Deakin Research Online

This is the published version:


Available from Deakin Research Online:

http://hdl.handle.net/10536/DRO/DU:3005639

Reproduced with the kind permission of the copyright owner.

Copyright : 2005, University of Tasmania, Dept of Education
Proceedings of the International Conference on Critical Discourse Analysis: Theory into Research

Editor: Thao Lê
Assistant Editor: Megan Short

ISBN: 186295296 5

The papers which are marked with the symbol ® at the end of the paper title are refereed papers. The papers were peer reviewed by at least one reviewer who is independent of: the author, the conference's organising committee and editorial board.

All the Abstracts and Conference Papers in this collection are copyright © under Australian law and international conventions. Each Abstract or Conference Paper is copyright © by the individual author or authors and may not be reproduced without permission of the author or authors.

The conference was held at the University of Tasmania, Australia on 15-18 November 2005. Special thanks are extended to Susan Grant and Leah Chandler for their assistance with the publication of the conference proceedings.

Published by:
Faculty of Education
University of Tasmania
Locked Bag 1307 Launceston 7250 Tasmania Australia
February 2006
ISBN: 186295296 5
## Table of Contents

Table of Contents .............................................................................................................................2

Grammar Choices and Making Meaning in Teaching Reading Thematic area: CDA as a Research Method/Perspective ©.................................................................................................................................8

*Hayat Al-Khatib* .................................................................................................................................8


*Idris Aman* ..........................................................................................................................................23

The Ticking Mind and the Beating Heart: Writing, Imagination and Empathic Intelligence (Keynote Paper) .................................................................................................................................................38

*Roslyn Arnold* ....................................................................................................................................38

A Critical Perspective on the Representation of Racial Identities in Business English Course Books ©.........................................................................................................................................................................................48

*Sarah Bedford* .....................................................................................................................................48

Where You Attend School does Make a Difference! The Impact of a School's Socio-Economic Status Upon the Academic Outcomes of its Young Learners ©.............................................................................................................64

*Margot Boardman* ...............................................................................................................................64

*Yoshi Budd* ..........................................................................................................................................75

Teaching Identity: The Discursive Construction of an Evolving Community of Practice ©.............84

*Matthew Clarke* ....................................................................................................................................84


*B. Coffey* ............................................................................................................................................94

Anti-Oedipus in Education ©..................................................................................................................110

*David R Cole* ......................................................................................................................................110

Learning by example: School Exclusion and Life-Enacted Learning © ...............................................119

*T.D. Corcoran* .....................................................................................................................................119

All the way with CDA: Using Critical Discourse Analysis to investigate the complexities of the classroom site ©......................................................................................................................................................128

*Leanne Dalley-Trim* .............................................................................................................................128

Text Analysis of Poetic Genre in Translation: a Contrastive Study of English & Persian Discourse © .............................................................................................................................................................................139

*Hossein Vahid Dastjerdi* ....................................................................................................................139

*Bahador Sadeghi* ..................................................................................................................................139

Power, Discourse and Enterprise Resource Planning Systems (Keynote Paper)...............................155

*David Grant* .........................................................................................................................................155

*Richard Hall* .........................................................................................................................................155

"What is in a request?": The speech act performance of English Second Language learners © ..........168

*Lizette de Jager* ....................................................................................................................................168

A Content Analysis of Three File-selves ©............................................................................................186
Volunteers in an Organisational Setting: a Critical Discourse Analysis of Identification and Power® .................................................. 203

Negotiations and Resolutions: Two Case Studies in Intraprofessional Meeting Talk......................................................... 210

Membership Categorisation Analysis and the Critical Analysis of Educational Practice (Keynote Paper) ................................................................. 218

Museums and Critical Discourse Analysis: Disentangling Exhibition Narratives® ................................................................. 219

Creating Compliant Citizens: Structuring the Nation and the Future through Language® .................................................. 228

Third Age Learners and ICT: Training and Support Implications .................................................................................. 236

Developing a Critical Discourse: Michel Foucault and the Cult of Solidarity® ................................................................. 242

Gendered Readings: Moving Towards a Pedagogy of Transformation® ........................................................................ 253

Constructions of Pedagogy and Masculinity within Teachers’ Discourses ................................................................. 264

Discourse of New Technologies: Designing Effective Computer Supported Collaborative Learning for Successful Communication in a TESOL Courseware® .................................................. 273

Good writing: they don’t see what I see in my head® ........................................................................................................... 290

Standardised literacy testing: Issues, approaches, effects .......................................................................................... 299

Learning Area Tensions and Popularity® ......................................................................................................................... 306

The Discursive Construction of Identities: A Critical Analysis of the Representation of Social Actors in Conflict® .................................................. 313

‘In the Pursuit of Justice’: the Discursive Construction of America as Global Policeman in the New World Order.................................................................................................................. 321

Social Epidemiology Research and its Contribution to Critical Discourse Analysis® .................................................. 330
Quynh Lê........................................................................................................................... 330

Researchers as Meaning Makers ® ............................................................................................335
Thao Lê ..................................................................................................................................... 335

The Discourse of Outsourcing: Some Implications for Health Services and Education ® ......342
Quynh Lê........................................................................................................................... 342
Rosa McManamey ............................................................................................................ 342

When is a Text? (Keynote Paper)................................................................................................350
Alison Lee.............................................................................................................................. 350

Academic Discourse: Power, Identity and Korean Migrant Women ®.......................................361
Jane Gyung-sook Lee ........................................................................................................... 361

Appraisal Analysis as a Critical Discourse Research Method: the Study of Hong Kong English Extensive Reading Texts ®..........................................................................................................371
On Kei Lee............................................................................................................................ 371

The use of interactional resources in argumentative/persuasive essays (APEs) by tertiary ESL students: a critical perspective ® .................................................................................................379
Sook Hee Lee.................................................................................................................... 379

Coming Here: an Analysis of the Migrant Experience in Context of Language, Power and Identity ...........................................................................................................................................405
Karin Lettau ....................................................................................................................... 405

Cultural Obstacles of the English Language Teaching in China ................................................412
Dan Li ................................................................................................................................ 412

Teaching Styles and Methodologies: Communicative Language Teaching ................................417
Yongjin Li........................................................................................................................... 417

CDA & LPP: Linking Critical Discourse Analysis with Language Policy and Planning Analysis (Keynote Paper) ...........................................................................................................................421
Joseph Lo-Bianco............................................................................................................... 421

ESL Education from a Vygotskyan Perspective: Discourse Characteristics of the Empowering Teaching ® ...................................................................................................................................422
Charlotte Liu..........................................................................................................................422

Role-Playing the Entrepreneurial Gender – a Critical Discourse Analysis Approach ® ............431
Seppo Luoto ...................................................................................................................... 431

Weaving the Threads of Disciplinary Conventions, Prior Literacy Practices and Personal Desires: International Students in Higher Education ®...............................................................439
Tran Thi Ly ........................................................................................................................ 439

The Quest to Control Emotion: A Foucauldian Analysis of EQ ®............................................448
Tony MacCulloch ............................................................................................................. 448
Debbie Payne .................................................................................................................... 448

Social Identities and Law Students’ Writing ®..........................................................................458
Rod Maclean ....................................................................................................................... 458

Discourse and the Emergence of New Global Institutions (Keynote Paper)............................468
Steve Maguire .................................................................................................................... 468
Cynthia Hardy.................................................................................................................... 468
Representing the Bible: Discourses in the Press News ®.....................................................493
John Matson...................................................................................................................... 493
The sociocultural context for language learning: Unpacking feedback interactions ®.........502
Kate McPherson................................................................................................................ 502
Encumbering Development: Development Discourse as Hegemonic Resources in the
Developing World ® ............................................................................................................512
Charles H. B. Mphande..................................................................................................... 512
A Critical Discourse Analysis of the Teaching and Learning of L1 in Malaysia ®.................529
Rosniah Mustaffa.............................................................................................................. 529
Idris Aman ......................................................................................................................... 529
Tasmanian urban kindergarten teachers’ perceptions of the purpose of kindergarten:
investigating the learning program offered in both full-day and half-day sessions ............545
Kim Nankervis ...................................................................................................................545
The Electronic Construction of the University and International Student ® .......................554
Chinh Ba Nguyen .............................................................................................................. 554
Giving and Receiving Compliments: Viewed from Textbooks and Respondents ®.............562
Thu Dinh Nguyen .............................................................................................................. 562
Discourse, Domination, and What it Means to be Critical: the ‘Disciplining’ of Foucault’s
Perception of power in Critical Discourse Analysis ® ......................................................574
John O’Regan ...................................................................................................................574
…”That Which We Are, We Are”… English Teachers’ Discourses and Their Professional
Identities in a Time of Change ® .........................................................................................581
Kerry-Ann O’Sullivan ....................................................................................................581
Self as a Co-productive Endeavour: A study of the Development of Discourse and Relationships
in an Arts Setting ® ............................................................................................................587
Helen Parry....................................................................................................................... 587
Constructing Social Responsibility in Mining Company Reports ® .....................................595
Richard Parsons.................................................................................................................. 595
Bernard J. McKenna......................................................................................................... 595
Analysing Other Person Reference Terms Within the Political News Interview ® ...............609
Johanna Rendle-Short ..................................................................................................609
Representing Willendorf Data: Gesturing Towards the Poststructural...............................620
Linda A. Rosendahl........................................................................................................... 620
Racism in Australian education exports: a Critical Discourse Analysis of one official policy ®.627
Li Shi................................................................................................................................. 627
The language of power or the power of language? Pre-service teachers’ perceptions of the
function of grammar in schooling discourse ® ....................................................................637
Megan Short....................................................................................................................... 637
Discourses of War vs. Discourses of Childhood: A Critical Discourse Analysis of Meaning,
Structure and Identity in Multimodal Narrative Texts ® ..................................................643
Alyson Simpson.................................................................................................................643
How do You Like Your Sea Stallion: Grazed, Clipped or Buried? ®.................................651
Peter Simpson................................................................................................................... 651
Rebuilding New Zealand’s National Identity: a Critical Discourse Analysis of the Role of the
Charismatic Documentary Presenter ®.......................................................................................660
Philippa K Smith ........................................................................................................... 660
Making Nursing Education Culturally Competent: Moving Beyond the Deficit Model ®...........668
Juliet Sondermeyer ........................................................................................................... 668
Kerry van den Berg ........................................................................................................... 668
Jen Brown .......................................................................................................................... 668
Indonesian Islamist Media: a Struggle against or a Legitimacy of the Dominant Ideology? ®..677
Rianne K. Subijanto........................................................................................................... 677
Textual Information Structure and Social Power ®.................................................................687
Zohreh Tahvildar .............................................................................................................. 687
Code-Choice and Code-Convergent Borrowing in Canberra Vietnamese ®.............................703
Bao Duy Thai..................................................................................................................... 703
Cultural agelessness: An exploration of the cultural influences related to age within a case study
......................................................................................................................................................713
Paul Throssell.................................................................................................................... 713
Constructing Public Opinion Through Metaphors ®...............................................................724
Júlia Todoli ........................................................................................................................ 724
‘Buy the book before Christmas’: Participants’ capitalisation upon culture in a Hong Kong
English classroom ®.....................................................................................................................732
Jimmy Woon Man Tong .................................................................................................... 732
A Critical Analysis of the Documents and Public Consultation Process on Xenotransplantation
(Animal-to-Human Tissue and Organ Transfer) ®.................................................................743
Ruth Trigg .......................................................................................................................... 743
Kant’s Contribution to an Ethical Approach in the Application of Aesthetics ®.................752
Kate Vickers ...................................................................................................................... 752
‘Asylum-on-Sea’: Prejudice and the Rhetoric of Location ®.......................................................758
Jodi Wallwork .................................................................................................................... 758
Intertextuality across Languages and Cultures: a Contrastive Study of Chinese and English
Newspaper Commentaries on September 11 ®.........................................................................769
Wei Wang.......................................................................................................................... 769
The Discourse of Euphemism...............................................................................................788
Xuefeng Wang................................................................................................................... 788
Intercultural Communication Awareness in a Tertiary Education Context..........................798
Yan Jun Wang.................................................................................................................... 798
Adolescence, Sense of Identity and Female Risk Taking in a Senior Secondary School in
Northern Tasmania.......................................................................................................................815
Derris Wood....................................................................................................................... 815
English and its Power in the Thai Discourse ...........................................................................824
Sita Yiemkuntitavorn ........................................................................................................... 824

Difficulties in the Implementation of Student-centred Learning in English Teaching in Chinese Universities ................................................................................................................836
Zhiqin Zhang .................................................................................................................... 836
Grammar Choices and Making Meaning in Teaching
Reading Thematic area: CDA as a Research
Method/Perspective®

Hayat Al-Khatib
Arab Open University

Abstract

The aim of the paper is to reflect on the application of Critical Discourse Analysis to classroom interaction. In this reflection I focus on a reading session from a time sampling record of a language classroom where common strategies of initiation, response and evaluation take place between the teacher and pupils.

The phonetic approach to teaching reading focused on exercises in letter sounds and the use of reading primers with highly controlled vocabularies to introduce initial consonant sounds of a language. Bryant (1994:246) in defense of the phonetic approach, explains: “Most literate people are all well aware that words and syllables consist of smaller units of sounds. This form of awareness is usually called “phonological awareness”, and there is a strong possibility that it plays an essential role in learning how to read”. Goswani and Bryant (1990) argue that children rely on their ability to recognize rhyming words in acquiring knowledge of new shapes and sounds. The importance of drilling activities and rhyming games in language classes, which focus the attention of the learner on the phonemic structure of words, have long been claimed to be an indispensable method in teaching reading though recognizing the constituent sounds of words (Bryant and Bradley, 1985). The audiolingual method and the mim-mem approach introduced pattern practice and drills which rely on substitution and repetition, and dialogues which rely on imitation and memorization of the materials presented as model.

I have adopted Halliday’s functional framework (The Open University, 2004: 45) to scrutinize the ways in which discourses are constructed. His framework relates the linguistics characteristics of a discourse to its functions at three levels of contextual analysis. In his Introduction to Functional Grammar Halliday (1985) argued that a deconstruction of discourses can bring a complex understanding of the social meanings that are embedded in the textual features of the discourse. Kress (1989) and Kress et al (2001; 1988) argue that social realities and selves are constructed or negotiated through selecting and juxtaposing specific lexis in particular arrangements in discourse.

In traditional phenomenalist literature, discourses were perceived to have static meanings that are reflective of an unchangeable reality that intrinsically preexists its realization (Apple, 1996; Muspratt et al, 1997). Structuralists argue that language gives shapes to ideas and makes meanings expressible (Wetherall et al, 2001). The concept of language as a form or a system that reflects a transparent unproblematic and naturalized reality is fundamental to traditionalist literature (Eldridge, 1993; Fairclough, 1995).

My argument is that the application of CDA brings to the fore a holistic view on language and language use basing the analysis on real data from real contexts. It highlights the complexity of the overbearing social and cultural hierarchies in texts and challenges views on the transparency and neutrality of structures abstracted from context. The research findings argue that the application of Critical Discourse Analysis underlines texts as forms of social action where given asymmetries of power that constrain the learner into receptive or even passive role in education are challenged. Evidence from the deconstruction of the discourse of a reading session rejects the assumption that language learning is the passive internalization and application of the instructed pattern. Through Critical Discourse Analysis a
new constructivist dimension is introduced, to the way language is perceived and analyzed.

**Introduction**

Critical discourse analysis or critical linguistics is an approach that is concerned with the social aspect of language. At the heart of critical discourse analysis is an interest in the ideologies that perpetuate or promulgate particular values in texts and discourses. Critical discourse analysis is concerned with assumptions and beliefs related to being an integral participant in a particular community. CDA also focuses on such questions that concern the role of human individuals as reflected or performed according to factors that relate, for example, to their age, social position, gender or education. CDA, therefore, rejects traditional aesthetic phenomenalist assumptions that language is a transparent medium of unproblematic fixed realities. Central to CDA is the idea that any social or cultural construction will promote some meanings or experiences and demotes others.

Much of critical work is directed towards identifying linguistic experiences and discourse specific lexicogrammatical features and relating them to the underlying social or cultural assumptions that constitute the worldview of the participants in the discourse. Fairclough (2000) insists that linguistic analysis should not operate on texts taken out of context. It becomes important to look for an interpretive framework that can account for the linguistic features that act as pointers to value systems and worldviews associated with the social and cultural setting in which texts and discourses are produced and received. Much work from the critical discourse analysis perspective relies on Halliday's (1994) Systemic Functional Grammar for its analytic framework as both share key ideas on the relation between choices made at the linguistic level and the social and cultural contexts associated with them. Systemic Functional Grammar provides a way of describing and analyzing the links between the linguistic choices and the sociocultural context.

**A Linguistic Framework for CDA**

According to Halliday and the systemic functional grammar approach, any examination of the lexicogrammatical choices within spoken or written discourse reveals aspects of the immediate social context and the wider cultural setting in which these choices operate. Under the systemic functional approach, discourse is seen as a social construct that incorporates and promulgates multilayers of meaning.

The experiential meanings relate to the processes, participants and circumstance associated with the social action in which the discourse operates. The experiential meanings relate to the field of the discourse. The interpersonal meanings relate to the roles and relationships of those involved in the discourse. Interpersonal meanings relate to the tenor of the discourse. The textual meanings relate to the communicative form the text takes. Textual meanings relate to the mode or channel of the discourse.

Therefore, the systemic functional framework focus on lexicogrammatical modes of meaning in relation to specific aspects of the immediate social setting. Crucial to critical discourse analysis is the way in which the analysis of meanings created or reflected in discourse can offer insights into how different texts provide different ways of viewing and understanding the world.

**The Case Study**

The study comes from extracts taken from a series of recordings that followed the progression of a child learning English as a second language. A record of field notes and audio cassettes was compiled for the period of one year, of A, a four-year-old child enrolled at a mainstream nursery in west London as she was tutored by a section-11 (ethnic language support unit) teacher in one to one support session to develop her English language. Time sampling was conducted of a bi-weekly basis, where, during the teaching sessions, a story was picked for reading and discussion, by the child, from a range of children's stories. The
teaching session focused on covering all aspects of reading: from examining the chosen book to discussing illustrations, the main events and the author. In each session a new book was chosen by the child.

In this study I examine the teaching session where the story of *The Hungry Caterpillar* was chosen for reading and discussion. The session is typical of a series of reading tutorials and it is representative of the natural bi-weekly routine of language support and the associated activities. *The Hungry Caterpillar* is a colourful children's book that builds the story line through repetition of key words and illustrations.

A close examination of the discourse taking place between the teacher and the child reveals more than a passive role for the learner. The choices she makes at the lexicogrammatical level indicate her sensitivity to the macro social components of the situation and her active attempts to utilize the contextual cues in building meaning and making sense as she deals with the reading task at hand.

**Theoretical Background**

Bryant (1990) argues that children rely on their ability to recognize structures and phonologic rhythm in acquiring knowledge of new words and sounds. The importance of patterns and structures in facilitating knowledge through focusing the attention of the learner on the phonemic structure of words have long been claimed to be an indispensable method in teaching reading through recognizing the constituent sounds of words (Bryant and Bradley, 1985). Pattern practices and drills rely on substitution, repetition and dialogues as well as imitation and memorization of the materials presented as model. Bryant (1994:246) argues: “... words and syllables consist of smaller units... there is a possibility that this “structural awareness” plays an essential role in learning how to read...” The overall effect of such views is that there has been a devaluation of children’s competence and an emphasis on direct instructional strategies. Hall (1987:1) comments: “There has been an almost universal assumption that either children are ignorant about the nature and purpose of literacy unless they are taught it, or that what children know is of no importance whatsoever in devising teaching strategies”. Walcutt (in Goddard, 1974) affirms a similar viewpoint: “In the earliest stages of learning to read there is very little need for thinking and reasoning on the part of the child. What he needs is a little practice in mastering a decoding skill and the thinking will come along quite some time later”.

Implicit in the above quotes that there is no active role for the learner. Rules and instructions are “fed into an empty mind” which is trained on reproducing the given model. Purpose does not feature in any consideration of how learners learn, or what motivates them as they search for meaning.

In the case of second language learning, educationists and cognitive psychologists examined the influence of second language learning on pupils’ performance and came up with recommendations on the best strategies that can result in bilingual learning. Cummins and Swain (1986) examined contemporary hypotheses in relation to case studies concerned with the performance in education of second language learners. Their findings gave rise to two explanatory hypotheses on the matter. The Threshold Hypothesis suggests that “threshold” degrees of proficiency in both languages must be reached, below which cognitive growth would be retarded, so that cognitive growth would be increased and the potential aspects of bilingualism realized, and the Developmental Interdependence Hypothesis, which emphasized the existence of some cross-lingual aspects of linguistic proficiency, and where, assuming that the first language is already sufficiently developed, intensive exposure in school to a second language will enhance the second language proficiency of the learner with no negative implications.

The interpretations of these two hypotheses resulted in efforts to provide threshold degrees of language exposure in the classrooms through drilling exercises to provide maximum input to second language learners. The phonetic approach to second language learning focused on exercises in letter sounds and the use of reading primers with highly controlled vocabularies to introduce initial consonant sounds of a language. Bryant (1994:246) in defense of the phonetic approach, explains: “Most literate people are all well aware that words and syllables
consist of smaller units of sounds. This form of awareness is usually called “phonological awareness”, and there is a strong possibility that it plays an essential role in learning how to read”. Goswani and Bryant (1990) argue that children rely on their ability to recognize rhyming words in acquiring knowledge of new shapes and sounds. The importance of drilling activities and rhyming games in language classes, which focus the attention of the learner on the phonemic structure of words, have long been claimed to be an indispensable method in teaching reading though recognizing the constituent sounds of words (Bryant and Bradley, 1985). The audiolingual method and the mim-mem approach introduced pattern practice and drills which rely on substitution and repetition, and dialogues which rely on imitation and memorization of the materials presented as model.

Krashen (1978) distinguished between two levels of second language learning:

1. Acquisition, the subconscious process which leads to the development of competence and is not dependent on the teaching of grammatical rules, and
2. Learning, which is the conscious study and knowledge of grammatical rules.

The two levels combine to constitute the monitor of the learner with the function of monitoring the grammaticality and correctness of the utterances produced.

The teaching of the basic rules again features as a fundamental step in language learning. Competence in language was, therefore, viewed primarily as linguistic competence and the application of correct grammatical rules that can only be acquired through direct instruction and drilling exercises.

**A Functional Approach**

Halliday (1978; Halliday and Hasan, 1989) put forward a view on language, language learning and language use that examined the primary function of language as a mode of communication. From this perspective, the use of any aspect of language has to make sense; it has to contribute to building meaning. “Learning one’s mother tongue is learning the use of language, and the meanings, or rather the meaning potential, associated with them. The structures, the words and the sounds are the realization of this meaning potential. Learning language is learning how to mean” (Halliday, 1973: 24).

The essence of the functional approach is that in language learning, children do not attend to language as a structural phenomenon or an atomistic system – as most teaching strategies assume in planning teaching methods and reading texts. Children are rather concerned with making sense as they search for meaning.

The functional approach is a semiotic approach that looks into the relationship of signs to the system of communication. It perceives language in terms of the functions it serves in the context of the situation in which it unfolds. Halliday argues that the analysis of language should consider the functions that are reflected in the structures of the language itself (Kress, 1976). To use language is to mean, and since text is the basic semantic unit of any instance of language in interaction, the functional approach looks at the role of various linguistic items in any text in terms of their function in building up the meaning.

Starting with the assumption that the child approaches language with a belief that it is going to make sense, I will propose the Functional Approach to Language Learning (FALL) as an alternative method that is learner-centred in a collaborative process of learning how to mean. An examination of the text from a functional perspective yields participants’ efforts in working with the functional components of the semantic system realized in it.

**Participants and Methods**

The nursery class, is a group of children of ages 4-5 years. At the time of the research, they were studying the life-cycle of the butterfly. The children of the reception class were reading about the stages of life of the butterfly and most of the material given to them in their language sessions revolved around that theme. I recorded some one-to-one reading sessions between A and her language teacher as part of my monitoring A’s progress in the second language as she moved from communicating mainly in her mother tongue, Arabic, to feeling
more confident with the English language to answer questions and discuss stories.

The method of reading that was applied during the one-to-one support sessions was the “real books approach”, where children are encouraged to act as competent readers as they deal with real books. The aim is to develop interest in the reader to start searching for meaning. The text is seen as a semantic unit made up of meanings that are coded in words, pictures and forms. The books are full of colourful pictures opposite every reading page. The titles are coloured and each page contains 4-6 lines in big font.

The teacher’s strategy relied on scaffolding; commenting on A’s answers, using words of encouragement, repeating the answers or correcting them, and elaborating by introducing new words into the discussion. A has progressed during these one-to-one sessions into behaving like an experienced reader, flipping through the pages, trying to guess the title, discussing the author, and sometimes taking the initiative to remark and comment on events outside the task-oriented situation using the target language.

In the extract under discussion, the recorded instant is taken from a session where a book about a caterpillar was discussed. The full transcript is in the appendix at the end of the paper.

**The Field**

The discourse displays a number of semantic features that can be defined in terms of their relation to the features of the situation. In this text there are particular grammatical structures associated with process types and determining the participants that are involved in them. These can be divided into two sets. The first set involves the interaction between the teacher and the pupil discussing the task at hand and thus processes associated with the two participants. The second set involves retelling the story, and hence processes associated with the activities of the caterpillar.

The nature of the interaction, being a teaching session, is expressed in the register used and the “rule of speaking” employed, that of question-answer followed by a confirmation or contradiction of the answer: e.g.

T (teacher): What is it here?
A: The sun.
T: Sun – beautiful sun.

Moreover, the types of processes involved, i.e. the transitivity patterns, manifest the nature of the interaction through the use of wh-questions. These assist in the identification processes where the noun in the answer to the wh-question is the identified one, e.g.

- What is this here?         The moon
- Where is the egg?          On the leaf
- What did he have?          Three plums

The transitivity patterns involved in the field of the discourse express meanings in terms of events and relations: agent/process/target. In the first section of the text, “Eric … decided to write a book”, the subject or the actor, which can also be termed the agent, is Eric, while the processes or the transitivity verbs are the infinitive verb “to write” and the verb “decided” referring to past events. In terms of the target, which is the entity that is acted upon, “book” is the object of the action, the target.

The same pattern of relations can be found in other sections of the discourse, e.g.

A: He eat one apple
where “he” is the agent, “eat” is the process and “apple” is the target.

Here another type of meaning relations is expressed, that of nominal quantifier, e.g. one apple. This relation is repeated throughout the text in similar forms, e.g. two pears, three plums, four strawberries, five oranges, and aids the quantitative characteristic which helps develop the child’s counting and predicting ability, and that, in turn, contributes to the nature of the interaction, being a teaching session.

The discourse also displays a number of nominal relations where attributive associations...
between words in an epithet/thing relation are used, which enhances the purposive interaction aimed at extending the child’s vocabulary and competence at forming logical associations, e.g.

A: the sun
T: Sun – beautiful sun
and T: Green Leaf
A then picks up the pattern of nominal relations and contributes to it in the same way:

T: there is the egg on the green leaf
A: and it’s gold (meaning silver)
T: what is it here?
A: the moon - gold (meaning silver)
then A: beautiful butterfly

In the above examples, A is using picture cues to predict the text but her command of the English language has much improved. A is showing interest in extending her vocabulary in the target language, e.g. her use of the technical word “cocoon” related to her project. Moreover, she displays her readiness to experiment with newly-learnt words, e.g. her use of the word “gold” to mean “silver”.

A pattern of circumstantial relations of time and reason is also exhibited in the discourse: A recalls past events and relates them to present activities, e.g. “I drawed a hungry caterpillar”. A is able to sort out small grammatical details, e.g. her use of pronouns “he” for the caterpillar, and is becoming more aware of the English tense system. She prefers to use the present tense but when using the past tense to refer to past events she over-generalizes with the use of the “ed” morpheme as the past tense marker for both regular and irregular verbs, e.g. “I drawed”.

There is also time reference related to the activities of the caterpillar throughout the week, e.g. on Monday, on Tuesday, on Wednesday, etc. These, in turn, form a predictable pattern that helps trigger logical processing of associations.

Circumstantial relations of reason referring to the cause or the purpose that lies behind a certain action refers to the context of the situation and aims at assisting the cognitive development of the child. This is reflected in the discourse as follows:

A: on Monday he eat one apple and he was still hungry
T: he was still very hungry
A: and there comes a little caterpillar and he coming to eat all these yummy
T: different foods
A: he’s got a sad face .. he’s got a tummy ache!

These relations manifest the logical component associated with such interactions by such means as:

1. Elaboration, “sun – beautiful sun”,
2. Connection, where parts of different forms in the text are interrelated through sequences like problem/solution or cause effect, e.g. hungry caterpillar coming to eat all these yummy,
3. Variation, e.g. T: now he wasn’t hungry any more, A: but he was fat!

The selections made above in the linguistic system by the participants in the interaction correspond to the ideational function of language; where language is used to refer to ideas that are constructed and communicated by the child in relation to their meaning potential as perceived by the child or their logical associations.

**The Ideational Meaning**

The ideational component is the section of language used to express the content and is divided into two parts:
1. The part of language used to describe the participants' experience in the world, the tenses used, the content aspect of the vocabulary, belongs to the **experiential** component of the semantic system. In other words, the experiential meaning related to the field of the discourse is the moulding of the choices, made by the participants, in the linguistic system into sequences of acts in the semantic system. The words are thus interpreted to represent the processes taking place during the teaching session. These processes can be divided into two types: processes associated with the two participants in the paratactical form where *they* are viewed as agent, and processes associated with the caterpillar in the hypotactical form where *it* is viewed as agent.

2. The other component of the ideational function of language is that of the logical relations. This is manifested in the text through abstract logical associations of apposition, connection and elaboration deriving from the experiential component, e.g. "he was hungry … he came to eat all these". These logical associations revolve around two types of forms:

   - **x-forms** related to the actual event that is taking place between the teacher and the pupil, defined as parataxis, and
   - **y-forms** related to the story being discussed between the two participants and revolving around the activities of the caterpillar, which are fictitious events, hypotaxis, as opposed to the actual events of the first forms.

**Tenor**

The tenor of the discourse manifests the relationships of the participants that are displayed through the grammar forms that are used. The tenor of the discourse is that of a teacher to a pupil. This is typically reflected in the sequence of the interaction, where the teacher is determining the course of the discussion by initiating questions. This is grammatically expressed through the choice of the interrogative mood:

1. Through the use of questions that demand a yes/no answer, e.g.  
   T:    Was he still hungry?  
   A:   Yeah

2. Through the use of wh-questions that demand elaborate answers, e.g.  
   T:    what is this here?  
   A:    the sun

and T: where is the egg?  
A: on the leaf

In the above examples, the teacher determined the beginning and the end of the teaching session and regulated the amount of discussion on each topic. This is realized in the discourse by the use of adverbs like "OK" and "Right" to mark the beginning of the session, and at certain intervals to indicate a shift in topic.

A one-to-one teaching session involves face-to-face interaction between participants. This is grammatically expressed through the choice of personal pronouns associated with people present at the interaction, such as the first person pronoun "I" and the second person pronoun "you", and the use of proper names by the teacher, e.g. "Well done, Alia". Patterns of modality such as auxiliary verbs concerned with ability are also used, e.g. "can" in "can you show me the egg?"

The question-answer statement sequences used by the participants assist in highlighting the experience of discussing a book. A uses her own words to retell the story, checking her answers against the teacher’s confirmation or contradiction. The teacher’s role involves evaluating A’s responses by agreeing or contradicting them.

The tenor, also, manifests three types of clauses corresponding to the two roles of the participants:

1. Declarative clauses, marked by a fall in intonation, used by the child and reflecting her role as a recipient of the wh-questions initiated by the teacher.
2. Interrogative clauses, marked by a rise in intonation, e.g. “What is this here?”, and indirect imperative clauses, used by the teacher to reflect her role as the person directing the course of the interaction, e.g. “let’s read the story”.

Thus, in the tenor, the relationship between the participants, expressed through the grammatical systems of mood and persons and through intonation patterns, reflects the interpersonal function of language.

**The Interpersonal Meaning**

The interpersonal meaning involves the interpretation of meaning from the aspect of communicating relationships rather than – as in the ideational component – from the aspect of communicating ideas. The discourse is an interaction between participants. Therefore, the grammatical forms involved are those concerned with participants and their interrelationships, e.g. use of personal pronouns, and processes related to the situation, e.g. “drawed”, including processes of modality, e.g. “can”.

The mood expressing participants’ attitudes in the interaction is also examined through its realized form in the discourse, here interrogative and indirect moods by the teacher, and declarative mood by the pupil, representing the type of relation between the participants.

**Mode**

The mode is the channel or medium of communication. The mode is spoken language based on the written language of the story at hand. The interaction is very pragmatic and task-oriented; it is wholly related to the book being discussed.

The role assigned to language in the situational context, i.e. the mode, the theme, the voice, the deixis and the distribution of information into given and new, is realized in the semantic system of the discourse by means of ties which are defined by Halliday and Hasan (1989) as elements of cohesion linking the discourse together and utilized by the participants to make sense of the discourse. These are identified as ellipsis, reference, substitution, conjunction and lexical cohesion.

**Ellipsis**, being an interaction between two participants, implies the use of elliptical forms common in question/answer sequences where words are understood with reference to a shared context without actually being uttered. This is realized in the discourse in clausal ellipsis such as:

- T: what is this here?
  - A: the sun.
  - and T: what is this here?
  - A: the moon.

The use of **references**; demonstrative adjectives like “here”, “these”, and “this”, and personal exophoric deixis including personal pronouns in examples like “he” and “you” to refer to places or persons outside the text, are utilized to assist in the interpretation of the semantic relations of the discourse.

The use of **endophoric** references referring to items within the discourse is also utilized to signal unity of theme and cohesion through information retrievable from the discourse. Endophoric references are here divided into two groups. The first group is concerned with referring back and is defined as anaphoric, e.g.

- A: The hungry caterpillar
- T: Is **that** the title of your book today?

The second group is concerned with looking forward and is defined as cataphoric, e.g.

- T: There **it** is, a green…
- A: Leaf!
Substitution: this is a method that is also used to indicate a unity of theme through the discourse and occurs between words that have the same structural function where anaphoric substitutions are used between words with the same structural function to indicate the synonymous relationship between them, e.g.

T: who wrote the book?  His name is Eric.

As for the theme structure, the ideas developed systematically from the general, i.e. talking about the book, to the specific, discussing the content of the book, i.e. the activities of the caterpillar. The theme, therefore, was at the beginning of the discourse the book itself. This is expressed by the interrogative interaction between the teacher and the pupil around the book, e.g. “is that the title of your book today?” and “who wrote the book?” Then the focus changed to discussing the contents of the book. The theme became the caterpillar, and all the discussion that followed centred around the activities of the caterpillar and its life-cycle.

Conjunction: this is another cohesive tie that reflects the systemic connection between what has preceded and what follows (Halliday and Hasan, 1989). It is manifested in the text by the use of conjunctions, e.g. “but”, “and”, and prepositions, e.g. “after”, to combine different sentences. Consider the following extract from the interaction:

T: After that he felt much
A: be’er
T: better, that’s right ( ) good
A: and he was fat.
T: Now he wasn’t hungry anymore
A: but he was fat!
T: and he wasn’t a little caterpillar anymore

In this extract, “after that” is a prepositional conjunction expression, “but” and “and” are adverbial conjunctions; “but” is used as an adversative conjunction, and “and” as an additive conjunction. “Now” is an adverb referring to time and used as a continuation conjunction, and “anymore” is a compound adverb bearing the same function.

Lexical cohesion: as for the lexical cohesion, it is achieved through reiteration, where the same item or its synonym is repeated, e.g. caterpillar/he, cocoon/house; through taxonomic relations like hyponymy, which is the relation of a subordinate category to a more general category, e.g. caterpillar/butterfly, where caterpillar is the hyponym, referred to towards the end of the story as a “beautiful butterfly”, where butterfly is the hypernym.

Lexical cohesion is also achieved by means of collocation of specific lexical items that have an apposition element, e.g. “he wasn’t little”, “he was fat”, and “he was still hungry” “he wasn’t hungry anymore”, or by arranging items in a specific order, e.g. “on Monday”, “on Tuesday”, “on Wednesday”, etc., and “one apple”, “two pears”, “three plums”, etc, or by selecting elements that belong to the same lexical domain, e.g. “hungry”, “looking for food”, “ate”, and “sad” “got tummy ache” “felt much better”.

Cohesion is also maintained by the arrangement of patterns of meaning into units of information. These are divided into two categories, given and new, according to their recoverability by the hearer. The structuring of information into given and new is believed by Halliday (Brown and Yule, 1983) to be marked by intonation, i.e. the speaker decides to organize his or her information units into chunks whose beginning and end is expressed phonetically through intonation. According to Halliday, the distribution of information units in a discourse will characteristically be given information before new, i.e. the speaker in sequencing the information will disclose the given before the new. This, in turn, corresponds to the syntactic structure of the sentence. In other words, the clause which is more likely to contain given information generally precedes the phrase where the new information may be disclosed. This is realized in examples such as:

T: it’s / a very big / caterpillar //
T: the very hungry caterpillar / set out to look / for some food //
A: On Monday / he eat / one apple //
Where / is used to mark a slight fall in intonation and // is used to mark a final fall.

Therefore, the three features of the context of situation of the discourse – field related to the setting, tenor related to the role relations between the participants, and mode related to the rhetorical mode – are realized in the discourse through three corresponding functional components of the semantic system: the ideational, concerned with transmitting information, with its two sub-components, the experiential and the logical, the interpersonal, concerned with establishing and maintaining role relations, and the textual, concerned with providing texture, which are manifested in the structure of the discourse.

In this study the child was able to use language to identify familiar items in the book. She used positional vocabulary accurately. She differentiated between the past and present tenses in telling events. She used adjectives to describe nouns. She used language to describe what was happening in a picture. She behaved like a reader who has an understanding of a book and follows print with the assumption that it conveys meaning. She used picture cues to predict the events of the story and joined in at specific intervals. Overall she showed interest and awareness of the printed word as she searched for meaning.

The primary concern of the child was to search for and communicate meaning (SFCM) rather than to imitate the correct input. Critical Discourse Analysis provides evidence of the child’s efforts to engage with the task in a more active role than a passive receiver of knowledge.

The child was also attempting to sort out grammatical details. She used the "ed" marker to indicate past actions that she has done, irrespective of regular or irregular categories, e.g. “I drawed”. She used the present tense to refer to actions taking place in the story as she read it. She used technical words from her memory of class interaction to refer to the specific items that relate to the subject under discussion: “cocoon/house”.

The plural category is also tried with "pieces", when more than one item featured on the picture page opposite to the printed text. These attempts at sorting out grammar categories and specific lexis show an active effort of hypothesis forming and testing in language learning. Once the learners’ interest is aroused, the search for the correct form and vocabulary follows the initial search for meaning.

Conclusion

The study set out to examine classroom discourse in the speech of a bilingual child to identify the principles guiding language acquisition and use. The real books approach in teaching reading proved to be a helpful method in providing contextual cues that focus the child’s attention not only on decoding the print but also on developing sensitivity to purpose and context in search for meaning.

CDA provided evidence that the emergent reader was making use of picture cues and the thematic organization of the text, e.g. numbers, weekdays, food categories, etc. to develop her line of thinking as she focused on the sequential progression of the theme and tried to use the relevant words to produce the intended message.

As the child uses language for communicating answers in the teaching session, she also gets socialized into patterns of behaviour that are characteristic of such situation; listening and responding, question and answer dyads, and turn-taking. The child becomes aware that the choices made from the linguistic system and their different forms and usages has to be relevant to the context of the social situation of the language use.

In relating language use to the functions that language serves in communication, the following relations are evident,

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Context of Situation</th>
<th>Areas of Learning</th>
<th>Functions of Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Field of Discourse</td>
<td>Vocabulary</td>
<td>The descriptive function</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenor of Discourse</td>
<td>Register</td>
<td>The social function</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Role relationship</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The field of discourse, which is acknowledged by the child, influences the content of the vocabulary used and serves the descriptive function. The tenor of the discourse is again evident in the specific selections made by the participants that relate to their role relationships and serves the social function of language use. The chosen mode of the discourse fulfills its perceived function in being primarily a channel of communicating with a specific purpose that serves the expressive function of language use. Critical Discourse Analysis was able to account for much of the recorded data, focusing on the child’s attempts to mean.

Learning becomes multifaceted; not based on a simple instructed language model where the learner has a passive role. The learner takes part in a process of language use that is function based and with a clear theme that is being targeted at every level.

Implications from the study point toward encouraging a move away from the instructional model of language learning towards useful and meaningful language use that incorporates functional approach to searching for and communicating meaning in language learning, teaching models and practices.
Appendix

Key: // indicating tone group boundary
{ indicating overlap
[ ] indicating pause
= indicating latching

T: OK. / Right. //
A: The hungry caterpillar./
T: Is that the title of your book today?
A: and that =
T: {the hungry cat =
A: { The hungry caterpillar /
T: the / very hungry caterpillar //
A: {Very hungry caterpillar //
T: Right / (it's) / a very big / caterpillar //
A: yeah
T: mm / and who wrote the book?
A: [2 sec] (flipping the pages)
T: Who wrote the book? His name is Eric //
A: Eric
T: Eric was a little boy / and when he grew up / he decided to write a book / about a hungry
caterpillar //
A: I drew a hungry caterpillar on my paper, Miss / and then I put it on a piece of paper //
T: Really? / Right / Let's read the story and find out all about the very hungry caterpillar. /
A: his hair is long!
T: what is this here?
A: the sun /
T: Sun – beautiful sun //
A: you / you don’t have to (flipping the page)
A: when the moon
T: In the light of =
A: { the moon
T: of the moon
A: the moon / the li- little egg / lying on the leaf /
T: where is the egg? Can you show me the egg? / There is the egg / on the green leaf//
A: { and it’s gold
T: mm / it’s on the green leaf /
A: Gold //
T: what is this here?
A: the moon / gold //
T: the moon / very good /
A: he start to look / at some [2 sec] food //
T: right / the very hungry caterpillar / set out to look for some food // one Sunday morning =
A: {Sunday morning /
T: the warm sun came out //
A: {the warm sun came out / pop
T: and pop / out of the egg / came a tiny?
A: came little egg?
T: little?
A: egg?
T: little hungry
A: {caterpillar and that is not bigger anymore //
T: he started to look for some food
A: {food
T: when he =
A: he caught it
T: yes?
A: on Monday / he eat one apple / and he was still hungry //
T: he was still very hungry //
A: and there came a little caterpillar / and he coming to eat all these yummy =
T: {different foods //
A: different foods //
T: on Monday =
A: on Monday, he=
T: he eats / one apple
A: {one apple
T: on Tuesday
A: {Tuesday =
T: he ate two / what is this?
A: pears! 
T: Pears / how many pears he ate on Tuesday?
A: one, two / and he was still hungry //
T: {good girl! What did he have on Wednesday?
A: eating all different food and he's eat pl=
T: on Wednesday / he ate / how many plums?
A: one , two, three / three //
T: three plums /
A: { but he was still hungry =
T: {was he still hungry?
A: yeah /
T: very good girl //
A: he got two left to eat //
T: on Thursday =
A: {Thursday / he eat four strawberries (counting) one two three four /
T: four strawberries / but he was still hungry
A: {still hungry / and he got one left /
T: on Friday /
A: { Friday / he eat three / no / five oranges / one two three four five / five //
T: was he still hungry?
A: yeah
T: he was still very hungry //
A: on Saturday / he eat one /
T: on Saturday / he ate through / one piece of =
A: {cake!
T: chocolate cake =
A: chocolate cake / one piece of ice-cream /
T: one piece of ice-cream / =
A: {cone / one piece of =
T: {one pickle
A: one pickle / one [2 sec]
T: slice of swiss?
A: swiss ? [2 sec]
T: what is this? / what is it?
A: [3 sec] ch –cheese //
T: cheese / well done // one slice of [3 sec] sa? Look at it here / sala?
A: ---
T: salami //
A: salami / then he eats one pieces of
T: one? What is this?
A: lollipop!
T: lollipop / well done //
A: one pieces of apple pie /
T: cherry pie / well done /
A: one pieces of sausages //
T: one sausage /
A: one pieces of cupcake /
T: one more cupcake /
A: one pieces of watermelon / T: and one slice of watermelon // A: and he’s got a sad face / he’s got a tummy ache // T: yes / that night he had a stomach ache / well I’m not surprised // A: then he bu-
T: {the next day was Sunday again A: {day was Sunday T: the caterpillar / ate through / one A: {green T: nice / green? A: apple? No / T: there it is . a green?
A: leaf! // T: a green leaf // well done // Alia / and after that he felt much = A: be’er // T: better / that’s right / good // A: and he was very fat /
T: now he wasn’t hungry anymore = A: {but he was fat!
T: and he wasn’t a little caterpillar anymore / A: he was big / fat /
T: he was big / what have we got here?
A: ---
T: he built a small ?
A: {cocoon house //
T: yes / build a cocoon / well done, Alia // around himself / and he stayed A: {a long =
T: inside for a long / two weeks // A:{two weeks
T: then he nibbled a hole in the cocoon / and what did he do?
A: he
T: he pushed his way out / and what happened?
A: beautiful butterfly //
T: he became / a beautiful butterfly //

References


Language and Power: A Critical Discourse Analysis of the Barisan Nasional’s Manifesto in the 2004 Malaysian General Election¹

Idris Aman

Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Malaysia

Abstract

Barisan Nasional – a coalition of several political parties which governed Malaysia since independence in 1957 – has retained the power to rule after a landslide victory in the 11th 2004 general election with a 90 percent majority in the parliamentary seats, and dominated all state governments, except for Kelantan. Various victory factors have been commented on from the political science, sociology, and from public views in the mass media. In contrast, this study analyses the Barisan Nasional victory from the way they manipulated and utilized language or discourse in order to retain and gain political power. This study believes that political power striving management is a part of organizations’ language management too. Striving political power in the context of this study is seen as a part of social practice. The Barisan Nasional discourse chosen for this study is their 2004 general election manifesto. Analysis is based on Fairclough’s approach of critical discourse analysis. Through this approach, a textual and discursive process will be analysed. The textual analysis will comprise vocabulary, grammar, and generic structure of the discourse. Meanwhile, the discursive process will include the interpretation of the production, distribution, consumption, force of utterances, and semiotic aspect of the discourse. Findings from both dimensions then will be inter-connected dialectically with the acquisition of power, which is hidden in the manifesto.

Introduction

Barisan Nasional – a coalition of several political parties² which governed Malaysia since independence in 1957 – has retained the power to rule after a landslide victory in the 11th 2004 general election with a 90 percent majority in the parliamentary seats, and dominated all state governments, except for Kelantan. Various factors have been commented on as a result of the victory. Among the factors were the personality of Abdullah Ahmad Badawi – the new Chairman of Barisan Nasional cum of UMNO³ President which has taken over the power from Dr. Mahathir Mohamad on November 1, 2003 – the dominant party in Barisan Nasional, young voters factor, there was no major issue for opposition to manipulate, wind of change among voters, and Puteri UMNO (young women wing of UMNO) factor. But, most of the factors were from the political science and sociology analysis, or public views in the mass media.⁴

¹ Based on research of SK/24/2004 Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia

² Barisan Nasional is a coalition party of UMNO, MCA, MIC, Gerakan, PPP, PBB, PBDS, SUPP, PBS, UPKO, SAPP, PBRS, and SPDP. At the beginning of the formation, there were only three parties in the coalition that are UMNO, MCA, and MIC which are formed during the pre-independence of the country.

³ United Malay National Organization

⁴ See also Mohd Fuad et al (2004) which are discussed the political hegemony of Barisan Nasional in order to gain the power.
In contrast, this paper tries to analyse the victory factor of Barisan Nasional from the way the party manipulated and managed their language in a process of gaining the political power. Language in this context refers to language use, or in certain schools of linguistics is named ‘performance’, or to use a term that has come into fashion recently, as ‘discourse’. This paper believes that language is a potent cultural object in human social life. In most of our daily social life, the function of language is undeniable. People manipulate and use language for a social process or practice, such as to lead, gain power, educate, do commerce, love, justify their action, and so forth. Habermas (1984) for example, “has focused upon the colonization of the ‘lifeworld’ by the ‘system’ of the economy and the state, which he sees in terms of a displacement of ‘communicative’ uses of language – oriented to producing understanding – by ‘strategic’ uses of language – oriented to success, to getting people to do things” (Fairclough 1992: 6). Meanwhile, Bourdieu (1991) emphasized that language should not be considered as a medium of communication only but must also be seen as a medium of power (Fairclough 1992). As speakers we are aware of the many ways in which linguistic exchanges can express relations of power (Thompson 1991). Nevertheless, language is always being isolated in the understanding of a social process. This is because language is intensively described in most current linguistics transparently. In other words, language is seen more in a framework of ‘world of language’ rather than ‘real world’ framework. Fairclough (1992) see these phenomena as consequences of lacking workable discourse analysis framework to handle such kind of analysis.

This paper also believes that election discourse is a way of language managed by politicians (or their institution and organization) in order to lead or to gain/retain political power. Gaining political power or leadership in this context is seen as a form of social practice. The importance of language in power striving is supported by statement made by Chilton & Schäffner (1997), that politics cannot be conducted without language. Following Fairclough & Wodak (1997), “the calculated design of political language is one crucial factor in success in political struggle… The increased importance of language in social life has led to a greater level of conscious intervention to control and shape language practices in accordance with economic, political and institutional objectives.” Besides that Fairclough (2000) writes, “language is becoming an increasingly prominent element of the practices of politics and government” (p. 6) and “political differences have always been constituted as differences in language, political struggles have always been partly struggles over the dominant language” (p. 3). In short, power-gaining management partly is a matter of institution, organization or individual discourse (language) management. There is a dialectical (two-way) relationship between power management and discourse management – where one shapes another.

A part from that, this perspective of linguistic analysis is an effort to broaden the meaning and dimension of linguistics, which is not only about the ‘world of language’ but is also about the ‘language in real world’, and simultaneously as a ‘social theory of language’. The former is named world of language linguistics where as the latter as real world linguistics. In short, world of language linguistics is about the description of system or form of a language per se, such as phonology, morphology, syntax, semantic, discourse analysis, etc. without any concern about function and its relation with representation of social life which may be subtle in the discourse/language. Meanwhile, real world linguistics sees language as more broad and comprehensive. It is not only about the system of language but also as an attempt to relate the system with the function of language, as it is in the discourse, in a real daily life of a human. For example, a system of transitivity or modality in an individual or institution discourse is related to social process or practice, such as power strive. Whereas with ‘social theory of language’ means to draw methods for analyzing language developed within linguistics and language studies, and social and political thought (Fairclough 1992). Thus, this study has two fold objectives; to sharpen a theoretical framework as an area of academic work, and as a pragmatic effort.

The Discourse
The discourse of Barisan Nasional in this analysis is their 2004 11th general election manifesto.
'Manifesto' is "a usually printed statement of principles and policies made by a leader or a group, especially a political party, before an election" (Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary 1995). And, this study believes that a manifesto is a very important 'accessibility' written message medium between political parties with people during the election, besides of face-to-face campaign, and the role played by mass media. During the election, most political parties will set up their election manifesto as a statement of their political idealism, objective, commitment, and promise.

In conjunction with that, Barisan Nasional has also officially launched their general election manifesto on March 14, 2004 in a special event at Putra World Trade Centre (PWTC), Kuala Lumpur (New Straits Times, Mac 15, 2004). It was launched by Barisan Nasional Chairman, Dato' Seri Abdullah Ahmad Badawi. In other words, this means that Barisan Nasional sees that the manifesto has its unique role and it is crucial in the context of ‘accessibility’ of party echo - discourse - to the voters. Because of that importance, Barisan Nasional has designed their manifesto as a power strives in the general election.

In line with the importance of the manifesto, Barisan Nasional did not put it aside after winning in the general election, but it is still referred to. For instance, New Straits Times May 6, 2005 reports in the front page about the concern of Prime Minister Abdullah Ahmad Badawi on 2004 general election Barisan Nasional manifesto in his speech to Harvard Club function. The newspaper writes, "PM: I'm aware …" "I am committed to realizing the promise made in the Barisan Nasional manifesto before the general election last March. Those were solemn promises, not made in the heat of electioneering, but rather after careful thought about what needed to be done for Malaysia."

Framework and Methods of Analysis

This linguistics work is a discourse analysis that is geared on a ‘real world linguistics’ approach. Through this approach, a discourse will be associated with certain social practice or process that may be subtle or opaque in it, such as leadership, power, domination, racist, solidarity, hegemony, ideology, and so forth. This study adopts critical discourse analysis (CDA) theory. CDA in general believes that there is hidden social practice in most discourse. But to be specific, this study utilizes Fairclough’s (1989; 1992; 1995) CDA framework. In this study, the social practice concerned is the way political power strived and managed through language – discourse. The Barisan Nasional’s 2004 general election manifesto is analyzed through the ‘reconstruction’ technique.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Practice/Process</th>
<th>Discourse Practice</th>
<th>Textual Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Production of text</td>
<td>1. Vocabulary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Interdiscursivity</td>
<td>2. Grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Intertextuality</td>
<td>• Transitivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Distribution</td>
<td>• Modality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Transformation</td>
<td>3. Cohesion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Reproduction</td>
<td>4. Generic structure of text</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Consumption</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Conditions of the discourse practice</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Force of utterance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Semiotics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Following Fairclough (1992), in order to understand the subtle social practice in the discourse, the analyst has to describe the textual features and interpret the discourse practices, and finally, explains both dimensions dialectically with social practice involved. In other words, it is a three-
dimension of discourse analysis. Analysis of discourse practice is an interpretation of (a) production, (b) distribution and transformation, (c) consumption, (d) conditions of the discourse practice, and (e) force of utterances. Fairclough (1995) also includes (e) a semiotic tenet of the discourse, such as photograph and non-verbal communication. Meanwhile, textual analysis is a description of (a) grammar of a clause, (b) vocabulary, (c) generic structure, (d) coherence, and (e) cohesion. Findings from the two dimensions after that explained their relationship dialectically with the opaque social practice in the discourse – in this concern, which is power. The framework is shown in Table 1.

### Background of 11th Malaysian General Election

The 11th Malaysian general election was held on Mac 21, 2004 and Mac 13, was the domination day. Campaign period was seven days, started after the domination day until 12.00 midnight of Mac 20. 10 political parties took part in the election – Barisan Nasional, PAS, Keadilan, DAP, MDP, Setia, Bersekutu, Pasok, SNAP, and STAR, and independent candidates. The general election was held to elect 219 Parliament seats and 504 state legislative seats (excluding the state of Sarawak) (www.parlimen.gov.my/dR).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STATE/SEAT</th>
<th>BN</th>
<th>PAS</th>
<th>Keadilan</th>
<th>DAP</th>
<th>Indpdt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perlis</td>
<td>P:3; S:15</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kedah</td>
<td>P:15; S:36</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pulau Pinang</td>
<td>P:13; S:40</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perak</td>
<td>P:24; S:59</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selangor</td>
<td>P:22; S:56</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Sembilan</td>
<td>P:8; S:36</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melaka</td>
<td>P:6; S:28</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johor</td>
<td>P:26; S:56</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kelantan</td>
<td>P:14; S:45</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terengganu</td>
<td>P:8; S:32</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pahang</td>
<td>P:14; S:42</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sabah</td>
<td>P:25; S:60</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarawak</td>
<td>P:28; S:0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kuala Lumpur</td>
<td>P:11; S:0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labuan</td>
<td>P:1; S:0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Putrajaya</td>
<td>P:1; S:0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>451</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


In the election, Barisan Nasional has won 90 percent majority of parliament seat, with 199 seats,
while DAP 12 seats, PAS 6, and Keadilan and independent 1 seat respectively. The full figures are shown in Table 2. Other parties have not won any seat in the election. This means, opposition only won 20 seats. Besides that, Barisan Nasional has control over all states, except for the state of Kelantan (www.parlimen.gov.my/dR).

And now is the discussion of the finding from the critical analysis of the election manifesto.

**Manifesto and Power**

The manifesto of Barisan Nasional subtly implies a social process of power. Power in this context means the management of political power striving in order to govern the country. This study believes that the management of their language of the discourse manifests the management of power to govern, which is hidden in the Barisan Nasional manifesto. It is traced through their discourse practices and features of textual. The finding from the study is shown briefly in Table 3.

**Discourse Practice**

The analysis of the discourse practice in the 2004 Barisan Nasional general election manifesto involves a process of interpretation of (a) production, (b) distribution, (c) consumption, and (d) semiotics. Following is the detailed discussion of each of them.

**Production**

Analysis of production is conducted by reconstruction technique. In this study, a production analysis is focused into intertextuality, interdiscursivity, and force of utterances. These three practices are believed to be inter-related with the process of power management.

**Intertextuality**

Briefly, intertextuality of a text is the presence within it of elements of other texts. The most common and pervasive form of intertextuality is reported speech and quotation (Fairclough 2003). Intertextuality implies the insertion of history into a text and contributes to wider process of power. From the analysis, I believe that there are two forms of intertextuality in this manifesto, i.e. label and quotation.

```
Table 3: CDA of Barisan Nasional's Manifesto: Summary Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MANIFESTO AND POWER</th>
<th>DISCOURSE PRACTICE</th>
<th>TEXTUAL FEATURE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intertextuality</td>
<td>Grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Label</td>
<td>a. Transitivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Quotation</td>
<td>- Active sentence: BN &amp; kami as actor;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- akan, perlu, harus, telah, tetap, terus, masih</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
```

6 Simple majority is 110 seats, two-third majority is 146 seats, meanwhile 90 percent majority is 197 seats (www.utusan.com.my/utusan/special).
Label is about naming something. Labelling is a normal practice, especially in the world of business. Following Tony Blair (Britain Prime Minister), “ideas need labels if they are to become popular and widely understood” (Fairclough 2000). ‘Third Way’ is the best example of label created by Tony Blair, which according to some political analyst has contributed to the victory of New Labour in the election.
Barisan Nasional also utilizes label in their 2004 general election manifesto. The label is Cemerlang Gemilang Terbilang (‘Excellence Glory Distinction’). These three words are collected from Abdullah’s discourse during his speech to the supporters after receiving the Prime Minister post from Dr. Mahathir Mohamad in November 2003. The label is placed and printed at the front page and at the top of page 2 until the last page (p. 20) of the manifesto. Interestingly, the label is not only about the meaning but also has a beautiful final syllable rhythm. Now Cemerlang Gemilang Terbilang has becomes familiar and is always being used by other Barisan Nasional figures and government officials in their discourse.

(b) Quotation

The other form of intertextuality in the manifesto is quotation of Abdullah’s prominent words. The words are marked with quotation mark (“ “) and presented stylish in a caption technique. Those are the words of Abdullah’s after appointment as Prime Minister and before general election. The intertextuality of the Abdullah’s word contributes to the effectiveness of the manifesto. There were 8 quotations intertextualized in the manifesto, and here some of them.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quotation</th>
<th>Translation from English text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Saya adalah hamba no. 1 negara.” (p. 2)</td>
<td>I am the No. 1 public servant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Bekerja bersama saya dan bukan untuk saya.” (p. 3)</td>
<td>Work with me, not for me.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Benar akhirat itu penting, tapi jangan hidup di dunia ini menjadi pengemis. Jangan hidup di dunia ini dihina orang.” (p. 4)</td>
<td>It’s true that the hereafter is important, but we should not live on this earth as paupers. We should not allow others to put us down.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Barisan Nasional amat unik kerana mewakili semua kaum di Malaysia. Semua pihak mendapat tempat dalam pembangunan Malaysia. Ini menjadikan Barisan Nasional sebagai formula kongsi kuasa politik paling hebat di dunia dan berkesan hingga kini.” (p. 5)</td>
<td>Barisan Nasional is unique because it represents all the ethnic groups in Malaysia. All the groups have a stake in Malaysia’s development. This makes Barisan Nasional the best and the most effective power sharing formula today.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Berjanjilah kepada diri dengan nama Allah, ‘saya tidak akan merasuh dan tidak boleh dirasuh’.” (p. 6)</td>
<td>Make a pledge to yourself in the name of God that ‘I’ll not accept bribes, I’ll not be bribed’.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interdiscursivity

Analysis of interdiscursivity aims to specify what discourse types, genre, activity type or style are drawn upon in the discourse, and how (Fairclough 1992). Normally, a new text is constituted by several other texts. According to Hodge & Kress (1993) “texts are constantly recycled, appearing in an endless succession of text-about-text, readings of readings of readings of readings.” Interdiscursivity also contributes in the developing process of power. In the manifesto, there are four other discourse types incorporated, i.e. a message, pledge, exclamation, and poem.

The message is from the Chairman of Barisan Nasional, Abdullah Ahmad Badawi himself. It is placed in page 3. It is about the commitment and vision of Barisan Nasional, such as “Barisan Nasional has never been satisfied with its excellent track record. We constantly look for ways to renew and improve. Barisan Nasional has the vision, planning and implementation capability to lead the nation in today’s challenging world.” At the end of the message, there is an imperative clause ‘Selamat Mengundi’ (‘let’s vote’) and the name of Abdullah Ahmad Badawi.

Pledge is placed on page 19 of the manifesto. It is structured by three sub-components: statement of appreciation, pledge, and promise. The statement of appreciation leads the pledge
with the sentence “We in Barisan Nasional wishes to record our gratitude and appreciation to all citizens for the support and mandate given to us to lead our beloved nation”. It is followed by four pledges in bullets format. The main points of the pledge are (1) to defend the independence and sovereignty of Malaysia, (2) to continue to develop Malaysia, (3) to fight all forms of racial intolerance, extremism and terrorism, and (4) to raise the stature of Malaysia. The sub-component of the pledge is a statement of promise, also in one sentence: “With this resolve, we will convince the people, through example and concrete proof, to continue to support the Barisan Nasional government towards realising the hopes and aspirations of the Malaysian people”.

The third discourse type is exclamation. It is placed on page 20 with the clause “Undilah Barisan Nasional” (‘Vote Barisan Nasional’) in a bigger size of font. Placing it at the end of the text is meant to conclude all that has been said or ‘marketed’ before and as a final request for the voters.

Abdullah’s poem is also inscribed in the production of the manifesto. The poem was originally read by Abdullah in one occasion in May 9, 2003 - ‘Malam Puisi Utusan’. The title of the poem is ‘Ku Cari Damai Abadi’ (‘I look for eternal peace’). Basically, the poem is more about his ‘personality’, such as be religious and not materialistic. Personal pronoun aku (‘I’) is used prominently in the poem. The narrative of his good personality in the poem has been manipulated subtly in order to support the process of power gaining.

**Force of Utterance**

Force of utterance is one of the important aspects in CDA because it contributes to the understanding of the process of power in discourse. What is meant by ‘force of utterance is a speech function, such as statement, demand, offer, question, or acknowledgment which is manipulated in the production of the discourse. Those force of utterances can be detailed into several speech acts, such as an offer which can be a promise, threatening, apologizing, thanking, etc., meanwhile a demand can be an order, request, begging, etc. (Fairclough 1992; 2003).

In the manifesto under analysis, there are two force of utterance prominently used - statement and demand. The statement force is much more dominantly used, covers all subsection of the manifesto. Basically, statement is about ‘telling’ something to other parties. In other words, this manifesto fully utilised the statement force to tell people (future voters) about Barisan Nasional idealism and commitment in the coming general election. Telling future voters is a big effort to make them know and understand about the party struggle. And this was seen as a very important aspect by the party in order to retain power.

There are three focuses of statement: statement of background, achievement, and commitment. Background is a place to highlight the related issue in that section or page; achievement is about what has been done and achieved by the same party ruling in the past; commitment is about what are promised to the voters in the future. The example of statement is shown in Table 5.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5: Force of Statement: Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Statement of Background</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dengan Barisan Nasional semua rakyat Malaysia mempunyai peranan dan suara. (p. 4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Everyone has a stake and a voice in Malaysia under Barisan Nasional)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kejayaan negara kita bergantung kepada penguasaan ilmu pengetahuan dan keupayaan generasi muda. (p. 12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Our future success depends on the knowledge and capability of our younger generation.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of Achievement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rakyat Malaysia dari segenap lapisan masyarakat boleh merasa bangga dengan pencapaian ekonomi hasil kerjasama erat semua pihak. Antara petunjuk kejayaan kita adalah: kadar pertumbuhan ekonomi 5.2% bagi 2003 melebihi jangkaan dengan kadar inflasi yang rendah” (p. 8).

(Malaysians from all walks of life can be proud of the economic achievements we have accomplished by working together. Some indicators of our success include: better than expected economic growth of 5.2% for 2003 with low inflation.)

Kadar kemiskinan berjaya dikurangkan dari 17% kepada sebanyak 5% semenjak 1990 (p. 9).

(Reduction of poverty from 17% to 5% since 1990.)

Statement of Commitment

Untuk memberikan anda perkhidmatan yang lebih baik dan pengurusan kerajaan yang telus Barisan Nasional bertekad:

- meneruskan kempen memerangi rasuah secara habis-habisan, tanpa segan-silu mahupun pilih kasih” (p. 6).

(To address your need for better services and more accountable government, Barisan Nasional will:

Continue the all-out campaign against corruption, without fear or favour.)

Usaha untuk memastikan pembangunan sosioekonomi yang seimbang masih berterusan. Kami bertekad: membasmi kemiskinan sepenuhnya dan merapatt jurang pendapatan” (p. 9).

(Ensuring balanced socio-economic development is an ongoing effort. We will: fully eradicate poverty and reduce income disparity.)

Force of demand is used much lesser compared to statement. There are only three occurrences, respectively one on page 12, 14, and 20. I think this figure is inline with the objective and context of manifesto itself that is it has to be 'self promotion' compared to 'demand' from audience. There are two types of demand – 'requesting' and 'begging'. Requesting is marked by the modality *perlu* ('need to') and *harus* ('should'), meanwhile begging by the particle –lah after the verb undi - undilah (‘let’s vote’). Table 6 shows the usage.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demand - Request</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bagi mewujudkan masyarakat yang berpengetahuan, kita <em>perlu</em> memperbaiki kualiti pendidikan. (p. 12).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(To become a knowledgeable society, we need to focus on improving the quality of education.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demand - Begging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Undilah</em> Barisan Nasional. (p. 20).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Vote Barisan Nasional)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Semiotics

Semiotics is a general science of ‘signs’ and sign has meaning (Mathews 1997). Following Fairclough (1995), to be able to give a comprehensive understanding about social practices hidden in the discourse, analyst should look into semiotic aspect too. In this analysis, two semiotic forms are considered very significant in the process of power – design and photograph of the manifesto.

The manifesto in the national language (Malay language) consists of 20 pages, inclusive of the front page. At the front page is placed a quite big photo of Abdullah in national attire, waving his hand and smiling, Putrajaya mosque, national car, and people waving the Barisan Nasional flag. There is also the Cemerlang Gemilang Terbilang label, the Malaysian flag, and the Barisan Nasional symbol. In every page is placed photographs, which match with the topic of the page and the label of Cemerlang Gemilang Terbilang at the top. And almost every page has a photograph of Abdullah in several occasions too. Besides that, there are photographs of several achievements and activities in sports, economics, education, religion, social, moral and civic values, foreign relations, etc. There are also captions of Abdullah’s words, poem, and message. All these elements are well designed, colourful and attractive.

Consumption and Distribution

From my observation during the campaign, it is found that the printed manifesto has been distributed effectively to the public through several methods, such as distributing in home letterbox, during face-to-face campaign, and personal distribution. By the middle of the campaign week, all Barisan Nasional front post I visited has distributed their entire manifesto. This situation was very different from 2000 general election, where a lot of printed manifesto were still in heaps at the post. Furthermore, some election candidates or their aid makes the idea outlined in the manifesto as topics of campaign.

Multi-media are also counted in the matter of distribution and consumption of the manifesto. For example, the manifesto is also downloaded in Internet. Besides that, the summary of the manifesto is mediatised as news report in newspapers and radio and television, especially when they were reporting the event of the Barisan Nasional leaders.

Another tenet in consumption and distribution matter is language. The manifesto also considers medium of language as an important factor in order to go through multi-lingual society in the country. The manifesto is printed in several languages. So, there are Malay (national language), English (international language – widely understood in the country), Mandarin, Tamil, and Kadazan and Iban (major ethnic group in Sabah and Sarawak) version of texts.

Analysis

In this analysis, three textual features of the manifesto has been recognised to contribute integration in the Barisan Nasional’s power making process. The three textual features are grammar, vocabulary, and generic structure of text.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actor</th>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BN</td>
<td>mengutamakan</td>
<td>perpaduan negara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>dan memastikan</td>
<td>satu sistem kerajaan untuk seluruh rakyat. (p. 2)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(BN/ gives/ priority to national unity and/ will ensure/ one system of government for all Malaysians.)
2. BN bertekad memastikan Malaysia tetap berpengaruh di peringkat antarabangsa khususnya selaku pengerusi OIC dan NAM. (p. 3)

(BN/ will ensure/ that Malaysia continues to play an influential role in international affairs, particularly as Chair of OIC and NAM.)

3. Barisan komited memberi kepada demokrasi berparlimen setiap warganegara suara dalam pentadbiran negara. (p. 4)

(Barisan Nasional/ is strongly committed/ to Parliamentary democracy, which gives each citizen a say in the administration of this nation.)

4. Kami berpegang kepada perkongsian yang adil dan saksama dalam pembangunan ekonomi negara. (p. 5)

(We/ believe in fair and equitable sharing of the fruits of economic growth.)

**Grammar**

Analysis of grammar aspect in the manifesto is focused into transitivity and modality only. These two grammar features are very relevant with the issue of power.

**Transitivity**

The objective analysis of transitivity is to see whether any particular process types and participants are favoured in the text, what choices are made in voice (active or passive) (Fairclough 1992). In this analysis, it is found that active clause is more regularly used compared to passive. The structure of active clause is Actor + Process + Goal. In other words, active clause focuses or gives priority on actor or theme. In the manifesto, the most dominant actor is *Barisan Nasional* and pronoun *kami* (*we* exclusive refers to Barisan Nasional). With this actor, it implies that Barisan Nasional is really committed to what was said and promised in the manifesto. Table 7 shows a few sample of it.

**Modality**

In Malay, there are two types of modality; one is related to time (future, ongoing, and past), the other is related to the situation of the lexical verb (Asmah 1980). Both are found and used in the manifesto. Nevertheless, modality related to time is used more than the situation. The occurrence of the modality is shown in Table 8.

---

### Table 7: Sample of Transitivity in the Manifesto

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actor</th>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BN</td>
<td>will</td>
<td>continue to promote peace, prosperity and harmony among all Malaysians.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BN</td>
<td>member</td>
<td>to Parliamentary democracy, which gives each citizen a say in the administration of this nation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kami</td>
<td>berpegang</td>
<td>fair and equitable sharing of the fruits of economic growth.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7 See Halliday (1994)
(Barisan Nasional will enhance the understanding and practice of Islam.)

### Continuous

| xtpt | 1. Barisan Nasional xtpt memainkan peranan aktif dalam isu-isu antarabangsa. (p. 18)  
       | (Barisan Nasional will strive to ensure that Malaysia continues to play an active role in international relations.) |

| tetr | 1. BN tetr melaksanakan strategi pembangunan ekonomi untuk mencapai Wawasan 2020. (p. 3)  
       | (BN will continue to implement economic growth strategies to achieve Vision 2020.) |

| masih | 1. Usaha untuk memastikan pembangunan sosioekonomi yang seimbang masih berterusan. (p. 9)  
       | (Ensuring balanced socioeconomic development is an ongoing effort.) |

### Past

| telah | 1. Di sebalik pelbagai cabaran yang dihadapi pada masa lalu, kita telah berjaya mencatat pencapaian yang menggalakkan. (p. 9)  
       | (Despite the historical difficulties, our achievements have been encouraging.) |

| 2. Sejak dulu, Barisan Nasional telah berusaha untuk menyediakan peluang meluas bagi pendidikan. (p. 12)  
| (In the past, Barisan Nasional has worked hard to provide universal access to education.) |

### SITUATIONAL

| perlu | 1. Bagi mewujudkan masyarakat yang berpengetahuan, kita perlu memperbaiki kualiti pendidikan. (p. 12)  
       | (To become a knowledge society, we need to focus on improving the quality of education.) |

| harus | 1. Untuk menjadi sebuah negara membangun berdasarkan acuan kita sendiri, kita harus juga memastikan bahawa rakyat Malaysia memiliki nilai-nilai positif serta akhlak dan etika yang baik. (p. 14)  
       | (To become a developed country in our own mould, we must ensure that Malaysians have positive values, strong character and high ethical standards.) |

Akan (‘will’) is used to imply on the future commitment and programme of Barisan Nasional; xtpt, tetr, and masih focus about the continuity of the previous programme; and telah is about their achievement. Meanwhile, the situational modality perlu (‘need to’) and harus (‘have to/must’) are used less mostly because it is more about ‘demanding’ or ‘asking’ from the people. By contrast, normally the nature of manifesto is more about ‘telling’ and not about ‘asking’. So, this type of modality is not suitable to be inscribed in the manifesto.
Vocabulary

In this textual feature, the focus is on the ‘keyword’. In my opinion, two keywords, which are related with Barisan Nasional power strive, are bertekad and berazam. Bertekad occurs 19 times, meanwhile berazam only 4. They have the same meaning - ‘resolution’ or ‘believing firmly to do something’. The usage of these keywords implies the seriousness of the party to convince people in order to strive political power. The serious resolution covers many areas of life, such as economic, religion, education, international affairs, social, and so forth. Below are several usage of the keywords.

1. BN bertekad meneroka sumber-sumber kekayaan dan pendapatan baru dengan membina potensi kawasan luar bandar. (p. 3)
   (BN will explore new sources of wealth and income by realising the potential of rural area.)

2. Atas kesedaran dan keinsafan ini, Barisan Nasional, berikrar dan berjanji bahawa sesungguhnya kami:
   - Berazam mempertahankan kemerdekaan serta kedaulatan Negara, menjunjung prinsip-prinsip Rukunegara,… (p. 19)
   (Recognising this, we in Barisan Nasional hereby pledge:
   - To defend the independence and sovereignty of Malaysia and uphold the principles of the Rukunegara, …)

Generic Structure of Text

Generic structure of text is “the overall structure or organization of a text.” “Analysis of generic structure is of value for more strategic, purpose-driven genres” (Fairclough 2003: 216; 72). In other words, it contributes to the process of power striving. In my opinion, the generic structure of Barisan Nasional 2004 manifesto is constructed by five elements, starting with theme, principle, policy, pledge, and appeal. Every element functions and moves to convince voters about the ability of the party to form a successful government. Every detail in each element is stated clearly and convincingly. The generic structure is shown in Figure 1.
Conclusion

The strong desire of this paper is to broaden the dimension of linguistics, so that it is not only about the description of ‘world of language’, but furthermore it must also be about the explanation of ‘language in real world’. ‘Real world linguistics’ is an effort to incorporate the work done in the ‘world of language’ tradition (which focuses on system (form) of language) with real usage of language (so called discourse) in social life. It is known that language and social are inextricably related. Through language, we undergo social life process/practice, life such as leading, governing, educating, trading, and so forth. Using ‘real world linguistics’ framework, this paper describes how power is hidden in a discourse with analysis on how language is benefited and at the same time how language functions in order to strive a governing power. General Election 2004 Manifesto of Barisan Nasional has analysed. Through critical discourse analysis approach, it is found that striving of power in the manifesto is constructed through integration its discursive practices and textual features. From the dimension of discursive practice, the manifesto is produced with intertextuality of label and quotation, interdiscursivity of poem, message, pledge, and appeal, force of utterance of statement and demand, and effective semiotics element and distribution. From textual dimension, the manifesto dominantly utilises active sentences with ‘Barisan Nasional’ as actor and time modality, convincing keywords, and well-organized and effective generic structure. In my opinion, this kind of manifesto is one of the factors that contribute to the success in striving power for Barisan Nasional in 2004 general election.
References


*New Straits Times*. May 6, 2005.

www.parlimen.gov.my/dR

www.bharian.com.my/Misc/Pilihanraya2004
The Ticking Mind and the Beating Heart: Writing, Imagination and Empathic Intelligence (Keynote Paper)

Roslyn Arnold
University of Tasmania

Abstract

This paper will explore the nature of inter-subjective and intrasubjective engagements with particular attention paid to the interface between language, thinking, feelings and relationships. The central argument is that educators need to be sensitive to the embodied language experiences of students and imagine how certain discourse experiences can enable or disable students' language development. In developing the argument, reference will be made to the ways students' writing can both reveal and conceal their thinking and feeling. Empathic intelligence will be posited as a model to enable educators to engage with students in articulating silence.

Introduction

I expect that the title of this paper makes it clear that I favour metaphor as a way of exploring ideas. The references to time rhythm, vitality, corporeality, and synergies between thinking and feeling are quite deliberate. I want to explore here the nature of some of the inter-subjective and intra-subjective phenomena fundamental to learning. To place this exploration in context, I am keen to revisit some ideas which have served education and literacy well in the past, and deserve to be revitalized in the light of recent developments in the study of affect and mind research (Bransford, Brown & Cocking, 2000).

The Current Literacy Debate

There is some urgency to address the issues raised by the National Inquiry into Teacher Education and the National Inquiry into the Teaching of Literacy. I argue here that it is timely to look closely at current thinking about literacy development to determine whether or not its necessary and sufficient conditions have been adequately theorized to serve the complex needs of contemporary students. It is easy to sigh with exasperation at each new beat up about apparent declines in students' literacy but might it not be worthwhile to consider carefully whether turf wars between theorists shouldn't remain as sidelines to the serious business of meeting students' needs as effectively as possible? Those needs don't remain static. The Internet and global communications alone have made new demands on students' communicative abilities and upon their qualities of discernment. Let's evaluate what we know about the nature of student learning and hypothesise their future needs as well as we can imagine them.

It seems to me that a timely critical discourse is one which revitalizes the role of imagination, repositions the function of narratives in human learning, and asserts the transformative values inherent in embedded symbolic forms such as poetry, drama and literature. While it is not easy to quantify the effects of high order experiences emanating from engagements with emotionally and intellectually challenging symbolic systems, it is certainly desirable to educate through such experiences. Enriching experiences, even puzzling ones, can liberate minds while mundane experiences tend to paralyse them.

Of necessity I have reached widely here but will focus the argument shortly.
Historical perspectives in English Education

Let me put this into an historical context to provide background to my argument.

Twenty five years ago, in August 1980, the Third International Conference on the Teaching of English was held at the University of Sydney. It was a significant conference because it followed similar international conferences on the teaching of English in 1965 and 1970. All three conferences had very significant things to say about the teaching of English. A central theme in all conferences focused on what children and students can do, rather than focusing on what they cannot do. There was compelling evidence that classrooms which functioned as communities of learners enhanced student outcomes (Arnold 1991). There was a sense of hope and optimism about utilizing research insights from classroom-based research (Britton et al, and Graves, 1975) and enthusiasm for incorporating concepts such as Vygotsky’s “scaffolding” (1978, 1988) and Polanyi’s ‘tacit abilities’ into pedagogy (1974, 1983). With hindsight that period looked like a golden age with State Departments of Education well endowed to support the implementation of curriculum reform and teachers enrolled in large numbers in postgraduate study.

This conference is titled Critical Discourses and I intended to play around with that title and suggest that it is critical for us to conduct conversations such as those we have heard at this conference because educators and academics thrive on conversation. Ask an academic to develop and debate a new theory and their eyes light up. As do the eyes of all their colleagues. Educators can be captivated by theory because it presents an opportunity to play with ideas, reflect one’s view of the world, tease out meanings, and contest propositions. However, in the course of this academic endeavour, it is possible to lose sight of the purpose of a theory, which, in education, is to explain the phenomena of pedagogy, and ideally, to improve practice. Hence, prime attention needs to be given to theories based on real learning situations, with echoes, at least, of the voices of students.

The critical discourse I would like to see come back into the central agenda of education, is how to lift the never-ending debate about literacy standards to something more edifying, more enlightening; something that is apolitical and student-centered. Does that mean that we undertake more research to demonstrate that one kind of literacy development is better than another? Or do we insist that it is fine for students to leave school understanding something about the multi-literacies around them, but little about the literacy hidden in books? We do need to accept that the world is changing so quickly that it is impossible to predict what school experiences are useful for students. But we should certainly share with children the power of literature and the magic of language experiences that have the power to transport them to the wonderful world of imagination.

I believe that we do need to deepen their understanding of the known, but we also need to provide scaffolds to help them delve into the unknown. Alice, in Alice in Wonderland had to fall down a deep hole before she discovered her wonderland. If you crave encounters with white rabbits, mad hatters and the created world of conundrums, you have to take some risks. But if the wonderland is your own mind, the risks can be privately encountered, savoured and secret. I am sure that is a useful metaphor to describe the very special kinds of learning that can occur in productive, thoughtful English classrooms where curiosity is encouraged.

In order to explain the powerful dynamics generated from productive teacher/student relationships, it is necessary to be able to understand and articulate the principles that underpin them. I have chosen to reference Vygotsky (1978, 1988) and Polanyi (1974, 1983) because each provides a strong scholarship/research base for recognizing how silence can be articulated. You will recognize what I am thinking of silence here as something potentially active and pre-articulate, something dormant (not dead), something like unconscious thought in that it can influence the mind and does so best when it is articulated. If you need to visualise that I am thinking about, consider how you can observe subtle shifts in facial expressions even when the observed is silent.
When educators have developed a relationship with their students they are better placed to read facial expressions and body language and can assist in the articulation of student silences. Attuned teachers are often unconsciously aware of what students want to say or write, and can ‘scaffold’ ways to help them to break through the silence. In such situations, articulation is a particularly apt word because it has a dual meaning of expressing and moving forward. These ideas might sound unremarkable today, except that I think we sometimes forget that in education, theory is useful precisely because of its power to explain ideas and its capacity to improve practice, particularly the practice of teaching and learning.

In 1980 there was a tremendous sense of excitement about the benefits to English education of insights from psychology, philosophy, linguistics, infant studies, semiotics and their sub-disciplines. By its very nature English education, with its basis in language and ideas, can usefully borrow from a number of disciplines, but it did so without really defining its own core substance. Consequently, by the mid 1980s, English in universities began to be colonized by cultural studies, by linguistics, by gender studies and by communications. This was not necessarily undesirable, except that instead of defending its territory, the teachers of English politely welcomed the visitors at their door and offered hospitality.

It seems to me that the teaching of English is still unclear about its core. While English has continued to agree with its neighbours and accept that boundaries are unimportant, it has become more diffuse and lost sight of much that is valuable in English as a discipline and a medium. For example, Drama left English and became a subject in its own right, and that was no bad thing since it has flourished as theatre studies and Drama in Education. However, by its separation from English it has been marginalized in its importance as a critical aspect of English teaching in secondary and primary schools.

Then Linguistics took over the language part of English, though Linguistics has little to tell us about creativity or the aesthetics of texts. Even though English still holds narrative dear to its heart, there seems to be some discomfort in the idea that one can make equal comparisons between mobile text messages and literature. While this is possibly a good and valuable thing to do, I hope students are never left believing that each is equally deep, beautiful and long lasting; albeit they are differently important.

In the carve-up of the English (Education) Empire, little wonder that some aspects of language languish for want of a champion. Students are more baffled than they might have been in the past, about that unique form of language, poetry, which has carried cultural, emotional and metaphoric messages since time immemorial.

This is not just a cry from the heart from a sentimental English educator who resists change. Rather it is a call to make sure that the best of the past is revitalized to address the challenges of today. I am in awe of contemporary students’ abilities to move fast and purposefully with technological change and the demands of global communication. Ideally, they will be multi-skilled and deeply contemplative, as the need arises. It is heartening that the reading of books is still robust, and were it to cease to offer people entertainment, solace and insights into life, other art forms might well emerge. Let’s hope that the kinds of connoisseurship which excellent, well-read English teachers display and share with their students is always preserved.

What research tells us about the human brain

Perhaps in the search for wisdom, we might reflect that for all the amazing advances in technology and science, can we explain the dark interior of the human mind? I am reminded of the American philosopher and arts educator, Professor Maxine Greene’s remark in conversation with me in New York after 9/11. She reflected that up until then, she had thought of imagination as a positive human quality. The 9/11 experience made her re-think her position. And the author Marina Warner’s remarks in an article in the Guardian where she argues “I don’t think that writing and reading as acts of imagination can exist in cyberspace alone…. computers should never be thought of as replacements for books”. Why? She tells of watching a little girl entranced with the
flecks of light from a mirror lamp. So entranced, the child caught one of the flecks of light in the palm of her hand and bent down to taste it. As Warner remarks, “We need to be able to lick stars” (2005, p.11). Pictorial or visual imagination obviously needs to be matched with moral imagination, and the concept of imagination carefully re-appraised (Cole 2005). The kind of moral imagination underpinning what I have theorized as empathic intelligence, and teacher’s care for students, is a form of imagination matched with foresight based on past experience (Arnold, 2005). It is a disposition of care which believes that life’s possibilities are enhanced when students can learn to understand their own minds, thoughts and feelings through self awareness (intra-subjectivity), cultural life and engagements with others (inter-subjectivity). Imagination is not only the province of the humanities. Stephen Hawking, reminds us:

In the past hundred years, we have made spectacular advances in our understanding of the universe, and probed deeper and deeper into space in order to further our knowledge. We have put men on the Moon, landed robots on Mars and sent probes out to the farthest reaches of our solar system. Voyager 1, for example, has been travelling for more than 27 years, and is now sending images back to us from approximately 13 billion kilometers away. (Good Weekend, November 5, 2005, p.27)

It is hard not to be enthralled when you read these words. Science and poetry are equally capable of putting us in touch with the sublime, the mysterious, even the mystical. Relationships have that capacity as well. Have a look at this image:

SLIDE 1 – children gazing

Just sometimes, teachers see that look on the faces of their students and wonder, possibly, just what were the enabling conditions which created that feeling and look. Awe, wonder and amazement, along with an abiding curiosity to understand the source and meaning behind the objects of contemplation stimulate the intellect in often enduring ways. Research into teaching and learning barely tackles these aspects, yet it would seem the time is very ripe now for such inquiries. Teachers no longer have to transmit information, the Internet does that. They are free now to create the enabling conditions for higher order learning. English, drama, the arts, humanities and sciences, taught well, are equally able to meet this challenge. As I argue here, it is vitally important for teachers to demonstrate professional expertise in both pedagogy and discipline. With high order professional expertise they can create enabling relationships, discourses and contexts for students to explore worlds of knowledge and the vast range of affects available to humans, from wonder and awe to despair and even dread. Intelligent contemplation can mobilize insight from complex, even painful emotions. It is here that language, thought, imagination and feelings can work dynamically in the service of wisdom.

Central to my argument here, is that educators need to be alive, with ticking minds and beating hearts, with creative and critical imaginations and with moral dispositions centred on students’ well-being and learning, to enable their full intellectual development.


Contrary to traditional scientific opinion, feelings are just as cognitive as other percepts (1994, xvii)… (Emotion and feeling) provide the bridge between rational and non-rational processes, between cortical and subcortical structures (1994, p.128).

The neurological evidence simply suggests that selective absence of emotion is a problem. Well-targeted and well-deployed emotion seems to be a support system without which the edifice of reason cannot operate properly…These (results) also made it possible to view emotion as an embodiment of the logic of survival (2000, p.42).

SLIDE 3 - Quotes from Siegel (1999)

Interpersonal experiences directly influence how we mentally construct reality. This shaping
I want to propose that empathic intelligence (Arnold, 2005) can provide a model for understanding the interconnections between relatedness, imagination, thinking, feeling and literacy development. For the most part I will offer examples from writing development to illustrate my argument.

Let’s look at where it all starts

SLIDE 4 - Charlotte slide
Here is a model of an ideal learning relationship: a caring adult engaged with the child, each mirroring the other’s affect or feelings, absorbed in each other and sharing mutual pleasure. Some aspects of empathic intelligence are encapsulated here, but not all of them.

Let me explain briefly the basic tenets of empathic intelligence. Empathic intelligence theorized here:

SLIDE 5 – Definition of Empathic Intelligence
SLIDE 6 – Empathy
SLIDE 7 – Enthusiasm
SLIDE 8 – Expertise
SLIDE 9 – Engagement
SLIDE 10 – Summary of Empathic Intelligence
It is important to recognize that empathic intelligence is not the same as emotional intelligence (Goleman, 1995) which is a necessary but not sufficient condition for empathic intelligence. Empathic intelligence requires the ability to be aware of both thoughts and feelings, and to be aware of the dynamic or interplay between them. Importantly, in this model, such multi-awareness is necessarily accompanied by a disposition of caring about the other, in inter-subjective engagements. Let me explain this in another way.

What research tells us about language/ writing development

In an empathically intelligent model of pedagogy, teachers are aware of their own thoughts and feelings, and they are attuned to the thoughts and feelings of their students. This states very simply what is in action, a complex attitude and behaviour involving the teacher’s almost simultaneous capacity to be both engaged and dis-engaged while also focusing on the pedagogical objectives. Such teachers are fundamentally engaged in pedagogy because they want to help students to learn. That is, the purpose in planning lessons is to enable students to acquire knowledge, or practise skills, or to understand why it is important to behave in particular ways, as a result of being involved I purposeful engagements with the teacher.

Writing as a Particular Discourse

I don’t propose here to engage in a rhetorical debate about the nature of English, rather I want to pick up some important themes such as the power of language to create and transform experience, the nature of interpersonal and inter-subjective experience, the function of care and empathy in human engagements and the nature of that ephemeral experience known as learning. In short, the existential nature of human learning is under discussion here, particularly as it is created and mediated through relationships, feelings, thinking and language. To focus this complex and wide ranging topic, I propose to concentrate on writing as a particular discourse which can provide opportunities for students to discover what they are thinking and feeling and communicate their thoughts and feelings to others.
I would like to focus now on demonstrating how empathic intelligence can play out in the teaching of writing development. I am drawing on research evidence from my own longitudinal study of schools children’s writing abilities (school years 6-9), Arnold (1991). In that study which involved thirty male and female students (aged 12-15) from two different schools in different socio-economic areas working with me in the writing project, they exchanged letters with writing partners whom they had not met.

The teacher in this model has professional expertise, particularly in having a developmental model of writing. For example, the teacher knows that personal writing can be a pre-cursor to public writing; the teacher knows that it is easier to write for an audience that is close and known, than it is to write for an unknown audience. Indeed, the teacher knows that to write for an unknown audience requires high-level imagination, amongst other skills and qualities. Such a teacher knows that students need to be led, developmentally through the complexities of writing, from that which is closest to the self to that which is most distanced from the self.

Let me illustrate how this worked in a peer-writing situation in which students engaged in writing research with me. These students never met each other but they did correspond with each other, they formed relationships across distance, they used writing to share ideas, to discuss, to challenge and to explain. In other words, they were using language to make meaning, to think their way through problems that were important to them. In the modern world of computers and the internet, the potential of such classroom based activities is considerable when teachers recognise the substance of writing as a valuable language activity.

One of the many difficulties teachers face is creating suitable contexts for learners to learn. It sometimes seems as if we are involved in a profession designed to give people what they do not want and that we are reluctant to give them what they do want because we think that might not be real learning. We assume that we, rather than our students, know best how to promote growth and self-development, if that is what we are aiming for anyway.

The argument to be presented here centres on the premise that writers and learners do know how to promote their own self-development, drawing on the natural resources they have for using language to establish and maintain relationships and to explore their own sense of self through those relationships. The evidence for the argument arises from observations and an analysis of 245 letters written by 35 Year 7 students over a four month period.

One of the major hypotheses of the project was that development as a writer is affected by a variety of selected language and thinking experiences from which the writer can abstract significant patterns of written discourse to develop a continuity from writing anchored in the self to that distanced from the self in time, space, content and purpose. Put simply, writers need experiences which tap innate abilities and develop them in order to continue the process of reaching out to more distant audiences and purposes. The writer finds within self an audience to write to. Gradually, he or she shares that self with another, and in the sharing internalises that other’s responses thereby expanding his/her own aspects of self. The process of writing for more distanced audiences becomes one of finding that audience within. Its internalisation depends on language and thinking experiences which offer that possibility. When writers have internalised a range of such experiences they have recall of different audiences and purposes, or at least an approximation to it – something like a tacit understanding which can then be explored and expressed in the writing. Writing experiences which extend the writer’s dialogue-with-self to dialogue-with-others are ‘authentic discourse’ in Moffett’s terms (1968).

The writers in the longitudinal study were using intuitively, a strategy they recognized as productive in relationships and in this particular writing context, namely endorsing the other’s self-esteem in order to establish and maintain the relationship. In this context, that had to be done through the language of written discourse.

Self-esteem and relational comments were categorized as any comment which clearly functioned to make the reader-writer partner feel good about himself or herself. Because of the reciprocal nature of the letter exchange, any comment which sought an endorsement of the writer from the reader was also classified as a self-esteem/relation comment. While self-concept and self-
esteem are closely allied notions, self-concept is defined here as the sum of constructs a person holds for him or her self. It seems from observation and interview with the pupil writers that one’s self-concept as a writer depends largely on one’s positive image as a writer.

That is, a pupil who sees himself or herself as a ‘bad’ writer is inclined to see himself or herself as not a writer at all. When students begin to see that writers are people who write, and include themselves in that category, then they develop a more realistic self-concept, with self-esteem subsumed within that. It becomes the process of writing which develops a self-concept as a writer, not just one’s own or another’s evaluation of the writing.

In 245 letters arising from the exchange there are more than 350 comments of a self-esteem/relational nature.

Broadly, the self-esteem comments included: questions about the other’s interests; positive reactions to previous letters; apologies for handwriting or content which clearly functioned to forestall criticism and/or to acknowledge that the reader deserved better; enthusiasm for a reply; congratulations on some achievement; exchanges of confidences or the giving or taking of advice.

In the initial letters in the exchange there are marginally more brief self-esteem comments than later on when the relationship is established and functioning well. Then the self-esteem issue becomes more complex. In the initial letters the writers recognised that they had to establish the relationship wholly through the letters, so they drew on their prior knowledge of relationships to do that. They knew intuitively that in order to make the other feel positive towards you, you express your interest in them. Each partner also recognised to some degree a mutual problem, that of balancing comments about the self with comments showing interest in the other:

I’ve liked your letter very much and your letter never bored me a bit. I just hope I never bored you. (Lino – letter 2)

I don’t think you are a show off because talking about yourself is the way to find out about others. (Robyn – letter 2)

I hope I haven’t bored you. Your letter was very entertaining. (Robyn – letter 2)

P.S. As I was reading this letter I got the impression that you might think I am a show off writing what I like and am good at. Please write back and tell me about yourself. (Judy – letter 1)

I like to imagine (sic) you so it is interesting writing to someone I have never seen. (Judy – letter 2)

You said I must be sick of your letters. Well I’m not. (Justine – letter 7)

I’m dying to meet you and also hope she (the teacher) can arrange it. (Sean – letter 3)

Your letter could be a little bigger (writing?) like a page or two and I won’t mind but please don’t write 4 pages until we’ve written about 10 letters and we get to know each other a bit better. I can’t keep up. (Sean – letter 5)

Coincidentally, Sean was writing to a girl (Julia) who, like him, was of slight build. She wrote in her first letter, ‘P.S. By the way I am a shrimp’. He replied, ‘Size doesn’t mean a thing’. They maintained a very supportive relationship through the letters. Sean wrote at greater length than previously and they both explored various aspects of their own self-concepts as young people and as writers. In his sixth letter Sean wrote:

I like writing these letters especially to you. These classes probably help me to write better but most of the magic is in the brain. I think I’m fairly good at writing.

One wonders why it needs extensive research to teach adults what children already know, namely that ‘most of the magic is in the brain’.

As the relationships developed through the exchange of letters, there was a greater degree of self-revelation and a sharing of problems, as one might expect. In some cases the self-esteem
function of the letters became embedded in the much larger context of the relationship. For example, Michelle in her fifth letter spontaneously wrote a highly sustained fantasy, concluding with the comment, ‘If I was you I wouldn’t believe this’. It could be argued that Michelle implicitly acknowledged her partner’s value as a reader/friend by sharing her fantasy with him.

Jane and Anna developed a relationship where each became involved in the other’s concerns. Jane asked Anna how to deal with the problem of being chosen for a solo part in a musical, ‘I know I can’t do it... Another problem is none of my friends got in!!’ In reply Anna shared her experiences:

If they sort of disliked you cause you made it don’t worry they’ll get over it. And once its over they’ll be even better friends than before. But if it isn’t that way don’t let me put ideas in your head (I hope I don’t sound bossy). When I first did a play Hansel and Gretel, my friends were jealous. But eventually they were there when I had trouble. If they have a fight, talk to them and prove that it wasn’t your fault you made it and they didn’t (letter 6).

As a relationship develops, the other’s concerns become more important to us and our own problem-solving resources can be drawn upon in an empathic response. Anna and Jane became involved in endorsing each other and themselves in the sharing and shaping through writing of their life experiences.

Young writers bring to new writing experiences a sum of constructs, expectations and self-images which are drawn upon consciously and unconsciously each time they write. In learning to talk they mastered complex cognitive and linguistic processes in part because they wanted to create their own meanings and join their language community. In that process they were encouraged by attentive, supportive and responding others. In mastering written language they need a similar audience.

What keeps the writing process going is the writer’s recognition that there is something in it for him or her. This something need not be an external reward – none of these writers sought that – but should be an internal one. This can be the pleasure of seeing one’s thinking processes on paper, finding one’s writing voice, establishing a discourse with one’s self and/or another or solving a problem by writing it out. These rewards share in common the facility to make the writer feel good about himself or herself.

When the writer’s self esteem is sufficiently stable he or she can take risks and reach out to audiences more distant from the self. Then the process of developing a range of written discourses can be an exciting challenge involving the full range of psychological and linguistic resources young writers bring with them to the classroom. In writing contexts which learners perceive as potentially self-endorsing, they will take risks and persevere in finding the language and format necessary for the task. Effective teachers create such contexts and demonstrate importance of affect and cognition in education, that is, empathic intelligences.

What research tells us about effective teachers

Studies by Lingard et al (2002) and Ayres et al (2000) identified a range of personal competencies that make a difference to the quality and effectiveness of teaching: sound subject knowledge, communication skills, ability to relate to individual students: self management skills; organizational skills; classroom management skills, problem solving skills, a repertoire of teaching methods; teamwork skills and research skills (OECD, 2005, p.101). As well, Hattie (2003) drew on an extensive review of research to identify five major dimensions that distinguish highly competent teachers. It has taken something like 554 studies of teachers to date to tell us that teachers can make a difference to students’ learning (Hattie, 2003). Perhaps we need to know how students experience teacher effectiveness and what they think makes a difference. One would not expect that their views of effectiveness would vary markedly from adults' views, but they might have a hierarchy of prioritized qualities from their experiences of teachers.

Professor Peter Cuttance, one of Australia’s experienced education researchers is reported as
commenting “Policy makers generally take little notice of most of the research that is produced and teachers take even less notice of it - other than giving researchers a salary, it has little relevance” (Brydon, 2005). Maybe it is time to work out why and how teachers make the difference.

A recent study provides further evidence for the argument for understanding the interplay or dynamics between students and teachers (Arnold & Hughes, 2005). This study demonstrates that students' voices can reveal insights into the nature of effective teaching and signal the importance of inter-intra subjectivity in the dynamics of pedagogy. The study was designed to determine the match between new insights and the principles of empathic intelligence and students' embodied experiences of pedagogy. Secondary school students' voices, articulated through a particular role-play, provided data to reveal the degree of match between their experience and these principles. The study provides nuanced evidence to suggest that the relational and affective aspects of pedagogy are integral to learning and teaching effectiveness.

**Conclusion**

Imagination is a complex concept which manifests itself in mindful and felt ways. Relationships are notoriously complex affairs of the mind and the heart. Teaching and learning defies easy analysis. The allied professions of teaching and teaching education are under pressure to do better, or at least to articulate better why and how we work our magic. Let's look at what is happening in the spaces between students and teachers, and the spaces between students, their peers and their significant others. Somewhere in there lie answers to profound questions. Let’s hope they are not 27 light years away!

**References**


A Critical Perspective on the Representation of Racial Identities in Business English Course Books®

Sarah Bedford
University of Sydney

Introduction

Studies from around the world by, for example, Bilbow (1997) in Hong Kong and Akar (2002) in Turkey confirm that English is an intrinsic part of communication in international business contexts. The position of English as a global language seems secure for the next fifty years (Graddol, 2001, 2004), and with it the dominance of English use in many international business interactions. The effects of company restructuring and the desire to develop markets and business relationships internationally have impacted on the learning of English. Business English language teaching is booming (St John, 1996), and this boom shows no sign of abating as the number of institutes offering Business English courses continues to rise. This is reflected in the greatly increasing quantity of published Business English language materials since their emergence about fifteen years ago (Flinders, 2005).

This paper reports on a study which takes a critical approach (Pennycook, 2001) to the examination of the representation of people of different races in Business English language course books. A sample is used of current editions of seven Business English course books produced by well-established publishers of English language teaching materials. The study considers the issue of a White Western orientation (Brookfield, 2003; Modiano, 2001) and explores the relationship between the professional roles assigned to people and their race. This includes an analysis of patterns in the representations of ‘native’ and ‘non-native’ speakers of English. The books included in the study are New International Business English published by Cambridge University Press, International Express Pre-Intermediate and Quick Work Pre-Intermediate by Oxford University Press, First Insights into Business, Global Links 2 and Market Leader Intermediate by Pearson Longman, and In Company Intermediate by Macmillan Publishers.

Related Work

Previous studies of English Language Teaching (ELT) course books have mostly focused on English as a Foreign Language (EFL) and English as a Second Language (ESL) and have found a Western orientation and Eurocentrism in the linguistic and cultural references (Matsuda, 2002, 2003; Tomlinson, Dat, Masuhara, & Rubdy, 2001). Analyses of racial identities in course books tend to be conducted within limiting, binary terms, ‘Whites’ and ‘non-Whites’ (see Hall, 2000) or ‘Westerners’ and ‘non-Westerners’ (see Matsuda, 2002, 2003). Studies of EFL course books (Tomlinson, et al., 2001) and Business English materials (Flinders, 2001, 2005) have concentrated on aspects such as pedagogic methodology and syllabus design, with brief reference to issues of race.

Empirical studies have not focused on the representation of people of different races in course books, or on a critical approach to Business English. Brookfield’s (2003) theoretical approach argues that adult education is racialised, with Whiteness presented as the implicit norm. He explores the need for a critique of the Eurocentric view of teaching and learning evident in African American adult education, arguing that “Euro-American traditions...tend to ignore issues of race and dominate the field” (p.497) and calling for an examination of “the presence and effects of
Whiteness in adult education practice” (p.520). A White Western orientation can position material writers as promoters of Anglo-American hegemony and can render the course books linguistically and culturally inadequate (Modiano, 2001). The model perpetuates the negative impact which language learning can have on the cultural integrity of the learner (Modiano, 2001) and is considered to be disempowering and repressive (Brookfield, 2003; Matsuda, 2003).

Methodology

Most research into English in international business contexts has remained largely uncritical in approach (Nickerson, 2005). Publications from Pearson Longman, Oxford University Press, Cambridge University Press, and Macmillan continue to dominate the materials that are available to Business English teachers and students (Flinders, 2005). Through an empirical study of the seven Business English course books by these publishers, this study takes a critical, poststructuralist approach (Pennycook, 2001) towards exploring and examining “unproblematized” (Brookfield, 2003) Western racial interests and evaluations. The study takes a critical perspective (Fairclough, 1995; Pennycook, 2001) on course book representations involving broader ideological and contextual questions of the data. The study considers the ways in which an examination of and reflection on issues and aspects of racial identities as dynamic and multiple (Cameron, 2001) are invited in the course books, or fixed views involving traditionalist stereotypes are reinforced.

The fear that predetermined categories might distract the researcher from observing uncategorised dynamics in the data meant that no a priori categories were used in the analysis of the course books. Instead a ‘grounded’ approach (Charmaz, 2000) was used towards the coding and comparison of verbal and visual representations. The aim was to explore emerging themes and patterns from the analysis data and how words and images are used in the construction of the discourses. Pictures including people who could be identified by race as present, and not by the number of the people in a picture, were included in the analysis. Accents were identified as precisely as possible, which sometimes involved including information provided in the course book materials. However, sometimes a general description, such as ‘European’ or ‘Asian’, was used. The researcher is subjective in the interpretation in the research process. A method of increasing the reliability of the analysis could have been through the comparison of categories generated from the data by additional coders, with a high level of agreement between the coders indicating greater reliability of interpretation. Through comparison and modifications involving additional coders, the influence of any personal bias in the researcher could have been reduced. The involvement of people from different racial and linguistic backgrounds from that of the researcher could have further increased the validity of the research design. This paper reports on the first phase of the data analysis. The next phase was an analysis of themes within the course books and included use of the appraisal tool (Martin & Rose, 2003) of the systemic functional framework (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2004) to identify how the lexical and grammatical systems used by the writer align the learner around sets of values in the discourses.

Analysis

The sample of Business English course books consists of editions from 2000 to 2005 and was selected for the study as representative of current materials designed to address the English language needs of business people who need to develop their skills specifically to work in international business contexts with speakers of English from around the world. The course books present themselves as working within an international framework and the centrality of this concept is indicated in the occurrence of the words ‘international’ and ‘global’ in three of the books’ titles, International Express Pre-Intermediate, Global Links 2, and New International Business English. The featuring of world globes on the front covers of Global Links 2, In Company Intermediate, and Market Leader Intermediate also highlights this aspect. The concept of operating within an international context extends to including front cover representations of
people; businesspeople are framed by the globes on the front of In Company Intermediate and a hand is holding a globe on Market Leader Intermediate. The same globe images repeat throughout In Company Intermediate, the four images alternately punctuating each unit heading. Within these four images, Asian, Black, and White people are depicted; White people are included in all four images, Black people in three of them and an Asian person in one.

However, this distribution of images of people of different races is not representative of In Company as a whole (see Table 1) nor of the other six course books (see Table 2), where there are on average approximately four images which include White people to each image including a Black or Asian person. The course book interpretations of the terms ‘international’ and ‘global’, and the images of businesspeople do not correspond with a comprehensive representation of people of different races through the quantitative distribution of images within the course books. These findings support Brookfield’s (2003) argument that adult education is racialised, with Whiteness presented as the implicit norm, and extend the issue beyond Brookfield’s domain of American adult education to international Business English language education. The centrality of Whiteness is underlined not only by the predominance of representations which exclude Asian and Black people, but also by the absence in the seven books of any images which include both Asian and Black people without a White person present (see Table 3).

The cover pages, Prefaces, and Introductions of the course books define the language needs of learners through a profile of the activities and contexts in which the learners need to use Business English. The Introduction to New International Business English defines Business English as mostly “English used in business contexts” and as excluding “specialized terminology”. This definition may be applied to all of the seven course books; as well as developing language skills for more business-specific situations, the course books also cover business-related situations. For example, on its back cover, International Express Pre-Intermediate informs potential purchasers that the book includes “English for work, travel, and socializing”. The course books’ topic-unit structure also reflect this approach, with headings such as ‘Meetings’, ‘Corporate Goals’ and ‘Marketing’ on the one hand, and ‘Eating Out’, ‘Making Conversation’ and ‘ Cultures’ on the other. As Ellis and Johnson (1994, p.10) point out, “Business English is not a neatly-defined category of special English. The term is used to cover a variety of Englishes, some of which are very specific, and some very general”, and these seven course books steer a middle way in terms of unit-topics.

The scope of the books is extended to including non-linguistic as well as linguistic aspects of doing business at an international level and of international business communication, as is suggested by course book topic-unit headings such as ‘Crossing Cultures’ and ‘Ethics’. On the back cover, First Insights Into Business states it features “cross-cultural approaches to business”, and in its Preface Global Links 2 states it offers “Cultural information for doing business worldwide…and interacting with business people from around the world”. In linguistic terms, the Preface to Global Links 2 claims the course provides audio recordings which are “spoken at natural speed and include a variety of native and non-native English speakers’ accents, exposing students to the different kinds of spoken English they will encounter in business situations”. This is echoed on the back cover of In Company Intermediate, where the course claims “a variety of native and non-native speaker accents, providing the learner with extensive exposure to natural spoken English”. Acknowledgements of both the increasingly multi-cultural and multi-lingual aspects of international business contexts are combined in the Quick Work course webpage statement which claims that “The content has an international feel, and does not present specifically British or American cultural or linguistic models” (‘Quick Work’, 2005). Flinders (2005) in his latest review of Business English course materials concurs with this view, “Mercifully, whatever ‘international English’ actually is, there is more of this, and less British English in the books than five years ago” (p.174), and welcomes intercultural observations of “a less Eurocentric kind than usual” (p.162).

However, the findings of this study do not correspond with the course book claims regarding the models of spoken English. Whilst a variety of accents can be found on the recordings, there is a predominance of British and American accents. The Global Links 2 audio recordings contain five times the number of American accents to the other accents combined, and seven times the
number of American and British accents combined to the other accents combined (see Table 4). Whilst *In Company Intermediate* provides a much wider range of accents, approximately triple the number represented in *Global Links* 2, ‘native’ speaker accents dominate by five to one (see Table 5). *Quick Work Pre-Intermediate* provides a greater balance with a ratio of four British or American accents to three of any other accents (see Table 6); however, and this is the case with all seven course books, only English or American accents are used as models for the pronunciation exercises. These findings concur with Matsuda’s (2002, 2003) reports of a focus on American English and infrequent and sporadic representations of spoken interactions between ‘non-native’ speakers of English, and extend the issue beyond Matsuda’s Japanese secondary school EFL contexts.

That only English and American accents are used as models by the course books for pronunciation exercises seems to imply that having a ‘non-native’ speaker English accent is not desirable. However, research data from interactions between ‘non-native’ speakers suggest that those who speak English in international contexts are aware that it is not necessary to reproduce all aspects of ‘native’ speaker English pronunciation to be intelligible to other ‘non-native’ speakers (Jenkins, 2000). Research suggests that intelligibility amongst ‘non-native’ rather than ‘native’ speaker listeners makes different demands and that “in pronunciation, probably more than in any other area of ELT, there is an urgent need for a completely new paradigm” (Jenkins, 2000, p.194). For example, learners are encouraged to adopt features of ‘native’ speaker English pronunciation such as elisions, contractions, assimilations, and weak forms because these are features of ‘native’ speaker pronunciation, regardless of the often negative effect on intelligibility for their ‘non-native’ speaker interlocutors (Jenkins, 2002). The content of the pronunciation exercises may underline the desirability and positive evaluation of a ‘native’ speaker accent through association with increased employability. For example, *Insights into Business* (p.25) has as the model sentence to practise pronunciation of contractions “They’re looking for someone with good communication skills”, which reiterates and may define by implication the job requirement ‘good communication skills’ stated in advertisements for the UK media groups Granada and Financial Times in the previous unit in terms of features of ‘native’ speaker English pronunciation.

However, the perception of ‘native’ speaker status is not necessarily based on linguistic evidence or criteria, and it is generally agreed that difference does not automatically imply deficit (Piller, 2001). This raises the question of why the Business English language course books continue to promote the ‘native’ speaker construct. Such positioning by the course books can be perceived at a political level as Anglo-American ‘linguistic imperialism’, with British and American companies and agencies extending their influence and securing their position through the exporting of educational materials (Modiano, 2001). Rather than depending on the continuing ‘saleability’ of Anglo-American models, the course book publishers and writers could go beyond Graddol’s (1997) suggestion of implementing “more careful ‘brand management’” (p.63) of the English language, and cease contributing towards “global cultural imperialism and widening social inequality” (p.62) while meeting the needs of Business English language learners more precisely. Research has shown a link between pronunciation and identity (Jenkins, 2000; Piller, 2001) and that ‘native’ speaker perception involves aspects of identity, such as nationality (Piller, 2001). The predominance of representations of White people and of British and American accents in the course books in this study indicates that a person’s race is involved in ‘native’ speaker status.

Only English and American accents are used as models for the narration and instructions in the audio recordings. During the opening sequences of the audio recordings, it is the British or American model that represents the publication, presents the legal copyright information, greets, gives instructions, and keeps the learners informed about procedures relating to the learning of Business English. Through this extensive and selective use of English and American accents, these ‘native’ speaker models are not only promoted over other accents, but are also associated with authoritative, knowledgeable pedagogic and legal roles beyond the roles of the businesspeople featured within the course book language learning activities.

The notion of the ‘native’ speaker has been widely problematized in Applied Linguistics (Piller, 2001) in the last twenty years on linguistic grounds and their broader implications. Research
indicates one implication is that ‘native’ speaker status is an important factor in the recruitment of English language teachers and that ‘non-native’ speaker teachers are not equally represented in US-based English language programmes (Mahboob, Uhrig, Newman, & Hartford, 2004). An additional implication might be the marginalising of professionals on the basis of their race. Through the accounts of seven people’s experiences, Lin, Sachs, Grant, and Vandrick (2004) report on how educational institutions have reinforced the perception that ‘native’ speakers are more capable than ‘non-native’ speakers and, furthermore, have marginalised “women of color” working in TESOL; however, there has been little research interest in this area (Lin, et al., 2004). In Amin’s study, ESL teachers report their students’ belief only White people can be native speakers of English and that only native speakers know ‘real’ English (Amin, 1997). There is a similarity with the findings of Mahboob’s (2004) study in which ESL students expressed the importance as they saw it of an ‘ideal native speaker’ model. Yet, pedagogic roles from those who are second language speakers themselves make for more realistic and inspiring role-models (Piller, 2001), and complementary strengths in linguistic and non-linguistic terms have been identified in the roles of ‘native’ and ‘non-native’ speaker teachers (Mahboob, 2004). The incorporation of more comprehensive linguistic and racial role-models by course book writers could form a step towards greater recognition and employment of the assets of people of different races and ‘non-native’ speaker professionals within the domains of education and business.

Conclusions

In this study the critical examination of seven Business English course books focused on the representation of people of different races. The course books are marketed as addressing the English language needs of business people who develop their skills specifically to operate in multi-lingual, multi-cultural business contexts with speakers of English from around the world. The findings show that the course books include far fewer representations of Black and Asian people than White people. Overall, there are four representations which include White people to each representation which includes Black or Asian people. Furthermore, British and American accents predominate. Whilst the Business English course books are presented as working within an international framework, the people in them are defined primarily in terms of White Western racial and linguistic models. The foundation for multiracial representation is sufficient coverage of people of different races. It is proposed that an approach be used by the course book writers which more comprehensively integrates racially diverse representations and which acknowledges the complexity of racial identities. Though the sample of this study was limited to seven Business English course books, the results can contribute towards understanding how representations of people of different races can function in course books beyond this sample. The findings of this study into Business English language education support Lin et al.’s (2004) call for the need of greater affirmation of students’ race, values, and experiences, and thereby the development of people’s potential within and beyond the classroom.

References


Table 1. Analysis of Images in *In Company Intermediate*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course Book Unit</th>
<th>Number of Images</th>
<th>Race of People Included (in numerical order)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>unit 1 international English</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>White: 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Asian: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 2 making contacts</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Black &amp; White: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>White: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 3 making calls</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>White: 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Asian &amp; White: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 4 keeping track</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 5 speed of life</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>White: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 6 business travel</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>White: 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 7 handling calls</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>White: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 8 making decisions</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>White: 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 9 big business</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Black &amp; White: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Black, Asian, &amp; White: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 10 small talk</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>White: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 11 e-mail</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 12 presenting</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Asian: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Black: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>White: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 13 technological world</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>White: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 14 being heard</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>White: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 15 snail mail</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>White: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 16 solving problems</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>White: 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 17 global village</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Black: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>White: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 18 eating out</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>White: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 19 messaging</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>White: 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Asian: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Black: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>White: 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 20 negotiating</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>White: 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>White: 46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Asian: 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Black &amp; White: 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Black: 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Asian &amp; White: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Black, Asian, &amp; White: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Asian &amp; Black: 0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Images including,
White people: 51
Black people: 7
Asian people: 6
Ratio of images including White people approx. 4:1

| Front & rear cover        | 8                | Black & White: 4                           |
|                           |                  | Black, Asian, & White: 2                   |
|                           |                  | White: 2                                   |
Table 2. Analysis of Image Totals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race of People Included</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Course Book</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>471</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>54</td>
<td>First Insights into Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>27</td>
<td>Quick Work Pre-intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>116</td>
<td>New International Business English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>51</td>
<td>Market Leader Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>76</td>
<td>Global Links 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>96</td>
<td>International Express Pre-Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>51</td>
<td>In Company Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>471</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>69</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>First Insights into Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Quick Work Pre-intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>New International Business English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Market Leader Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>29</td>
<td>Global Links 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>International Express Pre-Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>In Company Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>69</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>57</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>First Insights into Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Quick Work Pre-intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>New International Business English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Market Leader Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Global Links 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>International Express Pre-Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>In Company Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>57</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratio of images including White people (approx.)</td>
<td>5:1</td>
<td>First Insights into Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3:1</td>
<td>Quick Work Pre-intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5:1</td>
<td>New International Business English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4:1</td>
<td>Market Leader Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2:1</td>
<td>Global Links 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5:1</td>
<td>International Express Pre-Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4:1</td>
<td>In Company Intermediate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3. Analysis of Image Composition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race of People Included</th>
<th>Course Book</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>27</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>First Insights into Business</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>Quick Work Pre-Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New International Business English</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Market Leader Intermediate</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Global Links 2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>International Express Pre-Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In Company Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black, Asian, &amp; White</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>First Insights into Business</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quick Work Pre-Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New International Business English</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Market Leader Intermediate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Global Links 2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>International Express Pre-Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In Company Intermediate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian &amp; Black</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First Insights into Business</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quick Work Pre-Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New International Business English</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Market Leader Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Global Links 2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>International Express Pre-Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In Company Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Asian &amp; Black</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian &amp; White</td>
<td>First Insights into Business</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quick Work Pre-Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New International Business English</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Market Leader Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Global Links 2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>International Express Pre-Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In Company Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Asian &amp; Black</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black &amp; White</td>
<td>First Insights into Business</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quick Work Pre-Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New International Business English</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Market Leader Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Global Links 2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>International Express Pre-Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In Company Intermediate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Black &amp; White</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Race of People Included:** White, Asian, Black, Black & White, Asian & Black, Asian & White
### Table 4. Analysis of Accents in *Global Links 2*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course Book Unit</th>
<th>Number of Speakers</th>
<th>Accent of People (in numerical order)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>unit 1 talking about your company</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>US x 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 2 making conversation</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>US x 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish x 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>US/Asian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 3 arranging meetings and schedules</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>US x 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Asian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 4 getting ahead</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>US x 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 5 turning a company around</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>US x 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 6 describing processes</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>US x 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 7 teamwork</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>US x 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 8 managing change</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>US x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 9 clients and customers</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>US x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>German x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 10 corporate goals</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>US x 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 11 describing and comparing products</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>US x 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>German x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 12 challenges to management</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>US x 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 13 motivation and productivity</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>US x 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 14 advertising strategies</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>US x 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>German x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>US x 87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish x 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English x 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>German x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Asian x 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ratio of US accents approx. 5:1  
Ratio of US + British accents approx. 7:1
Table 5. Analysis of Accents in *In Company Intermediate*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course Book Unit</th>
<th>Number of Speakers</th>
<th>Accents of People (in numerical order)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>unit 1 international English</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>French x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dutch x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Italian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Korean x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hungarian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 2 making contacts</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>English x 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scottish x 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Welsh x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 3 making calls</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>English x 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Italian x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>European x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Irish x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Australian x 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 4 keeping track</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>English x 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scottish x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 5 speed of life</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>English x 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scottish x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>US x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dutch x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 6 business travel</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>English x 47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>US x 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>South African x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scottish x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 7 handling calls</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>US x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Australian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 8 making decisions</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>English x 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>European x 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scottish x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>US x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 9 big business</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>English x 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scottish x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Welsh x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 10 small talk</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>English x 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>US x 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Japanese x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>German x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Italian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finnish x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 11 e-mail</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>English x 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Scottish x 1
English x 6
US x 2
Irish x 1
Table 5. Analysis of Accents in *In Company Intermediate*, continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course Book Unit</th>
<th>Number of Speakers</th>
<th>Accents of People (in numerical order)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>unit 13 technological world</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>English x 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scottish x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 14 being heard</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>English x 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>European x 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Japanese x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Italian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scottish x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Welsh x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 15 snail mail</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>European x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 16 solving problems</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>English x 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>US x 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scottish x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 17 global village</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 18 eating out</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>European x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>US x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Japanese x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 19 messaging</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>English x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Italian x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>German x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Japanese x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>US x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 20 negotiating</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>English x 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scottish x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>302</td>
<td>English x 197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>US x 28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scottish x 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>European x 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Italian x 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Australian x 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Japanese x 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Welsh x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Irish x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dutch x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>German x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Korean x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hungarian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finnish x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>South African x 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

‘Native’ speaker accents x 255
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(English, US, Scottish, Australian, Welsh, Irish, South African)</th>
<th>‘Non-native’ speaker accents x 47</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(European, French, Italian, Japanese, Spanish, Dutch, German, Korean, Hungarian, Finnish)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ratio of ‘native’ to ‘non-native’ accents approx. 5:1
Table 6. Analysis of Accents in *Quick Work Pre-Intermediate*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course Book Unit</th>
<th>Number of Speakers</th>
<th>Accents of People (in numerical order)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>unit 1 organisations</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>US x 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>European x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Italian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Japanese x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>German x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Indian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scandinavian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Asian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 2 visitors</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>US x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 3 sharing ideas</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>US x 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>German x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 4 exchanging information</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>English x 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>European x 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>US x 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>German x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Italian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unit 5 solving problems</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>US x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>English x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>European x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>English x 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>US x 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>European x 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French x 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>German x 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Italian x 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Asian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Japanese x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Scandinavian x 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Indian x 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ratio of British + US accents approx. 4:3
Where You Attend School does Make a Difference! The Impact of a School’s Socio-Economic Status Upon the Academic Outcomes of its Young Learners

Margot Boardman
University of Tasmania

Abstract
Over the past decade, there has been a heightened interest regarding the quality of educational provisions for young learners prior to commencing full-time schooling. During 2004, a Tasmanian study was undertaken to investigate the impact of school socio-economic standing, upon the educational outcomes achieved by children commencing their first year of full-time schooling in Prep, after a year of part-time attendance at kindergarten the previous year. From results of the PIPS (Performance Indicators of Primary Schools) testing procedure, undertaken by all five year old Tasmanian children (n=884) at the commencement of their year in Prep. Qualitative data were obtained via focus group interviews with Prep teachers (n=15), which allowed for discussions of trends and issues that had arisen during the quantitative stage of the study. Findings from this study revealed statistically significant results between children in reading, maths, and total scores when the socio-economic standing of each child’s school was considered. The results clearly showed that the greater the economic needs’ rating of the school the lower the PIPS results attained by the children. Directions for pre-school education in Tasmania, focusing on the importance of quality educational provisions for three year olds, are explored in the paper.

Introduction
Many discourses pervade the area of teaching and learning in the early years of education, with the specific area of kindergarten education forming a significant discourse itself. However, with the increasing pressure being placed upon young children attaining set educational outcomes and benchmarks, as laid down by the federal and state governments in Australia, new discourses are emerging. One such discourse concerns social disadvantage associated with quality educational provisions for young children. Within this discourse different school communities are seen as advantaged and empowered, whilst others are perceived to be disempowered. However, the nature and extent of this disempowerment within different school communities, for young children commencing formal schooling, has not been fully investigated within Tasmanian education, and this study set out to gain significant data to inform the debate about the quality of education outcomes being attained by young children following their first year of school in kindergarten.

The significance of this research project lies in its original contribution to the educational debate associated with the impact of a school’s socio-economic standing upon the PIPS (Performance Indicators of Primary Schools) results for children commencing full-time schooling in Prep, within the state school system of Tasmania. Previous writers have reported that a child’s cognitive functioning is influenced by the type of home background experienced (Tymms, 2002), with Warner and Sower (2005) stating that children from disadvantaged backgrounds “often have difficulty keeping up academically with other students” (p.154). Furthermore, research has also shown that children who experience academic problems when commencing school overwhelming come from schools with high poverty (Hill, Comber, Louden, Rivalland & Reid, 2002), with Henniger (2005) indicating that these children are frequently raised in low-income families and “typically have fewer educational resources at home and (have) poorer health care and nutrition” (p.294). The longitudinal research findings, into the effectiveness of pre-school education and care within the United Kingdom, completed by Sylva, Melhuish, Sammons, Siraj-Blatchford and Taggart (2004), reveal that
“socio-economic status showed effects upon …cognitive attainment … (where) the children of professional parents were rated more highly than other children” (p.12). Additionally, Sylva et al (2004) reported that “for cognitive development, a two parent family, higher socio-economic status and mother’s qualifications were all significantly related to higher outcomes” (p.12). Sylva et al (2004) also established that “child and family factors … show a significant relationship with attainment in both reading and mathematics” (p.42).

Another aspect which has been probed in research studies relates to the quality of the learning provision in pre-compulsory school settings and the length of time spent in these settings prior to school. In the studies by Sylva et al (2004), the impact of pre-school attendance on the child’s cognitive development, prior to commencing full-time schooling, was investigated and they found that “high quality pre-school centres may be seen as an effective intervention that can help cognitive development and thus provide more vulnerable children with a better start at primary school, particularly if children spend more months in the pre-school centre” (p.54). Further, the High/Scope Perry School longitudinal study, cited by Barnett (2004), revealed that low income children who attended the High/Scope program at ages three and four were nearly three times more likely to graduate high school, than children who didn’t attend the program. However, what is important to note from Sylva et al’s (2004) work is that, in respect to the quality of the educational provision in pre-schools, “quality effects were similar for both socio-economically and educationally advantaged and disadvantaged groups alike” (p. 27).

When considering the impact of school socio-economic status on the academic results of children, it is important to establish whether this academic disadvantage only exists between those children who are enrolled in schools of low socio-economic status, when compared with children who attend schools of high socio-economic standing. The key research question, discussed this paper, investigates whether academic disadvantage is only revealed between children in schools of high and low socio-economic standing or whether this disadvantage is more widespread, occurring between schools of different levels of socio-economic status. Additionally, implications for future educational provisions and practice are also probed within this paper.

Method

In Tasmania, following a year in kindergarten education children are enrolled in compulsory, full-time education in Prep. During the first month of the new school year, all children in state school Prep classes undertake a formalised testing procedure, Performance Indicators for Primary Schools (PIPS) On-Entry Baseline Assessment, mandated by the Office of Educational Review (OER) for the Tasmanian Department of Education. Prep children are assessed on their early literacy, phonics and early numeracy skills through participation in a computer-based assessment program, administered on an individual basis with each child by his/her class teacher.

The researcher received approval from the Office of Educational Review to utilise the PIPS results’ data for the purpose of this study. The study’s population comprised Prep children (n=884) and their teachers (n= 39) from state schools in three of the six state school districts in Tasmania.

A factual questionnaire format was deemed appropriate for this phase of the study, as it allowed a wide variety of information (including demographic details and academic test results) to be gathered (Thomas, 2003), and also ensured consistency in the data received, which allowed the relationship between variables to be investigated (Punch, 2003). In the questionnaire, each Prep teacher was asked to indicate the category of his/her school’s Economic Needs Index (ENI - Department of Education (Tasmania) Economic Needs Index and Teaching Staff Formula, 2003). The provided list detailed the economic needs’ rating for each Tasmanian school, indicating the lower the economic needs’ rating of a school the higher the socio-economic status of the school. For the purpose of the study, categories of schools’ economic needs were formalised. These categories and total number of students in each were Category 1 – ENI of 0-30 (n=0); Category 2 – ENI 31-45 (n=413); Category 3 – ENI 46-60 (n=326); Category 4 – ENI 61-75 (n=116); and Category 5 – ENI 76 – 90 (n=29); Category 6 – ENI 91+ (n=0).
The analysis of the questionnaire data encompassed a complex "process of progressively summarising and `distilling' the data to arrive in the end at substantive conclusions" (Punch, 2003, p. 65) and was undertaken in two stages. Each set of information from the questionnaires was entered into an Excel spreadsheet, where it was summarised and reduced to allow the distribution of the variables to be shown. Following this, the data were imported into Statview, which enabled descriptive and inferential analysis to be undertaken. This analysis process was utilised to ensure that using statistical techniques to calculate "the degree of relationship between phenomena" had the advantage of providing "precise information" which enabled correlations between variables to be expressed in statistical amounts (Thomas, 2003, p.50).

Qualitative data were obtained utilising focus group interviews, which provided information that could be used to corroborate, contradict and augment the evidence obtained from the questionnaires (Thomas, 2003). Three focus group interviews were completed with self-nominated Prep teachers (n=15) be undertaken, one in each educational district involved. Data from the interviews were coded using the constant comparative method (Merriam, 1998) where one segment of data is compared with another to determine similarities and differences.

Results

Investigating the Impact of School Socio-Economic Status on Children’s PIPS Results

Analysis of the raw scores from the PIPS results according to the school's socio-economic needs' standing (ENI, Department of Education, 2003) revealed many clear differences and are shown in Table 1.

Table 1: Comparison of PIPS Results Considering Child's School's Socio-Economic Status
### Comparison of Results from Prep Children's PIPS Testing

**Considering Children's School's Socio-Economic Status**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School's SES Level</th>
<th>Maths Mean Score</th>
<th>Reading Mean Score</th>
<th>Phonics Mean Score</th>
<th>Total Mean Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Category 2 – high SES (n=413)</td>
<td>36.19</td>
<td>51.01</td>
<td>12.89</td>
<td>100.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category 3 (n=326)</td>
<td>33.26</td>
<td>44.99</td>
<td>11.65</td>
<td>89.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category 4 (n=116)</td>
<td>32.37</td>
<td>43.41</td>
<td>11.36</td>
<td>87.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category 5 – low SES (n=29)</td>
<td>22.03</td>
<td>23.79</td>
<td>8.38</td>
<td>54.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total (n=884)</td>
<td>34.17</td>
<td>46.95</td>
<td>12.09</td>
<td>90.51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results for totals may not agree with results for individual cells because of missing values for split variables.

No results were received from schools in Categories 1 or 6. This was anticipated as these schools are few in number within the districts selected for this study. Categories were established at regular intervals, each of a 15 need point increase, between differing categories of schools. This means that the higher the schools’ indices are, the greater the economic needs of the school and its community. Thus, Category 2 schools were those with the lowest socio-economic needs whilst Category 5 schools were those with the greatest needs.

It was revealed that Category 2 children’s results (from schools with the lowest ENI rating) were the highest in all areas, in maths (36.19), reading (51.01), phonics (12.89) and when the total scores (100.9) were calculated. Children from Category 5 (from schools with the highest ENI rating) scored the lowest results in all areas and these are 22.03 (maths), 23.79 (reading) and 8.38 (phonics). The results from this Category revealed a total overall score of 54.21 which is substantially lower than Category 4 results with a total score of 87.14. In a like manner the mean score results for Category 2 (100.09) and Category 3 (89.90) is noteworthy.

A high number of statistically significant results were returned when each school’s socio-economic needs standing was taken into account during Scheffe post hoc analysis and these are shown in Table 2. This analysis revealed that Category 2 (students from schools with the lowest needs’ rating) achieved significantly higher maths results than Categories 3 (p = .001), 4 (p = .0020 and 5 (p = <.000). Category 3 results were also significantly higher than Category 5 (p = .000). In addition, it was found that Category 4 achieved significantly higher levels of achievement than Category 5 (p = > . 000).

Table 2: Statistical Results of PIPS Results Considering Child’s School’s Socio-Economic Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statistical Results from Prep Children’s PIPS Results</th>
<th>Considering Children’s School’s Socio-Economic Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comparison of Child’s School SES Level</td>
<td>Math Mean Difference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reading Mean Difference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Phonics Mean Difference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total Mean Difference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category 2 to Category 3</td>
<td>Category 2 to Category 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.93 (p=.001)</td>
<td>6.02 (p=.021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.16 (p=&gt;.000)</td>
<td>27.22 (p=&gt;.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.23 (p=&gt;.000)</td>
<td>21.19 (p=&gt;.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A similar finding was revealed for reading with Category 2 children’s results being statistically significant when compared to the other Categories, such as 3 ($p=.021$), 4 ($p=.045$) and 5 ($p=.000$). In addition, Category 3 was significantly higher than 5 ($p>.000$). It was found that Category 4 children’s results were at a significantly higher level of achievement than Category 5 students ($p=.003$).

Results from the phonics component of the PIPS tests returned less statistically significant results than those seen in maths and reading. Nevertheless there was a significant result of $p=.002$, when Category 2 and Category 5 children’s scores were compared.

Comparison of the total scores of all categories showed that all comparisons except one (Category 3 and 4 – $p=.915$) returned statistically significant results when post hoc analysis was undertaken. This is an indication that there are clear differences between the academic results of children from schools of differing levels of socio-economic status.

Discussion

There were significant links between the socio-economic status of the child’s school and the child’s PIPS results. Scores revealed that with every fifteen point rise in the ENI rating of schools, there were statistically significant results between all school categories in reading, maths and total scores except between Categories 3 and 4. All results were highly significant, with twelve of the fifteen ANOVA results being between $p<.003$ and $p>.000$. There was little difference between the categories, in relation to phonics scores, with the only significant result ($p=.002$) being between Category 2 and Category 5 schools. This lack of difference in phonics’ results between different categories of schools is a notable finding. One possible explanation for this finding could be that parents consider teaching the alphabet to be the domain of school teachers, resulting in the majority of children coming into school with a similar level of knowledge and understanding of phonics and its role in literacy. However, further research is needed to substantiate such a position. Nevertheless, it does appear to indicate that the impact of socio-economic disadvantage is not as detrimental in the area of phonics’ learning as in early reading and maths.

During the focus group interviews the study’s findings were discussed at length and the teachers raised some noteworthy perspectives. In all three interviews, the issue of parental interest and capacity to assist young children with basic literacy and numeracy development prior to school were explored. The following dialogue, between one of the interview groups of teachers, explores the impact of disadvantage experienced by some Prep children, as is evidenced in the statistically significant differences in children’s overall PIPS scores, and in reading and maths test results. One teacher was quite incredulous when these results were shared. She commented: “Is there such a difference in their home life – to make that extent? When you see that huge step from one level (ENI Category) to the next …?”Whilst another teacher replied: “When you get to looking at the children in this way, it is scary!” Teachers then went on to explore the issues associated with children coming to school with limited interest in, and exposure to, early cognitive skills.

“Often the children can’t talk properly when they come to school…”

“They wouldn’t know what a pencil is or how to hold it!”

Another Prep teacher elaborated a little further and added: “I have got kids in my class that haven’t learned to write because they weren’t allowed to have pencils – not even to colour in”.

In another interview teachers commented about the exposure children get to early literacy and numeracy experiences in some home environments: “They don’t do any of that and maybe when you get to Category 4 and 5 children as well, it is not just the not supporting the academic learning, it is also all the other …”

“Family issues and violence!” added another group member. However, a further teacher pointed out that the problem of young children being exposed to early literacy and numeracy prior to attending compulsory schooling was not specific to children from lower socio-economic areas and she went on to observe: “I wonder too sometimes - sometimes you get a
lot of children – and you do at every school – that don’t get read to at home. This has to have an impact”. The sentiment of this comment is reflected in the words of Zigler (2004) who states “the evidence is fairly clear now that poor children aren’t the only ones who lack school readiness. Many middle-class children also aren’t ready for school (and) that means all children can benefit from high-quality early education” (p.4).

Conversely in another interview a teacher noted: “There are some kids who have been read to because I can pick them – they have knowledge about books; they have knowledge about written language work and in conversation work”. A further participant in this interview contended that the quality of the teaching program provided in the classroom is significant in relation to the development children make over a year. She stated: “It might be interesting though …I can think of some kids last year that I had that came in with really, really low PIPS scores at the beginning of the year and I was concerned for them that these children were going to really struggle … but with the explicit teaching program, they made huge gains”.

In exploring the concept of explicit teaching, it is important to consider the words of Walker (2004) who cautions that it is important “to make sure we don’t just push kindergarten standards down to early education… there are lots of ways to put literacy and numeracy into the curriculum, to do it explicitly, as part of play activity” (p.6). Further elaboration on quality learning provisions is provided by Sylva et al (2004) who point to the importance of quality in adult-child verbal interactions as these have a crucial impact upon young children’s development and they report that “adult ‘modelling’ skills … often combined with sustained periods of shared thinking; open-ended questioning and modelling were associated with better cognitive achievement” (p.vi). Furthermore, these researchers recommend that it is important in pre-schools settings to “work towards an equal balance of child and adult initiated activity” (Sylva et al, 2004, p.vi).

In another interview, when asked by the researcher what could be done to assist with promoting early literacy and numeracy skills in young learners, the teachers responded:

“They (schools) have got to go away from the focus on kids and go to the parents”.

“You have got to set up different community things and stuff like that – before the children even start (schools)- you have got to do things with the parents. But the only problem is the parents are too scared of people like us”.

“Well if they had a bad experience themselves at school, it is a negative thing about establishment.”

“And it sort of spirals down and I suppose now what schools need to do in that situation is try and turn that around and go out into the community”.

“It needs to be a welcoming place doesn’t it?”

“You need to be seen as not above them”. These opinions demonstrate a strong desire to make a difference in young children’s learning, but also acknowledge the many constraints involved in such actions. Tasmanian schools would do well to consider the findings of Sylva et al (2004) in progressing partnerships with families to assist young children’s academic learning. They report that they found that excellent pre-school settings “shared child-related information between parents and staff, and parents were often involved in decision-making about their child’s learning program” (Sylva et al, 2004, p.37). Porch (2002) also contends that ‘meaningful involvement by parents’ is an essential characteristic of high-quality pre-school programs (p.5). However, in respect to more socio-economically disadvantaged areas, Sylva et al (2004) established that “staff in disadvantaged settings had to be proactive in influencing and supporting the home education environment in order to support children’s learning” (p.37).

Teachers also explored the possibility of children being involved in more extensive pre-school programs. As one teacher remarked, “You wonder whether more underprivileged kindergarten children should come in full-time (to kindergarten). They would get more attention!” Another respondent commented that there may be a need to provide more pre-school programs for three year old children: “We should be getting them the year before kinder!” Whilst another group member commented “Maybe that is why they are pushing for that stuff in childcare now – to have programs … because it will cover a lot of those things – that’s if you can get them into childcare”. Current research from overseas strongly concurs with these teachers’ sentiments. However, it is not enough to just provide child-care/pre-
schools spaces for young children. The essential component is **quality** in provision and staffing. As Barnett (2004), from the National Institute for Early Education Research (NIEER), states “a quality program can lift children’s language and math skills” (p.3). Further, Sylva et al (2004) report from their pre-school research that “children made more progress in pre-school centres where staff had higher qualifications ... (and) having trained teachers working with children ... (for a substantial proportion of time, and most importantly as the curriculum leader) had the greatest impact on quality” (p.iv). Additionally, “High quality pre-school provision combined with longer duration had the strongest effect of (children’s) development” (Sylva et al, 2004, p. iv).

Tasmanian educational policymakers have much to learn from these studies as child-care places are in strong demand within the state, however, few centres have teacher trained staff on site, as salaries within these settings are much lower than in school settings, thus making the option of teaching in pre-school settings most unappealing financially for trained teachers. As Barnett (2004), director of NIEER, contends “It just makes sense. If you pay teachers adequately they are more willing to get college credentials, get the skills that make them effective in the classroom and stay in the job... research shows that’s key to ensuring quality” (p.8).

In some Tasmanian schools there are moves by school staff, which are directed towards addressing the lack of a pre-school centre in the school’s locality. These schools are providing a two hour session per week for three year old children within their school’s area. However, these schools are the exception and not the norm. Such initiatives are the beginning of proactive initiatives in pre-school education, but two hours per week is not long enough (Sylva et al, 2004). The future education of young Tasmanian pre-school children must be strongly informed by the latest findings from credible research, including those from this study. Furthermore, guidance from prominent international sources must also be fully considered, including the work of researchers such as Sylva et al (2004) who report that “children who start pre-school at a younger age (between 2 and 3 years) experience a cognitive boost, which remains evident up to the start of primary school” (p.26).

The implications of this reported study’s research findings, demonstrating that a school’s socio-economic standing does have a significant impact upon young children’s learning in literacy and numeracy are of crucial importance in providing a beneficial early year’s program within Tasmanian education. The findings reported in this paper clearly show that children who come from more materially and socially privileged communities are gaining higher results in their PIPS tests in literacy and numeracy. Pro-active educational measures are needed for less privileged children, as Sylva et al (2004) reveal “the effect of attending pre-school (versus not) on developmental progress is greater than the effect of social disadvantage” (p.vii). Indeed these researchers indicate that pre-school education is “an effective means of early intervention” for young children who come from disadvantaged backgrounds (Sylva et al, 2004, p.vii).

### Conclusion

The negative impact associated with higher levels of school socio-economic disadvantage must be addressed by Department of Education authorities in Tasmania. This study clearly shows that provision of quality pre-school programs must be a clear priority for state education if Tasmania is to address the issue of young children’s early literacy and numeracy achievement. The latest research findings show clear pathways and guidelines to steer this development and significant consideration must be given to the following:

- funding of all pre-kinder groupings in schools regardless of their socio-economic status;
- refurbishing empty school classrooms as places for the establishment of pre-school centres.
- employing trained teachers, with expertise in early education, to provide curriculum leadership and effective learning provisions for three year olds. This role must not be left to classroom assistants. Fully trained specialists are needed if quality provisions are to be provided.
developing practical initiatives to assist parents to become active participants in their child’s early literacy and numeracy experiences, with promotion of parent mentors;

promoting stronger links between the school and their community’s families in the education of children birth onwards;

employing kindergarten teachers to teach 0.5 and engage in community liaison roles for 0.5, linking to pre-kinder children and their families and offering pre-school programs for three year olds in the community;

promoting of the need for children to play and develop their knowledge, skills and understanding through self-initiated balanced with adult-supported learning experiences; and

providing pre-kinder attendance options for all three year old children, utilising school facilities, for this purpose, as often as space allows.

There is little question that less privileged children require earlier proactive support in their learning. Children who are not reaching the Kindergarten Checklist outcomes until they are in Prep or Grade 1 are in need of significant support. By and large, teachers are doing an excellent job in working with these children. However, if the foundational learning achieved by children who come from supportive, educationally aware homes, is not available in all homes then proactive measures are needed so that all can prosper. It is too late to wait until these less educationally competent children are enrolled in kindergarten.

The results of this study have the potential to inform new and emerging discourses around the area of early years’ education and clearly show that some children are disadvantaged educationally by their social background, and thus the type of school they attend, as early in their education as kindergarten. This is alarming and it is strongly recommended that action is needed earlier in children’s lives. Publication of the *Essential Connections* (2004) curriculum document is a step in the right direction, but resourcing must be made available to ensure schools are able to reach out to their pre-kinder children and parents in the years before the children are eligible for enrolment in kindergarten, especially amongst those communities shown to be in socially disadvantaged areas. Further, clear directions and proactive pathways for Tasmanian early education are available from Sylva et al’s (2004) research which “has demonstrated the positive effects of high quality pre-school provision on children’s intellectual and social behavioural development up to … (the commencement of) primary school”, specifically providing a “better start to primary school” for disadvantaged children (p.viii).

References


Sylva, K., Melhuish, E., Sammons, P., Siraj-Blatchford, I., & Taggart, B. (2004). *Effective Pre-
http://www.ioe.ac.uk/projects/eppe


Technological Discourses in Education®

Yoshi Budd
University of Tasmania

Abstract

This paper will outline the rationale for my research project and explain the theoretical and methodological principals that have framed and informed my understandings. In May 2004, the Australian Computer Society (ACS) warned that Australia will continue to lose ground to other nations in the global knowledge economy unless urgent attention is given to the supply of computer and Internet equipment to schools. The ACS president called for: the immediate provision of a national competency standard for computer literacy in secondary schools; ongoing professional development to ensure teachers proficiency with ICT; and adequate funding for all schools to supply ICT hardware and software, employ technical staff and access appropriate broadband connections.

As a secondary teacher specializing in English and LOTE, this latest and most urgent call to technologize my teaching practice, while not new, is strangely unsettling as I find myself located at the margins of new and powerful discourses. This paper will explain how Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) can provide an understanding of the way technological discourses work to both enable and constrain individual agency within an educational context. This is not only an important first step for recovering my own sense of agency in the face of a digital future but also a means for developing a liberatory framework for understanding the role of information and communication technologies (ICT) in the classroom. Standards and implementation strategies for ICT use in schools must be informed by inclusive teacher pedagogies, not by the discourses circulated by the computer industry.

This paper will provide an overview of my doctoral research project, which aims to understand the current rate of technological change by examining some of the dominant technological discourses that support it. Reasons for using a critical discourse analytic approach will be discussed within a feminist-poststructuralist theoretical framework.

Discourse Analysis

Discourses are particular ways of representing and understanding the world. In order to understand how language and other signifying practices figure as elements of social processes, discourse analysis looks closely at language or texts in use for the purpose of identifying patterns of textual representation (Taylor 2001).

Discourse analysis differs from other forms of qualitative research through its commitment to a social constructivist world-view (Phillips & Hardy 2002). Under this broad category, however, discourse analysis can draw from an interdisciplinary family of methodologies. Furthermore, discourse analysis is not only a methodology or set of assumptions that explain how and what we can know about reality but also a method or set of techniques for studying a socially constructed reality. Ensuring an appropriate fit between method and methodology therefore requires a clear articulation of the researcher’s theoretical position: an explication of the ontological and epistemological premises that inform and direct the research process.

Critical Discourse Analysis

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) focuses on the role of discourse in constituting and sustaining unequal power relations through the enacting, reproducing and legitimating practices of dominant groups and institutions. CDA aims to make visible the assumptions
that structure and limit our ways of thinking and being in the world in order to open them up to examination and critique. It is therefore an ethical imperative for the researcher to make explicit and reflect constantly upon his or her worldview and how it contributes to the enactment of power relations within the context of the research itself. The next section of this paper will explain the theoretical principles that inform my own research project and explicate my use of CDA as both method and methodology.

The Researcher’s Theoretical Location

Poststructuralist theoretical framework

Ontological position

A Poststructuralist framework recognizes the centrality of language and discourse in the construction of the knowing subject. This position offers a paradoxical ontological standpoint whereby language is both constituted by and constitutive of reality. Nothing exists outside of its textual representation (Luke, 1997). Language creates what it refers to. It is important to remember, however, that meaning is only produced within discourses: signifying practices that work to abstract and categorize what would otherwise be an overwhelming and meaningless amount of sensory input.

Epistemological position

If we take up an ontological position that sees our reality as always re-presented, that is, not directly knowable or present ‘in truth’, but always only known and given meaning through signifying practices, then a coherent epistemological position would concede that our knowledge of the world is always partial and perspectival, depending on how we are constructed and positioned as subjects by and within a range of discourses. In other words, how and what we know is an effect of signifying practices.

From a poststructuralist perspective, epistemic practices are open to plural interpretations. Language is seen as contextual: always historically and culturally situated; making sense in the context of a specific confluence of time, place and culture. Language is not static or neutral. It is always changing. As old meanings are contested, new meanings are produced; new words construct new categories of understandings, and allow us to talk about different things in new ways (Phillips & Hardy 2002, p.8).

Poststructuralist theories, therefore, make it possible to acknowledge and articulate a more self-reflexive and complex relationship between the subject and object of inquiry: between the knowing subject and the world. A poststructuralist position makes it possible to acknowledge epistemic practices as not only effects of an ontological position but also as constitutive of and inextricably bound up with that ontological position. Discourses are an integral part of this mutually constitutive relationship. Discourses produce and integrate signs, action, values, attitudes, and beliefs and this works to constitute both the knowing subject and its relationship to the object of inquiry, thereby both enabling and delimiting fields of knowledge and inquiry (Foucault 1980).

Feminist framework

Ontological position

A basic principle of poststructuralist theory is that of the plurality of meanings and the impossibility of fixing the relationship between representation and meaning once and for all (Weedon 1987). This provides an invaluable foundation for feminist critique, as it opens up possibilities for change. As feminist theories have often struggled around issues involving ways of conceptualizing the nature of ‘being’ and ‘the body’, it is important to make clear at this point that my understanding of the body as the site of cultural production is informed by the work of Elizabeth Grosz (1994, 1995) who claims that because discourses are always contextual and subject to change, the knowing subject is always ‘in production’. As a result, ‘the body’ as a discursively produced site of representation and production of and for the subject, is amenable to change and re-organization because of its ontological incompleteness: “The body is a most peculiar thing, for it is never quite reducible to being merely a thing; nor does it ever quite
manage to rise above the status of thing." (Grosz, 1994).

**Epistemological position**

Acknowledging and engaging with the complexities and paradoxes emerging from this methodological framework has often led to charges of relativism and solipsism. An argument against these charges is that what counts as knowledge is always relative to a set of criteria, which are at best, temporary and specific to the discourse within which it is produced. Furthermore, it is the very fluidity and plurality of discourses that make change possible. This theoretical perspective therefore, does not cause meaning to disappear or regress but instead foregrounds the importance of creativity and critique in the production of textual representation. New ways of knowing can only emerge if dominant meanings become open to contestation and alternative meanings are affirmed (Weedon 1987).

In addition, a feminist-poststructuralist perspective sees all epistemic practices as inherently political. Discourses always work to validate some categories and marginalize others. To understand knowledge as situated and embedded in social relations that are integrally political and practical undermines any pretension to be able to identify one final true account. Furthermore, far from being relativist, this standpoint makes visible and locates partial, critical knowledges within complex networks of power relations (Haraway, 1988; Ezzy 2002). This can provide a catalyst for social change, not because subjugated knowledges are the whole truth, but because they include information and ways of thinking which dominant groups have a vested interest in suppressing.

**Educational Research**

A Feminist-poststructuralist theoretical framework foregrounds the need to know how and where knowledge is produced, by whom, and what counts as knowledge. In educational research, the researcher, being always implicated in and complicit with the construction of power relations, must evince an awareness of who is valorized and who is marginalized by the discourses produced at the research site. This means that the researcher not only looks for patterns of textual production to identify dominant discourses but also is also mindful of gaps and silences in the data as they signify the effects of dominant discursive practices in terms of producing a variety of possible subject positions: oppressed, resistant, empowered, conflicting and so on. Once these discourses are named and demystified and their effects are made visible, they then become open to discussion and critique. For this reason, feminist-poststructuralist theory provides a liberatory and transformative framework for educational research.

As my research project aims to understand how complex and often conflicting educational and technological discourses work together to construct teachers’ understanding of the role of ICT in education the following section will explain the concept of ‘the body’, as a discursive site of contesting worldviews, rather than as biological matter that will one day reveal its essence or true nature as a result of empirical investigation.

**Rethinking the relationship between technology and the body**

In order to produce a definition and understanding of the terms ‘technology’ and ‘the body’, the following section of the paper will begin by reconceptualizing these phenomena in terms of my methodological framework. In so doing, I will then be able to explicate the effects of this relationship, which is the production of the subject.

**Technology: an ontological position**

Perhaps the least contested understanding of the terms ‘technology’ and ‘the body’ refers to the hardware, or material artifact. Some examples include: the brain, a car and the sign.

While this definition of technology and the body appears to conflict with a
poststructuralist worldview, this tension can be resolved when we understand the sign to be a fundamental technology. Texts and discourses are in other words, foundational technologies, produced by and through their relationship to ‘the body’; a term I will elaborate on later. Reality therefore is always, already virtual: only meaningful and therefore accessible through the filter of signifying practices. Although my use of positivist terminology such as ‘material’ can be confusing, it also contributes to the appropriation and deconstruction of signifying practices that appear fixed and natural. This brings me to the second definition of technology.

**Technology as an epistemic practice**

‘Technology’ is also a form of knowledge: a systematized discourse or institution, which informs the purpose, construction, use and repair of the artifact. For example, the production and service industries, engineering, marketing, traffic and safety regulations and motor registration branch all produce specialized discourses which both enable and constrain ways of knowing about the car.

Consider the effect of a discourse that refers to the body as wetware. This signifying practice constructs the body as an element of a digital system: the body is reduced to a part of an information loop consisting of hardware, software and wetware. This is significant, because when we recast the body as an object, it always becomes the other: either dead, different or under interrogation; a thing, an abstraction or a practice. This once again represents the mutually constitutive relationship between being and knowing: materiality and signifying practices.

**Technology as cultural production**

Finally, ‘technology’ refers to the set of human activities otherwise known as culture that constitutes the object as an artifact. When a new technology is produced and put into circulation, new discourses and ways of knowing are also produced. As the new discourse circulates, new human activities, that is, new ways of being and new power networks, are produced as an effect of these discourses.

Using the car again as an example, new categories emerge for interrogating and constructing ‘the body’ in relation to the car. Terms such as L-plater, lead foot and women drivers for example construct a subject that is deficient in relation to the artifact. Others such as racing car drivers, safety inspectors and engineers are figures of authority. Alternatively new forms of criminality emerge as a cultural effect of the speed camera, hooning, parking in the wrong spot and so on.

The main point to emerge from this third understanding of technology is that technology is never neutral. It is always implicated in our understandings of the body and the construction of the subject within networks of power. Technology both produces and is a product of epistemic practices. These epistemic practices, or ways of knowing constitute a reality in which subjects act upon objects to produce relationships of power and desire.

**The body**

At this point, I need to explain my use of the term ‘the body’. I write as though the body is a material artifact, but like technology, the body is never just a thing (Grosz, 1994). ‘The body’ is an abstraction of the lived experience of embodiment. ‘The body’ is always normative in relation to some set of criteria and represents the centre of perspective, insight, reflection, desire, agency (Grosz 1994). In other words, it is the site of processes of inscription, normalization and abstraction. Inscribing practices correct and modulate embodied performance and works to create the myth of the stable subject. ‘The body’ is always reductive because this is a necessary step for the exercising of control.

In contrast, embodiment is lived. It is always contextual and perspectival; enmeshed within the specifics of place, time and culture. Incorporating practices, the things that we do that identifies us as social subjects, perform the embodied content of constructing our ‘selves’ as normal. In so doing, however, incorporating practices always deviate in some
measure from its abstract and idealized representations. Embodiment is therefore at once ‘excessive and deficient in its infinite variations’ (Hayles, 1999, p.196). It is messy, unreliable, unruly, rebellious and needs to be contained.

Understanding the paradoxical and complex relationship between materiality (ontology), discourses (epistemology) and cultural effects (power relations) is a necessary starting point for demystifying and challenging some of the powerful discourses that are circulating within the education system today. The following six ‘technological discourses’, identified through Millar’s discursive analysis of Wired magazine (Millar 2000), provides an excellent example of how discourses can work together to support a particular world-view.

**Discourse 1**

Technological change equals cultural change. Its existence, always mediated through language as a signifier of social processes and power relations, modifies and measures the performance of the body. This is a mutual relationship of production whereby the body is an integral part of the production of knowledge.

The first dominant discourse identified by Millar, however, does not see technology as embedded in social relations, but as a transcendent force to which all things must respond and adapt:

“…the theme of limitless faith in technological progress and the association of technology with religious transcendence is one of digital ideology's most important myths.” (Millar 2000, p.135).

Otherwise known as technological determinism, this discourse reverses the biological/technological dualism to privilege technology: man does not make the machine; the machine makes the man.

One effect of this discourse is an abdication of responsibility. If technology makes the man, if technology is God, then man is no longer responsible for its actions. Technology becomes a Frankenstein's monster, demanding more material for further production.

Another effect of this discourse is the construction of the body as deficient. This effect is evinced in the increased production of narratives expressing anxiety about technology’s superiority in terms of power and control. Films such as The Matrix, Terminator and I,Robot question man’s ability to control and defend the body. In The Matrix, the body’s resistance is suppressed by a constant flow of seductive information through the brain. Man and machine exist here in a symbiotic relationship: the body powers the machine, and the machine mediates man’s reality to conceal the duplicitous nature of the body.

**Discourse 2**

The second dominant discourse identified by Millar constructs a mythical space, one in which the subject is free to 'enter' without having to disclose their real sex, race, socio-economic status or body shape. In this mythical space experimentation does not endanger the body. The subject can therefore live out their wildest fantasies: create a new body and identity, engage in new and often illicit relationships and explore and create imaginary worlds. The reality is, however, that in cyberspace the body is not erased, it is just made invisible.

The apparent erasure of the body liberates the subject because making the body visible again means acknowledging possible physical and mental health risks associated with prolonged computer usage: eye, back and shoulder strain, lack of exercise, bullying, stalking, flaming, and isolation to name a few.

Making the body visible again also means considering the environment that sustains the body. While new technologies do not spew plumes of black smoke into the air they nevertheless require a high use of plastics and toxic chemicals. Add to this the designed obsolescence of computer products and the number of trees needed to supply paper, the sweatshops set up in third world countries to produce cheap computer products, the...
piecemeal work offered to women to keep them at home where they can look after the children and do other invisible work, and the ‘real world’ looms back into perspective.

Of course the body itself is a normative myth that serves technology well. The body is white, male, speaks English, is well educated and has access to sufficient funds to constantly upgrade and or repair equipment. Embodiment on the other hand acknowledges that the lived realities of bodies are not all the same. Gender, race, socio-economic background and disability can all affect access to and equity within this new network of social relations.

The discourse of disembodiment, in constructing a mythical space, affects our relationship to the real world. The more real and spectacular cyberspace becomes, the less real and significant our lived realities are; the more the normative body is privileged and embodiment undermined. Increasingly, we judge the real against the simulated: the ideal woman is a technologically enhanced photographic image; some of the most famous people in the world are actors; the most photographed bridge in America is famous not for itself, but for making its simulacrum, the photo of itself, possible. Here is an answer to the messy dilemma of embodiment. Instead of accommodating the real, the real conforms to our ideals through simulation and reproduction within a self-referential illusion of totality, otherwise known as the internet.

The denigration of an embodied reality has another effect: it justifies an increased symbiosis with technology: a blurring of the boundaries of biology and technology. Repairing and augmenting the failing body has become an accepted norm. Breast implants, stomach stapling, face-lifts and chemical alterations to the body are now welcomed as necessary interventions in what is seen to be a degenerate and vulnerable biological process.

Invisibility is on the increase. We now consider it normal for people to go about their daily lives while wired to an ipod or mobile phone, engaging in social relationships via invisible communication networks. The body is no longer the signifier for social presence and this, along with the discourse of disembodiment, makes the next discourse possible.

**Discourse 3**

Are people moving faster these days? Am I wasting too much time vacuuming and mowing the lawns at home? Is there an appliance that will help me to get these jobs done faster? Why do I feel guilty when I relax? If ‘the future is now’, then I’m already late. Its no wonder I feel stressed. Yet if I did less, I’d feel that there was something wrong with me.

This is an effect of the third dominant discourse, which conflates the present and the future and disparages the past as a technological backwater, thereby constructing an ahistoric understanding of progress. This discourse also enables the indefinite deferral of responsibility because there is simply no time to plan or evaluate so ‘just do it’: an imperative that sounds like a familiar marketing ploy. The discourse of the future as present suggests that technology is evolving so rapidly that there is no time for policy writing, reflection or critique.

This discourse works to justify the demand for novelty, turnover and corporate restructuring, while at the same time ignoring the fact that the increased rate of technological change has not made life any easier for the majority, who continue to labour under oppressive social structures.

**Discourse 4**

This discourse constructs the myth of free information as inherently liberating and progressive when in reality the environment and individuals’ lived realities are reduced to informational resource for the purpose of commodification and control. It is not so surprising therefore, that while multinationals who own most of the physical communications networks and operating systems maintain their opposition to
government intervention, corporations are rushing to secure intellectual property rights. If free information were truly the goal, then securing intellectual property rights would not be an issue.

Discourse 5

Sadly, I fall into a new category for the technologically challenged: the new ‘other’. I am marginalized by dominant technological discourses because I cannot for the life of me remember the difference between a MUD and a MOO and I still refer to pages instead of screens or slides or ‘portals’. Fortunately, English is my first language as English rules the web.

The fifth dominant discourse identified by Millar is the discourse of imperialism, which reinscribes social divisions, including racism, sexism and classism. It does so by providing separate online environments that cater to the needs of different groups where the exotic is assimilated into western categories or paraded as a side-show. This discourse constructs the myth of a global marketplace but the globalization advocated by this discourse involves less an exchange of inter-cultural understanding than a self-interested extraction and commodification of subordinate cultures:

‘Like the civilizing mission of the colonial period, new digital technologies are sold to the world as a new liberating ‘truth’ in … the name of development. … a price must be paid for inclusion in the global marketplace of the future. Even if your place in that global marketplace is one of exploitation.’ (Millar, 2000, p. 152)

Discourse 6

This discourse constructs the myth of technological productivity and foregrounds the efficiency of technology as producer, again constructing man as subordinate to the machine.

‘Productivity must be measured in terms of a society’s total input and output. This means the negative consequences of technology-induced unemployment as well as social and environmental cost must be considered. When assessed in this way, it is clear that rapid technological progress has not delivered the efficiency it has promised.’ (Millar, 2000, p.155)

Discursive effects and implications for educational research

The identification of dominant discourses can serve to generate some important questions or at least raise awareness of significant issues for educators. Using Millar’s technological discourses as an example, the following possible lines of enquiry would be relevant.

Discourse 1, the discourse of technological determinism, might highlight teachers’ and students’ increased dependence upon technologies that work to standardize production while at the same time contributing to the classification, grading and evaluation of the individual. To what degree for example, do we give credence to the information we receive from the Internet over our own contextualized and lived knowledge? Do we validate and privilege the standard formatting of essays produced by a word processing program over the messy and sometimes illegible and irregular individuality of handwriting? Do we think some people are smarter than others because they are competent computer users or because they have access to specialized discourses? As we work on the computer, does the computer work upon us to affect our knowledge of the world and order our patterns of social interaction?

In education the increased availability of online learning and distance education programs, can provide remote, sick, disabled, unsightly and unruly bodies an alternative to normal classroom attendance. Discourse 2, the discourse of disembodiment might
encourage many students to take up this option. While this can be seen as inclusive, empowering and liberating, it can also contribute to the marginalization of bodies that do not fit the norm and work to create an invisible group of students.

The third discourse, the discourse of speed, is not limited to Wired. An advertisement in Australian Educator asks: ‘Is your old computer too slow and making it difficult for your children to do their homework? Imagine having a super fast PC that helps you children get their work done in half the time’ (2005, Spring, no. 47, p.8). How fast can children think? Who benefits from such speed? How can schools keep up with the demands of the computer industry in terms of technical staff, teacher training and hardware and software upgrades? Is the solution just a matter of wiring students up to the information highway and if so, where will the information highway take us in the future?

Although departments of education subscribe to the discourse of ‘information as liberation’, discourse 4, by investing heavily in outfitting classrooms with the latest computer technologies to ensure access to as much information as possible, studies indicate that educational software can encourage both a high degree of individualism and an exaggerated sense of personal power. This is because privileging information over knowledge obscures the extent to which knowledge is produced collectively and subjectively.

Schools are prime examples of the ‘digital divide’ suggested by discourse 5, the discourse of imperialism. In some private schools every student has their own laptop while in public schools students compete for access to a computer and teachers compete for access to a computer lab. Are we in danger of further dividing our society into those who have access to the computer network and are computer literate and those who do not? As our social relationships and informational resources are increasingly enabled by computer networks owned by powerful corporations, will our private lives become increasingly open to scrutiny and commodification?

Finally, the discourse of technological productivity suggests that computers make life easier and more productive for teachers and students. For many teachers, however, the reality is that hours are spent clearing a backlog of email and students and teachers alike waste time surfing the net looking for that allusive bit of relevant and useful information. Technological progress does not result in a reduction of work-load or stress. Housewives for example, have found that the more unhygienic practices that science can identify, the more gadgets they must have and the cleaner their house is expected to be. Similarly the bar has also been raised for teachers who have been given a tool that makes them accountable for administration, surveillance, teaching, resourcing, communicating, assessing and timetabling.

In education, the call to technologize the teaching and learning process has left many questions unanswered and unasked. The speed of implementation and the range of powerful technological discourses that demand high priority be given to the development of students’ and teachers’ ICT skills have been effective in assuaging dissension if not doubt.

Conclusion

This paper has examined the effect of the mutually constitutive relationship between ways of being and ways of knowing upon the construction of the subject within relationships of power. Identifying dominant discourses through discourse analytic methods empowers the subject by making visible the forces that position him or her as both the product and producer of culture.

Identifying a discourse makes possible a consideration of its effect on social power relations and the construction of the individual. In any specific social context, a wide range of discourses may be circulating and working to construct any number of subject positions. The aim of my research project is to identify the dominant discourses circulating in conjunction with the increased use of new information and communication within the context of a specific teaching and learning situation for the purpose of examining and discussing their effects upon teacher pedagogy.

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) is a key to understanding the effect of epistemic
practices upon the construction of the subject and his or her relationship to the world because it deconstructs this relationship. The identification of dominant discourses makes visible the workings of networks of power that are enabled and sustained by the discourses themselves as they seek to normalize the body by inscribing certain ways of being upon it. Making discourses visible means making them open to the possibility of critique and social change.

References


Teaching Identity: The Discursive Construction of an Evolving Community of Practice ®

Matthew Clarke
United Arab Emirates Higher Colleges of Technology

Abstract

This paper presents research into the development of student teacher identities within a new four-year Bachelor of Education degree at the six Women’s Colleges within the Higher Colleges of Technology (HCT) in the United Arab Emirates (UAE). The UAE is an exciting and rapidly changing environment where traditional culture co-exists with the immense changes being wrought by the forces of globalization and the wealth brought about by the development of the oil industry. Within this context of rapid change and development, the HCT’s B.Ed. degree prepares UAE nationals for English as a Foreign Language teaching positions in local government schools as part of the UAE’s nationalization of the workforce program.

The research presented in this paper is drawn from this two-year study of student teachers. Drawing on recent work in teacher education, the study theorized student teacher formation as a process of identity development within an evolving ‘community of practice’. The data in this study, drawn from focus group interview data transcriptions as well as from online discussion forums, and was analyzed using a Critical Discourse Analysis framework. The study was also significantly informed by Laclau and Mouffe’s Discourse Theory.

The focus in this paper is on the discursive construction of the community’s system of knowledge and beliefs, looking in particular at the construction of ‘antagonistic’ relations between the Emirati student teachers and the expatriate-Arab school teachers who were their school mentors.

This paper is based on a two-year study of the first cohort of students to graduate from a new, four-year Bachelor of Education program at the Higher Colleges of Technology (HCT) in the United Arab Emirates (UAE). As one of three government higher education providers, the HCT offers the B.Ed. degree to prepare female Emirati students for positions as English language teachers in government schools, as part of the country’s Emiratization, or nationalization of the workforce, program.

Theorizing learning to teach in terms of the discursive construction of a teaching identity as a member of an evolving community of practice, this paper focuses on the extraordinary degree of uptake of educational discourses by the student teachers. After offering a socio-discursive reading of the contemporary UAE, the paper briefly outlines the nature and scope of the HCT’s teacher education degree, before moving to the main discussion, involving an examination of the take-up of educational discourses by the first cohort of graduates from the degree, and a consideration of how this might be interpreted, within the UAE social and educational context, and in light of some of the theoretical insights offered by discourse theory.

The UAE Socio-discursive Context

The United Arab Emirates (UAE) is located on the Arabian Peninsula and, like other oil-rich Gulf states, has seen rapid growth in most sectors since independence was declared in 1971 (Butt, 2001). Indeed the UAE has gone through – and continues to experience – exponentially increasing development that has transformed the country socially and economically, though interestingly, not politically. In the latter sphere, the UAE Federal government’s control over oil revenues has provided an instrument for penetrating and integrating civil society through welfarism (UAE nationals are entitled to free health care and free education at all stages as well as subsidized housing and
utilities and payments to assist with the costs of marriage and child raising), enabling it to literally ‘buy off’ any aspirations towards participation the polity might harbour (Davidson, 2005).

Attempting to understand how the UAE has rapidly and successfully integrated a radically different past and present, Kazim (2000) presents a reading of UAE history and society in which successive “sociodiscursive formations” have involved both continuities and discontinuities with the preceding formation(s), as society in each period strives to reproduce itself. Examples of such continuities are the political structures of hereditary rule, the economic structures of agriculturalism, mercantilism and industrialism and the sociocultural structures of language, art, food, dress and religious beliefs. Other aspects of earlier periods are reconstructed within the contemporary formation to serve its reproduction, for example, camel racing (for a discussion of the reconstruction of the “tradition” of camel racing, see Khalaf, 2000; see Hobsbawm and Ranger, 1992 for a wider discussion of “invented traditions”), urban sculptures of coffee pots, pearl shells and sailing dhows, and traditional Bedouin “tents” located in the marbled atria of hotels and shopping malls. At the same time the contemporary period has its own constructions in each of these areas, for example, a Federal government which develops foreign policy and issues passports in the political sphere, sophisticated oil, tourism and banking industries linked to globalization in the economic sphere as well as the development of multiculturalism and consumerism in the sociocultural sphere.

Reflecting the thrusts of these continuities, changing patterns and new constructions, Kazim identifies three discourses operating in the contemporary UAE. These comprise what Kazim describes as “conservative”, “progressive” and “moderate” discourses; the first seeking to preserve past patterns, the second embracing globalization, while the third seeks a balance between the first two (Kazim, 2000: 434). All three discourses are accommodated by UAE policy makers as each contributes in different ways to the socio-discursive reproduction of the contemporary UAE social formation (Kazim, 2000: 452-456).

The HCT Bachelor of Education Degree

The HCT Bachelor of Education degree, which commenced delivery in 2000 and graduated its first teachers in 2004, is social constructivist in orientation (Wells, 1999; Daniels, 2001; Kozulin, Gindis, Ageyev and Miller, 2003; McInterney and Van Etten, 2003). This is reflected in our emphasis on the interrelationship between practical experience and theoretical investigation, and our view of knowledge as co-constructed by students and teachers through dialogic interaction, reflection and inquiry. Students are exposed to a range of educational discourses and related constructs that have gained prominence over the past fifty years. Indeed, we recognize that education generally, and teaching specifically, is an “amalgam” of discourses (Coldron and Smith, 1995) that are appropriated and synthesized in the process of learning to teach.

The discursive ‘threads’ that the HCT Emirati students in the Bachelor of Education in Teaching English to Young Learners are working with are multiple and complex, with at least three particularly significant sources of potential tension. First, English language teaching is inseparable from discourses of colonialism (Pennycook, 1998), as well as contemporary globalization (Block and Cameron, 2002), with implications for the survival of local cultures and languages. Second, nationalist discourses mean that the expatriate teachers – the same group HCT relies on to supervise teaching placements – are the ones the students will eventually replace as part of the Emiratization process. Third, the ‘traditional’ model of teaching the students experienced in their own schooling, and which they still see in many of the classrooms they teach in during their eight teaching practice rounds (totaling 36 weeks), is at odds with the ‘progressive’ models, focused on learning through active, purposeful and collaborative inquiry, that the students experience in college and in the teaching practice rounds they complete in international schools.

Over the four years during which this first cohort of HCT teacher education students have been completing their degree, a number of related factors struck me as having
particular significant interest and requiring further exploration. First was the passion and commitment with which the students embraced the discourses of education that comprised the degree. Second was the degree to which the student teachers were exemplifying teacher education as the taking on of a new identity. And third was the strength of the community the student teachers were creating. In the section below I look at how these theoretical constructs of discourse, identity and community were translated into research.

Theory into Research: Discourse, Identity and Community in UAE Teacher Education

Social constructionist philosophies reject notions of totalizing and universalizing knowledge, beliefs, or identities emanating from an ultimate center. Rather, discourse as a series of temporary, unstable and ambiguous closures of meaning is presented as constitutive of both the social and the individual to varying degrees. Discourse in this sense can be defined as “a pattern of thinking, speaking, behaving, and interacting that is socially, culturally, and historically constructed and sanctioned by a specific group or groups of people” (Miller Marsh, 2003: 9).

Discourse thus implies a mode of acting upon the world as well as a means of expression or form of representation. It also implies a mutually constitutive relationship between language and society, between the word and the world at multiple levels: at the level of systems of knowledge and belief; at the level of social relationships and groupings, such as gender, class, institutions or communities; and at the level of effects such as social identities (Fairclough, 1992, 2003). It is through discourse that the social production of meaning takes place, through discourse that social relations are created and maintained and through discourse that social identities are produced.

Viewed within this social constructionist framework, learning to teach is a complex achievement that brings together theory and practice, knowledge and action, intellect and emotion, individual experience and social context, through a process of discursive appropriation and synthesis to create a coherent teaching identity or teaching self (Danielewicz, 2001). However, this teaching identity is socially constructed within a ‘community of practice’, as students mutually engage in the joint enterprise of learning to teach and utilize a common discourse in order to establish common understandings of what it means to be a teacher (Wenger, 1998).

From this perspective, teacher thinking is a mélange of past, present, and future meanings that are continually being renegotiated through social interaction... In order to attain membership in a given group, an individual must appropriate one or more of the discourses that flows through the community.

Miller Marsh, 2003: 6-7

This research into the discursive construction of student teacher identities as members of an evolving community of practice thus draws on theory in a number of ways. The first relates to recent theorizations of teacher education as a process of identity formation (Britzman, 1991; Danielewicz, 2001; Miller Marsh, 2003). The second relates to communities of practice as a productive construct in thinking about teacher education (Kornerup, 1999; Porter, 2003). The third relates to research into the role of discourse in identity construction (Weedon, 1987; Burr, 1995; Mansfield, 2001) and group formation (Laclau and Mouffe, 1985; Torfing, 1999), as well as the ways second language learners take up discourses as part of the process of constructing a new identity in their additional language (Norton, 2000).

The Research Method and Data Analysis

The data for the study that forms the basis of this paper was gathered over a two year period from mid-2002 to mid-2004, working with the first cohort of students to complete the degree. Building on the notion of conversation as “the social justification of belief”
The majority of the data was collected through two forms of ‘conversation’. These included corporeal, face-to-face conversations in the form of researcher-led focus groups and virtual, online Web CT conversations in which the researchers were not present. This data was coded using NVIVO’s NUD*IST qualitative analysis software to explore grammatical and lexical choices and patterns, which structured the students’ discourse.

In terms of semantic choices, a key aspect of the analysis involved examining the ideological import of particular words or ‘nodal points’ (such as ‘traditional’ and ‘modern’, used as adjectives to describe teachers and teaching) and the way lexical ‘chains’ or words with similar ideological import are placed through a text, cumulatively reinforcing a particular ideological thrust (this is also an element of cohesion) and governed by what Laclau and Mouffe (1985: 127-134) describe as ‘the logic of equivalence’. This logic works through key ‘nodal points’, which function as ‘privileged discursive points that partially fix meaning within signifying chains...the nodal point creates and sustains the identity of a certain discourse by constructing a knot of definite meanings’ (Torfing, 1999: 98).

In terms of grammatical choices, a key aspect of the analysis involved examining modality, which offers insights into ‘commitments’ to truth, obligation and necessity (Fairclough, 2003). This includes epistemic modality, where an utterance assumes a putative truth or reality by virtue of its existential expression, as when a student teacher asserts that ‘the teacher’s responsibility is to create an active learning environment’. The analysis also considered evaluation, involving degrees of commitment to what is desirable or undesirable, good or bad. Evaluations may be expressed through a range of linguistic structures, including evaluative statements, statements with affective mental processes, statements with obligational modalities and value assumptions. Overall, in linking textual features of modality and evaluation to social identities, we can say “that what people commit themselves to in texts is an important part of how they identify themselves, the texturing of identities” (Fairclough, 2003: 164).

Discursive construction was explored within this study at four levels:

- the discursive illumination of the ways in which the student teachers exemplify a community of practice;
- the discursive construction of the community’s systems of knowledge and belief;
- the discursive construction of intrapersonal identity, through a focus on the construction of one student teacher;
- and the discursive construction of interpersonal, social relationships among members of the community.

In the discussion of the data below, I focus on the discursive construction of the community’s systems of knowledge and belief, since it is this area that most clearly illustrates the students’ enthusiastic embrace of the discourses of modern education and pedagogy.

The Discursive Construction of the Community’s Knowledge and Beliefs

Moving towards a more student-centered, active approach in all aspects of teaching is I believe the mission of the B.Ed. program. In this way students take ‘ownership’ of their learning, which has the potential to make them more motivated, pro-active and interested learners. Passive learning belongs to the past.

Sara, Dealing with Challenging Behaviour: Re: Dealing with Misbehaviours

---

Data from the Web CT postings is referenced using the format: Student (pseudonym), Topic title, Thread title (‘Re’ indicates response). Data from focus groups is referenced as FG 1, 2, 3 or Arabic.
This statement is typical of the HCT B.Ed. community in its pedagogical passion, reflected in the word ‘mission’, and in its confident assertion of educational ‘truth’, exemplified in the strong modality employed in the final sentence. The corollary assumption, implicit in this final sentence, is that active learning is the way of the future. Indeed, one of the most characteristic discursive strategies employed by the HCT’s student teachers is the establishment of a series of strong binary oppositions that serve to define, establish, maintain and monitor their community. The binaries revolve around a core opposition between the ‘new’ teacher, who uses ‘new’ or ‘modern’ teaching methods and approaches, and is defined in contrast to the ‘traditional’ teacher, who uses ‘traditional’ methods and approaches in the classroom. The ‘traditional’ teachers include both the majority of the teachers the students experienced in the ‘then’ of their own schooling, as well as the majority of the supervising school teachers (SSTs) they have worked with during their teaching placements in the ‘there’ of government schools; while ‘new’ or modern teaching is defined in terms of the approaches they have encountered during the ‘now’ of their years of study on the HCT B.Ed. degree within the ‘here’ of college, and which they intend to implement in UAE government schools. Hence this is also an opposition between ‘them’ and ‘us’ which involves the students investing significantly in a discursive divide between themselves and the teachers they are, and will be, working alongside.

For one student teacher, twelve years of belief in what were once viewed as ‘perfect methods’ were overthrown in just a few months of study:

Throughout twelve years of being a student in school, I had always thought that the best methods in making the students understand the lesson were through using the traditional methods such as memorizing… However, in the first couple of months in the B.Ed., all my beliefs about these perfect methods changed.

Nafisah, Beliefs About Teaching: What are the appropriate methods to use in our classrooms?

Again we see the strategy of constructing the ‘traditional’ and the past in opposition to the ‘new’ and the present. Indeed, such is the prevalence of this commitment to the ‘new’ and the personal and professional passion with which the students testify to their belief in it, that it is often possible to talk in terms of a ‘conversion’. We can see this intensely personalized transformation in a number of postings, for example, in Nashita’s opening line, “Now I can say it and I can say it in a loud voice MY WHOLE LIFE HAS CHANGED” (How Teaching Has Changed My Life: I Love Teaching, emphasis in original). Admittedly, some students, while still embracing change wholeheartedly, did present their conversion to new teaching beliefs in less dramatic fashion as implied by the title of the discussion thread, ‘My beliefs have changed in stages’. The initiator of this thread contrasts her teaching approach during the first year of the B.Ed. with her current views:

My beliefs at this stage were somehow old-fashioned approaches that school teachers used to utilize. Lessons were viewed as teacher-centered classes where the teacher dictates the knowledge to students. Now I know that learner-centered classes are the best environments to improve students’ learning in which the students are allowed to expand and explore their own knowledge.

Halma, Beliefs about teaching: My beliefs have changed in stages

Nevertheless, despite the more moderate expression, the elements of revelation and testimonial, with regard to past errant beliefs, and wholehearted acceptance of new beliefs (“now I know”; note the forceful modality) are still present here. What we see here is these testimonies is part of a discursive strategy that involves drawing a passionate and personal, as well as professional, ‘line in the sand’ between the “new”, teachers that characterize the B.Ed. student teachers’ community of practice as defined through their shared discourse repertoire, and the “traditional” teachers of their past (and current) experience.

A number of further distinctions support this major discursive opposition between the ‘traditional’ teachers of the past and the ‘new’ teachers of the present and future.
Students are often represented as being treated with insensitivity or cruelty in the traditional classroom whereas sensitivity, kindness and a concern for the whole student and their individual needs is the modus operandi in the new, learner-centered classroom. Another binary opposition can be seen in the representation of characteristic teaching approaches in these two contexts, where the former approaches are usually characterized by the students as ‘traditional’ or ‘teacher-centered’ while the latter are described as ‘student-centered’, ‘learner-centered’ or simply ‘new’. In ‘traditional’ classrooms, learning is passive and learners display low motivation and self esteem, whereas new classrooms involve active learning and motivated learners with positive self esteem. Other oppositions focus on the way that the new classroom is characterized by equality whereas rigid hierarchy dominates the traditional classroom. Teaching in the traditional classrooms is an ‘easy’, straightforward business involving transmission of knowledge whereas in new learner-centered classrooms it is complex and challenging and the teacher is more of a facilitator. These binary oppositions, as represented in the discourse of the student teachers in the HCT’s Bachelor of Education, are outlined in Table 1 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Traditional Paradigm</th>
<th>New Paradigm</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The past - traditional teachers &amp; teaching - them</td>
<td>The present/future - new teachers &amp; teaching - us</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insensitivity / cruelty</td>
<td>Sensitivity / kindness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learners as a homogenous collective – children as empty vessels</td>
<td>Learners as presenting individual styles, strengths and needs – children as tender plants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher-centered</td>
<td>Student/learner/child-centered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passive learning</td>
<td>Active learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low motivation &amp; self esteem</td>
<td>High motivation and self esteem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hierarchy</td>
<td>Equality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher as transmitter</td>
<td>Teacher as facilitator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching as easy</td>
<td>Teaching as complex</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Many of these distinctions are evident in the following student teacher’s belief statements, about students and the sort of classroom environment they need. Key terms referencing many of the aspects of the new paradigm in table 1 above are italicized:

> I have come to believe that students are not empty vessels to be filled with knowledge and facts, the way I learned my English language. I have come to believe that they are tender plants who need the support and scaffolding, either from their peers or teachers, to meet their potentials and zones of proximal development. In my opinion, they have to be actively engaged in a child-centered classroom where they construct their own understandings and interact in social groups…in my opinion teaching is like an apprenticeship where students and teachers learn from each other, not as passive bottles. We are preparing active learners to explore, discover and work cooperatively on their learning, not computer programmers to be fed with basic rote knowledge…I believe these learners need a supportive positive environment which fosters learning, inquiry and taking risks to make errors and learn from them.

Manal, Beliefs about teaching: Is teaching a lesson to be taught? emphasis added

The binary structure organizing this text is set up in the first two sentences, establishing an opposition between the metaphors of ‘empty vessels’ versus ‘tender plants’. Operating here is a powerful ideological positioning that largely constructs the students’
community of practice, through this set of binary oppositions, in contradistinction to and at times in antagonism towards, past and present teachers in government schools. The question remains, however, particularly given their strong protective feelings towards their own culture and the gap between progressive educational theory and current practice in local schools, as to why the students have been so wholeheartedly receptive to the educational discourses of modern progressive pedagogy. This question is explored below.

**Interpreting the Findings**

One obvious factor in the students' positive embrace of what we have described as 'new' approaches to education, is their immersion in them as part of a teacher education program that models this progressive pedagogy. This is a reason that came through time and time again in student comments as they contrasted the approaches they experienced at college with those they recollected from school. It may also be that the 'missionistic' rhetoric that underpins progressive approaches, maps readily onto the mission and rhetoric of nation building that is part of the Emiratization project (Kazim, 2000). Youthful naivety may have a role to play too.

But another possible insight into what the processes at work here might be is offered by the findings of a recent study with Jewish and Arab teacher education students in Israel. In this study, Eilam relates the powerful uptake of theory on the part of the Arab students and speculates on the reasons underlying their strong confidence in the ability to relate theory to practice: “The Arab educational milieu, which traditionally involves firm discipline and grants teachers high status and respect, may have encouraged Muslim Arab students to believe more in their ability to successfully apply what they had learned” (2003: 180). The eager, wholehearted acceptance of progressive theory coupled with, indeed intensified by, criticism of their own schooling resonates with findings in Eilam’s earlier study: “The difficulties the Arabs had experienced in learning made them invest much more energy into making sense of and trying to apply the new knowledge” (Eilam, 2002: 1695). Harold, McNally and McAskill (2002: 7) reported a similar “impact of academic course content” on teacher education students at Zayed University in the UAE.

Thus, in line with both these studies, it can be argued that the students are now so critical of their schooling because pedagogically it was at odds with the approaches to education they have encountered in the HCT’s B.Ed. degree. But ironically, it may also be that the students' backgrounds in a “teacher-centered” milieu may contribute to their ready acceptance of “student-centered” approaches. Eilam goes on to suggest that “causing students to deeply contrast other cultures with their own constitutes an effective training method” (Eilam, 2002: 1695). This may well be so in terms of prompting a sort of Piagetian cognitive dissonance, which forces the learner to rethink their prior assumptions. However, it may be that the students’ ‘oppositional affiliation’ (Danielewicz, 2001) is the result of an essential dynamic operating here in the discursive construction of the students' identities and community, which we can best understand by considering Laclau and Mouffe’s logics of equivalence and difference.

Within Discourse Theory, meaning focuses around ‘logics of equivalences’ and ‘logics of differences’; however, these are not given or fixed (Torfing, 1999; Howarth, 2000; Andersen, 2003). We may see a ‘Mercedes’ and a ‘BMW’ car as different or we may see them as equivalent in their difference from a ‘Ford’; which logic prevails depends on context and purpose, and is the very stuff of politics. In a similar fashion, an Emirati student teacher may see herself as equivalent to an Egyptian teacher insofar as they are both non-western, Arabic speakers and fellow professionals in the field of education; or she may focus on her UAE nationality as a source of distinction and difference. The logic of equivalence will strive to delimit and dissolve difference by creating ‘chains of equivalence’; yet because meaning and identity are necessarily differential, the operation of a logic of equivalence is always operationalized through the construction of a purely negative opposite.

As we have seen, for the student teachers’ community, meaning revolves around a
constructed opposition between ‘traditional’ and ‘new’ or ‘progressive’ teaching. Though necessarily temporary and contingent, these particular constructions have achieved a degree of naturalization, becoming hegemonic among the community members. The individual and community identities involved are built up through ‘chains of equivalence’ between elements of ‘new’ or ‘progressive’ teaching. These elements include teacher as ‘facilitator’, practicing ‘student-centered’ teaching within a ‘complex’ classroom environment that values ‘high motivation’ and ‘active learning’ and prizes ‘sensitivity’ towards learners, who are recognized as having varied ‘learning needs’ and individual ‘learning styles’. The meaning of these elements is dependent upon their opposites (‘transmitter’, ‘teacher-centered’ etc.) which also form a chain of equivalence. This opposite chain serves to distinguish the students from the government school teachers, by comprising the ‘constitutive outside’ that offers the condition of possibility for construction of the identities in question (Torfing, 1999: 124). That is, the meanings that make up the student teachers’ identities are established relationally by being equated with some, and contrasted with other key signifiers.

Within this discursive construction of hegemonic meaning and identities, the two chains of equivalence, (lining up with ‘new versus ‘traditional’ teaching) are mutually exclusive, in that it is impossible to be a ‘new’ and a ‘traditional’ teacher at the same time, or for the classroom to be a site of both ‘new’ and ‘traditional’ teaching. This is reflected in thread titles that set the concerns of the government school teachers in opposition to those of the student teachers’ community, such as ‘Discipline versus Learning’. As a consequence of this pattern – and we can see this in thread titles such as ‘My SST is the problem’ – the ‘traditional’ teachers are constructed as – and resented for – ‘blocking’ the full fruition of the student teachers’ identities as ‘new’ teachers (Howarth, 2000: 106-7).

We should be wary, however, of reading a penchant for dichotomous schema as unique to the UAE context. In their work with teacher education students in North America, noted a rejection of ambiguity and a “desire not only for stability but also for what we called a Utopian harmony” (Hinchman and Oyler, 2000: 503). Hinchman and Oyler urge teacher educators to cultivate an appreciation of contingencies, contradictions and ironies in student teachers, so as to guard against susceptibility to overly coherent constructions of pedagogical ‘reality’. In the final section below, Laclau and Mouffe’s discourse theory suggests a potential way forward in addressing this challenge.

**Conclusion**

A situation of hostility between student teachers and government school teachers runs the risk of fusing with other constructed differences such as that between Emirati nationals and expatriate Arabs, leading to situations of mutual resentment and the entrenching of oppositional stances which will obstruct possibilities for cooperation and collaboration. One way to surmount the latent and sometimes explicit antagonism that we have seen in the discourse of the student teachers’ community of practice is to promote what Laclau and Mouffe describe as an *agonistic* approach, which “acknowledges the real nature of its frontiers and the forms of exclusion they entail, instead of trying to disguise them under the veil of rationality or morality” (Mouffe, 2000: 105). Yet while antagonism entails an us/them relation in which those we disagree with are our ‘enemies’, agonism sees them transformed into ‘adversaries’ whose legitimacy is accepted (Mouffe, 2005: 20). This would entail moving beyond characterizations of teaching as good and bad, but rather, seeing education and schools, teachers and students, teaching and learning, within a wider sociodiscursive perspective. Such an emphasis on developing awareness of the discursive construction of all identities resonates with Gee’s recent urging of the need for language teachers to become ‘masters’ of the ‘political geography of discourses’ (Gee, 2004: 30).

The implications of this is the need for teacher education programs in general, and the HCT B.Ed. in particular, to encourage student teachers to develop an awareness of the ways in which their own understanding is continuously being constructed in and through discourse and to see in turn the constructed-ness of ‘other’ teachers’ understandings. In this way we can assist student teachers to move beyond “the veil of rationality or
morality” that constructs the ‘problems’ of UAE education in purely pedagogical, rather than political, terms (Clarke, 2005). Together these elements of an agonistic politics could potentially encourage students to view the teachers in terms of what unites rather than what divides them and to look from a position of shared empathy for common sources of inspiration for action and collaboration.

References


Kornerup, I. (2001) Constructions of Pre-School Teacher Identity: Identity and


B. Coffey
University of Queensland

Abstract
Discourse theory is a perspective on social research that is based upon the assumption that reality is socially constructed, with language constructing social realities, relationships and identities rather than merely providing a description of them in any straightforward or direct way. In relation to environmental issues, the value of such an approach is clearly indicated by Hajer’s view, that whether or not environmental problems appear as anomalies to the existing arrangements, depends first of all on the way in which these problems are framed and defined (Hajer 1995, p4).

Critical approaches to discourse analysis inform a growing body of research in social policy, urban studies and housing policy, and provides for different understandings and insights into policy processes. In particular, critical discourse analysis focuses closely on language use to direct attention to how issues are ‘problematised’ or ‘represented’, and hence foregrounds issues such as problem definition, identification of causes, allocation of responsibility, and indicating what can or should be done.

However, there has been relatively little use of critical discourse analysis to investigate environmental issues. Therefore, this paper employs a critical approach to discourse analysis to analyse how governments can define environmental issues and their respective responses. Victorian Government responses to environmental issues are used as a case study, with a particular focus on two environmental strategies (or green plans): Protecting the Environment (released in 1987) and Our Environment Our Future (released in 2005). Green plans provide a useful focus for investigation because they are relatively comprehensive and strategic statements about environmental issues and what needs to be done to address them.

Introduction
The legitimacy of concerns about environmental degradation and the need for more ‘sustainable development’ is largely accepted across Australia and internationally (eg the United Nations Earth Summit Conferences) even though the nature and adequacy of responses adopted varies. In responding, there are many avenues open to Government, including institutional reform, social mobilization and green planning (Buhrs and Aplin 1999). Of these approaches, the development of green plans has most attracted the interest of governments within Australia (Buhrs and Aplin 1999) and has also attracted significant attention internationally (Dalal-Clayton, 1996; Kenny and Meadowcroft, 1999; and Janicke and Jorgen, 1998). At its simplest, green planning involves the development of comprehensive and integrated policies, plans and strategies to address environmental problems, and often has sustainable development as the express goal (Buhrs 2000, Dalal-Clayton 1996). For Kenny and Meadowcroft (1999) green planning is valuable for its capacity to coordinate different conceptions of the future, and for offering a means of embedding sustainability in both an institutionalized and normatively rich set of intellectual contexts.

However, it is also apparent that there are many different approaches to sustainable
development which can be drawn upon in green planning, and that these are highly contested (Dryzek 1997, Beder 1996, Hollick 1990). It is therefore important to examine how environmental issues are ‘defined’ through public policy processes. This paper therefore, investigates how environmental issues, and their responses, have been defined within public policy processes in Victoria, since the mid 1980s with a particular focus on two environmental strategies or green plans. In doing so it draws upon critical discourse analysis, which is an approach to discourse analysis that pays particular attention to language use. The remainder of the paper is structured as follows: Section 2 provides a brief overview of discursive approaches to policy studies; Section 3 briefly introduces some of the ways in which environmental issues have been defined within public policy literature; while Section 4 provides a preliminary examination of how environmental sustainability has been constructed within ‘official’ policy discourse of Victorian Government’s in two statewide green plans: Protecting the Environment, released in 1987, and Our Environment Our Future, released in 2005. Continuities and discontinuities and their implications are then briefly discussed in the conclusion.

**Discourse Analysis and Policy Research**

Discourse analysis is an emerging perspective within the social sciences which draws on a number of academic traditions (Mills 1997, Howarth 2000) and which Fairclough considers is difficult, largely because of the many conflicting and overlapping definitions formulated from various theoretical and disciplinary standpoints (Fairclough 1992, p3). Potter and Wetherell (1994, p47) for example, identify discourse analysis as:

- Research inspired by speech act theory which is directed at providing systematic accounts of the organisation of conversational exchange in settings such as classrooms;
- Psychologically focused research such as focusing on the effect of discourse structures on recall and understanding;
- Research within the sociology of science which focuses on exploring how scientists construct their talk and texts to display their acts as rational and warrantable in any particular setting; and finally,
- Research, based on the traditions of continental social psychology and cultural analysis, which is concerned with exploring how institutions, practices and individuals can be understood as being produced through the workings of a set of discourses.

Environmental policy research which uses a discursive approach mainly corresponds to the type of studies found in the fourth dot point, and is particularly informed by the work of Michel Foucault (Rutherford 1992; Litfin 1994; Hajer 1995; Luke 1995; Dryzek 1997). In many ways this is not surprising, given that Foucault is arguably the discourse theorist most concerned with analysing the power relations and institutional context of social relations associated with discourses (Gare 1995, p66) and environmental issues are often a source of political conflict. In general terms such an approach is concerned with understanding and interpreting socially produced meanings, rather than search for objective causal explanations. This means that one of the major goals of social inquiry is to delineate the historically specific rules and conventions that structure the production of meaning (Howarth 2000, p128). Foucauldian approaches to discourse analysis also focus on problematisations, which foregrounds questions of how issues are defined and framed.

In parallel to these developments, a body of literature has emerged in policy studies since the late 1980s, which draws on a social constructionist epistemology which challenges straight forward notions about problem identification (Edelman 1988; Stone 1989; Rochefort and Cobb 1993; Rein and Schon 1994; Fischer and Forester 1993), and which in some cases is informed by a Foucauldian perspective. Bacchi captures the focus of much of this literature in stating “…it makes no sense to consider the ‘objects’ or targets of policy as existing independently of the way they are spoken about or represented, either in political debate or in policy proposals. Any description of an issue or a ‘problem’ is an interpretation, and interpretations involve judgment and choices” (Bacchi 1999, p.1).
However, Fairclough considers that while an approach to discourse analysis inspired by Foucault constitutes a rich set of theoretical claims and hypotheses for TODA [textually oriented discourse analysis], Foucault's neglect of textual analysis and his view of discourse as constitutive [as opposed to dialectical] limits his value for textually oriented discourse analysis (Fairclough 1992, p56). By contrast, Fairclough's approach draws together language analysis and social theory, which centres upon a combination of a social theoretical sense of discourse with the text- and – interaction sense of discourse from linguistically oriented discourse analysis (Fairclough 1992, p4). Under this perspective “any discursive ‘event’ (i.e. any instance of discourse) is seen as simultaneously being a piece of text, an instance of discursive practice, and an instance of social practice, with:

- The ‘text’ dimension attending to language analysis of texts;
- The discursive practices dimension, like text- and- interaction’ view of discourse specifies the nature of the processes which types of discourse (including the more social-theoretical sense) are drawn upon and how they are combined; while,
- The social practice dimensions attend to issues of concern in social analysis such as institutional and organisational circumstances of the discursive event and how that shapes the nature of the discursive practice, and the constitutive/ constructive effects of the discourse referred to above” (Fairclough 1992, p4).

In broad terms therefore Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) can be seen to be based on a recognition that changes in language uses are linked to wider social and cultural processes, and a recognition of the importance of using language analysis as a method for studying social change (Fairclough 1992, p1). This critical (or textually oriented) approach to discourse analysis has been applied to a number of areas of social research, including: political discourse; ideology discourse; racism; economic discourse; advertisement and promotional culture; media language; gender; institutional discourse; education; and literacy; with the work in these domains concerned to highlight issues of power asymmetries, exploitation, manipulation, and structural inequalities (Blommaert and Bulcaen 2000, p4). However, it appears that environmental issues have yet to attract much attention from critical discourse analysts, with Stamou and Paraskevopoulous’s study of ecotourism experiences in the visitors books of a Greek reserve, being a notable exception (2003). By contrast, there are small but vibrant communities of social policy, urban studies and housing policy scholars, who have found CDA highly relevant (eg Hastings 1998; 1999; 2000; Jacobs 1999; Jacobs and Manzi 1996; Marston 2000, 2002, 2004; Atkinson, 2000, 1999).

Building on Hajer’s insight that whether or not environmental problems appear as anomalies to the existing arrangements, depends first of all on the way in which these problems are framed and defined (1995, p4) and the relative lack of analysis of environmental issues using CDA, this paper offers a very modest contribution to address this gap.

**Discourse and the Environment**

Critical approaches to discourse analysis clearly have value for investigating environmental policy issues. This section therefore briefly introduces some of the ways in which environmental issues have been defined in public policy, as a way of highlighting the types of constructions to be looked for in applying a more textually oriented approach to assessing the way in which governments in Victoria responded to environmental issues.

**Social constructionism and the environment**

It is important to note that heated debates have occurred regarding the value of discourse analysis, and social constructionism in general, to the study of environmental issues (Gandy 1996; Dickens 1996; Burningham and Cooper 1999; Jones 2002; Crist 2004; and Demerritt 1998). These debates have been particularly fierce within environmental sociology, with Dickens (1996) claiming “insofar as academia is capable of having a stand-up row, it is over this issue that sociology has become most heated” (p72). In broad terms, realists objections to social constructionism centre around the view that social constructionists do not acknowledge the ‘reality’ and independent existence of nature, the environment or environmental problems.
Burningham and Jones’ response is that:

- Firstly, realists are objecting to one particular form of social constructionism, and that there is a disjuncture between the version of social constructionism constructed by realists in their criticisms, and the approaches to constructionism that are most often actually used in empirical case studies; and,

- Secondly that realists’ characterisation of ‘strict’ constructionism (those who avoid making any assumptions about the ‘reality’ of the conditions and focus entirely on the claims made about them) used by both realist critics and authors of some empirical constructionist studies, misreads the approach in significant ways (that is they consider it denies the existence of an objective reality when all it does is seek to remain agnostic about the existence and extent of the conditions and simply consider the claims made about them (1999 pp304 - 308).

