNICEF, UNESCO and other such organisations, which threaten to withdraw support from projects if progress is not observably measurable. Hence, both foreign and locally designed Continuing Professional Development (CPD) programmes for teachers have lacked long-term follow-up strategies. More copying of ‘teacher tricks’ rather than sustained teacher development has occurred. Short-term bursts of teacher motivation rather than the
sustained energy of self-motivation have so often resulted in a petering out of the classroom teaching and learning strategies introduced during professional development programmes. In many cases, support has been rightfully and often righteously withdrawn as financial aid for education projects has been ciphered off for business projects, low-quality schools buildings, ghost schools or stolen for personal gain. In such an environment, investment in an improved quality of teacher education has been minimal. It is working counter to these types of outcomes that is fundamental to the philosophy, structure and process of the NDIE teacher education programmes. My research gauged the success of this NDIE approach and its potential for the future of teacher education in Pakistan.

The government has acknowledged that the existing programmes of PTC, CT and BEd for teacher education are not ‘adequately responsive to the demands for quality education’ in the school or tertiary systems (National Education Policies 2009, 1998). The policy documents indicated some of the major issues underlying this state of affairs, giving priority to the fact that teaching is usually the last choice of profession for young men and women. This situation resulted in poor motivation among the teachers, especially the males. An allied factor was the imbalance between teaching content and obtaining guided practical experience in school classrooms, with the latter suffering. My observations within schools have provided evidence of few examples of ‘good’ or suitable classroom teachers for teacher education students to observe and learn from. This situation highlights the fact that the energies and resources for teacher education need to be spread between pre-service and CPD domains.

In 2006, the HEC undertook practical steps to raise the quality of the formal teacher education from the top down. The commission established a new structure and issued new, centralised BEd and MEd curricula for the professional teacher awards (HEC 2006, revised 2010). Since that time, provincial Ministries of Education and Universities have both endeavoured to implement the new BEd course and also resisted the change. The successful implementation of the plan will accomplish the replacement of PTC and CT courses by a two-year ADE and a four-year BEd (Honours) course with the successful completion of 12 years of schooling as the
entry requirement for both. An ADE certification will qualify a teacher for the elementary level of teaching (Grades 1–VIII) while a BEd (Hons) is the minimum qualification for secondary level teaching (Grades VI–X). The BEd (Hons) allows for a primary/elementary or secondary level of specialisation in teaching and the ADE can be converted to a BEd (Hons) after the completion of a further two years of study. It is envisaged that the MEd qualification will be awarded after successfully completing two years of professional studies post BEd (Hons). Both the national and provincial Ministries of Education anticipate that the new plan for teacher education and its standards will be fully implemented and be operational at least in the government sector by 2018 (see Appendix 3 for a diagrammatic representation of the new teacher education pathways).

There are many hurdles that have to be faced and overcome if the desired teacher education reform is to become a reality. Teacher education institutions are confronted with a shortage of facilities including buildings, equipment, furniture, teaching aids, educational technology and library resources, and the quality of staff appointed is an even more serious question. In the existing system:

Any person belonging to school or college cadre can be shifted to a teacher education institution...The appointment procedure usually disregards merit due to political inference and other malpractices prevailing in the society...These institutions are also not being supervised in an appropriate manner. (National Education Policy 1998, p. 62)

The problems seem overwhelming and, in terms of documentation, the reformation of the standards that both individual teachers and teacher education institutions must meet for accreditation has been set in place. In 2009, the Government of Pakistan approved both the National Professional Standards for Teachers in Pakistan and the National Standards for the Accreditation of Teacher Education Programs. While Pakistani educationalists have been involved in the formulation of these documents on the national level, the challenges for implementation lie with the provincial Ministries of Education, the autonomous provincial Universities and the Teacher Associations.
It is in such a milieu that the NDIE project has been endeavouring and continues in that effort to make a difference, not by setting itself up in opposition to the government system, but by treading a path that works both alongside it in order to be able to challenge and be different, and as a partner within it. As Schneider’s (1997, p. 196) study indicates, there is value for NDIE in being associated with the large, unchanging, bureaucratic government system provided NDIE sustains a flexibility in its learning and teaching strategies and exercises a strong, diplomatic leadership (British Council 1988; Nauman 1990). Much of what NDIE has been striving to achieve in the quality of teacher education and teacher professionalism is contained in the vision of the 2009 documents for teacher and teacher education standards.

3.7.5 Continuing Professional Development

Systematically planned and implemented in-service or CPD programmes for teachers and administrators were almost nonexistent in the government education sector until the aftermath of the terrorist attacks on America in September 2001. Many countries formed an alliance to counteract the ‘War on Terror’ not only through military action but also through developmental interventions, with a particular emphasis on education. The results have been sporadic opportunities for teacher development, usually from an injection of funds for specific projects whose foci are donor dictated (Haiplik 2010; Fatima 2006; Stites 2004). Donors fall into three major categories: multilateral organisations, bilateral organisations and international nongovernment organisations. What has not occurred on the large scale are long-term follow-up or mentoring programmes where rigorous accountability for implementation of CPD learning lies with the programme participants so that the benefits gained from the sponsored courses are not lost. In the for-profit private sector, educating teachers and administrators is an integral part of a school’s or system’s successful business plans. Amongst the not-for-profit private sector, Catholic Education and the AKES-P are examples of two systems that have developed diocesan or district in-service streams and in both instances, NDIE graduates, particularly the MEds, are present in significant numbers.
The Education for All (EFA) Global Monitoring Reports (2005–2007) identified Pakistan as one of the countries that is far from achieving the EFA goals. The shortcomings in teacher education and the poor status of the profession are named among the most fundamental reasons for such categorisation. Since 2005, USAID, through agencies such as UNESCO’s Strengthening Teacher Education in Pakistan (STEP) and Pre-STEP projects, Education Sector Reform Agency (ESRA) and Links to Learning: Education Support to Pakistan (ED-LINKS), has been working to enhance the capabilities of Pakistani teachers in the public sector ‘with the understanding that it is better to rebuild the teacher and professional development system in its totality rather than investing in fragmented individual inputs or processes’ (unseco.org/en/ev.php).

3.7.6 Teacher Professionalism

Teacher absenteeism is an enormous problem, not only reflecting the low motivation of the teachers but also the poor management in the schools, lack of accountability structures, extremely low wages and lack of incentive for feeling or acting as professionals (Khan 2006). It also reflects not only the poor quality of training that teachers have received (Sarwar & Husain 2010) but the commonly held estimate that 70 per cent of teachers have had little or no training even if they hold certification with some, particularly in the more isolated areas of the country, barely literate themselves. Rehmani’s (2003) research indicated a correlation between assessments demanded by Pakistan’s public examination systems as a further impediment to ‘what’ and ‘how’ teachers teach and students learn in classrooms. With the exams requiring neither understanding nor critical approaches to learning, teachers settle for textbook-based, teacher-centred, poor-quality teaching, which subsequently forces even the poorest of students to seek private tuition in addition to their schooling. When this is considered in conjunction with the fact that many parents see no value in education, either because they do not see how it can better their children’s lives or the family will starve if the children do not go out to work each day (Akhtar 2008), there is an air of uselessness that pervades the teachers and the schools to which they are attached. My experience from talking and working with teachers from various schools across the country has been that teachers feel powerless to change the
situation. With very low remuneration for their services, it is hard for them to feel pride in their work and believe that they can make a difference to the present and the future (Khan 2006). However, Rizvi and Elliot’s (2005) research demonstrated that the seeds of self-perception as professionals exist amongst Pakistani teachers. They argue that treating teachers as professionals is an incentive for them to improve the quality of their teaching and reciprocally, the students’ learning.

3.7.7 Leadership in Teacher Education

By its own admission, the Ministry of Education (National Education Policy, 2009) recognised the absence of arrangements for training of leaders in education. Administrators, supervisors and curriculum planners to date from school to university levels assume their positions through seniority or favour. They then gather around themselves, staff who is content to comply with the leader’s wishes and thereby receive their rewards. Educational research, most particularly in the classrooms and in curriculum development, has remained miniscule and of varying quality (Haider 2008) in relation to the numbers who claim education as their profession. The HEC in the past decade has made progress in encouraging the development of researchers but focussed in the areas of science, technology and engineering while incentives for the development of the skills of research amongst the educational community have received minor attention. From this reality, Khan (2009) offers a challenge to both the HEC and educators with the reminder that creating a culture of research in Pakistan should not be one driven by financial incentives but by a genuine desire to create new knowledge out of which the wider Pakistani society will reap the benefits.

My research has provided a critical account of how NDIE, most specifically through its MEd programme, took up the challenge of addressing some of the problem issues in Pakistani teacher education. The particular emphasis in the MEd programme was the formation of educators and researchers whose leadership qualities and capabilities enabled them to effect change in their professional settings (NDIE 2009). My research interpreted the quality of educational leadership evident in the practices of the MEd graduates and the role their studies at NDIE played in bringing this
leadership to fruition. Their sustained motivation and ability to ascertain appropriate change along with their choice of processes that helped changes to occur effectively were areas of investigation that I determined as vital to the quality and value of this study.

Such facts and figures regarding graduate employment and common perceptions of their capabilities can yield only a partial testimony with respect to the outcomes of the MEd programme. What they are incapable of portraying are the correlations between the process and style of learning, teaching and interaction at NDIE and the change effected in the personal and professional lives of its graduates. I found that each of the MEd graduates, in his/her own way, has a passion for education. They work amongst the middle classes, the elites and some of the poorest Pakistani children to be found in schools. My dissertation has woven a critical narrative out of the richness and honesty of the professional stories of three of these women and men. The narrative yielded a richness of insight that made meaning out of their years of study at NDIE, demonstrated the institute’s impact on their professional practices and provided guidance for the future of teacher education both at NDIE and beyond its walls. In Chapter 4, I have outlined the rationale behind the methodological approach and procedures of my research.
Chapter 4: Research Methodology

In this chapter, I establish my research as a case study, which is interpretative in its nature because its prime focus was to seek the meaning contained in the relationship between the Australian women’s influence on the education of teachers at NDIE, particularly through its MEd programme, and the changes in the educational practices being effected by its graduates. I have outlined the logic of justification or the rationale for the manner of conducting the study and the insights as well as truths and outcomes generated and supported by the process (Creswell 2009; Maxwell 2005; Piantanida & Garman 2009). In the course of the chapter, I clarified my selection of the narrative approach to the collecting, describing and understanding of the research data (Butler-Kisber 2010; Andrews, Squire & Tambouku 2008; Holloway & Jefferson 2000) and established it as the most appropriate way to chart the social and educational reality of the research context (Clandinin 2007); to own my relationship to the research question and the research participants and to draw out meaning from the data (Clandinin et al 2006).

4.1 Methodological Issues

4.1.1 Interpretative Research: A Case Study

I chose the narrative method for this interpretative case study because of its appropriateness in regard to the research question and the circumstances in which I was to conduct the study. Interpretative research comprises close, detailed, intensive work carried out by the researcher participating in the substantive context. As the researcher, I was the major research instrument, eliciting information from relevant sources while interrupting the usual flow of professional and social life as little as possible (Creswell 2009; Goddard & Melville 2004; Burgess, Mousley & Kortman; 1996). A particular outcome of interpretative research can be a phenomenological account that not only attempts to describe the subjective world of the study but also to understand it (Huberman & Miles 2002; Silverman 2001; McTaggart cited in Mousley & Kortman 1996). I decided that an interpretative narrative, created by my reentering the stories along with the subjects to critically examine the texts, was the
most suitable way to draw out an understanding of, first, the relationship between the NDIE MEd programme and the professional practice of the graduates, and second, the role of the Australian women in the formation of this relationship.

McNiff (2007) refers to teachers’ storytelling as looking at teaching from the inside, an epistemological claim that teachers’ knowledge about what they do is most appropriately structured by story and can best be understood in this way. This use of ‘story’ was more than an effective and interesting way to present what had and was continuing to happen in the teaching-learning environment of NDIE and the professional work of its graduates. Rather, it was the research methodology itself. The story format allowed the thoughts and actions of the Australian teachers to be linked and the narrative derived from these stories (Connelly & Clandinin 2000, 1990) facilitated a making sense of what they had done as educators. The narrative itself became both the phenomenon and the method of the research (Connelly & Clandinin 2006, 1999). It provided a window into an understanding of the working together of Australian women and Pakistani students on continuum of time, place, the personal and the social for educational purposes (Yin 2003, 2009; Andrews, Squire & Tambouku 2008; Connelly & Clandinin 2000). From this perspective, and in acknowledging its cross-cultural context and political-geographical location in the Asian subcontinent, my research was situated broadly within a postmodern, postcolonial paradigm. The postcolonial position enabled the relationship between and among the Australian educators and the MEd students/graduates to be examined essentially from how and where power was exercised as well its modes of expression in both overt and covert ways as the learning and teaching interactions occurred (Seth, Foucault & Nandy cited in Ghandi 1998).

4.1.2 Describing the Method

The method employed involved three major components, namely, the writing of a narrative from the storied accounts of the three Australian women, the fieldwork case studies located in three different sites in Pakistan where MEd graduates were engaged as professional educators and the reciprocal interrogation of these two components, each by the other. In this way, my research produced bipartisan

Throughout my research I drew on the ‘critical incident technique’ (CIT) (Webster & Mertova 2007; Tripp 1993). I found this data gathering technique most suitable for my research as it situated the research participants in their experiences of actual events of teaching, administering and schooling at NDIE or in schools or educational systems at various locations within the country. It took the participants beyond describing what they saw as typical or significant events. The technique provided them with a way to analyse such incidents—to indicate the trends, motives, structures and values that underpinned them. Such was the core data of my research process. The work of Tripp (1993), Bolton (2010) and Mander (2008) guided these processes of collection and analysis of data gathered from the critical incidents described and elaborated upon by the participants.

4.1.3 Three Minor Case Studies

I used five stages in constructing these case studies. The first stage involved interviewing the three graduates selected from the total number of graduates to gather their stories using the CIT (Tripp 1993, 1994; McEntee et al 2003). An initial data analysis followed at the second step, prior to the third step of rechecking with the graduates to ensure accuracy and making necessary amendments. At this point, I also interviewed three to five current professional colleagues of the interviewees. An examination of the data to elicit themes and a comparison with those themes that emerged from the narratives of the Australian women comprised my fourth stage, while my final step led me into an understanding of the meaning of the narratives and the naming of outcomes and leaning points for future action (Carspecken 1996, 1998; Mander 2008).
The relative quality of qualitative vis-à-vis quantitative research remains a topic of debate in academic circles. The approach of qualitative research is not focussed on the generalisability of its insights and outcomes. Its aim is to demonstrate the ‘rightness’ of particular social knowledge in a specific context. My research interrogated or challenged the Australians’ narrative from the Pakistani educators’ perspectives. To do this, I undertook minor case studies of the professional lives of three NDIE MEd graduates. The choice of multiple case studies was appropriate as Yin (2003, 2009) holds that such a step follows a replication and not a sampling procedure. I judged that if I discovered replication of meanings and ideas and outcomes among the three cases, I would be more confident about the overall result of the study. Yin terms such consistency in findings as ‘robust’. The primary role of the three case studies was to generate the data and produce outcomes that provided critical insights for an interrogation of the Australian women’s narrative. This allowed my research to signify the confirmations and contradictions of both perspectives regarding the educational endeavours at the heart of the NDIE project.

4.1.4 The Interrogation

The narrative I constructed from the Australian women’s stories and the outcomes of the three case studies offered two perspectives on the contribution made by the Australian women to the Pakistani educational scene. The first perspective demonstrated what had been hoped for and what the women identified as outcomes from their work as teacher educators. The second perspective verified what was actually occurring in the teaching/schooling activities of MEd graduates. Bringing these two perspectives of the research process into dialogue exposed a bipartisan understanding of what occurred in the particular NDIE teacher education process. The work of the research was not to establish a proven, beyond reasonable doubt (Maxwell 2005) cause and effect relationship between the work of the Australian women and the educational practices of their MEd graduates but to make meaning of their partnership (Creswell 2008; Gay, Mills & Airasian 2009) with its cross-cultural (Frow & Morris 2000), transnational type characteristics (Hussain 2007).
In juxtaposing the two perspectives, I compared and contrasted the commonalities and differences in the emerged themes, the insights I discovered and the meanings I interpreted (Craig & Huber 2006). This allowed for the trustworthiness and authenticity of each to be tested alongside the other, not to establish which was right or wrong, but to uncover the conformities and differences that emerged when the partnership in education was reflexively examined from two perspectives (Guba 1981; Marshall & Rossman 2006; Creswell 2009). I contend that through this process, my research uncovered a new level of meaning in the Australians’ educational contribution in Pakistan.

4.2 The Case Study using Qualitative Methodology

My research was representative of a descriptive (Yin 2003, 2009) and interpretative research (Shenton 2004; Silverman 2000; Guba & Lincoln 1985) in the sociological domain (Merriam 1988, 2002) or field inquiry (Burgess 1984) where the problematic (Tripp 1993) was an evaluative investigation of the contribution made by particular Australian women to the ongoing process of educational change in Pakistan. In its particular form, this interpretative research was a case study, ‘a generic term for the investigation of an individual, group or phenomenon’ (Sturman 1994, p. 640), the study of an instance in action or a portrayal of ‘what it is like’ to be in a particular situation, to catch the close-up reality and ‘thick description’ (Geertz cited in Cohen, Manion & Morrison 2000) of participants’ lived experiences of, thoughts about and feelings for, a situation. This type of inquiry can have diverse purposes or outcomes with a different approach required for each (Flyvberg 2006), yet its distinctive quality was its basic tenet that ‘human systems develop a characteristic wholeness or integrity and are not simply a loose collection of traits’ (Sturman 1994, p. 640). The case of my thesis can be described as the ‘bounded system’ (Goddard & Melville 2004; Adelman, Jenkins & Kemmis 1996) of teacher education, particularly the MEd programme at NDIE, Karachi. It was through an investigation of the professional life and work of the graduates of this programme that the worthwhileness of the contribution of some Australian women educators was ascertained.
I recognised that a sound decision about the effectiveness of an educational provision required my attention to the interdependence of its circumstances, values, processes and consequences. MacDonald (1996) builds a strong argument that the case study method allows for such an integrated portrayal of a particular educational programme in action. He uses ‘portrayal’ in the sense of ‘telling it as it is’ (Kemmis cited in MacDonald 1996, p. 2) so that the participants in the research or its readers can engage the educational process in their hearts and minds. The case study method appropriately catered to the need for my research to be sensitive to the cultural context and to use variety in the ways of data collection (Patton 2002). Additionally, it ensured that my research was capable of achieving a richness and depth that would have been unobtainable through the empiricist’s clinically quantified measurements (Creswell 2008; Punch 2008) or propositional knowledge (Stake 1996, 2006).

I used the more natural abilities of the participants to name the educational experiences in which they were immersed and to re-enter them reflexively (Watt 2007; Foley cited in Shacklock & Smyth 1998; Schratz & Walker 1995). I took this step to enable the MEd graduates and the Australians to understand, not just describe, their current professional practices or former contributions in light of what they learned and experienced at NDIE. This was the type of knowing that Stake (1996, 2000) calls ‘tacit’ and in such perception lay the value of my research. It had the potential to leave participants as local educators, me as researcher and teacher educator at NDIE as well as interested readers, with their boundaries regarding teacher education in Pakistan pushed beyond their present ambit and challenged to consider alternatives for future directions.

A case study does not possess the prescribed and structured process of quantitative research, but it does have a framework that is flexible, allowing the investigation to adapt in order to explore unexpected findings, newer and deeper insights, controversies and inconsistencies as they emerge (Kothari 2008; Flyvberg 2006). Equally important is the fact that it allows for the involvement of the researcher as part of the investigation and not to remain outside the research process or objectively unengaged. This involvement allows for creative insights to emerge as the research progresses (Jackson & Mazzei 2008; Marshall & Rossman 2006), and the scope of
the study proliferates, extending the problematic. Such outcomes illustrate further the value of embedding research in the contextual situation.

A case study cannot be carried out by researchers who see themselves as detached from the situation or as neutral observers whose concern is measurement and presumption is lack of bias since qualitative research is located in lived social situations and involves a search for meaning and understanding. Green argues that meaning in life does not present itself for examination from without (Sherman & Webb 1988, p. 175), as it is not a function of behaviour but is attained from a critical reflection on events or behaviours of life. Participant observations, particular modes of listening, reading of autobiographical or biographical stories, taking note of the way research participants move, interacting or reacting are ways of catching the stuff from which meaning is derived. Inherent in such interpretation are lenses or horizons of pre-understanding on the part of both the researcher and the situation being studied and it is from an interrogation of these two horizons that the interpretation of meaning emerges. For Tripp, the researcher receives, perceives, creates and negotiates the reality of the situation (1993, pp. 28–29).

4.2.1 Data Collection

I used a five-stage data collection and analysis process similar to that delineated by Carspecken (1996) and Carspecken and Apple (1992). My data collection involved fieldwork in three different geographical locations of Pakistan, namely Karachi, Rawalpindi and Gilgit/Sher Quila, and in Melbourne, Australia. This fieldwork comprised unstructured and semistructured interviews in order to gather biographical stories constructed around critical incidents (Tripp 1993) and photographic images (Creswell 2009; Allan et al 2005; Bach 1998; Kress & van Leeuwen 1990) as well as critical insights into the current professional practices of the research participants. All interviews were recorded on audio tapes, transcribed and verified by the interviewees and kept in the confidence of my research supervisors and myself (see Appendix 4 for the semi-structured interview schedule and Appendix 5 for the stimulus photographic images).
4.2.2 Participants

4.2.2.1 The MEd Graduates

My process of selection of the sample population for the study further delineated its boundaries through my choices of people for storytelling, selection of photographed images and the settings for interviews. The first step employed was an interview with approximately 40 per cent of the NDIE MEd graduates to gain a widely focussed perspective of their lives as professional educators. Following this process, I selected three graduates for in-depth storytelling. Criteria for this selection was in the graduates’ willingness to contribute to the research, being located in different types of geographical areas, representing variety in the professional works in which they were currently engaged, having time available to recount and reflect on their stories, hailing from different cultural backgrounds and ensuring both male and female representation.

4.2.2.2 The Australian Women

Individuals carrying the overall leadership responsibilities for an educational institution have a unique way of perceiving it from an overarching umbrella perspective, no matter what their leadership styles. In its first 20 years, NDIE had three directors, each an Australian, a Sister of Mercy, an experienced educator and administrator. While several other Australians have been members of the NDIE academic faculty for short or longer terms, I selected the three directors (me being one of them), because of the united purpose yet diffracted lens through which they possibly perceived the role and achievements of NDIE.

4.3 Interpretation of Narrative

4.3.1 The Subaltern Voice

Within the gambit of subaltern studies particularly focussed on South Asia, Spivak (Landry & Maclean 1996) challenges the limited permission that members of the nonelite classes, particularly the women, have to narrate not only the stories of their past but also those of their present reality. In this context, the notion of ‘subaltern’
was initially ascribed to a rung of the societal ladder during the British colonial rule in India. The term refers to the massive section of the population that had no access to the social mobility available to the foreign and local elite. In the postcolonial present, it still bears reference to those who are trapped outside the local elite groups, those whose lives or voices have no weight in the society or those who belong to the minorities (Landry & Maclean 1996; Guha & Gayatri 1988). As a Western woman in Pakistan, I can commonly be perceived as part of the foreign elite and feel shamed into silence by an initial reading of Spivak’s ‘Can the Subaltern Speak?’ (Williams & Chrisman 1994), thus overlooking her provocation to get in touch with what about her words made me passionate and propelled me to act on the urgency in that passion. I drew substantially on the work of Spivak (1988, 1993) and Ewing (1997), as this research sought to learn how to attend to a particular subaltern story so that it could find voice in words and images and be heard in Pakistani and wider educational spheres. However, I was also conscious of Riesman’s caution that researchers cannot give voice but rather they can hear voices that they then record and interpret (2008).

4.3.2 The Narrative Approach

The narrative approach is multilayered and many stranded (Connelly & Clandinin 1986, 1990, 2000, 2006) and it encompasses a variety of research practices that hold in common an interest in the way people try to make meaning in their lives through the ways they communicate—their language, images and actions (Craig & Huber 2006; Casey 1995). In other words, people live lives that can be told as stories. The work of the narrative researcher is to collect such stories, interpret them and, from these interpretations, write the narratives of the way people experience their world. Connelly and Clandinin have explained this process by viewing ‘narrative’ as both phenomenon and method. The narrative identifies or puts language around the way people both experience and understand their world. It also names the patterns or methods used to inquire into the phenomenon. On these grounds, Connelly and Clandinin (1990, 2006) call the phenomenon ‘story’ and the method of inquiry, ‘narrative’. This general notion of narratology, when applied in the field of
education, recognises teachers and learners as storytellers, a medium through which
they can recount and make sense of their lives.

The oral tradition of storytelling is strong in Pakistan and is sustained in part by the
low literacy rate, as described above in Chapter 3. My lived experiences have also
taught me that the Pakistanis are highly descriptive in words and action, evidenced
from their abilities to rote learn, to reproduce enormous amounts of information and,
despite illiteracy, to make exact replicas of small and large machinery parts as well
as electronic technologies. The move to critical interpretation in order to gain a
deeper understanding of actions or events is more complex and is a step that is not
often taken as it involves a level of analysis. In my research, I employed the
participants’ natural tendency towards storytelling combined with the challenge to be
critically reflective, to examine the professional practices of teachers from within
their own stories. I found support for this move in the work of MacIntyre (cited in
Elbaz 1996) who stresses that while humans are essentially storytelling beings, their
stories are bound by their culture milieu, namely, the context, the inherent
possibilities and the sense of identity and meaning contained in that cultural
community. A teacher’s story is embedded in the educational community from which
he or she draws meaning and identity.

My assumption was that the NDIE MEd graduates encountered the culture of two
different educational milieus. That of NDIE is different from other local teacher
education institutions or communities and is counter-cultural to the teaching styles
practiced in the majority of schools and universities in Pakistan. An aspect of my
research focussed on discovering if the graduates of the NDIE MEd have used their
learning and been able, not only to recognise new possibilities for the teaching-
learning interplay in their classrooms (graduating from NDIE would indicate that
they have), but to turn such possibilities into realities because they have been able to
make them the ‘right fit’ for their students’ learning. My hunch was that finding their
professional identity between the possibilities for teaching that they discovered
through their MEd studies and the realities of the educational communities of which
they subsequently found themselves a part, was a difficult, but not impossible,
transition for the graduates. Using story as the discourse for this critically reflective teacher research was therefore most appropriate.

4.3.3 Story and Narrative

Insider knowledge can be constructed from teachers' critical reflection on their stories (McNiff 2007, Reichert 2002). This use of story is more than an effective and interesting way to present what happens in the classroom. It is the research methodology itself and it is how I used the constructs of stories, not just to link together the thoughts and actions of teachers, but to facilitate for both the MEd graduates, the two Australian women and myself, the ‘making sense’ of what they were doing as teachers and administrators.

My use of the Connolly and Clandinin (1990, 2000) distinction between narrative and story to structure my research meant that from the selected MEd graduates and the Australian women, I drew out firstly the stories and accounts of their educational endeavours. From these stories, I constructed the narrative that retold the lives of the storytellers in a way that made meaning of their professional lives. In choosing to use this method, I was cognisant of Elbaz’s (1996) point of differentiation regarding the use of ‘story’. While Connolly and Clandinin (1986, 1987) and Butt and Raymond (1987) draw on MacIntyre’s (cited in Elbaz 1996) notion of the unity and wholeness between the past and the present components of life story, they tend to overlook the fragmentation of current life situations. As Elbaz (1996, p. 5) expresses:

> Facts and values, ends and means, thoughts and actions are split apart and the individual’s life is similarly divided up into spheres and roles (private and public, work and play, theory and practice).

I sought to look for the uniting aspects of the stories, for confirmation of my probing and meaning-making processes yet my narrative writing endeavoured to avoid positing unity in the scripts before discovering if it was there in each story’s own telling.
4.3.4 Teachers’ Storied Understanding

The literature supporting the narrative approach to research on teachers and teaching is constantly expanding, responding to a need for a greater sense of community in the professional lives of teachers (Freidus 2002; Lyons & LaBrosky 2002). My study explored and contributed to this field and, to my knowledge, no such studies have come from teachers in neither South Asia, nor Pakistan in particular. I hoped my research would make some initial contribution and expose any sense of professional community that had developed between the Pakistani and Australian educators involved in the NDIE project.

Barone (1996) emphasises the fact that teachers telling their stories can have a transforming effect not only on their own practice, by understanding more clearly the what and the why of what they are doing as educators, but also on the practices of other teachers who read the research and find similarities with their own situations. Honesty of thoughts, beliefs, desires, intentions, habits, practices and empathy between storyteller and researcher are necessary foundations for moving to a perception of what is happening below the surface recounting of the story lines (Rorty 1989). I noted Wiseman’s (1990) caution that a researcher needs to be conscious of his/her own factors that could, even unwittingly, be inserted into the interpretation of the meaning of the teacher’s stories. What the storytellers (that is, the MEd graduates and the two Australian women) made of their own world, and what lay behind the ways that they acted within that (educational) context, had to emerge on centre stage in my research (Mousley & Kortman 1996).

I continuously took guidance in my narrative approach from such writers as Creswell (2003, 2007), Denzin and Lincoln (2005), Weiler (1988, 1999), Casey (1993, 1995), and Middleton (1993, 1999), who see the practice of teaching as a way to change the world that emanates from the critical wisdom learned from the stories of teachers. Toth (1996) warns about academic ‘tinkering with a good yarn’ by being overawed by the text of the story and not addressing the narrative contained within it. Issues such as ‘researching down’, ownership of the stories and the narrative, tensions between empowerment of the subject of the texts and the imperative of the narrative
voice are raised by Thoebald (cited in Weiler & Middleton 1999), not as deterrents to narrative research, but as reminders of practical and theoretical challenges within the process.

Smith (cited in Weiler & Middleton 1999) and Dwyer and Buckle (2009) raise the possibly complex process of uncovering the narrative when the relationship between researcher and storytellers is complicated by ethnic differences, in my situation, the indigenous teachers and the ‘foreign’ researcher. Mohanty (1988) and Alexander and Winne (2007) have also cautioned regarding ‘cultural reductionism’—the process of fixing storytellers in a particular place because of their ethnicity or class or gender. I was cognisant of these cautions in conducting this research as not only the insider-outsider, Asian-Western dichotomies existed but also those of teacher-student, Christian-Muslim and caste-castelessness and with the Australians, employer-employee, Sister of Mercy-Sister of Mercy. Prior to, but not during the research, I had a relationship with each of the participants, which fell into one or more of the above mentioned categories. Each of the relationships therefore had the capacity to impinge on both the telling of the stories and the writing of the narrative.

Connelly and Clandinin (1990, 2000, 2006) address the relationship issue between the researched and the researcher as one of ‘narrative unity’, namely, a collaborative relationship that is actually the ‘interpenetration’ of the spheres of experience of the storyteller and the listener who becomes the writer of the narrative. This highlights the fact that the narrative approach to research provides the opportunity for the participant storytellers to have their voices heard, provided they are not made to feel less than equals (Noddings cited in Connelly & Clandinin 1990) and that time and space is allowed for the growth of the collaborative relationship. Such a relationship is couched in what Elbow (cited in Connelly & Clandinin 1990) called the ‘believing game’ where I endeavoured to insert myself into the story and come to know it, not as an outsider but as an insider. This was the process of facilitating the voice of the ‘other’ to emerge. In Spivak’s language, if I have carried out this process, then the subaltern will have found voice (Spivak cited in Landry & MacLean 1996), a narrative will have been told.
4.4 Data Collection and Analysis

While acknowledging that a case study can include both qualitative and quantitative approaches to research (Maxwell 2005; Creswell 2009; Sturman, 1994), I employed the former and my data gathered over a two years’ period comprised written stories, personal interviews, photographic images, informal conversations and graduate participant workplace observation. My professional journal and research diary have provided additional materials.

The data for five narratives—two Australian women and three NDIE MEd graduates—were acquired from two interviews with each participant and a third contact for the clarification of data through either personal or electronic communication. All interviews, except for one Australian participant, were conducted in their respective working locations, which also enabled observation of the participant in her/his professional environment. One participant was interviewed in her place of residence in Australia. Data for the sixth narrative was taken from my own autobiographical writing and reflections. Each of the narratives was built around the CIT to enable a focus on the occurrence of change or significant turning points in the individual’s life (Kain 2004; Tripp 1993).

For the three minor case studies, semi-structured interviews were conducted with three to six educators who were current working colleagues of the MEd graduates. These interviews were likewise conducted on the interviewees’ local worksites.

4.4.1 Methodological Stages

In the initial stages of the research process, I found guidance in the work of Carspecken and Apple (1992) and Carspecken (1996) and their five-step outline for gathering data from stories. I found this approach useful because elements of the historically located symbolism of white, western, colonial in juxtaposition to brown, eastern and subaltern (Spivak 1988) along with the lingering association of westerners exercising power over those they colonised were potential factors present in my relationship, particularly with the MEd graduates. I also needed to ensure that I
had a way of not only hearing stories as they were recounted by both the Pakistanis and Australians but of being able to listen for their meaning as I analysed them. The research proceeded in the following manner.

My initial step involved compiling factual evidence from the interviews along with my own note-taking regarding the research context and setting. I transcribed the stories that emerged from the interview and, without changing any of the text, ensured that they were comprehensible and made sense to me in the context. This reflected the first stage of Carspecken (1996), what he termed the ‘monological data collection’. The next step in the process involved my initial analysis of the stories. I looked for any patterns that were within the stories, noted similarities and differences and noted any initial relationships I could identify between and among segments of the stories. While this was reflective of the second or preliminary reconstructive analysis stage of Carspecken’s work, it also enabled me to do a loose categorisation and initial inference of meaning (Hubermam & Miles 2002) in order to understand and begin to perceive values, motives and structures of relationship amongst the data (Kain 2004; Tripp 1993).

My next step was to take the transcribed stories and my initial work on them to the Australian women and the MEd graduates so that they could recheck their stories and make any amendments they felt necessary as well as offer comments on some of my preliminary analysis. Both as a confirmation of and to stimulate the telling of any further aspects of their stories, I presented each research participant a series of 10 photographic images, some of NDIE moments and the others depicting general aspects of Pakistani life. I asked them to select three to five of the photographs that stimulated a memory or incident that might add another aspect to their story or embellish what they had already told. Next, I completed the data collection process for the minor case studies of the MEd graduates. This involved taping semistructured interviews with up to six of their current professional colleagues and representatives of employers, their peers and those amongst whom the graduates worked in administrative positions (see Appendix 6 for interview schedule). From this point on in my work, I asked a critical Pakistani friend to read my writing of the narrative as I crafted and understood it to emerge from the stories as another means of cross-
referencing my reflections and interpretations of meanings in the cultural context. This stage of my work was similar to what Carspecken (1996) termed ‘dialogical data generation’.

The fourth step in my research process involved examining the narrative to identify its differentiating themes (Boyatzis 1998). This brought to light the points of connection and disparity in the narrative amongst the Australian women and the MEd graduates as well as between the two groups of story-givers. My interpretation of the narrative began to emerge, which was similar to what Carspecken (1996) termed ‘describing system relationships’.

Last, I sought to examine, explain and integrate the preceding steps in the research by providing a holistic interpretation of the Pakistani and Australian perspectives in relation to the research question. This involved my move from describing the situation to understanding it, questioning it and suggesting future directions, leading to an endpoint similar to Carspecken’s ‘explaining system relationship’. Through this guided process, I gauged the fact or fiction of a partnership in education between Pakistanis and Australians, which has enabled the personal and professional voices of MEd graduates to find a public place in which to be heard.

4.4.2 Critical Incident Technique

A critical incident is human behaviour. Such behaviours become significant through the interpretation given to them either by ourselves as the actors or by others in keeping with the way in which the events or situations are viewed. It places a value judgement on the particular behaviour (Tripp 1993, p. 8) and in so doing, what could have originally been seen as a typical event becomes critical through its analysis and a resulting judgement, which often challenges taken-for-granted attitudes.

Tripp (1993) and others (Kain 2004; Scheirk 1999; Shacklock & Smyth 1998; Hansen 1997; Pedersen 1995) have argued that while any judgements made of critical incidents must be justified, such conclusions are largely determined by an individual’s or a group’s worldview, which Tripp names the ‘problematic’. It is this
The CIT is a modus operandi for directly collecting data and subjecting it to a process of analysis. I followed Flannagan’s (1978, 1954) five fundamental steps in the critical incident procedure for collection of research data. These include:

- articulating the goal to be achieved through the technique;
- indicating the manner in which the incidents are to be collected;
- collecting the incidents from concerned persons through a relevant data collecting technique;
- analysing and categorising the incidents according to predetermined criteria; and
- interpreting and reporting on the outcomes.

Because I employed the CIT as a focus strategy in the interviews to gather the narratives of the six key participants, they were transcribed and their contents verified by the participants. Tripp (1993) guided my work at this stage, both in the posing of trigger questions during the interviews and in the subsequent process of analysis and decision making leading to interpretation. I found his four aspects of questioning helpful when I probed the critical incidents within the stories, as I first had to make practical choices regarding which incidents would be included as part of the narrative, which would not and reasons for that selection. Second, I pulled the individual incidents apart to see each one’s description, its causes and the feelings and emotions contained in it. My next step was to critically reflect on my discovery so far and determine how it affected others and me, as I interacted with it. In my fourth step, I endeavoured to name what a particular incident was an example of and so I was able to situate it in relation to other critical incidents recounted by the MEd graduates and the Australian women (Tripp 1993, p. 27).

4.4.3 Representation of Experiences

Dealing constructively with representation in narratology is a crucial issue. O’Shaughnessy and Stadler (2002) hold that narrative, as a representation, is not
simply a reflection but a reconstruction of the storyteller’s story. Representation is not about being 100 per cent accurate in the process of collapsing all the aspects of each story into a single narrative. It does mean that from the original stories, I selected and retold certain aspects and events and made connections between these, not only within the individual stories but between and among the six stories. I endeavoured to remain conscious of both the power and acute responsibility I had to my living sources in re-presenting their stories in the form of my research narrative (Borland cited in Gluck & Patai 1999). To achieve this, I simultaneously looked inwards to listen, interpret and shape my experiences of what I had heard in the stories and looked outwards as the researcher to produce a narrative that would display a degree of competence so that it would ring true to my readers. Riessman alerted me to the complexity of the process of representation and so I referred to what he terms the five ‘porous’ levels of representation as a guide in order to get as close as possible to the stories of the participants (Huberman & Miles 2002).