In this context, there is some merit in Dryzek’s view that while real problems exist, our interaction with them can only ever be through culturally constructed lens – meaning that we can never know nature except through the interpretive mechanism of culture, which means that all perspectives are partial and contestable (1997, p10). In addition, social constructionism has also been criticised for ‘political quietism’ and diverting attention away from what people consider are the real issues (eg Crist 2004; Mercer 2000). By contrast however, I consider that discursive approaches draw attention to the ways in practices are justified.

Environmental discourses

Within the context of this paper, issues warranting investigation include views about the causes and severity of environmental issues, the sources of environmental concern, and what type of responses are required. This section highlights some of the ways that environmental sustainability can be conceptualised. Identifying these different discourses and constructions will help to make sense of the way in which policy debates have played out in Victoria.

Ideas about the environment in western thought are diverse and varied and have presented challenges to accepted views about the relationship of humans to other living things (Hay 2002). In arguing that environmentalism represents a new political ideology, Eckersley, for example identifies that there are at least 5 distinct sources of concern for the environment as follows:

- **Resource Conservation:** it is wrong to be wasteful in the use of the environment, ‘the gospel of efficiency’, ‘prudent husbanding’, ‘wise use’, ‘elimination of waste’;

- **Preservationism:** parts of the environment are unique, inspire awe, or are highly aesthetic and these should be protected – we should have a reverence for nature and an aesthetic and spiritual appreciation of wilderness – saving nature from development – ‘silo’ (stockpile of genetic diversity), ‘laboratory’ (scientific), ‘cathedral’ (spiritual), ‘art gallery’ (aesthetic beauty);

- **Human Welfare Ecology:** enlightened self interest – the environment provides us with goods and services and therefore it is in our own long term self interest to look after it – eg sustaining the natural resource base for human production, and sustaining biological support systems for human reproduction;

- **Animal Liberation:** if animals can feel pain or suffer then we have no moral right to cause them harm – eg humane treatment; and,

- **Ecocentrism:** There is “no valid basis to the belief that humans are the pinnacle of evolution and the sole locus of value and meaning in the world … Instead all of the various multi-layered parts of the biotic community are valuable for their own sake” (Eckersley 1992).

Following broadly from these philosophical positions, responses to environmental issues can be seen to span the political spectrum. Dryzek, for example has identified different discourses about the environment (1997) and having identified the basic dimensions of environmental discourses he then focused on the elements which are used to construct particular storylines which underpin these discourses. These elements are the:
• basic entities whose existence is recognised or constructed (ontology);
• assumptions about natural relationships (i.e. competitive etc.);
• agents and their motives (individuals or collectives; self interested or public spirited);
and,
• key metaphors and rhetorical devices (e.g. spaceship earth) (Dryzek; 1997, p18).

Table 1. provides a summary of the different environmental discourses identified by Dryzek (1997) who considered this is a useful approach because these discourses condition the way we construct, discuss and analyse environmental problems and hence, are embodied in institutional arrangements that are put in place for managing the environment (1997, p 19).
Table 1. Summary of Environmental Discourses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Limits and their Denial</th>
<th>Basic entities recognized</th>
<th>Natural relationships</th>
<th>Agents and their motivations</th>
<th>Key metaphors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Looming Tragedy: Survivalism</td>
<td>Finite stocks of resources Carrying capacity Population and Elites</td>
<td>Hierarchy and control</td>
<td>Elites motivation, is up for grabs</td>
<td>Overshoot and collapse Commons, Spaceship earth Lily pond and Cancer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth Forever: The Promethean Response</td>
<td>Nature as only brute Markets and prices Energy and technology</td>
<td>Humans at top of hierarchy Competition</td>
<td>Everyone, motivated by their material self interest</td>
<td>Mechanistic trends</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problem Solving Approaches</th>
<th>Basic entities recognized</th>
<th>Natural relationships</th>
<th>Agents and their motivations</th>
<th>Key metaphors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Rationalism: Leave it to the experts</td>
<td>Liberal capitalism Administrative state Experts and Managers</td>
<td>Nature below human problem solving People subordinate to the state Experts and managers control the state</td>
<td>Experts and Managers Motivated by public interest, defined in unitary terms</td>
<td>Mixture of concern and reassurance The administrative mind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democratic Pragmatism: Leave it to the People</td>
<td>Liberal capitalism Liberal democracy Citizens</td>
<td>Equality among citizens Interactive political relationships, mixing competition with cooperation</td>
<td>Many different agents Motivation a mix of material self interest and multiple conception of public interest</td>
<td>Public policy as a resultant of forces Policy like scientific experimentation, Thermostat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Rationalism: Leave it to the market</td>
<td>Homo economicus Markets, Prices and Property Government (not citizens)</td>
<td>Competition Hierarchy based on expertise Subordination of nature</td>
<td>Homo economicus: self interested Some government officials must be motivated by public interest</td>
<td>Mechanistic Negative view of regulation Connection with freedom</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Quest for Sustainability</th>
<th>Basic entities recognized</th>
<th>Natural relationships</th>
<th>Agents and their motivations</th>
<th>Key metaphors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable Development: Environmentally Benign Growth:</td>
<td>Nested social and ecological systems Capitalism economy No limits</td>
<td>Subordination of nature Economic growth, environmental protection, distributive justice, and long term sustainability go together</td>
<td>Many agents at different levels, notably transnational and local rather than the state; motivated by the public good</td>
<td>Organic growth Connection to progress Reassurance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecological Modernisation: Industrial Society and Beyond:</td>
<td>Complex systems Nature as waste treatment plant Capitalist economy The state</td>
<td>Partnerships: govt, business, environmentalists, scientists Subordination of nature Environmental protection and economic prosperity go hand in hand</td>
<td>Partners, motivated by public good</td>
<td>Tidy household Connection to progress reassurance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Green Radicalism</th>
<th>Basic entities recognized</th>
<th>Natural relationships</th>
<th>Agents and their motivations</th>
<th>Key metaphors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Green Romanticism: Saving the World through New Consciousness</td>
<td>Global limits Inner nature Unnatural practices</td>
<td>Natural relationships between humans and nature have been violated Equality across people and nature</td>
<td>Human subjects, some more ecologically conscious than others Agency exists in nature too</td>
<td>Wide range of biological and organic metaphors, Passion Appeals to emotions, intuitions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Rationalism: Saving the World through new Politics</td>
<td>Global limits, Rational humans Nature as complex ecosystems Social, economic and political structures</td>
<td>Equality among people Complex interconnections between humans and nature</td>
<td>Many individual and collective actors, and varied motivations Agency in nature downplayed though not necessarily denied</td>
<td>Organic metaphors Appeals to reason, and potential rationality of social structures Link to progress</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Compiled from Dryzek J (1997)
The Environment in Policy Processes

The work of Caldwell (1993) and O’Riordan (1996) provides further insights into highlighting the way in which problem definition influences environmental policy responses. Caldwell (1993) identifies three different ways in which environmental problems can be defined within public policy processes:

- Incidental interpretations which see environmental disruptions as accidents or miscalculations, and thus amenable to admonition, education, indoctrination and a few legal sanctions such as anti-litter laws;
- Operational interpretations which see environmental problems as largely inadvertent, but caused by inadequate or inappropriate organisation and management of economic and public affairs – notably in relation to technology. Under this interpretation, policy responses include improved procedures, independent review, standard setting, enforcement and incentives; and,
- Systemic interpretations of the environmental problem which focus on the need to uncover the roots of environmental degradation and seek to remedy basic causes. Advocates of this approach consider that the present socioeconomic-technological order (socialist and capitalist) are the ultimate cause of deteriorating environmental conditions.

Table 2 outlines stages on the path to sustainable development (O’Riordan 1996). While not intended for such a purpose it is possible to consider the four stages as different ways of defining sustainability, and the types of the response required. That is if environmental issues are defined as isolated individual cases then isolated individual responses will be proposed, whereas if sustainability issues are defined as being inherent feature of our current way of life then the responses required are systematic and far reaching.

### Table 2. A Possible Map of the Sustainable Transition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Policy</th>
<th>Economy</th>
<th>Society</th>
<th>Discourse</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stage 1</td>
<td>Very Weak Sustainability</td>
<td>Lip service to policy integration</td>
<td>Minor tinkering with economic instruments</td>
<td>Corporatist discussion groups; consultation exercises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dim awareness and little media coverage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 2</td>
<td>Weak Sustainability</td>
<td>Formal policy integration and deliverable targets</td>
<td>Substantial restructuring of microeconomic incentives</td>
<td>Round tables; stakeholder groups; parliamentary surveillance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Wider public education for future visions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 3</td>
<td>Strong Sustainability</td>
<td>Binding Policy integration and strong international agreements</td>
<td>Full valuation of the coast of living; ‘green accounts alongside national accounts</td>
<td>Community involvement; twinning of initiatives in the developed and developing world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Curriculum integration; local initiatives as part of community growth</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage</td>
<td>Very Strong Sustainability</td>
<td>Strong international conventions; national duties of care; statutory and cultural support</td>
<td>Formal shift to sustainable economic accounting both nationally and internationally</td>
<td>Community-led initiatives become the norm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Comprehensive cultural shift coupled to technological innovation and new community structures</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Finally, within the policy studies literature competing environmental discourses have been
identified, including for example:

- Sharp, who differentiated between environmental approaches based on technocentric and ecocentric discourses in investigating how British local authorities put notions of sustainability into practice (Sharp and Richardson 2001, p203);

- Hajer, who differentiated between the “traditional pragmatist” (minimizing organisational disturbance and looking for pragmatic, piecemeal solutions) and “ecological modernist” (anticipatory approach to policy control and the idea that pollution prevent pays) discourses in investigating how acid rain should be considered (Hajer; 1995, & 1994, pp 64-65)

- Whatmore and Boucher (1993), who identify competing “conservation”, “commodity” and “ecology” narratives in exploring the role of planning discourse and practice in the social construction of nature in debates about the use of planning gain mechanisms to generate environmental benefits (Boucher and Whatmore 1993);

- Browne and Keil, identify three broad discourses (the “economic efficiency”; “clean air” and “environmental justice” discourse coalitions) operating within the debates regarding air pollution within Los Angeles (Browne and Kiel 2000).

What these studies indicate is that there are many different ways in which environmental issues can be portrayed, and that within public policy processes there are different discourse coalitions (Hajer 1995) competing to define the terms of the debate. Given that policy processes are contested and that truths are historically specific, a discursive approach is therefore useful for investigating how environmental issues have been defined within Victoria, and it is to this I now turn.

**Economising on Sustainability in Victoria?**

Given the diversity of ways in which environmental issues can be defined and the contests over competing definitions, there is a need for empirical investigations to examine how debates are actually played out in particular situations. Within this context recent experience in the Australian State of Victoria will be examined focusing on the development of two government strategies for environmental sustainability (or green plans: *Protecting the Environment: A Conservation Strategy for Victoria* (Victorian Government 1987) and *Our Environment Our Future: Victoria’s Framework for Environmental Sustainability* (Victorian Government 2005).

The influence of economic discourses will be a particular focus. As context, it should be noted that the Labor Party in Victoria held office from 1982 to 1992, when it lost to the Liberal – National Party coalition which governed until 1999. At the 1999 state election the Labor Party was able to form a minority government with support from independent Members of Parliament. The Labor Party was returned in November 2002 winning a resounding victory and establishing a majority in both Houses of Parliament.


In June 1987, after 5 years in office the Labor Government led by John Cain released *Protecting the Environment* which was claimed as “the first attempt in Victoria’s European history to develop in a comprehensive way a coherent philosophy and program of actions designed to protect and enhance our natural and cultural heritage” (Victorian Government 1987, p7). To put this in context, this was the same year the Brundtland report was released, with that report being widely acknowledged for its role in popularizing the idea of sustainable development. Nonetheless, *Protecting the Environment* was a landmark strategy, given its stated commitment to sustainable development, and to my knowledge, it was the first such strategy released by a State or Territory Government in Australia.

The way in which this commitment to sustainable development is articulated is through adopting a long term perspective, as well as offering a 4 year program of actions, with the strategy structured in three parts:

- Part A which provides the context for the strategy;
Part B which outlines priority programs by describing the challenge, what the government has done, and what the government will do for each of the priority 8 programs; and,

Part C which deals with implementation.

The release of the strategy was a significant policy making exercise taking five years to realize, and which included the release of a discussion paper, draft strategy (which received 250 submissions) and undertaking of a community workshop involving 180 participants.

Protecting the Environment draws on a number of sources of environmental concerns that broadly match those outlined in Eckersley (1992). Examples of this include:

- Firstly, the Premier’s foreword which indicates “If Victoria is to remain beautiful and prosperous, fertile and diverse, then we must all learn that our future quality of life depends on the wise integration of progress and development with the need to look after and conserve precious resources. It does not mean trading one for the other. It means learning to use resources without using them up” (Victorian Government 1987 foreword [highlighting added]) and

- Secondly justifications for the protection of genetic diversity include that “For reasons of self interest and moral obligation to other species, human beings should not knowingly cause the extinction of species” (Victorian Government 1987, p13) [highlighting added].

In terms of the cause of the problems and the challenge that they present Protecting the Environment deflects responsibility through claims such as “Like most developed regions in the world today, Victoria is facing serious environmental problems that must be overcome” (1987, foreword) and portraying these as associated with an historical context where it is possible to lay blame on past generations with “The nineteenth century pioneers belief that natural resources were unlimited gradually given way to growing concern about the effects of uncontrolled development and the need for environmental protection” (Victorian Government 1987, p1). In addition, with only ‘uncontrolled’ development being the problem this points towards the government's perspective regarding issues associated with environment versus growth debates, and is one of the ways in which ideas about ‘limits to growth’ can be defined away (Dryzek, 1997). This approach is broadly consistent with Caldwell's operational definition of environmental problems discussed above.

This line of argument is evident elsewhere in the documents with the Premier’s foreword also stating “My government supports development and expansion of our economy and the creation of more jobs … it needs to be sustainable development, where the social and economic benefits can continue indefinitely” (Victorian Government 1987, foreword). The validity of this approach is repeated elsewhere with the conclusion indicating that “The conservation objectives of the strategy are not incompatible with economic development” (Victorian Government 1987, p105). However, it is also clear that part of the Government’s strategy was to marginalise opposition from interests opposed to environmental objectives with “the government reject[ing] the misguided, but oft stated, view that environmental protection is necessarily achieved at the expense of economic growth and employment opportunities. This simplistic equation does not recognise the complex interactions between these different sectors of public policy, nor does it look beyond the immediate time-frame into the medium- and long term where a true perspective can be granted” (Victorian Government 1987, p10) (highlighting added).

In terms of what was to be done and how urgently, Protecting the Environment:

- Establishes its primacy as the first attempt to develop a comprehensive approach to sustainable development within the State;
- Establishes both long term and short term imperatives, with the Strategy taking a long term view as well as offering a four year plan of action; and also;
- Indicates that it “marks the start of a statewide campaign to alert the community about the need to act now” (1987, foreword).

With action required the issue of ‘who’ is the focus for attention to undertake any specified
actions. While “cooperation between government, landholders and developers and the community in general” is highlighted as being necessary (1987 p98), agency within the document is clearly directed towards government, with Part B of the strategy outlining the priority programs by describing the challenge, outlining what the government has done, and stating what the government will do for each of the eight priority programs that cover the suite of issues identified. Further, the word “Government” referring to the Victorian Government features prominently throughout the document, for example through the use of the subheading “What the Government will do” and the repeated use of the phrase “Specifically the Government will …”.

Our Environment Our Future: Victoria’s Framework for Environmental Sustainability 2005

Having provided a brief sketch of Protecting the Environment our attention can be directed forwards 18 years to April 2005 with the release of Our Environment Our Future: Victoria’s Framework for Environmental Sustainability (Victorian Government 2005). Following the 2002 State election, the Government implemented machinery of government changes to establish a Department of Sustainability and Environment, and subsequently initiated the development of Our Environment Our Future, with neither of these initiatives being flagged during the election campaign. Further, unlike Protecting the Environment, there was no public consultation process during the development of OEOF prior to its release in April 2005.

According to the Premier’s foreword “the Framework provides direction for government, business and the community to build environmental considerations into the way we work and live” (Victorian Government 2005). The way in which it sets out to achieve this purpose is through:

- Outlining the challenge ahead;
- Explaining what environmental sustainability is and why it is important;
- Outlining the new approach encompassing three strategic directions:
  - Maintaining and restoring our natural assets;
  - Using Our resources More efficiently;
  - Reducing Our Everyday Impacts; and finally,
- Putting the Framework into Action.

In terms of the discourses informing the source of concern for the environment, these are indicated by the Premier who states “Victoria’s rich and diverse natural and built environment are assets of immeasurable worth. Our magnificent coastlines, lands and waterways, spectacular alpine regions and our unique built environment have intrinsic values that improve our quality of life. They also have direct economic benefits providing safe drinking water, fertile soil, shelter and many other services” (Victorian Government 2005, Premier’s foreword).

While these bear some semblance to those of Protecting the Environment it is worth highlighting the use of the terms “natural assets” and “services” which effectively draw on economic discourses. This economic language is prominent throughout the text with the reasons why we need to become sustainable presented as:

“What is good for the environment is good for Victoria. Clean air and water support our healthy, productive land and ecosystems support our economy, and environmental industries provide new jobs. There are a number of reasons why environmental sustainability must be our goal:

- A healthy environment means healthy communities;
- Environmental sustainability will boost Victoria’s liveability;
- Victoria’s environment is a valuable asset that provides essential goods and services;
- Environmental sustainability delivers economic and social benefits;
Environmental sustainability creates business opportunities and new jobs;

Cutting costs – now and in the future;

Environmental sustainability is a better way of addressing our environmental challenges;

Environmental sustainability helps Victoria meet its national and international obligations, and;

Victoria’s environment supports or lives, our lifestyles and our economy”.


The use of economic discourses as a means for constituting why environmental sustainability is important is clearly indicated in the statement that:

“We have a stock of natural assets – air, land, waterways, plants and animals. These assets provide essential services that support our life, communities, industries, economy and jobs.

Just as investors seek to protect their financial assets while enjoying the interest earned from them, Victorians must also live off the benefits provided by our stock of natural assets without running down the assets themselves” (Victorian Government 2005, p22).

In addition, in comparison to Protecting the Environment, what is missing is a recognition of the intrinsic value of the environment, and while intrinsic values are mentioned in the Premier’s foreword this is the only place that it is mentioned in the text, and it is used in a way that is contradictory –saying that “they improve our quality of life” is contradictory to the intent of intrinsic value in environmental discourses. However, like the earlier strategy, Our Environment Our Future is based around the discourse that economic growth and environmental sustainability are compatible. For example, it is stated that “For too long we have seen a healthy environment and economic prosperity as being mutually exclusive. This framework has at its heart, a more sophisticated and creative understanding of relations between the economy and the environment” and also that “The State believes you can achieve an A-plus rating for the environment while still retaining an AAA credit rating for the economy” (Victorian government 2005, p16). This statement has a clear resonance within Victorian state politics since the late 1980’s, with the Kennett Government of the 1990’s making the re-attainment of a AAA credit rating its major goal, while the Bracks Government’s use of this a clear reference to avoid being tarred with the brush of the earlier Labor Government led by John Cain.

It is also interesting to note the use of the terms ‘sophisticated’ and ‘creative’ when the Government has recently approved the expansion of the greenhouse gas intensive brown coal burning Hazelwood Power Station. In summary, it is apparent that there is a greater concern to identify the source of environmental concern in economic and human welfare terms relative to the ‘moral’ imperative or recognition of intrinsic value identified by Eckersley (1992).

With the prevalence of economic terms and metaphors for defining environmental concern, it is not surprising that the individual choices of Victorians are also fore grounded as the cause of the environmental challenges facing Victoria, with for example:

• “Our environment faces many significant challenges that have resulted directly from the choices we have made in the past and continue to make” (Premier’s foreword);

• “Taken together, the daily activities of individual Victorians are putting enormous pressure on our environment. It is time to reflect on our simple daily activities” (p10); and,

• “Collectively, the daily actions of all Victorians are having a significant impact on the environment. Inefficient use of resources, poor choices and depletion of our natural environment is a burden on the Victorian economy and business” (p16).

Our Environment Our Future identifies the seriousness of the issues as “It is now time to ensure we develop much more sustainable ways of living our lives” and that “It will take a long term, whole of government approach, and this Framework sets out the challenge that lies
ahead” (Victorian Government 2005, Premier’s foreword). It is also suggested in *Our Environment Our Future* that “Victoria is proudly playing its part in helping the world meet [the objective of achieving sustainable development and a higher quality of life for all people] … But [that] we have a long way to go before we can claim to be a truly sustainable state” (Victorian Government, 2005, p10). Following on from this it is stated that “Government, business and communities are urged to build environmental considerations into the way we work, and live” (Victorian Government 2005, Premier’s foreword). However, there is less attention on what government will do in future, beyond the exhortation that “we now need to take the next step, which is to incorporate environmental sustainability into all the things we do (Victorian Government 2005, Minister’s foreword). By contrast, individuals are central to future efforts with it being “Time to reflect on our simple daily activities: how much waste we produce, how much water we consume, what products we buy, how we run our businesses and how we choose to travel. Taken separately, each of these decisions seems insignificant, but multiplied by five million people that live in our state their impact on our natural assets is profound” (Victorian Government 2005, p10). Such as an approach would appear to be consistent with neo-liberal discourses where governing is at a distance (Rose and Miller 1992). Further, throughout the strategy the terms “Our” and “We” are used although who “we” are and what is meant by “our” are left ambiguous.

Finally, the inside cove to *Our Environment Our Future* includes the following acknowledgment to Victoria’s aboriginal people:

> “Since time immemorial, aboriginal people have cared for this land and its natural and cultural resources. This long and unique association continues to through the Aboriginal communities who live and work in Victoria. Accordingly, the Victorian Government is proud to acknowledge Aboriginal people as the original inhabitants of this land” (Victorian Government 2005 inside cover).

**Conclusion**

Given the above analysis, what tentative lessons or sense can be made from this preliminary examination of these two government strategies, separated by almost 18 years of social, political and environmental change in Victoria? Firstly, to me what stands out most obviously is the increased use of economic terminology to conceptualise environmental issues and why we should be concerned about environmental sustainability. From a point where a broader range of sources of concern were permitted and incorporated throughout *Protecting the Environment*, the more recent document *Our Environment Our Future* offers a far more limited view of environmental values, and one which draws more on economic discourses and which focuses on individual actions rather than promoting more cooperative forms of social action. At a time when scientific evidence indicates that the environment in Victoria is seriously degraded, and that new more holistic approaches are required, (Victorian Catchment Management Council 2002) it is hard to reconcile this with the framing of the issues in economic terms. Secondly, the relationship between the environment and the economy has been reframed from the discourse of ‘sustainable development’ to one of ‘ecological modernisation’ where the relationship between the environmental quality and economic growth is reframed as a positive sum game “pollution prevention pays” although whether this claim stands scrutiny remains to be seen. Thirdly, the role of government has changed with there being less of a focus on government as having an influential role in setting ‘the rules of the game’ within which individuals, communities, and businesses operate within Victoria. Further, the focus of attention has shifted from government to the individuals and the choices they make, and disappointingly neither strategy provides much discursive space for issues of equity and social and/or environmental justice, despite these discourses being evident within environmental policy literature. There is also limited attention directed towards the role of business, although *Our Environment Our Future*, does appear to attempt to make environmentally responsible action appear as a business opportunity. Further, the acknowledgment of Victoria’s aboriginal people in *Our Environment Our Future* is a clear indication of at least lip service to reconciliation, and personally it is disappointing that more wasn’t made of this, for both aboriginal people and as a way of opening up other ways of examining the complexities of the environmental sustainability challenge.

Finally, there is also potential to extend the focus of the analysis in this paper through
examining others aspects of the texts, and the context within which they occur. Such an analysis would look at other avenues of government environmental policy making, and situating these within the broader contexts of Victorian state politics and experience elsewhere. This would allow greater attention to be directed towards issues associated with the almost obsession of recent Victorian governments with financial management and neo-liberal agendas, and the implications of this attention for environmental sustainability.

References


Anti-Oedipus in Education®

David R Cole
University of Tasmania

Abstract
This paper will blend theory with practice, and may be bracketed in the genre of conceptual fiction. It uses the theoretical apparatus given to us by Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari in their opus maxima, anti-Oedipus, to explore actual relief teaching experiences in inner city schools undertaken in the UK. Through this blending, the author has produced a way into understanding the behaviours that underpin western educational practice. This is quite far removed from the rhetorical policy making exercises that have arisen from the central offices of the bureaucratic structures that administer the educational systems of the west. It is in fact an informed and conceptual mapping of the actual experiences and power relationships that affect teachers and pupils alike during the school day. It is important to note that the place where these maps come from crucially alter their alignment and in a sense this demonstrates a form of perspectivism that we may derive from Nietzsche or Deleuze & Guattari as they have formulated writing that combines critical precision with experiential understanding about the real effects of their writing. The ironic aspect of this writing is that it offers no easy solutions or ways out of the clearly problematic educational paradoxes that it presents. On the contrary, these ‘dark places’ that exist in the structure of western education are celebrated and communicated, and their energy is taken seriously in terms of perhaps being fundamental to hierarchies that require a chaotic, messy, undisciplined other clearly in their midst….

A question of style
The introduction of strategies that undermine a singular perspective in theoretical writing, immediately takes us away from a sense of a unified objective opinion about the phenomena at hand. Authors such as Friedrich Nietzsche (1885/1961), Jean-François Lyotard (1974/1993) and Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari (1972/1984) have deployed such a technique to resist the idea that they are writing a unique, authoritative and experience free academic book. Furthermore, we all know that inspirational teaching comes from a different place to the solely book exercise. You could say that this is when the textbooks have been consigned back to the shelves, and the educator starts to live the ideas with their pupils. It also when minor, disruptive and localised signs of life that may be present in the educational context, sit comfortably alongside the big ideas and may begin to exist in the theoretical writing and therefore produce generalised effects, ambience or Stimmung above and beyond their usual normative location. In this analysis, I shall take several of the theoretical elements from perhaps the most vital book that Deleuze and Guattari constructed, anti-Oedipus, and I shall place parts of this structure alongside experiences of relief teaching in the UK. The objective of this approach is to free up the writing in terms of directly attending to experiential elements through theory, and to produce a synthesis that does not fall into the gaps and holes that can often blight well intentioned ethnography and qualitative analysis that sets out to achieve a parallel goal though divides theory and practice into their component parts.

Internal forces
The eminent 19th century German judge Schreber went to school, but what did he learn? Perhaps we could understand the learning process that he was subjected to as institutionalised schizophrenia, or the introduction of madness through the workings of a huge external machine? Or perhaps he merely learnt how to deceive society with his will to power and strong expediency whilst retaining a secret, private self? What we do know is that the cruel front of a
respective judge, who sat in the correct and esteemed manner to laud over the citizens in his jurisdiction, masked the processes of transformation that were at work within him. He was, in fact, developing the body without organs. This is an absolutely antithetical position to the one socially deemed proper for him to assume. Within the regime of an extraordinary educational system of discipline and learning machines (metal chairs that look more like medieval torture devices!), that had been invented by his father and were upheld by the society at the time as apparently having beneficial educational effects, the judge started to become a woman. We have personal accounts that rays of light began to shine from his arse-hole, and that in the process of radical internal feminisation, every tentacle of his progressively calcified existence began to spread into a cosmic and personal communication system with God.

Schreber went mad. However, locking the body without organs into a straight jacket only intensifies its dysfunction. For example, prison and mental institutions may serve as useful ‘meat’ on which the body without organs will feed as they demonstrate antithetical behaviours that intensify the movements of the internal body. Also, if one tries to threaten the breakdown of institutional oedipal mechanisms with the rebukes of blame, violence or solitary confinement, this in fact increases the pressure to ‘become-other’ and to try to escape from familial reproduction in a closed environment such as a school. During the process of becoming-other, the subject enacts events such as the interruptions and the violations in the development of the normative self, as if they were the only meaningful interactions to pass over the body during that period. The western system of education also becomes caught in such cycles, as, for example, the desperate search for discipline dissolves into an attraction and repulsion machine that is continually coercing the irregular into straight lines and constantly rearranging knowledge and learning, as if they were the weapons of crusading knights and as if there was some kind of final truth that education will eventually deliver. Of course, we all really know that knowledge and learning have become fixed to economic parameters, and that they are tied to objectives as laid out by higher forces in government and business; in the west, and progressively around the globe, through education we are enacting a socio-political organisation that is taking us headlong into an unknown future of economic progress and the accumulation of internal forces inside of our institutions.

The replacement programs

The bells ring. Management shuffle paper around the staff-room, the ever mounting number of teachers absent is remarked upon, the dates for the ‘o.f.s.t.e.d.’ (a.k.a. UK education terror brigade) inspection are clarified and a meeting with parents to decide about the future of the school is arranged. The staff force out jokes, they remain rooted in their sanctuary away from the outside. Stress related disease is a plague akin to the more widespread medieval horrors. The problem is that it doesn’t kill you outright, but it slowly eats away at the subject; stress attacks physiological stability with the pain of continual reaction, monitoring and control, it disables expression and replaces calm words with the need to shout. The teachers clutch their papers and march to their pre-defined locations for their hour of contact with the pupils. The playground is a wasteland, given over to the bright and dull shades of the pupils that will soon be present in the confined space of the classroom. The shades amble inside, they are armoured and protected against the stress disease that will pour forth from their teachers. The duller shades merge into the dishevelled rows of tables and chairs; they already have their books and are ready to watch the spectacle of the replacement programs. The brighter points cannot accept the lack of focus and signature. This isn’t television, or football, or a nightclub. They are expected to slide effortlessly into place, into the classroom and the curriculum, but why should they? Who is this teacher? Why can’t he just chill out or go away and stop this useless talk?

The explicit desires of the children in this situation cannot be interpreted as a rebellious lack of discipline and control. These expressions are not founded in needs that are attempting to replace something that isn’t there, something that is absent in the subjects and requiring replacement. In other words, the anti-Oedipal figure of the unconscious is full; in a sense the pupils have no needs. Their desires constitute complex mixtures of energies and drives that should not be sublimated or siphoned off into various abstracted strata to disable their potentia (the strategies of the replacement programs). That is to say, we should not align reason or the sensible directly against the unconscious as represented by the antipathetic attitudes of the pupils. Previous epochs have taught us that the primal terror of primitive human groups cannot
be simply diluted into contemporary civil society. In fact, movements such as the Enlightenment have in many ways reinvented and reinvigorated fear and channelled it in new and dramatic forms. For example, the horror of Mary Shelley (1818/1994) in *Frankenstein*, or the panopticon of Jeremy Bentham are both supreme reinventions of the fear of the other, and the more recent surveillance devices in LA as described by Mike Davis (1990) in *City of Quartz*, could themselves be figured as movements of the unconscious, in that they simultaneously decry and uphold civil society. The point of using *anti-Oedipus* to understand the desire of rebellious pupils in western educational contexts is that their desire is not a static phenomenon. In other words, desire in these terms is tied to the breaking of bonds, it also related to the reformation of stronger ties in order to feel the rush of release from them. Perhaps one might say that this is characteristic of the movement of desire in western education - as Foucault (1972/1984) has put it; “we desire our own repression” (p.xiii).

Meanwhile, the emptiness of boredom remains. Teachers perilously attempt to assign meaningless tasks to their disruptive classes in order to achieve the passing of the contact hour without serious conflict. For example, the copying out of diagrams, the design of a poster for your favourite film, the answering of irrelevant questions based on sections of words plucked from tired textbooks that are still basking in the fervour of learnt information. It doesn't take a genius to see through the activity, the leading students soon find more amusing past-times, which might include the baiting of the teacher or localised action such as humiliation, laughter, sharp oral games, fighting, erotiks and the use of projectiles to communicate something more meaningful than the previously designated task. At this point it could be said that the class is crossing-over; it is becoming other, taking on board the movement of desire and turning the allotted space into landscapes of action which are not controlled through the replacement programs. The teacher attempts to enforce the authority assigned to his or her position through the socio-political complex maintaining the school and advocating the replacement of desire. Shouting has no effect, the pupils shout back, or do not hear the stressed out screeching from the front of the class. Threats and rebukes dissolve aimlessly into the livelier and less directed atmosphere of the crowd. The teacher is abstracted and isolated in his or her educational goals. At best the teacher is reduced to a policing role in order to determine whether or not any serious laws are being broken during the lesson.

In *A Thousand Plateaus*, Deleuze and Guattari (1980/1987) have introduced the concept of segmentation that allows us a way into the nature of the replacement programs. At school we are told, “you are not at home anymore”, in the army you are told, “you are not at school anymore” (p.209). The constant shuffling between classrooms in the high school context, the breaks, the sounding of bells that composes the anatomy of a school day and continually interrupts time as duration; all contribute to the cutting up of experience. Marshall McLuhan (1964) famously noted that the modern classroom was akin to a feudal dungeon and that it can no longer function as an isolated space, or without recognising the language of forms in the outside media environment (p.201). Perhaps it could be argued that his envisaged media education is the last throw of the dice for the survival of the educational establishment in the west; however, the relevance and expansion of the replacement programs that enhanced media education would enact cannot dispel the internal forces which are rupturing it from the inside. For example, the forecast PC liberal revolution in educational practice does nothing to dispel the moment of segmentation, which has already mutated desire into a cancerous torpor and an obstreperous debasement of authority despite the new technology as fresh learning tools. In addition, *anti-Oedipus*, which involves the questioning of familial reproduction through machinic assembly, does not give us solutions to the formation of schizophrenics, madmen and avatars through replacement, but in many ways, examines the acceleration in the process of their formation.

Jean Genet (1951/1971) who was locked in his prison cell, created a fantasy world of princes and kings. He saw in the foulness of dreaming and hell, gardens of saintliness, where he could worship the rims of petals, the mossy thorns and insect holes. William Burroughs (1959/1993), who has been similarly affected by the delirium of the modern world, and has created artificial and paranoid environments in which to act out his drives, sought bodily deformation as the only escape from nameless bureaux and demented scientists. In one such episode, *The All American De-anxieted Man*, is presented at the International Conference of Technological Psychiatry where the Lobotomy Kid sells his creation to the awaiting audience of esteemed guests. The man turns into a black centipede through viscid, transparent jelly and emitting a lung wrenching stench; he is a monster of decay and mutation setting the scene into chaos,
producing new and unheard of diseases as he goes. Elsewhere in the *Naked Lunch*, Burroughs restates the body in terms of an all-purpose blob, the organs are replaced by a hole, (it is the man who taught his arse-hole to talk), efficiency is augmented and undifferentiated tissue can grow into any type of flesh. The resulting society is cancerous and its power mechanisms are a vast bureaucracy, which variously set into motion schemes such as Program empty body - the replacement of humans with exact viral copies, the liquefaction program - the merging of everyone into One Man by the process of protoplasmic absorption, and the Divisionist programme - where tiny pieces of flesh are cut off and grown into exact replicas of themselves in embryo jelly, making one person with millions of separate bodies. Burroughs (1971) sees the working of society through the replacement programs as constituting a machine, whatever we feed into it, it will process, so feed in, “dismantle yourself” (p.123).

**Anti production at work**

The teachers are already dismantled. They are cyborgs plugged into stress software from central office. This office is continually redesigning goals and positing achievement and performance standards for classroom use; in addition it records educational objectives, initiates inspection and creates multipurpose educational values. It could be stated that these activities are part of the cybernetic functioning of an ideally co-ordinated meta-body or system in that they attempt to create the illusion of function despite the obvious dysfunction ‘on the ground’. I walk across the playground, a hunched senior teacher with a marked stare and dressed in a rough tweed suit comes up to me and offers some advice: “I’ll tell you something for free, to survive in this place you have to act like Attila the Hun”. He marches grumpily to his next lesson. He is a proccessional figure, a clown caught in a communal hallucination from a New Orleans Mardi Gras, forced into teaching quadratic equations, integration and the use of cosine. I begin to see the theatre of the situation. Antonin Artaud (1938/1958) used the idea of the *Theatre of Cruelty* to relay the workings of society in the wake of annihilation on the plane of social success. Arthur Rimbaud (1850s/1976) wrote about the mad twisted parade, which jostled noisily down the street as he lived it up in nineteenth century Paris. At a certain level, the dysfunctional daily reality of education could be understood as a sick joke. It is a game of hide-and-seek with the body sinking into ever-weirder formations to avoid the rigorous torture of knowledge and learning; this contest is enacted on a stage set of societal concern and educational funding. Yet the rules of this action serve only to replicate themselves, it is a battle that cannot be won or lost.

We find this absurd process expressed in *anti-Oedipus* in terms of the plane of immanence. Through this analysis, western society is characterised by two movements, one towards schizophrenia and the other capitalism. Both are organised and maintained by the state that is fulfilling its need to become-immanent and cause generalised decoding and the replacement of coding and over-coding with its own axiomatics (the replacement programs). At the base of this complex process is the sterility of anti-production, which is the fixed points in society that includes conventions, institutions and impulses that provide a framework for possible social relations, but are themselves unaffected by whatever happens according to these relations. Anti-production permeates the capitalist complex because of the universal history of debt as described by Nietzsche (1887/1956). It sits within the notion of the schizophrenic because of the oedipal analysis; which takes as given the psycho-analytic concept of repression and does not produce new figures to follow the fluctuations of schizophrenic desire in whatever direction they might be taken. In synthesis, *anti-Oedipus* attempts to conjoin capitalism with schizophrenia. The generalised coding of social activity by capital produces a plane of immanence or smooth space, where dysfunctional action is required to enable the development and exploitation of surplus value. The tedium of the working day with its breaks, interruptions and repetition, is rehearsed and played out through the schools of the west. This is the development of the schizophrenic necessity of capital, the foundation of capitalist political economy on the abstract subjective essence of wealth as theorised by Marx (1844). Through this system, production becomes an end in itself. It is a cosmopolitan, universal energy that overthrows every restriction and bond, yet encounters limits and barriers that are interior and immanent to it. These limits and barriers are reproduced on a larger scale involving police states, the vigilance of the citizens, perhaps even war. Capitalism doesn’t work without expansion, it creates schizophrenic flows of sign-signifiers that are checked and regulated by the despotism of paranoiac over-coding, which is continually attempting to designate some unity and characterises the nature of
the modern, liberal and democratic state.

Education may be examined from this perspective. On the one hand, the obsession with the markets, economic consideration and efficiency creates an environment of production, where the pupils are streamed and encouraged to excel to the limits of their ability, achieving qualifications, skills and the knowledge necessary to get into university. On the other hand the functioning of such a machine of mental production can only focus the ability of society as a whole to develop stringent and impossible criteria for the intellectual judgement of pupils. Deleuze and Guattari in *anti-Oedipus* do not prioritise one movement over the other but conceptualise the connection between the two. The temptation to perceive educational failure in terms of psychoanalytic concepts such as the Oedipus complex with its repressions and catharsis, or stable categories such as schizophrenia, psychosis or neurosis is in their terms the working of anti-production. Instead of looking at the flow of desire, which might possibly exceed, dissolve or reverse the regulatory expectations which have been determined for the pupil at that particular state of development; the irregular behaviour is pinpointed and characterised as being in need of attention by specialists. Resources, expertise and educational research are poured into the characterisation of the irregularity, which, once understood, has specific attention withdrawn from it and the pupils are reintroduced into mainstream education. Education oscillates in this economically determined environment, and suffers from the stagnation of anti-production, which permeates its whole body with resentment, antipathy and repetition.

A different teacher approaches as I saunter into the staff-room. He wears his white lab coat proudly, and speaks in an excruciatingly loud voice. This teacher tells me about the lack of academic success which the school has recently achieved. He says that very few pupils are reaching GCSE standard and describes the routine misbehaviour of fights, swearing and criminal activity. Teaching for him is a holding mechanism until the pupils are forced into taking jobs. They come to school because they are not allowed to just walk around on the streets, and in many ways it is safer for them to be inside the school system. “On the outside their behaviour would not be tolerated, outside they will be up against the law,” he says.

Yet the school is not a sanctuary where the law does not intervene. During that day the police are called because a gang has attacked a rival gang that have been using the school premises to sell drugs. It is clear from this instance that there is no narrowly defined ‘educational space’ where the parameters of restricted action according to the liberal dictums of fair play and the value of learning may work effectively. In addition, the threat of violence and incarceration has been internalised by the population to such an extent that the drama of its execution is enacted regularly; it gives a brief adrenaline rush and the liberation from monotony. The teacher was wrong to suggest that unruly behaviour will be treated differently on the outside. The memory of transgression is carried around by the school population at all times, and acts as a double bind in determination of cultural activity in the form of law breaking and the internalisation of the laws which are going to be broken. The only difference between the police and the teachers is that the teachers have not been handed the badge of authority and power that the police have come to wield on behalf of the state.

The school building is a run down piece of pre-fabricated design. The windows are too large, supposedly to enable clear observation of the interior of the classrooms from any angle. Yet the impression created is of rectangular goldfish bowls, irregularly fitting together at odd yet mathematically determined intersections. Small metal staircases wind up between the classes, creating multi-level environments where pupils may easily hide and congregate between lessons. Some of the buildings have already been abandoned, the others wait for dereliction and demolition as the only escape from the enforced torture of rampaging students. The school environment reinforces the resigned perception of the teachers and enhances the division between them and the pupils through its disassembled harmony. It functions to provide a suitable space for graffiti and provides a 3-dimensional, maze-like opportunity to escape and to be found. The school has become a social meeting place for the disaffected amid the ruins of organised society and anti production.

**Schizophrenic analysis**

Johnny Rotten in Marcus (1989) said, “I don’t work, I just speed, that’s all I need” (p.56). His characteristic slouch defied the encroachment of impending forces to neutralise the efficacy of
punk music in the early eighties. It could be argued that the rigorous body politics of education has failed to leave its mark on a transient generation of punk rockers who were tribalised and exhilarated around outlandish hairstyles, bondage clothing and amphetamine sulphate. The fusion of musical tribalism latterly translated and transmuted into electronic rave culture, which exploded towards the end of the eighties and through to the present day. Now, a hybrid mix of punk, reggae, hip-hop, techno, space-hop, various strands of rock, trance, drum & bass and jungle animates the youth in accelerated subterranean activity. It is becoming less plausible to isolate and define this cultural production as being the mark of alienation, or any direct suburban rebellion or reaction towards the tedium of capitalist endeavour. Modes of capitalist production and the subsequent musical diversity that caters for the emerging markets of the west are intrinsically interwoven. In an attempt to characterise this relationship, the social scientist, Michel Maffesoli (1988/1996) has spoken about the creation of an ‘electronic palaver’. These are groups of complex networks of association and affiliation that respond to impersonal forces and bubble and effervesce with a Dionysian multiplicity, which is unholy in the eyes of the Apollonian God. Maffesoli points to the study of ambience or Stimmung as being the only way to characterise this palaver, and as he terms it, “the twilight of organisational models and their ways of thinking in the world” (p.149).

The point for education that we may derive from Maffesoli is that the attempt to organise our systems from one defined point is futile. In other words, the age of grand design of educational excellence and ‘best practice’ that was supposed to be universally implemented without regard for the nature of the specific relationships that develop between pupil and teacher is in the process of coming to an end. Some teachers do genuinely relish the patriarchal discipline that they have to impose to get these abstract and universal schemes of learning pragmatically into place. Others seek more subtle strategies, making friends of the pupils or encouraging their popularity in the school community, which enhances the chance of getting the lessons across without serious disruption. Yet the clever manipulation of the emotions of the students or the rigid adherence to absolute control, does not address the fundamental malaise that is sweeping through western education. This is that the bulk of the exercises that are set for the pupils are irrelevant or demeaning and the genuinely useful activities are often swamped by reams of gap filling. The pupils in this system consequently become experts in excuses or pretending to be occupied, the teachers pass the time in the hope that there will not be another flare up during their lesson. Inspection by Government hit squads provides the school with the opportunity to congregate the least disruptive pupils in a classroom for rigorously prepared lessons and does nothing to tackle the real problems which are deep rooted, societal and profound.

To help us further to understand these processes, I would like to introduce the notion of schizo-analysis, which Deleuze and Guattari (1972/1984) formulated through the writing of anti-Oedipus. It involves the unconscious being invested in the social field. This realisation of desire comes about by the conjunction of flows, which is also the linking of intensities such as those that are produced in the first stages of familial reproduction. Psycho-analysis stops here, taking the infants familial intensities as the origination of the unconscious investment and augmenting the process of familial reproduction as the means to understanding (and controlling) the struggle for domination involving the adult drives in terms of the fight for possession of the ego. Deleuze and Guattari (1972/1984) extend the investment of the unconscious or molecular unconscious as they term it in order to render the unconscious able to represent the deterritorialisation of the full body of the earth; in other words schizo-analysis reinvests the unconscious as the body without organs and the workings of the global system of capital on the individual. It could be stated that schizo-analysis is functioning everywhere in the western educational system in terms of the production of desire. It escapes the familial oedipal mechanisms of repression by producing moments of universal history that are limit thoughts and are impossible to be familiarly reproduced under stable conditions such as in a school (for example many of the expressions that we find in Twilight of the Idols). These flows of production are exterior to the systems of capital, so they cannot be reterritorialised or overcoded by despotic state signifiers, and in so doing Deleuze and Guattari have formulated a methodology for educational research that cannot be reduced to governmental inquiries or social reports. The criteria for schizo-analysis are strictly immanent. They do not conform to models of representation or stable categories for examination. This is in recognition of the fundamental instability inherent within unconscious desire that is continually breaking and reforming bonds of filiation. In the later opus, A Thousand Plateaus, schizo-analysis is refigured in terms of rhizomatics. The rhizome characterises elements that ceaselessly vary and alter their relations with respect to
others. They are multiplicities that are indivisible or relatively indivisible, they cannot increase or diminish without their elements changing in nature, and they are aligned with intensive qualities and libidinal motion. They feature the unrecognisable, unconscious, intensive, they are constantly dismantling and constructing, communicating, crossing over; in other words they are continuous non-organisable multiplicities. The social relations produced according to rhizomatics are tactically subterranean, nomadic and difficult to pin down from the perspective of social stratification and the systems of sedentary capital integration that route tax money into western schools.

In corollary, one might ask if it is possible for the serious educationalist to utilise schizo-analysis or rhizomatics for the purposes of learning? This is perhaps not the correct question to ask. The point at stake is, in fact, the activity that we now call education. It is caught in an inflexible, hierarchical structure, which at its root serves to destroy the lives of the teachers and pupils, and produces a massive gulf between the pragmatics of the daily existence of schools and the idealistic and uniform rhetoric that is broadcast from central office. Schizo-analysis and rhizomatics cannot be hermetically sealed into curriculum structures of textbooks containing knowledge to be learnt, yet they might help to give some insight into what is going on by offering escape routes from the replacement programs and the accumulation of internal forces in western education.

**Escape routes**

I wander slowly in thought to my final two lessons of the school day. In the playground, I pass through groups of girls sporting the latest in club fashion, boys leaning against the pre-fabrication, hands in pockets and sharply aware. A frantic looking man with large eyes on stalks below a smooth bald head suddenly catches me up from behind. His eyebrows undulate like the rocking of a boat at sea, he wants to march ahead, though he slows to my pace as he also wishes to talk. He says that he will be giving his lessons in the room next to mine. I notice that he has a deep Irish accent, tinged with paranoia and regret. During the contact hour the pupils arrive intermittently, though with no real fuss. I do not impose the imbecilic task that has been set by the usual teacher, however, some pupils do get on with it, others sit and chat, others still talk to me, and the lesson passes calmly and uneventfully. Suddenly from the cavernous vaults from which screams originate, a bellowing can be heard from next-door. The glass portal opens, and the Irish teacher lurches in, demanding that I come to his room to see to his class. He points exaggeratedly at a small laughing girl and remonstrates that according to the 1988 Education Act, he has the right not to teach any pupil he wants, and that he does not want to teach her. I soon rejoin my class, and the lesson next door passes painfully with an organised banging of desks, the calling of senior teachers, and the expulsion of half the class. The next lesson is not much better, and I try to swiftly avoid anymore contact with this ruffled educationalist. However, he catches me on the stairs and orders me to tell the headmistress that he is keeping his class for half an hour after school for serious misbehaviour. Needless to say I got straight into my car and drove home, listening to techno music, wondering about schizo-analysis.

**Footnote on perspectivism**

As we leave this school located in the UK education system, we might reflect about how perspectival our reading of the situation may be. We may inwardly chuckle at the bad fortune of the teachers caught on a daily basis in this context as it has been described in this paper. Or we might think that we should galvanise our attempts to better this dysfunctional reality in some way. Yet neither of these reactions attends to the focus that *anti-Oedipus* lends our conceptual mapping of educational failure. Perspectivism in this context does not simply mean that there are many possible interpretations of this writing, and they are all somehow equally informative about the western educational system. It means that there is a focused, singular and unified reading of this world - and it is the most extraordinary one – and this should be carried forth and spread out to see what life-forms it will engender.
References

Artaud, A. (1958). *The Theatre and its double* (M.C. Richards, Trans.). New York: Grove Press. (Original work published 1938). ‘Never before, when it is life that is in question, has there been so much talk of civilization and culture. And there is a curious parallel between this generalized collapse of life at the root of our present demoralization and our concern for a culture which has never been coincident with life, which in fact has been devised to tyrannize life. Before speaking further about culture, I must remark that the world is hungry and not concerned with culture, and that the attempt to orient toward culture thoughts turned only toward hunger is a purely artificial expedient. What is more important, it seems to me, is not so much to defend a culture whose existence has never kept a man from going hungry, as to extract, from what is called culture, ideas whose compelling force is identical with that of hunger. We need to live first of all: to believe in what makes us live and that something makes us live – to believe that whatever is produced from the mysterious depths of ourselves need not forever haunt us as an exclusively digestive concern. I mean that if it is important for us to eat first of all, it is even more important for us for us not to waste in the sole concern for eating our simple power of being hungry. If confusion is the sign of the times, I see at the root of this confusion a rupture between things and words, between things and ideas and signs that are their representation’.


Nietzsche, F. (1956). *The Genealogy of Morals* (F. Golffing, Trans.). New York: Doubleday Anchor Books. (Original work published 1887). ‘Guilt,’ in its present incarnation, is associated with accountability and responsibility: you are guilty because you could have and should have done otherwise. Accountability and responsibility, which are connected with the concept of free will, are in no way connected with ‘guilt’ as it was originally conceived. ‘Guilt,’ according to Nietzsche, originally meant simply that a debt needed to be paid. As Nietzsche remarks in section 13 of the first essay in the genealogy, ‘free will’ is a recent invention that accompanies slave morality.


Learning by example: School Exclusion and Life-Enacted Learning

T.D. Corcoran
Charles Sturt University

Abstract
From the discourse of life-long learning comes the proposal that any interaction has the potential to become a learning experience. Further, that the relationships established and enacted via such exchanges are paramount to learning and psychosocial development. With this in mind the question begs: what is it that governments expect students and their school communities to learn from instances of State sanctioned exclusion? In this paper the discursive context is set with an analysis of Queensland’s Education (General Provisions) Act 1989 and discussion of the legislative power authorised to principals to enforce school exclusion. From this examination it will be tendered that legislative practice is incongruent with several policy initiatives currently directing State and federal educational practice in Australia. The cost of this conflict is examined in the second part of the paper when interview narratives, sourced from students who have experienced formal school exclusion, will be presented. It is argued that language use does contribute to the ongoing and situated construction of student’s identities and thus has the potential to engage or estrange a variety of learning-based relationships. In this sense the principle of temporality inferred in the concept of life-long learning can be conjoined with the contextual importance of life-enacted learning encouraged through relational engagement. To enable such a transformation it is necessary to re-vision the principles informing the conduct of every day relationships. The concept of relational responsibility is advanced as a promising supplement to individually-based discourses which dominate and debilitate contemporary communicative activity. Activity in and through which the practice of education takes place.

Introduction
Just over two years ago the Federal government Department of Education, Science and Training (DEST), through the Curriculum Corporation, published their study regarding Values Education in Australia (Curriculum Corporation, 2003). One of the central aims of the work was to make recommendations on a set of Principles and a Framework for improving values education in schools across the country. From a review of the literature and an engagement with case study schools the qualitative investigation produced a set of ten values said to have emerged from the research. One of these was responsibility. Etymologically, the word comes from the Latin respondere meaning ‘to respond’ and the importance of the word’s origin will become apparent momentarily. A more immediate issue however is the question of whether we can in fact teach responsibility to our students. And if so how this should be done? It should be noted that these questions are presupposed by an assumption that we are (or at least potentially could be) in agreement as to what responsibility is and how this may be communicated to the person known as the student/learner. Also, that this kind of focus retains an individualistic and unidirectional outlook and is reminiscent of Freire’s (1970) criticisms of a deposit-banking model of education. To approach the question another way we could ask about the relational responsibilities of participants in communicative activity. Such redirection does two things: first, it engages both participants, teacher and student, in a reciprocal communicative process and second, the concept refrains from positioning either participant as the one who should be doing the learning. In looking at the action as an inclusive and responsive exchange knowledge is understood as a co-
production developed through the participants' responsibilities to each other in the process of education. And therein lies the basis of my argument. If we are able to engage others around the concept of responsibility via curriculum, our pedagogies will be ultimately held to account as well. From these accounts we must acknowledge that we too are life-long learners and in reciprocal processes of communicative activity educators promote life-enacted learning. Thus, as fully responsible participants educators are formally engaged to not only teach but to enact or show what is meant by the lesson. As Wittgenstein (1969, no. 204) suggested, “Giving grounds, however, justifying the evidence, comes to an end; - but the end is not certain propositions striking us immediately as true, i.e. it is not a kind of seeing on our part; it is our acting, which lies at the bottom of the language-game” (emphasis in original).

The issue of responsible action is called front and centre when accounting for practices of school suspension and exclusion. Often this account focuses on the student and what s/he has done to warrant State-sanctioned removal from their school. In this paper I will go on to engage excerpts from interviews sourced from students who have experienced formal school exclusion but first I would like to consider the legislation that permits such action. As critical discourse analysts we are moved to engage socio-political practice at varying levels of interest. So not only will the reported experiences of students excluded from school be of importance here but I am also keen to consider how school principals are directed via the legislation to carry out such practice. Elsewhere (Corcoran, 2003) I have called this process the principal's gamble for in Queensland it is the principal of the educational institution who is authorised to decide when the student should no longer be a part of the school community. The decision to exclude or retain a student is a gamble because it affects future relationships which, always being co-produced, can never be guaranteed their outcomes. Thus the issue of behaviour, school staff's especially, directly contributes to the hidden curriculum. What we know to be responsibility is more than a set of rules, it is just as much about how we practice understanding, respect and trust (three more values highlighted in the Australian study) through pedagogy and disciplinary practice in school communities. Yet what we can be confident of is the way in which we enact our responsibilities to relationships and in the conclusion of this paper I explore further the concept of relational responsibility (McNamee & Gergen, 1999). This concept offers those involved in communicative activity, none more important than education, alternate options to a practice currently dominated by a pervasive discourse of individualism.

The Principal’s gamble

Legislation guiding schooling in Queensland was formally introduced in 1860 with the introduction of the Education Act. The Act primarily conveyed authority through the Board of General Education to establish and administer primary schools in the State. In 1875 the State Education Act superceded its predecessor and amongst its administrative tasks the Act decreed compulsory education for children aged between 6 and 12 years, directed that State education be secular, that education was to be free and the Department of Public Instruction be established to administer the Act. It was some time before the passage of the next State Education Act in 1964. This version of the legislation now formally included secondary schools under the authority and administration of the Act and raised the compulsory attendance age to 15. Another 25 years passed before the current legislation, the Education (General Provisions) Act was introduced in 1989 (hereafter EA). It is from the current legislation that the following discourse analysis is sourced. Of particular interest here is the section of the Act imbuing authority to school administrators regarding student suspension and exclusion – Part IV: The Good Order and Management of State Educational Institutions.

Reference to student age has remained a consistent feature in Queensland legislation. Dominant discourses of human development, universally applied in Western societies and very much tied to chronological constructions, tell us that with age comes maturity and responsibility and consequently certain practices have to be put into place to assist children to learn values. But to mitigate opportunities for choice on the basis of age, i.e. that a student’s potential for acting responsibly is directly correlated to their age, surely
disempowers the relationship and limits potential learning for those involved. An example and comparable form of developmentalist discourse appears in Part 4 of the Act. In discussing the elements of a school’s behaviour management plan, it is suggested that a principal should “encourage all students attending the institution to take increasing responsibility for their own behaviour and the consequences of their actions” (EA, p. 24). Perhaps what this means is that, over time of enrolment and with no relevance to age, the student should be encouraged to take increased responsibility. I doubt it. The chance that a principal would allow a Year 12 student (approximately 17 years old in Queensland and for argument’s sake let’s say they are new to the school) several months to develop a sense of responsibility seems highly improbable. What I am suggesting is that the increase in responsibility referred to in the legislation implicitly follows a developmental/ageist discourse. That is, it is with age as the determining factor that an individual develops responsibility and conversely, the younger the individual the less they are able to assume responsibility for their actions. The ramifications of this discourse concern me greatly but perhaps I should recontextualise my argument. My concern here is with students who are subjected to school exclusion and how they are represented and dealt with in this piece of legislation. What I find difficult to understand is how a student is presumed to lack responsibility because of their age and presumed stage of development but (as is played out in schools each day) then still able to bear the responsibility of their actions if and when the time comes for behavioural discipline to be dispensed. It would seem that within this example dealing retributive discourses trump any discourse of development regardless of how this is constructed.

I will offer another instance which succinctly encapsulates the direction of the text. According to the Act there are two definite categories of student according to age. There are students who fall under the category of compulsory attendees (CAs) and the binary, non-compulsory attendees (NCAs). These groups are differentiated on the basis of age: CAs fall between 6 years and 15 years of age and NCAs are students over the age of 15 years. The splitting of the two groups becomes particularly interesting when it comes to describing the act of exclusion in the text. For CAs, the text lays out “grounds for exclusion” (EA, p. 26) but in relation to NCAs, it reads as “grounds for cancelling enrolment of student more than the age of compulsory attendance” (EA, p. 30). The question should be asked: how it is that there is need to differentiate between the two groups in relation to the description of the action? An answer might be found in section 39(b) of the Act. In discussing the grounds for cancellation of enrolment involving NCAs, one such example may be when “the student’s behaviour amounts to refusal to participate in the program of instruction provided at the institution” (EA, p. 30). The suggestion here is that the student’s refusal to participate is a telltale sign of their motivational state. Couple this product of inference with the developmental discourse discussed a moment ago and the student has themselves taken responsibility, through their actions, for the cancellation of their enrolment – something that students of compulsory attendance age can not seemingly do. For those students, exclusion is a byproduct of irresponsible and presumably unintentional behaviour. What possible consequences could there be in removing choice in the form of an ability to act responsibly from student-teacher/principal relationships? Why not ask the students?

Voices from a distance

The first interview excerpt comes from Adam. He was 13 years old at the time of this interview and had been excluded from his previous school for truancy and disrespectful behaviours such as swearing at staff. This excerpt is of interest here for two reasons. First, a question presents regarding Adam’s understanding of the relationship taking place and second, that this knowledge then has a determining influence on subsequent choices and behaviours.

TC: Right. So that (.4) okay just ah going back to that um being excluded from (.6) from Kinwar did they um (.5) did you think it was fair that they did that?

Adam: Yes.
TC: How come?

Adam: Because um they didn’t know what else to- I’d been in um Access program (1.7) which is that=

TC: =yep y[ep.] [Behaviour Management Support]


TC: Yep.

Adam: You know about the people there?

TC: Yeah I [do.] Yep.

Adam: [Mary] Yeah (.8) with them yeah.

TC: Yep. So: (1.6) you’d what say that it was fair that they (x) they excluded you because.

Adam: They had nothing else to do with you.

TC: Right.

Adam: They helped me too much and I didn’t take it so.

TC: Right. (3.1) So- (1.7) what could you say that you’ve learnt from exclusion? Is there anything you have learnt from it?

Adam: Not to get excluded again.

TC: Right. Well you were just saying about the help (2.3) would you say that um=

Adam: =I’ll take help next time.

TC: Oh really? Wha- what do you think stopped you from taking it last time?

Adam: It’s just (.4) wanting my friends really. I wanted to stay with my friends.

When responsible action, however described, is situated contextually it acquires personal, relational and systemic significance. For example, when questioned whether he considered his exclusion to be fair Adam suggests it was. His answer intimates that he has some form of understanding regarding the appropriateness or otherwise of his behaviour and its impact on the school. But there is an interesting discursive conveyance taking place as an ‘us and them’ relational frame is developed in the course of his reported experience. Adam proposes that it was fair for the school to exclude because they had reached a point, as far as he could see, where the school’s options to respond to him had been exhausted. It does not seem from Adam’s response that what was taking place at the school had the potential to be considered outside of this binary separation. Not only does his response sound familiar with regards prevalent individualistic discourse, wherein practices of blame are at their most damaging when divisive, it also suggests a process of disempowerment in relation to Adam’s ability to develop a suitable response to the prevailing concerns. His use of the adverb ‘too’ is telling in this instance. For Adam to say that the school and its staff had ‘helped me too much’ infers that Adam experienced a degree of imbalance in the relationship. Recall, Adam was 13 years old at the time of his exclusion and according to the legislation a compulsory attendee. From his account it would seem that collaborative options had not been relationally developed nor realised prior to his exclusion from school. Where were the opportunities for Adam’s voice to be heard?

To answer this question more needs to be said regarding my contention that Adam was acting responsibly in the action as reported. When asked what may have stopped him from taking the school staff’s assistance Adam says that he wanted to remain with his friends. A separatist discourse presents once again for in choosing to stay connected to his peers he seemingly can not remain connected to the institution. But his choice, if marked as irresponsible, would privilege the adult’s version of responsibility in the situation. As an act of resistance or an act of empowerment Adam’s choice may in fact be the only responsible one he felt he could make at the time. Also, there is little doubt
that having to make this choice will ultimately impact on how Adam sees himself and on the social construction of his identity. A similar point is made by Michael Ungar (2004) in his view of how troubled adolescents draw upon personal resilience. He says:

We seek in our children, both boys and girls, a fanatical desire for them to be conventional without attention to their (and our own) discourses of resistance. Efficacy in social relations that give voice to this resistance is closely linked to experiences of competence, whether that competence is expressed prosocially or problematically (p. 139-40).

In offering an alternate understanding of the discursive action taking place it is necessary and frankly respectful to consider Adam's pronouncement as a significant personal movement in his relationship with the school administration.

Gary, our second example, is an NCA (non-compulsory attendee). In this segment he talks about the action he took in relation to smoking at his new school. To preface this excerpt it should be noted that it is illegal for staff or students to smoke at an Education Queensland facility. As a 17 year old student Gary had been excluded from his previous school for possession of alcohol and tobacco on school property and a history of relational difficulties with school staff.

TC: So wha- then they’re more accepting? More flexible [here?]  
Gary: [Yeah.]  
TC: Right.  
Gary: And that’s what’s accepting people in what you do around the class also.  
TC: In what you do around the class?  
Gary: Yeah. Well (.4) I’ll have a cigarette at the back gate and most teachers come out.  
TC: Right.  
Gary: And tell us to move along and that. If you don’t move on they say ‘I’ll sit down’ and have a chat with youse and then when their- (.3) that duty’s finished they just walk away and let us keep sitting there and that’s it. Yeah.  
TC: You smoke in front of them?  
Gary: Nup.  
TC: Nup?  
Gary: Don’t want to do that.  
TC: Right. (1.1)  
Gary: ‘Cause they do I’ll try not to do anything. I realise they will. They will suspend me. Oh well (.5) expel me here because I have no warnings. I’ve come in on no warnings so if I get (.3) if I swear at a teacher or (.5) miss a day of school without an explanation or (.4) that’s it. I’m out.  
TC: So (.4) bu- when you were enrolled they told you that you were enrolling with no warnings?  
Gary: Uuhuh. (2.3) Yeah [well-]  
TC: [What] did you think about that?  
Gary: I went to school for that long not to be (.3) I don’t know (.3) confused or try not to not bother.  
TC: You cou- (.3) that was acceptable to you?  
Gary: Yeah. I figured well it was. At least they’re trying (.6) to be a certain person on my side.
The discourse to highlight from this section of the interview is that of zero tolerance and how this plays out in Gary's relational understanding. It is not surprising that this discourse is evidenced in Gary's response given the way NCAs figure in the section of the Act previously discussed. From Gary's narrative he tells us that he is purposively making the choice of where and when to smoke whilst he is at school. The issue for discussion is not whether Gary smokes on school property as he suggests that he is at least on the boundary of the school when he chooses to light up. Neither is it his age for Gary had reported earlier in the interview that he lives independently and as such can decide for himself whether or not he should smoke. The concern I believe is whether Gary's actions would be acknowledged as responsible under a zero tolerance policy. Even if the school, acting with best intentions, used the zero tolerance discourse to instill the fear of potential exclusion with Gary, such action would be highly controversial and necessitate immediate attention regarding its appropriateness as a means for relational engagement. But an ironic and even more alarming discursive turn is yet to be taken. It comes from Gary's contention that in their use of the zero tolerance policy the school and its staff are evidentially showing that they care. To support this point he says that he sees them as 'trying' and he considers the staff to be 'on my side'. As a society we must be able to show or enact responsible action in some other way than to brutally intimidate another, and then if that fails, exclude them from the social order. If this is what teaching values in education is about we desperately need to revise the lesson plan.

**Conclusion**

Continued development, in our opinion, demands a rejection of knowing as the sole or dominant form of understanding. Activity must replace reality, even as performing replaces knowing in the practice and understanding of human life (Newman & Holzman, 1997, p. 61).

I have argued that education is an activity in which knowledge is performed. In adopting a relational frame we can engage an understanding of knowledge as enacted discursively through the use of particular language games and as it is embodied via the interpersonal practice of teaching. Both ways of conceptualising educative endeavour promote relational responsibility wherein two or more parties engage and in dialogic reciprocity transformative action takes place. McNamee and Gergen (1999) suggest that transformation of this kind occurs firstly, through changing the parties understanding of the act in question and secondly, through altering the relations for those involved. Application of these ideas are consistent with the values agenda currently in favour in Australian schools. Teaching responsibility, the example I have concentrated on, requires an explicit reworking of the practice engaging the lesson. This needs to be supported and promoted from within a range of situated actions, school legislation and the practice of exclusion being but one. We can change the way we understand a practice through changing the way we position and construct the relationships involved but this, as straightforward as it sounds, requires a vital corresponding shift. Individualised discourses essentially support hierarchical relationships wherein collaborative engagement is dominated by authoritarian practice. Such discourse also promotes blame, the absence of tolerance and does not invite individuals, as valued participants, to perform responsibility in learning based relationships. The practice of education is a communicative activity carried out in the responsive engagement of participants showing value to one another. Surely that is what is meant by learning by example.

**References**


Curriculum Corporation. (2003). *The values education study*. Canberra:
Commonwealth of Australia.


### Appendix 1 Transcription symbols

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOL</th>
<th>EXAMPLE</th>
<th>EXPLANATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| [ ]    | Quite a [ while]  
         | [ yeah ]  | Brackets mark the onset and completion of overlapping talk |
| =      | what I said=        
         | =But you didn’t   | Where one turn runs into another with no interval |
| (.4)   | yes (.2) yeah      | Elapsed time between speaker turns or duration of pause within a speaker’s turn |
| ::::   | O:Kay?             | Mark the prolongation of the sound immediately before; more colons show a longer prolongation |
| .hhh   | I feel that (.3) .hhh | A row of h’s prefixed by a dot indicates an inbreath; without a dot an outbreath. The length of the row of h’s indicates the length of the breath |
| (      | future risks and (  
         | and life       | Something was heard but unable to hear what it was |
| (word) | you could be (there) and here | Possible hearing |
| ((    | confirm that ((stands up)) | Clarificatory comment or description which is not a transcribed utterance |
What do you think?

A period represents falling intonation, a question mark represents rising intonation, and a comma represents a falling-rising intonation.

-represents a cutting off short of the immediately prior syllable.

^Indicates a marked pitch rise.

(x)Indicates a stutter on the part of the speaker.

°Talk that is quieter than the surrounding talk.
All the way with CDA: Using Critical Discourse Analysis to investigate the complexities of the classroom site

Leanne Dalley-Trim
James Cook University

Abstract
This paper explores critical discourse theories, in particular Fairclough’s three-dimensional model of discourse analysis, and highlights their role as an invaluable analytic tool within the field of educational research. It also signals the comparable view of language, discourse and subjectivity – as shared by many critical discourse theories and poststructuralism(s) – and suggests that these theoretical frameworks and associated analytical tools are in this way complementary. More specifically, the paper identifies the ways in which critical discourse theories provide an avenue for examining and unravelling the complex and multifarious site that is the classroom. Following discussion of the theoretical and analytical underpinnings and merits of critical discourse theories, the paper focuses upon the effective use of critical discourse theories in one classroom-based research project.

In line with the premise upon which the classroom-based study is founded, the paper advocates that classrooms are discursively constituted sites and that discourses, often competing and at times contradictory discourses, operate as organisers of social interactions within these sites. It also contends that classrooms, given that they are discursively constituted, are inextricably sites in which relations of power are produced and circulated, and in which individuals are positioned and/or take up particular subject positions. Further, the paper proposes that ‘the lesson’ – as constructed and as takes shape within the context of the classroom – is to be conceived of, and to thus be read, as a ‘text.’

Focusing upon the application of critical discourse analysis in the classroom-based study, this paper addresses a number of specific areas. It indicates how critical discourse analysis served as a tool that enabled the researcher to examine the discursive knowledges and practices employed by teachers and students within the classroom site. It also signals how critical discourse analysis enabled the researcher to read and account for the impact of the discourses operating within the classroom site upon what came to constitute the lesson and the classroom context. Further, it allowed for exploration of the power relations that were played out within the classroom and the subject positions made available to and taken up by those in the classroom.

Introduction
In light of the forum in which this paper is to be presented, and the limited space in which to engage in extensive discussion, it makes an assumption about the prior knowledge of the audience – more specifically, their knowledge of critical discourse theories and associated methods of analysis. The paper begins by providing a brief overview of Fairclough’s three-dimensional model of discourse analysis as used in the classroom-based study discussed here. It then goes on to discuss the study in question and to examine the ways in which critical discourse theories were used to inform the study and the analysis undertaken. Finally, and with a more acute focus, the paper discusses the use of critical discourse theories as a tool for analysis in the context of one classroom – one teacher, one class and two lessons.

Fairclough’s Three-Dimensional Model of Discourse Analysis
Fairclough advocates that discursive practice functions in a three-fold manner. Firstly, it “contributes to reproducing society (social identities, social relationships, systems of knowledge and belief)” (Fairclough, 1992, p. 65). Secondly, while reproducing society in this
way, discursive practice also “contributes to transforming society” (Fairclough, 1992, p. 65). Finally, it also varies in accordance to the social contexts within which it is mobilised.

Conceptualising discourse in this way, Fairclough propounds a three-dimensional model of discourse analysis (see Figure 1 overleaf). The model focuses upon the complex and interconnected relationship between three dimensions: texts, discursive practices and social practices.

*Figure 1: Fairclough’s (1992, p. 73) three-dimensional conception of discourse*
Of the first dimension, Fairclough (1992) suggests that in talking about texts, one invariably refers to the process of production and/or interpretation. Constituted by past discursive practices in the form of conventions, texts are endowed with a heterogeneous, multiple, diverse, and at times contradictory, meaning potential (Fairclough, 1992). As such, they are open to multiple interpretations.

The second dimension, discursive practice, involves the processes of text production, distribution and consumption (Fairclough, 1992). These processes and thus discursive practice vary according to social factors. As Fairclough (1992) suggests, texts are both “produced in specific ways in specific social contexts” (p. 78) and “consumed differently in different social contexts” (p. 79). Additionally, the processes of production and interpretation are socially constrained in two ways: “by the available members’ resources” and “by the specific nature of the social practice of which they are parts” (Fairclough, 1992, p. 80).

The third dimension, social practice, is concerned with the relationship of discourse to ideology and power. Here, discourse is placed “within a view of power as hegemony, and a view of the evolution of power relations as hegemonic struggle” (Fairclough, 1992, p. 86). Discursive practices are recognised as ideologically invested (although not all discourses are ideologically invested to the same degree), and as contributing to both the sustainment and restructuring of power relations. Acknowledged here, too, is the potential for change, hegemonic struggle, and the shifting and agentive constitution of subjectivities.

Fairclough's three-dimensional conception of discourse and the resultant model serve as powerful analytic tools. They allow one, “to combine social relevance and textual specificity in doing discourse analysis, and to come to grips with change” (Fairclough, 1992, p. 100). Furthermore, as Janks (1997, p. 329) suggests, a major strength of this model lies in its provision of “multiple points of analytic entry.” Highlighting that analysis is not always tidily linear – as evidenced in my own work – Janks (1997, p. 330) suggests that Fairclough’s model, with its embedding of the three boxes (dimensions), “emphasises the interdependence of these dimensions and the intricate moving backwards and forwards between the different types of analysis.” Finally, in terms of the particular study discussed here, the model enabled me to move between the three dimensions, and to address and account for the complex and inextricably interconnected relationship that exists between texts – or the lessons produced – and the discursively constituted social contexts – classrooms – within which they are produced.

Using critical discourse theories as an analytic tool: one study

The study discussed here was conducted in a State secondary school (referred to here as Lane Park) in a provisional North Queensland city and the research conducted within four Year nine English classrooms. During the course of the study, constructed within a qualitative research paradigm, I engaged in observations of the research site; conducted interviews with teachers and students; administered questionnaires to teachers and students; and reviewed documents – specifically the State-endorsed English syllabus and the School Junior English Work Program. And while qualitative research, and the study undertaken, draws upon a rich variety of theoretical frameworks, traditions of inquiry, and methodological practices, it is upon the use of critical discourse theories as a tool to analyse the sets of discursive knowledges and practices apparent in the range of emergent data in this study that this paper focuses.

However, before proceeding to address the issue in focus, I would like to acknowledge that a comparable view of language, discourse and subjectivity is shared by many critical discourse theories and poststructuralism(s). As such, it is advocated here that these theoretical frameworks and associated analytical tools are, in this way, complementary, and provide a strong position from which to research when used in conjunction with each other – as was the case in the research project discussed here. Like critical discourse theories, poststructuralist theories challenge the view of discourse as “natural,” acknowledge the power relations inherent in discourses, and assist in the unravelling of discursive power networks; account for and address the subtleties and complexities of language, and challenge the view that language is natural and neutral; account for the impact of human agency, the dynamics of contradiction, the possibility of change; and address and challenge the nature of oppression.
The Study: Teachers

Critical discourse theories were used to analyse the types of discursive knowledges and practices employed by teachers in discussing, writing about and practising Subject English. Specifically, I tapped into their use of the discourses commonly associated with the subject and its practice – the “models” of English teaching. That is, I identified their reference to, and engagement with, a skills-centred approach to English, the cultural heritage approach to English, the personal growth model, the genre model and/or the cultural studies model. Additionally, I explored their reference to, and use of, particular pedagogical paradigms – for example, their taking up of student-centred and/or teacher-driven discourses. In relation to the previous point, I also examined the types of subject positions they made – and / or desired to make – available to students within the classroom; the power relations inherent in, and resulting from, such positioning; and what came to “be” the context of the classroom. What came to “count” as the lessons or texts of English, as constituted by and within discursive networks of knowledge about, and practices of, the subject – as employed by the teachers – were also examined.

The Study: Students

Critical discourse theories were again used to analyse the types of discursive knowledges and practices employed by students in discussing and writing about Subject English and the “doing” of English; about their teacher and her/his practices; and in identifying the ways in which they constructed themselves, and others, as students within the classroom. Specifically, I identified the ways in which they made reference to “models” of English and English teaching as practised by their teacher. I also examined the ways in which they used specific discursive knowledges and their associated practices to construct themselves as students – more specifically, as “good student” (Connell, Ashenden, Kessler & Dowsett, 1982, p. 82) subjects or as those who disrupted this particular subject position. Additionally, critical discourse theories were used to analyse the power relationships between students, and between students and their respective teacher. These theories were also used to identify the ways in which students – through their employment of particular discursive knowledges and practices – became either complicit in, or disruptive to, the teacher’s endeavour to construct the texts or lessons of English and “workable” or educationally “appropriate” classroom contexts.

The Study: Social Artefacts

As a precursor to undertaking fieldwork, critical discourse theories were utilised as a tool to examine the discursive constitution of the documents that inform Subject English. Specifically, they were used to examine the discourses pertaining to Subject English, and the teaching of it, as endorsed by the State and as evident in the syllabus produced by the Department of Education, Queensland. Further to this, they were used to examine the school English work program, and to identify the ways in which English – as a discursively constituted subject – had been constructed for practice within the context of Lane Park School.

One Teacher, One Class, Two Lessons: an Exemplar

This paper will now narrow its focus to the example of one teacher, one class and two lessons as a means of illustrating the application of critical discourse theories as employed in this study. The teacher of this class, 9-3, is referred to here as Mr Jack, and the lessons under discussion are provided in the Appendices – see Appendix I and II.

The Teacher: Mr Jack

Interview and questionnaire data revealed that Mr Jack’s desired practices were mostly aligned to those associated with student-focused discourses, with the dominant discourses of the individual and the personal as popularised through personal growth pedagogy. While drawing primarily upon personal growth discourses, he espoused a plan to draw eclectically upon a range of discursive knowledges and practices – or “models” of English education. He also outlined his desire to remove himself from the position of teacher as authority figure. In essence, he desired to embrace a personalised, egalitarian and student-centred approach.
While desiring to practice English in this way, Mr Jack was unable, for the most part, to do as he had planned and desired – as evident in the exemplar provided (see Appendix I). Rather, he constantly battled – given the students’ performances and the context they served to construct – to maintain his desired position, and adopted teacher-focused and authoritative practices reluctantly. Essentially, it became difficult for him to engage in the personalist, student-centred practices he desired, or to maintain a non-authoritative position.

The Class; the Students

This class, and the interactions within it, came to be dominated by a group of three boys – Daniel, Matthew and Jerry – who took up the position of “bad lads.” This group of boys gained positions of dominance through their taking up and playing out of sexualised discourses, and their disruption of the “good student” (Connell et al, 1982, p. 82) subject position. Drawing primarily upon the discourses of sexuality and of gender, the three boys were able to disrupt, and to position themselves as other to, the “good student” subject.

The boys’ performances illuminated the potency of these disruptive and sexualised discursive knowledges and practices. As evident in the exemplar provided (see Appendix II), their discursively constituted performances served to challenge the teacher’s authority, disrupt his desired performance mode and practices, and thwarted the planned work of English. Their engagement with these sexualised and disruptive discourses served to undo the conventions of the lesson genre and affect what came to be English. Also evident in the exemplar is the ways in which the boys drew upon discourses of gender and sexuality – more specifically those of heterosexual/hegemonic masculinity – and constructed themselves as masculine subjects, and how their performances served to regulate, subjugate and marginalise the other students in the class.

The Lessons; the Classroom Context

A key and disturbing feature to emerge in the lessons provided here – as in most lessons throughout the semester – was the absence of the “work” of English. English, in this classroom, was constructed and dominated by the practices of classroom management. Work within this site became peripheral and obscured – often getting lost in the play of the classroom milieu. The performances of the students, and in particular the positions and discursive practices taken up and played out by the dominant boys, served to disrupt and at times thwart the conventions of the lesson genre. Mr Jack’s performance was marked by his efforts to address student (mis)behaviour, to maintain control of the class, and to manage the site; rather than the instigation of work-focused English practices. (See Appendices I and II)

Within this context – one co-constructed by the students – Mr Jack was unable to perform as he desired, or to construct the texts or lessons of English as he had planned. While he persisted with his endeavours to engage in practices associated with student-focused discourses, his efforts were essentially subverted by the operant contextual dynamics. Within this classroom context, these practices proved unproductive and served to open up the space of the classroom to “play” – a space seized upon by the dominant boys, and used, by them, to play out disruptive and sexualised performances. These discursively constituted performances proved pervasive, and had a significant impact upon the classroom context and the social relations operating within it. Furthermore, Mr Jack was unable to contain the performances of these boys and, subsequently, the lesson, as an identifiable genre, was often disrupted and rendered unrecognisable.

Essentially, while the majority of students in 9-3 took up the “good student” (Connell et al, 1982, p. 82) subject position, and employed discursive knowledges and practices deemed appropriate to the classroom context, the dominant and disruptive boys failed to do so. As a result, the performances of these boys served to challenge, and often times thwart, the lesson genre and the planned work of English. The potent and subversive constitution of the gendered and sexualised discourses taken up and played out by these boys also served to challenge the teacher’s desired performance mode and to subjugate, marginalise, and police the other students in the class. Finally, the inter-connected and discursively-constituted performances of the dominant boys and Mr Jack, failed to construct a context that was not recognisable as a productive or appropriate “classroom.”
Conclusion

With regard to the study examined here, critical discourse theories provided the tools I required in order to investigate the complex and ideological constitution of discourse. They enabled me to examine the discursive knowledges and practices evident in educational documents, employed by the teachers and the students within the classroom site, and those that emerged in the teacher and student interview transcripts and questionnaires. In doing so, these theories illuminated the ways in which discursive practice serves to inform subjectivity – making access to particular subject positions possible, while rendering others inaccessible. They also made it possible to account for the impact of human agency, the dynamics of contradiction, and the possibility of change, and the role played by discourse in sustaining unequal power relations. Additionally, they made it possible to conduct sophisticated readings of texts; to explore the multiplicity, heterogeneity and diversity within texts; and to examine how discourses serve to inform and/or constrain textual production and interpretation. Given this, I was able to discern the ways in which the texts or lessons – of English – were produced, and contextualise the texts produced in the classroom within the broader context of the school and wider society, and the documents or social artefacts that inform their production. Furthermore, positioned by and within this critical framework, I could observe how discourse affects the constitution of social contexts, in this instance, the classroom.

Finally, the study under discussion here identified, unravelled, and examined the inextricably interconnected relationship that exists between the texts or lessons of English and the classroom contexts in which they are produced. It illuminated the discursive complexity of this relationship, and demonstrated that the variables that constitute this relationship do not operate in isolation, but rather, as a dynamic network in which these variables intersect, interplay, and affect each other. While the study detailed here focused upon Subject English, the use of critical discourse theories as a research tool offers potentially powerful future possibilities – for example, the analysis of other school subjects and the dynamics operant within a range of educational settings.

References


Appendix I: A Typical Lesson - Exemplar A

The lesson detailed here was the thirty-seventh English lesson of the semester and was conducted during the course of a Radio unit.

The lesson illustrates the ways in which Mr Jack sought to take up a more authoritative position at this time in order to (re)establish control. It also highlights the ways in which the students read, and challenged, his efforts. It shows the continual play of gaining, losing, and regaining control throughout the lesson, and demonstrates Mr Jack’s movement within and across teacher-focused and student-focused discursive networks. At times, he could operate within student-focused discourses, and perform as a flexible and egalitarian subject. As other times, however, he was forced to move more deliberately towards teacher-focused discourses and perform as an authoritative, rigid and controlling teacher subject. The exemplar also highlights Mr Jack’s discomfort when forced to operate within the less desirable authoritative position. Finally, it highlights the lack of “work” occurring in this classroom context and the predominance of classroom management issues.

Mr Jack waited at the door of the classroom for late students to arrive, and discussed their reasons for being late.

He then announced: “Right … right everyone paying attention please.”

He then asserted his authority – moving Jana and Jane, instructing Daniel to remove his hat, and asking Leon to move outside. He joined Leon outside and discussed the reasons why Leon did not have the necessary books.

The class was to join another class. Mr Jack instructed the class that it would not be joining the other class “until [they] can behave.”

He then outlined the task students were required to complete by next week.

….. ….. ….. ….. …..

Mr Jack sent Kyle outside for not listening. As Kyle left the room, Matthew taunted him: “You’re a faggot … I’ll hit you … he’s got no friends.”

Mr Jack then moved outside to talk to Kyle about his behaviour on a one-to-one basis.

Upon returning to the classroom, Mr Jack again sought to take up a position of control: “Quieten up please, mouths shut.”

Daniel, who continues to talk, is asked to leave the classroom.

Mr Jack then had Kyle re-enter the classroom and apologise to the class for his behaviour.

Matthew called out: “Kyle, you jock strap,” to which Kyle responded: “Shut up.”

Matthew continued: “You gonna make me … you’re an idiot.”

During Kyle’s apology, Matthew called out over the top of him: “You knob.”

Olive and Alison challenged Mr Jack, and questioned him over his treatment of, and lack of disciplinary action in regard to, Matthew: “Why don’t you send him out of the room?”

Confronted by this challenge, Mr Jack reasserted his position of power and ejected Matthew from the classroom. Mr Jack then responded to the girls’ question: “I’m doing my best with Matthew at the moment.”

Mr Jack moved outside to speak to Daniel and Matthew. When they re-entered the room, Daniel apologised to the class. As the students became noisy and unfocused, Mr Jack again reprimanded the whole class.

Daniel commented on the events of the lesson to the student at the table at which I was seated: “Everyone’s in trouble. Miss’ll be next.” (referring to me)

William then commented to me: “This ‘ll be funny, everyone’ll have to go outside. This isn’t punishment, this is funny.”
Daniel continued ironically: “This is GOOD English!”

Matthew then re-entered the room and was told to apologise to the class, and to Kyle specifically. He commented to Kyle: “Sorry knob,” and was again sent outside by Mr Jack.

It is now twelve minutes into the lesson – a lesson that had so far been spent dealing with behavioural issues. No classwork had been undertaken. Mr Jack attempted to refocus the students, taking up the position of a teacher who wanted to “get on with” work. He commented: “Right, let’s get on with the lesson now.”

He then outlined the task, and provided the students with the equipment required to complete the task. He was then required to refocus the students again: “Let’s look up here.”

As the lesson continued, Mr Jack was again required to take up a controlling discourse. He stated: “Mouths shut please, look this way. You’ve been asked to be quiet, do so now, or expect the consequences.”

He then went on to reprimand the class as a whole: “That’s enough.”

Mr Jack then organised the students’ movement into groups. During this phase of the lesson the students began to work in their groups. Mr Jack moved between the positions of facilitator and disciplinarian. He disciplined Jerry on several occasions, and in one instance yelled at him.

The boys in the dominant group then engaged in a range of attention seeking (mis)behaviours in order to attain the assistance of Mr Jack and to test his patience.

Jerry called out to Mr Jack when he was helping Matthew and William: “It’s not fair, you’re helping them, not us.”

When Mr Jack moved to assist a group of girls, Matthew – faking a fight with William – called out: “Sir, sir, William punched me.” Mr Jack then moved to Jerry, to appease him and respond to his complaint. Jerry, who was sitting with his eyes down, his arms crossed, and with a stern, sullen expression on his face did not respond to Mr Jack.

Matthew then yelled out: “Sir,” to which Mr Jack responded.

Matthew continued to call out: “We need your help.”

Mr Jack responded to Matthew’s calling out: “That’s not appropriate.”

Matthew continued: “Yeah well, I’ve been sitting here with my hand up for hours and you haven’t come to help me.”

Mr Jack responded: “I haven’t seen it up, just be patient.”

Matthew commented, as Mr Jack remained seated with Jerry and Daniel: “You’re not even gonna come and help me.”
Appendix II: A Typical Lesson - Exemplar B

The lesson detailed here was the thirty-third English lesson of the semester and was conducted during the course of a class Novel unit.

The lesson demonstrates the ways in which the dominant boys – Daniel, Matthew and Jerry – positioned themselves, and performed, in the classroom. It illuminates the discursive knowledges and practices drawn upon by these boys, and how these performed practices served to challenge and disrupt the conventions that constitute the lesson genre, the planned work of English, and thus what came to count as English. It also demonstrates the ways in which their performances – as constituted by their mobilisation of discourses – served to position Mr Jack and the other students of 9-3.

In this lesson, the planned passport activity was resisted and manipulated by the boys. It became the vehicle through and by which they took up and played out sexualised discourses, and engaged in sexualised and masculinist language practices. Furthermore, the exam conditions, desired and planned by Mr Jack, were thwarted by the performances of the boys – who positioned themselves as the “bad lads” and thus disrupted the position of the “good student” subject. They refused to comply with the exam conditions – talking constantly and calling out. Their successful disruption of these planned conditions was signalled by Matthew’s claim: “Oh, this isn’t even a test, we’re just cheatin’.”

The bad lads’ performances, as exemplified in this typical lesson, were essentially constituted by their disruption of the “good student” subject position, and their taking up and playing out of sexualised discursive knowledges and practices. The vocabulary of masculinity, in particular homophobic language practices; acts of bravado; and the taking up of hyper-heterosexual versions of masculinity marked their performances. Their performance techniques proved potent and pervasive, and afforded the boys positions of dominance within the classroom. They also served to challenge Mr Jack’s preferred non-authoritative mode of performance, and to disrupt his planned pedagogical practices. As a result, his position and subsequent performance as teacher were fraught with tension, and marked as onerous. The boys’ performance techniques also regulated and restricted the subject positions made available to the other students of 9-3. Essentially, the employment of these discursively constituted practices enabled the “bad lads” to disrupt the conventions of the lesson genre, to sabotage the planned lesson agenda, and to significantly affect what came to count as English within this classroom site.

Mr Jack waits outside the classroom for the students to arrive and line up. When the students have settled, he instructs them to enter the room.

Once seated, he informs the students that they will be having a test. He then asks Leon and Belinda to distribute the students’ work folders, and proceeds to outline the requirements of the test/task. The students are restless, leading him to comment: “OK, we can continue in your lunch hour, ’cause I’m not prepared to talk while you’re talking.”

The test/task requires students to produce a passport for the main character in the novel. Mr Jack begins to demonstrate how to produce a passport – folding a sheet of paper into a booklet. When doing so, he jokes to the students: “I feel like a magician up the front here.”

He then distributes sheets of paper to the students – stopping on his way around the room to have a joke with Daniel.

Mr Jack then repeats his instructions. Daniel raises his hand immediately, calling out: “Jackey, sir, sir.”

Mr Jack again repeats his instructions, providing information about the characters – whose surname is not stated in the novel. He then asks the students to volunteer a surname for the character.

Daniel volunteers an answer: “Call him Wayne, and his last name King.”
William then joins in, offering further variations on Daniel’s reference to masturbation: “Make his last name Kerr, Wayne Kerr.”

Daniel continues: “Their last name’s gonna be flapper, it’s gonna be flogger.”

Mr Jack does not respond to their sexual references.

As the lesson continues, Daniel, Tom, and to a lesser extent William and Matthew, continue to chat, despite the “supposed” exam conditions desired by the teacher.

They do not comply with, but rather disregard the exam conditions, and complain about not wanting to do the work on their own.

Jerry calls out: “Sir, sir, oh, this is stupid.”

Matthew then comments: “Oh, this isn’t even a test, we’re just cheatin’.”

Kyle, who was assisting Matthew with the answers, is told to stop doing so by Mr Jack.

Mr Jack refers to the passport task: “Where could he/she have possibly been born?”

Tom responds: “In a sperm bank.”

The teacher then moves him into the foyer.

Jerry is constantly calling out to the teacher, who then moves to assist him. Mr Jack then moves to assist Daniel. Matthew attempts unsuccessfully to interrupt and gain the teacher’s attention. While assisting Daniel, Mr Jack is bent over in front of William. While the teacher is bent over in this way, Matthew holds out a pencil to William and comments: “Here, stick this up his arse.”

He continues: “William, go on, stick this up his arse.”

Matthew then comments to Jessica, who has now raised her hand: “I had my hand up before you.”

Mr Jack moves to assist Linda, when Matthew interrupts: “Sir, I had my hand up before her, she just put it up.”

Mr Jack responds: “Yes, that’s right,” and moves to assist Matthew.

Daniel then moves himself into the adjacent withdrawal room. Mr Jack questions him: “What’s your problem? Have you had a bad day today?”

Daniel replies: “Nuh.”

Mr Jack responds: “Well don’t take it out on me.”

Daniel replies in a gruff voice: “Yeah, well don’t take it out on me either.”

Matthew and Daniel start throwing a glue stick to each other, between the two rooms.

Mr Jack responds to the amount of talking: “I don’t want to hear any more talking from the front. Quieten down thanks, Belinda.”

Jerry: “Yeah, shut up, Belinda.”

Belinda: “You shut up, Jerry.”

Jerry: “No, you just shut up, Belinda.”

Daniel, who is still in the withdrawal room, is giving Matthew “the finger” through the window.

Mr Jack moves around the room, assisting the students.

Matthew, who is sitting with his hand up, calls out: “Sir.”
Mr Jack comments: “Tiffany was first.” (She, too, is sitting with her hand up.)

Michael responds: “Bull.”

Mr Jack assists Tiffany and then Matthew.

Mr Jack then moves to assist Jane, who is sitting with her hand up.

When Jerry complains, Mr Jack responds: “She was first.”

Jerry in turn comments to Mr Jack: “I was first. You’re the dumb one. I was first man. This is crap.”

Mr Jack then speaks to Matthew, who is calling out for assistance.

Matthew responds: “Oh, well, I can’t get your attention to come and talk to me.”

Kyle passes a comment (inaudible) to Matthew.

Matthew responds to Kyle: “Shut up you faggot.”

Mr Jack: “Matthew.”

Matthew to Mr Jack: “When are you going to come and talk to me?”

Mr Jack moves to assist him immediately. Jerry and Gavin are still sitting with their hands up waiting for help.

Mr Jack moves into the withdrawal room to assist David.

Tom returns from the foyer, and is called a “Cockhead” by Matthew. Mr Jack returns to the classroom. Matthew who is sitting with his hand up, wanting assistance, calls out: “Sir.”

Mr Jack moves to assist Tiffany, who was also sitting with her hand up. Matthew comments to Mr Jack: “Oh, do you want me to get mad?”

Matthew then turns to Jessica: “Sir wants me to get mad.”

As Matthew continues to carry on in the same manner, Mr Jack comments: “You can be patient, ’cause Tiffany deserves just as much attention as you.”

As Mr Jack walks away from Matthew to get a sheet off his desk, Matthew comments: “Oh sire, ignore me totally.”

Daniel is calling out from the withdrawal room, asking Jerry and Belinda for answers.

…… …… …… …… ……

Matthew, realising that he has been given two sheets of paper by Mr Jack, holds the papers in the air, and calls out: “Sir, I’ve got two.”

Mr Jack responds: “You’ve got to write one-hundred and fifty words.”

Matthew replies: “Oh, bullshit.”

He then drops his scissors on the floor, commenting: “Holy shit, oops, sorry about that.”

When Mr Jack fails to give Matthew the attention he seeks, Matthew calls out: “Sir, Mr Jack. Oh look, this is something we do need help on.”

Mr Jack moves to help him.

…… …… …… …… ……

As the lesson continues, Daniel pokes his head out from the withdrawal room to call out: “Matthew, ya faggot.”

Matthew’s response is inaudible.

The lesson draws to a close, and Mr Jack instructs the students to put their work into their folders. He then comments: “If you want, you can work into the lunch to finish this. It’s not a detention.”
Text Analysis of Poetic Genre in Translation: a Contrastive Study of English & Persian Discourse®

Hossein Vahid Dastjerdi
Isfahan University

Bahador Sadeghi
Takestan Islamic Azad University

Abstract

The move of attention from sentence level equivalence to text level and above it and the emphasis on communicative purposes of texts have been major improvements in modern translation theory. Equally, for a translation to be successful, those macro features including text type, genre and register are of importance to translations. Although many would likely concur with Bakhtin's dictum that "the better our command of genres, the more freely we employ them," operationally genre remains a disputed framework for translation courses and approaches.

This study aims at investigating some cross-linguistic properties of poetic genre. For this purpose, three Persian pieces of poetry by Jalal-Addin-Rumi (Avaze Nei (the Reed Flute), Shah va Kanizak (the King and the Servant), Moosa va Shaban (Moses and the Shepherd) will be compared with their English translations. The study draws on the most recent version of discourse analysis approach based on five hypothesis related to the specific properties of translation, namely, simplification, normalization, explicitation, transitivity, and nominalization. The analysis of the data reveals significant cross-linguistic differences in SL and TL as related to these properties, which in turn suggest a shift of mind from mere linguistic to metalinguistic and ideational analysis of texts in translation process.

Key Words: simplification, normalization, explicitation, transitivity, nominalization, mental process, relational process, and material process.

Introduction

The present article is an analysis scenario in which instances of various linguistic features need to be extracted in more than one language. The main theoretical goal is the empirical testing of some hypotheses about the specific properties of translations using some standard techniques of text analysis. As an example, it has often been observed that translations tend to be longer than corresponding SL originals, on the one hand, and that they are simpler than their SL originals on the other hand. There has recently been an increased interest in more exact formulations of such general contentions in terms of explicit hypotheses and in providing empirical evidence to confirm or reject them. Such formulations can be found in (Toury, 1995), (Baker, 1995) or (Kenny, 1998).

The article will touch five hypotheses concerning the specific properties of translations, to show how we need to refer to multiple levels of linguistic organization, in order to be able to extract from the corpus, instances of linguistic features ranging from grammatical to semantic ones. It will then come up with concluding remarks for future studies.

Based on Baker's (1995) suggestions, three hypotheses to be tested in this study are as follows: simplification, normalization and explicitation. Two other hypotheses, namely, nominalization and transitivity will be discussed later.
**Simplification**

“Translations tend to use simpler language than original texts… possibly to optimize the readability of the target language text” (Hansen & Teich, 2001). Possible measures for simplification are average sentence length, and lexical density. Taking lexical density as a possible measure providing evidence for simplification, the following more concrete hypothesis can be formulated (cf. Baker 1995):

H (1): In translations from Persian into English, one would expect the lexical density to be lower in English translations (ET) than in Persian original texts (POT).

**Explicitation**

Translations show a tendency to spell things out rather than leave them implicit. A possible measure for explicitation is text length; translations tending to be longer than their SL … originals texts (Hansen & Teich).

Also, some language-specific tests have been proposed, e.g., for English, frequency counts of optional that have been suggested (cf. (Baker, 1996, 180)); translations tend to use that more frequently than comparable original texts. Also translations employ more explicit linguistic renderings of a given semantic content vs. less explicit ones, e.g., more conjunctions vs. prepositions.

Conjunctions indicate that semantic relations, such as temporal or causal ones, are made explicit, prepositions indicate less explicit lexico-grammatical relations (cf. (Halliday and Matthiessen, 1999)).

Taking the number of occurrences of that complementizer and the number of occurrences of conjunctions vs. prepositions as indicators for explicitation, we can formulate the following two hypotheses:

H (2-1): In translations from Persian into English, one would expect to find more that complementizers in ET than in POT.

H (2-2): In translations from Persian into English, one would expect to find more conjunctions vs. prepositions in ET.

**Normalization**

Translations have a tendency to conform to the typical patterns of the TL, exaggerating the typical features of the TL (Hansen & Teich, 2001).


Translations tend to use punctuation less creatively. Taking the extensive use of punctuations to be ‘normal’ in English in the given register, we can formulate the following hypothesis:

H (3): In translations from Persian into English, one would expect that there will be a higher frequency of punctuations in ET than in POT.

While Baker’s proposal is clearly a novel idea of how to approach the question of the specific properties of translations, there is one important shortcoming: the measures suggested for testing the hypotheses are quite shallow linguistic properties, essentially operating at word and graphological levels. One of the problems with ‘superficial’ quantification (i.e. taking account of formal linguistic categories rather than semantic ones) is that the counting procedures distance the analyst from the source text. Once a linguistic phenomenon has become a tick on a coding sheet, to be processed by quantitative approach, the co-text, so vital for interpretation, is lost (Fairclough 1992: 230).

In this study our approach to the question of the specific properties of translations (Fairclough, 1989) differs from Baker’s approach in the following respect: we bring some more abstract linguistic features into the picture. The approach discussed in this study is intended to supplement, not replace, the methods normally used in DA. Qualitative and quantitative techniques need to be combined, not played off against each other. This allows us to formulate additional hypotheses about the specific properties of translations
relating to nominalization and transitivity; such as H (4) and H (5).

**Nominalization**

One of the features of poetic genre in Persian is the extensive use of nominalization. Taking the extensive use of nominalization to be ‘normal’ in Persian, we can formulate the fifth hypothesis.

H (4) In translations from Persian into English, one would expect a higher frequency of nominalization in source texts than in comparable ET.

This hypothesis is drawn on Badawi’s hypothesis (1973) which first pointing to the major difference between Classical Arabic and Modern Standard Arabic in that nominal clauses are more frequent in the latter, and verbal clauses are more frequent in the former. It will be interesting to extend Badawi’s hypothesis to translated texts from Persian to English. The significance of this extension lies in the fact that no published study has yet compared the ratio of nominalization and frequency of different process types in Persian texts vs. their corresponding ET.

**Transitivity**

As part of the ideational function in the Hallidayan paradigm, transitivity is a powerful semantic concept and an essential dimension of the discourse analysis (Fowler, 1991). Transitivity places agents, actions, and patients in various relations to each other (Stubbs, 1994) and has important ideological implications (Yaakoub, 1988).

The important difference between transitivity in traditional grammar and in Halliday’s functional grammar is that in the former transitivity relates to whether a verb is transitive; while for Halliday (1985), transitivity has to do with the entire clause, not only with the verb, but with the relationships between the verb and the noun phrases in the clause. A clause, as Fowler (1991) puts it, is based on a semantic nucleus consisting of an obligatory verb or adjective called a predicate. In Halliday’s model, the predicate is the process (1985). A process is typically realized by a verb group; It may be material (a process of doing), mental (a process of sensing), relational (a process of being) or verbal process. Material processes “express the notion that some entity ‘does’ something – which may be done ‘to’ some other entity” (p. 103). A mental process is a process of thinking, feeling, or perceiving. A mental process is not a process of doing. It cannot be substituted by “do”. The third type of process is the relational. A relational process is a process of being. It has three subtypes:

1. X is a (intensive).
2. X is at a (circumstantial).
3. X has a (possessive).

Verbal processes are processes of saying, e.g., “say”, “tell”, “argue”.

A contrastive feature of the English and Persian grammatical systems is that English tend to use more material process whereas Persian shows more tendency toward relational process. This view is not yet attested in any published work. This study aims at providing evidence for this opinion. Thus, with regard to transitivity we can formulate another hypothesis concerning translation properties:

H (5) In translations from Persian into English, one would expect that there will be a higher number of relational processes in POT than in ET texts.

This reorientation towards the more abstract properties of source language texts and their translations has the following advantage for the methods of analysis: It adds the ideational function of nominalization and process types to the analysis. Considering these features helps us answer this question: does translation serve the same ideological function as the source language and therefore appear to use the same frequency of nominalization and transitivity (process types). (Thompson, 1990; and van Leeuwen, 1995).

In the following section, the method of analyzing the corpus to elicit appropriate information on the hypotheses (H1)–(H5) will be described.
Methodology
This study adopts a text analysis approach in handling the data, following Baker's translation hypotheses (1995), Halliday's functional grammar (1985) and critical linguistic analysis explicated by Fairclough & Wodak (1997), in order to answer the following research question:

Is there any significant cross-linguistic difference between selected POT and ET as related to five hypotheses, namely, simplification, explicitation, normalization, nominalization and transitivity?

Material
The texts to be analyzed in this study are:
a) Three poems by Jalal-addin-Rumi (1373) as source texts:
   1. Aavaze Nei
   2. Shah va Kanizak
   3. Moosa va Shaban

b) Three English translations, corresponding to each Persian poem:
   1. "The Reed Flute 1" and "the King and the Servant1" by E.H. Whinfield (1898)
   3. "The Reed Flute 2" and "the King and the Servant 2" by Paul Smith & Omid Honari (2002)
   5. "The King and the servant 3" and "Moses and the shepherd 3" by A. J. Arberry (1993)

Procedure
Each text is first broken into its constituent clauses. The clauses of each text are then categorized, following Halliday (1985), into Relational, Material, Mental, or Verbal. Other linguistic features selected for hypothesis testing such as optional that, conjunctions vs. prepositions, lexical density, nominal phrase, punctuations, and number of words, are also extracted and inter-linguistic comparisons are made in order to empirically test H1-H5.

Analysis and Discussion
In the following, more precise formulations of the hypotheses stated above and at least one possible test for each of them will be provided. The empirical testing of each of the hypotheses places different requirements on the analysis techniques to be used. For the analysis of hypotheses, we need to refer to a range of linguistic features: Lexical density, that, conjunctions and prepositions, nominalization which is a syntactic construction and the process types (transitivity) which refer to functional-grammatical classes reflecting a semantic distinction. The tests illustrate the extraction of these linguistic features on the basis of a raw text corpus.

Simplification
Possible measures for simplification are average sentence length and lexical density. As far as sentence length is concerned translations seem to be longer (Table 1 & 2). In fact, except "the Reed Flute 1 & 2", translations tend to have longer sentences than the source texts. This verifies Baker's hypothesis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POT</th>
<th>Sentence length</th>
<th>Total number of words</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aavaze Nei</td>
<td>20.41</td>
<td>430</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1, sentence length in SL texts
Table 2, sentence length in TL texts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ET</th>
<th>Sentence length</th>
<th>Total number of words</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the Shepherd 1</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1463</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the Shepherd 2</td>
<td>11.54</td>
<td>820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the Shepherd 3</td>
<td>15.2</td>
<td>1111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute 1</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>647</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute 2</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>754</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute 3</td>
<td>24.23</td>
<td>509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the Servant 1</td>
<td>16.71</td>
<td>936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the Servant 2</td>
<td>17.07</td>
<td>5187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the Servant 3</td>
<td>19.44</td>
<td>2178</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As to lexical density, the focus is on one lexical item in each text: “God” in “Moses and the Shepherd”; “Reed” in “the Reed Flute”; “Sickness” in “the King & the Servant”. Tables 3&4&5 indicate that lexical density is lower in the English translations, if only slightly, and we can thus interpret this as simplification.

Table 3, lexical density in “Moses and the Shepherd”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ET1</th>
<th>ET2</th>
<th>ET3</th>
<th>POT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>God</td>
<td>God</td>
<td>God</td>
<td>خدا</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your Majesty</td>
<td>Divine</td>
<td>Your Majesty</td>
<td>الله</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glorious</td>
<td>The Judge</td>
<td>محتمم</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Almighty</td>
<td>The Almighty</td>
<td>أقتاب</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Lord</td>
<td>The Lord</td>
<td>حق تعالي</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glorious One</td>
<td>Allah</td>
<td>ذو الجلال</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ruler</td>
<td>حادث</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>You</td>
<td>خالق</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Holy</td>
<td>الله</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ET1</td>
<td>ET2</td>
<td>ET3</td>
<td>POT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complaining</td>
<td>tale of separation</td>
<td>reed</td>
<td>شکایت کردن</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lamenting</td>
<td>complaint</td>
<td>sigh</td>
<td>حکایت کردن از جداشی</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pangs</td>
<td>longing</td>
<td>fire</td>
<td>شرح شرح از فراق</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longing</td>
<td>stain</td>
<td>sound</td>
<td>شرح درد استنشاق</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plaintive notes</td>
<td>yearning</td>
<td>passion</td>
<td>اشک</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yearning</td>
<td>wailing</td>
<td>separation</td>
<td>بانگ نای</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wailing</td>
<td>weep</td>
<td>grievances</td>
<td>گوشش علق</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weep</td>
<td>grief</td>
<td></td>
<td>حديث راه پر خون</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ferment of love</td>
<td>sorrow</td>
<td></td>
<td>قصه علق مجنون</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grief</td>
<td>sigh</td>
<td></td>
<td>غم</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sorrow</td>
<td>cry</td>
<td></td>
<td>سوز</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anguish</td>
<td>The sound</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sigh</td>
<td>pain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire of love</td>
<td>passion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plaint of the flute</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 5, lexical density in “The King and the Servant”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ET1</th>
<th>ET2</th>
<th>ET3</th>
<th>POT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sick</td>
<td>بيمار</td>
<td>مريض</td>
<td>دردمند</td>
<td>دردمند</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lovesick</td>
<td>sickness</td>
<td>illness</td>
<td>مرض</td>
<td>دردمند</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment</td>
<td>drug</td>
<td>suffering</td>
<td>خسته</td>
<td>خسته</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cure</td>
<td>ailment</td>
<td>affliction</td>
<td>مرض</td>
<td>دردمند</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diagnosis</td>
<td>illness</td>
<td>treatment</td>
<td>رنج</td>
<td>رنجور</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>torment</td>
<td>cure</td>
<td>رنجور</td>
<td>رنجور</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>illness</td>
<td>مرض</td>
<td>زاري</td>
<td>زاري</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>torment</td>
<td>مرض</td>
<td>بيماري</td>
<td>بيماري</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>treatment</td>
<td>علاج</td>
<td>بيماري</td>
<td>بيماري</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>cure</td>
<td>ناخوش</td>
<td>رخ زرد</td>
<td>رخ زرد</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>diagnosis</td>
<td>علاج</td>
<td>درمان</td>
<td>درمان</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>remedies</td>
<td>علاج</td>
<td>دوا</td>
<td>دوا</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Explicitation

One possible measure for explicitation is text length; as it is evident from the number of words, in this study translated texts tend to be longer than their SL originals. Table 1 & 2 shows that there are four exception regarding text length (the total number of words). "The King & the Shepherd 1 and 3" and "Moses & the Shepherd 2 & 3" are shorter than their source texts.

Also, frequency counts of optional that have been suggested as another possible measure for explicitation. According to (H2), the translations show explicitation using the optional that more often than original texts do.

Table 6, below provides evidence for the rejection of the hypotheses regarding the excessive use of optional "that" in translations ("the King and the Servant 2" &" the Reed Flute 2" are exceptional).

The data show that there are significantly fewer that-clauses in English translations compared to their source language texts.
Table 6, the number of "that" in POT & ET

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ET</th>
<th>Number of &quot;that&quot;</th>
<th>Optional &quot;that&quot;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the Shepherd 1</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the Shepherd 2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the Shepherd 3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute 1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute 2</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute 3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the Servant 1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the Servant 2</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the Servant 3</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Moosa va Shaban&quot;</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Avaze Nei&quot;</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Shah va Kanizak&quot;</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The ratio of conjunctions vs. prepositions is another possible measure for explicitation. The results are displayed in table 7. Hypothesis (2-2) maintaining that there should be more conjunctions in the translations for explicitation to hold is confirmed, because the ratio of conjunctions to prepositions is more in translation than in original texts. The two exceptions are "Moses and Shepherd 2" and "the king and the Servant 3".
Table 7, conjunctions, vs. prepositions in SL and TL texts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ET</th>
<th>conjunction</th>
<th>preposition</th>
<th>ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the Shepherd 1</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>1.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the Shepherd 2</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>0.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the Shepherd 3</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute 1</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>1.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute 2</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>1.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute 3</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>1.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the Servant 1</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>1.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the Servant 2</td>
<td>408</td>
<td>595</td>
<td>1.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the Servant 3</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>1.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POT</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Moosa va Shaban&quot;</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>1.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Avaze Nei&quot;</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>0.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Shah va Kanizak&quot;</td>
<td>279</td>
<td>387</td>
<td>1.38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Normalization

The next hypothesis to be considered is related to normalization property. Translations have a tendency to conform to the typical patterns of the TL, exaggerating the typical features of the TL. As a test for normalization, Baker (1995) suggests comparing the use of punctuation; translations purportedly using punctuation less creatively than original texts. Hypothesis (3), which claims that there should be more punctuation in the translations for normalization to hold, is rejected as far as question mark and colon are concerned since they are used more in source texts. On the other hand, with regard to semicolon and full stop, the hypothesis is confirmed, since they are used more in English translations. (Table 8)
Table 8, punctuation in SL and TL texts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>.</th>
<th>,</th>
<th>;</th>
<th>:</th>
<th>?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shepherd 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shepherd 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moses and the</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shepherd 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Reed Flute</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Servant 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Servant 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The King &amp; the</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Servant 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POT</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Moosa va Shaban”</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Avaze Nei”</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Shah va Kanizak”</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Question mark as opposed to Baker's hypotheses is used more in source texts.

Colon which introduces explanation, amplification, or a list or a comment is used more in source texts. Two exceptions are “The Reed Flute 2” and “The King and the Servant 2” in translated texts.

**Nominalization**

Nominalization, deletes agency, tense and modality. It reduces a whole clause into its nucleus, the verb, and then turns it into a noun, thus deleting agency and modality, facilitating relexicalization, clouding relational responsibilities and yielding a tone of formality and impersonality. This syntactic reduction also allows suppressing face-threatening details such as Agent and Patient and presenting a complex relation in a single lexical item (Fowler & Kress, 1979). A nominal clause is one where the thematic/subject position is occupied by a noun phrase; in a verbal clause this position is occupied by a verb. A nominal clause, compared to a verbal one, is rather static and does not indicate action or continuity (Yaakoub, 1988). Tables 9 & 10 below show the results of the analysis of nominalization. They indicate a significant difference in the use of nominalization in original texts compared to English translations. Persian texts use more nominalization than English translations, and so the extensive use of nominalization is more a register feature of Persian than of English. Thus, hypothesis (4) suggesting that in translations from Persian into English one would expect a higher frequency of nominalization in source texts than in comparable English translations, is strongly confirmed.

Table 9, the ratio of nominalization in SL texts
The first text analyzed here, was "Moses and Shepherd". This text is divided into 3 subheadings which may be further divided into 4 nominal clauses and 1 verbal clause. One example of nominal clauses in subheading is "enkar kardane Moosa". Here, nominal clauses are more frequent in Persian, and verbal clauses are more frequent in English. The subheadings witness to this hypothesis. However, the tendency towards nominalization in titles and subtitles is not specific to Persian. Even in English subheadings are predominantly nominal. But the same tendency towards nominalizing is also noticeable within the text. It contains 146 instances of nominalization in 386 clauses. The ratio of nominalizations to clauses is approximately 1 to 2. That is, in every two clauses there is at least one instance of nominalization, e.g., "bi adab goftan"; (to tell impolitely) "vasl kardan"(to join). The same tendency is true in the two other source texts. "Avaze Nei" contains 97 instances nominalization in 259 clauses. Similarly, "Shah va Kanizak" contains 724 instances of nominalization in 1650 clauses; namely, in every two clauses there is at least one instance of nominalization in each text. So one significant difference between the source and the translated texts lies in the high density of nominalization (Table 9).

The tendency towards nominalizing, however, is less noticeable in translated texts. (See Table 10); it shows that except in "Moses and The Shepherd 1" the ratio of nominalization to all clauses is approximately 1 to 3, i.e. in every three clauses there is
at least one instance of nominalization, while in source texts there is at least one instance of nominalization in every two clauses.

**Transitivity**

The analysis of transitivity choices in the data has been concerned with processes. Processes “carry the main responsibility for representing the events and situations to which the text refers” (Fowler & Kress, 1979, p. 198).

Table 11 & 12 show the results of the analysis of transitivity. There is a significant difference in the use of transitivity in ET compared to POT, i.e. Persian uses more relational process than English which uses in turn more material process.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Relational N</th>
<th>Relational %</th>
<th>Material N</th>
<th>Material %</th>
<th>Mental N</th>
<th>Mental %</th>
<th>Verbal N</th>
<th>Verbal %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moosa va Shaban</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avaze Nei</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shah va Kanizak</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Starting from the source texts, the 234 clauses of the “Moosa va Shaban” text may be categorized as follows: 108 Relational, 88 Material, 23 Verbal, and 15 Mental. The percentages of these processes are given in Table 11 (N = number).

Table 11 shows that the most frequent category is that of Relational processes, and the
least frequent is that of Mental processes. The following are examples of the different process categories in this text:

1- “dastakat boosam…” (May I kiss your hand?) (Material)
2- “oo tanha nashod…” (He doesn't become alone …) (Relational)
3- “goft Moosa: ba ki ast in folan?” (Moses said:“ whom is he talking to?”) (Verbal)
4- “did Mosa yek shabani ra be rah” (In his way Moses saw a shepherd) (Mental)

Table 11 also shows the same tendency towards relational processes in “Avaze Nei” and “Shah va Kanizak” respectively.

Table 12 shows that the most frequent category in ET is that of material process and the least is of verbal process. There are two exceptions in which relational process is the most frequent and the mental process is the least frequent category in ET. Thus, H (5) which claims that in translations from Persian into English one would expect a higher number of relational processes in source texts than in translated English texts, is strongly confirmed.

Findings and Conclusions

This study illustrates the analysis of Persian poetic genre along with corresponding English translations for the purpose of testing some selected hypotheses about the specific properties of translation, using some standard text analysis techniques employed in translation assessment. The primary objective was to find how the translated texts differ from the source texts in terms of normalization, explicitation, simplification, transitivity, and nominalization. As to more abstract features such as nominalization and transitivity, the ultimate aim of the study was to find out how Persian and English vary in encoding ideology.

The only hypothesis strongly rejected was H (2-1) which claims that translations show explicitation, using more “optional that” compared to source texts. The study showed that there are significantly fewer that clauses in ET compared to POT. However, H (2-2) which concerns the ratio of conjunctions vs. prepositions as another possible measure for explicitation was confirmed, because with two exceptions, the ratio of conjunctions to prepositions came to be more in ET than in POT.

Hypothesis (1) was also verified with one exception. According to this hypothesis, the lexical density in translations should be lower than in source texts. The analysis showed that lexical density in ET was lower, a proof for simplification in translation. It is to be noted that here there is an important limitation as to the adopted method of analysis: that is in this study we have focused on only one lexical item in each text and thus, the result is not generalizable.

Hypothesis (3), which presents the ratio of punctuation as a possible measure for normalization was partly verified and partly rejected. This hypothesis which claims that there should be more punctuation in the ET for normalization was rejected as far as question mark and colon are concerned since they are used more in source texts. On the other hand, with regard to semicolon, comma, and full stop. H (3) was confirmed, since they are used more in ET.

The reason why question mark and colon are more frequent in POT needs to be explored more by further studies, since the commonly hold view is that punctuation is always used less creatively in Persian texts than in English. For example, semicolon, as it is evident in this study, is almost absent in Persian poetic genre. In this study, the excessive use of question mark might indicate that the authors of POT are more interactive with the readers. This needs to be further researched.

Hypothesis (4), which is related to nominalization, was strongly confirmed in this study. The ratio of nominalization to verbal phrases is approximately 1 to 2 in POT, and 1 to 3 in ET; that is in POT in every two clauses, while in ET in every three clauses, there is at
least one instance of nominalization. One significant difference, then, between POT and the ET, is in the high density of nominalization.

Hypothesis (5) claiming that there is a higher number of relational processes in POT than in ET, was also strongly confirmed because there was a significant difference in the use of transitvity in ET compared to POT. In fact, Persian texts use more relational process, while in translations, with two exceptions, the most frequent category is that of material process.

The above-mentioned findings, derived from the English and Persian data reveal significant cross-linguistic differences related to simplification, explicitation, normalization, transitivity, and nominalization. The significant difference in the use of transitivity and nominalization between POT and ET might be due to some other factors influencing translations. It might be an indication of an essential dichotomy between the two ideologies governing the two languages, i.e. one being subjective and the other objective (Brookes, 1995). This implies that we also need to add the ideational function of nominalization and process types to the findings.

It is, of course, very difficult to overlook the greater tendency towards subjectivity in source texts and towards its opposite in the translations, for the latter is predominated by reports of actions and things done through excessive use of material process, whereas the former is predominated by things speculated, stipulated or mandated through excessive use of relational, value- laden clauses (Brookes, 1995). The processes in the latter are thus more “measurable” (Brookes, 1995).

As to Relational processes, when they take precedence over Material processes, “the dynamic world of interhuman processes” is changed into “a static world of immutable precepts and interdicts” (Hastert & Weber, 1992, p. 169), and agency and action are “attenuated”, if not totally “omitted” (Brookes, 1995, p. 476). Processes are reified into states that should be taken for granted and duties that should be performed. This is the case in Persian texts to a much greater extent than in the translations of such texts.

Apart from formulating and testing additional hypotheses about the specific properties of translations, our longer-term goal is to work towards the specification of a translation corpus workbench that caters for the informational needs of researchers in translatology as well as teachers and students of translation.

Taken together, the techniques employed in this study support the kinds of analysis carried out, but there are a number of open issues that require more principled treatments. In fact, there is still a lot to do to establish discourse analysis (DA) in the Persian context and to cover other discourse genres in Persian. The list of unrehearsed, at least under-researched, Persian genres is too long, but such genres as news reports, opinion columns, cartoons advertisements, matrimonial columns, interviews, State documents and correspondences, courtroom discourse and legalese, religious sermons, folk tales and songs, can be good areas for further research.

What is at stake, however, is not the number of Persian discourse genres that should be explored; it is rather a reorientation of attention from linguistic choices and their meanings to linguistic and metalinguistic choices and their ideological meanings in a given context (Abrams, 1993).

References


**Appendix: Chi-square of data**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table No.</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18.615</td>
<td>0.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>19.377</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>307.426</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-12</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18.012</td>
<td>0.007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First 2 Parameters</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-12</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>0.144</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Power, Discourse and Enterprise Resource Planning Systems (Keynote Paper)

David Grant
University of Sydney

Richard Hall
University of Sydney

Abstract
Enterprise Resource Planning Systems (ERPs) are packaged business software systems that automate the integration of data across an organisation and impose standardized procedures on the input, use and dissemination of that data (Hall 2002). In this paper we show how power relations impact on the management and organisation of ERPs at five case study organisations. We argue that these power relations can be best understood by examining what Hardy and Phillips (2004) have described as the mutually constitutive nature of power and discourse. Moreover, we assert that the mutually constitutive relationship between power and discourse is, in the case of ERP systems, determined by the extent to which discourses concerning these systems and their use, resonate with the actual practice of using them.

We note that those who seek to promulgate the use of ERP systems construct discourses in which are embedded a variety of rhetorical devices that are designed to persuade various organisational stakeholders of the merits of ERP. However, and as our study shows, where organisations decide to implement ERP systems they often encounter considerable difficulty in doing so. Often the ERP systems are implemented in such a way that they only partially achieve what they are designed to do. This is because those stakeholders within the organisations that actually have to use ERP systems find them to be flawed and as not meeting the expectations created by the discourses used to promulgate them. In short the discourses used by the proponents of ERP often fail to stand up to what we term the “test of practice”. This has two interrelated effects. First, it means that the ERP is not implemented in ways that were originally envisaged. Second, it enables these stakeholders to undermine the implementation of ERP systems, particularly where they perceive them to in some way threaten their interests. We argue that the test of practice may be fundamental to understanding the mutually constitutive nature of power and discourse and the way in which this relationship impacts on the power relations underlying many of the processes and practices of organising and managing.

Introduction
Enterprise Resource Planning Systems (ERPs) are packaged business software systems that automate the integration of data across an organisation and impose standardized procedures on the input, use and dissemination of that data (Hall 2002). In this paper we show how power relations impact on the management and organisation of ERPs at five case study organisations. In order to achieve this, we divide the paper into four main sections. The first examines the motives behind ERP implementations. We discuss the significance of ERPs and show how ERP implementations can be considered major forms of technological change. In doing so, we illustrate how proponents of ERP systems have come to construct a discourse that presents ERPs as having a highly beneficial and positive impact on organisational performance. At the
same time, we note that there is evidence that ERP systems do not always meet these expectations. In the second section we propose a framework of analysis based on the mutually constitutive relationship of power and discourse and the “test of practice” and suggest how such an analysis might provide fresh insight into the management and organisation of ERP systems. The third section of the paper outlines the discourse analytic methodology employed by the study. The fourth section reports and discusses the results of the discourse analysis carried out in relation to our case study organizations. The final section to the paper presents our main conclusions.

The Motives behind ERP Implementations

Originally derived from Manufacturing Resource Planning II applications, ERP systems are computer-based technologies that integrate data across an organization and standardise procedures concerning its input, use and dissemination. Using an ERP system members of an organization can enter or draw on data from one part of an organization’s operations and then immediately inform or update all other parts of an organization’s operations in a variety of report formats, each designed to assist particular functions and procedures (Fahy 2001; Koch 2001a; 2001b; Laughlin 1999). The current generation of ERPs now include a range of modules that include the original manufacturing and logistics functions, complemented by various financial and accounting, human resource management, and sales and distribution applications (Mabert, et al., 2001: 70).

Because of their capacity for integration and standardisation, ERP systems are supposed to transform the nature, structure and management of work regardless of organizational context (Buckout et al., 1999; Davenport, 1998; Koch, 2001a; Laughlin, 1999; Trunick, 1999). As a consequence they are believed by many to deliver significant cost savings and increased profits to organisations based on reduced procurement costs, smaller inventories, more effective sales strategies, lower administration costs, and reduced direct and indirect labour costs (Buckhout, et al. 1999; Brady, et al., 2001; Davenport 1998; Gefen and Ragowsky 2005; Laughlin 1999). They are also said to lead to improved decision making because of their ability to provide “real time” information in a variety of report formats, each designed to assist particular management functions and procedures (Koch, 2001b; Laughlin, 1999).

It is argued that the capacity of ERPs to lead to significant cost savings and increased profitability have been the primary motivations for large numbers of organizations to adopt them since the mid 1990s (Booth, et al., 2000; Trunick 1999; Madapusi and D’Souza 2005). According to one estimate, by the late 1990s almost 40 per cent of large US companies and 60 per cent of small companies had deployed ERP systems (Cissna, 1998). By 2003 it was estimated that 30,000 companies around the world had implemented ERPs (Mabert et al 2003). A survey of large private sector Australian businesses in the late 1990s found an average ERP adoption rate of 52.7 per cent, ranging from 71.4 per cent in the manufacturing sector, to 29.6 per cent in “other services” (Philipson, 1999). The significance of the ERP “industry” is such that the worldwide market for these applications is expected to have grown to US$79 billion annually by 2004 (Gefen and Ragowsky 2005).

While proponents point to the widespread success of ERP implementations, a counter discourse exists which asserts that they are costly to implement, and often fail to deliver significant benefits. The cost of implementing an ERP system has been estimated at between US$300 000 for small firms to US$500 million for large corporations (Laughlin 1999; Mabert et al. 2001). According to Martin (1999), 40% of ERP implementations are only partially completed and between 20% and 50% are scrapped as failures. It has also been observed that between 60% and 90% of implementations fail to achieve the return on investment originally envisaged (Trunick 1999), while one recent survey of 63 US companies with ERP systems found that the costs of implementation exceeded cost savings and revenue gains by an average of US$1.5 million (Stedman 1999). Companies such as Fox-Meyer Corporation, Dow Chemical, Boeing, Mobil Europe, Hershey, and Kellogg have all been described as ERP implementation failures (Davenport 1998).
In many cases the cost blow-outs of ERP implementation and their failure to achieve a return on investment have been attributed to organizations having to customize the ERP system that they purchase. ERP systems are designed to be flexible, such that any suite of modules is 'configurable' to the needs of any particular organisation. Indeed, all ERP modules must be configured as part of the implementation process. However this configuration process involves choosing from a range of inbuilt options and completing parameters and tables (what in the ERP industry is known as the vanilla version of the ERP system) and is very different from customising the software code so that the ERP processes operate differently from their original design (Shanks, Seddon and Willcocks 2003). Thus the flexibility of ERPs should not be overstated because “ERP systems require the organization to adapt to the software rather than modifying the software to suit the organization's established practices” (Booth et al, 2001). Where organizations have chosen the latter of these options it has often been at a high price. The greater the extent to which the software is customized, the greater the cost of implementation to the organization and, often, the less effective the performance of the ERP system.

Despite the high cost and high incidence of failure, large numbers of organizations still persist in implementing ERP systems. That they are persuaded to do so can, in part at least, be attributed to the presentation of ERPs via a strongly technological determinist discourse. Elsewhere, we have suggested that ERPs are depicted by software vendors, consultants and those internal to the organisation who sponsor their adoption, as a form of technology that has far reaching and beneficial organisation-wide consequences (Grant et al, 2006). In some instances this discourse is tempered so as to warn businesses of the imperative of careful planning and the importance of seeing an ERP implementation as a change process that needs to be managed. Nonetheless, our analysis of marketing and other publicity materials issued by ERP vendors and consultants suggested that it consistently pushes to the fore major benefits flowing directly from the technology. Moreover, we also found evidence of this discourse in the academic literature. Typically this determinist discourse emphasises the considerable business efficiency dividends that can be realised through the introduction of an ERP system, the value of ERPs driving 'best practice' business processes into organisations, and the suitability of ERPs for organisations of any size in any industry (Grant et al 2006).

ERP as a technological intervention has been associated with: downsizing and delayering (Laughlin, 1999); individual job redesign leading to reduced employee autonomy and work intensification (Hall, 2002); the introduction of team structures (Koch & Buhl, 2001); and the centralisation of control (Buckhout et al., 1999). While from a managerial perspective these may be desirable outcomes, they challenge the existing power structures and relationships within the organisation. As a consequence, the implementation of ERPs may meet resistance from key managerial and employee interest groups. There has been some discussion of how such resistance manifests itself. For example, ERP implementations are said to have led to increased exit rates (Glover, et al., 1999), work arrounds (Hall 2002) and to job dissatisfaction (Hall, 2002). However, no studies have sought to show the precise reasons why such resistance occurs, and the extent to which it impacts on the successful implementation and subsequent operation of the ERP. This paper seeks to provide such an analysis. In so doing, it argues that an understanding of the power relationships underlying the management and organisation of ERPs is necessary and that this can be achieved by an examination of the discourses that are used by the various ERP stakeholders within an organisation. Such an approach highlights the important link between power and discourse and it is to this we turn in the next section.

**Discourse, Power and ERPs**

A burgeoning interest in organizational discourse has seen researchers apply discourse analytic approaches to the language and other symbolic media that are discernible in organizations (e.g. Grant et al, 2004 Iedema and Wodak, 1999; Hardy et al, 2004). This has enabled them to engage with, analyse and interpret a variety of organization related issues in ways that would not have otherwise been achievable. Drawing on the insights
offered by this literature, a discourse analytic approach to the study of ERPs might be expected to contribute to our understanding of their management and organisation in three significant respects.

First, a discourse analytic approach allows us to identify and analyse the key discourses by which ERP systems are conceptualized, idealized and articulated. Moreover, it enables us to demonstrate that discourse plays a central role in the social construction of ERP systems and the practices surrounding their implementation. Discourse brings an object (in this case ERP) into being so that it becomes a material reality in the form of the practices that it invokes for various stakeholders (employees, vendors, managers, consultants etc) (Hardy 2001: 27). As part of this process, it “rules in” certain ways of talking about the ERP that are deemed as acceptable, legitimate and intelligible while also “ruling out”, limiting and restricting the way these stakeholders talk about or conduct themselves in relation to an ERP systems or constructing knowledge about them (Hall, 2001: 72). In this sense discourse can be shown to act as a “powerful ordering force” (Alvesson and Karreman, 2000: 1127).

Second, a discourse analytic approach can show how, via a variety of discursive interactions and practices, particular discourses go on to shape and influence the attitudes and behaviour of key ERP stakeholders (Alvesson and Karreman, 2000: 1126-1127). As with any discourse, discourses related to ERP do not simply start out in possession of “meaning”. Instead, and in line with their socially constructive effects, their meanings are created, and supported via discursive interactions among key ERP stakeholders. This constructive process involves the negotiation of meaning among different stakeholders with different views and interests and results in the emergence of a dominant meaning that can be seen as a particular discourse. The emergence of this dominant meaning occurs as alternative discourses are subverted or marginalized and is indicative of the power relationships that may come into play. As Fairclough (1995: 2) explains, the “power to control discourse is seen as the power to sustain particular discursive practices with particular ideological investments in dominance over other alternative (including oppositional) practices.” Our discourse analytic study of ERP implementations seeks to demonstrate that, although some discourses related to ERP may seem to dominate (for example discourses with a technological determinist emphasis), “their dominance is secured as part of an ongoing struggle among competing discourses (among for example, consultants, managers and employees) that are continually reproduced or transformed through day-to-day communicative practices” (Hardy, 2001: 28). More specifically, it also seeks to reveal how dominant meanings emerge from the context under which they are negotiated.

Third, to understand how and why particular discourses and their meanings are produced, as well as their effects, it is important to understand the context in which they arise. This has led to the application of "intertextual" analyses of discourses (see for example, Fairclough, 1995). Such studies identify and analyse specific, micro-level instances of discursive action and then locate them in the context of other macro-level, “meta” or “grand” discourses (Alvesson and Karreman, 2000). In a similar vein, Fairclough and Wodak (1997: 277) have pointed out that “Discourses are always connected to other discourses which were produced earlier, as well as those which are produced synchronically and subsequently”. Our study seeks to draw on this observation, by demonstrating that the negotiation of meaning surrounding ERP unfolds through the complex interplay of both socially and historically produced texts (Alvesson and Karreman, 2000) that are part of a continuous, iterative and recursive process (Grant and Hardy, 2004). In short, any text is seen as “a link in a chain of texts, reacting to, drawing in and transforming other texts” (Fairclough and Wodak, 1997: 262). The value of this approach is that it takes us beyond simple examinations of verbal and written interaction and allows us to appreciate the importance of "who uses language, how, why and when" (van Dijk, 1997: 2). More specifically, it means that when studying a particular discursive interaction, our research into ERP implementations takes into account other discursive interactions operating at different levels and at different times, which are linked to, and inform, our interpretations of the ERP implementation under currently scrutiny.

Underlying these three contributions is an appreciation of the complex link between
power and discourse. Mumby (2004) notes a number of distinct but connected research traditions that have highlighted this link. They include critical management research emanating from interpretive-cultural studies (e.g. Frost, 1980; 1987; Smircich, 1983), discourse centred approaches to the study of organizational communication (e.g. Putnam, 1983; Putnam and Pacanowsky, 1983; Deetz, 1992; Deetz and Mumby, 1990) and critical studies of organization, management and society founded on major continental thinkers such as Derrida, Habermas, and Foucault (e.g. Clegg, 1989; Fairclough, 1992; Hall, 2001; Knights and Willmott, 1989).

However, and as Hardy and Phillips (2004: 299) have observed, more could be done to unpack the complex relationship between power and discourse even further. Thus, they propose an analytical framework where:

…power and discourse are mutually constitutive: at any particular moment in time, discourses..., shape the system of power that exists in a particular context by holding in place the categories and identities upon which it rests. In other words, the distribution of power among actors, the forms of power on which actors can draw, and the types of actors that may exercise power in a given situation are constituted by discourse and are, at a particular moment, fixed. Over time, however, discourses evolve as this system of power privileges certain actors, enabling them to construct and disseminate texts. Depending on the dynamics of transmission and consumption, these texts may influence the broader discourse and shape the discursive context. Thus, the power dynamics that characterize a particular context determine, at least partially, how and why certain actors are able to influence the processes of textual production and consumption that result in new texts that transform, modify or reinforce discourses. In other words, discourse shapes relations of power while relations of power shape who influences discourse over time and in what way.

In building their framework of analysis, Hardy and Phillips (2004) refer to some of their earlier studies (Hardy and Phillips, 1999; Phillips and Hardy, 1997) as well as that of, for example, Fairclough (1992) and Taylor (1985). These authors have used Foucault’s work in order to argue that discourses constitute three types of social category – concepts objects and subjects. *Discursive concepts* are the ideas “through which we understand the world and relate to one another” (Phillips and Hardy, 1997: 167). *Discursive objects* are closely related to discursive concepts. However, there is a key difference. Unlike concepts, which exist only in the realm of ideas, they can exist in a physical sense and have an ontological reality. Thus, the social accomplishment of a concept requires that it be applied to, or become, an object. Changing the concept stands to change the way in which the object itself is socially accomplished, acknowledged and related to. Whether a discursively constructed concept works once it becomes an ontological reality - an object - can only be assessed by paying particular attention to the relevant *discursive subjects*. Individuals participating in a discourse do so not as passive receptacles, but as active social agents with their own interests and subjectivities who are seeking to establish what their social and power relations are with the designated discursive objects.

In this paper we utilise Hardy and Phillips’ framework of analysis in order to identify and examine the power dynamics underlying the management and organisation of ERP systems. We show how these power dynamics lead key actors to produce influential discourses pertaining to ERP and why some of these actors are more successful in modifying the discourse in ways that are useful to them.

We have already noted that a particular discourse will be used to represent the interests of individuals or groups of actors. The mutually constitutive nature of power and discourse means that as a particular discourse becomes more powerful then the power of the group whose interests it represents increases. Equally, as the power of this group increases so too does the dominance of the discourse.

The power of a particular group to produce and disseminate influential discourses will, according to Hardy and Phillips, 2004: 306-307), be influenced by whether members of the group occupy subject positions associated with (a) formal power; (b) critical resources; (c) network links; and (d) discursive legitimacy. *Formal power* refers to
authority and decision making power (French and Raven, 1968; Astley and Sachdeva, 1984). Those actors who have formal power within a particular discursive field i.e., those that occupy subject positions that “warrant voice” (Potter and Wetherell, 1987; Hardy, Palmer and Phillips, 2000) are more likely to be able to produce influential discourses. Actors with power based on critical resources (rewards, sanctions, expertise, access to organisational members higher in the authority structure, control of finances etc. (French and Raven, 1968; Pettigrew, 1973; Pfeffer, 1981) may be well placed to utilise those resources in order to generate and disseminate a particular discourses in a highly effective manner. Those actors who derive power through network links and social relationships (Bourdieu 1993) are able to constitute alliances with, incorporate and win the consent of other groups that might otherwise oppose the discourse that they are promulgating. In so doing, the discourse is gradually adopted by its potential opponents to the extent that it becomes instantiated in every day organizational life. Finally, some actors are able to draw upon what is termed discursive legitimacy (Fairclough, 1992; Parker, 1992; Phillips and Hardy, 1997; Taylor et al. 1996). In these instances they are able to produce a discourse that is authenticated by other people. In confirming the authenticity of the discourse these other people by virtue of their number or position validate its dissemination and extend its reach.

Hardy and Phillips (2004: 307) are careful to point out that these forms of power are distributed among many subject positions. Moreover, multiple actors in a variety of positions are implicated in establishing the extent to which a particular discourse comes to dominate the meaning attached to a particular issue (for example ERP). Often there is a considerable struggle among these actors to establish a dominant meaning, such that discursive “closure” is never complete leaving space for resistance through the production of “counter” discourses.

We subscribe to this view, but in investigating the mutually constitutive nature of power and its impact on ERPs we believe it is important to bring to the fore three inter-related factors.

First, the power of any ERP related discourse - be it a discourse that is supportive of ERP or one that is hostile towards it - rests, in part, on its capacity to persuade others of its credibility / legitimacy (Fairclough, 1989). Moreover, the persuasiveness of the discourse is contingent on the extent to which the arguments and claims made translate into real and lived experience (practice) for those the discourse and its proponents are seeking to persuade. We would describe this as the test of practice. We are not here talking of discourse as practice where this refers to various types or instances of discursive interaction (Broadfoot et al, 2004). Rather, and in line with Foucault (e.g. 1976; 1979; 1982; 1998, 2002), we are talking about the extent to which the ideas or ideological or hegemonic assumptions underlying a particular discourse influence those occupying the particular subject positions that it is aimed at such that it has a material affect. A successful discourse (in terms of its level of influence and thus the power of its proponents) is one where these subjects think or behave in ways that lead to the discourse being translated into social practice (Alvesson and Deetz, 2000; Fairclough, 1992; Mumby, 2001; Parker, 1992). This contributes to the authentication of the discourse and thus the discursive legitimacy of those associated with it. Moreover, it means that the issue of discursive legitimacy may be far more significant in the linkage between discourse and power than Hardy and Phillips’ (2004) framework of analysis would initially indicate.

In the case of ERP, we have already seen how its proponents (those occupying subject positions who have an interest in seeing an ERP implemented in an organisation) assert that a range of benefits will flow directly from the technology and that it is commensurate with “best practice” in organizations of any size and in any industry sector. The benefits include reference to considerable business efficiency dividends, enhanced profitability and improved information flows and decision making processes. Much of the extant literature on ERPs seems to suggest that they often fail to deliver these benefits. In short, the rhetoric underpinning ERPs fails to match the reality experienced by those
operating them – often middle managers and other employees (Laughlin, 1999; Hall, 2002; Koch & Buhl, 2001; Buckhout et al., 1999). As a consequence, discourses in support of ERP appear to often fail the test of practice and thus lose credibility and legitimacy. Without this, the proponents of the discourse cannot rely on formal power, critical resources and network links in order to sustain the discourse.

Third, as we have already noted, by their very nature, ERPs challenge existing power structures and relationships within organizations and so their implementation is likely to meet resistance from those key actors such as middle managers and employees. Where an ERP discourse becomes misaligned with the reality it seeks to portray, these key actors are unlikely to be persuaded of the legitimacy or credibility of the discourse. Drawing on their own experience of ERP in practice, and contingent on their own formal power, critical resources and network links, this may encourage them to construct a highly persuasive counter discourse - one that enables them to undermine discourses that favour ERP and resist its implementation.

Methods and Approach

The paper draws on data from a major study of ERP implementations in five large Australian organisations. For reasons of confidentiality, we have given each case study an assumed name. FoodCo is a large food processing company, employing approximately 2,500 staff. FoodCo implemented an ERP system with staged roll-outs of a full suite of modules commencing in 1999 with most module implementations completed by the end of 2001. BankA is a large Australian bank employing over 20,000 staff and offering a full range of banking services. The bank implemented the financials modules of an ERP in the late 1990s and commenced an implementation of HR modules in late 2000, going live in late 2002. BankB is a large bank based in New Zealand offering a full range of retail banking, business banking and financial services. The bank is a wholly owned subsidiary of an multinational financial institution. The parent company and BankCo have been implementing ERP modules since 2000. OzUni is a large Australian university employing over 5000 people and enrolling over 40,000 students. OzUni implemented the financial modules of an ERP in 2002 with further implementations of other modules thereafter. OilCo is a large oil company operating in Australia as part of a large multinational corporation. The company first implemented an ERP in 1990, with subsequent major implementations of upgraded systems commencing in 1995/96 and again in 2004.

Data were collected through interviews with between six and twelve managers, workers and consultants at each of the five case study organisations. Each respondent was selected on the basis of their involvement with some stage of the ERP implementation or for their being in a position to provide an informed evaluation of the effects of ERP post-implementation. Interviews took place between 2003 and 2005. They were semi-structured, lasted between one and two hours, were recorded and transcribed. In addition to this interview data, the case studies made available a range of pertinent documentation including internal memos, organisational newsletters and reports.

In order to examine our data, the primary analytical approach employed was that of discourse analysis (Phillips & Hardy, 2002). We define a discourse as comprising a set of interrelated texts that, along with the related practices of text production, dissemination, and consumption, brings an object or idea into being. By this we mean that discourse relates to not just spoken or written texts, but also structures and practices that underlie the texts and their production, transmission and reception (Phillips and Hardy, 2002).

Our discourse analytic approach required that we first catalogued the texts we had collected according to which case study they related to and their genre (i.e. interview, report, memo etc) (see Orlikowski and Yates, 1994; Yates and Orlikowski, 2002). We then classified the specific speech act reference, in order to see what the text or a particular section of the text was aiming to achieve. For example, was the text trying to justify, empathise, correct, explain, resist. We then matched this microanalysis with broader, institutional references, noting concurrent line-by-line references to particular
issues such as organisational strategy; efficiency, performance, and culture (see Hardy, 2001).

**Results**

The discourse analysis of the texts gathered from the five case study sites reveals the existence of three fairly distinct if inter-related discourses: an ‘original management discourse’, a ‘user discourse’ and a ‘revised management discourse’. Distinctions can be drawn between the timing of the emergence and maturation of each of these discourses, between the authorship and appropriation of the discourses and between the content and apparent aims of each of the discourses.

Our analysis attempts to be sensitive to the power dimensions and implications associated with these discourses and to be highly contextualised, in the sense that we are seeking to analyse the relationships between the implicit and explicit claims of these discourses and the experience of practice. We contend that understanding practice is critical to understanding the fate of these discourses and, in particular, the emergence of a ‘revised management discourse’.

The original management discourse apparent in all of the case study organisations portrays ERPs as highly beneficial for the organisation and specifies a range of specific organisational advantages that will flow from the implementation of an ERP. These discourses tend to be generated, sponsored and sustained by a coalition that is normally led by one or more very senior managers and that includes vendor representatives, implementation and IT consultants and members of implementation teams. The power of these discourses rely on all of the dimensions of power identified by Hardy and Phillips (2004): the formal power and authority of senior management sponsors and ‘champions’; the critical resources at their disposal, especially financial and human resources (including control over in-house and external IT consultancy resources); the network links, particularly those of the vendors and consultants experienced in ERP implementations; and their discursive legitimacy earned through the experience and success of coalition members in past organisational change initiatives. In addition to its optimistic vision of ERPs the discourse emphasises themes of standardisation, efficiency, integration and control as well as quite specific claims about the way ERPs should be implemented.

The user discourse, generated and subscribed to by direct users of the ERP and typically their direct supervisors or managers, tends to portray ERPs negatively. ERPs, or at least the specific ERP as implemented at the users’ organisation, are seen to be inefficient, ineffective and inflexible. This discourse is far more emergent and (potentially) less coherent than the original management discourse. It emerges in response to the managerial discourse without apparently drawing explicitly on existing counter-discourses of ‘well-publicised’ ERP failures. Critically for our analysis, it is sustained and empowered by practice.

The user discourse does not appear to draw potency from dimensions of formal power – users tend to be relatively powerless in formal terms, being non-managerial, non-professional workers. Supervisors and managers who come to subscribe to this discourse have relatively limited formal authority in terms of their span of control and decision-making power. Users rely somewhat on their (limited) critical resources at their disposal (largely represented by their capacity to undermine or compromise the operation of systems and processes) and in some cases appear to have drawn on network links with other users in the organisation. Users also have little discursive legitimacy, at least at the outset of an ERP implementation. Rather than drawing on these conventional dimensions of power we find that users become empowered through the test of practice. As ERPs are implemented, and as they more or less fail the test of practice, we see that users draw on this experience to elaborate their emerging discourse around the ERP. The discourse is informed by the user’s experience of the test of practice. As users they are uniquely located to be able to articulate and enact a counter-discourse which is sustained by their own practice. Users possess a degree of potential discursive legitimacy when it comes to matters of operational practice. Users
are able to escalate the significance and potency of this discursive legitimacy when it comes to operational practice by marshalling evidence of ERP failures or shortcomings and articulating and demonstrating those failures and shortcomings in the user discourse.

Management, for its part, does not simply seek to defend its original discourse. Confronted by the test of practice and the emergent and increasingly powerful user discourse, management moves to appropriate the user discourse, at least in part, and re-fashion an emergent revised management discourse. This discourse recognises the legitimacy of the user discourse, in the sense that managers profess to ‘listen’ to the complaints of users. Other claims in the user discourse are deflected, re-framed or qualified. Some aspects of the original discourse are repudiated and some members of the original coalition (ie: consultants) are criticised or even condemned. Through the generation and dissemination of this revised discourse management seeks to reclaim its discursive legitimacy and protect its power.

The conference presentation will be used to describe and analyse each of these three discourses in more detail.

Conclusion

Our application of discourse analysis to the texts used by key ERP stakeholders at our five case study organisations allows us to develop a nuanced, in-depth understanding of the power-relations underlying the processes of organising and managing ERP implementations. More specifically, our approach enables us to examine the complex, mutually constitutive relationship between discourse and power.

Analysis of the texts gathered from the five case studies revealed the existence of three distinct, though inter-related discourses: an ‘original management discourse’, a ‘user discourse’ and a ‘revised management discourse’. Distinctions can be drawn concerning the times at which these discourses emerged, their maturation, who authored and appropriated them and their respective content and apparent aims.

The three discourses identified in the study both reflect and constitute the power of key groups such as senior managers, consultants, implementation team members, process owners, supervisors, and workers on the shopfloor or frontline. In general we find that the original management discourse promoted ERPs as purveyors of ‘standardisation’ and ‘efficiency’. However, the power of this ERP discourse rested on its capacity to persuade others of its credibility / legitimacy. Across all five cases, this power waned as the claims of the proponents of the discourse failed to translate into real and lived experience (practice) for those that the discourse and its proponents were seeking to persuade – ERP users. In short, the original management discourse failed the test of practice. The ERP users constructed a counter discourse. Essentially it conveyed the view that ERPs are ineffective, inefficient and inflexible. At the same time it both disclosed and constituted diverse reactions to ERP implementations that were related to concerns about ERP privileging managerial control. These reactions included forms of resistance that manifested themselves through the persistent use of ‘workaround’ practices, and work arrangements that were consistent with the previous legacy systems, longstanding custom and practice and the defence of tacit process skills and knowledge. Confronted by the test of practice and the emergent and increasingly powerful ERP user discourse, management appropriated the user discourse and re-fashioned it to serve their own ends. This revised management discourse acknowledged the legitimacy of the user discourse, to the extent that managers professed to ‘listen’ to the complaints of users and repudiated aspects of the original discourse. In some instances they also criticised some members of the coalition (ie: consultants) that promulgated the original discourse. The revised discourse became practice in the sense that the ERP system was often customised or implemented in a revised, more limited way. Through the generation and dissemination of this revised discourse management sought to reclaim its discursive legitimacy and protect its power.

Our discourse analytic study of power relations in the context of ERP implementations shows how various discourses reflect the different power dynamics of different groups,
and can be seen to contribute to the constitution of the power of management and workers in organizations with ERPs. Moreover, it directs attention to the differential impact of the changes ERPs bring about on different organizational groups and individual members. It also highlights the diverse reactions to ERP implementations, including resistance, that are often characteristic of those members and groups (Ross, Vitale and Willcocks 2003: 112). In so doing it goes some way to explaining the reasons for these various reactions and contributes to an understanding of why ERP implementations often encounter difficulty and fail to meet the expectations of the organizations implementing them.

Our final point is more a general observation, than one specifically about ERP. The study has applied a discourse analytic framework of analysis that contributes to a better understanding of the mutually constitutive nature of power and discourse. In doing so it has brought to the fore an important issue. On the basis of the results obtained, it would appear that there may be many circumstances in organizational life where the mutually constitutive relationship between power and discourse is influenced far more by the extent to which a discourse meets the test of practice than has hitherto been appreciated.

References


Cissna, T., (1998), 'ERP software implementation brings pain with its gains', Electric Light & Power, 76 11, 43-44.


Koch, C., (2001b), 'Enterprise resource planning Information technology as a steamroller for management politics?' Journal of Organizational Change Management, 14 1, 64.


Stedman, C., (1999), 'PeopleSoft speeds ERP installations', Computerworld, 78.


"What is in a request?": The speech act performance of English Second Language learners

Lizette de Jager
University of Pretoria

Abstract
In this article an analysis of the speech act of requesting is done after a study at the University of Pretoria, South Africa. Students speaking Afrikaans and African Languages and English as a Second Language were used as respondents. This was done against the background of Speech Act Theory and Politeness Theory. Data were collected through discourse completion tests (DCT) and analysed using the CCSARP (Cross Cultural Speech Act Realization Project) methodology, originally developed by Blum-Kulka and her associates. Results initially showed no significant differences in the strategies used to realize the speech act of requesting. This seemed to support the results within the CCSARP. After a further very limited study at the Mamelodi Campus of the University of Pretoria, results showed a preference for using the most direct strategies available.

The aim of this study was to investigate whether different language groups would manifest different requesting behaviour at both the pragmalinguistic and sociopragmatic level. As this study has shown, requesting appropriately and effectively in different contexts is a challenging task for L2 learners. The findings of this study show cross-cultural differences in the realization of the speech act of requesting. This has practical educational implications in L2 learning and teaching.

Key words: speech acts, speech act theory, speech act realization, requests, politeness theory, pragmatics, communicative competence.

Introduction
There is an established body of knowledge on communicative competence as being more than just knowledge of the linguistic forms of a language, such as grammar, vocabulary and phonology. It is, rather, knowledge of the function of a language, i.e. in Hymes's terms, the knowledge of when, how, and to whom it is appropriate to use these forms (Scarcella and Brunak 1981). Social relations affect communicative interaction and have an important effect on the production and interpretation of language (Spencer-Oatey 1993). This has posed practical problems, as one of the most important tasks in acquiring an additional language is learning the rules and mechanisms underlying its appropriate use.

Speech act behaviour has been a central concern for researchers in the field of pragmatics with specific focus on the pragmatic difficulties that distinguish the behaviour of second language (L2) learners from that of target language speakers. Lack of mastery of grammar, combined with sociolinguistic confusion, can make learners appear impolite, improper or even incompetent. The study of cross-cultural pragmatics has fascinated not only language teachers but also researchers, precisely because pragmatic failure can lead to serious misunderstandings.

The fact that there appears to be great divergence between African and English rules of speaking and social conventions, and that speech act behaviour has been shown to relate closely to speakers' linguistic and cultural norms (Blum-Kulka, House and Kasper 1989), make the study of requesting particularly relevant.
Context

Language and culture usually relate to each other in such an intricate way that culture can never be treated lightly if language learners want to use the target language well. The study of speech acts (and specifically requests) has been particularly effective as they not only provide insights into social values and relationships in that they act as indicators of distance and dominance in relationships, but they also underscore the role that pragmatic competence plays in speaking a language (Wolfson, Marmor and Jones 1989). Two dimensions that are frequently referred to in pragmatics are the power and distance relations of the participants (Spencer-Oatey 1993). Brown and Levinson (1978; 1987), for example, suggest in their model of politeness that participants in a speech event consider the power and distance of their relationship when determining the degree of face-threat associated with a given speech act. Spencer-Oatey (1993) states that there is much empirical evidence available suggesting an association between language use and power and distance relations, and that most of these studies have focused on particular speech acts, such as requests.

The speech act performance of native English speakers frequently relates to their cultural tradition, "which places special emphasis on the rights and on the autonomy of every individual, which abhors interference in other people's affairs (it's none of my business), which is tolerant of individual idiosyncrasies and peculiarities, which respects everyone's privacy" (Wierzbicka 1991:30). English speakers are consistently reported to show a great preference for conventionally indirect strategies in realizing requests, such as "Could you do me a favour?" (Blum-Kulka et al. 1989; Kasper and Dahl 1991). Native African speakers' speech act behaviour seems to be very different. They seem to prefer direct forms, such as "Bring us the menu". Such a difference closely relates to the speaker's native sociocultural norms. The African speakers, with a cultural tradition that stresses respect and subordination to others, tend to use direct strategies.

Speech acts have been claimed by researchers such as Austin and Searle to operate by universal pragmatic principles (Blum-Kulka, House and Kasper 1989). Others such as Green and Wierzbicka (1991) claim that the realization of speech acts vary across cultures and languages. Yet others, such as Brown and Levinson (1978), maintain that the directness level of the speech act performance seems to be ruled by universal principles of cooperation and politeness as defined by them. When studying speech acts, our concern is mainly with the functional value, or illocutionary force, of utterances (Schmidt and Richards 1980). How is it that speakers and hearers can normally understand one another, not only with respect to the form and meaning of utterances, but also with respect to the functions of the utterances? If a hearer responds only to the form and meaning of the utterance

(1) Can you tell me the time?

and replies simply

(2) Yes, I can

s/he has not taken the illocutionary force ("request") of the utterance into consideration and/or is being willfully (or unwittingly) uncommunicative, which leads to what Thomas (1983) calls "pragmatic failure", or cross-cultural communication breakdown.

Speakers and hearers understand these functions because they understand the linguistic meaning of the utterances and because they know under what contextual conditions or appropriateness conditions (Bachman 1990) an utterance can count as a particular type of illocutionary act. Thomas (1983) applied the terms pragmalinguistic failure, or linguistically inappropriate transfer, and sociopragmatic failure, or cross-culturally different interpretations of appropriateness, to clarify this notion further. An utterance can only function effectively, i.e. have the illocutionary force intended by the speaker, if the conditions which surround the utterance are appropriate. These conditions are of various sorts and include, among others, the roles and role relationships of the participants in the speech act, their intentions, beliefs and abilities, and their knowledge of the world and of the immediate physical context in which the speech act takes place (Thomas 1983).
Where utterances, if taken literally, seem to be at odds with the appropriateness conditions, the hearer will not simply reject the utterances as illocutionary failures. S/he will assume that the speaker is adhering to the general principles of cooperative behaviour as set out by Grice (Schmidt and Richards 1980) and will try to see whether the utterances actually have an indirect rather than a direct illocutionary force. S/he will then be able to interpret indirect speech acts in the way the speaker intended them to be interpreted.

Individual illocutionary acts are defined according to “felicity conditions”, i.e. the conditions under which a particular speech act can be successfully performed (Flowerdew 1988), and may be performed indirectly. For example, requests require a future effort, they are pre-events that are made to change an event or cause an event, and they call for mitigation (Blum-Kulka, House and Kasper 1989).

The term "request" refers to getting others to think, feel, or do something you want them to, and implies both a future action and an ability on the part of the hearer to carry out the action referred to (Becker 1982). Since requests are by nature face threatening acts (Blum-Kulka 1989), it follows that some form of redress or mitigation is required in their use. To increase their degree of politeness, they will tend to be more and more indirect and consequently become more likely sources of misunderstanding in cross-cultural communication (Blum-Kulka 1987).

Non-native speakers of English as a second language (L2) will have to acquire knowledge of how principles of politeness operate in the target culture, which implies knowledge of how “face-work” in terms of Politeness Theory is carried out in accordance with target sociopragmatic and pragmalinguistic norms (Kasper 1989). As requests not only embody the pragmatic relationship of form, function and context in communication, but also vary in explicitness and politeness, and as such require inference for successful comprehension (Liebling 1988), the L2 learner has very specific difficulties in successfully realising the speech act of requesting in the target language. A L2 learner's lack of awareness of pragmatic aspects of the target language and the subsequent inappropriate transference of speech act strategies from L2 to the target language may lead to misunderstandings and pragmatic failure.

Knowledge of speech acts make up a part of the native speaker's proficiency in his language, therefore, L2 learners will have to acquire an equivalent set of speech acts relevant to their use of the second language (Flowerdew 1988). Just as the native speaker produces requests, so the L2 learner must be able to perform these acts. There is no consensus as to how speech acts are realised across languages. Indirect speech act realizations are idiomatic according to Searle (Flowerdew 1988) and will, therefore, vary from one language to another. The L2 learner will have to learn that the forms of his own language cannot necessarily be used in the target language.

If the set of speech acts and the set of realizations are the same in two languages, it is still possible that the choice of act, or the choice of realization may vary across languages according to the situation in which it is uttered. For example, if two languages both had the speech act of requesting, and the same set of realizations for requesting, it might still happen that a particular form for requesting would be used in a particular context for one language, and a different form in the same context for the other language. This brings us to the question of appropriateness of realisation forms according to situation, as investigated by Thomas (1983), who refers to the L2 learner’s difficulties in this area as sociopragmatic failure. Requests are embedded in a social interaction and a social relationship (Becker 1982). Apart from getting the hearer to fulfil the request, by being sufficiently clear and polite in making the request, the social relationship between the speaker and the hearer has to be maintained. This implies that the expected degree of indirectness has to be used, in order to secure the relationship for the future, but also that the speaker must maintain his own “face” by not presenting himself unnecessarily as lower in status than is actually the case. This proves to be particularly difficult for L2 learners who tend to be much more direct (Scarcella and Brunak 1981), who over-generalise and make use of unnecessarily long utterances (Blum-Kulka and Levenston 1987).

If a L2 speaker appears to speak fluently, i.e. seems to be grammatically competent, his
apparent impoliteness or inappropriateness will be attributed to ill-will or wilful unfriendliness and not to any linguistic deficiency (Thomas 1983). Misunderstandings of this nature are almost certainly the cause of unhelpful and offensive stereotyping, e.g. "the insincere American", or "the standoffish Briton" and is an important source of cross-cultural communication breakdown.

Regarding the issue of universality, according to the literature, native speakers of a language are able to determine the intricacies of the inferential processes involved in understanding implicit meanings in natural conversations because it is assumed that the politeness principles and the Gricean maxims are basic to human communication (Blum-Kulka and Olshtain 1986). There is a strong probability that pragmatic failure occurs because these principles and maxims are subject to intercultural variation.

Kasper (1992) states that the literature amply demonstrates learners' full access to all of the fundamental components of sociopragmatic and pragmalinguistic competence with regard to their production or comprehension of requests. Non-native speakers' ability to interpret and produce such linguistic acts testifies to a universal availability of pragmatic knowledge. Certain aspects of indirect speech act performance need not be learned again in a second language. The speaker will probably know how to draw pragmatic inferences from context. What is not universal, and which needs to be learned, are the social rules that govern the choice of linguistic forms in context. If these rules are not mastered, it will lead to pragmatic failure. The reason for L2 speakers' failure thus stems from social or cultural constraints. The social acceptability or appropriateness of a linguistic action in the L2 speaker's native culture may influence the success with which they perform the same action in the target language. It seems that two languages might possess a similar range of linguistic means for realizing speech acts, but in any given context one culture's social norms can allow for a degree of directness that might be considered offensive if transferred to the other.

Learning to realize indirect speech acts in a second language necessarily involves learning new strategies for realizing speech acts, as well as new social attitudes about the appropriateness and effectiveness of these strategies in context (Blum-Kulka 1982). A number of studies have shown that L2 speakers might fail to communicate effectively even when they have an excellent command of the target language. This pragmatic failure has been shown to be traceable to cross-linguistic differences in speech act realization rules (Blum-Kulka and Olshtain 1984).

The study

This study was performed as part of an extended assignment submitted to the Department of General Linguistics at the University of Stellenbosch in 2004 in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the MA Programme in Linguistics for the Language Professions. I wish to acknowledge the contribution of the Department and, in particular, that of Dr Christine Anthonissen in supervising the work from which this article resulted.

The purpose of this study was to gauge the similarities and differences between native and non-native speakers' realization patterns with regard to the speech act of requesting and to determine whether the findings support the claims made by the researchers working within the CCSARP framework. A critical consideration is also given of the merits and/or shortcomings of cross-cultural speech act studies such as those undertaken by Blum-Kulka and her associates.

Blum-Kulka and House (1989) used the request realisations of Hebrew, Canadian French, Argentinean Spanish, Australian English and German native speakers to study the choice of request strategies. They found that all the languages made full use of all request strategies, but did so with varying frequency. The overall distribution along the scale of indirectness followed similar patterns in all languages, but the specific proportions in the choices between the more direct and less direct strategies were culture-specific. For example, Argentinian Spanish speakers were found to be the most direct, while speakers of Australian English were found to be least direct.

For the purposes of this study it was decided that the theoretical framework of the
CCSARP project (Cross Cultural Speech Act Realization Project) as developed by Shosana Blum-Kulka and her associates (Blum-Kulka and Ohlstain 1984) would be particularly useful since it was developed specifically to compare requests across a number of languages. The detailed coding scheme of this project would also facilitate the testing of the claim that request strategies are universal. The analysis followed in this study to classify the different strategies is based on the categorizations of the head act-supportive move of Blum-Kulka et al. (1989), which will be explained in 3.3.

**Method**

In an attempt to determine what knowledge or skills underlie the successful production of speech acts, particularly requests, in a second language, I studied how non-native speakers of a second language apply the speech act of requesting in conversational situations.

The instrument used was a discourse completion test (DCT), originally developed for Hebrew speakers (Blum-Kulka, House and Kasper 1989:13). I used a reduced version of this CCSARP discourse completion test, i.e. I used only those situations that specifically focused on requests. The analysis of the results is based on the CCSARP coding scheme.

I discarded responses which showed that subjects had misunderstood the situation. The test consists of 10 scripted dialogues that represent socially differentiated situations. Each dialogue is preceded by a short description of the situation, specifying the setting, and the social distance between participants and their status relative to each other, followed by an incomplete dialogue. Respondents were asked to complete the dialogue, thereby providing the speech act aimed at. Not all dialogues contain a response to the missing turn (see Addendum A).

**Respondents**

The respondents in the study were thirty non-native speakers of English as a second language whose native languages varied from Afrikaans to Zulu, North Sotho and Xhosa.

All the students were enrolled at the University of Pretoria. As a control group, similar data were collected from fifteen native speakers of English.

By specifically choosing students, as much homogeneity as possible in social class, level of income, educational background and age was ensured. The samples consisted of equal numbers of males and females. All the subjects were assured of total confidentiality and participated freely and willingly.

**Data analysis**

Responses were analysed using the CCSARP coding scheme (Blum-Kulka et al. 1989) in order to determine whether a comparison from the different groups was possible. This scheme pays particular attention to the Head Act of the request, 'the minimal unit which can realize a request' (Blum-Kulka 1989:275). All the responses were coded according to the CCSARP's 9-level scale for analysis of request strategy. This ranges from most direct (1), basically commands, to least direct (9), mild hints (see Addendum B). This scale represents a cross-culturally valid scale of indirectness (Blum-Kulka 1987). These 9 categories were then grouped into 3 major levels of directness: 1-5 form the most direct or explicit level; 6-7 form the conventionally indirect level; and 8-9 the non-conventionally indirect level or hints (Blum-Kulka 1989). This criterion of directness is very important since one of the universals of request strategies is thought to be a close link between indirectness and politeness (De Kadt 1992).

The unit of analysis for the data provided by the DCT is the "discourse-filler", e.g. the utterance supplied by the subject in completing the test item. These units of analysis are the constituents of a request sequence, which include alerters, the head act and supportive moves and form the basis for the analysis.

**Alerters**
An alerter is an opening element preceding the actual request, of which the function is to alert the hearer’s attention to the ensuing speech act (CCSARP Coding Manual 1989).

Below are the types of alerters that could be used in requests. As all the types listed in the CCSARP Coding Manual were not present in the data, only a few examples taken from the manual are provided below.

- **Title/role**, e.g. professor, waiter
- **Surname**, e.g. Johnson
- **First name**, e.g. Judith
- **Nickname**, e.g. Judy
- **Endearment term**, e.g. honey
- **Offensive term**, e.g. stupid cow
- **Pronoun**, e.g. you
- **Attention getter**, e.g. excuse me

**Combinations of the above**

### The Head Act

A head act is the minimal unit that can realise a request, and is the core of the request sequence (CCSARP Coding Manual 1989). Head acts can vary on two dimensions, namely strategy type and perspective. The head act can also be internally modified.

Strategy type, or request strategy is the obligatory choice of the level of directness by which the request is realised (CCSARP Coding Manual 1989). Three levels of directness can be used in requesting strategies, namely (i) direct strategies; (ii) conventionally indirect strategies; and (iii) non-conventionally indirect strategies. As stated before, all the responses were coded according to the CCSARP’s 9-level scale for analysis of request strategy (see Addendum B).

Requests vary with regard to the choice of perspective. The following categories make up request perspective:

- **Speaker oriented** (e.g. "can I…?")
- **Hearer oriented** (e.g. "will you…?")
- **Speaker and hearer oriented or inclusive** (e.g. "we…”)
- **Impersonal** (e.g. the use of people, they, one as neutral agents)

### Supportive moves

The modifications discussed thus far are internal, i.e. they operate within the head act. In addition, the speaker might also support or aggravate the request by supportive moves.

Supportive moves do not affect the utterance used for realising the request, but rather the context in which it is embedded. Supportive moves therefore indirectly modify illocutionary force (Blum-Kulka and Olshtain 1984).

Supportive moves can be divided into **mitigating** supportive moves, e.g. *Promise of reward*: to increase the likelihood of the hearer’s compliance with the speaker’s request, a reward due on fulfilment of the request is announced, e.g. Could you give me a lift home? *I’ll pitch in on some gas,* and **aggravating** supportive moves, e.g. *Threat*: to ensure compliance with the request, a speaker threatens the hearer with potential consequences arising from non-compliance with the request, e.g. Move that car if you don’t want a ticket!

For the purposes of this study, the discourse filler was analysed according to the following categories:

1. **Strategy type**
Results and Discussion

Similarities and differences between native and non-native speakers' realization patterns

The CCSARP coding method provided a way to organize the broad range of strategies into more specific categories. This made a comparison between the distribution of strategies used in different situations possible. Although a broad range of requesting strategies was found from both non-native and native speakers, the overall tendency among respondents was to use conventionally indirect strategies in the realization of the speech act.

Strategy type

The native speakers used the full range of strategy types in their responses, i.e. direct strategies (21.8%), conventionally indirect strategies (70.6%), and non-conventionally indirect strategies (7.6%). The most frequently used substrategy was preparatory (65.5%), followed by mood derivable (12.6%), and strong hints (7.6%).

![Figure 1: Native speakers (University of Pretoria)](image-url)
The non-native speakers used the full range of strategy types in their responses, i.e. direct strategies (24.7%), conventionally indirect strategies (67.6%) and non-conventionally indirect strategies (7.7%). The most frequently used substrategy was preparatory (59%), followed by mood derivables (21.3%) and want statements (8.6%).

![Percentage of respondents](image)

**Figure 2: Non-native speakers (University of Pretoria)**

**Perspective**

The native speakers used three request perspectives, hearer oriented, speaker oriented and impersonal. The most frequently used request perspective was hearer oriented (59.7%), while the requests were speaker oriented in 37.8% of the instances. Only three requests (2.5%) were impersonal, while no inclusive requests were recorded.

The non-native speakers used three request perspectives, hearer oriented, speaker oriented and inclusive. The most frequently used request perspective was speaker oriented (66.7%), while the requests were hearer oriented in 31.6% of the instances. Only two requests (1.7%) were inclusive, but no impersonal requests were recorded.

**Supportive moves**

The native speakers used supportive moves in 36.1% of the requests, of which 88.4% were mitigating supportive moves, 7.0% were aggravating supportive moves, and 4.6% were a combination of these.

The non-native speakers used supportive moves in 53.6% of the requests, of which 92.2% were mitigating supportive moves, 5.9% were aggravating supportive moves, and 1.9% were a combination of these.

Both groups were found to modify their requests, both internally and externally, and in similar ways as identified in the CCSARP framework. With regard to non-native speakers, it was found that their responses were generally longer than those of native speakers because they contained more and longer supportive moves, as well as hesitations.

1. Respondent no. 8: "Please, do you mind, are you maybe going in our direction?"
2. Respondent no. 6: "Don't you think it would be better if you get it cut?"

Non-native speakers also used more justifications and explanations given before the
head act.

(3) Respondent no. 10: "So it won't bother you, are you sure you don't mind if I borrow them?"

(4) Respondent no. 23: "I'm going to make an appointment at the hairdresser. You have to cut it."

Non-native speakers also tended to respond more frequently from a speaker-oriented perspective.

(5) Respondent no. 11: "Can I borrow your notes?"

(6) Respondent no. 20: "Can I have a ride with you?"

It would seem from the results that the tendency to produce requests in the conventionally indirect manner directly correlates with the level of politeness respondents wanted to achieve, since this was most evident in situations where social distance and power were most obvious. This also supports the claims made by researchers working within the CCSARP framework.

**Correlation with the CCSARP framework**

Initially it seemed from the data that there were no significant differences in the speech act realization strategies of the groups in this study. This was interesting to note, since it was contrary to what was predicted. Based on personal, experiential evidence of the Afrikaans and African languages, it was hypothesised that these groups would show different speech act realization patterns than those in the CCSARP framework. However, on first inspection, it seemed that this study revealed similar correlations with studies done within the CCSARP framework.

Possible inferences from the data were analysed to try to explain this phenomena. Superficially, the findings seemed to support the claims of universality of speech act realization among cultures. On the other hand, a possible reason for this phenomena could be that in choosing such a homogenous group where most of the learners were at a similar level of education and urbanization, and had reached a fair level of proficiency and communicative competence in the target language, the cultural differences hypothesised to be in place, were in actual fact levelled out. This would explain the fact that the findings correlated with the findings of Blum-Kulka and her associates.

In an attempt to find proof for these hypotheses, a further very limited pilot study was made at the Mamelodi Campus of the same university. These students all speak a varying range of African languages and are predominantly taught in their mother tongue, whereas the first sample was taken from a predominantly white, Afrikaans university. Ten students were asked to complete the discourse completion test, of which only 6 could be used.

The results from these data showed that the responses from this group differed from those found in the first study, in that they used the most direct or explicit strategy to realise the speech act. These respondents made use of strategies in the form of imperatives.

(7) Respondent no. 44: "Waiter, bring the menu."

(8) Respondent no. 39: "Move your car."

These respondents used the full range of strategy types in their responses, but differently to those in the first study, i.e. direct strategies (63,2%), conventionally indirect strategies (24,3%) and non-conventionally indirect strategies (12,5%). The most frequently used substrategy was performatives (59%), followed by obligation statements (21,3%) and imperatives (8,6%).
These respondents used all four request perspectives, hearer oriented, speaker oriented, impersonal and inclusive. The most frequently used request perspective was speaker oriented (72.3%), while the requests were hearer oriented in 22.6% of the instances, followed by inclusive (2.5%) and impersonal (2.5%).

These respondents used supportive moves in 65.6% of the requests, of which 73.2% were mitigating supportive moves, 9.8% were aggravating supportive moves, and 17% were a combination of these.

The results from this second study would support the hypothesis that L2 learners tend to realize the speech act by using the most direct strategies. Overall, it would seem that the findings of this study substantiate the CCSARP findings, where conventionally indirect requests were most frequent in most of the languages studied. This would also support the notion that conventional indirectness is a universal category for requests.

However, in a conventionally black community where exposure to the target language has perhaps not been optimal, a tendency to use the most direct strategy to realise the speech act is prevalent. It is obvious that further detailed research is indicated.

**Critical consideration of the merits and/or shortcomings of cross-cultural speech act studies**

Much has been written about speech acts and speech act theory, and several studies such as those by Beebe and Cummings (1985), Rintell and Mitchell (1989), Kasper and Dahl (1991) and Rose (1992) have dealt with the validity of data elicitation techniques such as the discourse completion test (DCT) (Rose 1994). Like all methods used in the collection of sociolinguistic data, they have advantages as well as disadvantages. One major advantage is that it allows the researcher to control specific variables in the situation (Wolfson et al.1989). The researcher can include almost anything in the questionnaire descriptions, thus leading subjects to take these factors into account in their responses. Another advantage is that these tests allow researchers to collect a considerable amount of data on a given type of speech behaviour within a relatively short time. This fact has led researchers to believe that the value of what can be gained by this method outweighs the problems inherent in the direct elicitation of sociolinguistic data. It is, however, still not certain whether such techniques are cross-culturally a valid means of data collection. Most of the speech act studies have been done in Western or Anglo-European contexts and relatively few in non-Western contexts. The claim of universality made by researchers such as Searle and Austin, and others, in the absence of universal
data are, therefore, suspect to say the least and should be treated with caution (Rose 1994).

Studies in pragmatics are extremely controversial. It is very difficult to collect enough examples of cross-linguistically and cross-culturally comparable data through observation of authentic conversation (Kasper and Dahl 1991). On the other hand, data elicitation techniques such as DCTs are tightly controlled and might exclude precisely the kinds of conversational and interpersonal phenomena that might shed light on the use and development of language. There is a great need for more authentic data which have been collected where the speech event takes place in more natural environments. It seems that future studies would benefit by including ethnographic data on subjects’ natural use of requests to contrast with data from controlled tests.

The major aim of studies such as these has been to compare data for cross-linguistic studies and to investigate the sociolinguistic problems that L2 learners face. The fact that L2 speakers tend to realize speech acts inappropriately in the target language, even though they may have excellent command of the grammatical structures of that language, has given rise to a serious need for studies of this nature. By analysing data elicited through questionnaires such as DCTs, it is possible to gain considerable information concerning the speech act forms regarded as most appropriate by members of a particular cultural group.

Requests serve as an extremely useful means of studying the development of pragmatic competence in that they embody the pragmatic relationship of form, function and context in communication (Liebling 1988). They also vary in explicitness and politeness ranging from imperatives to hints, which may require inference for successful comprehension and production.

Studies of this nature could not only provide cultural information, but could shed light on the universality of linguistic theories developed largely on the basis of Anglo-European languages. Furthermore, studies such as the one undertaken by De Kadt (1992) and the one reported on in this article, add to existing knowledge about the various speech acts in African languages and can only be of great benefit to L2 learners and contribute to better cross-cultural understanding in our country.

**Conclusion**

The degree and nature of possible cross-cultural variance in speech act realization are related to general cultural preferences along the direct/indirect continuum (Blum-Kulka and Olshtein 1986). The findings point to cross-cultural differences in the levels of directness chosen to realize the speech act. Variations in the use of speech acts may be subject to the effect of social parameters. Blum-Kulka found that the degree to which requests are made indirect varies with the relative power of the addressee, so that the least direct requests are made to those in the most socially dominant positions (Wolfson 1989). Degrees of social distance and power between participants are among the most important factors in determining variation in speech acts. Cultural differences must, therefore, be taken into consideration. Speech act studies have been done against the background of a universal ‘natural logic’ (Lakoff 1975), a universal ‘logic of conversation’ (Grice 1975) or universal rules of politeness (Searle 1975). As discussed in this article this line of interpretation must be seen as highly ethnocentric. However, the generalisations suggested in the above-mentioned works provide useful insights into mechanisms of language use and should not be discarded altogether (Wierzbicka 2003). When it seems that speakers select more direct strategies for request acts, it cannot be simply assumed that these speakers may be considered impolite, or even that their cultural system is organised differently and therefore they have different ways of expressing politeness. Different pragmatic norms reflect different cultural values (Wierzbicka 1991).

The aim of this study was to investigate whether different language groups would manifest different requesting behaviour at both the pragmalinguistic and sociopragmatic level. As this study has shown, requesting appropriately and effectively in different
contexts is a challenging task for L2 learners. In fact, it is an essential aspect of communicative competence that cannot be treated lightly, because the ability to make appropriate requests can help learners engage in meaningful social interaction. It can also help greatly to reduce the possibility of misunderstandings in intercultural communication.

The findings of this study have practical educational implications in L2 learning and teaching. L2 learners will have to understand pragmatic factors of the target culture better in order to speak grammatically and also to interpret appropriately what they hear. L2 teachers will have to incorporate many cross-cultural pragmatic factors into their teaching in order to address learners’ possible communicative problems. Studies like these contribute to existing research in that they help to analyse patterns of social behaviour, and thus provide insights into the forms and rules that speakers use (Ming-Chung 2004). Pragmatic transfer, pragmatic failure and sociolinguistic miscommunication play a critical part in the field of intercultural communication. As such, the findings of this study contribute to our understanding of why and how communication may break down between L2 learners and speakers of the target language. While we may not be able to eliminate completely all the cultural misunderstandings, we may be able to reduce them by well-planned, enlightened education that focuses its attention on the cultural meanings behind speech act behaviour.

References


Addendum A

Discourse Completion Test

Thank you for taking part in this research project. Please be assured that all information will be kept confidential. Any results stemming from this questionnaire will only be used as part of a discussion in an academic article.

Please read through each "situation" in the Discourse Completion Test very carefully.

Indicate your answers by drawing a circle (O) around a number in a shaded box or by writing your answer in the shaded space provided.

Complete each dialogue by filling in the missing turn.
Please understand there are no right or wrong answers.
Please do not discuss your answers with anybody. Just fill in each missing turn in the way you feel is appropriate to the situation.

Example:

At the University

A university professor asks a student to give his lecture a week earlier than scheduled.

Professor: I have to be in Italy earlier than expected. I'll have to move everything up on my schedule. That includes your lecture.
Student: Oh no, but I am not ready yet!
Professor: Sorry. It can't be helped.

...  

Student: O.K.

In the above instance the required missing turn could be similar to any of the following:

Could you present your lecture a week earlier, please?
Please present your lecture a week earlier.
I'd like you to give your lecture next week.

Any one of these turns could be written into the shaded box above!
Respondent

Section A

1. What is your age in completed years?

2. What is your gender?

   Male 1
   Female 2

3. What is your home language?

   English 1
   Afrikaans 2
   An African language 3

Section B Discourse Completion Test

Fill in what you consider is the appropriate missing turn, in the shaded space provided, in each of the following:

4. At the restaurant
   John: What would you like to eat?
   Mary: I don't know, let's have a look at the menu. Waiter,…

5. Among friends
   Jane: I found a great apartment, but I have a problem. I have to pay the landlady R500-00 deposit by tonight.
   Susan: And you haven't got it?
   Jane: No, I'll get my salary only next week.
Susan: Sorry, no, I'm out of money right now.

6. **Mother and son**

Peter: Mom, where is the hairbrush?
Mother: In the bathroom. Peter, your hair is down to your knees!

Peter: I don't want a haircut!

7. **At a teachers' meeting**

Teacher: When’s the next meeting?
Principal: Next Wednesday at 8:00. We’ll have to notify the people who aren't here tonight.

James: O.K. I'll do it.

8. **On the street**

Diane: We are going to miss the train. Let's ask somebody how to get to the station.
Robert: I hate asking people in the street. You ask.
Diane: O.K. I'll do it.

Excuse me,...

9. **In a student's residence**

*A student's roommate left their flat's kitchen in a terrible mess the previous night. The student wants his roommate to clean it up.*

Richard: You really left this place in a mess last night.

Jerry: I'll start in a minute.

10. **On campus**

*A student missed a lecture and asks another student for her lecture notes.*
Judy: I missed yesterday's lecture.

Wendy: Sure, but let me have them back before tomorrow.

11. After the show
A student asks people living on the same street for a ride home.
Lee: I've missed my lift. You live on my street, don't you?

Driver: Of course, squeeze in!

12. In town
A policeman asks a driver to move her car.
Policeman: You can't park here, lady, this is a loading zone.
Driver: But I won't be long. I'm waiting for my friend, she'll be here any minute.

Policeman: Lady, ...

Driver: O.K!

13. On campus
A student asks a lecturer for an extension on an assignment
Judith: Excuse me, Professor Smith. I'm sorry I haven't yet handed in my assignment. I have had pneumonia and am only now feeling better.

Professor: Certainly. Just bring me your medical certificate.

Thank you for your cooperation and time
Addendum B
Coding Manual

1. Strategy Type

**Head Act** (the request proper: "Could I borrow your notes?")

coding by strategy type and perspective:

- **strategy type** (choice of level of directness by which request is realized – directive type – on the direct/indirect continuum):
  
  9-point scale of mutually exclusive categories:
  
  1. imperatives ("do it!"
  2. performatives ("I am asking you to do it/Are you ready to do it?"
  3. hedged performatives ("I would like to ask you to do it"
  4. obligation statements ("You'll have to do it"
  5. want statements ("I really wish you'd do it/ I'd like you to do it"
  6. suggestory formulae ("How about doing it?"
  7. query preparatory ("Could you do it, please?/ Can I please…?")
  8. strong hints (Intent: getting a lift home: "Will you be going home now?"
  9. mild hints (Intent: getting hearer to clean the kitchen: "You've been busy in here, haven't you?")

these strategy types vary in directness from 1. being most direct and 9. being most indirect.

- **Perspective** (choice of perspective affects social meaning)
  
  speaker-oriented
  hearer-oriented
  both
  impersonal

2. Supportive moves (mitigating or aggravating the request)

Optionally elaborated with **internal modifiers** (downgraders – "do you think" "please", mitigating the effect of the request, or upgraders – "I'm sure" "terrible mess" you'd better", increasing the effect of the request) and/or **external modifiers** (justifications or reasons).

mitigating: pre-information ("I missed class yesterday" "Can I ask you something?" "Could you do me a favour?"

post information ("I promise to return them by tomorrow"

aggravating: threats, insults, moralizing, etc.

Coding by presence (or absence)
A Content Analysis of Three File-selves ®

Geoff Denham
University of Canberra

Alasdair Roy
University of Canberra

Abstract
Rom Harre argued that all people, in order to be fully human, must consciously operate within a personal, social and physical mode - and, accordingly, can be considered to have a personal-self, a social-self, and a physical-self. Harre also suggested that that people may also exist as a collection of documents and images - or, as a file-self. This paper considers a recent study in which a content analysis of four file-selves was undertaken, using the Leximancer Text Mining and Mapping Program - a computer program which generates a two dimensional map of the primary concepts contained within a text, including the relative frequency of each concept, as well as the placement and meaning behind each concept. In undertaking the study, descriptive texts generated from the four file-selves were analysed, with a comparison between those texts written by clinicians with only access to the file-self, and those texts written by a clinician with access to the files-selves and the real people subject of the files. Differences between the concepts generated, and their placement and meaning are discussed, as are future research opportunities emerging from the study.

The results of the Leximancer content analysis are presented within a broad discussion of the implications of those results. In order to follow the research process, the reader is asked to examine each of the twelve written summaries provided by the four writers (the three practitioners, and the researcher), which are included in Appendix 2. In a further attempt to convey a clearer understanding of the research process, the findings are presented chronologically in the order in which they were discovered, experienced, and interpreted by the researcher.

Most Frequent Concepts
Leximancer automatically extracts the most frequent concepts contained in a document (text), with the program capable of synthesising anywhere between one and 1000 concepts. In undertaking this analysis, and due to the relative brevity of each written summary (approximately 250 - 450 words), the number of concepts scale was set at 10. The following three tables provide a summary of the five most frequent concepts employed by each of the four writers to describe each of the three subjects - Neil, Tracey and Liam. Concepts are presented by subject, and are coloured according to their thematic grouping. Thematic groupings are, simply speaking, the contextual similarity within which concepts occur. For example, the concepts mother, husband and family may not be related entities (in that they do not appear close together in the text), however they may appear within the same context in the text (for example, love). That is, whenever the concepts mother, husband, and family appear, they are not co-located in the text, however, they both appear in the broader context of love. If this was the case, then the three concepts would all be the same colour.

Additionally, the relative count of each concept is included. The relative count of a concept is a measure of how frequently that concept occurs in the text - relative to other concepts. For

9 Names have been changed to protect the anonymity of the subjects.
example, if the relative count of one concept is 100%, and the relative count of a second concept is 80%, that means that if the first concept appears 10 times in the text, then the second concept appears 8 times. The figure is a useful indicator of how common any particular concept is within a text, and, accordingly, whether any particular concept (or type of concept) dominates the text. It is important however not to conflate frequency and importance.

Table 1: Five most frequent concepts for Neil, including relative count of concepts. Thematic groupings of concepts are indicated by colour.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Practitioner One (363 words)</th>
<th>Practitioner Two (200 words)</th>
<th>Practitioner Three (292 words)</th>
<th>Researcher (456 words)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>trauma</td>
<td>Neil (100%)</td>
<td>support (100%)</td>
<td>relationship (100%)</td>
<td>Neil (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neil</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
<td>unclear (100%)</td>
<td>person (100%)</td>
<td>great (33%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>violence</td>
<td>ongoing (100%)</td>
<td>appears (100%)</td>
<td>mother (80%)</td>
<td>happy (33%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>appears</td>
<td>young (66%)</td>
<td>appears (100%)</td>
<td>notes (80%)</td>
<td>capacity (16%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disease</td>
<td>(50%)</td>
<td></td>
<td>case (80%)</td>
<td>should (16%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Five most frequent concepts for Tracey, including relative count of concepts. Thematic groupings of concepts are indicated by colour.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Practitioner One (402 words)</th>
<th>Practitioner Two (219 words)</th>
<th>Practitioner Three (220 words)</th>
<th>Researcher (382 words)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>report</td>
<td>Tracey (100%)</td>
<td>seeking (100%)</td>
<td>reports (100%)</td>
<td>Tracey (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracey</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
<td>young (100%)</td>
<td>person (100%)</td>
<td>sexual (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>presents</td>
<td>woman (100%)</td>
<td>presents (100%)</td>
<td>review (66%)</td>
<td>young (66%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>states</td>
<td>elaboration (33%)</td>
<td>appears (100%)</td>
<td>attention (66%)</td>
<td>friends (33%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Five most frequent concepts for Liam, including relative count of concepts. Thematic groupings of concepts are indicated by colour.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Practitioner One (296 words)</th>
<th>Practitioner Two (250 words)</th>
<th>Practitioner Three (324 words)</th>
<th>Researcher (359 words)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>diagnosis</td>
<td>limited (100%)</td>
<td>presents (100%)</td>
<td>person (100%)</td>
<td>Liam (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>issues</td>
<td>presents (100%)</td>
<td>limited (100%)</td>
<td>lack (80%)</td>
<td>love (60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liam</td>
<td>intellectual (100%)</td>
<td>presents (100%)</td>
<td>disability (80%)</td>
<td>great (60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>emotional</td>
<td>system (100%)</td>
<td>criminal (66%)</td>
<td>esteem (80%)</td>
<td>mother (40%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>identity</td>
<td>(60%)</td>
<td></td>
<td>low (80%)</td>
<td>system (40%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The striking feature here relates to the naming of the subject. The primary concept used by the researcher - in all three texts - was the subject's name (Neil, Tracey or Liam). This contrasts sharply with the primary concepts used by the three practitioners (both individually, and as a group) - with none of the nine texts written by a practitioner showing the subjects name as the primary concept. Furthermore, two of the three practitioners (Practitioner Two and Practitioner Three) never used the subject's name as a concept, and the one practitioner that did (Practitioner One), used it twice as the second top concept (for both Neil and Tracey),
and once as the third top concept (Liam).

Similarly, the concepts Neil and Liam (as used by the researcher), were not only the primary concepts in the text, however they were both also the most frequently occurring concepts in their respective texts. That is, for the subject Neil, the concept Neil was approximately 3 times as common as the second top concept (great), and, for the subject Liam, the concept Liam was approximately 1.5 times as common as the second top concept (love). Again, this contrasts with the practitioners, who, as a group, tended to have little overall variability between the relative frequency of each concept. Specifically, of the researchers fifteen concepts, four (27%) had a relative count of 100%, whereas twenty-five of the practitioner’s forty-five concepts (55%) had a relative count of 100%. This means, simply, that the researcher tended to have one concept which dominated in each text, whereas practitioners tended to have two or more concepts of equal dominance within each text.

Interestingly, while Practitioner Three never used the subject’s name as a concept, he did use the concept person, which, on the surface, appears to have some qualities in common with the concept of a person’s name (Neil, Tracey, or Liam). Additionally, in one of Practitioner Three’s three texts, the concept person was the primary concept. The proposal that the concept person may be similar to the concept of the person’s name will, however, be further explored at a later stage.

It appears that knowing, or having experience of, a young person at firsthand may have an impact on the nature, frequency and dominance of concepts used in a description of that subject, including how that subject is named. Specifically, such knowledge may facilitate a more intimate or personal description, with the subject becoming a real person with a real name, not just an abstract entity without a name.

Finally, and prior to moving to further analysis of the data using the Leximancer program, all sixty concepts were read aloud to an independent child protection worker with no knowledge whatsoever of this research project, with that worker being asked “if you heard this concept used in a professional case description of a young person, would you think the concept: positive, negative or neutral?”. While the limitations of such a methodology are evident, it was intended that the results might provide a basic emotional evaluation of each concept, including insight into how different concepts in a text might be perceived (and, therefore, interpreted and acted upon) by an external reader, or receiver, of that text.

For the researcher, 40% of the concepts were rated as positive, 0% as negative, and 60% as neutral. In comparison, for the three practitioners (as a group), 13% of concepts were rated as positive, 20% as negative, and 67% as neutral. While hesitating to generalise these results, they do suggest that knowledge, or experience of a person’s real self may invoke more positive concepts, and, accordingly, a more positive view, or description, of the person. At the very least they are provocative results.

**Entity Vocabularies**

One of the more useful features of the Leximancer program is the capacity to generate an entity vocabulary for each concept. The entity vocabulary of a concept is a list of those words (not concepts) which most frequently appear next to, or near to, that concept as it appears in the text. The vocabulary provides valuable insight into those words which surround or support a concept.

For example, if the entity vocabulary of the concept mother included words such as love, supportive, husband and elderly, this would mean that wherever the concept mother appeared in the text, the words love, supportive, husband and elderly tended to be close by. Such an entity vocabulary, quite obviously, provides a different meaning to the concept mother, than if the entity vocabulary was made up of the words angry, drugs, prostitute and young.

Given the interest already generated by the subject’s name as a concept, and to avoid analysing all sixty concepts (a mammoth task), a decision was made to examine only the entity vocabularies of all of the subjects’ names which emerged as concepts within the texts (Neil, Tracey and Liam). Similarly, as the concept person may have some qualities in common with the concept of a person’s name, the entity vocabulary for the concept person
(as used by Practitioner Three) was also examined. Such an examination may inform as to whether the concept *person* (as used by Practitioner Three) tends to be surrounded and supported by the same type of words which surround and support the use of the concepts *Neil, Tracey, and Liam* (as used by Practitioner One). If so, it may indicate that the use of the concept *person* is, overall, similar - but not quite the same as - the use of a subject’s name as a concept.

**Table 4: Entity vocabularies for the concepts Neil and person - top seven words.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NEIL/PERSON</th>
<th>Practitioner One</th>
<th>Practitioner Two</th>
<th>Practitioner Three</th>
<th>Researcher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>appears</td>
<td></td>
<td>not applicable</td>
<td>positive</td>
<td>interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disease</td>
<td></td>
<td>(did not use either the concept Neil, or the concept person)</td>
<td>relationship</td>
<td>future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>unclear</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>mother</td>
<td>behaviour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>life</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>case</td>
<td>sense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>times</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>drugs</td>
<td>happy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>report</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>notes</td>
<td>sad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>trauma</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>relationships</td>
<td>mother</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 5: Entity vocabularies for the concepts Tracey and person - top seven words.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TRACEY/PERSON</th>
<th>Practitioner One</th>
<th>Practitioner Two</th>
<th>Practitioner Three</th>
<th>Researcher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>recommended</td>
<td></td>
<td>not applicable</td>
<td>report</td>
<td>sexual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>states</td>
<td></td>
<td>(did not use either the concept Tracey, or the concept person)</td>
<td>mental</td>
<td>attachments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>issues</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>behaviour</td>
<td>woman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>report</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>mentions</td>
<td>father</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>requires</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>reports</td>
<td>develops</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>presents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>diagnosis</td>
<td>home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>family</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>drugs</td>
<td>physical</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 6: Entity vocabularies for the concepts Liam and person - top seven words.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LIAM/PERSON</th>
<th>Practitioner One</th>
<th>Practitioner Two</th>
<th>Practitioner Three</th>
<th>Researcher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>issues</td>
<td></td>
<td>not applicable</td>
<td>behaviour</td>
<td>sense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>diagnosis</td>
<td></td>
<td>(did not use either the concept Liam, or the concept person)</td>
<td>esteem</td>
<td>system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>presents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>disability</td>
<td>great</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>multiple</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>lack</td>
<td>young</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>exploration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>anti-social</td>
<td>deep</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>accident</td>
<td>love</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>depressive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>negative</td>
<td>range</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Close inspection of the elements in this table reveals some interesting patterns. The first of these is that the decision to treat Practitioner Three’s use of the concept *person* as a surrogate for the subject’s name appears to be justified by a certain comparability suggested by the entity vocabularies of the two concepts. That is, the entity vocabularies of the two concepts (*person* and the subject’s name) appear to derive from a similar language register.

Secondly, the entity vocabularies for the concepts *Neil, Tracey, Liam* and *person* (as used by
Practitioners One and Three), tended to include words with a somewhat more negative or clinical character or tone than the words which made up the entity vocabularies of the concepts Neil, Tracey and Liam (as used by the researcher). For example, the entity vocabularies for Practitioner One included such words as disease, trauma, and depressive, and the entity vocabularies for Practitioner Three included such words as drugs, disability, anti-social and negative. In some contrast, the entity vocabularies for the researcher included the words future, happy, great and love.

Such differences illustrate Kleinman’s (1978) work on concepts and models of medical systems - in particular, his differentiation between disease and illness. Kleinman argues that disease and illness are simply different ways of constructing and describing sickness, with the construct of disease representing “a malfunctioning in, or maladaptation of, biological and/or psychological processes” (Kleinman, 1978, p.88), and the construct of illness representing “the experience of disease, or perceived disease, and the societal reaction to disease” (Kleinman, 1978, p.88). That is, disease represents a clinical malfunction, whereas illness represents the total experience of human suffering. Thus, illness includes an account of the situational context of a sickness, how such a context is perceived by the person experiencing the sickness, as well as how such a context exists within broader social relationships.

The construct of disease more readily fits within a clinical or medical perception of sickness, whereas the construct of illness more readily fits within a humanistic or socio-psychological perception of the state of sickness, or, as Kleinman notes, “a more personal, non-technical idiom concerned with the life problems that result from sickness” (Kleinman, 1978, p.88). In line with Kleinman’s model, it appears that the entity vocabularies used by Practitioners One and Three (disease, trauma, depressive, drugs, disability, and anti-social) fit more readily within the disease model, whereas the entity vocabularies used by the researcher (future, happy, great and love) fit more readily within the illness model.

As before, it may be that knowing, or having firsthand experience of a young person, may have an impact on the entity vocabularies of concepts used, particularly if such concepts are the person’s name. It would appear that the use of a disease model register of language is facilitated by ‘distance’ from the flesh and blood person. Close-up and personal encounters problematise this language use, though it is probably facilitated when the patient is prepared also to also use this language register. Our particular study focused on readings of files on young people at risk, both because they were available, but also because the institutional accounts embodied in file selves and the lives as lead by the young people appeared most disparate.

Related Entities

Another feature of the Leximancer program is the capacity to identify related entities for each concept. Related entities are concepts which co-occur within a text. For example, the concept mother may be strongly related to the concept husband, yet less strongly related to the concept children. This means that, while the three concepts are different (they have different thesauri, and have different entity vocabularies), the concept mother tends to occur nearby to the concept husband, and nearby, yet less so, to the concept children. To an extent, it is this relation between the concepts which determines each concept’s location on the map - with all concepts exerting a continual pull on each other until a relational balance between all concepts is found. This feature is useful in determining the placement, and, therefore, the level of association, between concepts within the same text.

The related entities of a concept may be extracted in one of two ways - the first, and the most visually rewarding, is to double click on a concept as it appears on the map. This produces a set of coloured lines between concepts, with the lines indicating which concepts are related to which other concepts. The brighter the colour of the line, the stronger the relationship. Related entities may also be extracted by using a feature of the program which allows the user to actively search for examples within the text where two (or more) concepts co-occur.

It follows that an analysis of the related entities of all of the names which appeared as concepts within the texts (Neil, Tracey and Liam), as well as the concept person, will provide a mapping of the associations or relationships, those concepts have with other concepts.
Specifically, it will indicate, whether, for example, the concept Neil, when used by Practitioner One, is associated with the same concepts as when used by the researcher.

The following table provides a summary of the two most frequently related entities for the concept of the subject’s name, or the concept person.

Table 7: Two most frequent related entities for the concept of the subject’s name, and the concept person - concept in bold and italics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practitioner One</th>
<th>Practitioner Two</th>
<th>Practitioner Three</th>
<th>Researcher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>trauma (Neil)</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>relationship (person)</td>
<td>great (Neil)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>violence</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>mother</td>
<td>happy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>report (Tracey)</td>
<td>presents</td>
<td>report (person)</td>
<td>sexual (Tracey)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>review</td>
<td>young</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>diagnosis (Liam)</td>
<td>issues</td>
<td>lack (person)</td>
<td>great (Liam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>disability</td>
<td>love</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is apparent that the related entities used by the three writers (Practitioner One, Practitioner Three and the researcher) consist of words drawn from a number of different language registers - with each of those registers reflecting, to a large extent, the lens through which the subject of the text is thought about, and described, by the writer of the text. Specifically, those words which are in pink text - report, presents, issues, and review - all appear to belong to a quasi-legal language register, and reflect a distant, or administratively functional, approach to case management or description. Such words would not be out of place in a legislative or policy setting, however, in the context of this research, seem somewhat remote from the personal characteristics or qualities of the subjects of the texts.

In contrast, those words which are in green text - trauma, violence, diagnosis, lack, and disability - all appear to belong to a psychiatric language register, with the words reflecting language drawn from a psychiatric, or medical model. Given that none of the writers are psychiatrists, this is all the more interesting, and reflects the increasing tendency of clinicians in a broad range of professional settings to medicalise the suffering of clients, including, in particular, those with complex case presentations. Whether such a method of description produces better outcomes for clients is a point of contention with some arguing that there is no evidence supporting the better outcomes thesis (Westcott, 2003).

Finally, those words which are in blue text - relationship, mother, great, happy, sexual, young, great, and love - all appear to belong to a non-specialist language register, a register which could easily be used by professionals in a range of communication contexts where people - as people - are the primary focus of attention. Such a register is markedly different from the other two registers, in that it appears resistant to a hegemonic, quasi-legal, or psychiatric formulation of personhood - instead focusing on the non-specialist language and personal descriptions.

The interesting point to keep in mind here, is that the related entities describe those concepts which are contextually related to either the subject's first name, or the surrogate, person. The discussion here relates to how the actual subjects of the texts are perceived, and described, by the writers of those texts. The researcher employs a more personal language register than any of the practitioners. The finding suggests that knowing, or having experience of, a subject's real-self has an impact on the language register used to describe that subject.

**Thematic Groupings**

The final feature of the texts to be explored is the thematic groupings of the most frequent concepts. Thematic groupings are the contextual similarity within which concepts occur. For example, the concepts mother, husband and family may not be related entities (in that they do not appear close together in the text), however, they may appear within the same context in the text (for example, love). That is, whenever the concepts mother and husband appear, they are not co-located, however they both appear in the broader context of love.
The following table provides a summary of the top three thematic groupings for each of the twelve texts. Groupings are presented in order of size - with the larger the grouping, the greater the spread of the grouping across the concept map.

Table 8: Top three primary thematic groupings for each of the twelve texts - subject of the text in bold and italics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practitioner One</th>
<th>Practitioner Two</th>
<th>Practitioner Three</th>
<th>Researcher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>trauma (Neil)</td>
<td>appears (Neil)</td>
<td>person (Neil)</td>
<td>Neil (Neil)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>appears (Neil)</td>
<td>support</td>
<td>sessions</td>
<td>great</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neil</td>
<td>unclear</td>
<td>feelings</td>
<td>capacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>report (Tracey)</td>
<td>presents (Tracey)</td>
<td>attention (Tracey)</td>
<td>young (Tracey)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>living</td>
<td>woman</td>
<td>reports</td>
<td>Tracey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>elaboration</td>
<td>Family Services</td>
<td>person</td>
<td>significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>emotional (Liam)</td>
<td>system (Liam)</td>
<td>person (Liam)</td>
<td>Liam (Liam)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>identity</td>
<td>social</td>
<td>problems</td>
<td>great</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liam</td>
<td>criminal</td>
<td>treatment</td>
<td>involved</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the blue shaded cells, the person’s actual name (Neil, Tracey or Liam) appears as a thematic grouping, whereas in the pink shaded cells, the person’s name does not appear, but in place of it are the surrogates person and woman. In the unshaded cells, the person’s name does not appear at all, nor does a surrogate concept. The person’s name as a primary thematic grouping appears in all three of the Researcher’s texts and appears as either the top, or second top, thematic grouping in all three of the texts. In contrast, the person’s name as a thematic grouping appears in only two of Practitioner One’s texts (Neil and Liam) - however, even then, as only the third top thematic grouping. Following, the person then appears in the weaker form in all three of Practitioner Three’s texts, and then again in the weakened form of woman in only one of Practitioner Two’s texts (Tracey). Finally, and in stark contrast, in the unshaded cells, the person (as either a name or a surrogate concept) doesn’t even appear.

Such a phenomena could well be described as the “disappearing person”, suggesting a continuum with first name use at one end and a total absence at the other. Thus, the markers of personhood fade from view. In presenting these findings, it is worth keeping in mind that thematic groupings reveal underlying organising concepts for a text, and not simply the presence or absence of particular words. Accordingly, these are revealing results, in that the individual (named or not) could well be considered as a fundamental organising principle of the discipline of psychology - and the absence or presence of the individual (named or not) within a text is significant.

There are further important thematic groupings revealed by the analysis. For example, the groupings trauma, sessions, problems, and treatment (as used by Practitioner One and Practitioner Three) suggest an organising principle along the lines of Kleinman’s (1978) model of disease Explanatory Model (EM) (as a clinical malfunction), whereas the groupings living, identity, person, feelings, great, capacity, and involved (as used by Practitioner One, Practitioner Three and the Researcher) suggest an organising principle in line with Kleinman’s (1978) illness Explanatory Model (EM) (as the experience of a disease) - or, at least, in line with model of practice which recognises and engages with human suffering. Similarly, the groupings report, Family Services, system, and reports (as used by practitioner one, practitioner two, and practitioner three) reflect an organisational (or even quasi-legal) focus, and the groupings appears, elaboration, unclear, and presents (as used by Practitioner One and Practitioner Two) reflect a distant, or ambivalent focus.

It is the thematic groupings of the researcher which, again, primarily reflect a perception, and description, of the subjects of the texts as people - with a name and a personal experience of their own predicament.
**Ramifications of the study**

The study suggests there are substantial divergences in the ways that fileselves are read and interpreted. Clearly more work needs to be done to establish that such divergences in readings are produced largely by the degree of connection that the professional readers have with the clients so described. That has been the thesis underpinning the present work. At present the possibility that the different readings were produced by the predelictions of the professional readers cannot be ruled out as an explanation.

The study suggests that readings informed by medical models of psychotherapy, as exemplified by descriptions of people using a disease explanatory model, are problematic. Recently Wampold (2001) has demonstrated that there is no evidence to support a medical meta-model conceptualising of psychotherapy. He argues that the problems, predicaments, ailments and issues that bring people to a psychotherapist or counsellor, are better understood using a contextual meta-model of psychotherapy. There is considerable support for the contextual model in Wampold’s meta-analysis of the outcome literature. While a medical model of psychotherapy posits disorders, illnesses or complaints; employs disease model conceptions of suffering; posits a psychological explanation for them, a mechanism of change, specific ingredients in treatment and specificity of effect of these ingredients, (Wampold, 2001, p. 14) the contextual model provides a contrasting view of psychotherapeutic engagements. It employs a non-specialist language register. It posits “an emotionally charged confiding relationship…[in] a healing setting in which the client presents to a professional who the client believes can provide help” (Wampold, 2001, p.25). A further feature of the contextual model is that there is a plausible explanation offered for the client’s predicament and the articulation of some means of resolving the issues- that is a rationale exists for a procedure which will address the problems and which makes sense to both therapist and client. Lastly the contextual model posits an active participation of both therapist and client in the ritual or procedure recommended.

Indeed, the study is about absence and we must note in conclusion all the absences which are produced by our current professional disciplinary arrangements. First and foremost, we have argued that the absence of the client produces what we consider are skewed readings of fileselves. The remedy for the skewness of these readings is the presence of the client, or some indelible memory of that presence informing the decision-making processes of the professional when that professional is ‘case managing’. Indeed the phrase ‘case manager’ achieves a de-personalisation. We note also an absence of the client which is predicated in the medical model of psychotherapeutic intervention. Patients are treated, but the importance of their collaboration in the treatment program is re-cast as the problem of patients complying with their treatments. We think the problem of non-compliance needs to be re-drawn. A key to that transformative work is to acknowledge the gap between a professional disease model discourse (as it is currently employed) to describe clients’ predicaments and their accounts of their suffering. And lastly we note the absence of the client from our research endeavour. The absence was part of the contrivance which brought the central thesis of the research into view. However, this is not the end of the story, simply the end of this account. Our next move will be to consider how the young people who are the subjects of all this writing, can engage with it, and in so doing, can become participants in the research process.

**References**


Appendix 1

Use of Leximancer Options

The Leximancer program has a number of options, or settings, which may be manipulated by the user of the program depending on the nature of the text being analysed, and the format of the results required.\(^\text{10}\)

The following table lists the chosen options for this research project.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Setting</th>
<th>Function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Remove stop words</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>Removes words such as ‘and and ‘so’ from the text prior to analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make folder tags</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>Inserts the name of the text being analysed within concepts, and on the map, to allow comparisons between texts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automatically identify concepts</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>Causes Leximancer, rather than the researcher, to identify concepts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total concept number</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Specifies the number of concepts to be included in the map (range is 1 to 1000, or automatic). If too many concepts are looked for, ‘junk concepts’ may be mapped</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of names</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Specifies the minimum number of names to be looked for within the text (range is 1 to 1000, or automatic) - useful if a particular person’s name is of interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concept editing</td>
<td>automatic</td>
<td>Allows the researcher to edit (add or remove) concepts automatically found by Leximancer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning threshold</td>
<td>14 (normal)</td>
<td>Specifies how easy it is for Leximancer to learn a new concept, and how broad that concept will be (range is 1 to 21)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sentences per context block</td>
<td>3 (normal)</td>
<td>Specifies how many sentences are included in each context block</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classification settings</td>
<td>automatic</td>
<td>Specifies words or concepts to be either required, or ignored</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map settings</td>
<td>gaussian</td>
<td>Specifies whether the map generated will be ‘gaussian’ or ‘linear’ - the former emphasising similarities between concepts, and the latter emphasising co-occurrence between concepts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^\text{10}\) In selecting these options, the researcher spoke personally, on a number of occasions, with the designer of the program: Dr Andrew Smith, Key Centre for Human Factors and Applied Cognitive Psychology, University of Queensland. The assistance provided by Dr Smith does not, however, suggest that Dr Smith endorsed, or is in any way associated with, the content of this research report.
Appendix 2
Written Summaries Provided by the Four Writers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PRACTITIONER ONE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subject: Neil</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neil presents as a young man who is taking increasing responsibility for his life and commencing a process of active choices and decisions. His life is marked by abuse, trauma, neglect and rejection, and he appears to have grappled with the actions taken by the service sector. At times Neil has resisted the limitations and boundaries the service sector has placed upon him, and he appears to have a conflictual relationship with the symbolic parents of Family Services and the Youth Justice system. It is noted at times he does not engage with workers and his whereabouts are unknown, and in contrast will seek out the assistance of previous workers. It appears that Neil is exploring his sense of self and his sense of family, a developmentally appropriate task at his age. It is clear Neil’s connections to his family remain important, and these interactions are increasingly positive when he is able to exert greater control in relation to their duration and frequency. Neil appears to be suffering from post traumatic stress disorder symptoms associated with an incident with the police a few years previously. The report states this symptomology presents itself at night time during his sleep. The report states Neil’s childhood trauma as being when he was thrown from the balcony, which also resulted in the development of Perthe’s disease. It is unclear how his injury has resulted in the formation of a disease. It is recommended that Neil is provided with counselling to address this issue. It was unclear from the report if Neil’s disease has a genetic component and the future implications of this. It was additionally unclear how Neil’s disease will impact upon his employment opportunities and these two issues require further exploration. Other issues that require further exploration relate to Neil’s experiences of family and childhood trauma and violence. He may benefit from counselling to explore his relationship with his mother. It appears Neil has been required at times to take responsibility for his mother’s life. She stated she would kill herself if he refused to live with her. Further complexities include her alignment with her partner during an incidence of violence and Neil’s subsequent criminal charges.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PRACTITIONER ONE

Subject: Tracey

Tracey presents as a semi independent 16 year old who is seeking to separate from the symbolic parent of Family Services. She presents as ambivalent toward her educational and employment opportunities and uncertain of her interests and direction. While it is noted that Tracey is knowledgeable and aware of service support, she is unwilling to engage and utilize these services. This lack of connection places her at increased risk and vulnerability. It is clear that Tracey does not yet possess a full range of emotional skills and abilities that will equip her to live independently. Tracey presents with multiple issues that are currently unresolved. These issues relate to her family of origin, attachment issues, and identity. It is recommended that Tracey and her family are offered family therapy to explore and resolve some of these issues. The relationship between Tracey and her current carer was unclear. It is noted she is living with him and his five children. Is he an approved foster carer? If not, what are the boundaries between he and Tracey+, and what type of role does she maintain in the family home. It is recommended a risk assessment of Tracey’s current living arrangements is undertaken. The report states Tracey is suffering from depression. This issue requires also clarification. Is Tracey dysthymic or suffering from a major depressive disorder? It is recommended that Tracey is assessed for depression and appropriate medication prescribed. She will require therapeutic counselling to manage her depression. The report states Tracey has presented to drug and alcohol services for withdrawal. It is unclear what substance she is using or and withdrawing from. The report states Tracey uses cannabis with friends. This issue requires further exploration to assess the links between Tracey’s drug usage and her depressive state. The report states Tracey does not dress appropriately for her age. This statement requires elaboration and possible follow up. Additionally, the report states Tracey keeps clothes that do not fit her. This statement requires elaboration. Concerns are raised Tracey has difficulty maintaining peer relationships and appears to “need” a relationship. It is recommended that an assertive outreach model of counselling and support is implemented for Tracey to explore and address these issues. It is recommended Family Services continue their financial support until the age of 18 years. It is recommended Family Services continue to monitor Tracey’s progress and continue to assist Tracey to connect with the service sector.
### PRACTITIONER ONE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject: Liam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liam presents as an emotionally needy and vulnerable young man who simultaneously seeks approval and rejects adults within the service system. He appears to have struggled with his identity as a child in need of care, and his sense of self has been affected by his understanding of his cognitive abilities and status as an individual with a significant disability. Liam presents as an angry and frustrated young man who has a reduced understanding of his emotional state and limited skills in managing his moods. His affect regulation is poor, and he presents as being difficult to engage, defensive and hostile. Liam has experienced multiple traumas and complex issues occurring at the same time that he is a developing child and adolescent. Liam's multiple assessments and continuing re-evaluation of his cognitive capacities has created confusion and uncertainty for Liam. Liam's sense of self may be fragmented and uncertain as he struggles to understand his own capacities and limitations. It is likely Liam continues to have multiple and complex psychological issues and emotional issues that may benefit from exploration and resolution if he is to move towards living functionally and independently in the community. Liam's early diagnosis of ADHD requires clarification. The report states Liam suffered an accident as an eleven year old boy and it appears this diagnosis was given shortly after this time. It is uncertain from the report if other diagnosis were considered for example, post traumatic stress disorder, reactive attachment disorder, or an acquired brain injury. Early attachment issues may require exploration and his current depressive diagnosis requires further exploration and monitoring. If Liam has a major depressive diagnosis he may require medication and appropriate therapeutic counselling. Specialist counselling that seeks to address issues of trauma, family issues and identity may be useful.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### PRACTITIONER TWO

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject: Neil</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>This young man presents as having low self esteem and negative self image. It appears that his self image has improved with maturity and an increase in independent living. It appears that as a result of early child hood trauma and deprivation of emotional needs, he has experienced considerable difficulty in achieving his full potential. He presents as a complex young man who alternates between rejecting support and seeking their assistance. He appears to have taken considerable steps toward recognizing his emotional and appropriately expressing his feelings. It appears that despite considerable exposure to neglect, emotional deprivation, violence and poor parenting, this young man is developing into a mature and considered adult. While he has significant family of origin issues, he appears to be working towards a healthy lifestyle without therapeutic support. It is recommended that he be offered contacts with appropriate counselling support should he seek to address these issues in the future. It was unclear from the report if Neil will experience ongoing pain, and reduction of physical capacity thereby affecting his employment opportunities. It is also unclear if he is eligible for a disability allowance from Centrelink, or whether a disability agency will continue with ongoing support.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PRACTITIONER TWO

Subject: Tracey

This young woman appears to be seeking independence, without acknowledging the responsibilities associated with this independence. She is resistant to the support services that have been offered and has not engaged successfully with workers from the agencies. She presents as a young woman who has tested the limits and boundaries provided by Family Services and has not experienced consequences for her non-compliance. She also appears to have been successful in removing Family Services from her life through her passive non-compliance, and also presents as being a needy and vulnerable young woman who is seeking to be independent while also ensuring that peers and adults remain connected to her through the creation of dramas or the development of her motherly role. While Tracey seeks to maintain a pseudo adult presentation she additionally presents as a young woman with an unclear sense of self and her vocational future. She requires a more assertive approach to be taken by the service system. It appears that she acknowledges some drug and alcohol issues and it is recommended drug and alcohol services continue to engage with her in order to address these issues. She does not appear to have been adequately assessed by mental health services, and a more flexible and adaptive model of engagement with this young woman is required by these services.

PRACTITIONER TWO

Subject: Liam

This young man presents as a troubled and complex person, with low self esteem, and who is anxious, depressed, hostile and defensive. His cognitive abilities are limited, as he has an acquired brain injury and an intellectual disability. He has been provided with extensive support from the service system, however he does not seem to take any responsibility for his actions and behaviours, including his criminal and illegal activities. He appears to have difficulty managing his social relationships, and requires an intensive level of one and one attention. He also presents with a high level of need for approval from his peers, and the adults in the system that supports him. He also appears to have a limited understanding of his emotional needs, and this reduced understanding appears to have resulted in seeking peer approval through undertaking offending behaviour. His offending behaviour has unfortunately only served to alienate him further from gaining acceptance and support from his peers. While Liam has already undergone multiple assessments, further exploration of his intellectual and mental status would be useful, so as to be able to accurately provide him with the support that he requires. Without this, it is concerning that he may fall through gaps within the service system due to his unclear status. Also, his family of origin issues require addressing through family or individual counselling. Finally, he may also need counselling for his depression and anxiety, and his criminal and anti-social behaviours. If counselling does not work, he may need medication.
### PRACTITIONER THREE

**Subject: Neil**

The person in this case appears to use drugs to self-medicate in response to emotional pain. The fact that this person feels pain because of the fractious relationship with his mother is in some ways a positive sign. It shows that he values his family members, and his relationships with them. It is stated that criminal activity by the person is related to funding a drug habit. It would appear then that the best course is to deal with the underlying causes of the drug abuse first. It would appear from the case notes that the primary cause of the person’s need for drug use is the negative feelings caused by his poor relationship with his mother. This relationship should be the primary focus of treatment. The relationship needs to be dealt with as completely as possible. This would include counselling with the person dealt with in the case notes, counselling with the mother (if possible), and ideally, joint sessions with the two parties. In addition to a more positive relationship with his mother, the person needs to be encouraged to further develop his relationships with the positive influences in his life. The notes seem to indicate this is already happening, and that it is having a positive effect. If the positive aspects of this person’s life can be embraced there should be no reason why this person cannot develop into a healthy adult. In addition to developing the positive relationships it would be beneficial to encourage the further education and vocational interests of the person. Practical ways in which this could be achieved would be to further develop the relationship with the teacher, and to make an effort to encourage some work experience or part time work in landscaping or horticulture.

### PRACTITIONER THREE

**Subject: Tracey**

Before summarizing the report on this person, some comment needs to be made on the nature of the reports. There are inconsistencies between the Review Report, and the Report on a Young Person in Care. For instance, the first report mentions drug use being an issue, while the second report does not mention drug use. The second report mentions a diagnosis of depression, while this is not mentioned in the first. The first task required in helping this person would be to compile a more comprehensive and comprehensible report. Given the report is inadequate, a person reading the report must make their own diagnosis based on the behaviour mentioned in the reports. Given this, it is most likely that the person has a very low self esteem, as evidenced by the need for the attention of others, regardless of how this is obtained. The person may suffer from a mild mental illness, which contributes to the erratic behaviour. Before treatment is decided upon, a more comprehensive review of the persons mental health needs to be carried out, to determine whether a mental illness exists, or whether the person simply does not like themselves. A review of the persons mental wellbeing needs to focus on the causes of the trouble developing relationships, and the need to cause trouble to get attention.
**PRACTITIONER THREE**

**Subject: Liam**

The person subject to this report has a complex set of inter-related problems. This person resorts to anti-social behaviour, seemingly due to a combination of low-self esteem, a lack of positive role modelling, a lack of positive identity, and anger and frustration. He also has an intellectual disability, and a significant acquired brain injury. The person’s history of neglect and abuse by parents and guardians contributes to each of the factors mentioned above (low self esteem, lack of role modelling and anger). While it is too late to provide adequate parenting, the person needs to be helped to understand the past and reflect on the negative influences the past has had. It is important for the person’s self esteem that they feel the negative aspects of their past were not their fault, and that they can choose to be different. The consequences of the anti-social behaviour, which include criminal behaviour and run-ins with authority, and fraternity with other offenders, have only served to exacerbate the low self esteem and lack of positive identity. This seems to be an unfortunate cycle of events where the person is punished for anti-social behaviour, which only serves to result in more anti-social behaviour. Breaking this cycle is critical to the development of this person. The accident the person was involved in as a boy only adds to the problems in a number of ways. The disability seems to have made it more difficult for the person to deal with stressful or tempting situations. The disability will most likely make treatment of cognitive processes more difficult. The accident has also exacerbated the already low self esteem, both because of the mental disability, and the physical scarring. The issues relating to the accident need to be carefully considered when conducting treatment of the underlying causes of the anti-social behaviour. Advocates for the person need to use the person’s disability to minimize the negative impact of disciplinary actions by the state.

---

**RESEARCHER**

**Subject: Neil**

Neil is a young man who understands his future. He appreciates that he comes from a disadvantaged background, yet also understands that he has a significant degree of control over his future, and that he has the capacity to ‘make something’ of his life. Neil is sad that his father has let him down, and continues to let him down, yet still continues to love him and worry about him. Neil does, however, feel less positive about his mother - he is embarrassed that she is always drunk, and can’t see why she doesn’t give up drinking after all it has done for her. Neil wants to see his father, on his own terms, yet really does not want to see his mother. Neil enjoys a fair level of recreational drug use, especially dope, and he is happy that he has not been bothered to try anything heavier than dope and alcohol - and occasionally speed. Neil would like a place of his own, however he doesn’t mind staying with friends, or sleeping out when he has to. He hates refuges, and would rather stay anywhere than where Family Services say he should stay. Most of Neil’s criminal behaviour centres around stealing cars, yet he knows that doing so is not only stupid, but also wrong - he only does it because he is bored. He will, however, never steal a car when drunk or stoned, as he doesn’t want to kill himself - or anyone else. Neil is frequently reported to be depressed, and to display self-harming behaviour, however it is unclear who first produced this diagnosis - or why, as he is, overall, cheerful, positive and happy. He does, however, suffer from lower back pain, and gets sad and irritable when the pain interferes with his sleep or day time activities. Neil hasn’t been to school for years, however he really wants to get back into some sort of program, as he knows that if he doesn’t have a formal education he is unlikely to get a job. He does, however, read a great deal, including the newspaper most days, and has a keen interest in current affairs. Neil is reasonably fit and physically active, with an interest in a number of sports, yet none of these interests have really been pursued or encouraged. Neil is significantly more intelligent than most people give him credit - he has a keen sense of humour, as well as a great sense of loyalty to his small group of close friends. He knows full well that if he doesn’t get his act together soon, his life is going to be rather limited - or that he is will end up in an institution. He also knows that he can’t change without help.
RESEARCHER

Subject: Tracey

Tracey is a young woman without any real sense of belonging. She has been out of home for over two years, and repeatedly makes allegations about sexual and physical abuse of her by her father, yet also talks very fondly of him and repeatedly says that all she wants to do is go back home. It is doubtful that Tracey’s father has ever sexually abused her, yet it would appear that she has suffered some level of abuse in the past. Tracey’s father is now also very angry that Tracey keeps on accusing him of things that he says he has never done. He would like to have Tracey home, yet is very worried that she will accuse him of something and that people will start to believe Tracey’s accusations. Tracey develops deep attachments to, and is very protective of, her friends and her professional support workers, and she takes a very strong motherly and nurturing role with most people around her. Tracey always welcomes any ‘new kid’ into the refuge system, and will always offer to go to court or case meetings as a support for any of her friends. Tracey seeks a great deal of physical contact with those around her, and is forever hugging and touching people. She does not do this in a sexual way, yet just wants to feel both loved and loving. Tracey acts as if everything is alright in her life, and that she is confident, mature and independent - which, in some ways, she is. Tracey has multiple sexual partners, and develops deep attachments to those she has slept with. When these attachments are not reciprocated, she becomes depressed, and occasionally self-harms. Similarly, if Tracey develops an attachment to a particular person, who does not reciprocate her feelings, she frequently accuses them of sexual advances or, even, assault. She is a young woman who is acutely aware of the powers and limitations of being a woman. Tracey is not involved in the criminal justice system, she only smokes dope occasionally, and attends school on a regular basis. Tracey is intelligent, takes significant interest in her physical appearance, and would love to own a horse. Tracey also says that she would love to have a baby, and is convinced that she would make good mother.

RESEARCHER

Subject: Liam

Liam is a young man with varied and complex issues. He has been involved in the care and protection system since a young boy, with a wide range of professionals forming just as wide a range of opinions regarding his capacity and ability. On the surface, Liam appears as a young man with fairly high level criminal and anti-social behaviour, however he also has a great sense of humour, a keen sense of loyalty, and both deep love and deep anger towards his mother. Liam loves his mother, and remains close to her, however he also blames her for never providing him with a safe and secure childhood. Liam also suffers from a mild intellectual disability, which sometimes makes it difficult for him to remember or plan things, however, when given the chance and the time, Liam can learn and remember quite complex details. Liam also suffers from an acquired brain injury, and many people have told Liam that this injury makes him different from everyone else. While, in a sense, this is true, Liam is Liam because of his upbringing, and not really because of his disabilities. Liam would really love a place of his own, and a job, and he would be able manage both with regular, limited, support and encouragement. Liam also has a great sense of who is telling him the truth, who he can trust, and who is just stringing him along or making false promises. He truly likes a number of the workers who have been involved in his life, and remembers them fondly for many years. While Liam is, currently, smoking too much marijuana, and hanging with the wrong crowd, he is really only doing so out of boredom, and a desire to belong to some sort of family or social system. The odds are that Liam will plod along doing what he is currently doing for many years, or else, he could easily be led into making a bad decision and end up in the criminal justice system. Regardless, Liam is well liked by many professionals, with many of these willing to go to great lengths to assist and support Liam.
Volunteers in an Organisational Setting: a Critical Discourse Analysis of Identification and Power

Christine Fahey
University of Tasmania

Abstract
A small body of research indicates that there are poorly understood implications for volunteers and their organisations resulting from changing roles for voluntary organisations and changing volunteer demographics. The changing social, political and economic climate since the 1980s appears to have affected volunteerism in complex ways. Despite participation and volunteerism underpinning the power of a democracy, volunteers within organisations can seem powerless. And yet issues of power and volunteers within formal organisations have rarely been studied. In this paper I use critical discourse analysis (CDA) to look at identification and power for a particular group of volunteers.

The perspectives of Foucault and Fairclough informed the study, undertaken as part of a doctoral thesis. Foucault highlighted the relational and changing nature of power as well as focusing attention on the power processes inherent in knowledge production. Fairclough’s approach to data analysis is employed to draw on developments in discourse analysis techniques. While CDA and Foucauldian approaches have often been applied to marginalised groups, I problematise the valorisation of volunteers and apply identification as a lens to view processes of power within an organisational setting. Using CDA I delineate four key identities that are available for volunteers within the organisational setting: the moral volunteer, the professional volunteer, the staff volunteer, and the self-interested volunteer. Each identity is used to interact in power relations by members of the organisation. I detail the key features of each identity, the orders of discourse involved, and the power implications.

Ultimately I argue that volunteers can become locked out from resource and decision making organisational arenas when there is too great an emphasis on a moral volunteer identity. Such discourses of identity locate volunteers outside economic discourses, which places them at a disadvantage within the organisational setting. As a result, volunteers can be economically disadvantaged by their identification as ‘wonderful community helpers’.

Introduction
Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) has demonstrated benefits in the study of identity and power (Ainsworth & Hardy, 2004; Fairclough, 1992; Hastings, 1999), but this approach has not previously been applied to volunteer identities. Volunteering received recognition as an important aspect of civil society towards the end of the 21st Century, but research has tended to be uncritical of the volunteer concept. Volunteers are commonly defined as individuals who contribute their time in an act of free will to benefit others, but this unitary understanding of volunteer identity is likely to disguise multiple identities and related power dynamics. In this paper I delineate the identities that are available to a group of formal volunteers, and the material and social consequences of identity choices. Using identity as a theoretical lens allowed me to examine the systems of governance within formal organizations, with the aim of increasing the theoretical understanding of how to effectively incorporate volunteers within organisational settings.

Despite the recent focus on volunteering by the public, governments and academics there has been little critical analysis of volunteering. Instead, with a few exceptions (See for example Cox, 2000) the view has been particularly ‘rose-tinted’ with ‘Third Way’ discourses embracing the importance of volunteering and community participation (Giddens, 1998).
Volunteers and third sector organisations were lauded for building well networked and trusting communities and were also seen as an avenue for the delivery of public services previously provided by governments (Harris, 2001). However, governance changes have affected factors such as management styles, organisational purpose and ethos, and requirements for volunteer professionalism (Harris, 2001; Mocroft & Thomason, 1993). A shift in volunteer power relations and identity is a likely outcome of reforms that have created more formalised and professional environments and could be implicated in why some organisations report increasing difficulty in recruiting and retaining adequate numbers of volunteers despite statistical increases in overall volunteer numbers (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 2001).

Individuals both contribute to the construction of identity and subject themselves to identities, by acting within certain parameters or expressing certain characteristics (Fairclough, 1992). People have access to, and subject themselves to, multiple identities and can take up and put down any identity either temporarily or permanently by positioning themselves within discourses to belong to one category or another (Davies & Harre, 2001). This involves recognising oneself as belonging to various groups and not others, and seeing the world from these perspectives (Davies & Harre, 2001). While the individual has choice in positioning, they are also constrained by the subject positions that are available in the context of time and place. By using CDA to study of identity, I challenge normalised assumptions, show how identity is socially constructed, and uncover the material and social implications of identity (Ainsworth & Hardy, 2004: 237).

Of most interest to this study are the economic and social impacts of volunteer identities within formal organisations. Formation of identity is strongly influenced by power, as knowledge and institutional practices shape the construction of particular identities, promote identities, or foster different qualities (Florence 1994). The knowledge/power nexus is an important process of power in modern societies and discourse is central to this process (Foucault, 1980; McHoul & Grace, 1993; Rose, 1999). I follow Fairclough (1992) and take discourse to be text, discursive practices and social practice simultaneously, that is written, spoken, and social actions. Analysis of the formation of identities concerns looking for the subject type that discourses either assume or work to develop. Discourses promote and attribute certain qualities to some subjects in a process of identification (Dean, 1999).

This theoretical approach requires consideration of the processes that subjectify and therefore link individuals and politics (Burchall, 1991). Foucault makes a strong contribution to discourse theory in terms of the relationship between discourse and power (Foucault, 1980, 1991; McHoul & Grace, 1993). Discourses can support power bases within society, while also providing points of resistance for marginalised groups. Discourse analysis reveals instances of contestation and resistance to dominant power, and such micro events can provide small shifts in power that combine into significant events and changes in the positions of dominance (Hodge & Kress, 2001). Critical discourse analysis focuses on social power which “is based on privileged access to socially valued resources, such as wealth, income, position, status, force, group membership, education or knowledge.” (Van Dijk, 2001: 302). Power must be considered as not only repressive, but also productive, as it constitutes identities and social entities. This paper uncovers evidence of both dominance and resistance in volunteer ambulance officer discourse, which allows some insight into the complexity of power relations, where power is never static, and everyone has some degree of power.

**Methods**

The volunteers of interest were Australian and New Zealand Volunteer Ambulance Officers. They have operated for over a hundred years in many areas and have grown from small local groups to become increasingly professionalised and managed by state based bodies. In this way they parallel many volunteer groups that are increasingly professionalised and accountable for the delivery of services. Volunteer ambulance positions within major city centres have given way to paid ambulance officer positions, so that now Volunteer Ambulance Officers are largely a rural phenomenon.

The data corpus consists of four text genres to provide a broad to narrow focus: government speeches that highlight a national level representation of volunteers; open-ended survey comments from 702 Volunteer Ambulance Officer survey respondents, to access an broad
and relatively unconstrained volunteer voice; Australian ambulance organisational documents to access volunteer identification and visibility within organizations; and interviews with volunteers and management from one Australian ambulance organization undergoing change, to examine local power dynamics.

Data was analysed with the assistance of the N-Vivo computer analysis package. Initial analysis identified broad identities and features, which was followed by further text selection to allow in-depth text analysis. Text pieces were selected for in-depth analysis if they clearly demonstrated identity features or power dynamics. I followed Fairclough’s (1992) synthesis approach to CDA selecting the most relevant text analysis approach from a tool box of options. In retrospect, the major text features of relevance were transivity, modality, and word meaning.

The study delineated four identities that position volunteer subjects within ambulance organisation discourses. The subjectification and material implications of these were explored and the process of local operation of discourses by dominant management was analysed and interpreted.

Though my analysis was informed by the literature, interview transcripts and organisational documents and my experiences within volunteer circles, the study approach has limitations (Ainsworth & Hardy, 2004). The reader must keep in mind that this analysis is only one construction of the data, and does not have any special claim to truth. I acknowledge that others may have found different identities within the data, but if I have managed to remain reflexive during the analysis process these four identities and how they are used should find resonance with other readers due to the shared understandings within our society.

**Findings**

The four key identities that volunteers are subjected to or subject themselves to within Australian ambulance organizations are: the moral volunteer identity; the professional identity; the volunteer as staff identity; and the new, self-interested volunteer identity. I describe the moral volunteer and the professional volunteer identities in the greatest detail as the strongest and longest standing of the identities, with briefer descriptions of volunteers as staff; and the self-interested volunteer identity due to space limitations. The power implications with subsequent social and economic consequences of the different identities are discussed.

The moral volunteer identity is relatively dominant within our society and represents the most public face of volunteering. The identity draws deeply on the traditional discourse and imagery or rural battlers and Australian mateship. The moral volunteer identity has three key features: volunteers as special people, volunteers helping the community, and volunteers working for rewards other than money. It is this moral citizen identity to which many volunteers subject themselves in the process of becoming a volunteer.

The following excerpt is taken from a speech by Australian Prime Minister Howard (2001) and highlights key features of the dominant moral volunteer identity.

---

Prime Minister Howard: It is a real pleasure for me to share the platform this afternoon with Bruce, particularly as we are having a little ceremony, an occasion, to honour and thank and acknowledge the people who really when the chips are down really hold our society and our community together. And that is the hundreds, indeed tens indeed hundreds of thousands of Australia[sic ns] who for no reward other than the satisfaction of helping their fellow Australians, no reward other than the satisfaction of bringing a facility to a community, of getting a sporting activity going, they are prepared to give up their time to build a happier and more cohesive society.

Australia in many ways is the greatest volunteer society in the world. One of the reasons for it is that because in our early days we had long distances and small populations and no help from outside, we really had to club together and to make things work in local communities. And out of that necessity we have
The key tenet of this discourse is that volunteers are ‘special’ people; people who are ‘caring’ and ‘altruistic’ and doers who get things done. The volunteer contribution is largely described using valiant and exaggerated terms such as extra-ordinary or wonderful. In the excerpt above Prime Minister Howard even credits volunteers for holding our society together and lays claim to Australia being the ‘greatest volunteer society in the world’. Such honoring positions volunteers in a very special light. While complimenting volunteers is part of the context of the speech setting, where the Prime Minister was attending a ceremony for the express purpose of thanking volunteers, it also highlights how volunteers are positioned to be rewarded within a moral volunteer identity. Volunteers are given respect and thanks for their unpaid work, and their role in the local setting is linked to the broader Australian society and given great prestige. By highlighting the unpaid and helping nature of volunteering, volunteers are identified as highly moral Australian citizens, however the data also found that they were placed almost outside the organisation. The moral volunteer was a ‘community’ member more than an organisational member, and because they gained status as unpaid helpers, they were positioned outside of economic discourses.

However, there was resistance by volunteers to the dominant moral volunteer identity through the use of the professional identity. The key features of the professional identity were: competency, support equipment and services, and service delivery. Through the survey comments, many volunteers argued for improved support for service delivery. The key arguments were that more training, equipment, uniforms, or organisational support in recruitment and communication were necessary requirements for supporting the delivery of a professional service. A feature of many of the survey comments was their blunt and direct criticism of the ambulance services as the following excerpt shows:

*Anonymous volunteer:* Put some money into equipment – if we want a decent sphygmomanometer, BP cuff or stethoscope we have to buy our own! That’s crap. I am wearing the same 2 shirts I was issued with 7½ years ago – they are so thin they are nearly see through. My service [name] does not pay for dry cleaning or repairing uniforms – mine is so shabby it is hard to wear it with pride. To me the equipment and the AOs [ambulance officers] look 2nd rate and I don’t feel “honoured” any longer to be part of a service that seems to rate appearance and its officers (100% volunteer) so casually.

This respondent focuses on lack of equipment and poor uniform provision and links this to decreased reward in the form of pride/status/prestige. The technical description of medical equipment establishes the volunteer’s professionalism, and by explaining that volunteers must buy their own equipment the author is expecting that the audience would understand that by modern standards this is unusual or even unacceptable. The author then effectively makes a strong statement by using the word ‘crap’ which is ‘contextually marked behaviour’ (Diamond, 1996: 52), and in this case a form of ‘negative politeness’ (Fairclough, 1992: 235). By describing a ‘loss of pride’ and not feeling ‘honoured’ the respondent challenges the validity of the moral payment of volunteering as per the moral volunteer identity. The volunteer positions him/herself as a professional, identifying as an ambulance officer first, and using the word volunteer only as a descriptor of ambulance officers. Overall resistance is achieved by positioning the volunteers as poorly treated professionals, with responsibility for the poor treatment forcefully assigned to the ambulance organisation.

By positioning as professionals, volunteers were able to argue that they require training, equipment and organisational support to achieve competence. This was different to the management use of the professional identity, where accountability for training and standards were foregrounded, and equipment and organisational support were backgrounded or not evident. The reverse was true of volunteers’ use of the professional identity, where training,
equipment and organisational support were foregrounded and directly linked to competence and professional standards. The volunteer use of the identity exhibited strong evidence of resistance, through criticisms of the organisation, and avoidance of, or subtle negation of the moral volunteer identity. The safety of patients was presented as a key goal in this discourse, but agency for achieving this goal was allocated to either the organisation or ambulance volunteers, depending on the author of the discourse.

The volunteer as staff identity draws heavily from managerial and equity discourses. It is an emerging identity within ambulance organisations but it can be found in other volunteer organisations. In this study the volunteer as staff identity was most evident in the interview texts of newer management members and it was largely used as a discourse of resistance and change. The main features of the volunteer as staff identity were: the representation of volunteers as organisational members; the argument that volunteers were entitled to fair treatment and adequate policies and procedures; as well as an overtly political use of the discourse to promote change.

Volunteers by being represented as staff were aligned with paid employees, which drew on new orders of discourse, management and worker equity, for the identification of volunteers. The volunteer as staff identity positioned volunteers within the organisation, unlike the moral volunteer identity which positioned the volunteer within the community. One result was that the responsibility for service delivery was placed with the organisation, not the community or volunteer group. The staff identification also positioned the organisation as responsible for the volunteer staff, largely in terms of policies and procedures, safety, and equity.

The use of the terms ‘staff’ instead of volunteer, was often a deliberate strategy to either avoid some of the moral connotations of volunteerism, or to open up the discourse of volunteerism to HR managerial concerns. The strategy was identified by several interviewees as deliberate. The following quote identifies perceived problems associated with using the term volunteer:

```
New executive management Sophie: The whole area of resourcing for the regional workforce is enormous and has never been properly addressed because the moment you say the word volunteer, everybody shuts down. That’s why I don’t use the word.
```

Sophie directly claims a problem with using the word ‘volunteer’ when seeking resources for regional (i.e mostly volunteer delivered) services. She stresses that resourcing has not been ‘properly addressed’ because it is linked to volunteers. Sophie’s claim ‘that’s why I don’t use the word’ directly acknowledges the weak position of the volunteer in arguing for resources, and the power of words to change power relations.

The other volunteer identity evident in the ambulance organisational discourses was the ‘new, self-interested volunteer’. This is a broadly emerging identity that can be found in much academic and management literature. It is often used as a dichotomous discourse of the traditional volunteer versus the new volunteer. Traditional volunteers are moral volunteers, identified as rural doers who help the community. In contrast the key features of the new self-interested volunteers discourse are: a focus on modernity and changing demographics, a more demanding volunteer with uncertainty or even fear over how this affects the future of volunteering, and a volunteer who is positioned within a family and social context. New self-interested volunteers are represented as having different demographic characteristics to traditional volunteers. They are likely to be categorised as younger and busier people who are metropolitan based and have more self-interested motivations. The new self-interested volunteer is part of the discourse of both volunteers and management and the work it does is often to explain the reasons for changing volunteer demands, or to project the future impact of such changes.

The use of volunteer identities play an important role in power relations within the ambulance organisations studied. Each identity positions volunteers in a different context such as the linking of moral volunteers to the community, or professional volunteers to the organisation and each has different material and social impacts? The moral volunteer, whether as subject or object, is positioned in a highly moral context, which means that volunteers gain prestige by social identification as moral individuals with caring and unselfish natures. The volunteer
attracts admiration and respect from others because of their demonstrable kindness and contribution to the community. The gains to the individual volunteer are in terms of status or prestige. Lenski (1966: 37) claims that while individuals often deny any desire for prestige, it actually influences most of their decisions. He links this desire for prestige to the psychological need for self-respect, which has been shown to be largely “a function of the respect accorded by others” and that therefore our sense of well-being is “greatly dependent on our status in the groups we value.” (Lenski, 1966: 38).

However, the data also suggest that volunteers lose power through the moral citizen identity. By being aligned with high moral standards and the motivations of helping, volunteers become positioned outside the individualistic economic discourse and are placed in a weak situation when arguing for a share of economic resources. Within an organisational context this is particularly a problem as volunteers cannot readily draw on normal economic discourses about payment for services. As a result, debates about reimbursement of expenses become based more on emotional and moral arguments than equity or economic matters. This can affect not only the individual volunteer who may be ‘out-of-pocket’ but also areas serviced by volunteers, which can become under-resourced.

Hence volunteers use of the professional identity, which focuses strongly on resource requirements for service provision by drawing on issues of competence and service standards. The professional volunteer does not lose status by arguing for economic resources as this defence of service standards is part of the role of a professional.

**Conclusion**

In this paper I have delineated four volunteer identities that emerged from the data corpus. Each discourse drew on different orders of discourse to identify the volunteers. The moral volunteer drew on community participation and moral citizen discourses; the professional volunteer drew on professional competency and juridico-legal discourses; the volunteer as staff identity drew on managerial and equity discourses; while the new self-interested volunteer identity drew on discourses of modernity and generational change. Each volunteer identity worked to represent the volunteer with different responsibilities and levels of agency. The volunteer was positioned variously within the community, the organisation, or society depending on the identity used. Each discourse was used for both dominance and resistance and more than one identity could be used depending on the aim of the speaker or text author.

The data analysis highlighted the complexity of power relations by uncovering how the different positioning and representation that are used in identification can cause volunteers to gain or lose power in arguing for economic resources or social status. Volunteers where locked out of decision making and resource allocation by identification as moral volunteers, but resisted through the use of professional or staff identities. The message for organisations with volunteers may be to be reflexive about how volunteers are identified within the formal setting. Too great an emphasis on the moral aspect of volunteering may mask an under resourced and invisible organisational sector.

**References**


Negotiations and Resolutions: Two Case Studies in Intraprofessional Meeting Talk

Andrew Foley
Australian Centre for Education, Cambodia

Abstract

One of the main ways in which decisions are taken, and plans of action resolved, in a workplace is through the mechanism of intraprofessional meetings. The findings of a study carried out by the author to examine the discourse used in such meetings will be presented. The focus of the analysis is on what the discourse might reveal about the participants, the nature of the negotiations undertaken, and the resolutions achieved as a result of the meeting talk. This included examining the discourse of participants in a meeting environment with reference to their workplace status and roles within their organisations.

Two series of meetings, both in English language schools were recorded. One series was of staff meetings, the other of management meetings. An extract from each series of meetings was analysed using the framework developed by Eggins and Slade (1997), using the types of parameters suggested by systemic functional linguistics and critical discourse analysis.

Some comparisons of the two sets of data are made, and tentative conclusions suggested about the nature of meeting talk and possible directions for further research.

An underlying goal of the study was to gather information to judge the effectiveness of different types of meeting interaction, as reflected in discourse.

Introduction

One of the main ways in which decisions are taken, and plans of action resolved, in a workplace is through the mechanism of intraprofessional meetings. The aim of this study was to examine the discourse used in such meetings, and to see what this might reveal about the participants, the nature of the negotiations undertaken, and the resolutions achieved as a result of the meeting talk. Two series of meetings, both in English Language schools, were recorded and transcribed. One was a series of staff meetings, the other of management meetings, each series in a different workplace. An extract from each series of meetings was analysed using the framework developed by Eggins & Slade (1997), some comparisons made, and tentative conclusions suggested. An underlying goal was to gather information to judge the effectiveness of different types of meeting interaction, as reflected in discourse.

Two questions posed were:

- To what extent were the different professional roles occupied by the meeting participants reflected in language choices, especially with reference to power and status?
- How might different language strategies, turn taking conventions, and accepted sequential steps contribute to the effectiveness of workplace meetings?

Approach and Data Analysis System

This study specifically used the data analysis system used by Eggins & Slade, and more broadly was based upon approaches from the perspectives of conversational analysis, critical discourse analysis, and systemic functional linguistics. A starting point was the realisation that the number of settings, functions, contexts etc in which spoken language is
used are myriad and multiple, and can show a huge amount of variety. Thus there is considerable scope for studies into the ways spoken discourse is used and patterns and features of particular spoken genres.

The data was analysed at a number of different levels, namely, at the level of grammar (clauses, subject choices etc.), at the level of semantics (appraisal, involvement), and at the level of discourse (turn taking, interruptions etc). Detailed coding sheets and tables were used for these analyses, but only a summary of the most relevant data will be presented here.

**Staff Meetings**

The first series of data collected came from staff meetings of a privately owned English Language college in Australia delivering English as a Second Language, predominantly to foreign adult students.

As the school Director did not attend these meetings (and had ultimate authority), action or decisions had to be taken to the Director by the DOS, and then a decision relayed back to the staff, often at the subsequent meeting. Thus, in terms of information flow, the DOS could be seen as a form of two-way information conduit between management and staff through the mechanism of meetings.

**Grammatical Analysis**

**Clauses**

Looking at meeting extract from a grammatical perspective, one of the most noticeable factors was the large number of clauses produced by the DOS in comparison to the other speakers.

In fact, the DOS produces more clauses on his own than all the other speakers combined. This would support the idea of DOS as conduit, and of the nature of the meeting talk being either:

a) DOS informing meeting → teacher query → DOS response, or
b) Teacher question → DOS response

In other words, it seemed much of the interaction was between the DOS and (any) other participant, with less interaction occurring between other participants.

Although the DOS produced the majority of the clauses, he had relatively few incomplete clauses. This seemed to be because his turns were significantly longer and contained descriptions or rationales, while the teachers had shorter turns, in providing short, interactive, reactions, or framing questions.

**Declaratives**

The previously surmised role of the DOS in providing information in longer turns is borne out by him having uttered a very high proportion of declaratives, much greater than all of the other participants. Very few of these declaratives were elliptical, showing that he spoke in longer, completed turns. Other participants, on the other hand, provided a higher proportion of elliptical declaratives, predominantly as a result of unsuccessful (not gaining the turn) interruptions.

**Tagged declaratives**

There was a total lack of tagged declaratives during the selected meeting extract. As the function of tagged declaratives is often to give the turn to another speaker, or to seek confirmation of assumed information, it could be surmised that in the nature of this meeting, the participants were more interested in maintaining their turn, rather than
passing it on, and in developing their own viewpoint, rather than investigating someone else’s. This was supported by the fact that almost no wh-interrogatives were produced.

**Most frequent subject choice**

One interesting feature here was the high occurrence of the generic ‘you’. This could be explained by the discussion revolving around rules and procedures, and wanting to not identify oneself personally as complaining/suggesting (or explaining/suggesting on the part of the DOS) as the discontent (instigator) of the rule/procedure, but talking on behalf of a collective, whether the teaching staff, or the school as an entity. The personal pronoun ‘I’ received only moderate use, perhaps again due to reluctance to express strong personal opinions.

**Analysis of Semantics**

Through the conceptual semantic systems of Appraisal and Involvement, again drawn from Eggins & Slade, the attitudes which interactants expressed towards each other and towards the world were examined, utilising categories such as:

- Appreciation: reactions to and evaluation of reality
- Affect:: expression of emotional states
- Judgement: about the ethics, morality, or social values of other people
- Amplification: methods of magnifying or minimizing the intensity and degree of reality. (summarised from Eggins & Slade, pp125)

In general summary, the data showed a relatively low amount of appraisal items being used, about half of that shown by Eggins & Slade with their analysis of a casual conversation between workmates (pp141). The overwhelming majority of these appraisal items were spoken by the DOS, and fell almost exclusively into two types; appreciation in the form of reaction, and amplification in the form of mitigation.

There were no lexical items of either affect or judgement used during the meeting extract, and very little evidence of the use of Involvement in making attitudinal meanings. When people are referred to, they are referred to collectively as ‘teachers’, ‘we’ or impersonal ‘you’. One could speculate then, that the interactants had a low interest in seeking or expressing the intimacy or solidarity with other interactants that they might in an informal conversation. Their goals are more material than social.

**Discourse Structure Analysis**

In considering speech functions, and the sequencing of moves as the speech unfolds, the data indicated that while several of the teachers were actively involved in the meeting dynamic and were prepared to take turns, the DOS’s turns were considerably longer. The DOS can be seen as having taken an informing/explaining role (longer turns), while the teachers took a questioning/challenging role (shorter turns throwing the turn back on the DOS).

The assumption of the DOS providing longer, information/explanation-type turns is supported by him having produced nearly all of the prolonging moves, whether elaborating or extending. The reacting roles of the teachers as a group was shown markedly in the react: rejoinder data (that is, reactions that could be seen to add an extra element into the discussion and thus delaying or changing its outcome), with twice as many such moves made by the teachers compared to the DOS. On both “sides” an even distribution between rebounding (seeking a response from the previous speaker), and countering or rechallenging the previous speaker’s view can be seen.

The above analysis showed us a pattern of the DOS providing information regarding one specific issue, and the dominant teachers diverting or moving the topic onto related issues of school organisation or resources. The DOS countered in each case, some short
discussion ensues with supporting or confronting opinions from other teachers, and each side issue was left unresolved, or at least no change from the status quo was agreed upon.

**Interruptions**

An examination of interruptions was also made. While interruptions are a normal feature of conversation, they have obvious implications with regards to status and role of the participants, as well as the way in which the conversation topics develop through the exchange.

The interruptions data reflected many of the previous deductions regarding the roles of the participants. The DOS received more than half of all the interruptions made, perhaps due to the fact that his turns were longer and other participants felt the need to interrupt in order to take over the turn. In fact, approximately half of his turns were interrupted by other participants.

**Management Meetings**

The second series of data came from management meetings of a large school in Cambodia teaching English as a second language to predominantly Cambodian students. Management meetings served the function of discussing and making decisions regarding the organisation and running of the school. The meetings were attended by four people; the Director of the school, two Directors of Studies, and the Human Resources Manager.

**Grammatical Analysis**

**Clauses**

The most noticeable factor was the relatively dominant role of the school Director, producing more than half of the number of clauses. As she was controlling the agenda (in terms of being an informal chair), and was also the most senior person in the meeting extract, this reflects that. But how is her role in these meetings similar to, and how does it differ from, the role of the DOS in the staff meetings?

**Declaratives**

The nature of meetings as the provision/gaining of information can be seen in the high proportion of declaratives produced by all of the participants. In general terms, the pivotal role of the Director can be seen in the lower proportion of declaratives than other interactants, as she used a wider variety of speaking mood choices in order to obtain more (and more specific) information, and to move the issue to a resolution.

**Polar interrogatives**

As remarked upon above, we can see further evidence of the Director’s role in her relatively high use of polar interrogatives, almost all of those produced during the extract. She demanded specific information from other participants in order to clarify issues and move towards a resolution.

**Tagged declaratives**

The use of tagged declaratives by the Director was another feature of her discourse. These tagged declaratives served the same function as the polar interrogatives, seeking clarification from other participants. The specific nature of both polar and tagged interrogatives meant that while the turn was transferred to other speakers, it was usually short and within the framework created by the Director, who would then resume the turn shortly afterwards. This is an interesting contrast to the Staff Meeting extract analysed, where participants used no tagged declaratives, and seemed reluctant to give up their turns or to seek specific information from other speakers.
Adjuncts
When we examined the adjuncts used in the staff meeting extract it was noticed that there was a higher proportion of interpersonal adjuncts used than in the familial casual conversation analysed by Eggins & Slade (Eggins & Slade Table 3.1, p110). The management meeting shows a different trend; a low number of interpersonal adjuncts, as compared to textual and circumstantial adjuncts. The closer proximity of the participants in a smaller, action-driven meeting may have led the participants to be less wary about their framing of suggestions and questions and feeling less requirement to introduce opinions in a diplomatic way.

Analysis of Semantics
The data shows a considerable degree of use of appraisal items during the management meeting extract, considerably more so (approximately double) than during the staff meeting extract. It could be surmised that this is a result of the participants in the management meeting being much surer about expressing opinions, making open judgements and, above all, making assessments of other people's abilities and behaviour. While there was no use whatsoever of Affect (happiness/satisfaction) or of Judgement (social sanction/esteem) in the staff meeting, all of the speakers in the management meeting use these categories extensively, especially that of social esteem, when discussing the capabilities of different teaching staff. Such discussion of people's capabilities would of course be inappropriate in a staff meeting.

Also, there was much more extensive use of Amplification in the management meeting, both augmenting and mitigating. Again, it seems that the participants were more prepared to express opinions, and to state them strongly.

Discourse structure analysis
With respect to the dominant role of the Director, the discourse structure data shows more clearly what had been determined at the level of grammar and at the level of semantics. What is more interesting, apart from the quantitative dominance of the Director, is the way in which she interacts with the other participants, and exerts control over the flow and form of interaction.

In addition to having approximately half of the turns in the extract, examination of these moves shows a turn structure in which the Director takes almost every alternating turn. This is quite similar to the turn taking role of the DOS in the staff meeting extract, but, as will be seen, when the individual functions are examined more closely, there are fundamental differences in both the interactions between meeting participants, as well as the role of the dominant participant in each meeting.

In the examination of the staff meeting it can be seen that the DOS had considerably longer turns in his role as information provider/complaints responder and made nearly all of the prolonging moves. The management meeting data, however, shows relative equality between the participants, with the number of such moves being proportional to participants overall, and a much greater number of appending moves. As was surmised previously, staff members were reluctant to give up their turn, and each speaker provided little opportunity for another speaker to intervene, whereas in the management meeting there seemed to be a greater freedom for each participant to take or relinquish their role, and interruptions were not intended so much as turn changing opportunities, but for the seeking of information.

The staff meeting extract had a more or less equal distribution between supporting and confronting reaction moves. The management meeting extract, on the contrary, had almost no confronting moves. The Director, in particular, used a large number of supporting moves. This could lead to surmising that the management meeting was much more of a work-in-action with decisions more likely to be achieved through consensus, as opposed to a staff meeting whether there was little resolution of issues, and more confronting viewpoints expressed.

Another interesting contrast is that of the data for rejoinder moves. A much greater
proportion was shown during the management meeting extract. As these have the function of passing the turn over to the other speaker, again it could be surmised that participants were more comfortable about allowing other speakers a turn, and felt it would be easy to get their turn back. Many of these rejoinders were questions to probe, clarify or confirm information, and thus we can see greater work-in-action occurring.

Looking at the exchanges one by one a pattern can be seen of the topic being introduced, and then brought to a conclusion in almost each case by the Director. She seeks information or opinions from the other participants, and then a quick decision is reached, and the topics change quickly. The interchanges between FM1 and he other participants seem to have equal length of moves and openness to suggestions and the obtaining of turns. The relatively high number of exchanges in the extract perhaps indicates the number of issues discussed and resolved within a short time, and a high degree of efficiency in terms of action achieved, especially when compared with the staff meeting extracts.

**Interruptions**

The data on interruptions indicates that there were a relatively low number of interruptions, especially when compared to the staff meeting extract. This would seem to back up the previous supposition that in the staff meeting participants made longer turns and were reluctant to give up their turn. Thus, in order to gain a turn, it was often necessary to interrupt an interactant who was already speaking. Obtaining a turn seemed to be an easier matter during the management meeting extract, especially when considering that there was considerable use of questions and other devices which voluntarily passed the turn over to another speaker.

**Some Conclusions: Similarities and Disparities**

As with other forms of spoken discourse, it soon became obvious that it is very difficult to make generalizations from one situation or context to another. The two types of meetings showed different patterns and forms of interaction, which could have been shaped not only by the nature and context of the meetings themselves, but also by the different personalities of the participants.

In general terms, both meeting extracts showed the dominant role of one participant, through which most of the discourse was channeled. The dominant interactant was the most senior in status in each meeting. Other participants contributed to varying degrees, with each meeting having participants who were prepared to contribute sparingly, usually upon demand. There was a progression of topics determined by a preset agenda, although new topics often were introduced spontaneously. Whether these are factors common to all meetings would need further research.

However, the differences between the two sets of data were more noticeable. The staff meeting extract showed participants taking longer turns, especially the DOS, and being reluctant to give up their turn. Other participants were rarely drawn into the discourse, and a turn often had to be obtained by interruption. The nature of the meeting, that is, its relative inability to make major decisions, meant that it served more as a forum and a two way passing of information between staff and management, rather than as a means of taking action.

In contrast, the management meeting extract showed a high number of decisions taken, and of a more rapid turn around between speakers. Speakers often passed the turn over to another speaker, and there was a higher nature of supporting rather than confronting moves. The dominant speaker, the Director, was more interactive, and assumed a generally productive rather than defensive role, as was perhaps the case with the DOS.

The overall impression gained by the author of this study is that context and environment plays a crucial role in determining the linguistic choices make by interacts in any speaking situation. It is thus very difficult to generalize about a particular genre, and better to consider particular contexts in seeking patterns of language use.

The author also found it extremely interesting, as a participant in both sets of meeting to examine his own language choices and patterns, and see how they were fundamentally
different from one set of meetings to another, perhaps lending credence to the idea that it is context and role, not personality, that shape the way we communicate in workplace, (and perhaps also wider), communicative contexts.

References


Holmes, J., Language in the Workplace: a study of communication based on real interactions in New Zealand workplaces: http://www.ac.nz/lals


Sarangi S. (1998), Rethinking recontextualisation in professional discourse studies (Text 1998, 18, 2, pp 301-318)


Membership Categorisation Analysis and the Critical Analysis of Educational Practice (Keynote Paper)

Peter Freebody
University of Queensland, Australia

Abstract

Among the original ideas motivating critical analyses we find the contrast between ideology and ontology. Ideology is described as naturalized descriptions yielding versions of an apparent reality that in fact differentially serves the interests of some groups over others. The notion of ‘categories of persons’ as the fundamental building blocks of an understanding of social life, therefore, has always been at the heart of the critical program. In this presentation I briefly describe and illustrate Membership Categorisation Analysis, the principal purpose of which is to document directly the operations of categorisational work, and the way it provides for the attribution of certain characteristics to certain types of persons as a primordial way of explaining social experience. This presentation has a primary interest in educational practice, but draws on examples from the media and policy statements as well as on classroom transcripts.
Museums and Critical Discourse Analysis: Disentangling Exhibition Narratives

Sotiria Grek
University of Edinburgh

Abstract
This paper explores the process of conducting research in the field of museum and gallery education, utilizing aspects of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) within the methodological framework of critical ethnography. It is constructed around the author's on-going doctoral research, a comparative study of adult education policies and practices in four museums and galleries in Dundee, a small city on the east coast of Scotland.

Building on critical theory and the work of Antonio Gramsci, Pierre Bourdieu and Jürgen Habermas, this research uses critical discourse analysis methods in order to examine documentation derived from the field of investigation. The paper discusses an indicative example of such data, in order to make explicit how CDA can cast light on the ways different discourses (e.g. learning discourse and market discourse) interrelate and, consequently, how this influences policy and practice in museum education in the UK today.

However, the main focus of this paper is the application of aspects of critical discourse analysis in the examination of exhibition narratives. It is argued that museum displays form a particularly interesting discursive genre, since, especially in most contemporary museums, they combine the visual (artifacts/artworks) and the textual (text panels/video shows/guides). A specific aspect of an exhibition is examined, in order to look at the ways such exhibition narratives can be 'disentangled' through the application of critical discourse analysis.

The paper concludes by drawing on the experiences of applying aspects of critical discourse analysis in the research of the museum field, to suggest some explanatory connections between museum exhibitions, education and social relations of power.

Theoretical Framework - Background to the Study
Critical research, according to Horkheimer (1972), is never satisfied with simply increasing knowledge. It is political, in the sense that it becomes a transformative endeavour. 'Thus critical researchers enter into an investigation with their assumptions on the table, so no one is confused concerning the epistemological and political baggage they bring with them to the research site' (Kincheloe and McLaren, 1994:140). A critical theory framework requires the utilisation of research methods that can offer a critique of the agents' understandings, an explanation of the reasons those understandings keep on being employed, and possibly an alternative interpretation of the agents' identities, their capacities and real interests (Fay, 1987).

This study looks at museum adult education policies and practices. Despite the claim for a 'new museology' (Vergo, 1989) that would displace the museum from its authoritative standing and the sincere efforts of many museum workers towards realising this, this 'new museum' faces difficult times, competing demands and cumulative pressures for scholarship, education, social inclusion, representation, participation, regeneration —the list goes on and on.

Since the 1980s, UK museums have experienced a severe decline in funding. The 1979 to 1996 Conservative government's emphasis on the economic role museums were to play became the impetus for a drive towards marketing and commercialisation of the museum experience. Financial constraints forced museums to adopt new business models in order to improve their management; museums began to see themselves as
part of the tourist industry and the heritage experience. The concept of 'enterprise culture' was introduced to the arts and cultural organisations, whereas at the same time fierce competition for visitors in the wider leisure market led museums to improve the 'visitor experience' (McLean, 1993). Therefore, museums re-oriented their emphasis from the elitist (and numerically low) public interest in research and scholarship, for the sake of attracting 'multiple audiences', increasing 'participation' and 'diversity'. By adopting the principles and methods of the market, museums experienced the evolution from product-centred to consumer-centred marketing: after improving the product —new displays, interactive exhibits, cafes, parking spaces and museum shops—they went on to analyse visitors' needs, characteristics and perceptions—a marketing centred on demand (Kawashima,1998).

Nevertheless, most museums have always been portraying a version of the world that belongs to the few. They show/ed what was considered precious and rejected the ordinary, the popular, the vulgar and the 'low'. People from all walks of life, but primarily from higher educational and financial backgrounds (Bourdieu and Darbel, 1991) would visit them, knowing more or less what to expect —visitor demographics, according to recent research have not changed dramatically (Hooper-Greenhill, Moussouri, 2001). Thus, what has brought the discourses of learning, access, inclusion, participation and the like into core 'performance indicators' for museums? Was this an internal, self-generated development in the museum world itself? Was it subject to the new postmodernist thinking of relativism and the celebration of the agent? Or, was it itself a consequence of transforming the public domain into the sphere of the entrepreneurial? Is it an opposition to the trend established in the 1980s or an extension of it?

**Museums and Critical Discourse Analysis**

Even though CDA deals principally with language, Fairclough has emphasized the need to incorporate visual images and sound, as other semiotic 'texts' (1995); a similar synthesis of script and icons is applied by museums and galleries in constructing their exhibition narratives. Regarding the mode of analysis used, there are three dimensions of every ‘discursive event’: the textual level, where content and form are analysed; the level of discursive practice, i.e. the socio-cognitive aspects of text production and interpretation; and finally, the level of social practice, related to the different level of institutional or social context. In this research, aspects of CDA are utilised in examining the displays of the museums researched; how narratives are built, what types of messages are put together and across through the use of text panels, video shows, as well as specific choices of artefacts and artworks.

Prior to the discussion of the ways museum narratives can be ‘disentangled’ through CDA, I would like to briefly argue for the possibility of using critical discourse analysis methods in order to examine documentation derived from the museums under investigation. Again, this study adopts the three-level examination analysed above: looking at the specific form and content of the text in question, linking it to other, related discourses and their interpretation, and ultimately attempting to contextualise it in the wider social and historical circumstances in which it develops.

Fairclough talks about interdiscursivity, examining how discourses and genres blend, forming bridges between texts and contexts: in rather stable and traditional societies, where social conventions are highly respected, texts are semantically more homogeneous than in less stable ones, where texts can be rather heterogeneous, linking different discourses together. Fairclough gives the example of documentary texts, where information and entertainment are combined (Titscher, 2000). One can find similar examples in the ways a market discourse has interdiscursively penetrated the language of education and culture:

> Dundee has long recognised that its cultural activities have the capacity to fulfil a crucial role in improving the quality of life of its citizens and tackling social exclusion. They promote a positive image of the city, contribute to economic regeneration, retain skills, attract jobs, provide opportunities for voluntary and community participation and stimulate lifelong learning….The benefits of a local cultural strategy are that it relates to the City's corporate policies and objectives.
It provides a clear cultural vision which focuses on people’s needs and aspirations, defines priorities and assists in reconciling competing demands (Dundee City Council Cultural Strategy 2002-2006; 3, my emphasis).

Clearly, what is found here is a growing tendency to move from institutional identities to a stronger investment in the construction of an entrepreneurial identity (Fairclough, 1993). Increasingly, cultural policies, and especially museum education policies, are adopting more of a promotional genre of language, rather than one that requires critical thinking or is based on any form of dialogue with its readers/citizens. This is in accordance with the more general emergence of the new managerialism in the cultural sector—the necessity to respond to the economic imperatives of the new ‘enterprise culture’ as discussed above. According to the document quoted earlier, the Dundee City Council Cultural Strategy ‘…is arranged under three Aims, seven Strategic Objectives, twenty one Key Areas and over one hundred Action Points’ (Dundee City Council Cultural Strategy 2002-2006; 5). Such a ‘listing’ syntax of language is reader-friendly, but it is also reader-directive: any links explaining the argument behind the ‘objective’ are lost in such a monologue, where no space is left for the counter-argument. Instead, a clear divide is set between ‘those who are making all these assertions, and those who are addressed at — those who tell and those who are told, those who know and those who don’t’ (Fairclough 2001: 229). According to Bourdieu,

Linguistic exchange … is also an economic exchange which is established within a particular symbolic relation of power between a producer, endowed with a certain linguistic capital, and a consumer (or a market), and which is capable of procuring a certain material or symbolic profit. In other words, utterances are not only (save in exceptional circumstances) signs to be understood and deciphered; they are also signs of wealth, intended to be evaluated and appreciated, and signs of authority, intended to be believed and obeyed (2002:129).

Likewise, exhibition narratives, which use not only language but also images and objects—and therefore might even require specific deciphering of aesthetic forms—are not purely informative. The poetics of exhibitionary language is a unique communicating style, laden with social value and symbolic efficacy. It is hoped that critical discourse analysis can therefore unveil the hidden ‘text’ involved in ‘meaning-making’ in museums; it deconstructs the different layers of meaning by imposing a critical questioning of the visual communication. Adapting Fairclough’s model of text and discourse analysis (1992), the following schema for exhibition interpretation appears:
By starting from the analysis of a specific display, the researcher can move to the interpretivist model of looking at how people actively produce meanings and make sense of them on the basis of shared ideas and pre-knowledge. Finally, the analysis widens to a macro-sociology of education and culture, by examining the socio-historical conditions that govern meaning production and learning processes in museums (Fairclough, 1992). Every phase of analysis is embedded in the previous one, emphasising their interdependence and allowing the researcher to move back and forth between the three strata of examination. According to Fairclough, there are two types of interpretation:

Interpretation-1 is an inherent part of ordinary language use: make meaning from/with spoken or written texts....Interpretation-2 is a matter of analysts seeking to show connections between both properties of texts and practices of interpretation-1 in a particular social space. Notice that interpretation-1 is part of the domain of interpretation-2; one concern of interpretation-2 is to investigate how different practices of interpretation-1 are socially, culturally and ideologically shaped (2002: 149).

This research uses critical discourse analysis in order to go beyond looking at the ‘interpretive repertoires’ (Hooper-Greenhill, 1999) people use during their museum encounters, to an interpretation-2 model of analysis; a focus on the explanatory connections between museum exhibitions, education and social relations of power, and therefore on questions of ideology.

In what follows I will give an example of such analysis, by looking at one aspect of the exhibition display in Verdant Works, an industrial museum in Dundee. The museum opened in 1996 by Dundee Heritage Trust, which also runs Discovery Point, ‘Dundee’s flagship visitor attraction’. ‘Discovery’ was the first ship to travel to Antarctica in an exploration expedition in 1901; since its arrival back to Dundee in 1986, ‘it heralded a new identity for the city, that of tourist destination’ (Eunson, 2002: 6). Both museums are independent, which means, in UK museum terms, that they are not public but privately funded; hence the admission fees (almost £6 for an adult ticket, when most museums in the area do not charge admission at all) and the ‘branding’ of both museums as major ‘visitor attractions’ in Scotland. The central theme in Verdant Works, a former jute mill, is the history of jute, an industry that turned Dundee into one of the most important trading centres in 19th century Britain.

**Juteopolis**

This is a thirteen-minute video show which forms the first part of the tour in Verdant Works. It introduces visitors to the story of jute and the reasons for Dundee becoming
'Juteopolis'. It combines old footage, local songs and historical fact in a narrative which attempts to describe the history of jute in Dundee. The experience of a six-month fieldwork in the museum shows that the overwhelming majority of the visitors watch it with great interest. *Juteopolis* is quite a significant part of the visit, in the sense that it gives visitors the very first idea of what they are about to see in the exhibition. In addition, and more importantly, it sets visitors, and especially those that do not have personal experiences of jute, in a particular frame of mind.

Arguably, the video presents a romanticised version of the history of jute in Dundee, one that agrees with the dominant ideology. It does attempt to relate to a wide range of visitors, both locals and tourists, especially older Dundonians—who by far outnum ber all other visitor age groups—and those homesick migrants in countries like Australia or Canada, who often come back to their homeland for their holidays. Nevertheless, no matter the visitor type, the point of departure for all is one—that of nostalgia. This is how an exhibition narrative can turn ‘a great industrial cul-de-sac’, a ‘grim monument to man’s (sic) inhumanity to man’ (Hugh MacDiarmid cited in Whatley, 1993; 160) into a golden history, one that legitimates the exploitation of thousands of workers. Nostalgia is a deliberate choice of mood, which dominates and defines the thematic structure of the script from the beginning to the very end. I would argue that this ideological construct is also used to support a specific profile of contemporary Dundee, that of an entrepreneurial centre.

Here, I will try to analyse specific extracts of the video narrative, even though a great deal of its impact through the animated picture and sound is lost in the transcription. However, critically analysing the ‘deconstructed’ script casts light on many hidden ‘texts’ developing explicitly or implicitly in the video. The analysis follows Fairclough’s model of text analysis, starting from the vocabulary used, looking at the grammar, the cohesion of the sentences and ultimately, moving on to examine text structure (Fairclough, 1992). This form of analysis moves from the specific word (lexicalisation) to the rhetorical schemata used in order to build the ‘architecture’ of the text.

First of all, the visitor is struck by the male narrator’s broad Dundee accent; the person talking is not an outsider. He is ‘one of us’—but who are ‘we’? How does history smooths and unites deep gaps between the powerful and the weak, the masters and the servants? To begin with, a local sense of pride is constructed from the very first sentences in the narration:

> Edinburgh and Stirling both have high places from where the citizens have a broad view of life, but Dundee snuggles against the perfect tower of rock from where one can see the chimneys all around the city. This is the vision Dundee men carry to the ends of the earth, no wonder that they always go back there some day.

Such an introduction works in multiple levels. First of all, it sets the context (‘chimneys’), but also ‘wins over’ the two different audiences the video is addressed at; the locals, who are flattered by Dundee’s superiority upon the other Scottish cities; and the tourists, mainly economic migrants visiting their homeland ‘from the ends of the earth’. The description goes further, to a point where it actually misinforms:

> The setting of the city is stunningly beautiful, so beautiful that it was given the name Donum Dei, gift of God.

According to A. Scott, ‘the name Dundee derives from early Gaelic ‘dun’ meaning either hill or fort and ‘Daig’, presumably an early local chief’ (1999; 10). Interestingly, the narrative chooses a romantic etymological version, rather than the more mundane one.

Briefly giving the background of the jute history in Dundee, the narrative starts from the city’s early years, from its founding in the 13th century and throughout the middle ages. Apparently, jute industry was preceded by ‘merchant dynasties’:

> The historian Hector Boys was proud of his later city ‘for money and virtues and labouring people are in making the clath (=cloth)’.

It is interesting to examine how the history in the centuries before the booming of the jute industry is constructed. It is a world of dynasties, the successful ancestors of the
later jute barons. This is not a legendary fable; it is quoted by a historian, carrying all the credentials of truth and historic accuracy:

The town’s hand loom fever had grown with the intellectual fever of the age of revolution in America and France. But their independence did not appeal to a new breed of entrepreneurs, who began to organise themselves out of their cottages and into weaving shops and in order to impose discipline, a toll order for men used to being their own masters.

This is not a city of rebels or workers; this is a city of entrepreneurs. And when the whole world is shaken by massive popular movements, these men (sic) prefer hard labour and discipline. However, other historians have a completely different view about the ways revolutionary ideas influenced the society of Dundee, one that does not find a place in this narrative:

New political ideas emanating from France and from America...put down firm roots in Dundee. The movement for radical reform and for a more egalitarian society, strong throughout Scotland, took a firm grip of Dundee, which came to be known as the ‘Radical Toun’. (Scott, 1999:33)

And the video narrative continues:

The power looms developed. It was obvious that a new order would prevail, based on child and female labour. When factory commissioners entered the mills in the 1830s undernourished and undersized children as young as nine were found working up to 16 hours a day; the bairns no doubt consoled themselves with the contributions they were making to Britain’s imperial glory.

How is it obvious that the industry would be based on children’s and women’s work? ‘One of the reasons for the higher percentage of women in employment in Dundee was the fact that they were cheaper to employ’ (Scott, 1999:53); this part of the story is silenced completely. History’s great injustices are naturalised, they become ‘obvious’, ‘necessary’, ‘natural’. Even children’s ‘blood money’ is a legitimate cause in the service of the British imperialistic 19th century foreign affairs, a well-known populist ploy used for the legitimisation of domestic or colonial exploitation.

The narrative goes on to describe the era of the establishment of Dundee as Juteopolis and both the problems and the benefits of industrialisation:

As the city was industrialised, dozens of mills like the Verdant sprang. Some of the new works are most imposing structures, palatial in appearance, colossal in extent and endurability, magnificence and comfort unsurpassed by the mills in any other town in the kingdom or any country in the world. The jute barons also built fabulous mansions in Perth Road, Broughty Ferry and increasingly in country estates far from the communities in Dundee which generated their wealth. (song) In Juteopolis people’s lives were determined by jute to an extent difficult to imagine today.

Notice the paratactic structure of the clause constructed and the deliberate use of ‘imposing’, ‘palatial’ and ‘colossal’ in order to give emphasis to the architectural elements of the mills. As for the ‘magnificence and comfort unsurpassed’ it is a shame that, according to Patrick Geddes, famous Scottish biologist and town planner, writing in 1909, it had to open its doors to ‘that misery of labour, and particularly of woman, which makes Dundee the very hades of the industrial world, and of which the consequences and aggravations, in bad housing, in disease and mortality bills both of adults and of infants, are in those terrible returns of insanity, vice and crime...as to demand an explanation and invite a corresponding special inquiry’ (1909:64). There is no such issue in the video narrative; instead of any sort of reasoning, more of a ‘that’s life’ explanation is given. In one of the interviews that were taken in the museum, a similar viewpoint to that of Geddes’s emerged through the discussion:

-But what they should have done, those barons, the wealthy ones, that were sleeping in great big houses, what they should have done is give proper houses to the people. But they didn’t think like that (Interviewee 30).

-Yes, this was the one side of the story that was not told here today, the
inequalities and the poverty. What was given was a more romantic side; they looked at the good points. (Interviewee 31)

-THEY didn’t even have enough money to feed their children, yi ken? It wasn’t the good old days, these were the awful days! (Interviewee 30)

An account of another interviewee contrasts strongly to the video narrative:

Verdant Works and all these places show you only the best, you follow what I mean? They show you only what the jute industry was supposed to be like but the reality was that if you saw the people...They were four and five feet tall, because they didn’t even have the food to grow, and then the air...What they call the stour and dust, you know, and the smell, the stuff...Oh, the air was absolutely polluted (Interviewee 21).

Here is how the video portrays the same picture to the visitors:

The sweet smell of jute was the city’s perfume, a head and body smell as the city’s working and living environment became one.

I am going to conclude by looking at the way the Dundee women and migrant workers are portrayed, along with the jute barons. Notice how women, even though, as later stated, ‘a matriarchal society developed’, still have the traditional role of up-keeping the city; no mention is given to women’s strikes or to the Dundee suffragette movement arising in those years. This is a negative image of the women of Dundee, coming in sharp contrast to the textile magnets’ gifts to them:

On the streets and in the works the mill lassies were described as loud, disordered and hard girls, accused of indecent conduct; anarchy and lack of discipline were their characteristics. Yet, the sewing girls grew up to become the women of Dundee that kept the social fabric of the city intact.

…..

Nevertheless the quality of living in Dundee was enhanced; the city’s art collection is superb, parks such as Lochee and Baxter Park were laid out, the Caird Hall, the Technical Institute and University College were all endowed by textile magnets.

The level of specificity here regarding the philanthropic donations to the city, shows how preferred information is given in over-complete, detailed ways. On the other hand, dispreferred information regarding popular discontent, class-based conflict and the Chartist movement (Whatley 1993:118), are all seen as irrelevant and thus silenced. On the contrary, the owners of the factories are mentioned again and again throughout the film. These are some of the descriptions used for them: ‘merchant dynasties’, ‘entrepreneurs’, ‘jute barons’ and ‘textile magnets’. This form of lexicalisation signals their power in multiple ways, their political, social and economic position against the, sometimes even patronising and very few, references to the mill workers: ‘mill lassies’, ‘bear weavers’, ‘snuffy spinners’. Even worse, the South Asian migrants who worked in the mills are totally ignored. This is the story an Indian lady shared in her interview in the museum:

My husband used to work here and my son as well. I remember they had something like a small mattress and they folded it and put it wherever just for a sleep. It could be inside the factory, or on the pavement, wherever, so that they could wake up and start work again (Interviewee 44).

Another interviewee, from Dundee, had to say:

A lot of the stories about the Indian people who were working in the mills are being neglected. If you asked a lot of the people that used to work here, and you have to catch them because this is an ageing population, a lot of them would remember Indians working at the highest levels. For example, Mr M. was a financial director. This is not part of Dundee’s history that it is put across. That would go against the grain, because what you have here is a paternalistic view. That’s a heritage thing, I guess… (Interviewee 40)
Conclusion

Critical discourse analysis is a research method with an overt political standpoint; the fact that other methods do not recognise or acknowledge their equivalent commitments, does not in any way mean that they are more objective or that similar commitments do not exist (Fairclough, 2002b). My study looks at ideologies as those assumptions built into museum practices which sustain relations of domination. I would suggest that a type of research that only looks at the subjective ways adults make meaning in museums, without examining the socio-historical context of this learning, has its own ‘partiality’ and helps sustain hegemonic practices.

This research uses critical discourse analysis in order to examine the ways in which exhibition narratives can be disentangled, changed and corrected so as to minimise hegemony and achieve democratisation of (museum) discourse (Fairclough, 2002; 201). Were hegemony a matter of this specific museum and video show analysed above, critical discourse analysts would have a much easier job to do. However, the colonised ‘other’, the one who either is outright invisible or, according to more recent trends, deficit, is constructed through complex and continuous textual and institutional practices (Luke, 1996). Museums need to engage with the public by giving people meaningful opportunities to voice ideas and challenge beliefs. Ultimately, critical discourse analysis can unmask power relations through a social analysis of language and image and by reflectively looking at how knowledge, policy and (even one’s own) research can shape and frame ‘truth’.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Mr Brian Martin and Dr Jim Crowther, University of Edinburgh, for reading and commenting on drafts of this paper. I would also like to thank Dundee Heritage Trust for allowing and supporting this research and the University of Edinburgh for having contributed towards conference travel expenses. My final word of thanks goes to the Harold Hyam Wingate Foundation for their on-going financial and moral support.

References


Routledge.


Interviews

Susan Galloway, 14.1.05, Verdant Works, Dundee

Interview 21, 30.6.05, Verdant Works, Dundee

Interview 30, 9.6.05, Verdant Works, Dundee

Interview 31, 9.6.05, Verdant Works, Dundee

Interview 40, 12.7.05, Verdant Works, Dundee

Interview 44, 19.7.05, Verdant Works, Dundee
Creating Compliant Citizens: Structuring the Nation and the Future through Language

Lisa Gunders
University of Queensland

Abstract

Leadership, according to Parry (2001), is probably the most important role that political leaders, and especially the Prime Minister, enact. It involves presenting a vision and generating a willingness within the people to achieve that vision. Part of this vision is the creation of a national identity (Curran, 2004; Johnson, 2000), a sense of who we are and where we are going; who counts as a full citizen and who is on the margins. Through their use of language, political leaders can invoke and change the attitudes and values of their followers (Parry, 2001), enabling them to create “better than they know” (Horne 2001, p. 17), or causing them to focus inward and put up defensive barriers.

As Prime Minister, John Howard has contributed to a vision of what it is to be Australian; where we come from and what the future holds. It is a vision which, on the surface, seems designed to make some people feel ‘relaxed and comfortable’ (Johnson, 2000, p. 6). Yet it also disempowers people through the creation of anxieties and the marginalisation of particular groups.

Drawing on the methods of Critical Discourse Analysis, and using the case of welfare reform as an example, this paper will look at the way in which Howard constructs a vision of Australian identity based on values and attitudes that are conducive to the implementation of his social and economic agendas – agendas which are not necessarily compatible. Political speeches are a key site where the strategies to achieve these goals are played out in language, and so form the major data source for this paper.

Paper

Leadership is a contentious issue (Uhr, 2001), not least in its definition and identification of leaders. By some definitions, failure to act in a socially responsible and mutually beneficial way disqualifies a person from classification as a leader (Parry, 1997). This paper, however, follows Roberts (2003) and Lipman-Blumen (2005) in proposing that leaders can be socially constructive or destructive: That is, they can be good or bad for their own and other nations. Bad leaders, to greater or lesser extent, ostracise others, pursue policies beneficial to their own group but detrimental to innocent others, and exclude variant views (Lipman-Blumen, 2005).

Political leaders have the ability to effect changes in attitude that go beyond those changes brought about by legislative action. Good democratic leaders enable people to create “better than they know” (Horne, 2001, p. 17). Leaders are expected to present a vision of the future, or some goal, to which the people can aspire, one which results in mutually beneficial action (Parry, 1997). Particularly in the Australian context, key roles of the Prime Minister are to engage in “citizen-building” (Uhr, 2001) and nation building (Curran, 2004), including leading the “process of public deliberation” (Uhr, 2001, p. 4).

Claiming to know the future, or to know the only path open to a predetermined future is “to deny it as a future” (Grosz, 1999, p. 6), and undermine it as a “site through which political change can be imagined and, ultimately, realized” (Dunmire, 2005, p. 482), just as an obsession with the past can lead to social inertia (Hewison, 1993). Constructing the present as a time of instability and uncertainty disconnects it from the alternative...
futures it is possible to imagine, making it difficult to see how they could be brought into
being, and, in effect, limiting challenges to the status quo (Levitas, 1993).

Australia’s Liberal-National Coalition government has been in power for almost ten
years, with John Howard as the Prime Minister. Despite occasional speculation that he
will hand leadership to his treasurer, Howard has remained unchallenged as leader
during this time. His longevity as leader of his party, together with his success in leading
it to victory through four elections, suggests that Howard’s leadership is strong and likely
to have significant historical impact. For this reason, it is worthy of extensive academic
attention. Howard sees his leadership role as addressing social and economic
problems, defining future challenges and goals, and uniting Australians “by engendering
a sense of common purpose and community cooperation” (qtd in Parry, 2001, p. 62).

This paper will argue that, contrary to the above expectations of leaders, Howard uses a
discourse of globalisation (Fairclough, 2001) to narrow possible visions of the future and
obscure the historical precedents of his policy positions; to justify his policies and deny
voice to alternative visions. Such rhetorical strategies work to discourage policy debate
and constrain political action (Lavelle, 2005; Shin, 2000), which is essential to a healthy
democracy. Rather than uniting the nation, he discursively marginalises groups who do
not benefit from his vision. It is the contention of this paper that these strategies are
disempowering for many groups. The case of welfare reform will be used to demonstrate
these arguments.

The discourse of globalisation as it is manifest in contemporary western democracies is
only one of many possible ways of constructing nations and economies in the face of
globalising economies (Fairclough, 2001). The policy responses to similar changes in
economic conditions vary considerably among countries (Beeson, 2000; Harley, 2000;
Pixley, 2000). To present globalisation as having a recent onset, as Howard does, blurs
the distinction between the deregulation of the economy and the globalisation of the
economy, and enables it to be presented as something new and potentially frightening.

The research project from which this paper is drawn investigated the speeches of
several government ministers from the beginning of the second term of the Howard
government in October 1998 until August 2000, just prior to the release of a report
commissioned by the government into welfare reform. Welfare reform, along with tax
reform, was billed as a major second-term agenda item for the Howard government. The
data set consisted of 95 speeches from six federal ministers, whose portfolios impacted
on welfare services provision, including those for employment services.

The analytical method used in this paper is based on Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA)
as developed by Fairclough (1992; 2000; 2001; 2003) and van Dijk (1998). CDA sees
discourse as a social practice which both shapes, and is shaped by, power relations in
society (Fairclough, 2001). It analyses texts in both their linguistic and discursive
aspects (Fairclough, 2003). At the linguistic level, it studies such features as vocabulary,
grammatical structure, and textual structures manifest through conventions such as
genres and styles (Fairclough, 2001). At the discursive level, it is concerned with the
orders of discourse, being networks of conventions associated with social institutions
(Fairclough, 2001), and their ideological bases (Fairclough, 2001). Specifically, CDA
seeks to make explicit and challenge the way that power works through language
(Fairclough, 2001). While similar policies and discourses of globalisation and welfare to
the ones examined here occur in other western democracies (Fairclough, 2000), to date,
CDA practitioners have paid little attention to these in the Australian context.

A representative speech by Howard will be used as the main source of evidence for the
arguments in this paper. It was a keynote address delivered to the National Congress of
the Australian Council of Social Service (ACOSS) in Adelaide on 5 November 1998.
ACOSS is a national body representing the community welfare sector in Australia, and is
the principal avenue for the voice of low income and disadvantaged people to be heard
in social and economic policy matters. This speech was Howard’s first and most
complete elaboration of the government’s welfare agenda after election to its second
term.

Speeches are one of the primary ways for politicians to show leadership (Horne, 2001)
and communicate their ideas and vision for their country (Curran, 2004). Furthermore,
the Prime Minister has considerable power in the Liberal Party in Australia, having a
more central position in the party structure than is the case with most other parties
(Costello, 1993), and the power to choose his ministry, but no formal compulsion to
consult widely (Brett, 2003). The parliamentary party, rather than the broader party
organisation, has full responsibility for policy (Brett, 2003). This justifies selection of
Howard as the focus of this paper.

There will be two parts to the analysis section of this paper. First, an examination of the
discourse of globalisation will be presented, to support the argument that this discourse
is used to close down debate and exclude alternative views. Second, the representation
of welfare recipients will be contrasted with that of other groups mentioned in the
speech.

Analysis

A transcript of the speech was downloaded from the publicly accessible website,
www.pm.gov.au. It is approximately 4700 words long, 111 paragraphs (P), and divided
according to the following headings: Introduction (P1-P25), Securing the Nation’s
Economic Foundations (P26-P31), Tax Reform (P32-P49), The Modern Social Safety
Net (P50-P64), New Approaches (P65-P90), Opportunities and Priorities (P91-P105),
and Conclusion (P106-P111). The main line of argument within this speech is that
globalisation presents new social challenges, particularly to the sustainability of
communities and the social security system. Another main argument, which recurs in
many speeches, is that “the first role of any government in securing the welfare of its
people is to provide for sound economic foundations. To this extent, far from being
mutually exclusive, a government’s social and economic goals should support each
other” (P26). Howard outlines the changes his government proposes to the tax and
welfare systems as ways of addressing social problems and “strengthening families and
local communities” (P17) so that they “can be sustained into the future” (P16). The
speech contains assurances that the welfare system is not to be abolished (P66) and
concludes by stressing “the importance of the government and community sectors being
able to work together” (P106).

The speech opens with nationalistic discourse, which praises the values and
characteristics of the Australian people. It describes values of decency, fair mindedness,
family support, hard work, enterprise, and fair sharing as traditionally Australian. This,
together with the discourse of globalisation in the following extract, form the introduction
of the speech, and sets the context for the audience to interpret the later sections on
taxation and welfare reform.

It is undeniable that the onset of what some people call globalisation and the
information age have challenged old ways. Many Australians quite reasonably
fear the pace of change. Some see technology as being beneficial while many
others see it as a device which is driving a wedge between older generations
and the young.

Globalisation is unavoidable. The challenge for government is to manage its
impact. It must be simultaneously beneficial to the community while helping
those sections of the community adversely affected by globalisation to adjust.

It is political fools-gold to pretend that globalisation can be avoided and that
some simplistic wave of the wand is available.

Freer flows of trade and investment have challenged the traditional Australian
notion of the family business or the family farm. Many who have toiled the land
for generations now find that their farm can no longer sustain the family as it
once did.

It is quite understandable that so many feel left behind and resentful.

Part of the challenge for government in these times, therefore, is to address
such concerns.
One of the great challenges today is to find ways that regional local communities can be sustained into the future. (P10-P16)

A number of linguistic techniques are used to effect in this passage. The process by which national economies are opened up to international competition and investment is grammatically nominalised and constructed as an independent and unavoidable force, obscuring the deliberate policy decisions taken by governments in these processes, as well as the differences between globalisation and deregulation.

Lexical choices help to create an image of globalisation as something new. It is said to have an "onset", and challenge "old" ways. Farms are said to "no longer" be able to support a family. Globalisation makes people feel "left behind"; presupposing that at one point everyone was perceived to be at a similar point or level.

Globalisation is set within economic and managerial discourses by the equivalence relations set up with "freer flows of trade and investment", "the information age", and "technology". This also suggests that technology is the root cause of social divisions related to age, rather than structural discrimination, or changes in values and attitudes necessary to succeed in a competitive international marketplace. Globalisation is dehumanised, separating it from human values and emotions, and thereby reconciling a potential clash of ideologies between the social conservatism and free market economics of neo-liberalism with regard to human virtues.

Considerable attention is given to relational values of the text. This refers to the way in which the text helps create social relationships between participants (Fairclough, 2001). Having earlier appealed to the pride of his audience in their common values, in this section Howard appeals to a sense of fear on the part of unspecified others with regard to change and insecurity of life in modern, late capitalist society. This is achieved through the lexical choices noted above, and mention of people reasonably fearing "the pace of change". In acknowledging their fear, saying that it is the role of governments to "address such concerns" and laying his government's plans for reform in the context of traditional Australian values, Howard represents himself as sympathetic to the concerns of his people.

The modality (Fairclough, 2001) used when speaking about globalisation indicates authority and certainty: "it is undeniable", "globalisation is unavoidable", "it must be", "the challenge for government is". Similar modality is effectively used later in the speech in relation to the state of the existing welfare system, as demonstrated in the following passage.

But maintaining the safety net of itself is not enough. It may have been adequate to do so in the post-war decades when a relatively small number of people used it for short periods of time but that is no longer the case.

... For various reasons, far more Australians are dependent now upon government support for sustained periods of time than in our recent history. If we are to meet the challenge of great social change then we need a substantially different approach to the role of community support and indeed, the role of government itself in providing that support. (P64-P65)

Certainty is expressed with regard to the inability of the existing safety net to cope with change. The word 'may' is used to express equivocation as to whether the safety net has ever been adequate, and an 'if . . . then' construction equivocates the willingness of the audience and the Australian people to "meet the challenge of great social change".

This choice of modality, evident in both extracts, contributes to the sense of inevitability attached to globalisation. It is also enhanced by declaratives such as, "it is political fools-gold to pretend that globalisation can be avoided and that some simplistic wave of the wand is available." A binary is constructed between dealing with the changes associated with globalisation, or attempting to avoid them; it does not allow for variation in the way of dealing with them.

The reasons for more people being dependent on the safety net for longer are glossed
as “for various reasons” (P65). The only reasons available to the audience, within the speech, are the challenges posed by globalisation mentioned at the beginning. Glossing over them at this point leaves the connection with globalisation implicit, and as globalisation has already been constructed as an independent and irresistible force, deflects close analysis of the argument and other possible explanations for the situation described.

The analysis so far has argued that the way that Howard constructs globalisation, as inevitable, as potentially frightening, and as something that must be dealt with in a binary fashion, works to constrain debate on economic and social policy.

The next section of this paper draws on van Dijk’s (1998) “ideological square”, a theoretical construct used to explain the ideological maintenance of discrimination through a construction of in-groups and out-groups, to argue that welfare recipients are constructed as an out-group by highlighting their negative actions and attributes while highlighting the positive actions and attributes of ‘mainstream’ Australia (Johnson, 2000).

In contrast to the quite explicitly negative representations of welfare recipients by other ministers (Abbott, 1999; Newman, 1999), Howard is quite mild. He rarely makes specific mention of welfare recipients as such, and is much more likely to talk about “those who are disadvantaged”, or those who have been “left behind”. The negative out-group representation is achieved partly through lexical choice and explicit contrast, but mainly through presupposition.

While described elsewhere in the speech as being “in need”, “dependent”, or “in trouble”, in the following passage, welfare recipients are cast as either genuine or not, and set against the “taxpayers”.

> We have maintained the rates of other allowances paid by the Government to those in genuine need whilst ensuring that taxpayers' dollars are not abused by those who seek to take undue advantage of the system. The integrity of the social welfare system is part of the ‘social contract’ a government has with the community. Taxpayers deserve to see that the social security system has integrity for it to be sustainable and for them to maintain their support in the system. (P60)

They are also set against people on ‘other allowances’, listed in the surrounding paragraphs as aged pensioners, war widows, carers, and the sick.

The passage presupposes both that some welfare recipients are not in need, and that there are people taking advantage of the system. Presuppositions do not need to be supported with independent facts or data, and so the extent of such problems is left open to interpretation by the audience.

Much of the negative portrayal of welfare recipients is through presupposition, as the following extract demonstrates:

> Education and training are fundamental to achieving the vision we want for Australia in the twenty first century. The Government will be seeking to lay stronger foundations for life long participation in education as one of the key elements in creating and maintaining opportunities for employment. We will continue to emphasise the basic skills of literacy and numeracy, and to work on ways to strengthen the skills of the teaching professions in schools.

> As part of our integrated approach we will also be seeking to ensure that all young people, whatever their career aspiration [sic] have access to a quality pathway from school to further employment.

> Our new Youth Allowance is a prime example of giving young people the necessary incentives to remain in education and training until they are suitably equipped to enter the workforce. At the same time it provides active incentives and assistance for young people to break out of dependency.

> Work for the dole is an example of how government can help instill [sic] a work ethic in our young people while demonstrating to the young unemployed the need to give something back to the community that supports them generously.
The extension of Work for the Dole to Year 12 school leavers after three months receipt of full Youth Allowance will not only reinforce our commitment to mutual obligation, but will also ensure that this group is helped from the outset to develop and maintain self esteem, confidence, and good work habits. It will help many to make a smooth transition to the workplace. (P71-P74)

The passage presupposes that literacy and numeracy skills and poor quality teaching are responsible for unemployment, and that people need incentives to "break out dependency", that they will not do so of their own accord. This suggests that they are incapable of knowing and acting in their own interests. It is also assumed that they lack a work ethic, and have little or no self esteem, confidence, or good work habits (P74).

At the time this speech was delivered, youth unemployment was receiving a lot of media attention. Work for the Dole, a program whereby people receiving income support payments can be required to work on community projects in order to continue receiving their payments, has since been expanded to include older people and the long-term unemployed. Because the program has been continually expanded, it is reasonable to take the presuppositions applying to young people in this passage as applying to other unemployed people.

The speech sets up an implicit comparison between the negative representation of people on income support, and the positive representations of the government and other Australians, who are described in the opening of the speech as “a down to earth people”, with “a sense of fair play and a strong egalitarian streak”. They are associated with hard work and enterprise. Such praise is effective in attracting a favourable audience response (Atkinson, 1984). The government is described in terms of its “commitment”, its roles and the challenges it faces, its goals and plans and the benefits these will provide, its generous support of youth employment, pensions and Medicare, and its work with other agencies. Howard describes the government as having “acted resolutely” to restore a budget surplus, and securing stronger economic foundations through “some difficult but fair decisions”. The activeness, work, and initiative of the government and the people are highlighted while the passivity, lack of work and work skills, and dependency of welfare recipients are foregrounded.

Discussion

Two main discourses have been discussed as part of the order of discourse of welfare appearing in this speech. These are nationalistic discourse, and a discourse of globalisation. The above section dealing with the representation of welfare recipients could also be described as welfare discourse. Nationalistic discourse is used to posit individual character traits as the answer to the challenges of globalisation. The welfare discourse emphasises personal flaws as leading to welfare dependence. Both discourses focus on individual explanations for failure or success. The reference to teaching quality (P71) is a rare exception to this. Earlier parts of this speech, which emphasise the strength of the economy due to the government’s management, help to work against structural explanations for unemployment.

In contrast, the discourse of globalisation constructs globalisation processes as inevitable and obscures their connection with the values or decisions of particular people. The only sphere of action construed for individuals is at the personal level. Even government is claimed to be only capable of managing the impact of globalisation (P11), rather than being able to control its direction.

The solution to sustaining both communities and the welfare system is to be through a coalition of government, business, and community working together to “strengthen” society with the values listed in the opening section of the speech. Measures to strengthen the economy are less clear, but include tax reform (P32-P49), budget surpluses, low inflation, and low interest rates, which are claimed to aid employment growth (P28-P30). These measures, together with a focus on individuals and traits such as hard work, enterprise, and self-reliance, are part of a neo-liberal ideology. Possibilities to challenge this ideology are closed down through the focus on individual traits and glossing the reasons for more people being reliant on welfare. Setting up a
binary between accepting globalisation or not rather than allowing for a range of
positions, and presupposing the rightness and positive value of the above neo-liberal
approach without allowing discussion of alternatives, reinforces this. Because of this
presupposition, the government’s approach to dealing with globalisation appears to be
the only possible one, and not accepting their approach to the economy, welfare policy
and tax reform is equated with “pretend[ing] that globalisation can be avoided” (P12).

Globalisation is attributed with creating many social problems and upsetting previous
expectations, and is equated with new, but constant, change. The psychological impact
of extensive, rapid, and constant economic, social and cultural change over the past
three decades has, for many people, been increased feelings of stress, anxiety and
insecurity (Mackay, 1993). Howard draws on this anxiety to motivate his audience’s
retreat to traditional values and acceptance of his reforms under threat that without
these, “the long term viability of any social safety net is in doubt” (P33). Limiting the
possible imaginings of the people in this way, by drawing on fear and constraining
discussion of possible future paths is, I argue, disempowering.

People who are likely to hold differing ideologies are either ridiculed as foolish and
simpistic (P12), or represented negatively as a needy and sometimes potentially
abusive (P60) out-group. Representation as an out-group contrasted to ‘real’ Australian
citizens in this way promotes ideological discrimination and is disempowering for those
groups so represented.

This paper set out by suggesting that good leaders are expected to inspire and
empower the people to create a better future. I have argued that the evidence in
Howard’s speech suggests that he does not meet the expectations of a good leader. By
constraining debate on possible futures and the policy directions to achieve these, he
discourages people from actively participating as citizens in a democracy. By
constructing a section of the people as an out-group, he does not live up to his own
standard of uniting the people. These tactics have been successful for Howard, and
while unchallenged, will remain effective in pursuing other policy agendas, such as the
current focus on industrial relations.

References
Abbott, T. (1999). Beyond the unemployment pieties: Speech to The Committee for the

London: Methuen.

from http://www.acoss.org.au/about/index.htm#What%20is%20ACOSS

and the ‘national interest’. In P. Boreham, G. Stokes & R. Hall (Eds.), The
Frenchs Forest, NSW: Pearson Education.


Curran, J. (2004). The power of speech: Australian prime ministers defining the national

political discourse. Discourse and Society, 16(4), 481-513.


Uhr, J. (2001). *The language of Leadership: Prime Ministers as political institutions*. Discussion Paper No. 90, Graduate Program in Public Policy, Australian National University.

Third Age Learners and ICT: Training and Support Implications

June Hazzlewood
University of Tasmania

Abstract
Training and support implications are drawn from a doctoral research study about older men and women who are learning to access information and communication technology (ICT) in the third age of active retirement. Australia’s population is ageing due in part to the increased life expectancy of both men and women in retirement, which is a consequence of medical advances and healthy lifestyle choices. At the same time the falling birth rate and immigration policies are resulting in a greater proportion of the population who are old and who are young. This national population trend, which parallels the global ageing demographic is particularly noticeable in Tasmania, which state has overtaken South Australia as the Australian State with the highest proportion of people over sixty years of age.

The primary focus of this research study is on the effect that available and affordable training and support has on the fostering or inhibiting of the acquisition of ICT literacy by men and women in what Laslett (1989) called the ‘third age’ of active retirement. Some of the ICT training and support issues and implications for older adult learners are directly related to the longer lives now stretching ahead of them or, as Jarvis (2001) puts it, to the long leisure years that confront retirees. A secondary focus is on the implications for learners, families, trainers, providers and non-government organisation (NGO) volunteers and policy makers. The implications are both social and economic as the current trend for men and women to enter the third age earlier due to early retirement and work-related redundancy, is being reversed. Many of the baby boomers who are swelling the ranks of the third age are also seeking to acquire ICT literacy for personal enrichment or for vocational reasons as the technological age gives way to the age of connectivity. The extent to which ageing and adult learning research, theory and practice inform each other.

Implications for policy makers are indicated as a need is identified for the adoption of a broad strategic approach to equitable formal and informal third age ICT training and ongoing support. The significance of this post-retirement study lies in the expected need for men and women to stay at work longer and for older adults to come out of retirement to return to the age-skewed paid or unpaid workforce. A need for a vision for the future, which is designed to include rather than exclude older adults, is critical as the age imbalance is marked by global greying.

Background
The demographic of ageing constantly features in government reports, academic research and the popular media. In Tasmania, for example, Jackson (2005) writes that the Tasmanian population shows a significant and sustained rate of growth despite the brain drain caused by the departure of younger people for interstate and overseas destinations. Jackson states that while this outflow is more than compensated for by the arrival in the island state of post-World War II baby boomers and older adults, in 2003, almost 50% of the 29 to 65 age group who arrived in Tasmania were aged between 50 and 64. She reports that 10,000 more adults over 65 are added to Tasmania’s population every five years by both natural addition and new arrivals. In what could optimistically be called a brain gain, this age exchange, however, also adds to the age imbalance in this regional Australian area.
Warburton and Bartlett (2004) decry the negative ageing problem mantra, suggesting that the opportunities should be considered as well as the challenges. They suggest a change in emphasis, which acknowledges the positive and extensive, if largely unrecognised, contribution of older people to social capital and civil society. The urgency of the need for provision of appropriate and affordable ICT training and support for these third age learners is reinforced as some of these retired men and women may need to return to the paid workforce, albeit in a part-time capacity. This situation is expected to arise as the ‘baby bust’, which followed the baby boom, depletes the second age workforce. Vocational training is an urgent need for those older adults who wish and are able to remain in, return to, or enter the paid or volunteer workforce to fill the predicted employee hiatus. A training and support implication for policy makers and funding bodies is that subsidised ‘on the job’ vocational education training—even commercial work experience—is just as important for older adult NGO volunteers, who are responsible in many cases for running small business enterprises, as it is for employees in the paid workforce.

Theory, Research, Policy and Practice

Theory put into practice, informing research and generating theory, has been a well trodden path writes Field (2000, p. 10), who suggests that “historically, the lines of communication between investigators and practitioners in our [lifelong learning] field are relatively short and uncluttered”. Field adds that as the interest in the adult education sector grows and its boundaries are blurred, “we may need to look for ways of renewing and strengthening dialogue between research and practice”. Awareness of theories of ageing and of adult learning as they are applicable to the new learning required in the technological age has implications for all stakeholders, but particularly for ICT course developers and trainers. The role of the trainer or facilitator and the rhetoric of the policy makers impact on post-compulsory adult community education as the vital two-way link between the ivory tower and the coalface, or as Kilpatrick (2003) writes, the ivory tower and reality, is not always recognised, acknowledged or even present. Research into learning, however, that matches the special needs of older adults, holds both theoretical and practical implications for training and support provision as King (1997) and Mott (2000) attest.

The literature reviewed reveals synergies between theory, research and practice. Clark (2004), for example, suggests that the delivery of learning for older people requires different approaches when compared to the training required for younger people. He stresses that this is especially important if older learners need to acquire skills they have never used or encountered before as, for example, with new technology learning. Jarvis (2001), on the other hand, declares that older learners as students do not need different teaching methods, but that they do need to be able to use new knowledge and skills.

There is also a growing body of knowledge about brain plasticity and the implications for learning new skills in later life. Equating learning computing with second or subsequent language acquisition, Prensky (2001) differentiates between the way children and adults learn a language other than their mother tongue, describing young and older learners as digital natives and digital immigrants. Magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) used to identify which parts of the brain are involved in learning (Prensky 2001; Wolff 2003) show that adults register second or additional language learning in a different part of the brain from children, which may have implications for third age ICT learners and trainers.

Incentives and Barriers to ICT Uptake

In the literature reviewed and in this study, barriers, whether major digital divides or minor digital gaps are more often mentioned than incentives. The implications here are that ICT training and support attention is focussed on the re-active too little too late catch-up rather than the motivating pro-active needs-based life-stage relevant promotion activities. Awareness, motivation, encouragement and opportunity are factors in influencing third age decisions whether to take the first hesitant step on the Super
Highway by choice or necessity or whether to remain on the side byways. Relevance, accessibility, usability, affordability and availability of resources and appropriate training and ongoing support for ICT learning in later life are significant for a range of stakeholders. Buys (1998) sees implications for training providers aiming to match training and support to the needs of new users of technology.

The immediacy of communication made possible via email is a prime incentive for older adults to become e-seniors (Kilpatrick & Hazzlewood 2001). Adult children provide encouragement to parents with gifts of ‘hand-me-up’ computers (Scott 1999) as they themselves upgrade their equipment. Accessibility by older adults to affordable, upgradable personal computers, Internet connection and appropriate training and ongoing support are found to be essential elements in achieving success in ICT use. Implications for website developers are that web pages are reported to be difficult to navigate, making information, which is often not obtainable elsewhere, inaccessible. Obscure links and jargon-laden content are also reported to deter novice older adult ICT users.

Literacy, Numeracy and ICT Literacy Issues

Literacy and numeracy deficits mean that much of the text-based material is out of the reach of many and this can cause a lowering of confidence and self-esteem. A lack of basic literacy skills is a severe limitation for many older adults, however, as others in this peer group have similar problems, this is not a focus in informal age-segregated groups and may be one reason for the satisfaction expressed in the comfortable non-threatening learning environment of the ACE ‘great good third places’ away from home and work referred to by Oldenberg (1997).

There are both awareness and remedial implications for ICT course developers as well as trainers with or without adult literacy and numeracy teaching experience. There are implications here for trainers, text-based course developers and website designers to provide a range of innovative material to suit different learning styles and different literacy levels.

Physical and Cognitive Ageing Issues

Age related physical problems include sight impairment and hearing loss. Sight impairment is a major computer training and Internet use problem for older adults. This has implications for designers of training manuals—many have small sized text and graphics—and for website designers, who do not include provision for enlarging text. Hearing loss, a largely concealed age-related deficit is a significant barrier to learning with implications, not only for trainers, but also for public speakers who either decline to use microphones, or use them ineffectively.

No study of adults learning in later life can avoid touching on aspects of cognitive ageing. It is generally accepted that while chronological age is not a critical factor in determining how adults learn as they age, cognitive slowing is a factor which has implications for learners, trainers, course developers and training providers. Adaptive technology solutions are readily available and should form part of train-the-ICT-trainer instruction. The reality of cognitive slowing with its implications for ICT training and support is acknowledged in the studies reviewed, also the recognition of individual differences rather than generalised similarities (Burns 2002). Age-related cognitive impairment has dual implications for older adults learning about and via ICT in later life. One aspect relates to the attendant memory lapses and awareness of techniques to compensate for these decrements (Williamson, Wright, Stillman, Schauder & Jenkins, 2000; Sargeant & Unkenstein 2001). The other cognitive ageing aspect is that more time is needed by many older adults to select and carry out ICT procedures (Manheimer, Snodgrass & Moscow-McKenzie 1995; King 1997; Cody, Dunn & Hoppin 1999; Burns 2002), and to practice and complete coursework within required time frames (Taylor, Rose & Wiyono 2004). Older adults may take a little longer to learn new skills than when they were younger and report that they also need more time to process
information and associate it with what is already known.

Another time-related aspect featured in the findings in this study has implications which may qualify to some extent cognitive slowing generalisations. A major factor reported by most of the sample participants to inhibit their ICT learning is that many simply lack the time to practice skills learned. Multiple family and NGO roles in retirement take a time toll as older adults acquire ‘sandwich generation’ commitments, which erode their retirement choices. Responsibilities include care for ageing parents, partners or siblings and assistance to working children as babysitting surrogate parents to grandchildren. The need for older adults to cope with constant changes in the technological age is in direct contrast with the changes experienced in earlier eras, when these occurred almost imperceptibly and over periods longer than the average lifespan.

Short term episodic memory deficits frustrate many older adults as they misplace keys and glasses and forget names and phone messages. One of the implications for those involved in assisting older adults to become ICT literate is the need for recognition that until the new knowledge is internalised as semantic memory and the new accompanying skills are well practised, they are as ephemeral as items in episodic memory. Recent optimistic scientific findings about the ageing brain (Greenfield 2003) counter previously held views which suggested that cognitive decline for all in later life is both inevitable and irreversible. Social engagement, however, where older adults maintain social connections and participate in physical and mentally stimulating activities, is thought to arrest cognitive decline (Bassuk, Glass & Berkman 1999; Swindell & Vasella 1999).

Social Capital and the Wider Community

Aside from its social implications, Australia’s ageing demographic will have many implications for health and social security costs and the tax system. (McIntyre 2005) Falk and Kilpatrick (2000) suggest that there are benefits to communities, regions and the nation from an active, learning population and that emerging evidence shows that active and learning older people not only contribute to society directly, but also indirectly by easing the economic cost of health care and associated services such as home-based care.

Older adults who are able to access training and ongoing support benefit themselves, their families and friends, strangers and the wider community. The acquisition of ICT literacy is important not only to function in everyday contemporary life, but also to ensure that the experience and enthusiasm that older adult volunteers contribute to community social capital is not lost and that large numbers of third age learners are not marginalised as the age imbalance increases. The bulk of training and supporting a growing number of older adults who are learning to acquire ICT literacy in the long retirement years is left to the generosity of largely untrained peer volunteers.

An implication for all stakeholders is transition strategic planning to bridge the gap between pen, paper and telephone and online banking and shopping and particularly for financial institutions to be involved in providing secure online transaction. The informal ACE sector, which caters for the needs of those unable or not interested in vocational learning, is well placed to provide both training and actual and virtual support for older adults learning new skills in retirement. The sector, however, is often starved of ICT training and support resources with too few third age volunteers attempting to fund training and support for too many potential third age learners by means of small grants. Failure by second age policy makers and gatekeepers to address the deficit issues will isolate and marginalise a significant proportion of the population. The fostering and channelling of the diverse lifespan experience and enthusiasm of older adult volunteers who contribute to community social capital is both critical and cost effective.

The rewards for investing in people throughout life have never been greater, and the need for it has never been more urgent. It is the key to employment, meeting skill and knowledge needs, supporting economic growth and sustaining communities, and progressing the reduction of social and regional inequality.

Adult Learning Australia (2005)
References


King, D., (1997), The Virtual Older Learner. Paper presented at the CAUCE, Canadian Association for University Continuing Education, Saskatoon, Saskatchewan.


McIntyre, J., (2005), Adult Learning and the Ageing Population, In Quest of Learning, Adult Learning Australia, pp.12–13.


Mott, V., (2000), The Promise - and Peril - of Web-Based Course Delivery in Adult and Continuing Education: East Carolina University, USA.
Developing a Critical Discourse: Michel Foucault and the Cult of Solidarity®

Mark Hearn
University of Sydney

Abstract

Australian trade unions face the organizational and ethical challenge of advanced liberalism and its privileging of an enterprise culture, an ideological hegemony which unions, with their traditions of solidarity and collectivism, struggle to resist (Rose 1999; Keat & Abercrombie 1991). As McKenna argues, corporate culture seeks to infuse the subject employee ‘with the logic, the episteme, and the ethics of corporations.’ Critical Discourse Analysis offers a research methodology for ‘improving the lives of ordinary people by making transparent the relationships of power that oppress and diminish.’ McKenna advocates an interrogation of the discourse of corporate culture while leaving a number of ethical assumptions unexamined - although postulated as driving moral imperatives of CDA: ‘class identity as a worker’, ‘solidarity in collective organisations’, ‘class solidarity.’ (McKenna 2004 pp.21, 23) What do these terms now mean in the context of an enterprise culture? Do they unambiguously privilege claims of freedom, or do they contain and have they legitimated practices that mitigate against solidarity, promoting their own forms of oppression or exclusion? Foucault’s ‘mobile sensibility’, a ‘desire to stay close to changing events’, may as Barratt argues help to critique solidarity in terms of its implicit codes, its ethical conduct and its present challenges, sensitive to ‘a continuous questioning of values and commitments, a preparedness for self criticism, a willingness to change and to accept the pluralism of values’, and suggest new forms of political agency. (Barratt 2004 pp.199-200)

Developing a critical discourse of solidarity requires a dialogue with history. From the late nineteenth century Australian unions embraced a cult of solidarity that has required liberal governmentality as a defining reference point of ethical and organisational validation - while living in an uneasy and ambiguous relationship with liberalism. There is a need for a new labour history that addresses the relationship between liberalism and unions, and the often unexamined propositions of labour history – solidarity and mateship, union-state relations, internal union organisation - and the limits traditional union practices and values place on union renewal. Unions cannot move forward until they have clarified their values. This history would collapse arbitrary distinctions between past and present; history understood as a discourse of identity, of our acts of self-actualisation and validation, so that we know who we are and how to live. The ‘continuous questioning’ of Foucault’s mobile sensitivity suggests a new history of union organisation and solidarity, a new story of how to live.

Introduction

If Michel Foucault was reconstituted as a cyborg consultant and asked by the Australian Council of Trade Unions to travel to Melbourne and recommend new strategies for a struggling movement, how would he commence his examination of the discursive events that constitute the archive of Australian union culture? He might ask for any number of reports and books that probe and lament the apparently relentless decline of trade union membership, or seek to urgently activate ‘organising’ strategies (Peetz 1998; Combet 2003; Crosby 2005). Unions now represent just 23% of the workforce, and 17% of the private sector workforce, steadily losing their grip on the instrumental base of their
solidarity with their own constituency, and thereby shedding their identity as unions and their status and function in liberal polity (ABS 2002). Foucault might recognize these reports as the traces of a culture ‘salvaged from its downfall’, but perhaps he would detect that they failed to account for the culture’s ‘mode of existence’, the conditions which governed the appearance of its statements and their complex interaction, and how these statements were invested in practice and attitude (Foucault, 2000a p.309).

Perhaps Foucault would summon the abundant volumes of Australian labour history, and histories of unions and arbitration (see for example Hagan 1981; Patmore 1991; Hearn and Knowles 1996; Isaac and Macintyre 2004). He could see these histories opening a path of interrogation into the potent, genealogical fragments of union and class discourse, the relations of power revealed in this genealogy (Flynn 2005 pp.23-5); or he might reflect that their analysis was diminished, as Edward Barratt suggests, by an unwillingness to engage in ‘a continuous questioning of values and commitments’, perhaps the key element of Foucault’s critical system (Barratt 2004 p.199). Immersed in the great archive of the Australian labour movement, searching this elaborate system of statements and observing their ‘paradoxical existence’ as ‘singular and historical’ events, with their own weight and significance as ‘monuments’, Foucault’s technologically enhanced eye might catch on some neglected volumes in a dusty corner, intrigued by the Commonwealth of Australia Government Gazette for January 1984. A singular text that stands as an historical monument of the union movement’s claim of solidarity, of its conduct in the formation of Australian liberal governmentality, and a monument of union downfall. (Foucault 2000a p.309; 2003 p.146; Flynn 2005 p.21).

The Gazette recorded the applications that unions submitted when proposing to change their rules under the Commonwealth Conciliation and Arbitration Act 1904. Unions registered under the Act – and nearly all Australian unions were registered – could apply to alter their rules. Unions would commonly apply for consent from the Australian Conciliation and Arbitration Commission to change their ‘conditions of eligibility for membership of an organisation’, or ‘consent to a change in the description of the industry in connexion with which an organization is registered.’ The Gazette recorded and announced the lodgement of these applications, and served notice that any other organization registered under the Act, including unions and employer organizations, could lodge an objection within a specified time period. The applications provided highly detailed lists of union membership and industrial coverage. In the event of objections being lodged - and invariably there were - formal hearings would be conducted before the Commission’s Industrial Registrar (Commonwealth of Australia Government Gazette No.G 1, 10 January 1984 pp.13, 17.).

While employer organizations might register an objection, it was understood that these ‘rules matters’ as they were known, were essentially the internal and indeed a tribal contest of the union movement, a conflict whose terms were regulated by the state. Through these ‘demarcation disputes’ unions sought to alter their coverage of membership and their coverage of industry at the expense of rival unions. These rules matters were for union officials a regular and familiar aspect of their practice. Some of these applications were relatively trivial or procedural; the more substantial attempts to change or expand coverage reflected the industrial and political rivalries of the labour movement, represented by unions and the Australian Labor Party, the political organization formed by the unions in the late nineteenth century and with whom the unions maintained a unique and fractious solidarity.

Foucault would have been attracted to the discourse of union rules as an exercise in self-surveillance by unions, and as an expression of governmentality – ‘the range of practices which constitute, define, organise and instrumentalize the strategies individuals in their freedom can use in dealing with each other’ (Foucault 1996 p.448). In Australia in the early twentieth century, liberal governance had created through the Conciliation and Arbitration Act an ‘apparatus of security’ which the labour movement had encouraged and embraced; and here in the archive is the evidence of how this embrace of state-sanctioned security survived late into the twentieth century (Foucault...
Ironically the state discipline of union rules, which unions came to accept as a function of the cult of solidarity, had initially been imposed in the early 1900s by the Commonwealth and State arbitration jurisdictions as a device to subdue union militancy and particularly to promote conservative – and often white collar – unions loyal to employer interests (Hearn 1999a). Regulating union solidarity fulfilled the discursive mission to which the Commission was dedicated: to promote ‘industrial peace’ – that is, fulfilling the Commission’s function of facilitating the smooth operation of capitalist work relations within a liberal polity.

A History of the Present

Joan Didion once observed that ‘we tell ourselves stories in order to live’, a dilemma acknowledged by Beverley Southgate: ‘That is precisely why we need to sort out what we believe a good life actually is, for it’s only after having resolved that question (however provisionally) that we’ll know what characters and events from the past we need to recruit to enable us to get there’ (Didion 1979 p.11; Southgate 2005 pp.118-119). For Foucault the reconstructions of the past also had an ethical and political purpose. ‘My problem is to construct myself, and to invite others to share an experience of what we are, not only our past but also our present, an experience of our modernity in such a way that we might come out of it transformed’ (Foucault 2001b p.242). History has to be a story of our present experience and dilemmas, and a task requiring that we ‘lower the barriers’ between history and the social sciences (Flynn 2005 p.293). We need new stories that bring together our historical and contemporary analyses to tell us how to live in a culture of enterprise - creatively responding to this ethical and existential predicament rather than trying to maintain brittle walls of resistance.

I am a product of the history of solidarity and its contradictions. As a young union officer in 1984, it was my role to scan the detailed rules applications for subtle and minute changes of coverage; none of the changes sought by the applicant union were obvious at first glance. You would have to keenly search the dense columns of text in the Gazette, from the detailed list of hundreds (and sometimes thousands) of employment classifications in the existing rule to the equally detailed list of the proposed rule, to detect the often obscure but potentially significant change being sought. I would seek to establish if the proposed change would impact on the coverage rights of my union. If my union had an interest in the matter, I would appear in the Commission on a prescribed date of hearing and I would literally, and very briefly, ‘appear’. I would stand at the bar table and register my name, and the name of the union for which I appeared; sometimes ten, twenty or thirty other union officers, or lawyers engaged by the unions would do the same. The appearance of lawyers was a sign of significance, reflecting the seriousness of the applicants’ intentions - or the fact that an objecting union felt sufficiently threatened.

Sometimes I would merely sit in the gallery and observe. My appearance was entirely insignificant, as was the hearing itself; the hearing was usually a brief ‘mention’ of the matter, a term borrowed from judicial discourse and which reflected the highly legalised function and culture of the Commission, which for many years had been formally constituted as a court (Isaac and Macintyre 2004). Often I would be quite baffled about what was being mentioned, other than a list of names; within a few minutes the hearing would end and the Registrar would rise and bow to the assembly, who in turn would rise and bow in response, and I would leave the court room unenlightened as to the progress or to the conclusion of the application. Around me other officials and lawyers would seem to realise what had transpired, exchanging shorthand remarks and wisecracks about the case or about one union or another, remarks which only those familiar with the world of unions would understand. Sometimes they would simply rise from the bar table and sort their papers with a frown or a knowing smile.

For the uninitiated historian or contemporary researcher examining the Gazette or the transcripts of these rules hearings, it is confronting to be presented with a kind of
shorthand code – as it was a problem for a young union officer. Foucault would have understood that was important for the advocates of this discourse that the application and the hearing process was expressed and functioned as a code; the code is part of the story – we speak to each other in codes, naturalising our behaviour and our chosen metaphors; part of that code is the insider knowledge expressed in remarks and glances around the bar table. Foucault believed that to discover the formation of statements, the system of thought which constitutes the discourse of the subject, it is a matter of reconstituting another discourse, rediscovering the barely audible, murmuring, endless utterance that animates the voice heard from within and re-establishing the tenuous and invisible text that skims through the interstices of the written lines and occasionally jostles them. The analysis of thought is always *allegorical* in relation to the discourse which it uses. Its question is invariably: What, then, was being said in what was said? (Foucault 2000a p.306)

A principle of union solidarity constituted the underlying discourse of union participation in the rules proceedings. Solidarity was the ideal by which unions chose to govern themselves and their own behaviour. The rules proceedings were a mechanism for regulating their own behaviour and compelled allegiance to the cult of solidarity, a faith that took on a form of veneration among its adherents. The proceedings reflected the union movements fractious tribalism, a fractiousness which paradoxically was itself an expression of the cult of solidarity; periodically testing the agreed boundaries of demarcation was a way of re-establishing and asserting competing forms of solidarity, with one union asserting that their version was superior to that represented by a rival; but in the end all accepted that a new balance of agreed demarcation and solidarity had to be re-established, as unions sought to reassert some sense of a common *movement* on behalf of the rights of its working class constituency - however that movement was divided by political, industrial or personal rivalries.

The thick planes of employment classifications in the *Gazette* also represented order, a desire to impose ‘similitude’ and a shared bond over classifications that often had no basis of shared identity other than their tight unification on the pages of rule books and *Gazette*. The classifications established for unionists the ‘...empirical order with which he will be dealing and within which he will be at home’: a reassuring familiarity and as such a compelling appeal to conform to union culture and organization (Foucault 1994 pp.xix-xx). Solidarity also promoted conformity, and a predominantly male form of social inclusion. Unions rejected the enrolment of women and non-white workers as members; through the arbitration process the state sanctioned these exclusions (Hearn 1999b; Ryan and Conlon 1989). Union solidarity was self-limiting, placing an imagined limit around behaviour. By constraining options of the imagination, solidarity constrained options of action and empathy.

The re-establishment of the solidarity/demarcation status quo was rarely resolved by a judgement of the Commission. Some applications were resolved by private negotiation amongst union leaders; others simply seem to emerge as brief outbursts of aggression or assertion and then subsequently lapse. In nearly all cases, the pre-existing status quo was maintained, although this claim of static and fractious resolution is tentative, as there is little literature on the phenomenon of Australian union demarcation. Peetz has argued that ‘demarcation and territorialism’ was a factor in creating, by the end of the twentieth century, ‘an unusually sclerotic union movement in which significant parts have difficulty in adapting to change’. Peetz does not follow the logic of his pungent conclusion into an analysis of the values that produced clogged union structures and behavioural dysfunction. (Peetz 1998 p.182)

Unions clung to this form of inward-looking self-regulation long after its purpose had lost its meaning, and lost its organic relationship with the external world, a realisation that apparently occurred to John Macbean, a deputy president of the Commission (and former union official), in 1993. Asked to adjudicate a demarcation dispute between the Australian Workers Union and the Construction, Forestry, Mining and Energy Union over
the allocation of work constructing a proposed Aluminium Rolling Mill, Macbean expressed his frustration with the unions:

> It seems almost beyond description that in one of our country's worst recessions, with nearly one million unemployed and, despite all the union amalgamations, the joint partners' have been subjected to a lengthy period of delay and uncertainty … The time has long since passed when the country at large and the trade union movement can afford the luxury of unions squabbling over who is to perform the work on a project which is to employ over 600 persons while thousands seek work, including their own members (AIRC 1993).

Macbean added that the case ‘has occupied the Commission and the parties in a total of 15 sitting days; 10 witnesses have given evidence, and 59 exhibits have been tendered.’ This expensive and protracted dispute, in which Macbean enforced a fractious compromise on the unions, was in fact a relatively brief battle in a war which had developed and endured since the 1920s between the AWU and the CFMEU, a conflict based in cold war political rivalries, disputed industrial coverage – particularly of the civil construction industry – and personal antipathy between the rival union officials. During the 1990s the two unions continually returned to the Commission, and engaged in industrial action as they competed for coverage, each claiming superior standards of solidarity and organizing and maintaining a struggle undisturbed by the union amalgamation strategy imposed by the ACTU in 1987 - and designed in part to diminish demarcation disputes – or by the drastic decline in private sector union coverage (ACTU 1987). It is difficult to gauge the response of these unions’ members to these disputes; in the hearings the Commission and the competing unions interpreted workers in the same terms as the dense lists published in the Gazette - as abstract constructs of disputed coverage.

In particular, it is argued that pp. 5 and 6 of the CFMEU rules (exhibit P8) confines the CFMEU to covering non-trades persons in the following manner:

> (1) workers (other than tradesperson), on any work in or in connection with or incidental to the erection, repair, renovation, maintenance, ornamentation, alteration, removal or demolition of any building (AIRC 1993).

The CFMEU ultimately failed in applications to assert ‘exclusive representation’ of civil construction and mining industry workers at the expense of the AWU. The Commission, true to its historic mission on behalf of liberal polity, found that exclusive coverage was not in ‘the public interest’. By 1996 Commonwealth industrial relations legislation encouraged, as the Commission observed in its decision, ‘enterprise agreements’ – a heterogeneous form of industrial relations that might - or might not - include unions in the employee-employer bargaining process (AIRC 1996).

By the 1990s rules disputes had no impact and little meaning in the workplace or the nature of union coverage, and it was often quite divorced from the rapidly accelerating phenomenon of declining trade union membership, and the threats posed by labour market deregulation and hostile government legislation, a process unfolding from the mid 1980s and now becoming entrenched in law and workplace culture.

**Continuous Questioning? Critical Discourse Analysis and Enterprise Culture**

The Howard Government’s ‘WorkChoices’ workplace reforms pose a fundamental challenge of relevance and organisation for the Australian trade union movement. The reforms place significant restraints on collective bargaining, the right of unions to enter workplaces and the right to strike (Australian Government 2005). WorkChoices completes the Howard Government’s project to withdraw the liberal state’s recognition of unions and their legitimacy as representatives of worker rights, a process the Government commenced with the Workplace Relations Act 1996. Perhaps most critically, WorkChoices profoundly individualises the nature of workplace relations.
through an aggressive promotion of the individual employment contracts (‘Australian Workplace Agreements’) first introduced in 1996.

WorkChoices entrenches the shift to an enterprise culture that has been developing in Australian society over the last twenty years. Enterprise culture individualises economic and social life in a regime of labour market deregulation, privatisation and restricted welfare for those struggling without work, or faced with underemployment and enforced casualisation. Rose describes how the ethic of ‘advanced liberalism’ specifically infiltrates and individualises employment relations by seeking to turn ‘employees into entrepreneurs’. (Rose 1999 pp. 144.-145, 156)

In terms of organization and values unions are not well placed to meet this challenge. At just 17% of the private sector workforce unions are reaching a catastrophically low level of coverage, yet it is in the private sector that unions must substantially rebuild coverage in order to meaningfully represent the new generations of workers. While enterprise culture leaves little time for the collective expression of union allegiance, unions cling to a traditionally embedded ideal of solidarity. Michael Crosby, an influential advocate of ACTU organising strategy, links defending union demarcations to upholding an ideal of ‘good union behaviour’ - ie, solidarity, but with little sensitivity to the insularity and structural rigidity generated by demarcation disputes. Crosby cites Peetz as an authority on reforming union strategy but does not engage with the concerns raised by Peetz about demarcations. Nor does Power at Work reflect an awareness that state discipline of union rules developed as an instrument of suppressing union militancy - encouraging a culture of union division (Crosby 2005 p.273).

Academics sympathetic to unions and workers alienated and oppressed by enterprise culture also resort to appeals to solidarity, without necessarily considering how solidarity might need to adapt in a radically changing culture. McKenna argues that critical discourse studies (CDS) offers a research methodology for ‘improving the lives of ordinary people by making transparent the relationships of power that oppress and diminish.’ Exploring how critical discourse studies can develop this politically engaged strategy, McKenna presents a searching critique of theory, methodology, worker identity and subjectivity as he interrogates the discourse of the ‘corporate culture’ that seeks to infuse the subject employee ‘with the logic, the episteme, and the ethics of corporations’. Yet the ethical assumptions that McKenna suggests should form the basis of resistance to corporate culture, such as the idea of ‘class solidarity’, are left unexamined, as are similar identifications - ‘group identity as a worker’ and ‘solidarity in collective organisations’ (McKenna 2004 pp.21, 23). McKenna laments that it is ‘highly improbable’ that class solidarity can be maintained in corporate culture and rather meekly concludes that as a result ‘the social, political and cultural implications are profound indeed’ (McKenna p.24). McKenna leaves the question of future strategy and intellectual interrogation unresolved, an absence that seems to undermine his fundamental claim that CDS helps us to understand ‘the relations between discourse, power, dominance [and] social equality’, thus promoting ‘a political teleology to reduce inequality’ (McKenna 2004 pp.10, 15).

Employing discourse analysis to promote equality and workplace justice requires a willingness to engage in a critical examination of what terms like ‘class solidarity’ now mean in the context of enterprise culture. Do such appeals unambiguously privilege claims of freedom, or do they contain and have they legitimated practices that mitigate against solidarity, promoting their own forms of oppression or exclusion? The history of Australian unions suggests that the ethical assumptions that have sustained union mobilisation require a more searching interrogation.

Barratt has advocated the relevance of Foucault’s ideas and methods for the study of management and organizations, and argues that Foucault’s ‘mobile sensibility’, a ‘desire to stay close to changing events’, may help to critique solidarity in terms of its implicit codes, its ethical conduct and its present challenges, sensitive to ‘a continuous questioning of values and commitments, a preparedness for self criticism, a willingness to change and to accept the pluralism of values’, a critique that may help generate new
forms of political agency. (Barratt 2004 pp.199-200) Barratt suggests that the
interrogation of enterprise culture, and its effects on employees and manifestation in
organizations, is still insufficiently problematized, although this dilemma is steadily being
addressed in the critical discourse, organisational discourse and Human Resource
Management literature (Keat and Abercrombie 1991; Fairclough 1995; Grant and
Shields 2002; Knights 2002; Grant 2004; Wasson 2004).

Problematisation is a key aspect of Foucault's later work (Flynn 2005 pp.26-27). In 'The
Ethics of the Concern for Self as a Practice of Freedom' Foucault sought to examine
how the ancient Greeks ‘problematised their freedom, and the freedom of the individual,
as an ethical problem’ (Foucault 1996 p.436). Flynn notes that Foucault was concerned
with addressing ‘the constitution of the moral self’ (Flynn 2005 p.28). This form of self-
interrogation, and the key relationship it establishes between self knowledge and
freedom, seems to recommend itself to a new construction of union solidarity and the
interrogative codes we employ to develop that construction.

Foucault relates the idea of the care of the self and the care of others to the ‘power
relations’ that prevail in society. We cannot rid ourselves of the responsibility of
exercising power or of participating in power relations, but we can restructure power
from traditional top-down control to promote ethical power relations between free
individuals. ‘The problem, then, is … to acquire the rules of law, the management
techniques, and also the morality, the ethos, the practice of the self, that will allow us to
play these games of power with as little domination as possible.’ Foucault advocates
power as ‘strategic games between liberties’. (Foucault 1996 pp.446-7). Does this
“liberated” conception of power deny the essential power relations of the employment
relationship? Can it be used by unions to compel employers to restructure power
relations?

Foucault’s notion of power is often interpreted as describing a top-down relationship of
authority and subject. Hussein describes Foucault’s ‘grim vision … of incarceration and
terror.’ This is the realm of panopticon power described in Discipline and Punish
(Foucault 1991). Hussein also notes Foucault's critique of ‘modern rationality’ that
constructs regimes of power less brutal but no less domineering, a power insidiously
effective because of its ‘anonymity and diffusiveness’ (Hussein 2002 p.137). Aspects of
this kind of modern, rational power can be seen in the state discipline of union rules; the
power of the state is masked by its apparent encouragement of union practice and by its
restrained intervention in that practice. However Foucault’s conception of power as
described in ‘The Ethics of the Concern for Self’ seems also appropriate – power as a
creative exchange between free and willing subjects and networks. Foucault made this
point explicitly in regard to governmentality, which he defined as ‘the strategies
individuals in their freedom can use in dealing with each other.’ (Foucault 1996 p.448)
Unions were willing participants in the development of liberal governmentality because
the process which they helped to create and sustain offered them validation. Yet the
history of Australian unions suggests that this freedom does not necessarily lead to an
unambiguous moral responsibility. Union solidarity was also an expression of their own
cultural irresponsibility, which unions in turn made manifest in their relationship with the
liberal state.

The Heterotopia of the Hearing Room

Flynn argues that ‘spatialized reasoning’ is a central feature of Foucault's methodology,
and a more interrogative history of solidarity is suggested by Foucault’s preoccupation
with the way in which power created spaces of ‘legibility’ (Flynn 2005 p.89, ch.4). Unions
believed that regulation of industrial relations by the state would enhance the economic
and social rights of their members. But as Rose observes, what was created in this new
form of liberal government was ‘a space of regulated freedom’ in which the conduct of
the disciplined subject would be examined and transformed. (Rose 1999 pp.22, 24)
Foucault stressed the spatial nature of the disciplines of government in Discipline and
Punish, arguing that ‘discipline proceeds from the distribution of individuals in space’. The monastic cell, the factory and the panopticon architecture of the prison were all expressions of this discipline (Foucault 1991 p.141). As Rose observes these techniques were also applied in the forms of liberal governance developed in the early twentieth century: ‘to govern, it is necessary to render visible the space over which government is to be exercised.’ (Rose 1999 p.36) Liberal governmentality was represented in the physical space of the Commission’s hearing rooms - in the bench for the president, deputy presidents, commissioners and the industrial registrar, who for the purpose of rules determinations was vested with the authority and prestige of a commissioner. Beneath the bench were the commissioners and president’s assistants and the stenographers who undertook the vital task of literal transcription of the proceedings. The bar table was reserved for employer and union advocates; the audience sat behind them.

The hearing room was, as Foucault observed, ‘a space laden with qualities’ marking out a space of managed conflict, where the tensions of the negotiation of workplace rights and obligations could be enacted or represented (Foucault 2000b p.177). The Gazette was also a spatial representation of liberal governance, providing an official representation of the territoriality of unions; spatiality understood as an exercise in defining boundaries, not only rendering the subject visible, but as Rose observes ‘assembling information about that which is to be included and devising techniques to mobilize the forces and entities thus revealed.’ (Rose 1999 p.33) Unions mobilised to discipline themselves and their members, a process in which unions were the active participants, the industrial registrar often applying only the lightest supervision by facilitating brief mentions of an application. State intervention could be applied indirectly and with restraint, fulfilling an essential principle of liberal governance. (Rose 1999 p.70)

Foucault described ‘heterotopias’, as emplacements ‘designed into the very institution of society’. Heterotopias were diverse and ‘different spaces … a kind of contestation, both mythical and real, of the space in which we live.’ Spaces with ‘precise and specific operation within the society’, representing contestation and, in this realm of Foucauldian paradox, a kind of mirror: ‘from that gaze which settles on me, as it were, I come back to myself and I begin once more to direct my eyes toward myself and to reconstitute myself there where I am.’ Heterotopias legitimated the subject and validated their own function through self-scrutiny and in ‘purification ceremonies’, that exulted their status and access to privilege, a ‘system of opening and closing that isolates them and makes them penetrable at the same time … one can enter only with a certain permission and after a certain number of gestures have been performed.’ The process of application, its official publication, the call to appear and the registration of appearance at the hearing, each stage duly recognised by authority (Foucault 2000b pp.178-180, 183). Foucault identified ‘heterotopias of deviation’ – rest homes, psychiatric hospitals, prisons - implying that heterotopias provided a focus of panopticon power and surveillance which the subject was complicit in creating through his own transformative gaze: ‘Governable spaces … make new kinds of experience possible.’ (Rose 1999 p.32) The heterotopia of the Commission made a new experience of governable solidarity possible – a new form of living that suspended the need for self-examination beyond that required for the maintenance of the reconstitution and reflection of solidarity. A heterotopia ‘not of illusion but of compensation’, a ‘different real space as perfect, as meticulous, as well-arranged as ours is disorganised, badly arranged, and muddled.’ (Foucault 2000b p.184) Solidarity’s seamless integration within the system provided its attraction, some sense that the muddle of union mobilisation was capable of order, if not perfection, and was worthy of recognition; a refraction of self-image that accounts for its durability in union practice, until liberal governance withdrew its sanction.

Australian labour history has generated compelling critiques of the power exerted upon the labour movement and the working class, and their attempts to assert their rights (Markey 1988; Frances 1993; Scales 1997). Labour history has not sufficiently problematized this experience. There is no history of solidarity and its complex and contradictory expressions. Nor has union or working class participation in the creation of
power relations within liberal governance been subject to sustained interrogation – a project tentatively commenced by the New Left in the 1970s, abandoned and only fitfully resumed (Rowse 1978; Connell and Irving 1980; Davidson 1997). Foucault’s work, and the renovated techniques of discourse analysis that it inspires, suggests a number of ways in which Australian union and working class experience can be interrogated, and how we might better understand how these subjects problematized their own experience and our inheritance.

The Discourse Analyst as Parrhesiast

Scholars have drawn attention to the transformative ambitions of Foucault’s work, which found particular force in Foucault’s late works. It was framed around the ancient Greek concept of parrhesia, ‘a form of frank truth telling, practised in the public domain and involving an element of risk or sometimes actual physical danger to the speaker … Evoking Socrates, the goal of intellectual work is at once to transform the thought of others and one’s own thought.’ (Barratt 2004 p.195; see also Flynn 2005 ch.11; Foucault 2001b pp.11-13) Barker adds ‘one writes precisely to call into question not just what one knows, but how it is that one elaborates a relation to this knowing.’ A process that ‘calls into question what one is, and so opens up the possibility of what one might be in the future.’ (Barker 1998 p.84) By its nature parrhesia tied the speaker to civic life, a duty ‘to improve or help other people’ (Foucault 2001b p.19).

The process of continuous questioning is required to intensify our understanding of the past and present conduct of union organization and mobilisation, to open up the possibilities of what this conduct might mean in the future. ‘The Ethic of the Concern for Self’ suggests that union claims to govern and represent the interests of their members can only be reinvigorated by applying the Socratic idea of self-examination and self-transformation: ‘To constitute oneself as a governing subject implies that one has constituted oneself as a subject who cares for oneself’ (Foucault 1996 p.442). Dolvik and Waddington implicitly acknowledge this need when they argue that unions require a new form of ‘organic solidarity’, that breaks with the old and disengaged assumptions of ‘mechanical solidarity’, and pays ‘greater attention to the needs of individual members … while also placing a stronger emphasis on the interdependence between individual self-realization, group cohesion and collective regulation.’ (Dolvik and Waddington 2004 p.34) Organic solidarity suggests a path unions might follow in an attempt to re-engage with employees who have either lost or have no familiarity with the values and structures of union organization. Compelled to engage with such workers, unions would be compelled to examine the basis of that engagement. Empathy can only be generated from a process of self-scrutiny and self-awareness that provides a basis of care and support of others.

Barratt describes Foucault’s project as ‘an ethic of discomfort, or of never being wholly at ease with one’s own values or commitments.’ (Barratt 2004 p.197) This ethic lent Foucault’s work its moral force and its transformative political and intellectual effects. We need not follow Foucault methods in a literal minded way, but we need to follow his challenge to problematize our experience and by so doing transform our understanding of it – and by so doing transform our ethos and practices as individuals and intellectuals. The ‘continuous questioning’ of Foucault’s mobile sensitivity suggests a new discourse of union organisation and solidarity, a new story of how to live.

* Dr. Mark Hearn is the co-editor of the forthcoming Rethinking Work, published by Cambridge University Press. He is a Research Associate in Work and Organisational Studies, School of Business, University of Sydney.

References

Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS) (August 2002) *Employee Earnings, Benefits and
Trade Union Membership, Australia" 6310.0.


Gendered Readings: Moving Towards a Pedagogy of Transformation®

Claire Hiller
University of Tasmania

Abstract

The central concern of this paper is to explore the role of pedagogy in providing discursive spaces for students in response to narrative texts in English classrooms. Through an examination of classroom talk collected over a one year period of observations of a secondary English/literacy classroom, the author has constructed a network of intersecting discourses within which students and teachers take up multiple and contradictory discourses. This examination and its subsequent findings contribute to our understanding of the teaching and learning of literature and literacy at both a skills based and critical level, and demonstrates the complex interrelation of discourse, pedagogy and subjectivity. The author’s theoretical position is informed by a constructivist grounded theory (Charmaz 2003) in conjunction with a critical discourse analysis (Kress 1995; Fairclough 2003) which sees that language and discourse informs subjectivity and opens emancipatory spaces for transformation in classrooms in terms of critical thinking and literacy development.

Introduction

It is argued in this paper that the discursive positionings of students and teachers cannot be understood outside of the pedagogical discourses which frame classroom practices. It demonstrates that pedagogical discourses of teachers, in this case varieties of a personal growth pedagogical discourse, constrain and control discursive positions open to students. In this research the students take up a limited set of gendered discourses in response to narrative texts and are constrained by the pedagogy.

This research works to locate the discursive practices identified in the research within an elaboration of an alternative pedagogy. It moves towards the elaboration of an emancipatory pedagogy to disrupt essentialist categories which re-inforce binary oppositional terms and open up counter-hegemonic spaces for both teachers and students. This pedagogy, in its advocacy of the acceptance of difference and assertion of multiplicity, addresses the relationships of teachers, pedagogy, students and narrative texts and is concerned with renegotiating those relationships in order to transform the lived relationships of teachers and students in the English classroom. The research reviews the discourses reproduced in one English classroom in terms of gendered subject production through pedagogical practices which are identified in this research. The research also reviews the ways in which gendered positions are set up and reproduced through pedagogical discourses in one site.

The research suggests that from the analysis, the discursive reconstructions of a number of texts and the interrogation of the data, gathered from one English Secondary classroom over the period of one year, there are two dominant overarching discursive positions, one in which the boys prefer to be located and one in which the girls prefer to be located. It does not suggest that these positions are uncomplicated, nor that they are only available to either gender, rather it suggests that because the power structures of the class and the dominant views of femininity and masculinity which are unmediated by pedagogy, girls and boys prefer to be located within the feminised and masculinised discursive positions available. Six dominant discourses were constructed from the classroom talk gathered in one secondary classroom over one year. They are discourses of detection, confirmation, resistance, reflection, speculation and empathy. All students have access to all of the discourses. The differences are the ways in which the students demonstrate their willingness to use the discourses, the extent to which they are embedded in one or another of them and the extent to which they are positioned to take up the discourses.
This research has problematised the binary, masculine/feminine, to complexify it, to reconfigure it, to oppose it and to find ways of disrupting it. The aim of this research has been to deconstruct the initial binary, masculine/feminine, and to reconstruct it to reveal the complexities in ways not obvious in the initial binary. It has been to read against the text, to deconstruct it, to question the assumptions which shape it. It has not been to destroy, rather it has been to examine ‘the limits of what we think we cannot think without, our most cherished assumptions’ (Lather, 1991b:5). The interrogation of the complexities, through the production of complex discourses, is to show the power and stability of the initial binary, the power relations within it and its capacity to close down alternative possibilities. The initial binary, masculine/feminine, has been contested from within, to work against it, disrupting it, yet recognising that a binary system informs all discourses.

**Binary Oppositions**

**Dominant Discourses**

From the beginning of the research, the binary opposition of gender was central to the methodological and theoretical approaches. The masculine/feminine binary, is elaborated in terms of the discourses produced and reproduced, recognising the complexity and contradictoriness that exist within them. The research argues that the constitution of complex gender regimes in an English classroom are produced and reproduced through the dominant pedagogy operating. Through the interaction of narrative texts, pedagogical discourses and existing gendered subject positions, the research demonstrates how the pedagogical discourses produce and position students in complex, gendered ways.

The discourses of the students are listed as a set of binary oppositions in a way similar to that of Lee (1996:206-207). They are detection/speculation confirmation/reflection resistance/empathy.

The students take up the discursive positions because they are available within the pedagogical discourses operating in the classroom. This suggests that pedagogy determines gendered positions in some direct senses. These discursive positions are organised around the strong binary distinction masculine/feminine. The gender relation is one of masculine apprehension of the world, after Lee’s ‘masculine subject’ (1996:206) knowing and feminine insertion in some of the senses of Lee’s ‘feminised world object’ (1996:206). The discursively produced binary positions are those constructed through the examination of methodology and theory in the research analysis. The binary pairs demonstrate relations of gender and power which suggest issues for a theory of gender, pedagogy and texts in ways which question and do not reproduce the binaries.

**Detection/ Speculation**

The first two binaries, detection/speculation, like the other binaries, show the gendering processes at work. The students take up different positions to narrative texts which can be understood in terms of this binary. Most of the boys in this research seek for surface features of narrative texts and look for facts. It is not that the girls cannot respond in this way, it is that they choose to locate themselves differently. The boys’ oral demonstration of the detection discourse is recognised by the teachers as competence. Whatever the boys do is constructed by many teachers as better than what it is that girls do (Walkerdine, 1990b:127). In this binary, for instance, the attention of the boys to surface facts in narrative texts is endorsed as least as much as the speculative attempts of the girls which are often regarded as weaker, less focused and more uncertain than those of the boys. Most of the boys locate themselves on the surface of the narrative text whereas most of the girls prefer to operate in-depth, below the surface of the narrative. The surface facts of the narrative texts are contextualised by the real life experience of the boys and not within the text. The internal coherence of the text is not an issue for boys operating within this discourse. For the girls, the world of the narrative text is important. In the discourse of speculation they can hold at least two worlds, speculating that the world of narrative texts exists outside and other than what might be a real life experience for them. This discourse is a less powerful position for the girls because it relocates them in positions which values multiplicity and diversity. It is similar to Lee’s fact/value binary (1996:206).
Confirmation/Reflection

The second binary is confirmation/reflection. The boys take up a strong position to the narrative text in the discourse of confirmation. They use the facts to confirm their view of the world. This fits with the ‘instrumental’ view suggested by Lee (1996:207). The discourse of reflection is much more ‘relational’ (Lee, 1996:307). Facts, for many of the girls, are much more relational and open to contestation. Where confirmation seeks closure and singularity of meaning, it rapidly includes and excludes what will be accepted or not as confirmation of a world view. The discourse of confirmation is aimed at including only that which affirms a particular world view. In the discourse of reflection the girls use narrative texts to construct world views. The confirmation discourse is external to the text, whereas the discourse of reflection is about constructing open and changing meaning and is internal to the text.

Resistance/ Empathy

The third binary is resistance/empathy. The boys detect the facts, confirm them and take up a position of resistance to contradict positions that they find unacceptable. The girls, because of their discourses of speculation and reflection, are open to a position of empathy. The discourses of detection and confirmation fix the boys more rigidly to the text and to the world, especially in terms of hegemonic masculinity. In the discourse of resistance the boys refuse to accept readings of the text that do not confirm their reading of the text and the world. They are resistant readers in the sense of Kress (1989) and Cranny-Francis (1994). They resist the text itself, they dismiss it if it does not represent their world view. Their resistant readings are often a refusal to engage. The discourse of resistance often ends with a position external to the text. This position confers on boys power in the classroom and power to act upon the world. It does not open to them the possibility of multiple discourses which might be valid or the possibility of multiple positionings which might open spaces for alternative agency.

For the girls, the discourse of empathy enables them to relocate themselves in alternative positions from which they can be empathetic even if they reject the position offered. This discourse does not have a singular position in which power is located. It is multiple, not single and it is about understanding and accepting multiple positions. It is relational and non-linear (Lee, 1996:207. It includes the notion of complexity and ambiguity. For girls who locate themselves in this discourse they accept a position of less power. This is a discourse of inclusion as opposed to a discourse of exclusion. Like Lee’s speech/silence binary (1996:206), the discourse of resistance places boys, who take it up, in a powerful position to speak, a position which silences the girls who take up the oppositional position of empathy, placing them in empathetic silence with the position of resistance.

Apprehension and Insertion

Inside/Outside

The three discourses used by the boys and the girls reveal their mutuality and interconnections. Detection, confirmation and resistance show ways of looking at the world which have processes in common. They are exterior, surface, powerful, combining the already known with the new, affirming what is known and resisting that which is not easily recognisable. Reflection, empathy and speculation are likewise closely interconnected. They are interior, reflective, tentative, passive and emphasise the importance of feeling. These two sets of discourses reproduce the public/private, inside/outside binaries. This research has explored how the role of various institutional practices, especially the pedagogical discourses of the teachers, are implicated in the formation of gendered subjectivities and their relationship to narrative texts around an inside/outside, public/private binary. These oppositional discourses see girls and boys as two disparate groups who are disadvantaged in different but related ways within a specific institutional structure. The positioning of girls and boys within the pedagogical practices of an English classroom has different effects and consequences for girls and boys (Gilbert & Gilbert, 1994). Students are positioned to produce different discourses which exacerbate already existing inequalities for girls (Martino, 1994a). It is acknowledged that particular subjects have become feminised and masculinised in the structuring of the curriculum around the public/private binary and that the consequent devaluing of the subject English as a feminised subject has an influence on the boys’ positioning to narrative texts valued in the English classroom (MacDonald, 1980).
In seeking to find the binaries which capture the discursive positioning in this English classroom, a metabinary pair has been identified to demonstrate the oppositional and gendered responses of the students. These oppositional discourses are named ‘apprehension’ and ‘insertion’.

**Discourse of Apprehension**

The word ‘apprehension’ is ambiguous and appealing, capturing the active acts used in implying might and right, a process of viewing the world from the outside, seeing the world as fixed and able to be recognised and comprehended with almost immediate closure. The alternative meaning of apprehension, which is about hesitancy and fear, captures the fragility within which male hegemony is constructed in that boys work hard to maintain an appropriate masculinity and are fearful of its imminent shattering (Connell, 1989, 1995). There is something about the intensity with which the boys hold their positions that suggests their vulnerability. Many of the boys reveal that response to narrative texts requires them to reveal emotions which are not considered by them to be appropriate masculine behaviour. The construction of masculinity and the discursive positioning of the boys indicates how subjectivity is implicated in subject learning. They see masculinity in terms of a specific set of traits such as a capacity for strength, rational thought, sexuality and power. This version of masculinity is in opposition to what it is to be feminine; it is not to feel or to need.

A deeply ingrained aspect of this version of this form of masculinity can be contempt for women or those attributes constructed to be feminine. Women are defined as inferior and in opposition. Men are constructed as the competitors, against themselves and against women. The competitive curriculum of the school endorses a view of competition which is to the detriment of many boys. Boys who learn to compete; who are resistant to authority and to others, learn that to show emotion is not an acceptable part of the discourse of masculinity. What they do not recognise is that this discourse functions to maintain the power structures. To inflict pain on others and to not be affected by it works in the interest of the existing patriarchal order but it is limiting to those who take up that discursive positioning.

The boys, while sometimes inserting themselves into the text, are much more concerned with apprehension; firstly, with the text and the story, and secondly, via the text, the world. This behaviour involves knowing the world, fixing it and acting upon it in ways that may potentially change it. They are concerned with facts and with right/wrong answers, a position which confirms a masculine model of rationality and superiority. Fact-finding is often equated with superior performance by teachers who confirm a narrow definition of school success. For the boys this appears to be a position of power and resistance. Some of the resistance can be seen in terms of a response to perceived failure and a means of achieving an alternative status which is in opposition to anything which the boys consider as feminine. Boys demonstrate the need to compete with each other, to assert their masculinity and to deride those boys who position themselves differently.

Most boys do not want to question or make visible masculine constructions of gender because they do not want to acknowledge that assumptions about masculinity contribute to inequitable positions for boys and girls or that these assumptions might cause them problems. They resist interrogations of homophobia because the fear of being labelled gay puts great pressure on males to prove their heterosexual credentials by conforming to a narrow range of masculine expectations. Overt homophobia works to silence those, male and female, who are not prepared because of the consequences, to position themselves as other. This is a particularly oppressive version of masculinity as it is one which involves violence, competition and sexual virility at the expense of expressing emotions and valuing intimacy (Martino, 1994a, b).

**Discourse of Insertion**

Girls are much more likely to insert themselves into the text. The process of insertion involves identification with plot, character and world as if they are real and as if they, the reader, are part of the story. Girls investigate the world of the text and the real world from the inside, they can speculate about alternative possibilities and accept multiplicity and diversity. Their subjectivity is inside the story. While they accept the possibility and the necessity of change, they do not see themselves as acting upon the world easily. This research argues that this act of maintaining the narrative, especially that of the romance, is endorsed by girls. Such
reproduction of femininity endorses discourses which locate girls in discursive positions of learned helplessness. Dominant forms of masculinity serve to limit ways in which girls can behave and understand themselves. Girls often do not want to engage with issues of gender formation because they are positioned as victims, or the problem, and they do not want to acknowledge this position.

Insertion includes much interaction with the text. Most of the girls are very good at apprehension but are much more willing to move on to less literal readings. They immerse themselves in the text; they participate both in the reading and in the discussions with a willingness that the boys do not show. Their responses show flexibility and mobility towards the texts. Their responses include explorations of readings, the acceptance that more that one meaning is possible. They elaborate and speculate far more readily and frequently than boys. They are more concerned with generating their own meanings than are the boys. Perhaps the boys see themselves as powerful, but when their position is questioned boys resist new meanings. The discursive positioning of the girls indicates that it is in opposition to that of the boys. The girls reveal their preference for nurturance, caring, understanding, emotionality and receptivity to the needs of others. The empathy and understanding which is demonstrated by the girls does not necessarily position them as successful learners. Their apparent compliance can mask a failure to succeed as learners, can disrupt the learning of girls and can marginalise them as valued participants in the learning process. In this study, if a girl demonstrates any of the characteristics which are considered as masculine – independence, overt resistance or assertive intelligence – then her femininity is open to question by the boys in the class, by some of the girls and many of the teachers in the school, although not the teachers who participated in this study. For instance, two girls in this class frequently challenged the boys’ responses. They were sworn at by the boys, called names like ‘dogs’ and told to ‘shut up’. Many of the other teachers in the school expressed their contempt for the two girls and apologised to the researcher for their presence in the class. So their assertiveness, independence and resistance worked against them in a way that it did not for the boys. The position which the boys take up is the most powerful. For boys and girls the meanings they make which are taken as the reflection of an objective reality are both different and gendered.

Processes of Insertion and Apprehension

The discourses of insertion and apprehension are understood as processes which are brought into play according to context and they are not seen as fixed. It is through different pedagogical practices that students can be offered a range of alternative positions.

In a Cultural Heritage and Personal Response Pedagogical Discourse the discourses in which the girls are embedded are often interpreted as suggesting that the girls are better readers, who use a wider and more flexible range of discourses to respond to fictional texts. Yet while girls demonstrate the capacity to be good students of school literature, the discourses they acquire and prefer do not fit them well for success in the world of work. Narrative, if uninterrogated, can act as a powerful means of coercion which fixes individuals into particular subject positions. Being a good girl reader, rather than leading to empowerment, actually leads to the greater manipulation and coercion of the girls. They readily insert themselves into the possible worlds of the texts and embrace the textual ideologies by which they are seduced.

Pedagogy and Discursive Positioning

Feminised and Masculinised Pedagogies

While the subject of transmission pedagogies such as Cultural Heritage might be a masculinised one (Lee, 1996:208), so too the subject of a Personal Response pedagogy is a masculinised one, in that the dominant, the resistant, takes up most of the space in the current English classroom. In the Personal Response Pedagogical Discourse the feminine position is the compliant one (Lee, 1996:209). A pedagogy which endorses personal response at the expense of a critical reading can leave the readers at the mercy of the ideology of the text and maintain the gender ideology which confirms the power of the boys and effectively disempowers the girls. Critical Literacy has the potential to offer methods of deconstruction which potentially lead to an opening of spaces for both boys and girls. Critical Literacy, as a
pedagogy, focuses on a critique of texts and their social and political implications but does not critique the power relations which exist in the classroom. Teachers’ resistance to change, especially to the pedagogy implied in a Critical Literacy Pedagogical Discourse, reproduces a masculinist hegemony which is ultimately disempowering for the subject. However, for the teachers in this research, the negotiation, collaboration and engagement with theory and research lead to both a re-examination of the pedagogical practices which influence the reading positions available in the classroom and the suggestion of possibilities of alternative pedagogical practices, practices which not only offer alternative spaces for repositioning but the opportunity for agency and moves towards a liberatory pedagogy.

The naming of the pedagogy, especially the use of the word ‘transformation’, caused some disquiet and debate among the teachers and the researcher. The teachers were not as attracted to the word as was the researcher. They saw the word ‘transformation’ at first as negative, that it implied separation and alienation. Their tension over its use was both emotional and intellectual in that they wanted a positive, supportive, informative and clarifying word, while the researcher liked the ambiguity, the disruption, the discomfort and the disagreement provoked by the word. The naming of the pedagogy was left for further reflection and alternative suggestions. Finally, it worked on the teachers so that they agreed, in the absence of a better suggestion, that the ambiguity and disruption was appropriate for the intentions of the pedagogy.

**An Alternative Pedagogy**

**A transformative pedagogy**

A transformative pedagogy aims to encourage sharper understandings of masculinity and femininity, especially as they impact on the teaching of narrative texts in the classroom. It works through pedagogical positioning rather than providing a set of teaching practices. Current discourses of masculinity and femininity do not advantage either boys or girls in their engagement with narrative texts. Existing pedagogies do not take sufficient account of the gendered construction of the students, have not attempted to engage with the gendered subjectivities that students bring with them nor have they sufficiently critically reflected on the ways in which pedagogy conflicts with social constructions of gender.

A transformative pedagogy, one which makes visible to both teachers and students how power operates to privilege certain kinds of texts, both those produced and those consumed, is empowering. One of the aims of such a pedagogy is to examine the binaries that currently exist in the teaching of English and attempt to reconfigure them. To break the power of the binaries is to locate the excluded middle between the polar opposites, allowing proliferation of discursive possibilities and subject positions. Currently, many teachers and students accept hegemonic or dominant meanings without question. For example, in accepting that narrative texts are mimetic, reproducing a world that is assumed to be real, both students and teachers reproduce hegemonic meanings of texts. The unequal relations reproduced in a romance text are accepted as real and ‘true’ and the way things are. These dominant meanings freely circulate in ways which exclude the individual subject from the generation of counter-hegemonic meaning. A Personal Response Pedagogical Discourse, such as the one which was dominant in the classroom, reproduces the meanings that the students bring with them from engagement with popular culture. Many of the students in this research saw the popular cultural texts they read as real, ‘mimetic’.

The invisibility of how meanings are constructed, both in texts and through pedagogical practices, means that both teachers and students can easily accept them uncritically and do not interrogate them. They are so embedded in hegemonic meanings that sometimes it is difficult for the individual subject to know what is meant and how those meanings have been generated from already available meanings in the culture. Uninterrogated responses to hegemonic masculinity, as represented in the three narrative texts used, leaves this version of masculinity intact, does not question it. If interrogated as part of a Personal Response Pedagogical Discourse, the students, mostly male, are surprised and reject alternative views. What an alternative pedagogy, one with a critical perspective offers, is a new set of discourses, a politicised frame on pedagogy to help teachers reflect on current pedagogical practices in the teaching of English to ask what it is that the students are learning, what are the purposes of the learning and how the learning informs subjectivity. The aim of such critical
reflection is to be liberatory in the sense of Lather (1991).

The discourses taken up by the majority of the boys are more likely to be associated with objectivity, rationality, denial of emotions and resistance, while the discourses more likely to be taken up by the girls are associated with emotions, acceptance of diversity and complicity. A transformative pedagogy can make visible the constructedness of the discursive positions taken up by both boys and girls and can contribute to the remaking of subject English and the role of narrative texts in it, in order to resituate student subject and subject narrative texts within the resituated transformative pedagogy. Using processes connected with a Critical Literacy Pedagogical discourse, a transformative pedagogy asks questions which situate the students and teachers differently towards texts; it sees that texts can be read differently depending on the purposes for reading them and that meanings are multiple depending on the contexts in which they are made.

The process of transformation can work to deconstruct personal writing and talk in order to reveal the constructed nature of all texts (Kamler et al., 1997:25). This process disrupts the Personal Response Pedagogical Discourse as teachers who are operating in this discourse are not achieving the aims of the discourse because the personal response is not personal, but constructed from publicly available discourses. There is a sense in which the responses of the students are formulaic and clichéd rather than personal, in ways that the students often do not realise. To ask students to deconstruct personal writing or talk and to dislodge a connection between language as a representation of a true self can be threatening but also liberating. Reading the personal as constructed in a transformative pedagogy can question the sense of a true self, represented in so-called personal writing. To question the hegemony of the liberal humanist view of the subject is simultaneously liberating and confronting, yet the site of potential agency.

Processes of transformation expose the complex ways cultural values are encoded in reading and writing and make them visible for discussion. Such processes recognise the difficulty of discarding the gendered discourses in which the students are embedded. For example, most of the students bring both gendered responses to the selection of narrative texts and gendered patterns of response learned through engagement with popular cultural texts and socially produced and accepted ways of talking about narrative texts. An empathetic response, which was the dominant response of the girls in this study, is very difficult to question and to shift. Processes of transformation will be generative and produce alternative subject positionings for students, so that the girls might see that it is possible to see gender as discursively produced in a narrative text and limiting to women, while at the same time engaging empathically with the characters.

**Teachers and Explicit Meaning**

In a Personal Response Pedagogical Discourse teachers’ meanings are often not articulated to the students because either they do not know what they are or they are deliberately withheld in the belief that this frees the students to make their own meanings. A Cultural Heritage Pedagogical Discourse assumes values which are too difficult to articulate to the students, who have to be so embedded in the discourse that the values and assumptions are self-evident. To withhold explicit meanings and purposes from the students is also to maintain power over them. In a Critical Literacy Pedagogical Discourse many teachers believe that there are certain issues which cannot be discussed with students. This prohibits teachers from openly engaging in discussions of power with the students as this would hold the possibility of disruption. The hegemony of certain meanings is maintained by specific relations of power and disrupted by others. Critical Theory has not been used widely in English classrooms in Australia to inform literary pedagogy. A transformative pedagogy contributes to linking the best of Critical Theory and Critical Literacy in transforming the lived relations of gender and power in the teaching of narrative texts. It recognises teacher and student partiality as the teacher and pedagogy are aspects of the complex relationships of the classroom which can be subjected to the processes of transformation and subversion.

**Conclusion**

This research demonstrates that effects and contradictions are the result of discursive
positioning and not individual failure. This suggests the need to make visible the complexity of
the discourses of the English classroom, teachers, students and texts. The performances of
the discourses made visible are thus open to change and re-making and alternative
discourses are made available. Gender, as one of the discursive positionings which constitute
students and teachers differently, is central to the transformative project of this research. The
readings of the multiple texts have suggested the intersubjectivity, intertextuality,
interrelatedness and indivisibility of author/ reader/ text and knowledge/ known/ known. In so
doing, this research has identified and contested the boundaries that limit understandings of
the possibilities for pedagogic positioning and educational transformation beyond those
currently available and has suggested new lines of inquiry and pedagogic development.

References

Alloway, N. & Gilbert, P. (1997) ‘Everything is Dangerous: Working with the “Boys and


Butler, J. (1990) Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity, London,
Routledge.


Collins, C., Batten, M., Ainley, J. & Getty, C. (1996) Gender and School Education, Canberra,


Comber, B. (1997) ‘Managerial Discourses: Tracking the Local Effects on Teachers’ and
Students’ Work in Literacy Lessons’, Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of

Interpretations, Special Issue Critical Literacies, Vol. 30, No. 1, February.

Feminist Perspectives, Melbourne, Oxford University Press.


Maryborough, Australian Print Group.

Cranney-Francis, A. (1992) Engendered Fictions: Analysing Gender in the Production and
Reception of Texts, Kensington, New South Wales University Press.


Research on Subjectivity: Windows on Lived Experience, Newbury Park, Sage,
University Press.


Reform Project, Canberra, DEET.


Constructions of Pedagogy and Masculinity within Teachers’ Discourses

Claire Hiller
University of Tasmania

Jo Winckle
University of Tasmania

Sara Booth
University of Tasmania

Abstract
The purpose of this paper is to demonstrate the value of critical discourse analysis as a methodology for identifying and examining the complex interdiscursive relationships which exist between social constructions of gender, particularly masculinity, and teaching practices within a National on-line English/Literacy discussion forum.

Introduction
In this paper we refer to an innovative research project ‘Boys and Literacy’ (Hiller, Winckle & Booth 2003) that collected data from a National online discussion forum established by the Tasmanian Department of Education to encourage debate amongst the teaching profession regarding various educational issues. A critical discourse analysis was applied to the data and the findings were used to forward the argument that the current ‘crisis’ in boys’ education can be linked directly to issues of gender, power and subjectivity and that teachers are implicated in constructing the crisis which is not in the best interests of students, teachers or society (Connell 1995; Gilbert & Gilbert 1998; Epstein & Sears 1999). The discourses that emerged from this method of analysis also indicated that gendered identities for boys constrict their own development as well as restrict, hurt and endanger positions for other boys and girls.

In keeping with the transformative agenda of a critical discourse analysis Hiller, Winckle & Booth (2003) were able to offer their findings in support of an alternative transformative pedagogy in the English/Literacy classroom that is specifically designed to dismantle the walls boys construct around themselves in order to feel safely masculine (Collins, Batten, Ainley & Getty 1996).

Framework
Within education meaning making is constituted through language and texts, therefore it is about discursive practices and the norms and regulations which inform them. As a methodological approach a critical discourse analysis is potentially transformative for education in that it aims to show non obvious ways in which language is involved in social relations of power, domination and ideology (Fairclough 2001). Critical discourse analysis begins from a position of social justice, is committed to issues of social change and has an emancipatory or transformative intent. The frames of reference used to inform the critical discourse analysis in the ‘Boys and Literacy’ (Hiller, Winckle & Booth 2003) project were
primarily taken from the Fairclough (2001) and Carabine (2001) models of discourse analysis. Both theorists look at language in use, and in particular both theorists look for patterns. To assist in looking for patterns the constructivist grounded theory coding process was also used (Charmaz 2003).

The following demonstrates what the framework actually looked like in terms of the ‘Boys and Literacy’ (Hiller, Winckle & Booth 2003) project.

### Educational Critical Discourse Analysis (Fairclough 2001; Carabine 2001)

1. Select the topic or focus upon an educational issue that has a semiotic aspect.
2. Identify possible sources of data. Read and re-read the data as familiarity aids analysis and interpretation.
3. Identify active codes which occur and re-occur throughout the data. Note the number of times these codes occur, compare and collapse similar codes into categories and then themes making connections between them.
4. Construct discourses from the themes looking for evidence of inter-discursive relationships between them. Look for absences and silences and identify the effects of the discourses.
5. Identify alternative discourses. Look for possibilities for change in the way the educational issues is produced or currently organised.

Using the above model, the critical discourse analysis methodology for the ‘Boys and Literacy’ (Hiller, Winckle & Booth 2003) project, followed these steps.

**Steps 1 and 2** - Select the topic, read broadly, identify sources of data, read and re-read the data.

Recent educational literature has identified that the relationships between theory, teaching pedagogies and learning have not been explored as extensively as the relationship between gender and learning (Davies 1994). Educational theorists have analysed the production of gender in classrooms (Gilbert 1994; Martino 1995; Anstey & Bull 2002) and post-structural feminist theory has shifted the focus from students to curriculum materials, examining how these artefacts have been elevated to privileged positions by social ideologies and particular hegemonic practices (Davies 1994; Gilbert 1994; Mellor & Patterson 1991). Recently this work has been extended to include analyses of the subject positionings produced by curriculum materials and the network of practices within which they are produced and consumed (Anstey & Bull 2002; Luke 1993; Luke, Muspratt & Freebody 1996).

Not only has research confirmed that gender is constructed in the classroom, it has confirmed that gender impacts upon the way students are able to learn. As such teaching and teacher education must ensure that practitioners have access to theories and pedagogies which do not disadvantage students with oppressive and marginalising norms of gendered behaviour. Teachers must also be able to offer students the skills to deconstruct those potentially harmful versions of gender which are ‘located within networks of social relations and cultural practices’ such as school violence and bullying, homophobia, sexism and racism, through to those about boy’s perceived underachievement (Martino 1994, 30).

Teaching and teacher education in Australia, however, has been slow to incorporate post-structuralist theories or transformative pedagogical practices which make explicit the interconnections between issues of gender and learning, theory and teaching practices (Connell 1995; Luke, Muspratt & Freebody 1996; Gilbert & Gilbert 1994). Teacher education still privileges liberal humanist theoretical positions that support uniformity within gender and education, and critical literacy is still considered by many English teachers as an isolated or
separate lesson to be timetabled in during some stage of the English syllabus. This has meant that established norms for masculine behaviour, which are limiting and potentially destructive, remain largely uncontested.

We decided that the best source of data for this educational issue would be the secondary English/Literacy teachers themselves. What was needed was a method for collecting rich qualitative data that would reflect the complexities of teachers’ views, theories, and pedagogies as well as enable the changing social and political contexts of teachers’ workplaces to be considered. Logistically it was not practical to visit all teachers, and surveys and questionnaires were considered too restrictive as a method of data collection. It was at this point that the on-line secondary English/Literacy forum was put forward as a way of collecting rich qualitative responses from a broad spectrum of English/Literacy teachers. The on-line English/Literacy forum was National, it was voluntary and furthermore it allowed teachers to participate in a way that was not static, they were not limited in what they could say, or how they chose to say it, they were able to have an ongoing dialogical interaction with other participants on the forum, and they could change or elaborate on their responses at any given time. The on-line forum was in fact considered to be an excellent example of the way in which meaning making is negotiated, always in flux, partial and above all discursively constructed.

The research data was collected from the online secondary English/Literacy forum late in 2003. In order to obtain a diverse cross section of responses regarding boys and literacy, we posted three questions onto the forum. The questions were,

1. When considering multi-literacies (written, oral, visual, digital) do you think there are areas where boys tend to achieve and areas where boys generally tend to underachieve? If so, do you have any ideas why this might be the case?
2. What factors, in general, do you think influence boys’ literacy development and classroom participation and why?
3. What practices and strategies in the English/Literacy classroom have you found to most effective in improving literacy development and classroom participation for boys?

These questions were used as a framework to stimulate discussion around the debate of boys and literacy. What became evident upon reading and re-reading the data during analysis was the high level of emotion from the participants, which included principals, education officers, teachers and beginning teachers. This highlighted the need for continued research in the interests and needs of boys’ literacy education, in particularly in the area of pedagogical theory and practice. In this article we intend to argue that English/Literacy classrooms need to adopt an alternative pedagogy, informed by critical literacy, which can help dismantle the social construction of gender in schools. In order to appreciate and follow this particular online debate on boys and literacy, we will highlight some of the responses to each of the questions asked. Each of the responses were coded, categorised, and collapsed into themes which were then collapsed into a dominant discourse. Many of these discourses competed and conflicted with each other on each of the questions asked by the researchers.

**Step 3** - From codes to categories to themes to discourses – looking for patterns.

The responses to the questions posed on the online forum were the data used by the ‘Boys and Literacy’ project (Hiller, Winckle & Booth 2003). We analysed the responses using a model of critical discourse analysis which looks closely at language in use and furthermore, looks for patterns (Fairclough 2001; Carabine 2001). This model of discourse analysis is based on the assumption that language is constitutive, it is the site where meanings are created and changed, and therefore to look for patterns is to acknowledge the all-enveloping nature of language as a fluid, shifting medium in which researchers can seldom make confident predictions but can offer interpretations or versions of reality that are partial (Taylor 2001). We also applied a constructivist grounded theory coding process (Charmaz 2003) in our reading of the accumulated data to assist in identifying the patterns, and to aid in the interrogation and interpretation of the data. The dominant discourses were interrogated for inter-discursive relationships, including absences and silences, resistances, counter-discourses and their effects.

**Step 4** - Constructing the discourses.
As a result of comparing and collapsing the themes we constructed seven dominant discourses. These discourses are located in the areas of gender and pedagogy and the subsequent readings of them seek to explore how gendered positions are created and sustained through teachers’ pedagogical practices.

- **Discourses of Gender** - ‘Boys will be boys’, ‘Not all boys are bad’, ‘Boys cannot be categorised’, ‘Boys are better than girls’, ‘Boys are victims’.

- **Discourses of Pedagogy** – ‘Personal Response Pedagogy’, ‘Skills Based Pedagogy’.

Gender, female/male, is deliberately selected as the major binary pair to be opened for scrutiny and interrogation. The other binary pair selected is that of teacher/student. These binary pairs work powerfully in the classroom to position and reposition both students and teachers in terms of power. The investigation of the binaries in their connection with texts provides the basis for the interrogation of the readings produced and the dominant discourses identified.

Instead of suggesting that the discourses represent an opposition between the rational versus the emotional, reading from the head and reading from the heart (Patterson 1997, 431), their workings are rather more complicated and can be seen as an organising principle in literacy education. They are suggested not as psychological or sociological but as discursively produced through a specific pedagogical regime. The discourses are seen as part of a range of responses to a particular set of pedagogical questions, techniques of literacy education and current constructions of gender. The discourses can be read either as an expression of the discursive location of the students and also as a way of regularised literacy response. The analysis of the discourses is not to reveal individual subjectivities of teachers as participants on the online forum but to map the discursive spaces open to and taken up by them in the literacy classroom (Patterson 1997, 432). The discourses produced are seen to enact ‘a series of textualised personae that may or may not correspond to individual subjectivity’ (Fuller & Lee 1997; Laclau & Mouffe 1985). While the discourses appear to have stability because they are socially and culturally constructed, they are also open to change, to reconstruction and extension.

Within the online discussion there are a number of competing and contradictory discourses operating. If subjectivity is seen to be discursively produced and formed out of specific sets of social relations and social practices (Henriques, Hollway, Urwin, Benn & Walkerdine 1984), then the discourses which are produced and maintained on this site are crucial. These discourses reflect the cultural construction of gendered subjectivities and the discursive ways in which these subjectivities are reproduced including pedagogical practices. The construction of the discourses are not intended to maintain any binaries which might exist, rather they are intended to question and disrupt them, rendering them visible for interrogation.

The interrogation of the online responses demonstrates the potential power of the teachers’ pedagogical discourses in contributing to the discourses of literacy and gender. The teachers’ purposes, their theoretical positions and their pedagogical practices informed their responses. In order to explore the discursive practices endorsed by the pedagogical practices of the teachers this paper examines teacher discourse as reflected in the online responses. What emerge are the researchers’ understandings of the teachers’ pedagogical positions, discourses and practices towards boys and literacy. The paper locates the teachers within discourses of pedagogy currently available and subjects the discourses to critical analysis. It does not claim that there is one right pedagogy in currency which would transform literacy teaching. It acknowledges that there are limits to each of the pedagogical discourses available. It suggests an alternative pedagogical discourse to achieve some of the emancipatory aims of critical literacy pedagogy.

In classrooms students learn social, cultural and linguistic meanings through the discourses which are available. They learn what subject positions are appropriate in that classroom. They learn to be members of a community (Kress 1995, 40). They learn how to be students through the pedagogy that is used. They learn how to be participants in the construction of knowledge or they learn how to be subordinate and passive. The context of the classroom presents a set of possibilities for learners, possibilities of social agency and linguistic competence, subject positions that can be critically enabling or coercively conforming. In order to enable children
learn to be critical readers teachers need to tackle the ambiguities which exist in their pedagogical practices. Discourses of both gender and pedagogical practices need to be demystified if alternative spaces are to be made available for readers. Analysis of the responses on the online forum is one way of doing this. The following are condensed versions of the Discourses of Gender and Discourses of Pedagogy.

Discourses of Gender

'Boys will be boys'
This discourse shows that many teachers see gender to be a biological determinant rather than a social construction of society. The problems boys have are more related to a lack of understanding of boys’ physical and developmental processes rather than as a social construct. Boys are concerned with action, with what happens, with surface responses, with hegemonic forms of masculinity, with resistance and judgment. Their responses to texts are seen by the teachers as reflecting a desire to find meaning in the action rather than in human relationships, empathy, speculation or tentativeness. The discourse of action defines boys as logical, judgmental and action oriented. Many teachers see that these are innate biological and psychological characteristics of boys, and should be catered for in the classroom.

'Not all boys are bad'
This discourse refers to boys as a varied group especially in the insistence that not all boys have literacy problems. There is a peculiar resistance to any suggestion that boys might be inadequate in any way and an emphatic insistence that boys are diverse and interesting with a range of commendable interests and hobbies. The responses strain to justify the behaviour of boys and are argumentative in their tone. Boys’ literacy problems are attributed an almost mythical status in its focus on boys as a group. The mythical status of boys' problems serves the function of denying the existence of a possible problem. As Barthes observes, 'A myth, as a language for codifying what a culture values, serves contradictory functions, it points out, notifies, it makes us understand something and it imposes it on us' (Barthes 1972). It is only in the examination of teachers’ perceptions of boys’ literacy learning that the issue is addressed and not mythologised.

'Boys cannot be categorised'
Not all the boys position themselves as hegemonically male, but those who do not, ‘experience an inevitable tension in relation to their masculinity’ (Davies 1989, 124). In the classroom, those boys who try to position themselves differently are silenced by the other boys by derision, by name calling or by other forms of marginalisation. Some of these boys try to demonstrate enough of the qualities of hegemonic masculinity so as to be acceptable to the other boys (Davies 1989, 125). Any of the boys, who might have access to alternative discourses, and are sensitive and feeling, rarely demonstrate these discourses in classroom talk.

'Boys are better than girls'
This discourse raises questions about the construction of masculinity in its insistence on focusing on boys. This makes masculinity a marked category and many of the male contributors who participated in the research were not comfortable with this. The boys resist a position which might be thought of as more suitable for girls or might be sexually suspect. They express horror at the thought that they might be thought to be acting like a girl. One of the worst insults, and one which is used in the class, is to be called a girl. Both girls and boys accept that the nature of friendship is gendered just as sexuality is. They acknowledge that boys have to get around in groups or gangs whereas girls can have a best friend. When the teacher asks why, the boys say that it is a bit ‘suss’ if two boys get around together all the time. The majority of boys are more likely to be associated with objectivity, rationality, denial of emotions and resistance, while the discourses ascribed to girls are associated with emotions,
acceptance of diversity and complicity. The former are privileged over the latter.

‘Boys are victims’

These statements reflect a psychological discourse which endorses boys’ literacy problems as biological, that it is through no fault of their own that these problems are occurring. This is evidenced by the types of texts that are offered by contributors as guides to boys’ learning and development such as Moir’s ‘Brainsex’ and Gurian’s ‘Boys and Girls Learn Differently’. These texts support the argument that boys and girls learn differently and that it is an innate and natural process. These texts make such claims as boys are victims of their own biology and do not show their feelings in communicating, instead as one contributor argues, ‘they write basically to communicate information and fact’.

Discourses of Pedagogy

‘Personal Response Pedagogy’

Pedagogical discourses such as ‘Personal Response’ are complicit in sustaining male hegemonic positions, which include resistance to anything that threatens male hegemony. In a Personal Response discourse, girls are legitimated in an emotional response to texts. Their feelings are encouraged in the classroom and the emphases on relationships are affirmed. On the other hand, boys are confirmed in their tendency to remain more remote from the text and they are encouraged to make reasoned judgments. Such practices which are part of a Personal Response Pedagogy confirm and perpetuate current patriarchal views of femininity and masculinity. The texts that girls and boys are encouraged to read also reinforce popular cultural views of femininity and masculinity. From an early age girls are encouraged to read fairy tales and stories which affirm versions of femininity which focus on beauty and dependence while boys are supported in their reading of either action-based adventure stories or factual and scientific material which encourages a relation to the world which has agency, control and power (Davies 1993; Gilbert & Taylor 1991).

A Personal Response pedagogical discourse encourages girls to see that the texts they read are just as lived as lived experience and assume an important role in their lives, especially in their private moments (McRobbie 1984). They are encouraged to use fiction to escape the demands of real life, to relax and to learn how to behave in real life situations (Christian-Smith 1993). There is evidence that boys use fiction for similar purposes. What differs are the representations of femininity and masculinity in the texts that girls and boys are reading (Christian-Smith 1993). Texts are used as a form of preparation for life or in order to understand one’s place in life. Sometimes girls use fiction as a means of discovering resistance and agency and as a way of exploring alternative ideas of gender. Despite the possibilities for resistance which some girls use, patriarchal ideologies in texts used in the classroom are powerful and persuasive (Christian-Smith 1993; Davies 1989).

‘Skills Based Pedagogy’

The discourse encapsulating the practices and strategies in the English/Literacy classroom which are most effective in improving literacy development and classroom participation for boys are about action, competition, rationality and power. Masculinity is constructed through the responses in terms of a specific set of traits such as a capacity for strength, rational thought, sexuality and power. Men are constructed as competitors, against themselves and against women. The competitive curriculum of the school endorses a view of competition which is to the detriment of many boys. Boys who learn to compete; who are resistant to authority and to others, learn that to show emotion is not an acceptable part of the discourse of masculinity. What they do not recognise is that this discourse functions to maintain the power structures.

This discourse of masculinity involves affirmation of the importance of knowing the world, fixing it and acting upon it in ways that may potentially change it. It is concerned with facts and with right/wrong answers, a position which confirms a masculine model of rationality and
superiority. Fact-finding is often equated with superior performance. This discourse confirms a narrow definition of school success, one of power and resistance. Some of the resistance can be seen in terms of a response to perceived failure and a means of achieving an alternative status which is in opposition to anything which the boys consider as feminine. Boys are affirmed in the need to compete with each other, to assert their masculinity and to deride those boys who position themselves differently.

This discourse refuses to question or make visible masculine constructions of gender and does not acknowledge that assumptions about masculinity contribute to inequitable positions for boys and girls or that these assumptions might cause them problems. It resists interrogations of homophobia because the fear of being labelled gay puts great pressure on males to prove their heterosexual credentials by conforming to a narrow range of masculine expectations. Overt homophobia works to silence those, male and female, who are not prepared because of the consequences, to position themselves as other. This is a particularly oppressive version of masculinity as it is one which involves violence, competition and sexual virility at the expense of expressing emotions and valuing intimacy (Martino 1994a; Martino 1994b).

Step 5 - Identify alternatives, looking for the possibility of change.

We recommend as an alternative to the two dominant pedagogical discourses on the English Forum, Personal Response and Skills Based, a Critical Pedagogy. In order to make views of literacy and gender available for interrogation in a critical pedagogical sense, it is not enough to offer texts which provide alternative positions, although this is very important. It is important to take into account how the readers are reading the texts and to help them find alternative readings and more powerful positions. It is imperative that students learn to become ‘resisting readers’ and ‘resisting writers’. Rather than entering into the text as the personal response theorists would ask students to do, so that the world of the book and the world of the student become one, it is far more productive for students to engage with the textuality of the book, to unravel the many strands in the work and resist that apparent seamless coherence that the work expects (Gilbert 1990, 185).

To reveal how romance texts and other popular cultural texts position men and women differently for instance, is to reveal to students that although the positions might appear attractive, they are inequitable and restricting to both women and men. Girls learn to see agency in terms of the private rather than the public (Rogers Cherland 1994). Girls ‘come to regard the outside world as threatening, in contrast to the boys … who find it challenging’ (Sarland 1991, 55). For students to realise how they position themselves both towards the text and to the world would help to de-stabilise the apparent coherence and naturalness of the positioning.

Hegemonic masculinity, as it is reproduced in popular cultural texts, treats boys as sexual agents while girls are treated as sexual victims. This ideology of the victim and the oppressor is reflected in materials used in schools and in the fiction that is read by children (Fine 1988). It is these textual practices which need to be unravelled in order to empower all students.

‘Critical Literacy Pedagogy’

We suggest as an alternative, a Critical Literacy pedagogy, as it has the potential to offer methods of deconstruction which potentially lead to an opening of spaces for both boys and girls. A pedagogy which endorses a personal response at the expense of a critical reading can leave learners at the mercy of the ideology of text and maintain the gender ideology which confirms the power of the boys and effectively disempowers girls. Critical Literacy, as a pedagogy, focuses on a critique of texts and their social and political implications.

A Critical Literacy Pedagogy argues that texts are social constructs which produce and reproduce certain versions of reality. It is only in the analysis and deconstruction of texts and how people are positioned that exposes the different power relations involved. This pedagogy does not use a deficit view by attributing blame to boys, girls or any other factor. Instead it is more about the responsibility as a teacher to improve their own pedagogy for their students regardless of gender.

One resistant or counter-discourse in the data recommended teaching gender construction as
a subject in schools to improve literacy levels for both boys and girls.

'I believe it would be beneficial to introduce programmes for boys and girls dealing with gender construction and issues affecting adolescents, such as violence, sexuality, feelings and relationships. … Some of these issues need to be brought out of the PE and Health sector of education and into other areas such as English' (English Forum: http://www.education.tas.gov.au/english/forum, 2003).

Another counter-discourse explicitly recommended a Critical Literacy Pedagogy as a way forward,

'We have a responsibility to give each one of our students, in the case of English, access to different text types and discourses. When I attribute blame on something/someone else I am not addressing the problem in my own pedagogy. What elements of my own classroom practice can I improve? As English/Literacy educators if we continue to categorise students into certain groups we are supporting and endorsing that categorisation. By focusing on boys and boys lack of engagement in the English classroom we are reproducing gendered stereotypes/classifications in our classrooms… As teachers we have a responsibility to expose these gender biases so that students don’t reproduce them in their own lives' (English Forum http://www.education.tas.gov.au/english/forum, 2003).

This paper has been offered to demonstrate one way in which critical discourse analysis might assist in identifying and examining the complex interdiscursive relationships which operate between dominant discursive constructions of gender and teaching pedagogies with a secondary English/Literacy classroom. Its usefulness as a methodology within education is seen as particularly relevant given that within education meaning making is constituted through language and texts.

References

Barthes, R 1972, Mythologies, Jonathon Cape, London.


Charmaz, K 2000, ‘Grounded Theory: Objectivist and Constructivist Methods’ in NK Denzin and YS Lincoln (eds), Handbook of Qualitative Research, Sage Publications, California.


Epstein, D & Sears, J 1999, A Dangerous Knowing: sexuality, pedagogy & popular culture; Cassell, London.


Mellor, B & Patterson, A 1991, ‘Reading Character: Reading Gender’, *English in Australia*, (95), 4-23.


Discourse of New Technologies: Designing Effective Computer Supported Collaborative Learning for Successful Communication in a TESOL Courseware®

Yasmine Howard
University of Tasmania

Abstract
Internet communication technologies have revolutionised how students’ in Higher Education communicate and learn. These include asynchronous and synchronous technologies. Asynchronous technologies enable messages to be received instantly but read and responded to in learners’ own time, such as email and discussion boards. Synchronous technologies on the other hand enable communication immediately in real time, such as online chat. There is a growing literature base that supports the belief that Computer Supported Collaborative Learning (CSCL) has the potential to motivate learners’, maintain the retention of at-risk learners and assist in problem solving, if it is well-designed, well-implemented and facilitated. An analysis of this literature however, has also found that researchers’ tend to support or argue against the use of CSCL, without detailing differences in the use of CSCL between groups of different ages, culture and gender. Anecdotal evidence received by the researcher, strongly suggests that there are strong differences in how these different groups perceive and use CSCL. This presentation would like to investigate this evidence further, and examine how this may affect the instructional design of the example courseware Teaching English as a Second Language (TESOL). The researcher will attempt to recommend how CSCL can be used in eLearning, to support different learning styles and user groups.

Introduction: Preliminary Thoughts, Anecdotal Evidence and Personal Experiences
There is a growing literature base that supports the belief that Computer Supported Collaborative Learning (CSCL) has the potential to motivate learners’, maintain the retention of at-risk learners – that is, learners who are ‘at-risk’ of dropping out of their online course due to socio/cultural/economic factors and assist in problem solving, but only if it is well-designed, well-implemented and facilitated (Chadwick and Callaway 2002, Comeaux 2002, Nixon and Rogers Leftwich 2002, Shedletsky and Aitken 2002, Stager 2002).

A preliminary analysis of this literature by the researcher however, found that academics’ tend to support or argue against the use of CSCL, without detailing differences in the use of CSCL between groups of different ages, culture and gender. Anecdotal evidence received by the researcher however, strongly suggested that there are strong differences in how these different groups perceive and use CSCL. Linguists and academics in Education note the growing use of Internet technology for communication, and the transference of inequality and dis(empowerment) amongst participants of different gender, age, wealth and nationalities for example. This is particularly evident in the use of language, in CSCL (Li 2005, Rossetti 1998, Stager 2002, Warschauer 1999).

Example One: Gender
An analysis of personal emails received from both the researcher and her fiancé’s friends and colleagues found that gender stereotyping tended to occur by both female
and males. For example, male friends tended to attach movies or images to emails that depict females as sexual objects and/or commodities (see Image one), whereas female friends tended to send jokes about the over-sexed and apathetic men (see Image two).

![Image one: feminist.jpg, sent to my fiancé by another male friend, as a ‘joke’](image1.jpg)

![Image two: typicalmen.jpg, sent to me by a former colleague and friend](image2.jpg)

On the other hand, the researcher also found that females also used email and discussion boards as a form of empowerment of their own sex, creating a strong sense of community. The excerpt below is an example of this, although some feminists may argue that it encourages women to conform to social standards of ‘attractiveness’ and ‘intelligence’.

*Today is International Very Good Looking Damn Smart Woman’s Day, so please send this message to someone you think fits this description. Please do not send it back to me, as I have already received it from a Very Good Looking Damn Smart Woman. And remember this motto to live by:*

*Life should NOT be a journey to the grave with the intention of arriving safely in an attractive and well preserved body, but rather to skid in sideways, chocolate in one hand, red wine in the other, body thoroughly used up, totally worn out and screaming WOO HOO what a ride!*

[Emailed received by the researcher by several different friends between 2004-2005].

The following email was sent to the researcher several times, by different female friends and family between 2004-2005. Arguably, this type of ‘chain letter’ is an example of how technology can be used to educate and empower women.
The #1 thing men look for in a potential victim is hairstyle. They are most likely to go after a woman with a ponytail, bun, braid, or other hairstyle that can easily be grabbed. They are also likely to go after a woman with long hair. Women with short hair are not as common targets.

The #2 thing men look for is clothing. They will look for women whose clothing is easy to remove quickly. The #1 outfit they look for is overalls because many of them carry scissors around to cut clothing and on overalls the straps can be easily cut.

They also look for women on their cell phone, searching through their purse or doing other activities while walking because they are off guard and can be easily overpowered.

The time of day men are most likely to attack and rape a woman is in the early morning, between 5 and 8:30 a.m. The number one place women are abducted from/attacked at is grocery store parking lots. Number two is office parking lots/garages. Number three is public restrooms.

The thing about these men is that they are looking to grab a woman and quickly move her to a second location where they don't have to worry about getting caught. Only 2% said they carried weapons because rape carries a 3-5 year sentence but rape with a weapon is 15-20 years. If you put up any kind of a fight at all, they get discouraged because it only takes a minute or two for them to realize that going after you isn't worth it because it will be time-consuming.

These men said they will not pick on women who have umbrellas, or other similar objects that can be used from a distance, in their hands. Keys are not a deterrent because you have to get really close to the attacker to use them as a weapon. So, the idea is to convince these guys you're not worth it.

[Emails received by the researcher from several different friends between 2004-2005].

The researcher has been an avid user of email and discussion boards over the past eight years, for personal, research and business use. She has found over this period of time, that females tended to send longer more detailed emails, and also tended to use emails and gender-specific discussion boards more often than their male counterparts to share news, photos and gossip. For instance, the online Vogue Australia Showcoverage + Model + Designer Forum is used predominately by a large group of female models or fashionistas, who share industry news and gossip. The forum is a generally supportive community where users have taken it upon themselves to co-construct multiple definitions of beauty, update each other on industry events and warn other users against the pitfalls of the industry, such as casting agents with an experience of sexual harassment. Users have also taken it upon themselves to ‘slam’ anti-social behaviour – such as threads, which incite racism, and educate new users on topics, which may not be appropriate for their forum. Whilst there is a contingent of male users, they tend to post messages less often. Furthermore, they also tend to post messages inviting models to participate in photographic sessions for ‘personal portfolios’.

Example Two: Age

The researcher undertook a questionnaire for her thesis, during August and September 2005, at several universities and organisations in Victoria and Tasmania. These include the University of Tasmania, Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology, Melbourne University, Deakinprime and Online Learning Australia. The questionnaire asked potential participants for feedback about the design specifications of effective courseware for Higher Education. User-groups included academics and students in Education, academics in Other Disciplines, Instructional Designers and Web Designers from private eLearning organisations. Most participants were invited to participate in the study face to face, and filled the questionnaire out in their spare time.

Two academics - both from the Faculty of English, University of Tasmania however,
asked the researcher to fill the questionnaire out jointly. One of these academics was a competent courseware designer, who had delivered several fully-online and web-dependent courses over the past few years. This academic noted that courseware must be more and more interactive and multi-media oriented, due to the expectations of new young students who are predominately from the ‘Net Generation’. She also noted that increasing expectations on the quality and content of courseware placed significant stress upon academics, particularly in term of time and personal training and development. The other academic had not yet delivered a courseware, but was in the process of designing a courseware for future delivery. Thoughts for his preliminary design included use of multi-media and CSCL, and he indicated the need for courseware to ‘capture’ the sharing of understanding and meaning, that is created in face-to-face learning.

Example Three: Cross-Cultural and Sub-Cultural Communication

Lastly, the researcher attended a seminar held by Craft Victoria October 7th, and was engaged by a comment by speaker and business entrepreneur Eliza Donald. The presenter noted that when communicating via email among clients from different countries such as Australia, England, Spain, France and Japan, she must remember greet and conclude emails differently. These cross-cultural nuances presented the researcher with the possibility for problems to occur between users of different cultures. This is a particularly important consideration, given the increasing number of international students among Australian universities.

The researcher has noticed a higher use of MSN Messenger amongst international and younger students from the Net Generation. She has also noticed the development of sub-cultures amongst different user groups. For instance, international students tend to use MSN Messenger more often than other mediums for social discourse and organizing education and personal events. On the other hand, she has noticed the development of a ‘net-language’ amongst younger users, in which a hybrid language, including grammar and punctuation is created. For instance ‘kewl’ for ‘cool’, ‘&’ for ‘and’, ‘@’ for ‘at’ and the use of emoticons in replacement for adjectives such as ‘happy’, ‘sad’, ‘embarrassed’, ‘sick’ and ‘tired’.

This anecdotal evidence encouraged the researcher decided to investigate further, the effects of gender, age and culture in CSCL, as shown in the following case study. The result showed that there is a strong body on the impact of gender, age and cross-cultural communication in CSCL, however there is still a need for further research in these areas. For instance, a Google search on the words ‘Use of MSN Messenger Among International Students’ came up with few links of relevance. Of relevance to my interests however, is research relating to the use of CSCL to support gender, age and cross-cultural differences in the design and development of courseware for Higher Education. Specifically, a fully-online courseware for Teaching English as a Second Language to undergraduate university students.

Case Study: Using Public Listservs ITFORUM, IFETS and Tas-IT

This case study shows how using public listservs support the belief of social constructivists, that CSCL can enhance learner understanding of academic problems. It also backs up however, the relevance of gender and cross-cultural differences in using technology to communicate.

The researcher posted the following message to three public listservs: ITFORUM, IFETS and Tas-IT. Each ListServ is intended for researchers interested in Educational Technology and Instructional Design.

    Hi from sunny Melbourne, Australia!
    I hope all you listserv members are happy and healthy. If not, I hope things get better for you soon.
    I am writing a paper, which examines the effect of gender, age and culture on
computer mediated communication, i.e. the use of asynchronous or synchronous technology for teaching and learning.

Does anyone know of any good research papers in this area? To be honest, I have been having trouble finding information, although my search is young.

Otherwise, does anyone have any stories/anecdotal evidence that they'd like to share? Only share it, if you're willing for me to quote this information in a paper I'm writing for this conference:

http://www.educ.utas.edu.au/conference

Of course, you will not be personally identified, only referred to as "academic 1", etc.

For example, I recently went to a conference "Making a living out of Craft and Design", held by Craft Victoria, Australia. One of the speakers talked about communicating for business by email from Melbourne to countries in Europe and Japan. She noted that there are different protocols for ending emails, to recipients in different countries, e.g. with one kiss 'x', two kisses 'xx', kisses and hugs 'xox', or no kisses.

This got me interested in how people communicate using technology differently, depending on their culture, age and gender.