My attention to the representation process unfolded in the following manner. First, from the total number of Australian women and MEd graduates available, I selected representatives whose stories would comprise the research. As the participants considered the people, events and experiences that constituted their lives as they had unfolded so far, I asked each to focus on who they were as educators and the place of NDIE in that journey. This allowed them to tell their stories with a particular attentiveness and purpose. Second, I requested the participants to re-present the events of their lives in a semi-ordered fashion, using the CIT after I ensured they were sufficiently familiar and comfortable with the technique. Hence, during their recounting, they described settings, characters and scenarios from which I stitched together their stories, making sense of the events before attempting an interpretation. As I listened to the storytelling, I was conscious of the gap that existed between the events as they happened and the time and words of their recounting. I was also conscious that I could have been hearing the story differently to what the teller was reliving. As each of the MEd graduates had been my student at NDIE, I was mindful of the fact that there may have been elements of depicting their self-representation according to what they thought I wanted to discover.
After each interview, I wrote up my own reflections on the interaction, describing such things as gestures, facial expressions and what I experienced as the movement of moods and energy throughout the interview. These descriptions were important memory simulants and provided critical insights as I joined them with my word-for-word transcription of the taped interviews in order to construct the narrative in a manner that sought to remain as close as possible to the storytellers’ presentations. Riessman’s (cited in Huberman & Miles 2000) fourth point reminded me that decisions about inclusion or exclusion of data from the stories needed to be made on the basis of factors that enabled me to present a narrative that made sense of the data and made sense to the original teller.

I found each of the stories wide-ranging. They were plurivocal within the renditions of the tellers themselves as well as with the people and circumstances of their lives. They were rich in their levels of meaning and expansive in their content. Reissman’s work cautioned me about developing too rambling a narrative that lost the perspective from which I needed to write, namely, a critical evaluation of the MEd programme in light of such factors as Pakistani-Australian partnerships, the raising of postcolonial subaltern voices and bringing change in teacher education practices and outcomes in Pakistan.

4.4.4 Use of Images

Rose (2001) claims that social scientists have used ideas about people to construct their understandings of cultural and social life. Her contention is that Western societies—and my experience evidences the subcontinent just as strongly—are bombarded with images, and it is such images that provide key cultural insights (p. 6). For images are neither innocent nor transparent windows. They are familiar forms such as drawings, film, paintings, graphics and photographs that have the potential to contain meaning often far beyond the power of words to express. At the same time, images can invoke the power of words in those who study or observe them (Allen et al 2005) and dredge up the inner life of the mind to provide a vehicle for making those insights or perceptions visible, audible and tangible (Edwards
1988). They assume social value and therefore help to give a heterogeneous interpretation of a world, and in my research, a particular bounded world.

As English was not the first language of some of the participant storytellers and others amongst the group had a preference for expressing their thoughts and ideas in shape or form other than words, I chose to use 13 photographic images (see Appendix 5) in the second round of interviews as stimuli for the participants. I anticipated that such images might spark in them another element of their stories that needed to be told. I also saw this as a means by which they might expand, contradict or confirm what they had recounted in their first interview. Some of the photographs captured aspects of the site and life at NDIE, while others framed various glimpses of Pakistan and its people, their cultural practices and statements of social significance. To enable the participants to do this, I employed the three meta-functions of the semiotic language code, which Allen et al (2005) and Kress and van Leeuwen (1990) hold can be applied to images or pictures as well as to written text. After considering three to five images, participants were asked to express how the characters or component parts related to each other (ideational function), capture something of what they saw as the mood of the photo (interpersonal function) and express in words a coherent response (textual function). This process provided me a way to confirm the trustworthiness of the data from each biographical interview as well as a means of gaining additional insights into the gathered stories. For this latter step of image interpretation, I used and the critical approach, as proposed by Rose (2001).

First, I considered the importance that the participant gave to the image as a means of stimulating an enrichment or enlargement of his/her story. On some occasions, the participant demonstrated an immediate affiliation with the image and proceeded to recount another memory or insight. At other times, the picture elicited an event or happening that had previously not been remembered. Second, the photographic images enabled participants to comment on their own position within or the difficulties and uniqueness of Pakistani society as well as the relationships between and among NDIE staff and students. As the interviewer, I also saw each photograph selected by participants from my own perspective, which at times was similar to and at others, different from those of the Australian women and MEd graduates. This is
the third level on interpretation as outlined by Rose (2001). The intertwining of my own insights with those of the participants played both challenging and confirming roles in my efforts to make meaning of the narrative that I constructed from the data of the stories.

4.5 The Stories and the Narrative of the Research

I had to pay close attention to the methods of narrative inquiry to enable the narrative of my research to emerge. Connelly and Clandinin (1990, 2000, 2004, 2006), Barone (1996), Elbaz- Luwisch (2007, 2010) and Gough (1998) provided me guidelines, as outlined below, for collecting data for the stories as well as criteria for the formation of the interpretative narrative (Bell 2002; Mousley & Kortman 1996; Webster & Mertova 2007). I was conscious that this methodological approach has its limitations in that the construction of new insights and knowledge was taking place in a world of which I was a part. The educational context, the data gathered and their analysis were all very familiar to me (Anderson cited in Shacklock & Smyth 1998). Hence I endeavoured to be grounded in a self-critical, reflexive stance (Loughran 2002; Roman & Apple cited in Shacklock & Smyth) that acknowledged my theoretical, professional, personal and non-neutral beliefs or positions that were and part of shaping and moulding the data and its analysis into a creditable and unique account of a particular programme of teacher education.

The process of reflexivity must occur between the storyteller and the researcher if the latter is to construct and reconstruct a narrative that is the storyteller’s voice of significance, value and intention. Also, the narrative researcher must move beyond the telling of the lived story to ensure that the research story emerges or that the narrative shows a way of understanding the recounted educational practice.

As the researcher, I had to locate myself in relation to the narrative, acknowledging that my own social categories, history, culture and knowledge were part of the shaping of the narrative. Clandinin, Pushor and Orr (2007) along with Freidus (2002) insist that the narrator must be written into the text and not remain outside as a disembodied, neutral voice that leaves the narrative in an ‘author evacuated’ state. I
acknowledged my constant presence throughout the text by use of the first person; provided additional, explanatory and local information for the reader where I judged such to be necessary; occasionally struggled to leave the stories as participants told them rather than add what could have been expansive embellishments and, because of my multiple relationships with each of the participants, drew upon my research supervisor to add a critique to my narrative as it emerged.

4.5.1 Voices without Words

Each medium of communication has its own possibilities and limitations of meaning (Kress & van Leeuwen 1990). My research was undertaken in the English medium, the first language of three of the other five storytellers and me. While each MEd graduate participant was proficient in oral and written English, it was the third or fourth language of use for two of them. This reality provided another reason why I used visual images in the form of photographs as a means of facilitating the telling of the stories and the capturing of the meanings inherent to the narrative (Allen et al 2005).

One very practical issue that presented itself to my research process was the nature of the research voice. By the very language I used in setting up the interviews and guidelines for storytelling, I created the frames within which the research process was realised. In line with what Walker (1996) notes, my choice and use of language as the researcher has significantly determined what has been learned from the research. This was a limiting factor that I chose to address in two ways: the use of plain language and the use of photographs.

In both my oral and written communication with the research participants, I consciously used plain language. For the Australian women and MEd graduates, it was important that I hear their stories through their own style of language use, and so my trigger questions for their interviews were open and simple in their construct and choice of words. I envisaged this would allow participants maximum freedom to create or image their stories in their own words. When interviewing the twelve educational colleagues of the MEd graduates, I kept in mind that ten had English as
their third or fourth language and that for four of them, it was not the language they used daily in their work situation. For their maximum contribution to the research, the questions I posed to them were straightforward and focussed on the intent of the research (see Appendix 6).

The photographic images employed in the second interview with the MEd graduates and Australian women provided one way for them to stand outside the stories they had constructed orally and revisited through the written transcript and, in Walker’s (1996) words, allow themselves to be caught unawares by the impact of what the image might arouse in them. I used both public and private photographs (Allan et al 2005, Berger 1980), the former to engage the out-of-context or unexpected storyline, the latter to capture the subjective knowing in a way that was an image rather than words. This engaging of photography stimulated the storytelling, eased the interview process, enabled the storyteller to reflexively visit her/his story and enriched the interpenetration of the storyteller’s and my spheres. In trying to escape the language trap, I discovered voices within the storytellers that might otherwise have remained silent.

The research process rested primarily on my ability to engage the MEd graduates and the Australian women in honest and open storytelling as educational colleagues and partners. The valuable outcome of the research depended on my ability to create a narrative that functioned as a diffracting lens, moving this specific educational inquiry to a point of actually making a difference to the practice of education in Pakistan.

4.6 Stepping Inside the Problem

To address such a question meant entering the history that has been creating itself as a part of the MEd programme. A chronology of happenings and the linkages of events and personages, whatever the writer’s perspective, provide one view of history. This is an important role for history to assume for happenings, the stuff of human experiences, occur in space and time. If these experiences are to find and give voice to their meaning, they must find their positions in relation to other experiences
and situations whether they are similar or different. For Scott (1992) this is the way to be written into the remembered and retold as part of the discourses of human experiences. The linear record of the human story contains various discourses that interpret human experiences through different voices, because their identity and agency is different. Cultural, religious and subjective positions of student and teacher provided me conscious challenges in interpreting the events that characterised the historical record of the MEd programme.

Therefore, I hold the perspective that a study of history involves more than just linearity. History can trace continuities, but it also picks up discontinuities, isolated and scattered events and, just as importantly, it involves captured images. In other words:

[History] involves not only the flow of words but their arrest as well. Where thinking suddenly stops in a configuration pregnant with tension, it gives that configuration a shock, by which it Alicelizes into a monad. (Benjamin cited in Arendt 1973, p. 262)

The remembering, recording, retelling and reflecting on experiences have been acknowledged educationally as an integral part of the learning process at least since Dewey’s (1938) work on Experience and Education. The radical nature of his work lay in its claim that a person’s inner self cannot be ignored but must be acknowledged as an indispensable element of the learning process. Building on the further development of Dewey’s work in the intervening years, Butt, Raymond, McCue and Yamagishi (1992, p. 58) go as far as to claim that the most powerful informant of learning that has a lasting effect ‘is that which results from experiences which have a telling impact on our person’.

Zahreen’s father told me that we had changed his daughter from and ‘anything will do’ young lady into a responsible and professional young woman. ‘She’s my only child and I never thought education in Pakistan could do this for her.’ (Margaret personal journal, November 2008)

I can now appreciate the hard work and struggle and strictness and love of NDIE. I’m a principal now and I’m adapting the NDIE model of admin for my school...There’s no way now that I can ever be a lazy principal! I think NDIE took all the laziness out of me. (Asad, email communication, February 2007)
During the BEd orientation programme I couldn’t speak more than a few words in front of the group ... now I’m the debating coach at our school. (Sobia, personal communication, June 2006)

These above examples may be pithy vignettes of the pen and electronic mail, yet their strength is in the lives impacted by the experiences. As such, they begin the turning of the soil of this evaluative case study. The verdict of success or failure passed on any teacher education programme is necessarily linked to the relationship of the judges to the programme and the evaluative criteria they employ. Such judges are numerous, and approaches to their roles can be from a variety of perspectives. Children/students in classrooms can be inadvertent evaluators in the way they express their likes or dislikes of ‘the how’ and ‘the what’ that makes up their learning experiences. Intended formal evaluative processes, such as measurements of learning outcomes of teacher graduates or professional performance reviews, provide other avenues for attaining valuable insights into the worth or otherwise of an educational programme.

In my research, the evaluative process resided in the narrative critical method, which drew its data from the voices in the stories of the MEd graduates and Australian academic faculty members. This approach was supported by the claim of Halse (1996) who, in studying the long-term effectiveness of a professional development programme for teachers, contends that a reflexive use of teachers’ stories not only gives insight into who they are but also enables teacher-centred professional knowledge to be produced. Within the captured images of individuals’ experiences lies the notion that these teachers/educators are caught up in the gradual process of ‘becoming an educator’, a journey that I hoped to discover was one of continual movement towards becoming a good educator.

4.7 Diffracting Lens

People’s stories of the NDIE MEd programme, stories of graduates and academic staff, bounce with experiential evidence as to its practical relevance and professional significance to their educational endeavours within Pakistan. Pursuing such an evaluation through narrative allowed for a more indirect approach to the topic. In
Minh-ha’s words, the focus of the study was to approach it without killing it, also allowing for time to become acquainted with the ‘envelope, that is, all the elements which surround, situate, or simply relate to it’ (Trinh cited in Chambers & Curti 1996, p. 4).

When this view of Minh-ha is allowed to be positioned beside the belief that storytelling is innate to human beings; that humans are storytelling organisms who individually, and in their interconnectedness with each other and their worlds, live storied lives, it is fitting that the ‘envelope’ or the context of the narrative be explored through the medium of stories. Heilbrum goes as far as to say that we live our lives through texts:

They [texts] may be read, or chanted, or experienced electronically, or come to us, like the murmurings of our mothers, telling us what conventions demand. Whatever their form or medium, these stories formed us all. (Heilbrum cited in Connelly & Clandinin 1990, p. 2)

Heilbrum further contends that that the stories of our lives must be retold if we are to make sense of the current world or if they are to create new narratives. It was from a community of storytellers (Carr 1986) that the narrative of my research emerged. Stories must not only be retold and entertained reflexively by the community of storytellers, because such activities will only disperse the stories to other places. Rather, I sought to enable my narrative to function as a diffracting lens that broke open or critiqued the positives, the negatives and the varied spectra of its content in order to make sense of it, to find meaning in it. To have achieved this means that my narrative gained the capacity to move my educational inquiry beyond reflection and reflexivity towards making an actual difference in the complex world of education in Pakistan.

4.8 A Good Narrative

Elbaz-Luwisch (2010) terms ‘narrative enquiry’ as a wakeful engagement with an educational experience. Reciprocal to this type of encounter I recognised that the need to establish the authenticity of the meanings I established from data was integral
to the research process, although I acknowledge there is considerable debate about
the underlying techniques and theories involved in the process (Creswell 2008;
Elbaz-Luwisch, Glesne & Peshin 1992). Personal judgement plays its part in all
research, and Sturnam (1994, p. 644) argues that:

Instead of the blanket condemnation of subjectivity or the universal
approbation of objectivity, what is needed is an opportunity to appraise
those personal judgements being made.

Those personal judgements began with the choice I made regarding the methodology
most appropriate for the inquiry to be undertaken. I knew clearly why I did what I
did and, in the course of the research report, have been able both to justify the
methodology selected and to acknowledge its limitations.

There is a disciplined subjectivity to the case study and part of this is its being
subjected to standards of ‘trustworthiness’ (Gubrium, & Holstein 2009; Guba &
Lincoln 1985) in the presentation and interpretation of its data. While validity,
reliability and generalisation are the quality controls for empirical and some forms of
qualitative research, the narrative inquiry relies more on apparency, verisimilitude
(Spilchuk 2009; Connelly & Clandinin 2006; Van Maanen 1988) and transferability
(Rodon & Sesé 2008; Creswell 2007; Guba & Lincoln 1989) to judge its truth-like
qualities. The narrative is neither fiction, nonfiction nor a mirrored world of the
storytellers. It is built from rich data sources of recounted human experiences (storied
time) to capture a sense of the whole (discourse time) from which meaning can be
gleaned. Most important in judging the ‘authenticity’ of the narrative is not the linear
tracing of cause and effect between specific experiences and applied meanings. The
 crux of the narrative’s worth is the manner in which it invites the reader to live
vicariously the lives of others (Connelly & Clandinin 1990, 2006; Kramp 2004).
Although it is expected and promoted that there will be multiple interpretations by
multiple readers (Coulter & Smith 2009, p. 578), a narrative’s statements, if they are
to have truth-like qualities, must produce in its readers a sense that they have or
could experience events the way they are being described. This judges the
plausibility and the adequacy of the narrative. As Connelly and Clandinin suggest,
the narrative ‘rings true’ to the readers or they ‘could see that happening’. It establishes its own verisimilitude. It tells the truth. Peshkin explains:

When I disclose what I have seen, my results invite other researchers to look where I did and see what I saw. My ideas are candidates for others to entertain, not necessarily as truth, let alone Truth, but as positions about the nature and meaning of a phenomenon that may fit their sensibility and shape their thinking about their own inquiries. (Peshkin cited in Connelly & Clandinin 1990, p. 8)

External readers were an essential element in my research process of constructing the narrative. Hooley and Colyar (2009) emphasise the critical role that challenges the writing of the narrative at each point of its formulation: its principles, its particular form or style of writing, its selection of relevant data and its interpretation of meaning. Gough (1998) along with Coulter and Smith (2009) indicate the critic’s role in helping to ensure the researcher’s responsible use of power in the handling of the storied data and in its interpretation. Throughout my research, it was important to have my research supervisors critique my work from perspectives of the research structure, process of execution, analysis of data and construction and presentation of the research report. The Pakistani teacher educator who read parts of my work was able to decolonise (Mutua & Swadener 2005) my work by clarifying the cultural issues that challenged my understanding of aspects of the stories and my interpretation of facets of the narrative that an ‘outsider’ even while living ‘inside’ the local milieu can easily misread (Dwyer & Buckle 2009; Chase 2005).

4.9 Limitations of the Narrative Inquiry

Throughout the research, I was mindful of both general and emergent limitations that were present because of the methodology and my unintended shortcomings as a researcher. Smith (2009) re-enforced this point for me through a warning that narrative researchers need to work towards revealing the ‘constructedness’ of the stories they create so that readers have the information they need to question and critique the researcher’s perceptions and interpretations and perhaps find alternate meanings. Therefore in creating the narrative, I was conscious of the ‘authorial surplus’ (Coulter & Smith 2009) formed from the residue of data I did not select for
the composition of my narrative, data that could offer readers other perspectives of interpretation. The central value of my narrative inquiry was its ‘capacity to render life experience, both personal and social, in relevant and meaningful ways’ (Connelly & Clandinin 1990, p. 10). This, too, could have been its weak point. I was vigilant in rechecking the gathered data of significance, value and intention. This was a particular concern within the local South Asian context where deference to me as a more senior academic, an administrator and as a foreigner could have been paid by the local participants telling me what they thought I wanted to hear. I was particularly alert to this factor in interviewing the educational colleagues of the MEd graduates, some of whom described it as an honour that I had selected them for an interview. To contend with these factors, I read and reread my data, interrogating them in order to discover concealed or even controverted meanings that my outsider, Westerner status could have caused to be implanted in the participants’ responses (Dwyer & Buckle 2009). Through such reflective-reflexive handling, I maintained my own integrity in dealing with the data, not embellishing facts or using correct data to intentionally interpret false meanings and thus produce a work of fiction. These factors reinforced the essential place of the critical reading by my supervisors and the diligence with which I maintained a research journal.

To dismiss criticism would have endangered the research and run the risk of producing an outcome that was no more than my own solipsism, causing the whole plot of the narrative to become an end in itself. If this occurred, then the fine lines of meaning were missed, the ‘secrets’ inherent in the narrative remain untold and the research presents less than truth-like statements (Clandinin et al 2006; Ochs & Capps 2001).

Another danger I had to avoid was the temptation to provide a smooth ‘Hollywood’ or ‘Bollywood’ ending, where the narrative had a neat sense of wellness. To counteract this, I scrutinised the text for alternative meanings to those I first presented. To further test the meanings that emerged, I consulted literature to critique them against other theoretical or principled positions. As I was doing the research in a cross-cultural situation, I maintained an open discourse throughout with other local academic colleagues in less formal ways. These included discussions during my
teaching of the current MEd students, at teacher education conference workshops and meetings of teacher educators, particularly where critical insights from past and current experiences in the field of teacher education in Pakistan formed the basis for redesigning both pre-service curricula and approaches to teacher professional development programmes. Such occasions allowed me the opportunity to present aspects of my evolving work in a way that permitted me to ascertain whether or not it rang true amongst other teacher educators (Creswell 2007; Connelly & Clandinin 2006; Seeberg & Qiang 2005). Literature and interaction with colleagues, each in its own way endeavoured to ensure the legitimacy of my narrative from within their cultural perspective.

4.10 Ensuring the Authenticity of the Research

Steps to ensure its authenticity were incorporated throughout the research. As an interviewer, I was conscious that my own attitude towards, opinions or expectations of the interviewee could be a source of preconceived notions of what the interviewee would present. Therefore, I endeavoured to maintain openness in my own attitude and relationship with the participants and critically reflected on my part in each of the interviews in order to be cognisant of the role I was playing and open to the reception of the data as the participants presented it (Patton 2001). To further ensure verification of the data, I recorded all interviews, transcribed them and re-presented them to the participants for verification. Records of these verifications and suggested amendments were maintained. The issue of reflexivity or looking through the eyes of the interviewee (McEntee et al 2003; Campbell cited in Sherman & Webb 1993, p. 60) entered the research most evidently at this point. Photographic images were also presented to the interviewees as another means of confirming the data of the stories they had recounted.

External validity that requires the replication of the quantitative approach is not possible in qualitative research and remains a contentious issue (Denzin & Lincoln 2005; LeCompte and Preissle cited in Cohen et al 2000). However, I employed well-organised and systematic procedures and carefully documented all steps in the research process to ensure future researchers could follow a parallel trail. Within the
research report, the methodology is clearly defined, and evidence of all formal protocols is provided in the appendices.

4.11 Controlling the Quality of the Research

The terms justification and authenticity are multifaceted and are as applicable to qualitative research as to quantitative, though they are applied differently (Cohen et al 2000). Messick (cited in Stake 1995) holds that all researchers must consider the internal and external consequences for their selected methodological approaches and tools of measurement. Proponents of quantitative research have long questioned the significance of the standards of qualitative research because it fails to demonstrate ‘concurrent, predictive, convergent, criteria-related internal and external validity’ (Cohen et al p. 106). Verity (Piantanida & Garman 1999, 2009), authenticity (Maxwell 2005; Guba & Lincoln 1989a) and understanding (Mishler 1990) replace the notion of validity in qualitative research that is concerned with accounts, the meanings subjects ascribe to data and the inferences drawn from these, and not with measurable data and methods (Cohen et al). In concurrence with the above authors, Golafshani (2003) proposed that the authenticity of qualitative research can be addressed by faithfulness to standards such as (a) honesty in recording and verification of interpretations and observations, (b) the depth, richness and scope of the data acquired and the role of reflexivity in acquiring these, (c) the selection of participants approached and (d) the disinterestedness or rigor of the researcher as evidenced in dealing with variations in meaning and value positions of the participants and the researcher within the social context. In Piantanida and Garman’s terms, the research must possess a logic of justification (1999, p. 147) in the manner in which the data is moulded into its component parts or portrayals as well as the rationale for the fit of the portrayals to form the structure of the presentation with respect to its underlying assumptions. To ensure this justification in my work, I used as my yardstick six criteria for demarcating the difference between qualitative research of high and poor quality, as outlined by Piantanida & Garman (1999, 2009). These criteria were applied throughout the four phases of my research, namely, in setting the context and construction of the stories that are at the heart of my research,
in the analyses and interpretation of the narrative, in drawing implications from the study and in the crafting of the entire research report.

4.11.1 Integrity of the Research

As the architect of the research, I established the research question as one of value, and the conceptual framework rested on the belief that a particular instance of Western-Eastern partnerships formed for an educational purpose can function in a noncolonial mode that enables the local MEd graduates to be effective educators who make positive changes in their own professional settings. In a social context of a ‘third world’ country where foreign tertiary institutions join the market economy of ‘buying’ students for overseas campuses or ‘selling’ their programmes locally, NDIE has taken a different stance characterised by the forging of a not-for-profit local-foreign partnership. The institute was built on a belief that both local and foreign institutions can be comparable in quality and that good quality education can happen through Pakistani people if they have been introduced to better practices and choose to adapt them within their local environment. The NDIE MEd graduates have been educated, with some significant Australian direction, to demonstrate leadership qualities in their local educational settings and to effect educational change in that environment. The expediency of using a narrative approach enabled me to explore the connections of partnership between the MEd graduates and the Australian women and to facilitate the emergence of the meanings or consequences of those relationships as I discovered the connections between the stories of both groups of research participants. As the researcher, an Australian woman, a director of NDIE, a teacher of the MEd graduates and colleague of the other two Australian women, I brought to the inquiry a sensitivity to the context, my critical reflection on the narrative and my own part in it as well as my analysis of the conceptual framework. While in Eisner’s words, I viewed the research process through an ‘enlightened eye’ (Piantanida & Garman 1999, p. 144), I also had to remain open to ‘being enlightened’ by the narrative’s nuances, its deeper meanings and its aspects with which I resonated and those that I found to be grating against my own positions.
4.11.2 Verity and Rigor in the Research

A key to maintaining the authenticity of my research was my persistent dialogue (Creswell & Miller 2000; Isreal & Hay 2006). This discourse occurred first with myself by critically reflecting and re-entering the text of the narrative, asking the ‘what’, ‘why’ and the ‘how’ of the levels of meaning that were emerging from the text of the narrative as the process of questioning was repeated several times (Herman 2007; Healy & Perry 2000). I endeavoured to ensure that I was not distorting the storyteller’s story in a way that made it more interesting, convenient or supportive of my own conceptual position (Creswell 2007). Second, I engaged in discourse with my supervisors where I not only deliberated the structure of the narrative but also the rationale for the data I chose to include and exclude in order to formulate the narrative (Maxwell 2005). This helped me ensure that I was not intentionally omitting episodes that criticised or contradicted my position or placing unsubstantiated emphasis on aspects of the stories to reinforce my perspective. Third, my local colleague read my narrative and analysis as it emerged, to help me ensure that I was culturally sensitive to the social and religious milieu of Pakistan.

In this manner, I sought not only to generate deeper understandings of the particular educational phenomena but also to convey those insights through a coherent and comprehensive piece of writing. I judged that in this the worth of the work would lie. Other educators would be able to vicariously engage with it and gain a sense that these were the type of experiences that people can have and that the outcomes of the research find their relevant connections within published works and research literature.

4.11.3 Utility and Vitality of the Research

The NDIE community of learners, educators and planners are the prime audience for drawing interest in this research, for it points to the achievements or otherwise of the intended outcomes of the MEd programme as seen in the professional lives of the graduates themselves and by those who are their associates. The research provided a substantiated response to my question of whether or not a learning partnership
existed between Australian educators and Pakistani teacher education students at NDIE. If such was the case, the research asked if the partnership was lived out in a fashion that enabled foreign and local insights and relationships to create effective and capable educational leaders in at least segments of the current schooling system of Pakistan. The research came at a crucial time for NDIE as it began to set in place plans for the long-term development of its programmes and the expansion of its physical site. In so doing, the tentacles of the research penetrated well beyond the limits of NDIE. It addressed issues of approaches to teacher education at a time when the Government of Pakistan through its HEC formulated plans to implement new pre-service and graduate programmes of teacher education. The existing schooling system—primary through to tertiary and postgraduate—is seen to fall far short of its dualistic and paradoxical role of socialisation and transformation (Dean, 2007). While its teachers transmit the traditions and values, essentially through poor quality textbooks and rote learning, they fail in their duty to improve society by educating children who can think and challenge and create new knowledge.

Therefore, as a study that examined a different way of educating teachers for Pakistani society my research will have relevance well beyond the institution from which its narrative emanated. Teacher educators from both the public and private sectors can learn from the strengths and weaknesses as portrayed in the storied lives of Pakistani and Australian teachers. In a milieu where educational research lay in abeyance for a quarter of a century (1970s–mid-1990s) and is only beginning to be re-established, my research can contribute an insight into processes and outcomes of teacher education, and through its choice of research procedures, capture the human interest of educators in the lives of colleagues as well as demonstrate an approach to research that is not as yet prevalent in the country.

4.11.4 Strategies to Ensure Ethical Processes

The observance of ethical standards is an integral part of the research process. Guidelines to ensure such observances are well articulated in the research literature

---

28 In February 2007, the Pakistan Association for Research in Education (PARE) was launched as a national body whose aim is to encourage, develop and disseminate local educational research of good quality. NDIE is a founding member of this association.
(Piantanida & Garmen 1999; Stake 1996; Silverman 2001; Huberman & Miles 2002; Cohen, Manion & Morrison 2000). I understood the ethical dimensions of my work and adopted the following steps to ensure correct procedure throughout the research process.

Approval of the research project was sought of and approved by the Deakin University Human Research Ethics Committee in November 2000 after which I proceeded with my research process (see Appendix 7). Each participant was informed verbally and in writing of the nature of the research and their role in it. They were assured that confidentiality of their data would be respected, which was further evidenced through my use of pseudo and not real names in the research report. Participants were informed that the intended initial use of the data was for the acquiring a formal academic qualification and later would be used for professional writings, teaching, conference papers or publications. They willingly signed a consent form prior to the commencement of their participation and understood that they had the freedom to withdraw from their involvement at any stage. No participant took this latter option.

At all times I endeavoured to be sensitive to the Pakistani cultural issues surrounding the role of women, customs and sense of time. As a foreign, Western woman in a Muslim context, I had to deal with sensitive issues in relation to my approaching and conducting interviews alone with male participants. This occasionally meant that I took interviews in the open rather than behind closed doors. When arranging interviews with female participants, I ensured that they were situated at places and times that were convenient and safe for them and, when necessary, sought the approval of their relevant family members even though no participants, male or female, were under the age of 18 years.

The taped and written records of each interview have been stored with coded rather than individual names ascribed to them. To date, these have been stored in a locked filing cabinet in my place of residence in Karachi. Similarly, the original letters to participants and their signed consent forms have been likewise filed but separate
from the gathered data. The final documents will be stored for a six-year period as per the requirements of Deakin University’s Faculty of Education.

As a matter of courtesy and for the smooth operation of the data gathering segments, I negotiated suitable times and arrangements with the administrators of the concerned institutes, educational systems and schools to ensure they were cognisant with the nature of the research, its intent and the manner in which it was being conducted.

As leader and administrator at NDIE, I was conscious of my roles as colleague and former teacher of some of the participants. In no aspect of the study did I ask them to account in any way for my personal involvement in the NDIE project. Any such comments they offered, either positive or negative, were purely at their own volition.

There were some circumstances beyond my control that impeded the progress of the research in relation to its original timeline. These included the war in Afghanistan in 2001 when my safety as a foreigner in Karachi could not be guaranteed by local or international government agencies and I had to leave Pakistan for a short time. However, on my return and in the ensuing year, I have had to live under armed guard 24 hours a day and my ability to travel outside the NDIE campus either within or beyond Karachi has been severely restricted. Living with persistent threats on my life and safety has not provided the most conducive environment for the rigours required for serious academic research.

While up-to-date electronic technology in computers and communications is readily available in Pakistan, their quality is often very poor. A major contributing factor to this situation is the lack of even reasonably operational utilities such as a persistent and consistent electricity supply and quality functioning of telephone cables or wireless broadband systems. These factors have placed limitations on my abilities to function adequately as a researcher in terms of data analyses, construction of the narrative, my access to literary resources as well as my research supervisors in Australia.
Karachi burned, bodies littered the streets, ambulance, hospital staff and media workers were fired upon like criminals, while civilians remained besieged in their houses. But the ruling commando did nothing to save his people. This was the ‘reigning’ party’s method of showing strength against the people supporting judicial values. We all grew up knowing that life was never fair but till now we had never seen such a grim example of ‘might is right’. (Rashdi 2007, p. 1)

A description like the above is not unusual for the city of Karachi where law and order are maintained at a minimal level. That Australian women continue to live and work in this vastly different context from that of their own nation is by no means unique, but neither is it typical. This chapter provides the narratives constructed from the self-told experiences of the three Australian women educators of NDIE. I constructed the narrative around critical incidents which initially identified common and personal circumstances that shaped the women’s lives and led to each individual’s choice or acceptance of the option to work at NDIE as its director. The narrative located the intent and purpose behind their teacher education endeavours in Pakistan and the overt and less obvious meanings underpinning their choices, their collaboration, their contributions and the changes they effected in their own lives as well as the Pakistani men and women among whom they worked, notably the MEd graduates. The women shared unmistakable commonalities whilst displaying differing personalities and experiences of the joys, challenges and ordinariness of lives lived in both Australian and South Asian contexts.

The chapter presents mini portraits of each of the women. I built these portraits around the significant themes of agency and a subtheme of autonomy with its stress on the interrelatedness of the women’s lives, efficacy that encompasses self-esteem and leadership as well as partnerships in their expressions of vulnerability and collaboration. These themes emerged from my meaning-making of the data. Each woman defined herself and found her direction in the social setting of Karachi with its predominant Islamic religious ethic along with its roots buried deep in caste and
tribal social systems that still struggle to emerge from the effects of British colonialism. In breaking open these themes, I recounted the women’s lives as an alternative history of teacher education in Pakistan and demonstrated how this phenomenon has relevance well beyond what is a personal meaning for the women.

5.1 Three Backgrounds: Common Threads

Though being born into different decades—Beatrice prior to World War II, and Julia and I, post-war—each family bore the label of ‘stable, working class’. We each grew up Catholic but, as Beatrice’s father was a teacher and principal in rural state schools in Victoria, her early schooling was at her father’s schools and for her secondary schooling, she was a boarder at a Sisters of Mercy school. Julia and I did all our schooling as day scholars at Mercy Schools. Education was greatly valued in each of the families, and the three sets of parents did all in their power to ensure their children had available to them the best opportunities. Both Beatrice and Julia wanted from an early age to be a teacher. On the other hand, I was more interested in being a pharmacist or a medical laboratory technician and only after joining the Sisters of Mercy (the Mercies) did I take up the option of teaching.

Two of us entered the convent after completing secondary school and subsequently undertook university studies and teacher training. Julia gained her professional qualifications and spent some years teaching before joining the Mercies. Each of us had careers in secondary school teaching leading early to administrative responsibilities as heads of departments, principals of schools, and for two of us, leadership and formative roles in Diocesan Catholic Education Offices.

Ongoing professional development, through both formal and informal studies, was a common factor in each of our lives. Beatrice and Julia gained their postgraduate qualifications through Australian universities while I had the opportunity to undertake my studies in both Canada and Australia. In secondary schools, each of us had gained experience in teaching at the tertiary level before taking up positions in Karachi.
5.2 An Iron Fist in a Kid Glove: Beatrice’s Story

During the first 8 years of its existence, Beatrice’s presence filled the breathing air of NDIE whether or not she was physically present on site. Her expectations for students and staff to give of their best were tangible as were her care for, interest in and utter hope for the institute and each person associated with it. The door to her office was always open and visitors were frequent. In the midst of the often-disturbing realities of Karachi city during the 1990s, the atmosphere of NDIE was busy but peaceful, giving the impression that nothing could disturb its daily intentions.

This ability to permeate the lives of others can be found in Beatrice’s self-belief or her sense of agency. She lived with a cancer, which came out of remission in Karachi in the mid 1990s. This circumstance created in her a sense of urgency to complete what she determined was her part in establishing the teacher education institute, and it provided one possible explanation for her almost profound ability to influence others and the events and circumstances surrounding NDIE. Her sense of being in the right place at the right time and doing what she needed to do did not manifest itself suddenly in the context of Pakistan. Its presence coupled with her need to continually make meaning of her life appeared in her earlier years and evolved over time as one of her greatest strengths. As she recounted:

I remember when I was about eight years old reading a story about a doctor in India. The story grabbed me and I told myself that I’d like to do that—be a doctor in India (there was no Pakistan at that stage). Of course life changed directions for me and I became a Mercy sister.

While the option to become a Mercy sister was her free will, for some 20 to 30 years it curtailed other autonomous choices, where her own preferences for a place of work or ministry were subjugated to the will of a religious superior. She was:

---

29 Macko (1995) reports that Karachi of the mid 1990s was ruled by a group of militants armed with rocket launchers, anti-tank weapons and an arsenal of small arms. Essentially what the Mohajir Quami Movement (MQM) was doing in the city was waging urban guerrilla war against the citizens and its 22,000 police officers.
... Interested in working in other cultures so in the 1960s I volunteered for PNG (sic. Papua New Guinea) but it was not seen as appropriate that I go there. I felt during the 1970s and 80s the movement of the Mercies to become involved in other cultures, especially South America and I visited there ... However, it didn’t gel with me. It seemed Asia was more our (Australian Sisters of Mercy) thing—its immensity, the needs, the poverty, the deprivation ... and yet the richness of the culture. It seemed to me that that was where we should move... (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000)

Beatrice lived her life in Karachi believing that she did have the mental strength, the know-how and the power within herself to shape and form a new institution in a land where the cultural, political, educational and religious milieu was new to her. This was more than an intellectual knowing, as during her visit to the country in 1985 she found within herself a readiness to love and absorb what she found and recognised—the generosity of the people, acting out of their poverty, touched her. Beatrice felt there was something she and other Mercies could contribute with much to learn from the qualities and values of people. Sixteen years later, her reflection noted that the physical components of the enormous difficulties of life in Pakistan were very real and drove her mad at times, yet they were nothing in comparison to what happened in her inner life and the sense of meaning and purpose that was there for her:

> I remember being sick in Pakistan where the temperature sat at 46 degrees centigrade, lying in my room bathing in sweat and feeling rather putrid. I really wasn’t well and recovering from a bout of chemotherapy. But lying there at about 1:00 o’clock in the morning, I suddenly thought: ‘I feel so happy! I am so happy! This experience in Pakistan has been so rich and fulfilling and I’m really glad to be here’. There was a quality and richness that I couldn’t compare and I was astonished at what I said particularly in the context of quality of life and whether or not people who are suffering should continue life. (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000)

Incidents that occurred during her eight years of residence in Karachi spell out a Beatrice story.

5.2.1 Beatrice’s Defining Moments

Planning in Pakistan and Australia, prior to the arrival of Beatrice’s three companions and herself in August 1991, had been for the establishment of a two-year Bachelor of Teaching (B Teach) course for primary school teachers with the
anticipation of a one-year setting up time period prior to the intake of students. The first encounter with the unexpectedness inherent in the Pakistani mode of operating awaited her. For seemingly political reasons, KU did not approve the B Teach programme; hence, Bishop Lobo handed his alternate plan to Beatrice. The new institute would open within a couple of weeks on 1 October 1991, and KU’s BEd course for the education of secondary school teachers would be taught. This meant crash planning but not without the input of a mix of local educators from schools, colleges and universities who indicated that they wanted teachers who could and would use innovative methods in their classrooms and thus effect change in learning and teaching processes at the most potent level. While Beatrice was driven by the conviction ‘that, until teachers were trained properly, nothing was going to change—the perpetuation of the existing system would remain’ (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000), it was also obvious that many of the teachers and principals consulted from the Catholic Education System, for which the institute was primarily being established, did not really know what they wanted. In Beatrice’s words:

Some thought that everything was fine. They just wanted good teachers, that is, ‘teachers who will do the same as we have always done and get good results in the tests and exams’. Others said that things had to change as the current reality in the schools for learning and teaching was not good. (Beatrice interview 6 Dec. 2000)

Wryly, Beatrice recalled how these clouded directional views of the education and function of teachers bore some storms of protest when NDIE students and graduates moved into the schools and put into practice learner-centred and activity-based teaching strategies. The objections to the disturbance caused by the new methodological approaches to the well-hewn patterns of teacher-centred, traditionally run schools and classrooms was not Beatrice’s main interest, as such reactions to changes were anticipated. What concerned her more were the reasons behind either the objections raised or the welcome given to the fruits of NDIE’s labour. For, in the criticisms they offered, principals and teachers were beginning to articulate the

30 These included internal differences between the University’s two departments, namely the Faculty of Education and the Department of Education, the latter of which controlled the Colleges of Teacher Education affiliated with the University. Further, there were undercurrents of aggression towards the application as it came from within the missionary segment of the minority community. The term missionary is a local descriptor for Christian Church-run institutions.
beliefs they held about teachers, students and the manner in which learning and teaching should happen in the schools. These expressed thoughts were viewed by Beatrice as a sign of the fertility of the ground for teachers’ professional development.