Regards
Yasmine

The researcher received nine replies. Of these:

- Three included a list of relevant publications;
- Two included attachments of relevant publications;
- One included an introduction and invitation for me and my colleagues to submit articles to a journal relating to the topic;
- One included a note of introduction from a researcher in the UK who is also attending the same conference mentioned above; and
- Two included personal/anecdotes/stories.

The researcher found all publications were relevant, and opened up a whole new body of literature as yet unexplored by the researcher. Of the two personal anecdotes, each addressed gender or cross-cultural differences.

**First Personal Anecdote: Gender Issue**

I received the following email from academic one. This highlights the possibility and existence of sexual harassment in online courses, and the need for this to be considered both in the design of the courseware and the policy and procedures of the university or organisation.

I'm an online student at Indiana University. And, I had a very strange experience when a fellow (male) student made an inappropriate suggestion via email (sic). I don't know if you plan to study issues of sexual harassment (sic) in your paper, but I think my experience is quite germane (sic) to that. It's certainly something that I expect most of my male colleagues don't have to deal with!

I can tell you that it made me much more cautious about revealing personal information online in class and much more guarded, in general, about how I present myself online. Although I am quite determined as a student, I wonder if such an event could dissuade a less determined female student from online learning altogether?

Let me know if this is central to your research. It is my opinion that schools
need to have policies in place to deal with things like this, just like they do for brick & mortar classrooms.

The following reply was emailed to academic one:

>1. What sort of personal information did the user have of you before the communication (e.g. photos, name, hobbies?)?

>2. Do you think this was purely a gender issue, or could it have been a cultural issue as well?

Academic one answered as follows:

1. Our online classes include a place for students to post personal info so that the class can seem more intimate. So, I had posted my photo, my address, my home and work phone numbers, something about what I like to do in my spare time and the nature of my job, which happens to involve a lot of travel, much of which I do alone.

So, you can imagine how quickly I edited that profile! Since then, I've been much more cagey about the information posted there.

2. This was purely a gender issue, not a cultural one. The man who approached me was not obscene nor perverse, he merely made a rather direct pass, suggesting that we could be romantically involved. Now, normally, I would consider that a nice misunderstanding. In this case, however, the language that he used was not appropriately friendly nor lighthearted for the circumstances.

What happened next was interesting. After a couple of days (editing my profile), and conferring with my peers at work, I decided to bring this to the attention of the online instructor. He was totally flumoxed. He acted appropriately, that is, he asked me what I thought should be done to address my concerns. I told him that I had not responded to this offensive email and that, if it came up again, I would respond very directly indicating my opinion of the matter. I merely wanted him to report this, on the chance that this student was approaching other women in online classes. I pointed out that one woman who was in this man's group for the first project of the semester has since dropped out of the class. I wanted the instructor to record this email along with my concerns. I wanted to be prepared should I run into this fellow in a future class to request that I not be placed into a group with him. He had no idea who he should report this to, neither did he know of any standard operating procedure for dealing with an incident like this. After that, I never heard anything more from anyone. So, I don't know if there was a report or further discussion at the college.

I don't think the college is responsible for what happened, neither do I feel particularly harmed. It was a small incident, really. I do think, however, that colleges should have policies in place to deal with stuff like this and that instructors and students should be aware of them. Chances are, I'm not the first, nor the last student to have to deal with it.

Good luck with your research, I hope this helps.

Second Personal Anecdote: Cross-Cultural Differences

I received the following email from academic two:

Dear Yasmine, what a name!

I guess I have a “story/anecdote” for you,—and you may quote it as you please.

But first a little history about your name:

In accordance to a Talmud Tractate Shabat: Yasmine (Jasmin) was first discovered in The Land of Israel, on the mountains of Bashan, where I was
reared.

It is a tropical plant of the olive family, fragrant flowers of yellow, red or white, and it emits a sweet smell pleasant odor.

One more brief information before I copy my story/anecdote for your perusal.

My name is (gives name).

I am the author of two recent books, published here in the U.S., entitled (provides name).

In order to better perceive my background, I suggest to visit: (provides URL).

The author then proceeded to provide excerpts from his controversial essays and books, which are extremely interesting, however not related or relevant to my questions regarding CSCL. It appeared that the author misunderstood that I required personal anecdotes relating to cross-cultural differences in the online classroom, as opposed to cross-cultural differences in the ‘real-world’. This misunderstanding highlights the importance for online collaboration between peers and academics to occur, to co-create shared understanding. I replied to academic two, with the following message:

>Dear (author),
>
>Your email is fascinating! I will certainly make a point of reading >these books. Your story was certainly moving, thank you.
>
>Regards
>
>Yasmine

Readers may note that I didn’t inform the academic that the information provided was not directly applicable to my research in CSCL. There are several reasons for this. Firstly, the academic dealt with controversial material relating to a topic I am ill-informed on, and unable to pass judgment. Secondly, I did not wish to potentially insult a reader whose character I do not know. I received the following reply to the last email, within 24 hours:

>Dear Yasmine:
>
>Thank you for your kind comments.
>
>I wonder if you could contact me with an agent and/or a Jewish >congregation.
>
>My objective is to offer them (names title of essay and book))

>I will be glad to mail to you a copy of the (name of book one) or >>(name of book two), to your postal address.

>Regards, (author’s name).

Upon reading this email, it occurred to me that the author may have assumed me to be Israeli, as he had previously quoted the meaning of my first name to be of Israeli origin. I also felt conflicting feelings of fear, confusion and the desire to help. Firstly fear, as I am aware of the dangers of providing my personal address to a stranger. Secondly, confusion because the reader assumes I would be able to provide him with an agent’s name and/or Jewish congregation – both of which I could not do, nor had I indicated that I am able to. Furthermore, confusion as the author states that the essay and book have already been published in the US, so doesn’t he already have an agent who could do this? Thirdly, the desire to help the author, as it appeared that he had a genuinely harrowing story about cross-cultural differences, and a desire to share this story for the good of humanity.

This experience highlighted the importance of critically examining online communication to protect against potential fraud and the need to educate learners who may not be aware of this possibility. Internet fraud is a serious issue, affecting eCommerce
businesses and individuals willing to provide personal information such as usernames and passwords upon request. On the other hand, it also shows how cross-cultural differences have the potential to create misunderstandings that may have far-reaching affects and the need to educate myself on more effective methods for coping with these differences.

**Brief Review of the Literature**

Before the researcher can investigate the implications of gender, age and cross-cultural differences in the design of CSCL, it is important to provide a brief review of the literature in this and other related area.

**Brief Review of the Literature: Gender**

Warschauer notes that whilst the “Internet had its initial roots among a small number of well-educated, relatively affluent, and mostly male computer users in the United States. It has branched out rapidly to larger numbers of users, but its usage still remains skewed by gender, wealth, and nationality” (1999). Similarly, the UCLA World Internet Project in 2004 found that a “digital divide” exists in many countries worldwide. The project was the first of its kind to “produce international comparison data on the social, political and economic effects of Internet use and non-use”. The researchers found that more men that women go online in all the countries they surveyed, and that overall there is an eight percent gap in the number of men and women who go online.

As Li notes however, the increasing numbers of women going online to use CSCL does not guarantee parity (2005). Li provides an excellent literature review in her recently published article ‘Gender and CMC: A review on conflict and harassment’ – where CMC is a synonym for Computer Mediated Collaborative Learning. She quotes the following:

- Males rate their computer expertise higher than females (McCoy, Heafner, Burdick & Nagle, 2001);
- Males are more motivated to acquire CMC skills, and develop less anxiety toward technology (Nachmias, Mioduser & Shemla, 2000);
- Females viewed CMC more favourably than males (Hiltz & Johnson, 1990); and
- Females see computers as more useful than males do, although they are less comfortable using computers (Katz, Maitland, Hannah, Burggraf & King, 1999).

She also notes that there is sexual harassment is a growing concern in CSCL, and a relatively new topic that requires further investigation. The types of harassment include “flaming” (personal attacks), sexual comments, the use of pornography and seduction under false pretences. Li found that face to face gender differences replicate in an online environment, and that it is possible that cyber-language also perpetuates and deteriorates this situation in a virtual environment. On the other hand, she recognises the potential for CSCL to create equitable learning, by understanding other issues that affect equitable learning – such as culture, age and class, and relying on “a thorough understanding of gender differences in the CMC context”. Li notes that there is a great need for literature that “better understand the issue and improve the development and utilisation of CMC”.

Herring notes “For many female Internet users, online harassment is a fact of life” (1993). Herring (1994) also notes that men and women have different styles of communicating on the Internet. In particular, the researcher found that the male style is characterized by “adversiality - put-downs, strong, often contentious assertions, lengthy and/or frequent postings, self-promotion, and sarcasm”; while the female style, is characterised by “supportiveness and attenuation”. For instance, females are more likely to express appreciation, apologize, express doubt, ask questions and contribute
In response to Herring's research, Rossetti undertook a project of informal research into the different styles women and men adopt when contributing to e-mail discussion groups (1998). He collected and assessed 100 emails on a variety of topics over a period of two weeks. He found a clear difference in the language used by males and females online. For example, males were more likely to record aggressive or sarcastic language including personal attacks and put-downs as well as references to 'taboo' body parts. He found that women used language that offered support and a deepening of their relationship with the readers. They also used much more open expressions of appreciation and thanks, whilst men used 'tighter' and less direct expressions. Lastly, Rossetti found that men were found to be more interested in presenting their personal point of view in order to present an 'authoritative' contribution to the discussion, while women were more interested in the contribution itself. He concludes that men see the opportunity provided by CSCL as a chance to further one's own influence, by gaining valuable information and by extending one's own authority and respect in society; while women ostensibly view this technology as an opportunity to nurture existing relationships and develop new ones.

In summary, the literature tends to argue that gender differences are replicated in an online environment, and is evident in the perception of greater confidence in the use of technology, a desire to upskill themselves in the use of CSCL technology as opposed to supporting its use as an effective learning medium, and of the use of language to convey a sense of authority and masculinity by males, whereas females tended to view CSCL more favourably than males, see it as an opportunity to cultivate relationships and use language to convey a sense of nurturing and femininity.

**Brief Review of the Literature: Age**

Arguably, the literature relating to age and CSCL is still in its infancy compared to the literature on CSCL and gender. In their eBook published this year, Oblinger and Oblinger define the following generations, which are generally accepted and quoted by researchers and journalists.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Matures</th>
<th>Baby Boomers</th>
<th>Generation X</th>
<th>Net Generation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Greatest generation</td>
<td>Me generation</td>
<td>Latchkey generation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attributes</td>
<td>Command and self control Sacrifice</td>
<td>Optimistic Workaholic</td>
<td>Independent Skeptical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likes</td>
<td>Respect for authority Family Community involvement</td>
<td>Responsibility Work ethic Can-do attitude</td>
<td>Freedom Multitasking Work-life balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dislikes</td>
<td>Waste Technology</td>
<td>Laziness Turning 50</td>
<td>Red tape Hyper</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The researcher notes however that the definitions may differ according to the individual, their personality, learning style and preferences. Nevertheless, they provide an effective start to defining age and age-related CSCL issues. In general, adult learners (matures and baby boomer) are independent and goal oriented (Lieb 1991). They need to know
why learning is required, they want to direct their learning, and need to feel competent and experience success throughout the learning program (Abell 2005). On the other hand, "traditional students" (generation x and the net generation) require learning experiences that incorporate fast-paced and visually intensive instruction, frequent interactions with corresponding feedback and the need to feel a sense of achievement (Abell 2005).

Oblinger and Oblinger note that older students (matures and baby boomers) are more likely to be satisfied with fully online courses than traditional students. They state that this is because the net generation needs to be connected to people and be social as well as their expectations of higher education, whereas older learners tend to be less interested in the social aspects of learning. Convenience and flexibility is more important than them. The researcher tends to question this answer however, and points to the growing use of CSCL for social and educational use in higher education courseware, to create a sense of community. It may be that traditional students require a blended learning experience in order to socialise with their peers on a face to face basis as well as via synchronous and asynchronous communication.

Whilst the Net Generation are also known as Generation Y or the Millenials, and are more digitally literate than previous generations. As a result Oblinger and Oblinger note that Higher Education must engage this generation in a dialogue regarding their expectations relating to technology (p.3.7). They believe this generation:

- Are intuitive visual communicators;
- Can integrate the virtual and physical world;
- Learn better through discovery;
- Can multitask and may choose not to pay attention to things that don’t interest them; and
- Are able to respond quickly and expect responses in return (p.2.5).

Whilst CSCL must cater to these traits, it must also cater to the traits of other learner groups. This may not be as difficult as it appears however, as the author’s also found that this generation do not value technology above appropriate pedagogy. For example, they note that this group value their lecturer’s experience and expertise, before their ability to convey lecture points using contemporary software (p.3.4). Furthermore, they found that the net generation preferred a fifty percent mix of face to face lecturing and online interactivity, as opposed to higher levels of online interactivity (p.3.4).

The literature cited above covers the traits of learners according to age, however it does not discuss the implications or design features in creating CSCL for different generations in higher education.

**Brief Review of the Literature: Cross-Cultural Communication**

Internet technologies such as email, listservs and instant messaging have revolutionised the way we communicate, enabled instant communication between friends and colleagues, and eases the means by which new social networks can be created between users of different countries and cultures. These technologies enable one-one, one-many and many-many forms of communication.

Researchers have noticed however, that cross-cultural differences and misunderstandings are likely to occur in CSCL. For example, Chen reports the results of a twelve week international e-mail exchanges between students in the United States and their counterparts in Denmark, France, Germany, Hong Kong and Turkey. The email exchanges were highly structured debates. Chen found that:

- The differences of thinking patterns and expression styles among participants may affect their perception of e-mail debate and of their development of intercultural sensitivity. For instance, he notes Western people tend to emphasize logic and rationality by believing that the process of discovering truth follows a logical sequence, whereas people in the East believe that the truth will
make itself apparent without using any logical consideration or rationality;

- The differences of thinking patterns often causes misunderstanding in the process of intercultural communication, especially in international e-mail exchanges where face-to-face interaction is lacking; and

- Culture plays an important role in the international e-mail project. The differences of thinking patterns and expression styles dictate the way participants perceive and utilize e-mail communication. Applied to our project, because it was designed as a highly structured debate form for e-mail communication, the format immediately causes orientation problems for some of the participants. For instance the author cites that people from 'low-context' cultures tend to use language that leads people to express their opinions directly with the intention of persuading others to believe their viewpoints. On the other hand people from 'high-context' cultures tend to value harmony and use language that is ambiguous and talk around the point, as opposed to saying "no" outright.

In another direction of the same topic, Cemalcilar found that the Internet – including email, chat rooms and newsgroups, was a primary medium in acculturating International students, enabling them to maintain a sense of national identity, form a social support network, maintain existing relationships and bridge spatial and temporal divides.

A review of the literature by the researcher found a small literature base discussing cross-cultural issues in CSCL, and suggestions for addressing these. The researcher found this surprising, given the increasing importance of effective cross-cultural communication for global business opportunities and education. This is despite recognition that technology can improve intercultural communication (Chen). The researcher recognises that her lack of expertise in this area will impact on the quality of her design methodology for CSCL, however she expects that this will evolve and improve with the advent of new research and the discovery of other existing literature of relevance.

**Brief Review of the Literature: Other Related Areas**

The primary intent of studying the literature related to gender, age and cross-cultural communication in online, is to create a design methodology to support individual differences for CSCL. In doing so however, the researcher recognises the importance of considering the following:

- Different learner styles – e.g. a consideration of multiple intelligences;
- Type of learning strategy that may be used – e.g. deep, strategic or surface approaches;
- Cognitive, motor or physical abilities – e.g. applying rules for accessibility; and
- Preferred learning approach – e.g. encouraging learner-centered courseware that provides for flexible delivery in terms of access, use and navigation.

**Implications for the Design of a TESOL Courseware: An Example Design Methodology for CSCL**

So far, most of the literature discussed outlines gender, age, cross-cultural and other issues in CSCL, as opposed to the implications for the design of the effective use of synchronous and asynchronous technology in courseware. The researcher suggests the following design methodology, to attempt to address the four issues above. This methodology will be described using an example TESOL courseware for higher education.

**Design Methodology**

1. Define why CSCL will be used in the courseware:
• What are the pedagogical benefits of using CSCL? For example, create a sense of shared community, encourage problem solving and enhance learner motivation.

• What are the potential limitations in using CSCL? For example, the potential for sexual harassment and cross-cultural misunderstanding, the realization mature learners may not adapt to the technology, the possibility for accessibility issues to occur and the prospect of the communication methods used not addressing individual learner requirements.

2. Define how CSCL will be used in the courseware

• Will it be part of a blended or fully online strategy?
• Will it be a course requirement or optional?
• Will it be asynchronous, synchronous or both? Note the limitations of using each forms of technology.
• How are user’s profiled? For example, consider that anonymity may enable users to harass others and hide their identity.
• Does the CSCL provide for social and pedagogical communication? Provide a separate forum for each.
• Will these activities be part of a tutorial and/or assessed?
• Create a guide for Netiquette, warning against flaming and other forms of online abuse and stating potential outcomes if this is breached.

3. Research technologies available, and choose most appropriate

• These include asynchronous tools such as email, discussion boards and listservs; or
• They may include synchronous tools such as text chat, video conferencing and voice chat.

4. Create prototype of courseware

• Start using pen and paper,
• Then transfer these ideas to electronic form, such as Microsoft Word.

5. Undertake user-assessment of the prototype and adapt it according to feedback

• Show prototype to a selected group of academics and researchers whom you trust to give honest and constructive feedback.

6. Program the courseware

• You may start by using web development tool Dreamweaver,
• You may use open source programs such as Moodle,
• You may use free software such as MSN Messenger, Skype or Proboard,
• You may use tools provided by the university, such as LMS like WebCT, Vista, Blackboard or Docent,
• If particularly difficult programming is required, consider using a university or private based web developer.
• Remember that exploiting the expertise of others, may save you a lot of time and heartache that is worth the cost outlaid.

7. Undertake user-assessment of end-product
• Show prototype of end-product to another selected group of academics and researchers whom you trust to give you honest and constructive feedback,
• Assess the courseware yourself and see that your design objectives are met.

8. Deliver courseware
• Introduce students to the courseware – describing navigational features, course expectations, netiquette and other relevant design features.

9. Undertake formative and summative feedback of courseware, and adapt accordingly
• Create a link to ‘Suggestions for Improvement’ and ask learners to send their suggestions throughout the duration of the term.
• Present the learners with a questionnaire upon completing the course.

10. Share findings with other researchers.

Example Design of CSCL for TESOL Courseware

Background:
Encourage constructivist learning by utilising synchronous and asynchronous communication in a fully-online courseware for Teaching English as a Second Language, to undergraduate students at University.

The Design: Adapting to Research on Gender, Age, Cross-Cultural Communication and Other Issues

Pedagogical Design
• The courseware utilises a learner-centered approach that encourages personal and social constructivist learning.
• The courseware contains a link to the Content, which itself includes links to five topics covered by the courseware. Each topic presents instructional suggestions, introduction to the problem (topic lecture), a link to case studies, a link to activities, a link to collaborative learning tools and a link to resources. To facilitate the learning process, a self-check test will be included, for students to ensure they have covered relevant content.
• All topic lectures will be presented via text, video and audio, to foster multiple intelligences and help students with poorer English skills understand the content and improve their reading and writing abilities through example. Furthermore, the text of the lectures will be printable, to aid usability and prevent against accessibility problems.
• Case studies will be implemented to scaffold learner’s understanding of the problem, by presenting real-world situations that individual users may relate to, despite their age, gender, class or nationality. Each case study will present a different problem relating to the topic area, example solutions and outcomes.
• All learners must include a public profile, including a name and photo. Personal information such as location, study interests and hobbies are optional. It must be possible for learner’s to contact each other via the use of personal messages, however if required email addresses can be hidden and learner’s may block individuals on approval from the course instructor.
• The courseware must contain a guide to Netiquette, that explicitly warns against the
use of CSCL tools to harass or abuse other learners. It will include examples of sexual harassment and racial or cultural abuse, to educate learners. It will also state the implications of breaking the rules of Netiquette such as possible expulsion from the course or other disciplinary measures. The guide will also inform students that academic language is preferred, in an attempt to problems related to linguistics.

- All CSCL activities should be optional, as the researcher believes that learners’ will utilise collaborative learning tools as required for their individual learning, according to the principles of adult and traditional learning. That is, adult learners’ will be responsible for their own learning and traditional learners will seek interactive and social collaboration. In another perspective considering the theory of multiple intelligences, each person learns differently. Linguistic and interpersonal learners may prefer to use text based communication, whereas visual and oral learners may prefer to use multimedia or face-to-face communication.

- A range of CSCL tools are included, including suggestions for their use:
  - My Journal, which is a personal BLOG that learners may or may not choose to post publically. This enables students to reflect upon their learning and make meaning of content, as they require.
  - Discussion Board, which includes an Introduction with instructions, netiquette and IT help; five forums, each relating to each of the five case studies, with example threads posted for student consideration; a Related Resources forum, which enables students to share relevant research; and a Social forum, which provides a space for students to chat socially.
  - A Chatroom, which enables students to chat via text or webcam socially or about work as required.
  - Links to RSS which sends user-defined news to students’ Inboxes, and relevant Listservs that enable learners to collaborate with a broader social and academic group, to provide multiple modes of understanding.
  - An option for assessment is a group activity, that utilises asynchronous or synchronous technology to solve one of the ‘case study problems’ presented in the courseware. The instructor will choose the student groups, however they must be responsible for deciding their topic and co-creating their answer. If unhappy with the end answer, students may also choose to submit alternative answers, but must explain why they are doing so.
  - The instructor will set times for online chat, including example topics for discussion. He/she will also attempt to reply to emails within a set period of time.

Prototype of Screen Layout and Design

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exit Course</th>
<th>Home Help Site Map Contact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Home</td>
<td>You are here &gt; Home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Welcome text, including a link to Netiquette.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My Journal</td>
<td>Video welcome from instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>Link to unread personal messages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities</td>
<td>Link to news, including hyperlinks and rss</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaboration</td>
<td>Updates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Page 286
Quick Links
- Timetable
- Assignments
- Email
- Discussion Board

[Figure Two: Homepage]

Quick Links
- Timetable
- Assignments
- Email
- Discussion Board

[Figure Three: Home > Content page]

Quick Links
- Timetable
- Assignments
- Email
- Discussion Board

[Figure Four: Home > Contents > Case Study One page]
Future Research and Suggestions for Further Research

The researcher anticipates using this design in the development, delivery and assessment of a TESOL courseware by academics and students in Education and Other Disciplines. She hopes to add to the literature base regarding CSCL, and address some of the issues in this paper. Future research into the effect of age and cross-cultural differences are particularly required, as is research regarding the design implication for delivering effective courseware that adapts to individual differences.

References


Good writing: they don’t see what I see in my head ®

Sharifah Nurul Huda Syed Hussein
Curtin University of Technology

Abstract
This paper is a brief summary of an on-going doctoral thesis which investigates the perceptions of lecturers and students at three faculties of the University of Brunei Darussalam (UBD) towards ESL students’ academic writing in non-scientific discourse. Research suggests that lecturers and students have different views regarding parameters of acceptability in tertiary academic writing. ESL students, in particular, are less informed of their readers’ expectations of acceptable academic writing than L1 students.

This study adopts a mixed method approach to examine if students’ perceptions of ‘good’ writing concur with their lecturers’ expectations or otherwise. The conclusions suggest that there is considerable mismatch between the perceptions of these two sets of respondents and to a lesser extent, between content-course and language lecturers, on one hand, and NNS (non-native speakers) and NS (native speakers) lecturers, on the other. The reasons for the disparity in views are outlined.

Introduction
Brunei Darussalam is the smallest of the ASEAN nations with a population of about 380,000 only. The population is ethnically diverse, the majority being Malay, but with sizable minorities of Chinese, indigenous people and expatriate workers. The official language of the country is Bahasa Melayu, which is similar to the Standard Malay language used in Malaysia. English is the official second language of Brunei. The emergence of English can be traced back to the 19th century when Brunei became a British Protectorate. Since 1984, Brunei has adopted a dwibahasa (two languages) policy for the entire school system, based on a gradual emphasis on English over Malay starting from Primary Four onwards.

At the tertiary level, English is one of the mediums of instruction at UBD, the country’s sole university. Most of the courses at the university are taught in English. As students can enrol in English-medium courses with a minimum pass in the GCE ‘O’ Levels English language examination, a majority of students who enter UBD have been found to have relatively poor English literacy skills. Most of the concern expressed by lecturers regarding the English literacy levels of UBD students focus on writing skills as they are probably assessed more than other communication skills and are perhaps the most difficult to acquire successfully.

This paper is a brief summary of a doctoral thesis which is in the final stages of completion that investigates UBD students’ perceptions of ‘good’ academic writing skills and whether their views are shared by their lecturers teaching language and content courses in the English language. They include native-English speaking (NS) and non-native speaking (NNS) lecturers, with the latter forming the bulk of the academic population. Johns (1993) believes that this area of research (i.e. readers’ expectations) has been “least explored in the literature” (p.75) and that it is especially important for English as a second language (ESL) students to acquire knowledge of their readers’ expectations.

The study focuses only on aspects of ESL students’ academic writing in non-scientific discourse as approaches to academic discourse have been found to vary according to discipline, especially between discourse in the Humanities and the Sciences (Connor & Johns, 1989; Swales, 1984; Halliday & Martin, 1993). This study will also focus specifically on essays as a particular genre of academic writing. Woodward-Kron and van der Wal (1997) in their university-wide survey of lecturers’ perceptions of student literacy found that the text types most students are required to write are discussion and analytical essays. Although
Swales (1990) states that a particular discourse community uses one or more genre of writing, the literature on academic discourse indicates that the essay is the preferred genre for academic writing.

**Brief overview of previous research**

Early studies on raters’ or readers’ perceptions of ‘good’ writing focus on L1 readers’ perceptions of L1 students’ writing (Freedman, 1979; Stewart and Grobe, 1979; Grobe, 1981). In the area of ESL writing evaluation, studies have found that English language proficiency, especially absence of error, exerts the greatest influence on raters’ evaluations (Homburg, 1984; McDaniel, 1985; McGirt, 1984; Mullen, 1980; Perkins, 1980; Sweedler-Brown, 1993a, 1993b; cited in Song & Caruso, 1996). Lecturers’ evaluations were also found to be partially attributed to their discipline and gender and also to the amount of exposure they had to the writing of NNS writers (Vann, Lorenz and Meyer, 1991; Faigley and Hansen, 1985; Cushing Weigle et al., 2003).

The studies mentioned above primarily investigated the perceptions and assessment practices of mostly NS lecturers with regards to the writing of NS and NNS students. There seems to be less emphasis in the literature on the role of NNS readers or raters. Most studies with NNS readers as subjects focus on the judgments and evaluations of teachers or readers in the discipline of ESL or EFL only (Graeme, 1999; Mariko and Masako, 1998; Kobayashi, 1992; Connor-Linton, 1995; Hamp-Lyons and Zhang, 2001). As expressed by Cushing Weigle et al. (2003), “little is known about how non-ESL faculty judge field-specific text responsible (TR) writing” or writing that is done in the context of content area studies “by ESL students” (p.345). Even less is known regarding the perceptions and assessment practices of NNS university lecturers teaching content courses in the English-medium, who are not ESL or EFL-trained teachers, with respect to their NNS students’ academic writing. What do NNS university lecturers teaching content courses consider as important and highly regarded features of ESL writing?

One of the few studies which investigated the perceptions of both NS and NNS academics in various disciplines is Santos’ (1988) study. She reports that NNS professors were more severe in their judgments of language errors in NNS students’ academic writing than NS professors. She attributes this to the fact that NNS professors have attained an extremely high level of proficiency in English and, because of their investment of effort in the language, judge the language errors of other NNS students more severely than do NS professors. A more recent study by Land and Whitley (1998) found that readers whose L1 was not English rated a group of papers written by NS and NNS students of equal quality, whereas the L1 teachers rated the papers of ESL writers lower. Their conclusion was that NNS readers can accommodate a wider range of rhetorical patterns than can NS readers.

As stated previously, this study will also focus on the perceptions of ESL students towards what they regard as ‘good’ writing. In her review of L2 writing research, Leki (2001) noted that there seems to be limited interest in trying to understand learner perspectives:

I was struck by the fact that so many of these studies talked about the students but never gave any evidence that the researchers spent any time talking to the students, never asked them one on one what all this(whatever feature of L2 writing was under study) meant to them(p.18)

Most research into the assessment of the writing of ESL writers has centred on students’ performance in tests as measured by teachers and the perceptions of both with regards to classroom activities or task outcomes (Block, 1994; Lewis and Basturkmen, 2000; Peacock, 2001; cited in Basturkmen and Lewis, 2002). These studies have generally found little match between the perceptions and views of both teachers and students. Among the reasons proffered for the existence of this disparity in views are differences in cultural approaches to assessment and knowledge and expectations of ‘good’ writing (Ballard and Clanchy, 1991; San Miguel, 1996; Scardamalia and Bereiter, 1987). As this study focuses on both students’ and lecturers’ perspectives on what constitutes ‘good’ ESL academic writing, it is hoped that that the findings generated from the research will contribute to what is known about how academic writing is assessed by readers who come from different cultural backgrounds and disciplines and whether students’ perceptions are consistent with their
Methodology

This study employed a mixed-method integrated research design. The qualitative phase progressed through three stages of open-ended and semi-structured interviews conducted among a total of 80 lecturers and students from three faculties at UBD. The information obtained from the first stage of the qualitative phase was used to help inform the development of the subsequent stages of the qualitative investigation in order to develop a more structured interview guide and form a conceptual framework.

The three stages of qualitative data collection thus led to the development of a conceptual framework that consisted of 9 categories, 17 sub-categories and 59 definitions of the respective sub-categories and categories which is encompassed within an ontological, epistemological and methodological framework of super ordinate categories. These three super ordinate categories seek to consider the extent to which a given piece of student writing reflects a particular view of reality, the degree to which a student’s writing conveys knowledge associated with the topics concerned and the ways the students’ mastery of technical and mechanical aspects are associated with ‘good’ responses to essay questions. The questions for the separate interview schedules for the lecturers and students were also developed and visualized from this conceptual framework. The definitions were distilled from the lecturers’ interview data.

This framework was then used as the basis for the construction of a questionnaire to confirm the findings of the first phase of the study. The triangulation of qualitative and quantitative data was intended to corroborate or establish convergence of the results of the study. Based on the definitions of the categories and sub-categories in the conceptual framework, definitions that could be displayed within a relatively short paragraph were identified. When constructing the extracts of writing for the questionnaire, attempts were made to develop the texts as examples of authentic academic writing, to keep the language used as simple as possible in order to avoid ambiguity and to develop a multi-disciplinary approach to each text. The questionnaire items were then constructed after careful analysis of the writing extracts. The items were developed to reflect what the definition of a particular sub-category meant when broken down into separate processes.

The collection of quantitative data comprised of four stages. The fourth and main stage comprised of a final version of a 40-item questionnaire administered to 213 first and second year students at the three faculties. The questionnaire included preliminary categorical items concerning respondent gender and academic discipline in accord with the research objectives of the study. Rasch Unidimensional Measurement Model (RUMM) programme was applied to generate summary test-of-fit statistics to provide global information on the psychometric properties of the data and also individual item fit statistics including estimation of item difficulty logits to show which items were more difficult for the students to answer and hence those aspects of correct academic writing that were more difficult for the students to identify.

Findings

1. Interviews with students and lecturers

The tables below highlight the constructs of ESL academic writing that reflect either high level (more than 90%) or some level of agreement (less than 90%) among lecturers and among students as to its importance in the planning and execution of a ‘good’ essay. Anomalous Areas” in Table 1 and Table 3 below refers to data of the “Yes, but…..” or the “Yes, but only if…..” kind.

Table 1  Constructs of ESL academic writing that reflect high level of agreement: lecturers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High Level of Agreement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Addressing the Question</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* Reproduction of Facts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Personal Perspective  * Plagiarism
Critical Analysis  * Referencing Conventions
Comprehensiveness of Coverage  Morphology and Syntax (grammar)
Familiarity with and/or Comprehension of Topic  * Vocabulary

* indicates sub-categories with relatively limited data primarily due to not being explicitly stated in interview schedule but reflects high level of agreement among those who responded.

Anomalous Areas

- Class year;
- Essay topic/task requirement;
- Students’ ability. Futility of high expectations due to students’:
  1. poor English language skills, particularly writing skills;
  2. limited general knowledge;
  3. particular cultural backgrounds;
  4. limited cognitive ability.

Table 2  Constructs of ESL writing that reflect some level of agreement: lecturers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Some level of agreement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of wide reading in subject matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of ability to synthesise information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate organisation of topics and ideas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Register</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3  Constructs of ESL academic writing that reflect high level of agreement: students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High Level of Agreement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Addressing the Question</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* Familiarity with and/or comprehension of topic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* Referencing Conventions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of Wide Reading in Subject Matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* Reproduction of Facts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* indicates sub-categories with relatively limited data primarily due to not being explicitly stated in interview schedule but reflects high level of agreement among those who responded.

Anomalous Areas

- Lecturers’ academic discipline;
- Lecturers’ individual preferences;
- Lecturers’ first language;
- Inability to articulate ideals of definitions of ‘good’ writing due to:
  1. poor English language skills, particularly writing skills;
2. limited cognitive ability;
3. lack of motivation/interest;
4. time constraints/workload;

Table 4 Constructs of ESL writing that reflect some level of agreement: students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Perspective</th>
<th>Critical Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensiveness of Coverage</td>
<td>Appropriate organisation of topics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and ideas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Register</td>
<td>‘Good’ Style</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morphology and Syntax (grammar)</td>
<td>Handwriting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Presentation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ii) Questionnaires among students

The Rasch analysis of data from the 40-item questionnaires distributed among students indicated the following main findings:

- there was a small variation in students’ ability to identify correct use of academic writing. Neither students’ gender nor academic discipline were significant factors in influencing students’ ability;
- the range of item difficulty showed a large variation in the difficulty the students displayed in identifying the correct use of different aspects of academic writing. Four items had item difficulty locations above +1.0 logits (very difficult).

Discussion

The data from the study reveal that there are differences in views between both sets of respondents as to the importance of several constructs in ESL writing and these constructs cut across all the three super ordinate categories with the majority contained within the ontological and epistemological super ordinate categories. There is certainly cause for concern as it suggests that a considerable number of students do not gauge accurately what is perceived by their lecturers as important in ESL academic writing.

The students’ educational background prior to entering UBD could be one of the contributing factors to this disparity in views about the constructs of good academic writing. The education system in Brunei has been described as highly centralized and the school curriculum as fairly rigid. Communal and social values and needs are stressed over values that emphasise individual needs or aspirations. On the other hand, the lecturers teaching English medium courses at UBD comprise of expatriates from the West and non-Western countries and Bruneian lecturers. Almost all of the lecturers can be described as either educated in Western universities or exposed to Western educational systems and these influences extend to ideals of academic writing at tertiary level. Thus, it appears that the two sets of respondents seemed to come from two very different paradigms with different expectations and requirements towards academic writing at tertiary level.

The existence of this mismatch in views between students and their lecturers can also be traced to the apparent lack of information regarding the constructs of good writing, as perceived by the lecturers. Although some students reported that they have been informed by their respective lecturers regarding their criteria of good essays, many students revealed that for the most part, the criteria of good writing is assumed rather than explicitly told by their lecturers. Students generally resort to guessing what their lecturers think constitutes a good essay. As noted by Kaldor (1998), San Miguel (1996) and Leki (1995), although academic
staff at universities recognises the constructs of good academic writing when they see them, they, however, often fail to articulate clearly their expectations to students.

The differences in views regarding ‘good’ writing could also perhaps be explained by the fact that although all the respondents were from the disciplines of the Humanities and Social Sciences, they constituted quite different discourse communities. As noted by many researchers, notably Swales (1990) and Berkenhottter and Huckin (1995), each discourse or academic community has its own ‘rules of use’ and expectations. These are then communicated, either explicitly or implicitly, to the students within the discourse community. Casanave (1995) suggests that disciplinary communities are “not monolithic” and they contain “local contextual dimensions”. These contextual dimensions or elements influence students’ writing and lecturers’ perceptions to various degrees. In light of this, academic writing can be viewed as a highly complex process and is influenced by what Samraj (2002) describes as “layers of context”. Thus, the concept of good writing is seen as context bound and that what is good writing in one instance is not as successful for all circumstances.

The qualitative data, for example, indicates that content-course lecturers were found to be more generally concerned about the quality of content in students’ essays than language or ESL teachers who generally value language skills as well as creativity and originality in writing more than others. These findings recalled studies by researchers such as Bush (1997), Leki (1995) and Faigley and Hansen (1985), amongst others, who reported very similar findings between content-course and ESL lecturers.

The data also revealed that there are some divergent views of good writing among NS and NNS lecturers, although these dissonances in views were not very extensive. The most marked difference revolves around discussions on how to address an essay question. NNS lecturers, specifically Brunei lecturers, were found to prefer that students present some kind of preamble or background information in the introductory paragraphs of their essays. On the other hand, most non-Brunei and NS lecturers wanted students to answer or at least provide an outline of the answer from the onset of the essay. Interestingly, most of the data on the existence of differences in views between the two groups of lecturers came from the students. Some students believe that NS lecturers regard qualities such as displaying some form of personal perspective or insight in students’ essays and creativity and originality in writing more highly than NNS lecturers. They also maintain that NS lecturers accept a less formal academic tone in their essays more readily than NNS lecturers. On the other hand, many students feel that the latter are generally more tolerant towards errors of morpho-syntactic forms in students’ essays.

There are many probable reasons for these so called differences in views between NS and NNS lecturers. Firstly, although it was argued earlier that even NNS lecturers teaching English-medium courses assess student essays along the lines of academic essays in western academic institutions, they are also exposed to other styles of writing which are non-western in nature. Thus, even though they may be familiar with the notions and expectations of western academic rhetoric, NNS or more specifically Bruneian lecturers are still the products of a Bruneian educational background, rooted in a system which nurtures different values and expectations of good writing. Land and Whitley (1998), for example, reported that NNS readers can accommodate a wider range of rhetorical patterns than can NS readers. In the same way, the reason why NNS lecturers are perceived as being more tolerant of errors in morphology and syntax (grammar) is because they are ESL users themselves and are perhaps more aware of students’ difficulties in learning this particular aspect of language, based on their own personal experiences.

The data obtained from the questionnaires also indicated that there was a small variation in students’ ability to identify correct use of academic writing. Students’ gender and academic discipline did not significantly affect this ability. This could be attributed to a number of reasons. Firstly, even though the out-of-school experiences of UBD undergraduates may not be totally similar, their backgrounds and language learning experiences are more or less homogenous. The vast majority of UBD undergraduates are products of the Bruneian educational policy with its emphasis on the *Melayu Islam Beraja* (MIB) or the Malay Islamic Monarchy philosophy that promotes the inculcation of social values and attitudes and the preservation of traditions, beliefs, goals and aspirations held by Bruneian society. Bruneian children enrolled in international schools would most likely opt for a university education overseas. In addition, the students in this study were all lower division students. Some had
just commenced their studies at UBD while many others had been enrolled for one or two semesters only.

Another overall conclusion is that there is a relatively strong existence of a paradox about the responses from some of the respondents towards the constructs of good writing. For example, the data revealed that the vast majority of lecturers say they regard a comprehensive coverage of issues discussed within the essay as important. However, at the same time as many as 30% of the lecturers interviewed during the main stage of qualitative data collection do not feel that it is essential for students to show evidence of wide reading of subject matter. The existence of this paradox in views of good writing among lecturers can be partly explained by the fact that for the most part, lecturers were perhaps articulating their criteria of good writing for the first time in their academic careers. This is especially true perhaps for the content-course lecturers. Their years of teaching experience may mean that lecturers can recognise ‘good’ writing when they see it but have had fewer opportunities to think about and articulate their criteria of good writing within the space of 30-45 minutes, which is the average span of the interviews with the lecturers. Perhaps this resulted in some lecturers going into ‘auto-mode’ mentality where they gave their criteria of good writing or what they think should be the criteria but whether they actually assess essays based on these criteria is less certain.

The qualitative data also suggests that there were unfulfilled expectations of good writing. Lecturers were found to make adjustments to their perceptions or definitions of ‘good’ ESL academic writing in almost all of the categories of good writing. This prevalent sense of compromise is mainly due to the recognition and awareness of the students’ ability level based on their particular socio-cultural and language backgrounds. For example, some lecturers believe that Bruneian student writers find issues such as presenting personal perspectives or critically analysing facts in their academic essays particularly problematic as their previous educational experiences, are by nature, at odds with the notions of critical enquiry in western academic rhetoric.

Among the students, the same phenomenon manifests itself in some students acknowledging that they can recognise their lecturers’ criteria of good writing and in several cases, share the same views towards the constructs of good writing. However, they are unable to fulfill these expectations due to precisely the same reasons offered by the lecturers, that is, poor language and cognitive skills and social and cultural constraints in meeting these definitions of good writing. As one student succinctly puts it, she acknowledges the fact that “when someone else reads it, they don’t see what I see in my head.”

References


Japanese EFL. *World Englishes*, 14, 1 (97-113)


Standardised literacy testing: Issues, approaches, effects

Lauren Johnson
University of Tasmania

Abstract

Standardised testing, of students' literacy and numeracy skills, is a contentious issue in Australia, as well as elsewhere. State and Federal governments make use of the data collected from such tests to promote a number of agendas; and various interest groups are similarly keen to weigh in to the debates. This has resulted in widespread media coverage on the topic and in the popularisation of student assessment and reporting with the community.

The specific area within this broad topic in which I am chiefly interested is that of the actual implementation of these standardised literacy tests in Australian and Tasmanian classrooms. This means that in addition to examining the wider discourses surrounding the use and effects of these tests in Australia and Tasmania, I will also be researching the ways that teachers introduce and use standardised literacy tests and how their use of the tests affects or is affected by personal beliefs and teaching pedagogies. Furthermore, I aim to identify ways that teachers can best use standardised literacy tests to promote student learning and engagement, and ensure that students' experiences with these tests are constructive and beneficial.

In my presentation I will discuss the processes and data that I have and will use through the course of the research project. The analysis methodology/ies — critical discourse analysis, genealogical discourse analysis, constructivist grounded theory and Rowan's transformational analysis — will be detailed and their use justified with respect to the data and research objectives. Some of the ethical issues of the research will also be identified and discussed in my presentation. My presentation will give no research outcomes or suggestions, as I feel this would be premature at this point in my study.

Research Overview

Through my doctoral research project I am undertaking an examination of current and recent government and government school approaches to standardised literacy benchmark testing. I am especially interested in issues and practices concerning the kinds of language and literacy skills being encouraged through testing, how these skills are assessed, and possibilities with respect to the framing and approaching of these tests. I am researching this topic to contribute to the development of a more thorough understanding of current and future language and literacy skills, needs and changes.

Standardised or benchmarking tests are commonly used in schools, and have the potential to encourage and discourage inequalities and inequities based on learners’ gender, socio-economic, or socio-cultural background. The ways in which this can happen will be examined within a study of the uses, values, effects and classroom context of standardised literacy tests.

Literacy tests come in a variety of forms and are employed by schools and teachers for a number of reasons, most commonly for recognising and recording student learning progress. Norm-referenced, standardised and benchmarked literacy testing approaches have often been criticised as the least constructively used and least useful method of assessment for the purposes of monitoring student learning progress and constructive consolidation of the learning process. The ‘Testing Game’,...
as it has been labelled, is arguably ‘one of power, control, and regulation’ (Williams, Dotson, Don and Williams 1980, 268).

The claims that ‘norm-referenced tests … assess very limited competencies’ express sentiments that are shared by Kalantzis, Cope and Harvey, who argue that ‘standardised testing and a ‘back to basics’ approach to curriculum are unable to promote and measure effectively’ these skills and characteristics required of ‘successful learners, workers and citizens’ (Nolte 1990, 102; Kalantzis, Cope and Harvey 2003, 15). Instead, they call for ‘correlative assessment techniques such as analysis of portfolios, performance, projects and group work’ (Kalantzis, Cope and Harvey 2003, 15).

The Australian Federal Minister of Education, Dr. Nelson, has announced that increased investment will be made in literacy promotion and assessment programmes, major aspects of which will centre on nation-wide testing as a gauge of student progress. This decision reflects the still-prevalent belief in the legitimacy and necessity of testing to collect clear and concise data on student learning progress. The overriding rationale behind standardised literacy testing is gauging student learning progress to provide additional help with schooling. Information from test results could be collated as statistical evidence about education in given locations, with specific groups, or particular schools.

Opponents of standardised testing cite political motivations as the policy drivers; Rees argues that in the context of standardised testing in the United States, President George W. Bush’s educational policies as well as his use of standardised testing are tendentious and attempt to promote his ‘partisan political purposes’. One can draw parallels with Australia from Rees’s claim that, in the US, ‘conservatives use test results to forward their political agenda’ (Rees 2003, 1, 8). There are numerous arguments made about the purposes served by standardised literacy testing, as with literacy teaching, learning and assessment in general (Anstey & Bull 2004; Anthony, Johnson, Mickelson & Preece 1992; Edelsky 1991; Edwards-Groves 2003; Harlen 1978; Kalantzis, Cope & Harvey 2003; Nolte 1990; Williams, Dotson, Don & Williams 1980; Wolk 1979).

This study will explore the validity of various claims made about standardised testing, and the effects and uses of standardised literacy testing in current practice, through an examination of the ways teachers and schools choose to make use of these tests in the classroom.

**Research Aim**

State and federal government attempts to gauge student literacy levels have produced a culture of standardised benchmark tests, which as I have already mentioned have been argued can include and exclude students on the basis of socio-cultural, geographical, gender or other grouping, through promoting merely one rigid set of language and literacy skills and uses. As argued by Johnson and Kress, ‘the way in which literacy is represented in the curriculum, taught and assessed, bears little resemblance to the multimodal, multimediial communicative systems that dictate the exchange and creation of meaning in the everyday working, public and private lives of people’ (Johnson & Kress 2003a, 3). Whether these standardised literacy tests, as well as the ways they are utilised in classrooms, reflect the language and literacy needs and skills of all students are questions that merit comprehensive analysis.

Standardised literacy testing is a highly controversial, political issue, and the need for a re-examination of assessment practices is clear (Johnson & Kress 2003a, 2003b; Kalantzis, Cope & Harvey 2003). Large amounts of educational research have been devoted to the design, contents, context, utilisation and impacts of standardised tests, in addition to scholarly attention given to student results in these tests and what can be inferred from these results. Some literature, for instance, focuses on the value of standardised literacy testing in gaining precise results which express, exactly in
quantitative form, the success or failure of student learning to date, while other literature expresses concern as to the possibility of underlying cultural or sex/gender biases in a test and how these might affect the overall credibility of that test as an accurate portrayal of student learning (Anstey & Bull 2004; Anthony, Johnson, Mickelson & Preece 1992; Brookhart & Bronowicz 2003; Darling-Hammond 1995; Edelsky 1991; Edwards-Groves 2003; Harlen 1978; Kalantzis, Cope & Harvey 2003; McCormick & James 1983; Stobart 2003; Williams, Dotson, Don & Williams 1980; Wolk 1979). Understanding these perspectives and stances on standardised literacy testing is an important part of this study, represented in the research objectives.

Research Objectives

My research project has seven key objectives. They are:

1. To identify the various arguments and stances with respect to standardised/benchmarking literacy testing.
2. To examine and discuss political, social, pedagogical and economic/financial motivations underpinning the various arguments and stances with respect to standardised literacy testing.
3. To examine the ways in which standardised literacy tests are designed, implemented in the classroom and the data used.
4. To identify and critique the strengths and weaknesses of standardised literacy tests and the ways through which they are used in the classroom.
5. To examine and discuss the ways in which standardised literacy tests empower and disempower students and teachers.
6. To identify, examine and discuss ways in which student learning progress and assessment could be improved.
7. To discuss what these findings can contribute to improving educational theory and practice, teaching, learning and assessment within contemporary and future social, educational and political contexts.

Research Methodology

Language can be used to empower and disempower, because of the power ascribed it by its users, as a method not just of communication but also as an avenue through which meanings and truths can be created, maintained and challenged. The underlying theories behind the selected analysis approaches provide the theoretical basis for understanding how language can empower and disempower, include and exclude, appropriate because of the researcher’s interest in inclusion in education, teaching and learning.

The selection of a discourse analysis approach is appropriate for two main reasons.

Language: Discourse analysis is the ‘close study of language in use’, which synthesises with a study of literacy and language: this research project takes as its focal point literacy testing, itself a study of the ways through which our society/community reflect the value and power of language (Taylor 2001a, 5, 15).

Social Analysis: More broadly, discourse analysis examines ways that we as humans allow and often encourage language to both enable and constrain both our ‘expression of certain ideas but also what [we] do’ (Taylor 2001a, 9). This analysis methodology/approach seeks, through a closer examination of language-based and -mediated human interaction, to understand and illuminate the power relations and structures we create for ourselves and, knowingly or not, perpetuate. This follows Fairclough’s understanding of discursive analysis, in examining ‘the totality of discursive practices within an institution or society, and the relationships between them’ (Fairclough 1989/2001, 29).
Two kinds of discourse analysis will be utilised through this research project. A critical discourse analysis methodology will be employed throughout the analysis of collected data, such as interviews, observations and relevant data. Over and above the question of actual content within standardised literacy tests, the ways they are implemented in classrooms and how teachers (among others) consider them as a teaching, learning and assessment tool can be clarified and scrutinised through a critical discourse analysis approach, which goes past a superficial examination of the language in favour of a rigorous examination of the broader discursive context, including social, political, and economic context of the language usage and production. It is this social context that is the primary reason behind the use of a critical discourse analysis approach; as Norman Fairclough has noted, ‘language connects with the social through being the primary domain of ideology, and through being both a site of, and a stake in, struggles for power’ (Fairclough 1989/2001, 15).

A genealogical discourse analysis approach will be employed with the analysis of select literature and data, in order to gain a deeper understanding of the historical and social context of emergent discourses. A genealogical discourse analysis is similar to a critical discourse analysis in its interest with the power of discourses and the development of often unchallenged practices and structures. Such a genealogical discourse analysis, following Foucault's 1961 *Madness and Civilisation*, ‘explores their wider implications, such as the identities they make available and the constraints which they set up’ (Taylor 2001a, 9; Foucault, 1961).

While a critical discourse analysis will be applied to most of the collected data, such as that collected from observations in classrooms, interviews and so on, a genealogical discourse analysis approach will be applied to official documents such as standardised literacy testing guidelines, literature concerning the topics of standardised literacy testing in Australia and elsewhere, and analyses and reviews of instances of formative and summative testing assessment and monitoring, to examine for discourses relating to the practice of and theories concerning standardised literacy testing, as well as to identify how and to what extent standardised literacy testing and attitudes toward it have developed. This will in turn inform the wider analysis into current standardised literacy testing issues, approaches and effects.

These two discourse analysis approaches will enable me to become more familiar with the discourses in the collected data and literature, from which I will be better able to critique and study them and their meanings.

In addition to critical and genealogical discourse analysis approaches, collected data will be analysed through a combination of analysis approaches. These approaches are constructivist grounded theory, genealogical and critical discourse analysis, and Rowan’s transformational analysis (Carabine 2001; Charmaz 2000; Charmaz & Mitchell 2002; Haig 1995; Rowan 2001; Taylor 2001a, 2001b). These research methodologies challenge assumed beliefs and practices, and seek to present a subjective, partial piece of research, and hence are aligned with the research perspectives.

The dominant discourses of the data, determined from the employment of a constructivist grounded theory analysis approach, will be examined through genealogical and critical discourse analysis and Rowan’s transformational analysis approaches (Carabine 2001; Rowan 2001; Taylor 2001a, 2001b). This involves the application of Rowan’s six transformative analysis questions, to illuminate ways the texts and practices either reinforce or challenge the existing status quo, then the questioning, through a genealogical discourse analysis, of the wider educational and social implications of the usage of standardised literacy testing, as already examined in the wider context of understanding power, inequality and inequity (Carabine 2001; Rowan 2001; Taylor 2001a, 2001b).

This research project is shaped by theories concerned with power, discourses and knowledge which might be located within standardised literacy testing. Through an examination of these practices, to use the words of Carabine, the ‘nature of power/knowledge in modern society’ can become clearer (Carabine 2001, 276).
this way, the employment of each of these three analysis methodologies can frame the research project more firmly within the theoretical framework of social justice, equity, inclusion and empowerment in education.

The employment of three analysis approaches helps ensure analytical rigour and reliability, and that the inferences drawn are not based upon uninformed opinion, untested hypothesis or sweeping assumption. The validity of the research project, as with reliability, will be demonstrated through the depth of the research and data analysis. The results of the analysis will be judged according to the criteria of three analysis methodologies, so providing merit for the ‘truth or accuracy of the [research] generalizations’ (Taylor 2001b, 318). In this way the study will fulfil the requirements of one that is valid, carefully considered and thorough.

A motivation for the use of three data analysis tools within this study is the clear benefits gained from such triangulation. That this study intends to make use of three methods of data analysis means it will support the production of a more thorough piece of research, one that does more than just produce convincing research conclusions for the reader. Further, separate groups of textual and non-textual data will be used to provide strengthened analysis and to produce more thorough conclusions; and a variety of resources for each type of data will be accessed to ensure the data be examined as much as possible within the time limitations of the research project.

A clear constraint even at this initial stage of the study is caused by the wide scope of the issue being examined. This will become more noticeable further into the study, and the focus of the project may need to be narrowed somewhat. During the initial research and reading stage, though, this has meant a large amount of data has been and will need to be collected and examined, to better inform the later decision of the narrowing of the study focus. This large amount of data needing collection and examination will itself present a valid challenge, in the form of time constraints; as a response to this, the initial stage of the study is anticipated to be a time-consuming, but very valuable, process for the research process as well as the researcher.

This study necessarily began with data gathering and research on the background of the topic and its related issues. The second stage, the clarification of a more concise aspect of standardised literacy testing upon which to narrow the study, included widening the types of data collected and analysed to include non-textual data as well: interviews with persons who have had personal or professional experiences with standardised literacy tests, such as teachers, educational administrators and researchers, students, and observation and examination of various instances of standardised literacy testing in schools. Following this, the third stage of the study is one of consolidation of the various collected data, data analysis, and writing up of the research findings.

Ethical Issues

Education is a highly political issue, with educational policies and practices often reflective of political, social and cultural beliefs. The challenge of producing research in education that is transparent, rigorous and unaffected by the various political or financial motivations of educational practitioners and administrators is a very real and pressing one. In examining educational policy and administration, classroom practice and teaching pedagogy, current practices will be opened up to critique, a process which will need to be approached and executed with sensitivity to political and personal issues.

The following are just some of the ethical issues I have been considering and will need to continue to take care of throughout my research.

- Selection of teachers to observe
- The effect of the researcher’s presence upon the classroom during observation
• Student, teacher, school, interviewee privacy and confidentiality
• The effect of my own subjectivity, values etc. onto the data and its analysis/interpretation

References


Edwards-Groves, C. 2003, On Task: Focused Literacy Learning, The Primary English Teaching Association (PETA), Newtown, NSW.


Rees, J. 2003, A crisis over consensus: standardized testing in American History and

Rowan, L. 2001, *Write Me In: Inclusive Texts in the Primary Classroom*, The Primary English Teaching Association (PETA), Newtown, NSW.


Learning Area Tensions and Popularity®

Robbie Johnston
University of Ballarat

Abstract

Theoretical discussions of ‘discourse’ and critical discourse analysis highlight the varied meanings of the terms: meanings which vary according to the traditions from which they are derived. Currently, critical discourse analysis is assuming a place within the teaching and learning of Studies of Society and Environment (SOSE); a learning area increasingly recognised for its multi-textuality. The learning area is recognised widely as being unpopular with students and has been criticised for its largely passive pedagogical practices which are thought to contribute to the high level of student dissatisfaction. Discussions of the learning area tend to centre on the pedagogical binary of passive and active approaches to teaching and learning. However, recent longitudinal research which explored pre-service teachers’ choices of field sites for SOSE led to a series of research questions about the discourses—both explicit and implicit—underlying the teaching of SOSE in primary classrooms in Australia. The research highlights the importance of remaining open to an evolving approach to research. A discourse analysis of the blueprints for SOSE indicated the potential power of institutional and disciplinary discourses to influence the way that the learning area is conceptualised and taught. Although discourses of schooling may act to position students and teachers in particular ways—for example, either as passive receivers of knowledge or constructors of it—the effect of such positioning would also seem to be far from deterministic. Yet, findings from the study discussed in the paper pointed to three dominant discourses that seemed to be highly influential in shaping pre-service teachers’ choices: a discourse of community, a discourse of the local environment and a discourse of history. These findings are significant in that they shed new light on the tensions between the dominant discourses of SOSE and the contested global environment in which students live.

Introduction

In connection with the dominant discourses of policy blueprints, the critical discourse analysis (CDA) discussed in this paper aims to elucidate some of the potential tensions which may lead to the widely reported unpopularity of the learning area known as Studies of Society and Environment (SOSE)—along with possibilities presented by these findings. The CDA comes from PhD research (Johnston, 2003) which investigated the field site choices of a cohort of B.Ed students in their first and second years of study in Education at the University of Tasmania, their reasons for their choices of fieldwork sites for children’s learning, their perceptions of iconic spaces and places as teaching resources and the world views these embody. The naturalistic study was grounded in the teaching of Studies of Society and Environment (SOSE) within the broader context of teacher education. SOSE as the learning area most commonly is known in most states of Australia, appears to be unpopular with school students (Education Department of Western Australia, 1994, p. 10). It is argued that students see the learning area as lacking in relevance for their everyday lives. It is suggested that teachers may resolve the problems by implementing active approaches to teaching and learning rather than passive, teacher directed approaches. However, the longitudinal research on which this paper is based suggests that widely reported student dissatisfaction with the learning
area—and its ‘close relations’ of social studies and civics and citizenship—is likely to be more complex than often suggested. This paper discusses SOSE in terms of its dominant discourses and seeks to highlight the tensions of the learning area through a critical discourse analysis of SOSE.

Theoretical and conceptual issues
There is widely held agreement that SOSE and related learning areas such as social studies are alienating to students (Adler, 1991a; Armento, 1996; Reynolds and Moroz, 1998). School learning of SOSE, it is argued, is markedly out of step with trends and debates in academia (Davison, 2000; Morgan 2000; Ryan, 1996, p. 208). The nature of knowledge is, in many instances, highly political: school curricula are influenced by political and community censorship and control (Ryan, 1996, p. 208). Difficult issues and conflict have tended to be avoided (Apple, 1990).

Despite criticisms of curricular bias, recommendations for resolving the student dissatisfaction with SOSE, both for teaching in schools and for teaching social studies methods courses in teacher education programs, tend to focus on an educational binary of active, inquiry oriented versus passive, teacher directed approaches. Likewise, geography and fieldwork tend to be discussed in relation to this educational binary (Clark, 1997; Higgitt, 1997). There tends to be a preference for enquiry oriented rather than didactic “tour guide” approaches (Laws, 1989). Indeed many recommendations for teaching and learning mirror those from the Education Department of Western Australia report (1994, p. 10): “the need for relevance (of school learning) to everyday life and the use of more active strategies such as inquiry-based learning using a variety of resources and that students be provided with opportunities to perceive connections and relationships in their studies.”

More recently, others taking a feminist perspective to their analyses of fieldwork and geography, in particular, argue that enquiry oriented approaches are problematic (Lee, 1996; Nairn, 1997, cited in Morgan, 2000; Rose, 1993, cited in Ploszajska, 1998). For example, Ploszajska (1998, p. 758) argues that “it is now beginning to be recognized that disciplinary practices not only produce particular kinds of knowledges but also produce gendered subjects who are differently positioned in relation to those knowledges.”

Research approach
The discourse analyses discussed in this paper evolved from a mixed method approach to research. Data sources for the study comprised participant observation, my own pedagogic reflections as a form of reflective practice, and participant responses from an open-ended survey and semi-structured interview. With the exception of the interview, all other data was gathered when participants were students in a first year unit, Social Education, which focused on the teaching and learning of SOSE.

This investigation fomented a series of research questions about the discourses underlying the teaching of SOSE in Primary classrooms in Australia, both explicit and implicit, and in the frameworks provided by curriculum documents. These discourses form the focus of this article. Meanings of the term discourse vary according to the traditions from which they are derived (Poynton & Lee, 2000). For this research, I drew upon a meaning offered by Gilbert (2001, p. 95) for thinking about discourse analysis of the texts used in SOSE: “The term ‘discourse’ refers to the practices through which people use symbol systems such as language in their everyday activities and interactions, and how these systems enable and constrain their practices.”

Analysis of surveys and interviews
Key themes arising from a constructivist grounded theory approach (Charmaz, 2000;
Strauss & Corbin, 1990) to the analysis of survey data were used as the basis of interpretation of the interviews. In addition, interview transcripts as well as official blueprints for SOSE were analysed thematically in terms of their dominant discourses to elucidate the overt and hidden curricula and pedagogies mobilised by participants.

To identify mutually exclusive categories that embodied the essence of what participants were saying about their choice of SOSE fieldwork sites, I conducted a thematic analysis of the interview data to produce an interpretive framework inclusive of all of the statements. As each of these themes constituted a *naming* of the potential value of sites selected, each theme can also be considered as a *discourse* drawn upon and mobilised by participants to explain why they chose particular sites.

When participants justified their choice of well-known, named, highly visible, and bounded sites for implementing SOSE, it seemed that they drew upon and mobilised a range of discourses broad in scope, yet also tending towards the culturally hegemonic. Participants drew upon a range of available and competing discourses that cohered closely with broader discourses—those of the SOSE guidelines themselves, of fieldwork pedagogies, and of taken-for-granted views about educating children.

**Critical discourse analysis arising from interview analyses**

These findings led to a critical discourse analysis of the official blueprints that had comprised key reference points for participants in their choices of sites for the assignment. Notably, these documents were national and Tasmanian state guidelines for the teaching of SOSE (Australian Education Council, 1994b, 1994c; Department of Education and the Arts, 1995a, 1995b).

As official learning area blueprints, these various documents consist of an amalgam of varying approaches to the study of society and environment. At one level, with its strong allegiance to social science disciplines, the SOSE curriculum tends to derive from an academic rationalist (Print, 1993, pp. 47–48) approach to curriculum. At another level, SOSE moves beyond a strict academic rationalist position and reflects broader trends in the social sciences. Whether the focus for learning is one discipline or many, the documents tend to promote a multidisciplinary approach. Slight differences occur in the parameters of the official blueprints at state and national level. Although both sets of curriculum documents are based on the social sciences, Tasmanian SOSE documents adopt a social issues stance to enquiry from a range of perspectives described as curriculum organisers.

**Three dominant discourses**

Several inter-related discourses run through the official blueprints. One which I term a discourse of community is a pervading theme that operates in several ways. As a discourse oriented to learning through direct experience in the immediate environment, it exists as much for factors of expedience—financial and time constraints, as well as concerns for teachers and schools to fulfil their “duty of care” to students—as it does for pedagogical concerns: learning for young children takes place in their “immediate environment” (Australian Education Council, 1994a, p. 19). Learning occurring in the local environment and about the local community is a recurring theme frequently aligned with the intended aim of citizenship education.

The second of the dominant discourses is a discourse of history. Although the five strands are described in similar detail and at similar length, one tends to claim priority over the others. In the general strand description, only one, “Time, continuity and change” is described as “a vital part of integrated studies” (Australian Education Council, 1995a, p. 14). None of the other areas is described as *vital*.

While the SOSE documents mention many other places, the greatest emphasis is on the immediate locality, in relation to both the discourse of community and the discourse of history. When the environment is seen as bounded, severe limitations are placed on opportunities for children to learn about society and environment in an increasingly
global context. This latter discourse, for example, illuminates one possible reason for previous research findings which suggested that students consider that SOSE has little relevance for their understanding of their everyday lives.

In frequent references to children’s involvement in exploring their surroundings, the SOSE Statement (Australian Education Council, 1994a) reflects the view that children, and more especially young children, learn through concrete experiences. Although there is mention in the SOSE Statement of children exploring “a range of social and environmental settings” (p. 19) and specific mention of differing communities—for example, “the school and local or global community”—there is a dominant discourse of children “exploring their immediate surroundings” (p. 21). Immediate environments also are seen as familiar environments—the two tend to be conflated. The SOSE Statement, for example, describes familiar places for children as “homes, schools, shopping centres and local neighbourhoods” (p. 21).

One of the problems with this discourse is the implication that children’s direct experience is limited to their home, school and community. Moreover, the three tend to be conflated. There appears to be an assumption that school children are characterised by racial and cultural homogeneity. Another assumption would seem to be that all children attend schools close to their home. In a state such as Tasmania characterised by rurality, many children do not attend school in their immediate locality. They travel considerable distances from home to attend an area school.

Likewise, it is assumed that children attending school in the locality in which they live do not have diverse place experience. Tellingly, the Band A Starter (Department of Education and the Arts, 1995a) suggests that children “Explore lifestyles in high density urban areas or rural areas in contrast to learners’ environment.” Yet, most rural children travel to high density urban areas for recreational reasons. It is also suggested that children find out about other places through indirect experience. Band A of the SOSE Statement (Australian Education Council, 1994a, p. 19), for example, states that “Students are encouraged to imagine the world beyond their immediate environment through stories, maps and photographs.” Such statements do not acknowledge the diversity of experience that may be the norm for many children, even if this does not include places far distant from their homes. The wisdom of such assumptions about children’s limited place experience is increasingly questioned. As Robertson (2000, p. 14) argues, “multiple spaces [constitute] the child’s world.”

In the contemporary world when many children’s lives are characterised by family relocations and travel, it is likely that for even very young children, direct experience of the environment will include experience of many different environments. It is just as likely that for some children, opportunities for diverse informal place experience is constrained—particularly if their lives are highly regulated. A curriculum discourse which makes unproblematic assumptions about children’s place experience tends to universalise children’s experience and potentially normalises the experience of some children over others. It does not acknowledge that children are “entitled to know” (Slater & Morgan, 2000, p. 272).

The tendency to select not only places in the children’s locality but places considered to be relevant in terms of their common experience points to a view of children as lacking in environmental experience—or capacity to engage with the unfamiliar. In various ways children are seen as lacking—either in their ability to observe, explore and/or understand. In statements that suggest children do not know their own places from recreational pursuits there is something of an irony. Family experiences—“staple family outings” and “going to all sorts of places around Tasmania”—are the very ways that many of the participants said that they had found out about places. As one participant said, “Like you know with my family when I grew up we did quite a bit of gadding about Tasmania.” Yet interview data suggest that “recreational purposes” such as picnicking and going to sites “with their parents” are not seen as conducive to learning. Some statements suggest that children do not know their own localities: “so they might go there with their parents and not know anything about it”. These statements convey a tabula rasa or empty vessel view of the learner.

Findings suggested that decisions were made with reference to the master discourses
of schooling encapsulated in the dominant discourses of the official blueprints for SOSE. Participants were drawn towards the discourse of community and history. Publicly valued, high status places reflecting an anodyne view of the past and perceived authenticity as places of some aesthetic value or importance as community habitats were considered to be of some worth for children’s learning. It appeared that such choices amounted to a culturally hegemonic curriculum.

Likewise, places representing controversy were excluded. In some cases, such sites were ones deemed unsuitable for children’s learning; on the other hand, they were places that had the potential to raise difficult issues such as social disparity. Sites were selected for their perceived propensity for settled enquiry; locations were excluded when they were thought to be conducive to exposing inherent differences and strongly held points of view. These trends pointed to a strong impetus for participants to censor what was available for children’s learning. It appeared that such decisions were made without full recognition of the multiple realities encountered by children in everyday, contemporary life.

Conclusion

The study findings elucidate the potential for curricula and pedagogical bias of the learning area and highlight the mismatch between what children are likely to learn in SOSE and what they experience in their everyday lives. Previous studies have suggested that, at school, students are alienated from SOSE due to a lack of active, enquiry oriented approaches. The critical discourse analysis within the longitudinal study on which this paper is based has added to debates surrounding the widely reported high level of dissatisfaction with learning in SOSE. It appears that the dominant discourses of SOSE perpetuate a curriculum and pedagogical approach out of synch with the contemporary realities of school students.

Moreover, it appears to be clear that seeking to teach SOSE through sanitised curricula choices is out of step with reality and not conducive to developing an understanding of the world in which we live. Such choices not only lack recognition of conflict in the present but also in the past: history is not anodyne. History is “littered with bloody massacres, pogroms and persecutions, with wars and insurrections” (Abbott-Chapman, 2003, p. 2). Likewise, highly politicised and contested times highlight pedagogical difficulties. It becomes more evident that neither a controlling pedagogy of cultural transmission nor a pedagogy of cultural immersion is appropriate—nor is an enquiry approach that does not include understanding of competing discourses. Any of these approaches has the potential to marginalise and alienate. As this paper has argued, the dominant discourses of SOSE are powerful shapers of teacher education students’ curricular and pedagogical choices for children’s learning. It would seem to behove teacher educators to expand the ‘discourse repertoire’ to redress this imbalance.

References


Australian Education Council. (1994a). A statement on studies of society and


Please note: This paper was presented at the 'International Conference of Critical Discourse Analysis: Theory into Research' under the title of 'A critical discourse analysis of SOSE: What can we learn about the tensions and unpopularity of the learning area?'. 
The Discursive Construction of Identities: A Critical Analysis of the Representation of Social Actors in Conflict®

María Labarta & Rosana Dolón
University of Valencia (Spain)

Abstract

Starting from a context of controversial urban planning, which conveys the transformation of a residential area in Valencia (Spain) into a leisure area, -a project which meets the residents’ opposition-, the discourse practice here focuses on the dialectics encouraged between the two parties: on the one hand, the supporters of the urban plan and, on the other hand, the residents’ defensive attitude of exclusion avoidance. We look into identity construction and exclusion as related to a discourse practice of resistance. Our research will allow us to highlight the ways in which the different social actors are represented, to witness the dialectics of conflicting discourse practices, and reveal its underlying mechanisms.

Historical background

The interior reform plan for the Carmen Quarter around the Arab wall, which was submitted in 2002 and affected 200 people (40% of the population of the area), anticipated the demolition of 16 buildings and the reuse of 17 construction sites. The plan, which was originally meant for the construction of public equipment and some houses, was in fact a way of getting rid of the neighbours, a way of demographic cleansing, since the type of equipments that were to be set up in the area was not specified at all. In other words, the plan meant throwing around 200 people out of the district through expropriation or purchase of the affected properties, and did not consider rehousing the affected neighbours.

Introduction

The study of discursive practices between confronted groups because of an urban plan will allow us to gain an insight into the dynamic construction of identity as a means of representing social actors that favour the public opinions’ acceptance of the proposal of the new urbanistic project.

Our research will allow us to highlight the ways in which the different social actors are represented; to witness the dialectics of conflicting discourse practices, and reveal its underlying mechanisms.

Methodological framework

We start from Critical Discourse Analysis as a methodological framework, relying as well on the contributions of Social Psychology. Construction of discourse, we understand, implies active selection: by giving an account, language users ‘construct’ reality. As stated by Davies & Harré (1990), the discursive practice refers to all the ways in which we actively produce social and psychological realities. Likewise, we relate identity to the construction of subjectivity, to the production of social actors and to self-presentation activity. We share, as well, a conception of identity understood as a set of culturally available performances, which are sanctioned through power relations (see e.g. Wetherell 2001, Fairclough 1992).

More specifically, we have resorted to the methodological tools provided by Fairclough’s (2003) categorisation, and van Leeuwen’s (1996) sociosemantic categories for the representations of social actors.
A principle underlying Critical Discourse Analysis (see Fairclough 1989) is that it allows for an insight into texts as acquiring their meanings by the dialectical relationship between the texts themselves and the social subjects. All speakers and writers operate from specific discursive practices originating in special interests and aims which involve inclusions and exclusions.

Fairclough (1995:57) also conveys a multifunctional perspective, where a text is analysable in terms of the articulation of three functions, which he refers to in terms of Representations, Relations and Identities: the text is an expression of particular representations, inasmuch as it carries particular ideologies and in its potential for recontextualising a social practice; it is as well the expression of a particular relation holding between writer and reader, as it corresponds to a particular construction of writer and reader identity.

The link between discourse, society and culture is well established from the studies done by social psychologists, who see discursive practice embracing all the ways in which people actively produce social and psychological realities (see Davies & Harré 1990, Wetherell 2001). The discursive practice involves the construction of identity and subjectivity, whereby the discourse itself allows to trace how social actors are constructed, i.e. how people tell stories about themselves and how they present themselves in talk and writing.

Van Leeuwen’s (1996) study of the representation of social actors provides an interesting characterisation of the principal ways in which social actors can be represented in discourse through specific linguistic and rhetorical realisations. The author’s way of understanding the creation of social actors corresponds as well to a dynamic perspective, which involves the construction of identity and subjectivity starting from a relational view of self-conception.

For our analysis of the representation of social actors in the dialectics between the opposed discursive practices of the two parties, we have relied, then, on the following textual variables:

In the first place, we have considered the inclusion or exclusion of social actors: we examine which social actors are included and which ones are excluded, and how this is linguistically encoded. If and when tracing identity exclusion, we have further identified whether this conveys suppression or backgrounding of the social actor. The use of nouns and pronouns as linguistic means that enact the presence or absence of social actors has also been considered.

On the other hand, we have looked into the grammatical role of the social actor within the clause, and looked into textual aspects such as personalisation versus impersonalisation, or whether the social actor is represented through explicit naming as opposed to classification (being grouped or classified within a category).

We have based our analysis on a corpus that comprises three blocks:

1. the urban project outlined by the technical specialists.
3. round tables where architects, urban planners, archeologists and neighbours have been discussing the project.

We have tried to choose a comprehensive corpus in terms of data and sources, and at the same time we wanted it to be balanced with what regards the authors’ ideological tendencies and their corresponding chosen texts.

We have referred to the two group representations in terms of ANTI-PROJECT actors (those who are against the urban project) as opposed to PRO-PROJECT ACTORS (who promote and defend the enactment of the project).

The ANTI-PROJECT ACTORS would, then, include directly affected people, like the inhabitants of El Carmen quarter, neighbours, residents associations and authors of opinion articles against the project.

The PRO-PROJECT ACTORS would be represented by the promoters and defenders of the project, Governmental Institutions, Technicians, Architects, Archeologists, and authors of press articles published in conservative newspapers.
Analysis of data - Representation of social actors in the selected data

Anti-project actors

We have looked into each corpus section separately since each one represents a specifically contextualised discourse practice. We have highlighted examples from the texts to refer to the representation of anti-project actors in the first place:

- La funcin residencial the residential function
- El tejido residencial the residential tissue
- la distribucin de la poblacin por manchas distribution of the population in patches
- Ocupacin de viviendas house occupancy
- Los interesados the interested party
- Algunos de ellos some of them
- La poblacin the population

The anti-project actors, i.e. the Technical Specialists of the project, are extensively backgrounded in the main part of the text, being almost exclusively represented through common nouns such as “the resident”, “the tenant” or else abstract nouns as are for example “social tissue” “residential tissue”. These latter examples allow for the de-personalisation of the referred actors. Anti-project actors can be said to be extensively backgrounded in these two senses. Through nominalisations of the type “the occupation” (of houses), or “the distribution” (of the population) the direct inference to the anti-project actors is avoided, who are thereby taken away from the focus of attention, excluded from the participatory frame.

It is interesting to note, however, that only on specific occasions these are fore grounded, namely when referred to as an obstacle and a problem for the project to be carried out: “Some of them are very difficult to reach. …”

As to corpus B, we have considered a selection of thirty-five press articles on the topic. Generally speaking we can say that anti-project actors are represented in the text samples. This is predominantly done through the use of nouns. It is interesting to note that anti-project actors are mostly represented as groups:

- Los vecinos the neighbours
- Las familias the affected families
- Los propietarios afectados the affected owners
- Los vecinos del Carmen the neighbours of ’El Carmen’
- Los residentes the residents
- Los residentes afectados the affected residents
- Personas y colectivos afectados affected people and groups
- Sus habitantes (del barrio) its citizens (of the district)
- …lo que sgun los culculos vecinales suponia desalojar a 200 personas.
- …what, according to calculations made by the neighbourhood, implied the eviction of 200 people
- Las comunidades de propietarios the owners’ communities
- Las asociaciones vecinales the associations of neighbours

Note that the examples referring to pro-project actors are printed in pink, and those related to anti-project actors in blue.
Whenever these anti-project actors are representatives of an association or else hold a
position, they are referred to by first name and surname:

**El urbanista y ex decano del CTAV, Alberto Peñin**, uno de los expertos más críticos,
 lamentó la falta de un debate público....

The urban planner and former dean of the CTAV, Alberto Peñin, one of the most critical
experts, regretted the lack of a public debate...

**El historiador Josep Montesinos** The historian Josep Montesinos
El alcaldable socialista Rafa Rubio, fue a la cena que los vecinos organizaron.

The socialist mayor Rafa Rubio, went to the dinner organized by the neighbours.

On the other hand, when the affected neighbours do not hold any institutional position, they
are just mentioned by their first name. In the following example reference is made to houses
or establishments that will be pulled down, as is for example the popular bar ‘Arandinos’,
whose owners are “Manolo and Manoli”:

**Manuel y Manoli**, de 60 y 58 años, regentan el bar Arandinos.

Manuel and Manoli, 60 and 58 years old, are in charge of the bar ‘Arandinos’.

A su propietario, Manolo, parece que le va a hervir la sangre cuando habla del proyecto.

The owner, Manolo, gets very heated up when he talks about the project.

In the following example just the architect has a surname:

**Amparo**, de 87 años, y **Ángela**, de 77, esta última suegra de **Josep**, viven 10 años en
el barrio, pero lo sienten suyo.

Jose Luis is a craftsman, who has a PhD in Fine Arts and teaches pottery in Manises

Jorge Palacios is an Argentinan architect who has lived since 1998 on a block in the
Plaza del Angel Custodio.

In some cases, explicit reference is made to the fact that the neighbour at issue has been
leaving for a long time or has always been a resident of the district, thereby claiming a historic
fact of belonging to the urban context.

**Carmen** es hija y vecina del barrio del Carmen desde que nació (...) Como Carmen
existen muchos otros afectados, 200 según la entidad vecinal...

Carmen has been a resident of the 'Carmen' quarter since she was born (...) Like
Carmen, there are other many more affected citizens; 200 according to the
neighbourhood entity...

As to corpus C, looking into the interventions of round tables, we find examples of anti-project
actors exclusion in the sense that they are not mentioned at all, as happens in the second
intervention. The second speaker, Carolina Járrega, for example makes a description of the
distance traced by the wall. The anti-project actors are not referred to at any time.

In the first 60-minute debate, only on three occasions are the neighbours mentioned, namely
when being problematised. That is referred to in terms of “the neighbours are a problem”.

In the next 60 minutes the speakers include the population of the district and place the
neighbors of the Carmen quarter in the foreground. Some examples of representations of
anti-project actors are as follows
pensando en los vecinos afectados y en el resto de Valencia

...El taller de Pepe March. El RIVA lo ignora

Los equipamientos que se proponen, ¿para qué nos sirven?

El barrio no está degradado, como se dice. ¿En qué nos beneficiamos? Lo digo desde el punto de vista de los vecinos.

Se debería haber hecho una consulta previa con la población

thinking of the affected neighbours and the rest of Valencia

...Pepe March’s workshop; The RIVA ignores it

The equipment that is being proposed, what are they useful for?

The quarter is not degraded as is being said. How do we benefit from it? I say this from the point of view of the neighbours.

The citizens should have been consulted previously

(4th. Speaker: Jorge Palacios, architect and affected neighbour)

Los vecinos no son un problema, son la solución

Los vecinos apenas se mencionan” (el el proyecto)

El plan es ilegal (...) se debe hacer en acuerdo con los vecinos (...) Buscando el acuerdo, no la imposición.

The neighbours are not the problem, they are the solution

The neighbours are hardly mentioned (in the project)

The plan is illegal (...) it has to be implemented in agreement with the neighbours (...) Looking for agreement, not imposition

(5th. Speaker: (Fernando Gaja, University Professor)

Pro-project actors

The representation of pro-project actors in our corpus, that is of both the actors and the supporters of the plan, differs importantly from the representation of anti-project actors. In general terms, we can talk here of “foregrounding” as opposed to “backgrounding” and of “inclusion” of social actors as opposed to “exclusion”.

Pro-project actors are highly personalised and individualised in the texts either through the use of personal pronouns: (We will analyze, it allows us to see, we will differenciate); possessives (in our project, our context), and also through direct naming (the local government, the administration…) This explicit textual reference makes the presence of the plan, its importance, also more salient.

Sometimes, however, pro-project actors are textually encoded through impersonal reference, as in:

En un primer análisis del tejido residencial del entorno ha de considerarse el número de viviendas ocupadas que existen en cada uno de los inmuebles habitados.

In the first analysis of the residential tissue of the environment the number of occupied homes has to be considered within each of the inhabited buildings.

Como se puede observar, de un total de 209 viviendas existentes en el entorno estrecho
de las manzanas afectadas, se verían directamente afectadas cerca de 48, lo que supone aproximadamente algo más del 20% de ellas.

As one can observe, of a total amount of 209 homes within the precise environment of the affected building blocks, around 48 would be directly affected, which corresponds to approximately 20% of them.

Or through nominalisations:

Sólo se considera viable la expropiación, o la adquisición…;

The only thing that is considered feasible is expropriation or acquisition…

Otro dato que ha habido que completar es el de la situación económica de los afectados por la intervención

Another detail that had to be completed is that of the economic situation of those affected by the intervention

Se contempla especialmente el realojo de los inquilinos de las viviendas que hayan de ser sustituidas (…) Se procede a la construcción…

Especially the re-lodging of the tenants is considered of the homes that have to be substituted (…) One proceeds to the construction…

Both linguistic devices, the use of impersonal forms and nominalisations serve the purpose of pro-actor exclusion. Not explicitly mentioning the subject for both actions of “considering” and “observing”, the agent is backgrounded, not projected in the text.

Through nominalisation on the other hand it is the activity that is given relevance instead of the agent. Reference is made to expropriation, intervention, acquisition, with the effect of excluding the social actor.

For corpus section B, that is the press articles, sometimes pro-project actors are projected in terms of an institution as the regional government. It is also often the case to find pro-project actors represented though explicit naming, especially when they are political authorities or when they hold a political position.

Aunque el proyecto está prácticamente cerrado, tal y como explicó a Diario de Valencia el Director General de Vivienda, José María García Zarco.

Although the project is practically closed, as the managing director for town planning, José María García Zarco explained to ‘Diario de Valencia’ (local newspaper).

Joan Pecourt, urbanista y redactor del plan de la muralla, junto con los técnicos de la oficina RIVA Cesar Misfut y Carolina Járrega, se quedaron solos en la defensa del proyecto ante el centenar de vecinos del Carmen que asistió e intervino en el debate.

Joan Pecourt, urban planner and drafter of the plan for the wall, together with specialists from the RIVA office, Cesar Misfut and Carolina Járrega, were alone in the defence of the project in front of a hundred neighbours from 'El Carmen' quarter, who attended and participated in the discussion.

La solución prevista para mostrar la muralla – dice Juan Pecourt…

The solution we have anticipated to show the wall - notes Juan Pecourt…

However, with pro-project actors we can also talk in terms of exclusion. Impersonal structures, such as:

Para ello se utilizará

To that purpose one will use...

or placing an abstract concept in subject position, as in “The project anticipates”, “The action plan will renew And act on…”, have a distancing effect: the representation of the pro-project actors is decentralised and backgrounded. However, what is worth noting here is, that inclusion is more represented than exclusion; and that the use of exclusion has a very
concrete intention, which is to avoid responsibility)

As for corpus C there, is a persuasive presence of pro-project actors, mostly represented in the texts through the pronoun form "we". For example:

"We did also a social survey, studying how many family units lived in a building."

**Conclusion**

When considering the three sources of the corpus and comparing the presence of pro-project actors with the presence of anti-project actors in the texts, we can in the first place talk of two different representations of social agents.

Pro-project actors are basically foregrounded, included in the texts through first person pronoun choice (mostly the plural *we*) and through the name of the person or naming of the institutions they represent.

Exclusion or backgrounding through grammatical devices of depersonalization or nominalization only holds when negative consequences for the neighbourhood are conveyed. In other words, identity exclusion here means not accepting responsibility: it’s like hiding one’s hand behind some intervention.

Under critical circumstances, where expropriation would be requested as a valid course of action, the project actors’ invisibility, their exclusion, de-emphasizes their responsibility in the matter.

With anti-project actors identity exclusion differences can be spotted for the three sections of the corpus:

In the first section, the project outlined by the technical specialists, we find that anti-project actors appear as backgrounded, as silenced subjects that have no saying in the matter. The neighbours of the district are represented in terms of “tissue”, “a function”, an abstract entity where the individual is not existing. This way, the authors of the project manage to ignore the negative social impact that the plan has on the neighbourhood.

To illustrate this, let’s have a look at the following quotation:

"On the one hand, the degradation of the social tissue, which lacks in having its own initiative, which leads to restoration"

The residents are first treated in abstraction as a depersonalised: “social structure”, but in the second part of the expression they become personalised though lacking in own initiative. The neighbours are human beings but without certain capacities, like initiative. The fact of presenting them in terms of “social tissue” enhances the effect of depersonalisation; they are referred to in abstract terms.

Anti-project actors were also found to be projected as groups rather than as individuals, which contributes to the avoidance of individualised presentation of the neighbourhood.

In the second corpus section, the newspaper articles, while anti-project actors appear as groups, they are provided with agency and are often projected as the protagonists of the plan and its consequences: “they have resisted…”, “they have bought”, “…they have restored…”

Exclusion in this corpus section has to do with forms of address: only those neighbours who have a university degree or else hold a specific social or political position, are individualised and addressed by their first name and surname.

Another form of exclusion can be found in the third section of the corpus, the round tables, where the Anti–Project actors are not mentioned at all, and whenever they are textually encoded they are presented as problematized actors.

The exclusion of Pro-project actors has, to generalise at this stage, the effect of devoing the authors, drafters and supporters of the plan of responsibility, with what regards the neighbourhood and their interests.

The exclusion of anti-project actors is meant to have a social effect, to have the public opinion accept the urban plan. And this could only be implemented through backgrounding and de-
emphasising. In other words, exclusion of certain aspects in the representation of anti-project social actors, that is to say the residents affected by expropriation and demolition of their homes.

**References**


‘In the Pursuit of Justice’: the Discursive Construction of America as Global Policeman in the New World Order

Annita Lazar
Nanyang Technological University

Michelle M. Lazar
National University of Singapore

Abstract

‘Out of these troubled times … a new world order can emerge: a new era – freer from the threat of terror, stronger in the pursuit of justice, and more secure in the quest for peace’. – George H.W. Bush, 11 September 1990.

This paper is concerned with America's articulation of the pursuit of justice in securing the 'New World Order'. The New World Order, we contend, has been a discourse-(in)-formation in the post-Cold War years, from Bush Senior's inaugural statement in 1990 to President George W. Bush's administration in the present time (Lazar & Lazar 2004). In a world no longer divided along strategic bipolar lines with the demise of the 'Soviet threat', the New World Order discourse refers to America's articulation of its unipolar global hegemony in the face of a world otherwise gravitating towards multipolar centres of power. The study of the discourse involves a critical intertextual analysis of the speeches of the three post-Cold War American leaders across time and specific historical events, and their respective administrations. The corpus for the present study comprises Bush's speeches in the aftermath of 9/11 including the attack and occupation of Iraq since 2003; Clinton's speeches in the context of American military action in Afghanistan and Sudan, and Iraq in 1998; and Bush Senior's statements in the context of the 1990-91 Gulf War.

This paper deals with the justification for America's use of force in the New World Order, based upon its 'pursuit of justice and peace'. The critical analysis shows how a 'law and order' frame is fundamentally set up in the discourse, and how within it Saddam Hussein and Osama bin Laden have been similarly positioned as criminals/outlaws, while America self-elects to be the global policeman and protector of the new international order. Although policing in the modern world is conventionally tied to the enforcement of 'law and order', the analysis also shows that the two are not always collocational. Indeed, they unravel in places in the discourse, revealing that 'keeping order' out of moral outrage is sometimes prioritised over the principles and practice of law – suggesting, interestingly, that America itself is above the law.

Introduction

This paper is concerned with America's articulation of the pursuit of justice in securing the New World Order. The New World Order, we contend, is a 'discourse formation' (Foucault 1972) that comprises a socio-historically contingent field of related statements, which produces and structures normatively knowledge of contemporary international relations and America's role within it. It has been a discourse-in-formation in the post-Cold War period, notably from President George H.W. Bush's inaugural statement in 1990 to President George W. Bush's administration. In a world no longer divided along strategic bipolar lines with the demise of the 'Soviet threat', the New World Order discourse refers to America's articulation of its unipolar global hegemony in the face of a world otherwise gravitating towards multipolar centres of power. Even though America possessed unrivalled military power, at the time of the Soviet debacle, Europe and Japan posed industrial and economic competition.
A foundational element of the New World Order discourse, which we have earlier identified, is the establishment of an American-led moral order (Lazar and Lazar 2004). It is an order that is built-up vis-à-vis the enunciation of the aberrant ‘Other’ or ‘threat’ which, at the same time justifies the identification, division and excision of that threat (Foucault 1967). In the post-Cold War era, the ‘threat of terror’ has been identified as the new enemy, comprising Saddam Hussein and Osama bin Laden and his associates11 (with the list expanding in the present Bush administration to include still others). Our analysis of the ‘twin terrors’ has shown that based upon the dual principles that “They are all the same”, and “They are different from Us”, Saddam Hussein and Osama bin Laden have been conflated as a related class of threat, and similarly condemned as outcasts of the international order. One way they are made outcasts is through criminalising them; other strategies of outcasting include enemisation (i.e. as enemies of freedom and democracy), orientalisation (i.e. as moral degenerates), and evilification (i.e. as evil).

In what follows, we provide an analysis of America’s justifications for the use of force in the construal of policing the New World Order, based primarily upon criminalisation. Although this is the main frame drawn upon, orientalisation which presents the other as a culturally bellicose people, and evilification in which the other is the personification of evil battling the good combine with criminalisation to reify the menace and the moral justification for America’s use of counter violence. (The strategy of enemisation leads to use of another form of violence namely, the execution of war discussed in Lazar and Lazar, forthcoming a)

As a discourse-in-formation, this involves analysis of an intertextual archive of speeches and written statements of the three post-Cold War American leaders across time and specific historical events, and their respective administrations. The archive for the present study comprises President George W. Bush’s speeches in the aftermath of 9/11 including the attack and occupation of Iraq since 2003; President Bill Clinton’s speeches in the context of American military action in Afghanistan and Sudan, and Iraq in 1998; and President G.H.W. Bush’s statements in the context of the 1990-91 Gulf War. The intertextual analysis of the discourse is based on identification of particular themes with regards to policing action that emerged from the data. We will organise our discussion based on these discursive themes below, and show how these themes are manifested through clusters of lexico-grammatical (Halliday 1985) and rhetorical strategies including the use of metaphors, frames, speech acts and argument structures (Fairclough 1989; Lakoff, 1991; van Dijk 1995).

Policing the New World Order

Policing is a means of securing the New World Order.12 In this paper, we observe the following discursive themes constitutive of policing: reference to the law; construction of the ‘criminal’ as transgressor of the law; and America’s role as global policeman. There is also textual evidence to suggest that in spite of the fact that America’s justifications for actions against the enemies is based on the rule of law, America itself, at times, appears not to be bound by legal conduct, and is above the law.

The Rule of Law

Central to policing in the New World Order discourse, is the disciplining of the international polity through the maintenance of ‘law and order’. The invocation of law is foundational in the new world order as originally espoused in G.H.W. Bush’s vision (see below) as well as subsequently continued in the discourse formation.

1. Today, that new world is struggling to be born … a world where the rule of law supplants the rule of the jungle. (GHW Bush 11 September 1990)

2. Iraq’s brutality, aggression and violation of international law cannot be allowed to succeed… (GHW Bush 8 November 1990)

3. The long arm of American law has reached out around the world and brought to trial those guilty of attacks in New York, in Virginia and in the Pacific. (Clinton 26 August 1998)

4. The search is underway for those who are behind these evil acts. I have directed the
full resources of our intelligence and law enforcement communities to find those responsible… (GW Bush 11 September 2001)

The appeal of the field of law -- both domestic and international -- rests on the assumption of clear and objective rules, principles and procedures. In the examples, references to the law in the topic or subject positions (plus their embeddedness in the noun phrases as postmodifiers instead of as 'heads', which makes scrutiny harder) show how the basis of this appeal is presupposed as self-evident, and thus not requiring elaboration. Reference to the law alone is sufficient grounds for the legitimation of action. The invocation of the rule of law, however, is based upon relations of power, dominance and control.

Foucault (1977) has argued that the penal system, although a seemingly more humane system than war, is nonetheless a form of domination, albeit via a different mode, practised as a 'discourse of right'. It is exercised through processes of normalisation, whereby subjects are bound to one another in a social contract of prescribed behavioural norms. The social contract we can say exists for various levels of actors -- at the sub-state, state, and trans-state/global levels.

In the New World Order discourse, the prescribed behavioural norms connote civilisational superiority. Note particularly the contrast between the 'rule of the jungle' and the 'rule of law' (see example (1)). Hayward (1994: 237) comments that for Americans, the expression the 'rule of the jungle', with associations of the primitive, alludes particularly to Africa and Asia. If this is so, then the implication is that a world order based upon 'the rule of the law' refers to 'our' province; that of the 'civilised'. The relation between the two, moreover, is not merely one of dissimilarity but, as the verb supplants suggests, one of ascendancy.

**Constructing the Criminal Other**

The 'criminal' is a transgressor of the behavioural norms laid down by law. Criminalisation of Osama bin Laden and Saddam Hussein has been discursively produced in a number of ways, which we discussed in Lazar and Lazar (2004). To summarise, the casting of the Other as 'criminal' is accomplished through the following rhetorical strategies, which represent the transgressive acts as well as the transgressor's perverse state of mind.

**Overlexicalisation and listing of criminal acts**

5. Saddam Hussein systematically raped, pillaged and plundered [...] maimed and murdered (GHW Bush 16 January 1991)

6. terrorists would unleash blackmail and genocide and chaos (GW Bush 11 March 2002))

**Characterisation of victims**

as vulnerable

7. a small and helpless neighbour [Kuwait] (GHW Bush 16 January 1991)

as ordinary

8. the victims were in airplanes or in their offices. Secretaries, business men and women, military and federal workers. Moms and dads. Friends and neighbours (GW Bush 21 September 2001)

as innocent

9. the murder of innocents (GW Bush 11 September 2002; Clinton 26 August 1998)

**Concretisation of the acts in graphic, horrific terms**

10. Iraq … a regime that has already used poison gas to murder thousands of its own citizens, leaving bodies of mothers huddled over their dead children (GW Bush 29 January 2002);

11. Iraq’s occupation of Kuwait has been a nightmare … homes, buildings and factories have been looted. Babies have been torn from incubators: children shot in front of their parents. (GHW Bush 26 November 1990)
Highlighting the intentionality and perverseness of their actions

12. their mission is murder (Clinton 26 August 1998);
13. our enemies send other people’s children on missions of suicide and murder. They embrace tyranny and death as a cause and a creed. (GW Bush 29 January 2002)

Criminalisation, furthermore, is accentuated by elements of orientalisation and evilification:

14. We’re going to find those evildoers, those barbaric people who attacked our country (GW Bush 17 September 2001).
15. The search is underway for those who are behind these evil acts. I have directed the full resources of our intelligence and law enforcement communities to find those responsible… (GW Bush 11 September 2001)
16. Iraq’s brutality, aggression and violation of international law cannot be allowed to succeed… (GHW Bush 8 November 1990)
17. We fight to protect the innocent so that the lawless and merciless will not inherit the Earth. (GW Bush 8 October 2001).

In these examples, orientalist and religious classificatory schemes are in operation: in (14) and (15) via premodifiers or ‘classifiers’ “evil”, “barbaric” and in (16) and (17) through coordination that links the field of law with orientalist and religious tropes, respectively. In the case of (16), the co-ordinate structure produces a list whereby “brutality” and “aggression”, which suggest lapses of civility or morality are linked with illegality. In the case of (17), the field of law is incorporated and thereby recontextualised, within religious discourse, i.e., the “lawless” in conjunction with the “merciless” constitutes the (grammatical) subject that “will not inherit the Earth”. Interestingly, though, the religious discourse referenced here is not an authentic quotation from the bible, but spliced together from two different beatitude verses – “Blessed are the meek, for they shall inherit the earth” (Matthew 5:5) and “Blessed are the merciful, for they shall obtain mercy” (Matthew 5:7) (American Standard Version) – and negated, for prescriptive effect. On the one hand, it could be argued that the double-articulation (the inflection of criminality with elements of the supernatural and/or the uncivilised) in these examples potentially places the Other outside the remit of ‘our’ modern and secular penal system. Yet, on the other hand, the orientalist and religious descriptors contribute directly to the construction of the criminal as they categorise the indefensible nature of the criminal acts, thus adding moral gravity to the offences. Indeed, given the hypersignification of the Other as a multi-dimensional outcast (as earlier discussed), the double-articulation of criminal in the discourse is hardly surprising nor unexpected.

Although in the New World Order discourse on the whole, Saddam Hussein and Osama bin Laden are cast as the main criminals, particularly in President George W. Bush's administration several other actors have been included as potential criminals because of their association with the outlaws. In the examples given below, the wider circle of potential criminals refers to Actors – ranging from the less specific “those” and “the people” to the more specific “the government” – whose actions benefit the offenders (Goals) i.e. harbouring, hiding, housing and feeding them. In pragmatics terms, these utterances all express the speech act of warning, which is felicitous based on knowledge of Anglo-Saxon law that treats perpetrators and abettors of crime as equally culpable and deserving of punishment.

18. I gave fair warning to the government that harbours them in Afghanistan. The Taliban made a choice to continue hiding terrorists, and now they are paying a price. (GW Bush 8 November 2001)
19. We will make no distinction between the terrorists who committed these acts and those who harbour them (GW Bush 11 September 2001)
20. We’re going to hold the people who house them accountable. The people who think they can provide safe havens will be held accountable. The people who feed them will be held accountable. (GW Bush 17 September 2001)

America as Global Policeman

Just as the discourse of right is premised upon the legitimate requirement of obedience and
conformity to the social order, it invests authority structures with the legitimate right to pursue and punish offenders. America assumes the role of global policeman or marshal tasked with seeking out the offenders. “Search”, “find”, and “hunt” in (21) to (23) below constitute the semantic field of a massive manhunt for elusive perpetrators.

21. The search is under way for those who are behind these evil acts. I have directed the full resources of our intelligence and law enforcement communities to find those responsible […] (GW Bush 11 September 2001)

22. We’re going to find those evildoers (GW Bush 17 September 2001)

23. We hunt an enemy that hides in shadows and caves (GW Bush 6 November 2001).

The search is undertaken in the pursuit of ‘justice’ – a notion that once again (like ‘the law’) is presented as if its meaning was self-evident and singular. The invocation of the concept of justice, because of its strong sense of righteousness, enables America to garner support both domestically and internationally for its police (and military) action.

24. we will […] bring terrorists to justice (GW Bush 29 January 2002).

25. whether we bring our enemies to justice or bring justice to our enemies, justice will be done (GW Bush 21 September 2001);

26. you will not escape the justice of this nation (GW Bush 29 January 2002).

However, references to liability and punishment, as seen below in the emergent semantic field, points to only one kind of justice in the New World Order discourse, namely, retributive justice, and not also distributive and restorative forms of justice.

27. The search is under way for those who are behind these evil acts. I have directed the full resources of our intelligence and law enforcement communities to find those responsible […] (GW Bush 11 September 2001)

28. We’re going to find those evildoers, those barbaric people who attacked our country, and we’re going to hold them accountable. (GW Bush 17 September 2001)

29. Iraq’s brutality, aggression and violation of international law cannot be allowed to succeed (GW Bush Senior 8 November 1990)

30. the world can therefore seize this opportunity to fulfil the long-held promise of a new world order – where brutality will go unrewarded and aggression will meet collective resistance. (GHW Bush 29 January 1991)

Horwitz (1990: 24) has argued that penal systems are moralistic forms of social control. Not only are offenders punished for their moral wrong-doing, but the justification for punishment also lies in its moral correctness. Hence, in (29) and (30) the use of the negative – “cannot be allowed to succeed” and “will go unrewarded” – suggests that the actions are morally unacceptable and must be denied any equivocation of meaning. Indeed, retribution for the moral violation is the only solution. Note below the metaphor of retribution ‘to pay a price’ which operates on a payback principle needed to right a wrong in the restoration of the moral balance. The payback is the consequence in the cause-consequence argument structure set out in (31) and (32) i.e. because $x$, the consequence $y$. By authorising and legitimating the commission of violence (upon violence) then, law enforcement, like war, is a coercive system that institutionalises violence (Foucault 1977).

31. I gave warning to the government that harbours them in Afghanistan. The Taliban made a choice to continue hiding terrorists, and now they are paying a price. (GW Bush 8 November 2001)

32. …we’re delivering a powerful message to Saddam. If you act recklessly, you will pay a heavy price. (Clinton 16 December 1998)

The exercise of power in ‘bringing to justice’ the criminals are both intensive and extensive. While the goal of punishment is foremost, the tenacity in policing arguably also acts as deterrence. Such tenacity at the same time bolsters America’s self-presentation as a committed, thorough and effective global law enforcer. The intensity of power is evident from the formulation of lists of adjectives denoting constant policing:
33. Our military action is also designed to clear the way for sustained, comprehensive and relentless operations to drive them out and bring them to justice. (GW Bush 8 October 2001)

34. Our nation will continue to be steadfast and patient and persistent in the pursuit of two great objectives. First, we will shut down terrorist camps, disrupt terrorist plans and bring terrorists to justice. Second […] (GW Bush 29 January 2002)

The exercise and effects of disciplinary power are also far-reaching. Drawing on Bentham’s ‘panoptican’ (see Foucault 1977) – a potentially wide-reaching and all-seeing surveillance system – we could argue that a similar mechanism is at work in examples (35) and (36) below. Here, the spatial circumstantials of extent (around the world; 7000 miles away; across oceans and continents) and location (on mountain tops and in caves) show the reach of power to be ‘everywhere’, signalling too that America quite literally is a ‘global’ policeman. Furthermore, the efficacy of such power relations rests on the curious mix of generalisability of reach (most of the spatial circumstantials denote indefiniteness) as well as specificity (the definite measurement of extent: 7000 miles away as opposed to ‘thousands of miles away’) and concreteness (the metaphor of the long arm of American law makes the reach almost palpable).

35. The long arm of American law has reached out around the world and brought to trial those guilty of attacks in New York, in Virginia and in the Pacific. (Clinton 26 August 1998)

36. The men and women of our armed forces have delivered a message now clear to every enemy of the United States: even 7000 miles away, across oceans and continents, on mountain tops and in caves, you will not escape the justice of this nation. (GW Bush 29 January 2002).

America as above the Law

Although modern policing is about the enforcement of law and order, it appears that in the New World Order discourse the twin notions ‘law and order’ cannot be assumed always to be collocates. Indeed, they sometimes come apart in the discourse, revealing that keeping order out of moral outrage may supersede principles of legality. Conventionally, while retribution underlies the disciplinary technology of punishment, within the frame of the legal system, retribution is to be accomplished without prejudice and in observance of due process. Yet in the aftermath of the 9/11 attacks on America, President G.W. Bush’s speeches and actions betrayed traces of outright vengeance and lack of impartiality in the pursuit of justice, and in some instances also suggestive that America is above the law. Consider the following examples:

37. Our grief has turned to anger, and anger to resolution. Whether we bring our enemies to justice, or bring justice to our enemies, justice will be done. (GW Bush 21 September 2001)

38. I will not forget this wound to our country or those who inflicted it. I will not yield; I will not rest; I will not relent in waging this struggle for freedom and security for the American people. (GW Bush 21 September 2001)

39. America will not forget the lives that were taken and the justice their death requires. (GW Bush 11 March 2002).

In (37) to (38), motivations of revenge surface in several ways. First, through the language of emotion: the expressive modality of the words ‘grief’ and ‘anger’, and the transmutation from ‘grief’ to ‘anger’ to ‘resolution’, which entails that America’s ‘resolution’ is based upon passion rather than reason. Note too the metaphors of pain and injury (‘wound’ and ‘inflicted’) that connote an emotional response. Second, explicit statements of personal resolve suggest the lack of impartiality. The personal is evident in the choice of the grammatical subjects below: ‘our grief’, ‘I’ and ‘America’ (where in the latter case, the state-as-person metaphor, as suggested by Lakoff (1991), is at work). The ‘inflicted’/‘wound’ metaphor also is suggestive of personal physical injury on one’s body (in this case, the body politic of America). The personal is tied to America’s doggedness, expressed explicitly in the word ‘resolution’ and in speech acts of resolution: ‘America will not forget’, ‘I will not forget’ and ‘I will not relent’. Given the
specific circumstances of the 9/11 attacks on America, expressions of emotion and personal resolve are understandable, even expected. However, this has significant implications for America’s role as disinterested global law enforcer. If we consider the conventional police script or narrative as comprising an innocent victim, a treacherous villain and a police hero (Lakoff 1991), in this case America is both the victim and the police hero, which begs the question of America’s impartiality. The resolve uttered in these instances, therefore, is not simply a reflection of dedicated police duty, but signifies personal score-keeping. This comes across more clearly in the third way revenge is made manifest in the discourse, namely, through the reason-result argument structure employed, where the pursuit of justice (‘result’) is tied to personal grievances (‘reason’).

Present in the discourse are also resonances of the notion of ‘frontier justice’, which sets America above the law, particularly in regard to the observance of due process. It is justice at all cost; an assassination order. The clearest allusion to ‘frontier justice’ or ‘western’ justice is President Bush’s statement in the days following the 9/11 attacks: “I want justice. And there’s an old poster out West […] I recall, that said ‘Wanted. Dead or Alive.’” (GW Bush 17 September 2001). This is a historical reference to a form of policing practiced during the settling of the ‘wild west’, when solitary sheriffs or in some cases individual ranchers took justice into their own hands and executed outlaws, without a fair trial. Hayward (1994) notes that the criminal usually not brought to court, was gunned down publicly in the streets (as happens in the ‘western’ movie genre) or hunted and killed in his hideout. The reiteration of the verbal phrase ‘to hunt down’ (below) in Bush’s speeches resonates with this idea.

40. I have called our military into action to hunt down the members of the al-Qaeda organisation who murdered innocent Americans. (GW Bush 8 November 2001)

41. our government has a responsibility to hunt down our enemies, and we will. (GW Bush 8 November 2001)

42. We are deliberately and systematically hunting down these murderers (GW Bush 8 November 2001)

43. the United States will hunt down and punish those responsible for these cowardly acts (GW Bush 11 September 2001)

With one man acting as judge, jury and executioner, ‘wild west justice’, as noted by McCarthy (2002: 129), was “inherently and undeniably cruel” in terms of the “brutality with which those ‘judged’ guilty were treated”.14 The hunting metaphor, for instance, suggests the de-humanisation of the criminal as an animal, to be thus treated as such. In the context of the New World Order discourse, animalisation of the criminal is doubly layered with orientalist significations for, as discussed elsewhere (see Lazar and Lazar 2004), the dehumanisation of the Other is a common orientalist trope.

America’s punitive action against Afghanistan in 2001 is a case in point of frontier justice exercised on another sovereign nation. Bypassing the legal requirement for credible evidence, America started bombing Afghanistan within a month of the 9/11 attacks, when there was no hard proof at the time of al-Qaeda’s and Afghanistan’s culpability. Jack Bussell, a board member of the Maine Veterans for Peace, in fact noted: “If you remember, the Taliban offered to turn bin Laden over to us if we furnished proof, and this has been reissued and both times it has been rejected. The first thing we do is reach for our guns. This is frontier justice” (2001: 18).

**Conclusion**

This paper has aimed to show America’s justifications in policing the New World Order. Police work is an important technology of power in securing the American-led New World Order – a technology that is exercised as much through actions as it is through language. In sum, what emerges then from this paper is that the viability of the New World Order requires not only in representing the enemy categorically as an ‘outcast’, but also in punishing and defeating the enemy for the challenge they pose to the norms and values of that order.
**References**


**DATA: SPEECHES/INTERVIEWS/PRESS CONFERENCES/REPORTS**


Bush, G. W. 'Remarks by the President to the Warsaw Conference on Combatting Terrorism’, Washington, D.C.: Office of the Press Secretary. 6 November 2001


Social Epidemiology Research and its Contribution to Critical Discourse Analysis®

Quynh Lê
University of Tamania

Abstract
Social epidemiology has received great attention recently in research, particularly in population health. Health issues have been studied a long time as the link between health and society is very close. However, social epidemiology has brought innovative insights into population research. It explicitly investigates social determinants of population distributions health and health-related issues. The paper examines social epidemiology as a new approach to population health. The discussion includes its research methodology and its contribution to Critical Discourse Analysis.

Keywords: Social Epidemiology, social determinants of health, health discourse, critical discourse analysis, population health

Introduction
It first appears that Social Epidemiology (SE) and Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) are two unrelated fields of research as Social Epidemiology deals with social determinants of health; whereas Critical Discourse Analysis is primarily a linguistically orientated area. However, a close examination of the research in these two fields reveals their very close relationship. Social Epidemiology actually deals with different discourses in population health. According to Krieger (2001), ‘social epidemiology’ is distinguished by its insistence on explicitly investigating social determinants of population distributions of health, disease, and wellbeing, rather than treating such determinants as mere background to biomedical phenomena. Critical Discourse Analysis is also interested in social determinants which contribute to competing discourses, power relationship and control, and social injustice. This paper discusses the complementary nature of these two research fields and explores some implications for future research.

Determinants of Health
The social determinants of health can be understood as the social conditions in which people live and work. It points to both specific features of the social context that affect health and social conditions translate into health impacts (Tarlov, 1996, Krieger, 2001).

The health of individuals and populations is influenced and determined by many factors acting in various combinations which are multicausal: healthiness, disease, and disability. Death is seen as the result of the interaction of human biology, lifestyle and environmental (including social) factors, modified by health interventions. (AIHW, 2004)

Health determinants can be described as those factors that raise or lower the level of health in a population or individual. Determinants help to predict trends in health and to explain why some people are healthy and others are not. They are the key to the prevention of disease, illness and injury. (AIHW, 2004, PHAC, 2004, BlueShield, 2005)

According to Krieger (2000), social determinants of health include:

- a society's past and present economic, political, and legal systems, its material and technological resources, its adherence to norms and practices consistent with
international human rights norms and standards; and

- its external political and economic relationships to other countries, as implemented through interactions among governments, international political and economic organisations, and non-governmental organisations. (Krieger, 2001a)

In some contexts, health determinants are conceptualised primarily characteristics of the individual, such as a person's social support network, income or employment status. Population are not only collections of individuals but the causes of ill health are clustered in systematic patterns; and effects on one individual may depend on the exposure and outcomes experienced by other individuals (Evans et al., 2001, Smith, 2005). This flows from the fact that the determinants of individual differences regarding some characteristic within a population may be different from the determinants of differences between populations (Marmot, 2001).

According to (AIHW, 2004), determinants are in complex interplay and range from the very broad level, with many health and non-health effects, to the highly specific. The following figure is a simple framework of determinants and their pathways, with the general direction of effects going from left to right.

**Figure 1: A conceptual for determinants of health**

Sources: Australia’s Health 2004 – Figure 3.1 pp. 123 (AIHW, 2004)

General background and environmental factors can determine the nature and degree of socioeconomic characteristics. These both factors can influence people’s health behaviours, their psychological state and factors relating to safety.

These in turn can influence biomedical factors (e.g., Blood pressure, body weight, cholesterol etc) which may have health effects through various further pathways. At all stages along the path these various factors interact with an individual’s makeup. In addition, the factors within a box often interact and are highly related to each other. (AIHW, 2004)

**Social Epidemiology**

**What is Social Epidemiology?**

Berkman and Kawachi (2000, p.6) define social epidemiology as the branch of epidemiology that studies the social distribution and social determinants of states of health, implying that the aim is to identify socio-environmental exposures which may be related to a broad range of physical and mental health outcomes (Berman and Kawachi, 2000). Syme (2000, p. ix)
argues that social epidemiology deals with two essential aspects: (a) family, neighbourhood, community, and social group and (b) risks and factors and diseases. If one accepts that individuals are embedded in societies and populations, one can postulate that the health of individuals is embedded in population health.

Unlike other sub disciplines of epidemiology which devoted to the investigation of specific diseases (e.g. cancer, cardiovascular), social epidemiology focused on specific phenomena such as socioeconomic stratification, social networks and support, discrimination, work demand, and control rather than on specific disease outcomes. In other words social epidemiology is the scientific study of how social interactions, such as social norms, laws, institutions, social conditions and strategic behaviour, affect the health of populations. (Berman and Kawachi, 2000, PAHO, 2002)

Social epidemiology examines the association between individual risk factors and poor self-rated health. Risk factors are normally socially based such as low income, lack of access to health care, low employment and smoking (Kawachi & Berkeman 2000, p.174).

Social epidemiology deals with the questions "What is and what determines health and disease". Social epidemiology focuses on the identification of health potentials like social support or occupational qualifications and of health risks like stress, risk behaviour, social isolation etc. It provides the quantitative measurement of these risks and potentials on wellbeing, life quality, disease and mortality (University of Bielefeld, 2005).

Krieger (2001a) defines social epidemiology as distinguished insistence on explicitly investigating social determinants of population distributions of health, disease, and wellbeing, rather than treating such determinants as mere background to biomedical phenomena. Tackling this task requires attention to theories, concepts, and methods conducive to illuminating intimate links between our bodies and the body politic.

Social epidemiology has therefore broadened the objectives of traditional epidemiology and makes a strong contribution to the study of population health, which now includes the following:

- To determine the rates of specific disorders so that society can properly analyse the parameters of a problem, establish an effective public policy regarding it.
- To understand further the many factors that influence proper functioning in our society and culture.
- To understand more fully how our society and culture function, giving us normative information about the presence and absence of certain problems. The range of issues examined can be health, mental health, opinions, occupation, habits, and personal characteristics. (Keane, 1990)

Social Epidemiology Research

Research in social epidemiology examines how features of social and institutional context (e.g. a neighbourhood’s economy, demographics, social cohesion, political organisation, and employment patterns), rather than individual characteristics or health behaviours, influence persons’ risk for disease and poor health (Eckenwiler, 2002).

Social epidemiology uses the same methods and approaches as medical epidemiology but extended for the instruments of quantitative empirical social sciences (University of Bielefeld, 2005).

Eckenwiler (2002) and (Krieger, 2001a) stated the rationales of social epidemiology research:

- Public health advocates can use research in social epidemiology to set priorities for social, economic, and health policy to better promote health among society’s most vulnerable groups. These groups of people tend to be held individually responsible for their poor health status, asymmetrically situated in relation to health and social policy makers, and disenfranchised from decision making processes. Therefore, it is unlikely for them to have their needs adequately understood.
- Social epidemiology research can lend strength to the notion that social justice is a proper moral basis for public health (Eckenwiler, 2002).

In contemporary the three main theories for explaining disease distribution are: (1)
psychosocial, (2) social production of disease/political economy of health, and (3) ecosocial and other emerging multi-level frameworks. All seek to elucidate principles capable of explaining social inequalities in health (Krieger, 2001b).

According to (Krieger, 2001b), a psychosocial framework pays attention to endogenous biological responses to human interactions; a social production of disease/political economy of health framework focuses economic and political determinants of health and disease; whereas ecosocial and other emerging multi-level frameworks seek to integrate social and biological reasoning and a dynamic, historical and ecological perspective to develop new insights into determinants of population distributions of disease and social inequalities in health.

**Social Epidemiology and Critical Discourse Analysis**

It firsts appears that social epidemiology and Critical Discourse Analysis are unrelated as the former is about health and the latter is about discourse analysis. However a close examination of these two fields reveals that social epidemiology and Critical Discourse Analysis deal with fundamental issues relating to social and economic aspects of discourse, social behaviours and resource distribution. For example, Harvard University researchers (1) have found that children of parents from working-class backgrounds are nearly twice as likely to become depressed when they get older than children from higher-income, white-collar families. This research was carried out by social epidemiologists who were interested in the relationship between social economic conditions and depression. The findings of such a study can be used by CDA researchers to further examine different types of discourses in which children and their parents live their experiences. How do they view themselves and relevant others in these discourses? (Roache 2001)

Another common feature of research in both social epidemiology and Critical Discourse Analysis is social equity or inequity. Kawachi and Kennedy point out from their research that there are huge inequities among nations and among American people undermine health, welfare, and community life. According them, the gap between per capita Gross Domestic Product (GDP) among nations is astounding. The income ratio between the richest and poorest countries increased from a three-fold difference in 1820 to more than 75-fold nearly 200 years later. This figure should capture the interest of CDA researchers who are critical of the economic power of rich nations and their political influences exerted on poor nations. (Roache 2003)

Social epidemiology researchers at the University of Minnesota (2005), for example, have conducted research on the prevalence, determinants, and prevention of alcohol abuse and related social and behaviour problems such as traffic crashes, homicides, suicides, rapes and other assaults, drowning, and teenage pregnancies. They study environmental factors that contribute to the development and prevention of alcohol-related problems. This kind of research is important to CDA researchers in the sense that CDA researchers are not satisfied that these are the expected correlations between environmental factors and health conditions, which seem to be ‘obvious’ or ‘normal’. CDA researchers are keen to challenge the concept ‘nominalisation’ so that policy makers need to be more discourse-conscious.

**Conclusion**

In summary, the relationship between SE and CDA can be briefly described as follows:

- CDA challenges the concept ‘normalisation’
- CDA examines discourse in terms of social injustice, power (or lack of power), inequalities
- CDA attempts to describe, explain and scrutinize how different communities, institutions and organizations operate in a social context in terms of power, interaction, control, management, policy and communication.
- Public health advocates can use research in social epidemiology to set priorities for social, economic, and health policy to better promote health among society’s most
vulnerable groups.

- Social epidemiology research can strengthen the notion that social justice is a proper moral basis for public health.
- CDA and SE are interested in social inequalities, injustice, and vulnerable social members.
- CDA researchers can use evidence (data analysis) from social epidemiology to strengthen their analysis and discussion
- Social epidemiology can be used as a tool for CDA and vice versa

As indicated in this paper, both CDA and SE are interested in social discourse. However each employs different research methods to investigate social environmental factors and social discourse. It is argued in this paper that these two research fields can make a huge mutual contribution to social research.

References

Researchers as Meaning Makers®

Thao Lê
University of Tasmania

Abstract
The paper starts with a brief discussion of the concepts meaning and meaning making. It discusses how quantitative and qualitative research methods handle ‘meaning’ in data analysis. It examines the relationship between meaning and meaning making in data collection and data analysis. Different research methods treat meaning and meaning making differently: ethnography, narrative research, and Discourse Analysis. The analysis of meaning can be made at linguistic and discourse levels. There are issues involving researchers’ role in the meaning making process.

Keywords: Meaning, meaning making, semantics, research methodology.

Introduction
Recently the term ‘evidence-based research’ seems to receive a great deal of attention in the academic discourse. Actually to some, the word ‘evidence’ is redundant in this context as research is expected to provide research evidence. Research is supposed to provide hard evidence to prove or reject a claim. Everyone can provide some sort of evidence but research needs to be vigorous to come up with hard evidence. This hard evidence is normally judged in terms of reliability and validity of the research tools used in data collection and data analysis. Thus, it is unscientific to think of researchers as meaning makers. Researchers must be as objective as possible. They should not contaminate data collection and data analysis with personal biases and prejudice. On this basis, researchers cannot be meaning makers. This paper offers an alternative view.

Meaning and meaning making
The word ‘meaning’ is one of the most widely used words in English. Children are aware of meaning in their early language acquisition. They need to know what words mean in order to communicate with those around them. The word ‘dog’ means an animal with four legs and a bird is an animal with two legs which can fly. In their later development children acquire words with different shades of meaning. Some have concrete meaning and some are abstract, conceptually and socially. Conceptually abstract words refer to things which are not perceived through human senses. They often denote ideas, thoughts, and relationship such as ‘sacrifice’, ‘betray’, ‘discovery’, ‘mind’ etc. Socially word meanings vary to cover different social aspects. The words ‘lady’ and ‘woman’ both refer to female. However they are used differently due to sociolinguistic variables.

Metaphor is a powerful expansion of word meaning. They can denote attitudes, value, and poetic imagination. This can be seen in expressions such as ‘roads to peace’, ‘life school’, ‘global village’, ‘battle of life’ etc. Words have meanings but their meanings need to be contextualised. The ‘word’ ‘hate’ can mean ‘love’ in the context of intimate conversation.

Language has words but words alone are not enough for communication. We need sentence meaning to help us to express our ideas and propositions. The following sentences have the same words but different meanings:

- A black dog chases a white goat.
- A white goat chases a black dog.
- A white dog chases a black goat.
- A black goat chases a white dog.

With these six words (a, black, white, chase, goat, dog) we can generate different sentences to convey different propositions or statements.

Like word meaning, sentence meaning can be expressed in different ways to designate subtle differences. For example:

- Wisely the hunter hid his gun.
- The hunter hid his gun wisely.

In the first sentence, the word ‘wisely’ is placed at the beginning of a sentence to convey the judgement of the writer. It can be paraphrased as “It is wise that the hunter hid his gun”.

Whereas in the second sentence, the adverb ‘wise’ appears at the end of the sentence to focus the meaning on the verb ‘hid’. The second sentence can be paraphrased as “The hunter hid his gun in a wise manner”.

According to Halliday (1985), grammar is a source for meaning organised as a system of choices:

- Ideational function: saying something about the state of events in the world.
- Interpersonal function: saying something about the state of the social relations between those who are interacting by means of the communicational system,
- Textual function: saying something about the organization of the structure as a message.

Speakers and writers of English, or any human language, use this system of choices as a source in meaning making.

In undertaking research, researchers deal with meaning and meaning making in many ways in terms of meaning decoders and meaning encoders. Meaning decoding involves text reading and text analysis. Text reading includes literature review in books, journals, official documents etc, to identify current research dealing with the research topic. Text analysis requires careful perusal of written data to critically examine ideas, issues and themes which are explicitly or implicitly present in the text.

Meaning encoding poses a big challenge to researchers. Basically they require an ability to bring their ideas and views on paper (or in other visual modes) to communicate with others in a research discourse. Their choice of words, expressions, and genres reveals their presuppositions, prejudice and ideology. Language is not semantically neutral and the use of language is ideologically loaded, on surface manifestation as well as at deep structure. This is often seen in the ways in which discriminatory language and metaphors are used.

Discriminatory language includes two main aspects. Firstly discrimination and prejudice are already embedded in the language and are often accepted by some as ‘normal’, for example Friday girl, airhostess, waitress, disabled people, mad patient, and black migrants. Recently attempts have been made to discourage or ban the use of discriminatory language in official writing.

The rationale underlying the advocacy of non-discriminatory language is that prejudice and discrimination have permeated our language so deeply that the language itself is the instrument used to reinforce the institutionalisation of prejudice and discrimination. It paints a picture of ‘false reality’ about the nature of human beings and their worth. It distorts social reality and coherence (Mark Le, IRE1).

Secondly discriminatory language is inherent in the writer’s ways with words. In this case, words themselves are not discriminatory. It is the writers’ personal expressions indicate their value judgement and prejudice. The following sentences illustrate the point.

- You can’t expect much from a woman driver.
- Migrants do not want to work. They just want social benefits.
Researchers, particularly in social research, are not immune from discriminatory use of language. The meaning making process in research requires them to engage in decoding as well as encoding of text. The question is not how to totally avoid discriminatory language in meaning making when research topics deal with human beings, involving personal experiences, values, feelings, opinions and thoughts. Researchers cannot neutrally distance themselves from the meaning of the research discourse. One way of dealing with it is to wave the red flag declaring their ideological orientation rather pretending to be neutral and objective.

Analysts, as well as research participants, bring to the investigation biases, beliefs, and assumptions. This is not necessarily a negative trait; after all, persons are the products of their cultures, the times in which they live, their genders, their experiences, and their training. The important thing is to recognise when either our own or the respondents’ biases, assumptions or beliefs are intruding into the analysis. Recognising this intrusion often is difficult because when persons share a common culture, meanings often are taken for granted. (Strauss & Corbin 1998, p.97)

Metaphor is an important part of language and communication. Metaphors permeate deeply in our language and our use of language and we may not be aware that we actually use it in our communication. According to Lakoff and Johnson (1980, p.3), “it is pervasive in everyday life, not just in language but in thought and action. Our ordinary conceptual system, in terms of which we both think and act, is fundamentally metaphorical in nature.” Metaphors are consciously and unconsciously used to enhance meaning making.

Metaphor is for most people device of the poetic imagination and the rhetorical flourish—a matter of extraordinary rather than ordinary language. Moreover, metaphor is typically viewed as characteristic of language alone, a matter of words rather than thought or action. For this reason, most people think they can get along perfectly well without metaphor. We have found, on the contrary, that metaphor is pervasive in everyday life, not just in language but in thought and action. Our ordinary conceptual system, in terms of which we both think and act, is fundamentally metaphorical in nature. (IRE2)

Metaphors are widely used in academic discourse, both in teaching as well as research. There are many metaphors in research genre such as ‘research pathway’, ‘tree diagram’, ‘unpack the text’, ‘hidden theme’, ‘research journey’ etc. They have become key words in research. They are metaphors by which searchers live. They are ‘ready-made’ and have become the manifestation of research. In addition, each research paradigm has its own research metaphors. Researchers, therefore, use appropriate research metaphors in making meaning within the paradigm that they adopt.

Another aspect of meaning making in research is the use of speech acts. The theory of speech acts treats language as actions with a focus on language in use, or pragmatics. For instance, we ask questions and expect answers from others. According Bach (IRE3), making a statement may be the paradigmatic use of language, but there are all sorts of other things we can do with words. We can make requests, ask questions, give orders, make promises, give thanks, offer apologies, and so on.

Words are not in themselves "things" which cause knowledge, but relational entities which carry the value of meaning. It is meaning which must be present for communication to occur. It follows that, although words are not actual things, and as such, are not the efficient cause of the knowledge one gains through the use of language, words do have value. Their value lies precisely in the meaning which they carry. (Johnson IRE4)

Does speech act theory have anything to do with meaning making in research? When researchers examine texts as data, they often encounter the presence of speech acts in their collected texts. They can be used to persuade (political text), to sell a product (advertisement), to voice a complaint, to demand actions etc. It is important that researchers are aware of speech acts which underlie the pragmatic meaning in the collected data. It is not just what a text is but what a text wants to be dealt with. It is worth mentioning that different cultures may use similar speech acts but they are expressed differently. For example, in some cultures, direct commands are not acceptable when someone talks to older people. Researchers should be culturally aware in cross-cultural research to avoid misinterpretation of
cultural meaning in speech acts.

Meaning making in quantitative and qualitative research

The question ‘how does quantitative and qualitative research deal with meaning’ presupposes that both research approaches deal with meaning. Do they? It is obvious that qualitative research deals with meaning as it works with non-numerical data, whereas quantitative research deals with quantitative data which is fundamentally numerical. How do they differ in treating meaning in their own research discourse?

Meaning making in quantitative research

To conduct a quantitative research, researchers start with determining research aims and objectives. What is the research about and what specifically they want to find out? Research objectives must be clearly stated so that its success can be judged in terms of those objectives. For example if a research is about the reading view and behaviour of adult beginning readers, the objectives can be:

- Objective 1: to identify some common types of reading errors made by adult beginning readers.
- Objective 2: to determine different types of strategies employed by adult beginning readers in tackling unknown words.
- Objective 3: to identify the views of adult beginning readers on reading motivation.

What is the relationship between meaning making and those research objectives? Broadly speaking, developing research objectives is an initial part of the meaning making process. In the objectives given above, researchers need to conceptualise terms such as ‘reading errors’, ‘adult learners’, ‘beginning readers’, ‘reading strategies’, and ‘reading motivation’. It is hard for an outsider to judge whether researchers have achieved their research objectives if those terms are not clearly defined. Words such as ‘adult’, ‘mature age’, ‘teenagers’ etc are widely used in different research contexts and their meanings vary a great deal as they are ‘made’ or ‘shaped’ by different researchers. Thus, their meanings need to be presented in the context of a research. In this meaning making process, linguistic ambiguity and lexical inconsistency should be avoided.

The next stage of meaning making in quantitative research is literature review. What does literature reveal do? Its main function is to provide a background which leads to a study. It is important to describe how a new study is situated in a broad research discourse and specific discourses. This is the basis on which research significance of a study is judged. One would argue that literature review is an objective task. We expect those who do the review of the literature dealing with a the same topic will more or less reach some consistent conclusions. This may be the case in a number of scientific studies dealing with physical phenomenon. However, literature review dealing with the social world may present a different picture. Researchers’ subjectivity starts to show as literature review itself is becoming a meaning making process. Each researcher brings to the study some theoretical preconceptions, presuppositions, research paradigm and their world view which influence them in deciding what should be included in the literature review and what is seen as less relevant or irrelevant and therefore should be excluded in the discussion.

We often encounter words such as ‘critical review’, ‘vigorously examine’, ‘profoundly deconstruct’ etc in academic research. They are used to indicate that researchers are serious in conducting a study. They do not allow their personal prejudice to interfere with research. This does not mean that researchers do not offer their own views. What they are expected to do is to back up their own views with research evidence. This view sounds very respectable and scientific. However, one cannot expect researchers to empty all their prejudice while doing research. There are many problems here. First of all, no one will admit that he or she is prejudiced. Prejudice is in the eyes of the beholders. Secondly, the choice of research evidence to support a view can be selective. There is always evidence and counter-evidence. Perhaps this is academically an exciting exercise which supports the notion of academic rigour in research. However, the point is that researchers are meaning makers in this vigorous process.
Quantitative research deals with numerical data. A research hypothesis is accepted or rejected on the basis of statistical results. The Null hypothesis is a statistical hypothesis, which is commonly used in quantitative research to establish relationship between variables. In other words, the Null hypothesis is about prediction that an observed difference is due to chance alone and not due to a systematic cause. The positive result supports the hypothesis and the negative result of a statistical analysis rejects it. The results about the relationship between variables are therefore not invented by researchers. Every researcher deals with the same data and their data analysis will reach the same conclusion. It is an objective approach.

An interesting question here is: Is there any place for meaning making in quantitative research? One of the advantages of using statistical analysis is that it strengthens the notion ‘research objectivity’ and supports evidence-based research. However, researchers are to some extent involved in meaning making. They are the ones who are actively engaged in creating ‘the text’ of their studies. Numbers and figures are elements of a text but they are not the only ones. The term ‘text’ involves the process, context and act of researching. In other words, researchers are actively in constructing their own research discourses: making decision about the choice of words in a questionnaire, directly or indirectly interacting with participants, selecting variables, communicating the results in the way which suit their research agenda. This is itself a meaning making process in conducting research.

Meaning making in qualitative research

The term ‘qualitative’ is an interesting one. Is it about quality? The dichotomy of quantitative and qualitative gives an impression that the former is about ‘facts based on numbers’ and the latter on a ‘kind of facts’ based on human experience. Actually qualitative research is not just about quality. Quality research attempts to present a different kind of understanding, or more appropriately a different dimension of reality about human experience which can not be captured by numerical facts. Here the voices of participants as well as the voices of researchers themselves are primary source. The research data are derived from observation, documents, diaries, notes, visual information, interview texts etc. The role of qualitative researchers is to describe, interpret, and unearth the feelings, thoughts, and different kinds of discourses deeply rooted in human experiences. Can researchers be detached from participants and their existence? The question of subjectivity has been raised and widely debated in research. Drapeau (IRE5) in a paper with an interesting title ‘Subjectivity in research: why not …but’ captures this controversy:

For quantitative researchers, it is -and rightfully so- a variable needing to be controlled. For qualitative researchers, the answer does not appear to be as simple. Some suggest maintaining subjectivity at a near zero level by sticking to the text which is analyzed, thus establishing a clear connection between qualitative and quantitative research through a search for objectivity and a near-positivist perspective. On the other hand, many researchers suggest making use of subjectivity and drawing on one's inner experience in order to better understand the subject of a study. For them, distancing themselves from the subject through the use of standardized or semi-standardized methods only keeps the subject at a distance. Drapeau (IRE5)

In qualitative research, for example narrative research, meaning making is crucial. Quality of human experience is not adequately described by observable facts and figures. It can be about making sense of one’s own experience through narrative construction and narrative analysis. Narrative research has opened up a new window in research in terms of meaning making. It allows personal views, opinions, and sense making to be presented as far as they are textualised. Janesick (1994, p.217) points out that "for too long we have allowed psychometrics to rule our research and thus to decontextualise individuals" (p. 217).

The research genre of meaning making can be personal and expressive to capture the dynamic nature of meaning making through the use of personal pronouns and adjectives such as ‘I’, “my” and processes of sensing. Halliday’s Functional Grammar gives great deals of details on mental processes in language. According to Eisner (1991, p. 36) qualitative research writing is descriptive, incorporating expressive language and the "presence of voice in the text"

In hermeneutic research, meaning making takes place in an attempt to illuminate the background atmosphere. Phenomenon is not clearly presented to observers. Researchers
need to bring themselves into the discourse to unearth what is hidden. Meaning is not obvious and readily available to researchers. Concepts, themes, personal experiences can appear unrelated or contradictory. One can treat hermeneutic researchers as meaning explorers as Addison (IRE6) explains:

In their attempt to make sense or bring order to social processes, hermeneutic researchers seek to unearth what is buried, to uncover what is hidden, to illuminate the background atmosphere, to struggle with contradictions, and to find what is missing. Each unearthed or illuminated aspect adds to the overall understanding of the larger whole. Addison (IRE6)

According to Whitehead (IRE7), hermeneutic view recognizes the influence of the researcher on the conduct and presentation of a study. Although approaches such as ethnography and symbolic interactionism also recognize this, in hermeneutics researchers' ability to describe and interpret their experience is an integral part of the research process. This is undoubtedly an engagement in meaning making.

Conclusion
The discussion conducted in this paper deals with the concept 'meaning' which has been widely studied in linguistics and applied linguistics. In the literature dealing with research methodology, the discussion of meaning has been dealt with, but somehow rather incoherently and insignificantly. This negligence may be due to a focus on research methods and less on meaning making in research. This paper is an attempt to deal with an aspect of researching which deserves more attention: researchers as meaning makers.

References


IRE2 Review of Metaphors by which we live http://theliterarylink.com/metaphors.html


IRE5 Drapeau, Martin. Subjectivity in research: why not ..but. http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR7-3/drapeau.html#renn00a

IRE7 Whitehead, L. Enhancing the quality of hermeneutic research: decision trail. 
The Discourse of Outsourcing: Some Implications for Health Services and Education

Quynh Lê
University of Tasmania

Rosa McManamey
University of Tasmania

Abstract
Outsourcing has become an accepted practice in information technology, business, education and health. It takes place in private and public institutions. Outsourcing is the strategic use of efficient third-party providers to perform essential functions traditionally handled internally (insourcing). In business, it aims to transform a company into a more dynamic, market-leading organisation in a rapidly changing world. The primary reasons for outsourcing are that it is cost-effective, less time-consuming and flexible. This study examines the principles and premises on which outsourcing in health services (e.g. blood test, physiotherapy) and education (e.g. multimedia, assessment, interview, review) are based and how they are translated into practice. It identifies some problems and issues facing outsourcing in health services.

Keywords: outsourcing, critical discourse analysis, policy, health services, education, discourse

Introduction
Outsourcing has become a common practice in many Australian services, particularly in industry and business. In the health area, public and private hospitals use outsourcing in a number of services such as pathology, pharmacy, radiology and food services. One of the most common aspects of privatisation is outsourcing. It is basically the contracting-out of internal services to outside service providers. Australia is one of the Western countries which have strongly promoted outsourcing as a strategy to enhance efficiency and productivity of service provision.

What is outsourcing?
Competition as the central concept of privatisation under which outsourcing operates enables the private sectors to provide services to a wide range of stakeholders, including public institutions. Definitions of outsourcing touch on: contract; outside; variety of methods of contracting for labour; external agency responsibility; contrasting activities; in-house.
Outsourcing is a relatively recent addition to dictionaries (1980s) and still remains outside the Roget’s Thesaurus. The Oxford English Reference Dictionary (Pearshall & Trumble, 1996) simply states: outsource/‘obtain (goods etc) by contract from an outside; contract work out – outsourcing’ (p.1034). The emphasis of the definitions is ‘contract’.

Amiti and Wei (2004) suggest that to date there is no agreement on the term outsourcing. The American Heritage Diction defines outsourcing as ‘the procuring of services or products from an outside supplier or manufacturer in order to cut costs’, saying some people interpret outside to mean outside the firm and others outside the country, both usages being common. The emphasis of their interpretation is ‘outside’.

Young (2000) suggests it has been defined in a variety of ways and refers to a ‘variety of
methods of contracting for labour’ (p. 99). These range from traditional sub-contracting, to employees tendering for the provision of a service that they provided while on the payroll, to the full tendering service of a process or function to an outside organisation. It has been seen as, ‘the phenomenon of transferring services to a third party that had traditionally been carried out in-house’ (2000, p. 99).

Outsourcing is defined for this paper as the conscious decision and action to move one or more internal activities to an external vendor (Borg, 2003). According to Borg, there are different categorisations of outsourcing: (a) primary and secondary value chain outsourcing, (b) selective and full outsourcing, and (c) tactical and strategic outsourcing.

Kakadadse and Kakadadse (2003) raise the issues that the term is applied to a range of, at times, contrasting activities. They give the examples of procurement, purchasing, subcontracting and various organisational forms of contracting out. The critical difference is between those activities not previously performed by the company and the contracting out of activities previously performed in-house, the latter being the more accepted view of outsourcing. While there are a variety of opinions related to defining outsourcing, Young (2003) suggests that the major elements structured are: first, the third party should be outside the normal employment conditions that govern traditional employees of the organisation; second the functions should be those conducted previously in-house.

**Historical Discourse**

The World Conference on Quality and Improvement 2004, showed that there were three major trends affecting the quality movement, the first being globalisation, the second innovation and the third outsourcing (Lindborg, 2005). As a major trend, the strongest growth in outsourcing is in services outsourcing although international outsourcing of material input is still far more quantitatively important (Amiti & Wei (2003). There is very little literature on service outsourcing. Studies on service outsourcing and employment effects have mainly been conducted by management consultants.

As a global trend, developed countries show a tremendous amount of anxiety over international outsourcing of services equated with job loss. Amiti and Wei (2004) argue that a lopsided view of international outsourcing has been posited in the US and UK framed by the media. While acknowledging that the measurement of outsourcing is generally difficult, due to the fact that information on stages of production contracted out are not readily available, their assessment was based on imports of computer software design and using the International Monetary Funds’ *Balance of Payment Statistics Yearbook* to explore cross-border services trade. Amiti and Wei (2004) note there is a problem particularly in the under-estimation of the value of outsourcing because of the cost of importing services is likely to be lower than the cost of purchasing them domestically at home. Evidence shows most developed countries are not particularly more outsourcing-intensive (when adjusted for economic size) than many developing countries. Developed countries tend to run surpluses, i.e. the rest of the world outsourcing more to them than the reverse.

Corbett, (2005) notes it would be difficult to find a business or industry idea with more attention than outsourcing. Though historically the term was adopted in the 1960s and 1970s in manufacturing, it now influences most organisations. Outsourcing emerged a few thousand years ago based on the buying and selling or bartering of food, tools and other household goods. The origin of the term in a modern sense is attributed to Richardo’s (1817) Law of Comparative Advantage taken from his ‘Principles of Political Economy and Taxation’ (1817) which underpinned the Competitive Neutrality Policy implemented by the Australian Government in 1995. Historically the adoption of the Competitive Neutrality Policy (CNP) is seen as a policy structured to readjust Australia’s economic decline from the fifth richest developed nation in 1950 to the fifteenth richest country in 1990. The decline was seen as a result of protectionist policy reducing incentive to reduce costs, and innovation and efficient use of resources. Co-ordinated national economic approach was implemented to address these issues and Australia’s economic performance improved steadily. By 2002, it had regained the eighth position (National Competition Council Assessment, 2004).
The public discourse of outsourcing in Australia

The Australian Government's National Competition Policy (NCP) set in motion the most extensive economic reform program in Australia's history. It was implemented in 1995 by the Council of Australian Governments (CoAG) in accordance with Section 7 of the Industry Commission Act 1989. While the aim of the NCP was to promote competition, whereby government business enterprises resembled private sector counterparts and were subjected to similar efficiency incentives, it was professed to promote outcomes that enhance the welfare of Australians. Built on the recognition that competition drives economic growth and in turn provides higher standards of living, the National Competition Council of Australia (NCCA) made the following mission statement:

To improve the well being of all Australians through growth, innovation and rising productivity, by promoting competition that is in the public interest (National Competition Council, 2005).

The National Competition Policy (NCP) Agreements require each State and Territory Government to publish a statement of the application of the competitive neutrality principles to the State Government sector. These principles require Government businesses to operate without any net competitive advantage accruing simply as a result of their public ownership. The Australian Government makes payments to each of the states and territories as a financial incentive to implement the NPC, contingent on state compliance to the agreements in the reforms. The NPC Recommendations Report 2005 suggested payments estimated at $778 million dollars would be allocated to the states and territories for 2004-2005 on a per person basis.

The Industry Commission Competitive Tendering and Contracting by Public Sector Agencies: Overview (1996) related chiefly to services. It showed that all states and territories employed contracting, though at that point, aggregated data for states other than NSW and Victoria were unavailable. The Industry Commission Overview showed that Tasmanian contracts had been let for the provision of a range of public services, hospital facilities, fund management, legal services, repair and maintenance of technical equipment, telecommunications, and computer services. Local governments were acknowledged as contracting extensively, though reported as having enormous variation. Contracting of hospital services were noted in the Mersey Hospital Latrobe. Lack of effective competition was also noted in the report in relation to Aged Care Australia suggesting that the lack of aged care providers in rural and remote areas may be a problem in ensuring effective competition for this service. 'In Tasmania, as with many rural areas through Australia, the lack of viable markets is a real concern' (1996, p.223).

State Governments’ response to the NCP agreement introducing competitive neutrality principles though the application of outsourcing, varied enormously. While in Victoria it was claimed (Fairbrother et al., 2002) that the state had made the greatest privatisation advances of all Australian states in the break-up and sale of state utilities and other government monopolies (Young, 2005), Tasmania was seen as setting a benchmark in the implementation of State Partnership Agreements. The 2002-2003 Review of Progress Improving Efficiency and Effectiveness of Local Government, Application of National Competitive Policy to Local Government (NOAG, 2003) published the implementation of the Partnership Agreements Program as a program allowing the two levels of government to work together to improve economic, environmental and social development at the local, regional and state-wide level. The successfully implemented Partnership Program between the Tasmanian State and Local Governments was seen as a major and first of its kind reform achieved in any of the Australian states (NCCA, 2004).

Tasmania’s performance outlined in the National Competition Council Assessment (NCCA, 2004) in reviewing and reform legislation has been seen as excellent whereby 82% of its stock legislation, 82% of its priority legislation and 95% of its non-priority legislation has been reviewed and, where necessary, reformed. Reviews in relation to health services and professionals encompassed the Medical Practioners Registration Act 1996, Optometrists Registration Act 1994 Pharmacy Act 1908 and a number of acts under the umbrella of drugs, poisons and controlled substances (NCCA, 2004).

The review of the Medical Practitioners Registration Act 1996 provided that registration of
medical practitioners in the public interest is justified, restrictions or controls on ownership or advertising of practices were not. The review recommendations were accepted and passed by Parliament in the Medical Practitioners Registration Amendment Bill 2004. Key issues in the review of Tasmania’s optometry services resulted in the removal of restrictions on ownership of practices passed by Parliament in the Optometrists Registration Act, 2004.

CoAG review of Pharmacy Act 1901 recommended the removal of restrictions on the number of pharmacies owned by one person or the Friendly Pharmacies. While the Bill was tabled in Parliament in 2004, CoAG assessed Tasmania as not having yet its reform obligations in relation to pharmacy. CoAG is presently in the process of considering response review and recommendations are held by in relation to the drugs, poisons and controlled substances recommendations (NCCA, 2004).

In the Inquiry into Health Funding Submission, May, 2005 the Australian Local Government Association (ALGA) gives particular attention to:

> the roles and responsibilities of local government with regard to health and related services, funding arrangements and better defining roles and responsibilities between different levels of government (p.1).

The ALGA (2005) report showed that health services administered by local government concentrate on planning, coordination, policy development and in many cases direct service provision of population based public health services to their local communities. The services and activities provided by local government include: environmental health activities, i.e. environmental protection; development implementation of public health policies, i.e. water, air or food standards; health promotion and preventative health program and services, i.e. health inspections, food, child health, community hospitals, mental health programs and service; recreational and leisure facilities; promotion and increment of resident access to health services, i.e. specific languages information.

Key issues emerge from the ALGA related to medical services in the declining community access to primary and acute health services. They cited from Access Economics a shortfall of between 1200 and 2000 general practitioners with at least 700 more needed in country areas. Concern was reflected in resolution of the National General Assembly of Local Government 2002 asking the Prime Minister and the Federal Minister for Health to:

> urgently address the critical shortage of specialists, senior medical officers and medical practitioners …put in place Medical Practitioner Workforce Planning strategies to address this national problem (ALGA, 2005, p.9).

The ALGA submission shows that the impact of the medical shortages is that while access to health care is a federal and state government responsibility, local governments have increasingly become engaged in the recruitment and retention of health professionals, resulting in increasing rural GP practices that will be owned by local councils. The ALGA in its 2005 Inquiry into Health Funding welcomes the establishment of the Australian Government’s $15 million Rural Medical Infrastructure Fund targeted to assist rural councils to recruit and retain GPs.

Australian and New Zealand College of Anaesthetists Report (ANZCA, 2004) raises a number of issues surrounding the Federal Government, calling on all medical colleges to respond to a scheme for Overseas Trained Specialists to work in Areas of Need (OTS/AON). State Health Departments (“jurisdictions”) have now strongly indicated that they wish to play a major role in specialist training in their state hospitals. They have indicated that the involvement would include: scrutiny of the process of selection of trainees; strong input on the number of trainees; and outcome of the selection. The ANZCA Report suggests this is a new and challenging development for specialist medical colleges ‘which needs to be handled very carefully to maintain the current standards of our training programs’ (2004, p.3).

**Outsourcing in Health Services**

There are two major themes arising from the literature in health care/health services and outsourcing. Globalisation affecting health care and outsourcing relates to issues surrounding job loss both in the USA and United Kingdom as present in general outsourcing literature. The second theme relates to the IT service industry and outsourcing in health care, issues and policy (Sarivougioukas et al., 2002; Suomi and Tankapaa, 2004; Stansbury, 2005); IT and
small physician practices (Robeznieks, 2005), and; off-shoring of health care benefits administration (Shar, 2004).

Health care and health services literature focuses on a number of different forms of outsourcing such as:

- improvement of systems in health care include the outsourcing of patient care by collaboration and education of patients and carers (Beswick, 1996);
- implementing quality improvement in different setting and circumstances and the integration of evidenced-based medicine applied to clinical quality improvement methods (Massoud, 2002);
- the detrimental affect from the loss of health care professionals for developing nations (Segouin et al., 2002);
- outsourcing rising as a new phenomenon ‘medical tourism’, referring to where patients access overseas doctors trained in the USA; take advantage of lower cost procedures in India, Singapore and Thailand (Badam, 2004);
- the international standardisation of quality in health care teaching assisting developing countries; the imperative to progress with international standardisation of health care and professional education as a benefit for ‘all around the world’ (Segouin et al., 2005).

As comparative practice to outsourcing strategies in literature, the Centre for the Study of AIDS in South Africa (Thom, 2004) reports an interesting phenomenon rising from new government health policy. The policy supports the devolution of specialist services from tertiary hospitals to secondary hospitals as a major drive to improve and increase service and efficiencies, though highlighting difficulties in highly urban rather than rural sectors. Australian literature addressing outsourcing health care services and organisations arises from a major body of work focusing on firstly, economic implications and secondly management structures and imperatives (Young 2000, 2003, 2005). These studies primarily examine the reasons/drivers for, and attitudes to, outsourcing.

**Outsourcing in Education**

One tends to think that the word ‘outsourcing’ is primarily confined to business and administration as business is about financial success and outsourcing is one of the important strategies to achieve this. Nowadays, major companies need to ensure that their shareholders are satisfied with their financial performance. To achieve this, they need to reduce costs and increase outcomes. From this perspective, it is rather inappropriate to have outsourcing in education. However, a closer look at the current educational discourse reveals that outsourcing has been a common practice in education. Outsourcing has been undertaken in various forms. In some cases, it is outright outsourcing practice. One facet of international outsourcing practice is the development of international tutoring (Jacobs, 2005). Jacobs informs us that “companies like growing stars and Career Launcher, India, in New Delhi charge American students $20 an hour for personal tutoring, compared with $50 or more charged by their American counterparts” (Jacobs, 2005 p. 1). In other contexts, outsourcing is conducted in a very subtle manner.

In tertiary education, outsourcing has been practised for a long time. Cleaning service is one of the most common outsourcing areas. There are two main aspects of services at a university: academic and non-academic. The academic aspect includes teaching activities and educational resources and the non-academic aspect includes building maintenance, gardening and landscaping, cleaning, etc. Traditionally outsourcing tends to focus on the non-academic aspect.

Recently outsourcing at tertiary education institutions covers the academic aspect. It takes place in various forms and the concept ‘outsourcing’ is euphemistically expressed in ‘academic language’ such as institutional collaboration, joint activities, teamwork, stakeholder participation, etc. Students can do a degree by undertaking units at different participating institutions. Assessment can be outsourced. Some assignments are marked by outsiders.
This can be viewed as against teaching principles as lecturers should be directly involved in the assessment of their students so that they are totally aware of their students’ strengths and weaknesses and the link between teaching and learning.

**Outsourcing and Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA)**

Outsourcing first appeared as a strategy used to improve services and provide benefits to clients, workers, and their companies. However, there are issues which need to be addressed as outsourcing is not just about business strategy and cost saving. From the CDA point of view, the discourse of outsourcing reveals power relationship between workers and employers, communication control, participation in the decision making process, etc.

CDA is interested in the unequal access to linguistic and social resources that are controlled institutionally, particularly pattern of access to discourse and communicative events in an organisation.

How many workers have access to power and linguistic forum to defend themselves in different situations where outsourcing is strictly controlled by those who make decisions on outsourcing? They are marginalised in the decision making process; their voices are weak or unheard.

Where discourse analysis studies the relations between discourse, power, dominance, social inequity as a multidisciplinary complex area, health care outsourcing appears to have inequities in a multitude of areas. Business management calls it a ‘Lack of transparency’ (Deloitte survey 2005, Chadbrow, 2005). Authors such as Suomi and Tankapaa (2004) discuss governance in health care and Information Technology (IT) outsourcing to formally structure out communication and trust.

CDA examines and unpacks outsourcing discourses which have become naturalised and accepted as common (normalisation) as it can be disguised as improving a company profile and its prosperity. Thus it is beneficial to the company as well as its workers. This is not always the case. A company can increase its earnings at the expense of its workers in the name of outsourcing. It can create instability, mistrust between employers and employees, and among employees themselves. Employees may experience identity crisis, particularly for those who have served a company for a long time and are now working for an outsourcing agency.

It is commonly claimed that ‘restructuring’ of a company in terms of outsourcing will ‘improve efficiency’ so that clients are ‘better served’. Again, this is can be a propaganda strategy to maintain the loyalty of clients. Such expressions are deliberately chosen and powerfully persuasive to create a win-win situation in outsourcing. In reality, the financial improvement of a company is the basis of outsourcing. Clients are deprived of having a voice in the decision making process. It creates tension, deprivation and a sense of loss for those who are victims of outsourcing.

**Conclusion**

Outsourcing has become a common strategy in industrial societies which enables the private sectors to provide services to a wide range of stakeholders, including public institutions. Competition is the central concept of privatisation under which outsourcing operates. Proponents of outsourcing claim that in a competitive world of business, outsourcing creates efficiency and promotes collaboration among services for survival and growth. However, there are issues and problems involving power control, inequity, mistreatment, and abuse in the discourse of outsourcing which need to be critically examined and addressed. Outsourcing itself is neither a good nor a bad strategy. The central question is how it is undertaken to accommodate the vulnerable victims of outsourcing.

**Acknowledgement**

We would like to express our appreciation to Cecilia Chiu for her valuable comments on this
References


Lindborg, H. (2005). As the world flattens, Quality Progress, 38, 31


When is a Text? (Keynote Paper)

Alison Lee
University of Technology - Sydney

Abstract
Each discipline or theoretical tradition in the field of discourse analysis takes up a particular set of relationships around discourse and analysis, text and context, text and commentary, etc. These in turn construe or constitute the field in specific ways and produce specific categories of analysis. What is not often attended to, however, are the terms of these determinations. For example, how is a text defined? On what basis is it selected? What are the possible relationships between a corpus of data, and the production of specific categories or units of analysis? What is the relationship between the word and the world? When is a text?

This paper asks questions of the conditions under which specific categories of analysis such as ‘text’, ‘context’ or ‘discourse’ are determined within specific traditions of discourse analysis, the epistemological assumptions underpinning these, and the effects. It argues that these units are artifacts of the analytic disciplines themselves and that the terms and conditions of their production need to be reflexively accounted for. It takes up Bourdieu’s framing of the problem of limits, in order to demonstrate major epistemological challenges within the project of discourse analysis that continue to require attention. It then considers a brief personal history of practical engagement with the theoretical questions of text-context and text-commentary relations within discourse-analytic research.

The motivation for this paper is the pedagogical imperative of working with doctoral students and other researchers who seek to understand and use the tools of discourse analysis in a range of sites of research practice. It seeks to move discussion to pragmatic considerations concerning how, when and according to what principles texts come to be constituted through selection as objects for inquiry and analysis.

Introduction
My interest in the topic of how and when an object comes to be constituted as a text has been sparked by my ongoing work as a researcher and a doctoral supervisor. I engage on a regular basis with doctoral students and other researchers over questions of method in textual analyses within a research culture where discourse analysis appears to promise much (see for example Rogers, 2005 for a recent review). A major question that has brought me to the exploration I attempt in this paper is that of the contemporary allure of discourse analysis: what does it seem to promise and how do its promises continually seem to elude the grasp of scholars, especially though not exclusively those who are new and inexperienced in research? My concern in this paper is not so much about method but the related yet prior problem of the text itself and how it is constituted in research practices.

The question ‘when is a text’ immediately suggests an engagement with that which is deemed to be ‘not-text’, or that which is defined as outside or other to text at any given point. For example, many of the discussions about the constitution of the text take up conceptual questions of the relations between text and context or between text and commentary. Most fundamentally for discourse analysis, these are questions about what Michael Mulcay (1985) calls the relation between ‘the word and the world’. They are both epistemological and social, cultural and political questions, though these matters are often obscured or occluded through a preoccupation with method and technology. They are emphatically practical and political questions, as any researcher, whether doctoral student or established researcher formulating their own research grant applications, can attest as they struggle over the constitution and
delimitation of their fields and objects of inquiry and the role of discourse analysis in the work of that. Ultimately for my interests in this paper, they are pedagogical questions for supervisors working with students seeking to learn and to use the tools of discourse analysis within their own research domains.

In the following sections of this paper, I will briefly trace a story of my recent engagement with these questions. My starting point is the theoretical assertion that anything can be text, depending on location, circumstance or occasion. This puts the burden of choice or decision onto the researcher/discourse analyst to determine when an object is to be constituted as a text-for-analysis, on what terms and conditions, and to what purpose. These matters involve what Lemke (1995) calls ‘contextualising relations’, relations with which social and cultural theory have grappled throughout the previous century. It would seem to be a matter of utmost importance for the emerging field of discourse analysis to be engaging explicitly and critically in this crucial determining work as its key texts explicate their methods.

To this end I have been working through recent publications in a range of different disciplinary-theoretical traditions of discourse analysis to find evidence of engagement with these questions. What I have found is an extraordinary absence of discussion. Almost in every case the text is presented in terms of a presence, a given or as unproblematic. Yet even as what can count as text has become more open and inclusive – including many different modalities – what has gone before to establish its status as the text-to-be-analysed seems at the point of demonstration of the tools of analysis to have become naturalised – forgotten or denied.

My argument in this paper is that it remains problematical to think about texts as already pre-constituted, already formed and present. With my primary purpose in mind of exploring pedagogical questions concerning the constitution and delimitation of objects of inquiry, I take up Bourdieu’s work on ‘thinking about limits’. Working within sociology to challenge the continuing ‘mutilating’ effects of positivism in research epistemologies, Bourdieu advances a three-fold epistemological program for the production of the ‘scientific fact’ that may be helpful. His three concepts of ‘conquest, constitution and confirmation’ of a field of inquiry may be usefully explored here to elaborate a set of problems concerning the status of the text in discourse-analytic research. Bourdieu’s suspicion of the pre-constructed nature of data offers a way to turn the gaze upon the pre-constituted text and to ask similarly sceptical questions about that which appears to present itself to the researcher as a given. The text must be viewed with suspicion in this account precisely because it is pre-formed or even pre-determined. Such suspicion or doubt allows questions to be asked as how the text has been constituted, by whom, for what purpose, in whose interests, and with what effects.

In the remaining sections of the paper, I attempt to take up the challenge posed by Bourdieu to think about some of the epistemological and pedagogical questions surrounding the constitution of texts in discourse-analytic research. First, as this is a paper closely situated within the pedagogical and textual work I currently engage in, I trace a brief history of my own engagement with these problematics. From there I take up a set of paired oppositions commonly invoked in the definition and demarcation of text in different traditions and paradigms of discourse analysis and related fields: text/context; text/commentary or text/analysis; text/discourse or text/talk and ask questions about how the boundaries and limits around these ideas are drawn.

‘Thinking about limits’

A key argument in this paper is that the idea of ‘text’ is a construct that is located within a particular order of discourse or disciplinary frame. The constitution of a particular notion of text then of necessity also constitutes or presupposes a set of relations to what is ‘not-text’ – whether that be construed as internal to language itself (eg text/talk) or as a word-world relation (text/context). The movement between text, discourse and the world is problematic and complex, a fundamental matter of epistemology, or what is to be counted as knowledge. This kind of problem requires epistemological work that precedes method. These matters are, in my view, still often neglected within discussions of discourse analysis in the drive and imperative towards method and procedure. To engage these matters adequately involves a broader scholarship than that available within the field of discourse analysis itself, no matter which disciplinary genealogy is followed. It involves engaging with the broad recent history of
epistemological debate within the human sciences. As I will briefly describe in the next section, I have previously traced some of these debates through anthropology, arguing for the need for a mode of reflexive thinking about the constitution of the field of discourse analysis, its object of inquiry and the relationship between the analyst and their ‘subjects’ (Lee 2000). Here I take up Bourdieu’s epistemological challenge for sociology and hence for the human sciences more broadly.

For Bourdieu, the key point to the undertaking of any research enterprise involves centrally, ‘thinking about the way the object is apprehended’. In his paper published in *Theory, Culture and Society* in 1992, Bourdieu posits an epistemological program that he draws from the French sociological tradition, most clearly influenced by Bachelard. This program offers an alternative and a challenge to the more dominant German tradition of the binary opposition of explanation/understanding (Erklärung/Verstehen) that marks the shift from positivist to post-positivist and interpretive epistemologies. Bourdieu’s purpose is to break down this opposition, with its entrenched presupposition of the ‘universal’ nature of scientific fact vs. the ‘particularity’ of the human sciences. For him, what is required is a three-fold movement, centrally revolving around the constructed-ness of all facts. In this frame, facts are ‘conquered, constructed and confirmed’ (from Bourdieu and Chamboredon 1991). These three moments are complexly inter-related, both conceptually and in time in actual research practice. However, for explanatory purposes, Bourdieu separates them into a three-stage, linear process.

The idea of the ‘conquest’ of the scientific fact is central to this work. It can usefully be summed up here in terms of an ‘epistemological break’ (p38). This idea suggests a battle or a struggle rather than a simple reaching for a set of givens, or pre-constituted facts. Bourdieu is very critical of pre-constructed concepts and argues for the necessity of the struggle to constitute concepts as scientific constructs rather than assuming them to be pre-given. He illustrates this central epistemological challenge through problematising the practices of definition in the research process:

> Very often the positivist epistemological tradition attempts to escape from the problem I pose by means of the notorious operational definition. Imagine constructing a research programme into European intellectuals. How are you going to choose your sample? Everyone knows how to construct a sample, it's no big deal, and can be learnt in any course on methodology: drawing white balls or black balls, anyone can do the job. But how do you construct the box that the balls are in? Nobody asks that. Do I just say ‘I call intellectual all those who say they are ‘intellectuals’? How do we construct the limits?

The point Bourdieu makes strongly there is that subjects, the concepts, the words themselves that are used to speak about the social are socially pre-constructed and socially constituted. He argues that social problems are often too quickly converted, through this easy process of definition, into sociological facts, often erasing or effacing the history of disputation and contestation that mark the site of the problem. The examples he gives are juvenile delinquency, drugs and AIDS. Through this process of definition, limits are set on what counts as the concept to be investigated through method.

Bourdieu’s point is thus that it is necessary to should practise ‘radical doubt’ (p43) in the constitution of a scientific fact. Why does this scrupulous epistemological attention matter? According to Bourdieu:

> Sociologists, especially positivists, who are so hard to please in matters of empirical proof, are negligent, uncaring and incredibly lax when it comes to questions of epistemology. When it comes to coding data, for example, they employ the most naïve systems of classification. … Afterwards, there are some very clever exercises on the computer. But what is put into the computer is the pre-thought, ready to think with just a few alterations (p43).

The second moment, the ‘construction’ of the object of research, is, according to Bourdieu, decisive. Rather than speaking of ‘choosing a subject’ to research, the fundamental operation in this account is the actual construction of the topic as an object. Again, the critical point is to be able to think about and question the pre-given nature of reality that presents itself to the researcher. This is the ‘moment of maximum vigilance’:

> When you are within the pre-constituted, reality offers itself to you. The given gives itself, in the form of the notorious data. This is one of the reasons the given is so dangerous.
This problematising of ‘data’, in its literal sense of the ‘given’, is necessary to avoid the enormous scientific errors perpetrated through an uncritical acceptance of the pre-constituted concept. Everything must be subjected to questioning concerning the conditions of its constituted-ness.

The third phase, termed ‘confirmation’, in this account, is the empirical phase. The constructed objects and the system of hypotheses that allows their formation must be tested against reality and ‘subjected to verification’. Bourdieu stresses that:

To construct an object is to construct a model, but not a formal model destined merely to turn in the void, rather a model intended to be matched against reality (p45)

Bourdieu’s point here is that what is needed are means of constructing facts in such a way that models can be developed. This is a kind of third way between a theoretical formalism and a positivist hyper-empiricism ‘drowned in data’. This third way places construction – thinking about the way the object is apprehended – at the very start of the process.

Bourdieu’s explanation of his own research process is to try to ‘treat the particular scientifically without assuming a priori limits’. In this view, everything is an object of science and there are no a priori frontiers.

For a discussion about text and discourse analysis, there is much that is thought-provoking here. How are the problems that are to be subjected to the discourse-analytic methods constituted? How is the object of inquiry ‘apprehended’ and then constructed as the ‘subject’ of the research? How is the implicit model of the world thus constructed to be tested against reality? What criteria of adequacy to that reality are to count? Bourdieu’s insights into the setting of limits offer important and productive epistemological challenges for textual analysis. According to this analysis, the text, like the scientific fact, has to be struggled over (and ‘conquered’), constructed and confirmed. The word-world relation must be constituted in this process, rather than being seen or deemed to be given, to simply yield themselves up as ‘data’.

These epistemological questions are, in turn, always and ineluctably social, cultural and political. The taking of an epistemological position always involves ‘social forces’ – always involves ‘the position in the scientific field of those who take them and the type of capital which it commands’ (p48). Methodological strategies proposed by researchers are, he says, often ‘little more than rationalisations of their own limits’. Indeed, much of the debates in the social sciences, according to this account, are ‘debates which are organised around people caught within their pre-established limits’ (p48). The final points of concern, then, are these limits which he argues must be subjected to ‘radical doubt’. His challenge is to the ‘categories of thought which makes a whole collection of things unthinkable’ (p 48).

A brief intellectual history

I trace in this section a brief history of my own engagement in these questions of limits in the constitution of texts. In Gender, Literacy, Curriculum, a book published in 1996 from my own doctoral thesis, I was concerned with building a more complex account of text-context relations in relation to literacy education than had been available to that point. With respect to the linguistically-based interventions into literacy pedagogy that were being developed at that time, I was concerned to construct an account of curriculum and the discursive construction of knowledge and identity by differently gendered and positioned students in schools through their textual practices of reading and writing the curriculum (in this instance geography). Here my questions about the constitution of the text were articulated in terms of the claims to representativeness of the sample of texts chosen as exemplars for linguistic exegesis. The research frame was that of critical engagement with the implicit politics of curriculum and pedagogical knowledge. I sought to critique singular accounts of text/context relations through an accumulation of what I then termed ‘contextual materials’ – curriculum materials, readings and re-readings of the history of the discipline of geography and its curriculum history in schools. These materials included the syllabus, understood as a set of selections from a number of cultures: disciplinary cultures, politico-economic cultures and ‘educational’ (for example, curriculum-theoretical) cultures. Layered in relation to those documents was a series of readings of the printed resource material in use in the classroom, documentary and
observational material from my time in the classroom, including the classroom dynamics, and
interviews with the teachers and students over the time I was undertaking the study, and close
textual analysis of writing produced by students.

Of particular concern to that study was the problem of what I saw as ‘monologic’ accounts of
text/context relations that saw a one-way deterministic relation between curriculum and
literacy and where student written texts were only readable in terms of more or less accurate
renderings of ‘proper’ geography. I was concerned not only to stage the differences among
student writings in terms of staging fundamental rhetorical positionalities within the discipline
from which the school curriculum took its name, but also to problematise reproductionist
pedagogies for literacy and school learning. Text/context relations, then, were construed in
terms of the question of which texts and whose contexts were selected as properly
representative of a discipline or curricular field, in order to judge student responses to
curriculum and shape pedagogies for literacy within curriculum:

The texts selected … for the linguistic analysis, despite the implicit claim for general
representativeness, refer to only one particular ‘paradigm’ of geography and represent
that ‘paradigm’ in one particular way. A selection has been made from the discursive
multiplicity which constitutes the discipline in the totality of its sites of practice. However,
to be able to read this selection as selection, and to comprehend its implications for a
projection for literacy and curriculum it is essential to engage the history and politics of
geography as a discipline. (Lee 1996: 186)

Here the setting of the limits of the object of inquiry, and hence for the object of pedagogy,
became for me an important matter of epistemological and curriculum-political contestation.
This was because the discursive multiplicity of geography was no innocent plurality but a
political matter, one of direct consequence for the shaping of gendered subjectivities in the
young men and women writing geography in that senior secondary classroom. The too-easy
assumption of the identity of the discipline as read from a particular selection of a text was
followed by a privileging of methods of textual analysis that confirmed the rhetorical
functioning of the text but assumed the text itself to be – in Bourdieu’s sense – ‘pre-thought’
and ‘given’.

Several years later I returned to these and similar questions in co-editing Culture and Text
with Cate Poynton (2000). This collection was focally concerned with exploring various
discourse analysts’ engagement with questions of text-context relations and was broadly
poststructuralist in orientation. What was directly at issue was the challenge of developing
forms of discourse analysis that embraced the theoretical and political sophistication of
European traditions of discourse while also being ‘analytically precise and grounded in actual

In my own chapter in that collection I traced a particular set of theoretical debates concerning
the constitution of texts – debates about authority in analysis and about the relationship of
discourse analysis and writing. These could be reconstrued as debates about text/context and
text/commentary relations. Specifically, I was concerned with:

questions concerning the construction of the objects of analysis and the attribution of
knowledgeability in relation to the ‘text’ or ‘object’ of analysis and the analyst. These
questions are all the more important to ask since critical work is often expressly
concerned to redistribute ‘agency’ within the target population on whose behalf the
critical analysis is to be conducted (Lee 2000: 192-193)

At issue here was the question of which text and whose analyses were to be deemed
authoritative and with what effects. I cited Ann Game (1991) who cautioned against a too-
easy elision of the agency of the analyst. ‘Agency’ in sociology, according to Game, is used to
refer to refer to ‘others’, ‘oppressed groups’ – women, working classes etc. She proposed that
there was a need for a critical reflection on the agency of the analyst – ‘the agency of the
subjects of sociological knowledge’, which was suppressed through the focus on the agency
of the oppressed. The constitution of oppressed groups as ‘objects of knowledge’ effects a
‘return to self’ of the researcher (Game, 1991: 6). Game proposed that analysts ask critical
questions of the ‘itinerary of desire’ in their knowledge and the choice of the objects of their
study; questions concerning the ‘other’ to whom this desire is addressed and the ways in
which that other is constituted in relation to the analyst self (Game 1991: 10).

In the various fields taking up the name of discourse analysis of one kind or another, analysts
largely write about texts to communities of other analysts. This is a dominant feature of much of the work in discourse analysis, notwithstanding ongoing attempts to theorise and account for ‘context’ of production and reception of the texts in question. There is in common in most if not all of the various forms and modes of analysis a will to truth or ‘mastery’ (Hodge and McHoul, 1992).

My work during the decade or so between my own doctoral work and the publication of *Culture and Text* had been strongly influenced both by social-semiotic and text-political work, literary theory, feminist theory and poststructuralism. These influences can be exemplified with brief reference to work from my two doctoral supervisors, Bill Green and Alec McHoul. Green has consistently been engaging in questions of text-context relations from literary-theoretical and poststructuralist perspectives. Green works with a notion of reading as an ‘undecidable play’ of text and context. What he explicitly refuses is a view of context that posits matters of occasion, place and situation as independent and outside human events and activities, as existential ‘containers’ for them:

This notion of context needs to be understood semiotically, however, as a register of the practices and dynamics of meaning-making – rather than realistically or naturalistically. Contexts aren’t simply ‘containers’ or ‘frames’ for living and learning; rather they are thoroughly implicated in and indeed inextricable from living and learning. Our world only seems ready-made and ready to hand; whereas in actuality it is constantly being formed and reformed … The very distinction between ‘text’ and ‘context’ is fraught with difficulty – not just philosophically or theoretically but practically. (Green 1998: 9)

Green is drawing in part here from Derrida, for whom context is an indeterminate concept that is virtual rather than empirical and is constantly shifting, dynamic, multiple and heteroglossic. Green articulates the need for an appropriately understood concept of context in terms of ‘meaning and action’.

At the same time, he stresses the importance of similarly problematising the notion of text itself, and of the need to refuse the reification of the concept of the text, seeing it as similarly problematic and ‘undecidable’. Thinking about text simplistically in terms of presence is problematic, a point underscoring Bourdieu’s point about the pre-constructed nature of data. What presents itself to the researcher must be treated sceptically – ‘radical doubt’ must be exercised, precisely because the text appears so often appears as pre-formed or even pre-determined. What comes to be seen or understood as ‘text’ (no matter what the modality) is always predicated on a great deal of preceding constitutive work, which is now naturalised, ‘black-boxed’, forgotten or denied. According to Green:

… The very distinction between ‘text’ and ‘context’ is fraught with difficulty – not just philosophically or theoretically but practically. This becomes clearer and clearer as we begin to consider and engage meaning-making practices in media spaces. Indeed, the ‘text’ metaphor may well be both inadequate and profoundly misleading, since what such orientations characteristically miss are ‘the processual dimensions of media experience’ and their character as ‘communal events (Morgan 1996). A new language of contexts and trajectories, currents and networks might well be necessary to begin to approach teaching and learning in media culture. Where does *The Simpsons* begin and end? Or, to put it another way: *where, what and when* is the text? (Green 1998: 3)

Green’s assertion is that anything can be text, depending on location and/or occasion. This then brings the question to the fore the question of reading and of ‘reading formations’ (Bennett 1984). According to Green’s (1991) formulation, reading is a social signifying practice involving a ‘complex interplay of text/context relations characterised by a motivated and constrained undecidability’ (p216). Readings are complex, dynamic and relational, constitutive of the text-context relations they purport to reflect.

For Green, the question of where *The Simpsons* begins and ends in the passage quoted above is a question about limits and the constitution of objects of inquiry, in this case, of curriculum and pedagogy. The language of his commentary directs our attention to process, movement, experiences, events, trajectories and networks, in an effort to construe the problem of text. ‘Text’ is presented here as a potentially misleading metaphor in the sense that it appears to ‘fix’ an object of inquiry in time and space via some procedure and to evade or occlude both the act of such constitution and its effects in terms of what is then suppressed and disavowed.
Alec McHoul, the other scholar with whom I worked as a doctoral student at Murdoch University in Western Australia, produced a piece with Bob Hodge in 1992 titled ‘The Politics of Text and Commentary’ that was to influence the direction of my own work in decisive ways. Hodge and McHoul write of two extreme types of disciplinary formations of the text-commentary relation, which they refer to as ‘mastery’ and ‘liberty’. The first formation coheres around the notion of commentarial dominance over, and colonisation of, the object-text. The second is characterised by a more ‘humble’ gesture by which the commentary allows the object-text the position of dominance—‘to speak for itself’. In relation to the position of ‘mastery’, the text is positioned as containing a ‘mystery’, available only to the skills of the analyst:

What is paradoxically interesting about the approach ... is that it flatters the text equally with itself. The two, as it were, look as if they are in a conspiracy to defraud ‘ordinary’ readers. The text’s meaning is ‘deep’—but the commentary’s skill is more than equal to that depth. This is the characteristic mode of explanation and owes some allegiance to traditional (Baconian) natural science models. The text, like nature, is an infinite mystery. But the commentary, like the mathematical gesture, presumes to unlock that mystery, privileging, in one move, both itself and, to a lesser extent, its object. (Hodge & McHoul, 1992: 190)

At the opposite end of this binary formation, ‘libertarian’ approaches to ‘letting the text speak for itself’, dating from the 1960s, involve such traditions as those Hodge and McHoul refer to in terms of ‘ethnomethodological indifference’. Letting the text ‘speak for itself’ ranges from various traditions within ‘non-intrusive’ sociology, to approaches within phenomenology and ethnography. The text ‘becomes the master: it “teaches” the analyst’, who remains silent, acting as a medium through which the ‘text emerges to full consciousness’ (Hodge & McHoul, 1992: 194).

Hodge and McHoul point out, however, that text-libertarianism is a ‘panopticism under another name’. The silence of the analyst is ‘far from innocent and is in fact part of a very effective strategy of power’. Here they refer to crucial yet unexamined issues such which texts are to be selected and which excluded. As they note, ‘libertarians who self-consciously take the side of the victim still face the dilemma of which particular victim to choose’ (Hodge & McHoul, 1992: 195).

The question of ‘when is a text’ is taken up in terms of the politics of text and commentary. For Hodge and McHoul, it is important to ask questions concerning the institutional and historical conditions under which textual analysts come to be authors and the constraints under which forms of analysis take place. Hodge and McHoul give an account account, drawing on Foucault and Lyotard, of some of the politico-theoretical problems of textual commentary that seek to displace the problematic binary of text/commentary, self/other, leaving the intensive scrutiny of the ‘insides’ of texts and taking into account such matters as the conditions of their production and circulation. Ultimately, they insist on the notion of text as ‘spectacle’, as performance and as writing.

In my work in Culture and Text, I sought to tease out relations between text and context, text and commentary and other problematic binary formulations within the field of work captured under the large and highly differentiated field of discourse analysis. This paper does not in the space available seek to contribute substantially to this body of theory but to raise some immediate practical questions of method and of pedagogy that arise in the practice of doctoral supervision and research practice.

‘Patterns and limits’

In this section I attempt to draw a pragmatic distinction between two distinct orientations to discourse analysis in terms of the differential attention they pay theoretically to the ‘word-world’ relation, or how and when a text is selected for analysis. In doing so I am aware of doing some violence to an extraordinarily complex field of systems and relations and so, before I move into these practical considerations, I want to acknowledge this complexity briefly. As Lemke (1995: p32) explains eloquently:

What is important are the relations between text or event and formation or genre on the one hand, and those between formations or genres and larger issues of social structure
and process on the other. The text or event takes its meaning in part from being seen in
the community as an instance of one or more formations. We interpret it against the
background of other instances of the same formations to see how it is distinctive and we
contrast it with instances of other formations. Different formations (codes, genres,
registers, voices of heteroglossia, discursive formations,) are not just different, however.
They have systematic relations to one another and those relations define and are
defined by the larger social relationships of classes, genders, age groups, political
constituencies, and significant social divisions of every kind.

For Lemke what is at issue are the ‘patterns and limits’ that shape what he terms
‘contextualising relations’:

We say that when an act occurs it occurs in some context and that ‘its’ meaning depends
in part on what that context is. Better to say that we make the act meaningful by
construing it in relation to some other acts, events, things (which we then call its
contexts). (Lemke 1995: 166)

The key question for Lemke is what goes with what? What are the patterns and limits that
make meaning possible? He asks us to consider the alternatives with which researchers and
discourse analysts place a particular event in contrast, and to consider critically how the
relevant contexts in which the act or event has meaning are constituted. Contextualising
relations tell us what the contexts are in relation to which an act or event has its meanings in a
given community. They specify what the combinations are that an event of a given type can
belong to, and what the kinds of events are, the sets of alternative events or acts of the same
kinds, that can make up the various sets of combinations, etc. In this work, actions make
meanings and sustain the meaning system of a community by conforming to its patterns and
not violating its limits (p 167).

The word-world relation is complex and fraught. I intend in this section only to sketch two very
different examples of engagement with this relation in analytic work. The first of these is the
systemic-functional linguistic work of J R Martin and his colleagues. In my search through
recent published works introducing and teaching many different forms and approaches to
discourse analysis, I sought the chapters concerning ‘getting started’, with the view that it
would be here that the choice and selection – ie the actual constitution – of the text would be
explicated. This search proved instructive. Martin and Rose, for example, in their 2003 volume
Working with Discourse, make the following suggestion:

In order to get going with discourse analysis we need to settle on something to analyse
and this is not as easy as it seems. The advice we usually give our students is to start
with whole texts just a page of two long, and to choose something they really like or can’t
stand. (p206)

In this account, the text is chosen for its suitability for the early learning of techniques of
micro-analysis to be later demonstrated. The text is in some sense almost a pretext for the
demonstration and practicing of analytic technique. Once a text has been chosen in this way,
the question of selection and choice of analysis follows:

This brings us to the central challenge of micro-analysis, the immense complexity of
discourse. Texts are very dense phenomena, because they derive from social semiotic
systems and these are the most complex systems to have evolved on our planet. So we
have to be selective. But how do we decide which analyses to undertake, avoiding both
the problem of trying to do too much and thus feeling overwhelmed and the problem of
doing analyses that seem pointless and thus feeling decidedly underwhelmed (p 212).

Here the pedagogical intent appears to be to stage the learning of selection of analysis in a
way that constructs a manageable project of learning the tools of the discipline. An interesting
rider at the end of this account is this comment on the limits of following a micro-analytic
approach to building an interpretation of a text.

Perhaps the best advice we can offer here is to follow your hunches until you are more
experienced with consciously drawing on the regularities English systems entail. If
something seems unusual, go after it (pp. 213-214).

This reference to the use of the ‘hunch’ appears to allow the neophyte discourse analyst a
reading position that is outside the technical apparatus of the linguistic analysis. There is no
space here to tease out the epistemological complexities of the notion of ‘hunch’ at work here.
My intention in laying out this introduction in some detail has been to suggest that technical approaches to the analysis of texts and discourse -- whether they be linguistic or ethnomethodological etc – privilege the learning of the technical apparatus and assume the text to be a given, to be selected for pragmatic purposes. The pedagogy assumes the necessity of a disciplining into the technologies for analysis such that, until expert, the status of the text remains that of ‘training wheels’.

At an opposite extreme, perhaps, to this technicist orientation to discourse analysis are the poststructuralist and literary positionings of the work in *Culture and Text* and in the work of Green, Hodge and McHoul and Lemke sketched briefly above. Here I want to raise very briefly a set of questions that emerge for me in engaging with that work in my own pedagogy and practice. The questions of contextualisation relations for me become of paramount importance as I am confronted with the exigencies of a wide variety of needs and desires for discourse analysis among research students and colleagues and in my own research. I want to sketch, very briefly, several notions that are yet to be systematically developed and that form work in progress in our own supervision pedagogy, in research with colleagues, and in my reflections on methodology in discourse analysis. My concern as a researcher and a research supervisor is with the conceptual management of large bodies of data and the question of the selection and delimitation of text. First I want to talk briefly about the idea of a corpus of textual material and its conceptual and methodological relationship to that which is to be selected and constituted as text and subjected to analysis. Second, I want to refer briefly to the need to engage more closely with the notion of readings and reading formations.

The idea of the corpus has been useful in recent work I have undertaken with Bill Green and other colleagues in managing a large body of interview data which constitute the primary materials produced from a research project inquiring into the history and practices of the PhD in Australia. The term has not been put forward in any explicitly technical sense, as in, for instance, corpus linguistics. It refers, simply and literally, to the body of work assembled in the research process. What has exercised us in thinking about the selection of material for close reading and analysis in this research have been the very questions canvassed in the earlier stages of this paper: how do we constitute the objects of our analysis, how do we construe the contextualising relations – on what basis, for what purpose and with what effect, and how do we theorise what we do with these texts, once constituted, framed, delimited?

It is in my experience often the case that researchers produce data of the kind I refer to here within broadly naturalistic modes of inquiry. Typically, as here, the interviews that were conducted in order to ascertain participants accounts of a phenomenon are transcribed from audiotape and then bound into a volume or, as in our case, a set of volumes, waiting for the next stage – the determining of principles of selection and the setting of boundaries and limits. And the question of how to manage that next stage is both a profoundly difficult epistemological question and a daunting practical one.

The idea of the corpus alludes both literally to the bound volumes of transcribed material (are they texts? when do they become texts?) and to the conceptual entity thus constituted. The corpus can itself be designated and constituted as a text and ‘read’ in different ways, thus rendering it workable in many different ways. Some logics of selection can be applied more or less technically to the corpus. An example of a ‘horizontal’ logic is recent work we are doing on metaphor across the 100 or so interviews. An example of a ‘vertical’ logic is to read ‘down’ the list in terms of a story of each institution within which a collection of interviewees worked. And so on. There is no claim here for any particular method but rather a ‘way of proceeding’ in Barthes (1977) sense, that opens up productive lines of inquiry regarding the constitution of particular texts as objects for analysis and the explicitly constitutive work that is being done.

The notion of readings and reading formations is similarly important in thinking about contextualisation relations in the sense developed in this paper. Roland Barthes’ work, again a major influence on my thinking, allows a conceptualisation of textual analysis as, in the first instance, practices of reading and of writing. Such practices, as Barthes has pointed out, yield up ‘not a “result” nor even a “method” ... but merely a “way of proceeding” ’ (Barthes, 1977: 127). Barthes was writing at the time against a particular ‘scientific view of the text’ as it...
was constituted within certain disciplinary and methodological regimes – notably structuralism. While his injunctions are no longer new nor particularly radical within the human sciences, I noted in *Culture and Text* that they typically still await substantive debate within the field of discourse analysis. In particular, as newcomers to the field recognise the currency of discourse analysis as a new and increasingly influential research (writing) practice, there is a crucial need to engage histories of debates concerning the ‘politics and poetics’ (Clifford and Marcus 1986) of representation and signification.

Thinking about the constitution of the text and of contextualisation relations in terms of readings and reading formations allows the space for ways of proceeding that bring some conceptual sophistication to the notion of the ‘hunch’. In our work on the PhD corpus, for example, we have sought to articulate historical readings, explicitly theoretical framings as well as biographical-experiential readings of the material. We are mindful of the importance of prior readings and of trainings in particular theoretical traditions and of the dispositions produced by those trainings. We attempt to take into account the constitutive work of these trainings and dispospositions in producing readings. A reading of the corpus by any one of us currently working on it is thus shaped by these trainings and dispospositions, just as the corpus itself has been produced through prior theoretical-constitutive work. Data are not simply given, or present, just as the text has to be both constituted in a principled way, its limits interrogated and articulated, and subjected to readings that themselves need to be subjected to readings. What emerges is work in progress towards a non-realist methodology of textual analysis.

**Conclusion**

This paper raises more questions than it answers. It has served in many respects best as an assembling of reminders of important theoretical debates within the human sciences over the past half-century into which current preoccupations with method are inserted at particular moments in history. The rapid growth of the field known as discourse analysis in fields that have hitherto been dominated by positivist and empiricist epistemologies and methods can be at risk of missing this historical perspective and for this reason alone it is important to return to older work on the text and re-engage its central problematics. The problem of the text is far from resolved; indeed it takes new forms as the forms and sites of practice proliferate. The contemporary desire for discourse analysis, as evidenced by a proliferation of publications in many different fields, raises questions regarding what it appears to promise researchers. What I have tried to do in this paper is to trace my own engagement in some of these questions both in my own history and my current practice.

**References**


Academic Discourse: Power, Identity and Korean Migrant Women

Jane Gyung-sook Lee*

University of Sydney

Abstract

This paper examines the experiences of Korean migrant women (KMW) in the Australian labour market. A review of the extant literature leads to two propositions, both of which assert that KMW are likely to experience labour market disadvantage or barriers to entry. These propositions take into account two significant theories of the labour market: segmentation theory and human capital theory. Segmentation theory argues that unchangeable gender and racial/cultural differences have the greatest impact upon labour market value, human capital theory describes the labour market value of individuals as based upon apparently objective and attainable skills (here English language skills). Using narrative analysis and, more specifically, antenarrative analysis, the study examines the life stories of 33 Australian KMW. In so doing, it identifies hitherto unheard discourses concerning the experiences of KMW in relation to the Australian labour market-discourse that challenge established academic thinking regarding this issue.

Identification and analysis of these new discourses generates a number of alternative understandings of the labour market experiences of KMW. These alternative understandings both demonstrate the limitations of, and go beyond, the existing two propositions. In particular, the research shows that the impacts of gender and culture (segmentation theory) vary over time for KMW, do not always prevent labour market participation, and are experienced in terms of identity within a gendered Australian labour market. The research also demonstrates that while many KMW are in fact sufficiently skilled in the English language (human capital theory) to enter the Australian labour market, they nevertheless experience a sense of inferiority about their English language capacity that discourage them from entering, and limits their opportunities to participate in, the labour market. This in turn contributes to their social isolation.

The paper concludes that within the Australian academic literature, KMW have either been given little space and voice or have been misrepresented, reflecting and contributing to an ongoing ignorance of the experiences of Asian women in Australian workplaces. The KMW examined in this study are subject to numerous forms of subordination in Australian workplaces and society that cannot be adequately explained in terms of their human capital or their gender and cultural differences. The covert nature of the politics of difference within the work place makes exclusionary practices more difficult to identify and discuss.

Introduction

This research seeks to identify, explore and test current conceptions of barriers to Korean migrant women's access to the Australian labour market as presented in academic research and my hypothesis. In testing theses identified barriers, this research aims to expose the determinative practices and effects of studying and describing migrants, particularly Korean migrant women (KMW) in the Australian labour market. The research critiques and supplements existing knowledge and studies in three ways. Firstly, it aims to reveal how white Australia dominates KMW through problematising them, regardless of their objective skills and qualifications, and despite espousing principles of access and equity, equal employment opportunity and anti-discrimination legislation. The focus is upon embedded

* Jane Lee currently teaches at the Work and Organisational Studies, The University of Sydney. She gained a Ph.D. for her thesis on “A Narrative analysis of Labour Market Experiences of Korean Migrant Women in Australia”, from Work and Organisational Studies, The University of Sydney. E-mail: j.lee@econ.usyd.edu.au
discourses of domination that are reified in academic discussion, especially the apparently meritocratic and transparent human capital theory. Secondly, the research aims to provide some fill for the lacuna that exists with regard to studies of Asian migrants in the Australian labour market, a neglect which includes KMW. Thirdly, this research adopts a qualitative rather than quantitative approach to gathering and analysing data of KMW in Australia, to provide a rich and complex and understanding of the experience of marginalisation instead of a simplistic statistical summary of labour market participation rates.

The research is innovative in both subject and analysis. Qualitative analysis is performed here through narrative analysis: an examination of the life stories of KMW in Australia in relation to the academic discourses described above, testing for veracity, relevance, impact and alternatives. Narrative analysis offers the scope to hear the voice of the marginalised individual, otherwise generalised, summarised and silenced in quantitative studies (Boje 2001). While narrative analysis is an emerging technique in academic study, it is most likely to be applied to the narratives of those who can speak directly in the dominant language, the language of the research. In this research, life stories of KMW are recorded in Korean, translated into English and analysed using narrative analysis techniques. The labour market experiences of KMW are otherwise amongst the least likely to be studied through narrative analysis. This research is also new and unique in establishing the category of KMW while acknowledging the problematic of categorisation itself, in exploring individual and specific experiences of a shift from Korean cultures to Australian cultures and organisations, and in the nature of the division of the sample group into smaller groups for research purposes.

This research analyses the narrated experiences of Korean migrant women in the Australian labour market through their life stories to test existing academic notions and assumptions of labour market barriers. Three key issues for consideration may be identified within this endeavour: first, the understandings and existing literature of the Australian labour market; second, the paucity of qualitative approaches to the analysis of KMW’s ‘experience’ of the Australian labour market; and third, the categorisation and associated phenomena of defining a ‘KMW’. This paper however, only addresses the first issue for consideration which may be identified within this endeavour.

Existing Literature and Conception

The first issue involves existing understandings and discourses of the Australian labour market, arising from theories of segmentation, human capital and organisations. Segmentation theory is the more established theory of a labour market divided according to gender and ethnicity, arguing that in Australia white men will dominate labour market opportunities, indigenous women will occupy the lowest rung of the ladder of opportunity, and other will rest in between (Collins 1978; Inglis & Stromback 1984; Chapman & Miller 1985; Castles et al. 1986; Lever-Tracy & Quinian 1988; Peck 1989; Chapman & Iredale 1990). Under this theory, KMW will sit low on the ladder, based upon their lower valued gender, race and ethnicity.

Human capital theory has evolved from segmentation theory to offer an alternative explanation for disadvantage in the labour market, focusing upon an evaluation of an individual's apparently achievable skills or capital (Mincer 1974; Becker 1975; O'Loughlin & Watson 1997; Cobb-Clark & Chapman 1999; VandenHeuvel & Wooden 1999, 2000; Cobb-Clark 2000, 2001; Richardson et al. 2001, 2002). These skills include qualifications such as degrees, work experience, English language competence, and other qualities and attributes, such as age and physical fitness. Neither theory is entirely satisfactory, as segmentation theory offers little scope for individual agency and human capital theory denies structurally embedded, covert discrimination practices. An emerging critique of the two theories considers the strengths as weaknesses of each and is the starting point for the development of a potential new model of the labour market. This critique considers the cultural, segmentation aspect of evaluating human capital theory, arguing that skills and qualifications are accorded value according to acceptance and similarity of individuals to the dominant culture. Despite this critique, discourses pertaining to segmentation and human capital theory continue to dominate perceptions and discussion of women migrants and thereby Korean migrant women.

Organisational theory provides another and more recent lens through which to view, discuss
and understand the labour market. This emerging field of study considers organisations as the core of social analysis, constituting ‘the most persistent and universal relations between individuals and…set[ting] the conditions for human action’ (Ahrne 1994: 2). The term ‘organisation’ is used to refer to a wide range of social entities, characterised by formal and explicit rules of entry, exit and behaviour, including workplaces, schools and clubs. Organisational theory presents an understanding of gatekeeping, belonging, dependence and exclusion from organisations as a key aspect of all human experience and much social control. This research finds particularly cogent the notion of affiliation, or acceptance, of individuals into the voluntary but competitive organisations of the Australian labour market. The notion of affiliation provides that organisations are cultural entities largely defined by who is granted affiliation, who is not, why and how; and, as cultural entities rather than (ideally) meritocratic vehicles of industry, informal and implicit rules of entry, exit and behaviour may also be identified (Ahrne 1994). Each organisation has its own culture, and the rules and behaviours of one are never identical to another, this focus upon individual human experience of culturally embedded and silently understood rules of affiliation is best explored through qualitative analysis.

Methodology: A Narrative Analytical Approach

As noted above, qualitative analysis is a significant aspect of this research in revealing individual human experience. However, beyond more revelation of experience, narrative analysis is significant in acknowledging that, and exploring how, individuals interpret and translate their experience into their ‘own’ words. This research employs recently emerging narrative analysis techniques that focus upon the life stories of research subjects. These techniques have been particularly useful in contemporary feminist studies which aim to render individual experience significant and to privilege the experiences of those who are otherwise marginalised or unheard (Reinharz 1992). This research specifically employs antenarrative analysis, recognising that ‘narratives’ involve structure, theme and resolutions, whereas ‘life stories’ are the raw material, the work in progress that precedes the construction of a formal narrative (Bertaux 1981; Turpin 1984; Cohler 1988; Riessman 1993; Rosenthal 1993; Stewart 1994; Atkinson 1998; Boje 2001). Antenarrative analysis acknowledges that many first-hand renditions of experience will wander, be unresolved, change over time and contain contradictions and misrepresentations. As much as possible, this research seeks to embrace and incorporate the process of how individuals make meaning from their life experiences, not merely to present neat summaries of those experiences.

Three types of antenarrative analysis are used in examining the life stories of KMW in this research. The first involves the identification and testing of grand narratives from current literature relevant to KMW. This is the most straightforward and predetermined form of antenarrative analysis, asking whether current understandings are supported or refuted by the life stories of this research sample and remaining firmly within the terms of those understandings. The second type of analysis involves examining microstoria that relevant to or ‘around’ the grand narratives, focusing less on direct support or refutation and more on the quality of related experience and its interpretation. Where grand narrative analysis asks if this is so, microstoria asks how this is understood and felt. The third type of analysis involves examining the life stories free of the conceptions of the grand narratives of the literature review to develop a new grand narrative, if possible, directly from life stories. Together these three analytical techniques provide an assessment of current literature, an explication of how particular experiences are understood and felt, and the identification of a new paradigm for discussing KMW in the Australian labour market.

To facilitate and make wieldier the antenarrative analysis, the sample group is subdivided into five smaller groups. The division of the sample group resists traditional taxonomies based upon human capital theory or statistical ease, such as groups defined by levels of qualifications of linguistic ability, age, visa category, recency of arrival or marital status. Rather than reiterating and reproducing these existing taxonomies, this study seeks to offer an alternative division of the group based upon human agency and individuality. These groups are defined in terms of the desire of KMW to participate in the Australian labour market. This recognises that not all KMW wish to participate in the Australian labour market and that non-participation should not necessarily be understood in terms of poor human capital value or affiliation failure. Rather, this research incorporates into its taxonomy a
resistance to the conception of labour market affiliation and participation as the primary form of recognition and realisation of much human endeavour. While this research seeks to explore the interpreted and less interpreted experiences of KMW in the Australian labour market, it does not aim to ‘solve the labour market problems’ of KMW or to promote full labour market participation for all KMW as necessarily desirable.

**Practices of Power and Narrative Analysis**

Narrative analysis focuses upon language as being not merely a technical device for establishing meaning, but a deep and subjective constitutive of reality (Riessman 1993; Czaniawska 1997). For Riessman (1993) narrative analysis, or the recognition of subjective construction of reality through language, aims to see how research subjects impose order upon and make sense of their flow of life experiences. Methodologically, narrative analysis examines each individual’s story, analysing the tools of construction, the linguistic and cultural resources drawn upon, and how it persuades the listener of its authenticity. Existing narrative regarding women in their home cultures of Korea and Australia are helpful here in recognising cultural resources for narrative construction.

Many writers describe research respondents as using narrative to make meaning from their lives by ordering and explaining events to themselves and others (Gee 1985; Mishler 1986; Bruner 1990). Riessman (1993: 3) claims that this is particularly the case where there ‘has been a breach between ideal and real, self and society’. In this way, narrative is often used as a way of expressing and even resolving inner conflicts and frustrations when life situations are not as expected or hoped. These include expectations to be supported financially, to take sole responsibility for children, to find a job in Australian worthy of her tertiary qualifications, and to be rewarded for diligent and obedient work or service. While these are generalised narratives, they offer a selection of available sources of potential conflict, frustration and resultant narrative sensemaking.

This is not to suggest that the individual therapeutic construction of narratives addresses and resolves all conflict between the ideal and real, self and society. Roth (1993) writes that despite the universality of the discourse form in explaining one’s problems to oneself, some experiences are difficult or impossible to speak of directly. Political conditions can impede the discussion of events and relationships, and the absence of social movements or the naming of injustices may mean that individuals do not connect with each other and galvanise into political action nor construct linguistic expressions of particular experiences. Herman (1992: 3) writes that a common response to atrocity is to banish it from one's awareness, and thereby from one's narratives. For Riessman (1993), narratives are useful in examining practices of power such as inequality and oppression that may not be recognised but taken for granted by individual narrators.

Finally, narrative analysis is interpretive, on the part of both the narrator and the researcher who facilitates the narrative, and focuses upon human agency rather than deterministic explanations of social phenomena. Riessman (1993: 5) writes:

Narrative analysis-and there no one method here-has to do with ‘how protagonists interpret things’ (Bruner 1990: 51), and we can go about systematically interpreting their interpretations. Because the approach gives prominence to human agency and imagination, it is well suited to studies of subjectivity and identity. It is inappropriate for topics and theories in which the characteristics of actors as active subjects remain unexplored or implicit but well suited to others, including symbolic interaction and feminist studies.

This is significant for this research in acknowledging that labour market participation constitutes a form of symbolic interaction and each KMW defines her own identity and human agency to some degree, in accordance with human capital theory, but within limits, in accordance with segmentation theory. These limits are set by cultural practices of power which are described below.

As noted above, narratives are useful for examining practices of power, many of which may be obscured by those in power (the dominant) to become invisible or unfathomable to all. As the dominated find difficulty in telling of their domination, narrative analysis that examines and reveals practices of power in their narratives must first be informed by an awareness of those practices. This section outlines the hitherto unarticulated practices of power and how they...
may be linked to the key factors of inequality for KMW in the Australian labour market. These are language; race, gender and culture; and organisation.

Language

Discourse analysis is an evolving technique for examining reality, expanding and with antecedents in sociocultural and sociolinguistic theory. In examining social reality, discourse analysis focuses upon how that social reality is produced. To do this, it focuses upon the role of language. Clegg (1989: 151) writes that:

In the broadest terms, language defines the possibilities of meaningful existence at the same time as it limits them. Through language, our sense of ourselves as distinct subjectivities in constituted. Subjectivity is constituted through a myriad of what post-structuralists term discursive practices: practices of talk, text, writing, cognition, argumentation, and representation generally.

Language provides both the medium of communication and the mode of domination of subcultures within the dominant culture. For Bourdieu (1991), language is widely regarded as an essential skill that binds society into an apparent whole and is necessary for inclusion. However, language also provides a basis for the justification of existing hierarchies, so that while it constitutes the criterion for inclusion, it is a conditional and stratified inclusion. The designation of the particular language of the dominant group as an essential skill obscures the practice of power of devaluing any other language. Thus the individuals without the dominant language are regarded as silent, difficult or impossible to include and outside the reasonable purview of communication. The greater the individual’s ability in the designated language, the harder it becomes to explain her exclusion, for which other practices of power, must come into play. The relationship is not one of rewarded linguistic skill but a description or rationalisation of levels of inclusion after the fact. Foucault (1976: 94) warns that power is not ‘acquired, seized or shared…but the immediate effects of,…divisions, inequalities and disequilibriums’. Skill in the designated language is thus regarded as a value-neutral justification of the level of inclusion of an individual that in fact disguises a practice of power.

Bourdieu (1991: 167) describes the ideological domination of subcultures through the medium of communication in a way that supports this argument.

The dominant culture contributes to the real integration of the dominant class (by facilitating the communication between all its members and by distinguishing them from other classes); it also contributes to the fictitious integration of society as a whole, and thus to apathy (false consciousness) of the dominated classes; and finally, it contributes to the legitimisation of the established order by establishing distinctions (hierarchies) and legitimating these distinctions. The dominant culture produces this ideological effect by concealing the function of communication: the culture which unifies (the medium of communication) is also the culture which separates (the instrument of distinction) and which legitimates distinctions by forcing all other cultures (designated a subcultures) to define themselves by their distance from the dominant culture.

In this way, the KMW who does not speak English is rendered silent and incommunicado, and little further justification is requires for her lack of inclusion in mainstream society of which the labour market is one feature. As noted above, labour market participation is a form of symbolic interaction that is manifest by acceptance, financial reward and the granting of particular working conditions and opportunities. The function of communication or, more correctly in this case, English is concealed as a measurable and necessary skill, and operates to allow or prevent entry into Australian labour market organisations. Where entry is allowed and the KMW appears to be accepted, issues of lack of substantive and total inclusion, recognition and opportunity ensure that the KMW is reminded that she is a member of a subculture at some distance from the dominant, Australian English-speaking culture. The dominant culture, as Bourdieu describes, measures different subcultures in terms of distance from itself, creating a hierarchy based upon proximity. Bourdieu writes (1991: 168) that the dominant class is the site of struggle over the hierarchy of the principles of hierarchisation. Dominant class factions, whose power rests on economic capital, aim to impose the legitimacy of their domination either through their own symbolic
production, or through the intermediary of conservative ideologies, who never really serve the interests of the dominant class except as a side-effect and who always threaten to appropriate for their own benefit the power to define the social world that they hold by delegation.

Seen in these terms, the reification of English language skills can thus be described as an act of expediency, to be used by the dominant class of English speaking Australia. Bourdieu (1991) refers to this as euphemised and ‘misrecognisable’, so that it is accepted as natural and justified by dominant and dominated groups alike. In this way, there is an unwitting collusion in and obfuscation of the practice of power between the powerful and the marginalised. It is therefore likely that KMW will reveal an awareness of the significance of English language skills for their labour market participation in Australia but will not perceive a practice of power, describe it as discriminatory or express any resistance to it. Rather, KMW may interpret a lack of (substantive) inclusion or acceptance as indicative of an absolute and essential need to further improve their English language skills.

This insistence upon English provides a ready explanation for existing taxonomies or hierarchies of people, usually migrants but also indigenous people, who speak more or less, similar or different, English. This includes, for example, the category of Non-English-Speaking Background (NESB) migrants. This hierarchy is expressed through the exclusion or the inclusion of people at designated levels. These levels are characterised in the labour market in the form of divisions of labour: by industry, type of work, hours and conditions, working environment, remuneration, access to representation and opportunities for progress and career. The literature review provides a narrative of industry representation and participation patterns of NESB migrants as necessarily poorer or lower than for mainstream, English-speaking Australians. The role of English in defining the group characterised as poorer and lower thus becomes self-perpetuating and the reason for the status of the group, both prescriptive and descriptive. Bourdieu (1991: 169) summarises this:

> internal systems of classification reproduce overt political taxonomies in misrecognisable forms, as well as the fact that the specific axiomatic of each specialised field is the transformed form (in conformity with the laws specific to the field) of the fundamental principles of the division of labour.

Classifications and taxonomies thus contain the seeds of their own disadvantage or advantage and create the names of ‘imagined communities’ (Anderson 1983) that are useful for descriptions that pose as explanations. KMW are, from the outset, described as ‘other’ than the mainstream in three ways: they are Korea, they are migrants and they are women. Three ready explanations of labour market disadvantage have thus been provided. In addition, they belong to the larger group of NESB migrants, providing another explanation in waiting. The use of narrative analysis to examine practices of power and render them visible assists in resisting the temptation to provide further data supporting self-fulfilling taxonomies.

**Race, Gender and Culture**

Race, gender and culture are common choices of ‘otherness’ from defined mainstream that serve to define and describe imagined communities. Barrett and McIntosh (1985: 35) write that

> Race and ethnicity are about difference. Sites of difference are also sites of power. Dominant representations of difference function to exclude and/or exploit, and to justify unequal access and valuing. Subordinate groups, on the other hand may use difference to mystify, to deny knowledge of themselves to the dominant groups and to confuse and neutralise those who attempt to control or ‘help’ them.

In providing a definition of difference and concomitant levels of inclusion or power in society, race, gender and culture are key elements in identity construction. In constructing an identity, an individual chooses and accepts behavioural patterns and power relationships without necessarily questioning those behaviours or relationships (Ellemers, Spear & Doosje 1999). For example, she might define herself first and foremost as Korean, or first and foremost as a woman, accepting all accompanying duties and restrictions without question by virtue as of the fact that she is a Korean woman, whatever that might entail. The biological or circumstantial fact is thus inscribed with the behavioural and power relations of social
invention. Narrative analysis offers an insight into the narrator’s identity construction and a tool for examining these accepted but unacknowledged practices of power.

As noted, a KMW may choose to describe herself first as a Korean or first as a woman, drawing upon a range of points of difference to explain her behaviour and position in society. Each individual may therefore order and weight alternative points of difference from the mainstream differently, constructing one possible identity from a spectrum of unique permutations from the same sources. Race, gender and culture are thus considered here together as point of difference and potential identity construction rather than specific sites of discrimination.

One of the more established and coherent theories of domination on the basis of race, gender and culture that is relevant to KMW is Orientalism. Said (1978) describes Oriental women as inferior, other and in need of corrective study by the West. He writes that

> Along with all other people variously designated as backward, degenerate, uncivilised, and retarded, the Orientals were viewed in a framework constructed out of biological determinism and moral-political admonishment. The Oriental was thus linked to elements in Western society (delinquents, the insane, women, the poor) having in common an identity best described as lamentably alien. Orientals were rarely seen or looked at; they were looked through, not analysed as a citizens or even people, but as problems to be solved or confined-or as the colonial powers openly coveted their territory-taken over. (Said 1978: 207)

Orientalism operates in the same way as the narrative of the literature review and is a system of knowledge by one group, the West, about another inferior and problematic group, the East. For Said (1978), there are two basic assumptions upon which Orientalist knowledge rests, one of which may be regarded as a truism and the other as a utilitarian necessity in the practice of power. The first is that the West and the East are ‘irredeemably different’ and knowledge is produced in order to interpret that difference. The second is that knowledge production should serve economic and other purposes of the knowledge producer.

The West approaches the East, attempting to interpret it, while the East remains relatively silent, creating and reinforcing the Western perception of the East as impenetrable, mystical and unfathomable. This suggests that from the West’s perspective, the Oriental must learn to communicate the Western way, in Western cultural values and behaviours, because it is unthinkable that Westerners can really learn the ways of the East. The knowledge gained by Western interpretation is then appropriated in civil society by the administrative, the military and the economic, including dominant masculine paradigms of the labour market. The result is a relationship in which the Orient is either the outsider or the ‘incorporated weak partner for the West’ (Said 1978: 208).

For Foucault (1977) and Gramsci (1971), civil society is the site of consensual domination, seduction rather than rape. Civil society houses culture, in which some ideas, fashions and paradigms are given precedence over others not by decree but by mutual consent. Cultural hegemony is defined as ‘domination achieved by engineering consensus through controlling the content of cultural forms and major institutions’ (Jary & Jary 1991: 271). Gramsci (1971) is concerned less with the *apparatus* of state repression and more with ‘the way that consent of the subordinate sectors of society is “solicited” in the domain of “civil society” through such channels as education and cultural practices’ (Moore-Gilbert 1997: 37). Narrative analysis may be used to gain an insight into this solicitation of consent by KMW.

**Conclusion**

This paper has outlined the utility of narrative analysis in examining the human agency of the marginalised individual rather than the generalised and imagined group. It has identified the KMW as a marginalised individual inadequately represented in existing literature addressing larger groups or by other, less revealing research methods. The paper has described how narrative analysis is helpful in examining the practices of power and domination often hidden and silently agreed to, and how they are experienced and understood. These practices of power include the role of language as both the mode of communication and domination, the role of race, gender and culture as the hallmarks of difference and therefore social exclusion, and the relevance of theories of marginalisation and (non-) affiliation of Orientalism and organisational studies. The KMW is identified as attempting to become affiliated with
Australian labour market organisations that may refuse her through practices of power based upon language, race, culture and gender. The paper has defined the life story as the most fruitful focus of research for examining the labour market experiences of KMW, and identified two forms of antenarrative analysis for application in this study: grand narrative and microstoria.

References


O’Loughlin, T. & I. Watson (1997) Loyalty is a One Way Street: NESB Immigrants and Long Term Unemployment, ACIRRT(Australian Centre for Industrial Relations Research and Training), Sydney.


VandenHeuvel, A. & M. Wooden (1999) New settlers have their say: How immigrants fare over the early years of settlement: an analysis of data from the three waves of the Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Australia, Canberra: Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs.


Appraisal Analysis as a Critical Discourse Research Method: the Study of Hong Kong English Extensive Reading Texts®

On Kei Lee
University of Sydney

Abstract
This paper reports a critical discourse study of the Hong Kong English Extensive Reading Scheme. The extensive reading scheme involves learners reading a large quantity of reading materials, fiction and non-fiction books, according to their interests and linguistic competence (The Curriculum Development Council, 1995). The reading materials used in the extensive reading scheme are recommended by the Education and Manpower Bureau (2005). These reading materials were originally written for the general public and have been selected for use as learning materials under the extensive reading scheme for junior secondary school students. In this paper, three sample representation texts, two fiction books and one non-fiction book from the extensive reading program were studied. By studying the political and cultural values contained in the reading materials, my research aims to draw implications for raising teachers’ awareness of the cultural and political values inherent in the reading materials and propose the need for having pedagogy that supports the critical approach of teaching in the curriculum.

In terms of methodology, my original research covers both micro and macro analysis. However, this paper is drawn from research in progress. It only focuses on microanalysis. It is an example of how critical discourse analysis uses systemic functional linguistics for textual analysis. Appraisal analysis as an analytical method used in systemic functional linguistics contains three basic options, attitude, amplification and source (Martin & Rose, 2003). Attitude in appraisal analysis was used to study the selected extensive reading texts in this paper, aiming to identify the value positions of the writers as well as the implied value positions of the curriculum planners. In order for the researcher to practice appraisal analysis, the researcher’s interdiscursivity is employed. Interdiscursivity plays an important role in this paper. It refers to the researcher’s background as a Chinese English learner growing up in Hong Kong. The interdiscursive position that I hold as researcher has highlighted my awareness of the importance of critical discourse analysis.

Hong Kong English Extensive Reading Scheme
The Hong Kong English Extensive Reading Scheme is part of the English education curriculum for students in Hong Kong junior secondary schools. Students in the extensive reading scheme are recommended to read books extensively along with their interests and linguistic competence. The objectives of the extensive reading scheme are to develop effective reading skills, promote ‘reading to learn’ culture and inculcate an attitude of independent and lifelong learning amongst Hong Kong students (The Curriculum Development Council, 2002).

To facilitate the teaching of Hong Kong English Extensive Reading scheme, a wide range of activities is employed, including quizzes, story-telling competitions, writing competitions, book exhibitions, writing book reports and oral presentations (The Curriculum Development Council, 2002). General reading skills are taught in the
extensive reading lessons such as:

- Previewing—study the title and the cover and examine the list of contents or chapter headings;
- Predicting—predict the plots of the book by looking at linguistic clues, for example, connectors, sequencers, punctuation and grammar;
- Guessing unknown words—look at the visual support, suffix or prefix and then guess the meaning of the unknown words;
- Disregarding—disregard unfamiliar words, phrases and expressions that do not affect the global understanding of the book;
- Interacting and making interpretations—discuss the issue by role play or drama.

(The Curriculum Development Council, 1995, pp.19-21)

However, the suggested reading skills only focus on reading speed and reading quantity without the teaching of critical close reading of text. Simply providing a large amount of reading materials and teaching some general reading skills to students is not adequate. As Christie (2002) said,

Language is never neutral, for it is necessarily involved in the realization of values and ideologies, just as it serves to realize such values and ideologies, it also serves to silence others (p. 7).

Reading is a way of establishing patterns of thinking (Freebody & Luke, 1990; Norton & Stein, 1995). If students are not taught the methods of critical reading in the Hong Kong Extensive Reading Scheme, they will fall into lifelong positioning rather than lifelong learning. It can be fairly dangerous. I propose that English teachers have to teach students learning how to interpret texts critically.

**Reading texts in the extensive reading scheme**

Hong Kong has been a British colony for 99 years. Before 1997 (the handover to China), the reading materials and supporting materials of the extensive reading scheme were supported by the Edinburgh Project on Extensive Reading (EPER) of the University of Edinburgh. These reading materials were all written in English by Westerners from various cultural contexts. Since 1997, a small amount of reading materials from Chinese contexts has been added to the Hong Kong English Extensive Reading Scheme. Most of the current set reading materials are written in English by Westerners from various cultural contexts in different genres and supplied by different publishers (Education and Manpower Bureau, 2005). These reading materials were written originally for general public but they are now graded into different levels to suit the abilities of the students (readers aged roughly 12 to 14) and recommended for the teaching of Hong Kong Extensive Reading for Hong Kong junior secondary school (Education and Manpower Bureau, 2005). Auerbach (1995, p. 9) said,

Pedagogical choices about curriculum development, content, materials, classroom processes, and language use, although appearing to be informed by apolitical professional considerations, are, in fact, inherently ideological in nature, with significant implications for learners’ socioeconomic roles.

The process of book selection is an exercise of power because it involves choice. In the process of book selection, the curriculum planners and teachers may limit or constrain the ideologies that the students will experience. In critical discourse analysis, power can be practiced deliberately or undeliberately by people. “For CDA, language is not powerful on its own—it gains power by the use of powerful people makes of it” (Wodak, 2001, p. 10). Sometimes, people may be unaware that they are exercising their power in making their decisions but power does exist. Power is an inevitable effect of a way particular discursive configurations or arrangements.
privilege the status and positions of some people over others.” Locke (2004, p. 1).

Kress (1990, p. 86) made a reasonable argument that “Linguistics features, at any level, in their occurrence in texts are always characterized by opacity; language itself is an opaque medium and so, consequently, are texts”. This research studies texts from the Hong Kong English Extensive Reading Scheme and the curriculum support documents in the context of teaching English as a second language to Hong Kong junior secondary school students aiming to draw implications for raising teachers’ awareness of the cultural and political values inherent in the reading materials and propose the need for having pedagogy that supports the critical approach of teaching in the curriculum. The cultural value found in the Hong Kong English Extensive Reading materials may well represent the identity of the curriculum planners and the teachers as Hong Kong Chinese going through the complex historical situation.

**Appraisal analysis**

There is no consistent method in doing critical discourse research. The differences of methodologies mainly depend on the particular needs of the research and the sets of research data. My doctoral thesis covers both micro and macro analysis. Nevertheless, this paper is drawn from research in progress. It focuses on microanalysis. It is an example of how critical discourse analysis uses appraisal analysis in systemic functional linguistics for textual analysis. Three sample representation texts (two fiction books and one non-fiction book) from the extensive reading program were studied. They were *Charlie the Chocolate Factory* by Roald Dahl, *Appollo 13* by Dina Anastasio and *Helen Keller’s Teacher* by Margaret Davidson.

Appraisal analysis belongs to the system of interpersonal meanings in systemic functional linguistics. It contains three basic options, including attitude, amplification and source (Martin, 2003, p. 25). Attitude in appraisal analysis was used to study the selected extensive reading texts in this paper, aiming to identify the value positions of the writers as well as the implied value positions of the curriculum planners. Attitude can be divided into affect, judgment and appreciation; which is used to evaluate feelings. Martin (2003, p.25) referred “resources for expressing feelings as affect, resources for judging character as judgment and resources for valuing the worth of things as appreciation.”

The study of affect is significant in this research because it can help us understand the overall evaluative stance (positive or negative values) of the text-producers and the text-selectors of the Hong Kong English Extensive Reading Scheme. Affect is concerned with emotional responses (e.g. happy, sad, fear etc.) and physical expression which indicates emotional responses (e.g. laugh, cry, smile etc). People’s feelings can be construed as either positively (e.g. happy) or negatively (e.g. sad) (Martin, 2000, p.7; White, 1998, p. 32). See examples of affect analysis in Table 1.

To practice appraisal analysis, it is relevant to understand the content of the reading texts. For example, *Charlie the Chocolate Factory* is a story about people trying to win five golden tickets wrapped in the Wonka Chocolate bars so that they could visit Mr. Wonka’s Chocolate Factory. The first two finders and the first golden tickets are interpreted as positive affects (happiness) because people in the story had very high expectation on finding the tickets (see Table 1).

*Appollo 13* is a story about astronauts visiting the moon. The writer started the story by mentioning the America astronaut, Neil Armstrong, as the first person landing the moon. People watched Neil Armstrong on television. They laughed and shouted. The action of the people is positively evaluated because the people were very interested in the news that human beings can successfully visit the moon (see Table 1).

*Helen Keller’s Teacher* is a biography of a person who became a famous teacher of a girl, Helen Keller. Annie (Helen Keller’s teacher) was walking with her father and she
behaved well so her father decided to buy her a hat. Annie’s father patted her shoulder before getting into the shop. The action of patting Annie’s shoulder is a positive affect because Annie’s father’s was satisfied with her performance (see Table 1).

**Table 1: Affect**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSCRIPTION</th>
<th>EMOTOR</th>
<th>AFFECT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The First Two Finders</td>
<td>The author</td>
<td>Happiness: satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the first golden ticket</td>
<td>The author</td>
<td>Happiness: satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gone wild with excitement</td>
<td>People in the town</td>
<td>Happiness: satisfaction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Extract of analysis from *Charlie the Chocolate Factory***

According to the content of *Charlie the Chocolate Factory*, Augustus Gloop, one of the golden ticket holders is evaluated negatively. The writer was trying to establish a negative image of him throughout the story. His being fat is always associated with foolishness, greedy, lazy and ignorance. He has negative capacity (see Table 2).

In *Appollo 13*, the writer always established the image of the astronauts and people working in the Appollo 13 project, such as the astronauts working very hard in the team. The only time that negative capacity mentioned is that the astronaut was tired because he worked too hard (see Table 2).

Statia hardly ever said anything worth listening to anyway. Table 2 refers to Annie’s negative judgment of her cousin. It is an internal thought of Annie. Annie thought that Statia’s words were not worth listening because there were no content in her words. In other words, Statia was a person with low capacity and she did not deserve to be respected.
Table 2: Judgement

Extract of analysis from Charlie the Chocolate Factory

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSCRIPTION/EVOCATION</th>
<th>APPRAISER</th>
<th>JUDGEMENT</th>
<th>APPRAISED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>enormously fat</td>
<td>The author</td>
<td>- capacity</td>
<td>Augustus Gloop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(lazy, stupid, greedy)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>had been blown up with a powerful pump</td>
<td>The author</td>
<td>-capacity</td>
<td>Augustus Gloop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(spoiled, lazy, stupid, greedy)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great flabby folds of fat bulged like a monstrous ball of dough</td>
<td>The author</td>
<td>-capacity</td>
<td>Augustus Gloop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(lazy, stupid, greedy)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with two small greedy curranty eyes peering out upon the world</td>
<td>The author</td>
<td>-capacity</td>
<td>Augustus Gloop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(not intelligent, know nothing about the world)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Extract of analysis from Apollo 13

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSCRIPTION/EVOCATION</th>
<th>APPRAISER</th>
<th>JUDGEMENT</th>
<th>APPRAISED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;But he's our command module pilot,&quot; said Jim.</td>
<td>Jim</td>
<td>+ capacity</td>
<td>He</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ken always worked hard in the simulator.</td>
<td>The author</td>
<td>+ tenacity</td>
<td>Ken</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;I'm tired,&quot; said Jim.</td>
<td>Jim</td>
<td>-capacity</td>
<td>I</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Extract of analysis from Helen Keller’s Teacher

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSCRIPTION/EVOCATION</th>
<th>APPRAISER</th>
<th>JUDGEMENT</th>
<th>APPRAISED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Statia hardly ever said anything worth listening to anyway.</td>
<td>(Annie)</td>
<td>- capacity</td>
<td>Statia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Though the thought of your being quiet and well-behaved for entire day .... At least no tantrums. Hear?&quot;</td>
<td>(Statia)</td>
<td>-propriety</td>
<td>(Annie)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The study of appreciation is useful in reflecting text-producers’ beliefs towards certain objects. Appreciation is the evaluations of objects, processes and states of affairs. There are three categories within appreciation, namely, reaction (the assessment of the emotional impact of a phenomenon), composition (the assessment of the form or composition of a phenomenon) and valuation (the assessment of the worth or significance of the phenomenon) (Martin, 2000; Martin & Rose, 2003). See examples of appreciation analysis in Table 3.

Golden ticket in Charlie the Chocolate Factory is something that everybody dreamt of. The word “gold” also signals something expensive. Therefore, it is positively evaluated (see Table 3).

A moon rock is a special rock because it is uncommon (see Table 3). Since it is uncommon, it has very high value. Therefore, it is positively evaluated.

A one-way journey to somewhere is negatively evaluated (see Table 3). It is because no one likes to have a one-way journey. It implies that there is no hope because a person cannot go back to his or her journey again.

Table 3: Appreciation
Interdiscursivity in appraisal analysis

Interdiscursivity plays an important role in appraisal analysis. Appraisal analysis is concerned with the negotiation of social relationship by expressing one’s feelings towards things and people (Martin & Rose, 2003). In other words, appraisal analysis is concerned with solidarity. Solidarity negotiates around value positions through attitudinal assessments or beliefs about the nature of the world (White, 2002). It is my view that the word “negotiate” in Martin and Rose and White’s views on appraisal analysis is very important. The word “negotiate” implies that there is no definite way of interpreting or understanding value positions and beliefs. The difference in text interpretation is heavily related to the readers’ interdiscursivity. I refer “interdiscursivity” to the intricate relationship of text and different Discourses (diverse social and cultural backgrounds of the readers).

Reading is the readers’ construction of meaning from a printed or written form. To construct meaning, a reader connects information from the written message with previous knowledge, including the knowledge of the language, the knowledge of the reading subject and the knowledge of the world (Day & Bamford, 1998). Hartman (1992, p. 302) said,

The meaning that the reader constructs form the text is never a direct transfer of copy from the author or the text, but is mediated, transformed by some set of implied or explicit rules for establishing the horizon, or interpretive possibilities, for the text.

As a reader decodes meaning by generating intertextual links among textual resources to fit a particular context, the context of the reader may affect the way that he or she interprets the text. Therefore, it is significant to consider the content of the reading materials (the coherence of the text as a whole) as well as the interdiscursive position of the readers practicing appraisal analysis. In this research, the interdiscursive position that I hold as a Chinese Hong Kong English second language learner growing up in Hong Kong is discussed.

Being fat is construed negatively in Charlie the Chocolate Factory (see Table 2). However, being fat can be interpreted positively and negatively in Hong Kong.

We called a fat person發福 (fei fuk), literally means growing fat. 福 (fuk) refers to “blessing, happiness, good luck, prosperity, regarded as corresponding to one’s
character or destiny" (Lin, 2005). We believe that a fat person is always very lucky. People sometimes associate a fat person with a highly-placed official (達官, tat koon) and we called a government post as 肥缺 (fei kuet), a fat position that helps a person earns lots of money. However, a lot of people in Hong Kong like to keep fit nowadays. Being fat means unhealthy and lazy because a fat person does not like to do exercise. This is an example of how the change of culture can affect a reader’s reading interpretation.

First is associated positively in Charlie the Chocolate Factory (see Table 1). Being the first can be positively and negatively evaluated in Hong Kong culture. We have a saying, 快人一步, 理想達到 (fai yan yat po, li sheung tat tao), which means if you do things faster than others, your dream will come true. We have a phrase, 捷足先登 (chit chuk sin tan), which means “fast, quick, nimble, smart: victory to the swift-footed” (Lin, 2005). However, being the first one is not always associated with positive values. We also have a slang, 行先死先 (Hang sin sai sin), which means when you walk fast or being the first one to take action; you will be the first one to die or scarily. In this case, there is a need to consider the context of situation in interpretation the text.

Do not care much is interpreted negatively in Helen Keller’s Teacher (See Table 1). However, a lot of young people in Hong Kong love to hold their carefree attitudes, which are not necessarily interpreted negatively. Some people think that it is “cool” to be carefree. A lot of young people like to say 無所謂 (Mo saw wai), which means do not matter when they are asked where they would like to go to have a movie or dinner or lunch. Perhaps Hong Kong people just want to be modest in Chinese culture. It does not mean that we are not interested but we deliberately choose not to voice out our opinions.

Patting a person’s shoulder is interpreted positively in Helen Keller’s Teacher (See Table 1). However, in Hong Kong, if you pat somebody’s shoulder, it can mean cursing a person so that he or she will be very unlucky and cannot win money in gambling. Although it sounds superstitious, a lot of Hong Kong people still avoid patting others’ shoulders on horse racing days.

Conclusion

No analytical approach is perfect. Critical discourse analysis is scrappy. Fowler (1996, p. 8) commented, “Demonstrations [of CDA tend] to be fragmentary, exemplificatory and they usually take too much for granted in the way of method and context”. Fowler’s comment is understandable because there is no standard tool in critical discourse analysis.

As a proponent of critical discourse analysis, I hope to bring changes to socio-political practices and structures that support the discursive practices. Critical discourse analysis perceives language as a form of social practice. It draws attention to power imbalances and injustices in text by investigating meaning, context and the ways that ideology functions behind texts. Stubbs (1997) explained, “Textual interpretations of critical linguists are politically rather than linguistically motivated” (p.102). Appraisal analysis is subjective because different people may interpret the same text differently. However, any kinds of analysis to a certain extend is subjective.

Critical discourse analysis is an effective technique employed to raise teachers’ awareness of cultural and societal values inherent in the English reading materials contained in the Extensive Reading Scheme. Appraisal analysis can be a useful research method in locating the ideologies constructed in text.
References


The use of interactional resources in argumentative/persuasive essays (APEs) by tertiary ESL students: a critical perspective

Sook Hee Lee
University of Sydney

Abstract
This paper reports on one aspect of the interpersonal resources of English termed 'interactional' as deployed by two East-Asian international students (EAS) at the undergraduate level in argumentative/persuasive essays (APEs). Interactional resources are basically concerned with the writers' 'command' strategies of 'shouldness' operating at both clause complexes level and across clause complexes level from a perspective between writer and reader interaction. The purpose of the analysis is to examine how their construction of the interactional meaning contributes to the success of their APEs in order to address the issues of the Asian students' lack of critical voice with formality in their writing. A high-graded essay (HGE) will be compared with a low-graded essay (LGE) in terms of the writers' various interactional positions adopted in their writing. The theoretical bases of the description of interactional resources are derived from the work of Iedema (1995, 1997, 2003, 2004) and Martin (1992b, 1995, 2003) formulated within a Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) framework (Halliday, 1994; Halliday & Matthiessen, 2004). The academic grade-based differences are interpreted from mainly critical literacy (Fairclough, 1992, 2001). The analysis reveals significant differences in the extent to which writers make interactional choices expressing 'command' both within clause complexes level and across clause complexes level. These differences are reflected in the use of both strategies of involvement by mitigating command and strategies displaying distance by showing formality. Educational and theoretical implications will be discussed in teaching APEs in EAP (English for Academic Purposes) courses.

Introduction
Background
Arguing for and against a certain proposition is one of the most frequent and important kinds of assignments set in university (Connor et al., 1987; Crowhurst, 1991; Johns, 1993; Knudson, 1994). Although argumentative/persuasive essays are a central assessment item, most undergraduate students, particularly, students from East-Asian backgrounds experience the most severe difficulties in APEs (Kamimura and Oi, 1998; Arsyad, 2000; Hirose, 2003). One of the main reasons for the difficulties that EAS student encounter in arguing a case is attributable to their lack of audience awareness. Many scholars claim that audience variables play a significant role in producing successful academic writing (Kirsch and Roen, 1990; Grabe and Kaplan; 1996; Thompson, 2001; Burgess, 2002; Swales and Feak, 2004; Casanave, 2004; Paltridge, 2004). Particularly, a writer's sense of audience and purpose is important to the effectiveness of argumentative writing (Bradbury and Quinn, 1991; Johns, 1993, 1997; Schriver, 1992; Thompson, 2001). Problems become intensified by the fact that the writer has to deal with a "distant audience" (Peters, 1986:169). This conflicting nature of writing is a crucial area of difficulty for EAS.
Lack of audience awareness is manifested in the two main difficulties that EAS students...
experience from a linguistic perspective: structural components of the discourse level of argument structure, and interpersonal components of language features such as, grammar of mood, modality, evaluative language, metadiscoursal language\textsuperscript{14} or conversationality, intertextual relations, and formality. Problems associated with the interpersonal components can focus down two main areas of complaints that have been made by academic staff about international students: lack of critical/authentic voice, and lack of formality.

Rationale and the significance of the study

This paper attempts to address the linguistic realisation of a writer’s degree of audience awareness and the issues of the lack of critical voice with formality in APEs. The integrative theoretical framework proposed to capture the writer’s interaction with the reader through linguistic clues is the Australia genre-based approach, metaphorical realisation of command being recently formulated within mood system of SFL (Iedema et al., 1994; Iedema, 1995, 1997, 2003, 2004; Martin, 1992b, 1995). Command realisations are a functional model of major interpersonal meanings at the level of discourse semantics\textsuperscript{15}. The theory of command realisations has recently emerged from ‘Write it Right’ project (Iedema et al., 1994, Write it Right, 1996). The description of metaphorical realisations of commands have been developed both at the genre and the clause level in the memo and letters genre written in a bureaucratic administration (Iedema, 1995; Iedema, 1997, 2003, 2004). An APE is, in a sense, a directive genre, which mainly involves the discourse semantics of command, as APE’s main purpose is to tell readers to assent to the writers’ views or positions. For example, in my context, ‘universities in Australia ‘should’ learn from other intellectual traditions’. In an APE, those commands are realised as interpersonal metaphors of mood and modulation, i.e. obligation in statements. Few studies including studies in ‘interaction in writing’ have made an attempt to apply metaphorical realisations of command in APEs both within clause complexes level and across clause complexes level by incorporating a perspective of writer and reader interaction.

Theoretical frameworks

Systemic relations to discourse structure

One of the recent developments in SFL is that text-contexts systemic relations can also occur not only to systems but also to discourse structure (Halliday, 1982, Matthiessen, 1988; Martin, 1992b, 1995, 2003). That is, the ideational function (experiential, logical) is organised by particulate structure (part/whole of the orbital structure, part/part of the serial structure), the interpersonal function by prosodic structure and the textual function by periodic structure. Prosodic structure means that meaning spreads itself across the constituent structure over repetition. Scholars such as Martin (1995) and Iedema (1997) further argue that the concept of schematic structure aligns with particulate structure, which leads to its being experientially biased so that the schematic structure needs to be incorporated into other structuring principles. Therefore, the global text structure can be interpreted from the interpersonal perspective as well.

The metaphorical realisation of commands in directive genres

Drawing on Halliday’s discussion of metaphors of modulation and metaphors of mood, and also the homology between clause and text, Iedema (1995, 1997, 2000, 2003, 2004) describes the discourse of control in a bureaucratic organisation in relation to the interpersonal contexts of power/status and solidarity of contact and familiarity. He stresses that members of organisations must deploy linguistic resources in controlling others. At the level of grammar, these resources are referred to as commands. At the level of genre, these resources are referred to as directives. Directives can be defined as comprising at least one command (Iedema, 2004).

Iedema (1995, 2004) postulates two main principles that guide his consideration of commands and directives. The first principle is concerned with organisational positioning that

\textsuperscript{14} Textual and interpersonal language features that help readers to organise, to interpret and to evaluate propositional content (Crismore et al., 1993).

\textsuperscript{15} Three major interpersonal meaning developed in SFL are: Involvement, Negotiation and Appraisal (Martin, 1997). Command is one of four speech functions (offer, command, statement, question) within Negotiation.
affects the way must-ness or modulation is realised. The second principle is concerned with the level of familiarity that affects the way the ideational dimension of the command is realised. Iedema (1995:122) refers to the two principles as “status-contact configuration” (see Figures 1 and 2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interpersonal context</th>
<th>Commanding ‘down’ (+status)</th>
<th>Commanding ‘up’ (-status)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Text</td>
<td>Command Directness</td>
<td>Background/Legitimation Directness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Command</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Foregrounding</td>
<td>Backgrounding / Legitimation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clause</td>
<td>Directness</td>
<td>Indirectness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Give me a hand with this, I can’t do it alone.</td>
<td>[I can’t do this alone could you] give me a hand with this?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 1 Two types of command both at the clause and the text (after Iedema, 2004)*

*Figure 2 Status and contact configuration in APEs (Iedema, 1993:65, modified examples)*

With regard to the first principle, the generic structure of directives may reveal the writer’s positioning, depending on how soon or late the command appears in the document. That is, there are two basic types of command, depending on how much the command is ‘backgrounded’ or ‘foregrounded’. The essence of command, its must-ness, can be delayed until later at the clause or it can be placed up front. This foregrounding and backgrounding of command occurs at the text level as well (see Figure 1). Iedema (1995, 2004) further argues that the way commands are realised relates to social status. High status people tend to command ‘down’ using direct/congruent commands such as imperatives, while low status
workers tend to command ‘up’, using more indirect/incongruent commands (see Figure 1).

The second important principle used for understanding the domain of compliance is the degree of implicitness in interaction, which relates to ‘contact’ (see Figure 2). Contact refers to the degree of institutional knowledge interactants have of each other or of others. This knowledge is established on the basis of a particular frequency of institutional interaction, or ‘routinisation’. Low routinisation (-contact) will involve the need for relatively more explicit realisations, presuming less contextual knowledge, than high routinisation (+contact) (Iedema, 1995:122). Therefore, high routinisation means not only more implicitness, but also increased linguistic economy. Implicitness results from high levels of organisational routinisation, or high levels of contact and familiarity among workers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implicit (congruent)</th>
<th>Subjective</th>
<th>Ideaationalising the must-ness</th>
<th>Objective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UA should learn</td>
<td>UA is required to learn</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shifting modal responsibility</td>
<td>Turning passive voice into a middle voice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I want UA to learn</td>
<td>It is required that UA learn</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distributing modal responsibility</td>
<td>Institutionalising need</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From a linguistic perspective, ‘subjective implicit’ modulation thus involves simple grammar, while ‘objective explicit’ modulation involves more complex and abstract realisation. The explicit objective metaphors of modulation code the highest degree of institutional routinisation.

Demodulation and demodalisation

Iedema describes those processes involved in mood and modality metaphors as the concept of ‘demodulation’ and ‘demodalisation’. According to Iedema (2003, 2004), demodulation is achieved by what is called ‘time-space distanciation’. Distancing is achieved by the deletion of the agent of the commander and commandee. Time-space distanciated constructions go through “demodulated process” (Iedema, 1995, 1997, 2000:51). Time–space distanciated constructions create a presumed high degree of contextual knowledge and construct organisational familiarity. (Iedema, 2004). Iedema (1995, 1997, 2000) refers to this linguistic-semiotic process as a ‘demodalisation process’. Demodalisation means that modality (both maybe-ness and must-ness) is dislocated from the here and now by embedding and nominalisation.

Literature reviews

Most studies on command or request in written mode, i.e. directive genre, have focused on the clause level of analysis (Thompson and Thetela, 1995; Murcia-Belsa, 2000; Marley, 2000; Al-Sharief, 2001; Whittaker, 2000; Lavid, 2000; Hyland, 2002; Cook and Liddicoat, 2002). Few key scholars in SFL have explored written command both at the clause and at the genre level (Martin and Eggins, 2001). Major relevant work in relation to the use of command in writing has been carried out by Martin (1992b) under the terms ‘macro-proposal’ and ‘proposal’. The

---

Iedema (1994) identifies three main aspects of administrative practice: guidance, surveillance, and compliance. Those texts that effect compliance are referred to as directives.
notions of proposal and exchange structure were initially used in relation to spoken text at the clause level. Martin expands the clause level of proposal and the exchange move (spoken command) into the genre level of proposal. The macro-proposal is the main request form of the proposal, manifested in extended written text. He demonstrates how a request—a proposal (demanding goods and services)—is realised prosodically several times in the written advertisement text (in this case, fundraising).

Eggins and Martin (2001) seem to be the only researchers who explore Iedema’s (1995, 1997) realisations of commands at the genre level. In this study, command is considered as a stage of the schematic structure at the genre level. The command stage, which includes directive imperatives as an obligatory stage, is investigated in relation to supporting stages such as enablements and legitimisation. Enablements are stages which provide necessary information or procedures for the achievement of the command. Legitimisations offer incentives and justifications for complying. In Eggins and Martin’s (2001) study, the genre level of the command is explored in relation to the particulate structure of schematic structure as well as the prosodic realisation. Even though command has been explored at the genre level, the command has not been explored from an interpersonal perspective of genre. Further, command realisations have not been explored within the distinction between proposals and propositions at the discourse semantic level.

An analytical framework

The term ‘interactional’ consists of three main resources in this study: INTERpersonal, Interpersonal structure, and the textual distribution of commands. Hinted from Martin’s (1992) distinction between ‘interpersonal’ to indicate ‘acting on the world’ (e.g. speech function) and ‘interpersonal’ to ‘reacting to the world’ (e.g. evaluation), the term INTERpersonal is used for metaphorical commands that are realised within clause complexes level: metaphors of mood and modulation. Interpersonal structure includes generic structures from the perspective of interpersonal relevance and dialogic structure which explores the more delicate exploration of proposals in relation to the supporting elements of propositions. The textual distribution of commands involves exploring the theme-relevant construction of the proposals across schematic stages.

Research questions

Based on the literature reviews and research purposes addressed in the beginning, one main question and four sub-questions were raised.

What are the differences between HGEs and LGEs with regard to their deployment of the resources of mood and modality (modulation) to realise interactional relationships with the reader?

1. What are the differences between HGEs and LGEs in the proportion of different kinds of metaphorical commands deployed?
2. What are the differences between HGEs and LGEs in the proportion of metaphorical commands for which there are propositions that justify or enable what is being commanded?
3. What are the differences between HGEs and LGEs in the ways in which the writers use informational propositions to support proposals and where the proposals occur in relation to propositions in different schematic stages?
4. What are the differences between HGEs and LGEs in the types of proposals included

Iedema (1997) uses the term ‘legitimation’, while Eggins and Martin (2001) use the term ‘legitimisation’. However, both terms are the same. In this study, I use the term ‘legitimation’.

Different scholars in different disciplines use the term ‘interactional’ differently. Scholars in interaction in writing (e.g. Thompson, 2001) use this term to indicate all interpersonal systems such as mood, modality and evaluative language, while scholars in SFL including Hyland (2004) use this term to indicate mood systems only.
in the essays?

**Methodology**

**Data collection and the nature of data**

Participants comprised six EAS students and six Australian-born native speakers of English students (ABS). In this paper, two students from East-Asian countries were selected for comparison. The demographic information for the two students is described in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2 Demographic information of the students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAS 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAS 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EAS 1 is a HGE which refers to the essays that received distinction point above D or score 80, while EAS 2 is a LGE which defined as those that received below C, such as P and F. The site for data collection was English for Academic Purposes class in the Modern Language Program offered by a regional university in southern New South Wales. Throughout the semester, they completed four major assignments which were linked in terms of writing skills development. The final assignment four is selected for data analysis. The final assignment in this study aimed particularly to develop critical writing skills and the ability to construct an APE. The title of the APE is: "universities in Australia can learn not only from Western Intellectual Traditions but also from those of other cultures in order to meet the challenge of 21st century. Discuss" In this study, APEs is equivalent to analytical exposition in SFL, which presents only one side of an issue. Analytical exposition moves through four distinct stages: Identification or Background, Thesis, Series of Arguments, and Reinforcement, or Recommendation.

**Data analysis procedures**

In order to address the four research questions, the following data analysis procedures were adopted.

1. Analyses of command within clause complexes level

The first step is to identify and classify commands according to the criteria set out below. In this study, nine types of the metaphorised commands were identified from Metaphors of mood (six) and modulation (three). All commands are considered from high (didactic) to low (less didactic) value and from being personal (informal) to being impersonal (formal).

Metaphors of mood include: 1) 'If constructions'; 2) 'Negative command' (will not, without, etc.); 3) 'Projected command' (e.g. order, demand, request, recommend, etc); 4) 'Offer forms' (e.g. offer, give, provide, contribute, present, etc); 5) 'Non-finite clause' (e.g. by the use of the participle in the -ing form, etc) and 6) 'Declarative hint'. Metaphors of modulation include: 1) congruent modulation of the 'modal verbs' (e.g. must, need, should, have to, ought to, can, etc.); 2) 'Passive verb predicator' (e.g. is required, is obliged, is supposed, is allowed, is to, is encouraged, etc) and 3) 'Incongruent modulation of adjectives' (e.g. necessary, compulsory, obligatory, important, essential, significant, crucial, central, effective, helpful, useful, responsible, etc.) and 'nouns' (e.g. need, necessity, and requirement, importance, advantage, etc.)

2 Analyses of command across clause complexes level

---

19 In SFL, persuasive texts consist of three main genres in the academic context: analytical exposition, discussion and challenge (Write it Right, 1996).
2.1 Generic structure from an interpersonal perspective

The second step of the interactional analyses thus is that generic structure and staging are reinterpreted in interpersonal terms (see Table 3).

Table 3 Argument structure from an interpersonal perspective

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generic structure (particulate structure)</th>
<th>Interpersonal structures (prosodic structure)</th>
<th>Interpersonal systems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Across clause complexes level</td>
<td>Within clauses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Generic structure</td>
<td>Dialogic structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discourse</td>
<td>Textual distribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identification</td>
<td>Seeking Attention (Background)</td>
<td>Look, universities in Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thesis</td>
<td>Clarifying Services Demanded (Command)</td>
<td>Proposals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Series of arguments</td>
<td>Make and Justify Demands (Command) Legitimation 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Proposals and Propositions</td>
<td>Core-, Basic-, Implyed- proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Propositions</td>
<td>Macro-proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reinforcement of Thesis</td>
<td>Reminder (Command)</td>
<td>Proposals and Propositions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Propositions</td>
<td>Macro-, Core-, Basic-, Implyed-proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Will you?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As reviewed in literature, I have adopted Martin’s (1992b) accounts on the macro-proposal and its realisation at the level of genre. APEs deploy the following schematic structure from an interpersonal perspective: Seeking Attention, Clarify Services Demanded, Make and Justify Demands, and Reminder. Unlike genre from an experiential perspective where meaning is particulately realised, the meanings of interpersonal structures are realised prosodically in a series of the continuous moves.

2.2 Dialogic structure

Since Martin’s (1992b) suggested interpersonal structure is global, I have adopted another delicate level of the schematic analysis termed ‘dialogic structure’. The focus of the analyses of the dialogic structure is on the balancing or strategic deployment of propositions in relation to proposals within each stage. In order to investigate the interplay between proposals and their supporting elements across clause complexes level, the third step is to identify proposals and classify propositions according to the following criteria: any sentence that includes command, except ‘declarative hints’, is marked and defined as proposals. Propositions are naturally the sentences that exclude proposals. Proposals have interactional value, while propositions have informational value.

The fourth step is to identify supporting elements within clause complexes and across clause complexes. I have adopted Iedema (1995) and Martin & Eggins’ (2001) stage descriptions to classify the types of propositional support for each proposal in APEs. Those propositional supporting elements include stages such as ‘background’, ‘legitimation’, ‘enablement’ and ‘justification’. In this study, ‘enablement’ and ‘justification’ are regarded as the propositional supporting elements within clause complexes level, while ‘background’ and ‘legitimation’ are the supporting elements across clause complexes level. ‘Enablement’ includes Purpose (e.g. in order to) Condition (e.g. if), and Concession (e.g. however, although) as additional elements. Justification is confined to using linguistic features such as ‘reason, because, due to, etc.
‘Background’ and ‘legitimation’ are propositional stages that support command across clause complexes level. They thus become automatically a delicate level of the stages. ‘Background’ and ‘legitimation’ are actually the same thing. They have the same functional roles. The only
difference is whether these moves precede or follow the proposal within each paragraph or stage of the dialogic structure. Under each dialogic structure, ‘background’ refers to giving background contexts or “basis/reason” (Winter, 1992:148) in order to carry out proposals. That is, proposals are preceded by reason/basis. Legitimation refers to providing ‘bases/reasons’ or ground after the proposals within the paragraph: that is proposals are followed by basis/reason.

2.3 Analyses of the textual distribution of commands in APEs

The final step of the analysis is that proposals are then classified according to where they are positioned and the semantic relevance to the Thesis. Proposals are then analysed along with interpersonal structure.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interpersonal meaning and interaction progression</th>
<th>Textual meaning and thematic progression</th>
<th>Three proposed layers of proposals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Macro-proposal</td>
<td>Macro-Theme</td>
<td>Text</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core-proposal</td>
<td>Hyper-Theme</td>
<td>Paragraph</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic-proposal</td>
<td>Theme</td>
<td>Clause</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Drawing on Martin (1992a) accounts of the three levels of Theme (see Table 4) and his undefined notions of macro-proposal, core-proposal and basic-proposal (1992b), I claim that proposals can be analysed at three levels using three notions. I add ‘implied-proposals’, which are equivalent to ‘declarative hints’ within clauses. There are thus four main types of proposals: macro-proposals, core-proposals, basic-proposals, and implied-proposals.

**Analyses**

**EAS 1: High-Graded Essay**

1 Interpersonal structure across clause complexes level

EAS 1’s schematic structure from an interpersonal perspective

From the point of view of interpersonal use, ‘learning from other intellectual traditions’ is a ‘primary request’ or ‘macro-proposal’. As displayed in Appendix, the global schematic structure of APEs from an interpersonal perspective is Seeking Attention, Clarifying Services Demanded, Make and Justifying Demands, and Reminder (see Appendix 1). Within this global structure, a more delicate level of the interpersonal structure from its use is thus sketched as background, ℃ommand, ℃ legitimation 1, ℃2, ℃3, and ℃ reminder.

Dialogic structure (propositional support across clause complexes)

Once a command occurs, the legitimation, or reasons of justification, follow, introduced by ‘because’, ‘due to’, ‘by doing’, etc. The interplay between proposals and legitimations of propositions is well balanced. The middle exchange of the Make and Justifying Demands stage is also organised by the interplay between proposals and propositions. Within each paragraph, the proposal is followed by the proposition that provides legitimation of knowledge, and this in turn establishes proposals that are mostly basic or implied (14, 15, 22, 24, 29, 31, 35, 36). These implied- and basic-proposals are followed by the proposition of legitimations and reasons.

Essay 1 shows the interaction between orbital structure and prosodic structure. From the interpersonal meaning, Essay 1 contains several commands varying in realisation and located at various points in the text. The text is not serial or particulate because macro-proposals realise one and ultimately the same command: ‘learn from other intellectual traditions’. Writer 1’s macro-proposal repeatedly reinforces as the text unfolds by using the core-proposal and basic-proposal. These proposals are realised no less than 40 times, amplified throughout the text.

**Examples**
3-2. Australian Universities would need to learn …

4. The first reason for the necessity to learn … is

6-2. learning from the Chinese intellectual tradition can be effective

12-2. learning Chinese intellectual tradition may help

15-1. by bringing this idea to Australia Universities

16. A further reason for the need to learn … is.

25-2. learning from the Indigenous intellectual tradition can have a significant role.

34-1. An advantage of having more than two intellectual traditions …

48. learning from Indigenous intellectual tradition would contribute to …

2 INTERpersonal resources within clause complexes level

Essay 1 employs the most frequently interactional resources (51%). In example (1), the main command constructs the modal verb ‘need’ for the demand. The subjectively congruent realisation of modulation of the command form involves much ‘extra work’ by using the modal auxiliary ‘would’. Commands are thus ‘interpersonalised’ by mitigation. The writer signals respect by using linguistic resources such as ‘would’, and ‘consideration’. From a dialogic perspective, the command is heteroglossically open. This option acknowledges the readers’ different perspectives.

(1) However, in order to meet the challenges of the 21st century, Australian Universities would need to learn not only from the Western cultures but also from those of other cultures in consideration of advancing technology with appropriate plans, creating solutions for environmental problems and reducing international disputes-----Macro-proposal (EAS 1-3).

Apart from using the modal ‘would’, another way of doing the extra work of the interpersonalisation is evident in the way that EAS 1 makes certain sorts of contributions through additional elements, such as Enablement of Purpose (in order to), Concession (however) and Justification (in consideration of). These additional elements in the clause also reflect respect and contribute to expanding solidarity with a reader. Command in this beginning exchange is thus backrounded and elaborated within the clause complexes level. Essay 1’s essence of command has been backrounded across clause complexes level as well. Writer 1’s command is delayed in that the main command of the macro-proposal (3) includes backrounded (1, 2) prior to command (see Appendix). ‘Commanding up’ strategy is thus employed. It sounds polite because the command occurs after the supporting elements of background (1, 2) at the level of the genre are presented.

In contrast, the Demand and Justifying Demands stage begins with commands first, this time followed by legitimation. As seen in example (2), command (mostly core-proposals) (4, 16, 30, 34, 37) has shifted towards becoming far more directive, both within the clause and across clause complexes level.

(2) The first reason for the necessity to learn from other intellectual tradition is to advance technology with appropriate plans (EAS1-4). …Core proposal

The nominalised form of ‘need’ (the necessity) is used. Linguistically, the ‘need’ noun is a modulated ‘fact’ noun to realise control. This displays ‘time-space distanciation’. This form goes through ‘demodulated process’. This nominalised command is a ‘depersonalised’ order. Further, the metaphors of modulation are drifted to the monoglossic choice by using the relational process ‘is’. This monologic choice is possible because the writer assumes that the reader shares the same social/ideological position. Legitimation follows. Writer 1 is not concerned with delaying or mitigating the command in his text at this time. The ‘commanding down’ strategy is used. This strategy minimises reciprocity, and tends to signal higher status and high authority. The result is a tension between construed status and politeness. The ‘background-command order’ is reversed as ‘command-legitimation’, because most commands are foregrounded in the beginning. Commands (core-proposals) across clause
complexes level are depersonalised as well. The writer assumes a more authoritative position. This experientialised command is possible once the command is recontextualised and naturalised. Therefore, politeness is inappropriate this time. Linguistically, Writer 1 combines textual metaphor (reason), interpersonal metaphor (necessity), and ideational metaphor (plan).

As arguments develop in the Make and Justifying Demands stage, commands again tend to combine interpersonalised command with depersonalised command. Example (3) is a typical case in which Text 1 interfaces between a writer's ability to negotiate social reality of the institutional positioning on one hand (depersonalisation with authority, formality, ideational metaphor) and the writer's ability to deal with human behaviour on the other hand. (e.g. interpersonal work with politeness, humility, interpersonal metaphor).

(3) By having more than two intellectual traditions, the recognition of other values of other cultures and more objective point of view would be achieved (EAS 1-51). …Core-proposal

Non-finite form of command (‘by having’, ‘by introducing’) allows the writer to achieve the double purposes of controlling and respect. The dominant clause also functions as command (recognise other cultures) with a softening down by modalisation (would). In addition to the interpersonal metaphor, the mental process of the verb ‘recognise’ is metaphorically or incongruently realised as a nominal group. The controlling action only appears in the guise of this nominalisation. This is a typical example of ‘ideational metaphor’ of ‘experientialisation’. This ideationalising control reflects institutional distance.

**EAS 2: Low-Graded Essay**

Essay's overall schematic structure from an interpersonal perspective is strikingly different from HGEs 1: command, "background,"background 1,"background 2,"legitimation 1,"background 3," and command.

As seen in the Appendix and example (4), Essay 2 begins with a straightforwardly demanding command (1) without backgrounding or warming-up the relationship. Therefore, the Seeking Attention stage is missing. Writer 2 exercises her authority to choose high values of modal verbs 'must' and 'need' with little interpersonal work. This way of commanding is regarded as being impolite and didactic because the command is not delayed and backgrounded both within clause complexes level and across clause complexes level.

(4) Universities within Australia need to learn not only from western intellectual traditions /but must gain an understanding of other cultures in order to survive and their in the 21st century (EAS 6-1). …Macro-proposal

The following example (5) implicitly tells the reader to learn from other cultures. Services are not clarified clearly (4). The command is sharply contrasted with that in example (4) in that the command is depersonalised, as process verbs are repackaged as participants through ideational metaphors of nominalisation (acceptance, advance) and a metaphor of mood. Command (5) thus reflects the formality. Command has a far more soft tone than example (4) by using projected command (encourage). The interlink between interpersonal metaphor and ideational metaphor is exploited.

(5) The acceptance of multiculturalism encourages faster more efficient social and technological advances (EAS 6-4)….Implied proposal

Essay 2 shows directness and informality in the beginning, as seen in example (4) and shifts into a very indirect and formal tone, as seen in example (5). This abruptness occurs in the middle exchange as well.

(6) We must acquire an understanding of each other as tradition is an important feature which governs and our enriches our lives (EAS 6-16). …Basic proposal

(7) If we do not pay close attention to culture/ misinterpretation can occur and a may cause violence or even war (EAS 6-36). …Implied proposal
Example (6) demonstrates that Writer 2 has attempted to take high authority using 'we must' but her authority is subject to being challenged due to ill-construction of the tenor-relationship. The high frequency (23%) of using congruent forms of compulsion 'must' alongside the presence of the commander and commandee 'we' presumes high power and little institutional background knowledge. This choice also means that formality suddenly shifts to an informal tone, as seen in example (6). 'If negative' alongside 'we' in example (7) also creates a threatening air with an informal tone.

As seen above, a striking feature of Essay 2 is the frequent use of the first person reference 'we' which indicates the presence of writer-in-the-text and reader-in-the-text. The first-person references are combined with a high value of modulation to produce informal-didactic text (Smith, 1987). By choosing to identify the writer with the addressee, the writer-in-the-text is indicating a close relationship between them in the text. This association between the personal tenor (we) and functional tenor (must) in Essay 2 may code extreme power (commanding down) and high solidarity (low institutional contact). This construction is very different from those in HGE 1. Essay 2's command in the middle exchange certainly fails to incorporate interpersonalised forms into depersonalised forms.

Writer 2's preference for 'we' also reflects Chinese students' particular cultural orientation to the self (Scollon, 1991). Writing that foregrounds the self ('I') too openly and directly is considered as being flaunting and therefore dangerous in the collective culture. For this reason, the Chinese students modulate the 'I' in deference to the 'we'. Writer 2 has failed to learn to negotiate the 'I' and the 'we' in her writing in a culturally sensitive way.

Essay 2's commands are not frequently available at the beginning, thus commands cannot be legitimised. The interplay between proposals and propositions does not occur consistently. In general, backgrounds dominate and thus not many legitimations are seen in the middle exchanges. Essay 2 also demonstrates no use of core-proposals and a high frequency of macro-proposals. Essay 2's locations of commands tend to be arbitrarily scattered rather than prosodically spread around the text, then intensifying, and accumulating as the text nears its end.

**Summary of findings**

**Research questions**

Interactional analyses reveal that significant differences quantitatively and qualitatively can be found between HGE 1 and LGE 2 in terms of command strategies both within clause complexes level and across clause complexes level

**Sub-question 1**

- HGE 1 actively enacts interaction with a reader by employing higher frequency of command alongside more various, combined forms of the command than LGE 2 (HGE 51% vs. 17%). The LGE 2 shows less interaction with limited use of repertoires. HGE 1 uses a low value of the metaphors of mood, congruent modulation and a high frequency of incongruent modulation, while HGE 2 prefers a high value of mood metaphors (e.g. If negation) and congruent modulation (e.g. must, should)

**Sub-question 2**

- HGE 1 uses a high proportion of supporting elements such as justifying and enabling around commands, while LGE 2 'command is less elaborated and supported (HGE 1, 49% vs. 8%).

**Sub-question 3**

- Most importantly, across clause complexes level, HGE 1 display 'talking up (the hierarchy)/commanding up', 'interpersonalised' commands, 'background-command'
order/‘backgrounding commands’ strategy in the beginning stages. This strategy drifts to ‘talking down (the hierarchy)’/‘commanding down’, ‘depersonalised’ commands, ‘command-legitimation’ order/‘foregrounding’ command strategy in the opening part of the Make and Justify Demands stage. The combination between the two strategies occurs from the middle or the last part of the middle stage as arguments develop. This sound synthesisisation between respect and authority displays situation-sensitive approaches. These patterns do not occur in LGE 2. For instance, Essay 2 is not concerned with delaying or mitigating the commands/proposals of her text. This strategy minimises reciprocity and tends to signal a higher status, which reflects an ill-construed tenor relationship between students and an academic audience.

Linguistically, HGE 1 is more metaphorised interpersonally, textually and ideationally, in that the forms of commands go through demodulation and demodalisation through nominalisation. HGE 1 achieves the double purposes of telling the reader-in-the-text to learn from other cultures in a formal manner. In contrast, for EAS LGE 2, the interplay between interpersonal metaphors and ideational metaphors is not usually seen. Essay 2’s commands are also at times informal, showing abrupt change to formality. HGE 1 deploys a more effective interplay between proposals and supporting strategies of using propositions. HGE 1’s schematic structures are constructed similarly, displaying the dialogue between particulate and prosodic realisation. In this way, the main macro-proposal of learning from other intellectual traditions occurs repetitively throughout the text. In contrast, EAS LGE 2’s commands are not very repetitively reinforced. The use of command does not spread evenly throughout the constituency structure.

Sub-question 4

• HGE 1 is constructed by the predominant choices of proposals of the core-proposals (HGE 1, 15 vs. 0) and basic-proposals (HGE 1, 13 vs. 6), which result in the topic-coherent constructions, while LGE 2 tends to choose macro-proposal (HGE 1, 3 vs. 3) and implied-proposal (HGE 1, 9 vs. 5), which leads to less topic-coherent proposals. HGE 1 is thus proposals-oriented, while LGE 2 is propositions-oriented.

Discussion, implications and conclusion

The result indicates that using a variety type of the commands alongside the propositional supports play a significant impact on the quality of APEs. Qualitatively, one of the most salient differences between HGE 1 and LGE 2 in terms of deployment of interactional resources is that two different commanding strategies are played out in different stages. This successful drift indicates HGE 1’s situationally appropriate constructions of the interactional choices. The two different interactional patterns operating in different stages well reflect students and markers’ relationships in terms of power/status differences and the students’ institutional familiarity in terms of ‘contact’ in academic institutions. This shift also reflects the successful juggling of respect or humility and authority in different stages. This linguistic subtlety and complexity is a result of the two purposes that the academic argument has to serve at once: the organization of human activity (shouldness) and institutional positioning (interpersonal distance: formality) (Iedema, 1997). In contrast, poor writer’s commands are impolite and mainly exert high power with little institutional positioning.

Research results reveal that mood resources are vital in creating a critical voice in a formal tone. Further, APEs’ structure can be seen from an interpersonal perspective. Most importantly, EAP courses should explicitly delineate the pattern of interplay between ‘command up’ and command down’ strategy in accordance with the generic structure. This involves teaching grammatical metaphors that consist of interpersonal, textual and experiential metaphors (Ravelli, 1988, 2003; Derewianka, 2003). The development of literacy is often perceived as the move from non-metaphorical to metaphorical text (Martin, 1997; Ravelli, 2003). Those perceptions on grammatical metaphor are based on a ‘text-bound notion’. It should be changed to a ‘user-bound notion’. That is, grammatical metaphors should be explained from an interpersonal perspective (Butler, 1988; Iedema, 2003; Heyvaert 2003). The concept thus should relate to the tenor of discourse. As Iedema (1997, 2003, 2004) argues, interpersonal metaphor reflects status hierarchy, while experiential metaphor with passivity reflects institutional familiarity. In conclusion, academic argument is very situated.
contextualised and engaging. It is not just transactional, decontextualised and autonomous. The successful writer raises his subjective voices in a formal tone. This degree of the writer’s audience awareness closely relates to the quality of APEs. The writers’ exploitation of the interactional resources is a good indicator of judging quality of APEs.

References


Continuum, 84-103.


Appendix B Interactional analyses

First column: Bold: functional stages at the genre level from an interpersonal perspective. Italic underlined: delicate stages of the dialogic structure. PT (proposition) and PS (proposal) across clause complexes.

Second column: Number of clauses (NC).

Third column: Content: Bold: commands. Italic underlined: supporting elements of enabling or justifying.

Fourth column: the type of proposal at the discourse level and the type of command at the grammar level.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interpersonal structure</th>
<th>NC</th>
<th>EAS 1’s Interactional resources</th>
<th>Types of proposal and command</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Seeking Attention</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PT</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Background</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Para 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In Universities in Australia, their intellectual traditions are largely based on the Western intellectual tradition.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Some Australian Universities, with the Western intellectual tradition, have achieved international reputations due to their successes especially in the science field through 20th century.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Clarify Services</strong></td>
<td>3-1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Demanded</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PS</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Command</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3-2</td>
<td>However, in order to meet the challenges of the 21st century. Australian Universities would need to learn not only from the Western intellectual tradition but also from those of other cultures in considerations of advancing technology with appropriate plans, creating solutions for environmental problems and reducing international disputes.</td>
<td>Macro-proposal Modal verb (Need form) Enablement (concession, purpose) and Justification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Make and Justify</strong></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Demands</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PS</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Legitimation 1</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5-1</td>
<td>Para 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The first reason for the necessity to learn from other intellectual tradition is to advance technology with appropriate plans.</td>
<td>Core-proposal Noun of modulation (Need form) Justification and Enablement (purpose)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5-2</td>
<td>In the Western tradition, individualism is a character and this individualism can cause social problems.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PT</strong></td>
<td>6-1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>To prevent the further incidences of social problems, learning from the Chinese intellectual tradition can be effective.</td>
<td>Core-proposal Appraisal Adjective Enablement (purpose)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PS</strong></td>
<td>6-2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### PT

7-1  
In Western intellectual tradition, individualism is a strong feature and this individualism can create unplanned technologies that have the possibility to harm society.  

8-1  
In the intellectual tradition, although some knowledge is utilised for society, knowledge is often utilised for a pursuit of individual's happiness.  

9  
This can contribute to a development of an idea that is merely focused on individual financial benefits but not social benefits.  

10-1  
As a result of applying this idea, unplanned technologies that may benefit some capitalists but can harm society can be brought in.  

11-1  
For example, some capitalists promote establishments of nuclear power plants for their financial benefits by insisting nuclear power plants capability to reduce carbon dioxide in spite of its risks such as incidences of cancer, irregularities in human bodies especially, in infants and pregnant women.  

### PS  

12-1  
To avoid creating merely individually beneficial technologies, learning from the Chinese intellectual tradition may help.  

13-1  
The Chinese intellectual tradition, due to admiration for order, strongly values social contribution rather than individual success, and reproduces knowledge based on past works.  

14-1  
Even though reproduction of knowledge based on past works may not be effective in producing 21st century technologies that would have huge differences from those of past, advocating the idea that the ‘order’ would bring peace and balance in society can help to prevent developments of too strong individualism.  

15-1  
By bringing this idea to Australia Universities to some extent, technologies which merely benefits some capitalists but not society would not be developed.  

16  
A further reason for the need to learn
from intellectual traditions of other cultures is to create solution for environmental problems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PT</th>
<th>17-1</th>
<th>In solving environmental problems, although developments of technology and resource management would be important issues; the consideration of some assumptions and structures is also required</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>17-2</td>
<td>Implied-proposal Modulated passive verb Enablement (purpose, concession)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>17-3</td>
<td>Implied-proposal Enablement (purpose)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td>This is because social assumption and structures shape the form of technology that society utilizes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td>However, the ideas in the Western intellectual tradition often do not focus on social assumptions and structures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td>In the Western intellectual tradition, nature tends to be regard as ‘thing’, resources or material.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
<td>Due to this idea, attitudes and assumptions toward nature can be harmful on creatures, plants and lands.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
<td>Without respect for nature, environmental problems would be hardly solved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
<td>This is because environmental problems have close relation with the functions of nature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
<td>Advocating respects for nature would shape the social structures and create society that utilize environmentally friendly technologies.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PS</th>
<th>25-1</th>
<th>Para 5 In expanding the respect for nature to solve environmental problems, learning from the Indigenous intellectual tradition can have a significant role.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25-2</td>
<td>Implied-proposal Declarative hint Enablement (purpose)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Core-proposal Appraisal Adjective Enablement (purpose)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>In the Indigenous tradition, Indigenous people believe, based on 'Dreaming', that maintaining land, creatures and nonliving things (for them, they are creatures) are necessary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>This comes from their social assumption that failure in keeping balance will cause hazards such as illness or disasters.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>Due to this belief, this highly respecting and maintaining land is their one reason to exist.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| PS | 29-1 | Although 'Dreaming' may not be so effective to innovate technologies, 
29-2 | by introducing this belief, 
29-3 | Universities in Australia can change the assumptions and attitudes that treat nature as 'thing' into the respects for nature that would bring environmentally friendly technologies. | Basic-proposal Non-finite Basic-proposal Ability of modulation |
| PS | 30 | Para 6 | Third reason for why Australian Universities need to learn not only from the Western intellectual tradition but also other intellectual traditions is to achieve 'globalised view' that does not merely depend on a value sense of a culture. | Core-proposal Modal verb (Need) Justification and Enablement (purpose) |
| PT | 31 | This 'globalised view' can be a crucial component to reduce international disputes. | Implied-proposal Appraisal adjective Enablement (purpose) |
| PS | 32-1 | Conflicts between cultures are often generated 
32-2 | by the difficulty in accepting different social values, assumptions and structures. | |
| PS | 33-1 | Having more than two intellectual traditions can contribute to the reduction of international disputes 
33-2 | by bringing recognition of existence of different value sense and avoidance of subjective view. | Core-proposal Offer form Basic-proposal Non-Finite |
| PS | 34-1 | Para 7 | An advantage of having more than two intellectual traditions, to reduce international disputes, is a contribution for students to recognise existence of different value senses, 
34-2 | although learning more than two intellectual cultures can be difficult because it requires deep understanding of other cultures. | Core-proposal Appraisal noun + Offer noun form Enablement (purpose) Core-proposal: Appraisal adjective Enablement (concession) Core-proposal |

---

Page 397
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Paragraph</th>
<th>Text</th>
<th>Annotated Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>34-3</td>
<td>PT 35-1</td>
<td>The importance of this recognition is because of students’ realisation that their value sense may be merely valid in their culture and their criteria to judge different cultures based on their value sense can be irrelevant in differently structured societies.</td>
<td>Modulate verb. Justification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-1</td>
<td>PT 35-2</td>
<td>The importance of this recognition is because of students’ realisation that their value sense may be merely valid in their culture and their criteria to judge different cultures based on their value sense can be irrelevant in differently structured societies.</td>
<td>Basic-proposal Appraisal noun Justification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-1</td>
<td>PS 35-2</td>
<td>This recognition can help to reduce biases of different societies.</td>
<td>Basic-proposal Appraisal verb Enablement (purpose)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-2</td>
<td>PS 35-2</td>
<td>and would contribute to moderate international disputes</td>
<td>Basic-proposal Offer form Enablement (purpose)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37-1</td>
<td>PS 37-2</td>
<td>A further advantage of learning more than two intellectual traditions, in reducing conflicts between cultures, is its capability to avoid the development of subjective value sense and to achieve more objective point of view, even though achievement of perfect objectivity would not be possible due to possession of knowledge.</td>
<td>Core-proposal Appraisal noun Enablement (purpose, concession) and Justification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>PT 38</td>
<td>Subjectivity is often generated from a narrow value sense that depends on one point of view.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>PT 39</td>
<td>In addition, subjectivity usually does not accept the existence of different positions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>PT 40</td>
<td>This often develop biases toward other culture.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>PS 41</td>
<td>Learning more than two intellectual traditions would provide students at least two value senses.</td>
<td>Basic-proposal Offer form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>PS 42</td>
<td>This would acknowledge students the existence of other points of views</td>
<td>Basic-proposal: Appraisal verb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43-1</td>
<td>PS 43-2</td>
<td>This would help to build objectivity and decrease development of subjective view that often has strong relation with international disputes.</td>
<td>Basic-proposal: Appraisal verb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44-1</td>
<td>Reminder Command PS 44-2</td>
<td>In conclusion, Australian Universities need to learn not only from the Western Intellectual tradition but also from those of other countries in order to meet the challenge of the 21th</td>
<td>Macro-proposal Modal verb (Need form) Enablement (purpose) and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
for three reasons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PS</th>
<th>Legitimation</th>
<th>Justification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td><em>First reason is to advance technologies with appropriate plans.</em></td>
<td>Justification and enablement (purpose)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46-1</td>
<td><em>To meet this,</em> learning strong ideas for social contribution from the Chinese intellectual tradition can help.*</td>
<td>Core-proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46-2</td>
<td></td>
<td>Appraisal verb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td><em>Second reason is to create solution for environmental problems in terms of social assumptions and structures.</em></td>
<td>Justification and enablement (purpose)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td><em>Learning from the indigenous intellectual tradition would contribute to change assumptions and attitudes that treat nature as thing into the respect for nature.</em></td>
<td>Core-proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>This change would shape technologies that are merely focused on financial benefits into environmentally friendly technologies.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td><em>Third reason is to achieve globalised view that doesn’t depend on a social value system of a culture to reduce international disputes.</em></td>
<td>Justification and enablement (purpose)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-1</td>
<td><em>By having more than two intellectual traditions,</em></td>
<td>Core-proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-2</td>
<td>the recognition of other value sense of other cultures and more objective point of view would be achieved.</td>
<td>Non-finite with enablement (condition) Basic-proposal Appraisal noun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td><em>These would help to reduce conflicts between different cultures.</em></td>
<td>Basic-proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td><em>Learning not only the Western intellectual tradition but also from other intellectual traditions would benefit on universities in Australia.</em></td>
<td>Macro-proposal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total use of commands 40 / total clauses 79 x 100 = 51%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interpersonal and dialogic structure</th>
<th>EAS 2’s interactional resources</th>
<th>Types of proposal and command</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PS Command</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-1</td>
<td><em>Para 1</em> Universities within Australia need to learn not only from western intellectual traditions*</td>
<td>Macro-proposal Modal verb (Need form) Macro-proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-2</td>
<td><em>but must gain an understanding of other cultures in order to survive and their in the 21st century</em></td>
<td>Modal verb (Must) with enablement (purpose)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Seeking Attention

| 2-1 | Australia is a country, which is part of a world that is built on relationships as global communication assists the development of the nation. |
| 2-2 | |

| 3-1 | Intellectual traditions are diverse around the globe and in gaining an understanding of cultures such as Chinese and Greek our minds to different histories though patterns, knowledge and cultures. |
| 3-2 | |

| 4 | The acceptance of multiculturalism encourages faster more efficient social and technological advances. | Implied-proposal: Projected command |

### PT

#### Background

| 5 | Para 2 "The tradition of the west or "Western tradition is an intellectual dialogue of opposing views about the central ideas and ideals of the historical civilization that developed out of the ancient Hebraic and Greek cultures" 1 |

| 6 | Thus our civilization was created by collaboration and understanding of other cultures. |

| 7-1 | This is still occurring today |
| 7-2 | as we study each other in institutions such as universities |
| 7-3 | in order to effect, challenge and unite |

### PT

#### Background 1

| 8-1 | Para 3 The Chinese intellectual tradition began at approximately the same time as western tradition and developed almost simultaneously with it. |
| 8-2 | |

| 9 | It began with similar oral traditions which saw Chinese writing may have been inspired by the emergence of stable political empires in the eastern Mediterranean, the Near East, China and northern Indian. |

| 10 | Interestingly the Chinese intellectual tradition differed in their development, which was perhaps due to the Chinese bureaucracy and imperial state. |

| 11-1 | In understanding and investigating Chinese culture from the 21st century, |
| 11-2 | it is fascinating as it is different to our personal national understanding of our own history |

| 12-1 | It is helpful as it grants a comprehension of how the culture and its people came to be who they are today. |
| 12-2 | |
In comparing the Chinese to Western tradition there is evidence that the two are divided by beliefs, language, knowledge and morals.

An example is the introduction of the Confucian learning which was taught as an unchangeable body of knowledge.

Where as western tradition invited constant change within the understanding of intellectual thought as they slowly developed the impulse to challenger other than accept.

We must acquire an understanding of each other.

We must also understand that common intellectual is constantly changing within tradition.

For example, “The Catholic Church became more intellectually conservative during the struggle with Bolshevism and Fascism”.

This also alludes to the nation that imposing intellectual belief on another culture is dangerous as we live in a powerful world where countries have used their intellect in order to protect their tradition with weapons and nuclear power.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PT</th>
<th>Background 3</th>
<th>Para 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>The diverse array of thought patterns within traditions is enthralling.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Ultimately, we have little said over the tradition we are born into.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Each addition teachers from a biased perspective.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28-1</td>
<td>Even in western culture where we are encouraged to challenge intellect, history, current news and documentation are filled with opinion.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28-2</td>
<td>The Greeks, for example, were lead by Aristotle to enforce a deductive logic based on identity as they dismissed geometry and depended on fate to draw conclusions(2) (4).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29-1</td>
<td>Aristotle was respected as we feel the need to be guided by a scholar within tradition.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29-2</td>
<td>This is not a nation purely explored by the Greeks, it is generic within culture something we call snare(2).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-1</td>
<td>We look for someone with experience, knowledge and understanding to look up to and be educated by.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-2</td>
<td>This is the nature of universities as they encourage further development of a known intellectual tradition in order to develop technologically and socially.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PS**

| 34 | Another common factor within intellectual tradition is sat we all feel a need to understand ourselves in every way conceivable. |

**PT**

| 35-1 | Within the 21th century we battle with human relations our intellectualizations grant us the ability to understand what we see and hear. |
| 35-2 | If we do not pay close attention to culture, misinterpretation can occur and a may cause violence or even war. |

Basic-proposal Modal verb (Need form)
| PS | 37-1 | There is a respect that comes with knowledge and to be worldly in understanding makes on more employable and a sound representative of their particular intellect. | 37-2 |
| PS | 38 | Communication is imperative with in business interaction, land rights issues and politics. | |
| PS | 39-1 | We can not ignore each other or our beliefs as we interact for many reasons. | 39-2 | Implied-proposal Negative |
| PS | 40 | **Our university education should therefore teach cultural understanding acceptance and celebration** | 40 |
| PS | 41-1 | There is no right or wrong way to think and perceive | 41-2 |
| PT | 42 | The 21th century is an exciting time where intellectual traditions are banding together for common good. | |
| PT | 43-1 | It is interesting that whom this happens the two start to teach each other, | 43-2 |
| Background 4 | 44 | Para 6 | 44 |
| Background 4 | 45 | Advances that have been made prior to the 21th century are now being developed further | 45 |
| Background 4 | 46 | The internet is an example of the way in which intellectual traditions can reach out and learn about each other. | 46 |
| Background 4 | 47-1 | It displays arrange of intellectual cultures as each country contributes to facilities are available. | 47-2 |
| Background 4 | 48-1 | The media on the other hand, continues to be part of specific intellectual traditions as it is designed to infirm a specific culture or those countries whom share the same intellectual tradition. | 48-2 |
| Reminder | 49 | Para 7 | 49 |
| Command | PS | **Australia universities are obligated to enforce education concerning other countries intellectual traditions.** | Command |
| 50-1 | The 21st century demands that we shave our thought process so that we may maintain peace and develop to greater neighs. |
| 51-1 | If we dismiss multicultural recognition then as a nation, we limit our understanding of this mystical thing called life. |
|      | **Total use of commands 14 / Total clauses 84 x 100 = 17%** |

Implied-proposal: If form + negative

Implied-proposal: Negative

MP:3, CP:0, BP:6, IP:5
Coming Here: an Analysis of the Migrant Experience in Context of Language, Power and Identity

Karin Lettau
University of Tasmania

Abstract
The proposed paper attempts to address the migrant’s ‘real’ or subjective experience of being displaced.

This process reveals a conflicting relationship between what is experienced and what is representable and thus raises numerous questions about identity, power and the way migrants are portrayed. Gender related issues appear unavoidable in this enquiry.

In trying to establish a continuum within the notion of displacement these observations result in fundamental questions relating to belonging, including that of commonality and understanding.

The focus remains on three main aspects:
One: The time of departure and arrival of the migrant. It closely looks at the complex web of power relations within the culture he/she leaves and the receiving culture. The actual (physical) movement is considered as becoming a vital part of the experiential fabric, a Between where identity is suspended and challenged.

Two: The problematics and difficulties arising in communicating in a foreign language. This includes the question whether a limited language limits, ultimately, existence. It considers the implications of a receiving environment as a dominant institution, which subordinates anything foreign and controls meaning.

Three: An attempt is being made to establish a thread of qualities within the migrant experience; that of Becoming, a space of potential, one, which above all, requires a body as a moral necessity - what kind of power is that?

References are made to the theories of Foucault and Deleuze with an attempt to support some of the main arguments of this enquiry.

Coming here….
(This is a simple story…) We know the migrant. We share a common understanding that he comes from another country, another culture and most likely speaks another language. He would have had to cross the sea, by boat or simply travelled by air. We generally assume that he is a man and that there are economic reasons for him deciding to come here. He most likely has got a job or the prospect of getting one, other ways he wouldn’t be a migrant.

In that knowledge we are united and the migrant becomes one of us, a minority nevertheless, but one of us.

There are three main arguments I wish to address in this paper. The first one is intended to establish how and why objective representation of the migrant limits, controls and subordinates him to an external dominant power. Some gender issues are raised here and a brief and basic attempt is being made to link these with the concept of labour.

The second argument focuses more closely on the migrant’s actual subjective experience. His leaving of a known environment and his entering of a new culture including its language, introduces a plurality of positions and problems. It reveals a conflicting relationship between
what is experienced and what is representable and thus raises numerous questions about identity and belonging. Consequentially, and that forms the third argument, what emerges is a view which considers the migrant, as a nomadic subject, as a ‘wanderer’ between cultures and identities. This alters his placement profoundly. My research, which is largely based on personal experience and that of other migrants, attempts to show, that the migrant is in constant process of ‘becoming’. Movement as part of his experiential fabric defies the link between objective representation and subjective experience. What this calls for is a new subjectivity.

The actual word ‘migrant’ cannot be reduced to existing as a neutral sign.

He arrives in his new country as an already defined subject. In representing him objectively, he remains the product of a dominant language and values, that of the departing and the receiving culture. His identity is the result of a complex web of external and internalised forces.

Foucault argues that power produces identity; that it controls and limits the subject through language. Defined and representable, it is a product of external power, through which it remains controlled and dependant to.

All knowledge, including that of knowing ones identity, derives from the same power relation. Identity is only possible through the language of a power structure and therefore conditions the subject into its own limitations. It is, one could argue, the condition through which the self can position and orient itself within a power structure. Foucault is interested in the manner by which limits become enmeshed in relations of power, thereby restricting the flux of possibilities open to the individual.

I shall only briefly elaborate on two important points, one economic the other gender related. The migrant enters a system of exchange, which is largely based on economics. Thus, the principle of ‘labour’ primarily defines his position. It represents the dominant form of exchange and value.

He is required to undergo rigorous processes and fulfil a number of criteria in order to be granted the very status of being a migrant. One could argue therefore, that the migrant represents an ideology articulated like a language; namely that ‘freedom is the power to produce’. Could you imagine a situation, and I quote Olkowski’s metaphorical statement: “which does not favour the conditions of production but instead would favour the work of art or the work of political activism or the work of thought? Not to mention that these creative and pragmatic lives need languages, too, and require concepts that differentiate and produce in order to support their actions.”

According to Foucault, power not only controls, but also divides. The subject is either divided inside himself or divided from others because external forces define it. It is therefore limited and restricted.

A dominant culture, which defines the migrant by granting him the ‘right to enter’, creates an intriguing divisive foundation. On one hand he is promised the freedom he seeks on the other it is denied to him, as he is not granted a ‘chance’ to become subject. The migrant’s decision to gain freedom demands in a sense a commitment to a representation, which renders him unfree. He supports an agenda of those, who have the power to name and appoint positions of otherness.

According to Western Philosophy it is the masculine, which claims this dominant, view of subjectivity. Dorothea Olkowski expands this argument by claiming that “Objectivity is assumed to be neutral when in fact it is the point of view of men, men with the power and authority to enforce it.” It is not surprising that Feminist research in particular is questioning this dominant paradigm. Mezzedra claims that also, when the behaviour of migrants has actually been the focus of sociological research, as in the case of the Chicago School since the 1920s, it has still been carried out from the unilateral assumption of the ‘receiving society. He furthers his argument by stating that “there is an assumption of mainstream research, which places the main importance, regarding migrants, on the man and the woman is only considered in her position within the family. He continues by stating, that feminist studies have underlined that migration of women outside the family dynamics is not simply a response to economic needs but stems more often from a conscious decision to leave behind the long shadows of societies dominated by Patriarchy.
Objective causes such as war, misery, and environment, political, social tyrannies are still relevant. Considering the limitations, however, that are imposed on the subject of the migrant it seems crucial, to address his subjective experience and to lift him out of the smooth space of representation into an unsettling realm of impermanence, movement and multiplicities. This is a space of potential, a creative force, a becoming-minor, and a subject in continuous process, mutating and transforming.

Deleuze’s view of the Masculine coincides with the fixity of a centre and is opposed to process of becoming. “Being” which forms the core of Phallocentrism, allows no mutation or creative- becoming and tends towards self-preservation.

Becoming-woman lies at the heart of Deleuze’s conceptual framework. It signifies a process, which does not belong exclusively to woman. Nor does it talk about a person or a form of identity. It denotes experience on the margins of established society, such as that of the migrant. He calls upon his readers to: “discern in ourselves an artistic will irreducible to knowledge and power.”

(Quote Mezzadra) “For migration to exist there must be individual motion of desertion, made concrete by a concrete man or woman, embedded in family and social networks but nonetheless able of agency. This marks profoundly the subjectivity where he or she chooses to settle down.”

The decision to leave one place and exchange it for another maybe based on the desire for adventure, a journey of exploration, a thirst and hunger for life. It may mark an escape of oppression, violation or hardship due to personal, political or environmental circumstances. However it is always a decision for a better life, based on an individuals perception of what, at that time and in that place, might promise him or her greater freedom. Consciously or not, the individual’s complaints signify admittance to a position of inadequacy, inferiority or even powerlessness to bring about the necessary change within the existing environs. His or her power for change lies primarily in the leaving. A similarity in power relations occurs within the receiving society. The dominant paternalistic logic has in the past, often denoted the migrant into an inferior position and portrayed him as a weak subject in need of care and help. Integration and assimilation processes are a direct result of such a view.

The migrant leaves according to his own will. This fuels his action and marks the degree of force by which he desires to escape or transcend his condition. This presets a silent expectation of a different thus better life, and the moral framework of ‘goodness' becomes the unquestionable foundation of the receiving culture. The migrant, condemned to live in the receiving culture into a ‘commitarian’ turn introduces a problematic relationship between individual experience and the collective dimension of experience. A society, which is represented unilaterally, exposes most profoundly, the loss and fractured life, which has become part of the migrant's new identity, for which there is however no common language.

Leaving divides the migrant’s world and his position becomes one of judgement. The choice of leaving could be perceived as a responsible act of courage and trust in the ability to face the unknown. The act of desertion may be judged or met with envy, hostility or rejection. Violating and oppressive factors may merge with the love he has for his people and his homeland. His action of leaving and of leaving behind may turn him into a witness of ruthlessly exposing a moral conflict. The migrant is implicated in a narrative, which does not relieve but binds him ever more deeply to an identity he seeks to transcend. Hence, an incomplete past is expressed as a frequent complaint and haunts most migrants. However it is a total past, void of closeness and distance. It is a past they possess, of which they have ownership, but to which they have lost an immediate link. Migrants tell of the desire to return, a melancholic longing, knowing however that something between them and the very thing they attach their yearnings to, has already changed. (I will extend this point later)

Mezzadra maintains, "they tell of an attitude of ‘suspension of identity' and a problematic relations with the nevertheless defined belonging they experience.

These characteristics of the condition of the migrant are instances of transformation not only particular to migrants but all minorities. It is ambivalent as it strains between re-claiming a radical instance of liberty and the functioning of old and new mechanisms of domination and exploitation."

With no knowledge of the new language or just a few words, the migrant maintains a fluid
space. His experiences and ways of communicating are as yet of another dimension. His condition is one of transition. Words initially float. They exist as sounds, which gravitate towards various meanings. The newcomer moves between and through them with ease, sounding them out, mimicking, and repeating. Slippages and distortions are most common here. Paul Carter recalls following memory: “I knew a builder who arrived here with only one word of English: but before long he discovered that it would answer to any situation. As the word never came back to him exactly as it left him, he was continually expanding his vocabulary. He said that the diagram showing how the word had split up would be a summary of his life. I remember for instance that his first marriage was the direct result of “air” being misheard as “hair” – or was it “her”?

Increasingly the migrant is caught between a process of becoming ‘solid’ within the new language and simultaneously of creating gaps, signifying his lack of knowledge and a limited and limiting comprehension. His commitment demands that communication is dependent on grasping the language of the receiving culture. This implicates him in becoming increasingly entangled within a dominant power, one that determines meaning. He is integrated into a culture to which traditions, values, morals and law he ultimately is disconnected. Language as an institution is encountered and the migrant takes on the position of a pupil and of being inferior. The emphasis on the individual’s need is aimed at understanding the collective experience, expressed through language and only then, can he perceive himself as becoming comprehensible. He accesses himself through a complete, external, communication fabric. Disconnected from body, memory and emotional language, thought becomes an externalised construct and with it the migrant an outsider to himself. Paul Carter poignantly writes about this seeming contradiction in the chapter called “getting in”: “Remember too that everything here is back to front. When speaking the language, for example, people begin fluent and only grow inarticulate later.” The migrant laments: “At the point when I get by and manage the daily demands of basic communication, I realise the limits of my words and that somewhere distant, what remains, is all that, which is left untold. I imagine that my intelligence and my credibility must be measured by what I manage to say, not of what I know and even less so of what I might be capable of becoming.” A limiting language limits life.

Carter addresses the native listener: “Above all do not be upset if the people seem to be deaf: they are only trying to get your name. Besides, their obtuseness amuses more than it angers. When even the simplest facts escape their comprehension, you may find you are tempted to invent the truth. It is a matter of getting on to their frequency. Have you not noticed how they leave their radios on?”

His insight raises the questions of “who witnesses whom?” For the migrant verification of what has been said becomes difficult. He absorbs information uncensored and unreflected as he lacks a base on which to discern what is true or not. His absence of scepticism and of critical engagement points to a vulnerability, which must be acknowledged. He lacks immunity in loosing his position of witness of what has been said. The migrant must continuously attain clarity and remove any potential ambiguity before he speaks. The emphasis is placed on making language more logical in order to be understood. This produces exclusive thought, abstraction and generalisation. Immediacy of speech and expression is stifled. The overriding motive to verbalise is driven by the need to be understood, which disrupts the fluidity of intuition, inspiration, and passion.

“Power is everywhere and nowhere”, Foucault famously claims. The life of a migrant, who desires to be somewhere and to belong, is continuously implicated in this ‘truth’. The need to represent, assimilate and integrate, does not only serve the dominant culture’s self-preserving interest. It is often linked with issues of survival regarding the migrant. To give up Identity carries the risk of becoming erased. This is a crucial point.

Let us consider Braidotti’s statement: “Only a subject who historically has profited from the entitlements of subjectivity, and the rights of citizenship can afford to put his “solidity” into question. Marginal subjectivities, or social forces who historically have not yet been granted the entitlements of symbolic presence – and this includes woman – cannot easily relinquish boundaries and rights which they have not hardly gained yet. “

On one hand the migrant seeks a new identity, on the other, identity takes on an unsettling proportion and produces tension as he gradually belongs to two worlds. He embodies both, separately and ideologically they might even be opposed. His leaving the territory of his
homeland and transgressing of its boundaries is a physical act of moving from one country to another. It is a continuous, uninterrupted experience, which requires a body. It marks a between space where identities are threatened but to which the migrant ultimately belongs. By introducing a continuum movement, space and time become a vital part of the experiential fabric of the migrant, irreducible to mere identities and thus capable of disrupting the symmetry of their position. Maybe unaware he is initiated into this other dimension. The Body is a space, according to Deleuze, of multiple Becomings potentially contradictory impersonal and polymorphous. Corporeality of the subject is a dynamic web of potentialities and intensities in constant move and transformation.

To re-instate the body as a necessity, adds a dimension, which makes acknowledgement of the migrants subjective experience possible. By making it part of the migratory movement it grounds experience as real, more accepting and less judgemental. Having a body as a moral necessity forms a crucial extensive argument, on which I will not attempt to elaborate. Parfit invites us to consider that if Identity is not what matters, it alters ones focus in that it introduces us to another possibility; namely that of experience, on which we ultimately place greater emphasis and which reminds us of our sense of connectedness rather than separation which identities rely on. Let us consider this space more closely. Kimura’s theory and etymological findings on the topic of the between are particularly revealing. He brings together three important Words, Man, Space and Time, which, in contemporary Japanese language, are written with the character Between; (nin-gen) meaning literally Man-Between, (ku^-kan), Free-Between or Sky-Between and (ji-kan), Time-Between. The word Man originates from the old Chinese translation from the Buddhist Sutra meaning World, Worldliness in the sense of Community of mankind. The word World, which is also written with the character Between, is the translation of the word loca from the Sanskrit similar to the Latin word locum, the German lokal describing place, as expressing the special characteristics of interpersonal relationship. Kimura concludes that Man + World meaning Worldliness of man on one hand and on the other individuality of man, which belongs to the unity of these two characters, signify (Handlungs-zusammenhang), order, the Tao (the way).

What he describes is a space, free of things, between one man and another as well as between man and himself – suggesting that within I is always another. According to his view the Self does not exist as an inside, where it is mostly located but in the ‘Between’, as a dynamic movement between different relationships. This is not a space where the I is a not yet formed substance, it is the I as dynamic Between, neither subject nor object. It is no longer something that allows a purely external position. Kimura speaks about a between as an in itself differentiating original spontaneity. The self as ‘Between’ and as a process of self-differentiation is a continuously productive movement. This movement includes the product (Noema) and the producing (Noesis) and creates a kind of continuous circular movement. We may relate it to the timing in songs, play and speech, an inner difference, which perpetually creates a temporal shift. It is to be considered as a ‘Between’ relation with oneself, within oneself, being the condition for the ‘for-onesself’. This structure, Kimura claims, forms the foundation of human life. He argues, that a disruption of the ‘Between’, such as schizophrenia and one might add here the migrant’s troubled existence of multiple identities, leads to a loss of a sense of reality for things, for ones own body, ones identity and self. It also sets forth a problematic relationship between Past and Future.

The migrant, for example, mourning his irretrievable losses is bound so strongly to his idea of ‘having’, ‘owning’ or ‘memory’. The presence therefore is largely washed away towards an endured and overdue past. This past, an enormous accumulation of the ‘not yet completed’ dreaded mass of subjunctive possibilities, is experienced in the form of the present. The movement forward towards a future, and the possibility of the new and unknown thus stagnates.

Let us return to Carter here. He tells a story about the meeting place of two between people: Charlotte and Jackson, an aboriginal woman and a white sealer are loosely based on historical origins. Processes of transportation, colonialization and expropriation had rendered them both between people. This mobile situation forged an In-between relationship, a meeting place where differences were not despised and eliminated but accommodated.

So, in Cooee Song, Charlotte and Jackson call across the sea to one another; and they take their cue not from dictionaries but from the wave patterns that surround and threaten to engulf them. They imagine that the air is “full of infinite lines, straight and radiating, intercrossing and
inter-weaving without ever coinciding with one another". They know that most of what they want to say cannot be said, at least not in words; and mostly any sense there was will be warped by the wind and returned to them as nonsense. 46

How can difference as an in itself differentiating dynamic capability be sustained? Representation of difference is limited to identity, similarity, analogy or opposition. Under the umbrella of Multiculturalism, differences are accommodated, however it is a framework, which easily succumbs to a stereotypical representation of migrants and risks to reduce an understanding of culture to elements of folklore. The plurality of positions and problems are easily removed. Braidotti claims that difference has been colonised by power relations that reduce it to gradation of inferiority. Furthermore this has resulted in passing differences off as "natural". Fixed, they thus become essentialised, where they are no longer reachable for changing them in a historic sense.

How can the migrant alter or overcome the restrictive frameworks on which he, in part, depends on? How can he change his complaints of symbolic misery, lack of self-representation, amnesia and refusal to forget the past? How can he belong, if he cannot be represented? He, neither on the periphery nor at the heart of the phallocentric empire is radically other, he occupies other spaces and is playing on different modes of scale and temporality. It appears crucial to emphasize the positivity of lived experience of a becoming – minority and to point out the profound asymmetry this creates. Memory activated is a time bomb, which will undo main effects of a phallocentric system.

If what is common is expressed through individualities the migrant does not fit into that equation. Let us consider briefly Deleuze's proposition, which would require a profound change in how we think. It is a new concept of society, in which what we have in common is our singularities and not our individuality, where what is common is "impersonal" and what is personal is "uncommon". Where for example we could say, that we all have a body. That is impersonal and forms commonality; how we engage with and experience having a body and what kind of body it therefore becomes is personal and uncommon.

In the case of the migrant it is not a matter of perceiving his as an individuals complaint. As a subject-in-the-becoming his position is one of relations and of migration as a social movement. The migrants subjective experience has no opposition, however it 'disrupts' and threatens the security of fixed values, transgresses established boundaries and has the capacity to expose and break open language. Braidotti's radical and inviting expressions describe this poignantly: "Let us call this new subjectivity "software carrying virus that may prove lethal to the oedipal military-industrial complex," or "nomadic subject of collectively negotiated trajectories." I wish to recall Deleuze at this point, who claims that a minority has no model and its power comes from what it manages to create and creating, he argues, is different from communicating. What happens if the migrant as a sign of becoming minority gives rise to his or her own representation of his or her becoming? Or to put it differently, we may consider him, as being part of a group of subjectivities whose productive impact is directly proportional to their relational, linguistic and communicative ability – a form of living labour. Maybe its unpredictable results defy immediate representation?

Let us end with a simple story. A close friend recalls a recent experience: "On my last travels to Bulgaria the train was on fire. The locomotive was transformed into an enormous column of smoke. The passengers were advised to leave the train. Most Bulgarians immediately began to pick blackberries and strawberries, which were growing on the grassy slopes along the train track and they made all kinds of bouquets with wild herbs and meadow flowers. The few western tourists however were staring for two hours at the timetable, despite the written information that only two trains drive in this direction per day. They were hanging on so insistently to the defined and the promised. Most others really didn’t recognise this situation as catastrophic. They only knew: At this moment the train is not driving – and there are ripe blackberries and strawberries ready to be picked.

References
Ricoeur, P. (1992), *Oneself as Another*, The University of Chicago Press

**Internet:**
Cultural Obstacles of the English Language Teaching in China

Dan Li
Beijing Language and Culture University, China

Abstract

This paper starts from the current difficulties that the foreign language teachers experience in China, and then illustrates the history and basic theory of communicative language teaching and the way that it has been applied to the English classes in China. Last but not least, the writer tries to clarify the topic with an interdiscourse analysis based on the case study of IELTS training in China and in Australia. In conclusion, the paper suggests that it might be the best to combine the essence of both traditional and western ways of teaching and always take into consideration the cultural context in teaching.

Introduction

According to statistics, from 1978-2003 the number of various Chinese students going overseas for study has exceeded 700,000. Up till now 172,000 have returned after graduation. While the accomplishments of returned students are highly recognised by the government and employers, there arise problems that some students who later become language lecturers find it difficult to fully apply the teaching methodologies they have learned overseas to their English classes. It is really discouraging when one works hard to shape into a series of innovative ideas and teaching methods and yet can't practise them in his own teaching experience. We might ask what have actually caused this situation and how we could possibly solve it.

Communicative Language Teaching, the obstacles to apply it to Chinese students and the Possible Solutions

Probing into the phenomenon, we naturally focus on the difference in teaching styles and methodologies between schools and universities in China and in western countries like U.S. and Australia. Comparatively, new ideas and concepts like constructivism and communicative language teaching have long shaped western education since 1960s.

Interaction is central to learning according to the constructivist model of learning. Learners are thought to be active conceptualisers, and learning occurs when they give meaning and structure to knowledge and information (Taylor and Maor, 2000). Learning thus is thought to benefit from an interactive learning environment, as feedback and reflections effectively help knowledge construction (IRE1)

Social constructivism posits that communities, institutions, and groups play a major role in the making of knowledge. In particular, the interaction of people within social situations mediates the construction knowledge through participation in social practices that convey meaning. In this view of learning, interaction is related to the desire to fit in with socially appropriate forms of practice. (Hales & Watkins IRE2)

According to William Littlewood(1981), one of the most characteristic features of communicative language teaching is that it pays systematic attention to functional as well as structural aspects of language. It is accepted that the structural view of a language is not sufficient on its own to account for how language is used as a means of communication. Therefore, in a language class, it is important that the teachers should help the learners to develop skills and strategies to communicate meanings as effectively as possible in concrete situations, and the learners must become aware of the social meaning of language forms in
order to avoid potentially offensive ones.

According to Brown (cited in IRE3). Communicative language teaching is the generally accepted norm in the field of second language teaching. CLT suggests communicative language and language acquisition, and the approach proposes way for learners to internalize a second language and to experiment in a classroom context. Therefore, the classroom context is used to create activities to teach students how to react in a real world situation, not to fake real-world situations. Its basic features are:

- An emphasis on learning to communicate through interaction in the target language.
- The introduction of authentic texts into the learning situation (Authentic material is a must, because students cannot extrapolate to the real world from their learning on made-up material)
- The provision of opportunities for learners to focus not only on language, but also on the learning process itself.
- An enhancement of the learner's own personal experience as important contributing elements to classroom learning.
- An attempt to link classroom language learning with language activation outside the classroom.

In China, education including the English language teaching is still under the influence of structuralism. Although most of the primary school children now start to learn English at the age of 6-7, it is an undeniable fact that the structure of the language is still the main concern. The tendency is more obvious in high schools and colleges where students are asked to focus on the spelling and grammar rules in order to pass a series of exams including the College Entrance Examination and CET (College English Tests) or PETS (Public English Testing System). Under heated competition, both the teachers and students have to work hard on test questions and it severely inhibits the application of communicative language teaching which encourages the students to use the language as a means of expressing their values and judgements or any functions that best meet their own communicative needs. Apparently, the teachers in China have to give lectures and explain the details for most of the class hour. Except for answering the teachers’ questions, the students have very limited time and space to think about expressing their own ideas in English. Under such circumstances, when a teacher wants to bring some activities into the classroom in order to improve the students’ communicative abilities, he might probably find himself met by silence as most of the Chinese students would feel uneasy when they are required to participate and think actively in class instead of sitting and accepting the knowledge. And comparing with the western students, the Chinese students are more knowledge-oriented rather than practice-oriented, which means that it is easier for them to memorise things from the textbooks and the teachers than to relate their learning to realities in the outer world. It is therefore frustrating even embarrassing for the students to be forced into talking and relating classroom study to actual communication with others.

What's more, unlike Singapore or Hong Kong, the language environment in China is not good enough for English learners. English is a foreign, not second language in China, and except for a few people who need English in their work, the majority seldom have chance to practise their language outside the classroom. Consequently, at the very beginning, the communicative language teaching method may arouse students' enthusiasm, but when it comes to real life situation, they simply haven’t chance to practise anything, so all they have acquired are but situational sentences which they normally forget in real life. Since their learning does not make much sense to them, the students’ interest in the language declines naturally. A solution could be a kind of teaching which combines communication with the traditional grammar teaching. For instance, in most of the classes in my school, the lecturers encourage students to give short presentation in turn in the first 5-10 minutes of lectures, and the students have plenty of time to do brain-storming in group-discussion or sometimes activities like debating or role play. Meanwhile, the teachers will also take time to explain the concerned grammar rules and useful expressions and once more ask the students to apply the new knowledge to their expressions in exercises like paraphrasing which reveals the student’s comprehension toward the sentence as well as his ability to express it in his own words.
Inquiry should be one of the key words in exploring constructivist strategies in education. It means that teachers design situations and students do research into solving and building a certain knowledge system by asking questions, applying investigations and providing descriptions, predictions and explanations accordingly. In China, long time of passive learning has strongly impaired students’ ability to ask questions and to build their own knowledge. In order to pass the College Entrance Examination, the students in their middle school are so used to listen to the teachers and follow each step of what the teachers ask them to learn. Some of the passive learners are able to gain a good score in academic tests. In fact, a great number of college students are professional test takers other than individual knowledge learners. It will take them a long time to adjust to the newly gained freedom in universities and obviously they will feel at the beginning that the teachers teach little or nothing to them. This might be the reason of the arising phenomenon in China that native speakers often find their teaching styles challenged by their Chinese students. The complaints include: no textbooks or seldom used; not enough information provided; have no idea why such an exercise or practice could help to improve their English, etc. A building of inter-cultural understanding could be the possible solution to the problem. And the phenomenon itself reminds educators the importance of fitting the new teaching methods into the cultural contexts.

**Cultural Challenge for the Chinese Students**

There is still cultural background which causes the difference in teaching. In western culture, teachers and students share equal status and the students are encouraged to challenge the knowledge, which is, in fact, to challenge the teachers’ authority. In negotiated learning, the freedom of asking question, presenting one’s own ideas from the students’ aspect is extremely helpful in creating an open academic atmosphere as well as establishing the students’ desire to explore more by themselves in study. Such confidence and originality are commonly lacking in most Chinese students. Tracing into Chinese history, the social ethics and moral teaching of respecting even worshiping the teachers and the elders have long influenced Chinese morality. Even to this day, in relatively remote areas in China, the pupils are still not allowed to move or talk freely in their classes, not to say challenging their teachers in class. And a great number of teachers are not ready to be challenged yet, they would feel offended if the students raise a question without being asked. Therefore, when a native speaker or a returned teacher introduces the new “freedom” to the students, it actually creates a different educational and cultural context for them, which “interact to restrict, or at least modify the nature of learning ” (John R.Kirby1996) . On one hand, students may start to realise the importance to express their own thinking and question the teachers sometimes; on the other hand, the students can also get confused when the new teaching style conflicts with the traditional style and even worse if it brings about the conflicts between the teachers with different way of thinking. In fact, such conflicts already exist in the English teaching classes in China.

**An Interdiscourse Analysis based on the case study of IELTS training in China and in Australia**

“The quickest way to change student learning is to change the assessment system.” (Elton and Laurillard, 1979, p. 100)

IELTS, an acronym for International English Language Testing System, is an internationally owned English language assessment used by those seeking international education. It’s jointly managed by British Council, IELTS Australia and the University of Cambridge. It is composed of 4 parts: listening, reading, writing and interview( oral test). In the past decade, IELTS became more and more popular in China as the students wished to obtain higher education in the Commonwealth member countries like Australia. As a result, many IELTS Training Centres sprout in the big cities in China. In order to survive and be prosperous, many centres adopt drastic measures to attract more students. Model tests are the only material and the teachers set up rigid rules to deal with each type of test questions. Actually, a connection between the test material they learned and how to use the material to succeed on IELTS is crucial to most test takers. In China, as well as in Australia, there are experts who
exploit the “weakness” of the test and work hard to find the “secret keys” to tackle with different type of questions. Such test-centred teaching seems to be effective at the very beginning for the students who crave for a dramatic improvement in their scores with a minimum time and effort. However, in the long run, the majority of the students who lack the basic English level required by the test make no or little progress in both their language ability and the test score itself. A few students do benefit from this style of teaching simply because their English is good enough and to know the types of questions is the only need in order to succeed in the test. Due to the Chinese students’ expectation and the heated competition in IELTS training, it’s impossible to avert the present situation in a short time, however, things are already changing when students who have experienced the initial inspiration calmed down and realised the problem. People are more aware of the fact that Rome was not built in one day and there is really no short cut in language learning. The fact is even if they pass the test by chance, they still have a lot to suffer abroad in catching up with the fellow classmates or even in surviving in an English speaking country.

But still it is the tradition for the Chinese to rote learning in order to pass the exams and pass the narrow bridge which brings a limited number of people to achieve their future ambitions and goals. The long time training has converted some students into test machines and they adapt to the test-centred learning so well that they are likely to get a higher score in the test than their real ability could achieve, especially in reading and writing.

David Ausubel (IRE4) contrasted meaningful learning from rote learning as follows.

**Features of rote learning:**

- Arbitrary, verbatim, non-substantive incorporation of new knowledge into cognitive structure.
- No effort to integrate new knowledge with existing concepts in cognitive structure.
- Learning not related to experience with events or objects.
- No affective commitment to relate new knowledge to prior learning.

**Features of meaningful learning**

- Non-arbitrary, non-verbatim, substantive incorporation of new knowledge into cognitive structure.
- Deliberate effort to link new knowledge with higher order concepts in cognitive structure.
- Learning related to experiences with events or objects.
- Affective commitment to relate new knowledge to prior learning.

On the contrary, Australian language teachers tend to pay much attention to students’ real ability in English. In a sense, they are more willing to help the students improve English rather than to help them pass the test. It is the right thing to do, yet it may cause students’ anxiety when they feel they still know nothing about the test itself and it can weaken the students’ enthusiasm and motivation in their study. As a lecturer of the English language and a student studying education in Australia, I was thinking maybe the best is to combine the two extremely different way of teaching and achieve a more idealised goal of IELTS training. For example, the teachers can provide the students with model tests and explain the exams and the type of questions and articles concerned in listening, reading in detail, so that the students, even if they have to improve a lot to attend the test, understand the test format and can set up realistic goals in their study to achieve the goal. Meanwhile, it does help them pass the exam in less effort.

**Conclusion**

Culture consists of values, beliefs, and ways of perceiving, Cultural differences in children's learning styles may develop through their early experience. A cultural group's values and traditional lifestyle may, through child-rearing practices, influence the
learning styles the individual will develop. (Heredia, IRE5)

More efforts should be put into the research of combining the western and eastern teaching methodologies and the research of how to introduce the new methodologies in ways that could be accepted easier. We hope our notice or research can be ripples in the water so that more people could realize the situation and work on solving it. Let's say while we are undertaking the task of eliminating the ignorance and illiteracy all over the world, we really should be careful and always take the cultural and social background into consideration, otherwise, teaching sometimes can be culturally devastating and subversive.

References


Marsh, Colin. (2004). Becoming a teacher Knowledge, skills and issues 3


IRE1 Constructivism,  

IRE2 Hales, R. & Watkins, M. The Potential Contribution of Phenomenography to Study Individuals’ Meanings of Environmental Responsibility  


IRE5 Hieredia, A., http://library.educationworld.net/a12/a12-166.html
Teaching Styles and Methodologies: Communicative Language Teaching

Yongjin Li
Ningxia Medical College, Yinchuan, Ningxia, China

Abstract

With China entering WTO, English is becoming increasingly important in every aspect of Chinese life, more and more Chinese are beginning to learn English. Therefore, an increasing number of Chinese English teachers and students are undertaking their studies in western countries and it is expected that what they have learned from innovative ideas and teaching methodologies can be applied on their return to China. The main issue which confronts them is that the ideas and methodologies that they have learned are the products of Western cultures. They need to critically consider how these “innovative ideas” such as constructivism, learner-centred curriculum; negotiated learning, communicative language teaching etc. apply appropriately to the Chinese cultural context. It is important to use new knowledge in enhancing teaching and learning. However, teachers need to be careful in applying culturally-motivated constructs to an unfamiliar discourse, especially in Chinese English teaching classrooms in an area with less developed education.

Current English Education Situation in China

For decades Chinese teachers have been quite used to the traditional ways of teaching foreign language, in which the teacher is regarded as an authority who dominates the whole class. Students are just an “ignorant audience” waiting to be filled up with knowledge by the teacher. There is little co-operation between the teacher and students and the teacher gets little feedback from his or her students. The traditional “grammar teaching” still dominates the most classrooms. This way of teaching severely frustrates students’ initiative and restrains the development of students’ potential and creativity. As a result, their communicative ability can not be developed.

It is widely recognised that the Grammar Translation Method is still one of the most popular and favourite models of language teaching, which has been rather stalwart and impervious to educational reforms, remaining a standard and sine qua non methodology. With hindsight, we could say that its contribution to language learning has been lamentably limited, since it has shifted the focus from the real language to a “dissected body” of nouns, adjectives, and prepositions, doing nothing to enhance a student’s communicative ability in the foreign language.

At present, with China entering WTO, communicative ability in English in China is treasured. Thanks to the rapid development of Chinese economy, more and more Chinese English teachers and students are undertaking their studies in English speaking countries and it is expected that what they have learned from innovative ideas and teaching methodologies can be applied on their return to China. Therefore, they introduced such teaching methodologies as constructivism, learner-centred curriculum, negotiated learning, and communicative language teaching etc into Chinese English teaching. However, the main issue which confronts them is that the ideas and methodologies that they have learned are the products of western cultures. They need to critically consider how these “innovative ideas” apply appropriately to the Chinese cultural context.
Methodology in language teaching

Methodology in language teaching has been characterized in a variety of ways. The theories of second language acquisition (SLA) are linked to various design features of language instruction. These design features of language instruction might include stated objectives, roles of teachers, learners, materials and so forth. Design features in turn are linked to actual teaching and learning practices as observed collectively came to be known as Communicative Language Teaching (CLT). Communicative Language Teaching advocates subscribed to a broad set of principles such as these:

1. Learners learn a language through using it to communicate.
2. Authentic and meaningful communication should be the goal of classroom activities.
3. Fluency is an important dimension of communication.
4. Communication involves the integration of different language skills.
5. Learning is a process of creative construction and involves trial and error.

Some difficulties in applying communicative language teaching
Methodology in China

Unlike the western teachers, who approach the classroom use of the textbooks as a resource that they exploit selectively, attempting to involve students in active discussion. They expect students’ participation which will include a critical evaluation of texts, revealing students’ independent thinking. Many Chinese students, however, approach textbooks as teachers and authorities. They expect the teacher to expound the book – they will learn through attentive listening, because the teacher is also an authority and provider of knowledge. They apparently accept this knowledge from the textbook uncritically, but in their minds they have their own thinking. They hesitate to express this thinking because their culture of learning includes the notion that one cannot really create or contribute something new until one has mastered the field or relevant techniques – that is, after long apprenticeship. Also, they reflect carefully before participating, in order to be sure their point is valid and useful. Further, they incorporate their care for social relationship into their learning environment, which includes their respect for teacher and fellow students, their concern for “face” issues, for not “showing off,” for group harmony, and so on.

These contrasting cultures of learning lead to variant interpretations of the classroom interaction that accompanies the use of textbooks. For example, asking questions about the cultural content of the textbook seems, for the teacher, very useful. The teacher will ask questions and encourage students to do so, in the belief that this reflects student activity and learning. Many Chinese students, however, believe that if they ask questions, there is a high risk of wasting time or being thought foolish. The teacher should, as part of lesson preparation and teaching, predict learners’ questions, so some students feel no need to ask, but will wait for the anticipated explanation. If no explanation comes, then they conclude that this aspect is not important or that they may find answers from the textbook and materials if they read them again and try to solve the problem themselves. Other students reflect carefully before they ask—they have good questions, but they ask the teacher individually after class in order not to disturb the class. Others ask after class in order to minimize the loss of face if the question seems foolish—their classmates will not hear them ask if they ask alone. Generally speaking, Chinese students are hardworking, well motivated, and friendly. However, these students seem unwilling to speak; they are passive and rather resistant to pair or group work. This brings some difficulties to communicative language teaching in class.

Innovative English Teaching Situations in China

Centred on the notion of the communicative language teaching, In China’s English
classroom so far, when teachers give English classes, instead of traditional one chalk in hand, one teacher-centred, a word-by-word lecture, Chinese English teachers apply some practical ways of teaching to develop students' communicative ability. They design some questions that will lead students into the core material of a lesson, create a friendly learning environment and provide more opportunities for students to practice oral English. Take my students for example, most of whom are from the remote mountain areas where the economy and education are less developed. In order to acquire good English communicative ability, we provide the students with the learner-centred learning environment. Starting from the phonetic symbol teaching, we give students enough time to communicate with each other in class in English, such teaching methodology includes group discussion, duty report.... Initially, the students may feel frustrated because they know fewer words to express their ideas. However, with time going by, by their third year of university English learning, quite to their satisfaction, most of them have achieved fluency and accuracy in English speaking.

Just as Li Yang, a very successful English learner in China, has said: “Learning a language is learning speaking. Only by speaking every day and communicate every day in a certain language can we learn the language well enough to use it freely” Apart from some communicative teaching in class, quite a number of extracurricular activities are also involved in Chinese students’ English learning such as English corner, various competitions, lectures about particular subjects, audio-visual lab, films, games, telling stories, writing a summary, doing gap filling and cloze, listening to BBC and VOA etc.

### Some prospects of Chinese English Teaching

It is true that when teachers and students return from English-speaking countries, they can speak English more fluently and can use it in English classroom teaching more skilfully. However, some methods such as group discussion, community language learning, etc may not be totally applicable in China. For group discussion, if the students have a low English standard, maybe they are allowed to speak some in Chinese and the teacher or other students with high English proficiency can help them to express their ideas more efficiently in English. On the other hand, considering Chinese national situation, grammar teaching should never be avoided in Chinese English classroom. With clear grammar point in mind, with CLT teaching methodology and frequent English-speaking practice in class, the Chinese English learners are sure to acquire English with both accuracy and fluency.

### Conclusion

Teaching methods come and go. The best thing is for teachers to be aware of different approaches and the principles on which they are based. To conclude this paper, I would like to quote Thanasoulas (IRE1) again.

From all the above we can see that the manageable stockpile of research of just a few decades ago has given place to a systematic storehouse of information. Researchers the world over are meeting, talking, comparing notes, and arriving at some explanations that give the lie to past explanations. Nothing is taken as gospel; nothing is thrown out of court without being put to the test. This "test" may always change its mechanics, but the fact remains that the changing winds and shifting sands of time and research are turning the dessert into a longed-for oasis.

### References

Culture in Second Language Teaching and Learning, Eli Hinkel

Discussion on developing students' communicative ability Ouyang Qin, Tang Chongwen, CELEA Journal, April 2004

IRE1 Thanasoulas, D., The changing winds and shifting sands of the history of English
CDA & LPP: Linking Critical Discourse Analysis with Language Policy and Planning Analysis (Keynote Paper)

Joseph Lo-Bianco
University of Melbourne

Abstract

Since the time of the full emergence of modern political structures national inculcation, (nationing, or state incorporation of marginalised populations, whether regional, indigenous, immigrant or colonised), has discursively naturalised its ambition as dealing with "language problems", or "cultural authenticity". A key element has been the desire for notions of culture and language deployed for state purposes to be internally consistent, stable over time and aligned in imagined space with the vertical structures of authority. This process has meant that the search for skilled and homogenous populations vertically connected to state authority has paraded as a process of "efficiency" and "educational effectiveness" and "universal literacy" while silencing the possibilities for more multilingual and pluralist alternatives.

Language policy and planning studies have been mired in the descriptive and taxonomic tendencies of applied linguistics. As a result they sometimes unproblematically accept state claims about "language problems" and "efficient communication" that have precluded a more probing analysis of state language policy making. In this talk I will explore the application of critical discourse analysis to some texts of language policy and planning. I will argue that the desire to be "systematic" and "technically proficient" and even "rational" has led language planning scholars to overlook the crucial role of the subjectivity of language planners and even of ourselves, as expert professional intellectuals in the process of knowledge construction for language policy formulation. My aim will be to open up lines of questioning that try to show the value of a critical discursive understanding of the process of language planning (authoritative interventions for language and communication) especially in societies that are multilingual and post-colonial. The result often has been to silence minority and marginalised voices and to perform cultural violence to communities of communication. The talk will also explore some discourse sensitive modes of analysis that might illuminate new kinds of language policy study, among this Q methodology.

To be included later
ESL Education from a Vygotskyan Perspective: Discourse Characteristics of the Empowering Teaching

Charlotte Liu
University of Adelaide

Abstract
In this paper, Vygotsky's cognitive theories are discussed in relation to the social consequences that language teaching approaches can have in the contemporary multicultural society. First of all, the author analyses the Vygotskyan perspective of the relationships between language, cognition, and consciousness, highlighting aspects of language that are important for cognitive development and conscious awareness. Secondly, Vygotsky's argument for grammatical and conceptual teaching in second language education is discussed. Then, the author builds on this cognitive psychological notion and extends it to a sociological understanding of ESL classroom approaches. An attempt is made to examine the role of social constructivist pedagogies in the light of education for social equity and the empowerment of minority student populations (See Liu & Matthews, 2005 for an epistemological analysis of the departure of social constructivism from Vygotsky's original philosophy). In contrast with constructivism-inspired teaching approaches, the paper proposes a “1+1>2” model of ESL education, and finally, possible implications for daily classroom practices are discussed.

Keywords: ESL / EAL, Vygotsky, constructivism, “1+1>2” model, conscious awareness

Introduction
The question of to what extent education, particularly language education can compensate for social inequity has been a question of debate. On the one hand, there have been observations that as the process of globalisation intensifies the English language has increasingly come to symbolize as well as provide accesses to social prestige and resources in many societies in the world (Pennycook, 1994). On the other hand, the literature has it that in the multicultural society of Australia, ESL education, compared with the political and ideological structures it is situated in, lacks the ability to empower individual and national development (Bullivant, 1995). Additionally, a criticism from within education, corresponding to the above-mentioned view of its “apolitical” nature, is that language education, largely inspired by applied linguistics, has been isolated from educational issues in general (Allwright, 1998).

One cause of this gap in understanding, as Allwright (1998) points out, is the consideration of language education as an epiphenomenon of social political and ideological structures, not a process of real, substantial social consequences. The danger of this viewpoint is that it will deflect our attention away from examining classrooms and schools as unique social settings. It is, therefore, the perspective in this paper that to find out why education changes only social relations between individuals but “preserves structural relations between social groups” (Bernstein, 1996, p.11), the most effective method is not to search outside the “battlefield where it all happens”, but to look into the microcosm and the correspondence in its operational mechanism to the macro structures.

Further, it is the intention of this paper to employ aspects of Vygotsky’s educational psychological theories for analysing popular language teaching approaches and informing possible alternatives for educational equity. In the next section, Vygotsky’s notion of the connection between language and the development of cognition and
conscious awareness will be overviewed. Then a proposal is made accordingly for ESL teaching for cognitive enhancement. A ‘‘1+1>2’’ model, in contrast with the ‘‘1+1<2’’ or ‘‘1+1=2’’ models of English as additional language (EAL) education is described. In so doing, an attempt is made to relate teaching theories and approaches to their social consequences for individual and social empowerment.

Language, Cognition and Instruction for Conscious Awareness

a) Every word is a conceptual generalization; cognition mediated by language represents a dialectical leap from direct sensation to thought (Vygotsky, 1987).

For Vygotsky, language mastery is the developmental mechanism of human cognition; it is the pathway to not just individual internalisation of the socio-cultural and historical, but also to the possibility of the individual standing above history and society. Firstly, language is dual in nature -- every word contains an external and an internal aspect. The external aspect of language is the communicative system that reflects the process and product of historical development of civilization. It is the symbolic system that is commonly accepted and the way of meaning publicly shared by the language community. The internal side involves the function of language in the subjective formation of verbal and conceptual connections. Such is the process of individual recreation built on the basis of social convention and tradition. The external and internal aspects of language are two highly interdependent and interactive composites of verbal thinking. Mastery of a language, therefore, entails not simply the production of grammatically correct use of the speech, but also the ability of intentional and situationally appropriate applications.

Secondly,

The word does not relate to a single object, but to an entire group or class of objects. Therefore, every word is a concealed generalization. From a psychological perspective, word meaning is first and foremost a generalization (Vygotsky, 1987, p.47, original emphases).

Because every word relates to a group of objects, and word meaning always represents an individual conceptual abstraction, the reality represented in individual cognitions by language is now qualitatively different from the reality reflected in immediate sensations and primary perceptions. Language serves to organize for the human mind a conceptualisation of the objective world that is both socially derivative and individually unique. The cognitive and revolutionary impacts of language mastery on thinking are transcendental in nature.

b) Differences between written and oral language

If oral language is a first-order generalization of reality, Vygotsky argues, then written language is a second-order abstraction. The latter encapsulates "verbal thought". Written language differs from oral language in terms of its cognitive requirements or foundations. Compared to oral language, the "sensual aspect of language" (Vygotsky, 1987, p.203), written language lacks the following: material sounds, an immediate interlocutor, extensive exposure or needs of use in family and community life, and situational cues and contextual structures. The abundance of aids from these aspects in the spoken speech leads to it that less is required of the speaker or the language learner in terms of conscious awareness and volitional capacity. On the other hand, written language is "directed by consciousness and intention almost from the outset (ibid., p.204). Hence, if consciousness (in contrast with primary sensation) is mediated by language, conscious awareness presupposes the development of the written speech.

Written speech is the algebra of speech. The process of learning algebra does not repeat that of arithmetic. It is a new and higher plane in the development of abstract mathematical thought that is constructed over and rises above arithmetic thinking. In the same way, the algebra of speech (i.e., written speech) introduces the child to an abstract plane of speech that is constructed over the developed system of oral speech (p.203).
c) EAL Instruction for scientific conceptual development and conscious awareness

With regards to classroom teaching, it is well-known that Vygotsky argues for the importance of interpersonal interaction and collaboration. What is less popularly learnt is his emphasis on interaction, collaboration and imitation as “the source of all the specifically human characteristics of consciousness that develop in the child” (p.210). In other words, the “socialness” in learning contexts itself is not the core of classroom education, if it does not serve as a source for higher mental function development.

Allwright (1998) describes an interesting classroom discoursal dilemma which plagues particularly language teaching: “a simple conflictual relationship between social and pedagogical pressures”, “wherein teachers and learners might delude themselves, and each other, that ‘all must be well pedagogically if all is apparently well socially’” (p.130). I shall come back to this point of sacrificing the academic for the social later, but here suffice it to say that a surface reading of Vygotsky often leads to the mere emphasis on social aspect of teaching, at the expense of pedagogic content, or to the popular belief that whatever is “social” enough will somehow, naturally bring about academic learning in classrooms.

By contrast, I invite readers to consider the following quotes, which seem somewhat at odds with popular beliefs of the role of social collaboration and instruction.

- “Among the basic tasks of the psychology of school instruction is to clarify this internal logic, the internal course of development that is called to life by a particular course of instruction” (p.208).
- School instruction and the adult’s collaboration with the child in solving problems must manifest “meaningfulness” and lead to the “understanding of structural relations” (p.210).
- “The strength of the scientific concept lies in the higher characteristics of concepts, in conscious awareness and volition. In contrast, this is the weakness of the child’s everyday concept. The strength of the everyday concept lies in spontaneous, situationally meaningful, concrete applications, that is, in the sphere of experience and the empirical. … Scientific concepts restructure and raise spontaneous concepts to a higher level, forming their zone of proximal development. … instruction in scientific concepts plays a decisive role in the child’s mental development” (p.220).
- Scientific concepts “develop from above to below, from the more complex and higher characteristics to the more elementary. … The birth of the scientific concept begins not with an immediate encounter with things but with a mediated relationship to the object” (p. 219, emphasis original).

Therefore, the process of school instruction is not one that evolves around the production of spontaneous or everyday understandings, but scientific concepts. Scientific concepts and spontaneous concepts have completely opposite developmental directions and pathways. Whilst spontaneous concepts originate from daily, immediate experiences, scientific concepts are those that reflect the internal logic of knowledge and epistemology. Instruction of scientific concepts may be subject-specific, but at other times, it “influences the development of the higher mental functions in a manner that exceeds the limits of the specific content and material of each subject” (p.208). Such is the formal aspect of all school disciplines. Only the teaching that directs towards scientific concepts can enable students to rise above themselves. To teach only for the development of spontaneous concepts is to reinforce and maintain the weakness in the child’s mental development.

d) Implications for language teaching

In language classrooms, the conflictual relationship of the social and pedagogic pressures is the cause of the over-emphasis on the social at the expense of the cognitive and academic. Popular language pedagogic theories often argue for reproducing within classroom the society outside, recreating in the learning context what is ‘real’ and ‘relevant’. In such considerations, meaningfulness is defined as truthful mimicry of the chaos and messiness of reality, as direct and constant connections to
personal experiences. On the other hand, as alluded to earlier, meaningfulness, according to Vygotsky, stands for the revelation of systematic, structural relations, in contrast with what is trivial, fragmented, and messy. In the popular worships of the ‘true social reality’ as the learning environment, we run the exact risk of blurring the ‘big picture’ and being blinded by trivialities. It is also a common proposal in language education that students should be encouraged to immerse in personal participation, to learn from self-discovery and exploration. Learning is conceived by psychologists as a ‘natural process that cannot be intervened’. In an interview with Fine Print, Christie (1995) observes that in natural learning theories, “children learn in the interactive patterns of speech. The proposal is that language is learned with a minimal amount of explicit intervention and a maximum amount of undirected participation and immersion in language” (p.10). By so doing, in popular constructivist pedagogies, the role of language for organizing the human intellect as argued by Vygotsky is not typically reflected. Rather than being presented the internal systems and patterns of language, students are expected to immerse in the classroom mimicry of life, as impossible as it is, and figure out for themselves inherent structures, purposes, and connections.

In his discussions of language instruction, Vygotsky illustrates the teaching of scientific concepts with the examples of teaching grammar and written language.

The preschool child possesses all the basic grammatical and syntactic forms. He does not acquire fundamentally new grammatical or syntactic structure in school instruction. From this perspective, instruction in grammar is indeed a useless undertaking. What the child does learn in school, however, is conscious awareness of what he does. He learns to operate on the foundation of his capacities in a volitional manner. His capacity moves from an unconscious, automatic plane to a voluntary, intentional, and conscious plane. Instruction in written speech and grammar play a fundamental role in this process (p.206, emphasis added).

Here, development occurs when the student gains conscious awareness of knowledge and the volitional capacity to operate under the conscious awareness. Regarding the written speech, Vygotsky argues for its teaching to children at a young age.

It could be argued that if written speech requires volition, abstraction, and other functions that have not yet matured in the school child, we need to delay instruction until these functions begin to mature. Practical experience demonstrates, however, that instruction in writing is among the most important subjects in the child’s early school career and that it elicits the development of functions that have not yet matured. Thus, when we say that instruction should rely on the zone of proximal development rather than on mature functions, … we are … freeing ourselves from an old delusion that implies that development must complete its cycles for instruction to move forward (p.211).

To conclude this section on the role of language in cognitive development and implications for language education, Vygotsky suggests that because every word is a generalisation of a group of objects or phenomena, word meaning contains the individual construction of conceptual connections. Hence, cognition mediated by speech is qualitatively different from immediate and primary sensations. Accordingly, school instructions need to teach to the development of scientific, systematic and internal conceptual logics. Only in so doing can instruction lead, instead of lagging behind maturation. Such is the instruction that differs education of human intelligence from the training of animals, and that distinguishes teaching of higher-level consciousness from that of trivial mechanical skills. For language instruction specifically, teaching systematic patterns of grammar and written speech facilitates the growth of higher mental functions and volitional use of language.

Additional Language Education for Cognitive Development and the “1+1>2” Model of ESL Education

School instructions should evolve around the development of scientific concepts, which, in contrast with everyday concepts, starts from the upper, more sophisticated level of
There is significant commonality in the mental foundations underlying instruction in the various school subjects that is alone sufficient to insure the potential for the influence of one subject on the other (i.e., there is a formal aspect to each school subject) ... In attaining conscious awareness of cases, the child masters a structure that is transferred to other domains that are not directly linked with cases or grammar; ... the mental functions are interdependent and interconnected. ... Because of the foundation which is common to all the higher mental functions, the development of voluntary attention and logical memory, of abstract thinking and scientific imagination, occurs as a complex unified process. The common foundation for all the higher mental functions is consciousness and mastery. This interdependency of school disciplinary conceptual systems applies equally to languages. When students learn an additional language, they do not simply pick up another way or system of speech. That is to say, the additional speech system is not mastered in isolation or independence from the native language system. Vygotsky points out that the developmental processes of the additional and native languages are in opposite directions, similar to those of scientific and spontaneous concepts. But in spite of that, “there is a mutual dependence between these two paths of development. The conscious and intentional leaning of a foreign language is obviously dependent on a certain level of development in the native language” (p.221, original emphasis). Before the beginning of learning an additional language, the student must already have an initial psycho-linguistic concept system, containing the network of connections between word and object, language and world. This is the formal foundation for the student to be able to make sense, in the second language, of how language functions and how a symbolic system organizes perceptions. Cummins (1984) has also discussed the cognitive transfer between native and additional languages extensively. Besides semantic concepts, as he points out, “subject matter knowledge, higher-order thinking skills, reading strategies, writing composition skills etc. developed through the medium of L1 transfer or become available to L2 given sufficient exposure and motivation” (p.144). In Vygotsky’s terms, while the relationship between reality and cognition is mediated by language, the relationship between the foreign language and reality is mediated by the native language. Moreover, during the process of additional language learning, it is not just that L2 is dependent on L1, L1, on the other hand, also interacts with and gains from L2 development. The mastery of the second language objectifies the primary connection between the mother tongue and reality. In the process of the second language learning, the relation between the external features of language, such as sounds, spellings, and sentence structures, etc., and the meaning aspects becomes less direct. The immediacy in such relation is reduced. Such development is not only a matter of addition but one of qualitative change. Mastery of a foreign language brings qualitative changes to the way reality is organized in the conceptual system developed in the native language. However, this process does not happen naturally to every learner. This has to do with a few factors. One, it has to do with the learner’s proficiency and literacy in the native language -- this prescribes the level of sophistication of the native tongue conceptual system, which is the cognitive foundation for the additional language as a psycholinguistic as well as social symbolic system. Two, it can be attributed to the manner of second language teaching and learning. For additional language education to facilitate the general cognitive development in conscious awareness, emphasis must be placed in teaching and learning on the formal aspect of the discipline. The additional language education evolving around the formal aspect of the subject is what I have termed the “1+1>2” model, in contrast with the “1+1= / < 2” models. The “1+1>2” model is oriented towards the contribution to general cognitive growth, in terms of scientific thinking and metacognitive awareness. This is nurtured by educational approaches and policies where both languages are respected and legitimately acknowledged. It differs
from the model where the basis for interlinguistic transfer is neglected, or discouraged, e.g., in some cases, use of native language in classrooms is forbidden or even punished. As well, the “1+1>2” model promotes the instruction that “impells [sic.] or wakens a whole series of functions that are in a stage of maturation lying in the zone of proximal development (Vygotksy, 1987, p.211, emphases original). In this sense, it targets towards giving away the generic patterns and literacy conventions in social discourses, it differs from models where focuses are placed on the linguistic form, divorced from meaning, or on fluent and spontaneous usage, leaving out the structure or system. Essentially, both the linguistic form and spontaneity in usage, on their own, are merely the external aspects of verbal thinking.

Inter-Linguistic Code Switching as Social Symbolic Power

In studying the social symbolic power of language, one may rightly point out the artificiality of the social prestige attached to one form of language use. Such has been argued of written versus spoken speech, and of the standard English versus other dialects of Englishes. But it would be less justifiable for one to come to the conclusion, based on the above judgement, that, for reasons of social justice and equality, there needs only be individual options of any one form or dialect of language use in their educational pursuits, at the discard of multiplicity. At a social level, this viewpoint of “multiculturalism” or “multilingualism” has been criticised by opponents as separatist (Radtke, 2001). At the individual cognitive level, this argument leads to the closure of the developmental pathway to higher-order abstraction and conscious awareness. Delpit (2002) describes her daughter’s ability to “switch” between the standard and black versions of Englishes. I could imagine such ability of “switching”, or in other words the cognitive flexibility in psycholinguistic capacities, may well be a key to individual empowerment and social realization of multiculturalism. Social prestige attached to one form of speech may be artificial and unsubstantial, but the benefits of the cognitive flexibility are real.

Implications for Classroom Practices and Discourse Environment for Language and Cognitive Growth

For classroom practices:

1. To teach to the strengths, rather than the weaknesses of ESL students.

In the case of migrant or international students in Australia, many have already received formal schooling in the English language system. For many of these students, when compared to English native speakers, their strength is their consciousness of the linguistic system, or the scientific conceptual understanding of the language. This is because emphasis on grammatical rules and the written speech is often the feature of foreign language education (Byram, 1989). These students’ comparative weakness lies in their inability to communicate fluently and spontaneously, which is the strength of native speakers. The point to be made here is, for language education to empower minority students, classroom teaching should not only compensate for their weaknesses, but also corroborate and intensify their strengths.

Social constructivist pedagogies, by contrast, propose spontaneous and automatic use through sustained immersion and implicit instructions. Language productions in the classroom are often elicited by the immediate situation, not volitional awareness of the functions of language.

In order to teach to the strengths of minority students, the following may be useful pathways.

Firstly, instructions of grammatical and generic features of the English language play a significant part.

Secondly, using metalanguage enhances conscious conceptualisation of the English speech system and its learning. Metalanguage is defined in two dimensions: linguistic,
grammatical terms and expressions, and the language used in discussing about learning. I limit my discussion here to that of the first dimension, and continue with the second in points c. and d. in the next section on classroom discourse environments. If in every word there exists a concept, i.e., a concealed generalization of a group of objects or phenomena (Vygotsky, 1987), then in grammatical notions there embodies structural connections amongst linguistic concepts. Classroom apprenticeship and communication in metalanguage in this dimension is the only channel for the realization of scientific, rather than spontaneous concepts. Externalising such structural relations in the speech system enables uplifting immediate, situation-bound perceptions to conscious awareness of internal structures.

And thirdly, teaching the written speech and literate skills should be an important component in ESL programs.

For classroom discourse environment:

a) Classroom use of language should be purposeful and conceptually focused. This is to say, language use in the classroom should not be eclectic, but systematically strung in concepts represented by language. However, this does not point to restricted use of language by teacher or students. Teacher's and students' speech alike need to reflect a suitable range of diversity and multiplicity in language resources. Language environment in the classroom needs to be familiar (i.e., conceptually structured) and challenging at the same time.

b) Successful teaching and learning presuppose well-structured task-environments. Students need to be provided with explicit and sufficient scaffolding and cues in language tasks. Cazden (2005) observes routines and institutionalised procedures are the essentials featuring effective classroom interactive activities.

c) Language learning happens not only in academic discourse, but also in the regulative discourse (Bernstein, 1996). Using the target language in the latter discourse has significant impact on internalising learning-to-learning abilities. This means that the target language is not just used as an end product or a performance conducted in strictly controlled environments of classroom tasks; but it should also be used in managing classroom learning processes. In some language classrooms, however, the production of the target language in drills and set tasks alone is perceived as “real learning”, whereas use of the target language in the regulative discourse is considered as unnecessary, as a burden to classroom communication, and as not having direct bearings on “learning”. This is reflected in the classroom practice where talks in L1 and L2 are strictly assigned to task negotiation and task completion, or where teacher's speech in scaffolding and monitoring learning is scattered, offhand, and at will. In such classroom language environments, either the cognitive and metacognitive aspects of learning are artificially compartmentalised, or the two are not in an echoing corroborative relationship as they should be in an effectively structured context. Encapsulated in using English in the academic discourse is the acquisition of specific target language items, on the other hand, embodied in the regulative discourse is the subject-specific metacognitive processes of guiding, planning, organizing, and regulating learning. The abilities to not only complete language tasks but also to discuss about language learning are an important characteristic of empowered learners.

d) To further the previous point of the regulative discourse of metacognition, there needs to be open, explicit, and honest discussions of cognitive structures in tasks and activities, and goals and purposes of activities and assessments. Embedded in implicit teaching is often an issue of teachers' individual control. In many classrooms where students alone are relied on for metacognitive insights and comprehensions, the teacher, for as long as it takes, stays in the position of knowledge and control, and the student the position without.

e) L1 and L2 are equally respected and promoted. This can be achieved, for example, by teaching and eliciting reflections on comparisons of the two languages' linguistic and generic features, sometimes also corresponding cultural dimensions. For the formal aspect of the discipline to be a strong orientation and for ESL or EFL education to facilitate the development of the general cognitive capacity, a higher-order conscious awareness of the English speech and literacy system will be a presupposed ability of
teachers. For this end, teachers may not be equipped with bi-/multi-literacy learnings, but it will be necessary for us to be able to initiate and participate in conversations with students on meta-linguistic or literacy matters, and be skilful at drawing important comparative conclusions.

**Pedagogies, Philosophies, and Ideologies**

Constructivism, a kin of post-modernism, is identified to be a dominating ideology in school education, which the South Australian Curriculum Standards and Accountability Framework is established upon (Gibbons, 2004). Although popularly claimed to originate from the theories of, amongst others, Vygotsky, it is argued that the school of thoughts essentially operates under the Cartesian dualism of mind and body, of the subjective and objective, and of the individual and collective (Liu & Matthews, 2005).

The argument to be made, however, is not one purely philosophical. Rather, the position taken here is that educational endeavours for empowerment and equity in multicultural societies need to be informed by a paradigm of epistemological coherence, integration, and holism. Educational equity is not likely to gain much from philosophies where the subjective and objective or the individual and collective are seen separated or inherently conflictual.

In contrast with the separatist charge for multiculturalism as a social ideology (Radtke, 2001), Smolicz (1999) puts forward a conceptual framework of "internalised cultural pluralism" (p.55), where multilingualism and multiculturalism at a national level is realized through individual internalisation. Concerning multicultural educational policies, Smolicz also proposes that multiliteracy, in contrast with the current monolingual myopic definition of literacy as that of the English language, serves as a yardstick for genuine multiculturalism. This perspective of the individually internalised balance between the national overarching language and ethnic language values is strongly supported by Vygotsky’s conception, where language is considered as a living microcosm within the living organism of human intellect, encapsulating both individual recreation as well as socio-cultural and historical development. Such holistic educational philosophy sketches an orientation to harmony in change.

**References**


Adelaide.


Role-Playing the Entrepreneurial Gender – a Critical Discourse Analysis Approach

Seppo Luoto
University of Vaasa

Abstract
This study focuses on finding out how Finnish male and female university and polytechnics students construct their “entrepreneurial gender” in their narratives on entrepreneurship. 105 narratives were gathered by using the role-play method and analyzed by using discourse analytical concepts. Two gender-related discourses were identified: “limiting discourse” (females) and “expanding discourse” (males) which were in line with traditional constructions of gender-related entrepreneurship. Based on this study, it can be suggested that critical discourse analysis approach could be valuable in identifying these usually hidden meanings which still seem to exist in our society.

Introduction
Previous entrepreneurship and gender research has noted that there exists, in terms of the supply of entrepreneurs, a gender gap (Minniti et al. 2005; Mueller 2004; Starr & Yudkin 1996). For instance in Scandinavia, women account for only approximately 20 percent of new firm foundations (Ljunggren & Kolvereid 1996). It is argued that different “discourses” linked to entrepreneurship might give one explanation to this, as they build up stereotypes or social constraints to women, thus creating a gender gap in the supply of entrepreneurs (Fischer et al 1993; Starr & Yudkin 1996).

In this article the focus is to study the gender linked to entrepreneurship as a discursive practice, a view which is a mixture of the literature of (feminist) critical studies, cultural studies, and discourse analytic studies. In this tradition the main interest is “how the gender is done” in everyday linguistic and social practices (Ahl 2002; Bruni et al 2002; Gherardi 1995). Therefore, the concept of gender could then be defined as a set of social practices and a system of cultural meanings, organized into a particular configuration of social relations (Rakow 1986).

The term “discourse” is here be defined according to Foucauldian and critical discourse analytic traditions as “any regular and regulated system of statements, which build up relations within the system and these relations can then be viewed as power relations done in social practices” (Fairclough 1995; Foucault 1977; Parker 1992). Discourses as a mode of everyday linguistic practice function as a way to reflect, create, and maintain cultural values; they are shaped to ensure that valued practices are given prominence (Hall 1992). Accordingly, the task of discourse analysis is to identify meanings “beyond the sentence-level” and to construct such theoretical concepts, which do not automatically come out of the data and which have relevance in relation to study topic(s) (Eskola & Suoranta 2000).

One central Foucauldian concept linked to discourse was the concept of “subject position”. According to Willig (2001) the concept of subject position means that “every discourse offers a subject a limited amount of positions one has to take…positioning is not a matter of subject choosing his/her position but a way of “seeing the world” or “to be in the world” what the discourse offers as reality.” Varying subject positions are formed in relation to other people or in relation to culture: ‘The self no longer uses language to express itself; rather language speaks through the person. The individual self becomes a medium for the culture and its language’ (Kvale 1992). This “production of self” can then be analysed as a linguistic practice (Gherardi & Poggio 2002).
Most empirical studies on these issues have not been designed to address pre-venture issues such as potential for entrepreneurship among women in comparison to men. There have been a few exceptions, however, in which differences between the female and male students in pre-venture stage have been studied. It has been found that males clearly have a higher level of interest in entrepreneurship than females for instance during their study-years (Kourilsky & Walstad 1998; Lips 1999; Leskinen 1999; Päällysaho 1997; Ristimäki 2004).

However, the discourse analytic approaches, which study this topic in the micro-level as a social and linguistic practice seem to be quite rare. Therefore, I study in this paper the Finnish female and male university and polytechnics students’ narratives about entrepreneurship and trying to find out what are the gender-related discourses and how the students “produce themselves”. The chosen linguistic practice here is the narratives about entrepreneurship done by these students.

Data Collection and Analysis

I applied the role-playing method (Eskola 1991; Eskola & Suoranta 2000; Hytti & Kuopuisjärvi 2004) to gather the narratives. I provided the students with a short frame story to write the narratives: “It is year 2008 and you have been building up a new business. Imagine yourself in the future and write a 3-4 page story about how your business started, what happened next, and how the story continued until the present situation. Describe what kind of action and actors were involved in the events along the story”.

The narratives were gathered in the cities of Kauhava, Seinäjoki, and Vaasa in the beginning of the course “New Venture Creation” in 2004. The respondents had approximately 60 minutes time to write their stories. Totally 105 stories were gathered, of which 57 were written by women and 48 by men. The average age of the writers was 22½ years.

The analysis process started at the end of 2004 by analysing the basic structures and content of these narratives (Luoto 2004). The pilot discourse analysis was done in summer 2005 with the female narratives (Luoto & Anttila 2005). In this pilot study the areas of businesses the female students reported in their stories were identified. The role of this “quantitative analysis” was in this study merely to help in the identification of main topics. It also acted as a start for the qualitative analysis (Eskola & Suoranta 2000). After this pilot study the same was done with the male narratives. This time the “research triangulation” (Denzin 1978) was also applied in order to deepen and widen the picture about the whole data. After that, the narratives were read again and the analysis further developed. My aim was to build up “thick concepts and categories” in order to “get the voices out of the data” (Alasuutari 1999).

Results

Based on the data, four discourses were identified and named. The two first are called “problem-solving” and “collaborating discourse”. These discourses are “shared” by both sexes and they are interpreted differently in both of the gender-related discourses. The identified gender-related discourses are called “limiting discourse” and “expanding discourse”. Here, I use extracts of these narratives to describe the data in a lively way (Eskola & Suoranta 2000).

Problem-Solving Discourse

In the narratives different risks, problems, or difficulties were associated with entrepreneurship. Students face constant situations of problem-solving in their entrepreneurial narratives, for instance high risks or lack of competence.

My friends began to hesitate, because they had good jobs elsewhere. Risks
were so high that I began to consider giving up but I did not at the end” (Male 22 years)

We did not have so much expertise in the area so our business was a constant battlefield between survival and failure (Male 25 years)

After running the business for a while the troubles emerge if they have not emerged in the beginning.

“We just decided to continue and work harder...we thought that giving up would be the worst idea...afterward s we thought that how could we manage those times doing work all days and nights” (Female 20 years)

In the problem solving discourse the entrepreneurship is constructed as risky and hard work. You cannot relax or enjoy your work until you have faced and solved the problems (Luoto 2004). This is in line with the previous Finnish studies among students concerning the images of entrepreneurship (see for instance Leskinen 1999; Ristimäki 2004; Hytti & Kuopusjärvi 2004). The entrepreneur simply does not manage to do without problems:

From the early stage of this business I just realised that there are so many tough questions all the time in entrepreneurship that in order to survive one cannot simply rest and take a holiday” (Male 23 years)

We have to work weekends and holidays to get the bills paid – we have tried to invent new ideas but the problems seem to stay there anyway (Female 21 years)

**Collaborating Discourse**

In both men and female narratives business is started with friends, relatives, and partners:

“We were four girls of the same age from different parts of Finland and when we finished the school nobody wanted to stay alone and therefore we decided to start a business of our own” (Female 21 years)

“Me and my older brother decided to start our own business in consulting” (Male 21 years)

In the collaboration discourse the business is seen as some kind of “team-effort”. Even if it is sometimes lonely and hard work, the entrepreneur knows that there are people around to help if needed. The willingness to these collaborative approaches is also documented for instance by Nevanperä (2003) in his study of students’ entrepreneurial attitudes.

**Limiting discourse**

The first gender-related (female) discourse is here named as “limiting discourse”. This means that female students tend to “limit” their possibilities and resources (see Dickerson & Taylor 2000):

“In the beginning I was very lost even though I had been trained to start an own business” (Female 23 years)

“I did not imagine myself as a leader when facing the real live challenges in the business” (Female 22 years)

The business areas were certain, traditional female businesses (see Kovalainen 1993; Henttonen et al 2003), such as clothing in local or national markets:

“As a woman I was naturally interesting in clothing and decided to start a business in Seinäjoki” (Female 23 years)

Women construct themselves here also as needing help and constant encouragement from the relatives and from their husbands/boyfriends:
"Luckily my family and especially my boyfriend was very supportive in everything so it was easier for me to take a part in the business" (Female 22 years)

"My relatives helped me by giving me a little sum of money in the start-up phase" (Female 24 years)

It seems also that in this discourse close friends and relations come first and the main idea for the business is to continue and maintain these relations via business, such as restaurant-keeping:

"I think we all wanted to have a very well decorated restaurant so that we could enjoy being together in the business" (Female 25 years)

Women see themselves as small business entrepreneurs in the narratives – no considerable risks are taken or efforts made. In this sense the entrepreneurial identity resembles the “artisan identity” (Stanworth and Curran 1976) where the entrepreneur values, for instance, the ability to choose the people you work with, or where the satisfaction lies in producing a quality product backed with personal service:

"For me the business did not give any big successes, but at least I had some work to do which is better than being unemployed" (Female 24 years)

"We were three young women and nobody thought that this was going to be a big business" (Female 22 years)

"We thought not to take any considerable risks in the means of marketing but to count on old good methods" (Female 23 years)

"I wanted to put my effort on personal client-relations…I think this is one thing my clients really appreciate” (Female 21 years)

In this way this discourse resembles Bruner’s (1987) concept of “inner world”, which is private, intimate, forgiving, and safe, and where the subject does not need to be afraid of anything.

**Subject Position in the Limiting Discourse**

The limiting discourse produces for women the role of the contemplator and maintainer. Women see themselves as contemplators, careful analyzers of risks: no big steps and successes are seen in the entrepreneurial future. The maintainer–role means keeping the business small and in local or national setting. The collaboration with others is based on close family relations – the primary role of “close relations” and the secondary role of “business” is described in this discourse. Women construct themselves also as needing help and encouragement from significant others like relatives and husbands and in many narratives their roles as entrepreneurs are defined against the dominance of male entrepreneurship.

**Expanding Discourse**

The male-related discourse is here named as “expanding discourse”. In the expanding discourse the males construct themselves as actively seeking market opportunities for the new, mainly growth-oriented businesses in national and international setting:

“We started to create something new actively with these technologies” (Male 22 years)

“We aimed at having 10% growth in every year” (Male 24 years)

“Of course we started to look at other opportunities besides Helsinki, like in Brazil” (Male 21 years)

Males construct themselves as active business planners and actors with good network of business partners and other collaborators supporting the developing of business ideas. The role of the collaboration in the male businesses is to “use the contacts”, “have good tips from the experts” in order to succeed and develop the business
constantly:

“I had managed to gather around me the wide network of relationships from different business areas like salesmen, venture capitalists, and sub-contractors (Male 20 years)

“We had good, five year old contacts all around the world in the fashion business” (Male 22 years)

“I was considered as trusted person in my network and I just wanted to use my network in this start-up” (Male 21 years)

Males just “make it happen”, they are the “frontiersmen of the West” who “discover the new lands” (Bull and Willard 1993). They are aware of risks, problems, and heavy work (“problem discourse”) but they have the courage and competence to face the problems:

“We just did it because we already had had some successes in our previous working life” (Male 24 years)

“There was no use in waiting – we knew that these kinds of opportunities did not come to us so often” (Male 25 years)

Males operate also in the public, “outer world” (Bruner 1987); the descriptions of family relations are few and especially the relations with wives/girlfriends are ignored in the discourse.

Subject Position in the Expanding Discourse

In the expanding discourse, the subject is constructed actor and developer. Males see themselves as active and capable business planners and actors using different resources and networks in the national and international setting. They constantly seek opportunities and collaboration, and different relations are described here as “business relations” – these relations have value as a way of developing the business. In another words, they “expand” themselves in the narratives. Here is a summary of abovementioned discourses and subject positions related to them.

![Figure 1. Summary of different discourses and gender-related subject positions](image-url)
**Discussion**

In this study I was interested in what are the gender-related discourses in the students’ narratives about entrepreneurship? Four discourses in the narratives were identified: the shared discourses were problem-solving discourse and collaborating discourse. Specifically gender-related discourses were the “limited discourse” (females) and “expanding discourse” (males). These discourses produced different subject positions to female and male students – female students’ subject positions were named as “contemplator” and “maintainer” and male subject positions as “actor” and “developer”. One could state that these narratives did reproduce the traditional picture of the gender related to entrepreneurship: males seem to construct themselves as capable, innovative, and developing actors and as ‘discovering of new lands’, whereas females constructed themselves as contemplators and maintainers of local small business in traditional female business areas. One may conclude that even though all the occupations are “open” for both sexes, the Finnish society is still “gendered” at least on the discoursive level, also with regard to entrepreneurship (see also Vainio-Korhonen 2002).

But what to do with these findings, then? The difference between Foucauldian and critical discourse analysis is that Foucault sees the individual as determined by discursive structures, whereas critical discourse analysis stresses that people use discourses as resources with which they (can) create new constellations of words. According to Fairclough (1992) the task of discourse analysis is both deconstructive and constructive. In its deconstructive moment it aims to disrupt and render problematic the themes and power relations of everyday talk and writing, here the “gendering of entrepreneurship”. In its constructive moment, it has been applied to the development of critical literacy curriculum that aims towards an expansion of students’ capacities to critique and analyse discourse and social relations, and towards a more equitable distribution of discourse resources, also in entrepreneurship education. In these “dynamic discursive practices” students need assistance in recognizing the influence of the dominant discourses which might direct their career planning process. In practice, this constructive side of the gendered entrepreneurship could be arranged in the long-term, for instance supervision type of learning processes, where the educators could provide the students with alternative role-models and time and different tools for them in the need of constructive “self-reflection”.

This study was done with the Finnish polytechnics and university students. It could be therefore noted that these results have limitations in intercultural setting. When it comes to the limitations of the chosen methodology, it could be stated that these approaches produce insights and knowledge based on continuous debate and argumentation. Many critical views consider discursive approaches only as “relativistic language games”, where every topic could be analysed in every possible way. However, there may still exist a “constructive relativism” meaning that with these views it is possible to highlight the possibility to different social constructions and open up the possibilities for social change and seeing differently to topic (Eskola & Suoranta 2000).

The common criticism towards the role-play method seems to be how "real" the narratives are and how superficial is the situation where the narratives are written and collected. Related to this it is said that this method only brings up the stereotypic thinking about the certain topic (Eskola & Suoranta 2000). It can be stated that the role-play method does produce stereotypic thinking, but in this study it is a strength because I was specifically interested in stereotypic kind of thinking, trying to analyse typical, gender-related thinking concerning entrepreneurship.

**References**


Weaving the Threads of Disciplinary Conventions, Prior Literacy Practices and Personal Desires: International Students in Higher Education

Tran Thi Ly
University of Melbourne

Abstract
This paper will explore how Vietnamese and Chinese international students exercise their personal agency and attempt to gain membership in their disciplinary discourse community through mediating between different interpretations of academic writing. Drawing on talk around texts (Lillis, 2001) and a modified version of Fairclough's (1992) text-oriented discourse analysis, it will look at the link between dimensions of life experiences and personal desires the students bring into their practices of meaning making and their voices in writing. The paper will also discuss how the students' awareness of the disciplinary discourse conventions shapes their writing. The discussion of the students' accounts raises the questions whether their seemingly unfamiliar ways of meaning making merit a place in academic writing in higher education in Australia and to what extent students' power and desires for new ways of meaning making can be afforded within the institutional practice. The discussion further indicates the need to listen to students talking about the reasons underpinning their specific instances of making meaning in their texts and confirms the fact that more attention should be paid to the issues of personal desires, life history and personal experiences in studying students' academic writing. These aspects have however been left largely unexplored in the related literature so far.

Introduction
Given that the internationalization of higher education has become an issue of increasing attention and academic writing is central to students' success in Australian institutions, international students' experience in engaging in disciplinary written discourse has been a common theme across various studies (Cadman, 1997; Ferguson, 1997; Phan, 2001). This study aims to unpack the factors underpinning the specific ways of writing of Chinese and Vietnamese international students in their disciplines. The study focuses on students in Education and Commerce disciplines at an Australian University. The work reported in this paper is part of a larger research project being carried out with international students in the above disciplines. Employing talk around texts (Lillis, 2001), a modified version of Fairclough's (1992) critical discourse analysis, this paper argues for the need to explore the silences in current practices and research into international students' ways of constructing knowledge and to problematize the assumptions made about international student writing based only on the analysts' or researchers' analysis of linguistic features of students' texts. In particular, the study indicates the value of examining ways to get insight into the real accounts of the students as the 'insiders' or 'producers' in producing their own texts and uncovering students' individual potential choices and intentions as their hidden logics in the construction of texts.

This paper will first address the key issues around the different interpretations of
International students from distinctive discourse communities

International students’ disciplinary writing seems to be marked by particular interpretations of academic writing. Their different understandings of the approaches to writing are formed by a host of factors including the ways they have learnt to see the world, the ways of valuing and constructing knowledge, the ways of communicating with the audience and organizing discourse (Cadman, 1997; Connor, 1996; Fox, 1994). Fox (1994) acknowledges that since different ways of making sense of the world and different approaches to knowledge exist in different distinct writing communities, approaches to meaning making in academic writing which are considered logical appear to be different in different cultures. From this perspective, it can be seen that international students have been brought up with particular ways of interpreting and describing the world and of reflecting this in their writing. However, these distinctive approaches to writing, which are largely shaped by distinctive cultural and social communities, may be differently mediated by different individual student-writers from the same community.

Moreover, Stephens (1997) argues that writing norms themselves are shaped by culture but culture is not a ‘set’ or ‘fixed’ construct. Therefore, within this study, although trends in Vietnamese and Chinese writing traditions (see, for example, Ferguson, 1997; Phan, 2001 and Hinkel, 1997; Mohan and Lo, 1985) need to be acknowledged, placing too much emphasis on them as the only explanation for students' writing experience may easily lead to stereotyping. Rather, in light of Littlewood’s (1999:83) suggestion, cultural assumptions should be viewed as ‘possible clues’ for our interpretations of students’ particular ways of writing. By involving students in reflecting on their specific instances of meaning making, the study aims to offer the grounding to unpack the ‘deeper’ aspects of Chinese and Vietnamese students’ writing practice. It sets out to avoid simplifying and stereotyping national or cultural characteristics of Vietnamese and Chinese students. Within this study, this view recognizes the significance of listening to individual students talking about their own texts, which is at the center of Lillis’ (2001) framework. This framework informs the research design of this study.

Discourse power and students’ agency

An important trend of literature on student writing in higher education has been devoted to bringing to the fore the deficiencies of treating writing as a set of skills or a ‘transparent’ medium of meaning representation, thereby arguing for the need to see writing at the discursive and social level (Fairclough, 1992, 1995; Kubota, 2004; Ivanic, 1997; Lea and Street, 2000; Lillis, 2001). In an attempt to avoid making surface assumptions about student writing, these authors tend to explore deeper aspects involved the nature of student writing within institutional practices such as the questions of power relations - how student writing is shaped by the discipline and to what extent it can influence the disciplinary practice. The issue of epistemology – beliefs of what constitutes knowledge in the writing practices and the issue of identity – the presence of self and agency in written texts, are also highlighted in this line of literature (Ivanic, 1997; Lea and Street, 2000; Lillis, 2001).
Student academic writing appears to be bound to a particular disciplinary, institutional and social context with its own traditions, practices and values (Fairclough, 1995; Lillis, 2001). Hence, it is also necessary to explore the reciprocal ways in which disciplinary discourse community positions student academic writing and how students may reshape those positionings through their writing in the discipline. This aspect is on the one hand related to how the lecturers, who to a certain extent represent the disciplinary structure and conventions, perceive and value what counts as good academic writing as well as reflect their values and beliefs in practice. In light of the critical discourse analysis theory proposed by Fairclough (1992, 1995), this reciprocal relationship can on the other hand be viewed in the ways students as language producers with their own values and interpretations of academic writing might have some influence upon the written discourse practices. That decides how international student writers could be involved in reshaping the disciplinary positionings in the new academic context through their act of writing. Fairclough's theory greatly influences Lillis' (2001) framework, which will be discussed in the next section.

**Research Framework**

I have used the *Talk around the text* approach (Lillis, 2001) as the main tool to collect data from the international students and the *Comment on the text* as the data collection method for the lecturers. Each student participant was invited to an one-hour interview in which he/she was asked to talk about his/her selected text. The talk aims to engage students in an exploration of their experiences of writing these texts and mediating between their own values and the disciplinary requirements in writing.

Lillis' heuristic mainly draws on the critical discourse analysis theory introduced by Fairclough (1992, 1995). That is, student writing will be looked at from three dimensions including the texts, interpretation of the language of the texts in relation to the conventions and explanation of the relationship between the discursive processes and the social practices governing the conventions (Fairclough, 1992). However, in criticising critical discourse analysis, Widdowson (1998) argues that rather than focusing on the analyst's view of the text alone, critical discourse analysis should take into account the perspectives of the 'producers and consumers' of the texts. Thus, in order to deal with this drawback, I will analyse student writing based on their own perspectives of the texts and the perspectives of the consumers of their texts, in the case of this study, the lecturers' comments on students' texts. Yet, this paper focuses mainly on the students as the producers of the texts. Listening to students as the 'insiders' or the producers talking about their own texts will allow the researcher to have an insight into the underlying factors influencing students' decision in making meaning in these texts, about which the outsider analyst may not always get it right.

In analysing this source of data, I have adopted the overall idea of Lillis' framework and adapted it to suit the context and research questions of my study. In this study, rather than the 'who' questions, the 'how' and 'what' questions have been more focused and the 'why' questions has been added. This aims to understand students' negotiation of different interpretations of academic writing through what/how they think they are required to write and what/how they desire to write. The 'why' question (Why do you want to write so? Why can you write so) in turn helps to unpack the underlying factors influencing why students wrote in a certain way as revealed through their texts. Through the students' response to the 'why' questions, their identities are also revealed. At level 1 (text), through *the talk around texts*, students' negotiation of different interpretations of academic writing is revealed through what/how/why they think they were expected to write and what/how/why they personally desire to write. At level 2 (discourse practice), how text is produced and how text is interpreted in relation to the conventions and values will be interpreted based on data from students' intentions and experiences in making meaning revealed in their *talks round the texts* and from lecturers' perspectives.
on those texts. At level 3 (sociocultural practice), the relationship between the text, the
disciplinary culture, Chinese and Vietnamese students’ culture of writing and students’
agency will be explained. A modified version of Lillis’ framework used in this study can
be seen in Figure 1.

**Figure 1: The modified version of Lillis’ framework**

**Talks around texts with international students**

In this part, I will mainly focus on the preliminary data which was collected using the
modified version of Lillis’ (2001) talk around text framework. The talks were with Lin and
Xuan, a Chinese and a Vietnamese international student, enrolled in a Master of
Education at an Australian University. The texts Lin and Xuan talked about were their
first assignments for the first subject on second language development. Lin has chosen
the topic, 'How motivation influences second language acquisition' whereas Xuan's
essay is about the impacts of age factor on second language acquisition. Below are
some of the main themes emerging from my preliminary data about the ways Xuan and
Lin communicate their ideas in the introductions of their texts.

**Lin - the struggler**

In the introduction of her essay, Lin signaled what she was going to discuss in the
development by posing an indirect question:

*This paper, by focusing on this classical model of L2 motivation, tries to find out whether
the integrative vs instrumental model can be applied to all L2 learning contexts (SL and
FL), and if it is always true that integrative motivation prevails over instrumental
motivation or other possible motivational sub-factors in all contexts.*

In the middle of her essay, Lin examined the differences between second language and
foreign language contexts. Next, she reviewed Gardner and his associates’ study on
integrative/instrumental motivational construct. Then, she discussed current research
conducted by different researchers who questioned Gardner’s traditional
integrative/instrumental motivational model. Finally, she concluded her written text by emphasizing that "Now, the two questions raised at the beginning of this paper can probably be answered". In the talk around the text, Lin explained her intention in choosing such a circular way to express her ideas,

At first, I have already had my own decision of what I am going to say though I didn’t make it explicitly but there’s an implication of it since I haven’t stated all the other researchers’ ideas and I haven’t given my own… Yes, I haven’t argued my own and haven’t given any evidence to support, so it’s better for me, I mean for the sake of readers’ understanding, it’s better for me just to throw a doubt on and gradually come to a conclusion which is more, which sound more reasonable and persuasive.

Regarding this point, Lin appeared to employ the indirect approach to expressing ideas as assumed to be typical in Chinese composition practice (Cortazzi and Jin, 1999; Hinkel, 1999). As for Lin, she prefers just to “throw a doubt” on a subject matter in the beginning because she has not argued for it and thus has not created a solid convincing position for it. In her view, for the sake of the reader’s understanding, she should gradually lead the lecturer as her reader from the “doubt” to the evidence and then to the conclusion. Her logic in constructing meaning in such a circular way is however different from the reasons underlying this communication style as argued by authors of prominent research into Chinese written discourse. The moral ideology underlying Chinese schooling practice (Barker, 2002; Cortazzi and Jin, 1999) may result in an assumption made by the students that as the master of knowledge, the teacher knows clearly what they are writing about. Therefore, the need to provide detailed explanation or persuasion in writing where the teacher is often the only audience of the written text seems unnecessary. According to Scollon and Scollon (1995), the Chinese writer may bear in mind that the reader often understands and shares with him or her what he or she is intended to convey in the written work, so proof and overt persuasion tend to be unexpected or even avoided. Under the common umbrella of the respect for the readers, Lin’s way of constructing meaning is however not shaped by the spirit of these above assumptions. This indicates the complexities around the student’s particular experience in meaning making under the taken-for-granted cultural based communication approach.

However, Lin’s desire in making meaning in her own way as described above may adversely affect her chance of success in her course. For example, this caused ambiguity for one of the lecturers, Anna. In commenting on Lin’s text, Anna said that she got surprised to read Lin’s conclusion that the two questions have been answered. For the lecturer, this is a ‘quite confused argument’; ‘they are a bit buried’ and she wondered ‘what are these [the two questions]’. She had to come back to Lin’s introduction and tried to read between the lines for what the indirect questions mean and relate them to the content of Lin’s essay.

Lin stressed that the Western practice of being direct was not strange to her since she was taught by an American teacher during her college days in China. She said: “I have the idea that in English writing you have to, you do not beat around the bush and finally you come to what you really want to say”. Lin therefore demonstrated that even before coming to Australian, she had been very aware of the Western linear approach to writing, which she assumed to be the style favoured in her discipline at the Australian University as well. Lin suggested that she deliberately wrote the introduction in a circular way, which she believed to be logical and appropriate although she seemed to be fully informed of what was conventional in her discipline.

Lin’s text and her discourse practice revealed in her account of writing these specific parts, indicate that Lin exercised her personal agency by drawing on what she personally valued in meaning making, which she revealed to be originally shaped by one of her teachers during her previous schooling. In light of the modified framework, at the level of context of culture (Fairclough, 1992 and Lillis, 2001), the sociocultural
practice Lin adhered to in her attempts of communicating her ideas was embedded in her prior literacy background. In writing the introduction for her essay, she appeared to imagine her lecturer as someone who could find her way of writing understandable and acceptable. However, in doing so, she in fact put her writing at risk since this appeared to be an unfamiliar way of writing in her disciplinary discourse. Also, her logic underlying her way of meaning making, which she revealed in the talk around text, was invisible on the surface of her writing and would otherwise remain silent without the opportunity for her to reflect on it. This indicates that only based on the analysis of the linguistic features of the text, the outsider researcher may not always make right assumptions about the students’ intentions embedded in their specific ways of writing.

Xuan - the pursuer of creative thinking

Xuan longed for some space for being creative in academic writing. For Xuan, in terms of idea expression, writing the first assignment at the Australian University was like a struggle between different values and emerging to be present in the disciplinary discourse was at some point accompanied with a sacrifice of her personal aspiration in writing.

Below is the introduction of her essay:

*When age factor is mentioned in regarding to the learning of second language, there is a common belief that “the younger, the better”... This paper will examine the existence of the critical period for the acquisition of second language phonological and syntactic system and consider other factors that affect the differences between children and adults in second language acquisition.*

Xuan commented on her way of writing this paragraph:

I start with something very general and then the next sentence will be less general and the next sentence will be more specific and then I come to the thesis statement... But I mean sometimes when I wrote something, I want to put an anecdote to it but I think is it safe to write this way?... But then in academic writing, they always structure, because when I learn EAP, they tell us like this is the way you write it, like for example this is the introduction, you start with something very general and then it's like a triangle with the point to the bottom. So usually we think it's safe to go with that way rather than try something different and you don't know how your lecturer is, whether she is very strict, for example very conservative, and then he or she think okay this is a piece of formal assignment and he or she did it like an article on a magazine or newspaper. Yeah, many many times I also think that why do I just keep to the old style, I like to change, I like to be creative but I think okay then...

In the above quote, Xuan seemed to be both interested in trying creative ways of writing and at the same time deeply aware of the conventional possibility for making meaning in academic writing in her community. Her preference for being creative in ways of meaning expressions appeared to be challenged and contradicted by her new interpretation of academic writing she learnt from the EAP course. Xuan exercised personal agency through accommodating her interpretation of the disciplinary writing requirement in order to be successful. Within Lillis’ (2001) framework, at the level of sociocultural practice, Xuan's specific instance of writing was bound to her disciplinary conventions, which represented part of Australian wider social practice. That is, Xuan chose ways of constructing meaning in light of new interpretations in the attempt to gain access to the academic world. That belief may be inherent on the surface of her writing but what seemed to lay behind the scene was her desire for having space for being on her own: creativity as she referred to.

What made Xuan's account more compelling was her awareness of the significance of the lecturer's personality (strict or conservative) to the evaluation of her assignment.
Xuan viewed her lecturer as someone whose expectation and personality was powerful in shaping international students' writing. Xuan's overriding concern about the safe way of writing in her academic community addressed the issue of power in discourse community (Fairclough, 1989, 1992) through illustrating how institutional practice was represented with its regulations as a gatekeeper to student academic writing. Xuan's experience in the above specific instance of meaning making also revealed that in her perception, the agency and power she can be allowed to exercise within the institutional practice was quite limited.

In the later part of her introduction, Xuan however appeared not to follow the convention but wrote in the way she valued. After mentioning the two contrasting views on whether children or adults acquire a second language faster and more effectively, Xuan mapped out what she was going to discuss. She decided not to state the main arguments or “the result” (Xuan's term) of her essay in the introduction. She did so with the expectation that the reader would go along with her through her writing and process it while reading and by that way, she believed she could attract the interest of the reader. Her view was expressed as follows:

Sometimes I want to say that “this is what I am going to say but in order to know the result, you have to read through until the conclusion”. I think this is more interesting because when you read the story, you want to know the result, what happen in the story, then okay, that's very boring, I think you need to process it, to see how people resolve the problem, what makes the content of the story, then up to the climax and something like that and will try to see how people resolve the problem, what's the result at the end, whether it is a happy ending or sad ending. Okay, I think this one did not say much about the result, right? But most of the others or from what I have been told, the thesis statement is similar to the conclusion but I think for this, I don't tell the result of my writing, don't tell the conclusion.

As the above example of writing and Xuan's talk around text illustrated, Xuan's way of exercising personal agency and negotiating the ways of writing the latter part of her introduction seemed to be shaped by her personality, her interest in writing and her personal life experience. Xuan gave explanation for what she valued in terms of writing: "I think most of this is affected from my personality, from my point of view about writing". At secondary and high school, she used to have some poems and stories published in Vietnamese magazines. She also mentioned that she loved writing with inspiration: "Maybe I like to write with inspiration because, I mean the fact that I am good at it is that I just like it because I like to but I don't like people to tell me what to write". Therefore, looking at academic writing practice from her own individual lens, which was shaped by her personal interest and life experience, Xuan tended to view the disciplinary convention as somewhat boring and not very creative.

Xuan's educational background possibly influenced how she mediated the different ways of constructing meaning and her identity in her discipline as well. Learning about analysing stories and poems is an important part of her previous schooling in Vietnam. Talking about what she wanted to mean in academic writing, Xuan's language choice such as "the result", "what happen in the story", "how people resolve the problem", "what makes the content of the story", "then up to the climax", and "a happy ending or sad ending" indicated that Xuan drew on her voice as experience (Lillis, 2001:45) in literary study from her Vietnamese school in her struggle in academic writing at the Australian University. Furthermore, as indicated in the literature (Phan, 2001), Xuan comes from the Vietnamese schooling background where the boundary between writing in general and academic writing is blur. Her struggle was bound to her desire to write creatively and the 'structured' way of writing she was expected to perform at the Australian institution.
Concluding comments

The students bring along with them new perspectives of academic writing into their disciplinary community with the ways of communicating their ideas in the introduction. Their accounts raise the question whether these unfamiliar ways of meaning making merit a place in academic writing in Australia and to what extent student power and desire for new ways of meaning making can be afforded within the institutional practice. If the students think these ways of constructing arguments are not welcome, for example, in some instances of writing of Xuan and Lin, they may exercise their agency by disguising their beliefs (Lillis, 2001) and resorting to accommodating as a coping strategy (Leki, 1995) in order to engage in their discourse community. As a result, what is often taken for granted as disciplinary or institutional conventions may contribute to silencing the possibilities for alternative approaches to knowledge and prevailing the seemingly homogenous nature of institutions.

The discussion above thus addresses the complexities of the struggles of international students in disciplinary writing in Australia. The Chinese and Vietnamese international students appear to demonstrate an awareness of the disciplinary conventions at the Australian University. However, at the level of practice, their actual construction of knowledge in written texts is variable and multilayer due to their differences regarding their personal intentions, their individual experiences and particular approaches to locating themselves in the new context. These aspects of their struggles often seem to be hidden from the surface of their writing. For example, these individual students may have different desires, challenges and reasons underlying their indirect ways of writing the introduction but on the surface, it just simply appears to be indirect or may be treated as language problem or language deficiency in the eyes of their lecturers or readers. These arguments indicate the need to listen to students talking about the reasons underpinning their specific instances of making meaning in their texts and confirm the fact that more attention should be paid to the issues of personal desires, life history and personal experiences in studying students' academic writing. Exploring the international students' intentions and potential choices in constructing knowledge perhaps seems to be a significant step toward promoting inclusivity and diversity in the internationalization of Australian universities.

References


The Quest to Control Emotion: A Foucauldian Analysis of EQ

Tony MacCulloch
Auckland University of Technology

Debbie Payne
Auckland University of Technology

Abstract
The ability to be aware of and to control one’s emotions was given worldwide recognition in the publication of Daniel Goleman’s book Emotional Intelligence in 1996. Over the last 10 years emotional intelligence (EQ) has achieved widespread popularity across a number of disciplines. While each discipline varies in its definition of EQ, what underpins these different meanings is the assumption that the ability to exert control over emotions is desirable. This paper examines a text that addresses the notion of EQ from a Foucauldian perspective highlighting what constitutes the object ‘Emotional Quotient’, the various subjectivities it offers and the technologies that it deploys. Through this analysis we aim to argue that it has become a ‘technology of power’: a disciplinary tool, a means of self-surveillance and discipline.

Background
The authors of this paper bring complementary themes of interest. For Tony MacCulloch, current PhD research using critical discourse analysis into discourses of emotional competence has provided a major impetus. Dr Debbie Payne draws on her knowledge of Foucault from her own completed doctoral research, and a longstanding interest in issues of social justice. This paper represents a continuation of personal interest into the ways that psychology and sociology examine the emotional dimension of human experience. In particular it focuses on how the notion of EQ, or emotional intelligence has emerged into the spotlight of popular interest, renewed research and commercial endeavour, but with relatively little critical review. It reflects concern about the implications for education and how, it is argued, construction of the self is increasingly the site of technologies of power. Within the whole range of definitions and conceptualisations of EQ there is a recurrent assumption that self awareness and control of emotions is desirable. Some writers also assert the value of controlling others’ emotions. Such ideas seem reasonable and easy to accept without much question. This paper seeks to question these assumptions and consider the other agendas that may be hidden within discourses of EQ.

A sample of titles and selected chapter headings on the subject of emotion in figure 1 reflect the problematic ways emotions are frequently viewed. Words like hostage, destructive, forbidden, highjacking, slaves, enemies, and crisis all carry powerful images that highlight problematic and dramatised perceptions. This is not to claim that all references to emotion in literature problematise it, but there is noticable focus towards negative constructions. Bodine & Crawford (1999) in their chapter on the ‘Our collective emotional crisis’ document a range of distressing scenarios in US schools that include property destruction, aggressive outbursts, and use of guns resulting in injury and death. The suggestion is that these events occur as a consequence of young people lacking social and emotional competence. It is little wonder that there is such a desire to control the emotional dimension of this seemingly wayward and harmful aspect of human behaviour.
In 1996 when Goleman published “Emotional intelligence” it quickly became a best seller that in some way resonated with and captured public interest. His writing was critical of narrow conceptions of intelligence and highlighted the importance of emotions in relationships, work, and peoples ability to succeed in life. Since that time a number of researchers have continued work on developing the concept and different ways of measuring EQ (Bar-On, 1997; Q-Metrics 1997; Mayer, Caruso, Salovey, 2000).

While there is much literature that seeks to illuminate our understanding of emotions, over the last 10-20 years there has been a rapid increase in interest, research, testing and teaching in the area. In 1995 a web search for emotional intelligence resulted in 142 ‘hits’. A similar search using Google in 2005 resulted in 11,600,000 ‘hits’. Together with this massive upsurge of interest many claims are made for what can be achieved by increasing a persons EQ. The following examples in figure 2 illustrate the diversity of claims conveyed within texts, and websites that focus on EQ. And they illustrate the varied constructions of emotion within the discourse of EQ.

**Figure 2 - Claims regarding EQ**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Express your emotions at work and still be a success</th>
<th>(Goleman 1996 - back cover)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Our society is emotionally repressive</td>
<td>(Heron, 1992 - text)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With a high EQ you can thrive during times of great change and uncertainty</td>
<td>(Cooper, Sawaf 1997 – back cover)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Americans have higher emotional intelligence than Canadians</td>
<td>(Press release - MHS website)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional intelligence (EQ) gets better with age.</td>
<td>(Press release – IMI website)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All of us are hostage to our emotions in one way or another</td>
<td>(Cameron-Bandler, Lebeau,1986 - text)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With a high EQ you can become a great leader</td>
<td>( Cooper, Sawaf 1997 – back cover)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Foucault and the focus of this paper**

Foucault did not provide an exact definition of discourse. In Archaeology of Knowledge (1972), Foucault writes that discourses should be regarded as “practices which
systematically form the objects of which they speak” (p. 49). Discourse engenders a regular effect, such as a systematized way of thinking about some thing (Mills, 1997). A discourse constructs an object, interpreting a phenomenon in a particular way. Significant in this quotation is the also the sense that discourses are performances. Discourses are systems of knowledge made apparent through people’s activities, their ways of doing things. Each discourse offers certain subjectivities or ways of being, of understanding one’s thoughts and feelings. In enacting a certain discourse a person takes up a particular subjectivity and subject position.

Discourses are inherently connected to power. Foucault’s concept of power is one that perceives power as not solely repressive. It has the capacity to create and produce knowledge. A central theme that characterises Foucault’s work is how he conceptualises the relationship between knowledge and power. In particular he examines how in a social context power both defines and exerts control over knowledge. So knowledge, even when purportedly scientific and objective, remains and indeed constitutes an instrument of power and control. Social control can take many forms, but he argued that governments are able to exert control over populations more effectively in subtle ways by influencing the minds of subjects. This theme can be seen in his archaeology of both sexuality and madness where again control of the mind was the most effective means by which the body could be dominated (Foucault, 1973; Stokes 2005).

In his later writings, Foucault (1988) focused on the analysis of how the human sciences were utilized and applied by people in order to “understand themselves” (p. 8). He termed the process of determining the truth in human sciences as “truth games” and the utilisation of the human sciences as “technologies” when referring to the practice of enacting or employing knowledge gained from the human sciences. For the purpose of this paper we wish to draw on two of the technologies that Foucault identified: the technologies of self and the technologies of power. The former refer to practices or strategies derived from or supported by scientific knowledges that a person may employ on him or herself “which permit individuals to effect their own means or with the help of others a certain number of operations on their own bodies and souls, thoughts, conduct, and way of being, so as to transform themselves in order to attain a certain state of happiness, purity, wisdom, perfection or immortality” (Foucault, 1988, p. 18). The latter refers to a type of power that is exercised over one or more people as a means of achieving uniformity, and conformity in their behaviour for some purpose such as increased productivity.

All of this connects with, and expresses Foucault’s view of government, which refers to ways that the conduct of individuals may be directed, influenced or controlled. Within this view professional or expert knowledges as expressed through disciplines such as psychology and medicine exert a particular power of governmentality (Rabinow, Rose 2003). That is subjects come to accept and internalise understandings of what is right or desirable as forms of identity, ability, normality, competence and indeed intelligence. Within such a view of the world Foucault alerts us to how various technologies of power are practices that enable subjects to construct themselves within that understanding and become both self observing, self monitoring, self disciplining and self improving.

Critical discourse analysis of an EQ text

Out of an extensive range of texts and articles addressing the subject of emotional intelligence, the one selected for the focus of this paper is ‘Executive EQ’ by Cooper & Sawaf, published in 1997. We examine this text from a Foucauldian perspective highlighting what constitutes the discursive object ‘EQ’, the various subjectivities it offers and the technologies of power that it deploys. Such an approach brings into question how the discursive object of EQ can be seen as an expression of a hegemonic process. The intent is not so much to challenge the appropriateness of acts of government that seek to influence individuals, but rather to make visible how EQ is a technology of self, which has the potential to become technology of power: a disciplinary tool and a means of surveillance if used to govern others, for example when employers use it to assess current or future employees. In taking a critical theory position we claim that within all of
this there is the possibility of oppression and exploitation that serves the interests of those in power at the expense of the subject (Fairclough, 1992; Sim, Van Loon, 2004).

The data that has informed this paper emerged from examination of the Cooper & Sawaf (1997) text using the following data analysis categories: Genre; Framing; Authorship; Contextualisation; Audience; Topicalisation; Subject positioning; Presuppositions; Persuasiveness; Authority source; Connotations; and Ideological position (Fairclough, 1992; Huckin, 2003; McGregor, 2003; Rose, 1996; van Dijk, 2001).

**Constructions of emotion**

Throughout history emotions have been constructed in ways that reflected the thinking and understanding of the time. The following somewhat cynical definition that originated in a publication circa 1881-1906, epitomizes the way that emotion has been pathologised into disease, something undesirable and problematic that has troubled society over the last century. Here the heart, part of the body, rules the head and provokes a response that is unconscious, uncontrolled and irrational.

*EMOTION, n. A prostrating disease caused by a determination of the heart to the head. It is sometimes accompanied by a copious discharge of hydrated chloride of sodium from the eyes (Bierce 1998).*

This meaning or construction of emotion has been contested. In more recent times during the 1960’s to 1980’s there has been a range of therapy approaches to liberate emotion that reflected a concern with oppressive and repressive social forces. Such therapies included Gestalt; Encounter groups; Energetics; Psychodrama; and other ‘radical’ therapies (Liss, 1974). These approaches constructed emotion as an aspect of human experience and expression that had been repressed by the family and society and needed liberating through a range of emotionally expressive therapies. These emerged alongside and some would argue in response to the equally repressive and controlling effects of psychiatry, pharmaceutical measures and the psychopathologising nature of diagnostic labels (Szasz, 1972).

**Constructions of EQ**

This paper proposes that different conceptualisations of EQ represent discourses of particular disciplines or genres. These include the manner by which emotional intelligence or competence is viewed and represented by commerce, psychology, organisational management, management leadership, education, neuro-biology, and developmental psychology. The matter of how to define and label EQ is complicated by the different approaches taken by a number of authors. Goleman (1996) talks of emotional intelligence, Steiner (2003) talks of emotional literacy, Heron (1990) uses the term emotional competence, and Cooper and Sawaf (1997) refer to EQ. Mayer (2001) concludes that there are two broad groupings. One sees emotional intelligence (EI) as a type of intelligence involving emotion and relates to a person’s ability to perceive, regulate and manage emotions, and the other reflects what he terms ‘mixed approaches’ that mix intelligence or competence involving emotion with other qualities, skills or characteristics such as motivation, trustworthiness, adaptability (Goleman, 1996). Throughout this paper we use the term EQ and understand it to refer to what is generally understood as emotional intelligence. The terms emotional literacy and emotional competence embrace many overlapping features with EQ and it is outside the purpose of this paper to address these definitional matters.

Cooper & Sawaf (1997) in referring to their EQ map define emotional intelligence as...

*Emotional intelligence is the ability to sense, understand and effectively apply the power and acumen of emotions as a source of human energy, information and influence. Human emotions are the domain of core feelings, gut level instincts and emotional sensations. When trusted and respected, emotional intelligence provides a deeper, more fully formed understanding of oneself and those around us.* (p324)
Their definition echoes elements from most other models, and incorporates a leadership flavour with talk of emotional intelligence as a *source of human energy, information and influence*. Emphasis on the value of understanding the self and others affirms the worth of seeking to explore one’s own emotional intelligence. What is apparent in the above definition is the valuing of emotions, that they are credible and trustworthy. Their validity is derived from their origin: the “gut”, that is, the body. However to be truly useful the sensations and emotional instincts need to be harnessed and utilised by the mind. A kind of rational mind that is capable of analyzing and distilling or re-channeling the emotions. Thus in this construction of EQ, Descarte’s mind/body dichotomy (Stokes, 2005) is contested.

For Cooper & Sawaf (1997) EQ is constructed as another kind of intelligence - emotional intelligence. By inference this implies that emotional abilities or competencies can be identified, quantified, measured and utilized in a similar way to IQ. The importance and authority of this proposition is strengthened in the cover caption above the title ‘The key to mastering the workplace, increasing profitability and competing for the future.’

**Subjectivities represented and produced**

The leadership - management discourse, like many others has drawn heavily on psychology as a powerful source of validation and authority in its quest to understand and manipulate human attributes and behaviour. Rose (1996) refers to the influence of the ‘psy-complex’ in constituting the theories and practices that shape both self reflection and psychological governance. The executive with EQ has an ability to be aware of the emotions which are being experienced; the ability to express them appropriately; to regulate this expression according to the situation; and a capacity to have empathy for others. Recognition and management of emotion is seen to be a central and valued feature. For example:

> ‘the four cornerstones of emotional intelligence that form the conceptual framework of this book, require that the reader is able to think, monitor and manage their own emotional functioning with an understanding of specific concepts...emotional literacy, emotional fitness, emotional depth, and emotional alchemy..... What we offer you is a starting point: a Four Cornerstone Model which moves emotional intelligence out of the realm of psychological analysis and philosophical theories, and into the realm of direct knowing, exploration, and application. (pxxvii)

Similarly, the authors use of equations represents an assumption that the reader can think conceptually in a mathematical way, for example:

\[ DxDxM=S \]  
\[ \text{(Discontent x Direction x Movement} = \text{Status quo)} \]  
(p115)

The text assumes an active and involved subject identifying personal goals for enhancing his or her emotional intelligence, and an ability to achieve such goals. Cooper & Sawaf (1997) illustrate this approach when offering the following 1-2-3 strategy for learning to manage emotional energy...

1. **Acknowledge and feel the emotion - rather than denying or minimalising it.**
2. **Listen to the information or feedback the emotion is giving you. Ask yourself for example “which of my principles, values, or goals is at stake here?”**
3. **Guide, or channel the emotional energy into an appropriate constructive response.**

At the beginning of each major section of the cornerstone structure described by Cooper & Sawaf (1997) specific gains are presented for the subject who seeks to enhance their EQ. These include under the heading of *Emotional literacy* - personal power; inner guidance, respect, responsibility and connection. *Emotional fitness* gains include...
inspiration, authenticity, and trusting relationships. Emotional depth gains relate to building core character, and increasing potential, integrity and purpose. Emotional alchemy gains include increase in sensing opportunities, creating the future, building confluence, intuitive innovation, integration, situational transformation and fluid intelligence. This is a considerable collection of personal gains that are claimed to accompany EQ and that many might desire.

**Technologies of power**

The desire to improve the self to become emotionally intelligent is then both assumed promoted and accepted as desirable in this text. This is evident in the first ‘Cornerstone’ chapter on emotional honesty where there is the first of a series of EQ building tools ‘EQ in Action’, that the writer shares with executives, professionals, and management teams..... he calls it the check in.

........Ask, ‘On a scale of one to ten, give an honest personal rating of your energy, openness, and focus. If ten is the highest energy level you’ve ever felt at work, and one means you’re on the verge of collapsing in a heap from exhaustion, what is your energy level right now?........’(p14)

On the next page another ‘EQ in action’ tool suggested is the use of ‘EQ morning notes’......

.....you get up five minutes earlier than usual, find your favourite well lit spot, sit quietly, listen deeply, and get out of your head and into your heart, openly reflecting on your life and work as you write a few pages a day, no matter how random or rough. (p15)

This action tool involves an intrusion into ones usual sleeping or rest time, moving to a favourite well lit place, involvement in deep reflection about life and writing a few pages each day. These tools in action fully engage the subject in his or her own process of self exploration, self regulation and change and in so doing constitute a technology of self whereby the subject is engaged in an exercise to better the self.

However an important precurser to changing the self is the need in some way to measure or assess the self. Measuring EQ is complex and there are a number of tests available that seek to quantify its different elements. Those listed in figure 3 illustrate some administered and self report tests available. As with different conceptions of EQ, assessment issues elicit differing and debated perspectives. Most of the issues debated relate to factors that call into question the ability of an individual to accurately appraise their own EQ. This criticism of self report measures is usually on the grounds that they can be manipulated or that they are dependent on the ability to have awareness of ones own emotional strengths and weaknesses. It could be that there is a basic mistrust in peoples ability to honestly and accurately appraise the emotional aspect of the self.

There is also a view that such self-tests measure emotional competence rather than a broader notion of emotional intelligence. While there is some caution about the validity or reliability of self testing EQ, there is general consensus that a variety of administered EQ assessment tools are valid and demonstrate varying degrees of reliability (Ciarrochi, Chan, Caputi, Roberts, 2001).

The EQ map provided by Cooper & Sawaf (1997) is an example of self assessment of EQ that the subject is invited to undertake in order to identify their own EQ strengths and weaknesses and so plan self improvement. The authors claim it has been extensively researched, is statistically reliable and norm tested on employed workers in Canada and the United States.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MSCEIT</th>
<th>Mayer, Salovey, Caruso Emotional Intelligence Test.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Mayer, Caruso, Salovey, 2000)</td>
<td>Administered test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEAS</td>
<td>Levels of Emotional Awareness Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Within the psychotherapeutic and personal growth domains different approaches reflect attempts to gain mastery over emotions. Rational emotive therapy overtly seeks to enable the logical ‘rational’ mind to control our ‘irrational’ emotions (Bergin, Garfield, 1994). Primal therapy (Janov 1991) emerged out of a belief that longstanding excessive repression of painful emotions contributed to a broad range of defences that manifest through physiological and psychological illness. From a Foucauldian perspective these approaches act as disciplinary tools in that they contribute means by which subjects willingly engage in processes intended to increase control over emotions. The Four Cornerstone structure provided by Cooper & Sawaf (1997) similarly constitutes a disciplinary tool. It draws on an architectural metaphor of foundational structures with the implication that the EQ foundations the executives seek to build must be strong and sound. The cornerstones are Emotional literacy; Emotional fitness; Emotional depth; and Emotional alchemy. These cornerstones constitute a disciplining tool to be used by the enlightened executive to improve and enhance themselves and their EQ in particular, structured ways.

**Disciplinary tool**

The whole focus of the text by Cooper & Sawaf is to encourage the reader to become aware of and assess their own levels of EQ functioning. At the same time it overtly invites surveillance and control of other peoples emotions. Such skills are powerfully promoted by assertoric statements affirming the critical need to increase ones own EQ. This is explicitly stated on the rear cover…

*Emotional intelligence is set to be the new driving force of business. Knowing one’s own emotions and controlling them, recognising emotions in others and controlling them, and self motivation are the key dimensions of EQ.*

The EQ map within the book provides the tool by which the reader can examine themselves, and document their emotional intelligence. It comprises 21 separate scales with 280 questions. These scales chart a comprehensive range of ‘dimensions of the self’ as shown in figure 4. Such detailed self examination constitutes and requires a high degree of self surveillance that is justified by the claims made in support of EQ.

---

**Figure 3. EQ measuring tools**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EQi</th>
<th>Bar-On Emotional Quotient Inventory</th>
<th>Self report test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Bar-On, 1997)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EQ Map</td>
<td>Q Metrics</td>
<td>(Q-Metrics, 1997)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Life events</th>
<th>Work pressures and satisfactions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal pressures and satisfactions</td>
<td>Emotional self awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional expression</td>
<td>Emotional awareness of others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intentionality</td>
<td>Creativity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resilience</td>
<td>Interpersonal connections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constructive discontent</td>
<td>Compassion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outlook</td>
<td>Intuition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust radius</td>
<td>Personal power</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Perhaps most powerfully the subjectivity produced relates to how the text renders the multiple and complex aspects of the subject’s emotional dimension observable, visible, measurable and desirable in specific and particular ways. And by labelling it EQ there is the implication of an ability to measure one quantity alongside another within the person and between persons. So it is now possible to compare and contrast my EQ with your EQ. In addition Cooper & Sawaf (1997) provide numerous examples of how having EQ is highly desirable, whether it be amongst ‘star performers’ at a think-tank near Princeton University (pxxx), or by reference to studies that ‘suggest that a single person with a low EQ can lower an entire groups collective IQ’ (p289). The many examples from the business world together with persuasive inspirational experiences from the writers life combine to create definite ideals and desirable criteria by which to judge the employability or competence of a prospective employee. If high levels of EQ in executives are claimed to enhance company success and profitability, there are strong motives to discipline individuals who do not conform or measure up to desired standards of EQ. Such an approach is very different to one where an executive has the option to consider their level of EQ and choose freely to change themselves, from where the employer requires them to make such changes in order to retain employment. This kind of situation has serious implications. This is dangerous if it does not acknowledge the multiple contextual variables that contribute to both the development of emotional intelligence or its manifestation at a particular moment in time. Saarni (1999, p328) offers the following caution in relation to the non static and contextually complex nature of emotional competence.

"We all demonstrate at one time or another sporadic behaviour that someone or even ourselves would probably label as maladaptive, maladjusted, inappropriate, nonsensical or just plain stupid. Does this mean that we are all characterologically emotionally incompetent? Not at all. It just means that in this transaction we demonstrated an emotionally incompetent response and that we had better remember some humility relative to notions of "emotional intelligence" and emotional competence; they are not global and enduring characteristics of the person."

Conclusion
The intent of this paper has been to argue that EQ as represented within the text by Cooper & Sawaf (1997) exemplifies expressions of the knowledge-power conceptualisation described by Foucault. It illustrates how the object EQ is constructed as an extension of the psychological construct of IQ and in so doing employs parallel notions of making observable, visible, and measurable what are claimed to be essential elements of emotional intelligence. In this way then it produces particular subjectivities where the reader is constructed as a self monitoring, self improving, self testing, self disciplining agent. It constitutes a technology of power whereby the individual may be monitored, tested and controlled. It expresses forms of governmentality in that it exerts power and control through the authority of psychology and business. It manifests a means of surveillance through EQ map testing and self monitoring. It exerts hegemonic discipline through appealing to seemingly reasonable quests for self improvement, success, profitability, and survival through times of change and uncertainty. In terms of the archaeology of human endeavour it could be claimed that EQ is yet another means by which emotions, and thus by inference human behaviour can be controlled or regulated through the unsuspecting mind of the willing subject. Each of the points we have examined may seem insignificant when viewed in isolation, but when taken together constitute powerful, yet subtle means by which people may be oppressed and
exploited in the interests of those in power.

References


Social Identities and Law Students’ Writing

Rod Maclean
Deakin University

Abstract
This paper argues that social identities, discursively speaking, consist of ‘positions’ that are individuated by distinctive linguistic features. These include distinctive patterns of representation indicated by clause structure and type, a set of priorities for attending to what is important indicated by thematic structure, and an orientation to the represented world and to self as indicated by modality, propositional attitudes and tense. A social identity comprises an array of these often contradictory ‘positions’ associated with a social or professional role. A person’s identity is constituted dynamically by the way they ‘reconcile’ the various positions that make up the social identity, and also, as Archer and Ivanic argue, by the way they reconcile a social with a personal or autobiographical identity. It is argued that this process of reconciliation gives clues about identity formation in the traces it leaves in grammatical texture.

This paper uses a simulated letter of advice to a client written by a group of first year law students to explore the discursive construction of social or professional identity. This letter is poorly written and full of grammatical mistakes and infelicities. It is argued that the mistakes provide a linguistic trace of the students’ struggle to reconcile the conflicting roles and positions they occupy as authors of the letter. In particular the students’ problems result from a struggle to reconcile their multiple positions as: students writing for assessment by a tutor about a legal problem, as a simulated firm of solicitors advising to a client, and as potential litigators anticipating the future course of events in their simulated moot court appearance.

Introduction
Identities are an important feature of the social world. A social identity as a teacher, lawyer, criminal or drunkard offers a sense of belonging and commitment, a set of actions and goals, and a way of fulfilling personal needs (Archer 2000). However assuming a new social identity can be a challenging process. Young students find learning to be a lawyer particularly difficult, for example, due to the incommensurability between legal values and practices and those of the lay community (Guinier, Fine & Balin 1997; Mertz 1996; 2000). Hence legal education offers a potential site for intervention by those seeking to reshape its practices in more inclusive and equitable ways. Because lawyers are agents of power (Butler 1997) legal education has a strong ideological significance and is hence a prime candidate for critical discourse study.

The usefulness of critical discourse analysis (CDA) for this purpose depends on its ability to deliver insights into the way language shapes social identities that are not available to other social scientists. CDA has promised more than it delivers. Despite important work on social identity by Fairclough (1995), Ivanic (1998), O’Connor (2002), Wetherell’s (1997) critique of theories of identity and subject positions in CDA still is largely justified.

Fairclough’s (2003) recent appropriation of Archer’s (2000) work on social identities, however, offers a future direction, and an aim of this paper is to outline one way in which CDA can address issues of social identity within Fairclough’s framework. To that end the writing of a group of first year law students is explored as they come to terms with a social identity as a lawyer. These students, like most first year law students, struggle to write and speak the language of the law. Using as data a simulated letter of advice written by a group of first year students (Text 1), this paper argues that the students’ writing difficulties are not due (entirely) to a lack of writing skill but to problems in coming to terms with a professional legal identity.

In order to establish this claim, I show how problems in coming to terms with a legal identity leave their traces in the texture of the letter of advice. The analysis distinguishes between a
social identity as a broad attribute of an individual or group established using a range of texts and semiotic resources, and a writing position associated with a single written text or part of a written text. The relationship between social identities and writing positions is an reciprocal one: occupation of a writing position reflects a person’s social identity, but at the same time control of the linguistic resources associated with a writing position is one of the tools a person uses to establish a social identity.

My argument is that a writing position is a written language analogue of a participation framework in speech. A participation framework is a relationship between speakers, listeners and those spoken about structured by an activity or social occasion (Duranti 1997; Goodwin 1990). For example court proceedings can be seen as a framework that defines roles for participants such as counsel, a judge, a defendant and plaintiff, and instructing solicitors. A written text such as a legal letter is similarly produced in an activity context that defines participant roles for author and reader. In this activity context, writing positions are individuated by three major factors: the actions performed through the text, the use of the ‘telling’ of text to represent the writer and reader, and the characteristic stance or position the writer occupies in relation to what is being written about.

**Action:** A position or role for the writer is defined by the genre of the text and by the social practices accomplished through the text: as responder, adviser, instructor, commander. At a micro level positioning is determined by the speech acts associated with individual clauses or clause complexes.

**The ‘telling’ of the text:** A spoken text establishes indexically a representation of the speaker and listener through reference to the situation of the telling. Similarly written texts also index a reader and writer. Where there is a direct communication with a particular addressee, as in a letter, written language indexes the situation of the writing in a similar way to spoken language. Written texts addressed to a general readership, on the other hand, are best understood through an extension of narrative theory as discursively constructing an implied reader. Where the author is writing not on behalf or him or herself but in a well-defined professional role the text may also be seen as constructing an implied writer by analogy with the literary notion of the narrator.