Her firm professional belief held that the focal point of any intervention in teacher education should be the primary school teachers. Therefore, the critical question regarding what drove Beatrice in her response of taking up the challenge that Bishops Lobo issued could be answered in many ways. Perhaps it was stupidity, over self-confidence, extensive educational experience and skills or hints of colonialism that a mem sahib could organise others to do her bidding. Her story reveals at least a tinge of each of these.

5.2.2 Finding Direction

Beatrice believed that what was good in Pakistan happened because one person was influenced by another, and she justified her belief in citing the example of Bishop Lobo. While he held sway across a variety of political, educational and religious milieus because of the relationships he forged primarily with people in leadership, he also received much criticism for this activity in religious and civic circles. In Beatrice’s estimation, Bishop Lobo used his influence to do good for a lot of people as individuals or as segments of society and, because of his example, others were stimulated to take positive action in their own lives. She saw this as exposing the living tradition of the guru/disciple in the South Asian culture, based in relationships and what one person does for another.

Consciously or unconsciously, Beatrice’s story reveals that while she admired and followed the footprints of Bishop Lobo, she did not do so blindly. She had a personal strength, a human wisdom and a professional expertise that led others to quickly recognise her own guru-like qualities. These did not reflect the master-servant relationship of the traditional guru of theism (De Bary, Hay, Weiler & Yarrow 1958) but instead qualities that endeavoured to live out an authenticity between her words and her actions and her interrelationships. As Meyers (2002) claims, if authenticity
as a quality is missing, then even the most elaborated mental framework on the part of the disciple will eventually collapse.

5.2.3 Leadership: The *Guru*

Both Julia and I, along with other Australians, were drawn to work at NDIE from Beatrice’s invitation. These invitations were issued in a variety of ways but each contained common elements. First, she convinced us that we had the skills and experience to do the work that so urgently needed to be done. However, the more powerful element in her invitation was her overtly expressed belief in what she was doing and her tenacious but well-appointed daring of us to take up the challenge that the invitation offered to be part of the unfolding of the institute.

Beatrice ascertained the need for two key qualities of her leadership: forming partnerships with educators, both those who comprised the academic staff of NDIE and those in the wider educational sectors of Pakistan, and establishing a teamwork approach amongst staff and students of the institute. In a cultural milieu that so clearly defined the status of a person by caste, religion and the work he/she does, Beatrice insisted that no employees were to be referred to or treated as menials, peons, lower staff or servants. The dignity of each person’s contribution to the day to day life of the institute was paramount. Such a counter-cultural stance was difficult for some locals and frequently earned criticism from a token number of them among the academic and secretarial staff:

> I refused Cheryl’s (office secretary) request to employ an unskilled man to sit at the office door to answer her bell rings, to run messages for her, to bring her glasses of water or to fetch papers from my desk or the office supply cupboard and bring them to her desk. She was quite capable of doing all those things herself and I couldn’t tolerate the way she looked down upon and spoke to our cleaning staff. I stated very firmly the expectation I had of her behaviour, even though she told me I simply didn’t understand the culture. Furthermore I really did model the respectful and polite behaviour I expected of all staff and students towards these employees. (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000)

---

31 Beatrice put into practice her belief in the dignity of each person, based in the Christian principle that all people are equal. There is not distinction between Jew or Greek, slave or free, man or woman (Gal 3:27).
Beatrice saw that the educational role of the institute was far more than teaching students how to form and deliver lesson plans and often recounted and invited others to reflect with her on a particularly potent moment of insight from her first year in Karachi:

In class one day we were having a general lesson on geography, trying to test out the students’ general knowledge which was one of the things unknown to us. I was being practical so I asked a lass named Zenaib who was in her 30s and had been teaching both primary and secondary classes for years, to come out and show the class where the North Pole was on the globe. She came out and to my astonishment and horror she didn’t have the faintest idea where to look for it. Some of the brighter students in the groups were just looking and smirking and laughing (including Saima and Angela and a couple of other very bright girls). And I can remember fixing them with my most basilisk glare which said ‘Don’t you dare laugh!’ And so I encouraged Zenaib to think of what she already knew:
What did she know about the North Pole?
So, where would she probably look for it?
At what part of the globe?—the top? bottom? and so on.
And finally she found it. (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000)

While Beatrice admitted that incident did not mean much when it happened, at the end of the year, Saima could name it as a turning point for her and this challenged Beatrice to look at the incident more closely and in so doing discovered how significant it was for her, too, because it was illustrative of a number of things, including:

- The appalling lack of general information and knowledge the students had, which she judged to be nowhere near as much as that of a student at the end of primary school (class 6) in Australia.

- The realisation that the NDIE students needed to be exposed to a lot of ordinary information which, in the many parts of the world, children just pick up almost by osmosis. The plethora of information available through many mediums had not been made accessible to the majority of Pakistani women and men who were typified by the NDIE students.

- The attitude that was quite reflective of how education was practised in Pakistan. Beatrice had observed in many classrooms, where students who did
not know the answer or made a mistake would be ridiculed and became the subject of laughter and sneering.

- The need to combat the attitude of ridicule—to get across to NDIE students first the fact that neither children nor adults learn through ridicule but respond to positive rather than negative stimuli.

Instances of Beatrice’s words and actions being in complete harmony are many as she set the example of Australians and Pakistanis learning with and from each other as colleagues rather than as ‘expert’ teachers of the West and ‘ignorant’ students of the East. The firm belief she acted on was that encouragement would bring the best out in people.

Team leadership in action was tangible for Beatrice, particularly during her last four years as director. Her health was very poor as her cancer came out of remission. Yet she saw that despite her illness, or because of her illness, much was achieved. She recalled:

_This is when I recognised that it really wasn’t just my work. It was our (staff and students) work, our vision that we needed to be working at together. We needed to understand why we did things the way we did and listen to and understand differing points of view. Therefore it didn’t really matter if I wasn’t there. NDIE would go on. In fact I think it was a blessing that I wasn’t there all the time ...it developed morale, a spirit, a way of doing things. That was important and significant for me to recognise._ (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000)

Partnership and teamwork in the wider educational community were not so readily achievable for Beatrice. As a foreigner of senior standing both professionally and in age, she experienced a lot of lip-service admiration where she was put on a pedestal but at the same time cut down. She deemed the Dean of Education at KU as a master at this. While he seemed to genuinely listen to and be interested in her ideas, insights and perspectives on issues under discussion, he simultaneously had to genuinely keep face with his colleagues and establish his own superiority, Pakistani style. This meant he had to establish himself by putting others down. Beatrice found this way of operating among academics unbearable. For example:
I was at a Board of Studies meeting\(^{32}\) where theoretically the official medium of communication was English. But the Principals would always lapse into Urdu and a number of them were not good at English. The Principal of one of the Colleges reminded the Dean that I did not understand Urdu. The Dean simply replied, ‘She’s been here three years so she ought to’. That was a real put down for me. (Beatrice interview 6 Dec. 2000)

Such incidents heightened the fact that Beatrice created a difference when she moved into the education faculty scene of KU. While not the only woman, she was uniquely a foreigner and an infidel holding strong, well-informed perspectives on the education of teachers and endeavoured to hold a nonthreatening stance during such interactions with her local peers. By being part of such a local scene, Beatrice felt she could make inroads into the mainstream of teacher education but always with the ulterior motive of bringing about change from the inside where she believed the roots of lasting change lay. She also learned from these encounters. One such insight in relation to student assessment pinpointed for her a crucial difference between what she was able to implement at NDIE and the acknowledged powerlessness of the principals of the Government Colleges of Education (GCE). Beatrice saw herself in an advantageous position, as she had taken up the responsibility for honest cumulative assessments of students throughout the year as she and the NDIE staff were confident that the work the students did throughout the year was their own work.

She recognised that this was not the case for other principals who did not have that type of control over their lecturers, who were tied to a system where corruption was rife, even though many of them were good people and wanted to do otherwise. Beatrice saw how the Dean of Education tried to reform in his own college but:

> Pressure from a particular student political party got him both suspended from his job and then shot as he returned to his home one evening. At least we had no student political parties operating at NDIE! I used the freedom to teach and assess students in ways quite different to the status quo to model simple steps other BEd and MEd college principals and lecturers might see as doable for their students. (Beatrice interview 6 Dec. 2000)

\(^{32}\) The Board of Studies of the Faculty of Education is an officially constituted body of KU. It comprises the principals of all the Colleges of Education affiliated with the University.
As a newcomer within the Karachi educational scene, her story proved that she was quickly learning to play the existing system but at the same time, to meddle with it to effect changes step by step. In the midst of so many conflicting factors, Beatrice’s belief was that she was leading an institute that could act out of its ideals and, in so doing, be a lighthouse that showed others a way to move through a process of positive change and reform.

5.2.4 Getting Her Way

After four years at NDIE, Beatrice was further convinced that its teacher education programme was both the right and the wrong one. It was the right one in the sense that it was producing reactions from principals and teachers some of whom welcomed the learner-centred, beyond-the-textbook approach the NDIE students were using in the classroom. Others saw such classroom practices as foreign/Western, a waste of time and unnecessary strategies that both prevented the syllabus from being covered and expected too much of the teachers (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000), some of whom had up to 200 copies to be corrected per day. Beatrice judged that the real need was to attack the primary scene but she met frustrations on every front. Karachi University had rejected the B Teach designed for primary teachers; principals of the Catholic schools were disinterested as they saw no need for trained teachers in the primary schools apart from the one -year PTC offered post year 10 and, in the wider educational community, she found little understanding of early childhood and primary school teaching and learning, apart from the Montessori approach. Then, in the courtyard of St Patrick’s School, she met an 11-year-old boy crying and sought the reason:

He blurted out that he had come only second in his class and not first. When I asked him his marks, he told me a list of 98, 97 and 99 percent but he still hadn’t come first and he was frightened to go home as his father would be very cross with him...This incident made me think a lot. When a child had done so well, why should he be so distressed...instead of being able to rejoice. He saw only disappointment that he had not achieved goals that somebody else had set for him... It made me more than ever determined to encourage positive co-operative rather than solely competitive learning

33 Students’ workbooks
in classrooms. The incident made me even more aware that at year 6 level, the boy was already set in a pattern of achievement and knowledge gaining.
(Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000)

Beatrice saw the boy as a prime example of what she and the NDIE students had seen in schools of Karachi during practical teaching experiences. The creativity of the children had been largely squashed, rote learning of textbook answers, even those that were incorrect or outdated, was the benchmark of achievement for the students and the class average percentage was the yardstick of good and successful teachers. This became a prime precipitating factor in Alicelising for her what had been a growing awareness and a frustration regarding the NDIE BEd course:

We were starting too late! By the time children reach secondary at year 6, they are already quite set in the patterns of the dislocation of theory and practice...we had to do something about attacking the primary scene! The boy’s story pushed me to action and that is how the MEd programme came into being. (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000)

Beatrice’s dream for the MEd was that it would produce educational leaders who could take action for the development of education but do that from a sound and insightful position. The first two years of its three-year duration concentrated on primary school education. Reflecting on its impact some six years after its introduction, Beatrice saw that it had enriched NDIE and brought a much more serious capacity to the work of teacher education and also enriched the institute through its development of educational research. Her conviction was that this course must always retain some primacy for primary education as the basis for the teaching-learning methodologies that the institute promotes.

The happiness and integrity that emanate from Beatrice’s story reflect her belief in her strength and gritty determination to accomplish what she saw as her contribution to the development of human lives. Two of her own often-repeated reflections play strong cameo roles in encapsulating these in regard to her part in the NDIE story:

I believed that I was about encouraging people in order to bring out the best in them, even though my determination in this and other areas earned for me from the students the title of the lady ‘with the iron fist in the kid glove’. I loved the fact that they could so openly award me that title.
You are not often given opportunities in your life to have your dreams fulfilled. (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000)

For her, achievement was not what she had done during her eight years in Pakistan but what became evident in the students’ lives through their learning and experiences at NDIE. Their personal development was paramount, as she perceived:

They came to us as shy and unsure and usually left us with confidence in their abilities to be good teachers. That is my biggest satisfaction. (Beatrice interview 26 Dec. 2000)

5.3 The Parable of the Second Choice: Julia’s Story

Julia’s story unfolded through a somewhat chronological structure. Her narrative was ordered. She laid the foundation for her sense of self to emerge through naming the bases on which it was built, the people, the events, the choices that, when fitted together, revealed how her story eventually became entwined with that of NDIE. During the Karachi years, Julia had her own yardstick by which she gauged her effectiveness and the time at which it was appropriate for her to take her leave. Much of her story emerged from the midst of two juxtaposed metaphors, namely, first choice and second choice, which were evocative in gleaning meaning behind key moments of agency, effectiveness, leadership and vulnerability, and expressed an underlying openness to the unexpected as it presented itself as the events of life unfolded.

5.3.1 I Couldn’t Spell Reservoir, Miss, So I Put ‘Dam’: A First Choice

Some incidents from the classroom deserve to be told and retold, gathering new audiences and yielding new insights with each retelling. Julia narrated one such significant incident from her first year of teaching:

I remember quite vividly this one little fellow in Year 8. I was teaching him English and he had a great sense of humour. I subsequently learned that it wasn’t until he was in about class 5 that his parents and teachers realised that he had a severe hearing problem. He talked, as people with hearing
difficulties often do, in a distinctive way. But I learned from him something about how there are creative ways that kids show they understand something by giving unexpected answers. And I can remember this particular spelling test where one of the words they had to spell was reservoir and we were going through and correcting them and he said to me, ‘Miss, I didn’t know how to spell reservoir so I put down dam’. I thought to myself, there’s nothing much wrong with you. You understand perfectly. And I often look back on that incident and think that it illustrates something to me that is very important in what we’re on about in teaching. We’re not just there to get the expected answers all the time. We’re looking to see if students have understood no matter how little. (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

A recurring theme in Julia’s story was her learning from and seeking meaning for the unexpected events and encounters in her life. She was innately a teacher; this was strongly expressed in episodes of her personal as well as professional life. Julia always wanted to be a teacher and, along with her parents, carefully selected available options throughout her schooling and post-schooling years to enable her yearning to be a reality. Her thirst for learning was a tangible aspect of her story that invited a listener or a reader to look more closely and appreciate its impact on her outlook and functioning as a teacher and an administrator.

In speaking of her learning, Julia oozed an enthusiasm that ignited her whole being while at the same time appreciated the financial limitations and difficulties her family bore in order to ensure that her early formal education developed her academic giftedness:

Mum and dad wanted to give me the best chance with my studies which I was very good at and they considered sending me to boarding school for my Years 11 and 12. However, I knew that money was tight in our household so I opted to stay on at the local school and because I took subjects like maths and geography, I did those through correspondence school. I now see that the work I did by correspondence really did develop in me the skills of being an independent learner. (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

Her choice of the second option to remain at home at the local school rather than attend a larger and better equipped regional boarding school for the final two years of her schooling could not be described only in disadvantageous terms. One distinctive outcome was that her skills to become an independent learner were honed out of the
necessity of studying selected subjects in the distant learning mode. Her academic achievements at the end of her schooling guaranteed the university education that her family had dreamed of and planned for so long:

*After Year 12 and because I still wanted to be a teacher, I applied for a Studentship. It was the only way I could get to university because again, mum and dad couldn’t afford the costs associated with it. So the studentship tied me up to a commitment to teach. My path for the future was emerging.* (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

Julia’s story revealed that her love of learning and formal teacher education set her on a professional path that expressed one of her strongest self-definitions. She was confident that she was a good teacher, a practical teacher who had an ability to read students, to recognise and acknowledge their insights, tap into their struggles and to create a learning environment that was well managed and inclusive of her sense of humour and ability to enjoy the teaching-learning interplay with the students. Her aim was to appreciate and nurture in students a confidence in their individual learning processes, and this was evident not only in the first years of her teaching, but particularly throughout her years at NDIE. She described herself as a teacher with:

*Lots of skills and I think I have the ability to develop a confidence in students so that they can learn. I like to teach with a lot of practical applications and give examples from my own experience. I found this particularly the case when teaching the Research Methods and Statistics unit with the MEds in Karachi...helping to develop a skill in students to have an idea of a problem that can be addressed and...to critically review what is happening in their classrooms or their professional situation.* (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

At no time in the recounting of her story does Julia see teaching as hard or difficult, words that she frequently applied to the varying administrative positions she held. Difficult could have been the case in her first year of teaching when her appointment to a rural technical school for boys found her teaching English and history. Her preferred choice had been for a coeducational regional school teaching the maths and geography, the subjects for which she had been trained. However, she thrived on this unexpected challenge and as she drew on and adapted previous experiences, her love of teaching took root, grew and developed across a spectrum of classrooms.
5.3.2 Teacher Models

As a university student, Julia became more critically aware of good and not so good teachers and the importance of shaping her teacher demeanour on good mentors or models. Two Mercies were her supervisors during one of her practicum experiences, and Julia observed the vitality with which they embraced their teaching and established a great rapport with students. In this environment, Julia began to feel at home, a fact that not only confirmed her as a teacher but also challenged her consideration of a personal life choice as a Sister of Mercy. While the perspective was different, other teacher role models emerged in her university lecturers. These spoke to her first as a learner, capturing her interest, challenging her thoughts, opening new horizons for her. Then she critiqued how they managed to achieve this:

*One would just walk in with himself and teach – no notes or anything. And he was fascinating! I just loved listening to him because what he said was just so interesting. Another lecturer made things just so practical for us. We did lots of practical things and explorations in his class. When I look at myself as a teacher, I know I was influenced a lot by their combination of theory and practice. And so when I started my career as a teacher ... I grew to love it.* (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

5.3.3 Joining Administration to Teaching: First and Second Choices

Many good teachers find their way into school administration and Julia was one such teacher. What was significant in this movement was the openness with which she explored administrative practices in herself and others and their impact on her as a teacher. The meaning of these two strands of being educator, while formed in an Australian setting, express their imbalanced preference most poignantly for Julia in the cultural climate of NDIE.

5.3.4 Initial Administrative Experiences

Julia enthusiastically embraced the administrative dimensions of school life in becoming the subject coordinator for religious education in a large regional Mercy
Secondary School. The times were tough for the religious\textsuperscript{34} on the staff because there was a small, conservative, influential, vocal Catholic group who scrutinised and constantly objected to almost everything the teachers did in the religious education classes.\textsuperscript{35} While it united the teachers against a common enemy, Julia found it very hard to manage the administrative responsibilities in such an environment that settled into a win-lose situation with the teachers keeping notches on the wall when they scored a point over the conservative parents. What it caused her to question as a teacher was the disproportionate power of a few parents within the whole educational setup of the school and the powerlessness of their daughters to seemingly do little but acquiesce. What was positive for Julia as an administrator was the supportive delegation of responsibilities by the Mercy principal.

\textbf{5.3.5 Administrators: Choices and Costs}

The Mercy principal, who was the first choice in the eyes of many local people and staff, became deputy to the male principal of the boys’ school when the Mercy girls’ school amalgamated with the local Catholic boys’ school to form a coeducational regional secondary college. In reflecting on the process of amalgamation and her role in the new administration team, Julia conceded that it was a rich learning experience but also highlighted how administrative positions can come at great personal cost. She offered strong descriptive images that were in stark contrast to her own perceptive, sensitive and person-centred approach to administration and the exercise of power:

\begin{quote}
Some of the male teachers from the boys’ school used to throw hand grenades down the corridor at each other…(Julia interview 26 Mar. 2001)
\end{quote}

The force and destruction inherent in such an image could glibly be described as a clash of male versus female approaches to administration, but her story points to fundamental differences in beliefs and practices about educational leadership and

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{34} Namely, Sisters of Mercy
\end{flushright}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{35} These were the turbulent days after the Second Vatican Council when changes were happening in the Catholic Church of the Roman tradition, including in the methods and content of religious education. Many people found the changes very hard to accept and continually ‘reported’ teachers to local Bishops and to the Pope.
\end{flushright}
professionalism. Such explosive forms of communication were in direct contrast, or perhaps a result of, the principal’s practice of writing notes rather than talking face to face with the other administrators and staff. This situation leered at the culture shock it caused for Julia mainly through its contentious and confrontational approach, and in response she took up the challenge to become more aware of her own strengths and weaknesses as an administrator.

Her subsequent appointment as a principal to another regional secondary school was accompanied by the ‘two options scenario’. On this occasion, Julia was the first choice but had to deal with a staff divided on the appointment, an experience that she found very difficult personally and a painful and gradual learning that you can’t please all of the people all of the time. It was also a period of satisfaction, learning the scope of administering a school, demonstrating her competencies and earning the recognition even of those on staff in the ‘doubting Thomas’ category. Perhaps her greatest realisation was that:

*I get a lot more satisfaction out of teaching than administration...I loved getting out into the school yard, taking extra supervision classes ...those things enabled me to know the students.* (Julia interview 30 June 2001)

5.3.6 The NDIE Classrooms and Beyond

Julia’s Pakistan story was deeply about her being a teacher and encompassed classroom teaching and learning moments as well as those spread far beyond any classroom situation. Teaching students at the BEd level was something she enjoyed and made practical as confirmed by the students themselves. While examples came from her experiences in a different cultural context, students were quick to make the transitions to the local scene and thus did the reverse teaching-learning process. One such incident that reaffirmed and challenged her as a teacher came from her encouragement of the students to critique the NDIE mission statement from their perspective. They ascertained that the words were not just on paper but were actually happening:

*Zakir found the community aspect was important to him as he worked with a community based school in Skardu and daily life at NDIE was teaching*
him how to work with and to understand differences among people. Patricia picked up on the word encourage and said that she wished schools were places where students were encouraged. At NDIE students were constantly being told to trust themselves, trust their abilities. For them, this was a whole new approach to the learning thing. (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

Students at NDIE were breaking free of the rote approach to learning that had been instilled in them throughout their previous 14 years of instruction at schools or university where either the textbook or teachers’ notes were copied and then learned by heart for written tests. Julia pinpointed a particular instance of the rapidity and ease with which students could revert to their old and trusted ways particularly at test time. The significance lay in how the incident was handled by both the student and Angela, the Australian Mercy supervising the exam. As Julia recalled:

The usual instructions were given to the students at the commencement of the test. They were not to ask questions of each other or the supervisors, nor were they to even look at each other. One student went to Angela who was supervising and asked for the answer to the question and received the response: ‘I’m sorry but you understand that I cannot give you help because it is an exam.’ Later the students expressed how annoyed she was at the time but later thought that both she and Angela had the opportunity to cheat but because Angela didn’t choose that option, hence the student didn’t cheat either. (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

While Angela’s action may have seemed very hard and uncaring at the time, her treatment of the student later bore no indication of the incident; she was her friendly self. In other words, the learning for the student was that there was a time for everything—being friendly and being strict. For Julia the professionalism with which she saw the Mercies acting in all their dealings at NDIE was important, even though that did not mean they always agreed with one another or blindly adopted a common approach to the learning-teaching interplay.

Julia recorded a qualitative difference in her teaching at the MEd level where she sought to develop in students skills to conceptualise a problem or educational situation and, through critical analysis and seeking of substantial and relevant information, address those issues whether in a classroom or other professional
settings. In evaluating her teaching experience with the NDIE MEd students, her estimation was weighted towards a mutual learning experience:

*I loved the intellectual and collegial aspect of the MEd teaching. It was something that I really got a lot out of as an educator as I learned just so much from the students’ insights as naturally they had much more insight into the local scene than I could ever have. The MEd area was a very fruitful learning experience for me.* (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

5.3.7 Change and Answerability

Classroom walls did not confine Julia when teachable moments presented themselves. These revealed an intense ability to rely on her self-wisdom and insight, seemingly attained through much internal reflection as well as an openness to learn from and in a situation that presented her with cultural challenges. Particularly where female students were concerned, a fine edge separated a decision to push them to make an independent decision and take responsibility for it or to move with the existing culture that expected women to defer to the choices made for them by the dominant males in their lives. Such were areas of cultural crunch. Julia was extremely conscious that the practical, independent ways the Australian Mercies at NDIE modelled in their personal and professional lives were in stark contrast to what the vast majority of the female students experienced in their homes, communities and educational settings.

Therefore, Julia saw that the Australian women carried a very delicate responsibility in terms of gently leading the female students into situations or experiences of independence and the implications for those young women in terms of having their lives changed, their visions broadened or seeing even the ordinary events of daily life differently. For most of them residing in the NDIE Women’s Hostel, taking responsibility for such things as going shopping in the bazaar for their needs whether for a new suit piece (*shalwar kameez*), study needs, household requirements or buying a train ticket was a completely new and sometimes difficult undertaking. This, combined with the constant encouragement throughout their studies to develop their critical thinking skills and to trust their self-expression, brought about key personal changes to varying degrees in each of the female students. Julia was
conscious of the resulting difficulty faced by a significant number of these young women who returned to their homes as changed persons. That meant moving from an environment where they could have an opinion and were encouraged to do so as the norm back into a situation where their father or brother or husband would still make decisions for them. How they coped with such was both a mystery and a concern for Julia and caused her to critically examine not just the meeting points of the two intertwining yet diverse cultures but the long and short-term effects of a directly Western influence on the self-belief and behaviour patterns of the graduates. Not all were negative outcomes. What gave her encouragement to continue to pursue this line of educating the whole person were stories such as Surrayia’s.

A particular incident arose after Julia chose to suspend five students (two males and three females) for an escapade involving a visit to the beach including a boating expedition during their teaching practicum. The parents of one of the girls, Surrayia, supported Julia’s action but also explained that:

*When Surrayia was in school, we lived across the road from the school. She walked across to school and she walked home. When she was in college, I drove her to college, I picked her up. She has never had any experience of having to make a decision or having to do anything like that on her own.*

(Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

At the end of the academic year, Surrayia reflected with Julia and some of her colleagues on how difficult it was going to be to leave friends and all they had shared throughout the year but the most difficult thing:

*Is going back to our parents and knowing that we have had these experiences of making decisions for ourselves which we won’t have much experience of doing there. And the other women in the group nodded in agreement.*

(Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

While such instances were both rewarding and challenging for Julia, they were also experiences that she found professionally difficult and personally hard. The crucial point related to discerning what changes were positive and helpful particularly for the women students when her own Western perspective was juxtaposed with the dominant cultural and religious perception of a woman’s role in South Asia. She was
left with a nagging question as to whether the encouragement to grow in independence was a positive factor in the women’s lives and regretted that she had not satisfactorily fulfilled what she saw as an obligation on NDIE’s part to give stronger personal and professional support to its graduates. She had greater confidence in those who had completed the MEd programme.

With three and a half years of study at NDIE, MEd students demonstrated that they were better able to assimilate a growth in personal and professional independence. Over 90 per cent of these graduates took up positions with leadership and innovation responsibilities in schools, colleges or education systems and had the confidence and competence to apply their knowledge and skills in an appropriate manner (see Fig. 8.2). Their abilities and growing professionalism were recognised by their employers and many colleagues but this has not always meant that their families understood or even supported these women and men in their growth. From Julia’s perspective, they were better able to cope with such types of situations than the BEd graduates, as the MEd students had a much longer gestation period at NDIE during which time they were encouraged and monitored not only in assimilating their learning but also in constructing their own knowledge and belief systems regarding education and its practices. Julia saw that while they were more able to approach their professional responsibilities with greater ease and confidence, they gained some of that confidence from ongoing contact with NDIE personnel. For some, the bonding with NDIE became stronger than those of the family, particularly amongst the women whose desire for higher education was largely misunderstood in their families where the belief and practice held women to basic, if any, education and home duties. For these women, their links with NDIE eased the aloneness and the suspicion they felt surrounded by in their homes and communities.

Julia recalls vividly the afternoon Saima arrived at NDIE, brandishing a letter from the chairman of the Board of the school system in which she was employed, saying, ‘I want you people to be the first to see this because my family don’t understand’ (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001). Saima had attained the highest possible grading in her MEd results from KU and had topped the NDIE group overall. The chairman acknowledged what she had done academically and how she was subsequently
contributing to the school community. Saima had struggled for what she had achieved, yet it all meant nothing to her family. She knew that at NDIE people would rejoice with her and understand what this recognition meant to her. For Julia, happenings such as these were what made her struggles and difficulties in administering NDIE worthwhile.

5.3.8 Transition Times

Both metaphorically and in reality, transition was a significant element in Julia’s story. Her transitions from teacher to administrator were highly significant as were her experiences of transition in institutions. The amalgamation of two schools marked her early teaching-administrator years while her time as director at NDIE marked a transition in the institute’s development as a local institution. This latter she experienced as both exciting and difficult. A particular incident concerned the change in the composition of the academic personnel. From a time when seven Australians comprised almost the entire teaching staff, the late 1999–2000 academic year saw these numbers reduced to four, and the pre-existing operational plan of introducing selected MEd graduates of the institute was enacted. Opposition reared its head amongst the NDIE students who did not believe that local people could teach as well as foreigners and therefore that the quality of the NDIE learning experience would be reduced. While she experienced this as personally painful, the wise guidance of Julia the teacher-administrator was evident for her recounting of events:

Naureen particularly was given a very hard time by the MEd students. She came to me and offered to resign but I told her I didn’t want her resignation but that we would work through it together. So I planned with her ...and by second semester there were no complaints. I really admire Naureen’s integrity and I think she’s come through as a better teacher for the experience. (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

Julia saw this particular transition period as crunch time for the Australian women in terms of not backing down to the wishes of the students and taking on extra teaching responsibilities. Julia worked with both the local and the Australian women to identify where the problems existed and address them. She saw this as a particularly significant testing time in the evolution of the institute.
Sometimes transitions in students’ lives slipped in almost unnoticed. She recalled an unsolicited letter she received from a graduate whom she placed in the bottom quartile in terms of ability to write and articulate his thoughts and ideas. After one year back in his school, he wrote to acknowledge how he had become a different person since his experience at NDIE:

*I would like to share with you my school experiences. When I joined my school I felt lot of changing in myself...My principal appreciates me and he gave me a chance to conduct some meetings for inexperienced teachers...I taught students how to make a model, especially in science. So I gave one date for little science and social studies exhibition...invited all the staff members and the principal and other classes. Students were able to explain their models. They used all different material...I am very happy and enjoying my teaching.* (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

He had felt the change within himself, others recognised it, some appreciated it and some criticised him for wasting his time in creating a learner-centred classroom, which has become well organised and managed. What Julia appreciated most was his strength to continue on his changed path and it came from sharing:

*... with each other, I mean all NDIE graduates who belong to Jhelum. So, if we have some difficulties then we can solve them.* (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

5.3.9 Being a Second Choice

I found that a second choice was both a haunting metaphor and recurring episode in Julia’s story, and its occurrence provided significant entry points into the NDIE segment of the story. Contact with Beatrice and subsequently a critique of the Pakistani education system, vis-à-vis the intervention being attempted by the NDIE project, provided Julia’s initial interest in the institute. Eventually her doctoral research investigated NDIE’s impact on teacher education (Schneider 1997) and she ventured on her first visit to Pakistan in response to Beatrice’s invitation to conduct a Principals’ Training Programme. Julia was both conscious of being Beatrice’s second choice as programme facilitator and sceptical about her abilities to do the task asked
in a country she did not know and with people whose culture was vastly different to her own. She acted on Beatrice’s stated belief that she could do the job.

By Julia’s second visit to Karachi some 18 months later, Beatrice’s health had deteriorated and the search for a new director was in hand. The first choice had been a retired academic from Australia but he found he could not live within the violence of Karachi city of the late 1990s. Julia was approached as the second choice. She felt strongly Beatrice’s expectation of an affirmative answer but her decision was couched within many questions that were not clearly answered even when Julia agreed to succeed Beatrice. For the first six months, Julia was co-director with Beatrice, a position that could never be one of equality given the experience, stature and prowess of Beatrice who had become well known in the local Karachi educational scene. For Julia:

> It was bit like saying yes to something that I wasn’t really sure about how it was going to pan out in practice. I applied for the position knowing full well that most probably no one else would be applying. I was thinking about what it would mean if I got the position and what would it mean if I didn’t. (Julia interview 24 Mar. 2001)

Returning to Karachi with a three-year work contract proved to be very different for Julia than her previous short-term visits, and Beatrice’s failing health meant that the ‘co’ part of being director would very soon disappear. Beatrice was a woman of high repute and charisma and Julia found establishing herself as the succeeding director a far from easy undertaking. Others, both inside and outside of the NDIE environment as well as Julia herself, constantly made comparisons between the two:

> Beatrice was such a gifted lady and I never want to not give that credit to her. But to establish who I was in all that was not an easy task. It was easier to establish my own person as a teacher rather than as an administrator and that is partly to do with who I am. I get a great deal of satisfaction from teaching. (Julia interview 30 June 2001)

Julia consciously chose her more natural path and established who she was as a teacher rather than as an administrator, for as a teacher she knew personally and professionally she was on a rich and secure ground. Her summary words are both
descriptors of herself and reflective of the Australian Mercies who have been part of the NDIE project:

*I think that so much in Pakistan is defined by what you are not. NDIE overarches that. I think that it has something to do with who we are as Australians, coming from a diverse cultural and religious nation. We have learned or are learning that there are other ways of defining who we are as people that are inclusive of difference.* (Julia interview 30 June 2001)

### 5.4 I Didn't Think of You People as Foreigners: Margaret’s Story

*You’re leaving? My God, I never even thought of you as foreigners! You’re just part of us. I don’t really think of you as being different.* (Lynette, pers. comm., 18 September 2001)

11 September 2001 was a defining moment in contemporary world history and many happenings and time periods are dated pre and post that event. It was likewise a central moment in my story as it unfolded a clarifying point in delineating my relationship with Pakistan and NDIE in particular. The aftermath in Pakistan caused me to question rationally and at the core of my self-belief and professional values what and why I was involved in teacher education on the grounds of a country viewed by the West as a perpetrator of terrorism. As Australian women we were seen at least by some NDIE graduates as part of the local fabric, yet my effectiveness as a self-assured educator began to look vulnerable against overwhelming criticisms of the Pakistani people as a nation and by implication, of the people amongst whom I had been working and collaborating. Therefore, the hinges on which my story opened out and closed inwards were important to name and explore in order to uncover their meaning within the actions and interactions that have become part of my NDIE story.

### 5.4.1 Opening Doorways to Pakistan

#### 5.4.1.1 Making Connections

*What have you been doing in Pakistan?* are the first Australian words I hear addressed to me each time I arrive in Australia. Immigration officers are trained to ask questions and, while the text remains consistent, the intonations vary amongst
disbelief, eyebrow-raised suspicion, interest, astonishment and disinterest. Why are you going to Pakistan? is the related exit motif.

My story pivoted around the very same questions asked in both the present and the past tense. The fact that the current episode of my life story has been unfolding in Pakistan happened via a circuitous journey.

The photos depicted in Figures 1.1–2.7 frame snippets of people and life in Karachi. They indicate captured moments of the overt reality but also depict symbols of the hidden life as lived in that city. Language may attach its symbols to the photographs through such descriptors as:

- poverty;
- happiness;
- locals and foreigners;
- colonialism;
- friendship;
- collaboration; and
- postcolonialism.

Photographs have a language, too, that tells stories way beyond the captured moments in time. The product of the lens has no control over the insights gained by those who look at them. For me they bear tangential messages and meanings. At face value, they captured aspects of my workplace that were pragmatically about enabling better schooling for children through education and training of good teachers. But pragmatism was not the only viewpoint. Professional satisfaction had its place along with adventure, social contribution, self-fulfilment and its co-partner, self-transcendence, as elements of my story that have been guided and challenged by a statement of life direction of the Sisters of Mercy, Australia.

The first Sisters of Mercy heard the missionary call inherent in our vocation and in response crossed the oceans and the continents. Likewise:
In the current times, there is an urgent need to respond to the worldwide movement of God’s Spirit towards reconciling and embracing difference, replacing fear with hope, suspicion with trust, violence with peace. (ISMA Chapter 2006)

I hold that ideals can become inanimate literary symbols, captured in black and white on a page. Examples of the simple statements and queries Beatrice posed to me prior to her setting out for Pakistan in 1991, such as ‘What do you do?’ ‘We could use those skills’ and ‘Have you thought of coming to Pakistan?’ redirected my encounter with Mercy directional statements. My response to this probing has long superseded the questions. I judged the passage of two decades an appropriate expanse of time from which to examine if the efforts of Australian women for teacher education have made a difference observable in NDIE graduates as they articulated their own theory and practice of teaching and educating.

5.4.1.2 Not Even Imagination...

…could put Pakistan into my view of future life when I became a member of the Sisters of Mercy in the latter half of the 1960s. The foreseeable geographical horizons of my future life covered the south and west of Queensland, with an adventurous possibility of Papua New Guinea. The work choices reached into the domains of education, healthcare and social services. Personal choice among these options was limited and subservient to the superior’s own gleaned knowledge of the needs of the congregation as well as the potential she judged to be in the individual young Mercy. Hence, secondary school teaching became the path that would take me into a future.

The religious and cultural domains within which this scene was being played out were clearly and thickly Catholic. For me, a worthy aim to set for life was to teach largely Catholic children in Catholic schools in order to turn out well-educated and good future Australians. Social outreach into homes, hospitals, prisons and into the lives of people shunned by society was the expected extension of the work beyond the confines of the classroom. My interpretation of these initial tent pegs supporting the framework of my adult life has vastly changed in the course of the past 40 years.
My belief in education as an agency to bring personal and societal change as well as my being tangibly involved in the lives of people in need has remained a constant.

5.4.1.3 Cultural and Colour Differences

People with black or coloured skin were always part of my environment as Australia’s first people lived on our street, were my classmates and worked with my father. Moreover, Chinese market gardeners stretched along the nearby river bank. My other notion of people who had black skin was learned in the context of Catholic missions. White missionaries left their homelands to go to countries such as Africa, the Pacific Islands and Papua New Guinea to convert the pagan people. At school, all the students were encouraged to help this process by giving donations to the missions—each of my pennies could help towards the conversion, welfare and education of a black child. We each could even ‘buy’ a black baby and sponsor his/her education and healthcare.

The 1960s–1970s movement of Martin Luther King challenged the accuracy of the information and attitudes I had assimilated over the years. I came to realise that skin colour did not make people better or less than each other and that people with coloured skin had their own cultures, beliefs, spirituality and social organisation, but they had also been shamefully treated by many white colonisers or masters and mistresses. Along with Australia, the subcontinent was another example of White colonial domination of indigenous peoples with coloured skins.

5.4.2 Looking Inside

5.4.2.1 Being Majority to Being Minority

From within the secure status and familiar background of a white, Northern position in sociological terms, my arrival in Pakistan changed my standing to that of a member of a minority people in a country of the South. To be a white, Western, Christian woman in a coloured, eastern, Islamic country was to experience prejudice from the minority and violent positions. To choose to remain in this state and circumstance required my constant reflexivity in order to plot the steps of a journey
from a starting point of helping the black babies to being in partnership with local Pakistani people in an educational endeavour. The dynamics of the partnership were like a hanging mobile of many parts that needed to be strategically positioned and repositioned not only to catch the gentle breezes, which produce harmonious tones, but also for the buffeting gales, which while producing discordant sounds did not destroy the mobile. In fact, it established a partnership where joint learning happened across skin colours, religion, culture and sociological and economic delineations.

5.4.2.2 Learning to Belong

Psychology purports that home is the comfortable place where individuals are able to live with themselves, but I have found the geographical location of home to be an equally important human factor. A sense of belonging cannot simply be esoteric but needs to be grounded in a social reality (Mason 2000). My home became both a here and a there, depending on my geographical location in either Pakistan or Australia. I found worth in exploring what allowed me to feel at home in Pakistan where the odds seemed to point against such a sense of being.

Ethnically, I can never be Pakistani. The culture will forever have an element of being ‘foreign’. Socially, I will always be part of the caste-less minority; religiously my status is infidel and morally I remain Western. Yet, I have grown into a sense of affiliation with the people and the country’s struggles. In Australia, I remain part of the majority Caucasian population of the relatively classless society, with all the freedoms operative in a society functioning democratically. Family, friends and a sense of belonging to the land of my birth have fed my claim to Australia as home, the place of belonging and rooted ties.

These vastly contrasting home fronts have also reflected a postcolonial existence. In Australia, I have fought to shake off the shackles of being a British colonial. As an Australian in Pakistan, I walked the fine line of being categorised as a coloniser yet, personally and collectively with my Pakistani and Australian companions, endeavoured to operate out of an educationally formative process that allowed the voice of the local people, the subaltern, to speak, act and be heard. As broken open
earlier in my thesis, the notion of ‘subaltern’, as Spivak has defined it and others have nuanced (Spivak 1987, 1988, 1993; Guha 1992; Trinh 1989) has been a stop and listen challenge in my life. It proved to be a significant entry point into a reflexive encounter with my professional and personal story.

5.4.2.3 Being Learner and Teacher

My life as a teacher in one sense just happened. Childhood dreams of being a pathologist, microbiologist or pharmacist faded in my formation years as a Mercy, when I was sent to university to begin my studies and training for secondary school teaching. A choice made for me? Yes. A choice I grew into? Yes. Whatever the initial impetus, teaching became an expedient choice and one that I owned for myself partly through study opportunities requested or offered, but mostly through my experiences as a teacher. I recognised that it was the commitment to being educated and an educator that pushed my boundaries of operation to far sides of the world—way beyond my initial visions of spending the rest of my life teaching and administering in schools across southern and western Queensland.

Educational and personal choices took me to Pakistan in the 1990s and have kept me there for the past 16 years. Appropriate or wise choices? Perhaps. But they have been driven by the massive sociological, personal, educational and religious experiences of change that became the essence of my personal life and professional experience. My constant and persistent challenge in teaching and administering at NDIE was to remain open to learning from and with the local people and environment while simultaneously not limited to horizons that remained localised. For example, ‘but we don’t/can’t do that in Pakistan’ is a strongly stated position I frequently encountered in the classroom, in teacher meetings and other educational settings. My response, so often tinged with frustration and echoing that of Beatrice before me, was always, ‘but will you try it?’ In such an effort was housed the daring of local educators to do something new or different from the entrenched, traditional patterns and so take more personal responsibility for the management of the teaching-learning interplay in a local classroom.
5.4.3 The Doorway Opening Outwards

5.4.3.1 Crossing Paths: Black Babies to Learning Partners

As my schooling process began in the mid-1950s, it bore the general characteristics of primary schooling of that era, namely, a teacher-directed classroom, memory and rote work and textbook-focused content. Rewards and punishments were the motivational forces for achievement and, to my mind, the teacher was an authority on all areas needing wisdom whether in content or in code of conduct. This scenario breathed in a somewhat similar pattern to the NDIE students’ stories and what I experienced as reality in Pakistan’s 1990s–2010 classrooms at school and university levels. Because of this commonality, I recognised but also at times too easily thought I understood the local situation only to miss fundamental differences between the circumstances, which span 40 years of vastly different social, economic and cultural experiences. My school teachers initially skilled me in such things as mental maths and logical thinking and drilled me in Greek and Latin roots. Simultaneously, they demonstrated the use of these skills as learning tools and eventually taught me to seek out and express my own answers. These latter two steps in the evolution of my educational process have not yet been accomplished amongst more than 90 per cent of the students who seek admission to NDIE. This reality was what I endeavoured to redress with the students rather than simply lament their poor quality of education and apportion blame on their former teachers.

5.4.3.2 Transition Paths

There were NDIE episodes that imaged for me the transitional process in action, from students’ reliance on copying from books and other resource materials to trusting their own abilities to locate, comprehend and use information to craft their own expressions of knowledge in written, oral or other expressive forms. These images captured the enjoyment of the learning processes, tears of frustration and stubborn determination and successful and challenging learning-teaching interactions among students and staff. Some episodes, spread over my years in Pakistan, caught or even demanded my attention time after time. I found in them a deeper significance, a hearing for the first time the sound or nuance of the voice recorded on
the pages of my journal or in the inner ear of my memory, a need to let go of events and happenings—a humbling experience in Holly’s (2002) words. Fractured as these experiences appeared, their positioning in relation to each other was part of the historicity of my coming to understand and respond to the MEd students within the thick culture of their educational milieu. I had to do this in order to facilitate the evolution of their abilities to use their higher order thinking skills and creativity in choosing their language and other modes of expressing their insights and learning. My initial three years at NDIE found me feeling still as a newcomer and somewhat floundering in my teaching as I questioned and debated my approaches with the students. As I recall:

*Bruce (staff) told me that he met Nadia (MEd student) crossing the quadrangle this evening, tears streaming down her cheeks ... She’d just met with me regarding her Individual Literature Study and recounted that I’d told her she had to write the whole b...section again. Nadia has spent all her summer holidays writing these chapters and now she sees that it’s all wrong. She said she’s sick of it and of me telling her to rewrite. Bruce was laughing as he knows the hard work it is for both the students and their mentors...I hope I’m right in pushing her as she is now showing in her conversation a movement to a new level of understanding and analysis of the materials and not just regurgitating the words of authors. (Margaret Journal, September 29, 1998)*

*All passed their viva voce for the Individual Literature Studies - relief! Zubaida got there! She still struggles to write comprehensively but is so convincing orally. Beatrice and I shed a few tears with Nusrat’s results. She has accomplished so much in 3 years! (Margaret Journal November 11, 1998)*

*I nearly lost it tonight. I just wanted to tell Sujida I can no longer deal with her work. After all these months and re-writes and still I hardly understand what she’s written....I miss the others [Australians] being here. There’s no one to let off steam to...Yet Sujida says she will do it all again! Her determination versus my frustration and patience! ...I hope all this makes them good educators! Are we pushing them too much? Creating unnecessary tension? Do we expect too much – in language, comprehension, critical reflection, making connections... (Margaret Journal July 18, 1999)*

While these stories marked the struggles and achievements of the students they also indicated my tussles between wanting to see the students appreciate their abilities, stretch their learning capacities and skills and the enormous stress and workload this
placed on the majority of them as well as on me as their teacher. I felt the niggling question regarding how both consciously and unconsciously I exercised my power as a teacher in the learning partnership amongst students who still overwhelmingly displayed their traditional and cultural respect for a teacher by doing my bidding no matter how impossible it seemed for them. Behind this type of behaviour was a commonly held belief in Pakistan that ‘foreign’ was far better than ‘local’ so that what we Australians said and required of the students in their studies was what they should do. I learned to acknowledge this as the dance of power and powerlessness but found the students’ lack of background knowledge coupled with the profound respect to do what I asked also rendered me powerless to read with a confident accuracy the directions that perhaps they would prefer to take in their learning processes. Reassuring voices also spoke against my doubts as students broke through the challenges and recognised their achievements and while my questions remained regarding the journey. Shirin and Catharine recorded struggle and delight as learning partners:

_We recently got over the graduate professional experience (GPE) ...It was a mammoth task of searching literature, meeting people, planning and implementing the four workshops... I could see myself grow from the workshops I did on personality and intelligence._ (Shirin email 2 May 2000)

_He (Dr Guy 36) met with Farah Noreen and Aysha re the GPE workshops they had done...(he) was more than impressed by...the two of them who spoke up like professionals._ (Catharine email 2 June 2000)

Pithy vignettes of the pen and electronic mail these above examples may be, yet they were for me powerful informants of my learning along with that of the MEd students. They gave me insight into the depth of the students’ struggles to participate in the NDIE form of education that pulled and pushed and enticed them to change from rote learners with shallow content information to articulate constructors of their own knowledge. The strength of their struggle along the way was not something I always appreciated fully as with them I tried to keep the end goal of their studies in sight. My teaching practices, though bread and butter stuff in the Australian scene, were

36 Dr Guy Theriere is President of the International Federation of Catholic Universities, an organization that sponsored NDIE to undertake Drug Education Research and Community Development action amongst two drug-affected busties in Karachi from 1992 to 2005.
catapulting the NDIE students across fundamental stages in the development of learning. Such things, like my insistence that students consult more than one author on a topic and then speak and write their informed position in their own words, were akin to stripping them bare in front of me and their colleagues as their final pieces of work were presented. Hence, the Sujidas and the Nadias continuously challenged my skills as a teacher and reinforced my need to learn and relearn to wait for the teachable moments and the instances when thinking, synthesis, self-expression and self-confidence overcome the long engrained practices and thick local culture of copying and rote learning.

5.4.4 Partnerships: Joint Learning

5.4.4.1 ‘We Cannot Guarantee Your Safety’: An Incident Most Critical

I took the dreaded phone call at 4 pm in the evening. Neither the Pakistani nor the Australian Government could guarantee our safety. We three Australian Mercies had to leave Pakistan immediately. The events in the US on 11 September 2001 caused dramatic upheavals around the world. The battle lines of suspicion and accusation were drawn between what was perceived as the Christian West and the Muslim Arab worlds. Afghanistan and Pakistan had fluid borders and became the epicentre of the terrorist originating activities. All white skins in Pakistan were labelled as Americans and Christians. The long-enjoyed relatively high degree of popularity of the cricket-loving Australians amongst the Pakistani people had ended abruptly. We had to go!

Throughout eight long days and nights I anticipated that foreigners would be ordered to leave the country and for our security we had not been able to leave the NDIE campus. Many people knew that foreigners were on the site and that in itself posed danger for others as well as ourselves. The institute functioned on as many days as it was safe for students and staff to move around the city. During these limbo days, I put in place contingency plans for the operation of the institute as, while our hopes were otherwise, all indications were that we would have to leave and once we did, there was no way of judging when we would be able to return. Apart from its High Commission evacuating its own staff, there was no assistance for Australian citizens to leave the country.
The month of September was relatively early in the academic calendar of the northern hemisphere. The BEd students commenced their course in early August and the MEds at the beginning of September. I was determined that even though the three Australians had full teaching loads, our leaving would not be sufficient reason for interrupting the academic programme. To find teachers to stand in front of classes probably would not have been too difficult an operation. But ensuring the quality of the work as well as the continuance of the NDIE approach to learning and teaching was not so easy a task. The faculty members and I developed a possible plan of action, part of which was compiling a list of NDIE graduates who were highly competent in their fields and who could perhaps help out. With all telecommunications systems in disarray, making the contacts proved challenging.

The first graduate successfully contacted was Lynette and I was taken aback by her response:

You’re leaving? My God, I never even thought of you as foreigners! You’re just part of us. I don’t really think of you as being different. (Lynette telephone 16 Sept. 2001)

In the midst of all that was happening, I so treasured her paradoxical response. Along with making herself available to help out, she was instrumental in the word moving like wild fire to other graduates. In what seemed next to no time, we had competent teachers in place and many other graduates offering to come to do extra work with the students and to support the young faculty we were leaving behind—young in the sense years of experience in teaching at a tertiary level.

5.4.4.3 Caught in a Network of Friends

I had an additional personal dread that I was carrying during these days. On 10 September, I had submitted my passport to the Pakistani Visa Office for the stamp of my renewed visa. I had no papers! All government offices were closed and no date...
for the resumption of work was forthcoming. I could not stay in the country, yet I could neither go! In response, friends from the Muslim community offered to give me refuge in their homes, risking their own safety. Others assisted in securing three seats on the only available commercial airline still operating in and out of the country. Against all odds, a friend who had government contacts managed to get my passport and visa released.

5.4.4.4 Closed Airspace

With extremely mixed feelings, tickets and passports in hand, we prepared to leave the campus for the airport. I felt like a stubbornly strong and healthy tooth being forcedly extracted from its rightful place in the gum. Akin to three burkered ghosts and taking only hand luggage we sat, along with four burly armed bodyguards, in the van that took us to the airport under the cover of darkness and via a tortuous route. Closed airspace was all that the airport could offer us that night and it was 24 hours later that the airspace was opened long enough to allow the last commercial airline to fly in and out of Karachi.

It was a long journey to travel as hearts, not luggage, provided the excess weight. For me it was a torturous journey. I was going where I did not want to go: away from Pakistan, NDIE, students, colleagues, friends and all that made up life in Karachi. I was where I did not want to be: flying across the world at 37,000 feet so soon after a horrendous form of terrorism had been released in the air.

5.4.5 Doorways of Uncertainty—Home but not ‘At Home’: Making Meaning

After three weeks in Australia feeling like a displaced person, it was time for my Pakistani companions and me to revisit the situation. The invasion of Afghanistan was well underway. I had confidence in my level of ability to read and know Karachi and its ways and I was in possession of up-to-date information constantly being fed to me by the NDIE staff. Intuitively, I knew it was timely to begin to plan the return journey. While it was a decision that most family, friends and Mercy congregational leaders did not cherish, they respected the position we held and the actions we were
taking. After the air tickets were booked and confirmed, one of my closest friends commented: You have come alive again! (Margaret journal 26 Oct. 2001).

I was acutely aware that the epicentre of my sense of belonging had shifted at this time and it had little to do with nationality. The partnership that had been formed over the years between Pakistanis and Australians was much deeper than doing a job that was the provision of education for teachers. It had moved both consciously and with its own momentum into a sharing of life and its gamut of events evidenced in an interdependence that was not just professional but also personal. I realised I had consciously chosen to stand beside Pakistani men and women in the realities of their local environment and their image on the world stage. This was not because I wanted to do good but because we had become part of each others’ lives in the midst of our similarities and our differences, and we had managed to learn with and from each and to accept each other.

5.4.6 Shared Authority: Here Are the Keys!

The route back to Pakistan was long and circuitous, almost circling the globe until eventually Catharine and I reached Bahrain and the almost empty aircraft bravely ventured into Karachi. Relief that we had arrived and were safely back within the NDIE campus was matched only by the welcomes we received by staff and students and our eagerness to settle into as regular a daily pattern as soon as possible.

Most significant for me was the exchanging of the keys of the institute. As I left for Australia, I placed them with every confidence, assurance and all that they signified into the hands of our most experienced full-time faculty member, Shahida. She had been a faculty member for 14 months and was a BEd-MEd graduate of the institute. With some relief from her perspective, she handed the keys back to me. I received with a knowing in my heart and a professional cognisance that she and her colleagues were competent, tertiary educators. In the most trying of circumstances, Shahida and her NDIE MEd and BEd graduate colleagues demonstrated some of the fruits of the learning-teaching interplay and preparation for educational leadership.
that was at the core of NDIE’s existence and the collaborative presence of Australian women.

5.4.7 Reflecting the Future

I judged the significance of the events surrounding the evacuation of the Australians from NDIE to lay in its projection of an image of the institute of the future. While the circumstances were exceptional and the time period relatively short, the existence of local foundational elements demonstrated their presence. Primarily, the existence of NDIE into the future was important to the graduates. They did not want the NDIE approach to teacher education to falter because of the absence of Australian women, a factor, I argue, that emerged from their experiences both as students and in their professional lives as graduates. Their sense of belonging to the institute way beyond the duration of their course of studies became coupled with an acceptance of the part they needed to play for its continuance. By their actions, graduates placed a positive value on NDIE and what it was becoming. The years of partnership now demonstrated a joint learning.

I contend that a sense of partnership between the Australian women and Pakistanis travelled well beyond the students and staff of NDIE. Both Julia and I found significance in Angela’s recounting of a wedding she had attended in Karachi where a well-heeled lady was astounded that Angela did not know and socialise amongst the foreign executives and general managers of the multinational companies. Angela’s response was that ‘well, most of our friends are Pakistani’ (Julia interview 30 June 2001). As Australian women, we became friends and colleagues of many Pakistanis and I contend that this has become a further example of our partnership as those with whom we fraternise mirrors who we are as educators. In Chapter 6, I have broken open the reflected insights of the MEd graduates on NDIE’s experienced learning, teaching and professional practices are presented and have provided an alternate perspective on the contribution of the Australian women educators.
Chapter 6: Being a Teacher Produces Generations of Teachers

6.1 The Storytellers

Over 90 per cent of the graduates of the NDIE MEd programme have also completed their BEd-IGCE studies at the institute; hence, they have had an association with NDIE for a minimum period of three and a half years. For many of the MEd graduates, the association has been longer depending on when they commenced their MEd Preliminary course and whether or not they deferred their studies at any time. Deferment is not so unusual for a year or two in order to work and gather finances to support them during the full-time final year of their studies.

The following stories of the three MEd graduates were reflections on the journeys that lead them to NDIE and the impact of its experiences on their professional competencies as well as their development as young adults and educators.

The three graduates came from very different backgrounds in terms of their ethnicity, culture and religion and the geographical location of their homes. Khadija’s home was situated in the Karakoram (black gravel) Mountain Range in the Northern Areas\(^\text{37}\) of the country. This is the most heavily glaciated part of the world outside the Polar Regions. Her isolated village is picturesque and situated on the banks of the Gilgit River, and most of the families are self-sufficient from the produce of their land. Her religious-cultural life is that of an Ismaili, a more liberal branch within the Shia tradition of Islam.

Nasir was a young Punjabi Christian man from an agricultural family whose home was situated in the north-western section of Punjab in the fertile valley of the Jhelum River, close to the Pakistan border with the disputed territories of Jammu and

\(^{37}\) Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA, FANA) commonly known as the Northern Areas of Pakistan.
Kashmir. While the majority of the Christian population in Pakistan is Punjabi, they are still largely a poor and illiterate section of the population. Most of them are descendants of Hindu converts to Christianity well before partition. Alice was one of four girls belonging to a Christian family of Goan-Portugese heritage. The leadership amongst the Christians in Pakistan has traditionally been from amongst the Goans who are well educated, English speaking and more economically secure. The majority of the teachers in the missionary schools\textsuperscript{38} of the subcontinent both pre- and post-partition were from the Goan community who were also well represented in the professions, the business community and civic leadership particularly in Karachi, the first capital of the partitioned Pakistan. Many Christians opted for Pakistan as a homeland in 1947 as it was to be a nation for the Muslim majority but a place where people of all religious faiths would have equal citizenship and be able to worship freely. The ideal and the reality have not as yet become one, and many from the minorities’ groups struggle for their very existence in their villages, their places of work and worship and in the Courts of Pakistan (Kushi 2010).

\textbf{6.2 The NDIE Connection}

The narrative that emerged from the stories told by the three graduates was characterised by unique experiences and insights as well as common themes of a development of self-efficacy and leadership abilities, a growing autonomy in learning and professional life and an expression of power in daring or risking to do what was different, thus inviting both collaboration and vulnerability into their personal and professional lives. Khadija was a pioneer and took risks to follow her beliefs about education and women and to go where other women in her community had not dared to venture. Nasir’s belief in himself and his abilities were tested through his educational experiences at NDIE but he was able to isolate his points of challenge through which he chose to grow and eventually appreciate the changes that occurred in him. For Alice, the value of her experiences at NDIE lay within and

\textsuperscript{38} A number of religious congregations, both men and women, as well as the English Grammar Schools came from Europe, England and Ireland, primarily to educate and cater to the faith needs of the families of the British soldiers and British East India Company. The schools thus established were termed ‘missionary’, a nomenclature that persists in current Pakistani society.
beyond intellectual challenge. For her, an unbreakable bond was woven between the people, the spirit of the institute and herself.

6.3 A Bold Girl: Khadija’s Story

The spinning of the educational web was begun by the wisdom and daring of her father many years before it eventually drew Khadija to NDIE. She began her story:

My father was an elder in our village and an enlightened man. As a little girl my cousins and I were the first girls in the village to attend primary school. At the beginning of the 1980s, His Highness the Prince Aga Khan was telling our people that they must educate the girls as well as the boys. People came to our village offering scholarships for girls to do middle and secondary education but as there were no girls’ schools in the whole district, the scholarships were for schools in Karachi. To set a good example for the people, my father sent me off to begin year 6. I was 11 years old. I then did my FSc\textsuperscript{39} and BSc from Hyderabad, living in a Hostel there. (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)

Her father’s dream was for Khadija to be a doctor but her independence of thought and ability to make her own decisions took her in another direction. The provocative threads of advice from her college teacher spun Khadija’s thinking in another direction:

He told me that if I became a doctor I would just be of service to the community, but if I became a teacher, I would produce many generations of teachers. And so this idea really impressed me and I started to think about becoming a teacher and what could be its benefits and what impact that could have on the society in general. While he gave me that direction, afterwards it was my own thinking that convinced me that I could help my community through teaching and produce many teachers, engineers, doctors, educated mothers and many other good citizens. (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)

The daring resolve of a young Pakistani woman setting out on a path not determined by her father’s wishes was an indicator of the strength of character and sense of mission that characterised Khadija. Her clarity of purpose was met by her father’s

\textsuperscript{39} FSc is the equivalent of the Year 12 Australian Higher Secondary School Certificate in the science stream.
wisdom and support, responses that were not always forthcoming from others within her community in her initial years as an educator.

6.3.1 One of the Best Teachers—But…

On the completion of her Bachelor of Science Degree (BSc), Khadija returned to her village of Sher Quila where the AKES-P appointed her as a teacher at the Girls’ English Medium School, one of the many established in the Northern Areas during the 1980s as a result of the Diamond Jubilee celebrations. The girls liked the way she taught, which comprised her regurgitation of all that she knew from the textbook and her encouragement of their learning of answers to ensure their confidence in passing their examinations. Khadija believed she was one of the best kinds of teachers. Her belief changed later and her time at NDIE was the vehicle of that change as she recounts:

*But then I went to NDIE and it was different. Now I don’t say that is good teaching. Now I don’t think that way. I always say now that I am in a learning condition; that I still have to learn a lot.* (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)

The school principal at the time, a British lady, actively endeavoured to promote a career path in education for local women so that they could take over the responsibilities for the schools and the educational development in their own geographical areas. Khadija grasped at the possibility and requested that AKES send her for teacher training as she could not afford it herself. Her principal suggested she apply to NDIE.

6.3.2 Self-Belief and Doubt

The fact that NDIE was an English medium institution was daunting for Khadija. English was her fifth language and her command of it was elementary. She

---

40 The Jubilees of Sir Sultan Mahomed Shah, Aga Khan III are well remembered. During his 72 years of Imamat (1885–1957), Diamond Jubilee Schools for girls were established throughout the remote Northern Areas of Pakistan. In addition, scholarship programmes, established at the time of the Golden Jubilee to give assistance to needy students, were progressively expanded.
acknowledged that it would be tough but she took courage and her determination convinced her that she would manage. There were also local detractors regarding her decision, as she recounted:

*Some people thought that I shouldn’t be going away from the village again and that I should stay home to get married. I suppose I was a bold and daring girl for even thinking about this; but my father supported me. He could see what I wanted to do for the village and it was also what he wanted for the people.* (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)

### 6.3.3 Climbing Over Big Mountains

As a woman born and bred in the rugged mountainous area surrounded by the Hindu Kush and the Karakorham and Himalayan Ranges, Khadija intuitively described her journey though NDIE like having a big mountain to climb. Well she knew the foolishness of starting out to climb in such unrelenting territory *unless you have enough in yourself to climb over it.* Her self-reliance was at times buffeted by self-doubt in her abilities to cope with the academic and social challenges presented to her. Yet her focus held firm or in her words:

*If you start thinking from the beginning, ‘I can’t climb!’ then it doesn’t work. For me it was a really big mountain and at first I was resisting as I didn’t have enough confidence in myself. But then I took myself in hand and ...it went.* (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)

Her inner determination, her boldness brought her through.

### 6.3.4 Encountering the Learning Gradient

Her schooling experiences as both a student and a teacher were focussed on rote learning and textbook knowledge; therefore, the NDIE learning and teaching approaches, which she encountered from her first days of classes, gave her an inkling of what the journey was going to entail. She felt a lack of proficiency in both spoken and written English and this underpinned her academic work and social interaction. She was the first student from the Northern Areas to attend NDIE, which meant her English accent was also new to both staff and other students. To speak in front of
either a small or the large group was almost too much for her so she initially settled into a ‘silent but active listener’ pattern, paying attention to how others constructed and used the language, which she practised by herself or with the help of one of the Australian women.

Writing even small assigned tasks in her words was an enormous hurdle. She had never been taught to study something, analyse it and write using her own construct. Her acquired assignment writing habit was to copy out unacknowledged passages from text books knowing that such would ensure a high 90s percentage mark. Gradually she began to write and put to academic use in a disciplined way the keenly analytic mind that was so much part of her ‘boldness’ and personal decision-making processes and acknowledged that she could not have achieved this initial step without the individual assistance given to her by the Australian women. Though her NDIE teachers would say differently, Khadija rated herself as struggling throughout her BEd and MEd studies to produce written texts that she judged to be up to the NDIE standard, primarily because of the necessary use of English medium. This uncertainty shadowed her to the last weeks of her MEd course and the finalisation of her research thesis and reports. She held in tension the expectations she imposed on herself to perform well along with those she believed were held by her sponsors and teachers.

Methods of learning, ways of addressing staff and interaction with other students each posed social challenges for Khadija who found herself in the midst of a clash of cultural mores. She recalled vividly the impact of the social climate she encountered on arrival at NDIE:

Students and staff addressed each other by their names (given) seemed disrespectful. Men and women mingling with each other was almost shocking and so very hard and not only for me but for others, too. In my culture, the ladies are always kept away from the men and there is a vast difference between what they do and say and how they behave. I had never really talked to men socially except for the members of my family. Therefore I always tried to keep away from social gatherings and never went into crowds, especially where there were lots of men. (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)
Some of the NDIE practices that strongly reflected an Australian version of Western educational approaches and social culture exacerbated this difficulty for Khadija. A learner-centred approach in the classrooms frequently employed the use of cooperative learning groups of mixed abilities and gender. In these situations, Khadija confronted not only her lack of English language fluency but also her capacity to deal with personal uncomfortableness and the seeming impropriety of the gender mix of the groups. The persistent strength of her inner drive coupled with the need to save face before family, employers and detractors urged her on to try to master the things of which she was afraid and believed were well beyond her capacity. When she entered her story reflexively, she named these conquered challenges as great gifts. Academically she grew more confident and competent in thought, oral and written English expression, and socially she learned the skill of dealing with a variety of people, as she recorded:

As a principal now, I have to deal with a number of people ...I never think about that it’s a man or a woman but I can just treat everybody as a person. I feel very confident and that was not in my life before I went to Notre Dame. (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)

6.3.5 The MEd Experience

‘Sister Beatrice trusted me and offered me a place in the first NDIE MEd group’ (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001). The incident recalled in these words was highly significant yet haunting for Khadija as, throughout the initial months of the course, she spent her time thinking that she could not do it. The encouragement for her to persevere through to the final year of the programme had to come from outside, through her class colleagues and the Australian teachers. The latter particularly continued to see the academic gifts and abilities that Khadija was not able to recognise in herself. A critical ledge near the summit of her climb over the MEd mountain presented itself when she went with her class fellows to Multan for a segment of the Graduate Professional Experience (GPE) Unit. This ledge provided

41 Multan is a large city in the north-west of the Punjab Province.
42 This field-based unit is a process of practical induction into a set of roles pertaining to the teacher as leader and facilitator of peer professional development within the educational sphere.
a decisive period in Khadija’s inner debate on self-belief in her academic abilities and her sense of agency or capability as a teacher and educator. Others saw her as a competent colleague, student and potential educational leader and attempted to confirm these in her while she stood unconvinced at the core of her being. Self-doubts presented themselves in hordes during the GPE preparation time:

All I could think of was that I was going to be standing in front of a group of people who were the leaders in Catholic Schools; they would most probably all have lots of experience. What would I have to give them? How could I even talk to them? (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)

The 20 days of the Multan programme proved to be taxing and exciting for both the NDIE faculty and the MEd students who worked in pairs to conduct evening workshops enabling the participants in the leadership programme to participate in each of the workshops on a rotational basis. The security of working in a pair, daily critical reflection on her performance by individual and group, learning from reflections of other MEd students regarding their workshops and gaining feedback from the participants became a catalyst in Khadija’s belief and appreciation of her ongoing achievements. She returned to Karachi a different person, a different student and in contrast to her anticipated fears and self-doubts regarding the GPE, her story recounts:

Multan really was a wonderful learning experience as the workshops were based on our own Action Research. But it was more than that. It was learning how to apply theory to the practice of education and how to work with our peers as well as with more senior educators. That really frightened me at the beginning but I came to a realisation of how much I did know and could contribute in such a professional setting. (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)

6.3.6 Home Experiences: Returning with One Dream Fulfilled

Khadija did have enough in herself to complete the educational, personal and social climb she began the day she entered NDIE. With relief, with much sadness in leaving the people who had become her colleagues and friends, with educational degrees in hand but with little self-appreciative acknowledgement of what she had accomplished, Khadija returned to the Northern Areas after three and a half years at
NDIE. A build-up of expectations confronted her in the North. Her family, particularly her father, was proud of her achievements but understood little of the immense struggle she had undergone. She was the first person to return from Karachi with Masters’ qualifications from KU and ACU, and her AKES-P employers planned and anticipated the manner in which she would contribute to their strategy for teacher development in the district. But Khadija presented her bold self. She was confident that she knew where her most valuable contribution could be made and also that she had gone away for studies with a particular purpose. Therefore, she took her own stand:

AKES-P wanted me to work in the central office but I did not want that. My intention was always to go back to my village and work for the people there and to show that local women were capable of getting admission to good educational institutions, of achieving their goals and then contributing to the development of the local children. (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)

And so Khadija returned to Sher Quila and the Girls’ Secondary School to resume her position as a Maths and Science teacher.

6.3.7 A Shocking Experience

After her second return from NDIE, the classroom was a completely different place for Khadija as she set about applying her insights into the learning-teaching processes and creating a learner-friendly environment. She wanted her students to do learning at school and so she encouraged them to write in their own words, using non-textbook vocabulary, work in groups, prepare small investigative projects and present their work in class in a variety of ways. The progress the students were making delighted Khadija, as her focus was on giving the girls learning skills that they could use for the rest of their lives. Her intentions no way prepared her for the students’ outright rejection of her approach. With the backing of both parents and the acting principal, the girls informed her that ‘they should not be doing all this ‘extra’ work in class and she should just focus on the Board Exam papers’ (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001). This meant for Khadija a request to return to the practices she had employed in her earlier teaching, namely, giving students long notes to learn by heart so they could pass their exams with good grades. The pressure to revert to
the old ways was difficult for her to bear as she knew from her experiences at NDIE that learning to write and speak in her own words had brought her a learning competency and confidence that no amount of rote learning could achieve. Therefore, she resisted in part the students’ bidding to take such a regressive step and allied her boldness to her beliefs about an educational process that would bring positive change to the quality of education offered to the girls of the village.

Change is difficult to implement in most circumstances and it can be particularly so when like minds are not involved in the process. Critical reflection raised important issues for Khadija. On the positive side, she had demonstrated that even shy students had gained a confidence in writing and in speaking and expressing themselves in front of others and in their own words. They had acquired some investigative skills and basic abilities to interrelate with each other in the learning process. While the students did well in their exams, Khadija knew they could have done better if she had been supported in her efforts to develop their understanding levels and not just their memories. Second, she realised that her communication with the principal, other teachers and the parents had been lacking, and sharing with them what she intended to do with the students and why could have prevented the stalemate that occurred. As she reflects:

> Perhaps parents needed more clarification at the time and the principal should have been able to give this to them. What I also know in reality and not just in theory is that change is difficult. However, it is easier to bring it about when you consult people, especially those involved in the proposed change. So I learned that I, too, could have done a lot of things differently when I first returned. (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)

### 6.3.8 Being on the Seat: Boldness Bearing Fruit

‘On the seat’ is a wonderful colloquialism in Pakistan referring to the person in charge as holding the seat of authority. The year following her return from NDIE, AKES-P appointed Khadija as principal at Sher Quila Girls’ Secondary School. Achieving this position had been part of her long-term dream and marked the reaching of another milestone in her determination to demonstrate that, with
appropriate education, local women had the qualities and capabilities to be leaders in their community.

After four years of Khadija’s principalship, Sher Quila Girls’ Secondary School had become a different place. The changes she initiated could be named and numbered but more important was the rationale that lay behind each of them and the processes used to decide, plan and implement the changes. Student centred and cooperative learning became strongly evident characteristics of the classrooms. The everyday features of the school reflected her intentions for education: student-prepared work bedecked the classrooms and corridors; singing emanated from the pre-prep classroom; the murmuring of students’ voices became a feature of the classes in progress; students led the school assemblies along with programmes for parents and the community; no teachers sat down in front of their classes nor hid in the staffroom correcting the piles of students’ copies. Khadija was determined to ensure that talents and ideas among staff and students would not lie latent.

Khadija’s conviction about what should happen in the school was evident in her actions. She employed her research skills to help teachers identify the development of reading skills as the biggest area of need amongst the students, and she taught the staff how to gather relevant information to design, implement and continually evaluate a whole school reading programme suitable for the students’ needs. A pre-prep class to orientate 4-year-olds for learning became another focal innovation. As Khadija recounted:

*It had long worried me that children come to school with preconceived ideas from their parents and others about how to learn. There is such a high rate of illiteracy here that mothers in particular give their small children the idea that school is all about books and writing and learning off all the teacher’s answers. Therefore the little children come to school with big bags of books on their backs and there is no fun in the classroom.*

(Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001)

Khadija situated the pre-prep class in the centre of the hexagonal school building so that happiness could be heard making its way down and around the corridors. She had learned from her earlier experiences and had put in place good communication strategies that ensured parents and teachers understood the pre-prep innovation and
supported it. Mothers often left the fields or walk a long way to bring and collect their children from the school, so Khadija encouraged them to stay to become part of the classroom and not only to see how the children learned but to learn with them.

6.3.9 Learning Not Copying

The treadmill of rote learning and copying was broken for Khadija through her NDIE experiences, and she confidently claimed that nothing that she and the staff have done at Sher Quila Girls’ School ‘is in its original form’ as located in literature or observed in another school. Her learning at NDIE was both practical and theoretical and she gained good knowledge especially during the MEd course. Particularly she valued the honing of her analytical, planning and reflective skills and these she tried to encourage in her staff. She was well-aware that everything she learned at NDIE was not applicable to the Northern Areas, which differed greatly from Karachi and literary examples. What she had gained was the ability and the confidence to adapt and initiate ideas and apply them practically in her local setting. Other teachers and principals in her geographical area and school had gained various educational qualifications, but Khadija saw evidence that they were lacking in both an understanding of what they had learned and hence an ability to make practical application. These skills were not within their range of capabilities. In reality, their studies had been of little use. Such qualities and abilities she did not see lacking in NDIE graduates, even amongst those who had study only at the BEd-IGCE level, although she recognised the different levels of capabilities amongst the individuals in these graduates. Summarising her use of her NDIE education, Khadija contended that she learned to become more flexible in the sense that ideas came automatically to her when the need arose, but that she also learned the discipline of research. The learned skills of identifying a problem area, observing the situation, thinking about its causes, consulting literature and other knowledgeable people, designing a plan to address it and evaluating the implemented plan were significant tent pegs of her professionalism. As she summarised:

*This is what NDIE taught me to do and showed me and guided me in how to do it. Now when a need arises in our school, we do something about it. We just don’t sit and talk about it.* (Khadija interview 3 March 2001)

163
Khadija’s climb through her years at NDIE changed and expanded her innate boldness. Her MEd years were very difficult, plagued by her self-doubts and plunging self-esteem when she compared herself to her student colleagues and endeavoured to live up to the expectations she placed on herself. Having completed the climb and experienced its fruits daily in her work threw a fuller light on the MEd years for Khadija. From the shy, reluctant but determined participant who arrived at NDIE, she found herself constantly growing as a confident and competent professional. She missed the intellectual challenge of discussions:

*These were integral to both the MEd classes and the tea and lunch breaks for it was largely in these settings where I learned to justify my own positions and loved to hear how other people were thinking. The staff room at Sher Quila now reflects some of these qualities of discussion and has proved to be a valuable link in the teachers’ input and involvement in the various developing aspects of the life of the school.* (Khadija interview 3 March 2001)

Rose-coloured glasses often cloud the view as students look back on their Alma Mater, *where my real development took place* (Khadija interview 3 March 2001). There was a tinge of this in Khadija’s story but her beliefs and actions that speak of her evolution as an educator of daring and sensitivity recounted their own truth of her reality. What Khadija did not forget was the root cause of the changes that were brought about in herself and hence in schools and educational environments where she has worked since leaving NDIE.

A strong, innate philosophical side was evident in Nasir’s nature, and his story reflected that this was appreciated and encouraged at NDIE. He often thought very differently to other students, but particularly the Australian staff encouraged his
thoughts because they were not threatened by his various questions. He asserted that he was taught the skills of critical reflection and could appreciate in his current personal and professional life how this ‘trained or disciplined my way-out thinking’ (Nasir interview 5 March 2001) into a more useful and productive activity. It was not surprising that Nasir articulated most of his learning points from NDIE through critical reflection on the incidents and experiences of applying his learning in the workplace. These provided a map of his development as a professional educator and his growth in understanding of what the activities of teaching and learning were about as well how such activities enabled learning.

Nasir arrived at NDIE from his home in the upper Punjab area with a great internal confidence in his abilities and a strong belief in what he could accomplish, while outwardly he presented as someone who was rather quiet and reserved because he was not confident of his fluency in English. He had a point to prove to his former principal and teaching colleagues who believed neither in his abilities nor suitability for the job of teaching. What they had not counted on was the hidden strength of the self-belief, which brought him to the door of NDIE seeking admission. His self-esteem was severely shaken during his early days at the institute, but experiences of his three and a half years as a student rotated around two critical questions that he asked of others but answered for himself: Should I be a teacher? and Can I do MEd? On moving out from NDIE to map his professional life, Nasir’s answers to two further critical questions—Should I take the principal’s job? and Can’t we do it more easily this way, Sir?—demonstrated that what he had learned was not merely information but a means of his self-transformation (Nasir interview 5 March 2001).

6.4.1 Teaching: Not the Preferred Option

As he recounted, teaching was not what Nasir intended to do as he sought employment after completing his college studies. Rather, he chanced upon being in the classroom:

The principal from the local convent girls’ school called me one day to say that their Maths teacher had died and did I want the job. Now I had no intention of becoming a teacher but had been taking some tuitions at my
home so the principal knew that. She was in a tight spot and I was doing nothing else at the time so I started teaching maths in the primary classes. For two years I was not sure if I could be any good in the profession because I had other plans in mind for my career. But when those plans could not be accomplished, teaching was the only choice open to me. (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

Enthusiasm for the role was not part of Nasir’s initial days in teaching, which he saw simply as a job to be done. Yet towards the end of his first year, he found that he was becoming interested in the students and in what was happening in his classroom while he gained confidence in what he was doing since his students were not underachieving when compared with other classes in the school. His inner feelings of confidence were counterbalanced by remarks by some teachers in the school, reminding him that he should not be teaching without appropriate training for the job and he sensed the negative attitude of the principal towards him. To Nasir, this latter was based on hearsay rather than facts and, though not endearing himself to the principal by his action, challenged her to exchange his class with those of any trained or experienced teacher on the staff and then compare the result. Nasir was ready to resign his position if the outcomes proved negative. In the two short years of his teaching career, he had moved from a state of disinterest to being prepared to challenge those who contested his right to be and his performance as a teacher.