**The stance taken by the writer:** Most clause and clause complexes do more than represent states of affairs as true or false. They indicate something about the stance that the writer takes in relation to the content of the clause or the position from which the writer sees the facts expressed by the clause. Frequently this positioning is not idiosyncratic but is related to the role or the social identity occupied by the writer. For example. More generally stances are expressed in a broad range of ways. These include:

- use of citation and intertextuality to frame and take a stance towards the ideas of others (Giltrow 1995)
- use of evaluation to adopt a stance that is formative of an academic discipline (Graham 2003)
- use of mental attitudes such as knowing, believing, desiring expressed by the writer in relation to propositions (Beneveniste 1971)
- use of epistemic modality to express the degree of certainty or uncertainty felt by the writer in relation to a particular proposition
- use of the synoptic grammar of nominalisation to turn clauses into nominal groups, thereby allowing them to be recontextualised in relation to discipline-based or institutional categories and frames of reference (van Leeuwen 1996; Halliday 2004). For example Dias et al. suggest that an explanation of the syntactic complexity of student legal writing lies in the specialised categorisation of experience characteristic of legal analysis, resulting in a ‘more intense interest in the hierarchical interrelationships between propositions: specific propositions are seen in the context of others, and relationships of cause, effect, condition and concession are highlighted’ (Dias et al. 1999, p. 55).
- Taking a stance towards actions. The writer is positioned by the way he or she controls the actions of others: making requests, giving orders, making plans, suggestions or recommendations. Positioning in relation to action is indicated by the
grammatical system of mood and also by deontic modality. The writer may also take a stance towards action through ‘key’ in Goffman’s sense (1974).

Positioning often changes because the writer occupies different positions in different segments of a text. Successful construction of a social identity requires the ability to move seamlessly from one position to another and to reconcile the contradictions between the different writing positions. In learning to write like lawyers students not only have to learn to occupy the writing positions associated with legal texts, they also have to learn to negotiate the conflicting demands of these multiple positions.

A letter of advice

This section examines the first task faced by a group of first-year law students in their practical legal skills program, writing a letter of advice to a client. This is the first writing task in which students are required to make a transition from writing about the law to writing within the law, that is, writing in role as a lawyer. The letter requires students to write from a range of positions and therefore provides a good example of the way multiple writing positions leave their traces in linguistic texture. Students have a great deal of trouble with this task and it is noticeable how poorly written the result is.

The letter (Text 1) is written by the Barry ‘firm’ of students. After some early withdrawals from the course, Barry consisted of 14 students completing the first year of either Arts/Law or Science/Law double degrees, 5 male and 9 female. Of these perhaps 11 remained actively involved through the program, although most of the work was done by a smaller group of 5 or 6. All the writing was collaborative. Typically there was a consultation of the whole group where the writing tasks were divided up into shorter subsections completed by small groups.

Barry’s simulated client (and the defendant in the hypothetical case presented to the students as a basis for their years’ work) was a sculptor, Susan. Susan’s sculpture (Close Encounters of the Worst Kind) had collapsed after being suspended from the ceiling of a lobby of a new building owned by the Victorian Development Corporation (VDC), the commissioners of the work. This collapse destroyed another work by Susan located in the lobby (Angry Penguins), delaying the opening of the building and causing loss. Documentation provided to the students about this case included a narrative of the facts of the case set out in the form of instructions. While the hypothetical case raised a number of issues, the central one was whether Susan had failed to fulfill the terms of her contract with the VDC, was responsible for the fall of the sculpture because the sculpture lacked ‘structural integrity’, and was therefore liable for damages, or alternatively whether the VDC was responsible for the fall of the sculpture through failing to hang the sculpture correctly, and therefore liable to pay Susan for Angry Penguins, the sculpture which had been destroyed in the fall and which had not been paid for. Even if it was found that Susan should be paid for Angry Penguins, a subsidiary issue was whether she should receive the full sum owing, as it had emerged that Angry Penguins was substantially completed not by Susan but by Fred Townsend, the unqualified owner of a foundry and metalworking business used by Susan.

In writing a letter of advice to Susan about her legal position, the students were required to focus not on technical points of law but on the client’s position in terms of obligations, choices to be made, and actions to be undertaken. This need is reflected in the structure of the ‘letter of advice’ genre given to Barry firm by their tutor and discussed by them at their first independent firm meeting:

1. Summary of factual instructions
2. Identify problems
3. Explain the law
4. Draw conclusions
5. What client should do

In Text 1 the summary of the factual instructions has been deleted and only the final four elements of the structure remain. Text 1 begins with a short statement of the problem to be addressed, then it addresses each of the relevant terms of the contract in turn under
This text omits the presentation of facts and reproduces only that section which offers advice on the terms of the contract. Original numbering and spelling is retained.

‘CLOSE ENCOUNTERS OF THE WORST KIND’
We perceive that the main problem is whether or not you can be held liable for the damages caused by the collapse of ‘Close Encounters’.

The Contract
In our opinion, the terms of the contract as stated in the order form are as follows:

1. You were required to supply and install ‘Close Encounters’

It is obvious that you supplied ‘Close Encounters’. It is on the question of installation that we believe the Corporation will argue upon. We believe that you have a strong case for installation; the structure was established in place for use, and the word ‘install’ is a very ambiguous term. So we believe the Courts would be more inclined to find in your favour here.

2. Suspension was to be organised and directed by the VDC engineering office, and they were to supply the suspension apparatus

This follows on from the issue of installation. However, before we can make any further conclusions regarding your liabilities, we believe it is necessary to acquire a statement from structural engineers clarifying an engineer’s vocational duty in regards to suspension being organised and directed.

3. Structural integrity required

The Corporation may allege that pre-contractual negotiations between yourself and the Corporation representatives constitute a separate term and/or collateral contract. After extensive examination, we believe that your negotiations were neither a term or collateral contract. Instead we feel it is a representation on your behalf. A representation does not give rise to a breach of contractual duties and obligations even if it is false.

However, the Corporation may try to obtain a remedy under section 52 of the Trade Practices Act (1975). Then it would be necessary for us to try to prove that you didn’t mislead or deceive them in your pre-contractual negotiations. We feel that the pre-contractual negotiations between yourself and the Corporation representatives were vague and ambiguous. For it is unclear whether they intended for you to seek professional advice. Also, the term ‘professional’ can differ in meanings. Thus, in you consulting Fred, it would be necessary for us to decipher whether or not he could be considered a professional.

Again we are faced with the issue of ambiguity in defining terms. Due to this we see the stronger case here as being in your favour.

Therefore we feel your case would be sound in relation to abiding by the term of structural integrity.

4. Property and risk in said items to pass on completion of installation

Again we are faced with the problem of defining installation. ‘Installation’, as stated earlier, is an ambiguous term of the contract. We would argue that installation occurred when the structure was fixed in place.

5. Work to be completed in a proper and workmanlike manner

As the Corporation did not adequately specify what constituted proper and workmanlike manner, there will be a problem arguing against you not acting in this way. If you considered your manner to have complied with the term
specified, the courts are more likely to find in your favour, and in doing so, you cannot be liable for breaching this term.

**Liability**

In short, we think you would have a reasonably sound chance of defending the allegations posed by the Corporation for the damages arising from the collapse of ‘Close Encounters’.

As of yet, we do not have any expert opinions from structural engineers giving their view on the cause of the fall. Obtaining such a document could assist your case, as well as further substantiating reasoning behind our conclusions.

Although one might expect that the letter is merely an artificial exercise, it retains its integrity and resembles the writing of a professional solicitor more than it resembles an academic writing genre. The genre has its own ‘memory’ (Bakhtin 1986). It shapes the students by bringing with it from its primary context in legal practice constraints which remain in force even in an academic setting.

**Writing positions in Text 1**

Writing a letter of advice leads students into an advisor stance. Students are forced to do more than apply the law to ‘the facts of the case’, which is what they are familiar with through the case method of law used in their teaching and assessment. The writing of the letter occurs as part of a textually-mediated adversarial practice (Smith 1990). It is the first of a series of continuing exercises based on a set of simulated case documents (Feinman 1995). The students are required simultaneously to occupy and to integrate the positions of: offering advice to a client, reasoning about the application of law to facts, and projecting the course of future events in the event of legal action. They have to find the right law, apply it to the facts, project potential consequences in terms of client obligations, actions, liabilities and rights. They then have to present the results in a way that recognises what the client is interested in and needs to know, while deleting technicalities that are of no interest.

These three writing positions correspond to three types of clauses, labelled A, B and C in Table 1 below. A clauses provide advice from solicitor to client: *we feel your case would be sound*. These clauses are usually main rather than subordinate clauses, and usually have ‘we’ as the explicit subject of a propositional attitude (*feel, believe, see, think*). These clauses indicate the giving of advice, that is, they constitute a current interaction between the solicitor and the client. Opinion is also expressed through epistemic modalities embedded in B clauses: *the Corporation may try to obtain, you cannot be liable* (indicated in Table 2 as A/B clauses), or expressed as separate A clauses: *you would have a reasonably good chance*. Another index of positioning in A clauses is the use of the first person *we*. There are 12 uses of *we* with an opinion or attitude verb in Text 1, emphasising the status of the letter as opinion. This is an exclusive *we* referring to the members of the legal firm but excluding Susan the client.

*B* clauses project likely future actions as part of legal proceedings: *there will be problem arguing against, the courts are more likely to find in your favour*. They are usually in future tense or contain a modal element. Participants are you (Susan, the client) or an inclusive *us* referring to solicitor and client acting jointly. Participants also include the *Corporation* (the VDC) and the *courts*. Verbs are generally legal actions: *argue, allege, obtain a remedy, find, defend, assist your case, prove*. The modalities are deontic, and express suggestions, options or requirements in relation to future actions when Susan is offered advice about what should be done: *it would be necessary for us to try to prove, it is necessary to aquire a statement, necessary for us to decipher*. In B clauses the authors position themselves as concerned to anticipate a range of future options and their likely consequences, that is, as able to manage future risks and benefits. This is evident, for example, in the use of conditional modality and the use of *if* to indicate contingencies: *If you considered your manner to have complied with the term specified*. A writing stance in relation to a future course of action is also implicit in the evaluative nature of the language: *your case would be sound, you have a strong case*.

*C* clauses relate to past events which include the making and fulfilment of the contract and demands made by the Corporation, for example, *the Corporation did not adequately specify*. 
Tense varies between past and present, depending on whether the focus is on past action or present interpretation. These clauses refer to the contract either intertextually through reproduction of the wording or through nouns such as term. C clauses tend to be presented synoptically as reduced or non-finite clauses: for breaching this term, abiding by the term of structural integrity.

These three clause types are summarised in Table 1.

Table 1: Linguistic correlates of writing positions in Text 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clause type A</th>
<th>Clause type B</th>
<th>Clause type C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Action/Role</strong>&lt;br&gt; (linguistic realisation: speech acts, lexis)</td>
<td><strong>Participants as writer and reader</strong>&lt;br&gt; (linguistic realisation: pronouns)</td>
<td><strong>Stance taken by writer</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giving advice</td>
<td>‘You’ (the defendant)/ ‘the corporation’ (the plaintiff)/ the courts</td>
<td>Advice and opinion&lt;br&gt; Linguistic realisation: propositional attitudes ‘we believe’, epistemic modality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arguing before courts/legal process</td>
<td>‘You’ (supplier of Close Encounters)/ ‘the corporation’/ parties to a contract</td>
<td>Recommending action&lt;br&gt; Linguistic realisation: Deontic modality ‘it is necessary’, conditionals ‘in doing so’, evaluation ‘would be sound’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpreting</td>
<td></td>
<td>Interpretation of facts in relation to law&lt;br&gt; Linguistic realisation: Nominalisation, reduced and non-finite clauses ‘suspension being organised’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Linguistic realisation: present tense&lt;br&gt; Linguistic realisation: future tense&lt;br&gt; Linguistic realisation: past tense</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**The complexity and poor expression of Text 1**

What is problematic in Text 1 is not just the range of writing positions that students have to occupy, it is also the need to move from one position to another and to combine the positions within clause complexes. This results in long and cumbersome clause complexes containing many levels of embedding or hypotaxis. For example, in the sentence (Extract 5 in Table 2): If you considered your manner to have complied with the term specified, the courts are more likely to find in your favour, and in doing so, you cannot be liable for breaching this term, the student authors move from past tense reference to the original fulfilment of the contract if you considered, to present tense reference to current liabilities you cannot be liable, to future reference to the likely actions of the courts the courts are more likely to find in your favour. They also move between a focus on the terms of the contract and a client-focussed concern with actions and liabilities. Similar examples of clumsy and highly embedded clause complexes extracted from Text 1 are presented below as Table 2.
Table 2 Clause complexes extracted from Text 1

Table 2 includes both finite clauses and reduced clauses. Indentations indicate hypotactic clause relations while aligned clauses are paratactically related. Numerals indicate clause position in Text 1.

| Extract 1 |  
|---|---|
| 14 A | However, before we can make any further conclusions regarding your liabilities, |
| 15 C | it is necessary |
| 16 A | we believe |
| 17 B | to acquire a statement from structural engineers |
| 18 B | clarifying an engineer's vocational duty in regards to |
| 19 C | suspension being organised and directed. |

| Extract 2 |  
|---|---|
| 29 A | However, the Corporation may try to obtain a remedy under section 52 of the Trade Practices Act (1975). |
| 30 B | Then it would be necessary for us |
| 31 B | to try to prove that |
| 32 C | you didn't mislead or deceive them in your pre-contractual negotiations. |

| Extract 3 |  
|---|---|
| 39 C | Thus in you consulting Fred |
| 40 B | it would be necessary for us |
| 41 B | to decipher |
| 42 C | whether or not he could be considered a professional. |

| Extract 4 |  
|---|---|
| 47 A | Therefore we feel |
| 48 B | your case would be sound in relation to |
| 49 C | abiding by the term of structural integrity. |

| Extract 5 |  
|---|---|
| 61 C | If you considered |
| 62 C | your manner to have complied with the specified term, |
| 63 A | the courts are more likely |
| 64 B | to find in your favour |
| 65 B | And in doing so |
| 66 A | you cannot be liable |
| 67 C | for breaching this term. |

| Extract 6 |  
|---|---|
| 68 A | We think |
| 69 A | you would have a reasonably sound chance |
| 70 B | of defending the allegations |
| 71 C | posed by the Corporation for the damages |
| 72 C | arising from the collapse of ‘Close Encounters’. |
A feature of the Extracts 1-6 in Table 2 is the attempt to combine A, B and C clauses in the one clause complex. In reasoning about the advice to give Susan the students have had to move between anticipating Susan’s needs so as to give her advice, interpreting the law as it applies to the case of Close Encounters, and anticipating legal processes as the case unfolds. Reflecting the students’ inexperience, the language of the letter is far too explicit. It includes reference to all these roles in almost every sentence. The challenge of embedding types of clauses with such different linguistic features within a single clause complex is more than the students find manageable.

Some particular problems can be highlighted. The students need to be specific about agency because who did what is an important question for the law. This requirement for specificity is in conflict with the taking of a decontextualised, synoptic stance because the nominalised clauses that reflect this stance have no subject. The authors frequently (in 25 of the 80 clauses in Text 1) opt for a compromise between a synoptic and a dynamic representation of events through use of non-finite or participial versions of the verb, for example: to decipher, to acquire, clarifying, to have complied, for breaching. These allow some level of agency to be represented because, although there is no explicit grammatical subject, a subject can often be inferred (van Leeuwen 1996). This need to preserve agency, however, frequently results in constructions that are only marginally grammatically acceptable: in you consulting Fred, and in doing so, your manner to have complied.

Another reason for the clause complexity is the nesting of attitudes and opinions. The student in the position of interpreter only has to worry about her own interpretation of a case. In the position of practitioner she has to be concerned with the perspectives of other participants such as the client, the opponents, experts, and possibly the courts, as well as with the dynamic interplay between these perspectives in the course of legal action. In seeking to negotiate between the positions and perspectives of different participants and different positions, the letter presents opinions about opinions about opinions. Thus for example Extract 5 in Table 2 deals not only with the opinions of the letter’s authors as expressed by the modals likely and cannot, it also deals with Susan’s beliefs (if you considered) and with the rulings of the court (the courts are more likely to find in your favour). The students have to negotiate the grammar needed to capture these relationships between different perspectives on, or representations of, events within the one clause complex.

Extract 6 shows a similar pattern of nested attitudes. The student firm’s opinion (we think), the client’s response (defending the allegations), and the Corporation’s actions (allegations posed by the Corporation) are all nested within each other. These hypotactic relationships of modality and projection reflect the complex way in which participants in, and interpreters of, the simulated case read and respond to the interpretations, judgments, attitudes and understandings by the four different parties: the corporation the corporation did not specify, the solicitors (who are the source of the judgment that the Corporation’s specification is not adequate), the client (if you considered), and the courts (the courts are more likely to find).

The representation of these relationships in the grammar constitutes a trace of the complex processes the students go through in sorting out the interrelationships of the various participants.

A final point needs to be made about positioning in the Text 1. Although this leaves no direct traces in the language of the text the letter is written in two keys (Goffman 1974). It is written both for the simulated audience of the client Susan, and for the real audience of the students’ university tutor. These two audiences have different needs. Despite the attention paid by the course designers to the construction of an extensive simulation, in practice when the tutor came to read and assess the letter she looked not at the quality of advice to a client but at the merit of the students’ legal interpretation of the facts of the case. The genre of the letter was treated as a ‘red herring’. It could be argued that the students’ confusion was due to the unresolved tension between these two audiences.

Conclusion

Using the example of a letter of advice written by law students to a simulated client, this paper illustrates how multiple writing positions leave traces in linguistic texture. This point has practical importance as a demonstration of one potential source of difficulty and confusion in student writing. It also has theoretical importance as a demonstration of the way in which
critical discourse analysis can throw light on the formation of social identities. Its theoretical claim is that social identities are not directly realized by written texts. Rather there is an intermediate level of structure I have called a writing position associated with clauses or clause complexes in a text. Writing positions stand in a reciprocal relationship to social identities. A person’s social identity is reflected in the writing positions that he or she takes; at the same time writing positions are a resource for the formation of social identities.

References


London, pp. 32-70.

Discourse and the Emergence of New Global Institutions
(Keynote Paper)

Steve Maguire
McGill University, Canada

Cynthia Hardy
University of Melbourne

Abstract

Critics of the burgeoning interest in discourse often challenge its relevance by saying it is simply “talk”. This paper explores the different ways in which discourse can make a difference by drawing on a study of the Stockholm Convention on Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs), a new global regulatory institution that came into effect in 2004. The Stockholm Convention allows for the regulation of dangerous products based on their potential harm to human health and the environment. It immediately eliminates or restricts twelve chemicals classified as POPs (toxic chemicals such as PCBs and DDT) and also specifies a process for adding chemicals to the list of POPs in the future.

Discourse played a number of important roles in the Stockholm Convention. First, the Convention incorporates the relatively new discourse of “precaution” and it is this discourse, rather than the discourse of “science,” that gives the institution its power to regulate chemical products. Second, different stakeholders are empowered or disempowered by these different discourses. Third, stakeholders engaged in a range of discursive strategies as they produced

Introduction

This paper uses discourse analysis to examine the emergence of the Stockholm Convention on Persistent Organic Pollutants (“POPs”, which are toxic chemicals such as PCBs, DDT and other agricultural and industrial chemicals), and to draw lessons for global institution building more generally. The Stockholm Convention came into effect in 2004 and allows for the elimination or restriction of markets for chemical products classified as POPs. By banning “some of the most toxic chemicals known to humankind”, it is hoped that the Convention will “save lives and protect the natural environment – particularly in the poorest communities and countries” (UNEP, 2004). The Convention is based upon and operationalizes the precautionary principle which was enshrined in the 1992 Rio Declaration on Environment and Development as Principle 15 and which authorizes regulatory action, such as banning dangerous products and technologies, based on potential or uncertain harms to humans and the environment. According to the precautionary principle, scientific uncertainty about adverse effects of risk-generating products does not justify societal inaction and, simply put, it is better to be safe than sorry in the face of possible threats (Wiener & Rogers, 2002).

New global institutions that incorporate the precautionary principle, such as the Stockholm Convention, have major implications. First, the Convention bans a number of incumbent chemicals from the market place. Second, by triggering societal deliberations about appropriate policy responses to potential harms more frequently, this new global regulatory institution provides increased scope for stakeholders, such as environmental and health-based nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), to

21 A revised version of this paper has been accepted for publication by Organization Studies.
22 The authors gratefully acknowledge the financial support of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, les Fonds pour la Formation des Chercheurs et l’Aide à la Recherche de Quebec, McGill University and the University of Melbourne in carrying out this research.
influence decision making about the elimination or restriction of markets in particular chemical products. Third, the Convention removes the burden of proving risk from regulators and shifts it towards polluters, enabling governments to ban products based on uncertain, incomplete evidence of potential harm, and requiring producers to defend their products more frequently. Fourth, under the rubric of risk avoidance, the Convention is more likely to lead to outright product bans and eliminate markets in dangerous chemicals, instead of allowing continued production, trade and use, albeit with safeguards, under the auspices of risk management. The Stockholm Convention thus heralds a transformation of the governance system of the global chemical industry, in which a number of diverse interest groups have a considerable stake. Given the economic and social importance of this new institution, it is useful to understand the “institutional structuring” process that gave rise to it (Whitley, 2000).

Scholars have argued that attention to language and discursive practices can provide a valuable tool for studying institution building activities: “studying talk is useful for understanding how actors negotiate new institutional orders – and deinstitutionalize old ones” (Clark & Jennings, 1997: 462). Our study details how different groups interact in the construction of new institutional regimes through their institution building activities, and highlights the roles they play in championing and mediating particular sets of ideas and ideological frames during this process. Our findings show the role that the discourses of “precaution” and “sound science” played in institution building, how different interest groups engaged with these discursive resources, and the different strategies they employed to shape the new global institution during the institution building process. In this way, our paper makes the following contributions. First, it provides a sophisticated view of the political dynamics involved in the struggle over a new global institution by drawing on post-structural conceptualizations of language and power. Second, in using discourse analysis, it adds to our understanding of the dynamics of institutional change and builds on the emerging body of literature linking discourses and institutions. Third, it shows the important role that language and, in particular, the strategic production and distribution of texts, plays in institution building. Finally, it provides practical insights for actors involved in championing or shaping new institutions of this kind.

The remainder of this paper is organized as follows. First, we provide an overview of the theory related to institutional change and global institution building, and develop our research questions. Second, we provide an overview of our case study. Third, we present the methods we used. Fourth, we present our findings. We conclude with a discussion of the implications of our study.

Institutional Change and Global Institution Building

Our interest is in the field or policy domain (Laumann & Knoke, 1989) of global environmental regulation. Such fields are constituted by sets of actors, including government bodies, business groups and NGOs, “who seek to influence a shared outcome (such as regulation) and pay attention to one another in the process” (McNichol & Bensedrine, 2003: 220). They are arenas of power relations (Brint & Karabel, 1991), where actors “compete over the definition of issues and the form of institutions that will guide organizational behavior” (Hoffman, 1999: 352). Such transnational negotiations represent a space “where interactions take place and behavioral patterns get structured” in processes that are shaped by the interests of social actors, and which, in certain circumstances, lead to the creation of new global institutions (Djelic & Quack, 2003: 8). In this section, we review the work on institutional change and global institution building to develop our research questions.

Institutions are defined as “historical accretions of past practices and understandings that set conditions on action” through the way in which they “gradually acquire the moral and ontological status of taken-for-granted facts which, in turn, shape future interactions and negotiations” (Barley & Tolbert, 1997: 99). Departures from institutionalized patterns of behavior are “are counteracted in a regulated fashion, by repetitively activated, socially constructed, controls”, i.e. sets of socially constructed rewards and sanctions (Jepperson, 1991: 145). As well as constraining actions, however, institutions also enable them (Leblebici, Salancik, Copay & King, 1991; Barley & Tolbert, 1997; Lawrence, Hardy & Phillips, 2002).

We see institutions as the fabric or frame shaping, constraining, embedding, orienting, facilitating and allowing actions and interactions, including those of an economic nature (Djelic & Quack, 2003: 2).

Institutional theory has, however, been criticized for focusing on the persistence of institutions and
ignoring issues of change (Greenwood & Hinings, 1996; Djelic & Quack, 2003). More recently, some theorists have incorporated institutional change into their analyses (e.g., Hirsch & Lounsbury, 1997; Holm, 1995; Hoffman, 1999). In addition, the concept of institutional entrepreneurship by organized actors with sufficient resources and skills to build new institutions has emerged to theorize institutional change (DiMaggio, 1988; Fligstein, 1997). This work is predicated on a relationship between interests, agency, and institutions wherein institutional change is viewed as a political process that reflects the power and interests of organized actors (Seo & Creed, 2002). As a result, a body of empirical work has started to appear on the activities of institutional entrepreneurs (e.g., Rao, Morrill & Zald, 2000; Garud, Jain & Kumarswamy, 2001; Maguire, Hardy & Lawrence, 2004). This literature tends to emphasize agency, focusing often on highly skilled, powerful actors who transform fields (e.g., Hinings & Greenwood, 1988; DiMaggio, 1991; Hoffman, 1999). Even work examining less powerful actors tends to focus on the activities of these actors rather than taking the broader institutional context directly into consideration (e.g., Maguire et al. 2004).

In relation to global regulatory institutions, organizational scholars have stressed the importance of studying institutional entrepreneurship by both state and non-state actors (Levy, 1997; Djelic & Bensedrine, 2001; Levy & Prakash, 2003). Researchers have typologized and theorized different patterns of transnational institution-building: in some cases, powerful states seek to have their national model successfully diffused internationally to become a global standard; in other cases, institution building and the negotiation of new norms takes place on the global stage, where non-state actors such as NGOs and business can play important roles in addition to states (Djelic & Bensedrine, 2001). Comparing the case of ozone depletion with that of climate change, Levy (1997: 55) demonstrates "how business interests have substantial influence over the contours of international business treaties"; his analysis "suggests that international environmental treaties require the assent of major affected industries" (Levy, 1997: 66), even if given passively. On the other hand, Levy & Newell (2002: 85) argue that "sensitivity to a strategic dimension of power suggests that intelligent agency can sometimes out-maneuver resource-rich adversaries", and point out how "NGOs are sometimes able to compensate for their lack of resources by coordinating their efforts, appealing to moral principles, and exploiting tensions among states and industry sectors with various interests" Levy & Newell (2002: 96).

An examination of the literature on institutions, as well as that focusing specifically on global ones, thus indicates a paradox – although it acknowledges the tension between their intertwined enabling and constraining features, specific works in the literature have tended to come down on one side or another of this structure-agency divide. Research tends either to emphasize structure and the pressures for the reproduction of existing institutions, as the neo-institutionalists do; or to privilege agency and free rein, as is often the case with the work on institutional entrepreneurship. Yet, as Djelic & Quack (2003: 3) point out, there is a need to reconcile embeddedness and change to provide a "historically bounded" understanding of globalization processes which can accommodate both constraining and enabling aspects of institutions.

**Research Questions**

We attempt to address this gap in the literature though a discursive approach. We define a discourse as an inter-related set or body of texts which, along with practices of their production, dissemination and consumption (Parker, 1992; Hardy & Phillips, 2004), which "systematically form the object of which they speak" (Foucault, 1979: 49). Discourse brings the social and natural world into being by creating the "ideas, categories, relationships, and theories through which we understand the world and relate to one another" (Hardy & Phillips, 1999: 3). By constructing the meaning of social categories, objects of knowledge, forms of 'self', social relationships, and conceptual frameworks (Deetz, 1992; Fairclough and Wodak, 1997), discourse shapes what can be said and who can say it (Fairclough, 1992; Du Gay, 1996; Hall, 2001) and, in so doing, also shapes practice.

Discourse … determines the strategies and rules by which we can speak about and act on a domain of objects, including ourselves, in such a way that certain possibilities and outcomes are realized rather than others (Reed, 1998: 196).

In other words, discourses "do not just describe things; they do things" (Potter & Wetherell, 1987: 6); and "the discursive constitution of society" is firmly rooted in "material social structures" (Fairclough, 1992: 66).
The aim of discourse analysis, therefore, is to examine bodies of texts to show how discourses constructs social phenomena and lead to particular practices, drawing on a set of theoretical assumptions that sees language as fundamental to the construction of social reality (Grant, Keenoy & Oswick, 1998; Wood & Kroger, 2000; Phillips & Hardy, 2002). Discourse analysis thus provides a coherent framework for the investigation of the processes underlying institutional change (Phillips, Lawrence & Hardy, 2004). Discourse analysts acknowledge a clear link between discourse and institutions and, specifically, view institutions as premised upon, embedded within and supported by particular discourses (Parker, 1992; Kress, 1995; Fairclough, 1995): when discourses produce social conventions with social sanctions that are sufficiently robust as to make alternative ways of thinking and acting either impossible to envisage or too costly to enact, an institution can be said to exist (Phillips et al., 2004). At the same time, by invoking different discourses, actors can change institutions (Fairclough 1992; Phillips et al., 2004). In this way, discourse analysis focuses on the relationships among discourse, texts and institutions, with particular attention to the power relations embodied in these relationships (cf. Fairclough, 1995; Fairclough & Wodak, 1997; van Dijk, 1993; 1996).

Discourse analysis is sensitive to both the embedded nature of institution building activities and the way in which the institutional context also presents opportunities for transformation and change (e.g., Fairclough, 1992; Hardy & Phillips, 2004). Discourse analysts acknowledge that “localized discursive strategies” are related to “institutionalized structures of power in which they are embedded” (Reed, 1998: 208); they also recognize that discourse is an important way to exercise power (Deetz & Mumby, 1990). As discourses are mobilized within a context of institutional arrangements, they are both shaped by this context and they help to structure or restructure it by creating particular understandings and meanings (Selsky, Spicer & Teischer, 2003). Not surprisingly, then, researchers have advocated a discursive approach to studying the emergence of new global institutions (Litfin, 1994). A focus on the discourses that permeate a particular institutional context is thus a useful way to combine considerations of both enabling and constraining aspects of institutions. This leads to our first research question: what is the role of discourse in constraining and enabling the emergence of new global institutions?

Discourse activity is thus a form of political activity where actors try to change understandings of a social situation, shape interpretations of experiences, and justify practices within a system of meanings that is commensurate with their interests (Deetz and Mumby, 1990; Mumby and Stohl, 1991). Discourse analysts focus their attention on the ways in which actors use language and produce texts in this process (e.g., Grant et al., 1998; Taylor Cooren, Giroux & Robichaud, 1996; Selsky et al, 2003).

Most of the work in institutional theory has adopted a behavioral view when examining institutional change (Barley & Tolbert, 1997). Phillips et al. (2004) argue, however, that institutions are rarely changed or built through direct observation of behaviors, but are much more likely to be influenced through the production and distribution of texts about the behaviors in question (also see Taylor & Van Every, 1993). Texts allow thoughts and actions to be transmitted across time and space (Smith, 1990), a process which is necessary to institution building in most contemporary societies, and especially global institutions, such as international treaties and agreements.23

[Actors] may produce texts that draw on discourses from other fields, or from society more generally, to produce new institutions or de-legitimate existing institutions. They may also work on producing texts that are accessible and understandable to other actors in the field, or changing how texts are disseminated within the field, maximizing the diffusion of their texts and preventing other actors from

---

23 As our methods section shows there is, in the case of international treaties, conventions and legislation, a heavy emphasis on texts. This is not to say that the behavioral interactions between particular actors play no role in building new institutions. Certainly, some negotiations may be done behind closed doors but, we argue that ensuing texts will provide traces of them. These textual traces also have the advantage of being more accessible to researchers than backroom deals.
being able to disseminate them (Phillips et al., 2004: 1).

Accordingly, we argue that actors engage in institution building by producing influential texts that draw upon or challenge the discourses on which institutions depend. This view is consistent with that of researchers who have argued that attention to language and discursive practices provides a valuable means of studying institution building activities: “studying talk is useful for understanding how actors negotiate new institutional orders – and deinstitutionalize old ones” (Clark & Devereaux Jennings, 1997: 462). Accordingly, our second research question is: how do interested actors use discursive resources to influence global institution building processes?

The Case Study

The Stockholm Convention on Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs), which came into effect on May 17, 2004, establishes new global rules for the production, use, import, export, release and disposal of twelve dangerous chemicals known as the “dirty dozen”. POPs are substances that: “are highly toxic”; “are persistent, lasting for years or even decades before degrading into less dangerous forms”; “evaporate and travel long distances through the air and through water”; and “accumulate in fatty tissues” of humans and wildlife (UNEP, 2002: 5). Specifically, the Convention bans or restricts ten intentionally produced agricultural and industrial chemicals (aldrin, chlordane, DDT, dieldrin, endrin, heptachlor, hexachlorobenzene, mirex, PCBs and toxaphene), and obligates governments to reduce releases of two additional substances which are unintentional byproducts of industrial activity (dioxins and furans). Importantly, the Convention also contains a provision for adding additional substances, establishing a POPs Review Committee to this end. Any government that is party to the Convention can propose additional candidate chemical products and, in so doing, trigger a structured evaluation of the nominated substance which operationalizes a precautionary approach to global chemicals management: “For POP no.13 and beyond, the Convention clearly states that the required standard of evidence will be based on the need for precaution” (UNEP, 2002: 11). The significance of this provision has already been underlined; on August 11, 2004, the European Commission (EC) proposed that the European Union “push for an additional nine nasty chemicals to be banned” under the Stockholm Convention (EC, 2004). In other words, a new, standardized and highly visible process is now available to actors seeking global regulations for dangerous chemicals, and this process involves a range of stakeholder groups, including business and non-government organizations (NGOs), as Article 7 of the Convention exhorts governments to cooperate and to consult with national stakeholders in implementing the Convention’s provisions.

The formal process that culminated in the Stockholm Convention began in February 1997, when the United Nations Environment Program’s (UNEP) Governing Council set in motion an intergovernmental negotiating committee (INC) with a mandate to develop an international legally binding instrument to address an initial list of twelve POPs. This mandate, officially known as UNEP GC 19/13C, explicitly invoked the precautionary principle from the Rio Declaration. The text of the Convention was drafted, debated, modified and, ultimately, consensually agreed over a series of five meetings of the INC, with input from two meetings of a Criteria Expert Group (CEG) created specifically to address the provision for adding new substances. The meetings took place from July 1998 to December 2000, and the Convention was officially adopted at a signing ceremony in Stockholm in May 2001. As of August 2004, there were 151 signatory states, of which 76 were full Parties to the Convention, having ratified the treaty domestically.

The meetings took the usual form for international institution building, with both state and non-state actors participating prominently. State actors were formal participants in the negotiating sessions where they proposed, debated, changed and ultimately adopted specific wording for the various articles and annexes of the Convention. The evolving draft treaty consisted of agreed unbracketed text and bracketed text, which was not yet agreed. Suggested changes to the draft text were made by states via written submissions termed “conference room papers” and accompanied by formal interventions in the plenary sessions of the INC meetings. Other states reacted to these submissions and, if there was consensus, the proposal was adopted and incorporated into the draft unbracketed; if there was not consensus, the proposed text was inserted but bracketed to indicate its provisional status. The first draft of the specific provision for adding new substances to the Convention was issued from the first meeting of the CEG in October 1998, while the first complete draft of the Convention became available at the third meeting of the INC in September 1999. As submissions were addressed at the various meetings, the bracketed text disappeared, eventually, and specific wording was
consensually agreed. The final draft of the Convention emerged from the fifth meeting of the INC, in December 2000.

As is customary in such international negotiations, non-state actors also participated and attempted to influence the final shape of the Convention, as observers; while they could not and did not make formal submissions, they did intervene numerous times during plenary sessions with suggestions as well as with criticisms and comments signaling their approval or disapproval of specific aspects of the evolving Convention and the negotiating process. In addition, stakeholder groups were prominent "in the corridors" of each meeting. There, they set up information booths, delivered to state delegates a large volume of discussion documents and position papers outlining their own recommendations, and lobbied state delegates verbally.

Methods

Site Selection

We selected this case because of what we perceived, at the start of the process, to be potentially important implications for markets and organizations in the global chemical industry. Because it drew upon the precautionary principle, we expected that the eventual international treaty would eliminate a number of markets in toxic chemicals, as well as lower the threshold of evidence necessary to trigger global deliberations about the fate of additional risk-generating chemical products. Stakeholders in government, business and NGO sectors clearly had a significant interest in influencing this process – from business actors, who have argued that the precautionary principle results in a climate of policy uncertainty, stifles innovation, encourage protectionism and politicize decision-making, to NGOs who have championed new global regulatory institutions for governing the chemical industry and incorporating precaution specifically. Thus we expected to see evidence of considerable attempts at agency during the global institution building process. Further, we knew that the process would evolve over time and that struggles among actors would play out over a period of years, which we could track over time.

A second reason for selecting this case study was our access to a wide range to published texts that documented the ongoing emergence of the Convention as well as the positions of different stakeholders. Thus we could supplement interviews and observations with "naturally occurring texts" that lend themselves to discourse analysis (Phillips & Hardy, 2002) and facilitate the study of the global institution building strategies of actors over time.

Data Collection

We collected data in a number of different ways. First, we collected the official texts produced during the negotiations that led to the final Convention: after each meeting, an official draft version of the Convention was published by UNEP, the intergovernmental organization which coordinated the negotiating sessions, and this yielded a series of easily comparable written texts that we collected. We also collected texts produced by both state and non-state actors in their attempts to influence the Convention: one of the authors attended and observed three meetings of the INC, noted when actors intervened, and collected relevant textual materials from both state and non-state actors, including: formal submissions (i.e. conference room papers) to the meetings, position papers, reports, press releases and transcripts of speeches from state actors; position papers, reports and pamphlets produced by business as well as NGOs; and official UNEP documentation. These were supplemented with daily reports of each of the seven meetings produced by the Earth Negotiations Bulletin, along with a wide range of broader texts such as historical records, archival material, and academic articles and books related to the regulation of toxic chemicals generally, as well as the precautionary principle more specifically.

In addition to this body of textual material, we conducted 40 formal interviews with state and non-state actors on both sides of the precaution issue, and these were taped and transcribed. Interviews were semi-structured, lasted between one and two hours, and involved asking interviewees to describe the POPs issue, the events leading up to the negotiations, and the negotiations themselves. Interviewees included: government delegates actively involved in the negotiation and representing EU member
states, the US, Canada, Australia from JUSCANZ\textsuperscript{24}, and other countries; representatives of health and environmental nongovernmental organizations; industry representatives; and UNEP officials.

Data Analysis

In the first stage of data analysis, we organized the data into two databases. An “event history database” (Van de Ven & Poole, 1990) was constructed by chronologically ordering descriptions of the process and juxtaposing the multiple accounts of events from different sources to ascertain convergence. This analysis captured “who did what, and when”. For each event, the relevant primary sources – the texts – were identified and chronologically ordered to comprise a “discursive-event history database” (Maguire, 2004), capturing “who said what, and when”. In this way, we were able to develop a narrative account (Eisenhardt & Bourgeois, 1988) that chronicled the process that resulted in the Stockholm Convention – how the issue emerged on the global stage, how negotiations progressed, how and which issues arose, and how they were resolved – along with the relevant primary textual sources. This first stage of analysis showed that the issue of precaution was regularly mentioned at meetings, in actors’ texts, and by actors in interviews. We therefore decided to examine the issue of precaution and associated provisions of the Convention in more detail.

Accordingly, in the second stage of analysis, we established which actors talked about precaution and in what ways by examining our discursive-event history database and the daily reports of each of the seven meetings produced by the \textit{Earth Negotiations Bulletin}. From this, we were able to establish the state actors who made formal interventions in the plenary sessions that contributed to the final official text of the Convention, as well as non-state actors who were most vocal and active on the issue of precaution. We thus identified the key players by counting the number of interventions they made and the number of conference room papers and position papers they authored. We also ascertained whether they supported precaution insofar as they advocated a stronger emphasis on it or whether they advocated a weaker approach to incorporating the precautionary principle into the Convention. From this analysis, we established that the main state actor seeking to maximize precaution was the EU (supported by Norway and Iceland) and the main state actor seeking to moderate precaution was the US (supported by Japan, Canada, Australia, and New Zealand – the JUSCANZ bloc). The main non-state actor seeking to maximize precaution was the International POPs Elimination Network (IPEN), a network of 350 NGOs and community groups from around the world; while the International Council of Chemical Associations (ICCA) was the main non-state actor seeking to moderate precaution. Finally, we noted how influential these actors were by noting whose language was eventually adopted. Table 1 shows how provisions of the Convention associated with the issue of precaution evolved from meeting to meeting, as well as the positions adopted by the main actors with regard to these provisions. (Table 1 — Appendix)

Ultimately, precaution figures prominently in the Convention: the Preamble states that “precaution underlies the concerns of all the Parties and is embedded within this Convention”; the Objective was agreed as follows “[m]indful of the precautionary approach as set forth in Principle 15 of the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development, the objective of this Convention is to protect human health and the environment from persistent organic pollutants”; explicit reference to precaution is found in Annex C addressing “best available techniques”; the technical threshold value of the persistence criteria for adding substances to the Convention was set at the more precautionary level proposed (unlike that for the bioaccumulation criteria, set at the less precautionary level); and, most significantly, the provision for adding new substances explicitly incorporates precaution by giving the Conference of the Parties (COP) final say over the Review Committee and by obliging it to make listing decisions “in a precautionary manner.” Table 1 thus summarizes how, on the specific issue of incorporating the precautionary principle, the EU and IPEN were more successful than the US and ICCA in having their recommendations adopted.

Having established that precaution was an important part of the local discourse used by a wide range of actors in their attempts to influence the institution building process, the third stage of analysis examined whether it was linked to a broader “grand” discourse of precaution (see Alvesson & Kärreman, 2000). Iteratively, we traced the intertextual links made by actors to other texts and established whether and how these other texts also invoked precaution and other texts. From the

\textsuperscript{24} JUSCANZ is an acronym referring to Japan, the United States of America, Canada, Australia, and New Zealand, who often form a negotiating bloc in international fora and are often in opposition to the European Union (EU) as regards trade and related issues.
resulting network of intertextual references, we identified a set of texts which included other international legal instruments as well as sources in academic journals from law, international relations and environmental studies. In this way, we identified an inter-related body of texts that allowed us to conceptualize precaution as a discourse (cf. Phillips & Hardy, 2002). We then examined the data for evidence of an alternative or legacy discourse, based on Reed’s (2004) assertion that new discourses cannot avoid inheriting the cultural and political capital of older ones. Accordingly, we coded actors’ texts to see whether and to what “precaution” was opposed and ascertained that the most common oppositional references were to “science”, “scientific criteria”, “science-based risk management” and similar concepts which are captured under the label “sound science”. In the same way as we did with precaution, we traced back from the texts associated with the Convention to a broader and older body of texts, thus establishing the existence of two discourses that permeated this institutional arena.

The fourth stage of the analysis systematically compared these two discourses. To do so, we started with an established framework (Hardy & Phillips, 1999; Phillips & Hardy, 1997) capturing the way in which discourses constitute the meaning of particular social categories. Specifically, we coded texts to see the way in which the two discourses constructed “objects”, “concepts”, and “subject positions”. Objects are part of the practical realm, with material aspects. Even with an independent physical or material existence, however, objects can only be understood with reference to prevailing discourses (Laclau and Mouffe 1987). Objects thus therefore derive meaning from the concepts applied to them: when a concept is used to make some aspect of material reality meaningful, an object is constituted (Hardy & Phillips, 2004). Concepts are culturally and historically situated frames for understanding social reality—ideas, categories and theories through which we understand the world (Harré 1979). We therefore examined the texts and the interview data to identify the main ideas that actors associated with precaution and sound science respectively, and the objects to which they were applied. We then explored subject positions, which are locations within the discourses from which certain delimited agents can act: “a discourse makes available a space for particular types of self to step in” (Parker, 1992: 10). Subject positions have differential rights to speak in each discourse. Accordingly, we identified the most important actors in terms of “warranting voice” (Potter & Wetherell, 1987) in the two discourses. In this way, we were able to distinguish the different effects – or “conditions of possibility” that could be “drawn upon in the exercise of power” (Knights 1992: 530) associated with the two discourses. From this analysis, we were able to draw more detailed implications for the major stakeholder groups and the way in which these groups were empowered or disempowered by different discourses.

In the final stage of analysis, we returned to the texts produced by the key actors to see how they drew on the discourses of precaution and sound science. In exercising power, actors try to produce and disseminate influential texts which leave traces and embed in discourse (Hardy, 2004). Having established that their texts did leave traces in the new regulatory institution, we explored what strategies they used to do so. Specifically, we built on the idea that texts are more like to “stick” (Hardy & Phillips, 2004) and influence organizing (Putnam & Cooren, 1994) if they involve intertextuality – referring to other texts (Ott & Walter, 2000) – and interdiscursivity – drawing on other powerful discourses (Livesey, 2002) – for legitimacy and meaning. By producing a text that evokes other texts and discourses, the producer hopes to shape the way it will be interpreted by other actors (Fairclough, 1992). Accordingly, we returned to our earlier coding of intertextuality (Stage 3 above) and also coded the texts for themes indicating interdiscursivity. We thus established patterns in the primary discourses, interdiscursivity, intertextuality and modes of engagement with different discourses employed by actors. In this way, we were able to draw conclusions about the strategies used by actors seeking to influence the institution building process.

Findings

In this section, we discuss the findings of our study. We first examine the discourses of precaution and sound science and the relationship between them. We then examine the implications of the two discourses and, in particular, the way in which they alter the power relations among actors. Finally, we examine the discursive strategies used by the key actors.

The Discourses of Precaution and Sound Science

The institution building activities of the actors were characterized by a discourse of precaution, which featured heavily in the texts, the interventions and the interviews. As Table 1, above, shows, particular actors took different stands, with some, such as the EU and IPEN, advocating a stronger stand on
precaution – and stronger wording concerning precaution in the drafts of the Convention. The US and ICCA also used the language of precaution, but advocated a weaker version and weaker wording. As a result, the precautionary principle was a central and highly contentious issue throughout the negotiations. In fact, whether, where and how the precautionary principle would be referenced in the Convention was among the last items to be agreed. Upon achieving consensus, one EU delegate quipped that the new treaty should be called the “Stockholm Convention on the Precautionary Principle, with some implications for POPs”.

This discourse of precaution was not simply a local one. In fact, one interviewee, a JUSCANZ delegate, went so far as to describe precaution as “almost a cottage industry”. The precautionary principle can be traced back to the Vorsorgeprinzip, or “foresight” principle, of West German environmental law, used in the 1970’s and 1980’s to address pollution, acid rain and global warming. The precautionary principle first appeared formally in an international context in the Declarations of the International Conferences on the Protection of the North Sea of 1984 and 1987 (Freestone, 1991; O’Riordan & Jordan, 1995; McIntyre & Mosedale, 1997; Adams, 2002; Maguire & Ellis, 2002). It was enshrined in the 1992 Rio Declaration on Environment and Development as Principle 15 (UNCED, 1992) which has come to be a frequently referenced and authoritative text within the discourse:

In order to protect the environment, the precautionary approach shall be widely applied by States according to their capabilities. Where there are threats of serious or irreversible damage, lack of full scientific certainty shall not be used as a reason for postponing cost-effective measures to prevent environmental degradation.

Since the Rio Declaration, the precautionary principle has been incorporated into numerous international declarations and treaties, and has been invoked in relation to a wide range of industries, including fishing, chemicals, agriculture and genetically modified organisms.

As the discourse of precaution has been incorporated into policy processes and regulatory institutions, the debate has intensified and widened. For example, some in the popular press, especially in the US, have claimed that the precautionary principle “poses a radical challenge to business as usual in a modern, capitalist, technological civilization” (Pollan, 2001: 94). Business commentators have also written extensively about “the perils of precaution” (Miller & Conko, 2001), going so far as to describe it as “a lopsided process that is inherently biased against change and therefore against innovation” (Miller & Conko, 2001). In contrast, many NGOs have welcomed the ascendance of the precautionary principle in domestic and international law because of the reduced burden placed on governments and vulnerable populations to provide incontrovertible evidence of harm. They believe that the principle fills “the vacuum created by a science that continually searches for certainty but which continually fails to deliver” (Adams, 2002: 311). We can see, then, that precaution represented a discursive resource (Hardy, Palmer & Phillips, 2000; Hardy, Lawrence & Grant, 2005) on which interested actors could draw in their institutional building activities, but one which was highly contested.

The institution building process leading to the Stockholm Convention was characterized by the juxtaposition of precaution with sound science, a competing discourse which emphasizes the ability of science to predict environmental threats and to develop the measures necessary to prevent them. Sound science was regularly positioned in opposition to precaution as actors attempted to influence the Convention. For example, ICCA (2000a) complained:

Indeed, industry today faces the prospect of having some chemicals, chemical groups, and entire technologies banned or strictly controlled as a result of government decisions that seem to apply the precautionary principle in a way that disregards important science and allows risk management decisions to be made on the basis of hazard, or intrinsic properties such as persistence or bio-accumulation alone.

Our intertextual tracing revealed that the local discourse of sound science used by actors in our case also drew upon and reflected a broader discursive context.

One of the most prominent axes for the emerging debate over the Precautionary Principle concerns a contrast that is often drawn between ‘precaution’ on the one hand and ‘science based regulation’ on the other. The implication of this distinction is that the adoption of a ‘precautionary’ approach might somehow be seen a priori as being antithetical to – or at least in tension with – the principles of scientific rigour in the regulation of risk. Under such a view, the implementation of the ‘Precautionary Principle’ becomes essentially a politically-determined compromise on what are held to be the otherwise clear dictates of the ‘sound science’ of risk assessment (Stirling, 1999: 6).
Our findings thus indicate that, and show how, the local discourses of precaution and sound science deployed by actors as they sought to influence the institution building process were permeated by, and part of, broader societal discourses.

These broader discourses provided actors on both sides of the debate over precaution with discursive resources. However, the relationship between them was not simply one of opposition. Neither discourse is complete or uncontested: each allows for considerable variability of meaning in the way it makes up the world – in this case, the shaping of a new global institution. In particular, within the discourse of precaution, actors often refer to “weak” and “strong” forms of precaution, which are respectively closer to and further from the opposing discourse of sound science. Nor are the two discourses self contained; they overlap – both include science to some degree or another, and traditional forms of scientific risk assessment and risk management are compatible with weak forms of precaution (O’Riordan & Jordan, 1995; Maguire & Ellis, 2003). In other words, the relationships between the discourses were complex and there was considerable variability in the meanings that they might confer.

**The Constructive Effects of Discourse**

The discourses of sound science and precaution, despite contradicting and complementing each other, nonetheless provided the means for actors to construct the social and natural world in quite different ways, with particular implications for the Convention and for practice. Specifically, they constructed different meanings through the interplay of objects, concepts, and subject positions (Table 2), leading to different conditions of possibility. In this way, the discourses produce different power relations among the actors and lead to different effects. (Table 2 — Appendix)

The focal objects of both discourses were risk generating products, in this case chemicals such as PCBs, DDT, etc. While the object is material, its meaning is variable: dangerous, safe, toxic, etc. As Maguire (2004) points out in detailing the rise and fall of DDT and its shifting identity, from “magic insect killer” to “persistent pesticide in the environment”, molecules are discursive objects insofar as they are given meaning and can only be understood through their association with particular concepts. The discourse of sound science constructs chemical products as safe until proven guilty; while the discourse of precaution constructs them as potentially dangerous in the absence of further knowledge. Differences in the meaning of these objects are achieved through the way in which different concepts from the respective discourse are brought to bear on them.

One key concept that changed the meaning of the objects was scientific knowledge. The discourse of sound science constructs scientific knowledge as something that experts can state with relative certainty about a given product. The discourse of precaution, on the other hand, constructs scientific knowledge as uncertain and limited, as evidenced here in a speech made by the EU (2000) during the negotiations:

> Yet, even [the] most serious scientific works often prove[d] to be misleading in the past concerning these substances. The POPs … were in the past deemed to be so harmless, including by most brilliant scientists, that they were massively employed. … This means that anywhere, governments must be in a position to act when science, because of a lack of scientific certainty, cannot assist them on a sound basis and leaves them in front of contradictory debates.

A second key concept is risk. The discourse of sound science stresses the importance of accurately assessing and, ultimately, demonstrating risk before triggering government intervention. The discourse of precaution, in contrast, draws attention to potential risks of chemicals, and how “serious and irreversible” threats of harm should trigger societal deliberations about appropriate responses and government intervention, which may include regulation and even elimination in the form of product bans. Thus chemical products become associated with different concepts – demonstrated risk or potential risk. Further, in the case of sound science, the certainty of scientific knowledge means that risk – if it exists – can be measured and demonstrated. The absence of evidence is accordingly taken to mean that the product does not pose a risk. However, if the uncertainties and limitations of scientific knowledge are foregrounded, as in the discourse of precaution, it is recognized that demonstrating risk with certainty is difficult, and that the possibility of getting it wrong – that the product poses a hidden or as yet unassessed risk – is greater. Potentially risky products are, as a result, far more worrying and deserving of government attention.

The discourse of sound science is also closely associated with another concept, risk management – the taking of action aimed at lowering demonstrated risks below some acceptable level, but only after rigorous and preferably quantitative studies to analyze and assess the risk. The discourse of
precaution, on the other hand, although not incompatible with risk management (Maguire & Ellis, 2003), is more strongly associated with the concept of risk avoidance, illustrated well in our case study by IPEN’s (1998) recommendation that “the goal of a global POPs convention must not be defined as the ‘better management of risks’ associated with POPs” but rather their “elimination”. In other words, the discourse of precaution constructs risk avoidance as superior to the traditional practices of risk assessment, analysis and management historically used as the basis of chemical regulatory institutions:

The analysis must go well beyond risk assessment. Though a useful tool in certain contexts, risk assessment has the potential to narrow rather than broaden the analysis (WWF, 2000).

The association of objects with these different concepts from the two discourses results in quite different meanings: rigorous and accurate scientific knowledge means that risks can be known and dangerous products can be identified and managed; uncertain and limited scientific knowledge means that risks may never be fully known and potentially risky products should be avoided.

The two discourses also create different subject positions – the categories available to actors from which they can speak, and which are associated with different degrees of discursive legitimacy. The discourse of sound science privileges scientific experts, who are assumed to deliver hard, “black boxed” facts to the policy process.

"Risk analysis … is first and foremost a specialized language – in formal terms, a discourse – that serves to allocate power in society. In particular, the decision to frame environmental problems in quantitative terms, through QRA [quantitative risk assessment], rules out other ways of classifying and measuring harms to the environment; risk-talk implicitly empowers certain people [scientists] as experts, and their knowledge as expertise, and excludes other people and their knowledge as incompetent and irrelevant." (Jasanoff, 1998: 96)

Scientists still have discursive legitimacy within the discourse of precaution, but their position is diminished since, especially for those environmental problems most salient to the public, they are typically capable of producing only limited and uncertain knowledge, and only after expensive, time-consuming scientific activities. The privileged status of scientists is also weakened by the greater voice provided for lay members of the public and NGOs speaking in their name. With precaution, the latter are now more legitimate interest groups in decision making processes addressing risk-generating products and can therefore legitimately voice concerns about chemical products on the basis of a much lower threshold of evidence than with the discourse of sound science.

The two discourses also construct governments somewhat differently. According to sound science, governments are neutral consumers of scientific information who are arbiters of demonstrated risks and benefits in society, acting only after the facts have been established. Precaution, on the other hand, constructs governments as arbiters of potential risks and benefits and provides even more normative support to them in their roles as champions of the public interest and, especially, as protectors of human and environmental health. As such they are supposed to be attentive to weaker stakeholders and willing to take preemptive action. Finally, business has always had a voice but, under sound science, this was largely behind the scenes in that they employed many of the scientists and funded much of the research (and also lobbied governments), and were only infrequently called upon to defend their products since this was required only once risks were fully demonstrated. Precaution constructs business as one among a range of legitimate stakeholders, and requires them to defend more of their products, earlier in their life cycles, as they respond to charges of potential harm. Describing the shift, one government official described:

These are things that I think would have been unlikely or very difficult to obtain twenty years ago. I think in many instances then the reaction of the industry was; “Make me. And then I’ll sue you.” … [Now they] have a certain responsibility to understand and anticipate a need.

By constraining “what can be said by whom”, discourses create different “conditions of possibility”. Comparing the discourses of sound science and precaution offers an excellent example of this phenomenon. Whereas in a regime of sound science the statement “scientific uncertainty justifies inaction” is a valid discursive construction for governments (or those seeking to influence them to conclude this), it is explicitly forbidden in a precautionary regime. The most authoritative text of precautionary discourse – Principle 15 of the Rio Declaration, above – is quite clear on this matter. In addition, because the concepts of risk in institutional regimes premised on sound science and precaution are those of “demonstrated risk” and “potential risk” respectively, and because scientific research is a time-consuming activity, the temporality of the attachment of the concept of risk to focal
objects, such as particular chemical substances, is quite different in the two discourses. In other words, conditions of possibility for actors to generate discursive constructions of the form “this product is associated with that risk” arise earlier in a precautionary regime.

A number of important implications arise from these differences, shown in Table 3. Sound science privileges scientific experts, positions governments as reactive such that political “rule-making” tends to follow technical “fact-making” (Maguire, 2004), and marginalizes NGOs and the public. Business is thus given more latitude to develop and commercialize risky products and to continue to sell them until their harm is unequivocally established. Overall, the discourse of sound science legitimates “non-decision making” (Bachrach & Baratz, 1963), which benefits businesses that are able to continue manufacturing their products, as underlined by one government delegate:

In some cases “sound science” means a two-ton truck full of paper; to others it means no matter how much science you have you will never have enough. Some people in government circles sometimes feel that when the industry starts thumping them for sound science, what they really mean is that they want you to research this for another five years so we don’t have to do anything now.

Precaution, on the other hand, directly challenges the validity of non-decision making and inaction. Precaution acknowledges that the rule-making process is political, but rather than marginalizing it, privileges it: if scientific knowledge is imprecise and only results after time-consuming activities, the risks of inaction can often be too great. Because it can be too dangerous to wait, rule-making and fact-making run in tandem and, in some cases, rule-making may precede some fact-making. Thus NGOs and the public are empowered in a more proactive, visible process – all stakeholders, including vulnerable populations or their representatives, are part of an explicitly politically process to establish risks and goals. Business, on the other hand, benefits less from societal inertia and non-decision making, has to compete with other legitimated and vocal stakeholders, and is more likely to have to defend its products and to account for itself more transparently. (Table 3 — Appendix)

These changes in the “rules of the game” have a major impact on markets. Within institutional regimes premised upon the discourse of sound science, there is considerable scope to keep markets functioning until risk is proven, dangerous products are more likely to be kept in the economy – albeit with some safeguards – in accordance with risk management, and new, potentially risky products tend to enter into the marketplace quickly. Further, regulatory institutions built upon the discourse of sound science institutions deal poorly with scientific uncertainty, tend to have a narrow scope in terms of products regulated, and operationalize risk management. Regulatory institutions premised upon the discourse of precaution, on the other hand, anticipate and accommodate scientific uncertainty, tend to have a broader scope and, while they still operationalize risk management, are more likely to incorporate more drastic risk avoidance mechanisms such as product bans or phase-outs.

**Discursive Strategies**

The discourses of precaution and sound science are not self-contained and distinct but, rather, overlap and interpenetrate one another: the precautionary principle requires, albeit uncertain, scientific knowledge in order to invoke it; while sound science inevitably informs precautionary deliberations about the consequences of alternative courses of action. The blurring of the boundaries between these two discourses provided actors with a degree of interpretive flexibility concerning the way in which they evoked them and how they tried to enforce their understandings of them. Actors exploited this interpretive flexibility in a variety of strategic ways in their texts, which we analyzed in terms of interdiscursivity, intertextuality and modes of engagement as summarized in Table 4 (Appendix)

**Interdiscursivity**

Interdiscursivity was a feature of the texts produced by all actors – as they drew upon one of the discourses, they also engaged with the other. One common strategy, not surprisingly, was to undermine the “opposing” discourse. For example, in one text the EU drew attention to a number of characteristics of the scientific method that showed how sound science, rather than removing uncertainty, actually could produce it, including “the variable chosen, the measurements made, the samples drawn, the models used, and the causal relationship employed”, “controversy on existing data or lack of some relevant data” and “uncertainty” related “to qualitative or quantitative elements of the analysis” (EC, 2000: 13-14). In a not dissimilar way the ICCA (2000b) tried to undermine the precautionary principle in its texts:

Including the precautionary principle in the provisions dealing with the selection of additional
candidate POPs could leave the criteria for such selection wide open so that they would no longer be based on science and the Convention could lose its focus on priority chemicals of real concern that meet the criteria for POPs.

Actors could not, however, afford to simply undermine the other discourse as both were sufficiently well established and legitimated that they could not credibly be dismissed out of hand. Accordingly, actors exploited interpretive flexibility to reconstruct the opposing discourse in their texts in such a way that made it more similar to their preferred discourse.

For example, ICCA’s (2000a) interpretation of precaution bears a striking resemblance to the traditional risk assessment and management practices associated with sound science.

Implementation of the precautionary principle should start with an objective risk assessment identifying at each relevant stage the degree of scientific uncertainty. … Risk assessment is entirely consistent with the application of the precautionary principle. Indeed, the precautionary principle cannot be applied without a risk assessment.

Similarly, the US (2000a) promoted an interpretation of precaution that emphasized scientific rigor, arguing that “precaution must be exercised as part of a science-based approach to regulation, and not as a substitute for such an approach.”

We noted a similar strategy among those actors advocating stronger precaution. For example, the EU, seeking to maximize the scope for invoking the precautionary principle argued that “even if scientific advice is supported only by a minority fraction of the scientific community, due account should be taken of their views, provided the credibility and reputation of this fraction are recognized” (EC, 2000: 16). Similarly, texts produced by IPEN (1998) did not reject sound science out of hand – indeed, they often called for more scientific research – but they also emphasized that precaution was scientific insomuch as it relied upon a weight of evidence approach:

As part of the global effort to identify and eliminate POPs, aggressive programs of toxicity testing should be undertaken directed to the many chemicals whose toxic effects remain unknown, evaluating these chemicals both individually and in combination, and addressing the broad range of relevant health outcomes, including carcinogenicity and mutagenicity, endocrine activity, and developmental, immune, neurological, and reproductive toxicity. Where there remains uncertainty about the effects of a POP, action should be taken consistent with the precautionary principle, which relies on the weight of evidence approach, with special consideration given to the risks to fetuses, children, and other vulnerable populations.

In sum, although actors did try to undermine the opposing discourse, our analysis shows that neither side could afford to completely ignore or dismiss either discourse; actors were forced to engage with both the legacy discourse of sound science and the new discourse of precaution in more positive ways, regardless of their position. Consequently, actors used the available interpretive flexibility to produce texts aimed at reconstructing the opposing discourse in a way that co-opted it into their preferred discourse.

Our findings demonstrate some of the complexities and subtleties involved in institution building on the global stage and the emergence of new global regulatory institutions. Precaution, as a discourse, is newer than that of sound science which is the legacy discourse and which has traditionally supplied the concepts and understandings of subject positions upon which regulatory institutions governing risk-generating products have been premised and designed. This new discursive resource was quite useful to those governments, such as the EU, who strove to respond to the public’s concerns in a more proactive manner and needed to legitimate earlier and more frequent interventions in functioning markets. It was also an important discursive resource for those traditionally disadvantaged by the legacy discourse and the non-decision making and societal inertia associated with the legacy institutions premised upon it. Invoked in each official decision leading to, as well as operationalized and embedded in the Stockholm Convention, it is difficult to imagine how this new global institution could have emerged without the discourse of precaution. But actors promoting change cannot simply dismiss the legacy discourse, just as those who might prefer the status quo cannot ignore the new one. All are constrained in some ways, and enabled in others. Our findings illustrate how actors seek to interpret and co-opt or undermine their less favored discourse in ways aimed at ensuring that their preferred interpretations prevail to provide the premises and understandings forming the basis of the new institutional regime.

Intertextuality
Actors’ discursive strategies also involved producing texts that referred to other particular texts both to support or refute the case that precaution was a full-fledged principle of international law; and also to secure “closure” on what precaution meant around their preferred meanings. The EU and IPEN promoted the idea that precaution was an emerging principle of international law. As a result, their texts employed the term “precautionary principle” more frequently than those of the US and ICCA, who were more likely to use the phrasing “precautionary approach”. The distinction between principle and approach has far-ranging implications: a legal “principle” affects the interpretation of all legal instruments in ways that a mere “approach” does not. Accordingly, delegates from countries seeking to moderate precaution were reluctant to use the term “principle” at all:

And then you have somebody come in and they say “I like the word principle.” It's like “No. No. You don’t really understand what's at stake here. If you start calling this a Precautionary Principle now, we can’t sign. Let's just be clear here. You know, it's not going to happen. And so you don’t want to go there.”

The EU, on the other hand, frequently asserted that “this [precautionary] principle has been progressively consolidated into international environmental law, and so it has since become a full-fledged and general principle of international law” (EC, 2000: 10). Similarly, the texts produced by IPEN and its member organizations recommended “The POPs Treaty delegates should recognize the precautionary approach as an emerging principle of customary international law in the context of high-stakes, low certainty environmental decision-making.” (WWF, 2000)

This struggle affected the patterns of intertextuality in the texts of actors: those of the EU and IPEN were much more likely to draw attention to other international legal instruments incorporating the precautionary principle, while those of the US and ICCA referred, almost exclusively, to Principle 15 of the Rio Declaration which, despite itself being a Principle, speaks of precaution as an approach. For example, during the final round of negotiations, the US and ICCA put forward texts containing very similar wording linking the wording of the Convention to Principle 15 of the 1992 Rio Declaration:

The ‘precautionary principle’ should be defined as it is in Principle 15 of the Rio Declaration Convention. (ICCA, 200b)

Given the wide-spread recognition and international agreement on Principle 15 of the 1992 Rio Declaration, the United States has advocated its inclusion in the Preamble to the POPs Treaty as a way to reaffirm the relationship between the science-based approach of Principle 15 and the POPs treaty. (US, 2000a)

As the negotiations continued, the US and ICCA invoked the Rio Declaration increasingly as an almost “sacred” consensually agreed text, whose meaning had already been clearly established and which, therefore, should not be renegotiated, something they claimed the EU was attempting to do.

[S]ome of the proposals that we have heard appear to be an effort to renegotiate Rio 15. The U.S. strongly believes that this is not the forum to engage in that inherently political discussion. This treaty is too important, and we have too little time here to allow this first global treaty embracing important chemical pollutants to be sidetracked. (US, 2000b)

Similarly, an industry representative complained that “we need a treaty that is based on science, and this last minute renegotiation of the Precautionary Principle isn’t really what we should be doing here.” ICCA's intertextual references to consensually developed official texts, and its repeated invoking of UNEP GC 19/13C in particular, also underlined this “not open for renegotiation” aspect.

EU and IPEN texts referred to a wider range of international legal texts. For example, the EU's Communication from the Commission on the Precautionary Principle contained an Annex (II) entitled “The Precautionary Principle in International Law” which referenced eight international instruments covering a wide range of issues, including marine pollution, biological diversity, climate change and trade. Both the EU and IPEN also referenced the 2000 Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety, which was concluded during the POPs negotiations and contained relatively strong precautionary language in its main provisions. IPEN also produced texts that referred to alternative “strong” formulations of the precautionary principle, such as the Wingspread Statement from a 1998 conference hosted by the Science and Environmental Health Network (Raffensperger & Tickner, 1999: 353).

When an activity raises threats of harm to human health or the environment, precautionary measures should be taken even if some cause and effect relationships are not fully established. In this context the proponent of an activity rather than the public should bear the burden of proof.” (IPEN, 2000a)
This alternative formulation is what legal scholars refer to as a “prescriptive” or “strong” formulation of the precautionary principle, which stands in contrast to the “argumentative” or “weak” formulation in the Rio Declaration (Sandin et al., 2002). Whereas weak formulations of the principle are of the form “uncertainty does not justify inaction”, strong formulations are of the form “uncertainty justifies action” (Wiener & Rogers, 2002). Principle 15 refers to only specific types of threats to the environment, those that are serious or irreversible, but the Wingspread Statement refers to all threats of harm to the environment and, additionally, to human health. Obviously, the latter applies to a much wider range of possible hazards and thus envisons a world in which the precautionary principle is invoked much more often. Additionally, strong formulations of the principle reverse rather than merely shift the burden of proof, placing the onus of demonstrating safety with those who benefit from potentially risky products and processes.

Our findings demonstrate how authoritative as well as alternative texts can be invoked by actors in ways that enable their own institution building activities and constrain those of others. Actors employ intertextuality strategically. Authoritative texts, especially those consensually agreed, can be drawn upon in efforts to close down meaning on actors’ preferred interpretations, as the US and ICCA did with the Rio Declaration in their efforts to moderate precaution. In a similar manner, the EU and IPEN invoked other international agreements in their efforts to have their claim, that the precautionary principle is indeed a principle of international law, accepted.

**Mode of engagement**

In coding the texts, we identified different “modes” used by actors to engage with the discursive resources available to them. The most significant dimension along which the texts differed was the use of pragmatism v. idealism. The texts of ICCA were the most likely to contain arguments based on and emphasizing pragmatism, as were those of the US, although to a lesser degree. The texts produced by ICCA reiterated numerous times the importance of having a Convention that was “workable” and “realistic” and, to achieve this, in their view, required incorporating provisions that were “practical” and that did not “create new and ambiguous obligations for parties”, as well as goals that were “feasible” and “achievable” rather than “aspirational”.

The POPs Convention needs to be workable and based on science. It needs to promote actions that are feasible and practical that will lead to realistic and meaningful levels of compliance and thus of real environmental improvement. … For the Convention to be practical, it is essential that it not include ambiguous and aspirational goals concerning ‘elimination’ particularly with regard to production by-products. (ICCA, 200b, emphasis added)

ICCA also sought to directly associate the manageability of the new institution with precaution itself, advancing an argument based on pragmatism and aimed at limiting the ultimate scope of the Convention to a smaller number of products that would, in their view, ensure an institutional regime that could be “feasibly and practically managed internationally” (ICCA, 1998). US press releases and opening remarks at meetings also stressed pragmatism, explicitly: “The U.S. is seeking a pragmatic treaty that will be guided by the best scientific evidence to craft provisions to produce real reductions of the risk of POPs to health and the environment.” (US, 2000).

EU and IPEN texts, on the other hand, contained few mentions of “practicality” but, rather, stressed the importance of the complete “elimination” as a goal for POPs, with the EU’s texts falling between those of IPEN and the US on this idealism-pragmatism dimension (see Table 4). The texts produced by IPEN were the most idealistic, containing numerous references to ideal outcomes and inspirational goals for the Convention, and reiterating the importance of complete elimination of POPs:

Once a substance is listed as a POP, it is inappropriate to accept its continued generation and release into the environment. We reject the claim that emissions and releases of POPs can be effectively managed and controlled. When a substance is listed as a POP, the plan of action set out by the agreement should set out a time-table to stop all its uses and all its emissions … A POP has no acceptable emission limit, no acceptable daily intake, and no acceptable level in the environment. (IPEN, 1998)

Our findings illustrate how actors engage in institution building activities by harnessing discursive resources and deploying them in different modes. In particular, those actors seeking to maximize differences between the emerging institutional regime and the legacy regime represented by the status quo are more likely to appeal to ideals and aspirational goals. Those actors who are more comfortable with the status quo and seeking to moderate the scope of the institutional change are more likely to appeal to pragmatism and feasibility. The finding that NGOs use idealism to maximize the scope of
global regulatory institutions while business deploys arguments based on pragmatism to moderate the scope is consistent with other research on institution building on the global stage (e.g. Levy, 1997).

Conclusions

Our study shows that discourse does make a difference to institutional building, in a number of ways. First, legacy and emerging discourses provide actors with resources for institution building. However, these resources are precarious and it is not a simple matter of the legacy discourse constraining action, while the emerging discourse enables it: both discourses can be constraining and enabling. Further, these discourses are not neatly demarcated but interpenetrate each other in complementary and sometimes contradictory ways. Second, different discourses construct the social world in radically different ways — constructing radically divergent meanings for the same object according to their central concepts and the subject positions they create. The contrast between the discourses of precaution and sound science illustrates clearly how institutional practices and market functioning — indeed, the very existence of markets in particular products — derive from the conditions of possibility that emerge from the discursive context. “Uncertainty justifies inaction” is a discursive formation explicitly forbidden in an institutional regime premised and built upon the discourse of precaution, with important implications for governments, business, NGOs and other actors. By changing the discourse, it is possible to change the rules of the game, the power relations among actors and, ultimately, to transform the institutional context through the building of new institutions. Third, institutional building requires actors to engage with these discursive resources strategically and in often contradictory ways. Thus, to build new institutions, actors must undermine and co-opt opposing discourses; they must draw on texts that help them close down meanings on their own preferred interpretations; and they must adopt a mode of engagement that is compatible with the discourse whose dominance they are trying to assert.

Our findings have implications for research and practice in a number of areas. First, our study suggests that discourse analysis, and, in particular, studies that are contextualized and longitudinal, offers a way around the structure-agency dilemma confronted by institutional theorists. By demonstrating how discourses create conditions of possibility for particular discursive formations and related actions and decisions (or inaction and non-decision making, as with the discourse of sound science in our case), our research suggests that understandings of institutional change can benefit from paying more attention to discourses, how they change, and, especially, the discursive strategies of interested actors (cf. Clark & Jennings, 1997). A concern for understanding how particular texts “stick”, become authoritative and form the basis for institutional arrangements reconnects institutional theory to a concern with power and politics, a focus of earlier work (Selznick, 1949). Discourse analysis can be used to provide a more sophisticated view of the political dynamics involved in the struggle over new global institutions and other processes of institutional change, because of how it draws on post-structural conceptualizations of language and power.

Second, our study suggests that institutions and discourses co-evolve. There is no question that the Stockholm Convention is a negotiated outcome and, as such, represents a compromise of sorts between actors promoting the competing discourses of precaution and sound science; it could have been weaker or stronger as regards precaution. And yet the very existence of this new institution, and one in which both business and NGOs, although not technically “negotiators” as are states, nevertheless played important roles. More attention could be paid to this dynamic in future studies of how the rules of economic games emerge, stabilize or are changed in transnational arenas.
Our study also provides guidance to actors in their institution building activities, highlighting the importance of understanding their discursive context and strategizing accordingly. States, business and NGOs can all benefit from post-structural conceptualizations of language and power as they seek to alter the rules of the game on the global stage.

References


Jepperson, R. L. 1991 ‘Institutions, institutional effects, and institutionalism’ in *The new institutionalism*


Mumby, D., and R.P. Clair 1997 ‘Organizational discourse’ in Discourse as structure and process. T. A.


van Dijk, T.A. 1996 ‘Discourse, power and access’ in Texts and practices. C.R. Caldas-Coulthard and
M. Coulthard (eds), 84-104. London: Routledge.


Appendix
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements of the Convention</th>
<th>Meetings from which draft and final versions of the Convention were issued</th>
<th>Actors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CEG-1</td>
<td>CEG-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Preamble</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- explicit reference to precaution</td>
<td>[✓]</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Article 1: objective</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- explicit reference to precaution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Article 8: adding new chemicals</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- explicit reference to precaution</td>
<td>[✓]</td>
<td>[✓]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Conference of Parties &gt; expert committee</td>
<td>[✓]</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Annex C: best available techniques</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- explicit reference to precaution</td>
<td>[✓]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Annex D: new chemicals listing criteria</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- more precautionary bioaccumulation hurdle (log K_{ow} &gt; 4, rather than 5)</td>
<td>[✓]</td>
<td>[✓]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- more precautionary persistence hurdle (half-life in H₂O &gt; 2 months, rather than 6)</td>
<td>[✓]</td>
<td>[✓]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Comparing the Discourses of Precaution and Sound Science

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element of Discourse</th>
<th>Discourse of Sound Science</th>
<th>Discourse of Precaution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Object</td>
<td>Risk-generating products, such as a chemical (e.g., PCBs, DDT, etc.)</td>
<td>Risk-generating products, such as a chemicals (e.g., PCBs, DDT, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key concepts</td>
<td>Sound scientific knowledge</td>
<td>Uncertain, limited scientific knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Demonstrated risk</td>
<td>Potential risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Risk assessment, analysis and management</td>
<td>Risk avoidance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key subject positions</td>
<td>Scientific experts supply hard &quot;black-boxed&quot; facts to the policy process.</td>
<td>Scientific experts supply soft, contested claims to the policy process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Governments are arbiters of demonstrated risks and benefits; they trigger policy conversations and regulate accordingly.</td>
<td>Governments are arbiters of potential risks and benefits; they trigger policy conversations and regulate accordingly.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Non-government organizations can legitimately voice concerns about demonstrated risks.</td>
<td>Non-government organizations can legitimately voice concerns about potential risks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Business organizations respond to concerns about demonstrated risks.</td>
<td>Business organizations respond to concerns about potential risks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditions of possibility</td>
<td>“Scientific uncertainty justifies inaction” is a valid discursive construction for governments.</td>
<td>“Scientific uncertainty justifies inaction” is not a valid discursive construction for governments, nor those seeking to influence them. It is explicitly ruled out by the precautionary principle (see Principle 15 of Rio Declaration).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“This product is associated with that risk” is a valid discursive construction for scientific experts, and is more likely to come later rather than earlier.</td>
<td>“This product is associated with that risk” is a valid discursive construction for other actors in addition to scientific experts, and is more likely to come earlier rather than later.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3: Power Effects of the Discourses of Precaution and Sound Science

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actor</th>
<th>Discourse of Sound Science</th>
<th>Discourse of Precaution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scientific experts</td>
<td>Expertise is unchallenged.</td>
<td>Expertise is more likely to be deconstructed and contested</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fact-making precedes rule-making.</td>
<td>Fact-making is more likely to be simultaneous with rule-making.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governments</td>
<td>Reactive stance towards the regulation of markets in potentially risky products is the norm.</td>
<td>Proactive stance towards the regulation of markets in potentially risky products is the norm.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Non-decision making” re regulation of potentially risky products is legitimate and the norm.</td>
<td>“Non-decision making” re regulation of potentially risky products is not legitimate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-government organizations</td>
<td>High threshold of evidence required to have claims of risks addressed by governments.</td>
<td>Lower threshold of evidence required to have claims of risks addressed by governments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NGOs are disadvantaged by societal inertia and “non-decision making”</td>
<td>NGOs are less disadvantaged by societal inertia and “non-decision making”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business organizations</td>
<td>Business is called upon to defend products infrequently.</td>
<td>Business is called upon to defend a wider range of products, earlier in their life cycle, and in a context of uncertain, limited scientific knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Business benefits from societal inertia and “non-decision making”</td>
<td>Business benefits less from societal inertia and “non-decision making”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implications for markets producing risk-generating products</td>
<td>Markets in potentially risky incumbent products continue to function while scientists produce texts characterizing, assessing and demonstrating risks.</td>
<td>Markets in potentially risky incumbent products are more likely to be deliberated and regulated earlier because of the lower threshold of evidence of risk required.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Once incumbent products do become associated with risks, they are more likely to remain in the economy with risk management measures; markets are thus more likely to continue to function but with restrictions.</td>
<td>Once incumbent products do become associated with risks, they are more likely to exit the economy via bans or phase-outs in accordance with risk avoidance; markets are thus more likely to be eliminated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Markets in new but potentially risky products come into existence earlier.</td>
<td>Markets in new but potentially risky products come into existence later, if at all.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implications for regulatory institutions governing risk-generating</td>
<td>Regulatory institutions accommodate scientific uncertainty with difficulty.</td>
<td>Regulatory institutions are designed to accommodate scientific uncertainty by facilitating access to the policy arena and precautionary deliberations.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Regulatory institutions tend to have a narrow scope because interventions are difficult to justify for any given product. Regulatory institutions tend to have a broader scope because interventions are more easily justified with respect to a wider range of products.

Regulatory institutions operationalize risk management.

Regulatory institutions operationalize risk management, but within which risk avoidance options are more likely to be implemented.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4: Discursive Strategies of Actors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Actors seeking to maximize precaution</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EU</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Primary discourse</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interdiscursivity</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mode of Engagement</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Representing the Bible: Discourses in the Press News®

John Matson  
University of Queensland

Abstract

While there have been a number of studies about the Bible in the media, they have tended to look only at the use of Bible stories in the entertainment area and in the tabloid press. These studies do not consider how the news media covers the Bible. This paper, on the other hand, presents the findings of a systematic and comprehensive analysis of the representation of the Bible in the press news. The primary aim of the paper is to understand how the press news constructs the Bible with its discourse.

To develop this awareness, I have employed the method of discourse analysis. This included both quantitative and interpretative analysis of the language of the news texts. The corpus came from news reports of the Bible in association with the controversy surrounding the Dead Sea Scrolls. The study period was from 1947, when Bedouins found the Dead Sea Scrolls, to 2003 when the editorial committee completed their publication. The media selected from which to draw the reports were: The Australian (Aust.), The Sydney Morning Herald (SMH), The New York Times (NYT), and The Times (London).

Results from the analysis revealed that while there were negative representations of the Bible, there were also press news reports that provided positive accounts. At first, news reports were more or less a matter of a factual accounting of the events. Later, the reports contained assertions on the need to rewrite the Bible — something that was clearly abhorrent to conventional Christians. Moreover, there was a press discourse portraying the Bible as a document that was culturally irrelevant and with an uncertain status.

Opposed to this however, there was discourse representing the Bible as a resource book (a document to which one could turn with one’s problems). This framed the Bible as a sacred document safeguarded as much by religion as by tradition. This sacredness is rooted deep in Western culture. It provided a sense that the Bible enjoys a degree of cultural and social authority as a guide to life based on an interpretation of past events in faith.

The impact of these findings lies in the apparent need for biblical scholarship to focus on the Bible’s heritage in our culture. Naturally, such a shift would represent a loss to the traditional philological/classical base of biblical scholarship. I expect that the findings of this report will contribute to both the growing body of research on media discourse; and a better understanding of the Bible in our way of life.

Introduction

While there have been a number of studies about the Bible in the media, they have tended to look only at the use of the Bible stories in the entertainment area and in the tabloid press (Bach, 1996; van Biema, 1996; Black, 2000; Exum, 1996). These studies have generally raised concerns about the media by focusing on sensational stories and how the interpretations of the Bible are being shaped by popular culture as represented in films, on TV, in comic books and so on (Sisley, 1998).

On the other hand, the research reported here presents the findings of a systematic and comprehensive analysis of the representation of the Bible in the press news of the Australian, American and English press.

One feature that makes the press news such a powerful moulder of public opinion is its pervasive nature (Bell, 1991). The production of media language is huge, and while it is only a fraction of all the face-to-face language between people, it is in touch with mass audiences who see or hear media language. By sheer weight of repetition, media texts
endorse certain sets of social values as inevitable and natural — newspaper texts are both pervasive and persuasive (Thwaites, Mules, & Davis, 2002).

Although the Bible itself is ubiquitous, it does not have the same persuasive powers and reach as the press. Research shows that while most people in the Western world have the opportunity in their homes for a similar direct exposure to the Bible as do the equally ubiquitous newspapers, very few read the Bible on a regular basis: certainly not daily like a newspaper (Clines, 1997; Gledhill, 1998).

Thus, for the majority of the population, the bulk of their knowledge of the Bible could well come from the media representations of the Bible, thus leading to a shift in the interpretations of a biblical narrative that suits the newspapers’ ideas, as shown above.

In this article, the representation of the Bible in four newspapers is quantitatively and qualitatively analysed. It is argued that while there were negative representations of the Bible, there were also press news reports that provided positive accounts.

At first, the news reports were more or less a matter of a factual accounting of the events. Later, the reports contained assertions on the need to rewrite the Bible — something that was clearly abhorrent to conventional Christians. Moreover, there was a press discourse portraying the Bible as a document that was culturally irrelevant and with an uncertain status.

Opposed to this view, however, there was other discourse representing the Bible as a resource book (a document to which one could turn with one’s problems). This framed the Bible as a sacred document safeguarded as much by religion as by tradition. This sacredness is rooted deep in the Western culture. It provided the sense that the Bible enjoys a degree of cultural and social authority as a guide to life based on the interpretation of past events in faith (Borg, 2001).

The following results provide an account of how the Bible became constructed in a sample of press news reports from four papers.

**Methodology**

Over a 55-year period, a quantitative and qualitative analysis was carried out in four newspapers on the language of the news text about the Bible.

Of initial concern was the availability of any news stories about the Bible — a subject which is generally not considered newsworthy (van Dijk, 1991b; Fowler, 1991c; Mcleod & Hertog, 1992). However, there is one story linked to the Bible that has had an ongoing media attention over the last fifty years or so: the events involved in the discovery and interpretation of the Qumran Scrolls or the so-called Dead Sea Scrolls (hereafter called the Scrolls or the Bible manuscripts). I therefore drew the corpus for this paper from the news stories about the Bible manuscripts. The study period covered 1947, when Bedouins found the Scrolls, to 2003 when the editorial committee published their results (de Hamel, 2001; Vermes, 1998).

The major focus of this article is on the relationship between the language (discourse) and the ideology in the press news reports about the Bible. The selected media for the reports were, The Australian (Aust.), The Sydney Morning Herald (SMH), The New York Times (NYT), and The Times (London). I selected these particular newspapers because they are among the principal agenda-setters for the rest of their respective nation's media. One can also expect them to reflect the views of the opinion leaders in their communities at large.

Overall, this search strategy for selecting the corpus yielded a sample of 334 press news articles for analysis. The break up of this sample, by paper, is shown in Table 1 below.

**Table 1: The Corpus**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Number of news articles collected by period</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYT</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The basic theoretical framework for this study has come from the work of a number of analysts in content analysis and discourse analysis (for book length discussions, see Bell, 1998; Berelson, 1971; Budd 1967; van Dijk 1988a, 1988b, 1991a; Fowler 1991a, 1979; Fairclough, 1995).

In the first stage of the study, the articles were subjected to an initial quantitative content analysis. The analysis involved categorising each news item by the same code for a number of features. Each major topic category is, in a sense, a large compartment into which each indicative topic or theme in an article is placed. A frequency table of the major topic categories was drawn up for analysis. Indicating topics or themes were usually associated with paragraphs. While indicating topics are derived from the content, their major topic categories need not be if an appropriate category system is available, as was the case for this research.

The other side of methodological coin was the interpretative analysis (critical discourse analysis) phase of the study. While content analysis can deal with the basic form of the text, it is not equipped to handle the structure and sequence of argument.

Critical discourse analysis focuses upon the structure, style and persuasive features of texts (van Dijk, 2001; Fairclough, 1992). However, in this case with hundreds of news clippings, I had to make choices about which features to examine in detail. Consequently, in the quantitative analysis phase of the study, I focused on news sources and actors, headlines and topics.

Research questions

To guide the analysis I considered it a worthwhile step to establish an elementary pentagonal template of key questions against which to review the discourse about the Bible.

1. How does the discourse represent the various actors in the news articles? Whose voice do we hear?
2. What are the characteristics of the headlines? Are there ideological differences in the headlines between the four newspapers?
3. What are some of the themes and topics in the news articles concerning the Bible manuscripts?
4. What reference is there on the Bible’s role in contemporary society?
5. Is there a trend for using a dominant ideology challenging how the Bible has shaped our society?

Results

The results of the analysis are presented below as responses to the above-mentioned key questions.

1. **News actors** played a major part in the introduction of partiality into news stories about the Bible. By choosing a prominent news actor with firm views, the press tended to construct the Bible in line with that view. As, for instance, occurred in the following extract from a news report: Controversy was added to the sensation when Professor Godfrey Rolles Driver of Oxford University, an authority on the Bible, was quoted as complaining that the
American scholars were keeping the documents to themselves and that those examining the texts in the United States had not had much experience (The New York Times, 12 August 1949).

This assertion about the incompetence of the American scholars carries weight because it comes from an elite news source — a scholar, Professor Driver.

Contrary to expectations, I also identified a non-elite group or unofficial source, namely, the Bedouins who were heavily represented as news actors. I concluded that they gained weight as a news source because they were deeply involved with the discovery of the Bible manuscripts and, consequently, the press news constantly mentioned them to provide background to the stories.

The range of news sources and actors used by each newspaper was comparable. The discourse in *The New York Times* from news sources other than scholars portrayed the Bible as having a strong religious or faith connection — a resource book. On the other hand, the discourse in *The Times* from similar news sources seemed to represent the Bible more as an archaeological artefact.

Nevertheless, the news sources used in all newspapers, other than the Bedouins, were represented as elite sources or experts and in particular there was a distinct preference for the use of scholars, religious groups and archaeologists. Overall, it was the voices of these news actors that were heard the most as can be seen from the following Table 2 below.

### Table 2: News actors in the press on the Scrolls, 1947 to 2003

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>News actor/source *</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scholars</td>
<td>253</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional or other public figure</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unofficial sources (Participant)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious groups</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Official</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional groups</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious figure</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human interest figure</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commentators</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political figure</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bible (scrolls)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vatican</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebrity</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Up to five actors or news sources were coded for each clipping.

2. **The Characteristics of Headlines.** Headlines are persuasive, they are the most conspicuous part of a news report; they frame the content, express the main topic (topical theme), shape the meaning of the news report in a few words, and are often the only part recalled by the reader. The following are examples of some of the language used in the headlines.

a) **Topical themes** related to the Bible were often set down in eye-catching headlines that laid down the ‘reading agenda’ for the report that followed. Some attracted interest with emotional themes concerning the Bible or Jesus. They were, in general, highly evaluative and often challenged the mental model that the newspaper readers held on the topic. For
instance, many readers would have had a different prototype in their minds than that suggested by the sub-editors in the following headlines, ‘Erotic bible “for adults only”’ (*The Times*, 29 March 2001) or ‘Jesus was gay – $51,000 says so’ (*The Courier Mail*, 29 May 2003).

**b) The use of military metaphor.** Editors often used the metaphorisation of reality to describe scholarly disputes in terms of a battle. Such is the case in the headlines, ‘Giving the Bible a bashing’ (*The Times*, 4 April 1999) and ‘A new screen test for Imax: It’s the Bible vs. the Volcano’ (*The New York Times*, 19 March 2005). The first headline sets the scene for an article on the debate over the thorny issue of the historicity of the Bible, while the second headline is from an article on the fight over evolution and the biblical descriptions of the origin of Earth and its creatures. These headlines appear to have ideological implications in that they bias the understanding process; that is, the metaphors present the issues from the perspectives of the editors. The editors would no doubt claim that they had reported fairly on the disputes, however, their language, perhaps unwittingly, reproduced a position that portrayed the Bible as culturally relevant.

**c) Words and their position** in the headlines had a considerable impact on the reader’s perspective of a situation. For example, the positions in the following headline of the words ‘Bible’ and ‘Scrolls’, ‘New Bible uses the Scrolls’ (*The Times*, 25 July 1975). Here, the Bible remains the standard for comparison, the source document as it were, even though the Bible manuscripts predate the Bible (‘Masoretic’ text and/or Latin Vulgate). The press news discourse portrayed the Bible as the book of authority in the relationship. Moreover, for the readers, the Bible was a traditional ‘pre-existing script’, it provided the background knowledge for the interpretation. Within this frame of reference, the text in the Bible subsumed the text in the Bible manuscripts.

**d) The lexical style** of headlines also had ideological connotations. To bathe readers in a discourse of a religious nature is to impose a religious ideology by a public institution, namely the press. For instance, the persistent introduction of biblical archaeology by using the term ‘Hebrew Scrolls’ builds up a rapport with the readers, ‘The Bible Discovery: Early Hebrew Scrolls’ (*The Times*, 12 August 1949). Such an association induced readers to view the Bible as a gift from a venerable past. Again, the press appeared to be constructing the Bible as a resource book.

**3. Themes and topics in the news articles** when analysed revealed that one of the most frequent major topic categories was a ‘Resource Book’ — that is, there were many instances where the Bible was being represented as a guide for life. Other major topic categories included the Bible as, ‘A book of authority’, ‘The Word of God’ and ‘The Bible as literature’. Each of these major topic categories subsumed a number of indicating topics. In other words, the major topic categories provided semantic domains into which topics and assertions about the Bible could be framed — as shown in the major topic category frequency Table 3.

**Table 3: Major topics of news items 1947 to 2003 — frequencies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Major Topic Categories</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Age of the Bible manuscripts</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>New Testament development and its links to Judaism</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The biblical books reflect the Scriptural message of the pre-Christian Era</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Publication issues</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Authors of the Bible manuscripts</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Inaccurate Gospels — a new Christology</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Money matters</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public viewing of the Bible manuscripts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rank</td>
<td>Major Topic Categories</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Bible text authenticated from earliest known version of parts of the Hebrew Bible</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Archaeological links to the scriptures</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>A resource book</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Ownership issues</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>A book of authority (in faith)</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Bible acceptance from biblical archaeology</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>An uncertain status</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Political issues</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>The Word of God</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Science and invention</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>A culturally irrelevant document</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>An artefact of our culture</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Origin of the Bible manuscripts</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Copy write disputes</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Bible development</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Searching for more Bible manuscripts</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Positive influence</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Church Leaders’ views</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Bizarre and curious stories</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Bible circulation irrelevently futile</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>The Bible as Literature</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Views of people well known</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Religious issues</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>The Bible as a book</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>783</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* n is the number of times a particular major topic category was indicated in newspaper articles coded.

4. **The Bible’s role today.** It was evident that each newspaper used a varied range of topics and assertions in its discourse to represent the part that the Bible plays in society — some good, some bad. In the main, however, the press news discourse constructed the Bible as a recipe for life, a guide to life as it were, a way of seeing and reading the Bible that makes sense to the reader as suggested in the following themes or propositions:

- ‘So deep is the attachment that many people hold to the Bible that it would be wise for scholars to tread carefully when they seek to challenge it, for they tread not just on dreams, but the most profound yearnings of people’s lives’ (The Sunday Times, 4 April 1999).
- ‘They believed the Bible was a divinely given guidebook, eternally relevant’ (The

- ‘The Bible is not only bursting with great stories and images, but is also believed, by many readers, to be a message from God’ (The New York Times, 13 May 2005).

5. Challenging how the Bible has shaped society was the final key research question. I found evidence in this study of a strong view challenging how the Bible has shaped the Christian world.

For example, the following discourses question the divinity of Jesus:

- ‘Jesus: political heavyweight, revolutionary’ (The Australian, 30 September 1995)
- ‘Jesus “was a divorced father of three”’ (The Times, 21 July 1992)

Such discourses challenged the Bible’s place in society, and the fact that they are headlines sets the agenda for public discussion about the Bible's place in the world. By airing these views, the press was manufacturing a consensus of opinion among the Doubting Thomases that Jesus was a fictional character and that he had possibly never lived at. Thus, we can conclude that the choices the journalists make in the text are persuasive.

These choices may carry ideological meaning, and while different ideologies showed up in a variety of representations of the Bible, at the same time there was a sense of a common ideology delimiting how far the Bible’s place in society could be challenged. That is, there is a journalistic frame organising the world around the Bible, and all that it represents as a sacred document safeguarded as much by religion as it was by tradition — it was within this frame that journalists tended to interpret events about the Bible.

Discussion — implication of press news representation of the Bible

Such aspects of the news text (headlines, topics etc.) tend to reveal the ideological position of the newspaper. As mentioned above, other studies of the Bible in the media, have concentrated on the surface themes. Whether or not news workers are aware of it, much of their news production routines automatically present their points of view and their ideology. News consumers need to become more aware of them so that they can read the news about the Bible more critically and accurately.

For example, the following mocking headline signals the ideological position of the editor about Dr Thiering's work.

THE GOSPEL ACCORDING TO BARBARA

The Times, 4 October 1996

Here the topicalisation makes Dr Thiering the topic and an active agent of the headline, which ironically suggests that she is on the verge of greatness with a new gospel. Such topicalisation influences the representation of Dr Thiering the readers construct in their minds, while at the same time for the readers the style discredits her work. Delimiting the framework for thought in this way was a common strategy adopted by all the newspapers in this study — no doubt to maintain the overall portrayal of the Bible as a document of religious significance to many.

At this point, I should repeat that the findings in this article do not suggest that any one newspaper is more objective in its coverage than any other. Rather, the intention is to point out that different newspapers employ different strategies of coverage. Therefore, it is up to the news consumers to become aware of these strategies to read the news more critically — to be actively critical rather than meekly receptive.

This paper represents a preliminary effort to better understand how the press press covers the Bible. It showed that popular attitudes towards the Bible have changed over the
past half-century, as indicated by the change in representation of the Bible in the press. The impact of these findings lies in the apparent need for biblical scholarship to focus on the Bible’s heritage in our culture. Under such conditions, scholars would study the Bible as a cultural artefact and not primarily as a religious text that is the property of various religious communities.

In summary, I hope that from this article news consumers will be able to find more ways to deconstruct the texts that they regularly ‘consume’ about the Bible. The more they know about the discursive representation and management of such issues related to the Bible, the better equipped they will be to disrupt and challenge the mechanism involved. Therefore, I expect that the findings in this paper will contribute to at least two things, (a) the growing body of research on media discourse, and (b) the provision of a better understanding of the Bible in our cultures.

References
Routledge.


The sociocultural context for language learning: Unpacking feedback interactions

Kate McPherson
University of Tasmania

Abstract
The classroom as a ‘social setting’ (Allwright, 1998) has been the focus of much exciting research, and the growing interest in sociocultural theory and its application to language learning has re-energised researchers working in this area. This paper draws on a recent research study carried out with advanced adult learners participating in English for Academic Purposes (EAP) programs at an Australian university. The initial impetus for the research was to uncover patterns of learner attention to the feedback provided on speaking skills; however, the analysis also revealed how feedback was mutually co-constructed by the participants in this classroom context, rather than ‘provided’ by one participant for another. Ultimately, learner attention to feedback was seen to be underpinned by a number of key factors including orientation to language learning and participation in collaborative activity, both of which highlighted the social context for learning.

The Classroom as a Social Setting

Learning is a social event, not an individual endeavour.
(Foster, 1989:25)

Classroom second language learning requires participants to work with, alongside and in front of other people. For adults, this involves the allocation of significant effort and attention towards the effective management of, and participation in, a range of social relationships with peers and the teacher (in fact, Oxford [2001:86] claims that the form of social interaction which occurs between teacher and student is one of the most intense and important). The success, or otherwise, of these relationships has a tangible effect on performance, and ultimately learning.

In the establishment and maintenance of these relationships the ‘interlocutor effect’ (Nunan, 1991:47) has a key role to play. In Nunan’s description it is the skill level of the interlocutor which is seen to have an effect on a learner’s participation in a speaking task. However, there is another important dimension and this relates to perceptions of the interlocutor's relative status and linguistic competence. Breen (1996) cites a number of studies to show that learners vary the style of their speaking depending upon whom they are addressing. Takahashi’s findings (1989) suggest that when learners are speaking with someone they perceive as very competent, they are more hesitant and use shorter utterances. Such issues are clearly relevant when feedback is provided on oral performance.

The social setting that is the classroom is not solely a result of the people who are actually present in the room: unexpected absences may also influence the behaviour of learners and teachers (Allwright, 1998:126). Changes in attendance patterns can indeed impact upon classroom life, especially when we are reminded that ‘. . pupils have different statuses, provide different models for imitation, act as reinforcers, give or withhold attention and communicate with differing amounts of noise’ (Cortis, 1977:127). Aspects such as group composition, role allocation, content focus of the lesson, volume of classroom discourse and the overall classroom climate can all be tangibly affected by absent class members.

Many teachers understand the importance of creating warm accepting class groups (Moskowitz, 1978) and so prioritise the establishment of positive group dynamics in their classrooms. Research has shown the extent to which teachers value cohesive classes and
make efforts to foster the development and maintenance of class cohesion (Senior, 1997). It is interesting to see how this concern is now quite prominent in the literature dealing with second language learning classrooms.

The aspects of the social reality of the classroom learning context described above show that learners may experience significant social pressures. This situation is further exacerbated by the pedagogic realities of the classroom. Consequently, it is easy to understand why a ‘conspiracy’ may result between teachers and learners, where they pretend to each other that ‘all must be well pedagogically if it is apparently well socially’ (Allwright, 1996b:210). This phenomenon has also been noted in mainstream classes: Karp and Yoels (1976:426) describe efforts to avoid direct personal confrontation and ensure amicability in the classroom.

In sum, it is clear that the kind of social setting provided by the classroom has a fundamental influence on learning. More specifically, factors such as the interlocutor effect, co-presence, level of classroom ‘noise’, absent learners, and inherent conspiracies will have particular bearing on feedback interactions. An important conclusion to draw from the discussion so far is that feedback is not solely a pedagogic matter; there are significant social implications also.

**Situating the individual in this context**

In an attempt to understand how the learner may be oriented to the classroom learning environment, brief mention needs to be made of the role of affect in language learning (Arnold, 1999; Gardner and Lambert, 1972; Horwitz, 1990; MacIntyre and Gardner, 1989; Oxford and Green, 1996; Oxford and Shearin, 1994; Scovel, 1991). Of particular interest here are learners’ attitudes, not to learning in the generic sense, but more specifically to how they orient themselves to the language classroom.

More humanistic approaches to second language learning have shown that a learner’s personal agency plays a significant role in what happens in a classroom: ‘As agents, learners actively engage in constructing the terms and conditions of their own learning’ (Lantolf and Pavlenko, 2001:145). Drawing on early work (for example, Karp and Yoels, 1976), Allwright (1996a:1) puts forward a very interesting and useful description of ‘participant orientations’ – ‘the mental sets with which people may approach situations they find themselves in, what they hope or intend to get out of being in any particular situation’. The ‘mental set’ which underpins a language learner’s participation in a language learning classroom may be oriented towards achievement, that is, ‘getting on’; this learner, for example, is keen to make tangible progress. On the other hand, efforts may be directed towards social success in the classroom, or ‘getting along’ with classmates, and avoiding conflict.

Breen (1987), building on these two concepts, also suggests a binary distinction. He places ‘achievement’ at one end of a continuum, and ‘survival’ (or ‘getting by’) is the other end point. There are now three orientations to work with, and these may be represented in this way (adapted from Allwright, 1996a:4):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>achievement</th>
<th>social success</th>
<th>survival</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>getting on/</td>
<td>getting along</td>
<td>getting by</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>getting ahead</td>
<td></td>
<td>scholastic/social</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A fourth has also been suggested (Candlin, 2004 personal communication), and this is ‘getting even’ where the learner may actively critique the context. It is possible to see how each of these participant orientations is likely to affect the learner’s perception of and attitude towards a particular classroom learning activity - the pedagogic reality of the classroom. This reflects Allwright’s [1984:8] Personal Agenda hypothesis – where learners ‘selectively take from a lesson only those things that they want, and in the manner that they want to do it in’. This selective attention is determined, to a great extent, not only by general motivational
orientation, but also by situation- and task-specific motivation (Julkunen, 2001).

These participant orientations can also affect how the learner perceives and interacts with the other participants in an activity – the social reality of the classroom. The ‘language learner’ who is oriented towards social survival will have very different demands from the one who is focused on achievement, and consequently in such cases, we can see that the term ‘language learner’ is actually a misnomer (Lantolf and Pavlenko, 2001:146). These participant orientations provide an important cornerstone for this feedback-focused research: for example, achievement-focused learners are probably going to be much more receptive to feedback than learners who are devoting their efforts to social success or survival.

**Classroom discourse**

There is just one aspect of classroom discourse which needs to be covered here and it relates to the basic classroom exchange unit reflected in Sinclair and Coulthard’s (1975) initiation-response-feedback/follow-up classification of classroom discourse moves.

The feedback/follow-up, or F-move, in this familiar classroom exchange is what distinguishes classroom talk from many speech events outside the classroom (Cullen, 2002:118). From their analysis of classroom discourse, Sinclair and Coulthard (1975) identified the (I) initiation move from the teacher, the (R) response from the class as a whole, or an individual learner, and finally the (F) follow-up comment from the teacher. This is illustrated in the following exchange:

T: Where’s the verb in this sentence? (I)
S1: ‘. . . is going to give up.’ (R)
T: She’s going to give up smoking. Right. (F)

This representation of the teaching exchange is fairly typical in that it reduces each turn to quite minimal contributions. In marked contrast, is van Lier’s (2001:94) description of the IRF classroom exchange (a similar approach is evident in Lin’s [2001] study in Hong Kong classrooms), where we see that students participating in this exchange are pushed to respond in complex terms:

In the I-R-F format, a number of different things can be accomplished. At the most mechanical, rote-learning end of IRF, the teacher’s questions require the students merely to recite previously learned items. IRF may also be used by the teacher to see if students know a certain word or linguistic item. IRF can demand more, challenging students to think, reason, and make connections. At the most demanding end of IRF, students must be articulate and precise; they are pushed by successive probing questions, to clarify, substantiate, or illustrate some point they had made previously.

There is some difference of opinion in terms of naming these individual moves, and this needs to be mentioned here because of the implications for clarifying definitions of feedback. Working in a primary school context, Jarvis and Robinson (1997:220, emphasis added) use the terms Focus, Build and Summarize to identify ‘an important discoursal means by which meaning is potentially shared by being publicly articulated’. These terms suggest much more than prompts (as is conveyed by ‘initiate’, for example), and show how classroom contributions may be worked with (and not just responded to) at each stage of the exchange. Furthermore, it is also possible to see how feedback may be included as part of each of these moves.

In Hüllen’s (1990:113) description of Elicitation, Response, Evaluative the ‘particular importance’ of the third move is highlighted because it ‘leads to the next exchange unit. It is the point in classroom discourse where a step forward is made. . .’. Such a ‘step forward’ may involve a focus on clarification of a new linguistic item or improved accuracy of a complex lexical chunk. A similar perspective on the importance of the third move is provided by Wells (1993:35, emphasis added): ‘it is in this third step in the co-construction of meaning that the next cycle of the teaching-and-learning spiral has its point of departure.’ Of special note here is the ways in which Wells, by describing the interaction as a ‘co-construction’, underscores the importance of collaboration; and, by using the descriptor ‘teaching-and-
learning spiral’, he also emphasises the non-linearity of teaching and learning processes. Sunderland (2003) describes how the IRF classroom exchange tends to receive a bad press: as was indicated above, it may be represented as a rather straightforward teacher-initiated exchange, in which the patterns are over-simplified and teacher talk contributions are over-emphasised. This negative perspective is evident in Pica’s (1987:10) appraisal of classroom interaction:

Classroom discourse is not oriented towards a two-way flow of information, aimed at mutual comprehension, but, rather, a one-way display from student to teacher. Communication is not shared equally among all classroom interlocutors. Instead, it is channelled through the teacher, who first elicits then evaluates students’ production. The issue of unequal communication, or participation, within the classroom is frequently emphasised in the literature: the teacher is ‘unequivocally in charge’ (van Lier op.cit., p95); the teacher is seen to be responsible for around 70% of all utterances (Hüllen [op. cit.]; and the teacher ‘took longer turns at speaking than any students’ (Mercer, 2001:245). Arguably, a more useful perspective is that ‘the asymmetry of teacher and learner is essential to Vygotsky’s zone of proximal development’ (Edwards and Mercer, 1994:201). More important is the way in which this asymmetrical relationship enables the learner to push forward.

Recent re-evaluations of the IRF sequence have produced some useful new frameworks. Sunderland’s study (op. cit.) investigates student-initiated IRFs and teacher and student variations on this three part pattern. She shows that not only do students initiate exchanges with the teacher, but also that these initiations often occur in clusters or ‘strings’ with one student paving the way for others. She provides the following model (op. cit., p35) of a student-initiated IRF:

```
[Student Pre-initiation]
[Teacher Acknowledgement]
Student Question
Teacher Response
[Student Continuation]
[Teacher Response]
[Student ‘Last Word’]
```

Such an extended model clearly reflects the ‘co-construction of meaning’ referred to above. It may be the case that the ‘student’ in each of these turns is a different student (cf CA analyses), which would then illustrate, on another level, the collaborative nature of language learning as a number of participants engage in the interaction. This provides a very useful framework for the analysis of feedback processes as, rather than describing isolated turns, the interdependency of contributions is emphasised.

**Unpacking Feedback Interactions**

Both the extracts used below are taken from English for Academic Purposes classes, where the focus is on the development of speaking skills. The first is from a ‘Rewind’ discussion: this is where the teacher devoted the last fifteen minutes or so of her class to a discussion of one of the main themes in the lesson. She named this speaking task ‘Rewind’ because the focus was very much on accuracy of production: when the students made a significant error, the rewind prompt was used to encourage them to reflect on what they had said and attempt to rework it. The extract below is from a discussion of an article concerned with an adoption mix-up.

**An example of a Rewind interaction**

493  Take: I agree with neither opinion because if Melvin were six months old or

494  one year old, it _could_ be possible to change his parents, but he’s
already six years old. He and his adoptive parents I think they love each other.

Esther: Rewind! I don't like your verb tense.

Take: They love each other. If Jody comes his home and said she is real mother yes, she's biological mother, I don't think he . . I think he doesn't believe Jody's his real mother . .

Take: If Jody comes his home and says she's Melvin's real mother, but I think he won't believe Jody is his real mother.

Esther: Just rewind that last part, thinking about do you want 'don't', 'he doesn't believe' in this situation . .

Yono: If Jody’s come . . the real mother . .

Esther: . . ‘he doesn’t believe’ is the situation now, but won’t 506 or wouldn’t . . just explain that last bit to us again.

An example of a one-to-one interaction

In the next extract the teacher and student (Yoon) are discussing a video-recording of the student’s participation in a pair-work interview. Yoon was asking his partner about a computer she had for sale, he was thinking of buying it. Here we see him not only working from the visible record of the video-recording of his performance in class, but he is also making use of a written record of selected utterances, a record which he partially constructed prior to this interview (when he viewed the video himself at home).

Kate: [continues to play video, and pauses after Yoon says ‘At the period, do you have any problem with it?’] What do you think of that?

Yoon: [under his breath as he writes down, ‘At the period, do you have any problem with that?’ and looking at what he has written] ‘At the period, do you have any problem with that?’

Kate: [looking over his shoulder] . . change things here . .

Yoon: . . ‘During the period’? . .

Kate: Mmm, and also here you could say -
acceptance, about to offer alternative

82 Yoon: ‘During that period . . . have you . . . ‘No! . . . ‘. . . did you?’ .
83 . Ah [erasing what he has written and trying again],
84 ‘During that period, did you have any problems?’ Yes.

provides alternative with emphasis, rejection, query, repetition of complete utterance with emphasis

85 Kate: OK, because you’re very specific about that period of time -

acceptance with justification

86 Yoon: - but if the computer had some problem . . . then it still have
87 problem -

rejection with explanation

88 Kate: - mmm -

recognition of problem

89 Yoon: She doesn’t say completely yes . . . so, I worried about that . .

further explanation

90 Kate: OK, so [pointing to what he has written] don’t use this
91 because that’s referring back -

opportunity to self-correct - indicates item to change

92 Yoon: - yeah -

acceptance

93 Kate: - you can use ‘have’. .

partial provision of correct form

94 Yoon: - ‘Have you had any problems . . . ?’

provides correct form

95 Kate: - so that’s continuing up until now -

explanation

96 Yoon: - yeah -

acceptance

97 Kate: - yeah, or you could say, ‘Since you bought it . . .’

acknowledgement, partial provision of alternative

98 Yoon: [writing this down] ‘Since you bought it’ -

acceptance, repetition

99 Kate: - ‘have you had any problems with it?’ would be OK.

continued provision of alternative

In both these interactions it is possible to identify how the teacher and learner move through various stages of acknowledgment, questioning and continuation. This manner of graded support is effectively described in the regulatory scale formulated by Aljaafreh and Lantolf (1994:471) in which they built on Vygotsky’s notion of the Zone of Proximal Development to describe the support they provided for their student writers. In Figure 1 below it is possible to see how the twelve levels of support move from the implicit to explicit (illustrations from the feedback interactions from the present study have been added).

0 Teacher sets performance analysis task prior to the feedback consultation (so
that the learner comes to the meeting with an awareness of potential performance issues).

1. The meeting between teacher and learner sets a ‘collaborative frame’ for the interaction.
2. The teacher prompts focus on a performance extract (e.g. a sentence in the transcript of a video segment).
3. Teacher indicates that something may be wrong (‘What do you notice there?’ ‘Is there anything wrong there?’).
4. Teacher rejects unsuccessful attempts to recognise/name the problem.
5. Teacher narrows down the location (e.g. ‘Look at this part here.’).
6. Teacher indicates the nature of the error but does not identify the error (‘What do you notice about your time reference here?’).
7. Teacher identifies the error (‘You need to use the present perfect here’).
8. Teacher rejects learner’s unsuccessful attempts to correct the error.
9. Teacher provides clues to help the learner arrive at the correct form (‘Are you referring to a completed action, or is it still in progress?’ ‘Are you stressing the first or second syllable?’).
10. Teacher provides the correct form.
11. Teacher provides some explanation for use of the correct form.
12. Teacher provides examples of the correct pattern when other forms of help fail to produce an appropriate response action.

Figure 1: Using a ZPD framework as the context for feedback interactions

It is important to note that this feedback interaction begins from a point where the learner has already reflected on performance. Prior to the one-to-one consultations, the learners have had time outside the classroom communicative context to identify ‘mistakes’ in their performance. In the class Rewind session, this identification is carried out on the spot, so to speak. The teacher sets it up as a task in which the learners are to monitor the accuracy of their production:

This morning I would like you to rewind other students because you also need to find your own mistakes. Remember that if you find a mistake belonging to someone else, don’t feel bad you are helping them if you help them to fix it.

The organisation of a one-to-one interview focusing on the learner’s video-recorded performance provides the collaborative frame for the feedback interaction. It is possible to see that a collaborative frame on a somewhat larger scale is provided in the Rewind task, in that the learner’s peers are also involved to varying degrees – as contributors, supporters, spectators – in the interaction. In both settings, the teacher provides a prompt to focus on a particular aspect of performance: ‘Rewind’ or ‘What do you notice there?’ The learner’s response to this initial prompt then determines what follows.

In the Rewind extract presented above, it is possible to see how the teacher moves through four stages of support in her responses to the student:

Stage 3: Rewind! I don’t like your verb tense.
Stage 5: Just rewind that last part, thinking about do you want ‘don’t’, ‘he doesn’t believe’ in this situation . .
Stage 6: . . ‘he doesn’t believe’ is the situation now . .
Stage 9: . . but ‘won’t’ or ‘wouldn’t’ . . just explain that last bit to us again . .
The teacher moves from a rather strong indication that something is wrong, to narrowing
down the location of the problem; she then provides some metalinguistic information to
indicate the nature of the error, and her final level of support is to provide concrete clues to
enable Take to arrive at the correct form.

The beginning stages of a one-to-one interview with Yoon (presented above) are similar, and
in total, the teacher makes use of five levels of support:

Stage 3: What do you think of that?
Stage 5: ... change things here ...
Stage 6: ... because you're very specific about that period of time -
Stage 8: ... so don't use this because ...
Stage 10: ... you can use 'have' ... 'have you had any problems with it?' would
        be OK.

Although the opening question here is neutral, it is used to indicate that there is something
wrong with the part of Yoon’s performance just seen on the video. In response, he writes
down what he has said and repeats it under his breath (a possible example of private
speech). In narrowing down the location of the problem, the teacher is able to refer him to his
written record as well as the recent aural record provided by the video-recording; then the
nature of his error is indicated by reminding him of the time reference. His written alternative
is then rejected, and he is finally provided with the correct form.

**Mutual Co-construction of Feedback**

This paper has attempted to show that there is much more to feedback than the
straightforward provision of one message from one person to another. Feedback is best seen
in terms of a rather complex process, consisting of a series of responsive moves which build
on each other and on previous shared experiences of the participants. Adding to the
complexity is the fact that this process is undertaken in the ‘public’ environment that is the
classroom, there are spectators to the interaction whose responsiveness (or not) will impact
upon the interaction to varying degrees.

The role of the learner’s personal agency (Lantolf and Pavlenko, 2001:145) cannot be
underestimated; for example, the learner’s ability to shape and contain the very learning
conditions around a particular learning task is just one illustration of the transformative
influence of agency. There are significant implications here as far as feedback is concerned,
as is evident in the very different perspectives underpinning these two learner comments:

Yumi: If I want to change, I have to care about the sentence.
Zumi: I don’t feel emotion when I speak English – if someone tells me I speak awful,
       I don’t get angry because it’s only sound.

The orientations that Yumi and Zumi have to their learning are going to influence not only the
amount of feedback they may encounter, but also the shaping of the feedback process. At
the same time, their approaches to the mutual co-construction of feedback become part of the
overall classroom discourse and are therefore available as a social/learning resource for the
group as a whole.

To conclude, the ‘last word’ is best left to Breen (2001:309):

... any explanation of how language is learned must locate the process within the
discourse of language lessons [because] what learners actually learn from the
classroom is socially rather than individually constructed.
References


Lantolf, J. P., & Pavlenko, A. (2001). (S)econd (L)anguage (A)ctivity theory: understanding second language learners as people. In M. Breen (Ed.), *Learner contributions to


Encumbering Development: Development Discourse as Hegemonic Resources in the Developing World

Charles H. B. Mphande
Victoria University

Abstract

Development as a concept is as complex as it is elusive to definition. Various accounts of the chequered historical course of development thought show attempts to explain the development process as it has been perceived in various contexts and during particular time periods.

Post World War Two socio-economic development assessments show bleak as well as paradoxical trends in the developing world, given the efforts of nationalist governments and the donor community to improve people’s quality of life. While assessments agree that the development project has under performed, or aggravated the poverty and suffering among the poor, explanations of responsible factors remain a subject of heated debate and shifting opinions. In the SADC region, Malawi’s post-independence rapid economic growth and its fall from the early 1980s have attracted divergent explanations, given Western donor community good will and support Malawi enjoyed throughout the cold war era.

A worthwhile starting point in tackling the complexities of development is to clarify conceptions of development and their strategies in context. Adopting techniques in Critical Discourse Analysis perspectives that espouse a constructivist approach, a rhetorical and linguistic study of public communication texts within the socio-political context at independence in 1964 and post-independence, throws some light on the development project as encumbered and distracted in Malawi and by extension, among (young) states of the developing world. As such, as much as the development agenda is seen to have primarily socio-economic bearings, analyses of depictions of development show that elites subtly used the development agenda as a hegemonic resource to entrench their positions. This paper focuses on the constructive element that was involved in the conceptualisation of development and the hegemonic purposes the development concepts served.

Introduction

The socio-economic standing of Sub-Saharan African states since their attainment of independence in the 1960s, more than anything else, is a tale of the failure of the development project to raise the quality of life on the continent. Arrighi (2002:5) captures aptly the abundant pessimistic assessments of the effects of underdevelopment that are in the political economy literature on Africa in the statement “Over the last quarter of a century, the African crisis of the late 1970s has been transformed into…the ‘African Tragedy.’” The worsening of the poverty situation in Sub-Saharan Africa is well documented in both serious and popular literature. For example, UNDP (2000) has detailed comparative aggregates of human development indicators (based on 1998 data) of the developing regions of Arab States, East Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean, South Asia and the Pacific and Sub-Saharan Africa. Those of Sub-Saharan Africa clearly show that the region’s performance has been on the worst side from the 1970s to the close of the 20th century. The Economist (2000) in its May 13 – 19 issue, dedicated mostly to the analysis of the African tragedy, had as its front cover title ‘The hopeless continent.’ Furthermore, the exacerbation of the crisis is captured in UNDP’s (1996:17) assessment statement of the 1980s decade: “The decade of the 1980s [was]…the ‘lost decade’ for Latin America and Sub-Saharan Africa. Several indicators register[ed] the decline.” These grim assessments were also highlighted in the Lagos Plan of Action in which African leaders stated that:
The effect of unfulfilled promises of global development strategies has been more sharply felt in Africa than in the other continents of the world. Indeed, rather than result in an improvement in the economic situation of the continent, successive strategies have made it stagnate and become more susceptible than other regions to the economic and social crises suffered by the industrialised countries. Thus Africa is unable to point to any significant growth rate, or satisfactory index of general well-being, in the past 20 years (OAU 1981:4).

While all assessments agree on the failure of the development project to provide better quality of life, interpretation of responsible factors for these trends have been a subject of heated debate and shifting opinion (see for example Arrighi 2002; Edozie 2004 and Mkandawire 2001). Whereas the World Bank (1981) blamed African governments and their bad policies, and Bates (1981) included to the list African state officials’ selfish motives to enrich themselves and their collaborators, African leaders challenged this view (OAU 1981). Although shortly later African leaders “acknowledged the responsibilities of African governments for the crisis, and the limitations of...actions undertaken by African states” (Arrighi 2002:9), they insisted external shocks were largely to blame for the deepening crisis, and saw a way forward in Africa’s greater self-reliance. Providing an alternative perspective, Arrighi’s (2002:11) analysis of the African socio-economic crisis “attributed a key role to world capitalism in constraining and shaping developmental efforts and outcomes at the national level.”

An inference that may be made from these brief examples of arguments and counter-arguments is that development is a complex activity, and interpretation of its operations, a highly contested field. As Roe (1999:1,2) asserts

> Because African…development is genuinely complex, it is saturated with development scenarios deployed to stabilize decision making in the face of that complexity. In their simplest form, development narratives are the rules of thumb, arguments, “war stories” and other scenarios about rural development...the challenge is to come up with counternarratives to replace those development narratives that do such a disservice in stabilizing practice.

A worthwhile starting point in tackling the complexities of development is to clarify conceptions of development and their strategies in context. Indeed the term and concept development itself remains elusive to definition (see Baster 1972; Mabogunje 1989; Patterson 1999; Rist 1997; Schech and Haggis 2000; Seers 1972) even though development has grown to be a thriving activity with experts of various interests. Ellis and Biggs’ (2001) chronological study of the concepts of development that have been in use since the end of World War II, and Patterson’s (1999) historical examination of metaphors and analogies of social change and development thought that have been used from classical times to the present attest to the variety of shades of meaning that development, as a preoccupation with improvement of quality of life, can assume in various contexts and time periods. Remenyi (2004) has gone further to give an account of the chequered historical course of development thought that has led to the people-centred view taking centre stage today (see also UNDP 1996). Remenyi (2004) advances a people-centred view of development that incorporates good governance and human rights as instruments within a poverty alleviation focus, as a “challenge to revise thinking on development” (p23). Such a call to revision of development thought is an indication of how development lends itself to multiple conceptualisations and interpretations. Analyses of various conceptualisations of development in contexts of social practices would help to cast some light on factors that contribute to inefficacies of various development strategies.

**Analytical Tools**

The theoretical framework of the analysis in this paper draws mainly from the discourse analytic perspectives that embrace a social constructionist epistemology (Berger and Luckmann 1966; Fairclough 1992; Potter 1996; Potter and Wetherell 1987; Gergen 1994; Gergen 2001). While text analysis is based on Fairclough’s Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) (Fairclough 1989, 1992), I also draw on Discursive Psychology (DASP) as practiced by Potter.
and Wetherell (1987) as it “provides particularly useful and widely used tools for research in communication, culture and language” (Phillips and Jørgensen 2002:106). In this analysis DASP is particularly useful for rhetorical analysis, which complements CDA’s analysis of formal linguistic features, using its three-dimensional analytical framework (Fairclough 1992, 1995). On a practical level, Fairclough (1992:71) explains that “discursive practice is manifested in linguistic form…as ‘texts’, using ‘text’ in Halliday’s broad sense.” He goes on to assert that “Discursive practice’ does…not contrast with social practice: the former is a particular form of the latter” (p71).

In view of the object of analysis, representations of development and contextual social practices that have been associated with development work in Malawi as they appeared in print media sources, radio (or policy submission texts), interplay or dynamics of discourses are a feature that is of interest in this analysis. Fairclough (2003:124) posits that:

The relationships between different discourses are one element of the relationships between different people – they may complement one another, compete with one another, one can dominate others, and so forth. Discourses constitute part of the resources which people deploy in relating to one another – keeping separate from one another, cooperating, competing, dominating – and in seeking to change the ways in which they relate to one another.

Thus, on an analytical level, the analysis elevates the concept of Orders of Discourse (whose elements include genres, styles, discourses) (Fairclough 1992, 1995) to the main pillar of the discursive/social practice analyses. As a concept, order of discourse has analytical advantage in empirical research in that it provides the researcher a tool to examine how discourses, by representing reality in one particular way rather than in other possible ways, constitute subjects and objects in particular ways, create boundaries between the true and the false, and make certain types of action relevant and others unthinkable (Phillips and Jørgensen 2002:145).

Both, CDA and DASP are agreed that discursive accounts of reality have social consequences. In this analysis, the interest is in what social consequences various representations of development have had, and also what consequences would be noticed if one understanding instead of the other were accepted. Fairclough (2003:124) aptly extends this thought: “Discourses not only represent the world as it is (or rather is seen to be), they are also projective, imaginaries, representing possible worlds which are different from the actual world, and tied in to projects to change the world in particular directions.” This points to the interplay of discourses and their social consequences.

Drawing on Fairclough (1992, 2003), the analysis of formal linguistic features, which provide for linguistic realisations of discourses in genres, examines texts on two levels. One level is identifying and characterising the discourses in question. On this level, the analysis distinguishes how vocabulary ‘lexicalises’ the world in particular ways. This analysis involves examining how lexical semantic relationships are deployed in different discourses to structure the world differently. This step is especially rewarding when conflicting discourses are being examined, as

What is centrally contested is the power of…preconstructed semantic systems to generate particular visions of the world which may have the performative power to sustain or remake the world in their image (Fairclough 2003:130).

The analysis also involves distinguishing discourses by the way they employ lexical and grammatical metaphor - noun-like entities (nominalisations) to represent processes as ‘things’ or entities, or process nouns (nouns with the verb-like quality of representing processes and relations). As for the importance of metaphor as a discursive resource, Fairclough (2003:131-132) notes “metaphor is one resource available for producing distinct representations of the world. But it is perhaps the particular combination of different metaphors which differentiates discourses.” Another important point of analysis in relation to discourses is that a particular discourse (or repertoire) “can…generate many specific representations” (Fairclough 2003:124). This calls for observations of levels of abstraction that discourses or repertoires have in terms of degree of repetition, commonality, stability over time and scale (how much of the world they include, and therefore the range of representations they can generate). Another feature of analysis on this level is the determination of underlying assumptions.
(Fairclough’s rendering of presuppositions) as varieties of implicitness, that include also logical implications, standard conversational implicatures, and non-standard conversational implicatures and intertextuality as parallel features (two sides of one issue) in their connections to other texts. According to Fairclough (2003:41), intertextuality “accentuates…dialogue between the voice of the author of a text and other voices” whereas assumptions “diminish…[dialogicality].” The importance of issues of assumptions and intertextuality is that they open up examination of what a text includes and excludes.

Another level of analysis of formal linguistic features involves identifying representation of social events and actors in addition to examining representations of development. Selections from Fairclough's (2003) tools of analysis of representational meanings are considered relevant. A pertinent feature of interest for textual and social analysis is how texts represent agency (that is, whether agency of actors is specified or elided) and the possible social and political significance of such textual choice. Central to representational meaning is analysis of the clause elements, namely: processes, participants and circumstances (Halliday 1985). For purposes of this analysis, the features of interest are transitivity, nominalisation and representation of social actors as included or excluded entities, or indeed represented as personal or impersonal entities.

**Development and Social Practice in Malawi**

The story of development in Malawi is well documented (see for example Chipande 1983; Harrigan 2001; Hogendorn and Christiansen 1996; Kydd and Christiansen 1982; Centre of African Studies, University of Edinburgh 1984; Pryor 1990). Chipeta and Mkandawire (2002:24) note that the period 1960 – 1979, particularly after independence in 1964, “Malawi’s economy exhibited above-average growth.” Malawi’s marked development success among other emergent Sub-Saharan states attracted international attention as an “alternative pattern to development” (Centre of African Studies, Edinburgh University 1984). However, due to a combination of external factors (such as oil price rise), natural disasters (particularly drought at the turn of the 1970s) and internal structural weaknesses in the economy, Malawi’s agriculture-led economy experienced a hitherto irreversible downward trend. This downward trend spelt the fading of hopes for meaningful development. Divergent diagnoses of Malawi’s economic circumstances have been made (see for example Harrigan 2001; Chipande 1983; Kydd 1984; Kajianike 1992). According to Harrigan (2001) the World Bank had misread Malawi’s economy as a true free market economy, thereby giving ineffective advice. Harrigan (2001) argues that the World Bank had misread the social practices of the Malawi polity under Dr Hastings Banda and their influence on the economy giving it appearances of a true free market economy. The analysis in this paper focuses on the discursive construction of the said social practices in the context of Malawi at independence and post-independence, and their socio-economic effects.

**A Gramscian Reading of Malawi at Independence and Post-independence**

Appropriation of successful development programmes and the socio-economic change they bring about in the lives of the citizenry for political legitimation by governments is not an uncommon occurrence in Malawian social life (Chilowa 2001). Thus, extra to socio-economic purposes, the development agenda has been used subtly as a hegemonic resource to promote a beneficent image of ruling parties and their governments to entrench themselves. Of discursive interest in this analysis are oblique requisites within the development agenda; the populist appeal that proffered a nationalist persuasive strategy to development as opposed to the colonialist’s coercion, and an illusory sense of empowerment of the people.

Two points need brief explication before examination of texts. The first is pointing out pertinent elements of Gramsci’s notion of hegemony that I find relevant for contextualising oblique references of the development agenda in the post-independence Malawi socio-political climate. The second is a brief socio-political context of Malawi at about the time of independence to put the hegemonic operations in a proper perspective.

In pointing out the elasticity and complexity of Gramsci’s concept of hegemony, Harshé (1997: 149-150) argues that
the concept of hegemony can be deployed in the domestic socio-political context of any state as well as in the context of any dominant mode of production such as capitalism that cuts across the boundaries of states, nations and regions.

The complexity of the concept is noted in the various elements of the socio-political practice that Gramsci attempted to understand in various socio-political formations of his time. Although I will not look at the totality of his concept, some key elements are worth pointing out. According to Harshé (1997) one of the complexities of the concept of hegemony are its two interrelated and dialectically interactive dimensions, involving the material base that sustains the hegemony and the superstructure that provides space to legitimise the hegemony. These lead to a "moral and philosophical leadership"...which is attained through the active consent of major groups in a society" (Bocock 1986:11). According to Gramsci (1971), the ideological and organisational functions that work within these dimensions, especially the superstructure, are accomplished by intellectuals ('functionaries') who are also subdivided into traditional and organic intellectuals. The 'organic intellectuals' are instrumental in performing mediating functions for the dominant class in the struggle of class forces. According to Harshé (1997:160) Gramsci theorised that apart from the organic intellectuals, the category of traditional intellectuals "represent[ed] an essential social group from preceding economic structure [that gave] historical continuity to the intellectuals as a social group." The 'functionaries' operate within two major superstructural levels, namely: 'civil society' "that is the ensemble of organisms commonly called 'private', and that of 'political society' or 'the State'" (Gramsci, 1971:12). Furthermore, in exercising the function of social 'hegemony', which the dominant group exercises throughout the society, and 'direct domination' or command exercised through the State and 'juridical' government, two sides to hegemony are identified.

1. The 'spontaneous' consent given by the great masses of the population to the general direction imposed on social life by the dominant fundamental group; this consent is 'historically' caused by the prestige (and consequent confidence) which the dominant group enjoys because of its position and function in the world of production.

2. The apparatus of state coercive power which 'legally' enforces discipline on those groups who do not 'consent' either actively or passively. This apparatus is, however, constituted for the whole of society in anticipation of moments of crisis of command and direction when spontaneous consent has failed (Gramsci 1971:12).

Thus, in Gramsci's formulation of hegemony, consent was an important feature for hegemony to prevail; coercion was to be used marginally in deviant cases (see Bocock 1986, and Harshé 1997).

A Gramscian reading of the post-independence Malawi context is relevant for two major reasons. The first is that the victory of the nationalist government was partly a result of the record of coercion associated with the colonial period. The aspiring nationalist government was, therefore, keen to take full advantage of this weakness on the part of the colonial administration to legitimise itself and to keep the loyalty of the citizenry. The second is that because of the cabinet crisis which led to exiling dissident cabinet ministers, and the ensuing brief and weak armed revolts that were brutally crushed, the moral standing of the Malawi Congress Party Government and Dr Banda's leadership underwent consolidation that used a combination of coercion and consent concurrently. The development agenda provided a rich arena for the interplay of these hegemonic workings. Before examining these workings in detail, a brief account of the 1964 cabinet crisis to locate the analysis in context, is necessary.

1964-65 Malawi Cabinet Crisis

The story of the Nyasaland/Malawi 1964 cabinet crisis is well documented (see for example Joffe 1973; Morton 1975; Short 1974 and Williams 1978). After the Malawi Congress Party's landslide victory in the 1961 Nyasaland General election, Nyasaland was given self-governing status in 1963, with Dr Hastings Kamuzu Banda as its Prime Minister. Although the Central African (Rhodesia and Nyasaland) Federation broke up, the British government was yet to be satisfied the nationalist government would manage the new nation. Out of a common overriding interest among indigenous Malawians to free Nyasaland from colonial domination, Dr Banda and his associates were all keen to demonstrate capability to run the affairs of the state for Nyasaland's/Malawi's eventual independent and republican status, bearing in mind
the glaringly poor example of the Congo that was torn apart by civil war (Short 1974). In the circumstances, differences between Dr Banda and his lieutenants were carefully suppressed. There were four main sources of tension between Dr Banda and his ministers. One area of difficulty lay in Dr Banda’s autocratic style of leadership. Williams (1978) asserts that the congress leadership that invited Dr Banda to take up leadership of the party in the fight against colonial domination was partly to blame for Banda’s later autocratic tendencies that they became uncomfortable with. Judging that they needed a hero figure for mass revolution, the congress leadership ambivalently constructed a demi-god image of Banda as a man who was never wrong and knew the best in public, while they hoped to contain his human failings within the circles of the leadership. Williams (1978:206) notes that one of the ministers who went into exile after the crisis was on record in the legislative assembly that he did not see anything wrong with dictatorship and that he looked forward to the removal of all traces of opposition. What started out as a strategy to deal a serious blow to the colonial forces turned into a recipe for an autocracy, soon after attainment of self-government in 1963. As Williams (1978:213) asserts, “Dr Banda had become more rather than less insistent that he alone would make all decisions and made it clear in the most humiliating terms that he was not under any obligation to consider the views of his subordinates.” Another source of tension between Dr Banda and his ministers was foreign policy, especially new Malawi’s relations with white governments of Mozambique and apartheid South Africa, and the question of recognising mainland China. Whereas Dr Banda was prepared to have closer ties with the Portuguese in Mozambique and apartheid South Africa, his lieutenants preferred determined support of African struggle against these regimes. Peking, which had diplomatic ties with Tanzania, made offers to new Malawi of GBP 6million and later GBP18 million for recognition. Short (1974) argues that although it appeared that Dr Banda refused to take up these offers as a result of ideological alignment with Britain and the Western bloc, there was evidence that Dr Banda felt that these offers came out of the personal initiative of his foreign affairs minister, with whom Dr Banda had little in common on foreign policy, and recognition of Mainland China would have undermined his leadership. Another source of tension between Banda and his subordinates was over the slow rate of Africanisation. While Banda’s subordinates wanted to carry out their campaign promises of rapid Africanisation of the civil service, Banda much admired the traditions of the British civil service and was wary of over hastily promoting locally based officers, having witnessed in Ghana the corruption and inefficiency to which this could lead (Short 1974:199).

This issue also affected the civil service in the capital Zomba and main commercial town of Blantyre. White and indigenous members of the civil service reacted differently to this. The white expatriate civil service felt unsafe if the ideas of the ministers were to succeed. The indigenous civil service was unhappy with Dr Banda, and when the crisis broke out, the civil service and educated Malawians, in general, protested violently in support of the dismissed ministers. The indigenous members of the civil service were also unhappy with Dr Banda’s readiness to adopt the Skinner Report which “recommended economies in the pay and conditions offered to locally based civil servants” (Short 1974:199). Another source of tension was Dr Banda’s institution of a compulsory charge of a tickery (threepence) for hospital outpatients.

On 6 July 1964 Nyasaland became the independent state of Malawi. In less than two months the tensions erupted into a confrontation between Dr Banda and his ministers. Dr Banda dismissed three of the senior ministers while three others resigned in protest. Several months of political unrest followed, during which Dr Banda made several constitutional changes to enable him to use restrictive measures, such as preventive detention, reminiscent of the frantic moves of colonial authorities earlier on against his own Nyasaland African Congress (that turned to be the Malawi Congress Party) (Short 1974:221). Following an armed invasion led by one of the ex-ministers in February 1965 which the armed forces crushed quickly, Dr Banda made several purges in the cabinet, the party and in the regions where the ex-ministers came from. He appointed new people to his cabinet, in key civil service appointments and in the party hierarchy who were now personally loyal to him. Some traditional authorities such as chiefs were deposed, and district councils in the regions where the ex-ministers came from were dissolved. Besides, Dr Banda strengthened the Malawi Young Pioneers to entrench his power, as Short (1974:229) states “parliament passed the Young Pioneers Act, which made the movement an integral and equal part of the security forces.” As such, the Malawi Young Pioneers, according to Williams (1978:227) “were able to
embark upon a reign of terror which…went unchecked by army and police; unless the police had first received personal permission from the president.” This was only part of what Banda had built to entrench himself as Harrigan (2001:31-32) describes a personal network of support and control which was independent of the party organisation, developing a comprehensive private and informal structure of control with channels of information and command outside the formal party hierarchy.

Thus by the end of the political unrests in 1965, with the ex-ministers all in exile, Dr Banda emerged the victor. He now went about consolidating his power and young Malawi’s statehood. With the euphoria over the collapse of the federation and now victory over his rebel ministers, Banda tactfully used common grievances and victories to his advantage for a long time to legitimise himself and his government. By denouncing the colonialists and inciting fear of invasion of dissident ministers, Dr Banda penetrated Malawi society with his political ideology that worked towards hegemony in the Gramscian sense. However, there was more to his means of legitimising himself and his government. According to Harrigan (2001:31) “Legitimacy was forged by an astute combination of coercion, political patronage, traditionalism, personal charisma, and a populist appeal, which reached all strata of Malawian society.” Harrigan (2001) further asserts that in the 1970s Dr Banda consolidated his position by the populist appeal, “based on continued criticism and exposure of hardships faced by all groups under the colonial regime” (p31). I argue that the populist appeal had two sides to it. One side was his denunciation of the colonial regime coupled with the alternative development agenda that he proffered in contrast to the colonial authorities. The other side was the illusory empowerment of the local people, as exemplified in one of his addresses (which he made after a sharp disagreement with his foreign minister over Nyasaland’s close association with white ruled Mozambique):

You, the common people are the real Malawi Congress Party. Watch everybody! Even ministers – and I tell you when they are present here…If they do what you do not think is good for the Malawi Congress Party…come and tell me. It is your job to see that nothing injures or destroys the Party…I am saying this because I know we have strange funny people here very soon, Ambassador for this country, Ambassador for that country, and they will be trying to corrupt people in the Party, and they will be starting with Ministers and members of the National Assembly (Short 1974:203-204).

Instances of Dr Banda’s references to the development agenda exemplify his use of development as a socio-cultural resource to legitimise himself and the Malawi Congress Party Government. An early case of Dr Banda’s use of this socio-cultural resource was soon after his victory over his dissident ministers when he announced that Chipembere, who led an abortive armed revolt in February 1965, had finally ended up in the US. As a conclusion of his May 21 nationwide radio broadcast, Dr Banda evoked his determination to develop Malawi:

Chipembere, Chiume, Chirwa, Chisiza, Bwanausi and Chokani have wasted our time and efforts since August 26… Now that Chipembere and all the others have run away, let us concentrate our minds, our thoughts, our efforts on nothing else but development, and not on bitterness, hatred or vengeance (Short 1974:230).

This paper further examines instances of such references to development as this, which were intended to be a means of winning consent of the various classes that formed the Malawi polity for hegemonic purposes. The textual analysis focuses on examination of the rhetorical resource that development provided to consolidate Dr Banda’s authoritarian rule and his Malawi Congress Party (hereafter MCP) Government. Because texts are from different sources as opposed to single documents, the analysis examines the rhetoric and the linguistic tools concurrently under particular micro-themes to capture the import of the texts.

**Development: A Libertarian Ideology**

The main contention in this part of the paper is that concerns of political legitimation seemed to override the practical issues of bringing the citizenry to a level of awareness of the complexities of the nation’s development agenda beyond the immediate euphoria of liberation from colonial domination and its many evils. Furthermore, this state of affairs persisted for a long time in Dr Banda’s thirty-year reign and this may have been a contributing factor to the limiting of emergence of innovative and reflective approaches to development among the
people. As Joffe (1973:85) indicates, “This theme of colonial neglect is a constant refrain in Parliament and on the hustings and is highlighted on all ceremonial occasions in which a review of the achievements of independence is appropriate.” Some political pronouncements are exemplars of this. (See Texts A and B.)

Text A

[Extract from: State Address: Opening of the Parliament of Malawi, Tuesday 3rd October, 1967]

INTRODUCTORY

When I last addressed you in July, 1966, on the day that Malawi became a Republic, I stressed then that the task of freeing this country from economic dependence on other countries would be a hard and difficult one; and I reminded you that the qualities of unity, loyalty, obedience, discipline and determination would be more necessary than ever before.

(Ministry of Information 1967:1)

(Italics, boldface and underlining mine)

Text A above is an excerpt of a long account of what government had done, and the proposals it had for socio-economic development. It is clear that at that date the undercurrent of all developmental programmes was eventual self-reliance, that is “freeing [the] country from economic dependence on other countries”. This notion was not unique to Dr Banda; Julius Nyerere of Tanzania, as well as other African leaders of emergent African states, shared the same notion. For example, Nyerere in his 1968 paper ‘Freedom and Development’ posits that “without freedom you get no development, and without development you very soon lose your freedom” (Nyerere 1973:58). However, in Dr Banda’s address, there are requisites to attainment of this liberty, namely “the qualities of unity, loyalty, obedience, discipline and determination” which were meant to satisfy his style of traditional leadership more than they would contribute to innovation for socio-economic change. Since his return to Nyasaland in 1958 to fight for Nyasaland’s secession from the Rhodesia-Nyasaland Federation, and his ascendancy to the Nyasaland African Congress’s presidency, Dr Banda established this dictum which he expected everyone to follow to the letter. Joffe (1973) has dealt at length with “this logo of Banda’s regime” (p52). She observes that

Enshrined in the Constitution of the Malawi Congress Party, displayed on banners heralding national political events, reaffirmed with ferocious regularity in the resolutions of party conferences, attributed with the victories of the past, invoked as the “four cornerstones” on which the future depends – “Unity, Loyalty, Obedience and Discipline” are among the essential rhetorical standards of Banda’s regime...The assumption underlying the four cornerstones was clear: a movement waging war for political liberation required the same rigorous unity and unquestioning obedience to the higher leadership as a national army requires in wartime (pp52-53)

Thus, attached as a conditionality for the people's longed for socio-economic improvement, the “four cornerstones” were a discursive/rhetorical tool for hegemonic ends.

The transitivity in the linguistic representation of the “four cornerstones” in the text is interesting, and can be observed by examining the discursive function of the nominalisation in the latter clause of the structure below (from Text A above).

“I reminded you that the qualities of unity, loyalty, obedience, discipline and determination would be more necessary than ever before.”

According to Gerot and Wignell (1994), transitivity is critical in analyses of the clause as representation. The analyst’s interest in the clausal functions is in relation to “who=does=what=to=whom, who/what=is=what/who, when, where, why, or how” (p52). As verbal processes are “processes of saying, or more accurately, of symbolically signalling”
(Gerot and Wignell 1994:62) the structure in question pertains to verbal processes¹. In relation to these, Gerot and Wignell

Gerot and Wignell (1994:64) assert that they are often “realised by two distinct clauses: the projecting clause encoding a signal source (Sayer) and a signalling (Verbal Process), and the other (projected clause) [which] realises what was said.” Based on this analytical scheme of functional grammar, the participants in the first clause (in bold) are explicit:

I (Dr Banda, the President) - Sayer
reminded - Verbal

you (members of parliament and nation as a whole) - Receiver

However, in the latter clause (underlined), which is the projected clause, nominalisation obfuscates the participants by turning “processes [of uniting; obeying; being loyal, disciplined, and determined] into states” (Fairclough 1992:182). Fairclough (1992) further shows that in sharing with the passive the potentiality of omitting the agent, and the variety of motivations for doing so, nominalisation is a tool of “considerable cultural and ideological importance” (p183). In the projected clause, nominalisation has been instrumental in “entify[ing]² local and temporary condition[s] into inherent state[s] or propert[ies]…which become the focus of cultural attention and manipulation” (Fairclough 1992:183). In this case, the elision of the participants coupled with objective modalisation (see Fairclough 1992:159) (in “would be more necessary than before”) in the projected clause, have the effect of drawing attention away from Dr Banda (as well as his government) as the participant with whom the Malawi polity must be determined to be united through obeying him, and being disciplined and loyal to for his own sake than anything else. Thus, while Dr Banda was an absolute ruler (Short 1974, Joffe 1973, Williams 1978), the import of the text is that Dr Banda was a disinterested conscientious leader who called all members of the Malawi polity to apply themselves to the task of socio-economic change without distraction to realise their independence. The reference to realisation of this kind of independence, as an appositive of development, was invoked in another speech about a year later (Text B below).

**Text B**

**[Extract from: The President’s Speech at the Opening of the Nkhotakota – Benga Road, 23rd July, 1968.]**

It is not enough to have independence. I did not want independence just for its own sake. I wanted it as a means to an end. What was that end? So that the life of everyone in this country could be improved… In other words, I wanted independence in order to improve the life of the ordinary people in the villages.

(Department of Information 1968:2)

(Boldface and underlining mine)

The spectrum of the object of socio-economic change in this text encompasses all social classes in Dr Banda’s reference to “the life of everyone in this country” but sensitive to the kind of audience he was addressing in this rural area of the country, he particularises the “ordinary people in the villages” as his focus of the development agenda. I contend that these

---

¹ In Systemic Functional Linguistics, there are identified seven different Process types realised by verbs. I tabulate the list below after Gerot and Wignell (1994:54). For an accessible introduction to Systemic Functional Linguistics in general, and Process types in particular, refer to Eggins, S. (1994).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Material</th>
<th>Doing</th>
<th>bodily, physically, materially</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Behavioural</td>
<td>Behaving</td>
<td>Physiologically and psychologically</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental</td>
<td>Sensing</td>
<td>emotionally, intellectually, sensorily</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal</td>
<td>Saying</td>
<td>lingually, signaling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relational</td>
<td>Being</td>
<td>equal to, or some attribute of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existential</td>
<td>Existing</td>
<td>there exists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meteorological</td>
<td>Weathering</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

² This is Fairclough’s coinage meaning “making an entity”.
references to development, or socio-economic change in general, and especially, the oblique requisites that are attached to the attainment of the envisioned development, with discursive management of inclusion or elision of participants, were hegemonic tools to win what Gramsci (1971) describes as spontaneous consent of the various classes in the Malawi polity.

**Metaphors of Liberation**

Lakoff and Johnson (1980) have demonstrated the pervasiveness of metaphors in social life. The conceptualisation of development in post-independence Malawi politics exhibited particularly two dominant metaphors that were hegemonically powerful in the public arena:

- War against poverty, ignorance and disease
- Reaping/Spreading the fruits of independence.

In the analysis that follows, it is contended that while the two metaphors served hegemonic purposes well, they did little to stimulate a reflective and innovative approach to strategising for socio-economic change.

**War against Poverty, Ignorance and Disease**

Text C

Malawi is in a hurry for development - Nyasulu

MALAWI is a country in a hurry to develop herself and thus to catch up with other countries, the Minister of Health and Community Development, Mr A. M. Nyasulu, has declared [1]...But to complement this, the war against ignorance and economic underdevelopment must be waged from the rural front as well [2]...Now that political independence had been achieved, the war against poverty and ignorance had to be waged on all fronts. [3]

(MANA 1970:3)

(Boldface and numbering mine)

Joffe’s (1973:v) analysis of the post-independence Malawi civic culture (patterns of behaviour in the public arenas of a polity) identifies the development imperative – the principle that held that, among others, the primary function of government was to promote and control development. Joffe (1973) argues that this view came out of colonial neglect of Nyasaland, the circumstances which the nationalist government sought to correct. Although Joffe’s (1973) position is rather apologetic to the colonialists’ responsibility for Nyasaland’s poverty, she makes an important point that while the colonial authorities "did indulge a defeatism about the country’s prospects, for ultimately it was not their country...In contrast, the nationalist regime is one which almost by definition has a firm belief in the possibility of effective development of the land and the people" (p86). In light of this determination to effect socio-economic change on the part of the nationalist regime, the metaphor was a socio-cultural resource for conceptualising and mobilising the people to do development work.

The war metaphor for socio-economic change was common pre- and post-independence. Kanyama Chiume, a prominent nationalist who became Dr Banda’s foreign minister, used the metaphor in 1963 at an international conference on Africa held at Howard University, quoted in Joffe (1973:48):

---

3 According to Joffe (1973:v-vii) the other principles include the non-conflict principle that held that political conflict must be severely restricted, with less latitude for the prominent than the anonymous; the populist principle that the people must be participants in the modern polity by giving them opportunity to fill political roles associated with the nationalist victory over colonial rule and to participate in regular rituals of explication, affirmation, and representation; the principle of development by exhortation that held that change in the rural areas needs to be induced at least in part by techniques of exhortation involving both tactics adapted from colonial experience and devices newly created to involve “politicians” in development work.
We in Africa feel that there is no one type of democracy... As we see it, it is necessary to have a strong organization to fight the unholy trinity of ignorance, poverty, and disease, the insidious legacies left behind by the colonial powers.

However, much as it was a common metaphor during the pre-independence period (when Nyasaland was self-governing after the 1961 general elections), the fight for independence was prior to the fight against the inanimate enemies of poverty, ignorance and disease. After independence, such statements as [3] in Text B (“Now that political independence had been achieved, the war against poverty and ignorance had to be waged on all fronts”) were directed to the inanimate enemies. This re-direction of the nation’s attention to another common enemy was powerfully hegemonic. Joffe (1973) asserts that one of the main reasons for Dr Banda’s continued and relatively peaceful tenure in office since a serious political crisis in 1964-65 had been the fact that he had not permitted “the atrophy of political institutions associated with the nationalist challenge to colonial rule” (pvi). Thus to Joffe (1973:vi), the development agenda is “in large part a logical extension of the nationalist defiance of colonial rule.” Thus by re-directing the people’s fight from colonialism to the inanimate enemies of their welfare, Dr Banda had an effective hegemonic resource in the development agenda for entrenching himself and the Malawi Congress Party. The requisites of unity, loyalty, obedience, and discipline, worked in unison with the war metaphor winning for Dr Banda spontaneous consent as the ‘forces commander’ by which he wielded absolute authority over the Malawi polity. As Short (1974:278) observes:

[Banda] possessed supreme power, and used it to secure an ever-increasing degree of control over every aspect of Malawian life. Only thus, he believed, could the Malawi nation be developed.

**Reaping/Spreading Fruits of Development**

The second metaphor that dominated the Malawi civic culture of Dr Banda’s regime was the ‘fruits of independence’ metaphor, as exemplified in Text D below. Similarly, this metaphor tapped into the euphoria of the nationalist victory over colonialism, which in a sense was like a *rite de passage* to the privileges which were in the past the preserve of the colonial masters. Its application was ambivalent: it was either *spreading*, or *reaping* the ‘fruits of independence.’

**Text D**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mbalachanda forges ahead with its development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rural development in Malawi is a concept that the Government, under His Excellency the life President, Ngwazi Dr H. Kamuzu Banda, has successfully employed to bring the fruits of independence to every Malawian...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Mbalachanda forges ahead with its development 1980:10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Underlining mine)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The ‘fruits of independence’ metaphor was commonly used in attributing to Dr Banda the political deliverance and that everything that people achieved under his reign was a ‘fruit of independence’. Williams (1978) shows that after the cabinet crisis, Dr Banda used a combination of economic opportunity, politics and the law for effective control. In this regard, political positions were filled after Dr Banda’s thorough scrutiny. This created a system of political patronage. Williams (1978:232) shows that “it became common practice for members of Parliament making their maiden speeches to offer profuse thanks to the president for the honour he had done them when he appointed them to the Assembly.” It is also well documented that Dr Banda and those in political positions had easy access to means of production and other benefits while the rest of the people struggled on to make a living (Short 1974; Mtewa1986). In fact, Williams (1978:284) argues that:

The ease with which prominent party members are able to obtain loans from the government raises doubts about the extent to which schemes for the identification...
and support of master farmers or master fishermen can be divorced from considerations of patronage, but even if the people chosen for these schemes were selected entirely on merit as prospective farmers and managers, it would still be the case that a small number of people have received great benefits from the state while the great majority, who continue to use traditional methods, have gained very little…

I contend that the 'fruits of independence' such as political positions that opened up privileges that only few had access to were instrumental to Dr Banda and his Malawi Congress Party’s hegemonic agenda. Thus, while access to this ‘fruits of independence’ remained elusive to the majority, economic opportunity was a useful hegemonic resource among those that had the opportunity of access and those who aspired to access the opportunities through political positions. However, despite the hegemonic effectiveness of the operations of this metaphor, there is an unproductive side to it.

According to Mtewa (1986:65) “the personal disposition of Malawians to join government has invariably been more dependent on their desire to advance themselves economically than on a commitment to democratic ideals.” This perspective is a variant of the ‘fruits of independence’ metaphor that has it in the social imaginary that the state has wealth and all an individual has to do is gain access through political positions. This has been injurious to Malawi's innovative approach to socio-economic change and national productivity in general. The kind of political commitment that pre-occupied the politicians was exhortation of their constituents over the blessings and privileges that were conferred on them by their leader. Such shallow commitments were far from encouraging more sophisticated search for alternatives towards socio-economic change. Joffe (1973:549) asserts that “Undoubtedly local politicians under Banda's regime have frequently failed to show any remarkable initiative or enthusiasm for rural development.” Mtewa (1986:66) is incensed against this political practice “which diverts the attention of subordinates from matters of substantive economics or politics.” Thus the ‘fruit metaphor’ was in many ways counter productive. The local rendering of this metaphor was more revealing of the absence of sustainability in the socio-political outlook of the time: “Kudyelera ufulu wa Ngwazi”. Literally: “Revelling in the independence/liberty that the Ngwazi [praise title of the President as a hero in the fight against colonialists] has brought about.” Such an outlook did not speak of participation and planning for sustainability in development work. In this view, the Ngwazi would continue to provide, and those who had access to the ‘fruits’ would continue to enjoy the ‘fruits’, caring only to continue in the routines of displaying their loyalty to the Ngwazi and the party. As a result of this psyche, political speeches at all levels abounded with “ecstatic eulogies on the president's character, capacity, and achievements” (Williams 1978:232), ending up in wishes of long life for the Ngwazi, so that future generations would continue to enjoy the Ngwazi’s ‘fruits of independence’ as well. As an extension, this view consolidated the centralised top-down view of development planning and practice. Because development was Government’s responsibility, individual responsibility over built community capital in general has been gravely lacking. The common local sentiment is that whether amenities and infrastructure are destroyed or vandalised, there is no individual who will be offended; they belong to government and government will replace them. A local common saying that characterises such an impersonal and irresponsible psyche towards built community capital is “Ndi za boma.” Literally, “they belong to government.” This has also been counter-productive to socio-economic progress. Although these sentiments were hegemonically advantageous to Dr Banda and the Malawi Congress Party Government in that the citizenry were made dependent on the government, they did not encourage the innovation and reflexivity and individual responsibility that would benefit socio-economic change.

Based on this analysis of the two metaphors, I argue that the call to arms against ignorance, poverty, and disease did not find in the ‘fruits of independence’ metaphor a helpful complement. In fact, it is ironic that the bulk of the leadership that ought to have been encouraging the citizenry to seeking alternatives in the fight against the inanimate enemies, had itself settled to harvesting the ‘fruits’ that they had now accessed in place of the colonial masters. Joffe (1973:62) calls to our attention the fact that under Banda’s regime, the metaphor [war metaphor] had been maintained throughout the independence period more or less in its original liturgical form, and had not been clothed with more subtle or complex expressions or replaced by new imagery.
This was also true of the ‘fruit of independence metaphor.’ Joffe’s (1973) observation is indicative of a socio-political culture that, probably unwittingly, stifled the imagination, creativity and innovation that would have helped to contribute more profitably to socio-economic change in the vicissitudes of the underdeveloped economy.

**A Persuasive Strategy to (Agricultural) Development**

The nationalist government of Dr Banda adopted persuasion, or exhortation as a hegemonic resource which provided a clear point of departure from the colonial approach to (rural) development. It was common rhetoric in political circles and even in public communication to make:

> continual reference to the idea that the defeat of British colonialism in Malawi meant the end of coercion as a technique for producing the behaviour appropriate to good citizenship and its replacement by techniques of persuasion (Joffe 1973:516).

This can be exemplified in *Text E* below.

**Text E**

**IMPACT OF AGRICULTURE ON THE PEOPLE OF MALAWI**

...The Ngwazi noted that Malawi had made a success of her independence because his people had listened to his appeals for hard work in the fields and because agricultural officers had followed his instructions to go out and teach the people modern methods of farming. (Kamlomo 1986:2-4).

(Underlining and boldface mine)

This excerpt indicates that Dr Banda (the Ngwazi) had won people’s spontaneous consent, in the Gramscian sense, in that “his people had listened to his appeals for hard work in the fields” and “agricultural officers had followed his instructions to...teach the people.” The independence that is successful in this case is the positive response of the indigenous Malawians to engage in commercial agriculture – which they hated during the colonial period because of coercion. Kydd and Christiansen (1981:100) point out that “conservation measures had formed an important focus for African opposition to colonial rule and, as a consequence, the agricultural extension service emerged discredited from the political struggles of the later 1950’s.” The nationalist government continued to use this issue throughout Dr Banda’s reign to legitimise itself in the sight of the citizenry. To rehabilitate extension service of the nationalist government in the eyes of the rural population, the new Malawi government adopted an “energetic political campaign in favour of ’improved’ farming methods, based on persuasion rather than coercion” (Kydd and Christiansen 1981:101). Although this campaign won the support of the indigenous people to take to farming, “It is doubtful whether this activity succeeded in correcting the bias towards the richer peasant of the extension service (sic)” (Kydd and Christiansen 1981:101). This is ironic. A possible explanation lies in the political fervour/euphoria of the time that must have overshadowed other equally important issues, such as equity.

Linguistically, the prominence of Dr Banda as the prime participant in the text exemplifies the dominance of Dr Banda over all affairs in Malawi. This dominance is informative of authoritarian tendencies that dominated Malawi politics and social life in general throughout Dr Banda’s thirty year reign. For development to succeed “his people had listened to him” and agricultural officers, who were specialists in their fields “had followed his instructions...to teach the people”. An important point here is that although Dr Banda was capitalising on the euphoria associated with political freedom from colonial rule for hegemonic ends, the fact remains that exclusion of the citizenry from active participation in planning for socio-economic change and its implementation may have contributed to the paucity of innovative approaches to complex issues of socio-economic change in the Malawi polity among the leaders, as we have noted above. However, the subtlety of Dr Banda’s approach lay in his principle of explication which was the “idea of nationalist persuasion displacing colonial coercion” (Joffe 1973).
The idea that the politician's major responsibility was 'teaching' needs a brief explanation. Dr Banda established a range of political structures to “keep the people informed of government policy and to teach them what the regime required of them” (Joffe 1973:521). Joffe (1973) specifies three major ‘messages’ the politicians took to the citizenry. One of them consisted of liturgical reiteration of the central principles of the civic faith, that is, to uphold the four cornerstones of unity, loyalty, obedience and discipline. Another was admonishing people to perform specific political duties such as renewing party cards, paying taxes and to be vigilant against the rebels. A third, comprising specific advice and instruction in rural development work, is what Joffe (1973) calls didactic exhortation. Politicians' routine responsibilities included addressing constituents regularly on such things as: the need to prepare gardens in time for early planting; the benefits of fertilisers; the evils of excessive drink; the necessity to refrain from dancing malipenga when work in the field remained unfinished; the dangers of deforestation; men not to leave work of cultivation entirely to women; the importance of proper grading of harvested crops for the marketing board; the best techniques of storing the harvest. In relation to such responsibility, there was a flurry of political activity that followed seasonal patterns. Much of this activity overlapped with government agricultural extension work. However, civil servants were expected to deal with the technical side as specialists and practical agents of change, while the politicians were specialists in civic leadership. Thus the politician was sent out as the moral agent of the nationalist government. Thus, despite Dr Banda's intolerance to dissent and emphasis on absolute leadership, the rhetoric in the explication principle of the nationalist government superficially appeared to be more friendly to the citizenry than the colonialists' blunt coercion, thereby winning the consent of the citizenry. Development in its various conceptualisations was instrumental as a hegemonic resource, notwithstanding primary objectives of socio-economic change.

**Conclusion: Development and Oblique Hegemonic Rhetoric**

The largely rhetorical analysis of this chapter has demonstrated that in the main, the nationalist Malawi Government's development agenda provided space for oblique hegemonic rhetoric of the ruling classes. It has been shown also by a Gramscian reading of the socio-political context, particularly the 1964-65 cabinet crisis, and requisites within the development agenda, that Dr Banda and his Malawi Congress Party Government manipulated the new Malawi nation's quest for socio-economic change to consolidate his (authoritarian) political power. The resources for this hegemonic manipulation included the populist appeal in which discrediting the colonialists and dissidents carried on for a very long time in Dr Banda's thirty-year reign. This was mainly carried in the libertarian conceptualisation of development. The subtlety of the hegemonic rhetoric in the libertarian conceptualisation of development lay in attaching requisites of conformity to Dr Banda's traditional view of a leader (Short 1974). Linguistically, this was managed by transitivit which drew attention away from Dr Banda as the participant demanding conformity to his dictum.

The libertarian conceptualisation of development was further represented metaphorically within the new Malawi's civic faith. The analysis has shown how the metaphors nurtured a dependence psyche among the citizenry thereby legitimising the continuation of Dr Banda and his Malawi Congress Party Government. It has been shown also that this dependence psyche did not encourage innovative and reflexive approaches to socio-economic change among the leadership, let alone the villager. This paper also contends that this political culture did not include any notions of sustainability in the planning and implementation of socio-economic change and general outlook to life. The adoption of a persuasive strategy as opposed to coercion was a powerful hegemonic resource that fed the memory of the grievances against the colonialist while Dr Banda's intolerance to dissent was couched in the rhetoric of a libertarian conceptualisation of development. The analysis has also demonstrated that the operations of the explication principle gave the people an illusory sense of participation. All these worked towards winning the people's consent in the Gramscian sense. Thus the development agenda served a hegemonic end for Dr Banda and his Malawi Congress Party Government, albeit inexplicitly.
References


Department of Information (1968). *The President's Speech at the Opening of the Nkhotakota-Benga Road, 23rd July, 1968*. Blantyre: Department of Information.


A Critical Discourse Analysis of the Teaching and Learning of L1 in Malaysia®

Rosniah Mustaffa
Universiti Kebangsaan

Idris Aman
Universiti Kebangsaan

Abstract
Research on the teaching and learning process of the Malay language (L1) in the classroom usually focuses on the method, content, and teaching aids. Contrary to this phenomenon, this study views the process from the discourse analysis perspective called pedagogic discourse analysis. The discussion is based on several hours of teaching-learning case study conducted in a secondary school classroom, which emphasizes integrated curriculum, in an attempt to understand the unseen social processes, i.e. teacher dominance in discourse. This study reveals that teacher dominance is concealed in turn-taking system, types of questions posed by the teacher, discourse control and the overall structure of the discourse. These types of classroom discourse have their implications to the implementation of the National Education Philosophy, which lay emphasis on each student’s potential. In spite of this, the nature of learning process that takes place in the classroom hardly focused on students’ thinking skills. This is indeed contrary to the objectives of the teaching and learning of the Malay Language (L1) whereby the major emphasis of the Integrated Curriculum for Secondary School is student-centered, with thinking skills infused across the curriculum. In this respect, students should be given the opportunities to exercise their critical and creative potentials. For the analysis, this paper adapts Fairclough’s (1992; 1995) Critical Discourse Analysis framework.

Introduction
Classroom discourse refers to the type of language use (parole or performance) that is found in classroom situations. This student-teacher discourse is also referred to as pedagogic discourse, and it is different in form and function from language used in other situations due to the distinct social roles of students, teachers and the activities they are engaged in (Richards e. al. 1992: 52). Analysis of classroom discourse is useful when examining the effectiveness of teaching methods and the types of student-teacher interaction (Richards et. al. 1992: 111). According to Chouliaraki (1998: 10), textual features or pedagogic discourse contribute towards an understanding of the relation between pedagogy and its practice. An analysis of classroom discourse produced by Sinclair & Coulthard (1975) in Britain gains prominence as the Birmingham model; it was named after the university where both linguists were attached to. Their research attempts to examine the structure of classroom discourse (McCarthy 1991: 6 & 12).25

Classroom discourse seems to offer autonomy and opportunity to teaching and learning

25 They discovered the structure of classroom discourse is consisted of 5 descending units beginning with lesson, transaction, exchange, move and act. An upper unit is built upon a lower one, for instance a lesson is built upon several transactions, which in turn are the product of several exchanges.

The exchange unit is usually marked by an informative, imperative or enquiry where in every element a statement and request or command is made and a question asked, usually by the teacher.
interaction between student-teacher and student-student; on a superficial level it appears pedagogically to be a social process that is *par excellence*. Such classroom discourse makes possible situations in which learning becomes more fun, student participation is active and teaching-learning activities are effective. Moreover, such situations also allow teachers to fine-tune their speech according to students’ progress. Chouliaraki (1998), whose work is based upon the pedagogic theories of Barne & Todd (1977), Bruner (1983; 1986) and Barnes (1992), asserts that fine-tuning is essential in learning since it improves student-understanding.

However, classroom discourse is usually analysed and understood in a transparent context, namely as the collective space where an individual interacts, discussing knowledge in a specific subject or matters that are “out there” (Chouliaraki 1998: 7), similar to the works of Sinclair & Coulthard (1975). The social process and practice taking place in classroom discourse seldom become the focus of analysis. Hence, contrary to this phenomenon I posit that in the context of this study two social practices, namely power and control, are embedded in or hidden within a classroom discourse based upon an integrative curriculum. Many speakers, especially teachers, are unaware of this notion. In other words, classroom discourse is dominated by teachers by virtue of their teaching status. This issue reflects Chouliaraki’s view (1998: 7) that emphasises the school as a substitute for or rather medium for social power reproductions, namely class, gender and race. In the context of this study, the three identified concepts also implicate social status. As such, classroom discourse basically lacks the ability to achieve the pedagogic aims of an integrative curriculum. This is due to classroom discourse having primarily interactive functions that marginalise knowledge inputs or thinking abilities. Besides, in such classroom discourse the priority is on teacher teaching that allows collectively minimal student involvement as compared to their intellectual needs. This kind of discourse is not beneficial to students and having this awareness can initiate improvements.

To expound the above idea, this paper begins by explaining the concept of classroom discourse in the context of an integrative curriculum, primarily in the teaching and learning of Bahasa Melayu. Examples of as well as discussions on analysis findings follow the explanations on the theoretical concept applied to the understanding and clarification of the issue at hand, namely the critical discourse analysis as proposed by Norman Fairclough.

**Concept of Classroom Discourse in Integrative Curriculum Context**

The integrative curriculum of the Malaysian education system (in both primary and secondary levels) is implemented to improve the quality of education by putting emphasis on holistic and integrative individual potentials. It is the objective of this curriculum that students’ intellectual, spiritual, emotional and physical potentials are developed so as to produce well-balanced individuals who can, not only adapt themselves in, but also contribute towards a harmonious and prosperous society and country (see Shahril@Charil & Habib 1999: 83). To achieve this philosophical objective, planning for Bahasa Melayu education in the contexts of this integrative curriculum, is motivated by the following needs: improving of language skills for effective communication; improving as well as expanding of the proficiency and practice of Bahasa Melayu as the country’s official language; developing and enhancing of intellectual as well as rational, critical and creative thinking; procuring of knowledge and developing as well as applying these skills in daily lives; possessing self-confidence that can contribute towards self and society (see Shahril@Charil & Habib 1999; Mok Soon sang 1996). In view of contemporary developments and challenges, for instance the current surge of information, rapid progress of science and technology as well as the

---

26 Critical discourse analysis, popularly abbreviated to CDA
27 The New Curriculum for Primary Schools was first implemented in 1983 and was revised in 1988 as the Integrative Curriculum for Primary Schools (KBSR). Integrative Curriculum for Secondary Schools (KBSM) was implemented on 1989 (see Mok Soon Sang, 1996: 147-8).
effects of globalisation, the Malaysian Education Ministry has been hard pressed to review the Bahasa Melayu subject within the KBSR and KBSM. As a result of revisions, adaptations are made to the aims of the syllabus, namely to produce individuals who are literate in Information and Communicative Technology, capable of exploring new knowledge and possessing the ability to communicate effectively in multiple socio-cultural conditions (Zahirah Aziz 2001: 12).

In this context, the concept of classroom discourse in the integrative curriculum Bahasa Melayu subject deals with discourse that emphasises student-centred teaching and learning or in other words, students play active roles in varieties of activities. This means teachers are encouraged to plan numerous activities and teaching aids suitable for student ability and interest (Shahril@Charil & Habib 1999: 72-73).

While executing a Bahasa Melayu lesson, a crucial component for teacher to give emphasis to is thinking skills; this is in addition to the incorporation of the skills of other core subjects literary elements, readings and also the concept of Bahasa Melayu across disciplines. To achieve high level thinking skills, teaching and learning activities need to stimulate students into thinking and discussing logically, rationally and objectively (Malaysian Ministry of Education 1992: 6). In short, the form of classroom discourse to be utilised so as to achieve the above objectives is one that is student-centred or one in which each student takes part actively in the teaching and learning. In such a context, a teacher becomes a facilitator, counsellor, manager, planner, guide, evaluator and helps mould students’ personality. Teachers need to plan their teaching and learning materials carefully in order to provide students with opportunities to enhance their analytical and logical skills, besides the abilities to reason, summarise and produce sound and effective ideas for speech and writing. Teachers need to be aware that students are not empty vessels; they instead possess abilities and talents that await discovery and perceptive nurturing by their teachers (Malaysian Ministry of Education 1992: 17-19).

To achieve those objectives, Zahirah Aziz (2000: 9) lists three language skills listed in the Bahasa Melayu syllabus which teachers can utilise to direct their teaching and learning activities towards improving students’ proficiency in critical and creative thinking skills. The skills are namely:

- a) discussing critically and analytically on the comprehensive meanings of the various materials as well as solve problems
- b) reading, evaluating and reviewing critically and analytically facts, ideas as well as human, social and cultural values in various prose and poetry
- c) producing reviews and criticisms of prose and poetry

Hence, classroom discourse practice in the integrative curriculum context needs to be heterogeneous or, in other words, be varied in nature.

Critical Discourse Analysis as Theoretical Framework to Examine Classroom Discourse

Critical discourse analysis (CDA) provides the theoretical framework for this study. In this theory, analysis of discourse is not merely transparent\(^{28}\); it is instead a perceptive and committed approach that includes examining the web of social processes implicated in the discourse. According to Fairclough & Wodak (1997: 258), “CDA sees itself not as dispassionate and objective social science, but as engage and committed”. In other words, the theory considers discourse as a social process. Language, or discourse, which is inclusive of its own as well as representational nature, is an aspect of social process (Chouliaraki 2000: 297).

Accepting discourse as a social practice means having to reveal the covert nature of social process embedded in discourse. Discourse is not merely a linguistic category or...
communicative medium; it is mediation between social structure and process cultural practice (Fairclough & Wodak 1997: 277). As a social process, discourse is linked intricately to the socio-cultural context from which it operates. It is neither produced, nor can it function, in a vacuum. It is instead contextual discourse, one which is embedded with social and institutional systems of ideology.

Social practice refers to actual acts of human activity, utterances or writing. Orientations of social practice include economical, political, cultural and ideological (Fairclough 1992: 66). Nonetheless, many speakers are unaware of such practices and analyzers may have problems identifying them (Hodge & Kress 1993: 210). This theory proposes that a close and systematic analysis of discourse can reveal the nature of social practice in discourse. Critical discourse analysis examines the social practices of individuals or institutions that involve concerns such as the use and abuse of power, hegemony, ideological operations, social change as well as conflict, domination, race and leadership (see Wodak (1996), van Dijk (1991), Idris Aman (2001) and Fairclough (1992)).

Critical discourse analysis and its practitioners can contribute towards enriching or transforming discourse practice patterns and unhealthy or negative social processes that have been identified. For instance, when the identified and analysed patterns and features of pedagogic discourse reflect dialectic association with undeveloped or ineffective education29 process, analysts are in fact bringing this finding to the attention of society, specifically those implicated in education. As such, improvements or adjustments to the discourse can be conducted by those concerned, while policy makers may, for example, adapt teacher training curriculum. Clearly, critical discourse analysis is a form of social practice too (see Fairclough & Wodak 1997: 279).

This next section discusses the theoretical underpinnings of Norman Fairclough's critical discourse analysis; his systemic approach to and method in analysis are reasons for its application in this study. Fairclough's descriptions of textual features and definitions of the processes in discourse practice are more comprehensive than other scholars30, making his the leading theory in the analysis of social processes in discourse.

Fairclough (1992: 63-64; 1995a: 131-132; Fairclough & Wodak 1997: 258) deems it important to accept discourse as a social process because (a) discourse reflects an action, in which the way a man acts or reacts towards the world, and especially each other, may be a form of representation, (b) there is a dialectic relationship between discourse and social structure, in which social structure determines and creates social process. On the one hand, discourse is not only produced by social structures (for instance, class and social relationships in society or institution), it also produces them; on the other, discourse also contributes to shape, just as it is also shaped by, dimensions within social structures (such as social relationship, identity etc.). In short, when analysing discourse social factors that are embedded within it as well as determine its own production need to be taken into account; the analysis should not merely concentrate on studying structural or behavioural linguistics as is the norm in pragmatics.

Discourse simultaneously constructs (i) social identity of a subject, namely social position, and character type; (ii) social relationship between people; and (iii) knowledge systems and beliefs, in various degrees of importance depending on situations. The description, interpretation and explanation of discourse as a social process also require language theories that emphasise on the multi-purpose nature of language. The three simultaneous constructs mentioned are intricately linked to four language functions, namely identity, relationship, ideational and textual. Identity functions are related the ways social identities are constructed by discourse. Relationship functions refer to the manner in which social relationships between participants is negotiated. Ideational functions concern the ways texts reflect not only the world but also its processes, entities and connections. Textual functions, on the other hand, refer to linguistic

---

29 Education is a social process too.
30 There are other discourse analysts who have proposed other theoretical frameworks in critical discourse analysis with different approaches to and methods for analysis, namely van Dijk, Wodak, Billig etc.
information and social situations that are outside of the text (Fairclough 1992: 65).  

The underlying principles in Fairclough’s critical discourses analysis theory are its descriptive, interpretative and explanatory approaches towards discourse; they are not just based upon linguistics but links are also simultaneously made to relevant social thinking orientations (Fairclough 1992: 62). Based upon these principles, Fairclough produces a three-dimensional approach to discourse analysis: namely text analysis, discourse practice analysis and social process analysis. He claims his theoretical analysis include three comprehensive ways to read the complex social conditions embedded in discourse which primarily requires interdisciplinary, or at the very least transdisciplinary, skills (Fairclough 1997: 1).

Textual analysis is a process whereby the forms and meanings of textual discourse are described. Textual form and meaning are interconnected to ideational, interpersonal and textual discourse functions. Textual features that are explicated include textual, clausal grammar and lexical structures. In relation to the objectives and nature of the discourse analysed in this study, explanations are focused on textual structures. In terms of dialogue discourse, textual structure analysis involves a description of interaction control, namely who controls the interaction, turn-taking and structure of change in discourse. A reading of these aspects can provide insights into the knowledge system, beliefs, values or perceptions regarding social relationships and identities that are embedded in discourse (Fairclough 1992: 75-78, 234-237; 1995a: 133-134).

Discourse practice analysis, on the other hand, aims at interpreting the processes of discourse production at the micro level. The interpretation may examine discourse production – on whether it has been conventional or creative, producers of the discourse, the distribution and use of discourse as well as the presence of elements such as interdiscursivity of genre and intertextuality (Fairclough 1992: 65, 134).

Meanwhile, social process analysis is concerned with revealing the social issues and practices that are embedded in discourse through its dialectic relationship with the nature of texts and discourse practices, as previously discussed. In short, such analysis aims at revealing the reasons why an addresser produces a particular discourse (Fairclough 1992: 226, 228).

**Discourse Data**

The discourse used as samples in this paper is part of the data collected through case and preliminary studies on 10 classroom discourses (or 10 texts) on the Malay Language subject collected from a secondary school in Selangor Darul Ehsan.  

Discourse was collected through direct audio recording while the teacher was teaching in the classroom. Recordings were transcribed into texts. To simplify the analysis, each utterance is given a number according to clauses. On the whole, the discourse implicates 5 graduate teachers (1 male and 4 female) with at least 5 years of teaching experience. The students involved were the KBSM forms one and two students, male and female, in the 13-14 age category,  

---

31 Basically, Fairclough’s discourse/language functions share similar features with Halliday’s language functions (1978; 1985), namely textual, interpersonal and ideational. Fairclough separates interpersonal functions into two, identity and relationship even though in his writings he usually draws upon Halliday’s three language functions.


33 The writers believe this number (10) is adequate for case and preliminary studies since for the purpose of critical discourse analysis specifically, it is the discourse that is of concern. Fairclough (1995a) only analysed three texts on university advertisements in his discussion on ‘Marketization of public discourse’.

34 It has to be stressed here that the elaborations in this study and paper are not references to any individual specifically, but they are to be regarded as institutional discourse.
Integrative Curriculum for the Malay Language Subject
Classroom Discourse and Teacher Domination

The social practice embedded in classroom discourse, which the speakers may not be aware of (and that include many of us), that is the concern here is teacher domination. Teacher domination, as used in the context of this study, refers to the more prominent teacher role and action in a classroom teaching and learning process than those of the main targets or subjects – i.e. the students. Such pedagogical practice can be illustrated by its dialectical relationship with several textual elements and relevant classroom discourse practices. The following are qualitative illustrations on the ways teacher domination take place in teacher-student discourse. Discussions begin with textual analysis, followed by those on discourse practice.

Classroom Discourse Textual Analysis

The focus of this classroom discourse textual analysis is on features of teacher-student interaction. Generally, interactive control in discourse is concerned with ensuring that interaction takes place effectively at specific levels of organisation, for example systems of smooth distribution in turn-taking, topic selection and exchange as well as question-answering (Fairclough 1992: 139). In the classroom discourse analysed, findings reveal specific interactive structures dominated by teachers. Such teacher practice is reflected in the following textual features, namely (a) domination in turn-taking, (b) topic control, (c) closed-questions usage, (d) modelled-answer extraction, and (e) teacher interruption of student-answers.

(a) Domination in Turn-Taking

Domination in turn-taking means the system is not necessarily based upon the equal rights and obligation of all speakers in discourse. This dominating phenomena in turn-taking is normally found in institutions that involve the professional, the ‘insider’, or ‘gatekeeper’ interacting with the ‘public’, ‘client’, ‘outsider’ or student (Fairclough 1992: 153).

Domination in turn-taking is obvious in the classroom discourse analysed. It happened when most interactions were initiated by the teacher, either through extraction, instruction or information by way of questions, statements or requests. A teacher-initiated utterance received response from the student, and was followed by an acceptance or acknowledgement by the teacher. In other words, the teacher-student interaction was organised according to the teacher-initiated ‘move’ (using Sinclair & Coulthard’s concepts), followed by student response/reaction and teacher acceptance. Thus, the interactive movement of this classroom discourse can be structured into 3 parts, Teacher initial-move – Student response – Teacher acceptance (explicit or implicit), or alternatively T-S-T. This structure is reflected in example (1).

…………………………………………………………………………

T (teacher) : [061]  O.K. berapakah jumlah pekerja pada tahun 1985?
(O.K. What is the total number of workers in 1985?)
S (student) : [062] (Buzzing-tak jelas)
(Buzzing – unclear)
(O.K. 5 million 6 hundred people, meanwhile in 1990, 1990, aa)
S : [064] juta 500 ribu
(million 500 thousand.)
…………………………………………………………………………………

T : [065]  Jadi, adakah berkurang atau meningkat?
(So, is there an increase or decrease?)
S : [066] Meningkat
(Increase.)
T : [067] Meningkat
(Increase.)
…………………………………………………………………………………
The example above has five exchanges (each marked with dotted lines). Move in each exchange is initiated by the teacher, followed by response from the student and then acknowledgement/comment from the teacher. For example, in the first exchange, teacher began move by asking a question in [061], and this was followed by student's move [062] as response to teacher's question, even though in the form of buzzing. In [063], teacher made acknowledgement move by re-emphasising the answer given by the student in the previous move. A similar pattern was repeated in other exchanges. In exchange three, teacher began move by extracting answer from student with a request (068), and not by questioning.

Such interaction structure leads to teacher control of the basic organisation of interaction by opening as well as closing every move and accepting student response/answer. This reflects the existence of control or domination in turn-taking, whereby the student seldom has or even has no chance at all of getting a turn to speak unless given by the teacher through the given questions or requests. Though in one aspect, this turn-taking system is one method of controlling the flow of discourse, but in another, is unfortunately reflects teacher domination in discourse.

(b) Topic Control

Topic control means the main participant – in this case, the teacher – usually controls topics in discourse, interaction or move. In other words, change to a new topic is made by the main participant.

In the classroom discourse analysed, this textual feature is identified. Topic control takes place when a new topic is proposed as a result of teacher question or statement, teacher disregard for student response/answer and also teacher selection in accepting student response. These phenomena are reflected in the following examples.
T : [164] Sektor mana yang nampak sangat meningkat di situ? (Which sector seems to be on the increase there?)
S : [165] Perkilangan. (Manufacturing.)
T : [166] Sektor per- (Which sector? Manu-?)
S : [167] kilangan (facturing)

T : [168] Kenapa agaknya sector perkilangan makin meningkat? (Why do you think the manufacturing sector is on the increase?)
S : [169] Aa..kerna (tak jelas-buzzing) (Aa.. because (unclear – buzzing)).
T : [170] Aa, negara kita menuju ke arah negara perindus- (Aa, our country is becoming indus-
S : [171] trian (–trial)
: [172] (Tak jelas) (Unclear)
T : [173] Banyak, contohnya kilang-kilang banyak dibuka, kan? (Many, for example many factories have been built, right?)

T : [174] Di Bandar Baru Bangi ini saja, ada berapa buah kilang, siapa tahu? (In Bandar Baru Bangi, how many factories are there, anybody knows?)
S : [175] 10 kot (Maybe 10.)
T : [176] 10! (10!)
S : [177] Lebih (More.)
T : [178] Lebih daripada itu (More than that.)

(Text 4)

In (2), which had three exchanges, the teacher determined the topic in every exchange. All three topics were decided through the questions in the teacher’s initial moves, namely [164], [168] and [174]. In the first exchange, the topic concerned occupational sector that was on the increase. In the second, it was concerning the reasons for the increase of manufacturing sector and in the third exchange was on the number of factories in Bandar Baru Bangi.

Teacher disregard for student response can also be detected in (3) below. The student provided response [186] by completing teacher statement [185], but that response was disregarded by the teacher when the teacher instead gave a set answer followed by a tag question [187]. The student was undeterred and continued giving responses, [188] to [191], i.e. three times, including making repeated interruptions marked by vertical lines in the data) as in [188]. The actions were disregarded by the teacher.35

(3) ……………………………………………………………………………………

T : [183] O.K. Mungkin jalan raya itu jalan raya apa? (O.K. maybe it's the road, the road is -)

35 For interaction interruption or turn-taking, refer (3)
(c) Close-Question Usage

A prominent textual feature identified in this pedagogic discourse is the use of close-question by the teacher. Close-questions are question that use question-words, such as ‘right/yes-no’, ‘is there’, ‘where to’, ‘who’ or ‘what’, which merely require straight answers or just confirmation. They do not require answers that provide opinions or the type of answers that require thinking. The use of open-questions that begin with question-words such as ‘why’, ‘how’ or explain are limited. The following examples show the use of close-question in the analysed discourse.

(4) ………………………………………………………………………………………

T : [210] O.K. Selain SPBT apa?
   ( O.K. what else besides SPBT?)
S : [211] Biasiswa.
   ( Scholarship.)
T : [212] Biasiswa, betul?
   ( Scholarship, right?)
S : [213] Betul.
   ( Right.)
T : [214] Biasiswa untuk orang-orang yang berkelayakan sahaja
   ( Scholarships are only for the deserving.)

……………………………………………………………………………………

T : [215] Kemudian, rayuan apa, sekarang ni,kamu nak adakan kem atau
   pun kita nak bina surau?
   ( Then, what kind of appeal, now, you want to have a camp or
   do we build a surau?)
S : [216] ( Buzzing- tak jelas)
In the discourse analysed, even though open-questions were also utilised, there were instances when the teacher answered the question himself. The teacher did not provide time for the student to think and offer their own opinion.

(5) ……………………………………………………………………………………

T                       : [172] Saya nampak acara Hari Guru ini, ramai yang terlibat ialah pelajar- pelajar.  
                        (I noticed in this Teachers' Day event, there are many students involved.)
                        [173] Betul tak?  
                        (Is that right?)
S  : [174] Betul  
     (Right.)
T  : [175] Cikgu buat kerja…  
     (Teachers do some work…(unclear).)
                        [176] Cikgu buat dek.  
     (Teachers made the deck.)
S  : [177] Betul,betul  
     (Right, right.)
……………………………………………………………………………………

T  : [178] Ada poin lagi?  
     (Any more points?)

(Text 1)

In (5), use of close-question is in [173], namely Is that right? It was used by the teacher merely to inform the students of an important point that was to be stated in that move
early in [172]. Thus, the question Is that right? only functions as confirmation request for
the student, as clearly seen in the student response [174], i.e. Right. Utilisation of such
questions merely shows interaction taking place without the application of thinking skills.

By asking close-questions, the teacher does not provide opportunity for students to
speak more or express their opinions. This is because the teacher has limited the
expected student response/answer to just one word or a couple more. Such situations
mean the teacher takes the floor or controls the discourse.

(d) Designed Answer Extraction

(6) ……………………………………………………………………………………
T : [125] Negara kita masih negara pertanian, faham?.
(Our country is still an agricultural country, understand?)
[126] Itu sebab, pertanian lebih tinggi, faham?
(That is reason why agriculture is higher, understand?)
[127] Baruah sekarang negara kita maju dalam bidang perindus-
(Only now, our country is developed in terms of ind-)
S : [128] - trian
(-dustry).
……………………………………………………………………………………
T : [129] Negara kita terkenal dengan apa?
(Our country is famous for?)
S : [130] (tak jelas)
(Unclear)
T : [131] Pengeluar kelapa sawit, dan juga..
(Producer of palm, and also..)
S : [132] getah
(rubber)
T : [133] Getah
(Rubber.)
……………………………………………………………………………………
(Text 4)

(7) ……………………………………………………………………………………
T : [090] Pengeboman apa?
(What was bombed?)
S : [091] WTC
(WTC.)
T : [092] Aa, WTC di New York
(Aa, WTC in New York.)
……………………………………………………………………………………
: [093] Jadi,aa,mereka ,aa pelancong-pelancong takut untuk menaiki
kapal,
( So, aa, they, aa, tourists are afraid to fly on the air, )
S : [094] terbang
(plane,)
T : [095] terbang
(plane).
[096] Takut kapal terbang diram-
(The fear planes will be hij-) 
S : [097] -pas.
(-jacked)
T : [098] -pas
(-jacked)
[099] Aa, itu sebabnya
In (6), the extraction of student response according to teacher design can be detected in teacher discourse [127] and [131]. In [127], students were only requested to provide as response the last two syllables for the word 'industry'; in [127] the teacher had already provided as guide for the student the set answer or the intended word. In (7), this feature can be identified in move two, i.e. in [093] and [096].

(e) Teacher Interruption of Student-Answers

Interruption of student answer is another textual element which dialectically reflects teacher domination during the teacher’s performance of his/her pedagogic duties. In such instances, the teacher interrupted and showed impatience for the student to stop speaking or give response to the question or statement extraction. Interruption came in the form of the teacher’s own answer to the question posed. In other words, the teacher did not provide time for the student to complete his turn to speak. Such textual features mean the teacher has denied opportunity for the student to be active and effective in the discourse.

(8). ……………………………………………………………………………………
T : [308]  Baik, sebagai penutup, penutup apa nak tulis?
   (Right, as conclusion, what do you write as conclusion?)
S : [309]  (Buzzing)
   (Buzzing)
   [310]  Ingatkan pemandu (tak jelas)
   (Remind drivers (unclear))
T : [311]  Awak boleh kata sebagai penutup, banyak, O.K. banyak kemalangan jalan raya berlaku di Malaysia pada setiap tahun dan ini memerlukan langkah-langkah apa,
   (You can say as conclusion, many, O.K. many road accidents happen in Malaysia every year and what kind of measures are required, )
S : [312]  Langkah-langkah keselamatan
   (Safety measures.)
T : [313]  Langkah-langkah keselamatan dari semua pihak ya, termasuk pengguna jalan raya itu sendiri dan siapa,
   (Safety measures from all those concerned, yes, including road users and who, )
   : [314]  Pihak, 
   (which body,)
S : [315]  berkuasa
   (government.)
T : [316]  Pihak berkuasa atau pihak kerajaan, ya tak.
   (Governing body or the government, right,)
   : [317]  Maksudnya, pengguna jalan raya itu perlu berhati-hati di jalan raya, mematuhi peraturan-peraturan di jalan raya, O.K.
   (This means road users have to be cautious on the road, follow all the traffic rules, O.K?)
……………………………………………………………………………………

(Text 3)

(9). ……………………………………………………………………………………
T : [049]  Apa tajuk jadual yang diberi?
   (What title is given to the chart?)
S : [050]  Kemalangan jalan raya ..(buzzing/tak jelas)
   Road accidents ..(buzzing, unclear).
T : [051]  O.K. jadual menunjukkan jumlah
Kemalangan yang berlaku pada tahun 2000 di Malaysia.
( O.K. the chart shows the total number of accidents in 2000 in Malaysia.)

………………………………………………………………………………………………………
: [052] Ini adalah satu isi, ter
(This is one point, ..)

(Text 3)

Examples of interruption shown in (8) and (9) are marked by vertical lines. In (8), teacher interruption occurred in [311], where the teacher did not acknowledge student response and instead proceeded to produce an alternative answer. In (9), this feature is identified in [051]; the teacher was too impatient to wait for students to complete their group response and interrupted them by providing the answer.

The textual features discussed above indicate the manifestation of teacher domination in the classroom discourse analysed. The following section examines teacher domination from a discourse practice perspective.

Classroom Discourse Practice

Discourse practice analysis involves a macro-level interpretation of, not only the production of discourse, but also its producers (Fairclough 1992: 65, 134). Analysis reveals the pedagogic discourse examined in this study has been produced conventionally, in which conventional practice indicates the act of production has centred on the teacher, and not student. A teacher-centred practice reflects, among others, a more dominant teacher-role as compared to student, interrupted-responses and the approach to question-making by teacher.

The following sections discuss the aforementioned practices identified in this study.

a) Teacher-answered question / Teaching Answering Own Question

In this situation, teacher answers own question rather than allowing student to answer. This practice is identified in (10) and (11). In (10), the teacher provided questions in [143] and [144] but proceeded to answer them himself/herself in [145]. Teacher-question in [146] was again self-answered in [147]. In (11), teacher-question in [294] was self-answered in [295]. Student responses in [296] and [297] were repeated ignored by the teacher before proceeding to the next move.

10. ………………………………………………………………………………………

T  : [143] Dalam ucapan itu, apa lagi ada?
(What else is there in that speech?)
[144] Ucapan siapa?
(Whose speech?)
[145] Ucapan..Kadang-kadang Pengetua.
(Speech...sometimes by the Principal.)
[146] Kadang-kadang cikgu lain membaca ucapan oleh siapa?
(Sometimes other teachers will read whose speech text?)
(The Minister of Education.)
[147] Lagi satu ucapan Pengarah Pendidikan.
(Another speech, the Director of Education.)
[148] Betul tak?
(Is that right?)

36 The group response is produced due to the nature of the teacher’s questioning; the teacher opened the question to the whole class instead of identifying individual students to answer. This phenomenon is discussed in 5.2. Individuality in pedagogic discourse has its own benefits; Chouliaraki (1998) had addressed this issue.
b) Limited Student Involvement

Another feature of a teacher-centred discourse practice is limited student involvement during interaction in classroom discourse production; this phenomenon results in teacher domination. In this study, the limited involvement of student was triggered by the way the teacher conducted the discourse in the classroom, namely by giving little or no chance at all for the student to be active by offering opinions, asking questions or discussing in groups. Instead, student participation was only limited to answering teacher questions (many of which were close questions, as previously discussed) or confirming teacher’s statement. The T-S-T turn-taking system which benefits the teacher (as discussed previously) is a practice that limits student participation.

12……………………………………………………………………………………

T : [35] Baik, dekat sini cuba kamu tengok. (Right, over here, check and see.)
[36] Yang pertama, tujuan dia, dia nak cerita fasal kematian sepupu dia. (The first, his reason, he wants to inform the death of his cousin.)
[37] Yang kedua, dia pergi kepada penerangan, bagaimana kejadian itu berlaku.

(c) Prominent Teacher Role

In contrast to the above discussion (b), the discourse analysed in this study reflects prominently the teacher’s role and teaching profession. For example, this practice happens when the teacher prefers to offer explanations, descriptions or answers to students rather than allow them to discuss, analyse or summarise in order to seek for their own answers. In other words, the teacher speaks more than the student. Discourse is, thus, centred on the teacher. This practice can be detected in (12).
(Secondly, he proceeds to the description, how the accident happened.)

[38] Jadi, kalau kamu tulis surat, yang pertama tujuan kamu tulis surat
(So, if you write a letter, firstly, you a reason for writing.)

Secondly, you proceed to your second point, other issues related to the previous one.)

[40] Selalunya dalam surat kiriman ke, apa-apa, kita akan letakkan isi, yang pertama isi penting.
(Usually in letter writing, we put the main point as the first)

[41] Yang kedua isi yang kurang penting.
(The second point is one that is less important.)

[42] Lepas itu sampailah kepada isi yang paling kurang penting lagi.
(Then you can have four other points that are of lesser importance.)

[43] Yang last sekali ialah...(gangguan-murid lain masuk).
(The last one is….(disturbance – a student enters).)

(You see, in this passage he provides details with descriptions.)

T : [45] Kalau kemalangan, dia akan nyatakan apa benda?
(If it’s an accident, what details will he give?)

[46] Aa, Khairuddin, bila kita cerita tentang kemalangan, apa yang kita nyatakan?
(Aa, Khairuddin, when we talk about an accident, what do we include for details?)

S : [47] Kesedihan?
(Sadness?)

T : [48] Ha, kesedihan!
(Ha, sadness!)

(Text 2)

In (12), it is obvious utterances in the discourse are teacher-centred. The teacher played a central role in this move by providing the explanations and not, for instance, asking students to examine the text and seek their own answers. In this scenario, the teacher’s role has more prominence.

The above discussions and explanations reflect the features of teacher domination in relation to discourse practice as found in the classroom discourse analysed in this study. Generally, this aspect is also interconnected to textual elements.

Conclusion

Based on the aforementioned discussion on textual features and discourse practice, it can be concluded that the classroom discourse analysed in this study is embedded with teacher domination practice. Teacher domination means the teacher controlling not only the discourse but also the students. As a result of this control, the role of the student as the main target of education process seems to be relegated, and instead it is the teacher who plays central role.

Such pedagogic discourse is not reflective of the concerns in the integrative curriculum education system. The teaching of the Malay Language subject in the integrative curriculum demands the incorporation of thinking skills among students. To acquire thinking skills that incorporate logic, rationality, analytical skills and objectivity, classroom teaching and learning activities have to be geared to encourage students towards those
ends. In other words, a pedagogic discourse that is suitably practiced is one that has to be student-centred, and every student needs to be actively and effectively involved in the teaching and learning process. Among the practices that should be utilised are making students offer their opinions, summarise, analyse, reason as well as suggest ideas through speaking and writing. The teacher/educator must be sensitive to students – they are not dense. Students have skills and talents that need to be recognised and polished by their teachers (The Ministry of Education 1992: 17-19). The discussions on the negative practices found to be embedded in this example of classroom discourse have good intentions and should be regarded as a contribution from the linguistics discipline towards the teaching of Bahasa Melayu.

References


Tasmanian urban kindergarten teachers’ perceptions of the purpose of kindergarten: investigating the learning program offered in both full-day and half-day sessions

Kim Nankervis
University of Tasmania

Abstract
This paper reports on a study which investigated Kindergarten teachers’ perceptions of the purpose and values of Kindergarten education in relation to the learning program offered in urban Kindergartens throughout Tasmania. A further aspect of the study was concerned with comparisons between the learning programs offered to children in half-day and full-day Kindergartens in urban Tasmanian schools. Additionally, Kindergarten teachers’ perceptions regarding the level of autonomy they possess over the learning program delivered in urban Kindergartens was explored. The study’s population comprised 55 urban Kindergarten teachers from government schools in Tasmania. Results from this study firstly indicated that urban Kindergarten teachers held similar views regarding the values and purposes of Kindergarten education as well as autonomy over planning decisions. However, a lack of congruence was evident between teachers’ philosophies and the actual learning programs they provided in their Kindergartens. Teachers held strong beliefs in relation to values and purposes of Kindergarten education, however, statistically significant differences were apparent between teachers who had more experience teaching Kindergarten, in relation to their commitment to a play-based curriculum, than their less experienced peers. Noticeable differences between half-day and full-day Kindergarten programs were also revealed, with half-day Kindergarten teachers devoting more time to a formalised approach, whilst full-day Kindergarten teachers planned for more breaks/rest times within their learning program. It was further revealed that children’s needs were not necessarily the determining factor in deciding the type of Kindergarten attendance mode offered in schools. Additionally, over 80% of teachers would prefer to teach half-day Kindergarten, believing it to be the most appropriate means, educationally and developmentally, for young children.

Introduction
A child’s first year at school, in Kindergarten, lays the foundations for future education. Arthur, Beecher, Dockett, Farmer and Richards (1993) believe that this first year has powerful effects on children for their entire lives. Because of this significance, teachers must be well informed when developing their learning program. Teachers must understand what should be learned in their Kindergarten and how it is best learned. The Kindergarten program should be guided by these questions and, in the words of Arthur et al. (1993), a program needs to be shaped to fit the child, to be “…developmentally and individually appropriate” (p. 55). Kindergarten programs are a contentious issue, with differences of opinion in the types of program offered and their effectiveness in the classroom.

In Tasmania children are aged four and five during their Kindergarten year, and can attend either full-day or half-day sessions. The attendance mode of Kindergarten is defined by the maximum hours children spend at school on any one day. In Tasmania, half-day attendees go to Kindergarten for three or four days each week, with sessions varying from two to four hours each, with a total weekly attendance of between 10-12 hours. Conversely the full-day attendance mode sees children attend Kindergarten for two entire school days (9am-3pm) weekly, with a maximum of 12 hours each week.

It is evident that over the past decade, Tasmanian state schools are offering more full-day sessions of Kindergarten than ever before. This is confirmed in Tasmanian based
research by Boardman (2004), who stated full-day Kindergarten in rural areas has been the ‘norm’ but now these sessions are becoming more prevalent in urban areas. Further, Boardman (2003) found that non-educational issues were responsible for instigating much of this change. However, the question arises as to whether changing the mode of attendance for Kindergarten children has implications for the learning programs provided.