He defended his pride and male ego amongst the almost totally female administration and staff of the school and realised that there was also some truth in their criticism of him. If he wanted to be a teacher by profession, formal education was a necessity. Whether by chance or by design remained a question mark for Nasir, but he met an older, respected educator whose advice was to do some professional study and to go to Karachi to NDIE to do it. Nasir procured the application forms by stealth and cheekily waved them before his principal. Though making an application was but the first step, Nasir’s inner sense assured him of his selection. And he was right!

6.4.2 Little Pond, Big Fish—Big Pond, Little Fish

A short time into his BEd course at NDIE, Nasir found that he was losing the strong self-confidence with which he had arrived, a confidence born in Jhelum where he
had been engaged in many Church-organised activities and was looked up to as one of its best young leaders. Reflecting some three years’ later on these early months in Karachi, Nasir understood that he had come into a much bigger pond where he met people who were more capable than he was in some respects and that amongst the group of students there were many gifts and talents, all of which were contributing to the learning and teaching that was happening at NDIE. He began to judge and measure his capabilities in a way that was much more realistic than his home town situation. Other students at NDIE were much more fluent in English than he was, could express their ideas more clearly and could read and comprehend more quickly and analytically. He found himself during the early months particularly with good ideas to share in class but as he was not yet thinking in English, others were able to provide an answer while he was still translating in his head. This situation caused him both hurt and frustration. In the continual comparing himself with others, either as a student or as a teacher, he gradually lost self-confidence. In his own estimation, he never seemed to measure up in those early days.

Another effect of being in a bigger pool found Nasir comparing the marks and feedback on his individually assigned work with a certain group of his class colleagues whom he judged to be at an aptitude level equivalent to his own. This self-measuring experience found him dealing with a conundrum. On the one hand, achieving lower marks than his self-determined equals caused him to lose heart in his studies while on the other hand, he believed that his abilities were on par with others but he needed to put more effort into his studies. He isolated English language incompetence as the root cause of his academic performance worries, and so requested one of the Australian Mercies to give him extra classes to improve his spoken and written language abilities. From this one-to-one assistance given outside of regular class times, he gained much encouragement and confidence as well as language fluency.

6.4.3 Right Pool—Right Size

Nasir ultimately made a clear-cut choice of teaching as his profession and as his personal commitment in life three years after completing his BEd, during the final
year of his MEd studies at NDIE. By that time he knew he was in the right place. He had become highly motivated in his studies, was fluent in English, could favourably compare himself with his class colleagues and enjoyed the rigour of the learning-teaching interactions of the class and the teachers. The answer to his first decisive question *Should I be a teacher?* was not only inside him but obvious in his disposition. He found confirmation of these changes in himself from his NDIE lecturers, one of whom was the Australian, Bernie, who taught him as both a BEd and a MEd student. In Nasir’s own reckoning, Bernie knew him in his weaknesses and his strengths (Nasir interview 5 March 2001).

One incident involving Bernie and himself marked this change in an indelible way for Nasir. Bernie placed particular emphasis on building up students’ critical reading skills through their writing judicious summaries of specific journal articles. As Nasir recounted:

*One day after I had handed into him my critical summaries of set journal articles, he called me to the staff room and asked, ‘Nasir, what are you doing?’ I was a bit scared because I thought I must have done an awful job of the work. Then he said, ‘I am very surprised because you have improved your skills so much but especially in written English. I have given you a B+ for your work’. Bernie usually gave students a D+ or C-. He continued, ‘This is really well constructed work’. I knew that I had received a lot of help over the years from the other staff but I, too, had put in the hard work. I was now able to use my teaching and learning experiences to critique theoretical articles in a practical way and from a Pakistani perspective. I knew, too, that no longer did I have to hold back in class because I couldn’t think quickly enough in English. Such a small event gave me real encouragement.* (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

Towards the end of his four years at NDIE, Nasir recognised that he had recaptured his confidence and self-belief but not in a somewhat brash way when he had displayed his self-belief in his initial encounters with the institute. He was emerging as a wiser, more thoughtful and critical educator, confident in his strengths and more willing to work with his limitations and not be paralysed by them. He had also found his response to two more of his critical questions.
6.4.4 Can I Do MEd?

Early in the course of their BEd year, NDIE students are asked to consider their further studies, particularly the MEd programme offered at NDIE. When Beatrice, as Director, spoke with Nasir’s group, he was eager in his response. His self-esteem was high at that point but also some self-doubt balanced his equation. His question of ‘Can I do MEd?’ was met with Beatrice’s response ‘Why not?’—a response that was non-committal on Beatrice’s part but challenging and encouraging to Nasir. He interpreted that Beatrice confirmed his ability to gauge his potential to undertake the advanced level of studies at the same time as others of his colleagues were not accepted into the MEd programme. An ‘A’ Division pass in his BEd examinations somewhat surprised him but also refurbished his belief in his academic abilities. He estimated that he had achieved far beyond what he ever dreamed he was capable of attaining even as he sat for his KU exams and his self-pride was restored although counterbalanced somewhat by the weight of expectations he felt was put on his abilities to perform as a teacher known to be an NDIE BEd graduate.

The completion of his BEd-IGCE marked a significant turning point for Nasir as he launched into what I identified as the first of two distinct learning phases as a professional educator.

6.4.5 Mapping Out a Professional Life

Three main episodes shaped Nasir’s finding of his pathway as a professional teacher. The first was his initial experiences as a teacher in Jhelum, which led him to NDIE, while the second occurred after the completion of his BEd-IGCE course and while undertaking the internship year of his MEd Preliminary studies. The third episode began to unfold in Rawalpindi after he attained his MEd Degree and returned to work in his geographical home territory. Through both post-NDIE episodes, Nasir encountered struggles between applying his theoretical learning and his pride in what he had achieved through his studies as well as the realities of school life which was

---

43 ‘A’ Division at KU lies at an aggregate percentage of 70 and above.
singed with his and others’ expectations of NDIE graduates. In Karachi, his appointment as teacher in a middle school\(^{44}\) coincided with the second or internship year of the MEd Programme and gave his studies a classroom focus. The time frame for his employment in the Rawalpindi Diocese began two and a half years later on the completion of his MEd studies and captured his experiences of fashioning and implementing the Diocesan Teacher In-service Team for the Catholic Board Schools. In both instances, he worked with an NDIE graduate colleague both of whom contributed significantly to his learning and professional development.

The two post-NDIE experiences were vastly different in setting, personnel and responsibilities yet showed a parallelism in the rudiments that carved out Nasir’s professional pathway and exposed its significant stepping stones.

6.4.6 Confidence and Expectations Meet

On both occasions, Nasir found moving back into the world of the Catholic Board systems akin to making his way quite confidently through an art gallery whose walls were framed by watching eyes. He confronted the commonly held belief from experience and hearsay amongst principals and staff of Catholic schools that NDIE graduates were different and knew how to teach in more modern ways. Teachers watched the graduates to confirm the rumours and very often criticised the changed classroom behaviours and teaching strategies that the NDIE graduates implemented. Nasir found that the expectations were even higher and the critique more judgmental for those who had finished the MEd programme. The assumption at all levels of administration and teaching throughout the Diocese was that the MEd graduates had expertise in administrative practices and continuing teacher professional development processes. Nasir discovered that he was under greater pressure to perform well as a member of the Diocesan In-service team because he had high qualifications and he was in his home territory. Allied to these was the fact that he was facilitating the professional development programmes where some of the participants were the Jhelum teachers who had doubted his suitability for teaching. He knew that he had become a very different person from the one who had set off to

\(^{44}\)This middle school had classes from kindergarten to class 10 matriculation.
NDIE four years earlier and felt confident that he could handle the new situation. Similar types of experiences other NDIE graduates also shared with Nasir: ‘It’s not that we are aliens or something but people expect of us a definite type of professionalism’ (Nasir interview 16 May 2001).

Counterbalancing these expectations, Nasir held a self-confidence that he nominated as emanating from three sources: first were his academic successes, recognisable in certified awards from both KU and ACU; second, in neither case did he apply for the job to which he was appointed; rather he was approached by his future employers to consider the positions and third, and more importantly, recommendations from his NDIE teachers supported his appointments for he knew they were the best judges of his capabilities and potentials at the time and in the situation of each position. Along with his self-confidence, Nasir recognised the expectations he had of himself, as he articulated:

> I felt that I was bound to put into practice what I had learned. There was no other option for me. Furthermore, there was a vast difference in my capabilities and attitudes at the end of the BEd-IGCE to those I had after completing my MEd. (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

### 6.4.7 Initial Stepping Stones—Karachi

The Karachi school was engulfed in poverty and comprised children mainly of Pathan background whose fathers worked as day labourers on the shipping wharves. The students were ambivalent about their education as the boys knew they could follow their fathers and the girls understood their destination as early marriage and child rearing. The overwhelming majority of the teachers were untrained, with less than 25 per cent having gained their CT, PCT or Bachelor’s degree, and the remainder of the staff having achieved matriculation or intermediate levels of schooling.

The principal, a friend and BEd-IGCE colleague, introduced Nasir to the staff with the intimation that he was someone who perhaps was better than they were because he was an NDIE graduate, was continuing with his MEd studies, undertaking some research in the school throughout the year and he would be the principal of the
afternoon shift. Initially, such factors worked in Nasir’s favour as he recalled that the teachers seemed to be thinking ‘he is something’ and that ‘gave me a bit of prestige and the teachers watched me and what I did’ (Nasir interview 5 March 2001).

Nasir fitted confidently into this scene even though his classroom, situated opposite the staff room, made him feel constantly under surveillance by the teachers. He considered this time as a good learning experience mainly because during his BEd-IGCE course he had been encouraged to use the skills of reflective practice and he fell into a regular routine of critical reflection on his classroom practices. When the deputy principal finally got the courage to point out a couple of mistakes Nasir made in his teaching, she was amazed by his grateful attitude and recognition of the fact that while he had the professional training, she had 10 years of practical school experience. On other occasions, Nasir was not so positive with her corrective comments but, as he had asked for critique, he accepted them at least in his outward behaviour. On one occasion while he was introducing cursive writing, a teacher burst into his classroom to declare, ‘Sir. That is wrong!’ While confident and sure of his correctness and anything but happy with her outburst, Nasir quietly thanked her with the promise of a later conversation at which time he learned the teacher’s ignorance of the differences between print and cursive writing:

*I was glad that I was able to contain my anger and didn’t put her down in front of the children. That showed I was able to be a little more Australian than Pakistani. We usually love to show we are better than each other on every possible occasion.* (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

Despite the fact that he was equipped with many teaching skills, modern techniques and the psychology of learning and teaching, there were times when Nasir failed to put these things into practice. He recalled:

---

45 Many schools in Pakistan have two shifts of students per day, known simply as morning and evening /afternoon shift. It is generally accepted that the children in the evening shift have lesser academic abilities than those who attend the morning. Also, because of the low salaries, many teachers work both shifts, with some changing schools to do so. These teachers also generally perform at a lower energy level than they do in the morning shift.
I reverted to the old Pakistani traditional way of teaching such as just using the textbook with little or no preparation, teaching aids or resources. (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

Even while employing such lazy teaching, Nasir continued to reflect on his classroom practices and record them in his professional journal, which his NDIE MEd programme mentor read and talked over with him. This call to accountability as well as that fact that some of the teachers asked his help to solve their classroom problems motivated Nasir to demonstrate what a well-educated teacher could do not only in his/her classroom but in the school community.

6.4.8 Making Impressions in Islamabad-Rawalpindi Diocese

The three-year interval between Nasir’s appointment to the Karachi school and his selection as an initial in-service team member for the Islamabad-Rawalpindi DBE enabled him to mature both as a learner and as a professional educator. His enthusiasm was buoyed and his self-esteem affirmed by the confidence the Board members had placed in him and his knowledge that they had consulted his NDIE lecturers regarding their estimation of his suitability for the position. He feared the expectations placed on him and his colleague, Shazia, who was also an NDIE MEd graduate. His fears did not reside as doubts about his abilities as an educator but in his presumption that his employers and principals of the DBE schools expected the two NDIE graduates to do something extraordinary and, in the course of a year, facilitate massive changes in the teaching and learning processes operating in the Diocesan schools. Nasir was conscious that the strong Australian influence on the educational approach used at NDIE caused an almost automatic scepticism or rejection amongst some teachers and principals to anything foreign in regard to approaches to teaching and learning strategies for the classroom. He had wrestled himself with the belief that a learner-centred approach could not be used in Pakistan because ‘the syllabus had to be covered; the Board exams passed; and parents wanted their children to know the textbook’ (Nasir interview 5 March 2001).

The initial teacher in-service efforts of Nasir and Shazia focussed on a series of workshops held at various locations throughout the diocese with an emphasis on
classroom management and motivating students to capture their interest in learning. Nasir and Shazia undertook follow-up visits to the schools to monitor the teachers’ implementation of their learning from the workshops and to give them further encouragement and support. They soon learned that only when the teachers heard that the in-service team members were to visit, did they find their workshop notes and try to implement the suggested activities. As Nasir recalled:

_They were doing it to satisfy Shazia and me and not for their own sakes. It seemed as though we were making no progress._ (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

A critical evaluation of the in-service team’s work at the end of their first year showed ‘little change as a whole across the DBE schools’ (Nasir interview 5 March 2001). It seemed to Nasir and Shazia that the teachers did not want to make the effort to change. Nasir’s personal reflection brought him to the realisation that he had taken almost four years to learn new methodologies and approaches and even more importantly, to learn why the approaches were taken and to understand the relevance and expected outcomes from the various strategies that constitute a learner centred approach to teaching. Therefore, he concluded:

_I was simply expecting too much too soon from the teachers. My studies had taught me that effecting change is a slow and deliberate process and that it is best not to be forced. Now I was learning this in the reality of my professional life. Also, at NDIE I had had lots of personal encouragement and assistance from the staff who allowed me the necessary time to learn, debate, understand and adopt a new perspective and practice._ (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

### 6.4.9 Pivotal Questions—Critical Decisions

The third and fourth critical questions embedded in his story, though seemingly simple when posed both to and by Nasir, marked significant stages in his journey of becoming professional first in the Karachi school setting and later in Rawalpindi. The first of these last two critical questions, he again asked of Beatrice.

His colleague-principal expected Nasir’s positive answer to the offer of the principalship of the school’s afternoon shift. Nasir was unsure and so he posed his
pivotal query to Beatrice. Should I take the principal’s job? met with a response typical of her reluctance to answer people’s questions for them. She had her own enquiry of Nasir:

*Do you feel capable? If you really feel you can do the job then accept it but if you do not feel competent and confident enough, then you can refuse.*

(Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

Nasir’s decision emerged from what he judged to be solid reasoning, an ability that he found because Beatrice challenged him to do so. Once again it was the high expectations both his principal-colleague and the teachers would place on him as an NDIE graduate, coupled with his fears regarding his aptitude for the job that clarified for Nasir the importance of being a good teacher before taking on the responsibilities of a principal. The reality of working the afternoon shift soon made him realise that his decision was wrong and he judged that he could have done a much better job than the incumbent principal. In this re-evaluation of his decision, Nasir began to believe that if he set his mind to a task and applied the skills and education he had received, he would not only become a good teacher but also be able to help others to do likewise by providing good leadership as the school principal.

Nasir’s fourth critical question presented itself within the challenge to provide leadership in the professional development of teachers not as a principal but as a member of the in-service team in Rawalpindi. This was a question not posed by him but put to him and its answer emerged through his critical reflection on the workshop and follow-up processes he used as well as his attitude towards the teachers:

*Couldn’t you just draw a line and colour it this way? Because then your script is more beautiful and more practical and the children will copy and learn it more easily.*

(Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

An experienced lower primary teacher posed this question, along with its reasoned answer during an Urdu writing workshop. From the newness of his position as in-service facilitator, Nasir’s response emerged in words he later could not believe were his own. To the teacher he responded:
Whatever I am saying and showing to you, just do! This is because we are doing the same in all the schools throughout the Diocese. So you have to follow. (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

During the second round of the workshops, the teacher raised the same question. This time Nasir’s response was positive:

If you are finding this more helpful and easy for your students, then adopt that procedure. (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

It was as if a pressure button had been released and a number of teachers began to share the little ways they made the teaching of the Urdu script easier for beginning writers. Using this technique, Nasir became the facilitator and not the dictator of the learning that happened in the continuing professional development process. His response to the teacher’s question the second time round was not so much spontaneous as the fruit of his critical reflections in the intervening months as the incident played on his mind. The outcome highlighted the difference between the imposition of his ideas on teachers and approaches he could take to allow him to be a catalyst for teachers’ learning whether the emphasis was on acquiring skills or understanding theoretical underpinnings. Deeper and firmer imprints began to emerge on his understanding of and practice as a professional educator. He insightfully expressed these changes that had occurred in him:

As a teacher I do not have all the answers and I’ve found out that learning is not a one-sided function. I learned so much at NDIE and am continuing that learning process as an In-service co-ordinator where my mistakes are very obvious. I do have the responsibility to improve the learning of teachers in the schools. But it is important for me to act in a way that whatever I’m teaching is not the only or final word. Just as I expect the principals and teachers to be open to learning from me, I, too, have to be open to learning from them and to demonstrate that. (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

In being open to learning, Nasir also found richness in working with NDIE colleagues from whom he gained further insights into himself, learned from the mistakes made and grew in his understanding of how to be a professional educator.
The innateness of individual differences ensures that students whether children or adults can sit side by side in a common learning environment but experience and take from it very different learning both in insight and in practical application (Jonassen & Grabowski 1993). Human actions and behaviours are modified by environmental settings, others’ expectations and an individual’s personality, particularly in the workplace (Kimble 1990). Nasir’s story reflected how he came to understand and react to such study-gained theoretical insights, particularly as he worked side by side with NDIE class colleagues. In Karachi, his former class colleague became his principal while in Rawalpindi, he and Shazia worked as a team. In Karachi, Nasir lived in the pride of his realised BEd-IGCE achievements and the eagerness to demonstrate what he knew. Two years later, he seemingly began his work in Rawalpindi on a footing matured by his professional studies and heightened personal and interpersonal insights.

Nasir tested his academic prowess at a staff meeting at the Karachi school when he offered an opinion contrary to that held by the principal. The latter he experienced as autocratic in his approach but it was Nasir who stormed out of the staff meeting because he could not accept the opinion of the principal. Critical reflection brought Nasir face to face with a class comment that I had made to the BEd-IGCE students, namely that being an NDIE graduate did not make them better teachers or better people than others; who they were and what they did determined that. In a lengthy discussion post meeting, the principal conceded Nasir’s position academically, although he added, ‘but I am your principal; you are my subordinate. You should follow my instructions’ (Nasir interview 5 March 2001).

While his colleague pulled rank, Nasir critiqued his own behaviour, which he described as his trying to show that although they were both NDIE graduates:

*I was even better than the principal because I was doing my MEd. Our difference of opinion could have been worked out within the walls of his office. My ego had taken over! I was learning a hard lesson that in the teaching profession, it is not always easy to work with and accept friends*
because of differences that make each person and individual. (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

It is this particular incident Nasir returned to frequently to reflect on from many angles, and from his critique emerged an image of the teaching profession in its many aspects. For him teaching:

*It is not like the military with a general and where all personnel are trained to follow him by hook or by crook. There is no option but to follow the officer's instructions. In the teaching profession, I have found that some, but not all people can argue their opinions and not just follow blindly what the authority person says...you cannot practice your own philosophy of approach 100 percent. You have to consider other people also. (Nasir interview 16 May 2001)*

It was a different situation in Rawalpindi while working with his MEd class colleague at a Diocesan or regional rather than a school level. The weight of responsibility and expectations weighed heavily upon both Shazia and Nasir, but that experience of working with an NDIE graduate colleague and friend was vastly different for him. He articulated this in terms of the changes that he noted in himself. First, he was not only more highly qualified professionally but also recognised the competencies he brought to the job. Second, he felt he knew himself better and was able to appreciate more fully the complementary nature of the differences between himself and Shazia. For example:

*Shazia is more outgoing and thinks aloud. I am more introverted and philosophical in my approach. She had worked for some time in the NDIE In-service team and so brought with her some familiarity with the job and brought with her a lot of resources used by that team. I thought we should just use those as references and design our own resources for the teachers in the Rawalpindi diocese. (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)*

Both Shazia and Nasir were able to discuss their perspectives, understand each other and work with compromise. They recognised that neither had all the answers nor the best way of doing things all the time. The enormity of the task they were asked to accomplish for the Rawalpindi DBE kept them focussed along with their determination not to fail. They wanted to show the professional skills they had
acquired through their years at NDIE. At the base of their relationship and their ability to work together, Nasir named the respect that they had:

... for each other as professionals and, as a result, we learned just so much especially in our first year. In particular, I had become a vastly different educator under the influence of my MEd studies and interaction with the NDIE MEd staff. (Nasir interview 16 May 2001)

Nasir’s story revealed that he was able to make transitions from an institutional learning about teaching and the practice of it in a somewhat sheltered environment to the reality of working as a teacher and a teacher educator and through those transition processes to continue to learn. For Nasir, every moment and instance of his learning was connected.

6.4.11 Becoming a Wise Professional

Nasir described himself as philosophical and possessed an ability to critically reflect and articulate the influence of NDIE on his growth into a profession for which he recognised his suitability. As he summarily expressed:

Every minute of my professional journey is connected to another but something happened to me when I left Presentation Convent and came to NDIE. I came with confidence in myself and with a hope that I would receive professional training. Throughout my years there at NDIE, I was challenged to the core of who I am and my belief in myself and my abilities. Above all, it was the staff who believed in me and they were mostly Australians who did things differently to what I was used to. I think I was affirmed, loved and challenged into finding, developing and accepting my gifts and aptitudes and some staff members have remained amongst my closest friends and it is to them I still turn for advice. My learning and studying hasn’t finished yet. I want to do my doctorate. I will never be finished as a learner, nor will I ever be free from NDIE! (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

6.5 Notre Dame Is Like My Mistress: Alice’s Story

I am a teacher. I love to teach and I am a good teacher! (Alice interview 3 June 2001)
Alice’s defining words provided both an entry into and a summary of her story, which was a tale of self-discovery by a born educator. The part of her story that unrolled in relation to NDIE was characterised by two words: different and difference. People, events, approaches to learning, behaviours and relationships that she encountered at NDIE were different from any of her previous experiences. These encounters changed her and her beliefs about herself and her capabilities and in turn, saw her be a person of difference in the professional settings in which she had been engaged since her MEd graduation.

Alice was creatively expressive in her use of the English language and skilfully built her NDIE story around a vivid, or perhaps cheeky, image as she told:

> *It (NDIE) is like my mistress! Because the time I’ve spent here either as a student or a staff member I have always enjoyed. You know, it’s like the imaged impressions of time with a mistress—enjoyable, pleasurable and a little risky—and they are the things that override the difficulties.* (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

### 6.5.1 A Mother’s Knowing and a Daughter’s Wily Ways

In her childhood, school was not a place where Alice liked to be. Before she could work it out for herself, she constantly questioned her mother ‘*When is Friday?’* Holidays kept her alive and steeled her against coping with the intense shyness she felt in the classroom, a reticence from which she finally stepped out during her studies at NDIE. She imagined herself as a lawyer or business woman of the future, never as a teacher; but she always got her homework done quickly and correctly so that by the time she was 10 years old, Alice’s mother involved her in the tuition classes held in their home. It was the children who had some difficulties in learning that her mother gave to Alice and while she loved working with them, she also longed to earn her own money. And so a small remuneration deal of Rs. 100 per week[^46] was struck between mother and daughter and almost surreptitiously, the teaching profession claimed Alice for itself.

[^46]: Approximately $1.4 AUD
Whether she found the classroom or the lure of classroom found her was not quite clear. The fact was that the completion of her schooling saw Alice drifting into employment first as a teacher in a nursery school and subsequently as a primary class teacher prior to becoming an English subject specialist. She loved what she was doing yet Alice also felt that she and teaching were misfits, as she was not confident that what she did in the classroom was what she could or should be doing. Opportunely, she heard of the opening of a new teacher education institute, namely NDIE that was doing things differently. She applied for admission but the classes had already started. And here she encountered the first difference between this new institute and regular, local practices. Once the programme had begun at NDIE, no late enrolments were accepted. Neither bribes nor cajoling could change the stance of the Australians! So Alice had no option but to wait out a year.

6.5.2 Being Schooled in Different Ways

Alice credited the NDIE experience as the trigger to realising her potentials. This understanding was two pronged, as it led her to appreciate and rejoice in the range and depth of her academic abilities, her sharpness of mind and giftedness as a teacher as well as the freedom this realisation gave her to accept a profession for which she was so well matched. I argue that the learning environment throughout the four years of her studies at NDIE acted as the conduit via which these changes occurred. The experience also enabled the gradual emergence of an educator who believed she had abilities to improve the learning of children and the teaching of teachers, could competently and at times forcefully express her views and had the energy to act on her convictions even if that meant leaving some of her colleagues behind. But it had been a long journey travelled before Alice arrived at such a point in her story.

As a schoolgirl, she was extremely shy and lacked the confidence to express her thoughts and ideas in the classroom. On the other hand, she was a very bright student as was evident in her high performance in written work and the fact that other children liked to sit beside her in class and ‘listen to me mumble the answers and then they would raise their hands and say them out loud…’ (Alice interview 3 June
(NDIE) different from anything else I had previously experienced in all my schooling years. I learned to come forward because I was given the confidence to be in charge of my own learning. (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

Critical to this movement was the fact that during classes, Alice’s lecturers not only encouraged her to share her opinion but respected it when given and they ‘were not fazed’ by the fact that she often presented a different perspective from other students or from the lecturers themselves. She found that through the encouragement of the latter, her love for reading and her thirst for information were quenched somewhat by her hours amongst resources in the institute’s library. Further, she began to find enjoyment in her assigned writing tasks and was well rewarded for the efforts she put into researching and constructing them. I hold that from such experiences, Alice discovered she was much more academically capable than she ever imagined herself to be. She reasoned, that if the different attitudes and approaches to learning and teaching that were employed at NDIE could make such an impact on her academic and professional life then, in turn, she could ensure its ripple effect reached whatever classrooms she touched.

Not all the different methodological approaches used in teaching at NDIE initially caught the positive light in Alice’s eye. Group learning and the teaching practicum were episodes that met with her resistance. Encouragement, although sometimes firm on the part of the Australian women, and Alice’s determination to understand her fears along with the negative experiences and intellectual conflicts associated with these practices demonstrated her struggles as well as her excitement in encountering learning approaches that were different.
6.5.3 Posing Questions and Finding Different Answers

In Alice’s estimation, the group learning processes employed in the initial years of NDIE were neither clearly defined nor explicated by the staff in terms of the types of group approaches being used and the theoretical underpinnings of the different methods of group learning. Alice’s descriptors indicated that while a traditional group structure was used, the expectation of the Australians was that the students would work cooperatively to achieve the learning tasks assigned to the groups. The BEd year encounters with group learning left Alice with many questions regarding its worth and formed within her a very negative attitude towards the process as a relevant and reasonable learning strategy. She struggled with her belief and experiences for she knew the Australian women to be good educators but questioned why they seemingly disregarded the weaknesses inherent in employing group learning amongst the Pakistani teacher education students who had been schooled almost entirely by the rote learning and copying blend. The mixed abilities that provided enjoyable opportunities for sharing ideas and getting to know other students were not sufficient factors to merit a positive balance in Alice’s estimation. She saw that contributions by group members were uneven, even minimal in some cases, and therefore the whole group assessments she judged to be unfair. She saw ‘that ...many of the group members rode on the coat tails of others...’ (Alice interview 3 June 2001), while she knew her own contribution began with reading before coming to the group as well as significant and enthusiastic input to the preparation of the group reports in whatever form they took. The Australians endeavoured to enable the students to learn the nature, strengths and weaknesses of the approach through their experiences of working in the groups rather than working from a theoretical understanding of co-operative group learning to its implementation. Alice’s perspective was that the philosophical underpinnings of the approach, namely, positive interdependence in achieving a learning goal, individual accountability of each group member, social development through face to face learning with the variety of group members and the insights gained from critically reflecting on the group process (Johnson, Johnson & Holubec 1993) were not sufficiently addressed. In her group experiences, the learning potentials of individual members were not reached.
Alice’s frustrations and their underlying critical questions found their redress mainly through her self-directed but mentored efforts. During the second year of her MEd Preliminary studies she took hold of the opportunity to implement cooperative group learning in her classroom as the problem to be addressed for her Action Research project. This enabled her to reach a self-explored understanding of the approach to learning from both theoretical and practical perspectives and to realise that, if well implemented:

*It could be a wonderful and exciting and enjoyable way for children or students of any age to begin to take responsibility for their own learning.*

(Alice interview 3 June 2001)

Her research activities grew out of her questions and unconstructive experiences as a BEd student and taught Alice ways of organising group processes that ensured contributions from each member and the selection of assessment strategies that accounted for individual performance while students worked on a common task. In fact, action research as a process demonstrated her movement from being a receiver of information to a learner and a teacher who constructed knowledge. She nominated this movement as one that brought significant difference to her ways and extent of learning and professional practices in both class and staffrooms.

In hindsight, Alice recognised that it was in small group work that she began to take the first steps in overcoming her fear of speaking out. These efforts were reinforced through the Australian women not only asking for her opinion or responses but respecting her ideas even when they were different from what others thought, including the teacher. By the final year of her MEd and her fourth as an NDIE student, Alice found that most of her learning took place through group processes involving extensive readings, research, discussions, seminars, arguing and clarifying opinions and ideas of others. Most importantly, she enjoyed articulating her views and challenging those of others and carried such skills, confidence and competencies into her professional life where she believed some of her colleagues wished she was not so vocal.
Alice did not always move through the questioning points and challenges offered to NDIE students in such a self-directed manner. However, in retrospect she nominated particular instances as turning points in her coming to terms with differences in approach within the interplay of teaching and learning.

6.5.4 Differences and Turning Points

Alice chose to study at NDIE because of its promise of being different in approaches to learning and teaching from the existing teacher education institutions. She embraced the hope and excitement this held for her. What she did not anticipate were the difficulties inherent in the journey that she faced and her the resistance to aspects of the new and the different. In both subtle and overt ways, she found that the Australian women challenged the customs and practices that were the norm in Pakistani educational institutions.

Initially, she found putting staff and students on the same footing by calling each by his/her given name, confronting of her cultural practices and values, which respected elders with titles whether they be, for example, the formal madam, ma’am or the informal auntie, hard to stomach. What she did appreciate was the underlying message, ‘that we were all colleagues who learn so much from each other’ (Alice interview 3 June 2001). Its worth as a practice and symbol of how and from where much learning happened gradually seeped into her psyche. Subsequently, on re-entering the world of schools after her NDIE studies, she found irritating the formalities of titles that were constant signs of the hierarchies of position, roles and worth. Her self-confessed discovery was that the environment built on the beliefs practiced by the Australian women, that each person possesses an innate dignity that was also mirrored in whatever work they did, had not only challenged but changed Alice’s way of judging and interacting with the students and staff from the various strata of Pakistani society in her work situations.

Two further incidents, located within School Experience episodes, confronted Alice with difference that had its roots in resistance first within her and second among the classroom teachers with whom she was assigned to work during her BEd and MEd preliminary courses. The first instance was an example of how Beatrice ‘pushed me
to try things I had never done before’. Alice was assigned to a boys’ school for her first BEd teaching practicum and she panicked. She refused to go to the school as she had had no prior experience of teaching boys, and, by her own descriptors, ‘was painfully shy and unsure of myself’ (Alice interview 3 June 2001). Beatrice recognised these factors and as a result changed Alice to a girls’ school but for the second teaching practicum, Alice was reassigned to the boys’ school with a firm directive from Beatrice that there was to be no escape. Alice put herself within the new and the different, and discovered that she really could do a very good job with the boys. Despite the difficulties she admitted, on reflection, that from such experiences of being pushed beyond what she knew she could do or was comfortable with doing, she learned so much.

A much more difficult confrontation for Alice occurred with the school administrators and the teacher to whose class she was assigned for the practical component of her MEd preliminary. It was quite different to what Alice anticipated. The school has been carefully selected and much preparation and negotiations between the NDIE staff and the principal and coordinators of the school had occurred as it was one of the few Karachi schools using an. integrated curriculum approach to early childhood education. Alice arrived at the school well planned, replanned and excited about the new adventure of using integrated curriculum in the Year 1 classroom. But her hard work met rejection from the teacher who would not allow resources other than those in her classroom cupboard to be used with the children. Alice was not ready to face such a situation and experienced difficulty in distinguishing between what was and what she imagined to be happening. Her experience of rejection was real, not only in the classroom but also in the staffroom where the Year 1 teacher complained about her constantly to the other teachers.

Beatrice read the situation and instigated an intervention by raising the awareness of the school principal whose injunction to the class 1 teacher ensured that Alice henceforth taught according to her prepared plans. What the principal could not change was the teacher’s attitude and manner towards Alice nor the fact that the children responded ‘wonderfully’ (Alice interview 3 June 2001) to her teaching and learning activities. She was invigorated by the excitement and the related hard work
in preparing to teach differently in a classroom while in contrast, the opposition she met left her feeling cheated and dejected. Alice held this experience as pivotal in preparing her for the realities of school life after her NDIE studies. There, too, she found that thinking, acting and doing things differently met walls of opposition in both overt and surreptitious ways. From reflection on the MEd preliminary incident Alice confessed that:

*I have carried that learning with me. In my job as academic co-ordinator and administrator it’s like living in a pressure cooker. You get students’ complaints, parents’ complaints, teachers’ complaints and you get no pats on the back. Sometimes it’s like the MEd school experience repeated. But I survived and I got my strength from the situation rather than letting it curtail me.* (Alice interview 7 August 2001)

6.5.5 Being Reflective: Perspectives on a Blessing

As a graduate teacher and administrator, Alice expressed confidence and clarity regarding her approaches to teaching and learning, knowing exactly the direction she wished to take and precisely the track that needed to be taken to accomplish her goals. Such confidence emerged from her learned ability to be reflective, a practice that had its genesis in her Action Research project as a MEd student and her recognition that the ability she acquired for critical reflection ‘was the greatest gift in my development as a professional educator’ (Alice interview 3 June 2001), as it enabled her to continue to become a better educator. Her performance, that of the students and the school continued to be the subjects of her critique and in order to increase its value, she persistently invited students and faculty members into the process. Alice’s persistent example triggered learning and experimenting to happen quietly amongst a portion of the teachers, as she pinpoints:

*After one particularly successful school function, I asked the staff what we could have done differently or better and why. They laughed at me, wanting to know why I always wanted to change things. Later, I went around the classes and asked the children the same questions, and they gave me lots of ideas which I put in my file because I knew that the next time such a function was to occur, no one would remember what happened and so we would simply repeat what we’d done the previous time ...they are used to me doing it now and it’s a type of joke amongst the staff. But I now find that some of them are doing the same thing in their own areas of*
responsibility—even in the classrooms, they are starting to use the simplified action research cyclical process that I use as an ongoing reflective and evaluative process. (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

Perhaps, Alice had become too reflective as I also found evidence that her perfectionist qualities fed greedily on her critical reflection and on occasions stifled her abilities to be satisfied with well-planned and processed activities. The root of this trait is traceable to her MEd days where both her colleagues and staff appreciated but also challenged the extremes to which she took possibilities of newfound ideas and learning processes and the struggles she faced to achieve a balanced way of operating out of them. Incidents from her story illustrate these struggles.

During her Graduate Professional Experience Unit, Alice and Cathy, her MEd colleague, facilitated a series of workshops for primary school principals and leaders to assist them in introducing a cooperative learning approach in their classrooms. Alice wallowed with delight and excitement in the planning stages as well as in the critical debriefing sessions following each day of the workshops. The fertility, pace and intensity with which she produced new ideas for a complete change of plans drove Cathy beyond a coping capacity and the outburst: ‘That’s enough! We’re not going to change anymore! What we have is good and we ought to stick with it!’ (Alice interview 3 June 2001).

Alice’s reflection on Cathy’s roadblock led to a realisation of the strength and overbearing effect her impatience for change and betterment had on others who did not possess her quickness of mind, confidence with content materials nor flexibility to use a range of learning-teaching strategies. This student learning she later demonstrated in her professional life as she acknowledged that she had become:

A very good planner but I still get horribly frustrated with those who come to planning meeting but don’t begin their thinking until the meeting starts. If there’s nothing else I learned at Notre Dame, it was to be well prepared and to be able to defend the positions or the action plans you put forward. (Alice interview 3 June 2001)
On her own admission, Alice continued to find the final step of the critical reflective practice, namely, prioritising options and decision making, the most difficult aspect of the process. Her natural instinct led her to gather a ‘plethora of information on ...and ...become over involved in’ the focussed aspect of her work and then to make use of all of it. In developing her Masters thesis, Alice’s preparation of 40 hypotheses was the catalyst for a learning watershed. She became totally engrossed in it and, with the memory of the event still obviously painful, Alice recounted her encounter with Terry, her Australian supervisor who issued an ultimatum:

Alice, I want to tell you something. This is not a PhD but a Master’s thesis and today you have to make a decision. Choose me or the research. Make your decision. I’ll give you time. (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

The thesis had become Alice’s child and having to decide to let go of any part of it was too painful. While Terry sat beside her with a blank expression on his face, her painful memory of the events recalled:

I knew I had to choose him. While I don’t think I have ever forgiven him for it, I realised that he had to do it—to choose 8 hypotheses and discard 32! Now that was a very powerful experience but he just had to do it. I constantly learn from it as in almost all my professional situations, I still present myself with a multitude of options. I still hate discarding good ideas and possibilities, but I have gradually taught myself to be more discerning in choosing what is best and letting others go. (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

The impact of the incident with Terry, along with many other NDIE occurrences, provided Alice with a yardstick in her decision-making processes long after the completion of her MEd studies. She admitted, ‘I am constantly reflecting on and learning something from those Notre Dame experiences as they really have left an indelible mark on me’ (Alice interview 7 Aug. 2001).

Experiences such as the dictum from Cathy and the ultimatum from Terry enabled Alice to develop her professional capabilities in a world of employment so vastly different from the challenging yet safe environment of NDIE and to gain professional recognition as a teacher and administrator. Alice grew into knowing herself as a good educator and acknowledged the vital role her practice of critical reflection has played
in achieving and maintaining this status. However, her competency found a frustrating counterbalance in episodes with employers and teaching colleagues who neither shared her theoretical knowledge nor possessed the abilities to implement theory as practice in particular or local situations. What Alice termed the ‘curriculum shopping experience’ was illustrative of this reality (Alice interview 3 June 2001).

She coined this image to pinpoint areas of frustration in her work in curriculum development as academic coordinator of a Karachi school which took pride in its reputation as modern in its approaches to teaching and learning as well as equipped with a wide range of resources including electronics and ICT. The principal’s ability to envision positive and relevant schooling in the local environment contributed significantly towards its reputation, but Alice identified the poor grounds on which the school-based curriculum was formed and the principal’s inability to grasp this weakness. In other words:

_Ad hoc decisions were made that just chipped away at or choked the Curriculum Guide with no understanding that you have to cover all areas of the curriculum even though you can deviate and vary the amount you choose to deal with in any one area. She (principal) says that doesn’t really matter. You can forget about the Curriculum Guide, forget about covering all those areas of development and just pick and choose from amongst them so long as you make it exciting, make it fun for the children and allow the teachers to do as they wish in the classroom._ (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

Alice understood curriculum as a complex and continuous process in which each year built on the previous one in terms of the scope and the sequence of the students’ planned learning activities. She believed that teachers and administrators with only a surface knowledge of the concept and role of curriculum made unprofessional or incompetent decisions regarding the shape and extent of the content and the approaches with which it was taught. She judged the outcome of such a curriculum shopping expedition as not achieving positive change but incurring a hindrance to the learning of the children and the teaching methods and strategies of the teachers involved. Her theoretical knowledge and understanding was what ‘holds me firm’ (Alice interview 3 June 2001), and challenged her to interpret her responsibility as academic coordinator as embracing the safeguarding of the children’s learning.
6.5.6 Who Will Take Care of the Children?

Alice’s resignation from the Karachi school occurred when she gained a scholarship to pursue doctoral studies in the United States of America. As she turned towards this new horizon, her reflections on what her journey at the school became more poignant. None more so than that comment from a member of the domestic staff who asked: ‘Now who is going to take care of the children?’ (Alice interview 7 Aug. 2001)

Her safeguarding the children extended far beyond curriculum and organisational issues, and they knew that they were always her priority. A child’s appearance at her office door meant he/she received immediate attention no matter who was present or what was happening in Alice’s office. A bandage, medicine, a personal worry, something to share—all received her full attention. For any type of trouble:

I would charge down the corridor or out into the grounds and when I got to the scene of the problem, I didn’t have to yell or scream at the children. I’d just stand there like Beatrice and give them a sort of look and they’d know they had disappointed me and they’d automatically sort themselves out. So often I didn’t have to take a next step. (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

Alice was unique on the staff in her approach to the children, to parents, to teachers and domestic staff alike. By her own admission, she was counter to the customs of Pakistan because she had seen and experienced something different at NDIE and had modelled much of her professional behaviour on that of Beatrice. She maintained an open door policy, was always there for staff or students, judged actions and not people and so earned respect because of who she was and not because of the position she held.

6.5.7 Australians Bridging Learning Cultures

As she unfolded her story, Alice ascribed a singularly influential role to NDIE and its Australian staff in her formation as a learner, a teacher and an administrator. Over the years, many foreigners have dabbled and continue to dabble in the educational scene of Pakistan and endeavour to effect change. Alice had experienced ‘their
parading of their degrees’ (Alice interview 7 Aug. 2001) as well as their condescending ways and attitudes towards the locals. She knew their influence to have had no lasting effect. Quite to the contrary, her experience of the Australian ways at NDIE were different because its work bridged a gap in the educational world between the private and the public as well as poor and high quality of education. She attributed this difference to the manner in which the Australians conducted themselves:

*When you Australian women came here you were and were seen as foreigners. But, unlike so many other foreigners, you didn’t fight the education system; you didn’t criticize it; you have been very analytical in your critique and what you have said has not been just the negatives...Your wore the same clothes as us; you tried to eat the same food as us; and that meant that you blended in very beautifully. You even tried to learn the language and that made a lot of difference. While I found it extremely difficult at first, you made staff and students call each other by name.*
(Alice interview 3 June 2001)

With these behaviours, Alice witnessed barriers being broken down and gaps between the Pakistanis and the Australians narrowed, and hence they were able to learn from and with each other. The fact that the Australian women showed no attitude of superiority to the local people set them apart from so many other foreigners. And it was these cross-cultural bridges and partnerships that Alice adopted and adapted as part of her personal and professional life. These tools have continued to shape her as her story concluded with a final image:

*I think that Notre Dame is a sculpture’s tool because the tool gains power when the person holding it actually shapes or gives form to the block it sets out to work upon. At Notre Dame, we had to do a lot of our own shaping but we were given the tools and that’s how each of us gained—some more effectively than others. But I don’t know of anyone who did not gain.* (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

In Chapter 7, I have walked inside the narratives of the MEd graduates and the Australian women and made meaning of the sculptors’ block, the tools and the sculptures that are the perceived contribution of NDIE and its Australian women to teacher education in Pakistan.
The events that fill and shape and form the stories of human lives are caught in the web of time and space. Yet the meanings of such events are not trapped by their occurrence at particular moments in time but can vary in depth and message according to the occasion and situation in which they are retold (Connelly & Clandinin 2005), the purpose of the recounting, and the need of both the teller and the listener(s) to hear the story. The work of this chapter was to identify and draw meaning from the unique narrative of teacher education that was captured in Chapters 5 and 6 above and that encompassed relationships between learners and teachers whose locational meeting point at NDIE entwined their dichotomous blends of Pakistani and Australian, East and West, North and South, Christian and Muslim.

In the meaning-making process, I broke open the narrative of the transnational (GATE 1997) Pakistani-Australian community of storytellers (Elliot 2007; Carr 1986) in order to critique the positive and the negative and the confounding that constituted the varied spectra of its content. In so doing, my specific educational inquiry moved to a point of insight that held the possibility of actually making a difference to the practice of education not only at its site base of NDIE but also in the educational community in Pakistan.

### 7.1 Discovering Insights and Making Meaning

I re-entered the narrative in a manner respectful of the individual tellers and their social contexts while at the same time I employed critical eyes and ears to interpret a compelling meaning (Rodriguez 2002) from what I could see and hear below the story line, conscious that the ‘I’ itself had infinite layers (Trinh 1989). My purpose was not focussed on giving individuals attention, but on the meaning making and learning that had the potential to emerge from the narrative when I applied a process of critical analysis, a means of deconstructing the text (Derrida 1978) to generate a plurality of possible meanings. Biesta and Egéa-Kuehne (2001) indicated that Derrida’s framework for meaning making was not a technical set of procedures.
to be followed. Rather, in Trifonas’s words (cited in Biesta & Egéa-Kuehne p. 98) the Derrida and education connection asked what it meant to think, to learn, to teach and to know and more specifically what it meant to teach the ‘other as other’. It was from the perspective of a teacher educator within the ‘others’ context’ that the meaning-making process had a particular effect on me, a response that I called forth from the individual storytellers, the events, the settings and the relationships, which wove the pattern, colour and strength of the narrative (Andrews, Squire & Tamboukou 2008; Powell 1990).

I used identifiable themes, at times clearly stated in the narrative and at other times implied, to communicate these interpretations or principal observations. They enabled me to give an expression of meaning or an illumination of some aspects of what had been true experiences of the six storytellers. Such overarching themes include first the inherent personal strength exercised by each storyteller and demonstrated through their journeys to achievements and inclusive of their struggles and vulnerability along with coming to know the meaning and function of their learning and teaching endeavours. The second theme was agency and its expression through the interrelatedness of the different stages and aspects of life experienced by each of the research participants. Partnership completed the trilogy of themes along with overt and covert expressions of individual and group leadership. I explored these major themes from the bi-perspectives of the Australian women and the Pakistani MEd graduates through subthemes that exposed a relevance of meaning in the purpose and outcomes of the particular NDIE undertaking for effecting a change in the process and the outcomes of teacher education in Pakistan.

7.2 Broad Thematic Strokes

Layers of meanings expressed in thematic forms can jump out at a reader of any narrative (Craig 2010; Elbaz 1996). Some of these themes encapsulate all-embracing aspects of life’s journey that are expected or waited for when reading or listening to a particular narrative. These are what Trinh referred to as the envelope holding the heart of the narrative (Chambers & Curti 1996, p. 4). Expectation and struggle, along with determination which breeds perseverance and the awareness of achievements
that yielded a sense of accomplishment, exemplified life journey themes that I found transparently obvious in the recounting of each of the MEd graduates as well as the Australian women. It was these broad thematic concerns that I first explored as I delved deeply into my research narrative to uncover insights into the process of teacher education.

7.2.1 Great Expectations Counterbalanced by Struggles

Expectation is animate in expressing its meaning as a belief that something should happen in a particular way or that someone or something should have particular qualities or behaviour hoped for or anticipated (Macmillan Dictionary). Not all anticipated occurrences are welcomed. Some expectations induce fear of failure or dread rather than a positive eagerness of attaining a goal or desire. Both these extremes were present in the narrative as the MEd graduates and the Australian women have held in tandem the expectations they placed on themselves in becoming a part of NDIE as learners and teachers, the expectations they sensed others placed on them because they were part of the NDIE teacher education programmes and the anticipated outcomes and achievements others placed on the institute as it made its way towards realising the dream of educating teachers who would change the existing patterns of teaching and learning in schools.

7.2.1.1 The Founder and Foundations

Producing a new breed of teachers was stark in the weight of its expectancy for Beatrice during the foundation years of the institute. Her story pinpointed how she lived with the supposition that in bringing to reality someone else’s dream for a teacher education institute, what emerged would be different from those colleges and institutes already in existence in Pakistan. Yet she was expected to do this while using an existing BEd university curriculum, which was failing to produce graduates who were educated and skilled enough to effect the desired changes in schooling rather than a new Bachelor of Teaching curriculum custom prepared by local and Australian educators to address Pakistani needs. Further, Beatrice was obligated to lead a team of academics to prepare teachers for the secondary schools when she
believed wholeheartedly that effective change would come into the schools only if an intervention was made at the primary school level where students acquired their orientation and attitudes towards learning as well as their formation in the ways to learn to succeed in the schooling process (Rogers & Kutnick 1992). Confounding this situation was the fact that no shared vision was evident within the Catholic Education System\textsuperscript{47} regarding the expected capabilities of either NDIE graduate teachers or the specific roles they would play within the system. Poignant was Beatrice’s point that ‘\textit{many principals just wanted teachers who would cover the syllabus and get the children through their exams’} (Beatrice interview 6 Dec. 2000) indicative of a day-to-day vision of outcomes from teaching and learning activities. While a few isolated voices intoned that they wanted innovative methods, Beatrice was convinced the principals ‘\textit{really didn’t know what they wanted’}, which highlighted the fact that they had little awareness of or readiness for the effects the planned NDIE introduction of innovations in teaching and learning strategies would produce on the pupils, teachers and administrators of the schools.

The mix of such a clouded local view with Beatrice’s clarity of direction could have been a recipe for disaster, as it contravened the basic premise of the noncolonial-development style partnership on which the institute was struggling to be established. In Crewe and Harrison’s (1998) estimation, this type of partnership:

\begin{quote}
Does not try to do things for developing countries and their people, but with them. It must be seen as a collaborative effort to help them increase their capacities to do things by themselves. Paternalistic approaches have no place in this framework. In a true partnership, local actors should gradually take the lead, while external partners back their efforts to assume greater responsibility for their own development. (p. 70)
\end{quote}

Operating from such a perspective, the team of Australians envisaged working alongside local educators, primarily within the Catholic or mission schools,\textsuperscript{48} in a united effort to effect positive changes in the teacher education process essentially in

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{47} When NDIE opened in 1991, the National Catholic Education Commission of the PCBC, the body with the responsibility for forming direction and policy for the Catholic Education across Pakistan, had not met for a period of 12 years.
\end{flushleft}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{48} Inherent in the efforts of Bishop Lobo for the education of teachers for the Catholic Education schools was the fact that University and College Quota Systems existed, which meant that Christians could not always get admittance to the BEd or CT programmes.
\end{flushleft}
pre-service but also, by extension and association, with teachers already employed in the schools. The lack of readiness among teachers was understandable, as most were untrained and perhaps uncertain as to why the well-established rote learning of the textbook approach was being questioned. I found as a result that the onus for the movement forward was overwhelmingly weighted towards NDIE, while the main impetus and tolerance for this move was acknowledged as the foresight and drive of Bishop Lobo. So much so that his transfer from Karachi to Rawalpindi was a struggling point for Beatrice who wondered ‘how we could persevere’ (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000)—a statement, I argue, that indicated the uncertainty of other sources of support for the development of teacher education from within the Catholic system.

Montero-Sieburth (1992) studied the effects of efforts to introduce changes in the ‘what’, the ‘why’ and the ‘how’ of teacher education and schools across a number of developing countries situated in Africa, Latin America and the Middle East. She cited the work of Hawes (p. 193), who demonstrated that in such countries, whole curriculum changes can only be as good as the people at the cold face, not only of its implementation but from the planning to the evaluation of the students’ learning outcomes. Beatrice knew the impossibility of transferring into the NDIE situation an established Australian teacher education programme, what Montero-Sieburth termed ‘an instant technological fix’ (p. 192). Local Pakistani educators had been integral contributors to the proposed and rejected Bachelor of Teaching curriculum. Hence, Beatrice struggled to understand in the changed circumstances, the dichotomy between the silence and the richness of the Sitz in Leben guidance the Catholic education administrators and teachers could have offered as critical components in the formation and implementation of a context-specific teacher education curriculum (Cornbleth 1990), inclusive of the KU BEd requirements. Avalos’s research (Montero-Sieburth) indicated that an explanation for such encounters with reluctance lay in the administrators’ fears of the new and unpredictable as well as their envisaging of the demands that change and innovations would place on them in terms of time and effort. There was sufficient evidence for me to argue further that in the focussed Pakistani context, the significant number of Catholic education

---

49 Literally translated from German, the term means ‘life situation’ or ‘setting in life’.
administrators who lacked educational competencies (or opportunities to gain such) and leadership skills were additional inhibitors in the planning of the NDIE curriculum and the implementation of its outcomes as its graduates became inserted into the Catholic school systems.

Expectations were not only from within the Catholic education environment. NDIE’s connection to the wider nongovernment sector movement for positive intervention in matters of teacher education in Pakistan at the beginning of the 1990s brought it under the critically watchful eyes and hopes for success held within this group of educators. NDIE (1991) was the first of three new breed teacher education institutes to begin operations and was followed by the Ali Institute of Education (AIE) situated in Lahore in 1992 and the Aga Khan University Institute for Educational Development (AKU-IED) based in Karachi in 1993. Beatrice’s well-recognised and long years of professional experience in Australia enabled her to stand equally amongst such peers. Yet, as director of the pioneer institute in the field, expectations of success as well as the waiting for mistakes to occur were identified as underlying factors within her story. My evidence for this claim was found in Beatrice’s admission of the pressure she felt in guarding herself and the institute against the belief commonly held in Pakistan that she and the other Australians were the experts in the field, having encountered what she described as a ‘cultural cringe in Karachi and Pakistan that anything foreign was acceptable’ (Beatrice interview 6 Dec. 2000). This situation was indicative of the personal and professional wrestle that went on within her as she sought to balance offering insights from other parts of the world about how the education of teachers could happen. Concurrently, she searched for some critique from local educators as to if and how the foreign approaches and insights could be applied in the context of Pakistan’s cultural and national histories, as these elements had been the shapers of its existing school practices and outcomes (Arnove, Altbach & Kelly 1992).

7.2.1.2 Brave Hearts: Struggles to Reach the Expected

On a less public level, Khadija’s story revealed the depth of a personal struggle that came as she internalised what she believed was expected of her during and after her
NDIE studies to the MEd level. Like Beatrice, Khadija was a breaker of new ground; both women tackled their tasks in environments foreign to them, in the world of ‘otherness’ (Biesta & Egéa-Kuehne 2001) amongst strangers and devoid of familiarities of operating in a home territory. Functioning in English medium was foreign and tough for Khadija as by her own admission ‘she was never very good at English’ and her initial foray into an educational institution that was what it said it was, namely English medium, posed many difficulties. Her attitude was to face and not cower from the challenge, steeling her approach in her words ‘I took the courage and said that I would manage if I could go there’ (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001). A difficulty she had not anticipated was the manner of social interaction expected of her at NDIE. ‘It was almost shocking and so very hard for me’ as, counter to her experiences of her familiar cultural, religious and educational environments, she was expected to interact with both male and female students (Khadija interview 3 March 2001). I found that the enormous personal cost to Khadija entailed in this expected manner of operating did not appear to be fully recognised by the Australian women in the early days of the institute. They, too, struggled to live within a foreign environment and facilitate learning processes that would change the way their students understood and practiced the arts of learning and teaching. In the interplay of culture and learning, Bruner (cited in Backhurst & Shanker 1996, 2001) marked an understanding of the past, present and future contexts or environments within which cultures and the learning processes interact as a crucial task for educators and their students. This pinpointed how, in the interpretative process of meaning making from this aspect of Khadija’s story, the struggle for her along with the Australians was to understand the impact that the expectation of a smooth interplay of cultural differences brought to bear on their day to day learning, teaching and social interactions.

Bruner (1996, p. 159) indicates how culture shapes the mind and provides the toolkit by which ‘…we construct not only our worlds, but our very conceptions of ourselves and our powers’. The strain of constructing a new operational culture out of the nexus of three cultural streams, namely the familiar culture of her isolated Northern Areas village, the massive nature of the metropolitan city of Karachi and the unexpectedness of Australian ways challenged Khadija’s sense of identity. It
highlighted her individual struggle to assess to the point of accepting or rejecting ‘the new’ expectations for behaviour that she constantly encountered—a cultural cringe that she resolved only in the final year of her studies at NDIE. She named this struggle as producing one of her most significant learning points for it taught her how to mix and interact and not feel intimidated by, or less than, her male professional colleagues.

In ways almost totally hidden from others, Khadija lived out the weight of the expectations of success that she accepted from three most important external sources as well as those with which she challenged herself. Of prime priority was her father who, as the respected leader of her village, firmly desired that she be a model and an incentive for villagers to see and understand the need for girls to be educated and consequently the contribution such women could make to the survival and advancement of the village. He envisaged his daughter would show that a woman’s contribution extended beyond motherhood and subsistence farming. Second, the foreign principal of the AKES-P village girls’ school estimated Khadija would get the best possible available teacher education at NDIE and encouraged the AKES-P to financially support the young local woman’s studies, while she also recognised the level of Khadija’s proficiency in English language could be a deterrent. These two sets of expectations Khadija carried with her to Karachi where she joined to them a third: that which she perceived Beatrice had of her, particularly in relation to the MEd programme, as Beatrice ‘trusted in me and ...thought enough of me to offer me a place in the first MEd group’ (Khadija pers. comm. 24 Feb. 2001).

7.2.1.3 Cultural Cringes: Respect and Shame in Expectations

The manner in which Khadija recounted her story implied a level of anxiety underlying this parcel of varied expectations. I estimated that this anxiety had its roots in a fear of the shame her failure to succeed would cause others, namely her father, her sponsors, NDIE and Beatrice in particular, and an anticipated weight of the guilt that would be hers to carry if she caused this perceived shame and insult to her elders. Fontaine et al (2006) found minimal differences between people in their cross-cultural study of varying shame and guilt reaction levels based on situations
and cultural socialising factors. Counter to these findings, the Australians operated out of vastly distant and inherently more individual-independent cultural experiences that did not enable them to recognise in Khadija a personification of the extended family-dependent Pakistani people’s proneness to deep shame and guilt in failing to fulfil the expectations of elders. Her struggle with cultural challenges became her securely hidden and personal agenda, as the encounter with cultural difference challenged her beliefs about a woman’s place and role in her society as well as her notions of acceptability or otherwise of behaviour patterns in and beyond the context of NDIE.

Accepting her perception of what others expected of her was not entirely negative for Khadija. I contend that it confirmed her commitment to herself and her father to serve her village people and to help bring them out of the backwardness that characterised their lack of contact with people, events and developments outside their immediate environs.

The benchmarks of achievement Khadija created for herself were coupled with the hopes held in her by other people. The journey to realising them at NDIE, I noted, was littered with unanticipated obstacles including active rather than passive participation in classrooms, social interaction between males and females and individually researched and composed assignment writing as opposed to the copying of other people’s words from books. Trying hard to do something that she found very difficult and to maintain that effort over a period of time both defined struggle (Macmillan Dictionary) as well as provided me a descriptor of a very significant part of her journey into learning, of learning to teach and of managing the resultant change within herself. From this struggle, Khadija expected to learn how to become a good teacher and this expectation was balanced by the Australians at NDIE who, as Beatrice expressed it, ‘…expected the very best that could be given from all involved —students and staff’ (Beatrice interview 6 Dec. 2000).

I saw in the recounting by each of the six storytellers that the dreams and expectations accompanied by their struggles for realisation were neither empty nor insignificant although at times unexpected in their shape and form. Both Nasir and
Alice came to NDIE expecting to experience the newness of approach to teaching and learning, which the Australians were reputed to have introduced. Both wanted to be trained as good teachers and for Nasir the impetus came from his place of employment where he felt the principal and teachers passed unfair judgements on his capabilities and suitability for a teaching position. His story revealed a key role played by situation variables in the creation of the expectations he placed on himself. His home territory of the school expected his failure, while granting his admission signalled that NDIE, located in territory foreign to him, expected his success. Insights from Rabideau’s (2005) research suggested that for Nasir, the institute became a lifeline that situated his egotistical performance expectations in an environment conducive to avoiding unfavourable judgements on his competence. Gaining admission to NDIE had buoyed his confidence, as it meant he had achieved the first step towards proving his critics wrong. This indicated that, in a similar fashion as Khadija, much of his motivation stemmed from a determination to avoid the shame of failure. Where he differed was that the shame would have been his alone to face.

7.2.1.4 Self-understanding and Transformation

With English as her first language, Alice did not expect to find difficulties in her studies and in fact they exceeded her expectation in enlivening and directing and challenging her thirst for learning and exceptional academic abilities. Neither Alice nor Nasir anticipated the breadth and depth of the challenges to personal development and change that their years at NDIE would offer to them. In Noddings’ estimation (cited in Gordon 2008, p. 322), ‘no goal in education is more important—or more neglected—than self-understanding’, and the drive to enable students to achieve this was what Beatrice saw as the heart of the NDIE project (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000). The students at NDIE did not encounter the reception of transmitted information (Miller 2007) to which their schooling years had accustomed them, nor were they drilled in teaching strategies and tricks for the classroom. Rather:

_We had to do a lot of our own personal shaping as individuals and as teachers. But we were given the tools by the Australians and that’s how_
each of us gained, some more effectively than others, but I don’t know of anyone who did not gain. (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

Such insights indicated to me that the education process that happened at NDIE sought out the whole person rather than simply training individuals to do certain teacher activities. Radically different in the local milieu of teacher education, the learning occurred if and to the extent the students chose to grasp and take hold of the struggles related to the opportunities and guided challenges offered by the Australians. Such an approach is at the heart of what Ayres (cited in Gordon 2008) calls genuine learning, namely, not the passive intake of information but the learner’s agreement to learn, to discover and be surprised by the outcomes. The original NDIE Mission Statement framed the institute’s intent to introduce a holistic approach to the education and formation of young Pakistani women and men who would have the courage and knowhow to effect positive changes in the local schooling processes. The underlying expectation was that the students would engage in their learning process rather than simply receive knowledge. Knowledge was not a commodity imposed from the outside but encouraged to be formed inside the students so that they reshaped and constructed much of what they learned and understood (Schunk, Brunning, Schraw & Ronning cited in Clemons 2006). Following this pattern, the Australian Mercies worked with and expected that the students would transform themselves as learners in order to use the experiences of NDIE to be contextually radical in facilitating the learning-teaching interplay when employed in schools and classrooms. While visionary and educationally sound, such an approach seemed to have challenged each of the student storytellers, but particularly Khadija and Nasir who had a lesser English language capacity than Alice, to a point almost beyond their capacities to struggle towards success.

Returning to the workforce brought its own set of external and personal expectations for the graduates. Where NDIE’s reputation was known, for example in CBE/DBE or AKESP schools, employers and teaching staff anticipated but not always welcomed the difference in approaches to learning and teaching that NDIE graduates were able to offer. Some went as far as telling the NDIE graduates to forget everything they learned at NDIE and to only teach the class the textbook as that was all that was required to pass the exams (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001). Conversely, the
graduates felt the pressure to perform through their desire to do so and what they believed NDIE personnel expected them to do. Both Nasir and Khadija showed that they were much better equipped after their MEd than their BEd level of studies to fulfil their own and the expectations placed on them from external sources. When returning to his DBE employment after four years of study at NDIE, Nasir felt he was bound to put into practice what he had learned:

There was no other option for me. As well, I felt the pressure from the DBE that maybe we were supposed to do something extraordinary in the first year and bring about massive changes in the teaching and learning processes operating in the Diocesan school. (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

I argued that pressures in the workplace caused the graduates to perform with a definite type of professionalism that they observed and gained at NDIE. This enabled them to struggle through the weight of the expectations to discover the ways in which they could best contribute to changing the learning and teaching interplay in the schools and systems in which they worked. Both Nasir and Alice acknowledged that some of their friends and colleagues who graduated from NDIE at the BEd level gradually eased back into a textbook, blackboard, copying, rote learning approach, as the energy and commitment required to be a learner-centred teacher was too much for them. Reinforcing this was the fact that principals and other teachers did not encourage or appreciate the new methods of teaching brought by ‘the foreigners of NDIE’ (Alice interview 3 June 2001).

For Julia and me, the bonds between expectations and struggles were none less obvious or meaningful. My entry into the NDIE scene was with the personal expectation of a professional challenge hinged by my commitment to using my education and educator experiences in a way that pushed beyond the safe boundaries of the Australian context. Beatrice gave me the task to develop and mould the implementation of a MEd programme that attended to the requirements of the KU courses of studies while creating a relevant and up-to-date curriculum of international standards to earn a licence from ACU. The struggles of such decisions of inclusion and exclusion of content and processes in an educational milieu where I was foreign and on a fast learning curve found their meaning in the competent and
confident professional practice of those women and men of Pakistan and Sri Lanka who have successfully undertaken the programme since 1996. Weightier is my current and more testing expectation to complete the process of preparation of local educators to take full responsibility for the ongoing development and administration of NDIE into its future. I must hand over the keys and not to accept them back, thus demonstrating the working of a partnership that prepared and supported the local educators in taking full responsibility for their own and their local people’s education (Crewe & Harrison 1998).

The unexpected expectation that she succeed the founding director (Julia interview 24 March 2001) crept into Julia’s role as a visiting researcher at the institute. I contend that her own truth in relation to this intrusion into her professional plans did not come at the time she accepted the director’s role. Rather, two crucial components of her directorship led her into its meaning-making process. First was the impact of the inevitable culture shock, which was a confronting and confusing component of her cross-cultural living (Ward, Boucher & Furnham 2001) since, as a newcomer, her familiar and competent ways of acting and operating were not a comfortable fit in the new situation of Pakistan (Haskins 1999; Pedersen 1995). I found this struggle to be deep and personal for Julia, a dislocation that was not connected with her teaching or acceptance by the NDIE community. Rather the struggle involved the stress of searching for adequate coping mechanisms (Ward, Boucher & Furnham 2001) associated with her coming face to face:

*With my own prejudices, my own judgements about cultures, judgements about myself ...I told myself I can stay here no longer...I don’t think I can complete the next 18 months of my three years contract.* (Julia interview 24 March 2001)

Cullingford and Dunn (2004) pointed to the changes, both subtle and revolutionary, that arise when contrasting cultural backgrounds encounter each other. I recognised that Julia’s experience highlighted another side to change. This held within it the expectations she and others had of her success as the director of NDIE that was counterbalanced by a revolution happening inside her as she encountered the Pakistani cultures and the not-so-subtle loneliness and alienation experienced with her basic support people located in a far distant Australia. Further angst was caused
in the clash between her highly competent planning and organisational skills and the disorganisation of the teacher education agenda and practice beyond the walls of NDIE. Julia laboured to establish her own authority as an educator and administrator within and beyond NDIE in the wake of the charisma associated with Beatrice as the founding director. This led her to downplay self-image as an administrator and firmly establish herself as a teacher where she knew, and the students came to appreciate, she had few peers. I have argued that the struggles and expectations of her three years as director gifted Julia with the insight that satisfaction as an educator necessarily comes from using gifts and talents where they are most suited. For her, that was being a teacher and not an administrator.

The intersection of expectations with struggles pinpointed a potential to thwart the development of the institute and the individuals associated with it. Yet when confronted by such crossroads, each of the storytellers was driven towards an option that placed achievement in her/his arena of choice.

### 7.2.2 Arriving at a Place of Achievement and Sensing Accomplishment

Individuals who arrive at a place of achievement that they have dreamed of but often feared to be unattainable exhibit expressions of happiness, surprise, satisfaction and often the warranted admiration of others. Demarcating achievement as a position reached, whether physical or emotional or mental, implies a story of success in fulfilling some planned or intended undertaking. Reaching the place of achievement is the result of a step-by-step building process that usually takes a lot of effort (Macmillan Dictionary). A deeper or more reflective consideration of the arrived at achievement produces in individuals a sense of accomplishment, an awareness of fulfilment in knowing that a desired or valued ability or skill has been acquired or the sought-after-knowledge has been gained (Clarken 2003). I found the existence of these two themes, namely, a place of achievement and a sense of accomplishment, in the stories of the MEd graduates and the Australian women compelling, and these themes were given depth by the consistent presence of strength of person and purpose in the storytellers who were each exhibitors of determination and perseverance.
The findings of Brunstein and Maier (cited in Rabideau 2005) indicate that individuals with strong needs and desires to achieve set high internal standards for themselves and stand in direct contrast to those who are content to adhere to the societal norms. The MEd graduates initially were reticent to participate in some of the NDIE social practices that were counter to their cultural customs (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001; Alice interview 3 June 2001), and they found the researching and constructing of their assigned learning tasks difficult. Neither they nor the Australian women could be categorised as contented with the stagnated state of the Pakistani society’s educational modus operandi. Like a juggernaut, Pakistan’s educational system by the 1990s drove its citizens to an entrenchment in a status quo of tried yet inadequate methods of rote learning and assessment not only in the schools but also in teacher training institutions (Ministry of Education 1999). At the same time, unimplemented policy documents that envisioned updated approaches to and modes of teaching and learning lay bound in the cobwebs of time. A definite step to address this dichotomous position was the magnet that brought learners and teachers together at NDIE and that specific action I interpreted as a stride away from the status quo. It also demonstrated some grassroots pro-activity for educational change where individuals chose to be part of a learning-teaching process that entailed a movement to a place of difference in terms of theoretical insights, professional behaviours and personal transformation.

7.2.2.1 Steps of Achievement

The varied and staged places of difference that evolved for each MEd graduate during their student years and beyond were achievements by another name that were triggered by events or stimuli that were housed in NDIE. I found Nasir very clear that his initial motive for coming to NDIE to do his BEd-IGCE studies lay in the personal challenge to prove his workplace detractors wrong in their estimations of him as a teacher:

50 The National Education Policy 2009 names seven key factors as implementation inhibitors: (i) absence of a whole education sector view; (ii) lack of policy coherence; (iii) unclear roles in fragmented governance; (iv) parallel systems of education – public & private; (v) widening structural divide; (vi) weak planning and management; (vii) lack of stakeholder participation.
I was fed up with the attitudes of the principal (who relied on hearsay) and the teachers towards me. They kept reminding me that it was not right to be a teacher without any training. (Nasir interview 5 March 2001)

Within the Catholic education milieu of his workplace, the belief was that only the best quality students, in terms of their academic abilities and English language proficiency, could gain admittance to NDIE. I judged that Nasir’s move to the institute was decisive and charged with a motivation that was intimately connected to his self-belief (Pajares & Schunk 2002) and his desire to prove he could gain professional qualifications and demonstrate capabilities his colleagues had failed to recognise or acknowledge. This was a critical issue for him and demonstrated a key characteristic in seeking to understand each of the MEd graduates whose sense of self was enacted in the manner in which they dealt with the tasks and the challenges that confronted them in studying at NDIE and later in their places of work.

By the end his first year at NDIE, Nasir had stepped into a new place of achievement and his insight into what he could attain through professional studies changed:

*When I passed my BEd with such a good result, I could not believe it as I had been so uncertain about my abilities during that first year.* (Nasir interview 3 March 2001)

This particular experience of success reignited his self-confidence (Clarken 2003, Marsh 1993) to the extent that his motives for prolonging his involvement at NDIE to complete MEd studies demonstrated a difference in emphasis. Settling scores with his former colleagues faded and was replaced with a more professionally focussed stance on his performance, as ‘*he was motivated to show what a well-trained teacher could do*’. I saw inferred in this decision not only Nasir’s change of stance in relation to the necessity of pre-service teacher education but also his insight that the one-year BEd-IGCE programme had provided him a constructive learning environment that he did not feel ready to leave. Beatrice’s ‘*Why not?’* response matched the layers of meaning around capability, permission and affirmation contained in his query ‘*Can I do MEd?’* Beatrice’s rejoinder was sufficient to affirm Nasir’s sense of accomplishment at the BEd-IGCE level while subtly offering him a modus operandi
for considering his options, with the definitive intimation that the final decision was clearly to be of his making (Nasir interview 5 March 2001).

Nasir’s choice pointed to at least two levels of revelation: his personal desire to learn more on theoretical and practical fronts for professional performance outcomes, and to do that in an environment where he was strongly challenged but sensed he belonged and was cared for. MacGinley, from her perspective as both a sponsor of students to NDIE and an employer of its graduates, expressed the latter as ‘...you Australians love them into learning beyond their dreamed of capacities’ (MacGinley interview 2 March 2001). Such a perception of the Australian’s approach was not without a firm basis for authenticity. In the midst of the patriarchal and authoritarian nineteenth century, William James (cited in Pajares & Schunk 2002) dared teachers to see their students not only as young people of good intention in regard to learning but also to love them. Only then would teachers be in the best position to become ‘perfect’ in their profession. I viewed such a mix of interpersonal and academic relationships at NDIE as pivotal to the students’ stepping into and owing a place of academic achievement and sensing, often for the first time, a worthwhile learning accomplishment.

7.2.2.2 Place of Achievement: Through Students’ Lens

Reaching a place of achievement during or at the end of their BEd-IGCE studies was a critical milestone for each of the MEd graduates for they had learned how to change their ways of learning, acquiring information and constructing and using knowledge. Their achievements firmed their beliefs that because they had entered a change process and encountered its covert and overt activities and experiences, their learning behaviours had been modified. These learning activities along with their determination in effort and mindset were all essential ingredients for success in an institute reputed to be different from others in the field of teacher education in the Pakistani setting. Benchmarks denoting the places of student achievement were not delineated according to competitive, comparative percentiles by any of the institute’s directors. Rather, each articulated a student’s personal best as the characteristic of both formative learning and performance and her/his summative academic record.
This approach theoretically found its basis in the combination of assessment for and assessment of learning, termed ‘formative assessment’ by Black and Wiliam (1998). Extensive studies by these two researchers and their team (Black et al 2004) provided strong evidence that formative assessment is at the heart of effective learning as its feedback helps students to see how they can close the gaps in their knowledge. The endeavour to introduce this formative approach to learning and gauging students’ teaching needs in relation to their performance I have claimed as a ground-breaking movement by NDIE in the measurement and presentation of learning outcomes for pre-service teachers in Pakistan.

I found the definite places of achievement reached by the MEd graduates at various points on their journey as students and in their professional lives evident in each of their stories. What was significant for Khadija, Nasir and Alice was their decision to continue studying at the institute beyond the one year of their initial commitment. For Alice, the BEd year was expansive and provided her utter joy academically. Being enlivened by the confidence of finding an oral voice for her thoughts offset her discontent with the group learning approach. For Khadija, the year was characterised by intense academic and social struggle that culminated in academic success while Nasir was led to question his pre-NDIE perception of his academic abilities and acknowledge his ability to compete favourably with his peers. Underlining these one-year milestones, I located nagging questions that sought to expose why such places of achievement reached were not enough for each of the students. Why did Nasir and Khadija choose to look at the further horizon of MEd studies when they knew the level of personal commitment and struggle it would entail? What did Alice perceive NDIE still had to offer her? What in the one-year BEd experience at NDIE had left the students feeling dissatisfied and ‘unfinished’ both academically and in their personal development?

An insightful response to these questions can be found in the often quoted caution of Alexander Pope.51 ‘A little learning is a dangerous thing; drink deep or taste not the Perian spring’. I do not claim NDIE to be the ancient Perian region nor the Australian women its muses, but I judged it reasonable to interpret that the students

51 Alexander Pope: An Essay on Criticism, 1709
at the conclusion of their BEd-IGCE programme recognised the deep cavern between the amount of knowledge and level of teacher expertise they had gained and the vastness of the areas of information, skills, personal and professional growth and development that they had yet to mine in order to experience a fuller sense of accomplishment. Hence the incentive existed for each to undertake the MEd programme and continue to walk more deeply and confidently into the learning journey of transformation they began at NDIE.

7.2.2.3 Place of Achievement: Through Professionals’ Lens—The Australian Women

The Australian women and the graduates of the MEd programme commonly recognised places of achievement reached and accomplishments sensed from the stance of practising professionals. For the former, especially Julia and I, a greater hesitancy was evident in recognising our attainments as professional educators. I continued to remain immersed in the NDIE setting and therefore viewed achievements as unfinished business, whereas the stories of my two predecessor directors were recounted at a time when their responsibilities for the institute had ceased and they had moved on to other locations and circumstances. My teacher instinct caused me to look to the demonstrated developments in the learning and applied skills of MEd students, particularly in their research efforts, to gauge aspects of my professionally realised hopes. Students by their own admission estimated that my eagerness for them to undertake and report research work of an internationally acceptable standard, whether it was to be presented to KU or ACU for assessment, placed a great burden on them, which at times threatened to stretch them beyond their capabilities. In Surayia’s estimation, she was sick of me asking her to write yet another draft of her research report:

As universities here (Pakistan) don’t expect us to do this amount of work and allow us to copy from books. (Margaret’s journal Sept. 1998)

I, too, consistently faced a professional temptation to accept a lower standard of performance based on the fact that the students’ formal schooling experiences previous to NDIE had not provided them a basic academic writing foundation on which they could draw. I could have rationalised this acceptance through a
consideration of all the limitations of the local educational milieu. I had the choice to resist such a lure and kept the bar of expected performance at a height the students had never previously strived towards. With the latter as my choice, the struggle towards attaining a place of accomplishment was both the students’ and mine as, previous to the Pakistan situation, I had not experienced the need for such an intense degree of mentoring or supervision of research for masters’ level candidates.

Under the pressure to meet research timelines, three student behaviours emerged. First, I categorised the analytically critical and original but overly verbose text writers, as represented by Alice, who possessed a strong command of the English language in each areas of its basic skills. Nadia provided an unambiguous example of the second group whose confidence in their abilities to demonstrate the required skills of constructing a research report or thesis waned to the extent that they reverted to copying large segments from published sources. The third description of students is illustrated by Zubaida and Sujida (Margaret’s journal July 1999) who desperately tried to compose their texts but failed to make it comprehensive or comprehensible, explicable in Schneider and Fujishima’s findings that practice of writing does not always make the writing perfect (cited in Belcher & Braine 1995). The students exemplified by Nadia, Zubaida and Sujida were entangled in a communication labyrinth where their abilities to convey insights and demonstrate constructs of knowledge were hindered by a lack of fluency in academic language, a situation that became exacerbated by the anxiety inherent in the newness of the academic task of research, the time frames needed for the completion of their work and the fear of failure to meet the high-quality standards required for success. The difference between communicative language skills and those demanded by academic writing became most marked for the MEd students during this phase of their studies.