It was seen as important to ascertain if the change of attendance for urban Tasmanian Kindergarten children has had implications for the learning programs offered, as is evident in full-day Kindergartens in the United States of America (Elicker & Mathur, 1997). This indeed was instrumental in the development of this study. By ascertaining the actual purpose of Kindergarten, as envisaged by Kindergarten teachers, along with values they considered important for the educational and developmental needs of young children, one could question if due consideration is given to each, when developing learning programs in these now more prevalent full-day Kindergarten settings.

Clark and Kirk (2000), citing Gullo (1990) see the implications of full-day Kindergarten sessions not with how long children attend school, but rather concern their experiences in relation to their holistic development. Understanding how children develop and learn could be described as teachers’ major responsibility. Catron and Allen (2003) believe that by having knowledge and an understanding of child development, teachers of young children can decide on the educational purpose of Kindergarten, whereby developing their own personal philosophy to effectively plan programs to match children’s needs.

If the philosophy behind Kindergarten is to recognise child development, whilst attempting to lay foundations for a continuing education process, then the nature of learning programs are of great importance. Kelly (2004) also saw benefits of further research into the nature of Kindergarten programs, as he believed the pressures of academic performance being applied to Kindergarten programs are of real concern (p. 49). This change has at times been made without considering the needs of four and five year old children (Kelly, 2004). A crucial question therefore, is whether or not children, who attend either half-day or full-day Kindergarten, should experience a learning program that is governed by societal pressures, or by the educational needs of the children being taught. Boardman (2004) and Kelly (2004) had both identified a need for further research into the educational purposes of Kindergarten.

Significance of the study

The significance of this study was with its potential to add to the limited amount of knowledge and Tasmanian research in this area of early childhood education. Boardman, a leader in this field of study in Tasmania, has researched the effects implementation of full-day Kindergarten has had on both parents and teachers, but accepts that much still needs to be done in this area. Among Boardman’s research studies are teachers’ and parents’ views on the escalating prevalence of full-day Kindergarten (2003) and teachers’ perspectives on links between types of programs offered and different attendance modes (2004).

Kelly (2004) provided an insight into Kindergarten teacher’s work, but identified a need for further research into the nature of Kindergarten programs provided for 4-5 year old children. Boardman (2004) found little research has been done in the area of Kindergarten in Tasmania, including the effects the implementation of full-day Kindergarten has on children’s development, “limited research has been undertaken to ascertain whether this change is educationally advantageous for young children” (Boardman, 2004, p. 14). Much of the work done in this area is based on overseas research where children in Kindergarten are 12 months older than their peers in Tasmania. Ebbeck (as cited in Lambert, 1992) agrees, stating research of early childhood in Australia needs to continue. For years Australian teachers have been reliant on research from the United States of America and United Kingdom, there was and still is to a large extent, a dearth of Australian research (Ebbeck as cited in Lambert, 1992, p. 81).

Arthur et al. (1993) relate that often teachers have lots of ideas, but their programs do not always reflect their beliefs. They go on to say that “this situation often occurs due to the many constraints that impact upon school settings” (Arthur et al., 1993, p. 62). Therefore, the question of importance for this study is: Are implementations of full-day Kindergarten
adding constraints upon teachers implementing programs, not influenced or based on their own philosophy? It is acknowledged that every Kindergarten learning program should be matched to the age and abilities of the child (Drury, Miller & Campbell, 2000). The overall benefits of this research study clearly linked with its significance, as it is the urban Kindergarten teachers of full-day Kindergarten, along with the young children who they teach, who will ultimately benefit from these findings.

Research Questions

The main purpose of this study was to investigate Tasmanian urban Kindergarten teachers' perceptions of the purpose of Kindergarten education and to make comparisons between these perceptions and teachers' actual practice. As it was evident that urban Tasmanian schools were increasingly offering more full-day sessions of Kindergarten, the impact full-day Kindergarten has had on teachers' learning programs in relation to their perceived purpose of Kindergarten education, was to be investigated. This research study was guided by the following four research questions:

1. What are urban Kindergarten teachers' perceptions of the purpose of Kindergarten education?
2. Are there inconsistencies between urban Kindergarten teachers' philosophies and the learning program they offer in the Kindergarten?
3. Do urban Kindergarten teachers have autonomy over decisions pertaining to Kindergarten education and in developing and implementing learning programs?
4. Have urban Kindergarten teachers' learning programs changed with the implementation of full-day Kindergarten?

The Design of the Study

The methodological approach pertaining to this study was guided by both a quantitative and qualitative research approach. Self-completion postal surveys were the only data collection tool utilised, resulting in a 46% response rate from the sample population. The survey included questions to collect both data for statistical analysis, (closed questions), and data of a more personal nature to be interpreted and described (open-ended questions). Closed questions included those seeking factual information from Kindergarten teachers in relation their years of teaching Kindergarten, the modes of attendance they had experienced in their teaching career, (full-day and/or half-day) and their teaching preference between full-day and half-day sessions of Kindergarten. Scaled questions, which sought the respondents' opinions, employed a Likert scale of strongly agree, agree, disagree and strongly disagree. The Likert scales enabled collection of empirical data of teachers' responses rather than subjective opinions and were seen to increase “the probability that a unitary attitude is being measured, and therefore that validity … and reliability are reasonably high” (Burns, 2000, p. 560).

The study population included 77 government primary schools throughout urban Tasmania. Urban, for the purpose of this study, related to areas of greater population throughout Tasmania. These areas, determined by postcodes, included Hobart (7000 through to 7030 inclusive), Launceston (7248, 7249, 7250), Devonport (7310), Ulverstone (7315) and Burnie (7320). Initial contact with prospective primary schools was made to determine sample size, following which 119 prospective Kindergarten teachers were approached. Gay (1996) contends that “30 subjects are generally considered to be a minimally acceptable sample size” (p. 297). Using this sample population, of which 55 (46%) teachers responded, the researcher was able to compile a broad range of data from around Tasmania, for subsequent analysis and interpretation, gathering insight relevant to the proposed research questions.

Each of the 55 returned surveys were allocated a number from 1-55 and, using this coding system, all data, from both open and closed questions, was transcribed into a Microsoft Access database designed specifically for the purpose of this research study. From this database, accurate information, relating to any selected question, could be extracted and
transferred into other programs used by the researcher, including Microsoft Word, Microsoft Excel and Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) software.

The analysis of the qualitative data involved determining the frequencies of teachers’ concepts and ideas gathered from the open-ended questions. Burns (2000) contends that a survey of people’s attitudes and beliefs may reveal a number of similarities and differences. The qualitative data collected from the open-ended questions, detailing teachers’ personal views on perspectives, were sorted, coded, interpreted, then presented and described with words. Examples of comments, with a prospective of both similarities and differences highlighted, were the focus of the reported discussion. In addition though, frequencies and percentages were collated for each category which Burns (2000) sees as beneficial for discussion in numerical terms as well as for meaning.

Qualitative data were coded and analysed by way of frequency of responses with results leading to subsequent discussions. The quantitative data, once coded, were analysed firstly with percentages and frequencies of each variable then further parametric analysis was undertaken by way of SPSS Independent samples t testing to determine statistical significant differences between independent variables. This procedure added substance to the analysis process. It provided the researcher with a higher degree of confidence that differences in responses that revealed a significance level of p < .05 (Burns, 2000) were less likely to have occurred by chance.

The final part of the analysis process was in making concluding comparisons between teachers’ perceptions of Kindergarten education and their actual teaching practice, in addressing the research questions.

Results of the Study
A summary of pertinent findings are presented below.

Urban Kindergarten teachers held strong beliefs in relation to key values of Kindergarten education and these subsequently had strong connections with their perceptions of the purpose of Kindergarten education.

The majority of teachers believed Kindergarten experiences were important in laying foundations for a continuing education and were a key purpose of Kindergarten education. With 94% of respondents in agreement, this indicated the importance teachers placed on providing an appropriate and effective learning program in the Kindergarten.

In addition many teachers placed importance on similar values and purposes pertaining to the importance of Kindergarten education. Teachers having knowledge of how children learn and develop was unanimously agreed with, and many teachers noted the importance of ‘a continuous learning program’, ‘both indoor and outdoor experiences’, ‘a play based curriculum’, ‘Essential Learnings values’, and ‘a focus on socialisation’. Further to this, children’s holistic development was considered of central importance to the key values and purposes of Kindergarten education. In comparison, when questioned on the importance of a formal approach, teachers did not rate this as being as important as provision of a play-based approach.

In contrast, statistically significant differences were revealed when comparing teachers’ years of teaching Kindergarten. These results showed that teachers, with less than 5 years of experience teaching Kindergarten, were more likely to agree with a formal education commencing in Kindergarten which they believed would develop a greater competence in reading and writing, than their more experienced peers. This result was seen as an important finding in that it perhaps indicated that more recent graduates, less set in their teaching ways, could be more amenable to undertaking an academic position when teaching in Kindergarten.

Additionally, other statistically significant differences were determined when examining teaching backgrounds and teaching preferences. It was revealed, that teachers currently teaching Kinder/Prep were the group most fully committed to play and socialisation in the learning program, than other groups of teachers.
This finding revealed that in relation to the aspects urban Kindergarten teachers identified, pertaining to the values and purposes they considered important to Kindergarten education, the majority of respondents were in agreement. Furthermore, urban Kindergarten teachers believed that the provision of a learning program, incorporating identified values and purposes, associated with play, socialisation and holistic development, was more important than the particular attendance mode of Kindergarten offered.

Although teachers believed that their learning program corresponded with the values and purposes they considered important to Kindergarten education, in reality, there were clear inconsistencies.

When Kindergarten teachers were questioned about their learning program, results complemented their stated beliefs on the values and purposes of Kindergarten education. These included sound research of Kindergarten education, child development, and values as stated in the Essential Learnings Framework (Department of Education, 2002). Irregularities in responses were evident, in that 92% of teachers indicated their programs were play-based, although 39% also indicated that their program was academically-based. This difference could be indicative of 87% of teachers who believed a balanced approach to planning was reflected in their learning program. Additionally it was found that Kindergarten sessions also incorporated specialised lessons into the daily program (57%). It was becoming evident that although teachers held strong beliefs concerning the values and purposes they believed to be important for Kindergarten education, this was not always realised in their actual programs.

Statistical differences revealed those teachers with more experience were more likely to develop play-based programs as were teachers having had experience with full-day Kindergarten. This result demonstrated that teachers with less experience were once again more open to providing an academically based curriculum. In addition statistically significant differences were determined in relation to those teachers with a preference for half-day Kindergarten and their beliefs concerning the influence departmental guidelines were having on the Kindergarten learning program, when compared to colleagues with a preference for full-day sessions.

Notable differences, between teachers' values and their perceptions of Kindergarten education, were realised when analysing qualitative data in respect to the learning program. Qualitative data collected from weekly percentages of session times, identified by teachers, were comparative to teachers' perceptions of the learning program as they included a play-based curriculum (54%), opportunities for holistic development and socialisation (27%) with less emphasis and time allotted to formal teaching (19%). However, when analysing teachers' actual daily program, discrepancies were evident. Instead of a play-based program, daily programs included a more formal structure. Furthermore, in relation to holistic development and socialisation, identified by teachers as fundamental to Kindergarten education, provision of such was evident through group work and child directed play time. However, in analysis of provided daily programs, time allocated to these sessions varied between attendance modes; teachers of half-day Kindergarten were found to devote 34.5% of their daily program toward these sessions whereas full-day Kindergarten allowed for 25%.

In summary, teachers' philosophies, which should reflect their beliefs of the values and purposes of Kindergarten education, were seen by urban Kindergarten teachers to be reflected in their learning programs (100% agreement). The daily program however, offered for analysis, showed clear inconsistencies with these beliefs.

Analysis of half-day Kindergarten and full-day Kindergarten sessions revealed some noticeable differences but consistency toward a formalised approach to learning was evident.

Half-day Kindergarten sessions included formal experiences (46.5%), and play-based activities (29.5%), with the remaining time devoted to other learning experiences including Stories/Big books/Reading, Music/Dance/Art, Breaks/Rest times (23%) and Maintaining home/school relationships (1%). In comparison, the full-day program devoted 39% to
formal teaching, 29.5% to play, 31% toward other learning experiences, with 0.5% of time devoted to Maintaining home/school relationships.

Overall this finding showed that more time in today’s urban Kindergarten is devoted to a formalised approach in comparison to a play-based curriculum no matter what the mode of attendance. This was seen as very ‘sad’, reflecting a ‘push down’ of the curriculum and, in addition, not consistent with urban Kindergarten teachers’ perceptions of the values and purposes of Kindergarten education.

This study revealed a mismatch between urban Kindergarten teachers’ perceptions of their autonomy in implementing their philosophies into their Kindergarten learning programs, when compared to the autonomy teachers envisaged they had in relation to decisions concerning Kindergarten education.

Data in relation to teachers’ autonomy were inconclusive as inconsistencies were revealed between teachers’ responses. When questioned on the topic of autonomy, teachers in one instance unanimously agreed that they had full autonomy to incorporate their philosophy into the learning program whereas on another instance the data revealed that some teachers were in disagreement of this fact.

Those teachers displaying confidence in their autonomy over the learning program believed that they were strongly supported by senior staff, colleagues and parents and indicated that their experiences and convictions were a further contributing factor. In contrast, it was those teachers lacking confidence in their autonomy, who believed the purpose of Kindergarten education was changing mainly due to departmental policies.

It was in fact departmental policy that created a mismatch between responding teachers. On one hand, teachers with the belief that they had the autonomy to implement their philosophy into the learning program believed that by providing a balanced program, congruent with departmental polices, autonomy was further realised. On the other hand, those teachers who doubted they had full autonomy, believed departmental policies were to blame, hence restricting their abilities to implement their own personal philosophies into the Kindergarten learning program.

Nevertheless, this study recognised that the overwhelming majority of urban Kindergarten teachers felt they were able to implement their personal philosophies into the Kindergarten learning program. However, differences were determined in relation to teachers’ perceived autonomy over decisions pertaining to Kindergarten education. It was determined that over 80% of teachers would prefer to teach a half-day Kindergarten, although in reality this was not the makeup of their current class. This indicated that teachers did not have autonomy over choosing the type of Kindergarten attendance mode they offered. This finding was statistically significant in relation to Kinder/Prep teachers when compared with teachers teaching both half-day and full-day sessions of Kindergarten. Furthermore, constraints on programming and outside influences, including school policy, parental demands and enrolments, were all found to be contributing factors in determining a teacher’s autonomy.

In summary, the majority of urban Kindergarten teachers perceive that they indeed had autonomy over their learning program and although this may well be true, this study found that outside influences reduce teachers’ autonomy in relation to planning, teaching preferences and for some, implementation of their personal philosophies into the Kindergarten learning program.

Children’s needs are not necessarily the determining factor when deciding Kindergarten modes of attendance.

Statistical significant differences ($p = .000$) were determined in relation to children’s needs being the major consideration in determining Kindergarten attendance modes, when comparing different modes of attendance. Teachers of full-day Kindergarten when compared with half-day Kindergarten teachers believed that the needs of children were not considered when decisions were made in relation to the mode of attendance that was to be offered. They held concerns over the extent of children’s tiredness and the detrimental effects this attendance mode had on children’s holistic development.
The majority of urban Kindergarten teachers would prefer to teach half-day Kindergarten.

In excess of 80% of urban Kindergarten teachers indicated throughout this study that they had a strong preference for half-day Kindergarten sessions believing that it is through this attendance mode that their personal philosophy, based on their values and beliefs of the purpose of Kindergarten education, can most effectively be incorporated. This was far in excess of reality, because only 52% of teachers taught half-day Kindergartens.

When compared to previous studies, this finding indicates an increase in teachers’ preferences toward the half-day program, even though the provision for full-day programs is more prevalent in these urban areas (Boardman, 2001).

Urban Kindergarten teachers’ programs have changed to cater for the implementation of a full-day attendance mode.

Responses showed 65% of urban Kindergarten teachers were required to alter their learning program when changing from a half-day Kindergarten to a full-day session. Almost half (48%) of responding teachers believed that their programs included more formal and structured experiences. Inconsistencies with responses were again apparent when qualitative data was analysed. This data showed that 31 teachers (89%) acknowledged the need for change with only 4 (11%) respondents standing firm that no changes were required.

A closer examination of qualitative results concluded that in relation to full-day Kindergarten, more formalised and structured teachings were evident in the mornings, leaving a play-based approach for the afternoons. It was further determined that the implementation of a full-day Kindergarten program saw the inclusion of quiet times/rest periods to cope with children’s tiredness in the afternoon sessions.

Overall though, it was evident that teachers were required to change their learning programs when altering attendance modes. However, except for the inclusion of more breaks/rest times in the afternoon sessions, much of this change was not with the content of the learning program, but with when experiences were scheduled throughout the day. Formal teaching and teacher-directed experiences comprised the morning sessions of a full-day Kindergarten, with a play-based approach in the afternoons.

Conclusion

Key issues regarding teachers’ perceptions of the purpose of Kindergarten education and actual practice have become apparent from the findings of this study.

- Kindergarten teachers held similar perceptions of the values and purpose of Kindergarten education.
- Clear inconsistencies were revealed between teachers’ philosophies and the reality of the learning program they offer in the Kindergarten.
- Over 80% of Kindergarten teachers would prefer to teach half-day Kindergarten believing it to be more educationally and developmentally appropriate for young children.
- Departmental guidelines and policies contribute to teachers’ inabilities to incorporate their personal teaching philosophies into their learning programs.
- Although 100% teachers believed they had full autonomy over the implementation of their learning program, analysis revealed a mismatch between teachers’ beliefs and practice, showing teachers lacked autonomy over planning decisions.
- In excess of 80% of teachers would prefer to teach a half-day Kindergarten because they believed it was the most effective way for implementing teachers’ personal philosophies on Kindergarten education into the learning program.
- 57% of urban Kindergarten teachers included specialised lessons in their learning
program, and this practice needs to be questioned as it could be seen as inappropriate in content and delivery to 4-5 year olds.

- Teachers of full-day Kindergarten believed that the needs of children were not considered when decisions were made in relation to the mode of attendance offered at their school.

- Teachers preferring to teach half-day Kindergarten were more likely to disagree with a formal approach to teaching.

- Teachers with more experience with Kindergarten teaching were more likely to have a play-based learning program whereas teachers with less experience were more amenable to providing formalised experiences.

- Changes to the learning program were apparent when Kindergarten teachers change from teaching half-day to full-day sessions.

- Teachers teaching Kinder/Prep classes were the most committed to play and socialisation being incorporated into their learning program and also felt that they have no input into the mode of attendance offered in Kindergarten.

The findings of this study have provided an insight into urban Kindergarten teachers’ perceptions of values and purposes of Kindergarten education and actual practices. However, this investigation has produced avenues for further research. It has been determined that teachers’ beliefs regarding the purpose of Kindergarten education and their teaching preferences, along with children’s developmental and learning needs, have at times little impact on decisions made concerning the education of young children. The lack of congruence between urban Kindergarten teachers’ perceptions and practice causes concerns about the appropriateness of learning programs offered for Kindergarten children. Further research into contributing factors would indeed be beneficial, hence informing teachers, schools and other stakeholders of more appropriate curriculum to support and nurture the learning and development of Kindergarten children.

This study set out to investigate teachers’ perceptions of the purpose of Kindergarten education. It endeavoured to capture teachers’ beliefs on what they saw as important for children of this age, as well as the values they believed children should experience in the Kindergarten setting. The findings illustrated that teachers’ beliefs were comparable with each other and they were consistent with previous research and literature on the subject. Unfortunately teachers’ programs did not always reflect their beliefs, with outside influences being a contributing factor. This study’s findings illustrate that there must be more congruence between teachers’ beliefs and departmental guidelines. From analysis of responses throughout this study, an understanding of all findings should facilitate awareness amongst Kindergarten teachers, schools and other stakeholders, so they are better able to support and cater for the education of these young children. More importantly, they must not overlook the true purpose of Kindergarten education, a purpose of satisfying the holistic developmental and learning needs of those children in attendance.

References


The Electronic Construction of the University and International Student

Chinh Ba Nguyen
The University of Melbourne

Abstract

University websites have become a dominant source of information direct from the University, providing up-to-the-minute essential information for international students to decide on their future education. With characteristics such as round-the-clock availability, ease of access, convenience, and information richness, international students are increasingly relying on universities' websites to guide their decision-making regarding higher education destinations. This paper contributes to the growing scholarly discussion of how Australian universities construct their identity on the web. Particularly, it examines the pro-internationalisation discourse constructed in an Australian university website for international students. Using Fairclough's (1992) model of critical discourse analysis techniques and Kress and van Leeuwen's (1996) visual analysis, I analyse how such discourse is constructed and reveals about the type of identity one Australian university has constructed on its website. The analysis focuses on ways of analysing textual features such as lexical choices, grammatical elements, generic structures as well as ‘lexis’ of images. This will be supplemented with the analysis of the interview transcript with an international student who is currently studying at the previously mentioned University to focus on the students’ perceptions and uptake of the university website’s manifestation. Finally, I consider implications of such internationalisation discourse for international students’ decision making and the process of institutional identity formation online.

Introduction

Today, it is widely acknowledged that the terms “global village” and “globalisation” have gained immense popularity. The forces of globalisation present fascinating opportunities whilst simultaneously posing mounting challenges. In this context, higher education has become a vital aspect of the national/global socio-economy. The universities, once-known as the closed ivory towers have welcomed international students from various corners of the world. In the case of Australia, exporting education is contributing six billions of dollars to its national economy (Australian, 2005). 78% of international students in Australia are from Asia (Australian, 2005). Additionally, the development of ‘markets’ within public sector services has been a widespread feature of government policy in many countries (Foskett, 1998). Higher education in Australia has experienced government reform of public sector institutions, and it is increasingly being pressured to move towards what Baldwin & James (2000) describe as ‘a goal of efficiency’.

At the same time, since the early 1990s, tremendous ICT growth, especially in the use of the Internet has started. The Internet has rapidly become one of the most powerful forms of information media whereby knowledge, information, ideas, and experiences are transferred across disciplines, time zones, and locations, binding disparate nations, regions, institutions, and individuals. The sheer number of Web pages that have proliferated on the Internet, and the resulting competition for user visits, has made it increasingly difficult for a specific Web site to attract visitors (Mechitov, Moshkovich, Underwood, & Taylor, 2001). For Australian universities, over the past a decade, the Internet has transformed and enabled them to become more active in tapping into the growing demand of information from prospective international students. University websites have become a dominant source of information direct from the University, providing up-to-the-minute essential information for international students to decide on their future education. With characteristics such as round-the-clock availability, ease of access, convenience, and information richness, international students are increasingly relying on universities' websites to guide their decision-making regarding higher
education destinations. This is emphasized in the discourse of market in Australian higher education and students have become informed decision makers (Baldwin & James, 2000). In the forthcoming paper on monitoring the internationalisation of higher education, Krause, Coates and James (2005) have also framed the indicators of internationalisation of universities, in which visual representation and imagery of international characters of university campus in information channels are categorised and stressed.

This paper contributes to the growing scholarly discussion of how Australian universities construct their identity on the web. Particularly, it examines the pro-internationalisation discourse constructed in an Australian university website for international students. Using Fairclough’s (1992) model of critical discourse analysis techniques and Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) visual analysis, I analyse how such discourse is constructed and reveals about the type of identity one Australian university (hereafter called “the University”) has constructed on its website. The analysis focuses on ways of analysing textual features such as lexical choices, grammatical elements, generic structures as well as ‘lexis’ of images. This will be supplemented with the thematic analysis of the interview transcript with an international student who is currently studying at the University to focus on the students’ perceptions and uptake of the university website’s manifestation. Finally, I consider implications of such internationalisation discourse for international students’ decision making and the process of institutional identity formation online. In the next section I describe internationalisation of higher education.

**Internationalisation in higher education**

The term internationalisation in higher education has a range of meanings referring to the flow of students between countries; the internationalisation of curriculum; the development of international research links; the development of regional agreements for the recognition of higher education programs or some combination of these activities (Hamilton, 1997; Knight, 2004; Scott, 1998). Internationalisation is seen as a response to globalisation (Knight, 2004) and aims to develop international or cross-cultural dimensions in all aspects of a university’s operations, with the ultimate goal of developing students, graduates and staff for working effectively in a global environment (Hamilton, 1997). The underlying reasons for internationalisation of universities also include staff and student mobility, student and staff development, mechanisms for maintaining academic standards and quality assurance and research collaboration (Knight, 2004). Increasingly, last few years saw the proliferation of world university rankings such as the Shanghai Tiao Jong University and the Times’ higher education supplement league tables, where universities are being internationally benchmarked against one another. Another useful perspective of internationalisation is defined by Scott (1998) and SAARDHE (2000) as international exchange, referring to student and staff flows between countries, institution-to-institution and nation-to-nation collaboration, as well as the flows of idea and knowledge around the world. In other words, internationalisation of higher education has four main dimensions: student mobility, lecturer mobility, the development of joint teaching/learning and research programs and the flow of ideas. Internationalisation is also about the enterprise university, commercialisation of research and spin-off campuses (Marginson, 2002).

Drawing analytical techniques from critical discourse analysis (CDA) and visual analysis, I explore how a university website introduce the international student to the knowledge constructed by the University. More specifically, I examine the pro-internationalisation discourse in an Australian university website. It is a particular way to ideologically construct the international university through special uses of e-texts and visuals to create particular virtual identities of the University. In what follows, I briefly present the research framework and some analytical tools to unpack the identities of the University.

**Critical discourse analysis and visual analysis of university website**

To date, most of the works that use CDA have taken on non-electronically mediated genre such as meetings (Hanak, 1998; Menz, 1999), television debates (Leudar and Nekvapil, 2000), political speeches (Lazar and Lazar, 2004), advertising (Hogben and Coupland, 2000), school textbooks (Oteiza, 2003), advertorials (Erjavec, 2004). This paper aims to mine the
Web for information about language usage such as lexico-grammatical focus and visual-iconology aims. For Halliday (cited in Kramsch, 1993) contented that text, as instances of language, express culture in their use of grammar and vocabulary and in the way they “stipulate a selective version of the world and of being and doing in that world,… position the reader as inside and outside of and visible and invisible in that world,… represent speakers’ beliefs, positions and ideas; establish and build up social relations and identities (Luke, 1995, p. 18). Cultural meanings of a text can be fully explored by studying the relation between elements in the text, and the text in its wider contexts of production and reception, institution and society (Fairclough, 1995). Similarly, images speak to the viewer much more than the identification of the subject matter in their contents (Brown, 1992; Corbett, 2003; Howells, 2003). Under this surface meaning, images carry what Kress and van Leeuwen (1996) termed as the iconographical and iconological meanings. For Corbett (2003, p. 158), “images do not have fixed, pre-determined meanings—they suggest through conventions assigned to them by culture”. According to Kress and van Leeuwen (1996), images and texts are two independent semiotic modes, each with its own ways of expressing meanings, its own vocabulary and grammar. Language expresses meaning through vocabulary, grammar, syntax, etc., whereas images though colour, size, shape, texture, etc. In addition to that, if language uses such structures as transitive, intransitive, classificational, analytical, possessive attribute, symbolic attribute, and so on to fulfill their ideational, interpersonal and textual metafunction, images use their own grammar structures such as vectors, eye gaze, eye contact, positioning and framing —foreground/background, left/right, centre/margins, top/bottom, physical distance — close up shot, medium shot or long shot for the same purpose (Kress and van Leeuwen, 1996). They structure their methodology around three metafunctions from Halliday which serve communicational requirements: the ideational, which they call the representational— or the ability of a semiotic code to ‘represent objects and their relations outside the representational system’; the interpersonal, or interactive — the way relations between producer, viewer and represented objects are projected; and the textual or compositional — the capacity to form coherent wholes, as realised through composition. These metafunctions, representational meaning, interactive meaning and compositional meaning, perform semiotic work simultaneously.

Phillips and Jorgensen (2002) put forward that discourse analysis is the study of language that has been developed to become a research methodology with fruitful theories and methods for research in communication, culture and society. However, they also point out that discourse analysis approaches do not provide researchers with fixed procedure to follow, but require them to tailor their research design “combining elements from different discourse analytical perspectives, and if possible, non-discourse analytical perspectives” (p. 4). In other words, there is “no set rules that can be followed step-by-linear-step to get guaranteed results”, and researchers have to “continuously and flexibly adapt and adopt specific tools and strategies available in the field of research for their own purposes” (Gee, 1999, p. 6). Thus, Fairclough’s (1992) framework and Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) will be used for texts and visuals that are composed of websites and narratives analysis of the students’ uptake on such website contents. What I present here will preliminarily be a selective rather than a full account through analysis of the university vice chancellor’s welcoming message, the university missions and the pages for future students of the university.

The analysis of the University website

In this section, I move on to analysing the discursive processes and a number of e-texts to illustrate how the pro-internationalisation discourse is being discursively constructed online. The first text that I analyse is the university vice chancellor’s welcoming text.

The university is positioned in the website as the elite institution in the country. The vice chancellor starts by introducing the university with two positive adjectives: proud and great, that relates to its past and future, respectively. The passage sentences are all declarative, statement of facts. This voice of authority is reinforced by the use of numbers: ‘150 years’ and the wording in the crest of the university, which shows the university motto is to ‘earning the esteem of future generations’. Mixed with the authoritative voice is the promotional dimension “leading research and teaching university”, “recent national and international rankings”, “great success in securing research funding”, etc. The international feel for the university is shown
through the use of a list of vocabulary such as “global academic community”, “international rankings”, “global responsibilities”, “internationally focused”, “world’s best”, “world-class”. It can be said that the university is linguistically manifested as the global educational player. Its educational “products” “make their mark in the world with significant contributions to society”. The international nature of the university is also revealed through key numbers and star staff members such as “over three million books in 20 languages”, “Nobel prize winners”, “Rhodes scholars”.

Such is a beautiful use of significant and international recognition to illustrate the international impact that its graduate leaves where they work. The description is given in the present tense to suggest that this is a universal claim. In addition, this claim ties in with the assertion made at the beginning of the text, which positions the international students as the beneficiaries of the university legacy, a global educational institution, past and present. Further at the end of the text, more specifically, the text uses a second person pronoun, “you”, to establish an informal or friendly relationship between the vice chancellor and the university’s future students “I am proud to welcome you to the University website”. Interestingly, the university website here is formally considered as the e-version of the university. The VC invites future students to be part of it.

The second analysis is the page for future students. As a webpage, it is an example of a multi-modal text, involving e-text, hyperlinks, and visuals. The overwhelming voice of this text is promotional. The page has links for both local and international future students. Regional hubs such as Hong Kong, Singapore, China, and Bangkok are presented and in the more upcoming events enlist a number of places throughout the world. Such manifestations are to say about the international recruitment of students for the university. Here, the international university is represented and constructed as one which boasts extensive links with international universities in the Asia-Pacific region, Europe and North America, attracts students from more than 100 countries, value[s] the presence of overseas students and offers a comprehensive support network devoted to the needs of international students.

Inherent in this data are the use of icons such as the global Universitas 21 alliance and Group of Eight. These ‘prestige branding’ groupings are vital tools to differentiate the University from other universities. Latest news on the university’s world ranking positions is timely reported. What we probably see from these groupings/ ranking position is the commitment to international benchmarking to ensure that they can deliver outcomes that are legitimately world-class. The combination of cutting-edge research and interaction with the broader economy enhances the quality of teaching and guarantees that their students are empowered and confident to take on challenges anywhere in the world.

The visuals I am using in this case study are from the website of the university. Firstly, for representational meaning, here we are dealing with the people, places and objects represented, or in Kress and van Leeuwen's terms, the ‘participants’. The main participants in these visuals are depicting smiling, happy students, holding balloons, chatting with one another and walking towards and into the campus where the centre of students activities are promised. Many of these students look Asian. It is self evident from the participants, specifically who or what they are or where the pictures are taking place because the texts that accompanied it.

We can then explore the significance of the participants further. The hordes of people in groups are not just a mere description. It represents the diverse cultural and scholarship mix of people. It symbolises the vital core of the university, where students’ learning and activities take centre stage. The whole scene itself is a symbolic representation of the student body, having fun on campus. Actions or events are recognised in images by the presence of vectors. These are lines connecting participants who are doing something to or for each other; they can be diagonal, vertical or horizontal; such lines are made by, for instance, limbs, glances and tools;
they are the equivalent of action verbs. In the photo, the perspective creates one single and very strong vector, which runs from the foreground to the background. This human gatherings and walks into the university where things get happened. Conceptual structures define the meaning and identity of participants. Here the linked members of the group of students are the young and lively female and male adults. The symbolic meaning potential of these people, balloons, the cramped place and the joined hands of the participants provide clues to the identity of the university depicted, which is the melting pot of knowledge and the experiences for students are in harmony, unity and diversity.

Secondly, interactive meaning refers to the relationship between the participants in the photograph and the viewer. Three factors are important in realising these meanings – contact between participants and viewer, distance, and point of view. In this photograph most participants face the viewer. Kress and van Leeuwen (1996) suggest that this angle, where the participants look directly at the viewers, means there is direct contact and viewers look at the participants in an up-close and personal way. Kress and van Leeuwen (1996) translate social distance in everyday relations into ‘size of frame’ shots in visual images. The closer the shot the more intimate the distance and the more one can see of an individual’s personality. We clearly see the strength and permanence of the structure. Point of view is represented by whether elements in the image are filmed from below or from above or at eye level, and from the front, the side or the back. The meaning potential of the vertical angle is symbolic power; frontality creates maximum involvement. Here the font shot gives maximum involvement into the university activity.

Thirdly, Kress and van Leeuwen’s (1996) compositional meaning is the “way in which the representational and interactional elements are made to relate to each other, the way they are integrated into a whole” (p. 181). Key concepts here are informational value and salience. The informational value of elements is determined by their position relative to each other in terms of the right/left, top/bottom and centre/margin zones of an image. In the above visual, the relationships between representational and interactional elements are tightly and vividly presented to showcase the campus for the incoming students. What I have selectively described so far is the use of visuals to reinforce what the texts aim to achieve. In the next section, I move to explore how an international student interpret the University’s electronic version.

The international student’s uptake of the University website manifestations

The interview with Fion is part of a series of interviews with international students that looks into the ways that a group of international students make sense and uptake on the university websites’ materials. The focus was on her engagement and interpretation of the university’s website. Before coming to Australia, Fion had worked as a business development and programme manager at a not-for-profit organization providing education services in Singapore. She has just started her postgraduate program as a full-fee paying student at the university under this study. Previously she had completed a Bachelor of Business Administration in Singapore and a Master of Commerce at a university in Australia. She has been online for some years; they are technologically literate and they maintain multiple email addresses and instant messaging (IM) identities. While online, she frequently is multitasking: conducting research for a paper, emailing friends, downloading programmes, reading online newspapers, using MSN or Yahoo Messenger. She is online for a number of hours every day and she represents an increasingly large number of technologically savvy students.

For Fion, the Internet, university website to be exact, helps her to search for her educational destination. The notion of “online educational shopping” is gaining momentum as students are increasingly see and feel what their future university has to offer. It can be said that Fion is representing a new generation of cyberspace users. “Yes, definitely yes. I shopped around by browsing the websites of universities”. What is implied here is the much heralded skill, technological literacy aptly demonstrated by the current students. This data illustrates what Luke (1997) argues - that the Internet has made global communications among all peoples a more democratic process. The new economy of signs and information is a reality; it is here now and already bringing about profound changes in the way students search for their
university, handle information and construct knowledge (Luke, 1996). Therefore, the role of the Internet for higher education is becoming increasingly more important for both prospective students and institutions.

Although the pages show the individual profiles of students from Asia, Middle East, Europe, North America and South America, and for her, “the information about the university is by and large enough”, she stills has the need to look for Singaporean community of students. “Hey I am going to a foreign country, how big is the Singaporean population there, how big is that? I wouldn’t be able to tell very much from the site.” This reiterates the fact that, in this era of “glocalisation” – a hybridised blend between the global and the local (see Lingard, 2000; Luke & Luke, 2000; Lockwood et al. 1999; Robertson, 1992), there is a notion of ‘home’. International students are always in need of something related to ‘home’ while they are away from their ‘home’. It is quite similar to what Macapagal-Arroyo (1999) argues that there are always locales of particular voices, images, and identities to which people, and nations belong. The argument to this point is in line with Held, McGrew, Goldblatt and Perraton (2000) et al.’s four spatio-temporal dimensions which are exemplified by the extensiveness of global networks, the intensity of global interconnectedness, the velocity of global flows and the impact propensity of global interconnectedness. Frankly, she continues “That gives me a chance to network. Another sense if there is a big enough pool of Singaporean students, at least I don’t feel foreign”.

Visually speaking, it can be said that the University projects some very positive feelings. The buildings, the colour of the visuals, the greenery pictures are in her words, “portrait the image, kind of welcoming, kind of feeling, vibrant, based on the pictures of the students”. For Fion, “picture speaks a thousand words and sometimes pictures help to add on to what the text say, for example, I keep telling you that this is the university of characters, it is long established. It adds on to the credibility of the text”. Prestige is what the university is trading on. Being an old university means a lot to international students. As she points out “Coming to a university, age tends to associate with how established it is, the older the university, normally, it’s more established. Because the education faces a lot of changes and the education is able to sustain and continue, means that there are certain things about the university”. Feeling wise, she continues “Being an old university gives me a good feeling, hey this is really a place where people are studying, serious of studying and learning, the buildings give me a confident kind of feeling that old enough, established enough”.

Taking the University’s personality online, the question asks that if the University were a person, what kinds of characteristics would it possess? “Mature person, male oriented, warm and quite disorganised. He doesn’t how to organise the things properly. I have to go through so many steps to find my things for research”. Understanding the international students’ perception of personality/identity of the e-version of university is intriguing because it tells you how those images/photos/icons are constructed in the minds of the educational consumers. With this image preconceived, the universities can adjust or modify accordingly to supplement their marketing strategies.

Next question is related to how impactful such electronic construction of universities to international students? On this point, Fion is carefully considering her options by crosschecking her experience at each of them. “One thing is that it doesn’t affects me 100%, I don’t think it affects me even 50%. But if I am given acceptance from two equally good universities, based on the website and interactions with staffs or people in the universities, it gives me a consistent messages that this University is disorganised in terms of getting the research materials, etc. then yes, it will influence my decision”.

**Concluding remarks**

Thus far, my analysis of some selective pages and visuals of the university has revealed the existence of the pro-internationalisation discourse in the University website as well as a student’s perceptions and her personal uptake of the university website’s manifestation. It is hoped that the discussion can contribute to the growing conversation about the construction of identities of universities and international students in times of globalisation and internationalisation in higher education. Part of my motivation for this paper was the belief that universities need to look to their practice of university e-branding. Fion’s interpretations of the
e-version of the University is useful in that university web developers should take into account not only the information richness, usability, but also the experience that international students have online.

**References**

Australian, (2005). We top OECD for foreign students. Australian, 14 September


Giving and Receiving Compliments: Viewed from Textbooks and Respondents

Thu Dinh Nguyen
University of South Australia

Abstract

Compliments have been fairly extensively studied in a variety of Englishes worldwide for the last two decades. However, they do not have such a position in other non-English languages, especially East Asian languages. Recently, thanks to the ever-increasing boosts for intercultural communication in all fields of work and life, compliments and compliment responses have attracted due attention from researchers, textbook developers, teachers and learners of English as a foreign language. This drive has lead to some research on complimenting behaviour in Chinese (Chen, 1993; Yi, 1998; Yu, 1999), Thai (Gajaseni, 1994), Korean (Jeon, 1996), and Japanese (Baba, 1996), to name a few. These researches highlighted sociolinguistic features of this particular speech act, the one which is widely used in daily interaction but is under-examined. They showed both similarities and differences in the target and source language(s).

Aiming at a practical view to teaching speech acts to students of English at tertiary level in Vietnam, this study investigates the beliefs on, attitudes towards complimenting behaviour, and how native speakers of Australian English and Vietnamese realize their compliments and respond to being complimented.

The data for this research are collected from 3 groups of informants of Australian English, Vietnamese and Vietnamese learners of English in terms of cross culture, and gender, employing discourse completion task questionnaires (DCTs), role-plays, and semi-structured interviews. The results are analysed quantitatively and qualitatively.

While quantitative results seem consistent with available literature on compliments and compliment responses in British English, American English, New Zealander English and South African English, the qualitative analysis of interviews reveals interesting and subtle aspects of compliments from both male and female respondents of Australian English and Vietnamese. Specifically, information from the respondents participated in the semi-structured interviews provides more invaluable clues on how compliments function, and are differently appreciated in social interaction in terms of gender cross-culturally, which is a potential cause of communication breakdowns rooted from different perspectives on beliefs, values and functions of compliments and role of gender in social interaction. This may be ascribed to insufficient, overgeneralised and stereotyped information from textbooks or from teachers.

The findings clearly has important implications on teaching and learning speech acts in general, and complimenting behaviour in Vietnam in particular, aiming not only at enhancing communicative competence among Vietnamese learners of English at tertiary level but also helping to preserve their culture and identity in globalization.

Introduction

Compliments can be defined as “a favourable judgement, or opinion, saying something nice to another individual” (Wolfson & Manes, 1980:339). Or in Holmes’ view, “a compliment is a speech act which explicitly or implicitly attributes credit to someone other than the speaker, usually the person addressed, about their ‘goods’ (possessions, characteristics, skills, etc.) (Holmes,1986b:485).

It has been shown that compliments are very frequently in English-speaking countries, and this speech act can perform a variety of functions (Wolfson, 1983). According to Manes and
Wolfson (1981), compliments are highly formulaic because the following three patterns reported the overwhelming percentage of 84.6% of their corpus of 686 compliments.

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{NP} \{\text{is/look} \} \ (\text{really}) \ \text{ADJ} : & \quad \text{"Your new jumper looks fantastic!"} \\
\text{I} \ (\text{really}) \ \text{like/love} \ \text{NP} : & \quad \text{"I really like your new digital camera."} \\
\text{Pro} \ \text{is} \ (a) \ (\text{really}) \ \text{ADJ} \ \text{NP} : & \quad \text{"That's a really delicious meal."}
\end{align*}
\]

Their research also showed that only five adjectives appeared in the adjectival compliments, such as nice, good, beautiful, pretty, and great (Manes and Wolfson, 1981: 117); and that just two verbs, like and love, occur in 86 per cent of all compliments which contain a semantically positive verb (Manes and Wolfson, 1981:118).

Attracting equally attention from researchers are compliment responses as they have been the focus of a great deal of research in the last 20 years (Pomerantz, 1978, 1984; Herbert, 1990, 1991; Herbert and Straight, 1989, Wierzbicka, 1991; Chen, 1993, Miles, 1994; Yuan, 1996; Rose, 2001; Golato, 2002) to name a few. Many researchers focussed their attention on syntactic patterns and lexical distribution when studying compliments. However, when studying compliment responses, they shift their attention to their semantic and functional characteristics.

Compliment responses always present the recipient with a dilemma because on the one hand, he has to accept a compliment and agree with it, yet at the same time he has to avoid self-praise. It is a really tricky business, especially for non-native speakers of English. Although the most recommended response to a compliment appeared in English textbooks is “thank you”, Vietnamese learners of English feel very reluctant to say so when receiving a compliment. And if they are forced to respond with a “thank you”, they often elaborate more to downplay their worthiness of being complimented. It is apparent that very often the norms in one native culture do not work in a different culture as because sociolinguistic norms differ as we go from culture to culture and what may be obvious in one cultural setting is by no means necessarily so in another setting.

Overall, compliment giving and compliment responses display a variety of differences among native speakers of English and ESL/EFL speakers as well. It is imperative that teachers of speaking courses raise students’ cultural awareness through a variety of teaching contexts so that they can socialise more competently with native speakers of English, and possibly avoid, to a certain extent, misunderstandings in social interaction.

The Study

Methodology

Participants:

Participants in this research are 3 cohorts of Australian speakers of English, native speakers of Vietnamese, and Vietnamese learners of English. Each cohort comprised 150 respondents. As for the Vietnamese participants, they are third-year students of English major and their language proficiency is post-intermediate. Their age ranges from 20 to 30. Most of them are full time students. Although they have studied English for 6 years at high school and 3 more years in universities, many of them are not confident enough in interpersonal interaction because they have been trained in a medium devoid of native-language environment, and do not have many opportunities to talk to native speakers of English.

On conversation with the participants who are students of English major, the researcher realized that these students have learnt some language functions such as making invitations, complaints, requests, showing approval and disapproval, giving and receiving compliments in their year-2 speaking course. After having examined the syllabus, the researcher critically studied the textbooks used as required materials. It was found that language functions are integrated in these speaking textbooks, viz Interaction 2 (CUP) and Speaking 6 (locally designed textbook). Some model utterances for either compliment giving or compliment receiving are presented in each of the books. Students are asked to learn by heart, being unaware of the different social parameters to be observed in real-life situations. In addition, they are not given a proper amount for practice. It is apparent that the language functions are
part of the units in each of the book, however, only theme-based lessons in the units receive due attention from teachers.

The Australian respondents were full-time students who were voluntarily took part in the research. Their compliments and compliment responses were used to compare with those collected from the other two cohorts of native speakers of Vietnamese and Vietnamese learners of English.

Data Collection:

The data for this study came from different sources: discourse completion task questionnaire (DCT), role-plays, syllabus and textbooks currently used for students of English major at the two institutions in Vietnam, and semi-structured interviews.

The first type of data collection used in the present study was DCT. It has been extensively employed in pragmatic speech act studies because it allows a wide amount of data to be collected in a relatively short amount of time (Houck and Gass, 1996), and is easy in administration and analysis. Nevertheless, design and construction of a DCT involves much hard work and difficulty (Bardovi-Harlig, 1999; Kasper and Rose, 2002). The DCT used in this research consisted of two parts with 24 situations: 12 for giving compliments and 12 for receiving compliments. [The DCT covered the frequently-used topics in complimenting exchanges as shown in research literature, namely, appearance, clothes, work/ skills, possession, child, and personality. In order to achieve the desired outcomes in terms of social variables set out in the research questions, i.e., gender and social role and status, which Holmes (1986) and Wolfson (1989) viewed as important factors influencing compliment and compliment behaviour, a pilot DCT was designed and tested.

The second type of data was role-plays performed by 10 pairs of Vietnamese students of English at the two sites of the study in Vietnam who were volunteered and showed their willingness to do so. Participants were advised that their role plays were audiotaped. They were suggested to choose their partner in the role play as it would be easier for them to work with their fond friend. Each couple was given a sheet of paper with scenarios they were to role play. The researcher invited them to talk as much as they could as they were in real situations. He also suggested that compliments might be used to achieve one’s intent in communication besides complimenting. Once they were ready, the researcher invited the couple to role play the scenario which he quickly gave a brief description to them.

The third source of data was from semi-structured interview. The semi-structured interview was employed in the present study to obtain respondents’ in-depth knowledge of complimenting behaviour. The questions raised in the interviews were basically the same for all participants. Nevertheless, some additional spontaneous questions were put to student participants and lecturer participants. Those who are students were asked to talk about the way they learnt compliments in the class, about the textbooks they were using. They were also asked to make further suggestions on teaching and learning compliments. Participants who were lecturers of English were asked additional, specific questions concerning teaching spoken English in general and speech acts in particular because they were the authority in the field.

In order to ensure smoothness and ease in interviews, an interview guide was sent to each of the participants one week prior to the interview so that they could have an ample amount of time to prepare and think about the questions and the answers.

Data analysis

Data Transcription

Unlike the DCT data, which needed no transcription, the recorded data obtained from role plays and interviews in English were transcribed in their entirety for analysis. Those data from interviews in Vietnamese were also transcribed and only those segments necessary for embedding in the thesis were translated into English.

Coding Scheme
Before coding, I reviewed the literature to see how different researchers coded their compliments and compliment responses (for example, Pomerantz, 1978; Wolfson, 1981; Lewandowska-Tomaszczyk, 1989; Herbert, 1989; Yuan, 1998; Yu, 1999). I decided to follow the coding methods for compliments by Wolfson (1981) and for compliment responses by Pomerantz (1978). These methods have been widely employed and the important thing is that these codings are simple and easy to apply in teaching practice.

**Coding reliability**

Coding is a central step to ensure the reliability of the result of research. Hence, seeking verification of the coding is often recommended. Nevertheless, it can be inconvenient or unreasonable to ask for coding or rating by two or more experts or on two or more occasions. Therefore, I asked my colleague who is a PhD student to verify the coding. I followed Brown’s suggestion (2001: 239) to use a sample of 10 per cent of the total data. It was coded separately by my colleague and myself. After that, we compared and checked our codings to determine their variability and reliability. We also discussed to how to resolve any gaps between the two codings. In such a way, coding reliability was established.

**Quantitative and qualitative analysis**

The coded data of DCTs were analysed using the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS 12.0) software. In this study, Chi-square was used to compare the results of the three cohorts. Chi-square analysis included frequency distributions, cross-tabulations and tests of significance. It also allowed investigation of relationships among different variables, such as gender, as well as types of respondents and their choice of strategies and sub-strategies used in expressing their compliments and compliment responses. In the present research, the standard of p < .05 was used to show the significance level.

The interview data were coded and categorised using NUD*IST software to find out both common and emergent themes. The information obtained from semi-structured interviews provided evidence to support the quantitative findings whether or not respondents in the three groups employed different substrategies in giving and receiving compliments. This will reflect Vietnamese learners of English’s beliefs in and attitudes towards complimenting behaviour in the source language and in the target language through their choice of strategies in varying situations.

**Results**

Compliments and compliment responses were described respectively. The results obtained from the questionnaire analysis was presented first and followed by qualitative analysis of semi-structured interviews with a view to providing further information about the respondents’ beliefs in, attitudes towards and behaviors about giving and receiving compliments. The analyses of transcripts of role-plays and syllabuses and textbooks currently used serve as supplementary information for the DCTs and semi-structured interviews. They were also used as evidence to illustrate and supplement the quantitative findings. These analyses were designed to see whether or not there exist differences in compliments and compliment responses in terms of frequent topics of compliments, the strategies employed, and the influence of gender and status roles in giving and receiving compliments among the three groups of respondents within this study.

**Quantitative results**

**a) Compliment Strategies**

Table 1 below shows the overall frequency of the four broad categories of compliment strategies employed by Australian English speakers (AusEng), native speakers of Vietnamese (Viet), and Vietnamese speakers of English (VietEng). The findings showed that Australian speakers of English ranked first with a total production of 1556 compliments against 1463 by Vietnamese learners of English and 1370 by native speakers of Vietnamese. An analysis of Chi-square of the overall compliment strategies show significant difference ($\chi^2 = 197.35$, df = 6, p < .001).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compliment strategies</th>
<th>Language group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Page 565
Table 1: Overall Frequency of Compliments across Language Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Syntactic Patterns</th>
<th>Language group</th>
<th>Australian English</th>
<th>Vietnamese</th>
<th>Vietnamese English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explicit compliment</td>
<td>1357</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>1105</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implicit compliment</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-compliment</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opt-out</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>283</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1800</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1800</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Overall Frequency of Syntactic Patterns across Language Groups

b) Syntactic Patterns

Respondents’ choice of syntactic patterns used in paying compliments is presented in Table 2 below. In general, respondents in the three groups employed a high frequency of NP Look/Be (Int) Adj (You look really cool today). However, there were some sharp differences in choosing syntactic patterns among the three groups. Australian used Adj NP (Cool mountain bike!) very frequently (23.4%) while those of native Vietnamese and Vietnamese speakers of English only indicated 7% and 3.2% of the total frequency respectively. On the contrary, What (a) (Int) Adj NP was favored by native speakers of Vietnamese (Cha! May anh dep qua!) and Vietnamese learners of English (What a funky mountain bike!). The overall statistic for syntactic patterns reached high significance ($\chi^2 = 726.64$, df = 18, p < .001).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Syntactic Patterns</th>
<th>Language group</th>
<th>Australian English</th>
<th>Vietnamese</th>
<th>Vietnamese English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NP Look/Be (Int) Adj</td>
<td>504</td>
<td>37.1</td>
<td>578</td>
<td>52.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pro Be (Int) Adj</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>.006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I (Int) Like NP</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adj NP</td>
<td>318</td>
<td>23.4</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Int) Adj</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pro/NP (Int) V (Int)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>.007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NP (Int) Suit You</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What (a) (Int) Adj NP</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>11.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You V (a) (Int) Adj NP</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congratulations!</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

c) Compliment Response Strategies

Table 3 below indicated the overall results taking together male and female respondents. The Chi-square statistic for overall compliment response strategies across languages is highly significant ($\chi^2 = 239.53$, df = 4, p < .001). In the Table 4, the overall distribution of compliment responses across language groups was separated in terms of gender, which reflects the preferred strategies in responding to being complimented between males and females.
Generally speaking, females seem to accept compliments than males do. On the contrary, males tend to reject or deflect compliments. This tendency also existed in each of the group. Specifically, while Australian female respondents employed 764 acceptance responses, (84.9% of the total compliment responses) against 743 used by Australian males (82.6%), female native speakers of Vietnamese paid 585 acceptance responses (65%) in comparison to 538 acceptance responses (60%) used by their male counterparts. Similarly, 671 acceptance responses (74.6%) were used by female Vietnamese learners of English compared with 648 responses of the same type used by male Vietnamese learners of English accounting for 72%. The difference in choice of compliment response substrategies between male and female respondents taken as a whole indicated high significance ($\chi^2 = 476.86$, df =24, p <.0001 for male and $\chi^2 = 267.09$, df =24, p <.0001 for female respondents).

Table 3: Overall Frequency of Compliment responses across Language Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compliment response strategies</th>
<th>Language group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Australian English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acceptance</td>
<td>1507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-compliment</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1800</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Overall Frequency of Compliment responses across Language Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compliment response strategies</th>
<th>Language group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. ACCEPTANCE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Appreciation/</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>agreement token</td>
<td>389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Agreeing utterance</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Downgrading/</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>qualifying utterance</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Return compliment</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>743</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. REJECT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Disagreeing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>utterance</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Question accuracy</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Challenge sincerity</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. DEFLECT/</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVADE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Shift credit</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Informative</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>comment</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4: Frequency and Percentage of Compliment Responses by Languages and by Gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>0</th>
<th>.0</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>.03</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>.09</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>1.7</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>1.0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10. Ignore</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Legitimate evasion</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.06</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Request assurance/repetition</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Opt out</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>207</td>
<td>23.0</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>18.8</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>18.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**d) Compliment function**

Functions of compliments were not much revealed through the DCTs data. However, they were fairly emergent in the role-play data. This supported that natural data collection has certain effect upon the intention of interactants. As maintained by Wolfson (1983), compliments can serve different functions or replace other speech acts as illustrated in the following examples:

**+ request for help**

a) - Oh, teacher! *Your presentation is very impressive* and I’m…
+ Thank you, Lan. I’ll try more. I don’t think I have made a good presentation.
Mm… *Could I meet you tomorrow? I would appreciate your kindness... uh to ...*
+ Oh, ... oh, if you would like...
- Thank you very much
+ Not at all!

b) - Hi, I’ve read your essay. *I like it very much. Can you show me how you could write so good ? uh... so well?*
+ Oh, you know I (……) I do my best ...
- Yeah, thank you.

**+ suggestion**

c) - Wow! What a beautiful mountain bike! Where did you buy it?
+ It’s a present, you know. My brother gave me last week.
- *May I borrow it some day?*
+ Yes, of course. You can.

**+ gratitudde**

d) - Thank you, Leanne! *You have an impressive presentation.*
+ You’re welcome.
- How can you make such beautiful progress?
+ Oh, I .... I ....am very embarrassed in ..... presentation, you know. Some problems in my presentation
In these examples, compliments were used both as an opener to help the speaker establish rapport with the compliment recipients and as a way for the complimenter to address their primary intentions to do something. Cross-culturally, this way of speaking is widely used among the Vietnamese and is adopted by Vietnamese learners of English. Information from the interviews showed that Australian speakers of English preferred expressing their intentions more directly. It suggests that Vietnamese people tend to be more indirect than Australians and that cultural norms play an important role in determining language behaviour.

Qualitative results

It is widely accepted that native speakers of English give and receive more compliments than do the Vietnamese. The latter tend to be thrifty on giving compliments to other people, even their friends.

I don’t know why. But may be it’s the…er..culture. May be mainly because… Vietnamese people appreciate modesty. In addition, they sometimes are shy and they… feel if they give a compliment, er… they are flattering (VF.TD)

Topics for compliments reflect culture-specificity and also degree of relationship. In European and American or Australian culture, most of the compliments are highly motivated from politeness. But in Vietnamese culture, on the contrary, they express something emotional. Apart from some safe topics for both males and females, some others are sensitive, or even taboos. Age, for example, is not expected as a topic for compliments in English-speaking cultures, it is however, high appreciated by the elderly in Vietnamese culture. The recipients are very pleased although you are talking about their age. Normally, the Vietnamese highly regard the older people. Obviously, the difference between the two cultures affects our complimenting behaviour.

Besides, the topics for compliments also reveal certain degree of relationship between the complimenter and complimentee.

I think it depends on the relationship. Because men usually give more compliments to women. They feel that they are close enough. May be the complimenter just want to do something else rather give you a compliment. Encouragement, for example (AF.SA).

In societies where hierarchy is still honoured like Vietnam, age, social status and educational background strongly influence upon one’s complimenting behaviour. However, in an egalitarian culture like Australia, perhaps the gender and relationship between interlocutors is the most important factor. This determines the frequency of compliments between males and females.

Er… Yeah. I think so. It is a little bit different for a compliment between males and females. If a woman compliments a man, I think it is more serious. When I compliment a woman it tends to be a bit more because it is more frequent, it is not so
serious. If I compliment a man on something I though about I have to check carefully beforehand and I wouldn’t think to be more flippant and spontaneous. Yeah! Because men may make the assumption that when I compliment a man, he might think that I am interested in him. (AF.SA).

When to give a compliment is a matter of delicacy. Because a compliment may be mistakenly received by the addresses as a wrong signal or unwanted compliment or an act of mockery. When the hearer has something good and you make a compliment on. Because they are interactional participants, and they are conscious to .. to know that you are .. er honest, to make a compliment. A second thing is they are really in good mood, and they are expecting a compliment. (VM.S.D)

Giving a compliment in an inappropriate time or manner may be misunderstood as flattery as the borderline between a real compliment and flattery is very blurred. No matter how thin the borderline between flattery and a real compliment is, however, we can make a clear-cut boundary between the two things. First the felicitous condition to make a true compliment is that the addressee has something good and he deserves a compliment. The second thing is the sincerity condition. It means that the addressee understand that the addresser is sincere in uttering such a compliment. Besides, the difference between flattery and a real compliment lie in one’s true emotion, coming from one’s heart and it is that one gives compliments not because he wants to make advantage from them,

Concerning compliment response strategies, while Australian speakers of English tend to employ appreciation/ agreement token (thanks) or agreeing utterance (yes, it’s beautiful), native speakers of Vietnamese and Vietnamese speakers of English prefer a downgrading/ qualifying utterance which reflects their being modest (Thanks, but I will have to try harder) or (Really? It’s a cheap one)

Not because I am doubtful about the compliments but it is just the way most Vietnamese people respond to being complimented. And they transfer into English when they are learning it. Many foreigners think that Vietnamese learners of English are not quite assertive about their strength in downplaying the compliments they deserve. These comments do not reflect the nature of complimenting and being complimented in Vietnamese culture because employing a downgrading substrategy is consistent with how to cope with the dilemma of accepting a compliment and avoiding self-praise (VF.SH)

To many Vietnamese respondents, responding to a compliment with ‘thank you’ implies arrogance and this should be avoided. Further, many Vietnamese learners of English think that some explanation is preferred because ‘thanks’ sound very abrupt and rather impolite.

To a Vietnamese complimenter, we don’t say ‘thank you’, because it sounds very formal…. You know.. and interrupts some kind of further conversation. For example, somebody says “Oh, I like your dress”, and I say “Oh, it’s a gift from my friend”. Er…However, to an English friends, we usually we say “thank you”, and even after saying thank you, we explain a little bit about the reason. I think we transfer the Vietnamese style and we combine. Yeah, we always try to explain (VF. TS)

Similarly, Vietnamese respondents who are teachers and learners of English express that ‘thank you’ is not the most appropriate. ‘Thank you’ appeared most in textbooks of English available for use in class. Learners automatically absorbed them to find out later that it is not the good choice.

First because it sounds too monotonous and unemotional. The second thing is that sometimes we respond to a compliment negatively or partly negatively. We should try to say something in order not to hurt the addresser’s feeling (VM.SS/ VF.TD)

As for the function of compliments, usually a compliment precedes a complaint or a criticism just because it helps to protect the addressee from being hurt. Similarly, a compliment should precede a request a way to establish a through channel between the speaker and the hearer. This is consistent with the maxims of politeness observed both in Western and Oriental cultures.
Implication of the study

Providing input to develop student’s sociopragmatic and pragmalinguistic competence.

Bardovi-Harlig (2001:29) states, “The empirical evidence shows that learners who have received no specific instruction in L2 pragmatics have noticeably different L2 pragmatic systems than native speakers of the L2. This is true for both production and comprehension.” Students need more options as input for giving and receiving compliments. These options may be a little bit different from the required textbooks used for speaking courses. In order to assist students in giving and receiving compliments, it is recommended that teachers in charge of speaking courses compile or design those which sound appropriately sociopragmatically and pragmalinguistically for use in class. These options are available from articles about complimenting and are very beneficial for students when they role-play imaginatively in a variety of contexts in which different social factors are taken into account. Obviously, it is the imagination which enhances the effects of role-play situations. As Bardovi-Harlig (2001:32) concludes: “Adopting the sociocultural rules as one’s own in an L2 may have to be an individual decision. Providing the information so that a learner can make that choice is a pedagogical decision.” Above all, learners must be sufficiently cultural awareness to be able to make informed choices, to decide how far they wish to go in any process of cultural adaptation (Fitzgerald, 2003). In all, the input - the explicit support - provided by the teachers, to a greater extent, will gradually enable students to engage in successful exchanges of compliments and compliment responses with native speakers of English.

Creating communicative opportunities for students to practice giving and receiving compliments in English.

Generally speaking, most students at this level (year 3) have a good command of English in terms of linguistic competence, many of them, however, may still lack pragmatic competence. In other words, they may still be unable to interact with native speakers of English socially and culturally appropriately. In order to help students overcome this problem, teachers should provide their students with opportunities to role-play the near-real situations through certain scenarios involving giving and receiving compliments. In addition, transcripts or videos containing compliments and compliment responses can be used for rehearsals, and then students are asked to role-play them again and then give feedback on these contexts. This activity is of great help for them when they encounter similar situations in real-life communication. Because through role-play (and simulations), teachers can have the opportunity to show their students the appropriateness of utterances, and how speakers negotiate certain situations (accepting/rejecting compliments) as well as providing a framework for the performances of speech acts (Burns, 1998).

Adapting textbook materials

Giving and receiving compliments have been presented in textbooks for teaching speaking English. This emphasizes the language function that the textbook writers have considered. Yet, there are quite a few options for students to learn and put in use. Even if they have learnt them all, it does not mean that they are able to use them appropriately because these options are too generalised and no explanation as to when and whom each of them should be used. As Bardovi-Harlig straightforwardly states, “it is important to recognise that, in general, textbooks cannot be counted on as a reliable source of pragmatic input for classroom language learners” (2001:25). It is also because textbooks generally provide too little information about language use and often the dialogues included in the textbooks are misleading and do not sound naturally-occurring talk (Golato, 2002:568). Also, may textbooks used for teaching the functions of English mostly focus on the acquisition of linguistic competence, with insufficient attention to a fuller communicative competence (Boxer and Pickering, 1995).

This task requires the co-operation between teachers and students. The teacher should create the opportunities for students to work in small groups or in pair to discuss the possible use of each option. While they are discussing, they can learn from their peer because peer-to-peer scaffolding may be just as important as expert-novice scaffolding (Ko et al, 2003) and eventually develop their sociopragmatic and pragmalinguistic knowledge (Kasper, 2001). This
task also emphasizes the teacher’s role in planning and designing the scenarios for role-play as classroom tasks to develop students’ communicative competence in giving and receiving compliments.

**Conclusion**

The study shows that there are some similarities in the semantic and syntactic patterns for complimenting in Australian English and Vietnamese in main strategies and substrategies for giving and receiving compliments. The findings of this study also show that at the level of syntax, Vietnamese learners of English in the present study is getting closer to the target language although the gaps are still big showing a maintenance of language and identity in interaction.

Finally, this study suggests some implications for Vietnamese ELT teacher. Learners should be made aware of the differences between semantic and syntactic structures in the two languages. This can be done through metalinguistic-awareness exercises. Further, as far as lexis is concerned, some of the adjectives (cool, funky…) widely used among young people should be introduced so that Vietnamese learners of English can employ a variety of widely used lexis in their compliments. Last but not least, differences between male and female choice of language use should be incorporated into teaching materials and classroom activities (role-plays) in order to help learners achieve better communicative language performance.

**References**


Discourse, Domination, and What it Means to be Critical: the ‘Disciplining’ of Foucault’s Perception of power in Critical Discourse Analysis

John O’Regan
Oxford Brookes University

Abstract

The paper discusses the role of Foucault in formulating CDA’s understanding of the discursive construction of domination. It characterises this formulation as one of ‘disciplining’ the concept of power in CDA. That is, in articulating CDA as a ‘disciplinary’ field of critical social research, and in ‘disciplining’ through a process of delimitation the perception of power which Foucault presents in his work. The view of power which CDA adapts from Foucault is one in which power is conceived negatively as domination, manipulation and control. This negative view of power is privileged over an alternative ‘positive’ view of power in which power is viewed as productive, constructive, and knowledge forming. The paper argues that the disciplining of the concept of power in CDA has had the consequence of narrowing the field of possible objects which are open to a critical analysis of discourse by orienting CDA towards the analysis of texts in which the abuse and manipulation of power by dominant groups are the principal concerns. The paper discusses the theoretical implications for CDA of adopting a more positive estimation of power as ‘power/knowledge’ and examines what this might mean for an understanding of critical practice.

Discussion

This paper concerns power, and specifically how power is conceived in Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) (e.g. Fowler, 1996; Fairclough and Wodak, 1997; Chouliaraki and Fairclough, 1999; Fairclough, 2001; Wodak, 1989, 2001; van Dijk, 1993, 2004). I would like to reflect on how power has been understood in CDA, and how this affects the practice of CDA, especially in the choice of the social phenomena/objects/texts that it studies. I wish to make some suggestions for an alternative perspective of power which may have implications for these choices, as well as for how CDA studies them. My interest in this is applied. By this I mean that it is derived from teaching courses in CDA to university students, and concerns in part the justifications which I have in the past presented to myself and to students for teaching a method of discourse analysis which is critical. These justifications have mainly been motivated by a desire to intervene, at the level of the text, in reified systems of social injustice, inequality and exclusion, in an attempt to understand how these systems operate discursively, and to consider how, or whether, they might be destabilised. Implicit in this practice is that I have hoped that as a critical discourse analyst and teacher I might make some contribution to the creation of more equitable and just alternatives. This is a perspective which many critical discourse analysts seem to share. This aim may be characterised as moving society away from orders of power which are based on systems of domination, obfuscation, manipulation and control, to ones which are based on principles of social justice, tolerance, openness and understanding. It is views such as these which make CDA critical, and which construct the critical practitioner as someone who is politically-minded and committed to just alternatives.

To set the context of this discussion I would like to introduce two brief extracts. The first is from Foucault’s Inaugural Lecture at the Collège de France, on December 2, 1970. He begins his lecture by saying:

I should not like to have to enter this risky order of discourse; I should not like to be
involved in its peremptoriness and decisiveness; I should like it to be all around me like a calm, deep transparency, infinitely open, where others would fit in with my expectations, and from which truths would emerge one by one; I should only have to let myself be carried, within it and by it, like a happy wreck. (Foucault, Inaugural Lecture at the Collège de France. December 2, 1970)

I think that, in what I am about to say in this paper, I too am entering a risky order of discourse and I am unsure as to how I will come out of it at the end. The reason this is risky is explained by the second extract, this time from the book *Discourse in Late Modernity* (1999) by Lilie Chouliaraki and Norman Fairclough. What they say here goes to the heart of the subject of this paper. In their (poststructuralist) view:

Although epistemic relativism must be accepted – that all discourses are socially constructed relative to the social positions that people are in – this does not entail judgemental relativism – that all discourses are equally good. (Chouliaraki and Fairclough, 1999: 8)

My problem is how both positions can be held at the same time, and in the remainder of this paper I will be raising some questions about the viability of this position, with all the attendant risks (for me) which this entails.

To begin this discussion we first need to look at how the concept of power is understood in CDA. The concept of power in CDA should need little introduction. It has been through the struggle against inequitable systems of power that critical discourse analysis has defined itself. To van Dijk, for example, the purpose of CDA is to focus on 'the role of discourse in the (re)production and challenge of dominance' (van Dijk, 1993: 240). This perspective is echoed by Fairclough, for whom the ‘critical analysis of discourse is nothing if it is not a resource for struggle against domination’ (Fairclough, 2001: 216).

Power as domination, is therefore understood as an oppressive force in society; one which is calculated to subjugate opposition to the mechanisms by which the status quo is maintained in the interests of power holders. These are loosely presented as consisting of an alliance of governments, capitalists and general stakeholders in capital, who together constitute the dominant bloc within capitalist societies, and within global capitalism more generally (Fairclough, 1999, 2001). Theorisations of the concept of power in CDA present power as closely aligned with ideology and the construction of consent, particularly as this is expressed in the work of Althusser (1971) in relation to the operation of ideological state apparatuses, and Gramsci (1971, 1986) on ideological hegemony and the manufacture of consent (see also Hall, 1996).

The idea that power is not simply oppressive but circulates between and through all social relations and practices is derived from Foucault (1980, 1981). Foucault conceives of power as a net-like organisation in which we are entwined:

And not only do individuals circulate between its threads; they are always in the position of simultaneously undergoing and exercising this power. They are not only its inert or consenting target; they are always also the elements of its articulation. (Foucault, 1980: 98)

This view of power is also recognised by Chouliaraki and Fairclough:

We believe that the view of modern power as invisible, self-regulating and inevitably subjecting … needs to be complemented with a view of power as domination … Otherwise it can collapse into structural determinism and anti-humanism which leaves no space for agency in social practices. (Chouliaraki and Fairclough, 1999: 24)

But as you can see, they insist that it must be complimented by a view of power as domination. More than that, I believe the view of power as domination in CDA is privileged over the view of power as an invisible network. The preferred dominant perspective of power in CDA is given by Janks:

Critical discourse analysis is used to understand how language works to position readers in the interests of power. It assumes a critical theory of ideology … which sees power as negative and productive of inequitable social relations. (Janks, 2000: 177)
It is in this sense that CDA as a discipline is generally understood. It is, as Janks says, a *negative* view of power.

The view of power in CDA, although primarily conceived in terms of domination, is nevertheless ambivalent, for two reasons. The first is that power as domination, and power as an invisible network running through life, are concepts which are inconsistently present in CDA.

Although Fairclough and Chouliaraki draw attention to both types of power, it seems less evident across CDA more generally. The second ambivalence is that there seems to be a conflict between power as an invisible network and power as domination, which is not effectively resolved. This centres on the assumption that a poststructuralist or Foucauldian view of power involves sacrificing the conception of power as domination, or power collapses into structural determinism and a loss of human agency because there is no more power to struggle against.

Foucault, however, does not efface power as domination. He says, ‘Let us not deceive ourselves; if we speak of the structures or the mechanisms of power, it is only insofar as we suppose that certain persons exercise power over others’ (Foucault, 1992: 217); he also says ‘where there is power, there is also resistance’ (Foucault, 1981: 95).

What Foucault does question is the idea that the resistance to power as domination can be predicated on foundational notions of truth, or an appeal to foundational moral principles, and that by opposing domination it is possible to reveal true knowledge and so promote a truer world. He says:

… the problem does not consist in drawing the line between that in a discourse which falls under the category of scientificity or truth, and that which comes under some other category, but in seeing historically how effects of truth are produced within discourses which in themselves are neither true nor false’ (Foucault, 1980: 118).

For Foucault then, the point is to examine how different discourses operate in making claims about truth, and the purpose of discursive analysis is to study how such discourses construct the world in the way that they do. It is not part of this analysis to determine which discourses are true and which are false, as this is futile. For Foucault we are unable to decide this because we are beings ‘who are historically determined’ (Foucault, 1984: 43) and also discursively situated (Foucault, 1989; Laclau and Mouffe, 1985), and so we are unable to stand outside these relations in order to make these types of truth judgements. He says: ‘one can’t, however regrettable it may be, put these notions forward to justify a fight which should … overthrow the very fundamentals of our society’ (Foucault cited in Rabinow, 1984: 7).

But as we noted at the start CDA needs ethical principles. It needed them in the past:

An important emancipatory political objective [in CDA] is to maximise the conditions for judgements of truth to be compared and evaluated on their merits … Retreating into a helpless relativism when faced with issues such as war crimes in ex-Yugoslavia, which require judgements of truth and falsity, is in my view serious ethical failure, whatever theoretical voices may be used to rationalise it. (Fairclough, 1995: 19)

… and it still needs them now:

… we see ourselves as working within a post-structuralist perspective, but without adopting either post-structuralist reductions of the whole of social life to discourse, or post-structuralist judgemental relativism. (Chouliaraki and Fairclough, 1999: 32)

There is no question of not sharing Fairclough’s view of war crimes. Nor is there any question of being unsympathetic to his and Chouliaraki’s opinion of the need to be able to make moral judgements. This much should be obvious. And yet it is in this very obviousness that my problem lies, because this is a *philosophical* order of discourse which they have entered into. And for the reason that they have entered into it, they also have to accept the attendant ‘risks’ which this entails. That is, they cannot just assume that foundational or judgemental truth is obvious, and that dissonant ‘theoretical voices’ can just be shut out; – they are already here; they are already present in this order of discourse. For this reason Foucault’s relativism (and the relativism of others) cannot be so easily set aside. Fairclough’s judgement of ‘serious
ethical failure’ is therefore a problematic one. Not only is it not a theoretically or philosophically obvious judgement, but it seems also to be dependent on a transcendental view. That is, it rests on the assumption that there is a neutral space where such adjudications can be made, where it is possible to distinguish right from wrong, true from false. The problem with this perspective is that it one which puts itself outside historical circumstances by locating human agency in a ‘third space’ which is outside such relations. Moreover, if this space is outside human situatedness in historical circumstances, it must simultaneously also be outside ideology and outside discourse, for it is in ideology and discourse that human experience, and therefore history, is engaged.

To be able to retain judgemental and moral truths, Chouliaraki and Fairclough would need to provide some explanation of how we can be historically, ideologically and discursively located beings and yet still able to make foundational truth claims. They do not do this however, and this leaves them (and us) with the philosophical problem of making truth judgements while appearing to deny our being in the wor(l)d.

I therefore view the concept of power as having been ‘disciplined’ in CDA. That is in articulating CDA as a ‘disciplinary’ field of critical social research, and in ‘disciplining’ through a process of delimitation the perception of power which Foucault presents. The disciplining of the concept of power in CDA involves privileging the discursive construction of domination, ‘negative power,’ over the discursive construction of social life and the domains of knowledge which constitute it. A central aspect of Foucault’s work is that this relation is formulated differently so that the constructing and constituting aspects of power are privileged over the concept of power as domination. His is a positive view of power. ‘Rather than analysing power in terms of its internal rationality’ (Foucault, 1984: 211), that is, how it oppresses and subjugates, the purpose is to analyse power in terms of what it produces:

What makes power hold good, what makes it accepted, is the fact that it does not only weigh on us as a force that says no, but that it traverses and produces things, it induces pleasure, forms knowledge, produces discourse. It needs to be considered as a productive network which runs through the whole of society, much more than a negative instance whose function is repression. (Foucault, 1980: 119)

The problem with the preoccupation with relations of domination in CDA is that ‘the study of language as a form of social practice’ (Fairclough, 2001: 18) is made secondary to the study of the discursive construction of domination. This has the consequence of considerably narrowing the meaning of what it is to be engaged in a critical practice, and therefore also the incidences in the discursive practices of a society to which a critical analysis of discourse may be applied. If domination and its deconstruction are the measures of a critical practice, it would seem for example that the great number, probably a majority, of the texts and sociocultural products which a society produces are automatically discounted from consideration in CDA. For example, book and CD covers, advertisements for holidays, hearing aids, household appliances, supermarkets, cigarettes, alcohol, clothes, beauty products. Also lonely hearts columns, DIY instructions, horoscopes, electricity bills, weather reports, sports commentaries, notices, signs, leaflets, bus tickets or tins of sardines. What this leads to is a neglect of mundanity, functionality, and utility in textual objects of study (e.g. recipes, weather reports, bus tickets, food labels), a prioritising of texts implicated in sustaining unequal power relations (e.g. racist, sexist, socially inegalitarian, divisive, etc.) and a focus on critical practice as ‘criticising’ and ‘deconstructing.’ This, it seems to me, places some limits on CDA as the study of language as a form of social practice.

What I am suggesting, following Foucault, is that the language as a social practice dimensions of CDA should be privileged over the discursive construction of domination. In other words, the hierarchy should be reversed so that positive power is privileged over negative power. This would enable CDA to be made open to a wider range of applications and to a wider range of texts. This leads to a re-estimation of criticality in CDA, in which a critical practice is understood as one which examines through the study of a society’s texts the discursive construction of social life. In other words, it is the study of how we as human beings construct and understand the world as we do through the texts which we produce, rather than an examination of how texts construct us within relations of domination (see Pennycook, 2001; Luke, 2004). Domination does not just disappear, however, as these relations are still part of the way we construct and understand our world. For the reason that there is no limit to the number and types of texts which a society produces, a principal
difference between CDA and the approach of this paper is that any text can be a critical object, and therefore any text may be subject to a critical analysis of its discourse. Rearticulating critical practice in order to privilege the constructing and meaning-making character of discourse over its role in the construction of domination (i.e. positive power over negative power) presents certain advantages for educational applications. Firstly, it makes it possible for students to analyse and discuss texts in a wide range of genres without the constraint of having to demonstrate how the text in question may be contributing to the production, reinforcement and/or maintenance of relations of domination, and secondly, for the same reason, it also gives the teacher a much freer choice in the selection of texts for the classroom.

While these are advantages, to reverse the opposition between negative and positive power, as Foucault does, leaves CDA with the problem of how it grounds itself as a critical practice, since foundational truths no longer have a place in the theorisation of power. As Pennycook (2001: 136) puts it: 'If there is no way of establishing reality or truth outside a particular sign system, how then can we still make judgements about preferable outcomes?' Gee (1993) suggests that we must consider the effect on people of what we do and say. He says, 'That something should harm someone else … is always a good reason … not to do it' (cited in Pennycook, 2001: 137). Gee offers a second reason; this is that 'One always has the ethical obligation to explicate … any social practice that there is a reason to believe advantages oneself or one's group over other people or groups' (cited in Pennycook, ibid: 136). The problem for these perspectives is how we are supposed to appreciate in the absence of ethical foundations why not harming someone is 'a good thing,' or why a social practice which advantages oneself over others is, if it is not explicated, possibly 'a bad thing.' It is difficult to escape the conclusion Gee and Pennycook still seem to be appealing to a non-situated third space to ground their ethical practice, because by appealing to 'goodness,' its inverse 'badness' is also implied, and therefore so is their (and our) ability to claim to be able to differentiate between them.

The issue thus remains as to how we can be historically, ideologically and discursively situated and yet still able to make ethical choices in the absence of moral guarantees. If we are to begin to try to find our way out of the circularity of a discourse ethics reliant on foundational moral truths, we first need to accept that discourses which are grounded in such truths are unreliable, and therefore that to talk in terms of good and bad, true and false, only returns us to where we started.

We therefore need an alternative discourse which can be seen to perform a similar role but which, in the absence of the ability to tell whether one truth is preferable to another, may nevertheless lead to outcomes which, if we were to employ the (albeit unreliable) discourses of good and bad, might still be described as ethical. In such a discourse, ethics would be effaced and yet in some ways also remain present. It is would therefore still be an ethical discourse, yet its ethics would be simultaneously both absent and present. This is the position which is presented by Derrida's notion of différance (Derrida, 1976; 1981), according to which all signs carry within them the implication of their other. For Derrida, there can be no originary or pure notion of good (as opposed to bad), of the outside (as opposed to the inside), or of truth (as opposed to untruth) which does not already include the implication of its 'Other,' in short, 'there is no experience of pure presence' (Derrida, 1988: 10). Différance is the formulation which for Derrida captures absence and presence simultaneously. It is therefore through Derrida that a discourse ethics which is not grounded in foundational moral truths might be proposed. Such a discourse ethics, if it is to have any value at all, must give grounds for making judgements which are not dependent on transcendentals. This is why in the deconstructionist discourse ethics of Derrida the grounds on which judgements may be made are determined according to the synonymic principle of an opposition to closure, and an openness to the 'Other.' He says:

Once you grant some privilege to gathering and not to dissociating, then you leave no room for the other, for the radical otherness of the other, for the radical singularity of the other. I think, from that point of view, separation, dissociation is not an obstacle to society, to community, but the condition. (Derrida, 1997: 14)

Rather than trying to determine whether different truths are good or bad, this discourse ethics asks instead whether putting a particular discourse or set of discourses into practice would lead to a Heideggerian ‘gathering’ or ‘closing’ of the ‘universe of discourse’ (Marcuse, 1964)
and therefore also a turning away from, or denial, of the Other. A critical discourse analysis which is concerned with adjudicating between truth claims, would on this basis seek to adjudicate between different truths according to whether the field of alternative possibilities – ‘the radical otherness of the other’ – would continue to remain open, and not be shut off or closed down. This is why Derrida insists on the need to be able to sustain both an interminable questioning of the social, and an open-ended hospitality towards the Other, because as he puts it: ‘pure unity or pure multiplicity … is a synonym of death’ (Derrida, 1997: 13). Derrida therefore rules out absolute contingency as well. For Derrida, there are no absolute truths to guide our actions. Instead what we have is a reflexive attitude towards our ‘responsibility,’ that is, towards our ‘infinite’ responsibility to openness and to the Other, and towards the discourses, conventions and practices which our responsibility entails. We have this responsibility because it is this which carries our acknowledgment of Other. It also enables decision-making and is a counter-force to inertia.

Turning back to CDA, if discourse ethics is to be reformulated on the basis of a Derridean opposition to closure and an infinite responsibility to the Other, then this means that a reformulated CDA is one which:

- is reflexive about its claims to truth,
- is aware of its fallibleness and its limits to knowing,
- is opposed to closure,
- does not presume to be emancipatory,
- has an infinite responsibility,
- and is judgemental without being foundational.

It is in this way, and it seems to me, only in this way, would CDA accord with the sentiment expressed by Chouliaraki and Fairclough (1999: 32) of a critical practice which is ‘working within a poststructuralist perspective,’ and not, as I feel theirs has been, of a CDA which still seems to be working ‘without.’

References


"That Which We Are, We Are"... English Teachers’ Discourses and Their Professional Identities in a Time of Change

Kerry-Ann O'Sullivan
Macquarie University

Abstract

This paper analyses the patterns found in teachers’ discourses during the implementation of a new HSC 2001 English syllabus in New South Wales and the ways in which these patterns relate to teachers' professional identities. The teachers involved in the study that is reported had no contact with each other, and were from a selection of locations and school systems from across New South Wales, and yet there is extraordinary consistency found in their ways of thinking and behaving. Although the unique voices of particular individuals are identifiable what is most striking about their discourses is the similarities inherent in them - the metaphors chosen to convey their feelings and attitudes, and the multiplicity of contradictions and ironies in what they said and did. Their collective voice speaks loudly even though their particular contexts for the implementation of new curriculum are markedly different. The teachers' discourses about their individual self concepts suggest that their professional identities, and what they value in the subject, English, are vitally important components of these constructs. Most teachers viewed their professional identities as being closely aligned with, or even inseparable from, their sense of self. The teachers' discourses about themselves and their subject in a time of significant curriculum change illuminate the nature of the change process and the ways in which a professional identity is constructed.

Introduction

The interior landscape of teachers' professional identity contains a number of domains that influence their work. Scholars, in their attempts to define teachers’ knowledge, beliefs and thoughts, distinguish many aspects that guide teachers’ practice and which contribute to their values and attitudes. Various components make up a teacher’s professional identity and it is generally acknowledged that this involves a complex interplay of elements. The contested nature of the subject of English adds to the multiple ways in which teachers within its discipline perceive themselves. The prevailing state of flux in the subject’s identity over the past twenty years has led to its practitioners crafting their own domains within its shifting territory.

How teachers respond to a new syllabus, what they say and do within the challenging landscape of educational reform and curriculum implementation in the contemporary postmodern world attracts considerable research interest from scholars. The introduction in New South Wales, Australia, of a mandatory new Higher School Certificate syllabus in 2000 - for examination in 2001 (see, Board of Studies, 1999) - challenged the prevailing paradigms of the school subject and disturbed the existing beliefs and pedagogies of English practitioners. This period of change provides the historical context for this investigation.

Methodology

The research was developed predominantly within a qualitative framework through semi-structured interviews with fifteen teachers from a range of schools from both the government and non-government systems in metropolitan and non-metropolitan locations in New South Wales (see, O'Sullivan, 2005). The participants, who included eight Head Teachers of English and seven teachers of English, were identified using a purposive sampling technique and were chosen from self-selecting respondents to an initial statewide survey. They have a variety of teaching experiences between them. This study is framed by an understanding that discourses always communicate more than a literal
message (Gee, 1996). Discourses present layered expressions of partial and constructed meaning which convey unique ways of being and acting, and which reveal particular perceptions and realities. The lens used to read the interview texts was informed by the view that “all texts are normative, shaping, and constructing rather than simply reflecting and describing” (Luke, 1995, p.19). In this way, the multiple views and voices produced within the teachers’ discourses and the various positions adopted by the speakers were analysed. The theoretical perspectives of grounded theory, discourse analysis, and curriculum change informed the analysis of the data. The interview texts positioned the individuals in distinctive ways and revealed their various ideas, versions and meanings about themselves as English teachers, their local worlds, and the event of change.

The findings that are presented below are complied from an analysis of the fifteen teachers’ responses across the interview questions. Clusters of ideas and images are used here to convey the particular features and details that have been drawn from the research data specifically about the teachers’ discourses and descriptions of their identities as English teachers and the nature of their subject.

Findings
Discourses about identity as an English teacher

When asked to describe themselves as English teachers, the participants reveal a strong sense of belief in their own abilities, irrespective of their age or teaching experience. The teachers’ discourses seem to present the established and confident views that they hold of themselves – related to, and derived from, - their past behaviours and thoughts. Their use of personally assertive expressions such as “I am…”, “I have …”, and “I’ve…” convey the sense that what they are talking about is firmly incorporated into their identity and is a secure part of how they behave and think. The directness and individual assurance of their responses heightens the personal and professional confidence that they communicate about themselves.

Most teachers use personalised statements and images to emphasise what they perceive as their distinctive, defining qualities as English teachers. They speak of the things they enjoy doing in English and some accentuate the specific skills and approaches they attribute as characteristic of their practice. Although a few teachers admit they are feeling less certain about their chosen profession because of the significant upheavals created by the current curriculum changes, they generally display passion for their role as teachers of English and speak confidently about themselves.

In other words, when these teachers are talking about their identities as English teachers at the time of a new syllabus, they tend to define their identity in terms of personal statements that convey their self-appraisals and beliefs; and through a choice of rather surprising images to describe the ways they see themselves.

Personal statements

Some of the teachers volunteered, without embarrassment, a frank evaluation of their teaching abilities and asserted a number of things that generally cast them in a positive light. Their personal statements reveal various aspects of themselves that they seem to have internalised as a part of their teaching identity and which are also part of their own belief and value systems.

Quite a range of perceptions is covered in their self evaluations with some teachers asserting very confident assessments: “a bloody good teacher”; “I’m an English teacher down to my bootstraps”; “I’m capable”; “I find teaching English very easy”; “I am confident”; “I know what I’m talking about”; and “you have to believe in what you are doing … and I do!”. Others moderate their judgments through their use of qualifiers or hedging, mitigating devices seen in: “I think I’m reasonably well respected by colleagues and students”; “I’m quite good”; “I’m a bit of a rambling teacher”; “some days - damn good…other days - absolutely hopeless” and my view is “in flux”.

Many of the participants appraised their various skills and their particular interests connected to English. The consistent use of first person in their statements creates a strong sense of their socially situated identity - how they position and perceive themselves as teachers of English. Their assessments acknowledge their practical skills, identify their strengths, and classify their state of action. In highlighting aspects of their own practice that they value they point out: "my strength is student motivation"; "I'm a very competent website user"; "I'm very tied to the text"; "I've always been
The teachers named aspects of their personality that they view as an integral part of their teaching disposition. These qualities seem to define them both as teachers and as people and are intrinsically connected. They appear to be incorporated into their philosophy for teaching and in the following examples, there is little separation between the personal and professional: “I don’t like to be bored”; “I like kids”; “I’m fairly flexible”; “I like to be able to go with the flow”; “I’m still anti assessment basically”; “I like variety”; “I’m interested in issues”; and “I like to have success”.

The teachers’ discourses also provide insights about what motivates them in their teaching and again, there is a strong sense of personal ownership and individual assertion. These reasons occur in two main clusters. The first cluster centres on what the teachers say they particularly value for themselves in their subject and their teaching. They espouse aesthetic, moral, practical, and even somewhat selfish reasons. Their use of words such as “love” and “moral” in the following examples represent the deeply felt personal intensity that the subject inspires in some teachers to an extent where it has become a part of their being. This enthusiasm appears as an animating spirit for their professional life: “I love English”; “I see myself as someone creating critical awareness”; “I have a cultural passion”; “setting a moral tone”; “I really enjoy the media side of things”; “the classroom is my ‘solace’ and where I want to be”.

The second cluster centres on their ambitions for their students. There is some evidence of altruism, of a zeal for outcomes beyond academic achievement, and a distinct focus on the wider panorama of life rather than on the more limited canvas of school. What they say lacks specificity in terms of how they actually achieve these expressed goals. There is a desire for something almost intangible in their claims that: “I like them (students) to get the same sorts of things out of literature as I do”; to “add value to students’ lives”; “in partnership”; “teaching for life rather than just the HSC”; “to open doors”; and “I’m someone who is able to inspire kids in the classroom”.

Their focus is largely on their own passion for their subject – whatever aspect particularly appeals to them - and their ambitions for improving the lives of their students through the sharing of their personal enjoyment and values derived from English.

**Personally chosen images**

The images the teachers use about their identity contain interesting and unusual comparisons; some are rather unexpected. Their discourses reveal that they chose metaphorical ways of describing themselves that draw on particular characteristics which define the ways individuals act. Their analogies include one collection that is related to the skills of creating, classifying and putting things together: “a facilitator”; “we’re masters of creation”; “a bit of a bower bird”; “queen of the magazines”; “a sociologist”; “a collector” and “a mechanic”. The other collection involves the skills of persuasion and dramatising: “a salesman”; and someone who “put(s) on a performance”. These metaphors represent distinctive styles of behaviour and practice and compare an identity as an English teacher to that of other people or occupations and ways of behaving. In each case, there is a sense of a commodity – material or relational - either being produced or sold. The metaphors position the teachers as perceiving themselves to possess some sort of skill that involves the making or selling of goods. The notion of a ‘product’ may imply their awareness of some commodification of their role within the educational process. In using these wider comparisons the teachers construct their very personally held concepts into more familiar terms. They seem to move out from an individual frame of reference as a teacher into describing the broader arena of peoples’ behaviours and actions within contemporary capitalist society.

As they described their view of their teaching identities, the teachers singled out particular qualities drawn primarily from the affective domain. These emotional states range from “enthusiastic”; “very dynamic”; “very patient”; “a bit radical”; “off-beat”; “fun”; “busy!”; “passionate”; through to Keith’s description of himself as “increasingly aging”. They express their emotional rather than intellectual conditions and therefore, present themselves as emotional beings. Their perceptions of their work seem to be shaped by their feelings and are directly connected to their inner beings. Most of the words selected appear to convey the teachers’ positive feelings of competence and enthusiasm, although for Warren and Neville, their choices indicate that a shift is occurring in their emotional state. Their lexicon reveals less security and stability, seen in “I’m somewhat stressed”; “I was very content”; and “any change is difficult”.

a collector of resources”; “I just love the text”; “I enjoy creating new resources”; and “I’m known for doing weird and wonderful things in English”. In contrast, Dorothy and Virginia identify their weaknesses as “I’m hopeless” (visual texts); and “I find poetry difficult”.

PERSONALLY CHOSEN IMAGES

The images the teachers use about their identity contain interesting and unusual comparisons; some are rather unexpected. Their discourses reveal that they chose metaphorical ways of describing themselves that draw on particular characteristics which define the ways individuals act. Their analogies include one collection that is related to the skills of creating, classifying and putting things together: “a facilitator”; “we’re masters of creation”; “a bit of a bower bird”; “queen of the magazines”; “a sociologist”; “a collector” and “a mechanic”. The other collection involves the skills of persuasion and dramatising: “a salesman”; and someone who “put(s) on a performance”. These metaphors represent distinctive styles of behaviour and practice and compare an identity as an English teacher to that of other people or occupations and ways of behaving. In each case, there is a sense of a commodity – material or relational - either being produced or sold. The metaphors position the teachers as perceiving themselves to possess some sort of skill that involves the making or selling of goods. The notion of a ‘product’ may imply their awareness of some commodification of their role within the educational process. In using these wider comparisons the teachers construct their very personally held concepts into more familiar terms. They seem to move out from an individual frame of reference as a teacher into describing the broader arena of peoples’ behaviours and actions within contemporary capitalist society.

As they described their view of their teaching identities, the teachers singled out particular qualities drawn primarily from the affective domain. These emotional states range from “enthusiastic”; “very dynamic”; “very patient”; “a bit radical”; “off-beat”; “fun”; “busy!”; “passionate”; through to Keith’s description of himself as “increasingly aging”. They express their emotional rather than intellectual conditions and therefore, present themselves as emotional beings. Their perceptions of their work seem to be shaped by their feelings and are directly connected to their inner beings. Most of the words selected appear to convey the teachers’ positive feelings of competence and enthusiasm, although for Warren and Neville, their choices indicate that a shift is occurring in their emotional state. Their lexicon reveals less security and stability, seen in “I’m somewhat stressed”; “I was very content”; and “any change is difficult”.

Page 583
The teachers’ discourses reveal a very individual way of seeing their role. The emphasis on metaphors related to creation, skill and dramatising, on producing something and on associating feelings with their identities rather than other aspects are somewhat paradoxical when considered together. There appears to be an implied contradiction between their descriptions of their modes of behaving and their expressions of such deep feelings.

**Discourses about subject English**

In describing their identities as English teachers, the participants also convey their views about their subject. There is no unified definition offered and a number of versions of English are constructed within their discourses. Cara's opinion that “it just seems to be one of those terribly nebulous subjects” is borne out by the many different ways of seeing the subject that are communicated by these teachers. What they value about this “really broad subject” is its personal meanings for them and what it offers students in terms of life skills and experiences. They see English as far more than a subject, it appears as an extension of themselves and as a gift they can give their students. They evoke an almost religious fervour through their emotive language and some blur the boundaries between a sense of self and of the subject. There is a fusion of beliefs, values, and identity, and an emphasis on subjective and rather abstract dimensions.

**What subject English means to teachers**

A complex mix of features characterises the teachers’ shapings of their particular Discourses of English. No one dominant Discourse defines the subject; rather these are personal constructions containing a variety of beliefs and elements. The nature of what they say in their versions of subject English is identifiable primarily through reference to their naming of its philosophical qualities, and in relation to what individuals see as its more significant textual features. Paradoxically, although English is perceived as an intrinsic part of each individual self, it is not the same interpretation for each teacher. Previously there was a cluster of words in the affective domain to describe their identities, here English is presented as a highly individualised creation with many different attributes and accounts to mark out its complex territory.

Some of the teachers value aspects of the subject that are explicitly connected to their personal beliefs, sense of aesthetics and feelings. They value it as being an integral part of their own convictions and life - it is an animating spirit and a powerful force. There is a lack of concrete or objective terms or facts used in their depictions. For some, “English is exciting” and “a humanities subject”. It is also “your control over life” and “language is power!” The various emotive responses it generates for them include: “I love English”; “I think it’s fun!”; and I have “a very philosophical view”.

Quite a few of the teachers indicate specific textual features of English that they regard highly and these generally relate to the subject’s literary aspects and a particular type of textual study. What a number of them say privileges English as a literature-based subject, for example: “I like teaching English as a literature course”; literature as “works of art”; “I love poetry”; “I prefer more modern literature”; “I love Shakespeare”; “a certain canon, a certain body of knowledge about literature”; and “academic literary rigour”.

Other teachers identify aspects that have special significance for them and include these in their very personal definitions of English: “language in its written, spoken, oral, visual forms”; “a variety of texts”; a subject not “not heavily classical literature and language based”; and being interested in “issues and different readings”.

**What subject English provides for students**

Embedded in their descriptions of English, many of the teachers include their opinions about the ways that the subject assists students. They perceive the subject in active and generally useful terms – as having some impact or consequence for those studying it. These perceptions can be classified according to the various effects the teachers see English creating for their students: either as the development of specific skills or as a preparation for life.

In the first classification, the teachers believe students can acquire particular competencies that range from “basic literacy skills”; the functional use of language; skills and genres used to enhance boys’ literacy; critical literacy; to enhanced communication; and improved examination results. Tom, Keith, Denise and Warren particularly, speak of English as a subject that should address social inequities through meeting the needs and abilities of a wide range of students.

Another dimension that English is perceived to provide for students is being a preparation of, and for,
life. Here, the teachers value the subject in terms that are beyond the acquisition of skills and which resonate with more personal and intangible aspirations. Jonathon thinks, “it stretches far deeper than the classroom”; and in Alexa’s opinion, “English is not just about the HSC exam”. Some teachers believe it has relevance and accessibility for students, it challenges their thinking; it allows rich cultural explorations; and it is “the one subject in which you can speak freely”.

Concluding Discussion

Teachers’ professional identities in times of change

The teachers’ discourses about their individual self concepts suggest that their professional identities, and what they value in their subject, are vitally important components of these constructs. Most teachers viewed these professional elements as being closely aligned with, or even inseparable from, their sense of self, and as occupying a large, significant part of the territory of self. The teachers’ frequently expressed uncertainty and stress about the curriculum change contrasts sharply with the powerful way they perceive their professional identities as part of themselves, and the confident ways they characterise English. Their professional identities seemed to remain virtually unscathed by the challenges created by the processes of change set in train by the implementation of a new syllabus.

The significance of the teaching subject discipline for secondary teachers’ identities has been acknowledged in the literature (see, for example, Ball, 1985; Clark, 1995; Little, 1995; Goodson & Marsh, 1996). However, there is no general agreement in the research about the exact character of teachers’ subject knowledge partly because it is considered that the nature of school subjects themselves is open to debate (Green, 2000). The finding from this study adds a further contribution through its recognition of the primary role of the teacher’s subject, in particular English, in the construction of their professional identity and behaviour. The teachers’ personal meanings about English lie at the very heart of their professional view of themselves. A number of their deeply held beliefs about the intrinsic qualities of their teaching subject have become features of their practice. This sheds light on their responses to the process of change, especially a change that attempts to challenge their core beliefs and understandings about their subject. Such firm boundaries around a strongly personal pedagogy make it difficult to alter practice.

No unified definition of subject English is offered by these teachers, a finding that supports the current thinking that there are in fact many “Englishes” (see, for example, Morgan, 1997; Pope, 1998) and that a plural form may be a useful tool (Green & Beavis, 1996; Peel, 2000). The prevailing state of flux in the subject’s identity over the past twenty years has led to its practitioners crafting their own domains within its shifting territory. The teachers’ professional identities have absorbed the way the subject can allow itself to be represented differently to various people. Each teacher in this study has established a personal definition of English and having created this unique signification for themselves - in more cases than not - it remains fixed and appears unlikely to be challenged.

Ball and Lacey (1995) believe that teachers create their own contextual interpretations of a subject based on their own values, knowledge and contexts. This research extends the understanding of how teachers create their versions of English by showing how closely aligned their personal and professional values are. The typical attributes of the subject such as its textual, literary or cultural features and its ability to appeal to the affective domain allow these teachers to draw their own responses and shape their personal meanings about English. They refer to particular literary works they “love” to read, they mention activities such as drama or writing that they enjoy, and they acknowledge some of the specific topics for discussion that they like to share with their students. The teachers’ professional identities, then, are constructed through this passionate defining and valuing of their subject.

This study highlights the ways in which English teachers’ different views of their subject are firmly entrenched, internalised and incorporated into their distinctive ways of being and acting. It is almost inevitable then that the imposition of major change will collide with this firm core of beliefs and values and it is not surprising that the teachers report feelings of being destabilised. Although hesitancies and uncertainties are evident in the teachers’ work, the portraits they draw of themselves suggest that any long-term residency in these ‘grey’ areas of doubt is not likely to occur. Paradoxically, the introduction of a new senior English syllabus does not appear to have affected the teachers’ images of themselves or to have particularly shaken their inner self-confidence. In a sense, their conception of themselves
and their subject beliefs are reinforced when challenged rather than being profoundly altered, and so, their adoption of the new remains, for most, fairly shallow. In their attempts to stand firm in the destabilised world in which they work, they impose their own order by keeping hold of their certainties.

The teachers’ discourses suggested that their professional identities and what they value in their subject are vitally important components of their individual self concepts. Most teachers viewed these professional elements as being closely aligned with, or even inseparable from their sense of self, and as occupying a large, significant part of the territory of self. When the forces of curriculum change challenged them, the teachers held onto what they knew and valued about themselves and their professional identities. The study acknowledged the power of the affective domain and the significance of the particular subject conception in influencing the teachers’ actions and these dimensions warranted continued consideration and further exploration. In the future, those who work to promote change should take into account the powerful value systems underpinning the construction of teachers’ professional selves and the ways that these shape their responses.

References


Board of Studies, NSW. (1999). English Stage 6 syllabus. Sydney, Australia: NSW Board of Studies.


Green, B. (2000). Faculty Power: On the role and significance of subject – departments, with specific reference to the English department. mETAphor, 4, 10 – 15.


Self as a Co-productive Endeavour: A study of the Development of Discourse and Relationships in an Arts Setting

Helen Parry
University of Tasmania

Abstract

If CDA is a study of texts which views language as a form of social practice, then by altering social dynamics, one may alter discourse, which in turn alters social practice, and so on. The more embedded and implicit a social practice, the more opaque it seems to analysis and deeper understanding. Only through understanding however, are we able to alter the language we use and therefore the manner in which a phenomenon is experienced.

This paper describes aspects of the transformative learning and teaching experienced by a group of seventy students, their three teachers and myself as we created a performance for the Wakakirri National Story Festival 2005.

I will discuss how leaping into the unknown was a factor in drawing forth extraordinary and unexpected developments in discourse and relationships.

All depends upon a breaking free, a leap, and then a question. I would like to claim that this is how learning happens and that the educative task is to create situations in which the young are moved to begin to ask, in all the tones of voice there are, “Why?” (Greene 1995)

Self as a Co-productive Endeavour

Participating in Wakakirri was a process which did alter social practices for the teachers and students concerned simply because it was so different from any prior experience of teaching and learning they had known. This in itself had the effect of “lifting the lid” on many taken for granted patterns of interaction. Like turning over long undisturbed soil, what comes to light may be foundational yet forgotten.

The arts perspective was also an important factor. All living is about relationships but not all living is about consciously creating or reflecting upon relationships. This tends to be a feature of arts engagement. Whilst there may be something unique and valuable about the arts, I understand that arts may vary in their effect on the individual depending upon experience. Eviction of “frogs” from the school choir, exposure to temperamental, tyrannical tirades and dismissal by elitists all mar the arts.

In this paper I will be referring to the specific situation in which these teachers, the students and I created our production. The creation was very much a group process from conception to performance and I acknowledge that a Wakakirri Story-Dance need not be created this way.

The Study

- Duration: six months. (Terms one and two 2005)
- Located in a semi-rural primary school
**Participants**

- Seventy compulsorily involved students in three classes from grades three to six. Two focus groups of six students were drawn from among them.
- Three teachers of those classes (T1, T2 and T3). T1 is my husband.
- Myself
- Most participants were new to arts performance and all were new to the particular undertaking, creation of a Wakakirri Story-Dance. I have a background in amateur performing arts and was a judge for Wakakirri in 2003 and 2004.

**Wakakirri**

Wakakirri is a National Story Festival running for fourteen years, now involving six hundred schools throughout Australia. It is a non-profit organisation privately run and sponsored but supported by the Australian Government Department of Education, Science and Training and the Department of Family and Community Services.

A Story-Dance is “A story performed on stage using a creative blend of movement and acting to pre-recorded music…” (Wakakirri 2005 programme). It may not exceed seven minutes. Wakakirri is competitive.

My analysis of data from the project is in its earliest stage at present, so the following interpretations are currently very broad and incomplete.

At this stage I am considering five discourses, or four plus a meta-discourse, which I believe are potentially always present but not necessarily in the balance or proportions evident during this experience. Needless to say, there must be other discourses which have not come to my notice which I and others would perceive given different interests and perspectives.

They are as follows:

1. The discourse of doing, or action
2. The discourse of feeling, or affect
3. The discourse of reflection
4. The discourse of democracy
5. The discourse of power and control

I acknowledge that they are closely interrelated. For example, does hoping belong with discourse 1, or somewhere else? Would the nature or circumstance of the hope alter one’s answer? Possibly 4 is subsumed by 5, and I think that 5 may overarch the others.

I also acknowledge that our understanding and expectations of these and any discourses are context specific and underpinned by values systems largely held in common, though probably insufficiently scrutinised.

1. The discourse of doing, activity

I feel more than a little tempted to rename this “the discourse of being”. It is not that “doing” as a descriptor is inappropriate, but I want to avoid any association with unconnected doing, or “busywork”.

Through the arts there is the potential to explore embodied learning: learning which simultaneously involves the whole person – physically, emotionally and intellectually.

Creating Wakakirri was not learning about. I noticed the meaning behind the students’ words changing, and the action changing along with this.

“Can you help me…?”
That plea which often means
“do it for me”
or
“just tell me the answer”.

“Can you help me…? can also mean “I want you near to approve each minor step I take. (The risk of failure or disapproval is too great.)”

You know how students look at you and say, …“Is that right?”

Hearing “Can you help me?” during Wakakirri came to mean other things like “Can we work on this together?” Students realised that not only was it beneficial to work together, but in fact, necessary. They also wanted to be the ones who did the work, almost to the point of lining up and fighting over it. Dependency diminished markedly as we progressed. I watched students turning to each other for help and support, especially over matters of friendship and encouragement. I also saw students turn to themselves. This might sound odd, but I think that quite often we flee ourselves, looking for support, answers and accountability from others.

Words that express the activity I saw are supporting, encouraging, risking, hoping, creating, constructing, negotiating, persisting, contributing, performing, assessing, evaluating and planning. Quite obviously, many of these would be at home in the other discourses also. They belong here as much as anywhere else because for the students, Wakakirri was being (Dewey 1980, Greene 1995, Koopman 2005). It was not “about” these things. One girl said “Now I really understand the You Can Do It programme.” This package is mostly “taught” via class discussion and re-enforced/assessed by students completing blackline masters. (In this programme, sometimes called Program Achieve, there are five keys to success, which are persistence, getting along, confidence, resilience and organisation.) Her brain had known what the keys meant, and now her being – body and heart – knew too.

I would like to examine the existential nature of embodiment in greater detail in my future research, focusing on what happens while one is immersed. I wonder whether we are too concerned with lasting benefit and transferability, using these as criteria for what is justified in the curriculum. I think about learning to swim as an example. I know that for very good swimmers some of their training occurs on dry land, but for most of us immersion in water is crucial to our progress. We don’t learn swimming very well from lectures, filling in photocopies or writing projects.

It seems to me to be of critical importance that we think more about this. When considering what education is for, future happiness and success are aims that spring to mind. I prefer to think of the aims as fulfillment and wellbeing: terms which clarify and add depth. It would be hard indeed to recognise fulfillment if one did not have much experience of it in one’s formative years. The focus thus falls on what life is offering right now for who one is right now. This is different from the often passive, detached, product-oriented learning for a possible (often predictable) future. Teaching to meet current rather than future needs alters how teachers relate to their students and may enhance the seeing of a student’s “self” and vice-versa. Based on my initial examination of my data this would appear to have the potential for profound impact on the development of positive learning relationships.

I noticed two things. Firstly that attaining fulfillment is not always easy or pleasurable. This is one way in which fulfillment as an educational aim differs from happiness. Rather than equating happiness with hedonism (advertisers love this), fulfillment requires striving and strength. It also strongly implies the involvement of others. Happiness can be compared and even flouted where fulfillment is shared. The students said that rehearsals were often hard work and not always fun, but they always wanted to be there.

Secondly I observed some behaviour that makes me wonder just how existentially children live. In interviews, they answered questions in such a way that I felt their past became irrelevant to them unless it bore some emotional connection to their present. This is not to say that they forget the past, but it was hard to get them to dwell there for the purposes of
analysis or reflection unless that emotional link existed. As for the future, their speculations sounded as if they were talking about somebody else, albeit a person they knew well. A self they had not created yet. Their talk lost depth and dimension. If there is anything in these observations then our attempts to make past learning “stick” and future learning seem valuable appear to need a little review.

Through such embodied learning the students seem to have come to know themselves and to have created new aspects of themselves. They are more certain of their identity and this has altered the way they speak to each other and to the teachers. There was at one stage some “overstepping of the mark” in the way students spoke to teachers. They experimented with cheekiness and familiarity. They took a while to adjust and learn how far their new familiarity allowed them to go. The teachers also took a while to decide what was appropriate to accept. The teachers expressed a new respect for these students who now had an air of self generativity, confidence and control. This to me is transformation. The resonance in the interaction between teacher and student tends to be ongoing. Whether it is permanent or more of a receding reverberation still remains to be seen. The teachers commented to me and to the students on the unprecedented growth and change they perceived.

2. The discourse of feeling and affect

Emotion also has a very existential element. One can remember experiencing emotions, anticipating or fearing their return, but a person cannot truly compare one episode with another. They are present in the moment. It has been argued that we are not even necessarily conscious of which emotion/s we are experiencing (Damasio 1999). Perhaps for this reason it is not commonly accepted that we are always in a mood of some kind and it pervades and shapes our being in the world (Dreyfus 1991).

I wonder about how we suppress or ignore emotion in school. It is of little value when delivering the contents of the traditional curriculum. Emotion is conspicuous by its absence. Outbursts, or “lack of control” are met with awkward embarrassment, even if the outbursts are happy ones, unless you happen to be under about five. There is the feeling that negative emotions should be stopped rather than worked through.

The lack of discussion surrounding emotion leaves students believing that displaying or articulating their emotional states is unwelcome. This silence also renders us and them impotent to a degree to find behaviour solutions where there is no forum. Do teachers worry that allowing emotion is somehow dangerous? That it may lead to a general lack of control? Or is it just considered irrelevant?

During the process of creating our performance, conversations about emotional states were frequent. In rehearsals, class discussions and research focus groups, it was a common topic. Initially the teachers needed to talk to the students about fear, embarrassment and shyness because the students were literally frozen into inaction. The teachers found it valuable to acknowledge their own fears and discuss strategies which might help. It was an important discovery for some students to realise that their teachers were actually more afraid of performing than they were. There was also a lot of positive feedback when progress was made. It was quite amazing to see how quickly the students cast off their fears. There was an atmosphere of unity and it was safe to talk because it was being endorsed by the teachers and widely experienced by others. The teachers found themselves admiring the reserves of strength they had not realised that these children had.

There was also the euphoria that comes with success after persisting with a long, challenging, sometimes confusing journey. There was talk about what it means to really achieve something and about how fulfilment is often hard won, but deeply satisfying (Dewey 1980; Koopman 2005)

Another form of discourse related to emotion was, I think, quite a rare one, particularly in primary school. As we structured our story, it was important to talk about how our movements, mime and dance conveyed emotion. How were we hoping to affect our audience? Were we meeting our goal? If not, what needed to change? This analysis of affect really made them think. What was the music suggesting and what effect was achieved by congruous or incongruous action? The idea of stimulating mixed feelings in the audience: making them laugh at something sad awoke a sense of potential. I am sure that most of them had an
understanding of how their behaviour and discourse could affect others. Playground picking and bullying thrives on it. However, I don’t think they had explored deliberate manipulation much beyond the usual attempts teachers make; “How would you feel if it was done to you?” I am not intending to disparage this approach but it does tend to put emotional manipulation in a negative light. Often it is negative or destructive but it need not be. Novelists, composers, poets, film-makers, playwrights and artists manipulate us emotionally. We expect it and value it. Advertisers use it too. Understanding affect is a discourse of power. We teach students about being on the receiving end as audiences and consumers but arts participation and creation provides opportunities to explore what may come of being on the transmitting end. This discourse was overt, cognitive and reflective.

3. The discourse of reflection

My presence as a researcher played an unexpected part in this. I video taped most of the rehearsals and played them to my focus groups as a stimulus for discussion. I intended them to use the videos to follow and reflect on their personal development. They did not do this as much as I expected. This brought to my attention the extent to which they live existentially: life happens NOW. They frequently did not relate more than superficially to past “selves” and couldn’t really speculate at all on possible future “selves”.

However, they latched on to the tapes as a vehicle for reviewing and reflecting on the development of the story and their part in it. They used the tapes to stand outside themselves and critique their own action. Some students even articulated to me that they thought the main reason for my presence was to tape the rehearsals for this very purpose. They saw on tape where they were in or out of character, how certain moves conveyed meaning better than others and how their action juxtaposed against the action of others increased the impact and depth of the story.

Initially watching the videos was an activity intended only for the focus groups but it soon grew to include everyone. Also, the tapes served to bring home to them just how far and how fast they were “travelling” personally and artistically. Reviewing this journey increased their pride and confidence in their abilities.

I saw a difference in what this reflection meant to the students from the more usual reflective experience. They were driving this one. They were the ones who chose to pursue it. We had not even really considered it. Given our way, we would probably have offered some time for reflection after the performance, as a concluding/ assessment type task. They showed us that it was needed during the creation process. The closer we came to the big day, the more intently they scrutinised themselves and pushed themselves forward, even effecting valuable changes on the morning of the show.

4. The discourse of democracy

By reflecting the democratic process of Government in our schools through studying the parliamentary system and electing student councils are we really searching into the nature of democracy or simply aping a veiled capitalism? We elect our “leaders” and then sit back, all too ready to complain when they don’t represent us. Democracy depends on involvement from citizens. I don’t think we see much of this.

To varying degrees, the students became powerfully involved in Wakakirri. As indicated above in other discourses they developed quite a deep sense of ownership for the production. This seemed to occur through coming to know, or rather, make their part. I saw students literally making their characters through self and co-directed idiosyncratic movement, costume and prop creation. How much of self can be created through creating and exploring “not-self”? At such times the ownership style talk, both of their character and the production was fascinating. I see this ownership arising from democratic action (Dewey 1916).

Their commitment made them feel that the production belonged to them individually but also therefore to everyone. The individual became the group, but without any loss of self or identity. They perceived that whole of which they were a vital yet unique element – the team that would not be the team if they were not there. One girl spoke about her best memory of Wakakirri being the feeling of the whole group working together and how the group was not
whole when there were people missing. They understood that they mattered. One little boy said that the success of the performance rested on him. It could have sounded egotistical, but given the context, nobody was in that frame of mind. He was simply expressing the weight of responsibility that he felt and that each cast member carried performing their part of the whole.

Why were they so willing to be actively responsible? I suspect that one feels an instinctive caring for one’s creations. In my capacity as an artist I do. Parents feel it for their children. Eventually, in both cases one must loosen the bonds and bid a partial farewell, allowing one’s creations their independence. Responsibility is often seen as a burden from which we seek escape, but I think there is a difference between responsibilities we perceive as imposed and those we generate from within. The latter could be better expressed as response-ability – through taking on the ability to respond we find a freedom to say ourselves into being.

...democratic action in general has to “be brought about not only with the assent of the people, but by their hand.” (Freire 1973:29)

In spite of this driving them in uncompromising pursuit of their best efforts they became more tolerant of the “fringe dwellers”: those students who could or would not risk committing themselves for various reasons. Two girls said of a consistently disruptive student;

St 1: …everyone started co-operating more. Participating… especially Tim. He went from not wanting to do it [Wakakirri] at all, messing up everything, to wanting to do it. Yeah… but still messing up a little bit.

Me: He didn’t mess up on stage though, did he?

St 1: No. I thought he would. I thought he’d mess it up for all of us.

St 2: He done well.

Was he improving, or was their forgiveness developing, or both? How did he perceive their attitude, and did it affect him? St 1 also made comment about how the team encouraged and sustained her, and how her own commitment developed through not wanting to let them down.

5. The discourse of power and control

I tend towards viewing this discourse as overarching the others because I believe that it is central. Essentially they are all to do with coming to feel secure and confident about the selves we co-produce into being through discourse, and this relates to our feelings of worth.

The teachers acknowledged to the students that they were co-learners starting from a similar point of no knowledge and discovering together. One of the most striking features for me of “co-learnership” is the tacit understanding that the learning is shared. The very fact that the teachers wanted to be on the same discovery path as their students gave the students the information that this must be learning that matters.

It was lovely to watch as the students noticed how they learned more and overcame more than their teachers; how they laughed at the way some teachers shuddered at the thought of being on stage and continued to avoid appearing on camera. I noticed that the students wanted a part of taking control. I noticed that certain teachers struggled with allowing this. We are always asking students to act responsibly without realising that in order for them to do so, we must relinquish our stranglehold on control and authority. When teachers say “control yourselves” what they really mean is “behave how I want you to”. Real self-control might not look how the teacher expects! (Greene 1995)

Responsibility is an aspect of power. One who is in the process of making oneself necessarily possesses a degree of control.

I observed other processes which I believe gave the students access to power and control other than the effects of being co-learners, two of which I will discuss briefly.

Arts productions of this kind give rise to managed risk taking opportunities (Fiske 1999). Coming to trust yourself, let alone another classified as a risk for some of the students. “Letting go” and putting embarrassment behind them was a lesson they confronted early in
rehearsals. One girl said that she changed from being embarrassed early on to being nervous towards the performance. She described the former as holding her back and the latter as an energy propelling her into giving her best. I feel the need to add that she is ten years old. I think research tends to underestimate the clarity and power of young students’ abilities to know and express themselves (Greene 1995). Learning to move beyond their comfort zones small step at a time was mentioned by many of the students as being a valuable outcome of the production. They articulated that this was a skill which could be useful elsewhere in their lives.

Secondly I noticed how the production offered them the possibility for learning to cope with change, the unexpected and the unknown. It would seem that students don’t encounter much that is unexpected in their education. Teachers actually go to deliberate lengths to structure smooth learning pathways. I sometimes wonder whether students really see the overarching goals and outcomes, thoughtfully broken into digestible chunks for them. I know I didn’t: any grand plan teachers had for me was obscure. I saw no relationship between one task and the next.

In Wakakirri, as we groped our way together towards the creation of our story, there was constant change. Bits that had seemed fine had to change to make logical connections to bits still under construction. This seems natural when working towards a somewhat undefined endpoint. It is part of the creative act: part of the pursuit towards the creation of something that matters and is worth doing well. Some students found it quite upsetting, even to the point of taking it as a personal affront: “Wasn’t how I did it good enough?” Others found changes disorienting and confusing, coming near to tears. T2, the teacher of the youngest class, did not want changes to occur even when things weren’t working because he didn’t think his students could cope. As with many teachers, he had trouble coping with change himself unless he was in control of generating it. Being fairly new to teaching, he was in the “deep end” with Wakakirri without a life belt. He acknowledged that the experience was very stressful – probably too stressful to walk into willingly – but one which taught him a great deal about his practice and his students.

As the performance progressed, the more the students came to see their part as integral to the whole, the less change bothered them. Some students came to see that change opened a forum which welcomed their input: they could suggest different ways of doing things too. This had a great impact for some as they saw their contributions shaping and furthering the production. One student spoke of coping with change in the latter stages of rehearsal: “We just clicked on to it without mucking up.” Most students came to want change even if they didn’t like it if the result was an improvement in the production.

What I noticed was the vast scope for different types of talk and the quite profound effects of widening and deepening the worlds of discourse in which the students participated with their teachers. The change, perhaps transformation which occurred was not slow and painstaking as we are often led to believe change must be.

Conclusion

There is currently a lot of talk about structuring learning experiences to promote the learning of sustainable practices for self, community and environment. Likewise there is similar talk surrounding transformative practice. How are we to be sure that we are teaching for understanding and transformation rather than teaching about them as concepts, which could be taken or left? Successful teaching in these areas implies the engendering of an inner compunction.

When I look at what happened in Wakakirri I see that transformation did occur. I also see that, although it was a sustained experience in terms of the average lifespan of primary school projects, it was not enough to effect permanent change. Maybe there can never be enough of such learning to do this: it could be that there is an ever present existential element such that it needs to be part of who we are on an ongoing basis. (The idea that you get your ‘dose’, like some kind of immunisation against detachment and fear is more than a little bizarre!) Further immersion experiences must be had, not only in the arts, in order that such practices become ways of being.
By learning a language we learn to live in collective realms of meanings. This means that language has implications for our experiential possibilities. (van Manen 2001:xiii)

We make our selves through making meaning; we and our lives are a process of becoming (Freire 1992:72, Greene 1995:20). The multiple discourses we employ are our means of articulation, our access to co-construction from shared experience.

The experience of making this arts production was real learning. Starting a production from nothing is a real problem requiring real solutions. One quite young student told me how she thought teachers were mean sometimes when they knew the answers but made her find them out for herself. At a subconscious level perhaps she was detecting a lack of authenticity in the transfer style of teaching. She felt proud of her input into Wakakirri and it was a source of satisfaction that sometimes the teachers knew no more about how it should proceed than the students did.

The learning outcomes and discourses outlined in this paper were largely circumstantial of course, due to the inexperience of the teachers. Not knowing what to do seriously bothered T2 and T3, yet perhaps it was this that created a clearing for the students. Models for collaborative practice exist (Fullan 2000) but tend to be aimed at adult interactions. This is no bad thing and schools will benefit greatly from such thinking. However, I wonder how this collaborative effect can be preserved between teacher and student in future experiences. It strikes me as one of the most valuable outcomes but also one of the most easily lost as teachers gain understanding and proficiency, and therefore potentially regain a majority of control.

References


Constructing Social Responsibility in Mining Company Reports®

Richard Parsons
University of Queensland

Bernard J. McKenna
University of Queensland

Abstract

This paper analyses how a mining company discursively constructs its rationale for corporate social responsibility in its annual Sustainability Review. Increasingly, large profit-making corporations are seeking to demonstrate their social and environmental responsibility, typically publishing annual reports as ‘evidence’ of their performance. In Australia, mining companies as an industry sector proportionally produce one of the highest numbers of such reports (CAER, 2004).

There are four pragmatic and philosophical reasons for these developments:

1. Good for Business
2. Political Pressure: The concepts of sustainability and sustainable development, meanwhile, emerged from political debates, and were popularised in the ‘Brundtland report’, or Our Common Future (WCED, 1987), giving institutional effect to the “green agenda”.
3. Risk and Image Management: Yergin and Stanislaw (2002) assert that the success of capitalism depends on its ability to appraise risk and uncertainty. Achieving “social” objectives can lead to competitive advantages.
4. Moral Responsibility: social responsibility is ‘the right thing to do’, regardless of potential financial benefits.

Methodology

As part of a larger diachronic study that considers the discursive changes over time and the interdiscursive influences propelling such changes, this paper essentially lexico-grammatically analyses the assumptions and ‘deep structures’ underlying word and grammar selection. The corpus analysis also uses Leximancer to help identify themes and their relationships. The CDA approach is informed by (Chiapello & Fairclough, 2002; Chouliaraki & Fairclough, 1999, p. 75; Meyer, 2001), while attempting to redress the shortcomings identified by Widdowson (2000).

From this analysis, we will seek to identify the epistemic foundations by which the company “construes the social order without referring to the system it is construing” (Halliday & Martin, 1993, p. 113). Of particular interest are ways in which the company discursively represents notions of community, implicitly reinforcing modernist, nostalgic representations which deny plurality, conflict and complexity:

- Liberal and communitarian
- Modernist vs Postmodern
**Introduction**

Recently, a new genre has emerged in the form of corporate reporting on social and environmental issues. These reports are variously called sustainability or social responsibility reports. In the mining industry, they are often called health, safety, environment and community reports. Ostensibly, they look similar to financial reports, typically appearing to present objective ‘facts’ regarding company performance and future intentions. Unlike their financial counterparts, however, these reports have no standard format, and typically are not independently audited or verified (CAER, 2004), leaving companies relatively free to determine what they include and what they exclude. Thus, corporate managers determine what ‘social responsibility’ means in practice. The nomenclature ‘report’, therefore, with its connotation of objectivity, may conceal the rhetorical function of such documents, which is to establish the company’s reputation as a socially responsible ‘corporate citizen’ (Marsden & Andriof, 1998; Matten & Crane, 2005). In this paper, we analyse how Comalco discursively constructs its approach to social responsibility in its 2004 report.

**Context: corporate social responsibility**

Traditionally, neoclassical economics has marginalised conceptions of community and social concern (Reed, 1996), and business has generally opposed discussion of social and environmental issues (Gray & Milne, 2002). Hence, corporate sustainability and social responsibility are relatively new concepts. The concept of sustainability was popularised in the ‘Brundtland report’, which defined sustainable development as “development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs” (WCED, 1987, p. 43). ‘Corporate social responsibility’, meanwhile, may have origins in industrial philanthropy, as exemplified by Joseph Rowntree (Frankental, 2001). Later, Bowen (1953) proposed that businessmen (sic) had obligations to pursue policies in line with society’s objectives and values, and Goyder (1961) advanced the concept of ‘The Responsible Company’. Since the 1980s, the dominant meaning of corporate social responsibility has been that corporations have responsibilities beyond those towards shareholders, and beyond legal obligations (Jones, 1980). Nevertheless, corporate sustainability and social responsibility are inextricably intertwined, and are often used interchangeably to refer generally to social and environmental concerns.

The extent of corporations’ supposed responsibilities is contested, and may depend on whether business executives take a neoclassical economic perspective, an ‘enlightened self-interest’ perspective, or a moral obligations position (Moir, 2001). Recent literature suggests that the neoclassical position (e.g. Friedman, 1970; Henderson, 2001; The Economist, 2005) has receded, while the ‘moral obligations’ position (Brock, 1996; Gibson, 2000) has never been considered consistent with economic ‘realities’. Accordingly, the ‘enlightened self-interest’ perspective dominates, manifested in notions such as instrumental stakeholder theory (Donaldson & Preston, 1995; Freeman, 1984) and the ‘business case’ for social and environmental responsibility (Hargroves & Smith, 2005; Hawken, Lovins, & Lovins, 1999; Holliday, Schmidheiny, & Watts, 2002).

Because the discourse of social responsibility comprises elements of neoclassical economics and managerial capitalism juxtaposed with antithetical discourses, such as environmentalism and community development, it can be seen as an example of interdiscursivity. Interdiscursivity represents the joining, or overlapping, of different discourses into a new discursive order or text (Wodak, 2001, p. 67). Thus, it is more than merely the combination of various texts (intertextuality), since it refers to the whole system of language (Fairclough, 1992, pp. 115-120). It does not represent a new, stable state, but rather an ongoing contestation, which may “allow for new fields of action” (Wodak, 2001, p. 66). Thus, ‘social responsibility’ constitutes a new, unstable discursive order, exposing ambiguities between competing paradigms and discourses (Livesey, 2002). The resulting interdiscursivity is the outcome of sociopolitical struggles to challenge existing hegemonic relations and ‘naturalised discourse conventions’ (Fairclough, 1995, p. 94).
Through this interdiscursivity, large corporations seek to demonstrate that addressing social and environmental concerns is consistent with economic development (e.g. Dunphy, Griffiths, & Benn, 2003; Elkington, 1997, 2001; WRI, UNEP & WBCSD, 2002), typically publishing annual reports as ‘evidence’ of this ‘Triple Bottom Line’ (Elkington, 1997) performance. The genre of ‘sustainability reports’, therefore, exemplifies interdiscursivity, since it incorporates dialectically opposed discourses, such as environmentalism, community, neoclassical economics and management. In 2004, 45% of the Global Fortune top 250 companies published a non-financial report. Australian mining companies as an industry sector proportionally produced one of the highest numbers of such reports (CAER, 2004), perhaps because of the industry’s high level of public scrutiny concerned with adverse environmental impacts and a history of Indigenous dispossession (AMEEF, 2002; Banerjee, 2000; Whiteman & Mamen, 2002).

Comalco’s 2004 Sustainable Development Report

The Comalco Sustainable Development Report 2004 (Comalco, 2005) is a 50-page, A4-size document. In the manner of this genre, it combines text, photographs, statistical tables and charts, and other images. Its interdiscursivity is exemplified visually by the juxtaposition of quantitative technical data, and photographs of industrial plants and machinery, alongside images of native flora, pristine landscapes, cheerful staff and Indigenous communities. Following a Message from the CEO, a Business Overview, and Performance Highlights, the main section is divided into three sub-sections, under the headings People (social concerns), Planet (environmental concerns) and Prosperity (economic concerns). This is clearly an adaptation of the sustainable development slogan, ‘people, planet, profits’. At the end of the report, they provide a feedback form.

Methodology

In analysing the report, we adopted principally an inductive, heuristic approach. We assumed that the report would be interdiscursive, but did not pre-define the different discourses represented. We conducted four analyses on a corpus of 18,936 words, aiming to consider both lexical and discursive levels.

1. Considering Comalco as the actor. An electronic search for phrases containing either ‘Comalco’, ‘we’ or ‘the company’ produced 153 sentences. We then considered the processes (verbs) to investigate Comalco’s performance as Actor.

2. Identifying discourses represented in the genre. We searched manually for terms (discourse identifiers) to identify the different discourses represented in the report. This enabled us to describe the interdiscursive nature of the report. Following a theoretical coding approach, we allowed the discourses to emerge from the data (Flick, 2002, pp. 177-185; Glaser & Strauss, 1967). We then compared our classification with the output from Leximancer, software which analyses the content of texts and displays it in a conceptual map (Smith & Humphreys, forthcoming).

3. Considering how Comalco positions itself as speaker. We analysed manually the 176 sentences to investigate how Comalco positions itself with respect to social responsibility.

4. Other textual characteristics. We analysed manually the corpus, to consider other textual characteristics of this genre.

Findings

Considering Comalco as the actor

Those 153 instances where Comalco is grammatically the Subject-Actor were selected and the processes (verbs) identified. Of the six possible processes, two did not occur (behavioural and existential) and one (verbal) occurs only once. Of the remaining instances, there were:

- 101 material processes,
• 33 mental processes, and
• 18 relational processes.

Further analysis of these provide useful putative descriptive information about this report genre, as well as information about how Comalco positions itself subjectively and discursively.

a) Material Processes

These ‘action’ verbs (in commonly understood grammar) were analysed for tense (simple past, present, future) and concrete/abstract dimensions (See Table 1).

Table 1: Material Verbs: by Tense and Concrete/Abstract

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concrete: 68</th>
<th>Abstract: 31</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Future</td>
<td>Past</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Concrete Past Material

It is not surprising in a report that the concrete past material processes predominate. Such sentences as:

*In 2004, Comalco also achieved record production at most sites across the business* …

are typical, although this sort of information seems more appropriate in a financial report. A more appropriate report of completed action is:

*In 2004 Comalco spent over A$15 million on community contributions* …

However, the numerical strength of this process is somewhat deceptive as the ‘actions’ include procedural issues (n=4: eg, *embarked upon …a programme*); statements of commitment and philosophy (n=3: *have developed a holistic approach*); and strategic and target development (n=2: *has set a reduction target*). Thus there is a lack of concreteness of action.

Concrete Present Material

These 27 instances are appropriate to report ongoing activity (e.g., *Comalco employs*). But at least five of these are rather abstracted subject-positioning: e.g., *We are striving to achieve leading industry practice*.

Concrete Future Material

Of the relatively few concrete future processes (n=9), the intended action is directed towards setting targets (n=3), and internal regulations and processes (n=3: e.g., *focuses on monitoring and improvement of processes*).

Abstract Material

These processes appear to have the rhetorical purpose of positioning Comalco as genuinely committed to sustainability. The most common process is focus: e.g., *We will also focus on initiatives to engage and involve employees*. Other abstractions include strive, demonstrate, and pursue.

b) Mental Processes

Mental processes basically express thinking and feeling. While issues of thinking—belief (*we believe our ongoing sustainability depends on*), recognition (*We recognise the importance of safety*), and cognition (*We identify root causes*)—are typical of a business report, it is probably less usual to find expressions of feeling in a report. Yet these affective processes are reasonably evident in expressing commitment (n=8: *Comalco is committed to*), aim (= hope, wish; n= 6: *we aim to minimise our footprint*), even pleasure (n=2; *Comalco was pleased that*).

c) Relational Processes
These processes (typically using verbs to be or to have) perform two functions: attributing and identifying. Although there are only 18 instances (Table 2) of this with Comalco as Actor (called ‘Token’ when dealing with relational processes), they are significant because they express how Comalco represents itself.

Table 2: Relational Processes: Comalco as Token

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Attributive</th>
<th>Identifying</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intensive</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.g., we will be trained and competent</td>
<td>e.g., Comalco is a major supplier</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circumstantial</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.g., is currently on track</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possessive</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.g., we have an overriding commitment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The intensive identifying function represents Comalco as an impressive company (e.g., eighth largest aluminium company), but also a good corporate citizen (e.g., a major sponsor) who is part of the solution, despite acknowledging that it is a significant emitter of greenhouse gases. The attributive possessives reinforce Comalco’s impressive corporate status (owns 59 percent), balanced by its corporate citizenship (we have an overriding commitment).

To summarise, the relational processes present Comalco as an impressive company and good corporate citizen. The mental processes express belief in and recognition of sustainability principles, at the level of thought and affect. However, the material processes tend to only partially validate such claims in terms of actual achievement.

Identifying discourses represented in the genre

Lexical selection can conceal ideology, because it “construes the social order without referring to the system it is construing” (Halliday & Martin, 1993, p. 113). Thus, studying lexical choices can inform us of the ideological assumptions within a text.

As noted earlier, sustainability reports ostensibly fit the genre of financial reports, purporting to present objective information regarding company performance and intentions. However, a key difference is that they draw upon discourses which are antithetical to the discourses of neoclassical economics and managerial capitalism, presenting implicit contradictions. Reading and re-reading the report enabled us to identify certain terms (discourse identifiers) which could be seen as instantiations of these various discourses. Accordingly, we have listed the discourse identifiers, classifying these into what we consider to be the principal discourses in the report (Table 3). Some discourse identifiers (e.g., ‘eco-friendly’, ‘holistic’) are included here even though they appear infrequently, because the appearance of terms which would not conventionally appear in a company report may signal significant discursive strategies.

Table 3: Discourses & Discourse Identifiers in Comalco Report
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>economics / finance</th>
<th>environmentalism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>prosperity</td>
<td>sustainability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>efficiency</td>
<td>stewardship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>economic viability</td>
<td>footprint</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>growth</td>
<td>biodiversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>competitive(ness)</td>
<td>environmentally</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>economic performance</td>
<td>eco-friendly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>assets</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>audit</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>revenue(s)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>investment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>shareholder</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>management &amp; business</th>
<th>community</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>target(s)</td>
<td>stakeholder(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>manage / managing /</td>
<td>partner(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>management</td>
<td>neighbour(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>system(s)</td>
<td>heritage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>strategy / strategic</td>
<td>host</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>excellence</td>
<td>mutual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>risk</td>
<td>cultural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>add(ing) value / value-added</td>
<td>customs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tools</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>measure(ment)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>procedure(s)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>world-class</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>key results areas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>benchmark</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
We then compared our classification with the output from *Leximancer*, and a conceptual map displaying extracted information is shown in Figure 1. Concepts which appear in close proximity on the map appear in similar contexts in the report (i.e. they co-occur with similar other concepts).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>industrial production</th>
<th>ethics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>operation(s) / operational</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>smelter(s)</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>refinery/ies</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>supply / supplied /</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>supplier(s)</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mine(s, d)</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>technology</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From this map (Figure 1), we can see that discourse identifiers such as ‘community’, ‘stakeholders’ and ‘sustainable’ appear in similar contexts to ‘business’, ‘strategy’ and ‘performance’, to the bottom left quadrant. This co-occurrence tends to confirm that the report interdiscursively blends apparently antithetical discourses. Another observation is that the physical business of Comalco, producing aluminium from bauxite, is conceptually distant from other concepts in the report, to the right of the map. Whereas OH&S concepts such as health, safety, and risks are thematically (the “safety” circle = theme) adjacent to management, the emissions theme is quite distant from management and less distant from business. This would seem to suggest that it is not linked strongly to these themes and operates relatively independently.

The significance of this interdiscursivity is that, by portraying these discourses not as antithetical, but as complementary, Comalco can instrumentally rationalise social responsibility, thus legitimating orthodox assumptions regarding the purpose of business. As noted above, the ‘enlightened self-interest’ perspective dominates literature on social responsibility, ahead of both the neoclassical and moral obligations positions. This domination reflects the influence of the instrumental stakeholder theory (Donaldson & Preston, 1995; Freeman, 1984), as exemplified in the following quotes from Comalco’s report. The rationalisation—business success—is underlined in each case.

Comalco seeks continual improvement in business performance and in its contribution to sustainable development in order to enhance shareholder value.

Comalco believes that good health is good business…

Comalco is committed to fostering healthy relationships with these communities, as they are fundamental to our long-term sustainability.

In order to be successful and grow, Comalco needs to ensure that our business activities are undertaken responsibly and managed to maintain or improve environmental quality.

We recognise that our overall business sustainability is enhanced by our performance in non-financial aspects of business, including health, safety and environmental performance.
Adopting Foucault's (1972) notion of a speaker's discursive choices being limited by the prevailing discursive formation, in this case managerialist and economic/financial, the report thus justifies being socially responsible not for its own sake, but because it is consistent with conventional conceptions of business. Comalco simply presumes that social responsibility leads to business success because the ideological assumptions behind apparently factual statements rely upon the 'doxa' (Bourdieu & Eagleton, 1992) in the underlying episteme.

**Considering how Comalco positions itself as speaker**

As noted above, the report draws on various discourses in an effort to portray Comalco as a socially responsible and commercially successful company. Indeed, the report explicitly attempts to create an impression of Comalco as positioned to deliver both sustainability and community development. Firstly, Comalco is rhetorically positioned not as an inherently unsustainable user of vast amounts of non-renewable resources (Jenkins, 2004, p. 31), but as actually contributing to sustainability. In each case, there is an implicit assumption that the goal, here underlined, can be realised within the existing business paradigm:

- *At Comalco, we believe that our operations and our products can make a positive long-term contribution to a sustainable future.*
- *At Comalco, we believe that aluminium is one of the most versatile and useful materials on earth and is essential for a more sustainable society.*
- *Therefore, we are determined to be part of the solution and seek to work with all our business partners towards sustainability.*

Secondly, Comalco is rhetorically positioned as a 'partner', 'neighbour' and 'host' to the communities where it operates, notions which suggest an equal power relationship, with Comalco regularly consulting these communities. The goal of each statement is again underlined:

- *Wherever Comalco operates, our vision is to be the preferred partner for communities.*
- *We set out to build enduring relationships with our neighbours characterised by mutual respect, active partnership and long-term commitment.*
- *This will mean sitting down with members of the community and other interested parties to listen to their views on what we are doing and how we report our progress.*
- *Wherever we operate we will take care to engage our host communities, respect laws and customs, minimise our adverse impacts ensuring the transfer of benefits and the enhancement of opportunities.*

Significantly, these are promissory statements, with no declared timeframe. Because they are not verifiable statements of achievement, they are impossible to challenge. Moreover, Comalco does not explain what it means by 'community'. In practice, when minerals companies talk of 'community engagement', they are mostly referring to communications with local residents; typically comprise newsletters, information sessions and complaints responses (Beach, Parsons, Brereton, & Paulsen, 2005). However, 'community' is a highly contested term (Burkett, 2001; Hopper, 2003; Little, 2002; McKenna, 2005), and the absence of definition may incline the reader to imagine 'community' as a shared dream of living among friendly, sympathetic, trusting, mutually supportive people (Bauman, 2001), a nostalgic, idealised simulacrum, rather than a really existing community. The polysemic nature of the word 'community' enables companies to make affirming statements without providing tangible evidence of enhancing community outcomes.

**Other textual characteristics**

Further analysis enabled us to categorise certain sentences according to three other textual characteristics.
a.) Statements of ‘fact’

The report makes apparently factual statements at two distinctly different levels, but presents them as similarly ‘factual’. Firstly, it presents reportage regarding quantifiable performance indicators, such as:

*Total consumption of water per unit of product decreased from 1.22 million litres per 1,000 tonnes of aluminium in 2003 to 1.21 million litres per 1,000 tonnes of aluminium in 2004 overall.*

Secondly, it presents abstract claims as factual statements. The ‘factual’ verb phrases are underlined:

*At Comalco, the business places a priority on positive relationships with our stakeholders.*

*At Comalco, we have an overriding commitment to environmental responsibility.*

*Comalco acknowledges that the Company’s mining lease is on Aboriginal land and recognises the importance of the land to the Traditional Owners of the Cape York region.*

The effect, probably unwitting, is that Comalco can leverage the features of technical reportage (even if, as above, the claims therein are minimal) to lend credibility and objectivity to abstract, unverifiable statements of social responsibility. The report thereby holds Comalco aloft as a good ‘corporate citizen’, often combining these statements with collaborative-sounding phrases, such as ‘working together’.

b.) Technocratising social responsibility

Reflecting the strategic management foundations of stakeholder theory (Freeman, 1984), social responsibility is progressively being incorporated into conventional business notions of risk assessment, measurement, performance and systems. In particular, despite suggestions that, in some cases, measurement is meaningless (Clegg & Hardy, 1996), managers increasingly strive to ‘measure’ social impacts, perpetuating the adage, ‘If you can’t measure it, you can’t manage it’. Indeed, attempts to measure social impacts of business in ‘Western’ societies can be traced to Myrick (1941), suggesting a long and persistent effort to translate social phenomena into ‘manageable’ language. Comalco’s report provides plentiful examples of phrases and clauses which suggest this technocratisation, such as:

*targets for safety performance*

*targets for selected performance indicators*

*performance and achievement in*

*the model that will integrate our*

*the area of environmental*

*health, safety and environmental*

*stewardship*

*management systems*

*innovative solutions through*

*engagement tools*

*advances in technology*

*key results areas (KRAs), which*

*include specific one and five year*

Comalco thus technocratises its approach, implying that social responsibility can be achieved via technological advancement and managerial technique, and that progress towards it can be measured. This approach constitutes technocratic discourse, which works to defend power interests through a specific political and economic agenda (McKenna & Graham, 2000). It also assumes that the current ‘Western’ economic paradigm, characterised by economic globalisation, individual libertarianism, mass production, and competition, need not be challenged (Korhonen, 2002). Such a challenge would be inconsistent with the discursive formation, and thus cannot be stated in the report.

c.) Reification

While social responsibility is an abstract concept, Comalco does provide tangible evidence of actions which could be described as constituting social responsibility:
In 2004 Comalco spent over A$15 million on community contributions in areas such as commercial initiatives, community investments and charitable gifts.

In 2004, Comalco committed an additional $1 million to the Comalco Community Fund for the Gladstone Region for distribution over the next three years.

In conjunction with the community, Comalco Weipa has set employment targets for Local Aboriginal People.

However, the tendency to account quantitatively for all actions and relationships can lead to the problem of reification (Lukacs, 1971). By this we mean that, when social responsibility is measured by ‘key performance indicators’ such as financial donations and Indigenous employment targets, the whole notion of social responsibility is technocratised. Reducing social responsibility in this way prevents deeper reflexivity concerning the responsibilities of business. Such a concern is compounded by the appropriation of these terms into business discourse, without dialogic negotiation with other discourses.

**Discussion and Conclusions**

This paper set out to provide a tentative description of how social responsibility is constructed in the genre of corporate sustainability reports, and to identify the ideological operations of such documents.

**Genre**

At a lexicogrammatical level, several features were identified:

1. Material processes, mostly concrete past, predominate, although many of these indicate procedural, philosophical, and strategic events rather than action. There is a significant number of abstract material processes.

2. It exhibits a significant level of mental processes, where thinking verbs are about belief and recognition. Although less prevalent, mental affect verbs express commitment and hope.

3. Relational processes are relatively minor, but play a significant role in representing the company in terms of an identifier (noun) and attributes (adjectival and possessive).

4. Apparently dialectical discourse identifiers (e.g., environment and managerial) are commingled. Sustainability is largely incorporated into a technical-economic discourse (reification) that allows intangible concepts such as community to be measured.

5. Negative elements (e.g., environmental performance) are muted, while positive outcomes (e.g., safety record; donations) are emphasised.

Other features were also identified:

6. The report mimics a financial report in terms of its format and visual elements.

7. Visual text reinforces the interdiscursive and ideological functions of the written text.

**Ideology**

‘Corporate social responsibility’ represents an unstable discursive order, in which the social responsibilities of business, and the appropriate content of reports in this emerging genre, remain contestable. Accordingly, in such reports, companies are free to construct their own understanding of social responsibility, with little dialogic negotiation. Such documents could form part of a company’s integrated marketing strategy to position it benignly as a responsible corporate citizen. In this report, Comalco rhetorically positions itself in this way, but in a way that is predominantly abstract and promissory. An important feature of ideology is to cast
history in a certain way or to ignore it. Here, the historical record is for the previous year. There is no acknowledgement of the mining industry’s adverse environmental record or its brutal relationship with Indigenous people. This ahistorical context limits the potential for real dialogue.

Limitations and Further Research
As this analysis examines only one document, its findings are not generalisable, but they do provide some possible lines of future inquiry. Furthermore, as such reports form part of a suite of community ‘dialogue’ (websites, planning documents, newsletters, community meetings), they should be seen as part of an overall communicative strategy. Nonetheless, we claim that this research provides a useful starting point for future such analysis.

References


Analysing Other Person Reference Terms Within the Political News Interview

Johanna Rendle-Short
Australian National University

Abstract

Previous research has demonstrated the need for objectivity or the maintenance of a neutralistic stance within the political news interview. (e.g. Clayman and Heritage, 2002). Interviewers, mainly journalists, maintain a neutralistic stance by (1) ensuring that the interview has a question/answer format, with journalists asking questions and politicians giving answers; (2) avoiding response tokens, thus ensuring that answers are heard as being for the overhearing audience rather than the listening journalist; and (3) speaking on behalf of a third person, as a way of ensuring that journalists’ questions are asked on behalf of others, rather than for themselves. However, an additional aspect to consider is how journalists, and politicians, use reference terms, names or address terms, to refer to their co-participants or other non-present people, as choice of reference terms is also tied to the notion of neutrality, as well as to issues of power and intimacy. This paper analyses 348 TV and radio political news interviews from both Commercial stations and the ABC (Australian Broadcasting Corporation) in the lead-up to the 2004 Australian federal election. The focus of the analysis is on how journalists and other politicians refer to, and address, the Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition. Do they use first name (eg John), first and second name (eg John Howard), title plus last name (eg Mr Howard), or institutional name (eg Prime Minister)? Initially, the paper focuses on the linguistic aspects of address terms and other-person reference terms, by examining how the reference terms themselves are closely connected with issues of power and status. Secondly, the paper focuses on how journalists and politicians refer to the Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition when they are not present, as such choices indicate how speakers position themselves with respect to issues of power, status and intimacy. Thirdly, the paper focuses on the interactional aspects of address terms, by examining both how participants address their co-participants during the interview itself, and where they position the address terms within the interaction as a whole. This paper therefore critically addresses the underlying aspects of discourse that are seldom noticed or referred to, thus laying bare ‘the political’ in seemingly ordinary everyday choices about names and address terms.37

Introduction

The political news interview is a major vehicle for presenting broadcast news and political commentary. One defining feature of the news interview is that because it is produced for the benefit of an overhearing public, it is not a private conversation nor can it be managed as such (Heritage, 1985). A second defining feature is that although both journalists and public figures, most often politicians, come to the interview with a prearranged agenda, the actual interview is unscripted and unpredictable (Clayman & Heritage 2002). As a result, it is not always possible to anticipate in advance what the interview will look like, or what the outcome will be.

A number of studies have shown the way in which the political news interview, as a form of institutional talk, differs from ordinary conversation (Clayman 1988, 2001, Clayman & Heritage 2002, Drew & Heritage 1992, Greatbatch 1988, Heritage & Roth 1995). In particular, the interview is characterised by constraints being placed on participants as to the types of turns they can produce as a consequence of their institutional identities (Greatbatch 1988). One of the most discussed constraint is the need for objectivity or the maintenance of a neutralistic

37 This research was made possible with the assistance of a Faculty Research Grants Scheme, 2004 at the Australian National University.
stance (Clayman and Heritage, 2002). Interviewers, mainly journalists, maintain a neutralistic stance by (1) ensuring that the interview has a question/answer format, with journalists asking questions and politicians giving answers; (2) avoiding response tokens, thus ensuring that answers are heard as being for the overhearing audience rather than the listening journalist; and (3) speaking on behalf of a third person, as a way of ensuring that journalists’ questions are asked on behalf of others, rather than for themselves. However, an additional aspect to consider is how journalists and politicians use reference terms, names or address terms, to refer to their co-participants or other non-present people, as choice of reference terms is also tied to the notion of neutrality as well as to issues of power and intimacy.

Choice of reference terms is closely connected to recipient design—talk is “constructed or designed in ways which display an orientation and sensitivity to the particular other(s) who are the co-participants” (Sacks, Schegloff & Jefferson 1974: 727). Interactants make choices at all levels of language (phonological, morphological, syntactic and semantic) in the light of the recipient of the talk. Therefore, how someone (e.g. a journalist) might address the Prime Minister of Australia is quite different from how that same journalist might address a different politician or a family member. The choice will be informed by the speaker’s knowledge of the situation in general and of the participants in particular (ten Have 1999).

However, the choice is also informed by social relationships. How speakers choose to refer to, or address, another person indicates how speakers describe and evaluate their social and cultural world (Duranti, 1992). Thus, examining the choices made by participants within the political news interview provides information as to how participants view their co-participants, in particular, how they view them with respect to issues of power and solidarity (Brown & Gilman 1960). The following example, taken from the beginning of an interview, not only illustrates the institutional nature of the political interview, it also illustrates the sort of choices both journalists and politicians make when referring to another person.

**Extract 1**

[JL/JH 30/8/04]18

1. JL: Well as you know, our prime minister
2. has called the federal election. October ninth.
3. lots of us ah tipped it. would be October ninth.
4. meaning we’ve got the longest campaign
5. ahead of us since nineteen hundred and eighty-four,
6. and the issue is trust according to the prime minister.
7. and the prime minister’s on the line.
8. Prime Minister good morning.
10. JL: And thank you for giving me some of your
11. precious time in what is going to be the start
12. of a very very busy six weeks or so.
13. JH: well it is uhm a long campaign.
14. it’s only a week longer than normal,

This extract exemplifies a number of aspects typical of the political news interview. It shows how the key players, in this case the Prime Minister, is introduced to the overhearing audience (lines 1-6); how the radio announcer (John Laws) refers to Howard by his institutional role (lines 1,6,7); how it is the interviewer who initiates the greeting (line 8); how the politician responds to the greeting (line 9); and how the interviewer manages the structure of the interview format (lines 10-12).

In this example, the journalist chooses to use the institutional role of ‘Prime Minister’ both to refer to Howard (lines 1,6,7) and to address him (line 8). By so doing, the journalist is able to emphasise the institutional nature of the interaction, and remind the overhearing audience...
that he is not simply having a discussion with any other person, but that they are partaking in a particular institutional event—the political news interview. It also serves to inform the listening audience as to who that other person is. In contrast, Howard uses the first name option of ‘John’ to address journalist, John Laws. This non-reciprocal choice of address terms indicates an asymmetrical relationship (Brown & Gilman 1960) between Howard and Laws.

Within the political interview, such information is not only relevant to the parties to the interview, it is also made available to the overhearing audience. Thus, by choosing a particular address term, both journalist and politician take into account not only how they are positioning themselves with respect to issues such as status and power, but also how they are indicating to the overhearing audience their perspective with respect to such issues. Thus, through choice of address term, participants both position themselves within a particular participation framework (Goffman 1981), as well as indicating their particular position to the recipients of the talk—the other interactant(s) and the overhearing audience.

To date, address terms have been variously analysed, from a sociolinguistic perspective (e.g. Adler 1978, Braun 1988, Brown & Ford 1961, Brown & Gilman 1960, Dickey 1997, Ervin-Tripp 1972, Poynton 1985); in terms of child-adult interaction (e.g. Wootton 1981); as well as from an interactional perspective (e.g. Sacks 1995, Sacks & Schegloff 1979, Schegloff 1996, Lerner 2003). Very little attention has, however, been given to address terms within the political news interview (see however, Clayman, 2001; Clayman & Heritage, 2002; Jaworski & Galasiński, 2000).

The focus of analysis in this paper is, how do journalists and politicians refer to, and address, the Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition. Do they use first name (e.g. John), first and second name (e.g. John Howard), title plus last name (e.g. Mr Howard), or institutional name (e.g. Prime Minister)? Initially, the paper focuses on how journalists and politicians refer to the Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition when they are not present, as such choices indicate how speakers position themselves with respect to issues of power, status and intimacy. Secondly, the paper focuses on address terms, by examining both how participants address their co-participants during the interview itself, and where they position the address terms within the interaction as a whole. This paper therefore critically addresses the underlying aspects of discourse that are seldom noticed or referred to, thus laying bare ‘the political’ in seemingly ordinary everyday choices about names and address terms.

Data

This paper analyses 348 TV and radio political news interviews in the lead-up to the 2004 Australian federal election. The leader of the Liberal Party, the current Prime Minister (Mr John Howard), and the then leader of the Australian Labor Party, the Leader of the Opposition (Mr Mark Latham), were often invited to give political interviews on both radio and television from February until September 2004. Data were collected from a number of sources, including radio and television interviews, from both the Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC) and commercial stations for the duration of the election campaign.

Other person reference

When analysing the way in which journalists refer to the Prime Minister or the Leader of the Opposition, the first thing to note is that the Prime Minister is referred to more frequently than is the Leader of the Opposition. Secondly, when referring to the Prime Minister, both journalists and politicians are more likely to use the institutional title of Prime Minister as referent, rather than the name, Howard, Mr Howard, or John Howard. We saw this in Extract 1, where Laws refers to Howard as the Prime Minister (line 1,6,7). Contrast this with the following example, recorded on the same day just after Laws had interviewed Howard, where Latham is initially introduced by the institutional role, ‘Federal Opposition Leader’, followed by name, ‘Mark Latham’.

Extract 2

[JL/ML 30/8/04]
1. JL: Federal opposition leader.
2. → he's in the studio, Mark Latham good morning.
3. ML: G'day John? How you doing.
4. JL: Ah more importantly how are you doing.
5. ML: Good. good. a hundred per cent
6. uh I feel really good.
7. JL: They tell me that ah it's absolutely
8. agonising. Pancreatitis.

Already we can see some of the differences that emerge in terms of how journalists choose to refer to politicians as part of the introductory sequence. In these two examples, Laws is making clear his attitude with respect power and status. By choosing to refer to Howard by institutional role (Extract 1), he is emphasising the status of the position and thus increasing the social distance between himself and Howard. He is also making the assumption that it is not necessary to indicate to the overhearing audience the name of the current incumbent in the role of Prime Minister. This might be because he assumes everyone knows who is Prime Minister, or because he considers the institution to be more important than the particular person. In either case, it emphasises the institutionality of the interaction, and emphasises the power and status carried by that institutional role.

In contrast, when introducing Latham (Extract 2), Laws uses both the institutional title and the name. The use of the name, even if simply to inform the overhearing audience as to who the interviewee is, demonstrates a different attitude towards the status of the political position. The very fact that a name is required indicates that in Laws' opinion, not all listeners would automatically know who the Leader of the Opposition was. However, he does not choose the more formal title plus last name option 'Mr Latham', instead he chooses to use the less formal 'Mark Latham' option. Such a choice again indicates Laws' attitudes with respect to Latham's position.

However, it is not only journalists who refer to other politicians. Howard also regularly chooses to refer to himself as Prime Minister.

Extract 3
[AJ/JH 16/3/04]
1. JH: → but I’m sad to report as Prime minister
2. that because of changed circumstances
3. nobody can assume that this country is immune from attack

Extract 4
[AJ/JH 21/4/04]
1. JH: → Well Alan all I can say is that if Mr Latham is saying that multiculturalism
2. should be redefined, I can say to him welcome aboard to common sense.
3. It’s something that I have been saying and practising in the time that
4. → I have been Prime Minister. As you know, I’m a strong advocate of the
5. benefits of our cultural diversity.

Extracts 3 and 4 illustrate how Howard refers to himself by his institutional role, thus ensuring that the title of Prime Minister is introduced into the conversation. Extract 4 demonstrates the contrast drawn by Howard, whereby he refers to Latham by name, but positions himself within the institutional role of Prime Minister. Through the use of reference terms, he clearly indicates his attitude towards his position of power within the political system, in contrast to Latham's position.
Thus the way in which non-present persons are referred to is not neutral. Choices are made as to how we talk about others. These choices are, in part, limited by the recipient design of the talk, in other words what information is required so that the audience (in this case the overhearing audience) knows who is being referred to, but even within those constraints the choices journalists and politicians make reflect their own attitudes towards issues of status and power. Thus when examining the way in which journalists are required to maintain a neutralistic stance it is important to pay attention to how they refer to non-present persons, as such choices lay bare their own underlying attitudes.

**Address Terms**

Address terms occur frequently throughout the Australian political interview. Howard, for example, uses about 5.7 address terms per interview; Latham uses 4.0 address terms per interview. They are most likely to occur within the opening and closing sequences.

The following table shows the address terms used by journalists when greeting Howard and Latham.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Politician</th>
<th>Choice of Address Term</th>
<th>Instances</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>John Howard</td>
<td>Prime Minister</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>54.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr Howard</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>20.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No name option</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PM</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prime Minister John</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>John Howard</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sir</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prime Minister Howard</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>John</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>134</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Latham</td>
<td>Mark Latham</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>39.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr Latham</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>25.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No name option</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>19.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mark</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr Mark Latham</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>79</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 1: Journalists’ choice of address terms in the greeting sequence*

As can be seen in Table 1, journalists choose varying levels of formality when addressing Howard and Latham. In terms of decreasing formality, 2.24% called Howard ‘sir’, representing the most formal option; 64.18% mentioned his institutional role; 20.9% called him Mr Howard; and 2.23% called him John Howard. 9.7% chose not to use any name in the greeting sequence, in other words to be neutral with respect to formality. Only one person called him John.

In contrast, none of the journalists called Latham ‘sir’; none mentioned his institutional role as Leader of the Opposition in the address term, although they may have referred to him using his institutional title (see Extract 2); 26.6% called him Mr Latham or Mr Mark Latham; 39.2% called him Mark Latham; 19% chose not to use any name when addressing Latham; and 15.2% called him Mark.

Thus, there is a difference in terms of how journalists choose to refer to Howard and Latham. Firstly, journalists are much more likely to refer to Howard’s institutional title when addressing him (64.18%), whereas they never addressed Latham as Leader of the Opposition or Labor Leader. Secondly, only one journalist tried to call Howard by his first name, whereas 15.2% of...
journalists called Latham by his first name.

The following extract shows journalist Paul Makin attempting to call Howard by his first name. Initially Makin orients to the institutional role of the Prime Minister (line 2) before greeting him and addressing him by first name, ‘John’ (line 3). However, such a choice cannot be taken for granted, as demonstrated by the interviewer’s question, ‘Can I call you John?’ (line 5).

Extract 5

[PM/JH 16/3/04]

1. PM: And good morning and welcome to the programme and I
2. welcome the Prime Minister of Australia, John Howard.
3. Welcome to Adelaide, John.
4. JH: Very nice to be here, Paul.
5. PM: Can I call you John?
6. JH: Please yourself.
8. First up. The date of the
9. federal election please, we’ll get that out of the way and
10. then we can do the interview.
11. JH: What’s your next question?
12. PM: Alright. Cricket. The second test starts today. Do you
13. think Stuart McGill and Andrew Symons will get a guernsey?

Howard’s brief response, ‘Please yourself’ (line 6), puts the onus of choice back on the journalist. Although not a direct ‘go ahead’, the response serves to give the impression that Howard is giving permission, albeit reluctant, for the journalist to use the first name option. Makin treats Howard’s response as permission to use the first name, as indicated by ‘Okay’ (line 7), although the fact that he goes on to say, ‘Well I’ll call you John’ (line 7), indicates his orientation to the social complexity inherent in such a choice. The subsequent interactional difficulty, as evidenced by Howard’s lack of response (line 11) to Makin’s question (line 8-10), may, in part, be due to the previous difficulty, although it is clearly not possible to say definitively that this was the case.

The decision to address the Prime Minister by first name represents the marked case, with both journalist and politician orienting to the markedness of the choice—Makin by asking for permission, and Howard by refusing to overtly give permission. The journalist, by choosing to address the Prime Minister by first name, might be orienting to Australian’s general distrust for authority and egalitarian bias (Ward, 1958) and the tendency to minimize social distance through the use of the first name option (Poynton, 1985). Howard, by seemingly putting the onus of choice back on Makin also indicates his awareness of the social norms within an Australian context. By choosing not to clarify the appropriateness or non-appropriateness of the informal address term, Howard is trying to remain neutral with respect to issues of power and solidarity. Within the context of the political news interview, that is broadcast to an overhearing audience, such a choice is not, however, simply in response to any personal choice Howard might have of how he wishes to be addressed, rather it is responding to the tendency towards informality within the Australian context, a tendency that the overhearing audience would be well aware of, as indicated by the following example.

Extract 6

[JC/JH 7/8/02]

1. JC: Hello Glen
3. You don’t mind me calling you John?
4. JH: Go right ahead
5. Caller: It’s a wonderful country that we live in
6. where we can actually ring up our leader
7. and call him by his first name. It’s just great.
8. JH: And it’s a wonderful thing for that leader
9. occasionally to be called by his first name.
10. Sometimes he’s called all sorts of things.
11. Caller: Look, it’s taken enormous amount of courage,
12. more than you can possibly know,
13. to actually ring you and talk to you.
14. But I have a question.

The above example shows a caller also orienting to the markedness of the choice to call Howard by first name. The caller does not assume that he can call him John, he asks for permission to do so. Both Howard and the caller then have a preliminary discussion as to how good this is—a discussion however, that once again demonstrates the out-of-the-ordinary nature of the request.

The following example shows how even Howard when using reported speech, relies on the institutional title of Prime Minister to demonstrate how the reported speech was directed towards him.

Extract 7
[JL/JH18/8/04]
1. JH: I mean to some of your listeners this may sound sort of splitting hairs
2. but actually it’s not, I mean there’s all the world of difference between
3. somebody saying to you “look Prime Minister, forget about this video,
4. I’m telling you straight that there’s no evidence at all, this is all a cock and
5. bull story.” Now he certainly didn’t say that or anything remotely
6. resembling that.
7. JL: Okay.

In contrast, addressing Latham by first name is unmarked, as indicated by the following example.

Extract 8
[JL/ML 14/5/04]
1. JL: Mark, good morning.
2. ML: Good morning, John.
3. JL: Are you happy with the response to what you had to say?

In this example, using the first name, Mark, is not treated by either journalist or politician as being unusual or out of the ordinary. Although only 15.2% of the journalists interviewing Latham choose this option (Table 1), it is clearly considered appropriate by both Latham and journalists as neither orient to such a choice within prior or subsequent talk. In fact, some of the journalists who greet Latham with a more formal variant (e.g. Mark Latham) at the beginning of the interview, revert to addressing him as Mark as the interview progresses.

In contrast to the way in which journalists address Howard or Latham, politicians never use title or the last name option in the greeting sequence, as shown in the following table.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Politician</th>
<th>Choice of Address Term</th>
<th>Instances</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>John Howard</td>
<td>First name</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>66.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No address term</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>26.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No greeting response given</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>130</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Latham</td>
<td>First name</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>89.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No address term</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No response possible</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>79</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Politicians’ choice of address terms in the greeting sequence

Here we can see that Latham uses the journalist’s first name 89.9% of the time when greeting him or her on air. In contrast, although Howard frequently uses the journalist’s first name (66.2%), he does not always use their name (26.9%).

In summary: The above data show that there is no prescribed form of address for politicians within the Australian political news interview, although Howard prefers to be called by title or institutional role. Thus addressing Howard by first name represents the marked case. In contrast, politicians invariably address journalists by first name. The data show that Howard prefers more formal interaction. He tends to use more formal versions of greetings compared to Latham (contrast Extract 1 with Extract 2); he does not encourage use of his first name (Extracts 5, 6, 7); and he is less likely to respond to journalist’s address terms in the greeting sequence compared to Latham (Table 2).

Discussion

When interviewing politicians, journalists have competing, and possibly conflicting, requirements. On the one hand they are required to maintain a neutralistic stance—ensuring that the interview has a question/answer format; that answers are heard as being for the overhearing audience rather than the listening journalist; and that their questions are asked on behalf of others, rather than for themselves. However, at the same time, journalists have to make decisions within the institutional setting of the political news interview, as to how to refer to non-present persons and how to address their co-participants, the politicians. These choices have a social dimension as they indicate the journalists’ orientation to issues of power and solidarity. Not all journalists choose to orient to Howard’s institutional role when addressing him. Some journalists prefer to call him by title plus name, others choose not to use an address term in the greeting sequence (Table 1). However, only one journalist tried to call him by his first name, the least formal of all the options. Even then he had to ask whether it was possible (Extract 5). In contrast when addressing the Leader of the Opposition, journalists never use his institutional title and calling him by first name is unmarked.

Politicians are making different choices. In choosing to call journalists by first name, they could be indicating to the overhearing audience that they know the journalist well enough to call them by name and are therefore ‘being friendly’ (Clayman & Heritage 2002, Blum-Kulka & Weizman 2003). Alternatively, they could be orienting to the egalitarian Australian society, in which first names tend to be used within the work environment (Poynton 1985). However, such choices have implications in terms of the interview as a whole, particularly in terms of power.

Although journalists have the ‘interviewing power’ in that they manage the political news interview by setting the agenda, by dictating what sort of questions can be asked, and by regulating what counts as a response to a question, politicians have the ‘political power’, invested in them by virtue of the political institution. One way in which both journalists and politicians can emphasise this institutional or political power is through the use of reference terms and address terms. By addressing politicians by their institutional role or title, journalists are both orienting to the institutionality of the interaction, and showing deference to the
politician and the political power held by the politician. By addressing journalists by first name, politicians are attempting, on the one hand, to minimise the social distance between them and the journalist, by being friendly and showing intimacy. However, politicians are, on the other hand, maximising the social distance between them and the journalist (due to the asymmetrical use of address terms), by reminding the journalist that in their political position they are ‘permitted’ to call them by first name even though they are not called by first name in return. This social distance is made most obvious when Howard uses his institutional role when referring to himself (Extracts 3,4,7).

The wider social distance evident in the Howard interviews is exemplified through the juxtaposition of the ‘inability’ to use Howard’s first name against the fact that Howard only uses first names when addressing journalists; through the juxtaposition of the frequent reference to the institutional role of Prime Minister against the infrequent use of the institutional role of Leader of the Opposition or Leader of the Labor Party; through the juxtaposition of Latham’s more informal greetings and their ease in terms of using first names when addressing Latham against Howard’s more formal greetings and addressing him in terms of his institutional role.

However, the social distance between Howard and journalists is even more marked when the sequential positioning of Howard’s use of address terms is taken into account (see also Rendle-Short, under review).

1. JH: I’m not going into that further.
2. People know my position on that
3. and I’ve got nothing to add.
4. CM: But for the Australian public
5. who are listening, who might want a chance,
6. who might not heard [the interview on this.
7. JH: → [Catherine you’re wasting
8. your time on that issue.
9. CM: → Ah. Prime Minister on family payments.
10. JH: yep?
11. CM: the Government’s been under a lot of pressure
12. JH: mmmm,
13. CM: by the Opposition on this,

This example shows Howard using the address term, ‘Catherine’, when he wants to interrupt her turn at talk (line 7), contrasting with the journalist’s use of the institutional title of Prime Minister in order to move onto a different topic (line 9). What is stark in this example is that the social distance already evident through the choice of address terms (institutional title versus first name), is made even starker through the way in which the address terms are used, particularly Howard’s use of first name to tell the journalist not to pursue a particular line of questioning. In other words, he is using the first name in the context of exerting his political power over her role as journalist to manage the question and answer format. As discussed above, it is meant to be the journalist that decides what to ask, and what counts as an answer, rather than the interviewee. Thus, an additional asymmetry is set up—an asymmetry that reflects a power differential.

**Conclusion**

Reference terms and address terms are a valuable resource for politicians and journalists alike, although journalists and politicians use them differently within the political news interview. Within the Australian context, journalists tend to refer to and address the Prime Minister by institutional title, although they less frequently use institutional titles when referring to or addressing the Leader of the Opposition. In contrast, it is common practice for politicians
to use first names when addressing journalists. Such a situation immediately sets up an asymmetrical power relationship. This power relationship is not simply evident at the beginning of an interview, when politicians and journalists greet each other, it is present throughout the interview, for example, when referring to the institutionality of the political role of Prime Minister, and is particularly evident when non-reciprocal use of names occurs within confrontational or adversarial environments.

Therefore although at first glance it may look as if Howard is being friendly because he knows the names of the journalists, the social distance created by the asymmetrical use of address terms together with the use of an address terms within a confrontational environment demonstrates how politicians’ use of address terms are an available resource for neutralising the interviewing power held by the journalist. In other words, choice of reference term or an address term is not a neutral decision, it carries with it implications in terms of power and status.

References


Rendle-Short, J. (under review). “Catherine, you’re wasting your time”: Asymmetrical use of Address Terms within the Australian Political Interview. *Journal of Pragmatics*.


Representing Willendorf Data: 
Gesturing Towards the Poststructural 

Linda A. Rosendahl 
University of Tasmania 

Abstract

Poststructuralist praxis challenges researchers and educationalists to work towards a closer alignment of their methods, practices and output with the ideals of their conceptual theories. (Lather 1991) In working towards a ‘community of authentic praxis’ (Case 1998: 81), this paper presents one PhD researcher’s response to this challenge.

The paper presents current educational research in critical discourse analysis at the University of Tasmania which investigates texts and images making reference to the famous artefact, historically known as the Venus of Willendorf. The research, using the tools of deconstruction, juxtaposition, electronic technologies, Foucauldian-informed methodologies, and rhizomatic (O’Riley 2003) and reflexive (Lee 2000) analysis, investigates at a micro-textual level how visual and verbal practices operate for power in contemporary discourses.

The presentation focuses on one of the chapters in the research thesis which works to push the boundaries of academic discourse in the layout of its data on the page, and explores the problematic implications of such an endeavour. It exhibits the chapter’s particular techniques in the poststructural representation of text: its particular strategies for examining both explicit and implicit systems in the socio-historical environment, its particular techniques for rhizomatically gathering and assimilating evidence, and its particular techniques of reflexive data analysis. Necessarily working to maintain an authoritative academic voice, like the thesis, the presentation works to show the constructedness of all texts, including itself as a text.

Venus of Willendorf is a fat-bottomed girl. She currently sits behind a glass display case in her specially-built, darkened, indoor hut at das Naturhistorische Museum Wien (Naturhistorisches Museum 2003: http), the Museum of Natural History in Vienna. She is female, stout and strong, ubiquitous, old. ‘She's big as a man's fist, big as a black-pepper shaker. Filled with gris-gris dust…Venus in her braided helmet is carved from a hunk of limestone. Shaped into a blues singer, in her big smallness she makes us kneel.’ (Komunyakaa 2000: 17) But this paper is not about her, per se.

The title Venus was originally given to the Willendorf artefact in a joke intended as ironic (Witcombe 2005: http). The position of Botticelli’s Venus is usurped by the Venus of Willendorf in a visual text that works to express this joke graphically (Fugitive Colors 2001: http). Following this line of thought, a number of texts, for example the book jacket of the novel ‘Myrtle of Willendorf’ (O’Connell 2000) and an image from the website Fugitive Colors (2001: http), juxtapose this circa 27,000-year-old artefact with more slender images of beauty, as if these two represent a binary opposition with beauty queens and Barbie dolls at one pole, and Willendorf at the other. Grey (2003: http) graphically represents this juxtaposition with a Barbie head atop Willendorf’s body. Speaking of fat-bottomed girls, Queen strongly asserts that there ‘ain’t no beauty queens in this locality’ (May 2005: http). These discursive sites speak to the social construction of this binary and are very worthy of postlinguistic exploration, but this paper is also not about this constructed binary, per se.

Many feminists and anti-weight-watchers construct texts that appropriate the Willendorf icon, in word or visual image, for emancipatory purposes, for example Snake and Snake (1999: http). The Willendorf Pages, a member of ‘Phenomenal Women Of The Web’ (1999: http),
was a website against violence towards women. Wann created a Willendorf paper doll book ‘for people who don’t apologize for their size’ (Wann 2003: http). Some discourses utilise the Willendorf icon for popularising their causes, as does Mutén (1994: 123), a data text identified as exhibiting a new-age discourse for the purposes of this study, and as does Gadon (1989: 236), a data text identified as exhibiting a feminist discourse. These discursive sites, too, speak to textual constructions in the socio-historical environment and are worthy of postlinguistic exploration, but this paper is also not about these emancipatory or popularising efforts, per se.

This paper, in a word, is about praxis. It presents a doctoral thesis chapter (Rosendahl 2005: 85-114), that works to put its poststructuralist money where its academic mouth is. Poststructuralist praxis as ‘the self-creative activity through which we make the world’ (Bottomore in Lather 1991b: 11), challenges researchers and educationalists to work towards a closer alignment of their methods, practices and output with the ideals of their conceptual theories. (Lather 1991a: 23) In working towards a ‘community of authentic praxis’ (Case 1998: 81), this paper presents one PhD researcher’s response to this challenge.

The presented chapter is a current draft of post-linguistic study in progress at the University of Tasmania. The title page of the chapter draft announces itself as ‘4: Academic-Agenda/s Word and Image Data: Willendorf Analyses’ (Rosendahl 2005: 85). The page shows previews of images from the data texts displayed in the chapter, and lists the five discourse categories included in the chapter, namely ‘Feminist Discourse/s, Liberal-Humanist Discourse/s, New-Age Discourse/s, Scientific Discourse/s, and Post/Structuralist Discourse/s’. The chapter begins traditionally enough for a doctoral thesis; the chapter introduction speaks via single academic narrative in the active voice that avoids use of the subject ‘I’. The block quotations on the page are definitions that use dot points in bold type. The academic convention of quotations works to establish authority by reflexively building upon established precedents (Rosendahl 2002: 148). Gee refers to this kind of reflexivity as ‘an important reciprocity between language and “reality”’ (1999: 82). The chapter introduction continues the thesis’ use of these conventional scholarly practices.

After two pages of introduction, however, the layout of the page changes (Rosendahl 2005: 89). At this point five windows or tiles divide the space into separate data texts, four running texts above and the academic narrative as a reflexive ‘running subtext’ (Lather & Smithies 1997: viii) at the bottom. Foucault said ‘There is…something ludicrous in philosophical discourse when it tries, from the outside, to dictate to others, to tell them where their truth is and how to find it’ (1992: 9), and yet this is precisely education’s inherited perspective: telling people what and where their truth is, and how to find it. By framing both its data and its own academic narrative for scrutiny, this page layout works against being the final authority on the topic. It works to include the reader/examiner in the research project, and to account reflexively for the textuality of its own text (Lee 2000: 202).

Feminist poststructuralist theory undergirds the entire thesis, but in this chapter especially, the thesis works not only to speak, but also to perform this theory by means of its page layout. In using these sorts of textual strategies, poststructuralism seeks ways, as O’Riley puts it ‘to open…rhetoric…toward a more refractive and diffusive engagement’ (2003: 23). From the macro-textuality of its page layout to the poststructuralist micro-textuality of its parentheses and virgules, the chapter works to engage this more refractive and diffusive interaction.

For example, poststructuralist use of parentheses works in the word (re)searcher (Rosendahl 2005: 89), to invoke both the initial nature and the cyclical nature of the activity. (Rosendahl 2002: 46) This micro-textuality works to express that a researcher builds upon searches and researches that have already been accomplished, as well as that a researcher is also in certain ways an initial searcher. This deconstruction of words into their rhizomatic parts potentially opens words, and the genealogy of words, to poststructuralism’s more refractive and diffusive engagement.

Poststructuralist use of the virgule, or slash, works in the word post/positivist (eg Rosendahl 2005: 89) to invoke the positivist/non-positivist binary. ‘In a well-known Marx Brothers joke Groucho answers the standard question “Tea or coffee?” with “Yes, please!”—a refusal of choice.’ (Žižek 2000: 90) Positioning the binary as a unified pair, potentially opens a space to say something else about the phenomenon, that is, without getting caught up, or positioned, by hegemonic dichotomous language on one side of the binary fence or the other (Rosendahl
The chapter also engages a more refractive and diffusive interaction in working, by means of its textuality, to show its own construction in a number of ways:

1. The textuality of the chapter works to show the construction of its images as texts by enlarging the Willendorf image (Rosendahl 2005: 89), as well as including the visual context from which it was taken. The academic narrative reinforces this performativity through conventional means by stating ‘this very text also constructs images as texts’ (Rosendahl 2005: 90).

2. The textuality of the chapter works to show its own construction by showing the noun of a sentence in red and the verb of a sentence in green. This treatment highlights what the text claims things are able to do, such as that a ‘page’ can ‘present’, and that ‘blue’ can ‘highlight’ (Rosendahl 2005: 89).

3. The textuality of the chapter works to show the production of its own construction by leaving the evidence of crossed-out words where second-nature hegemonic language struggles to maintain its foothold against conscious fledgling poststructuralist language (Rosendahl 2005: 90).

4. The well-established textuality of traditional academic referencing is also a form of poststructuralist praxis in that both traditional academic referencing and poststructuralist praxis are concerned with attaching particular words to particular people at particular times, rather than allowing statements to stand unqualified as part of a ‘grand narrative’ (Natoli 1997: 17-18).

5. The chapter italicises the word/s immediately after the word word (eg Rosendahl 2005: 89) and the word clause (eg Rosendahl 2005: 90) to show, through textual means at a glance, the reflective and reflexive praxis performed in its critical data analysis of the texts under scrutiny.

The chapter, like the rest of the thesis, prints on both sides of the page, more like an informal book or a magazine than a doctoral thesis. This tactic, again, works to include the reader/examiner as an active participant rather than to exclude and preach to her/him/them, as tends to occur in more formal-academic-document style. The problematic implications of working to show constructedness in the production of any text but especially in an academic thesis, include that to a certain extent it is at cross purposes with wielding hard-won, centuries-old, tools-of-the-academic-trade. In showing its own workings, poststructuralist academic praxis tends to undermine some of its own traditional support systems. As stated by Prado ‘the acknowledgment of reflexivity is perhaps postmodernism’s defining feature and its biggest problem’ (2000: 20). Further, having witnessed a text move poststructurally to reflexively show its own workings does not necessarily make it easier for a student to master, although the educationalist hope, of course, is that experience with this deconstruction, in a do-as-I-do-not-merely-as-I-say type of environment, does indeed work towards empowering students to consciously construct their own openly convincing texts.

The identified agendas of the data texts in the Willendorf study include not only the academic agendas displayed in this chapter, and the creative agendas, emancipatory agendas and popularising agendas briefly mentioned in the introduction of this paper, but also commercial agendas, as illustrated for example in an image of a bar of soap for sale by a company called Sacred Source (2003: http) that sells Goddess and Willendorf items from bars of chocolate to earrings, and promotional agendas as illustrated in this image of Willendorf rag dolls promoting the production of art through the ‘Goddess 2000 Project’ (Marewindrider 2001: http). Since chapter four is the only chapter of the thesis that uses the window/mirror page layout, and since the chapter presents only those data texts with agendas categorised in this study as academic, it is only the academic data texts of the study that are treated in this reflexive poststructuralist format. In this way the chapter compares apples with apples, or in other words compares the academic-agenda text of the thesis narrative with other texts identified as also having academic agendas.

As well as the six identified agendas, the study categorises five contemporary discourses. Four of these are hegemonic discourses which the chapter includes in alphabetical order in tiles at the top of the page (Rosendahl 2005: 89). These discovered and identified, dominant, contemporary discourses provide evidence of how visual and textual practices, built within
and upon the socio-historic environment, work to vie for power. In our culture knowledge is power. Thereby, being an authority on knowledge is also power. By and large, textual and micro-textual practices operate for power at this level, vying for position in hegemony’s master narrative. For example, at a textual level, given that the playing field is dominated by the idea that there is but one ‘Big Story’ (Natoli 1997: 17-18), a feminist discourse finds it necessary to advise the reader that ‘questions of differences can be asked’ (Nelson 2005: http). The liberal-humanist discourse must notify us that ‘there is an extremely perplexing question’ (Campbell 1996: 50). The new-age discourse informs us what was and what was not realised by primitive societies (Farrar & Farrar 1987: 8), and a scientific discourse tells us what ‘typifies the mature form’ (Dobson 1998: http). To do otherwise in the current cultural climate would be to sound insipid and feeble. A text that didn’t vie for position in this sure-footed way would not sound worthy of reading, because it would come across, in the metanarrative scheme that our culture currently operates under, as not knowing what it was talking about.

The fifth discourse, running across the bottom half of the pages, introduces itself as working ‘towards a post/structuralist discourse’ (Rosendahl 2005: 89), and categorises itself accordingly. The exciting aspect of poststructuralist discourse analysis for me is not that it is an educational doorway to freedom, whatever options that freedom may open, but that it is an educational doorway to workability in the sense of malleability. Poststructuralist discourse analysis does not follow tried and true road signs only, nor does it forge into the unknown underbrush only. It re-examines and works to go where there is a newfound need to go, a heretofore unseen path or unheard voice to follow. Borrowing the analogy of O’Riley’s ‘trickster Coyotes and coyotes’ (2003: 35), poststructuralist discourse analysis works ‘within/against’ (Lather 1991a) existing road signs and underbrush.

Since the study works to include all of the academic data texts in the chapter, and since there are less texts in some discourse categories than others, there is one less upper discourse tile per page as categories terminate. On the double-page spread of pages 92-93 of the draft, for example, the number of tiles moves from four on the left-hand page to three on the right-hand page as the academic data texts in the feminist category are spent. Chance alphabetic order is a particular technique for rhizomatically (O’Riley 2003: 24-33) gathering and assimilating evidence. The alphabetic order assists in cross-checking data as it accumulates, but also provides for ‘chance operations’ (O’Riley 2003: 36-37) in the juxtapositions that end up together on the page as a result of this imposed pattern, namely the pattern of texts being ordered alphabetically by the surname of their author.

For example, according to alphabetic fate, the discourse columns of pages 94 and 95 juxtapose the rectangular frames of the scientific discourse images with the circle of a new-age-discourse image. The discourse columns juxtapose these images, in turn, with the timeline excerpt of a liberal-humanist discourse image. Discourse analysis involves examining both explicit and implicit systems in the socio-historical environment. Laying out data texts in this way is not only a strategy for including the reader/examiner in the study, but also another means through which to spot explicit or implicit patterns between discourse categories that might otherwise go unnoticed.

The layout has moved, by page 96 of the chapter draft, to displaying but two categories of discourses across the top of the page. Namely, these are discourses identified for the purposes of this study as liberal humanist and scientific, respectively, the two largest discourse groups of the academic-agenda texts. That these are the largest discourse groups of the academic-agenda texts belies the shared cultural values and history of academic, liberal humanist, and scientific perspectives, or at least the researcher/author’s perception of these shared cultural values and history. As recently summarised by Wolf regarding the implications of quantum physics, ‘There is no “out there” out there, independent of what’s going on “in here”’ (in Arntz 2005: 47), that is, independent of what is going on within our respective selves.

The archaeological site at Willendorf was discovered during the construction of a railway line through this wine-cultivating region of Austria. A human-sized statue of the 4-inch-high Willendorf artefact now marks this place where the famous artefact was found in August 1908 (Neugebauer-Maresch 1995: 2). Two other so-called venuses, Willendorf Venus II (Neugebauer-Maresch 1995: 69) and Willendorf Venus III (Neugebauer-Maresch 1995: 70), were also unearthed at the same archaeological stratum, namely Willendorf II, layer 9 (Neugebauer-Maresch 1995: 67-70) of the Willendorf-in-der-Wachau (Neugebauer-Maresch
1995: 2) site. Some texts therefore refer to the well-known Willendorf artefact as ‘Willendorf Venus I’ (Neugebauer-Maresh 1995: 67) or ‘Willendorf no. 1’ (McDermott 1995: http). As the academic narrative of the draft states, including these added side-lights of information works to ‘invoke a sense of expertise and authority’ (Rosendahl 2005: 98). The academic narrative goes on to critically analyse its own text reflexively in stating ‘this very text does this as well by exhibiting its knowledge of and access to photographs of Willendorf Venuses two and three’ (Rosendahl 2005: 98).

By page 100, the scientific-discourse column stands alone across the top of the page. This column presents the largest number of academic-agenda texts. The scientific-discourse text on these pages exhibits further devices for adding a sense of expertise and authority to a text. Namely, it adds vertical and horizontal axes in its illustration drawings (McDermott 1995: http), provides close-up images showing the reader where to look and validating that there is something relevant there to be found (McDermott 1995: http), and uses number and letter sequences that add to a sense of the author’s thoroughness, control, and accuracy.

The page layout of the chapter draft changes yet again on pages 108-109 to a comparison of two editions of the same work, published 21 years apart (de la Croix & Tansey 1970: 22-23; de la Croix, Tansey & Kirkpatrick 1991: 26). At this point the academic narrative of the chapter no longer presents itself as reflexive; it is no longer framed or shaded as if it were a mirror. Instead it stands more traditionally, positioning itself outside the frames of that which it judges and critically analyses. Among the things that the academic narrative notes are ‘the politically correct change from “he” to “they”’ (Rosendahl 2005: 108-109), that is from ‘But again the artist’s approach to the human figure differs from that to animals. He obviously does not aim for that heightened realism so characteristic of his animal representations’ (de la Croix & Tansey 1970: 22-23) to ‘But again the artist's approach to the human figure differs from the way these early artists represented animals. They obviously do not aim for that heightened realism so characteristic of his animal representations’ (de la Croix, Tansey & Kirkpatrick 1991: 26), although as is evident in this last sentence, one ‘his’ was left behind in the editing process.

The academic narrative on these pages continues its analysis by saying ‘other differences are that “the cave artist” in the later version has an “inventory” rather than a “vocabulary” of forms’ (Rosendahl 2005: 109). The term cave artist is in itself an interesting generalisation in that it highlights an assumption that Palaeolithic humans—as in cave people: cave men, cave women, cave children and cave babies—all lived in caves. The academic narrative of the chapter goes on to philosophise on the limits of space and time in terms of text construction and explicates its understanding that in order to get an overview, a sometimes misleading perception of detail is passed along. The academic narrative closes its philosophical revelry on the construction of texts with ‘Whether or not the subject about which the text is speaking has changed, the text itself has changed’ (Rosendahl 2005: 109).

The chapter offers a summary page (Rosendahl 2005: 114), numbering its list of specific textual strategies for poststructurally highlighting the construction of text and for constructing authority. The summary closes with a comparison of academic and poststructuralist concerns, stating that those concerns match in that they both ‘juxtapose, compare and contrast’ and ‘attach statements to a particular person or persons and to a particular time’, but that those concerns differ in that academic concerns traditionally advocate a single correct perspective or ‘Master Voice’ (Natoli 1997: 17-18), the voice those concerns work to achieve, while poststructuralist concerns work to construct spaces for multiple perspectives.

References


Educational Discourses, New York, Peter Lang Publishing Inc.


Racism in Australian education exports: a Critical Discourse Analysis of one official policy®

Li Shi
University of Tasmania

Abstract
Over the past two decades, increasing numbers of overseas students have come to Australia. In 2000, there were 153,372 international students enrolled in Australia (DEST, 2001). And these overseas students generated $3.7 billion for the Australian economy (AEI, 2000). Exporting education has played a major part of Australian services trade, especially in Asia, from which the majority of overseas students originate. In 2002, China first surpassed Malaysia in student numbers studying in the Australian tertiary education system (AVCC, 2005) and became the biggest export country of the Australian education sector. By accepting increasing numbers of overseas students, Australia has become more widely recognised in the arena of international education, and is regarded as a safe, friendly study destination with high quality courses, said by Mr. Alexander Downer, Minister for Foreign Affairs (2005). However, there are still some latent superior sentiments and attitudes resonating beneath the surface of this “friendly study destination” in the predominant “white” society.

This paper aims to probe for ideological construction of racism imbricated within the structure of an official DIMIA (Department of Immigration, Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs) document. This research focuses on an official policy relating to assessment levels in terms of financial proof for the process of overseas student applications for Australian education. The analysis adheres to Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), employed by Van Dijk, Fairclough and Foucault et al. The paper is undertaken in two stages. The first, a general characterization of Australian education export discourse, reveals different policy evidence financial proof for students from different countries. The second is followed by a critical analysis of this policy based on its language used and a comparative analysis between this policy and those of other western countries such as the United States, the United Kingdom, Canada, New Zealand, France and Spain, which surfaces evidence of a racist ideology manifest in an asymmetrical power discourse in Australia between the (white) law-makers and overseas students from developing countries. The study concludes with a discussion regarding generalization issue in this policy and its implication in a society as a way to unravel the way in which racial prejudice is still imbricated within friendly educational discourse of Australia.

Introductory section
Commonly, ‘racism’ is violence in the form of verbal or physical abuse. This paper is concerned with racism of the sort that refers to ethnic domination in cosmopolitan societies like the USA and Australia (Van, 1992). ‘The people who practise this racism believe in or/and uphold the basic values of democratic egalitarianism, and would emphatically deny that they are “racist”. Nevertheless they would speak or act in such a way that distances themselves from the ethnic minority, engaging discursive strategies that blame the victims for their circumstances on their own social, economic and even cultural disadvantage’ (Teo, 2000).

The paper focuses on how this form of racism manifests itself through an official document in a modern society like Australia. I present how the discourse in the DIMIA document regarding assessment levels of financial proof in student visa processing can be used as an instrument to exert ideological dominance in the recruitment of overseas students. I also examine how this policy is embedded in such larger, but less transparent structure of power discourse that
disguised dominance in naturalized discourse.

Background

Australia was an early player in the education export industry. Today it is the largest provider per head of population, and the third largest English-speaking provider of international education services, with seven per cent of the market, behind the USA (32 per cent) and the UK (15 per cent). The industry is now Australia's third largest service export industry (Kenyon & Koshy, 2003). Kenyon and Koshy (2003) also estimate that incoming international students spent $5.2 billion in 2002 on tuition fees, goods and services, and that the economic activity this generated had an employment impact of about 42,650 jobs.

Through the past two decades, increasing numbers of overseas students have come to Australia. In 2000, there were 153,372 international students enrolled in Australia (DEST, 2001). In 2003-04, a total of 171,616 visas were granted to overseas students by 5.6 per cent increase over last year, applicants holding a passport from the following places were the major source of student visa grants offshore: the People's Republic of China (10%), the United States (6.2%), India (5.6%), Republic of Korea (4.8%), Malaysia (4.1%), Japan (3.9%), Hong Kong SAR (3.2%), Indonesia (3%), Thailand (2.9%) and Singapore (2.2%). Vietnam showed a significant increase in offshore grants (0.8%), which figures show that students from the ten Asian countries above account for 40.5% of all overseas students in Australia (DIMIA). The foregoing data also show that the increasing trend in numbers of overseas students still remains strong. To sum up, exporting education of Australia has been forging active links with other countries, especially in Asia, from which the majority of overseas students originate.

By accepting increasing numbers of overseas students, Australia has become more widely recognised in the arena of international education, and is regarded as a safe, friendly study destination with high quality courses, Mr. Alexander Downer, Minister for Foreign Affairs said (2005). However, there are still some latent superior sentiments and attitudes resonating beneath the surface of this “friendly study destination” in the predominant “white” society.

The aim of this paper is to show how discursive strategies expressed in this commonwealth government policy works to practise unegalitarianism, so as to help us better understand how racial prejudice against students from some countries is imbricated within the structure of this policy in Australia. DIMIA is the main policy-maker and policy-enforcer in the field of migration and education exports in Australia, i.e. it plays a key function in dealing with multicultural issues in the domestic and international scopes. Therefore, in this sense, this document chosen from DIMIA has much more significance or persuasiveness than otherwise. Before the discursive strategies are being dealt with, it is necessary to first briefly introduce a general characterization of Australian education export discourse.

General characterization of financial proof for overseas student visa applicants

In the last 20 years, transnational education has become a global phenomenon, fuelled by many forces. These include the globalisation of trade and communications, internationalisation of labour markets, declines in the costs of international travel and communications, and growth in the numbers who can afford to obtain better educational opportunities than previous generations. Governments are more actively promoting the international mobility of students and teachers for a mix of cultural, political, labour market and trade reason. International education became part of Australia's geo-political positioning after World War II (Poole, 2004). Today's Australian education export industry owes its genesis to the Australian Government's initiative in 1986 to open Australian education to full-fee paying overseas students (AEI, 2005).

With respect to the recruitment of full-fee paying overseas students, DIMIA set up a serial of policies to ensure that all the overseas student visa applicants to have sufficient financial capacity for their studying and living while in Australia. Such regulations are formulated for overseas student visa applicants as follows:
• You will need to show that you have enough money to pay for living expenses, education costs and travel for the duration of the course.
• You will need to show that you have enough money for you, your spouse and all of your children aged under 18 years, whether or not they will be coming to Australia with you.

Your visa subclass and assessment level determines how you will need to prove your capacity to meet your financial requirements. (DIMIA, 2005)

These descriptions reveal that overseas student visa applicants not only need to show that they can afford for their cost of living, education and travel but their family's ones if applicable, whether or not they will be coming to Australia. More importantly how much fund they need depends on their visa subclass and assessment level. Before presenting this key part of the paper, i.e. assessment levels, it is necessary to let us first look at what visa subclasses are (see Table 1):

Table 1:

| If the main course you will be studying is a(n)... | Then you can apply for a Student visa, subclass...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English Language Intensive Courses for Overseas Students (ELICOS), undertaken as a stand-alone course, not leading to an Australian award or ELICOS undertaken as a stand-alone course, leading to a certificate I, II, III or IV,</td>
<td>... 570 - Independent ELICOS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>primary school course</td>
<td>... 571 - Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>secondary school course, including junior and senior secondary or approved secondary exchange program,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>certificate I, II, III, and IV (except ELICOS) diploma advanced diploma vocational graduate certificate or vocational graduate diploma. Note: Former RATE system qualifications: Certificate, Advanced certificate and Associate diploma,</td>
<td>... 572 - Vocational Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bachelor degree associate degree graduate certificate graduate diploma or masters coursework,</td>
<td>... 573 - Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>masters research or doctoral degree</td>
<td>... 574 - Postgraduate Research</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
enabling course: non-award foundation studies or other full-time course or components of courses not leading to an Australian award,

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>... 575 - Non-award</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

full-time courses of any type undertaken by an AusAID or Defence student sponsored by the Australian Government,

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>... 576 - AusAID</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

(DIMIA, 2005)

By browsing the form, we can see there are seven visa subclasses, in which, generally speaking, Subclass 570 is for language learning, Subclass 571 is for primary and secondary schools, Subclass 572 for TAFE, Subclass 573 for coursework degree and Subclass 574 for research degree, Subclass 575 is non-award courses and Subclass 576 can be any type, but it is hard to get sponsorship from the Australian Government. And from the data provided by Overview – Australia’s Student Visa Program of DIMIA (2005), we can understand that a predominant majority of overseas students come from Subclass 572, 573, 574.

DIMIA also identifies four assessment levels by countries as a way to determine what materials student visa applicants need to provide in order to meet the relative financial requirements according to their visa subclasses. Table 2 describes what financial requirements are in student visa assessment.

*Table 2*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>If your assessment level is ...</th>
<th>Then you will need to ...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1,</td>
<td>... declare that you have access to enough money to meet the minimum financial requirements in the Student visa application form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2,</td>
<td>show that you have access to the minimum financial requirements for the first 12 months of your stay in Australia declare that you have access to the minimum financial requirements for the remainder of your stay in Australia. Note: Although non-cash assets are not directly acceptable, it is possible to either: liquidate the assets prior to applying for a student visa, depositing the money you receive in a bank or use the assets as collateral for a loan from a financial institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3,</td>
<td>show that you have access to the minimum financial requirements from an acceptable source for the first 24 months of your stay in Australia declare that you have access to the minimum financial requirements for the remainder of your stay in Australia Exception: If you are applying for a subclass 574 (Postgraduate Research sector) visa, you will need to show that you have access to the minimum financial requirements from an acceptable source for: at least the period of any preliminary course and the first 12 months of your principal course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4,</td>
<td>show that you have access to the minimum financial requirements from an acceptable source for the first 36 months of your stay in Australia declare that you have access to the minimum financial requirements for the remainder of your stay in Australia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Exception: If you are applying for a subclass 574 (Postgraduate Research sector) visa, you will need to show that you have access to the minimum financial requirements from an acceptable course for:
- at least the period of any preliminary course
- the first 12 months of your principal course

(DIMIA, 2005)

What groundings these assessment levels are set up remain unstated or unexplained, even a little, in the DIMIA documents. Nevertheless, what can be easily perceived is that:

- The countries on Level 3 in most subclasses (for a total of 29): Bangladesh, Bhutan, Burma, Cuba, Ecuador, Fiji, Ghana, India, Iran, Jordan, Kenya, Kiribati, Laos, Maldives, Mongolia, Nauru, Nepal, Nigeria, Philippines, Russian Federation, Samoa Western, Solomon Islands, Sri Lanka, Tanzania, Turkey, Tuvalu, Vietnam, Zambia and Zimbabwe

- The countries on Level 4 in most subclasses (for a total of 4): Cambodia, China (excl. SARs and Taiwan), Lebanon and Pakistan

The geographic distribution of these countries is as follows:

- 24 Asian countries: Cambodia, China (excl. SARs and Taiwan), Lebanon, Pakistan (all of Level 4 countries come from Asian), Bangladesh, Bhutan, Burma, Fiji, India, Iran, Jordan, Kiribati, Laos, Maldives, Mongolia, Nauru, Nepal, Philippines, Samoa Western, Solomon Islands, Sri Lanka, Turkey, Tuvalu, Vietnam.

- 6 African countries: Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria, Tanzania, Zambia, Zimbabwe

- 2 Latin Americans: Cuba, Ecuador

- 1 European: Russian Federation

The ongoing data display that a majority of countries on Level 3 and 4 are in Asia. Ironically, ‘Asia is Australia's most important regional market for education exports, and will continue to provide unprecedented opportunities for Australia, as Asian incomes grow and higher education takes on increasing prominence.’ said Dr Brendan Nelson (2005), Minister of the DIMIA. She then continued ‘In terms of international student spending, Australia's top eight markets measured on fees are in Asia. China is Australia’s largest source of foreign students with almost 70,000 students enrolled in Australian institutions in 2004.’