Koutsantoni (2007) sees in academic writing not only the variations across genres, academic disciplines and intellectual cultures but also the need to combine it with a pedagogical process that enables the acquisition of a new language (in this case, English) to move its use beyond the functional to the scholarly. Such has been and remains my challenge as a research mentor. I search to find the end of the entangled language or communication thread so that I can guide the students through the
process of weaving the scholarly texts of their research documents. As students like
Nadia, Zubaida, Sujida and Alice of the successive MEd groups reached their
research goals, I recognised a place of my own professional achievement and shared
in the sense of accomplishment enjoyed by the students. I saw, too, that with each
successive year at NDIE the journey began anew on two fronts. There was a
students’ journey for the new MEs to undertake, but more significant for
achievement measurements were the graduates’ actions that demonstrated the
adaptations and implementation of their knowledge and skills in the professional
employment they undertook. When these were enacted, I had sensed and continued
to sense accomplishment as a professional educator.

Julia’s realisation of what she helped to attain through her efforts to facilitate the
learning of students and their transformation into new-style teachers became evident
through the mostly unsolicited feedback she received from the graduates or their
employers. For example, Sajid, a student whose academic assessments measured in
the lower quartile in terms of ability to write and be articulate sent a letter to NDIE
describing what he had done during his first year back teaching in his school in a
remote area of the Punjab. Sajid admitted he was a changed person; yet his sphere of
operation was neither high profile nor broadcast widely beyond the parameters of his
school. He taught the children using the new methods and strategies he had learned,
and children responded well and enjoyed their learning. Very importantly, the
principal supported him and other staff members learned from him. What I gauged
especially significant was the simplicity of some of his actions, as his letter read:

I have made up a list of all the things that are in the science cupboard, as
we learned in SOM 52 ...and we’re getting together low-cost materials so
we’re making models and we’re having a display and we’re doing things
differently and the teachers think it is wonderful and the students are
discovering information for themselves from the Net and lots of other
places. (Julia interview 24 March 2001)

The candour and sincerity of the incident enabled Julia to understand how graduates
were capable of using and adapting their NDIE learning in local situations and how

52 School Organization & Management Unit
transformation and change can be effected in a school in the simplest of ways. Julia’s sense of accomplishment in seeing the young Pakistani women develop in self-expression and relative independence of movement and responsibility for their own lives was counterbalanced by a nagging question as to whether or not the Australian women had encouraged a way of living that might not be sustainable beyond the female students’ NDIE days. Their achieved places of personal independence, both professionally and personally, were more secure among the MEd than the BEd-IGCE graduates. I hold this as a demonstration of the strength of the prolonged contact with the learning environment of the institute. This gave Julia a sense of professional accomplishment and it also highlighted the areas where she and the institute had not achieved well, namely, a stronger networking system to support the graduates in their professional lives.

Beatrice’s story exhibited an assured personal sense of accomplishment, which was counter to Julia’s and my hesitancies amongst our recognised achievements. Beatrice linked into a similar vein with our stories when she named achievements in terms of what the students sensed as their accomplishments. Their graduating from NDIE with a confidence and self-assurance in their abilities to be good teachers was the place where Beatrice judged achievement to lie.

7.2.2.4 Place of Achievement: Through Professionals’ Lens—The Graduates

Giroux theorised teachers as transformative intellectuals whose pedagogical practice must engage themselves and their students in a process of border crossing. In other words, teachers must understand that the dominating culture regarding the practice of teaching and learning uses its position to maintain that dominance. Good pedagogy is not satisfied with such a ‘no movement’ situation. It must find ways for students and the teacher to infiltrate the established beliefs and practices with the new in a manner that enables each perspective to have the opportunity to understand the position of the ‘otherness’ in its own terms (Horn cited in Weil & Anderson 2000, p. 30). For change to happen, therefore, borders must be crossed. Those engaged in the learning process must understand both the theoretical hold of the established dominating practices and the theoretical underpinnings of the proposed innovative practices. I
discovered revelations in the stories of the MEd graduates in their professional lives that provided evidence that such an understanding of the need for border crossing was acted upon by the Australian women in the NDIE learning-teaching processes.

7.2.2.4.1 Border Crossings

Two striking features that I discovered in each of the stories made evident that the graduates’ most convincing professional learning experiences occurred out of situations in which they initially forgot to cross particular borders. Second, the insights into the limitations of their practices occurred because the Australians had tutored them in a disciplined use of critical reflection on their practices (Loughran 2002; Connelly & Clandinin 2000; Brookfield 1995) followed by their daring to reflexively enter those reflections. The latter action enabled the graduates’ learning to be situational socially and academically and their ideological positions to be challenged and modified in accordance with the circumstances and conditions in which they found themselves working (Watt 2007; Rodriguez cited in Barton & Osborne 2001).

The post-MEd professional practices of Nasir and Khadija demonstrated marked differences when compared to those in which they engaged on resuming their classroom teaching after their BEd studies. Khadija returned to her village school with an enthusiasm to implement all she had learned during her BEd studies in relation to such things as a learner-centred classroom, discovery learning and co-operative group learning. The opposition she met from the principal, students and their parents (Khadija interview Feb. 2001) became explicable to her only after she critiqued how her beliefs about learning and teaching had been changed dramatically through her NDIE learning experiences. She no longer held as authentic a teacher-centred, textbook-based rote learning, exam-oriented classroom, and set about implementing an active, interactive, teacher-facilitated approach where students were encouraged to think and demonstrate their learning in a variety of assessable ways. By reflecting critically on the direct opposition she encountered, Khadija did not discover ignorance in herself regarding the local community’s staid beliefs about how teaching should happen and what constituted student success. Rather her
critique pinpointed her failure to educate the school personnel and the local community regarding her newfound approaches and strategies. Their need had been to know what she was doing so that they could understand her actions and their impact on the students’ way of learning, voice their excitement or concerns and Khadija, in turn, could have tempered her actions to a staged implementation. I contend that such steps would have enabled a smoother transition from the old to the new, most particularly for the students involved.

The return to NDIE for MEd studies allowed Khadija the opportunity to reflexively encounter this experience by pitting her beliefs about education, enriched theoretical insights and the ‘intellectual and collegial interaction’ (Julia interview 24 March 2001) against the realities of the cultural, social and academic environment of her village school. This is what Rodriguez (cited in Barton & Osborne 2000, p. 234) termed ‘dialogical conversation’ that can happen at two levels. The first level involves listeners who understand the utterances of others, whether they are peers, teachers or students, and then orient themselves with respect to the given perspective. The second level involves the process of reflexivity, of listening to and conversing with personal insights or critical reflections and reorienting held beliefs or practices accordingly. Through these types of dialogical conversations, Rodriguez contends, a person finds his/her proper place or position in a particular context. Having learned through encounters, Khadija’s return to the village school as its principal on the completion of her MEd demonstrated a more mature, competent and confident professional whose every innovation was supported by strong communication channels connecting and involving staff, students and parents in an educative process of innovative schooling. As a District Education Officer noted:

The school is transformed! Students are alive, confident, speaking in English and leading the programmes for the community on special days. No classroom is a place where students are not heard. Early Childhood Education has been introduced to ensure small children are properly oriented to learning. They sing, they draw, they play, they carry no big bags of books on their backs. Ms. Khadija has the whole staff and community working with her...especially the NDIE graduates on the staff are showing the way. (AKESP 3 interview 27 Feb. 2001)
The contrast between Nasir’s professional activities as a BEd-IGCE and as a MEd graduate I found no less stark. Evidence for this difference lay in specific behaviours exhibited in his places of employment. These reflected enactments of the connection between his self-perception and the places of achievement he believed he had reached at the end of each of these two specific stages of his education. Exemplifying Pope’s warning of little learning being a dangerous possession, Nasir’s post-BEd-IGCE determination to prove his theoretical knowledge of curriculum superior to that of his principal in the public forum of a staff meeting demonstrated that while Nasir had the bookish information, he was professionally immature in the manner in which he applied it. He sought to let his words rather than his actions become a model for the other teachers. Likewise his principal, an NDIE BEd graduate-colleague, acted with no less professional maturity, claiming his correctness in the matter by virtue of his position of authority in the school—a behaviour pattern in direct contrast to what had been the focus of his NDIE education.

Khadija in the furthest north of the country and Nasir and his principal at the southern end of Pakistan exhibited similar patterns of transition setbacks as they set about translating their NDIE BEd education into local school settings. It would have been easy for me to conclude that their course of studies and its approaches to learning and teaching were unsuitable for the local context. However, I recognised that the graduates’ critical reflections on their actions pointed in another direction. Both Khadija and Nasir began with an eagerness to implement their learning in practical situations: Khadija focussed more on the students in her classes and Nasir motivated to show the other teachers in the school what he could do. In neither case were their students disadvantaged as recorded by the end of year exam results (Khadija interview 24 Feb. 2001; Nasir interview 5 March 2001). Evidently crucial for both was their ability to critically reflect on their professional actions. This skill enabled them to question what they took for granted (Loughran 2002) as the relevant mode and manner in which to implement the knowledge and skills they had learned and seen modelled at NDIE. From repetitive reflection on action, their ongoing learning emerged.
Significant in the graduates’ adoption of reflective practice as a way of professional learning was not only the paradigm shift it required for them in terms of their beliefs about how learning happened. Rather, it required them to change long-established cultural practices of not questioning a person of respect either because of their age or because of their honoured position in the society as a teacher or principal (Heng & Khim 2004). By the time Nasir had graduated from his MEd and returned to work as a teacher in-service team member in his home Diocese, reflective practice appeared as an ingrained part of his professional life. I found evidence of his ability to move from his initial belief that all teachers in the Diocese needed to receive the same in-service programmes, designed and implemented by the members of his team, to a position of ease and confidence that listened to the teachers in their local environments, addressed their needs and incorporated their ideas into the in-service programmes. He changed from ‘this is the way it must be done in all schools of the Diocese’ to an approach that was more confident, competent and respectful of the teachers as colleagues. This approach encouraged them ‘to adopt what you have found is a more helpful procedure for your students’ (Nasir interview 5 March 2001).

7.2.2.4.2 Effecting Change

Alice’s experiences exemplified another potential hiatus area encountered in the transposition of NDIE pedagogical learning into school settings. Her experience demonstrated how as a graduate student, during the two years of her MEd preliminary programme year, she faced situations of enforced paralysis rather than the implementation of an intended classroom innovation. This occurred in two different schools reputed as among the best of primary schools in the city of Karachi for their modern approaches to teaching and high student achievement. In one of them, Alice was excited to be actualising a well-planned and NDIE school-negotiated student placement of two month’s duration that had the strong support of the school principal for the introduction of an integrated curriculum approach in a selected Year 1 classroom. Opposition came from the class teacher who rejected all Alice-NDIE staff planning and refused Alice’s entrance to the classroom unless she taught from the teacher’s specified textbooks. The intervention of a watchful Beatrice and the principal reversed the teacher’s classroom ban but for Alice:
It was very tough as the teacher could find nothing good in what I was doing and complained to the other teachers in the staffroom. And while I loved working with the children and they responded wonderfully, I felt cheated and rejected. I think more than anything that prepared me for the realities of school life. (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

Conversely, at the second school, Alice endeavoured to carry out an Action Research project as required in the second year of her MEd preliminary studies. Her aim was to establish a more learner-centred classroom through a well organised cooperative group learning process. On this occasion, the principal intervened to stop the action even though the teachers were supportive and eager to watch and learn from what was happening in her classroom. In Alice’s estimation:

The principal did not understand research and was suspicious of what I was doing. He thought my research might say something negative about his school. Also he wanted all the teachers of the six year three classes to be teaching the same things on the same day in the same way. He had no idea of what classroom improvement meant, or what it could do for the children. (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

No intervention by Beatrice could change this principal’s attitude, but with the help of her NDIE research mentor, Alice worked by surreptitious means to complete her classroom research. In critical terms, she chose to learn deeply from both the situations and carried that learning with her into her future employment as a teacher and administrator, indicating how she got her strength from these situations rather than letting them curtail her (Alice interview 3 June 2001). She acted contrary to Bath’s (2006) research, which discovered teachers who in their daily professional lives were subjected to isolation or insult by other teachers or administrators often resorted to helplessness and consistently avoided responsibility for the problems and absolved themselves from finding solutions. In the broader picture, what the incidents in Alice’s story uncovered was the chasm in understanding of the learning teaching process between teachers and administrators in even some of the best rated schools and NDIE as a teacher education institution. I located the problem to lie not in what the institute did on a daily basis with its students, but at the point of when its graduates began to implement their learning in the day-to-day life of school classrooms.
Change theory envisages its agents as possessors of an ability to work with polar opposites (Fullan cited in Ellsworth 2001). Alice’s incidents indicated extremities first seen in the confidence that accompanied well-formed plans for classroom change being met by uncertainty about their outcomes expressed by teachers as fear of or uncomfortableness with the proposal designed to change the way of learning for the class one children. Second, her vision for more learner-centred and cooperative classrooms was stymied by the entrenched educational direction of the principal whose behaviour indicated a very limited insight into the nature of learning and a determination to keep the school safe in its tradition of rote learning of textbooks. The polarity of difference between personal and system change I saw as a third demonstration of the difficulties encountered by NDIE graduates as they endeavoured to operate as professionals who reflected the learning they achieved through the influence of the Australian women. This indicated the struggle between the positive and negative forces of change processes in making the transition from student in the integrated theory and practice learning environment of NDIE to the world of resistance that characterised the school settings. Marsh (2009) uses Fullen’s words to capture this situation of change as a journey of many pathways and not a securely produced blueprint for transition from one practice of learning and teaching to another.

I found worth interrogating the question as to why the pathways that the MEd storytellers experienced at NDIE effected a change in their beliefs about and patterns of learning and teaching yet their initial efforts as graduates to do likewise in their work settings initially was much less successful. The role played by the alliance between the Australians and the students to forge a relationship of learning partners partly addressed this issue.

### 7.3 Partnerships: Respect and Risks—Promises and Practices

Oh East is East, and West is West, and never the two shall meet,
Till Earth and Sky stand presently at God’s Great Judgement Seat;
(The Ballad of East and West, Rudyard Kipling)
An aura of suspicion that encapsulated Kipling’s sentiments lingers in the current atmosphere of daily life in Pakistan and paints the broad brushstrokes of the background to the Pakistani—Australian relationships that I contend lies at the core of the NDIE efforts to realise learning and teaching as an exercise in partnerships. The difficulties that Beatrice enunciated in her cry, ‘I didn’t know from where I would get any support when Bishop Lobo was transferred to Rawalpindi’ (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000), not only showed the reluctance she met in endeavouring to establish organisational collaboration between the diocesan Catholic educational systems and the newly founded NDIE but also indicated a meaning behind the reluctance on the part of the Pakistanis. Reasons for such disinclinations I located in the history and experiences of political and Church organisational structures and modes of operating. In the last 20 years—the span of NDIE’s existence—Pakistan has become recognised as a seedbed for terrorism or rogue state or most delinquent of nations on the world stage (Traub 2010; Rashid 2008; Ali 2008; Kfir 2006; Cohen 2004), and the country has had a subtle power shift from a secular pro-Western society to an Islamist anti-American one (Paris cited in MacDonald 2009). At the same time, Pakistan has been locking itself into partnerships with Western nations in exchange for aid for the country’s development where the focus of the aid is largely donor stipulated and, in Kapur and Subramanian’s (2009) estimation, deeply corruptive. The authors further contend that when governments of struggling countries are lucked into unearned cash, the healthy links that bind them to their citizens are often severed, as, freed of tax burdens, the people are less inclined to monitor their governments. Pakistan’s corruption, misrule and culture of violent instability have been in the process of creation since the decade of the 1980s. The inequality of the aid partnerships versus the increasingly anti-Western attitude is underpinned by the country’s organisation and political culture are still strongly influenced by its colonial inheritance of highly centralised institutions. This concentration of power in the public arena has enabled a hierarchical and authoritarian bureaucracy to perpetuate the status quo by resisting reforms or initiatives, thus ensuring that nothing changes unless it is the expressed wish of the political leader (Wilder 2009).
In such a milieu, the Catholic Church, comprising Pakistani citizens of Punjabi, Goan and Anglo-Pakistani backgrounds (Walbridge 2003), is not immune to but rather mirrors some of the structures and practices of the public organisational culture. The Church took root in the subcontinent through its colonial European forefathers and foremothers in what Frykenberg (2009) deems the third wave of the Goan (Portuguese origins) Catholicism of the Counter-Reformation followed by the fourth wave comprising the British and Northern European Colonials of the eighteenth century. The latter converted a number of the Chura (untouchables) of the Hindu cast, the forebears of the current Punjabi Christians. Walbridge (2003) further signals a perspective that is of importance for my study, namely, the persisting uneasy relations between the Goan and the Punjabi Christians. The former were the English speaking and educated Christians who settled mainly in the Karachi area and contributed significantly to its development through their Church, educational, healthcare, commercial and civic leadership from the years immediately preceding World War II. The Punjabi Christians were either domestic staff for the British, sanitation workers or farmers and agricultural workers. A significant number of the second generation post-partition Punjabis have been educated and comprise 98 per cent of the Catholic population. Since the formation of Pakistan, all but three of Bishops of the six Dioceses have been of Goan background, and this has been a stumbling block for the Punjabis deem it their right as a majority to provide the ecclesial leadership. Underlying this numerical fact, Walbridge (2003) suggests that the Bishops, along with the Goan and foreign (Sri Lankan and European) clergy, believe that the Punjabi Christians continue to see the Church as an institution that will provide for them and not as their own Church that they should support. They continue to be dependent on missionaries and foreign funding.

I considered an understanding of these background circumstances an essential ingredient for locating meaning in Beatrice’s deep concern and struggle for a firm systemic Catholic education ownership of NDIE. The combination of the roots and the prevailing Church, political and organisational cultures of the country mitigated against the ability or will of the Pakistan Catholic educational systems to form a

---

productive and operative partnership with Westerners (Australians) on a basis of shared and balanced strengths and abilities. Throughout the two decades of NDIE existence, there has been a lack of solid mutuality of goals and common concerns for the education of teachers primarily for the Catholic schools. I found evidence for my claims in the fact that the visionary and prime mover for the establishment of NDIE was a Bishop of Goan background. Second Karachi, instead of a city of Punjab, which is home to almost 90 per cent of the Pakistani Christians, was selected for the institute’s location. Third, I justifiably interpreted that quite contrary to the Australian Mercies’ notional partnership-arrangement with the CBCP through Bishop Lobo, the majority of Catholic educators expected that the Australians developing and administering the initial years of the institute would provide these services for the local Pakistani Catholics as well as make available the necessary funding. What was significant in the Australian women’s stories was that the lack of an organisational partnership became a focal point of strain for Beatrice yet the issue remained an unsurfaced or missing element in Julia’s and my recounting. This indicated that the position of NDIE as a satellite circling on its own orbit path within the Catholic education systems had become a fait accompli well before the end of Beatrice’s term as director in 1998.

Beatrice’s anti-colonial type decision not to force or demand a systemic position of recognition for NDIE in Catholic education was counterbalanced by the determination with which her formative hand worked in the sphere that provided her freedom of operation, namely, the approaches to learning and teaching that NDIE adopted. No bucket and thimble nor colonial dispensary metaphors indicated her conceptualisation of and orientation to this process. Partnership forming between and among students and staff was the overall construct out of which flowed her thinking about how the learning-teaching duo would be both conceptualised and practiced (Cook-Sather 2003) at NDIE. I saw evidence that she judged this to be the catalyst leading to a crafted professional strength of character and operation for the institute and its graduates in the country’s field of teacher education. As I further broke open the narrative of my study for meaning making, I discovered the effectiveness of collaboration and partnering in learning and teaching that I have examined below.
7.3.1 The Nature of Partnership

The terms ‘partners’ and ‘partnerships’ encapsulate a wide-ranging spectrum of meaning from the personal and intimate relationship between individuals to the corporate relations formed between and among companies or governments that can spread across nations. While the execution of such partnerships occurs in vastly different ways and contextual realities, at the basis of each lays a combination of reasons for its existence. These reasons include common interest, common good, opportunity, mutuality, sustainability and where what is achieved is commonly valued (Sagawa & Segal 2000). Furthering this perspective and with a relevance to the Pakistani-Australian relationship at NDIE, Facron (2008) uses egalitarian configuration as a descriptor in a postcolonial type milieu in which relationships are established on a footing of equality of persons, built on respect and trust rather than through the use of domination, which finds its expression in held positions of superiority and inferiority. An earlier work in a similar vein was that of Ramsey and Couch (1994, p. 160) who looked on the process of learning as a more egalitarian endeavour, which justified the authors’ coining of the term ‘partnership learning’ as an insight that encapsulates learning as a process in which teachers and students are ‘responsible with’ each other rather than the students being ‘dominated over’ by the teachers in the learning process.54

My interrogation of the stories of the MEd graduates and the Australian women revealed the building of partnerships to be potent in the behaviours that connected them in the interplay of their learning-teaching relationships. This process had at its essence a belief that productive learning and changed pedagogical practices would emerge from establishing a sense of partnerships between and among the students and the faculty members, based on the premise that both groups were learners and teachers. The relationship that developed between them was concentrated on achieving the valued personal and institutional goals which, though tempered with various perspectives, were commonly focussed on a drive towards better educational

54 Ramsey and Couch (1994) explain that their term partnership learning was inspired by the partnership model of society proposed by Riane Eisler (1987) in The Chalice and the Blade. Writing of an earlier time when a goddess was worshipped and women were priestesses and heads of clans, she suggests that society was more egalitarian and that power was seen more as ‘responsibility with’ rather than as ‘dominance over’ others (p. 160).
practices in the schools. I noted that the broadening of vision as well as the struggle to respect and comprehend the interplay of the otherness (Anderson 2000) of the Western and Eastern ways was a constant, though not always a conscious, presence in these partnerships.

7.3.2 Partnerships for Learning

Brinkerhoff (2001) looks underneath at the roots of successful or working partnerships to discover that they are founded on and sustained by trust and respect as the means of operating between and among people involved in the relationship which is contradictory to the adage that partnerships are successful when the outcome on the whole is greater than the sum of what individual partners contribute. There is a consistency in the work of Brinkerhoff, Facron (2008), Sagawa and Segal (2000) and Ramsey and Couch (1994) in their expositions of the values and attitudes that enable partnerships to be active. Based on their works, I designed a schema of principles and approaches that enabled me to walk more deeply into the theme of partnership in learning and teaching that gave meaning to the six stories that formed the basis of my research narrative. The elements of the schema comprised the following:

- Trust and respect—mutuality
- Working out of a new belief pattern
- Cooperative interdependence
- Commitment as the basis for collaboration
- Accountability for the means and the end achieved

7.4 The Shape of the Learning-Teaching Interplay

The foundational concept paper for NDIE (Jordon 1989) symbolically captured its intended role as a beacon of innovation or a lighthouse showing the way for others to emulate. The realisation of such a public institutional persona meant that radical steps had to be taken to ensure the students and teachers of NDIE understood the nature of and participated in the processes of teacher education that would witness its graduates implementing positive changes to the approaches and practices in use in
Pakistani schools. From my research narrative, I indicated curiosity as the driving force that initially led Alice to find out what exactly NDIE did in its approaches to and ways of learning. She sought admission but experienced:

*Absolute disappointment when I was 3 weeks late for the course that first year (1991) and Sr. Beatrice would not take me. No late admissions had ever been heard of here! That made me mad but also more curious about the other ways in which this place would be different.* (Alice interview 3 June 2001)

Nasir sought to change himself and to be taken seriously as a teacher, while Khadija wanted to be an example of a good, highly qualified teacher for other young women of her village and district. They each came with the trust that NDIE would facilitate their hopes to become the reality of their envisioned achievements. They believed that the Australian women could help them realise their desired changes. This situation counterbalanced the Australian women’s belief that their years of experience as educators (Beatrice interview 26 Apr. 2000) was usable to make a difference in the Pakistani context (Jordan 1994) while at the same time consciously they embraced the steep learning curve of cultural differences (Julia interview 3 June 2001) necessary to devise a teacher education process of relevance in both theory and practice.

7.4.1 Trust and Respect—Mutuality

In exploring the theme of partnership within the stories, I was conscious that partnerships in the ideal sense are hardly ever realities yet I reject Brinkerhoff’s (2002) polarity position that they are never possible. Nor were the partnerships in the learning situation of NDIE entirely equal. Nevertheless, they reflected the experiences of Ramsey and Couch (1994), which identified the responsibility roles of learners and teachers in a learning partnership as unequal by nature but at the same time, no less a partnership. Of even greater significance was the basis of trust on which, I argue, the NDIE student-teacher liaisons were formed and the overt and unspoken nature of the trust they built and sustained. I used trust in the sense of a firm reliance by the Australians and the NDIE students on each other’s integrity,
abilities and commitment to a learning and teaching environment and process that would turn their hopes for accomplishment into realities (Macmillan Dictionary).

The building of trust and respect presented itself as a potentially critical challenge given the political-religious corrupt conditions in Pakistan. I deduced from the stories that the aspect of trust and respect could have been threatened, given the differences in values between the Australians and the students. For instance, as discussed in Chapter 5 above, Beatrice described an incident in which she experienced a near clash with the authorities of KU over the methods of student assessment. As a senior and Australian academic in Pakistan, she was usually put on a pedestal of respect. Therefore, the manner of the Dean’s dismissal of her foreign opinion was a form of personal and professional detraction meant to counterbalance her request for the rationale behind the changed assessment procedures. Participating in a reasoned academic discussion was judged by the Dean to be a threat to his authority and a put-down in front of his subordinates (Beatrice interview 24 Apr. 2000). Unlike my experiences of being considered a local (Chapter 5), the foreign state of the Australian women led to rejection in some quarters. The NDIE graduates’ stories presented a contrasting perspective, which suggested that the gap that existed elsewhere between nationalities, East and West, Christian and Muslim had been bridged, indicating that persons were neither pigeonholed nor treated as ‘foreign’ within the parameters of the institute regardless of ethnicity or creed. My study located amongst the students and the Australians trust and respect for each other and these provided the foundational layer of the learning and teaching interplay. Learning to belong to the Pakistani society was key for the Australian women, but I contend that there was only a certain degree of assimilation that was able to take place, and this was also a key factor in a lived expression of mutual respect.

The 11 September 2001 attacks on the US had an impact that further polarised the differences in values between the Western and the Islamic world. Consequently, the threat of backlash became more prevalent in NDIE’s public arena. More

55 Public media & sectarian demonstrations across Pakistan showed steady growth in anti-American attitude & all Westerners perceived as Americans. The Pakistani government at national and provincial levels accept much aid from America in terms of money and skills training while many Pakistanis railed against the donor as they did not want to be beholden to their ‘enemy’. 227
significantly, the relationships among the students, staff and Australians displayed no underlying problems that worked at eroding the existing levels of trust and respect. McKenzie and Harton’s (2002) work discussed the critical nature of teachers’ efforts in establishing normative conditions by instilling trust and respect when social norms have been disturbed. I contend that the initiative necessarily came from the Australians. They ensured the maintenance of conciliatory relations within the institute despite the greater political and cultural conflict and suspicions between the Western and Islamic worlds, which existed within and beyond Pakistan. Mutuality or reciprocity, a two-way relationship with benefits and the responsibilities distributed between the two concerned parties (Mascolo, Misra & Rapisardi 2004; Rose & Wadham-Smith 2004), became an important psychological and social element demonstrated by the Australians and the Pakistanis, the Christians and the Muslims. The mutuality displayed through the emotions and behaviours of the narrative held cultural and religious differences respectfully.

An important factor in trust and respect was how both the MEd graduates and Australians acknowledged and recognised the importance and value of each other as learners and teachers. The established vision and mission for the institute provided inspiration for students and staff to perform according to function and responsibility. This did not happen automatically but was made possible because of the presence of a particular style of leadership. The leadership exercised by each of the directors was critical in maintaining trust and respect because it democratised the position of the staff and the students. I found that shared responsibility and an attitude of all being on an equal footing served as references for the presence of trust and respect. This was especially important as the responsibilities for teaching and administering the NDIE programmes began to be passed on from the Australian women to local staff, the vast majority of whom were NDIE MEd graduates. My experience along with the evidence from my research has given me a sense of knowing that passing on the keys to the local faculty members is an assurance that the institute is being passed into competent professional and committed hands.

A further question that emanated from my research was ‘how was trust and respect achievable in a venue that housed significant differences in values and beliefs?’ As I
claim above, a sense of common purpose for the betterment of learning and teaching experiences and outcomes created such an impact because purpose equalised people (Edwards 2007). The sense of vision and mission required action, and action took place notwithstanding these differences. In the narrated stories in which the Australian women shared potential conflicts and issues during their stay in Pakistan, I found that initially they managed to overcome problems by taking a step back and looking at the big picture. This was quite difficult especially as certain events and conditions, particularly in the established teaching and learning practices in schools and colleges and universities were against their beliefs about the process, content and product of education in general and teacher education in particular.

An aspect of Julia’s story unfolded an insight into this point. Her observations of some students led her to initially believe that the students faced significant pressure to perform in the classroom, which in their terms meant gaining top grades by writing learned off answers in the final exams. Taking and making the initiative to inquire and investigate as a means to gain knowledge and reach a point of understanding was therefore a significant challenge for them as it surrounded them with the uncertainty of walking into a new realm where their ability to perform was completely unknown. Khadija and Nasir initially found themselves floundering, and their self-esteem as learners plummeted as they confronted the challenge to do their learning in a different way and to understanding how they learned. Julia’s story exemplified how the Australian women persevered in this approach, knowing the difficulties it posed for most of the students and I argue that did not mean they stood back and were indifferent to the faltering of the students. Alice, Nasir and Khadija each articulated the individual help and encouragement that the Mercies and other Australian teachers used as the companion or reciprocal partner to the methods of teaching they employed and the demanding responses of a personal best that they encouraged from the students. This integral component of the learning process I interpreted as a critical instrument in gaining the trust and respect of the local students, because the mere initiative that someone wanted to understand them opened up the avenue of communication, and respect then took up its place in the relationship. Mutuality happened when both parties started to take the initiative to
understand each another (Rose & Wadham-Smith 2004) and subsequently served as basis to work around certain compromises so that the partnership was sustained.

7.4.2 Working Out a New Belief Pattern

In the accounts of the Australian women, I noted that their belief patterns were already shaped prior to going to Pakistan. Their beliefs also influenced their decision to serve there as Mercies rather than, for example, AVIs. However, perception and experience proved to be different among the three of them especially as they experienced and dealt with conflict and hardship in the country at varying times and in diverse manners. Their initial belief patterns about Pakistan changed, and in order to make the interplay of learning and teaching effective, their belief patterns needed to be changed again and again. What I saw as critical in all this was their endeavours to reconcile their new belief patterns with their values.

For instance, Julia referred to how women were treated differently in Pakistan, and coming from a Western society, she found many practices that embodied this were not acceptable. In such cases, the Australians’ belief patterns had to embrace the things they could not change, especially the sociocultural and religious practices of Pakistani society. Even though Julia, Beatrice and I frowned upon some of these practices, the situation required that we respect the practices that were part of the belief systems of our students and others of the societal majority. This I judged to be part of the Australians’ learning or becoming educated in and within the Pakistani context especially as the new belief patterns began to find the grounds of compromise that did not necessarily create a negative impact on our respective personal belief systems.

Working out a new belief pattern required the Australian women to have open minds and hearts. Similar to the dynamics of trust and respect through mutuality, I hold that their new belief patterns emerged as they found meaning in their Pakistani environment and thus their knowledge turned into wisdom (Birren & Fisher 1990). This led to a set of behaviours that established better relations among people of different backgrounds and walks of life. The outcome of this development was that
the Australian women and the Pakistanis had the opportunity to experience and embrace their differences. This was an important factor for the Australian women, especially as they needed to adjust to life in Pakistan, and through the changes in their belief patterns became able to see the country in a new light. This also eventually enhanced their functioning as teachers and administrators and the overall performance of the institute.

7.4.3 Cooperative Independence

The principle of cooperative independence refers to having a system function according to a strong coordination platform, but at the same time, the systems need to function independently (Paivio 2007). The Mercies never intended to be a permanent feature of the institute so their time on site in Karachi had to ensure that the performance and output needs of NDIE would be met when they passed on the responsibilities to a wholly local faculty and administrative staff. My examination of this perspective in the narrative showed that the Australians have operated as teachers and administrators and at the same time also taught the local faculty. This embodiment of coordination was designed to ensure that eventually the local staff members would be able to function on their own but maintain the high-quality educational and administrative practices for which NDIE had earned a reputation. The preparation process was especially important as the Australians assessed first-hand the poor-quality educational background of its students and initially relied largely on their Australian professional competencies and know-how to address the vast needs in a foreign environment. My research showed how they gradually built a student body able to offer some critique of its learning needs and appropriate teaching approaches. Likewise, the local faculty was integral contributors to the solutions designed to address the needs of teacher education with the Australian women cognisant of the fact that that the feasibility of the solutions extended to the capabilities and capacities of the faculty.

The mix of independence and cooperation demonstrated an important aspect of key professional strategies the Australian women established in the specific context of NDIE. Their approaches to teaching, learning and administration emerged from what
they believed would be effective in ensuring quality while ensuring learning independence. For example, Julia cited the effectiveness of mentors and models in learning how to teach, as this practice led to cooperative independence where students learned and practised professional skills through critically guided trial and minimum error methods (Orlich et al 2010; Killen 2006).

From my research I deduced that for people who work in the same context, cooperative independence can serve as the strong connection between foreigner and local. When as Westerners, the Australian women came to NDIE armed with skills and knowledge that could aid in creating better conditions, processes and strategies for educating teachers, it was important that they came and operated in a consultative manner. My research showed that trust was established between and among the students, faculty and the Australian Mercies at NDIE so that its graduates were able to perform firstly student and later professional functions for which they had been educated.

7.4.4 Commitment as the Basis of Collaboration

I found that collaboration was a critical and prevailing theme among the six storytellers in my research. This was evident in their perception that working and studying in NDIE relied on effective collaboration with and among the students, staff members and those who had significant roles in their education. Beatrice discussed the importance of teamwork and collaboration within NDIE and between it and the practicum schools particularly so that the efforts the Australians and the students put into the improvement of teaching and learning could be put into place effectively in the schools. Commitment to change became the avenue through which differences in the context of teaching and learning were resolved when goals were shared, whereas commitment to the status quo in a number of schools worked to thwart the efforts of NDIE and its graduates.

Griffin and Moorhead’s (2007) work showed collaboration as the foundation for commitment through stakeholder involvement. They argued that commitment gives way to efficiency and better performance and when collaboration, involvement and
participation become part of the greater whole, a notion captured in the mission of
NDIE. Beatrice found such attributes difficult to locate between NDIE and the
Catholic and university education systems in Pakistan. She nominated her and, by
association, NDIE’s foreignness as a main inhibitor. Conversely, within the domain
of the institute, the environment and system of educating enabled differences to be
bridged because collaboration created a sense of dependence among the students and
faculty. Because of a common goal, I located collaboration from many sides, for
example, from the institutional perspective as narrated by Beatrice, in the personal
notes of Julia, my cultural observations, the determination of Khadija, the freedom of
and through learning experienced by Alice and, in Nasir, the surprise at what he was
able to accomplish. In Griffin and Moorhead’s words, commitment to the work to be
done must follow collaboration. The commitment of the Australian women was well
recognised in the graduates’ stories and this, I contend, introduced a strong sense of
sustainability to the institute. In order to maintain the valued independence,
commitment to educational change became a spoken and acted upon agreement
between the students and the Australian women as they worked for a shared
education mission. Such a commitment cemented not only the collaborative factor
between Australians and the students but also created a more lasting relationship
between the two groups as educational colleagues.

7.4.5 Accountability for the Means and the End Achieved

Accountability in education, as Kirby and Stecher described, ‘refers to the practice of
holding educational systems responsible for the quality of their products...students’
knowledge, skills and behaviours’ (2004, p. 1). It was evident from Beatrice's and
my stories that we expected accountability by means of counting on quality and
continuity; for Julia, accountability was more about how education affected the lives
of the students, especially their values and way of life. As the means and the end
achieved, accountability in this context was designed according to the goals and
objectives of the institute and how these goals and objectives emphasised the benefits
for the students and members of the institute.
What made accountability important in this context was that NDIE in its programmes and processes centred on the stakeholders, namely, the recipients of the educational initiative, the students and the local faculty members. This I saw as an explanation for Beatrice’s concern about the effectiveness and relevance of teacher education programmes offered in Pakistan, and why Julia looked at the social and cultural influences that affected the education of the students while my concern was the establishment of a legacy of quality faculty members and administrators. Accountability, I hold, encompassed the strength of the coordination and collaboration efforts and the ability of NDIE to continue with the programmes and processes of teacher education that did in reality effect change in how its graduate teachers went about their facilitation of learning and teaching.

For its sustainability, NDIE had to be accountable for its innovative methods and approaches to its graduates, its accrediting universities and the employers of its graduates. In the recounting of the six storytellers, I recognised these concerns as operative though each looked at them through different lenses. Being seen to be accountable, NDIE potentially can function at its optimal level and it was evident from my research that such accountability did not reside only with the Australian women but also in the significant contributions of the local people it educated.

7.5 Experience and Personal Agency

I saw in Beatrice’s, Julia’s and my stories that we acted as agents in which we shaped our experiences and at the same time, carried with us the intention to shape the experience of others. Social cognitive theory and the mechanisms of human agency suggest that people can believe their actions will create a set of effects according to their plans and expectations, thus putting a stop to undesired events and conditions (Bandura 2006). This was an important theme in the entire experience. The social cognitive theory, in the aspect of agency, can result in actions especially as thought and behaviour function together to create certain results.

Human agency plays an important role especially among foreign workers who engage in work in conflict areas. This is especially important as these workers are
well aware of the conditions they are about to enter. Working in Pakistan and Karachi particularly is extremely dangerous for foreigners, and the drastic difference between life in Pakistan and life in the Western world is evidence enough for people to think twice in choosing this kind of work (Esser 2004). Bandura’s (1999, 2006) theory of human and personal agency shows that a great motivation for action is the expected and established outcomes. This explains why many organisations such as the Australian Mercies and individuals get involved in this kind of work; usually, their work is mostly driven by purpose. For Beatrice, Julia and I, our individual motivation to spend time in Pakistan needed to be founded on personal choice decision as to why each of us wanted, for a time, to live that specific kind of life. Co-relative to this scenario were the personal decisions made by Khadija, Nasir and Alice to study at NDIE, driven by inner desires for different types of learning experiences hearsay had told them of NDIE as well as the motivation to be professional in their teaching.

Lowe (2008) discussed how people behave according to their perceptions with respect to the greater picture; they can choose to be agents of cause and volition, especially as they come into a situation with certain goals. He further contends that people do not realise this until later on in the experience. For instance, my story revealed that it was not my initial choice to end up working in Pakistan, as I was more interested to learn something else, that is, being a pharmacist or laboratory technician; because of my environment and the external forces that surrounded me, joining the Mercies seemed like a logical course of action for me at that time. Only after such a step did I realise that I could take up teaching. Interestingly, in Beatrice’s story, teaching seemed to be a pressing option in the midst of her family background, and the vocation to the Mercies was not necessarily a dream of hers.

Such experiences narrated instances in which a person gets ‘thrown’ into a situation and then grows from there. This is an aspect of personal agency in which Lowe (2008) pointed out that the agents in the world were mostly brought by causal chains and that decisions typically take place because of externalism. People can thereby act not mainly because of personal beliefs and desires but because of these external influences. Beatrice and I joined the Mercies not necessarily against our wills but the
external factors made us do so; as a result, we took a different turn and forgot about personal ambitions. As for Beatrice’s decision to take the job in Pakistan, just like anyone, any assignment can be denied; but in her case she somehow found a purpose out of her and the Mercies’ perception on Pakistan thus causing certain actions to flow.

Beatrice’s personal agency was initially brought by her position as a Mercy and as someone with a cause. Coming to Pakistan, she saw a sense of purpose by means of formulating what she could do to create a significant impact on the institute. What initially fuelled her actions were both her function and personal intentions to make a difference in the lives of others by means of bringing in her skills, talent and character to better certain aspects of the educational conditions. How this compared with Beatrice’s position as an individual was that she somehow became an agent with a purpose and her personal purpose, as a result, took a backseat.

What I have illustrated from Beatrice’s story was mirrored in the recounting of the other five storytellers. For each, NDIE was a transforming experience (Bandura 2006). As educators, they each exhibited a growth in the characteristics that made them contributors to and not simply passive products of their learning experiences. They formed goals to be achieved and realised them through action plans and strategies. While not as evident after the completion of their BEd-IGCE programme, Khadija, Alice and Nasir set about their professional lives after graduating from their MEd with a vision, a sense of foresight about the outcomes they could achieve and the manner in which they could channel their efforts to achieve these milestones. What I found potently evident was that each of the storytellers was a self-examiner of her/his intentions and manner of functioning. Alice named learning self-reflectiveness as the greatest gift that NDIE gave her. Her story epitomised the behaviours of her MEd colleagues and the Australian women who each exhibited, at varying degrees and expressions, a self-awareness that enabled critical clarity of thought regarding their actions, motives and values. From this process, each made corrective adjustments (Bandura) to their ways of learning and teaching and interrelating with students and colleagues. The individuals and the Institute found
meaning in functioning with the intention of moulding and reshaping their personal and professional lives (Stajkovic & Lee cited in Bandura 2006).

From a slightly different perspective, I also argued that during the years the Australian women spent in Pakistan, the opportunity gradually became a means for each to realise her renewed dreams and personal ambitions, and an assessment of her initial purpose in going there. This was especially important, as personal matters can always intervene in the type of work in which they were engaged at NDIE, and essentially their obligations were not absolute in Pakistan. Had each of the Australian women chosen to shorten her time in Pakistan, she could have done so. Because their sense of purpose became redefined by how their friends, peers and the Institute responded to them, their motivation became renewed.

7.6 The Narrative: Nurtured and Nuanced

To remain faithful to the design and nature of my research as a case study, I have not claimed a universality of application for the meanings I have made and insights identified in this chapter. I remained cognisant of the fact that readers can learn vicariously from an encounter with my work (Stake 2005) by determining what is applicable in their specific contexts. I acknowledge that I had to be selective in passing along to readers my meaning making of the recounted events and experiences of the storytellers. I further recognised that readers will, in Stake’s words, ‘add and subtract, invent and shape, reconstructing knowledge in ways that leave it more likely to be personally useful’ (2005, p. 455).

I identified eight frames of meaning within which innovative and at times counter-cultural learning and teaching occurred at NDIE:

- Transformative teaching
- Loved into learning
- An environment for development
- Partnership in learning and teaching
- Integration of theory and practice
- Professional preparedness
- Daring to alter the boundaries
- Personal agency

These, I contend, exposed what was most precious to the functioning of NDIE and encapsulated the strengths and challenges that formed and shaped the person and the educator in each of the NDIE graduates and the Australian women. The frames, each in its own way, were indicative of the contribution the Australian women made to the education of teachers and teacher education processes in Pakistan. The Australians accomplished this form of transnational education by nourishing, challenging and loving the personified ‘spices’ of the country and in the country. That journey, my research signified, has shown a worthwhile pathway for which other teacher educators can consider and learn. I have illustrated in Chapter 8 that NDIE’s future has already begun. The insights from my research have a major role to play in the actions that will ensure implementation of the planned developmental strategies.
Chapter 8

We know what we are, but know not what we might be
William Shakespeare

The contextual social, political and educational realities in which I have brought my research to a conclusion are vastly different from those existing at its commencement. This chapter paints in broad brushstrokes of context, planned strategies for NDIE’s future and MEd graduate activities, the backdrop against which my study will find its immediate relevance.

8.1 Contextual Reality at the Study’s Endpoint

As I sat on an outward bound plane from Karachi in June 2009, war was raging in the north and west of the country as the armed forces of the Pakistan government sought to eliminate the waring tribal-based Taliban which claimed areas of Pakistan as its own territory under the Sharia rule of law. As a result, there were in excess of 2 million internally displaced people (IDP) of the FATA areas bordering the then North West Frontier Province (NFWP), Balouchistan and Afghanistan living in hastily located refugee camps mainly in the NFWP and Punjab provinces (Dawn 12 June 2009). Under the leadership of Baitullah Mehsud, the Tehrik-i-Taliban (TTP)\textsuperscript{56} had advanced through these areas, most significantly in the once so beautiful and restive Swat Valley, eliminating all who opposed them and extended their terrorist tactics to cities and towns throughout the country. There was a foreboding feeling in the country that no one was safe from the terrorists’ bombs. Significant for my study was the vulnerable position of education—students, teachers, institutions—in such a milieu. A total of 220 schools, mostly girls’ schools, had been blown up or otherwise destroyed by the Taliban militants in the Swat district alone during a six months’ period ending in April 2009 (Taliban Militants destroyed…2009). On the other hand, the Ministry of Education (Government of Pakistan 2009) continued to expound its

\textsuperscript{56} TTP refers to the Taliban ‘movement’ in Pakistan that coalesced in December 2007 under the leadership of Baitullah Mehsud, a wanted militant leader from South Waziristan.
policy on teacher education through which it intended to fashion a new cadre of
teacher educators.

In the ensuing twelve months until July 2010, terrorist bombing tactics across the
country had claimed hundreds of innocent lives through attacks on law enforcement
agencies, schools and universities, mosques, churches, sacred shrines, public
transport, market places, bazaars and people’s homes. I shared the constant inner fear
with so many of the people of Pakistan that nowhere was a space to call safe. July
2010 also saw the country swept into the worst natural catastrophe in recorded
history by the floods that ravaged the people and the land from the north to the south.
Twenty-one million people, that is, more than a tenth of the population, were
displaced; over 2000 people killed; homes in the millions, farming lands, livestock,
machinery, businesses and schools in the thousands were destroyed (Reuters-Alertnet
2010). While the country’s government was slow to respond to the devastation, so
too was the international community and the United Nations Report of November
2010 records that only 45 per cent of the requested and promised 2 billion dollars in
aid for the flood victims of Pakistan had been received (UN Press-TV 2010). As
Oxfam representatives desperately described, ‘Three months after the floods, cases
of disease are increasing and, in the worst-hit area, the southern province of Sindh,
remains underwater with seven million people still without adequate shelter’ (The
Nation 11 Nov. 2010, p. 1).

The floods have been a children’s disaster as over 9 million have been affected and,
in the Pakistan government’s estimation, more than 10,000 schools were destroyed
(Morris 2010; see Fig. 8.1: NDIE response). While such circumstances emanating
from the natural disaster have sorely tested political will, both the government and
educators have remained determined in their efforts to implement the planned
reforms in teacher education.
8.2 Then and Now

I am deeply conscious of the vast difference between the circumstances prevailing in the country in 2010 and those that existed when the NDIE story began to be formed. In 1991, Pakistan was a little-known player on the world stage with some few NGOs, donor agencies and foreign governments quietly making efforts to alleviate the dire nature of poverty and illiteracy and their deeply penetrative effects. Twenty years have made a vast difference, and the country’s internal and external affairs have become a pivotal point in struggles for tolerance and amity on the international stage between the East-West, Muslim-non-Muslim, democratic-Sharia rule of law and terrorism-peaceful coexistence.57 Far from its literal meaning of ‘Land of the Pure’, Pakistan has earned or been assigned descriptors that tag it as a ‘terrorist state and an unstable nuclear armed nation’ that is ranked ninth in the world on the ‘Failed State

57 Documented evidence on websites such as BBC News, UN & UNESCO, CNN News and Al Jazeera News, & magazines The Times, Newsweek, The Bulletin, Foreign Policy, etc.
In May 2009, John Kerry, as chairman of the Foreign Relations Committee and in his Report to the US Congress on ‘US Strategy on Afghanistan and Pakistan’, warned that if Pakistan as a nuclear-armed nation of 180 million people becomes a failed state, it would pose an unimaginable peril to itself, its neighbours and the world. Further, he judged the challenges in Pakistan to be far greater than those of Afghanistan (Kerry 2009).

As an Australian in such a milieu, doubts regarding my ability to remain in Pakistan have crowded my mind. I have found no lag in my willingness to remain as the struggle against poverty through its main lifeline of education continues on a daily basis within the chaotic and uncertain state of the Pakistani society. The vast majority of the people endeavour to eke out their living in fields, factories, businesses and professions; send their children to schools and universities when they judge it relatively safe to do so; hold on to a hope that one day Pakistan will be a prosperous nation for all and not just a few of its citizens or, if possible, seek and plan ways to find a better life in another country. The relative possibility of the latter choice for most Pakistanis is minimal, and because of this that I argue that an institute such as NDIE is a necessity and must continue to contribute positively to the formation of a new cadre of teacher educators and teachers in the schools, colleges and universities (Ansari, Nasim & Khan 2010). The time frame remaining for Australians to continue in the leadership roles at the institute is limited since the situation for foreigners in the country is fraught with uncertainty. Of more importance is the readiness of the local people to recognise and own what has been and what still needs to be accomplished through NDIE in relation to quality teacher education.

8.3 Developments in Teacher Education 2010

‘This time it’s going to be different!’ (Barber 2010). This statement, saturated with innuendo and daring challenge, was placed before of government officials and educators alike by the co-chairperson of the National Education Task Force in June 2010. Barber’s proposal for the movement forward comprised ‘seven key strands of...”
pressure and support’ reform strategies (pp. 6-11), where the second of the support strategies focuses on teacher education in both its initial and CPD stages. He named ‘sustained political will to succeed’, personified in courageous political leadership, as the key factors in accomplishing educational reform.

In August 2010, the HEC after three years of consultation with local and foreign educators released for the first time the curriculum for ADE course. This much-anticipated new degree course was launched on a pilot basis for the academic year of 2010–11 in 15 universities across the country. As indicated in Chapter 3, this course will phase out the existing PTC and CT courses and be the first formal award-granting step towards enhancing the standard of teaching in schools. The curriculum has been designed to respond to the requirement of the National Education Policy 2009, which states that by 2018 all teachers in Pakistan’s classrooms will require a Bachelor’s degree in order to teach (http://www.hec.gov.pk /curriculum/ revision, accessed October 15, 2010). At the same time, the HEC released its revised curriculum for the four-year BEd (Hons) course for Elementary and Secondary Education, a degree course that corresponds to international standards in teacher education. The process initiated by the HEC formed a National Curriculum Revision Committee to revise the education curriculum. The consultation process involved ‘experts’ from different universities and teacher education institutions from each of the provinces and territories. Three such consultative meetings were held in October 2009, November 2009 and March 2010 at two locations, Lahore and Islamabad and, in recognition of NDIE’s standing in the national teacher education community, I was invited to participate at the Islamabad gatherings.

To prepare the faculty of the elementary colleges of education and university faculties where the ADE and BEd (Hons) were to be piloted, the Pre-Service Teacher Education Programme (Pre-STEP)\textsuperscript{59} organised workshops for developing such components as the detail of the course outlines, the time and weightage allocated for each topic, the variety and suitability of instructional strategies deployed for different topics and methods of assessment to reflect the formative approach of the country’s

\textsuperscript{59} The Pre-Service Teacher Education Program (Pre-Step) is a 5 year (2008-2013) USA-Pakistan Government partnership (http://www.usaid.gov/pk/sectors/education/pre-step.html).
curriculum policies. At the invitation of Pre-STEP personnel who were cognisant of the approaches to teaching for learning used at the institute as well as the capabilities of several of its graduates, NDIE faculty members have been and continue to be (2010–2011) key contributors to the design and implementation of the modules for these workshops at three of the four government elementary colleges (GEC) in the province of Sindh selected to pilot the ADE course, namely Hussainabad (Karachi), Hyderabad and Mithi. NDIE is also responsible for the support and mentoring of the three GEC faculties as they implement the new ADE course.

8.4 NDIE Strategised Future

From a planner’s perspective, it is fair to say that NDIE opened on a ‘wing and a prayer’. Neither short- nor long-term plans for its development were drawn up nor were the foundations laid for its future financial security. As demonstrated in Figure 8.2 below, where I have made a comparison between the second and the nineteenth year of its operation, NDIE relies very heavily on donations and outside support for its year-to-year functioning. While an expansion of the involvement of the NDIE faculty in income-earning endeavours such as consultancies and government CPD projects is evident, future financial security remains very grim. To remedy this situation, the governance and management of NDIE undertook a Strategic Planning process throughout 2008–09. The course of action aimed to appraise and direct the future of the institute in the light of the changing environment (Mogavero & Lake 2006; Ronco 2007). This included Pakistan’s political instability, its expressed efforts for reform particularly in the area of teacher education and its increasingly transnational outlook on tertiary education. Specifically, the strategic planning exercise produced decisions and a plan of action with a supporting financial plan that mapped a future (2009–2014) for the institute in the light of its mission and in terms of what it will do and why it will take the specified direction and actions (Chang 2008).

60 Mr. Rafiq Jaffer, director of the Institute of Social Science, Lahore, was engaged to facilitate this process.
As the various components of the strategic plan are implemented, I am cognisant of the fact that the NDIE to which my research outcomes will be inserted and find their particular relevance is in the process of transformation. The strategic plan delineates seven specific areas:

- location and academic standing;
- curriculum options;
- organisational structure and leadership;
- financial plan;
- implementation timeline;
- marketing plan; and
- evaluation strategies

However, I have selected the first three salient features, where my research outcomes will have particular relevance and have noted Matthew’s (2008) warning that, in its implementation, each building block of the strategic plan must be developed calculatingly and attentively to minimise the risks of a collapse of the entire strategy.
8.4.1 Location and Academic Standing

NDIE’s long-term strategy is to be a degree-granting institute with the main campus located in Rawalpindi where sufficient Church land is available for building and expansion. The current NDIE site in Karachi, which cannot be expanded, can be refurbished and the available space can be reallocated. The initial steps for the realisation of this plan began in 2010.

In the journey towards being a degree-granting institution, NDIE will form closer links with ACU and discontinue its affiliation with KU. In the interim, all its awards
will be granted by ACU after obtaining the necessary credentials for such from the HEC in Pakistan.

8.4.2 Curriculum Options

In accord with the HEC policy for teacher education, NDIE will introduce the new two-year ADE course leading to the four-year BEd (Hons) award in 2012 and the two-year MEd course by 2016. In addition, it will offer Graduate and Post Graduate Certificate and a Masters degree in Educational Leadership beginning in 2011. ACU will be the degree-granting institution for each of these awards. NDIE will redesign its modes of offering these courses to include full-time and part-time on campus and mixed mode of on-campus and online access.

The institute will expand its research agenda, including school-based and policy research, and initiate a PhD programme under the supervision of faculty from ACU, which will also award the degree.

To cater to the needs of teachers unable to attend regular NDIE courses, including teachers of Urdu-medium schools, NDIE will offer CPD short-term programmes, including accredited certificate courses at NDIE during the summer vacations, and short courses and workshops at NDIE and school sites.

8.4.3 Organisational Structure and Leadership

The institute must make significant increases in the number of its academic faculty and strengthen its administrative staff in order to implement the proposals regarding logistics and curriculum. This will include a senior academic/administrative position to assume responsibilities for the day-to-day running of either the Karachi or the planned Rawalpindi campus, depending on the location of the director or head of the institute. The strategic plan details the projected gradual increases required in academic staff, some of whom will assume responsibilities for course coordination, subject area specialisations and other middle management positions. The strategic plan’s projections provide clear indicators for NDIE’s administrators.
throughout the transition and expansion stage so that the increase in student numbers across the two campuses, the planned new curriculum offerings and research activities are able to be realised.

However, I have learned through experience that a number projection of teacher educator requirements is the easy task, while the significant challenges lie in securing quality teaching and research faculty (Ahmed 2010, Fielden 1998). Measures to gauge the quality of potential faculty include ensuring that their academic awards have been soundly earned, that they have abilities to construct knowledge, model and innovate pedagogical skills and that they actively engage in academic scholarship (Keeley 2007). The recruitment of academic staff with such high qualities of scholarship, professionalism and pedagogy is a problem shared particularly in the developing countries of Asia, South-East Asia and Africa (Lam 2009; McTavish 2006; Norton et al 2005; Saint 2009; Tan 2006) and is an area ripe for research regarding teacher education faculties within universities, institutes and colleges.

My research has shown clearly that central to NDIE’s learning and teaching process is first and foremost the sense of partnership between and among students and faculty. Aligned with this is the consciousness of being cared about and loved into learning amidst challenges to the individuals to perform at their highest level of proficiency so that in turn, they adapt their knowledge and skills to help facilitate change in their professional settings. I contend that this is at the essence of the approach for which NDIE is known and it must be kept at the centre while the institute expands and seeks to recruit faculty members from wider domains. As noted below (8.4) and from a determined plan designed by Beatrice from its foundation, NDIE has been steadily building a local faculty of high quality from among its MEd graduates. In 2010, more than 80 per cent of the academic faculty and academic administrators are amongst this category. Rust and Fisher (2003) termed such a plan ‘growing your own’ but warned it must also be balanced and enriched by academics, including NDIE graduates, who have gleaned experiences from other universities and teacher education institutes both within Pakistan and in other countries.
8.5 The NDIE MEd Graduates

Ninety-nine MEd students have graduated from the NDIE MEd programmes, fifty-two women and forty-seven men (June 2010). Ethnically they are representative of the Pakistani nation being Sindhi, Balouchi, Punjabi, Goan, Pathan and from the tribal areas of the Northern Regions. They have come from Christian, Muslim (Sunni, Shia, Ishmaili, Bohri), Ba’hi and Parsi communities. They have been women and men who have left NDIE with the hope and the desire to make a difference within the Pakistani educational systems and to that end have taken up positions across the length and breadth of Pakistan, as illustrated in Figure 8.3.

![Figure 8.3: NDIE graduates in various cities of Pakistan](image)

8.5.1 Academic Accomplishments

Graduates of the NDIE MEd programme have been readily accepted into doctoral programmes in Pakistan and in universities of high standing in various countries. The quality and rigour of their NDIE training through the three pieces of research that
they each produced during their MEd studies have been key factors in admission processes (Margaret, pers. comm.; Sukaina 13 Nov. 2002; Alice 11 May 2002; Aien Shah Sept. 2010).

Seven of the NDIE graduates have completed their doctoral studies in the UK, US, Canada and Australia, while two are in the process of doctoral studies in Australia. Eight other graduates are pursuing doctoral studies within Pakistan, while another four are to begin such studies on full scholarships in the US in the 2011 academic year. Of the latter four, one is to pursue research into educational leadership at Harvard while the other three are faculty members of the recently established Faculty of Education at the Karokoram University in Gilgit-Baltistan. Each has taken up research on a selected Pakistani educational problem and to date, all but two of the overseas doctoral candidates have returned to Pakistan to continue their professional lives as contributors to the educational development of the country. Other graduates hope to pursue their studies when opportunity allows this to become a reality for them.

### 8.5.2 Professional Roles

The NDIE MEd graduates have assumed responsible roles as professionals and are much sought after by educational leaders and employers. The academic faculty of NDIE has been enriched since 2000, by 21 of its graduates joining the faculty, in either full or part-time capacities, with responsibilities in the BEd-IGCE, MEd and MEd Leadership and CPD courses, programmes and projects. These have been guided by the Australian women into positions of responsibility based on merit and not the bureaucratic system of seniority promotion that prevails in government and many non-government educational institutions. This is a challenging area for NDIE leadership, namely, to provide guidance for tertiary teaching and facilitation of the acceptance of the professional quality and capabilities of these graduates by the current BEd-IGCE and MEd students and the wider community. There remains a basic mistrust amongst some of the latter, that the local people can do as good a job

---

61 Two undertook their studies in the UK, three in Australia, one in Canada and one in the United States.
as the ‘foreign’ teachers. NDIE MEd graduates have obtained faculty positions on merit at other tertiary institutions such as the AKU-IED and the recently established Karakoram University in FATA and Gilgit-Baltistan.

In the schools in which they are employed, each MEd graduate has accepted administrative responsibilities as principals, deputies, section heads, curriculum developers and CPD coordinators. Those in long-established private community-based school systems frequently encounter many difficulties introducing curriculum and pedagogical changes. This has been exacerbated by the fact that many of the teachers on staff have had no formal teacher education. One graduate who was the first appointed principal in a new primary school had the opportunity to select her own staff, be instrumental in designing the curriculum and involve parents at each stage of the school’s development. Hers is a heartening story for Pakistani education and teacher educators and is reflective of Solbrekke & Karseth’s (2006) study, which found that professional responsibility in masters’ graduates requires more than being up to date with academic knowledge and skills. Their studies must also make them well equipped and competent to deal with the even larger challenges of dealing with the practical and moral issues that present themselves on a regular basis.

Ten MEd graduates form the backbone of Catholic Diocesan Teacher In-Service teams in Sindh, the Punjab and Kyber-Pakhtunkhwa. While much hope has been placed in them by the respective CBE, so too, their responsibilities to make a difference is great. Likewise, MEd graduates have leadership roles in the AKESP teacher professional development and academic administrative units, particularly in the Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral areas where they are well respected for their professionalism, skills and leadership qualities (interviews SD 3 March 2001; MAL 5 March 2001; MS 5 March 2001). Heavy expectations are placed on NDIE graduates by their employers (interviews SMC 15 March 2001; SD 16 March 2001) because the institute has earned a public reputation for excellence in its educational approach and outcomes. Figure 8.4 is illustrative of the professional roles in which NDIE MEd graduates are engaged throughout Pakistan.
Such facts and figures regarding graduate employment and common perceptions of their capabilities can yield only a partial testimony as to the outcomes of the MEd programme. What they are incapable of portraying are the correlations between the process and style of learning, teaching and interaction at NDIE and the change effected in the personal and professional lives of its graduates. In walking more deeply into meanings held within the recounting of the graduate storytellers of my research, I discovered that each, in his/her own way, has a passion for education. Their work is amongst the middle classes, the elites and some of the poorest Pakistani children to be found in schools. I contend that these are women and men whose richness and honesty of professional stories have been woven a critical narrative that speaks well beyond the borders of my research. My narrative has yielded a richness of insight that made meaning out of their years of study at NDIE, demonstrated its impact on their professional practices and gave guidance for the future of teacher education both at NDIE and beyond its walls.

![Figure 8.4: NDIE MEd graduates in various educational fields](image)

8.6 Conclusion: The Effort Came from Us: Verified ‘Actions of Implementation’ 62

Bishop Lobo’s dream for a teacher education institute that would educate teachers with the capacity and confidence to bring change to the learning-teaching interplay in

---

62 I acknowledge the connection between my choice of this chapter title and the work of Mohammed & Harlech-Jones (2009) ‘The fault is in ourselves: Looking at “failures in implementation”.’
schools in Pakistan was tried and tested only after it emerged from its passage down the birthing canal and took on the challenges of living out its imagined and planned life. Jordan (1989) further envisaged NDIE as a lighthouse that would provide for other teacher education institutes, an example of a way forward. I contend that my study has confirmed that in the considered view of the local Pakistani MEd graduates, their employers and colleagues, NDIE developed a roadmap by which its students chose to transform themselves into lifelong learners, demonstrated high quality educational and administrative competencies and facilitated positive changes in their places of employment. Thus, local spices did and do not need to be traded beyond the borders of Pakistan in order to achieve quality in learning and teaching and educational enrichment.

*NDIE is rich in local spices.*

**Figure 8.5: Local spices: Students of NDIE**
References


Akhtar, N 2008, Studying the attitude of parents towards the education of their children: a study conducted in low literacy areas of the Punjab, viewed 22 November 2010, <www.usa.edu.pk/Web/Publications/PDF/Studying%20the%20Attitude%20of%20Parents%20Towards%20Education>


Ashfaq, M 2010, ‘Universities oppose 4-year degree programme’, *Dawn*, 1 September, p. 5.


Barber, M 2010, *Education reform in Pakistan: this time it’s going to be different*, 255.
Pakistan Education Taskforce, Islamabad.

Research Methodology Reader 1, Deakin University, Geelong.

Bath, RS 2006, ‘Improving relationships within the schoolhouse’ Educational 
Leadership, pp. 8–13.

Baum, G 1979, Man becoming: God in secular experience, Seabury Press, New 
York.

Beck, C & Kosnik, CM 2006, Innovations in teacher education: a social 
constructivist approach, Albany State University, New York.

Bell, P & Winn, W 2000. ‘Distributed cognitions, by nature and by design’, in 
Theoretical foundations of learning environments, eds DH Jonassen & SM 

Arendt, Fontana, London.

Bennett, P 2003, Quality assurance in transnational education: an education 
international perspective, European Association for Quality Assurance in 
Higher Education, retrieved November 11, 2010 


Biesta, G & Egea-Kuehne, D (eds) 2001, Derrida and education, Routledge, 
London.

in Wisdom: its nature, origins and development, ed RJ Sternberg, Cambridge 

learning: putting it into practice, Open University Press, Maidenhead, UK.

86, pp. 8–16.

Black, P & Wiliam, D 1998, ‘Inside the black box: raising standards through 

Bolton, G 2010, Reflective practice: writing and professional development, 3rd edn, 
Sage, London.

256


Bourke, C 1989, A woman sings of mercy, EJ Dwyer, Sydney


Brinkerhoff, JM, 2002 Partnership for international development: Rhetoric or results? Lynne Rienner, Boulder, Colorado.


Clandinin, DJ & Connelly EM 2000, Narrative inquiry: experience and story in qualitative research, Jossey-Bass, San Francisco


Clemons, SA 2006, ‘Constructivism pedagogy drives redevelopment of CAD course: a case study rather than feeding information to the student through direct instruction, the teacher is maintaining the role of facilitator in the learning process’, The Technology Teacher, vol. 65, pp. 19+.


Dani, AH 2008, History of Pakistan: Pakistan through ages, Sang-e-Meel
Publications, Lahore.


262


Faculty of Education, 1996, ‘Course of study for Bachelor of Education,’ Faculty of Education, University of Karachi, Karachi.

Faculty of Education, 1997 ‘Course of study for Master of Education,’ Faculty of Education, Karachi.


pp. 327-335.
Flyvberg, B 2006, ‘Five misunderstandings about case study research’, Qualitative Inquiry, vol. 12, no. 2, pp. 219-245
Frytenberg, RE 2010, Christianity in India: from beginnings to the present, Oxford University Press, Oxford.
   Fuller, G 2003, ‘The textual politics of good intentions: critical theory and semiotics’, in Culture and text: discourse and methodology in social research and cultural studies, eds A Lee & C Poynton, Allen & Unwin, St. Leonards NSW.
Garrett, R 2004, Transnational delivery by UK higher education, Part 2: innovation


GATE


Goodson, LP 2008, ‘Pakistan, the most dangerous place on earth’, Strategic Studies Institute, Carlisle PA, viewed 9 January 2010, <www.strategic studies


Guba, EG & Lincoln, Y 1989 (b), Personal communication, Sage, Thousand Oaks, California.


Higher Education Commission, 2006, Curriculum of education: BEd/BSc (Hons) and MEd, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad.


Holly, ML 2002, Keeping a professional journal, UNSW Press in association with Deakin University Press, Sydney


Khan, S 2009, ‘Pakistan’s higher education funding holds many lessons for developing nations’, *Science, Technology and Education in Pakistan (STEP)*, 3 September, p. 1.


Kushi, Y 2010, Appeal for taking suo moto action against blasphemy case against Asia Bibi and other victims of blasphemy charges ... killing of innocent Christians could be brought to an end, The Supreme Court of Pakistan, Islamabad.


University Press, New York.


McNiff, J 2007, ‘My story is my living educational theory’ in *Handbook of narrative inquiry: mapping a methodology*, ed DJ Clandidin, Sage, Thousand Oaks,
California.


Miller, J P 2007, *The holistic curriculum*, University of Toronto Press, Toronto.


Mir, A 2009, ‘Pakistan turned into the suicide capital of the world’, Middle East Transparent, July 3


Morris, C 2010, ‘10,000 schools destroyed by floods in Pakistan’, BBC News, 1 September, viewed 15 October 2010,


Norton, L,


Powell, MA 1990 *What is narrative criticism?* Fortress Press, Minneapolis.


professional judgement, Routledge, London.


Van Maanen, J 1988, *Tales of the field: on writing ethnography*, University of


Wilder A, 2009 *Testimony of Andrew Wilder in Hearing on US Aid to Pakistan*: 281


Appendix 1: Relicensing of NDIE for Five Years

AGREEMENT

between

AUSTRALIAN CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY (ACU)

and

NOTRE DAME INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION (NDIE)

for offering the

International Graduate Certificate in Education
Master of Education
and other relevant approved courses

in

Karachi, Pakistan

Date: [date] day of December 2009

Parties:

AUSTRALIAN CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY Limited (ACN: 050 192 660) (ACU) of 40 Edwards Street, North Sydney, a company limited by guarantee under the Companies (Victoria) Code, and

NOTRE DAME INSTITUTE of EDUCATION (NDIE) c/o St Patrick's High School Campus, Ahmed Munir Shaheed Road, Soddar, Karachi, Pakistan
Agreement between Australian Catholic University and Notre Dame Institute of Education

This agreement supersedes all previous agreements.

SIGNATORIES

Signed on behalf of ACU

[Signature]
Professor Marie Emmitt
Dean, Faculty of Education
Date 1/12/2009

John Cameron
Pro-Vice-Chancellor (Administration and Resources)
Date 16/12/2009

Signed on behalf of Notre Dame Institute of Education

[Signature]
Sr Margaret Madden RSM
Director, Notre Dame Institute of Education
Date 30/12/2009

[Signature]
Bishop Anthony Lobo
Chairperson, NDIE Board of Governors
Date 30/12/2009
OFFICE OF THE AFFILIATION COMMITTEE  
UNIVERSITY OF KARACHI  

Secretary  

ACIS/2006/644  

May 10, 2006  

NOTIFICATION  

The Vice-Chancellor, on behalf of the Academic Council/Syndicate, has approved the inspection reports of Notre-Dame Institute of Education, Saddar, Karachi as follows:  

1. The number of seats for B.Ed. Program are now fixed, which shall not exceed 60 seats per year.  

2. The number of seats for M.Ed. Program are increased from 15 to 30, but as institute is not willing to pay the fee for additional 15 seats, and they have paid fee for only 5 additional seats, therefore number of seats for M.Ed. program are fixed 20 per year, however, if the institute wants to increase seats in future the number could be increased up to 30 only without any inspection, but on existing payment of fees for additional seats.  

3. All rules and regulations of the University pertaining to enrolment, examinations and declaration of result shall be followed.  

4. Approved courses of the University for the B.Ed/M.Ed. Programs (Morning) shall be taught to the college students.  

5. Any change in the administrative set up of the college shall be intimated to the University immediately.  

6. The University may inspect the college at any time without any intimation to the administration of the college.  

7. Being an affiliated college of the University, the college shall not seek affiliation from any other University or Degree Awarding Institution. Moreover, its name and premises shall not be used for any other purposes.  

(Prof. Dr. Sohail Barkati)  
Secretary  
Affiliation Committee  

Copy to:-  

1. The Director,  
   Notre-Dame Institute of Education, Saddar, Karachi  
2. The Controller of Examinations  
3. Assistant Controller (Arts)  
4. Assistant Controller of Examinations (Enrolment)  
5. The Deputy Registrar (Academic)  
6. File concerned  

285
## Structure of the Education System in Pakistan (Formal Only)

| Grade | I   | II  | III  | IV   | V    | VI   | VII  | VIII | IX   | X    | XI   | XII  | XIII | XIV  | XV   | XVI  |
|-------|-----|-----|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|
| Age   | 5/6 | 6/7 | 7/8  | 8/9  | 9/10 | 10/11| 11/12| 12/13| 13/14| 14/15| 15/16| 16/17| 17/18| 18/19| 19/20| 20/21|

### Appendices

**Appendix 2**

---

Source: Academy of Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM)
Appendix 3: Ministry of Education –HEC Plan for Teacher Education and Accreditation
2009

Higher Secondary School Certificate (HSC) → ADE (Year 1&2 of BEd) → Exit Point → BEd (Hons) (Year 3&4 of BEd) → MEd (2 Years Full time Equivalent)

Four Years' Formal Education

ADE (Year 1&2 of BEd) → Exit Point → BEd (Hons) (Year 3&4 of BEd)

Qualified for (Classes 1–8)

Qualified for Elementary Specialisation (Classes 1–8)
Qualified for Secondary Specialisation (Classes 8–12)
Appendix 4: Semi Structured Interview Schedule A

CRITICAL INCIDENT INTERVIEW

MED GRADUATES

1 Introduction to the interview; thanking XXX for her/his willingness to participate and assuring her that the data will be used for no other purpose than that intended for the research. XXX assured that she/he will always be in charge of what she/he shares in the interview and will receive a hard copy of the complete script at which time any changes that she sees as necessary can be made. XXX thanked for the contribution she/he is so willingly making to this piece of educational research.

2 The purpose of the interview is to capture something of your story as an educator with the particular focus on your connections with education in Pakistan and most specifically NDIE.

3 As I mentioned to you in our previous interview, for the purpose of this research I would like to capture that story through your own reflections on significant events or experiences that are markings of your journey as an educator and not a medical doctor or some other work or profession. Of course it may well be in hindsight that the experiences or events have been significant or critical for you – at the time they may not have ‘moved the earth’ so to speak.

4 My role then will be more of a listener, following with you wherever your reflection takes you.

5 At times I may draw you out a little more on some points or seek some clarification for my own understanding.

6 However, this data is your story and you are always in charge of the matter that you choose to share in terms of its detail.

7 Check any further questions ….. might have

8 So perhaps I can suggest a launching pad for you ….

- Would you tell a little of who you are and how you came to be a teacher.
• So, how did you end up at Notre Dame?

• What is your story of NDIE

• How do you see / or how could you describe the place of NDIE as an educational institution within Pakistan?

• How local or how Australian is it … are there any incidents or experiences that capture this for you?

9 In recalling your time at NDIE, I’d invite you to tell your story through singling out a few particular events or happenings that were significant for you and help to capture glimpses of your experiences as your journeyed on the way to graduation with an MEd Degree

10. END QUESTIONS IF NOT COVERED IN THE STORYTELLING

i. How significant for you was your experience as a student at NDIE?
ii. on the role and contribution of NDIE within Pakistan and the part played by the Australians
iii. What captures for you the success, firstly, and the shortcomings of NDIE.
iv. What contribution are the NDIE graduates making to any practical or observable educational development in Pakistan
v. How locally contextualised do you believe NDIE to be? Is such contextualisation necessary amidst the backdrop of a growing globalisation of education?
vi. Would such developments have happened without NDIE?

A sincere thank you at the end of the interview.

Set a date for the second interview.
SECOND INTERVIEW SCHEDULE

(i) Checking the Initial Interview Transcript
(ii) Using Photographic Images as Stimulants

Part 1

1. A copy of my transcript of the initial interview with the research participant was forwarded to her/him one week prior to the second interview.

2. Check for any instances of mis-information.

3. Ask if there is anything she/he would like to add.

Part 2

A selection of public and private photos will be arranged for the participant’s ease of viewing convenience.

The research participant will be asked to take time to select up to 5 photographs from the collection that evoke particular memories, incidents, associations, etc. related to NDIE and their connections with the Institute.
Appendix 5: 13 Photo Images Used in Interviews

Fig Ap. 1

Fig Ap. 2

Fig Ap. 3

Fig Ap. 4

Fig Ap. 5
Appendix 6 - Semi Structured Interview Schedule B

SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEW SCHEDULE
FOR
EMPLOYERS & COLLEAGUES OF MEd GRADUATES

Focus of the Interview: The professional competency of the NDIE MEd Graduate

AREAS OF INVESTIGATION:

1. Introduce themselves and tell a little of their current position and the types and years of professional experience.

2. The capacity in which they know XXX and the length of time they have been professional colleagues.

3. The professional roles and functions in which they observe XXX performing.

4. Three words they would choose to use to describe XXX in these roles.

5. What are professional strengths and weaknesses they see in XXX.

6. What differences, if any, do they see between XXX and other educators with similar roles and functions?

7. Did they know XXX before she/he studied at NDIE? If so, what changes, if any, do they observe in her/him?

8. From experiencing XXX as an employee or colleague, what impression do they have of the NDIE approach to teacher education?

10. Would you describe XXX as an educator who is making a difference? Reasons for the response.

11. Is there some advice you’d like to give to NDIE in terms of its teacher education programmes?

12. Any other comment.
MEMORANDUM

TO:       Ms Margaret Madden  
Social & Cultural Studies in Ed  
Geelong  

FROM:     Secretary, Deakin University Human Research Ethics Committee (DUHREC)  

DATE:     24 November 2000  

SUBJECT:  PROJECT: EC 240-2000  (Please quote this project number in future communication.)  
BEYOND THE SPICE TRADE: A STUDY OF AUSTRALIAN WOMEN EFFECTING EDUCATIONAL CHANGE IN PAKISTAN

The above project was considered at Meeting 6/00 held on 20 November 2000. The Ethics Committee decision and explanation are given below.

THAT APPROVAL BE GIVEN FOR MS MARGARET MADDEN, UNDER THE SUPERVISION OF DR JENNIFER ANGWIN, SCSE, TO UNDERTAKE THIS PROJECT FROM 1 DECEMBER 2000 TO 30 APRIL 2002.

Standard on-going ethics clearance has been given for the above project as submitted. However, a photocopy of any letter of authority to involve other institutions or organisations should be forwarded to my office for noting by the Ethics Committee as soon as practicable.

Also, the plain language statement (PLS) will need to contain the correct standard complaints clause as follows (and not that of the DUHREC Sub-Committee - Education given):

"Should you have any concerns about the ethical conduct of this research project, please contact the Secretary, Ethics Committee, Research Services, Deakin University, 221 Burwood Highway, BURWOOD VIC 3125. Tel +61 3 9251 7123."

A copy of the corrected PLS should be submitted for the record.

The standard conditions for on-going ethics clearance are listed on the accompanying page. Please contact my office if you have any concerns or queries about the above decision. The project reference number should be quoted in any communication.

Signature Redacted by Library

Keith Wilkins  
Secretary, Ethics Committee  
Tel: (03) 9251 7123 (or ext 17123)  
Email: keithwil@deakin.edu.au