In terms of the students from these countries, an additional requirement is made for them with regard to acceptable financial sources. The following table (Table 3) describes acceptable sources for the funding if their assessment levels are 3 or 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assessment level</th>
<th>The funds to support you and your family members can come from …</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>a money deposit with a financial institution held by you or an individual providing support to you for at least 3 consecutive months immediately before the date of your visa application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a loan from a financial institution made to you or an individual providing support to you</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a loan from the government of your home country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>your proposed education provider</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the Commonwealth of Australia or an Australian State or Territory government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the government of a foreign country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a provincial or state government of a foreign country that has the written support of the national government of the foreign country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>an organisation gazetted by the Minister</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Theoretical section

Now, it is necessary to lay down the theoretical framework within which the entire analysis is undertaken. This paper adheres to Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) employed by Van Dijk (1993, 1996) and Fairclough (1992, 1995), who point out CDA has been influential beyond the area of discourse to ‘an explanation of how and why particular discourses are produced. Discourse is not only a product or reflection of social processes, but seen to contribute towards the production (or reproduction) of these processes’ (Teo, 2000). Gramsci (1971) and Althusser (1971) have both stressed the significance of ideology for modern societies to sustain and reinforce their social structures and relations. ‘As a pre-eminent manifestation of this socially constitutive ideology, language becomes the primary instrument through which ideology is transmitted, enacted and reproduced’ (Foucault, 1972). Teo (2000) then states: ‘thus, by analysing the linguistic structures and discourse strategies in the light of their interactional and wider social contexts, we can unlock the ideologies and recover the social meanings expressed in discourse’. Van Dijk (1993, 1996) and Faircough (1992, 1995) share a common vision of the centrality of language as a means of social construction, and they embark upon various investigatory studies designed to unmask and make transparent the kind of socio-political or socio-cultural ideologies that have become entrenched and
naturalized over time in discourse.

**Data analysis**

The analysis of this policy discourse is undertaken in two parts. Some words within this policy are first sketched under linguistic analysis, with a focus on particular discursive strategies that have the potential to harbour ideological meaning. Following this, a comparative analysis based on relative policies in other western countries is undertaken. In so doing, I hope to gradually reveal the construction of a racist ideology embedded within its structure.

In a linguistic perspective, we can find that on Level 1 in Table 2 there is no requirement for financial proof, just to ‘declare’. However, on Level 2, it changes into ‘show that you have access to the minimum financial requirements for the first 12 months of your stay in Australia’, which is written in block. And then on Level 3 it shifts to ‘show… and 24 months’ and on Level 4 ‘show… and 36 months’ both of which are written in block. The increasing months can only give one implication, i.e. of decreasing credibleness or sense of trust towards these overseas student visa applicants. The similar difference also appears between Level 2 and Level 3 and 4. On Level 2, the requirement only states to ‘show that you have access to the minimum financial requirements for the first 12 months of your stay in Australia’, but On Level 3 and 4, ‘an acceptable source’ is added to it. That phrase implies some financial sources are not accepted or ‘we’ do not trust other sources in the countries on Level 3 and 4. What is more, between Level 3 and Level 4 in Table 3, in the delimitation of ‘an acceptable source’, there are still two disparities. One shows that on Level 3 one item states a money deposit with a financial institution held by an individual providing support to …’, while on Level 4 it changes into ‘a money deposit with a financial institution that has been held …by you/your spouse/your brother or sister/your parents/your grandparents/your aunt or uncle (only if they are usually resident in Australia and either a citizen/permanent resident of Australia or an eligible New Zealand citizen)’ which means DIMIA only trusts people list above as your financial supply sources. The other one appears that on Level 3, a money deposit is required for at least 3 consecutive months immediately before the date of your visa application’, but on Level 4, the corresponding requirement turns to be ‘at least 6 consecutive months’. The discourse expressed in these language reveals that the degree of credibleness is set up in a decreasing order along the four assessment levels.

What caused DIMIA to take such an action to ensure adequate financial capacity of those overseas students? And what is discursive strategy used in the discourse of this DIMIA policy? Although the reasons remain undeclared in the DIMIA documents, it is not hard to find out that some students from the countries on Level 2, especially Level 3 and 4 might falsify their application documents. However when a deeper thought is given, we might find these behaviours more likely concern educational levels of visa applicants, other than their financial capacity. As almost all of the financial proof such as money deposit are very hard to replicate or falsify and these are also very easy to be identified by only a ring to their relative financial institutions. In this sense, it seems not sufficient to justify this policy with the reason of document falsification. Or worse, that might give a suggestion that Australian government be more commercial oriented in terms of the recruitment of international students. The second reason easily identified is to prevent illegal migration from these countries. That sounds rather reasonable, but when we look closely back to the visa subclasses, it is similarly easy to be noted that for Master or Doctorate candidate applicants, one of the DIMIA minimum requirements is bachelor degree which they got with efforts of as long as three or four years, illegal residence in Australia costs them too much and must be much more harm than good; for bachelor pursuant, they are only around 17 or 18 years old and too young to risk their whole life in a totally different country; for TAFE pursuant, English is an unsurmountable task; as a matter of fact, IELTS (the International English Language Testing System) is the hardest part and an unachievable task for people in most of Level 3 and 4 countries who intend to remain in Australia in mind. The last reason for this policy could be to prevent overseas students to do too much part-time work in case their working activities will have a negative impact on domestic labour markets and also affect their own full-time study if in a noble perspective. But that is also groundless, as far as I know few of overseas students are not engaged in casual work when start their courses, it is also clear that no matter how hard they work, they can not make money enough to cover their tuition fee, working is more likely a life experience, since Australia has started to recruit fee-paying students for around 20 years
students should have been clear before they apply for students visa, that if they can not afford their schooling fee, they must be in a big awkward trouble after they commence their courses.

It can easily be perceived that the policy is based on such an assumption that Australian government is quite afraid of people from developing countries to sly into Australia and remain illegally. The assumption is made by such a preconception that some students from these countries provided falsified documents when applying for student visas, so DIMIA generalized this small group of people to their whole nations presuming that all the people from these countries have the disposition for falsifying documents and incredibleness. In Teo's point of view (2000) and in discursive strategy, DIMIA blames these people for their circumstance on their own faults, then naturally they deserve this strict policy. However, one result of which can not be neglected is that, new applicants from these countries have to take the responsibility for the bad influence made by their prior compatriots, although they have done nothing wrong. One example might give a clearer elaboration, such as in a family, all the four children have been raised by the same parents and under the same family environment, if a brother broke a vase and left away, no one would agree on that the parents should punish the rest three. The problem occurred in the discourse of this policy might be they are not in a same ‘family’, although they all live on the earth.

Moreover, compared with other western countries such as the United Stated, the United Kingdom, New Zealand, Canada, France and Spain, we can see their policies on financial proof in Table 4, financial policies are also very strict and specific such as income tax documents, original bank books and/or statements, business registration, licenses and payslips etc. just like what Australia does, but they do not identify different assessment levels by countries like Australia, all the overseas students are treated by the same requirements no matter how strict they are.

Table 4: Policies of financial proof in such major six western countries as the United States, the United Kingdom, Canada, New Zealand, France, and Spain

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Policy of Financial Proof</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Financial evidence that shows you or your parents who are sponsoring you have sufficient funds to cover your tuition and living expenses during the period of your intended study. For example, if you or your sponsor is a salaried employee, please bring income tax documents and original bank books and/or statements. If you or your sponsor own a business, please bring business registration, licenses, etc., and tax documents, as well as original bank books and/or statements. (from US Department of State, November 2004)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Bank statements, payslips or other evidence to show that you can pay for your stay and your course of studies in the UK... (<a href="http://www.ukvisas.gov.uk/servlet/Front?pagename=OpenMarket/Xcelerate/ShowPage&amp;c=Page&amp;cid=1018721067373,09/09/05">http://www.ukvisas.gov.uk/servlet/Front?pagename=OpenMarket/Xcelerate/ShowPage&amp;c=Page&amp;cid=1018721067373,09/09/05</a>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>Proof of funds available to support yourself and family members during your stay and to enable you to leave Canada, such as a bank statement, pay stubs, proof of employment or proof of travellers' cheques. (<a href="http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/applications/guides/5256E2.html2005-09-01">http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/applications/guides/5256E2.html2005-09-01</a>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>Evidence of sufficient funds to support yourself for the period you will be studying (If you are studying in New Zealand for less than 36 weeks please provide evidence of NZ$1000 per month. If you are intending to study in New Zealand for more than 36 weeks please provide evidence of NZ$10,000 per year as well as sufficient founds to purchase an outward ticket); AND a guarantee of accommodation. (Application to Study in New Zealand, September 2005)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| France      | Each French embassy sets the level of financial resources to be demonstrated by prospective students from that country. The amount is on the order of 3,000 francs for each month to be spent in France. Students receiving scholarship grants must produce a statement indicating the amount and duration of their grant on the letterhead of the granting organization. If the required resources are guaranteed by an individual residing in France the student must produce a signed statement of financial responsibility, a photocopy of the national identity card of the guarantor, and proof of the guarantor's own financial resources (such as the guarantor's three most
recent pay stubs and most recent tax return).

If the resources come from abroad, the student must demonstrate that a bank account has been opened into which the necessary funds will be deposited and produce a promise of payment, translated into French and bearing the authenticated signature of the individual responsible for making the payments, or a statement of payment of funds from the authorities of the student's country of origin.

(www.frenchculture.org/education/france/go/visa.html, 24/10/05)

Spain Letter from the study abroad program assuming full financial responsibility for tuition, room and board for the student during his stay in Spain. For many students this information is included on the previously mentioned letter of acceptance.

Proof of having received financial aid or scholarship covering expenses for tuition, room, board, and personal expenses during the stay in Spain (minimum of $350 per month).

Notarized letter from parents assuming full financial responsibility for the student for at least $500 per month of stay in Spain.

(http://www.spainemb.org/ingles/consulate/Student.htm, 24/10/05)

Discussion and Conclusion

The foregone analysis aims to provide a broad overview of discursive strategies that the policy-maker can and does exploit, whether consciously or sub-consciously, to develop a particular ideology. Now we are going to see how discursive strategies like generalization can be used to create a reality that generates and reinforces the negative stereotyping of the ethnic minority.

‘Generalization refers to the extension of the characteristics or activities of a specific and specifiable group of people to a much more general and open-ended set’ (Teo, 2000). Most significantly, categorizing someone into a particular social schema also tends to colour the perception of the meaning of what that person does. Thus a child taking an eraser from another may be seen as aggressive if he is black but assertive if he is white (Sagar and Schofield, 1980). Similarly, while a European student found providing falsified documents may be perceived as an individual case, a Chinese student may likely be ascribed to a nation’s orientation. That is based on the preconception of much more such cases happening to Chinese students, with disregard to a much larger Chinese student base in Australia, individuality of Chinese students and even prospective change of these students source.

Given the analysis above, the conclusion could be surfaced that the way which the DIMIA policy is stipulated and carried out not only reflects but reinforces the kind of social schemata that overseas students from developing countries are less honest, even then less trustful, need inflicting more restrict policies on themselves. In a naturalized way, these students are gradually distanced from the ‘white’ society, which is just the most symptomatic of racism that this paper is concerned with.

‘A critique of discourse inevitably becomes a political critique of those responsible for the perpetuation of dominance and hence social inequality (Van Dijk, 1993)’. It is hoped that this critical analysis of the official document contribute to the field of CDA and stimulate further research to be undertaken in all areas the harbour ideological persuasion, to make transparent the processes that enter into the construction of social inequality and injustice.

Acknowledgments

I am so indebted to Dr Kate McPherson of the University of Tasmania, Australia, for two most illuminating conversations and English corrections.

References


Althusser, L. 1971 *Idiody and Ideological State Apparatuses: Lenin and Philosophy and...*

Australian Education International (AEI) 2000, Overseas Student Statistics 2000, AEI, Canberra


Australian Vice-Chancellors’ Committee (AVCC) 2005, Provision of Education to International Students, Canberra


DIMIA (Department of Immigration, Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs) 2005, Overview – Australia’s Student Visa Program

DIMIA 2005, Student Visa Processing – Assessment Levels

Poole, M., 19May 2004, ‘Intellectual wealth is invaluable for us all’, The Australian Higher Education Supplement


Teo, Peter 2000, Racism in the news: a Critical Discourse Analysis of news reporting in two Australian newspapers


The language of power or the power of language? Pre-service teachers’ perceptions of the function of grammar in schooling discourse

Megan Short
University of Tasmania

Abstract

What is grammar? Responses to this question are complex and varied. Asking this question of a cohort of pre-service teachers produces a diverse range of responses. Language teaching is historically a contested aspect of teaching practice. Teachers are often called upon to develop teaching approaches based on their own views and experience of language pedagogy. The critical literacy movement has highlighted for teachers and students the inherent notion of power in discourse. Interestingly, the move towards a critical approach is often viewed as subverting or marginalising the teaching of structural aspects of language. The Foucaultian notion that discourse is a violence we do to things provides an intriguing framework for a discussion about grammar.

Introduction

‘What makes power hold good, what makes it accepted is simply the fact that it doesn’t only weigh on us as a force that says no, but that it traverses and produces things, it induces pleasure, forms knowledge, produces discourse’ (Foucault, 1980, p94).

An initial point of departure for this paper analyses the tension between traditionally held conceptions of grammar and the emerging views of pre-service teachers on the role of grammar in teaching and learning. How might an understanding of prescriptive and descriptive grammar enable pre-service teachers to approach language teaching and learning with greater confidence? Of particular interest is their understanding of the role that grammar plays in perceptions of relationships of power in teaching and learning. The quote from Foucault’s seminal text Power/Knowledge was chosen to underscore the complexity of grammar in education – grammar, like power, is both restrictive and creative - grammar is both a gatekeeper to success in language learning and an essential and individual aspect of every native speaker’s communicative competence. Narrow definitions of grammar that emphasise the importance of prescriptivism and ‘getting it right’ can overlook the creative, enjoyable and empowering aspects of grammar that are enabled with a descriptive approach to grammar teaching and learning.

The term ‘grammar’ is so widely used in a pedagogical context that an impression is often given that the term ‘grammar’ is used by many to mean the same thing. It is recognised by linguists and educators alike that grammar is not a singular concept, but a way of explaining, describing, exploring and structuring a range of language events. Grammar is both a system structuring language and a set of rules prescribing language use (de Siva Joyce & Burns, 1999, p3). These distinctions between a ‘system’ and ‘rules’ inform vastly differing approaches to the teaching of grammar and are at the heart of the ‘descriptive’ and ‘prescriptive’ divide. The importance of defining grammar for teachers in particular is paramount as a belief about what grammar ‘is’ will inform how grammar is taught. The present case study, therefore, provides some interesting views on grammar and a brief summary of the data reveals that, for these pre-service teachers, grammar is not a singular concept but a complex and important aspect of language.

The role of grammar in language and literacy education is marked by conflict and contestation. Debates about how and why grammar should be taught are contributed to by parents, teachers, policy makers and social commentators. Reference is often made by teachers to ‘the grammar wars’ when describing a period in the not too distant past in which the teaching of grammar was a politically and ideologically charged activity (Patterson, 1999,
p1). This is not to imply that other areas of the curriculum do not also attract controversy and media attention. However, the protracted and complex nature of the grammar-in-education debate, however, affords grammar a particularly interesting status. Grammar, in a historical context, has often been viewed as necessary in Weaver (1996) suggests a strong historical link between grammar instruction and instruction for the soul. A grammar text written by Dionysios Thrax in the second century BCE, provided the basis for study of grammar in the Middle Ages. Grammar formed part of the triumvirate of all knowledge – grammar, rhetoric and logic (Weaver, 1996, p3). Knowledge of grammar indicated a discipline of mind and the soul, especially as grammar was necessary for engagement with both sacred and secular knowledge. Grammar gave access to knowledge and from knowledge emerged an empowered subject position in terms of access to powerful religious and social discourse. With the advent of the Industrial Revolution in the 1800s, a new middle class emerged that had need of social acceptance. This social acceptance was gained in part through rigorous adherence to language conventions, of which grammar was an essential component (Weaver, 1996, p4). As schooling became an embedded social practice and a major agent of socialisation, grammar was enshrined as a non-negotiable aspect of a sound education. The rise and fall and rise of grammar in the curriculum in English speaking education systems from the 1800's to the 1980’s has been impacted upon by social and political factors that have kept the status of grammar as a subject area in a state of flux. The growth of linguistics as a discipline has also contributed to greater general understanding of not only what grammar ‘is’, ‘means’ and ‘does’ but has also informed cognitive psychology, education and sociology (Hudson and Walmsley, 2005).

Language enables many powerful practices. Among these practices is the power to define, construct, communicate, create meaning, dismiss, support and negate. Teaching, as a social practice, is enabled because language allows us to engage with each other – language is the medium, content, artefact and product of the teaching/learning nexus. Pedagogy is not possible without language. The present discussion considers how grammar is perceived by pre-service teachers as an aspect of language and literacy teaching and how grammar in a sense defines them as teachers as they embark on a career long construction of teacher identity. How might their understanding of grammar define them? What do they need to know about grammar in order to teach it, what does their understanding of grammar indicate about their capacity as language teachers. The teaching of grammar is in some ways a double edged sword for teachers as they must reflect on the difficult decisions that teaching grammar requires educators to make. What underlying philosophy of teaching and learning will they embody in including grammar in their language and literacy program and whose grammar will they teach?

Students who have never undertaken formal studies in linguistics find grammar is a daunting but relevant topic for discussion in class. This has lead us to conduct a small case study with our students (177) undertaking the unit Education 2. We were curious to find out: What beliefs do pre-service teachers have about grammar? What does grammar mean to them? How might their understanding of grammar affect their attitudes towards language and their future teaching?

The case study

The cohort for this exploration was second year Bachelor of Education students undertaking the core education subject, Education 2. There were 177 students in total.

As second year undergraduates, they have had a ‘taste’ of ‘teaching’ in that they have completed two school experience programs, they have developed skills as reflective learners, and they have begun the process of developing their own beliefs about teaching and learning. The students are a diverse group, a proportion of them are changing to a new career from an established one, such as nursing or sales, banking or human services. The range of ages in the cohort creates an interesting dynamic as the students have experienced a range of grammar teaching approaches in their own primary and secondary education – either traditional or whole language or a mix of the two. A proportion of the pre-service teachers are also parents as well, and they bring this perspective to the discussion.

The content of the second semester unit in Education 2 was ‘linguistic awareness’, and the students were exploring this topic from a variety of angles in their lectures and tutorials. They were considering the social, historical, psychological aspects of language acquisition, production and development. They were also being exposed to aspects of grammar in their
lectures that drew attention to the need to know ‘why’ grammar works in our language, particularly from a learner’s point of view.

The students were asked to respond to a series of questions in an online discussion by writing short responses, from 200-500 words. There was no prescribed word limit. They were required to complete a posting for each question as part of their assessment. No grade was given for their posting, it was a hurdle requirement.

They were asked not to ‘read up’ in order to construct an answer, and no reference to publications was required. It was important that they did not frame their thoughts in a formal writing or essay format.

The questions that they were asked related to their thoughts, feelings, beliefs about grammar in a number of contexts – personal, social and school contexts.

The questions raised for the on-line discussion were:

**Personal discourse**
- What does grammar mean to you?
- What do you know or not know about grammar?
- Do very young children (4 or 5 years old) know grammar?
- Do you think that grammar helps you in speaking and writing?

**Social discourse**
- Some educators think that people of different social backgrounds use language differently and also have slightly different grammars even though they speak the same language (i.e. English). It is not right or wrong, just different.
- Others have the opposite view: People of low socio-economic backgrounds often use grammar incorrectly and they need to learn correct grammar so that they can speak correctly.
- What is your view? If possible, please give examples in your reply.

**School discourse**
- Some parents complain that schools do not teach grammar any more. It is important that children should be taught grammar so that they can improve their speaking and writing, particularly for children who speak non-standard English. Others think that teaching grammar to children is not productive.
- What is your view?
- As you can see, the questions referred to grammar in a number of contexts – social, personal, educational, and were asking for opinion, not fact.

**What does this study tell us?**

The responses posted by the students were read closely to separate the themes that were emerging. Answering the research question ‘What do beliefs do pre-service teachers hold about grammar’ allowed us to explore the both the experiences that pre-service teachers have had in grammar teaching, and their aspirations regarding grammar teaching in their future practice.

**Descriptive and prescriptive grammar**

A certain amount of confusion between descriptive and prescriptive grammar was evident. The rules of grammar can be used to describe – explain – how people use language effectively and also to prescribe – tell – how people should use language. Prescriptive grammar involves “…artificial rules in order to impose some arbitrary standard of ‘correctness’” (Aitchison, 1995, p. 14). Descriptive grammar, on the other hand is the approach to grammar that asks the ‘why’ and ‘how’ questions about the role of grammar in language. The questions asked for opinion and belief about grammar as it referred to their own lives and experience, so it was not surprising for many of the responses to contain value
judgements about grammar and language in general. As future teachers these beliefs will in part underpin their attitudes and approaches to language education.

The following examples show the confusion between prescriptive grammar and descriptive grammar.

- Grammar to me is what is perceived by the dominant culture of a society as the acceptable way of speaking and written expression.
- To me the word grammar is rather scary. It signifies all the rules and regulations about how language is put together and all the rules and exceptions to the rules that accompany it.
- Grammar to me is basically anything relating to the structure of language, any language either written or spoken. All languages have their own rules and structures and these are key to the placement of words within a sentence.
- I guess grammar means the way that language is ‘put together’.
- If tomorrow all grammar was to disappear, would we be able to speak at all?
- It’s fascinating to learn how languages are different and how language changes from one generation to the next.

What does grammar do for us?

Many responses highlighted the importance of the communicative function of grammar. They felt that without grammar, communication would not be possible, and that meaning could not be created through language. In this sense, the students were identifying descriptive grammar – the way in which grammar allows language to ‘make sense’.

At the same time, there was a very significant sense that using ‘correct’ grammar was a marker of social class and knowing and using ‘good’ grammar was necessary for the development of employment and educational opportunities. There was a very strong link made between success in life and the usage of ‘correct’ grammar – the term the ‘Queen’s English’ was used quite often. This was also backed up by the belief that individuals were judged by others according to the way in which they spoke and wrote. Therefore, by not teaching ‘correct’ grammar, teachers were remiss in their responsibilities towards their students.

- Children need to understand how language works in order to communicate effectively within today’s society. They need to know the reasons why the English language has certain words that sound the same but are spelt differently and the reasons why we use certain words in particular contexts.
- As teachers, we should know as much about grammar as we can. After all, ‘ignorance is bliss, but knowledge is power.’
- As long as a person can use grammar correctly and identify when something doesn’t make sense, then there is no need for them to have a life-long, in-depth understanding of all the rules of grammar. It’s like many of us know how to drive a car, but have no idea about how the engine works.
- Human nature is to investigate and experiment. In this context, the knowledge of grammar will assist in expressing oneself when entering unexplored territory (i.e. new ideas) in a clear and understanding manner.
- I think that grammar plays a huge role when using it to help you read and speak. It helps your structure, meaning and emphasis.

Stories about grammar in the ‘old days’

Although the students were not asked explicitly to recall their own learning of grammar, many of them referred back to their own schooling to explain what they felt they did and didn’t know about grammar. Learning by ‘osmosis’ was a theme that continually emerged from the on-line discussion, and a sense of ‘missing out’ on being taught grammar perhaps emerged.
• It is not good enough to be told ‘here is the rule’, but there are some exceptions to it. This is what I was taught as a child. This only caused problems for me because the exceptions were just words which had to be memorised and I was not given any deeper understanding than that.

• During this semester, learning about grammar has made me realise how little I know about our English language. I feel like I am hearing all this for the first time.

• The grammar I was taught while attending school seemed extremely middle class in its expectations.

• As a child growing up, grammar to me did not include things such as full stops and commas, my idea was that it was something my mother said to me when I did not express words in the right manner. There was not any link between what I was learning at school and my mother correcting the way in which I spoke.

**Grammatical prejudice**

An interesting question to explore is the notion of grammatical prejudice, and if this is present in the beliefs of the pre-service teachers – do they disregard grammar, do they feel that it is unimportant, is grammar too hard to teach, is grammar a waste of time, does learning grammar stifle creativity?

There is definite evidence of an ambivalence towards grammar – the students feel that grammar makes them feel uneasy, they are unsure about grammar in their own writing, and they are unsure as to their capacity to teach it, especially in light of their own ‘ho hum’ experiences in learning grammar at school.

**‘Grammar and me’**

From their discussion of the topics we can see how the students’ previous experience as learners might inform their future teaching of grammar. The diverse bank of experience of the cohort provides a wide ‘spread’ of experience in historical language teaching trends. Some of the students were familiar with a ‘whole language’ approach, whilst others remember their language education to be more ‘traditional’. In-class discussion also led to a comparative analysis of how they remembered their own grammar learning. In this way, the pre-service teachers were able to situate themselves as teachers and learners in the ‘great grammar debate’, a debate that has been active for decades – some would say centuries. They also gained an understanding that the way they viewed the role of grammar in language education placed them in the debate as active participants.

The data indicates that the pre-service teachers involved in this project viewed grammar as important for a number of reasons. There is an acknowledgement of grammar as an essential component of the way language works, and that without grammar, language would probably not be possible. This recognition of descriptive grammar indicates a level of linguistic awareness that recognises grammar as a component of ‘making meaning’.

However, more strongly than this belief about grammar is the acknowledgement that grammar is prescriptive – ‘correct’ grammar plays a social and cultural in function as a ‘gatekeeper’ for success. However, there was also a recognition that grammar, in tandem with other language forms, is continually changing, and that what was grammatically ‘correct’ a generation ago may not be considered to be important today. The students recognised that this conflict between different types of grammar poses a dilemma for teachers. How can grammar be taught ‘flexibly’ acknowledging the existence of a language variation and change when grammar is commonly concurrently often considered to be prescriptive?

Grammar in this sense is an issue with many sharp edges! The students recall their own experiences of learning, or not learning, grammar at school. Their various life experiences have brought them to a tertiary educational institution and here, as undergraduates, they are asked to write essays, case studies and reports. In writing formally, many of them feel that they are not competent users of grammar, and in reflecting on their own schooling they ask themselves ‘Did I learn this, and if not, why not?’ As future teachers, they accept they play a key role in language education in the early childhood and primary education of their students. The interesting question is therefore; ‘How will these teachers handle grammar in school?’
Conclusion

What world of teaching does grammar belong to? Do the prior experiences of the students define their perception of grammar? If they do not ‘relearn’ grammar and go back again to the domains that grammar contests/defines are they doomed to repeat their pasts and teach grammar as they were taught to? How can we, as teacher educators prepare future teachers to discuss grammar as a valuable aspect of language teaching and learning? This small exploration into the beliefs of pre-service teachers about grammar is a minute indicator of the range of complex issues that arise when discussing grammar in an educational context. One of the constant themes that emerged was the way in which grammar defines those involved in the communicative exchange – in putting grammar under the spotlight we are also highlighting the social and political dimensions of language production and use. Interestingly, although there was significant ambiguity and uncertainty on the part of the teachers when discussing grammar, the importance of grammar was rarely questioned. By providing the teachers of the future with time to ‘learn’ about grammar and tools to include it in their curriculum, perhaps grammar will become less feared and more widely viewed as a creative and valuable aspect of speaking and writing.

References


Boomer, Garth, 1992. ‘Perspectives on teacher training for literacy’. Address to the Special Conference of the Teacher Training Providers on Literacy. ANU, Canberra.


Discourses of War vs. Discourses of Childhood: A
Critical Discourse Analysis of Meaning, Structure and
Identity in Multimodal Narrative Texts

Alyson Simpson
University Of Sydney

Abstract
This paper articulates how CDA can inform our understanding of multimodal texts by examining an illustrated narrative text about war. It tackles claims of inappropriate meaning construction in an award-winning children's picture book text. The story, *My Dog*, has been published as three different illustrated versions (Heffernan, 1997, 2000, 2001). Margaret Hamilton published the 2001 picture book edition, as she believes it is the responsibility of a children's publisher to "publish the best book possible – books that entertain, inspire, extend, and challenge" (personal communication). The third version created problems as it conflates the discursive constructs of: a “universal statement about all wars and human misery” and “the eternal optimism of youth” within the form of a picture book (Heffernan in Simpson, 2004). The fact that the book was listed by the Children's Book Council, as an example of a picture book for older readers (aged 8-12 years), is relevant to this discussion. *My Dog*, was subsequently described variously as “irresponsible”, “outrageous” (teacher's listserve 2001) and “an infringement of childhood” in a “bad time story”(Verghis, 2002). There was a disjunction between what the author conceived to be a suitable introduction for children to contemporary conflict and the general public’s conception of what was an appropriate form. A clash between content and context emerged, for it was the form of the text as a picture book that caused the controversy (Simpson, 2004).

This paper uses CDA to investigate the similarities and differences amongst the three different publications. It closely examines the most recent version of *My Dog*, to suggest that it demonstrates how the author has constrained his own previous writing to form a particular discursive construction of war for a child audience. Using an analysis of the grammatical construction of meaning in image and text (Halliday, 1994; Kress & van Leeuwen, 1996), the three versions of *My Dog* will be shown to be instances of the production of particular discursive positions. The link to CDA is found where the linguistic and visual analyses employs different grammars as “technologies for understanding” (Poynton, 1993) the relationship between language and ideology.

Introduction
This paper discusses the narrative picture book, *My Dog*, to examine a key issue relevant to education, a critical awareness of the relationship between form and function (Gee, 2004). It demonstrates how meaning is created and then, with structural changes using different semiotic modalities, may deliberately be recreated to suit contrasting social identities. I have chosen to analyse this book, as it is an example of the strategic use of discourse (textual form) to communicate a contentious message to a young audience. It is also an interesting example of the interplay of conflicting Discourses; in this case socially constructed beliefs about war and childhood. The discussion represented in this paper recognises that: "Texts are not just effects of linguistic structures and orders of discourse, they are also the effects of other social structures and of social practices" (Fairclough, 2004, p. 227).

The picture book, *My Dog*, became infamous in 2002 when it was awarded a prestigious prize through the Children’s Book Council of Australia. The author, John Heffernan, had
published the same story twice before and neither version attracted major criticism. The first time it appeared in press was as a short story in the children’s magazine published by the NSW Department of Education, The School Magazine, (Heffernan, 1997). The second time was in a children's magazine in the United States, Cricket, (Heffernan, 1997) (Heffernan, 2000). However, due to the CBC award, the new version came to the notice of many librarians and book reviewers and complaints were made that the format and visual design of the book were misleading (Verghis, 2002). In essence, the outcry erupted because Heffernan, McLean and Hamilton broke social expectations: 1. Picture books are for young children; 2. Stories about war should not be presented to young children. So the paper is motivated by the responses given to the third iteration of the narrative to examine the conflict created by particular ideological beliefs about war and childhood. It is written at a time when teachers who recognise the complexity of contemporary multimodal texts realise the pedagogical need for a critical awareness of how meaning is constructed in social contexts (BOS, 1998).

Linguistic and Visual Semiosis

In his discussion of the famous recruiting poster of Kitchener, van Leeuwen refers to the ‘text’ as an example of “a multilayered, multimodal communicative act” (van Leeuwen, p. 7). It makes simultaneous use of writing to address the reader indirectly as well as images that address the viewer directly such that the combined meanings are signified as a coherent whole. I propose that the children’s picture book My Dog operates in the same way. That is, the book makes use of written and visual semiosis in such a way that the impact of the written text is fused with and enhanced by the visual. Martin and Rose refer to this multimodal construction as the “coarticulation of text with image” (Martin & Rose, 2003, p. 5). It will be useful for us as critical readers of this text to analyse the grammatical elements in both the images and the text of the three versions of My Dog to perceive the variety of discursive positions created by the coarticulation of the author and illustrator’s work. It is fascinating to note that in semiotic terms although the third published version of the story is the least confronting, this version was critiqued because of its form in combination with its function.

Each version of My Dog narrates the story of Alija, a young boy living in a small town in Bosnia. In each text the story is set at the time of civil war when people are killed, children are orphaned and friendships destroyed because of ethnic differences. Yet each text is different to the others in either visual and / or linguistic form. In order to enable us to compare the form of all three texts we need some semiotic tools as technologies for understanding (Poynton, 1993). Therefore, close analysis based on available grammars of language and image will be used to assess in what ways the texts differ. A focus has been chosen for the micro level of analysis to record the visual and verbal grammatical strategies that engage the reader in interactive and reflective responses to the text. In summary this means that the reader of the paper will be directed to note the affect of point of view, abstractions and silences to engage or distance the reader from the harsh reality of the content – a child living in a war zone.

Text analysis

The quickest way to highlight some obvious differences that exist between the three texts is to compare how each text deals with the same parallel episodes. This is shown in Table 1 below. The table sets out some of the examples of changed or omitted text found across the editions. Note the similarities between version one and two compared with the major differences compared to version three. A blank cell represents the complete omission of an episode from the text.
Proceedings of the International Conference on Critical Discourse Analysis: Theory into Research, November 2005

Dad said the road through Mostar was closed because they were all killing each other.

They hit an old lady who couldn’t get down fast enough and made her head bleed.

Here we have the latest victim of this wonderful war. I give you the Unknown Hare. He twisted the hare’s neck. “Just another life.”

Then he laughed loudly and strangely. “Yes. Four legs good, two legs bad!” he yelled and laughed as he marched off down the road, shouting the words over and over, with the dead hare over his shoulder.

It’s warmer here at the coast, and there doesn’t seem to be as much killing, although the old man says that won’t last long.

Table 1: three contrasting versions of the text

A finer analysis of the differences amongst the written texts has also been completed. This kind of analysis was based on Systemic Functional Linguistics (Halliday, 1975). Elements of the grammar were used initially to compare 1. Interpersonal relationships created between characters through address terms in Theme position; and then 2. Representations of experience at three levels of abstraction: language constructing interaction, action, and reflection. The rationale for taking this kind of approach before moving to the critical analysis of discourse is that it enables me to compare patterns of wording usage across the texts before I attempt to discuss the social implications of wording choice in general.

Summary tables have been prepared to compare different grammatical patterns used across the three texts. In Table 2 the passages compared for Theme use are from the foreshadowing paragraph in 1997 and 2000 only, and up to the end of the first page of the 2001 book. In Table 3 the examples for evidence of level of linguistic abstraction are taken from across the whole text.

Table 2: representation of interpersonal relationships in Theme

Table 3: three contrasting versions of the text

Table 3: three contrasting versions of the text

Table 3: three contrasting versions of the text
Language as interaction  
*direct address to reader or command to character* on page 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language as interaction</th>
<th>Look at her.</th>
<th>Look at her.</th>
<th>See</th>
<th>See</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Hurry”, “Vite!”, “Get a move on Alija!”</td>
<td>“Hurry”, “Vite!”, “Get a move on Alija!”</td>
<td>“Alija the bread!”</td>
<td>“Alija the bread!”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Alija the bread!”</td>
<td>“Alija the bread!”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Language as action

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language as action</th>
<th>One man twisted her arm until she cried. They were all killing each other.</th>
<th>One man twisted her arm until she cried. They were all killing each other.</th>
<th>And they shot people in the village.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>See</td>
<td>See</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Language as reflection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language as reflection</th>
<th>But the fighting got closer. There doesn’t seem to be as much killing.</th>
<th>But the fighting got closer. There doesn’t seem to be as much killing.</th>
<th>Fear stuck all over them like mud. The fighting would blow away like the winter wind.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>See</td>
<td>See</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: representation of mode as level of abstraction

Image analysis

The second move towards text comparison is to analyse the differences amongst the images. This analysis was based on the grammar of visual design (Kress & van Leeuwen, 1996). I am using this section of the analysis to demonstrate how the visual message works as a complementary semiotic system to the written message. Again, the construction of interpersonal relationships were examined, but this time the images were analysed in terms of how the images attempt to set up “pseudo-social bonds” with the reader (Unsworth, 2001, p. 95). My focus here is to show how the images have been used deliberately in the picture book to position readers to align their sympathy in particular ways with a particular character. For this section, the elements of the grammar selected for analysis were used to compare representations of interactive meaning through contact and social distance. As it was also noted in the verbal grammar that abstraction is a linguistic feature, it was important to assess how representations of reality vs abstraction were managed in the images. Therefore, an additional element of the grammar was selected for analysis, that is, modality.

Summary tables have been prepared to compare different patterns of image creation used across the three texts. In Table 4 the images are compared for patterns of eye contact and social distance to see which text connects the viewer most closely with the main character. In Table 5 the images are compared for levels of realism or abstraction through the grammar of modality.
Close up with other 1 example 2 examples 0 examples
Social: boy only 2 examples 0 examples 6 examples
Social with other 0 examples 1 example 4 examples
Distant: boy only 1 example 1 example 0 examples
Distant to other 4 examples 0 example 14 examples
0 examples 1 example 2 examples
3 examples 3 examples

*Table 4: representation of interactive relationships*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>Realistic painting with high level of background details.</td>
<td>Realistic schematic collages with few background details</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>Medium/low schematic with little detail</td>
<td>Muted colours with pencil lines</td>
<td>Rich pastel with warm watercolour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Two colour pastel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| High colour tone | | | |
| Medium colour tone | | | |
| Low colour tone | | | |

*Table 5: levels of reality/abstraction*

**Discussion**

It is clear from the tables above that the author and illustrator has created three different texts each named My Dog. Two are more similar in their use of textual features though they are not exactly the same. The third is significantly different from the other two. In terms of obvious verbal differences, the third version is like an altered extract of the first two. Major sections of written text have been expunged from the third and are partly reinterpreted in the images. The written introduction that focuses attention on the dog in the first two texts before the story starts instead of on the boy has gone from the third text. Instead the verbal text commences with information about the boy's current context. The foreshadowing paragraph that tells how the soldiers treat women and children roughly has been cut. Details about the setting of the story are elided from the writing, to be shown in pictures. Most importantly for the CDA, direct references to death, violence and madness are strategically left out. The result is a sanitised version where little blood is spilt and action becomes object.

There are also some more subtle changes that can be found in the verbal text of the three versions of My Dog. These were displayed in tables 2-3 above. A summary of the effect of these would be that they direct the reader to experience the war from different perspectives. In the 1997 and 2000 texts, strategies like interaction with the reader through directed speech acts, for example, “Look” and “See” (page one School Magazine and Cricket text) are used to encourage the reader to be an alert observer. Also through the Theme patterns of version one and two the reader is led initially to consider the actions of the dog and others (soldiers, Granny, a sister), more than those of the boy. The result is that the level of engagement directly with the actions of the boy is lower in the older texts than it is in the 2001 text. He is part of the action but not the
main focus. The differences in representation of action vs representation of abstraction are quite marked between the first two texts and the third. My Dog 2001 has much less reported action due to the number of omissions and what action is left is often nominalised into abstraction, for example, they were fighting becomes the fighting. The reader is protected from the dynamic reality that people are being killed as it is represented as a concept.

In terms of the visual differences, the third version is dramatically different to the other two. As with the written text, the major indicators of violence have been left out, shadowed behind curtains, portrayed without emotion or shown way off in the distance. Where the first two texts clearly illustrate death and distress (Cricket especially so using high modality for specific details of weaponry and emotion) and place the child usually under the protection of others, the book most often alludes to positive connotations. Colour is a very important signifying feature of life and warmth in the book. Also, in the book the boy is featured more often in positions of control instead of backgrounds in positions of helplessness. In the 2000 text soldiers directly confront the reader, the dog is illustrated barking angrily and people are shown in close up crying or screaming, none of these images occurs in the book. The one occasion in the book when the boy is illustrated in major distress he is shown as a small figure in a long distance shot. The obvious effect is to separate the viewer from his pain.

There were many subtle differences in the visual strategies used in the book as compared to the other texts. A summary of the effect of these is that they support the verbal representation of the story as being told more directly from the boy’s perspective in the book. The third story starts on the front cover with an introduction to the boy and the dog but as the boy is looking at us directly in a demand and the dog has its eyes closed, we make a personal connection with the boy and not the dog. Once inside the book the reader is positioned often as a participant who watches over the shoulder of the key character ‘as if’ they were there too. The images are constructed with high level of realistic details as if the reader has been taken physically into the world of the text. In the third version of My Dog, the reader potentially becomes a silent character in certain scenes. For example, we stand behind the boy’s shoulder as he meets the dead man in the square. The last image of the boy that we are shown in each text neatly illustrates the difference in perspective that the author/illustrator wishes us as readers to take up.

Critical Discourse analysis

We have seen how one author attempted to bring an important message about war to a child audience in a relatively safe format. Through the use of both verbal and visual grammatical strategies the reader is led to see the world through the eyes of the boy who remains hopeful at all times in My Dog the picture book. The next move in this discussion is to consider how social theory can help us understand the outraged responses to My Dog, the picture book that were reported in the SMH in 2002. Both John Heffernan and Margaret Hamilton are clear that the book addresses themes
concerning human misery and war yet; they also believe that children need to consider such themes within the context of the eternal optimism of youth. They deliberately published the text so that it would be read by young children in order to “inspire”, “challenge”, “extend” and move them. Let us now move then to a consideration of My Dog that examines the connection between discourse and Discourse. In this case discourse is taken to be the language and images selected as appropriate for a child audience and Discourse is taken to be the beliefs, values and attitudes of the society that exist concerning childhood (Gee, 1996).

CDA allows us to examine the published responses in relation to the grammatical meta awareness that we have developed of the textual complexity of this story. Just as with written text where a reader will use their own cultural knowledge to make sense of a text, so will a viewer use their personal background in order to make sense of visual texts. The reader/viewer is an “interactive participant” in the meaning making experience who exists in a social context that is imbued with ideological expectations that regulate potential interpretations (Kress & van Leeuwen, 1996). I use the quote above to frame a discussion of text that considers that all meanings are made are in particular contexts but that some readings of text will be privileged above others due to the ‘power’ or ‘voice’ that the reader/viewer has.

Where are the social boundaries to critical response when a children’s book is read by adults? There is some precedence for this kind of situation arising in children’s picture books, for example, in the case of Where the Wild things Are (Sendak) vs the new York librarians. When that book was published adults said the images of monsters were too scary for children. It has subsequently gone on to become one of the most popular children’s books in publishing history. As the story My Dog in all its iterations has a strong message about the dangers of war, it deals with violence and death, topics even more threatening than imaginary monsters. And as cultural assumptions about picture books do not usually lead us to associate the topic of war so closely with children in a sense it is no surprise that when the book won its award in 2002 there was an outcry. However, as with Sendak’s classic, the anger was uninformed. By putting the two discourses of war and childhood together, Heffernan deliberately created a clash of cultural expectations. Yet, if the book had been examined carefully from a range of semiotic perspectives, the adult readers who critiqued it could have observed that the child character is protected at all times.

The influence of the semiotic patternings in the third text was to make available to the child reader a particular representation of life. It is recognised that, “the flow of meanings in a text naturalize a reading position for that text, a position which speakers and writers design because of the ways in which they want to act on others” (Martin, 2000, p. 290). The reading position created for the intended audience of child readers was to believe that a child could experience adversity and still have hope. Yet, when we consider the reactions to the illustrations, we quickly realise that many adult readers took up a resistant response to the text. They did not accept the way the message was told, reading into the text instead more politically informed and culturally laden meanings from their adult perspectives. A comment on one particular illustration exemplifies this issue, “one scene even suggests a gang rape”. The scene in question shows a truck driving away with Alija running after it.

It is clear that the adult critics represent their ideological positions on the Discourses of war and childhood in what is the naturalised stance: keep children’s books simple and non-threatening. They are not critiquing the book because it deals with war. They are critiquing the book because it deals with war in a book that looks as if it is published for young children. The librarian and the reviewer are outraged that the cover image has set up unrealistic expectations for people who buy books for young children. Their words spell it out clearly: “Benign title, cover blurb and design are misleading to parents”, “the cover of a book which says very clearly: book for little children” (Simpson, 2004). In their eyes, the form has clashed badly with the function.
Conclusion

This paper has addressed the tension between context and situated meaning (Gee, 2004). CDA has shown both how form was strategically used to make a contentious topic more suitable for a young audience and yet why anxieties still remained. The ideological stand that John Heffernan and took in matching the function of discussing ethnic cleansing within the form of a picture book challenged the every day accepted view of the social identity ‘children’. The fact that the text was judged as unacceptable by some adults but is loved by children underlines the risk that authors take when they make discursive choices that resist social practices. In current educational contexts we teach our students how to write texts where form suits both purpose and audience (BOS, 1998). Learning how to match how to say what we want to say in a way that accounts for audience expectations is a basic skill of communication. But teaching students that the impact of their semiotic choices creates different social identities, that is when we lead our students towards critically awareness. Understanding the link between meaning, structure and identity is vital to this educational project.

References


van Leeuwen, T. Ten reasons why linguists should pay attention to visual communication. In (pp. 7-19).

How do You Like Your Sea Stallion: Grazed, Clipped or Buried? ®

Peter Simpson
Okinawa International University

Abstract
The crash of a US Marine Corps Sea Stallion helicopter from the nearby Futenma Air Station into Okinawa International University in August 2004 has given rise to a political and discursive struggle in the media and beyond between US, Japanese and Okinawan governments, and the Okinawan public. This struggle, which highlights key issues relating to the political control, dissemination and manipulation of language, has at its epicentre the determination of the overwhelming majority of the Okinawan population to secure the prompt closure of the Futenma base and its relocation outside the prefecture. Opposing this are the US and Japanese governments, whose linguistic and political energies have been directed towards sapping the strength of local, national and international support for this struggle. This paper outlines the context of the helicopter crash, its coverage in local, national and international media outlets, and attempts by local groups and individuals, including the author, to challenge and change the anodyne or non-existent media coverage of the crash and subsequent protest. It takes as its starting point the context of the US military presence and the circumstances surrounding the crash, and then attempts to investigate the processes involved in the suppression of news about the crash and subsequent protest in the local press. The author then seeks to explain how local groups and individuals responded to the reproduction of this suppression in the national and international media. While stressing the positive contribution of critical discourse analysis to an understanding of such events, the author intends to expose the shortcomings of all forms of enquiry which place insufficient emphasis on the role of context and co-text, and to stress the need for CDA to develop a holistic critique of objects of inquiry which recognises, as Bolinger (1980:11) observed, that “language is the most intensified part, but still only the inner part, of an enveloping scheme of communicative behaviour.” The author concludes by suggesting that, when confronted with injustice, a critical discourse analysis which ignores the need for critical discourse activism may raise awareness of global and local injustices, but is likely to remain supine in overturning them. It is also hoped that the author’s own political and rhetorical strategies and attempts to influence facts on the ground in Okinawa can give rise to an interesting discussion regarding subjectivity and activism in the follow-up discussion.

Theoretical Background
In an earlier critique of CDA (Simpson 1997), I suggested that attempts to deal with linguistic aspects of texts and their covert effects on addressees had overshadowed the need for textual analysis to engage with what Halliday (1985) referred to as the ideational component of discourse: the ‘talked or written about.’

In the context of Fairclough's (1993:50-52) analysis of a local newspaper report headlined 'Quarry load-shedding problem' this had led to a misconception of the various roles of the participants. By talking to residents in Warton, the village at the centre of the report, and making further inquiries, it was possible to establish a litany of circumstances which rendered Fairclough's assertion that the article constituted an attempt 'to disguise the power of quarry owners and their ilk to behave antisocially and with impunity.' (as cited:52) untenable.

My arguments were based on an investigation which revealed a number of facts which were inaccessible from an analysis of the article in isolation from its social context.
Among these were the heritage of the village as a community formed around the quarry, which depended on the industry for its livelihood. Discussion with local people also revealed that, rather than representing the quarry owners, the drivers held responsible for spilling rocks on the streets of the village were in fact self-employed, buying loads from the quarry managers and selling them to outside contractors. In addition Fairclough's analysis could not reveal the tensions created in the village by the influx of middle class commuters, from whom the complaints had - by and large - emanated.

Furthermore, I discovered that far from conniving in these events, the British government had enacted a law to make the practice of sheeting lorries compulsory. In fact, almost everything that emerged from my investigation suggested a more complex set of circumstances than Fairclough's characterisation of the events in terms of class exploitation engineered by 'the powerholders in society' (as cited:50) implied.

Given such inconsistencies, I argued, analysis which failed to address ideational as well as interpersonal aspects of discourse, would do no more than reveal the political proclivities of its authors: in effect that Fairclough's analysis had failed to delve sufficiently into the social realities, rather than, as critics of CDA such as Henry Widdowson (1995, 1996) had suggested, strayed too far off the path of linguistic analysis.

The impact of the crash of a US military "Sea Stallion" helicopter into the main administrative building of Okinawa International University last August from the adjacent Futenma Air Station has done much to reinforce, in my mind, the importance of such ideational considerations.

The misleading, complacent and even cowardly reporting of the incident outlined below, has also convinced me of the need for CDA practitioners to develop forms of critical discourse activism which seek to confront and counter, as well as analyse, media discourse which fails to challenge existing relations of marginalisation and injustice, or to give expression to dissenting voices.

The Okinawan Context

Okinawa, Japan’s southernmost prefecture, consists of 160 islands spanning an area of 1,000 kilometres from east to west and 400 kilometres from north to south. This area covers most of what was, until 1878, the Ryukyu Kingdom, before its forced incorporation into the emerging Japanese state during the Meiji restoration.

For historical and pragmatic reasons predating, but intensely reinforced by the incineration of the central and southern part of the main island and over a third of its civilian population during World War II, a deeply rooted commitment to an ideology of pacifism, and in particular a rejection of the use of weapons as a means of resolving conflict emerged.¹

This heritage was romanticised in early European accounts of Okinawa, most notably that of British naval captain Basil Hall, who recounted his experiences on the island in a conversation with Napoleon on the homeward leg of his 1816 expedition, in the course of which Napoleon was reported to have been enchanted and amazed by Hall’s description of a society without arms which had never experienced war.

While Hall’s description was somewhat idealistic,² the pragmatic and principled commitment to pacifism has a long history in the islands, inspiring resistance, for example, to the initial garrisoning of Japanese troops in Okinawa in the 1870’s on the prescient grounds that "a military garrison … might attract the hostile attention and action of foreign powers with whom Ryukyu [has] no quarrel." (Kerr, 1958:370).

Opposition to war was also a feature of Okinawan resistance to over a quarter of a century of US military colonialism following WWII, which culminated in the partial transfer of sovereignty to Japan in 1972. While this was described as the “Okinawan Reversion,” large swaths of the main island, home to 90% of the prefecture’s population, remain under occupation by US forces. (See appendix).

The economic and cultural effects of Japanese rule, the sixty-year US military presence,
and the reversion, however, have largely succeeded, where the more brutal strategies of pre-and post-war dispossession failed, in the assimilation and reconciliation of many younger Okinawans to US and Japanese hegemony. This has been the result of a centralised Japanese education system which has attracted international notoriety for neglecting to teach school students about Japan’s wartime atrocities, including those committed against Okinawans. It has been accompanied by the marginalisation and displacement of the increasingly moribund Okinawan language Uchinaguchi by Japanese, which has disconnected channels through which Okinawa’s oral history can be communicated between generations. Added to this has been the influence of television, which has promoted a sense of Japanese identity through forms of incorporation into the dominant state culture reliant on what Billig (1995) refers to as ‘banal nationalism’. Overlying this is the cumulative effect of foreign news coverage highlighting threats from China and North Korea, and the potential danger posed by neighbouring countries as a result of territorial disputes.

At the same time, perceived economic dependence on the US military, and cultural contact through employment and intermarriage between Okinawans and US service members, and even the commodification of the US military presence have also contributed to intensifying intergenerational differences in the perception of the US military presence.

“Crashing into Okinawan Reality”

It was in this context that the helicopter crash took place, and in which a political and discursive struggle in the English and Japanese language media and beyond has developed over the significance and implications of the event between US, Japanese and Okinawan governments, and the Okinawan public.

At its centre is the battle between the overwhelming majority of the island’s population to secure the unconditional closure of the Futenma base or its relocation outside the prefecture, and the US and Japanese governments, whose political and linguistic energies have been directed towards promoting the transfer of the functions of the base to a new - though long-envisioned - US military facility, to be built offshore on one of Okinawa’s few remaining healthy coral reef and sea-grass ecosystems in Henoko Bay; home to Japan’s dwindling and endangered population of dugongs (sea manatees), marine mammals protected under both Japanese and US law.

Local and National Media Reaction

In the aftermath of the crash, reporter Jahana Takashi and a camera crew from Ryukyu Asahi Broadcasting (QAB), an affiliate branch of the national Asahi Broadcasting Company were among the first reporters at the crash scene.

Their subsequent footage recorded the sealing-off of the crash site by US military police with yellow tape bearing the ill-judged warning “crime scene, do not enter,” and also documented attempts by US military personnel to prevent filming.

Later in the day, QAB filed over ten-minutes of coverage of the afternoon’s events to the national station, which, on what could safely be described as a slow news day, was stripped down to a two-minute report which appeared as the sixth item of national news, provoking allegations that editorial decisions at the national station reflected a view that events in faraway Okinawa were of little interest to the nation as a whole.

Over the following days the two Okinawan daily newspapers, The Okinawa Times and Ryukyu Shimpo, featured the story and its aftermath on their front pages.

In contrast, English language coverage of the crash, sometimes even in the same newspapers, was strangely muted.

At the time of the crash, a colleague and I were responsible for translating stories for the briefs section of the Shimpo Weekly News, the weekly English news digest published by the Ryukyu Shimpo. On receiving the menu of stories for the week following the crash, I
was dismayed, though not surprised to find that the crash had been relegated to the briefs section, as the editor considered it "unsuitable."

During previous months, a lawsuit had been hovering over the head of the newspaper after another pair of translator-rewriters had failed to distinguish the conviction of a US Marine Corps for attempted molestation, rather than rape: a development which prompted the editor to take the decision avoid reporting military-related stories.

As a result, seven apparently more minor items which had appeared during the same week were given greater prominence. Most prominent was the governor's trip to Bolivia to celebrate 50 years of Okinawan emigration: a story which neglected to mention that many of those who had emigrated left after being evicted from land now occupied by the Futenma base during what became known as the Battle of Isahama (Yoshida, 2001:65). The story also avoided rekindling memories of false promises made about financial and other support which the US government was to provide after the emigrants arrived in South America.11

Also considered more suitable for the page were items about a yet to be confirmed merger of municipal governments in central Okinawa, and an annual village tug of war festival. When challenged about this hierarchy of stories, the editor of the English page claimed that it should not contain political material, but rather focus on cultural items.

I had been involved in translating political stories (at the request of three English page editors) for over four years, and this was the first time I had heard of such a policy. Besides, wasn't a story about the reorganization of local government political? In response, I extended the Okinawa crash story to cover a large portion of the briefs column I was responsible for. The column was subsequently rejected, prompting my resignation.

The same newspaper also refused to print an opinion piece I had written complaining about the use by international news agencies of the US military's verb of choice - graze - which along with "clip" was used to describe the impact of the helicopter against our Administration Building. At the same time, I attempted to dispute the claim, made by the Japan Times, that the university was "virtually empty" at the time of the crash. The piece, I was told, was rejected on the grounds that it was considered "too controversial."

This occurred a week after I’d registered a similar complaint with the Japan Times itself on August 17. This eventually appeared in the newspaper, though not until September 1, allowing the misleading account of the crash to fester in the public consciousness for over two weeks, providing an opportunity for the US military to resume some operations and create the kind of "facts in the air" we remain determined to resist.

In the first weeks of after crash, The Daily Yomiuri, which on August 26 printed my open letter to Colonel Richard Lueking, the base commander at Futenma, was the only major English language media source to promptly go into print with an opinion which went against the view that the crash was of minor importance and should be ignored: a pattern of behaviour reminiscent of US military news management of Okinawa's past scandals.11

As well as fear of libel action, press timidity could also be understood as the result of a more pernicious and ongoing form of intimidation on the part of the US government and its agents.

Shortly after arriving in Okinawa, I worked for a short period for a university on one of the 37 US military facilities here, and was asked by a colleague to write to an American military oriented newspaper in support of a US naval officer facing a court martial for refusing an anti-anthrax vaccination. (Medical research had highlighted safety concerns about the vaccine, and international agreements had established clearly in my mind that compelling military personnel to undergo vaccination against their will was a breach of the Geneva Convention.)

The officer eventually achieved a measure of victory, avoiding a dishonourable discharge and therefore vindicating his stand, though only after spending 60 days in military prison and being forced to accept a demotion for disobeying an order.
I thought little about the case after that until I found an article containing my name written by Stephen Carr (2000), the editor of the newspaper which had published the original letter.

Carr recalled how, after printing the letter, he had received a phone call "from a sinister sounding individual wanting to know the whereabouts of Peter Simpson." He then commented that the speaker identified himself as "an attorney" for "the government."

When asked which government, the caller simply said, in what Carr described as ‘gravelly, menacing tones’, ‘the US one.’

Thankfully, Carr put the caller on indefinite hold and wrote about the incident, rather than divulge my identity. Nevertheless, it would be interesting to discover how widespread such intimidation is.

Framing a Discourse of Resistance: No Fly Zone, FHAN and the Earth Report project

During the fifteen months since the crash, thousands of individuals and organisations have struggled to challenge the anodyne or non-existent coverage of the crash, subsequent protest, and continuation of flights from the Futenma base.

One of the first of these, No Fly Zone, was largely comprised of students and staff from Okinawa International University’s College of Global and Regional Culture.

As well as attempting to counter the discourse (or lack of it) emanating from US and Japanese governments, and compliant and complacent journalists and broadcasters, the challenge was also to mobilise students, whose capacity for protest had been emaciated by a sense of resignation borne of decades of inertia over base protests, and the fact that anti-base activities on campus were irreparably associated with a student representative association, regarded with similar suspicion by students as Japan’s notorious gangsters and religious cults.12

The No Fly Zone response, based on the obvious evidence of the crash and the appalling safety record of the US fleet of ageing Vietnam era helicopters was to separate political from public safety concerns, and to emphasise that the crash could have occurred anywhere in Ginowan City, with much more disastrous consequences.

This concern dominated material selected for the No Fly Zone website, and also motivated the No Fly Zone t-shirt design depicting helicopters flying over familiar landmarks and everyday scenes in the city between the logo “Danger: Time Bombs Overhead.”

Futenma-Henoko Action Network (FHAN), No Fly Zone’s sister organisation, has since sought to challenge the rhetoric of US and Japanese governments which has sought to cast the choice on offer to the Okinawan public as one which involves either living under the constant danger of another helicopter crash or sacrificing the island’s environmental heritage.

In December 2004, FHAN contacted Television Trust for the Environment, a television production company which makes programmes for BBC World and other international broadcasters, and with funds raised through a postcard campaign and donations jointly produced an Earth Report documentary which was broadcast on BBC World in October 2005. FHAN retains the rights to the programme and intends to ensure the documentary reaches the widest possible audience, both in Okinawa and internationally.

Implications for Critical Discourse Analysis

The most potent function of critical discourse analysis lies in its potential to challenge injustice and initiate change. In this respect, the early endeavours of critical discourse analysts in the 1970’s proved groundbreaking in exposing, through a combination of lexical and grammatical analysis, the power relationships realised and regularised
Nevertheless, as Billig (2002) suggests, institutionalised and academic practices associated with critical discourse analysis risk being incorporated into the same power relationships and institutional settings they seek to challenge.

In order to prevent this eventuality, a persistent and determined engagement with the issues and struggles with which we are concerned should form an integral part of ensuring that critical discourse analysts and their allies in struggles against injustice succeed in challenging authority, contesting accepted wisdom and creating alternative realities.

Notes
1. *Karate*, with is only the most well-known expression of this cultural heritage.

2. For a description of this encounter see Kerr (1958:258-9). Kerr’s history also reveals that the initial edict demanding Okinawans to relinquish weapons was issued by Ryukyu King Sho Shin as a means of stifling insurrection. The Kingdom’s subsequent promotion of the policy was also largely a function of the need to manage external relations with militarily dominant neighbours.

3. This was reflected by a presentation to a session of the Japan-Korea student forum, held at Okinawa International University in August 2005, during which one speaker, a student from Okinawa International University, recounted her experiences of high school exchange programmes with US Department of Defense schools on a US military base, an on base home-stay programme organised by the US military, and other visits to US festivals on the base. She prefaced these reminiscences with remarks which seemed to astonish students from outside Okinawa, along the lines that she had grown up with the US military bases and considered them ‘normal’.

4. These included forced suicides supervised by the Japanese military, the summary execution of Okinawans speaking *Uchinaguchi*, on suspicion of spying, and the more general sacrifice of the Okinawan population to protect the Japanese homeland. For details of the atrocities and their expunction from school textbooks see Ota (1981, 1996, 2000) and Taira (1999).

5. Income from US bases currently accounts for less than 5% of Okinawa’s GDP, a figure which has declined by a third since the 1972 reversion to Japanese sovereignty.

6. A phrase first coined by Kelly Dietz (2004) in what remains one of the most informative personal accounts of the crash and its aftermath.

7. The three most recent opinion polls, conducted by local and national newspapers between June 2004 and August 2005 have all indicated that between 80-93% of Okinawans support the unconditional closure of the base, or its relocation outside Okinawa.

8. After the gang rape of a 12 year-old girl by three US servicemen on 4 September 1995, the US and Japanese governments established the Special Action Committee on Okinawa which presented the Henoko scheme as a means of ‘reducing the burden’ on Okinawa by ‘replacing’ the Futenma base with an offshore facility on the Henoko reef. (See SACO final report, 1996). Both of these terms are contested by opponents, who describe the proposed facility as a ‘consolidation’ or ‘upgrading’ of the US Marine Corps presence on the island. They have also drawn attention to plans for an almost identical scheme dating from 1966, and accuse the US military of cynically using the rape to justify the rehabilitation of the costly and environmentally ruinous Henoko scheme. (Makishi 2004).

9. As well as on camera footage of American soldiers physically preventing filming, a number of broadcasters and eyewitnesses have reported attempts by military personnel to confiscate mobile phones and cameras in the hours following the crash.
10. Sports stories dominated the news, particularly the performance of Japanese athletes in the Olympic games, and the resignation of the coach of a national baseball team. According to Jahana (personal communication 3 November 2005), even this cursory attention to the story was greater than that of rival broadcasters NHK, Fuji Television and Tokyo Broadcasting Corporation.

11. For a detailed account of emigration to Bolivia see Amemiya (1999).

12. This tactic was especially noted by Chalmers Johnson (2004) in his account of the attempts of senior US officers and Department of Defence officials to trivialise the gang rape of a 12 year-old Okinawan schoolgirl by three US servicemen in 1995.

13. Student Union protests in the days after the crash typically mobilized a grand total of five of the university’s 5,000 student body, none of whom were Okinawan.

14. Details of FHAN activities, and a script of the Earth Report programme are available at www.fhan.org

References


Appendix – US Bases in Okinawa

- Following the defeat of Japan’s suicidal defence of Okinawa in 1945, the US vision of an island of American bases envisaged by 19th century militarist Admiral Perry became a reality. As a result, during the 1940’s and 1950’s thousands of Okinawans were driven from their land to make way for the bases, and left destitute or forced to emigrate to South America.

- After years of protest, the “reverted” Okinawa prefecture, while covering less than 1% of Japan’s surface area (2,267 km²), of which 49.1% is classed as habitable (i.e. not mountainous), is still obliged to host 74% of its US military bases.

- US bases cover about 20% of the total land area of the main island, and occupy a much larger percentage of its habitable land.

- Some of the most densely populated municipalities bear the brunt of the US military’s footprint. Futenma Air Station, located in the centre of Ginowan City occupies 25% of the choicest land in the municipality, (an area substantially bigger than New York’s Central Park), while the much larger Kadena Air Base, the biggest USAF facility in Asia, swallows 84% of the town of Kadena.

- 61% of the 45,000 US troops in Japan are stationed in Okinawa.

- Base facilities include wide uncongested boulevards (in contrast to the choked streets outside the perimeter fences), created to provide a “home from home” for US military personnel and their dependants. These Stateside-style roads are punctuated with shopping malls, fast food restaurants, movie theatres and fitness centres.

- The 37 separate US military installations on the island include arms dumps, listening posts, bombing ranges, golf courses, leisure resorts and private beaches reserved for the use of US troops and their families, all surrounded by barbed-wire tipped fences and protected by guards.

- Levels of aircraft noise far in excess of those permitted elsewhere in Japan, and the fear of accidents have continuously blighted the lives of Okinawans since the US occupation began almost 60 years ago. The most tragic incident occurred in 1959, when a US army jet crashed into a primary school, killing 17 people (including 11 children) and injuring 121.

(From Simpson, 2004)
Rebuilding New Zealand’s National Identity: a Critical Discourse Analysis of the Role of the Charismatic Documentary Presenter

Philippa K Smith
Auckland University of Technology

Abstract

Broadcast documentary in New Zealand has a history of focusing on nation building which derives from British film producer and writer John Grierson’s belief in the 1930s that documentary should be functional, instrumental and have “an optimistic exposition of faith in the ability of the nation to surmount its problems” (Goldson, 2004). This paper examines the role of a charismatic documentary presenter Gary McCormick who fronted a popular television series in New Zealand during the 1990s called Heartland. In a format, structure and style reflecting a Griersonian tone, this programme sought to address insecurities about New Zealand’s national identity in response to social, cultural and political changes the country was undergoing between 1960 and 1999 in the form of “decolonisation”. On the one hand there was a breaking of the apron strings with ‘Mother England’ which entered the European Common Market and left New Zealand to become more independent economically, socially and culturally, and on the other hand a resurgence among Maori (indigenous New Zealanders whose presence became more obvious as they moved from rural locations to the cities) and an influence of new immigrants were also to have an impact upon the country leaving New Zealanders wondering who they were and what was their culture.

McCormick’s personality, charisma and charm along with his presupposed image as a poet, comedian and entertainer are used in Heartland to effectively persuade viewers to more readily accept the programmes’ positive perception of the country’s national identity undergoing change. Fairclough’s three dimensional model for critical discourse analysis is used to analyse McCormick’s role through the relationship between the text (including language, image and sound), discourse practice as in the processes of text production and consumption, and finally socio-cultural practice which takes a wider look at society and culture and how it effects the communicative event (that is, Heartland), as well as the way the discourses of the programme influence social, cultural and political reality.

New Zealand - an insecure nation

The nation-building tendencies of New Zealand documentary date back to the influences of British filmmaker John Grierson when he visited New Zealand and Australia in the late 1930s. Finding New Zealand film had an over emphasis on tourist aspects of the country, Grierson’s influence led to a focus on maintaining the spirit of the Empire (pre-war) and a post-war spirit of nation-building (Goldson, 2003). While New Zealand’s representation of nationhood has continued to evolve, moving beyond the Empire, the theme of national identity remains today as a constant and popular thread in locally-produced mainstream documentary, though somewhat more reflexive in style.

Heartland was a television documentary series in the 1990s through which its producers Bruce Morrison and William Grieve aimed to show that a unique New Zealand culture existed that united the nation.

“It is our contention that it helps for a resident of Huntly or Whangarei to be able to see the life and concerns of the people of Haast, Fendalton, or Bluff. To see the gulf of customs which separates him from them, but to also realise that there are shared attitudes, references and certainties, the mixture of intangibles that let you know your
culture, and your part in it.”

(Morrison and Grieve in McCormick, 1994, 7)

The programme, first broadcast in 1993, was produced at a time when a national identity crisis was becoming evident. The late 1980s and early 1990s is a period identified when insecurities were surfacing within the New Zealand population about who they were and what made them a nation (Belich, 2001). The period of ‘decolonisation’ was the third in a series of processes which historian James Belich believes affected the nation’s identity. New Zealand had already undergone ‘colonisation’ by the British by the early 1880s, but the country “reshuffled and tightened links with Britain between the 1880s and 1900s” (mainly for reasons of trade and economy) in a process of ‘recolonisation’. The country’s identity became ‘dominionist’ — “… a New Zealand identity fitting neatly within a British one” and Maori lived under Pakeha (a New Zealander of European descent) control (Belich, 2001: 29-30). However a third process of ‘decolonisation’, emerging in the late 1960s and early 1970s, resulted from several changes. This included Britain’s move away from supporting New Zealand trade by joining the European Economic Community, a rise in Maori nationalism whereby identifying themselves as the first settlers to live in New Zealand Maori looked to rectify the injustices that befell them as a result of British colonisation, and a modern-day immigration policy which encouraged a greater diversity of immigrants, particularly Asian. This affected the country economically, socially, politically and culturally, but also challenged how the population defined itself as a nation (Belich, 2001: 425).

New Zealand’s sense of place had been fractured by the impact of immigration and the resurgence of Maori identities and histories according to Pawson (1996: 349) who suggests that as a consequence, a multiple of identities surfaced within the country as well as ambiguities associated with New Zealand’s place in the world. Throughout its history this country has moved through a series of labels of being a European country, a Pacific nation and more recently an Asian nation. Belich too relates the confusion amongst white New Zealanders in understanding their identity (2001: 549). This instability which spilled over from decolonisation into the 1990s left a void for New Zealanders seeking to establish who they really were. Programmes such as the television series Heartland provided a convenient and entertaining resource for establishing an answer to ‘what is our national identity?’, seeking to show that diversity within a population can lead to unity.

Broadcast by Television New Zealand Heartland’s popularity was considered one of the success stories of locally produced television and rated regularly in the top five programmes for the week, attracting between 550,000 and 650,000 viewers (Cunliffe, 1994). It developed into a 24-part series winning a bronze medal at the 1994 Film and Television Awards in New York as well as the best factual series award at the 1994 New Zealand Film and Television Awards. Its popularity resulted in the production of a further series which screened in 1995, and a video compiling highlights from the series titled Journeys in the New Zealand Heartland (Anson Grieve, 1995). The main focus of the Heartland series was the contact with ordinary ‘typical’ New Zealanders whose stories brought to life an easily ‘imagined’ community. It focused on what it saw as the ‘real’ heart of New Zealand, namely the rural and provincial spaces (Longhurst and Wilson, 2002). The programme’s tone is “determinedly celebratory” and provides “something of a showcase for a way of life that has achieved mythical status in New Zealand” (Bell, 1996: 141).

This paper suggests that the role of the charismatic presenter Gary McCormick had a significant influence in the promotion of New Zealand’s national identity in Heartland. Drawing on Fairclough’s (1995) three-dimensional model of critical discourse analysis (CDA) which focuses on textual analysis, discursive practice and socio-cultural practice, the relationship between McCormick’s role and the social and cultural processes and structures at work are evaluated. The objective is to firstly examine how McCormick seeks to persuade the audience to a particular way of thinking, and secondly to gain a wider picture of the social and political contexts against which the programme as a communicative event is set.
The Real McCormick

To New Zealanders in the 1990s, Gary McCormick was already a known identity because of his celebrity status originating through his wit and humour in his standing as a writer, travelling poet and comedian in the 1970s, through to his later career in the 1980s and 1990s on the television as a host/presenter of documentaries and a travel programme, a debater, talk and game show host, and featuring in humorous television commercials for the hardware chain store Mitre 10. McCormick had a specific ‘Kiwi-bloke’ persona consistent across his television roles (Longhurst and Wilson, 2002) which promoted him as a seemingly hard working, down-to-earth macho male, with a few rough edges, a heart of gold, a sense of humour and a love for the New Zealand way of life.

Heartland’s narrative followed its presenter McCormick as he travelled the length and breadth of New Zealand, visiting a particular city or region in each episode, interviewing the ‘locals’ along the way, and marvelling at the magnificent scenery. In a light hearted manner McCormick would explore the past, the present and sometimes contemplate the future of a region. In Heartland McCormick treats all people equally regardless of their social status or ethnicity. His informal interview style, along with a structured and coherent narrative, allowed McCormick to be instrumental in drawing together the various social actors in Heartland in a collective identity as New Zealanders.

Textual deconstruction – what makes McCormick work?

The positioning of McCormick in Heartland is most significant in response to encouraging a sense of national unity through the programme series. Rather than using a voice-of-god or public authoritative figure narration supporting a rhetorical ‘voice’ structure which was used in many of the ‘quality’ television series in the early 1980s and 1990s (Goldson 2004), McCormick’s presupposed image is used so that he becomes part of the Heartland story. While he often maintains a tone of authority to convey factual information, he easily switches to becoming part of the story in an entertaining and convincing way. For example, on visiting Haast on the West Coast of the South Island during the world famous white baiting season, he relates in voice-over historical information about the tradition for New Zealanders to gather at the mouth of the river, armed with large nets and buckets to catch the swarming masses of whitebait fish. He then appears on-camera and chats with people about what they are doing, enjoys the taste of home cooked whitebait fritters, and at the end of the day having gained full acceptance from the community joins in the dancing and merrymaking at the infamous Whitebaiters’ Ball held at a local hall.

McCormick’s use of multiple identities of being a friend, a critic, an observer, a participant, an educator, a storyteller, a guide, an enquiring visitor, a comedian and a philosophiser, contributes to the development of a special relationship with the audience where they are made to feel included in his journey around New Zealand. Scannell (2000: 5) suggests that broadcast programmes and daily newspapers have developed a peculiar communicative structure whereby they seem to speak to ‘listeners, viewers or readers personally, as individuals’ which he terms a ‘for-anyone-as-someone’ structure. Although the viewer experiences being addressed as an individual, he or she is also aware that they are only one of countless others experiencing the same. This creates a feeling of ‘we-ness’ or collective identity which is similar to Anderson’s theory of ‘imagined political communities’ whereby people are incapable of knowing everyone and therefore must “think the nation” (1991:22). ‘For-anyone-as-someone’ structures “create the possibilities of, and in practice express, a public, shared and sociable world-in-common between human beings” (Scannell 2000: 12). This experience is mostly conveyed by the mode of address used and, in the case of television, how it constructs its look and how its speakers are presented to viewers. McCormick’s acknowledgement to the audience by directly addressing the camera, his ‘acting up’ and making confidential asides to viewers, reinforces a feeling of inclusion. He often acts as a go-between the viewer and the social actors seeking to unify people who live in the same country. For example, when attending the annual horse races in a local field in the South
Island township of Glenorchy (a parody of England’s Ascot) McCormick purchases a cowboy hat to blend in more authentically with the rest of the men in that setting. He confides in a direct address to the audience:

GM: “Well looks like the weather is going to clear for us and I’ve got a new hat. In fact it’s a tad too new, looking at some of these blokes… they’re pretty tough looking. Give it a bit of a working over …” (He screws up his hat, throws it on the ground and stamps on it to make it look older and rougher, then puts it back on.) “There we are… and the first race is about to get underway!”

Kozloff highlights the charm, credibility and humanness of on-camera hosts in ‘personalising the impersonal’ who tell us ‘what we are seeing or what to think about what we are seeing, providing the commentary or exposition we are accustomed to from narrators in novels’ (1992: 79). McCormick’s charm is mostly evident in the style of language he uses. He has an informal conversational interview style, is polite and respectful and uses open questioning to get the social actors to disclose information about their lives. For example, often he will ask ‘What is happening here?’, ‘What’s going on at the moment?’ or ‘What's this ritual here?’.

In balancing the serious side of the programmes with an entertainment aspect, the programme makers selected suitable social actors for McCormick to interview. They ranged from eccentric senior citizens, unconventional but likable farm workers and mountain men, to intimidating tattooed Rastafarian gang members, Department of Conservation workers and a friendly local policeman. McCormick is the messenger promoting a national identity that brings New Zealanders together in their mutual recognition of him and in their belief in what they are watching confirms a shared culture. Although there is hybridity in the New Zealand population, Bell (1996) says a strong awareness still exists of being distinctive as ‘New Zealanders’, of wishing to belong to this country because we do not belong anywhere else and that, through a process of self-validation, both the national and personal identities are protected. McCormick achieves this for the audience. He aims to be seen as an ordinary person sharing the same culture and environment of the audience, but his position as narrator/presenter and his pre-supposed popularity allows him the credibility and authority to persuade and lead the audience to particular understandings. McCormick is a character, constructed over the years through his work and many appearances on television and radio. This in addition to his personal involvement in activities on Heartland and his apparent genuineness in caring about and being interested in other New Zealanders, has allowed the audience to develop a fondness and trust in him.

McCormick uses his personality to express a more personal humour and further develop his familiarity with the audience which paves the way for times when he wishes to be more of a critic and persuade viewers to adopt a certain viewpoint. The following example is from an episode based on the East Coast of New Zealand, which at the time, had a worrisome reputation for unemployment and racial conflict. While driving in his car McCormick speaks directly to the camera:

GM: “Well I’m halfway through my trip up the coast – in fact I’m just entering Tokomaru Bay and I’m starting to wonder whether the myth of the East Coast as a sort of depressed area is exactly that – a myth. I’m wondering whether if I’ve been sold a line for example in Gisborne where I come from, the expression “up the Coast” is sort of synonymous with backwards or in decline… In point of fact people seem to be remarkably cheerful about their predicament. I’m starting to wonder whether or not the judgements made about the Coast aren’t sort of European ones.”

The programme goes on to suggest that a greater understanding of the problems of the East Coast is needed and in a more philosophical context after interviewing a range of contrasting characters, McCormick promotes the idea that New Zealanders are capable of working together to sort out their problems:

GM: “I’ve always tended to think of the East Coast as being the last frontier but that may be because I live in Gisborne and have a romantic notion about these things. None-the-less it will be the first in the world to see the New Year light in the year 2000 to welcome in the new millennium which is appropriate in a sense because it’s also the area in the country which is dealing with one of the great issues surfacing in New Zealand today.
The relationship between Maori and Pakeha and for that matter between Maori and Maori. But it is an area which contains amongst the people a sense of warmth or hospitality and an overwhelming sense of spirituality and for these reasons it will be resolved."

In McCormick’s final four words in the above example – ‘it will be resolved’, the definitive use of the word ‘will’ in relation to the community coming to terms and resolving racial issues is authoritative. He intimates a sense of national pride and confidence in New Zealanders’ ability to get along. His confident attitude with the suggestion that the approach of the sunlight as the new millennium dawns, signifies a turning point in the relationship between the different groups of people who live in the area. The warmth, hospitality and spirituality of the local people are identified as providing the foundation for change and leaves McCormick and the audience with little doubt as to a positive outcome in the future for the people of the East Coast.

Persuasion is defined as ‘the co-production of meaning that results when an individual or a group of individuals uses language strategies and/or visual images to make audiences identify with that individual or group’ (Borchers, 2002: 444). McCormick’s style as described above contributes largely to his ability to persuade the audience to see the evolution of a positive national identity. But there are also other creative processes at work in the programmes’ construction that have aided this.

**Discursive Practice - creative processes at work**

The creative processes and how they are interpreted are part of the discursive practice – the second layer in Fairclough’s three-dimensional model some of which have overlapped in the textual analysis. In the case of television - visual images, sound and sound effects - should be considered part of the text and deserve mention (Fairclough 1995). Visual images and sound serve to reinforce McCormick’s role as a persuasive presenter because his dialogue and presentation are entwined in the promotion of a positive national identity and reinforced through the programme makers’ decision to emphasise images of the beautiful New Zealand scenery. The country’s clean, green image is elevated both literally and figuratively through the use of aerial photography and upbeat music, rather akin to the discourse of a promotional travel video. Whether it is the wild beaches of the East Coast, the rivers and mountains in Glenorchy or the peaceful Avon River running through Fendalton, the diversity and beauty of the country provide the perfect backdrop for McCormick’s journey around New Zealand to instil a national pride in the landscape. Background music has been carefully selected to tie in with the mood of the programmes - modern Maori songs to emphasise the strength and confidence of the rise in Maori nationalism being exerted on the East Coast, exciting instrumental travel log music coinciding with aerial shots following jet boats racing up the Dart River near Glenorchy – a boost for adventure tourism, and in contrast the sound of the church choir used in the Fendalton, Christchurch episode emphasises that community’s upper class socio-economic status and English traditionalism.

**Socio-cultural practice - who’s pulling McCormick’s strings?**

Socio-cultural practice is the third layer of CDA and examines the features that have shaped the *Heartland* episodes and the way it has been presented. These influences have been identified as being social, cultural, economic and political, brought about through insecurities involving changing diversity within the population, the rise in Maori nationalism, a move away from economic dependency on the United Kingdom. But at the same time the discourses within the text of *Heartland* itself serve to shape society. CDA requires an examination of socio-cultural practice to look for a deeper understanding of the texts to show the multiplicity of levels in what it was attempting to do and say. Fairclough (1995) points to the element of the media artists entertaining the viewer as consumer and it is important to realise the underlying motives at work in the construction of a programme which is produced in a commercial environment, where ratings play a major role in whether a programme continues to receive funding.
McCormick’s role as the narrator/presenter has been to not only provide factual information about New Zealand in an entertaining way, but to use his personality and charisma to persuade and reassure the audience that there are many aspects to New Zealand’s changing national identity which can be dealt with positively. Charismatic self-presentation with its elaborated qualities of informal speech modes, expressive manners, and extensive conversationalization is central to today’s broadcasting whether entertainment, popular fiction or journalism (Ytreberg, 2002). However McCormick cannot necessarily be seen to be solely responsible for his own presentation and the question needs to be asked, what other influences were involved in having him present the programme in the way he did?

Heartland was produced at a time when insecurities about national identity within New Zealand existed and both New Zealanders and the Government desired a greater sense of unity in the interests of stability. Broadcasting too had also undergone change which affected the way television documentaries were made. Debrett (2004) details the relevant history behind New Zealand’s broadcasting industry citing the Government’s introduction in 1989 of the Broadcasting Commission (later renamed New Zealand on Air/NZOA) which was “to administer a minimalist system of public subsidy for specific genres of local content under a competitive grants scheme” and ensure “the provision of programmes reflecting New Zealand identity in prime time” (Debrett, 2004: 6). Bell (1993, 1995) refers to it as political manipulation, but none-the-less it resulted in “criteria for programme funding which meant that applicants had to meet both the national/cultural requirements of NZOA and the presale, prime-time requirements of a commercial broadcaster, either (the state owned) Television New Zealand or its foreign owned competitor, TV3” (Debrett, 2004: 6). Therefore the pressure to gain funding for the production of programmes was dependent on developing an idea which would be approved by NZOA, but which would also attract a prime time audience to fuel advertising funds for the broadcasters. McCormick was instrumental in persuading the viewer to think a certain way through use of his charismatic personality as presenter of the programme. He was socially-shaping the audience, but equally he was at the end of a chain of influences trickling down from the Government, through NZOA, to TVNZ and to the programme makers. Equally the support of the audience cannot be underestimated. Horrocks (2004: 277) highlights Heartland as one of New Zealand’s local programmes that “clicked” with the audience because of its “special sense of relevance and loyalty”. In essence this suggests that influences were at work from many sources in socially shaping Heartland and McCormick’s persona.

Conclusion

Nation building as a theme throughout New Zealand documentary might seem curious. But with New Zealand’s history of change suggested through Belich’s ‘colonialisation, recolonisation and decolonisation’ paradigm it is not surprising that the population continues to seek out who they are as a nation. Goldson (2004) points out that the documentary genre (originally through film) was introduced in New Zealand to deliberately represent the nation as dictated by Grierson. Such a theme has not abated and even the TVNZ Charter introduced in 2003 sets out the need for programmes to “provide shared experiences that contribute to a sense of citizenship and national identity” (TVNZ, 2003).

Using a high profile, personality-driven presenter (such as McCormick) seeking out New Zealanders around the country was a successful strategy that has been adopted by other local documentary makers. Debrett (2004) relates that in 1998 there were 10 documentaries fronted by well-known personalities, seven of whom were comedians driving around New Zealand chatting to the camera and to local characters, using witty repartee, entertaining through their own styles of humour and subsequently trivialising the subject matter. This trend has continued since and even in 2005 a further extension of the ‘celebrity-presented-national-identity-documentary’ was seen in the eight episodes of the programme Billy Connolly’s World Tour of New Zealand screened by TVNZ which interestingly used a Scottish comedian – though admittedly also well known and popular with the New Zealand audience.
Television enables individuals to ‘imagine’ their community from the comfort of their living room and this paper has suggested that the power of a programme’s presenter can greatly influence the way a nation might see itself. McCormick sought to entertain, inform, guide and educate the audience as the humorous, witty ‘McCormick’ New Zealanders were familiar with. But the key to his popularity was that he represented the ordinary ‘Kiwi’ genuinely seeking out other ordinary New Zealanders. McCormick personified the Heartland series and his image was sustained and reinforced by the length that the series ran and by the interest in the programme and the publicity it often attracted. As a charismatic presenter he directed the New Zealand audience in the mid-1990s to regain a sense of belonging to the nation – a sense which, at the time, was very much sought after.

References


(1) 5-24.

www.tvnz.co.nz/view/page/506420/111535/

Making Nursing Education Culturally Competent: Moving Beyond the Deficit Model®

Juliet Sondermeyer
University of Tasmania

Kerry van den Berg
University of Tasmania

Jen Brown
University of Tasmania

Abstract
A need was identified by academic staff at the School of Nursing (SNM) at the University of Tasmania for increased levels of support for Students from Culturally and Linguistically diverse (CALD) backgrounds, including international students and domestic students whose first language was not English. A programme was developed using funding from the EDGE initiative to improve the academic experiences of students from culturally diverse backgrounds.

Following a review of the literature and needs analysis from 20 CALD students it was decided that students might benefit from support to enable them to function within the culture of the Bachelor of Nursing. Specifically the areas of support focussed on were: Academic and Institutional understanding: Functioning in the University community and understanding academic culture, and Communication in the Clinical health setting: Enabling students to move into practice settings with competent and confident language skills.

This paper describes the development of the “CALD Programme” and its outcomes for students and staff. It also discusses the direction in which we are now moving; which is to take the insights gained from the CALD project into mainstream units within the Bachelor of Nursing (BN). It is envisaged that this will further develop the ‘cultural intelligence’ of all students undertaking the BN by integration of the key tenets of ‘embracing diversity’ which is explicit in with university's internationalisation agenda.

Background
In 2005 The School of Nursing and Midwifery at the University of Tasmania developed a new program in an effort to assist students from ‘Culturally and Linguistically Diverse’ (CALD) backgrounds and prepare them for work in the health care sector. Its aims were to support undergraduate international and domestic nursing students both academically and in health care settings. It was acknowledged as a need because of the increasing number of international students and domestic students, such as African migrants, for whom English is a second language (ESL) it was felt that staff and students required more of an infrastructure to facilitate students’ acquisition of academic discourse The issues of inequity of access to English and academic support was raised at School meetings and resulted in consultation with English Language Support for International Students (ELYSIS).

It became apparent that University structures provide support to full fee paying international students but not to ESL migrant students who were defined as ‘domestic students’. Staff articulated their concerns about the lack of engagement and understanding demonstrated in both university teaching settings and clinical practice by many of the migrant and international students. In the undergraduate Bachelor of Nursing programme there are students from Sudan, Ethiopia, Sierra Leone, Ghana, China, South Korea, Japan and Fiji. Another
significant insight that emerged from discussion was that these students, all from very
different cultural backgrounds, had very different perceptions and expectations of what it
means to ‘be ill’ and what it means to be a nurse.

In developing the CALD programme the teaching team had two broad aims in mind: to
support the academic capability of CALD students and to develop their communicative
competence and confidence in clinical practice. The programme was run weekly and included
such activities as:

- Listening, reading, writing, critical analysis, referencing
- Practicing spoken English and pronunciation including nursing terminology
- Debriefing form practice in health settings
- Role plays exploring communication skills required in health settings including
  appropriate body language, eye contact etc.
- Showing video vignettes that depict clinical settings and communicating with patients,
  nursing and medical personnel.

**Language Teaching and Discourse Analysis in Nursing**

Nursing is a discipline which is informed by a variety of discourses from linguistics, sociology,
psychology and anthropology from which to theorize and politicize its professional practices.
As a linguistic tool discourse analysis provides a useful framework for nurses and teachers to
understand how academic and professional discourses are structured, both written and
spoken - for example how talk follows regular patterns in a wide range of different situations,
how intonation operates in communication and how discourse "norms" in language differ from
culture to culture. (McCarthy, 1991:1).

In Tasmania, migrant students are not required to have reached a specific standard of
competence in the four macro-skills of English (listening, speaking, reading and writing), a
condition of admission for international students to a degree course in Australia. This was the
cause of some confusion amongst academic staff, who previously had assumed they had also
been tested. After much discussion at school meetings it became clear that the migrant
students required as much if not more support than the international students who had a
proven level of English competence.

Many CALD students encounter unexpected difficulty in speaking and understanding English
as it is spoken in Australia. For example, though they may speak fluent English, it is usually
heavily accented; intonation patterns tend to be closer to those of their native language(s) and
words are often incorrectly pronounced when compared with standard English. In addition
students find it difficult to understand the slang and non-standard pronunciation of some
socio-economic groups in Tasmania and to interpret and respond to the Australian vernacular
English spoken by these groups.

**Learning Support at UTAS**

Other learning skills support programmes within the university, such as ‘Unistart’, are
available to CALD students, and many of them had previously participated in these. Although
it was found by students to be useful in many ways, anecdotal evidence strongly suggested
that they wanted to develop skills in the discourses of nursing, within the discipline, rather
than attempting to acquire generic skills out of context. We decided that the task of the ELSIS
co-ordinator within the CALD project would be to support acquisition of academic skills.

In order to capture anecdotal evidence of student needs more formally, focus groups with
CALD students and academic staff were conducted prior to developing the content of the
programme. We verified that support needed to be geared around the discourses of nursing:
both in the understandings of the academic aspects such as reading, analysing and writing,
texts and also, the culture of nursing practice, where students struggled with appropriate
social and clinical communication. Many students were finding it difficult to cope with critical reading and assignment writing and, in addition, they were bewildered by their lack of familiarity with the embedded cultural assumptions and knowledge. For example, how to talk to patients and how to communicate successfully with patients' relatives, medical practitioners and other busy hospital staff.

Many migrant students require flexible support because of their life circumstances. Refugee students experience particular problems related to the trauma of the circumstances of leaving their home countries. Many had previously been nurses, (many in refugee camps) but with little formal education and had often learned English in the refugee camps from non native speakers of English. Women, particularly, had little formal schooling and had been dependent on husbands for support. In many cases, husbands had been killed in wars at home and the women were now raising children alone. They were not able to drive, and often had to rely on the help of volunteers for transport. These factors made it very difficult for them to access university services and to develop academic skills independently.

**Misconceptions about CALD students**

Academics sometimes assume that, when students begin University, they will have the ability to source information and read it critically, answer complex written questions and write in a variety of genres. However this is often not the case, with domestic students, but particularly when students are from NESB. Misinformed stereotypes and assumptions made by staff and domestic students can contribute to the difficulties faced by CALD students (Biggs, 2004). For example, it is not commonly recognised that there is often a significant difference between a CALD students' ability to speak English fluently and read and write it well (Harmer, 1991).

This can lead to an assumption that a student who can speak English fluently must be lazy if their standard of written text production is inferior to their listening and speaking ability. In addition, according to Watkins and Biggs (1996), these assumptions may in themselves be a form of cultural imperialism that assumes western ways of acquiring knowledge are superior to others, for example, the Confucian Heritage Cultures.

**Academic Culture Shock: reading and writing**

Often the culture shock of so many unfamiliar discourses can be overwhelming for students. For example, in about week 5 of their first semester, CALD students often approach the ELSIS tutor in some distress, saying that they have "no idea" how to read any of the material on the reading list. They can't identify key information and have difficulty following lectures due to the speed of delivery and the strange Australian accent. In addition, academic teaching staff may be unaware of these difficulties because of cultural taboos that prevent students approaching lecturers for fear of appearing 'stupid' and an unwillingness to draw attention to oneself in tutorials.

Academic reading is often a minefield for CALD students, as reading requires interpretation and the ability to select relevant information. When CALD students go and see the ELSIS tutor it is often with an essay question (usually from a Sociology unit within the BN) about the 'biomedical model of health and illness', which they are asked to compare with the 'sociological approach'. Students have lecture notes on the topic and have attended tutorials. However they do not really understand how to interpret the question, and are unsure of how to structure their answer. They need to understand how to analyze a question. This involves defining terms such as "biomedical model" and "sociological approach" and connecting their understandings of these terms to examples in the journal articles and text books they are required to use as sources of information.

Students were equally challenged by academic writing. Referencing, in particular, was poorly understood and students would ask "Why was it not okay to just copy out the author's work when it is written so much better than I can write?" Many CALD students seemed unfamiliar with summarizing and paraphrasing and were puzzled by the additional need to reference such writing. In addition, it was difficult for them to understand the difference between surnames and first names in English. For example a student might write (Mary1990) or (John,
Proceedings of the International Conference on Critical Discourse Analysis: Theory into Research, November 2005

2002, London England). Punctuation difficulties can often make the writing of CALD students difficult to understand, as it is such linguistic and semantic devices that give writing its texture and ensure that a text "hangs together" both linguistically and conceptually (Hatim and Mason, 1990).

Cultural knowledge is needed to participate in written discourses of nursing. Culture is not just knowledge about history but it refers to "the social rules, beliefs, attitudes and values that govern how people act and how they define themselves". (Kennedy, 2002). CALD students face the challenge of learning a new cultural system, in many ways different from their own without enough knowledge of western culture to understand the task, or to make sense of what they have seen, heard or read. For example, in a writing task about the ‘changing image of nurses’, students discovered that they did not have enough background knowledge of the history of nursing in the West to understand the readings. For example: what were angels, nuns and handmaidens and what did these concepts have to do with nursing? Who was Florence Nightingale and what was the Crimean War? None of these historical facts and constructs were familiar to CALD students and they required much explanation and contextualization.

Critical Thinking

Critical thinking is "considered to be essential for academic success" (Davies, 2004: 1) and is a generic attribute of university study. Problematically this is often a skill which has not been developed by CALD students. CALD students often find the concept of Critical thinking hard to understand because they think ‘being critical’ about attacking someone else’s ideas rather than subjecting the matter to scrutiny and ‘offering a critique’. Any sort of criticism is seen by the majority of CALD students as rude and offensive.

The unwillingness of CALD students to dispute the views of others is also often poorly understood by academic staff who become frustrated by students who they see as "unwilling to participate" in tutorial discussions. For example Asian Students are influenced by the Confucian concept of losing face "mien tzu" (Kennedy, 2002: 43) as the student might believe that challenging the teacher's opinion might cause the teacher to ‘lose face’. This would be unthinkable as modesty and self-effacing behavior is highly valued in Asian cultures.

Discourses of Nursing, Illness and the body

Nursing practice is very much concerned with caring for people’s bodies. (Lawler 1992, Fassett and Gallagher, 1998) Doing things to peoples bodies and communicating to and about those bodies to other health professionals is highly culture specific.

In Australia, where white, western Cartesian understandings of body care dominate, (Fassett and Gallagher, 1996) the culture shock for CALD students entering clinical nursing settings can be significant.

Nurse academics who teach in nursing practice subjects, where student nurses go out into health settings, have found that often the capacity of the CALD students to engage in the complex discourses of Australian health care generally and Australian nursing specifically are problematic. In the practice-based learning environments where the complex language of the medical and nursing lexicon is the key to communication, patient care and safety, many issues of appropriate discourse (expressed through both words and gestures) arise. (Rita et al, 1998)

Within the CALD programme the issues of communication in clinical practice were addressed early, as most of the participants in the CALD programme were about to engage in their first practice experience. It became clear that most of the students were very worried about their standard of English and the norms of professional and social behaviours in an Australian health setting. Some of the students from Asia were particularly worried about racist comments being made to them and about them by health staff and patients. It was the intention of the programme to make as few assumptions as possible about any of the CALD students and to provide the students some ‘survival’ skills’ prior to their first experience in
clinical settings.
At an early CALD session the issues of illness and communication across cultures were discussed. We facilitated a vigorous discussion by asking the students to describe the discourses of their ‘home culture’ in regards to nursing, illness, caring and communicating with people, in an ‘illness’ or ‘health care ‘setting’. The stories that emanated from this discussion demonstrated the enormous cultural diversity in communication, social norms, therapeutic touching and constructions of illness. Some African students described illness as something that was often imposed on a person as a punishment for a wrong doing. The Chinese students talked about traditional Chinese medicine, with western medicine being employed, only if traditional methods failed.

It soon became apparent that indeed western communication ‘norms’ within a health care setting might well become difficult for CALD students. For example, many African students described issues of giving eye contact to those whom they considered to be ‘senior’ to them or ‘more important’ than them, whether patients, other health care staff or academic staff. For them, giving direct eye contact to a person of senior years (or a younger lecturer for that matter!) would be rude and disrespectful, where as in Australian culture not to ‘look someone in the eye’ when speaking with them may be interpreted as a sign of shiftiness or dishonesty. Little wonder then that some African migrant nursing students receive comments such as ‘poor communication skills’ when assessed in a clinical practice setting.

In response to these kinds of difficulties, we devised three main strategies for familiarising students with cultural norms (and some of the rather more colloquial language) of the Australian nursing profession.

Firstly, role-play experiences were used to give students practice in clinical communication in Australian health settings. We developed a series of these short plays in using academic staff and the CALD students to act in the roles. The participants then ‘acted out’ such things as introducing yourself to a patient, taking a patient history and gaining consent from a patient to perform a simple procedure - for example, taking their blood pressure. In these role plays we scripted some very Australian/English terms such as different expressions of needing to go to the toilet, including such terms as ‘going to the loo’ ‘spending a penny’, ‘passing water’ ‘needing to pee’ ‘needing to wee’ ‘wanting a slash’ ‘taking a leak’. When the various terms had been explained (with much hilarity), small student groups then performed their role plays to the whole group. It was encouraging that all the students took part willingly and that the activities generated a great amount of wit and laughter.

The second strategy was to produce a series of video vignettes which modelled various clinical practice settings and interactions between nurses, patients, families and other health professionals. Scenes included direct interactions and use of the telephone. A series of guided questions provided a starting point for discussion, for example: “What did you notice about the body language of the nurse? Do you think the patient sounded angry? Why do you think that?” Students worked in small groups to answer these questions and presented their observations to the whole class.

As a third initiative in the programme we invited two CALD graduates (now Registered Nurses) to speak to the group of students in the programme. Both of these Registered Nurses were University of Tasmania Alumni and were keen to share some of their experiences of being student nurses with future nurses from diverse cultures. Each member of the group immediately responded to the visitors, asking many questions and showing great interest in their experiences. A number of issues were raised in these discussions. One of the most interesting and important issues to arise of these discussions was that of body care (personal or intimate care). One of the registered nurses from South Korea described her shock when she was in her first day of clinical practice in an acute care setting of a hospital. She described how she was expected to perform intimate hygiene care for an elderly man. She had never thought that she would be expected to perform such care and was initially immobilised by the demands made of her as a student nurse. She explained to the students that culturally this was a taboo, and the only man she had ever seen naked was her husband, and that her family ‘back home’ must never find out about what she does or they will insist that she comes directly home. This story had a big impact on the students and led to further discussion about their cultural understandings of the body, body care and illness, in addition to what would be expected of them when they went into clinical practice. The differences in
their cultural ways of caring and ‘constructions of the body’ were extraordinary and a powerful reminder of the assumptions that are made by a dominant white nursing culture regarding the ‘construction of caring’ and the somehow imperialist way in which western nursing invented it.

The Discourse of White Nursing Dominance

In the process of the CALD programme the facilitators became very conscious of the discourses of assimilation into a dominant health culture. Much of the literature has titles such as “Educating the Culturally Diverse Healthcare Student” (Davidhizar et al, 1998) and “Increasing the Linguistic Competence of the Nurse with Limited English Proficiency” (Guttman, 2004) This is literature that speaks to the assimilation and ‘culturalisation’ of essentially non white nurses into a white nursing culture, and indeed critically, this had been the focus in the development of the CALD programme, in order to teach CALD students’ how to ‘survive’ in a western white culture. Whiteness, which includes ‘acting white’, is required for full assimilation into the nursing establishment on the part of students, faculty, and clinical nurses (regardless of colour), acting white means adhering to the behaviours, values, beliefs, and practices of the dominant white culture (Puzan, 2003).

It is easy to become swept up in the discourses of dominant cultures in an uncritical way, make assumptions about CALD students and unthinkingly attempt to create strategies for them to ‘get into’ our culture and, in doing so implicitly reject, override and in some cases violate their own. The old adage of ‘this is the way we do it here’ without acknowledging any prior knowledge or understanding remains rife in nursing, despite recent changes within nurse education. This is particularly relevant to CALD students as white nursing culture is powerful and subsumes and reshapes nurses in its own image. “Nursing is emblematic of whiteness in its power to define knowledge, membership and language” (Puzan, 2003).

Benefits for Students and Staff

The initial stages of the CALD programme enabled staff to gain a better understanding of the cultural and academic difficulties of students undertaking the BN. The collaborative approach and creating spaces in which CALD students could tell their stories helped to create a climate of understanding between staff and students in which the students could freely express their feelings and seek help. It was also an opportunity for staff to work together collaboratively across disciplines and departments to facilitate student learning.

Discourses on Culture and the Learning Community: Reflections and Future Directions

Reflecting on the CALD programme of 2005, we had to acknowledge the extent to which our own cultural assumptions and filters had limited how we approached students. Engaging with their experiences gave us insights that shifted our own understandings significantly. It is clear that the CALD program was successful in enabling students to better understand and negotiate the discursive practices of the community in which they live, the university in which they study, and the workplace where they engage in professional practice. Yet the program was limited by its deficit approach. As Biggs (2003) explains:

In the deficit approach to teaching, the strategy is to identify the skills and procedural knowledge that the target students ‘lack’ and that mainstream students are presumed to have already. The target students are then given separate out-of-class remediation, after which, their deficit duly repaired, they rejoin the mainstream (p136).

The deficit approach commonly appears in a range of affirmative action strategies in higher education. These strategies are aimed at minimising the impacts within institutional culture of the unequal distribution of power and privilege in the broader society so that students to compete on a more even playing field. Affirmative action establishes a norm and attempts to move all students towards it. It is based on a somewhat problematic ethos of equity through sameness.
Successful outcomes from affirmative action enable groups and individuals regarded as outside 'the norm' to enjoy a measure of success within the established institutional rules and hierarchies, but without necessarily impacting on them in any fundamental way. So while affirmative action strategies may render university cultures more equitable (and ostensibly more liberal and progressive) in one sense, there is also a sense in which they serve to maintain the status quo and shore up entrenched hegemonies. They do not generally support critique of institutional culture and can work against the achievement of genuinely diverse and inclusive learning communities. In our own case, for example, the CALD programme did not seek to canvas or address the cultural abilities of students identified as part of the dominant culture. Yet, observations in mainstream classes and the accounts of refugee and international students alerted us to a range of problems emanating from the lack of cultural skills and understandings of Australian students. Problems ranged from separatism within the classroom to racist comments by white Australian students.

We are not suggesting that affirmative action should be abandoned – CALD students need particular forms of support with English and academic skills and assistance in understanding and navigating their way through a western university and professional practice. But affirmative action strategies must also address the cultural abilities of Australian students and be placed within an array of initiatives within the mainstream curricula. All students need to be able to identify and think critically about their own cultural assumptions and practices and to communicate with others from diverse backgrounds. This is an essential area of professional development. As a DEST Review of Nursing Education (2001) observes:

Diversity of the student body carries a number of advantages. It is an investment in a diverse nursing workforce that can better meet the health care needs of a culturally diverse society. Beyond that, it provides a richer learning environment so that all students can overcome their stereotypes and prejudices about cultures other than their own. (Section 7.4)

Into the Future: intentions, rhetoric and real change

CALD 2006 will be integrated into the nursing education via a first-year foundation unit titled Narratives of Nursing. The central aim of this unit is to foster awareness and critical reflection on nursing as a profession whose central values and practices change over time and vary widely across cultures. Lectures will include historical and cross-cultural narratives and case-studies and tutorials will give students opportunities to observe and reflect on their own cultures and to gain experience interacting with peers from different cultural backgrounds. This shift represents a move beyond the deficit model and can be described as an enrichment approach to learning. It is underpinned by a notion of equity based on valuing and accommodating difference and diversity, rather than on activating strategies for its erasure.

We see this shift as vital in 21st century higher education. Indeed, the viability of Australian universities will most likely be contingent on their ability to become postcolonial institutions – that is, able to critique their own traditional structures and processes and to become more deeply democratic and inclusive of the diverse cultures they house. For although Western universities have a long history of drawing together teachers and students from across cultures, languages and nations, this mingling has often been played out within an imperialist agenda of colonization via education. The notion of ‘tolerance’ can sponsor a surface play of intercultural collaboration and exchange of people and knowledge with no fundamental accommodation of diversity.

Responses to this challenge can be seen in the proliferation across Australian university websites of policy statements on internationalising the curriculum and producing graduates with ‘global perspectives’. For example, the UTAS internationalization website38 advises staff to base their academic practice on principles of being culturally inclusive and sensitive to diverse fields of study. It amplifies what this might mean in the classroom by listing a set of key priorities and pedagogical strategies, namely:

38 http://www.utas.edu.au/tl/supporting/international/
• providing international case studies
• setting students tasks that involve investigation of international issues or cultures
• drawing on or directing students to international resources and publications
• using online discussions with overseas participants or an overseas ‘guest speaker’
• asking international visitors to give guest lectures
• providing comparative case studies from different cultures

Staff members are advised that initiatives focusing on internationalisation should be embedded and integrated within mainstream curricula rather than consist of external strategies in "help" mode (that is, based on the deficit model). It is suggested that such strategies should benefit all students and that they should be developed by multicultural teams and in collaboration with international and Australian students. Short-term and long-term social, cultural, educational and professional benefits should be made explicit and acknowledged by the institution and evaluation of programmes should be conducted from multiple cultural perspectives by both international and Australian students.

In alignment with the internationalization agenda is the policy that certain generic attributes in graduates should be fostered throughout their university experience. One subset of these desirable graduate attributes, adopted by UTAS, is ‘global perspectives’ which are described as the ability to:

• demonstrate an awareness of the local and global context of their discipline or professional area
• function in a multicultural or global context
• understand global approaches to research and practice
• identify discipline related international standards
• value differences in culture/language

Such discourses appear to support the liberal notion of the multicultural university. Yet they target the performance of academic duties (mostly teaching) and describe desirable qualities for graduates, rather than identify fundamental philosophical tenets which can be articulated into key university structures and management practices. Just how the internationalization agenda is to be supported by systemic institutional change is not made explicit in these policy statements and guidelines. Multiculturalism as a policy in broader Australian culture foundered because of its tokenistic conceptions of what cultural diversity really meant – the availability of good international cuisine, for instance, or ethnic festivals with colourful folk dancing. There is a risk that universities will continue to adopt this covertly imperialist version of cultural diversity as the enactment of moderate degrees of tolerance in some areas of academic life, yet forestall the fundamental shifts of power and perspective that would inevitably characterise a truly inclusive learning community. In the interests of all our students we hope that deficit models will not prevail in the management of higher education institutions and that we will move, at all levels, into a culturally enriched future.

References


DEST 2001 (Commonwealth Department of Education, Science and Training) *Multicultural Nursing Education* (Section 7.4), National Review of Nursing Education


http://www.admin.utas.edu.au/academic/acservices/meetings/talc/Appendix/2 -04E10.doc

http://www.admin.utas.edu.au/academic/acservices/meetings/talc/Appendix/2 -04E10.doc


Puzan E. 2003 *The unbearable Whiteness of being (nursing)* Nursing Inquiry 10 (3) 193-200


Indonesian Islamist Media: a Struggle against or a Legitimacy of the Dominant Ideology?

Rianne K. Subijanto
University of Indonesia

Abstract
Ever since the 9-11 tragedy, the media coverage of Islam is emerging, most of which represent Islam with the established violent images rooted in the Orientalist way of thinking (Said, 1997). Islamist media are among those that report Islam from a different perspective trying to show the ‘true’ face of Islam. To what extent these media represent Islam and Moslem is a question that underlies this research. From the discourse and discursive practice, it is interesting to see how the Islamist media represent Islam. This paper will undertake a critical discourse analysis on a major Indonesian Islamist magazine, Sabili. It tries to uncover the ideology that lies in the reporting of discourses related to Islam in this magazine. My primary objective will be to argue that this magazine works ambiguously in two ways, i.e. as a way to struggle against the dominant ideology and at the same time to legitimate certain elements of this dominant ideology. The essay will be presented in four parts. I shall first discuss the historical, cultural and social backgrounds of this magazine. I then continue with the critical discourse analysis of the text. Next, I shall also discuss the result of the analysis relating it with the sociocultural situation. I will then offer a way of understanding the ideology of the media, which I call “reading from within.”

Introduction
The Iranian revolution can be called as the starting point of the emergence of the Western media coverage of Islam and Moslems. This coverage, however, has mostly misrepresented Islam through its simplified stereotypes and misconceptions rooted in the Orientalist way of thinking. Islam is presented as a barbaric and backward religion, seen as oppressive and unjust and, most importantly, looked upon as an "extremist", "terrorist", or "fundamental" religion (Said, 1997). The trend of the media coverage that ignore the multifaceted nature of Islam including its complex nature of culture and customs is very significant even though there are some media that give a more careful reporting after the atrocious 9-11 tragedy.

These media that try to show the ‘true’ face of Islam usually come from the countries where Moslems are its majority. Aljazeera, for example, a media owned by Saudi Arabia, in most cases gives a contrast report of Moslems, Islam or Islamic countries from the ones reported by the Western media. Furthermore, Sabili, a leading Indonesian Islamist magazine in Indonesia, also tries to base its reporting from a different perspective, the ‘true’ Islamic perspective.

Amidst the critics of many scholars in the world to the Western media’s negative coverage of Islam and Moslems, it is then also crucial to criticize from within how Islamist media represents Islam and its people. Would it struggle against the negative coverage of Islam that has long been represented in the Western media and scientific journals and books? Or would it be a mere legitimacy of this dominant ideology that the Western media rooted in?

This analysis is aimed to criticize the ideology set up in the magazine and how it is constructed. This essay will be organized under four headings: 1) The Cultural and Historical Background of Sabili, 2) The Ideologies and Representation in Sabili, 3) A Struggle or a Legitimacy? and 4) Reading from Within.
The Cultural and Historical Background of Sabili

Sabili, which in Arabic means 'my way,' was first established on 12 September 1984, a year after the Priok tragedy - the atrocity of hundreds Moslems who were against the implementation of Pancasila, the ideology set up to be the only foundation by the new regime in Indonesia. Since some of the principles in this ideology were against the Islamic values, the existence of this magazine was aimed to show the 'true' face of Islam and give thorough insights of Islamic values.

Sabili's development can be seen from its circulation. The trend of Sabili's total printing has been increasing considerably from 17,000 copies in 1998 to about 100,000 copies in 2005. The ACNielsen's Readership Survey in 2005 shows that, of the 10 most popular magazines in Indonesia, Sabili is in the second rank. It is distributed to both major cities in Indonesia as well as other countries, such as Malaysia, Saudi Arabia, Japan, and Hong Kong.

Among several magazines with Islamic ideology in Indonesia, Sabili is the only one that claims as an Islamist magazine, while the rest states it implicitly through the use of Arabic names that sound 'Islamic.' This might be one of the reasons why many people perceive the magazine representing hardliners' and radical people's point of view besides its use of language and the style of reporting that is straight forward and to-the-point. Budiman mentions that Sabili is an example of "openly extreme Islamic publications [in Indonesia]...which never stop fuelling antagonism between Islam and anything considered un-Islamic" (2002). On the other hand, Haryono perceives it as a new power to uphold the true Islamic values in the society as well as a struggle over its true meanings (2005).

The Ideologies and Representation in Sabili

In this analysis of ideologies and representation, I shall be using the framework of Norman Fairclough’s Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA). Generally, the analysis will be on the interplay of the linguistic features in the text and how they work together in anchoring the preferred meaning and, thus, reflecting the ideologies lies beneath the text. Its focus will be on the analysis of communicative events and the analysis of the order of discourse.

Generically, Sabili is presented in two parts. The first part is usually the main news on socioculture, politics and economy, and the second part is usually targeted for young readers. My analysis will then focus upon the articles and reports of the magazine’s first part of the 3rd edition launched on 25 August 2005 when this research was conducted. The analysis is based on its original text in Bahasa Indonesia. The English version provided in this paper will, therefore, only be of help to understand the context without necessarily showing the exact structures, the choice of words, etc.

The articles and reports of this edition’s first part are about liberal Islam, U.S.’s economic imperialism, Sharm El-Sheikh bombing in Egypt and the fall of Taya’s regime in Mauritania. I shall classify the articles based on these topics: Liberal Islam (topic 1), U.S.’s economic imperialism (topic 2), Sharm El-Sheikh bombing (topic 3), and the fall of Taya’s regime in Mauritania (topic 4). Let us now start with the discussion of the analysis of the order of discourse.

1. Actually, it is scheduled that Gus Dus will come, but it seems that a public figure that is closed with Israel will be absent... (topic 1)39

39 sebetulnya, dijadwal pula hadir Gus Dur, tapi tampaknya tokoh yang dekat dengan Israel ini.

Sharm El-Sheikh bombing perpetrator is being searched. There are many possibilities and motives. Israel Zionist’s roles could be one of them. (topic 3)40

Taya regime, which is repressive and closed to Israel, was brought down in a military coup d’etat. (Topic 4)41

Taya’s regime has so far been closed to Israel. Since 6 years ago, Nouakchott opens a diplomatic relationship with Israel. (topic 4)42

As may be expected, the participants in the four abstracts that are represented negatively - i.e. Gus Dur related with Liberal Islam, perpetrator of the Sharm El-Sheikh bombing, and Taya as being repressive and authoritarian - invite comparison with another demon of Islam: Israel. All of them are expressed through the use of presupposition like “…a public figure that is closed with Israel…” and “Taya regime, which is repressive and closed to Israel…” This takes for granted the similar characteristics of these participants as Israel’s. The demonization of Israel is, then, further emphasized by not providing an explicit explanation of Israel’s relationship with the above participants. This leads to the evaluative belief that Israel has a latent threat and is mysterious.

The inclusion of Israel discourse in the reports of something found un-Islamic and violent shows the reordering of discourse, namely technologization of discourse (Fairclough, 1995a). If in western media, Islam is represented as a demon and threat and related with a violent act43, in this text Israel is the one, which is represented as a demon and related with violence. This magazine struggles over its representation of Israel by ordering the discourse of Israel with the discourses of violence and things against Islam and express it through the use of presupposition inviting a taken-for-granted agreement from its readers.

The next analysis is this edition’s main target, liberal Islam. What is important to notice is the discursive practice in representing the group. Positioning it in the agent slot in the sentence, for example, emphasizes its agency and responsibility for the verb “humiliate”, “insult” and “fight against.” Mixing this liberal Islam discourse with the discourse of satan is another example. In Al-Quran, the Islamic holy book, satan is always represented as a demon that will always influence and persuade human beings to do something against the religion values. Thus, the mixing of both discourses implies that what the group does is something against Islam and is supported by satans. This emphasizes the negative properties of the group inviting the readers to agree with the proposition. What is actually lack of in this text is the explicit explanation and attack to this group’s view of Islam. It only depicts what the liberal Islam do, “humiliate” and “insult”, instead of mentioning their Islamist values and how they contradict Islamic values. This can raise hatred of the readers toward the group.

2. Today, with various statements and discussions, they [liberal Islam] humiliate Ulama and insult Islamic values. May be, it will change its form and face again in another five to ten years. But actually, they, the gang of liberal Islam, are doing an old job, fighting against the truth. And satans support them, convincing them that what they do is right and beautiful. (topic 1)44

The next analysis is this edition’s main target, liberal Islam. What is important to notice is the discursive practice in representing the group. Positioning it in the agent slot in the sentence, for example, emphasizes its agency and responsibility for the verb “humiliate”, “insult” and “fight against.” Mixing this liberal Islam discourse with the discourse of satan is another example. In Al-Quran, the Islamic holy book, satan is always represented as a demon that will always influence and persuade human beings to do something against the religion values. Thus, the mixing of both discourses implies that what the group does is something against Islam and is supported by satans. This emphasizes the negative properties of the group inviting the readers to agree with the proposition. What is actually lack of in this text is the explicit explanation and attack to this group’s view of Islam. It only depicts what the liberal Islam do, “humiliate” and “insult”, instead of mentioning their Islamist values and how they contradict Islamic values. This can raise hatred of the readers toward the group.

41 Rezim Taya, yang dinilai represif dan dekat dengan Israel, terjungkal dalam sebuah kudeta militer. Meski begitu, reformasi masih menunggu bukti.

42 Rezim Taya selama ini dikenal dekat dengan Israel. Sejak 6 tahun lalu, membuka hubungan diplomatik penuh dengan Israel.

43 For example, the following day after the Oklahoma bombing, a British newspaper carried the headline “In the Name of Islam.” Afterward, it was found out that the bombing had been carried out by a Christian militant.

3. However, the gang of terrorist from Badui denies its cooperation with Al-Qaedah, a network led by Usamah bin Laden and other foreign groups. (topic 3)

Similar assumption comes from Ahmad Maniez, a political analyst from Al-Ahram Center, the center of the study of politics and strategies. “Al-Qaedah network is the most possible perpetrator that did the bombing. In its practice, it is not impossible that there is Zionist participation in it,” said Maniez surely. (topic 3)

Another point important to notice is the Al-Qaedah representation in Sabili. The two extracts above related to this are taken from the article about Sharm El-Sheikh bombing. In the first extract, it is presupposed that Al-Qaedah is a network led by Usamah bin Laden and other foreign groups. This shows that Sabili agrees with the common and worldly acceptable knowledge about Al-Qaedah that it is led by Usamah bin Laden. Nevertheless, what is interesting here is that it also presupposes the involvement of “other foreign groups”, which, of course, is positioned and identified as Them in the text. Later on, we then find out that this foreign group is Zionist (extract 3). The implied proposition presented in the first extract evaluates the existence of this foreign group which then is highlighted by mentioning the name of the group. This again relates with our discussion about the mixture of violence discourse and Israel (in this regard Zionist) discourse. Sabili relates the bombing with Zionist, Israel’s political movement.

Furthermore, the Al-Qaedah representation in Sabili is contrast with the Al-Qaedah representation in the western media, which usually relates the group with Islamist fundamentalism, radicalism or extremism. In presenting it as a presupposition in the text, again Sabili struggles over its technologization of discourse. It tries to reorder the common order of discourse about Islam related with terrorism by relating it with the discourse of Zionist.

4. The government, according to Fadli Zon, is supposed to be reflecting other countries, like Iraq. Due to his firmness, Saddam Hussein cannot be affected by the economic hit men who obviously work under the foreign side. That is why; they found a lot of difficulties in killing Saddam Hussein.

“Nevertheless, in the end they did an intervention to Iraq with a crude way. This case became the death of democracy and human rights. In this Iraq case, we can see how democracy and human rights are dead,” he said firmly. (topic 2)

But if this is not successful, then there comes what is called the jackals, which in this case is CIA to do things up to assassination or destabilizing the government, like what happen in Equador. If this fails, like in Saddam Hussein case who cannot be killed by the jackals, then what comes next is military invasion. (topic 2)
Indonesia has to make changes in the policies to be more close to the people, not to bend in submission to the foreign interest, for example, Iraq that will not submit to the foreign side. People like Saddam Hussein cannot be affected by the EHM. Indonesia is a very easy target. There aren’t almost any efforts to fight. So according to the West, Indonesia is and easy target to be intervened, both in economics and also ideology.

In the discourse of U.S.’s economic hit man (EHM), it is clear that they are represented as having to do with assassination and military invasion in doing their job of maintaining U.S. economic hegemony in the world. This demonizing of EHM is emphasized by establishing the discourse of a powerful and firm country and its unbeatable leader, i.e. Iraq and Saddam Husein.

The selection of discourses to include and to exclude is also an important point to notice here. While many analysis conducted by many scholars have proven that Saddam Husein is almost always represented negatively by the media and depicted as a “menace”, “tyrant”, and “mad man” (see Dijk, 1998; Fairclough, 1995b; Hodge, 1979), in Sabili Saddam Husein is seen as a hero and even a role model in struggling against the U.S. hegemony. The discourse about Saddam in the first extract is mixed with the discourse of condemning the intervention of U.S. to Iraq and the death of democracy and human rights. This is to demystify the U.S.’s filthy strategies as well as to give an explanation why Saddam Husein deserves to be a hero and a role model. Saddam’s representation in the text excludes the discourse related to his malicious deeds of exterminating thousands of people and his being authoritarian (Burns, 2003). It is just the positive and virtuous properties of Saddam Husein’s characteristics that are included in the text.

Moreover, the discourse of condemning the intervention includes the use of direct quotation of an expert’s voice, Fadli Zon, giving more authoritative impact to the ideas delivered. Thus, it will most likely invite the readers’ agreement as well as legitimate the ideas that the U.S. military invasion to Iraq is the result of a failure in doing the economic imperialist tricks to the country.

Let us now continue with the analysis of genres in the text. Most of the articles are interdiscursively complex, articulating together a variety of genres and discourses, including elements of narrative, conversational genre and genre of counseling. An obvious reporting element, in fact, is the presence of features of narrative. It is realized in the text, for instance in the first five paragraphs of the article entitled U.S. Think-tank confession, Indonesia is the atrocity target. It begins the article by telling a ‘story’ on how it was very difficult to get the source book, Confession of an Economic Hit Man. Notice also that the imperative structures in the text (forbid Ahmadiyah as soon as possible, Exterminate liberal gangs, we (let’s) beat liberal ideas) evokes a conversational style which gives a touch of informality to the personalized relationship between Sabili and its implied readers. The use of conversationalization expressed in the use of informal and every day language as well as the use of narrative function as an implementation of positioning the magazine in the same level as its readers. This use of conversationalisation appears to minimize status difference and foreground solidarity, yet a closer examination reveals it as merely another tool by which power is exercised. Thus, it can legitimate its assumption and gets support from its readers. Another good example for this is the use of genre of counseling at almost every end
of the article through the use of the modal should, for example “Indonesians should
dare to ‘clean’ the people who become a foreigners’ accomplice in Indonesia.” This
explicitly demystifies Sabili’s power and authority to give advice and, at the same
time, invite the readers to support it. This “mixed form” occurs comprising
accommodation and resistance, i.e. resisting the dominant discourse and
accommodating by being a tool of subversion (Talbot: 82). It tries to accommodate the
general assumption of the implied readers and resist the established dominant
discourse by describing it as a discourse does not belong to the Us side.

The next analysis will be the analysis of the communicative events. Let us begin the
analysis with the headline.

FORBID AHMADIYAH AS SOON AS POSSIBLE
THINK TANK CONFESSION FROM AMERICA: INDONESIA AS AN
ANNIHILATION TARGET
ULAMA (RELIGIOUS LEADERS) ARE INSULTED, EXTERMINATE LIBERAL
GANGS

In this headline, as well as in the rest of the text, the main target for Sabili’s attack is
Liberal Islam notwithstanding its attack to U.S.’s think tank. Structurally, the
importance of Liberal Islam is first emphasized by its appearance in the headline.
Secondly, fronting its name in the title highlighted with red color further emphasizes
his agency and responsibility for the passivized verb of the sentence that precedes it.
The use of passive structure here implies that Ulama is the important topic and most
importantly it emphasizes that it becomes the patient of the verb ‘humiliate’ with the
actor, ‘Islam Liberal.’ The rhyme of the sentence, Ulama are insulted, is obviously
intended in the political sense, and hence express not so much Sabili’s personal
opinion but the evaluative assumption of the implied readers. Note also what they
have done is not topicalized in the headline, but only the result of the action. So, it is
the evaluation itself that is thus emphasized. Then, Sabili’s negative opinions toward
liberal Islam are also explicitly expressed in the choice of words, gangs; this name for
collective group is being associated to something which is not favorable. Moreover,
the use of imperative structure in the headline also has a provocative effect. This is
realized in “EXTERMINATE LIBERAL GANGS” and “FORBID AHMADIYAH AS SOON
AS POSSIBLE.”

Its use of action verb to construct the U.S.’s EHM’s representation is also important to
notice. The representation of U.S.’s EHM is constructed through the action verb
choices: “to annihilate,” “to suppress,” “to manipulate,” “to deceive,” “to blackmail,” “to
imperialize,” “to exploit,” “to eliminate,” “to seize,” and “to control.” All of the choices of
words represent U.S. negatively and at the same time as an active agent that do all of
these bad actions. This use of action type of sentence, i.e. actor + verb + patient, first
emphasizes the actor, U.S. This then shows the ideological phenomena in the text that
Sabili actually perceives U.S. as a dominant country that does the action to other
victimized countries. It then can also be assumed that Sabili positions itself as the
dominated group (passive, patient of the action). This way of using action verb for
constructing U.S.’s EHM representation emphasizes the negative representation of
U.S.’s EHM and at the same time agrees with Chomsky’s statement that U.S. is a
‘leading terrorist state’ (2002:43-5) that wills to imperialize other countries for its own
benefits (in this regard, economy and politics).

To conclude, the articulation of various discourses and their ordering demystifies the
polarized grouping of participants in the text and establishes their characteristics, Us
group and Them group (Ulama, Saddam Husein, implied readers and Sabili are those
grouped as Us side, while Israel, Liberal Islam, and U.S.’s EHM are those grouped as
Them side). The harsh and straight-forward choice of words and provocative structure
of sentences as well as the use of presupposition emphasize and throw light on the

50 Bangsa Indonesia harus berani “membersihkan” orang-orang yang menjadi kaki tangan
asing di Indonesia.
negative representation of Israel, liberal Islam, U.S.’s EHM as well as the positive representation of Saddam Husein. Through the mixture of genres, Sabili both invites the readers’ agreement as well as legitimates its construction of discourse and identity. Moreover, the mixture of discourses and genres is also used by Sabili as a mean of struggle over its contrast report amidst the dominant ideological framework of reporting.

A Struggle or a Legitimacy?

After discussing the order of discourse and the communicative events of the text, we shall now proceed to a more thorough discussion of the socioculture in which these events situated. From the analysis in the previous chapter, I would like to argue that Sabili works ambiguously in two ways. It struggles against, and, at the same time, legitimates the dominant ideology.

The way Sabili struggles against the dominant ideology can be seen from several ways. First, Sabili intends to deliver the message explicitly to avoid the distortion of meaning they try to struggle over. It, for example, attacks directly the group and ideologies that go against the true values of Islam according to Al-Quran and Hadits, Moslem’s holy book and guide of life. It criticizes them through the use of straight forward language that sometimes sounds provocative, such as imperative structure and harsh choice of words. This use of provocative language is actually a part of the struggling discursive practice (henceforth called ‘the language of struggle). In its discursive practice, Sabili intends to give a clear understanding of the right path and attitude that the implied readers should take. It tries to clarify every thing that sounds un-Islamic and purify the religion’s values by stating what is wrong and what is right according to the religion’s basic principle, i.e. Al-Quran and Hadits. For sabili, amidst the dominant ideology that seems to be too tolerant to Islamic values and, thus, distorts the actual values of Islam, there should be a media of advocacy for the readers to distinguish what is Islamic and what is not. Therefore, discourses like the wrong teachings of Islam, americanization, westernization, and even Zionist will most likely be attacked in the magazine. Next, the technologization of discourse that Sabili tries to fight for, such as Israel and violence, is also another way of its resistance toward the dominant ideology that usually relates violence with Islam. Finally, Sabili also presents its opinion by organizing it following an ideological pattern that polarizes the ingroups and outgroups, Us vs. Them. In this case, the basic dual ideologies used are the contrast ones from the dominant ideology that usually associate We (West) with positive values such as democracy, rationality and non-violence, and They (East and Islam) with dictatorship, violence and irrationality (Dijk, 1998). Sabili formulates its own ideology that associate We (Islam) with positive values such as a victim of the dominant power and a group that holds the ‘right’ (Islamic) path of life, and Them (West) with violence, imperialism and hegemony.

On the other hand, the way Sabili presents the news, at the same time, legitimates the dominant ideology. First, its use of provocative language (imperative structure, straight forward language, and both words and discourses appealing to emotion) sounds very provoking from the dominant ideology perspective. This also shows how the language use and the order of discourses can raise people’s hatred toward a group being represented negatively. Furthermore, in reordering the discourses, Sabili tends to blame a group, i.e. Israel, without giving explicit explanation why it is the group to blame. With this, the readers will probably come up with the idea that the magazine works irrationally. Moreover, since the choices of words have a significant influence in the text production and thus the magazine’s representation (Hall, 1995), its uses of harsh language, red and black colors used stereotypically to represent the bad group, and violent and full-of-bloodshed pictures can lead into the violent representation of Sabili and, thus, Islam that it represents.

In addition, the way it polarizes the ingroup and outgroup to a very extreme end, such as Saddam Husein who is part of Us and is represented very positively as a good role model notwithstanding his dreadful deeds as a president, show Sabili’s reports that seem to be opinions yet are wrapped using journalistic style of reporting taking for
granted the ‘truth’ of the ideas delivered. Thus, the use of provocative language and stereotypes of a group and the way Sabili selects and presents the news legitimate the dominant ideology that represents Islam as full of hatred and violence as well as irrational.

In regards with this ambiguity, it is important to take into accounts the context in which this dominant and dominated group takes place. Within the domination of Western media that mostly represent the dominant ideology, it is actually important to have a media that represents the dominated group to work as a balance to give another version of report, ‘the truth’ from another perspective, especially if it is regarding the dominated group. In this globalization era, extreme westernization can lead to ‘secular fundamentalism’ that presents every thing related to religion as abnormal, irrational and backward (Esposito, 2005). It even presents religion as radical, extremist or fundamental, not to mention Islam. Sabili’s reporting, from western (secular) point of view, can be said radical, extremist or fundamental since it reports and analyzes news from Islam's perspective. Thus, people who read Sabili using this perspective will see that the magazine legitimates the dominant stereotypes of Islam. However, knowing the discursive practice and sociocultural context of Sabili, the radicalism, extremism or fundamentalism of sabili is not in the sense of being violent as what the dominant ideology shares, but in a sense of purifying the actual and true values of Islam from everything un-Islamic, such as the dominant modern and westernized ideology (‘radical’ in this sense loses its connotative meaning). Therefore, notwithstanding the meanings that may arise in the surface level, i.e. the use of language and order of discourse, Sabili strives to go against this secular fundamentalism as it distorts the actual values of Islam by providing a clear cut of Islamic rules, values and ways of life.

Reading from Within

The vast majority of mass media production takes place in the developed world. They are mostly dominated by North America and European conglomerates. Thus, first-world texts are then consumed by third-world audiences (Talbot, 2003:10). Since readers commonly have already had their ideological framework they get from the dominant media, many will most likely perceive Sabili as a radical magazine. Therefore, it is difficult for them to understand the ideological stances Sabili takes.

The difficulty in understanding the ideological framework of Sabili is because the readers, in reading the magazine, use the dominant ideological framework offered by the dominant ideology and perceive it as the only ‘truth.’ The ‘truth’ in media is actually ideologically constructed. Therefore, when the readers take this ‘truth’ for granted, they will not be able to understand another version of ‘truth’ circulated in other media.

In reading Sabili as well as other media of struggle, the readers need to ‘read’ them from within to understand their ideological stances. They need to know what voice of group this magazine represents, what this media struggle for and who or what it resists. They also need to understand the broadened context in which this media takes place. By understanding this and reading using the magazine’s ideological framework and the sociocultural context, the readers will most likely understand its ideological stances and then build critical thinking and participate actively in the construction of the ‘truth’ in the society. Thus, by being selective and actively attending, thinking about and using the media, readers can also then formulate their own construction of truth without necessarily agree with the mainstream’s.

In conclusion, Sabili in its discursive practice is aimed to resist the dominant ideology that distorts the true values of Islam. It tries to achieve this through the use of language of struggle. However, this will actually work ambiguously, legitimating the dominant ideology that perceives the language use of struggle as a part of being ‘violent’. For that reason, to avoid ambiguity Sabili needs to take into accounts the language use as well as the formulation of discourses in its reporting. It needs to avoid hypothetical judgments without providing logical supports and verifiable data. By this I mean, it needs to empower its readers to think critically. Considering the market is, of course, important for the media. Yet making the readers ‘think’ rather than ‘feel’
is much more important so that Sabili, as a leading magazine that has an influential role in the society, can involve in educating the people. Thus, the transformation of the society to be more critical in thinking and consuming media will prevail.

In addition, the readers should also be more critical in consuming the text. By understanding and knowing the ideological stances of the media and reading its report using its ideology, they can, therefore, avoid to be trapped within one dominant power of the society and formulate their own understanding of the world.

Acknowledgement

I would like to express my gratitude to Junaidi, Muhammad Fuad, and Manneke Budiman for their helpful comments on this paper.

References


Nurdi, Herry. ‘Ulama Dihina, Tumpas Gerombolan Liberal’ (‘Ulama is Humiliated,


Textual Information Structure and Social Power®

Zohreh Tahvildar
Islamic Azad University of Shabestar

Abstract

According to the social semiotic view of language, linguistic forms and meanings work together with social and cultural meanings and interpretations to create discourse.

Prominent amongst social structures which influence textual strategies is inequality of power. Any discursive practice deals, willy nilly, with the exchange of information, and the components of context of situation including the power status of discourse producer would certainly affect the textual strategies he/she employs. Amongst these strategies, the present paper has focused on information structure trying to investigate the relationship between the amount of social power a discourse producer holds and variations in the information structure of the text he/she produces. The researcher’s claim is that the information structure is one amongst many other textual strategies through which the discourse participants enact power to locate themselves in their social world when engaging in discourse.

The study undertakes the analysis of the variations in information structure in the discourse of two characters (situationally, one powerful and the other holding less social power) in a novelette, based on Brown & Yule (1983) information taxonomy as well as some tactics in demand for information adopted from Thompson (1999). In comparison, the results revealed significant differences in the degree of givenness and newness of information in their face-to-face interactions which confirmed the researcher’s claim.

Introduction

Human as a social being needs constant exchange of information, and every discursive practice includes some pieces of information to be conveyed and exchanged by discourse participants who, inevitably, enact their social power partly based on their socio-economic, socio-cultural, and socio-political statuses and partly in accordance with the context of situation. Mulholland (1991:184) emphasizes the vitality of the speakers’ assessment of the hearers’ knowledge and power status, since it is the very evaluation that contributes what information to be given and how it should be given.

The present study makes use of Brown and Yule (1983) taxonomy of information structure (figure 1.) in order to trace the hidden, implicit power in the two interactants’ moment-to-moment interaction process in a written-diologic type of text, a novelette by Hemingway. The need for such a study is indispensably felt to indicate that if we, as social members of the society, are competent enough to carry out discoursally-appropriate, socially-acceptable communications in different contexts of situation, then we are said to be successful communicators.

Background Studies

1. Functions of Language, Text, and Context

Functionally based approaches view discourse as a socially and culturally organized way of language use (e.g. Halliday 1994). Thus, functional analysis focuses on how people use language to meet various needs. Schiffrin (1994:22) believes that “a. language has functions that are external to the linguistic system itself; b. external functions influence internal organization of the linguistic system.” Halliday (1970) suggests three grammatically relevant language functions namely, ideational, interpersonal, and textual functions. The latter refers to the way in which the grammatical and intonational structure of sentences relates them to one another in continuous texts and to the situations in which they are used. According to Matthiessen (1995:22), “textual statuses such as themacity, news worthiness, information
focus, ellipsis and reference make contributions in guiding listeners or readers in the process of constructing instantial system from text." So, textual function represents the language users' text-forming potential.

In order to study the functions of language, one ought to resort to a language text (written or spoken) as a product of a dynamic underlying process of meaning negotiation i.e. discourse as language use in the context of a given situation which according to Van Dijk (1998:1) is "inherently part of and influenced by social structure, and produced in social interaction." Hassan (1999:240) assigns a complementary role on text and context and asserts that "the speaker’s perception of the context activates her choice of meaning and structure." According to Halliday (1994), textual choices are realized partly through information structure.

2. Textual Information Structure

Information involves two complimentary parts; what is "given", known or recoverable, and what is "new", unknown or non-recoverable for the listener or the reader. In analysing discourse into its given and new elements, one can usually point to factors of the context of situation, and preceding text that have determined what is given and what is new. Halliday (1989), Leech and Svartvik(1994) and Martin(1995) assign the outstanding functional role to prosodic features as the heart of the information unit in spoken English which they believe cannot be rendered in written punctuation. Brown and Yule (1983), criticising Halliday, propose the syntactic realization of information structure which they have adopted from Prince(1981) and then have developed their new taxonomy as follows: (figure 1.)

```
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>New</th>
<th>Inferrable</th>
<th>Evoked</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brand New</td>
<td>Unused</td>
<td>Situational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current</td>
<td>Textual</td>
<td>Displaced</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
```

Figure 1. Taxonomy of Information Structure (Brown and Yule, 1983)

In the taxonomy, brand new refers to an entity which is introduced to the discourse for the first time. Unused new is a new entity which is assumed by the speaker to be known to the hearer, in his background knowledge, but not in his consciousness at the time of utterance. Inferrable is an entity which the speaker assumes the hearer can infer from the entity(s) already introduced. Situationally evoked is an entity which is salient in the discourse context e.g. 'I' and 'you'. Textually evoked is an entity which has already introduced into the discourse which is now being referred for the second or subsequent time. Current evoked entity is the one which was introduced as 'new' immediately before the current new entity was introduced. Displaced entities were introduced prior to that.

They (ibid:170-71) introduce the syntactic forms in association with given information in the following way:

A. (i) Lexical units mentioned for the second time, particularly those in definite expressions:
   a. 1. Yesterday, I saw a little girl get bitten by a dog.
       2. I tried to catch the dog, but it run away.

(ii) Lexical units presented as being within the semantic field of a previously mentioned lexical unit, again particularly in definite expressions:

   b. 1. Mary got some picnic supplies out of the car.
       2. The beer was warm.

c. 1. Yesterday, Beth sold her Chevy.
2. Today, Glen bought the car.

d. 1. I bought a painting last week.
   2. I really like paintings.

B. (i) Pronominals used anaphorically following a full lexical form in the preceding sentence: ( example ‘a.1.’above)

e. 1. What happened to the jewels?
   2. They were stolen by a customer.

(ii) Pronominals used anaphorically to refer to the physical context of situation where the referent is present:

f. 1. Look out!
   2. It’s falling.

(iii) Pro-verbals:

g. 1. William works in Manchester.
   2. So do I.

3. Power, Ideology, and Discourse

Discourse is reality-creating social practice and the notion of language is now often replaced by “discourse” as the unit of actual language use in which power is enacted. Asher (1994:3240) contents that “nearly all human relationship have power dimension and are expressed via language which reflects, maintains, and enforces power differentials.” Fowler and Kress (1979) propose that prominent among the social structures which influence linguistic structure is inequality of power. Simpson (1993) argues that dominant ideologies operate as a mechanism for maintaining asymmetrical power relations in society. Gee (1999:2) refers to different sources of power as “academic intelligence, money, control, wisdom, knowledge, technology, literacy, morality and so on.” Fairclough (1995:73) acknowledges the fact that “language is the material form of ideology and language is invested by ideology.” So, the connection between language, ideology and power exists at the lexical level and at grammatical syntactic level according to Kress (1985). As a result, powerful participants, in accordance with the situational context, control and constrain the contribution of non-powerful participants.

As a final note, the analysis of text is form-and-meaning analysis. Any text can be regarded as interweaving ‘ideational’, ‘interpersonal’, and ‘textual’ meaning. The latter’s domains are the contribution of identities of participants and social and personal relationship including power status between them and the distribution of ‘given’ vs. ‘new’ and ‘foregrounded’ vs. ‘backgrounded’ information.

Inspired by all the finding reviewed, the researcher has provided a model of text analysis to investigate the very relationship in a written-dialogic type of text, a novelette by Hemingway.

Methodology, Data Analysis, Results and Discussion

Research Question

What is the relationship between the “power” orientation of participants in a discourse and their choice of “information structure” in a text?

Research Hypothesis

Null Hypothesis: There is no relationship between the “information structure” of a text and the “social power” of its producer.

Substantive Hypothesis: There is a relationship between the “information structure” of a text
and the “social power” of its producer.

The Design
The present study has been designed as a descriptive case study to trace social power through textualization process. The researcher aims at establishing the existence of a phenomenon, that is, to describe the implicit effect of social power on information status of a text, by explicitly describing it. In order to document the unequal social power of the two characters who interact throughout a selected story, a novelette by Hemingway, and its relationship with the information structure of their discourse, the researcher has adopted Brown and Yule (1983) model illustrated and described above.

The variation in information structure was examined and the proportion and the density of each category were calculated in the discourse of each character. The results were then compared and interpreted in terms of the degree of givenness and the newness of information in the discourse of each character within the textualization process. On the other hand, by adopting Thompson’s (1999) suggested *discoursal tactics in demand for information*, a comparison was made between the two characters’ different discoursal tactics employed in their face-to-face interactions in demand for information.

Methodology

**Material:** The material selected to be analyzed in this study is a novelette by Hemingway called “The Short Happy Life of Francis Macomber” (see Appendix 2 for the first three pages). Ernest Hemingway (1899-1961), the American writer, is especially famous for his short stories in most of which one can find rich and meaningful interactions as data if one intends to carry out an analysis of various dimensions of discourse structure. As far as the researcher tends to inspect the implied power of the characters and as far as she has to have access to an interactive mode of discourse, it seems reasonable for her to resort to such a novelette. On the other hand, Schiffrin (1994:204) believes that stories are useful texts in which a limited number of entities act and interact with one another in a definite location and for a limited period of time. Stories offer the opportunities to find referring sequences as part of the information structure in which new referents are introduced and continually used in a particular framework to which they are relevant.

**Procedure:** Once the material was decided upon, the following steps were taken:

1. After reading the story critically, the researcher chose two characters, the two men, one of which i.e. *Wilson* seems to be powerful due to the context of the situation and in relation to his knowledge and expertise as a hunter in that setting, the jungle. The other i.e. *Macomber*, seems powerless or rather less powerful in that setting inspite of the fact that he is typically a wealthy man who enjoys a happy life with his beautiful wife.

2. All the interactions, that is, all the utterances in their face-to-face conversations were selected and numbered throughout the story (sample pages in Appendix 1).

3. The discourse of each character was categorized and analyzed in terms of the above-mentioned taxonomy of information structure suggested by Brown and Yule (1983).

4. A comparative analysis of the categories was carried out in order to see whether the findings confirm the hypothesis.

5. A comparative analysis of the frequency of occurrence of some discoursal tactics in demand for information in *Wilson* and *Macomber*’s utterances including *Wh-interrogative, Yes-No interrogative, no process* (elliptical processes) and *Tag* was conducted, adopting Thompson (1999).

6. The number of *elliptical elements* was calculated in each character’s discourse as well as the number of *running words* and *sentences* uttered by each.
Data Analysis

It was mentioned before that the novelette, *The Short Happy Life of Francis Macomber*, which is forty pages long, is selected and analyzed in order to examine the hypothesis. Firstly, it is suitable and rich enough from the interactive view point to fulfill as well as to justify the researcher’s goal in describing the unequal power relations that exists between Wilson and Macomber, the two selected characters, through analysing the information structure of their discourse process. Secondly, in addition to the interactive mode of the story, the researcher realizes that the story reveals unequal power relations between Mr. Wilson, a professional hunter, and Mr. Macomber, a rich handsome American who has hired Wilson to hunt for their pleasure. The story happens in a jungle in Africa with the three main characters, Macomber, his wife and Wilson. Macomber seems powerless in the setting because of the event having happened before the story begins and strengthened his powerlessness because he felt ashamed as a result of his fear and the lack of expertise in encountering a lion which attacked him. Killing the lion by Wilson, on the other hand, empowered him not only as a hunter who is brave and knowledgable enough to carry out his responsibility but also in comparison with Macomber, a wealthy but a coward man, who is not able to be so courageous and self-confident as Wilson. During the course of hunting and throughout the story there are interactions between those main characters, that is, Wilson-to-Macomber, Macomber-to-Wilson, Macomber-to-Mrs. Macomber and vice versa, Wilson-to-Mrs.Macomber and vice versa. The researcher first selected and numbered all the utterances uttered just by Wilson and Macomber during their face-to-face conversations within the story. (See the numbered utterances in their interaction turns within the first three pages of the story in Appendix 2). Then she categorized the information structure of their utterances according to the Brown and Yule taxonomy discussed in details before.

Table 1. (to save the space, a sample of each table out of 43 tables is included in appendix1) illustrates “new” information in Wilson’s utterances to Macomber which has been categorized into “brand new” and “unused new” with each item(s) numbered due to the sentence(s) it (they) occurred in.

Table 2. shows “inerrable” and Table 3. “evoked” information which is taxonomized into two sub-categories “situational” and “textual” information. “Textual” information itself has two subdivisions as well: “current” and “displaced” information.

Table 4., 5., and 6. are concerned with Macomber’s utterances to Wilson in which “new”, “inerrable” and “evoked” information is categorized respectively. In order to avoid any misconceptions, some phrases are not broken but the intended entity(s) is in bold in some tables.

Results and Discussion

After categorizing information structure in each character’s speech, the researcher, in order to gain access to the density of *brand new, unused new, inerrable, situational, current* and *displaced* information, has divided the number of each information category by the total number of words spoken by each interactant. Then she has multiplied the obtained figure by 100:

\[
\frac{\text{Number of each information category}}{\text{Total number of words spoken by each interactant}} \times 100
\]

Table 7. shows the number of running words and sentences uttered by each speaker. Table 8. illustrates the number of each category and Table 9. supplies the percentages of information categories.

*Table 7. The Number of Running Words and Sentences in Both Wilson and Macomber Discourse*
As Table 7 shows, it is evident that the number of Wilson’s words is about three times more than Macomber’s and in the case of sentences Wilson utters, 266 out of 368 sentences which is about two and half times more than Macomber's 102 sentences, are due to him.

Table 8. The Number of Information Categories in Wilson and Macomber’s Face-to-Face Interaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information Category</th>
<th>Brand New</th>
<th>Unused New</th>
<th>Inferrable</th>
<th>Situational</th>
<th>Current</th>
<th>Displaced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Character Name</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WILSON</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>166 (21 ellipsis)</td>
<td>133 (4 ellipsis)</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MACOMBER</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9. Percentages of Information Categories in Wilson and Macomber’s Face-to-Face Interaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information Category</th>
<th>Brand New</th>
<th>Unused New</th>
<th>Inferrable</th>
<th>Situational</th>
<th>Current</th>
<th>Displaced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Character Name</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WILSON</td>
<td>9.8 %</td>
<td>0.5 %</td>
<td>3.4 %</td>
<td>9.2 %</td>
<td>7.5 %</td>
<td>4.6 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MACOMBER</td>
<td>5.9 %</td>
<td>0.3 %</td>
<td>0.8 %</td>
<td>15.6 %</td>
<td>6.5 %</td>
<td>4.1 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tables 8 and 9 are self-evident enough to reveal considerably significant and meaningful facts concerning the impact of power on information structure. The amount of brand new is of great importance in Wilson’s case, while situationally evoked information is critically
significant in Macomber’s case. It refers to the fact that Wilson is an expert in his own profession who knows A-Z of hunting in any settings of jungles and because of his familiarity and expertise, he gives new information constantly. Situation forces Macomber, who is new in the setting, to convey *situationally evoked* in a great percentage. The percentages of *unused new* in both are so much different. *Inferrable* information due to Wilson is greater in percentage in comparison to Macomber. *Current* and *displaced* information also shows higher percentage in Wilson’s. There are some elliptical entities in *situationally and currently evoked* information in Wilson’s which according to Thompson (1999:115) “are working together with other choices in textual meanings… to counteract the inequalities-based-on expertise. The choice of elliptical textual forms is determined at least partly by the kind of relationship that the interactants are enacting.” According to him, the use of ellipsis in itself projects the role of a co-operative hearer, and thus normally construes a friendly for the interaction. Wilson is dominant here and enacts cooperatively by placing on Macomber the task of filling out the missing parts which are situationally and currently present in the context.

In their demand for information, Wilson and Macomber deploy some tactics which are shown in Table 10.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Character Name</th>
<th>Discoursal Tactics</th>
<th>WILSON</th>
<th>MACOMBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wh-interogative</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes-No interogative</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No process (ellipsis)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tag</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Consider Table 10. In their demand for information, Macomber deploys 15 *Wh-interogative* which shows his need for essential information while it is 4 in Wilson’s. *Yes-No interogative* is 14 for Wilson who, seems, does not need more information and it is 18 in Macomber’s. Again, 8 processes are missing in Wilson’s whole interaction while it is zero for Macomber. The amount of *Tag* is not so much considerable but more in Macomber. By interpreting the total number of these tactics in demand for information, Macomber makes use of 37, 15 out of which is due to *Wh-interogative*, 18 is related to *Yes-No interogative* and 4 is concerned with *Tag*. The total due to Wilson is 28 out of which 4 is related to *Wh-interogative*, 14 to *Yes-No interogative*, 8 to elliptical processes and 2 to *Tag*. The results improve that the dominant, Wilson, deploys more *ellipsis* and less *Wh, yes-No interogative and tag* in comparison to the dominated, Macomber, whose *Wh-interogative* is considerably higher.

**Conclusion**

The findings which were gained by the researcher’s theoretical and practical examination of textual and syntactic realizations of information structure based on Brown and Yule (1983) model to find any relationship between the power orientation of a text producer and the information structure of his/her discourse rejected the null hypothesis by providing us with the fact that the relationship is so highly significant and meaningful that requires comprehensive and rich data base to test the hypothesis if one is to go deeply into the issue.
References


## Table 1. “New” Information in Wilson-to-Macomber Discourse

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>NEW INFORMATION</th>
<th>Brand New</th>
<th>Unused New</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>a gimlet</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>a quid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>absolutely</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>your lion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>a damned fine one</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>no difficulty</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>women upset</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>amounts to nothing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>strain on the nerves</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>one thing’n another</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>nonsense</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>a spot of the giant killer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>nothing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>nothing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>fifteen of the best</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>quite illegal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>a row</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>not strange</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>your pay</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

► No. = Assigned number of the sentence in the story
### Table 2. “Inferrable” Information in Wilson-to-Macomber Discourse

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>INFERRABLES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>the whole thing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>a good birching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>a beating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>our client</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>129</td>
<td>that racket</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>132</td>
<td>the old boy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>180</td>
<td>a hare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>181</td>
<td>boys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>181</td>
<td>that sort of show</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>266</td>
<td>cool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>281</td>
<td>the other two</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>312</td>
<td>the driver</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>312</td>
<td>in the shade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>367</td>
<td>the whole thing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>381</td>
<td>the boss of the horns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>382</td>
<td>the nose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>383</td>
<td>chest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>383</td>
<td>the neck</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>383</td>
<td>the shoulders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>387</td>
<td>head</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3. “Evoked” Information in Wilson-to-Macomber Discourse

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Situational</th>
<th>Textual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Current</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>you</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>you</td>
<td>your</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td>one</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>( ellipsis )</td>
<td>it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td>a damn fine lion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>us</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
<td>it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td>nothing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td>all nonsense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>( ellipsis )</td>
<td>him</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>he</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td>it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>you</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>they</td>
<td>they</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td></td>
<td>they</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td>they</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td>it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 4. “New” Information in Macomber-to-Wilson Discourse

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>NEW INFORMATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brand New</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>lime juice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>lemon squash</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>the headman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>for the rest of my life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>lashes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>strange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>no one</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>lots of things</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69</td>
<td>a rabbit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70</td>
<td>buffalo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>a worth-while head</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79</td>
<td>tomorrow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>not very pleasant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>something</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>a shot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>106</td>
<td>properly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>111</td>
<td>range</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>116</td>
<td>at under a hundred yards</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 5. “Inferrable” Information in Macomber-to Wilson Discourse

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>INFERRABLES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>something like that</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94</td>
<td>his roaring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94</td>
<td>that far</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>259</td>
<td>everything else</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>296</td>
<td>all</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 6. “Evoked” Information in Macomber-to-Wilson Discourse

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Situational</th>
<th>EVOKED INFORMATION</th>
<th>Textual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Current</td>
<td>Displaced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>you</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>it</td>
<td>the thing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>him</td>
<td></td>
<td>three gimlets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>them</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td>it</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>he</td>
<td></td>
<td>a good lion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>he</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the lion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>you</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
<td>that</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>we</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>you</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>me</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>you</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2

The Short Happy Life of
Francis Macomber

Ernest Hemingway

(1898–1961)

It was now lunch-time and they were all sitting under
the double green fly of the dining-tent pretending that
nothing had happened.
1. ‘Will you have lime juice or lemon squash?’ Macomber
asked.
2. ‘I’ll have a ginlet,’ Robert Wilson told him.
3. ‘I’ll have a ginlet too. I need something,’ Macomber’s
wife said.
4. ‘I suppose it’s the thing to do,’ Macomber agreed.
5. ‘Tell him to make three ginlets.’

The mess boy had started them already, lifting the
bottles out of the canvas cooling bags that sweated wet in
the wind that blew through the trees that shaded the tents.
6. ‘What had I ought to give them?’ Macomber asked.
7. ‘A quid would be plenty,’ Wilson told him. ‘You don’t
want to spoil them.’
8. ‘Will the headman distribute it?’
9. ‘Absolutely.’

Francis Macomber had, half-an-hour before, been
carried to his tent from the edge of the camp in triumph
on the arms and shoulders of the cook, the personal boys,
the skinner and the porters. The gun-bearers had taken
no part in the demonstration. When the native boys put
him down at the door of his tent, he had shaken all their
hands, received their congratulations, and then gone into
the tent and sat on the bed until his wife came in. She
did not speak to him when she came in and he left the
tent at once to wash his face and hands in the portable
wash basin outside and go over to the dining-tent to sit in
a comfortable canvas chair in the breeze and the shade.
10 ‘You’ve got your lion,’ Robert Wilson said to him, ‘and
a damned fine one too.’

Mrs. Macomber looked at Wilson quickly. She was an
extremely handsome and well-kept woman of the beauty
and social position which had, five years before, com-
manded five thousand dollars as the price of endorsing,
with photographs, a beauty product which she had never
used. She had been married to Francis Macomber for
eleven years.

12 ‘He is a good lion, isn’t he?’ Macomber said. His wife
looked at him now. She looked at both these men as
though she had never seen them before.

One, Wilson, the white hunter, she knew she had
never truly seen before. He was about middle height with
sandy hair, a stubby moustache, a very red face and
extremely cold blue eyes with faint white wrinkles at
the corners that grooved merrily when he smiled. He
smiled at her now and she looked away from his face at
the way his shoulders sloped in the loose tunic he wore
with the four big cartridges held in loops where the left
breast pocket should have been, at his big brown hands,
his old slacks, his very dirty boots and back to his red
face again. She noticed where the baked red of his face
stopped in a white line that marked the circle left by his
Stetson hat that hung now from one of the pegs of the
tent pole.
‘Well, here’s to the lion,’ Robert Wilson said. He smiled at her again and, not smiling, she looked curiously at her husband.

Francis Macomber was very tall, very well built if you did not mind that length of bone, dark, his hair cropped like an oarsman, rather thin-lipped, and was considered handsome. He was dressed in the same sort of safari clothes that Wilson wore except that his were new, he was thirty-five years old, kept himself very fit, was good at court games, had a number of big-game fishing records, and had just shown himself, very publicly, to be a coward.

‘Here’s to the lion,’ he said. ‘I can’t ever thank you for what you did.’

Margaret, his wife, looked away from him and back to Wilson.

‘Let’s not talk about the lion,’ she said.

Wilson looked over at her without smiling and now she smiled at him.

‘It’s been a very strange day,’ she said. ‘Hadn’t you ought to put your hat on even under the canvas at noon? You told me that, you know.’

‘Might put it on,’ said Wilson.

‘You know you have a very red face, Mr. Wilson,’ she told him and smiled again.

‘Drink,’ said Wilson.

‘I don’t think so,’ she said. ‘Francis drinks a great deal, but his face is never red.’

‘It’s red today,’ Macomber tried a joke.

‘No,’ said Margaret. ‘It’s mine that’s red today. But Mr. Wilson’s is always red.’

‘Must be racial,’ said Wilson. ‘I say, you wouldn’t like to drop my beauty as a topic, would you?’

‘I’ve just started on it.’
Code-Choice and Code-Convergent Borrowing in Canberra Vietnamese ®

Bao Duy Thai
The Australian National University

Abstract

Code switching has taken social structure as fundamental and regards language practices as reflecting that structure (Clyne 1967, 1985, 2004; Cameron, 1990; Cashman 2005). Research in conversation analysis also argue that the domain of code selection of bilinguals and multilinguals depends largely on interlocutors and such variables as ethnic ascription, situation of speaking, topic, style, role-relationship, venue, interaction type and medium (Sandkoff 1971). In its turn, communication in multilingual contexts, the tendency of lexical and structural borrowings often reflect the nature as well as the degree of the influence of the donor language upon the recipient one, reflecting the speakers’ life styles and cultural identities. From the data collected on the bilingual conversations of 36 Vietnamese Australians and a number of prints available within the Vietnamese communities in the ACT, the paper discusses the nature of code choice and code-convergent borrowing beyond the word level, the language integration that is claimed leading to an early loss of the mother tongue counterparts due to the principle of pragmatic detachability.

Introduction

Code choice, as a linguistic behaviour of any bilingual interactant, has been analysed by a great number of investigators from a wide range of disciplines with diverse approaches and perspectives. From a macro level, scholars often look at this linguistic choice within the domains of language use (Fishman, 1965; Greenfield, 1972; Parasher, 1980), the social network of interlocutors (Gumperz, 1966; Poplack, 1977; Lipski, 1978; Milroy & Li, 1995) and in relation to the languaging process (Scotton & Wanjin, 1983; Myers-Scotton, 1988, 1993), accounting for such societal factors as domain, social network, location, interpersonal relationship, perceived rights and obligations etc. Microanalysis often focuses on patterns and structures of interaction (Schegloff, 1968; Schegloff & Sacks, 1973; Sacks et al., 1974) posing the linkage between the two levels (Fishman, 1971; Auer 1984, 1991, 1995, 1998, 2005; Gafaranga, 1999, 2001, Gafaranga & Torras, 2001; Li, 1994, 2002, 2005; Li & Milroy, 1995, Sebba & Wootton, 1998; Wei, 2004) and at the same time, viewing code choice as a practical, social interaction phenomenon among bilinguals. Shared among these scholars is the social reality regarding factors that determine the choice of linguistic code in bilingual communities. Such concepts as “power”, “authority”, “identity”, “prestige” or “ethnicity” have been used to interpret why and how interactants move from one language to another.

Researchers who study bilingualism and multilingualism address code alternation as a conversational activity and interpret its meaning within the framework of sequential development of interaction (Hasselman, 1970; Clyne, 1985; Gumperz. 1976; Poplack, 1977; Sankoff et al., 1990). Emphasizing identity-related accounts of language alternation, influenced by “language-reflects-society perspective” (Sebba & Wotton, 1998; Cameron, 1990; Gafaranga, 1998, 2001) some researchers argue the conversational structure relates to the social structure insofar as language itself, and social structure and language must not be seen existing outside each other (Gafaranga, 2005). Challenging this “language-reflects-society” approach, others argue for the higher-level social structures and look at the relationship between social identities (ethnicity and group membership) and conversational code-switching (Cashman, 2005), the influence of social roles upon code alternation as a conversational strategy (Williams, 2005) and particularly, the individual acts of speech and interaction (Wei, 2005) as well as the relationship of rational choice and interaction as “programmatically relevant to the talk-in-interaction” (Li, 2005). By and large, code-choice and code-switching have been often examined in relation to social identities which allow interactants to be involved in linguistic “acts of identity” reflecting concepts of group membership or speaking styles. Two of the questions that should be
addressed seriously, according to Auer, are: what kind of identity predicates that the alternating use of language can be index of in conversation and how exactly such an index can be shown to be interpretively relevant (Auer, 2005: 404).

Given that speaking a language is seen as an index of membership of a given social group, the monolingual use of a given language would not be an exception. The tendency of code-choice and code-switching or code-mixing as a speaking style could also be indexes of social membership beyond the memberships indexed by the monolingual variety. This is actually the case with migrant speech communities where interactants very often switch identity when they engage themselves in such hybrid ways of speaking, as Auer shows:

“Migrants may switch (national) identity and become members of the receiving society, giving up their language of origin in the melting pot. Or they may maintain their identity by forming a “language island” which is not only geographically but also socially and ideologically separated from the “main land”: (Auer, 2005: 406)

This study will build on this trend and present an initial observation on the code-choice and code-convergent borrowing in the Vietnamese spoken in Canberra.

**Language contact in Canberra Vietnamese**

Located in the Australian Capital Territory, Tuggeranong and Belconnen are the two areas with a large number of Vietnamese immigrants. The population of Vietnamese in the ACT is approximately 3,000 out of 325,100 of the whole ACT (ABS, 2005). The Vietnamese immigration flow to Canberra was mainly through three stages: the pre-1975 period when immigrants came under the Colombo Scholarship Plan, the refugee settlement after 1975 and the period of family reunion program since the mid 1980s (BIR, 1994, Ho-Dac, 2004). Overall, the Vietnamese community, the new settlers who were Vietnam-born and their offerings, comprise less than 1 % of the population of the ACT. Like any other Vietnamese communities in Australia, the Vietnamese community in the ACT formed a Saturday Vietnamese Language School in Dickson with the number of enrolments of over 200 primary and high school students. Though Vietnamese is the home language of more than 2,694 speakers, it has not yet become the language offered at school as a LOTE subject (Clyne et al., 2004). The usual congregations are often seen at more than 5 Vietnamese language churches and one Buddhist temple both in the North and South sides of Canberra. The Vietnamese community here also have access to most of the Melbourne and Sydney-based daily and weekly newspapers in addition to the daily broadcasts of SBS and Quê Mề radios. In view of communal activities, the community meets together twice or three times a year, mainly during Tet (Lunar New Year holiday), Mid-Autumn Festival and some special events. Due to a number of factors such as, occupational structure (a majority of residents working in the public sectors), geographical locations (one in the North- Belconnen and one in the South side-Tuggeranong) and informal social system, it can be said that the social networks of the Vietnamese in the ACT are weaker than those in Victoria or NSW.

Similar to most of the research on language contact, Vietnamese as a migrant language shows not only how linguistic integration and transference from Vietnamese as a home language into English as the donor language, but also how the cultural identity of the interlocutors as first and second generation immigrants: ethnic identity and national identity (Thai, 2005). Among the manifestations of the linguistic influence of the donor language, Vietnamese in contact has phonetic transference, lexical borrowings as a result of cultural contact and syntactic transference as well as code switching between English and Vietnamese at structural positions which are compatible to both languages (Ho-Dac, 1997, 2004; Thai, 2005). To put it differently, the Viet immigrants have, as our recent studies show, added English on various levels and in different ways to their core linguistic and cultural menu, which remains Vietnamese. This study presents the identities that predicate the code choice in conversations of stable bilinguals whose Vietnamese is more dominant in non-professional domains and then discusses the indexes of such code-convergent borrowings.

**Methodology**

**Data collection**
The geographical area of data collection was Belconnen, an area in the North of Canberra with a diverse population and the number of Vietnamese is about 1,000 which outlines the main concentration of Canberra Vietnamese speakers. Approximately 11 hours of spontaneous interaction was recorded using a tape-recorder with built-in microphone. The field worker was present during the recording sessions and participating in the conversations from time to time while recording information about non-verbal activities. The specific goal was to create a record of local borrowings, loan words, loan blends and loan shifts alongside the language behaviours attached to speech. However, as video-recording was not possible, the field worker was forced to rely on the audio record backed up with his observations.

**Informant characteristics**

Of the 36 speakers, twenty were female and sixteen were male. They live within 20-kilometre radius and range in age from 19 to 58 years, with at least 5 years residence in Australia. Four of the speakers are monolingual and the rest are fluent bilingual speakers, some of whom showed very high fluency in specialized jargon. Because the specific goal is to record code-switching, semi-speakers were excluded, and speakers needed to be fluent enough to discuss at length specific crafts and ways of life. All the interactions before and after the recording were in Vietnamese. The conversations were generally described as free-flowing descriptions and discussions. Also, a number of print media items was used for investigation, and linguistic choice and code-convergence were major points of focus.

**Table 1: Informant characteristics**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Country of birth</th>
<th>Current residence</th>
<th>Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Belconnen</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Belconnen</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Belconnen</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Weetangara</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Belconnen</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Gungalin</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>Belconnen</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Belconnen</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>J</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Belconnen</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Dickson</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Gungalin</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Gungalin</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>O’ Corner</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>Tuggeranong</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Weetangara</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Q</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Dickson</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>R</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Macquarie</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Belconnen</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Kaleen</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Tuggeranong</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Kaleen</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Bruce</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Dunlop</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Dunlop</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Z</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Bruce</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>ZA</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Belconnen</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Transcription
The transcriptions include a record of nearly 23 conversations, and every instance of each substantive utter was also recorded. In order to record the full range of configurations of each lexical item all that was recorded was transcribed in its original form. Reliability tests were conducted with a research assistant to ensure the validity of the raw data.

Examples and analysis
Code-choice and code-switching as indexes of ethnicity and group membership
Over the last decades, the conversational analysis approach has proven the linkage between code-switching and the macro-social structure (Fishman et al., 1971; Blom & Gumperz, 1972; Gumperz, 1982). While some scholars try to look at code-switching in relation to the organization of on-going talk (Li, 2002), others points out the dialectical relationship between the social structure and conversational structure (Gafaranga, 2005). In its turn, social structure in terms of group membership and ethnic identities are constituted, ascribed, contested or accepted through conversational interactions (Schegloff, 1997; Cashman, 2005). In this section, we examine the process through which the choice of linguistic code is made through our data.

Consider extract 151:
The interaction occurs at a coffee shop in Belconnen area.
2. F:  
(Yes, Vietnamese. Hello, Mam.)
3. J:  
(Vietnamese. Hello, Mam.)
4. (o)
5. F: Có cà phê sữa Việt Nam không? (Have you got Vietnamese coffee with milk?)
6. K: Đa có, anh. Anh uống đã hay nóng? (Yes, we have. Would you like it hot or with ice?)
7. F: Iced dì. Trơi lạnh uống iced cùng hay làm. (With ice, please. Good to drink it with ice in cold weather.)
8. J: Thời, cho tui hot black dì. Có gì ăn giờ không chi? (Well, let me have hot black coffee, please. Have you got anything to eat now?)

51 Transcription conventions for this paper:
Plain text: English original
Italics: Vietnamese original
/text/: overlapping talk
(o): gap in talk
(text): English translation
(hhh) laughter
The use of names as a form of addressing oneself is translated as “I”
In this interaction, with a traditional analysis based on “we/they code” dichotomy, we might claim that K started the conversation by using English as “they code” to address the customers (F and J). However the interaction was continued in Vietnamese (from turn 2 onwards), which indicates the fact that through code-choice the speakers are affirming their social identity or “talking into being” social structure or group membership (Li, 2002; Cashman, 2005). In view of Auer’s differentiation (1984) between discourse-related and participant-related language alternation, one might assume that this code-switching (from turn 2) accounts for the participants’ language preference based upon their linguistic competence or dominance. However, this is not the case, as it was proven in previous research (Shin & Milroy, 2000; Cashman, 2005). Our observations, however, indicate that though both F and J are highly English fluent (the use of “ice” and “hot black” in turns 6 and 7, and in the extract that follows), their preferred language here is English. It might be well said that by doing this code-choice, the interactants would, for one point, categorize themselves as bilinguals and in another, disaffiliate themselves as the group of “English-dominant speakers” where in the context of the coffee shop, there are other Anglo-Australian customers around.

Consider Extract 2:

F and J are joined by A, N and ZD. They are talking about Vietnamese video shows.

   (You guys often view video CDs made overseas? Like “Paris by Night”, “Van Son”, “Asia”?)
2. A: À, nên mả cói... er... live, thì A thích coi giống mấy người ở Việt Nam hơn. Còn er...er... nên mả coi biểu diễn ở TV er... thì A thích coi “Paris by Night” hay là “Asia” hơn, vì cái cách nó quay phim hà, nó hay hơn.
   (Er... if viewing shows er... live, then I prefer viewing sorts of live shows in Vietnam. But if viewing on TV er..., then I like viewing “Paris by Night” or “Asia” more, ‘cause the way they film them is much more interesting.)
3. ZD: Nhưng mà máy cái cách nó biểu diễn ở Việt Nam hà, nó hơn ... corny, right?
   (But the way they perform in Vietnam, eh, is a bit corny, right?)
4. F: Yeah, corny.../hhh/
5. A: /hhh/
6. J: /hhh/
7. N: /hhh/
8. ZD: /hhh/ yeah... với lại trình diễn nó cũng không hay bằng ... giống như máy cái máy bằng “Paris by Night”...
   (Moreover, their performance is not better than...er... like “Paris by Night”.)
9. J: Máy cái bằng như “Paris by Night” nó trình diễn máy cái hài hà...thi mình có thể relate hơ, còn bên kia nó biểu diễn hà, đúng nhiều cái văn chương mà mình Hồng có hiểu được...(hhh)
   (The video tapes like “Paris by Night”, its comedies er... are more related to us. But over there (Vietnam) they perform using a lot of literary language that we can’t understand.)
10. N: /hhh/ Yeah, em cũng thích coi “Vân Sơn” nữa. Nó cũng hay...
    (Yeah, I like viewing “Van Son”, too. It’s interesting.)
11. A: Mà, ca sĩ người Việt hát tiếng Anh à, cái giọng của họ không có dùng hà...mà chac người Việt ngoé... chắc lòng có sao đâu, nhưng mình nghe hà... thấy hơi kỳ à.
    (But, about the Vietnamese singers singing English songs, their accents aren’t correct; but the Vietnamese listen to them, it may not be a problem. And for us, it’s a bit strange.)
12. F: /yeah/
13. ZD: /yeah/
15. F: Ừ, chắc tại mình nghe cái bài đá tiêng Anh rồi...hà, rồi mình so sánh với original singers hà... cho nên mình nói: “oh, that song isn’t...er...as good as we first heard it, you know?”
   (Yes. Perhaps we had heard a song sung in English already, right? Then we compare it with original singers and we might say: “Oh, that song isn’t... er... as good as we first heard it, you know?”)

Page 707
Three co-participants are making comments on the concepts of “fairness” in relationship. The fourth person who is older than those three suddenly appears.

1. ZD: Sao người ta nói quan hệ bè với người Úc song phẳng hơn quan hệ với người Việt?
   (Why do people say the relationship within Aussie groups are fairer than that with the Vietnamese?)

2. I: Song phằng er..?
   (“Song phằng”..er what?)

3. ZD: Song phằng là “fair”dơ! Như là, giống như bèn Mỹ, khi ZD đi ra ăn với mấy người bạn thân ấy, thì một người dùng đầy trả tiền hết thôi. Xong rồi, lần sau thì người khác, vài thời. Khi mà ZD đi chơi với mấy người Tây phương, ZD không thích ngồi lại, rồi phải chia tiền này; nó làm cho tinh bàn sứt mẻ, không được năm giữ như mấy đứa bạn Việt Nam. Tài vi, ZD nghĩ là cái vài để tiền bác nó... nó... nó có khi lại là a big obstacle in relationship. Nhưng mà mình don’t it be that way, it would be better, you know?
   (“Song phằng” is “being fair”. Like in the US, when I eat out with some of my close friends, then only one person stands up and pays it all. Then the next time, another will do it. That’s it. When I go out with Westerners, I don’t like to sit down and then divide the bill... Just breaks down the friendship, not being so close to each other as with Vietnamese guys. ‘Cause I think that money matters are ... are sometimes a big obstacle in relationship. But... but if we don’t let it be that way, it would be better, you know?)

Then Q. suddenly appears. He just sits down at the table and listens to the conversation.

   (I also lived with Westerners. Everything is shared in halves completely)

5. ZD: Chia phân nửa. (hhh)
   i. (Shared in halves)

6. I: Giống như hồi mình ở chung với mấy người Úc khác ha, họ cũng như vài đố. Có mấy người có anh hưởng Asia, họ cũng hiểu cách song bên bên, rồi mình share với nhau. Mà cái người mình ở bây giờ, thì cái gì cũng phân nửa hết trọn ha. Nếu mà ia xài bở câu her, she nói nên mà ia xài hết phải mua lại. Cái đó ia thấy lành lẽ ông quạ ha.
   (Like the time I lived with other Australians, they were the same that way. Some people are influenced by Asia, they understand the way of life over there and share things together. But with the person who I live with, everything is divided into halves. If I use her butter, she says, if I use it up, I have to buy again. That thing, I see it’s too cold)

7. T: Tôi lại thích cái đó. Nhưng mà lúc nào mình cũng trả tiền, người ta lại nói ..nhưng mà người ta không có tiền, rồi không có bao được mình... thì cái đó mới break cái friendship. Nhưng mà lúc nào cũng...Tôi không thích cái expectation là lúc nào mình cũng phải trả, you know?
   (But I like that. But if we must always pay and they just say... they say that they don’t
have money to treat us, it’s just breaks up friendship. But if all the times… I just don’t like the expectation that we must always pay, you know?)

8. ZD: Anh cửa ZD thì nói là … anh cũng có thấy nhiều quyền lợi của những cái Western culture, you know. Nếu mà mình đi không chịu trả thì sẽ bị lỗ…. Minh bị lỗ, xong rồi, bạn bè đe dọa nhau. Còn mấy cái Western culture nó.. nó very song phẳng, nó lấy down to the sense, down to the thing...
(My brother said that he saw a lot of benefits of the Western culture, you know? If we don’t agree to pay, we lose. We lose and friends easily get quarrels. But the sorta Western culture, it’s … it’s very fair, but down to the sense, down to the thing…)

In this interaction, there is a high tendency of code-switching from turn 3 when ZD enters. Our observation shows that though the co-participants are not highly Vietnamese fluent they all somewhat successfully resist against the ascription of a lack of Vietnamese competence. Other than that, within the Vietnamese diaspora, it is a widely held belief that children should be encouraged to maintain the mother tongue as a way to maintain the culture. In this situation, the interactants cooperate very well not to do the code-switching for a while (from turn 4 onwards). However, the degree of code-convergent borrowings begins at turn 7 with some lexical and discourse marker borrowings. Likewise, in another case from our corpus where the interaction among young co-participants was going on in English, the appearance of a participant of the same age, did not either create a code-switch. As such, we would argue that regardless of who interlocutors are, the identities that they do in interaction rely on the expected ascription to the interlocutors themselves apart from the linguistic, facilitator and group identities as mentioned. In this extract, the co-participants overtly reject the social structures that ascribe themselves to being "westernized", which constitutes an “oppositional social identity (Cashman, 2005).

Linguistic aspects of code-convergent borrowing

Similar to previous studies on code-borrowing, we focussed on categorizing the data when lexical items are partially or wholly integrated phonologically (Dubois & Sankoff, 1997, Poplack, Sankoff &Milier, 1998, Ho-Dac, 1997, 2004, Thai, 2005). With the exclusion of proper nouns, the corpus consists of 867 lexical items, 12.7% of the corpus. In its turn, the number of phonologically integrated loan words- those pronounced with Canberra Vietnamese accent and prosody or tonemic transference, is 387 or 45% of the total loan words, and the number of non-phonologically integrated loan words is 480 or 55% of the loan words. However, a salient feature from this corpus is that the younger participants are, the less phonologically integrated their code borrowing becomes; and the more distant the interpersonal relationship is, the more apparent the degree of code-convergent borrowing becomes. Other than that, as to the type of lexical category borrowed, the corpus shows the same borrowing hierarchy with nouns being the most frequently borrowed (Ho-Dac, 2004, Thai, 2005), and conjunctions the least. Except for a number of lexical items with semantic expansion or those used compromissingly, the tendency of this linguistic integration appears to enhance conversational coherence and in a broader sense, be a response to the demands of the new society where the 1.5 generation speakers would make themselves to be more functional and attached to the recipient society. As such, while code-convergent borrowing would add new layers to their traditional linguistic and social identities and ultimately their cultural menu, there is a threat that some of Vietnamese lexical counterparts appear to be fading from use, as the corpus shows. However, since language choice among bilingual speakers must be seen as an activity in its own right (Gafaranga, 2004), particularly, when the donor language is pragmatically dominant, the motivation for borrowing in bilingual conversations could also be claimed as based on a hierarchy of pragmatic detachability- for the lexical items that are detachable from the content of the utterance but serve to organize the ongoing talk (Matras, 1988; Fuller, 2001).

Concluding remarks

As it stands, the paper has revisited the relationship between the conversational structure and social structure in code-choice and code-convergent borrowing among bilingual interlocutors. The discussion has shown that linguistic “acts of identity” in bilingual interactions in this study reflect such concepts as linguistic, social and cultural identities. Seen from this perspective, we would contend that while socially integrating into the new receiving society, bilingual migrants in Canberra are apt to
maintain their traditional linguistic and cultural behaviours, but at the same time, to effect integration via language use, which forms a "language island" that is linguistically and ideologically different from the language used in their home land. This direction would therefore call for an acceptance of possible loss of lexical counterparts in the first language and this "social schizophrenia" should be expected accordingly when any solution between extremes would mean a loss of one identity without gaining another (Auer, 2005). Going for or against this tendency, colloquial Vietnamese as a migrant language is more and more distantly varied from the standard colloquial Vietnamese spoken in the mainland.

References


Greenfield, L. (1972). Situational measures of normative language views in relation to person, place


Thai, B.D. (2005). Preliminary observations on Vietnamese as a “migrant language. In: Papers from the 15th meeting of the Southeast Asian Linguistics Society, Research School of Asia Pacific Studies, ANU.


Cultural agelessness: An exploration of the cultural influences related to age within a case study

Paul Throssell
University of Tasmania

Abstract
This paper is a critical discourse analyzing the lived effects of perceived power relationships involving local ethnographic influences. Particular emphasis is related to epiphanous life experiences within a restricted Tasmanian Aboriginal environment and their effects on age-related behaviour. The interactions of change, identity and the role of adversity in developing agelessness characteristics is also discussed.

These agelessness characteristics, referred to as identity resources, emerge from the experiences that emanated from life in an island setting. This paper arises from a completed PhD study into agelessness and its relationship to lifelong learning. Agelessness, for the purpose of the study, was regarded as being demonstrated by a person who conducts their life in ways that are not chronologically age stereotypical in relation to the culture they live in. This may include exhibiting behaviours, and holding attitudes and values that do not follow cultural perceptions pertaining to age.

Research Overview
Chronological age, being a measurement of age based on the amount of time lived, has widespread societal usage. In our culture it is a social construct often used for societal organisation purposes (Settersten and Mayer 1997, Whitton 2001), such as a guide for school grading or in regard to retirement age. However, the use of chronological age can be restrictive in a variety of ways. Viewing individuals in age-stereotypical ways has been suggested as a key contributing factor in inter-generational conflict (Neugarten 1972, Longman 1986, Biggs 1993, Dychtwald 1999). Also, age limitations on the way our lives are conducted may have important implications for the role of learning during the whole of our lives.

In all societies the concept of chronological ageing brings with it cultural perceptions. Chronological age has application in all cultures in terms of expectations of acceptable behaviours and values to be exhibited at particular ages, especially older ages (Amoss and Harrell 1981). In effect this creates stereotypes from which it is difficult to deviate, causing individuals to become ‘culture-bound’ (Sargent, Nilan and Winter 1997).

The influence of culture has a paramount effect on both the individual and on society. Krieken et al (2000, p.6) maintain that:

Culture shapes our view of the world, influencing the assumptions we have about who we are, our location in the cosmos and how we should relate to other people. The ways in which we think and feel, the outlook we have on life and the feelings we give to situations are all located within the culture in which we are reared.

A person is restricted in behaviour and values by cultural expectations (Sargent et al 1997). One illustration is that an individual's concept of retirement might change their behaviour, mind-set, sense of self-worth and perceptions of their ability to attempt new challenges, leading to the “You can't teach an old dog new tricks” thinking often suggested in common usage. Furthermore, according to Amoss and Harrell (1981, p.3):

Every known society has a named social category of people who are old – chronologically, physiologically, or generationally. In every case these people have different rights, duties, privileges, and burdens from those enjoyed or suffered by their juniors.
Cultural perceptions relating to chronological age would, therefore, appear to continue to limit involvement in learning throughout life. Some people, nevertheless, appear to conduct their lives in ways that are not age-stereotypical. These people, of any age, may be regarded as attaining and demonstrating agelessness characteristics. The term agelessness has been chosen, partly because it has been discussed in recent literature (Kaufman 1986, Andrews 1999, 2000, Bytheway 2000), and also as it is commonly used within social settings as a word relating to age in a non-classifying way. The Oxford English Dictionary (1989, p.247) defines the word agelessness as “The quality of being ageless. Without old age or limits of duration; never waxing old or coming to an end”. However, in relation to characteristics such as behaviour, attitudes and values in modern usage or in the literature related to an individual, the meaning of the term agelessness is not clearly identifiable.

The purpose of this completed doctoral study was to investigate the concept of agelessness. Once it elaborated on an understanding of the characteristics of agelessness, and situated context influences such as home or institutions, it considered further whether there was a relationship between agelessness and lifelong learning.

The choice of the term agelessness for this study enables exploration of concepts related to age. For the purposes of the current investigation a person who is perceived to have agelessness qualities is proposed as: A person who conducts their life in ways that are not chronologically age stereotypical in relation to the culture they live in. This may include exhibiting behaviours, and holding attitudes and values that do not follow cultural perceptions pertaining to age.

The study also ascertained influences on attaining or developing characteristics of agelessness, in particular critical life events such as epiphanies. Denzin (2001, p.34) defines epiphanies as “interactional moments that leave marks on people’s lives… having had such a moment the person is never the same again”. These moments of enlightenment, that change a life, for the purposes of this study, are also described as turning points.

An exploration of the concept of agelessness and associated attitudes to age, and in particular the relationship between agelessness and lifelong learning would be beneficial to deeper understanding of ageing issues. This is particularly relevant in consequence of the effect that increased longevity has on the role of learning during the whole of our lives. Insights into the processes that may contribute to an agelessness mind-set, and consideration of any linkage to lifelong learning, may assist in encouraging and facilitating individuals of any age to choose to improve their social wellbeing by understanding and restricting negative age-related influences.

A major part of the study involved conducting biographical case study life histories of subjects perceived to display agelessness characteristics, that emerged from earlier stages of the study. The later part of the study focused upon concept development and understanding of agelessness, as well as adaptation to learning through the learning practices of the subjects as demonstrated by their described experiences.

One of the in-depth biographical case studies in this study, was Auntie. What follows is based upon an extended narrative of Auntie’s life experiences, and emphasises her childhood experiences as an indigenous Tasmanian Aborigine, in particular, related to age and agelessness. Her emphasis on her response to her childhood experiences contrasts with other views at the time. Auntie’s responses to her life experiences, particularly on an island setting regarded by the government of the day as an Aboriginal reserve, are further commented upon in relation to perceived identity resources of agelessness.

A range of characteristics of agelessness emerged from the case studies. These lived personality characteristics are regarded as identity resources for use in promoting or responding to changes within or outside of an individual’s perceived locus of control. A key attribute underlying agelessness is that the subjects’ identity includes seeing themselves as having qualities that have become potential resources. Characteristics demonstrated by the subjects in response to life experiences are viewed as identity resources (Falk and Kilpatrick 2000). The concept of identity resources is adapted from
Falk and Kilpatrick’s (2000, p.101) “cognitive and affective attributes”, such as self-confidence and trust, which can be utilised in interactions with others. Identity resources are personality characteristics accessible for use.

In this study, identity resources are personality characteristics utilised as personal resources and influenced by, understood through, and played out in response to, an experience. Identity resources are prevailing characteristics that an individual can derive and utilise. For example, utilisation of positive thinking, and acceptance of others are identity resources.

Auntie’s narrative discusses her response to her childhood environment and epiphanies arising from that time. Views of others to that environment are also discussed. The difference in understandings of that environment between Auntie and those reporting on the environment are incorporated within the narrative. Despite the perceived powerlessness of the situation for its inhabitants, including needing to ask the government for permission to travel from the island, Auntie’s development, focused in this paper towards age and agelessness is examined in detail.

**Auntie’s journey: “It’s a long road you walk along”**

I’d like to wash clothes in the trough, you know, wring them out and peg them on the line. That was our way. Not washing machines. I’d like to go camping. Watch the kangaroos come out at night. I can't do it now. I've got a machine that side and that side, and an emergency button that side. I'd look fine wouldn't I? I'd be a real trumped up modern Aboriginal, I think I would call myself.

Throughout her story, Auntie stands out as a life that has been unrestricted by chronological age while encompassing, and adapting to, radically differing life circumstances. Changes occur between an ethno-cultural childhood background, which in her view is consistent with the traditions of the Tasmanian Aboriginal culture, and an adult Australian city life. Auntie never attended high school, and left primary school at 13 after a childhood in a natural setting on a small island designated as an Aboriginal reserve, and yet eventually she earned widespread general respect leading to an honorary university degree while in her seventies. I wondered what was the pathway from a start to life in a small community on an isolated island, as part of an Aboriginal community that the state government denied as existing, to the public recognition denoted by the bestowing of a high academic award.

On being asked what agelessness meant to her, Auntie used the metaphor of a road as she replied spontaneously that “It’s a long road you walk along, you know you never get old. You’re never going to get old. You're never going to feel old. That’s what I feel like. I’m not going to feel old”. Auntie’s view of age, agelessness, and learning emerges through her narrative. Experiences of life, and in particular the influences of her life’s epiphanies, impact on the development of her identity. Auntie’s narrative focuses on events, particularly epiphanous events, their situated contexts and her responses to the occurrences. Perceived effects on her, both in the short term and in a longer perspective of her life, are discussed through demonstrated personality characteristics.

Our interviews were held in Auntie’s house, minimally furnished though comfortable, but showing few souvenirs of the experiences of her life. Auntie’s calmness and quiet energy pervaded our discussions, her voice rose only as she made an emphatic point about one of the topics she felt so strongly about. Her complexion is fresh and natural, though she admits to using face cream to “stop the dry rot from setting in”. Her belief in being authentic in life extends to the physical appearance of not colouring her hair: “I don’t put dye in my hair because it’s going grey. I want it to go grey”. This, I think, represents Auntie’s attitude towards her belief in living life genuinely and not being concerned about the judgement of others relating to this physical sign often equated with age.

Auntie’s story starts with powerful and poetic memories of her childhood. This is not surprising, as some of these experiences she describes as being catalysts for actions in the rest of her life. Initially I interpreted her story more literally, as one of overcoming
modest beginnings leading eventually to winning respect from the non-Aboriginal community for her contributions to the Aboriginal community. I have been inspired by her struggle to overcome what I view as adversity. Her narrative confronts her hard times and incorporates learning from her experiences of life, through the filter of her positive view of life. The way she views herself in terms of characteristics such as determination, the need to be involved, and a continuing passion for life has assisted her to respond positively to life events in different life contexts and settings.

Her humble and unemotional descriptions of her involvement in assisting her Tasmanian Aboriginal community to value and develop identity, through assisting young people and being a prominent member of Aboriginal policy-making groups, are an illustration of her constructive attitude towards life circumstances that were often hostile to racial matters. Her open and positive attitude in this element of her life is in stark contrast to the negativity of enforced segregationist policies. Furthermore, a symbolic example of difference could be inferred from her experience of being treated as a scientific curiosity in a study by an anthropologist on the island’s inhabitants during her childhood, and her description of the personal and communal indignities of having physiological features examined.

**Epiphanies: “You’ve known all your life what you are”**

A number of epiphanies (Denzin 2001), indicating impactful transitional life elements, have had a significant effect on Auntie’s life. The epiphanies I have identified are mentioned in general order of the importance Auntie placed on the particular events and depth and feeling of discussion in our conversations. The epiphanies referred to are discussed later within the context of the narrative. In her childhood she emphasises two turning point moments, which I view as affecting her lifelong involvement with the Tasmanian Aboriginal community. Firstly, an epiphany was the visit for scientific purposes by an anthropologist to her home on Cape Barren Island, where he conducted racially-based physiological examinations on Auntie and other islanders. Also at this stage of her childhood, a second epiphany can be identified in her visits to Aboriginal ‘old people’ (her term). This epiphany was influential in her later responses to age and development of characteristics related to agelessness. Further important epiphanies emerging in Auntie’s childhood were a third one relating to a classroom incident involving a poem, that influenced her attitude to learning, and a fourth epiphany, her mother’s response to specific instances of misfortune at the time of a polio epidemic, strengthening Auntie’s resolve to act in a positive, affective and giving manner in her life interactions with others. Auntie also discussed an event later in her life, which to me becomes evident as a further, and fifth, epiphany, when she was asked – and chose – to foster Aboriginal Wards of the State children.

**Childhood context: “The open road to happiness”**

Auntie’s story began with descriptions of her childhood spent on Cape Barren Island, a small island utilised as an Aboriginal Reserve from 1912 to 1951. In contradiction to its existence, the Tasmanian government decreed that there weren’t any surviving Aborigines at that time (Ryan 1996). In the government’s view Truganinni, the last Aborigine, died in 1876, creating the paradox of a government establishing an Aboriginal Reserve when simultaneously promulgating the view that no Aborigines were held to be living. Ryan (1996, p.3) refers to this as, “The myth of extermination”. Auntie has contended with this myth throughout her life in being labelled as Aboriginal, while simultaneously having her existence and heritage as an Aborigine denied.

There is an interesting interplay between Auntie’s memories and official reports of Cape Barren Island. While describing the same place, they present different perspectives. Furthermore, her historical descriptions evoked in me, a white person, a mixture of emotions from anger and sadness at the way the Aboriginal people were often treated, to a sense of wonderment at the warmth of human spirit displayed in the events and
environment described by Auntie.

She commenced her account of her own life by describing recollections of a 1930s childhood within a community separated from many everyday characteristics of the outside world. Throughout the interviews, the lived experiences of what she viewed as the rich and diverse life style of her childhood were regarded as positive lessons to be utilised as the basis for negotiating changes and later events in her life.

To find in her narrative the constant reference to a lost but seemingly idyllic existence was not my expectation. Even if I took account of the beneficial views of past memories, in essence a mythologising of childhood experiences, there still remained to me a composite of the affirmative verbal pictures Auntie gave of her life on the island. Common beliefs in values such as compassion, togetherness, and sharing seemed to predominate in her descriptions of life, over the difficulties of a likely frugal existence from the described scarcity of material benefits and the narrow range of foods.

Auntie’s admiration for the life style of her childhood is evident. She pronounced that it was “…wonderful the way we lived”. The pattern of a childhood that owed little to distractions from outside the island, and was portrayed by her as demonstrating a simplicity and connectedness between the inhabitants and the natural world of life on an exposed Bass Strait island, was described by Auntie in autobiographical writings in these glowing terms:

We lived on an island of peace without fear of the outside world coming in and turning our lives around in those days. In the midst of the mainland turbulence, this little island shone upon the waters of Bass Strait like an oasis in the desert. We only had to look at Cape Barren to see the open road to happiness … In our minds were a feeling of admiration for the moon, the stars, the sea and flight of birds, for the glow of flowers, and the sound of wind as it passed through the trees, waves gently lapping the rocks.

This description inspires me as a mythic or symbolic representation of a way of life in tune with natural elements, which Auntie views as traditional. Again she utilises the metaphor of a road, this time in envisioning the island of her childhood.

This view was also surprising to me, as Auntie paints a picture of the Cape Barren Island Reserve that is in contrast to the Western world’s reconstruction of the Tasmanian indigenous settlement history. This is often viewed as one more step in a dark and tragic history of Tasmanian Aboriginal people that had begun with European colonisation of Tasmania, or as it was originally known, Van Diemens Land. The killing by intent or imported disease of so many of the Aboriginal population of Tasmania was so severe that a people, who it is thought inhabited in isolation for 10,000 years, was reduced from 50,000 to 7000 in less than a hundred years (Reynolds 1995). This was followed by a fateful move to Wybelenna on Flinders Island in 1835 (Ryan 1996), and further degradation and loss of life for the native people.

Furthermore, her autobiographical writings describe how the seal traders of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries affected survival, after initial trading cooperation descended into dishonourable actions as the sealers, “…raided the clans, abducted women and killed the men who tried to protect them”. From the Aboriginal women who comprised part of the sealing community, mutton birding, in Auntie’s view a more traditional Aboriginal custom, was developed, thereby superseding sealing as seal numbers diminished.

Auntie described to me the continuation of the Tasmanian Aboriginal culture as demonstrated by island life at the time of her childhood in the 1930s, without malice or regret for what had occurred to her ancestors. She recalled her lifestyle being simple, perhaps strongly affected by the economic position of her family and the community generally. An income of five shillings per week, half of the amount given to white families at the time, sufficed for essentials, while the staple foods were obtained from the island. Nevertheless, she recalled leisure pursuits such as sports days, dances, horse races and even blindfold races with the participants losing a sense of direction and crashing into physical obstacles such as bushes, trees and spectators.

Auntie negotiated her identity through her experiences as part of the Aboriginal community on the island. Despite financial limitations, the sense of togetherness
amongst the inhabitants was marked. Throughout our interviews Auntie referred to the community life on Cape Barren Island in positive terms. Epiphanies such as the visit of the anthropologist, despite its negative impact, also brought a sense of being different together. Her mother’s response to the adversity of community polio illness and the visits to the old people of the community are occurrences Auntie brought to mind that also involve a sense of community. Other instances, such as the careful preparations for the social events discussed, were community happenings that allowed the expression of feelings of specialness through difference, as well as of mutual respect. She told me that the experiences of her childhood inculcated a sense of identity with other Tasmanian Aboriginal people, “We knew who we were. I think the pride …was instilled in us”.

Ryan (1996) refers to observations made on government-initiated visits, in contrast to the sense of community Auntie describes, consistently noting what was judged to be a basic level of physical living conditions. Included was Burbury’s (1929 as cited in Ryan 1996, p.245) assertions that:

How they live is a mystery…In the settlement there are about twenty-four dwellings, more than half mere shacks of two rooms: some contain four rooms and about as many three rooms. Into these are crowded 200-250 men, women and children…they have an inferiority complex deeply ingrained, and they hate whites, regarding themselves as having been supplanted and exploited by white men.

The description would be judged as being far from idyllic in some people’s terms of living conditions. However, for Auntie, her view of traditional practices of the island was developed through the process of community life and her identification with the life practices involved in this environment during her childhood.

Auntie’s descriptions of the warmth of human interactions and communal sharing within the Tasmanian Aboriginal group emphasises a different perspective of life from Burbury’s described starkness of living conditions. Her emphasis on affective elements of the lifestyle is meaningful to her in contradiction to the analytical government account.

A turning point in her childhood on the island, one that led her to a lifelong striving for public recognition of a Tasmanian Aboriginal culture, was being one of the subjects of a scientific study by an anthropologist. The decisive experience, which Auntie regarded as degrading, occurred both during the field work and through categorised photographs in the report. She described to me her personal recollections of the human characteristics of some of the individuals, not evident in the sombre two-dimensional black and white ‘mug shots’ taken for the study.

She discussed her sense of resentment and disgust at the indignities of the study and what the study represented. Her anger is apparent from the humiliation of those times so clearly remembered. As she recounted in her autobiographical writings:

I can remember as a young teenager getting undressed and standing in line with boys while the scientists examined us. I was very embarrassed. We were taught never to expose our bodies to the opposite sex. Even when we went swimming we had to keep our bodies covered with a top. I was well developed at 13 years old. I cried all the time, I wasn’t the only one who had their head measured, looked up nose, in ears, structure of cheek bone, hair, fingers, toes recorded. Did we have four fingers and one thumb on hands, toes on our feet?

The symbolism of this mistreatment is reflected through her intuitive understanding, evident to me from graphic images evoked by her description of the recalled events. She gave two examples, the first being the government approved anthropological study, where she further emphasised to me her feelings of being looked down upon, and the slights of caste labelling from the experience. “I thought someday we gotta get up here, you know. I just thought, yes we can get to the top you know, we can make something of ourselves”. The second example occurred when politicians arrived from the Tasmanian mainland at voting time and threw boiled unwrapped lollies in the dirt for the children to squabble over. She told me that she never scrambled for them. These actions can be viewed symbolically as representative of a governing system’s views of the Tasmanian Aboriginal people.

Her recall of what she believes are the most crucial and influential experiences of the
time led her to develop underlying tenets of a personal belief system. A tenet is regarded in this study as the underlying basis for a belief system. This system was not based upon a ferment of hate and bitterness, which might have been the result of such confronting experiences, but upon the softer rebellion of development of directed personal and human values. In some people the experiences of racial segregation from the rest of Tasmania might have created negative responses to the inferred, and often explicit, messages being promoted in incidents such as those described. Residual attitudes of fear, anger and even self-destructive behaviour, with accompanying feelings of low self-worth, could have been a long-term manifestation of the low expectations of teachers and public figures, and other social messages given. However, for Auntie, her time on the island was crucial and influential in leading her to develop a range of personal beliefs. These beliefs accentuated the development of values, developed despite, and perhaps because of, the confronting experiences she faced.

Her mother influenced this development by modelling actions in assisting others throughout her childhood. Auntie believes that her recall of her mother’s actions was influential upon her own actions. This impacted most strongly at the time of what I see as an epiphany, relating to a polio epidemic on the island. A repeated theme of Auntie’s life is her displayed determination, and she admired this demonstrated quality in her mother in response to the crisis. Auntie explained that her mother’s involvement as midwife in the community necessitated one room of their small crowded house (Auntie is one of twelve children, with ten initially surviving from infancy) being kept for birthing. At the time of the polio epidemic her mother’s method of looking after those suffering was particularly memorable for Auntie. Despite her father’s admonitions of “What about your own children, they’ll get it”, her mother continued to help. Auntie recalled this with pride in her voice. “Nothing could stop her from doing things you know, she was so determined”.

Auntie’s strong attachment to her mother and her mother’s reaction to this experience of adversity during Auntie’s childhood was transformational in responses to difficult times in her own life. Auntie’s mother influentially modelled characteristics such as giving, of her time, materially with food, or caring through using her nursing skills to look after others as well as through mid-wifely practice. Also, determination was evident in recalled events, and prominent in her declared perception of her mother.

An epiphany experienced by Auntie related to the interactional occurrences with the old people of the community. She recalled that she was the only child who shared time consistently with them. She was fascinated by the people and their stories and would, she said, sit and listen without interruption. These stories would often last past dark and result in her being walked home by complaining older children of the house she had been visiting. She declared to me a love of the “…way they [the old people] spoke, their lingo that they used”, and how she felt important just being there while other children were out playing. Her representation of the atmosphere of those listening times was evocative as she confided that:

I’d have to go and watch Uncle Clarence and Aunt Fanny talking. I’d have to go round to Athie and Florry’s, listen to them arguing, I’d have to go up to Aunty Kilma’s where she’d be going, “tut, tut, tut” and smoking the old pipe. You know things like that fascinate me.

Auntie’s identity was influenced by these interactions. As she concisely said, of the old people, “They were our professors”. Perhaps at the time there was a growing feeling of specialness at being a Tasmanian Aborigine. The seeds of a potential influence on future events in her life were sown. She maintained that, “…you know who you are here, you don’t have to get up on a soapbox and sing out and scream, look I’m Aboriginal, because you’ve known all your life what you are”.

By her maintaining, “You know what you are,” Auntie expresses the clarity of understanding of her identity. Living in a community during her childhood where people identified as Tasmanian Aborigines clearly assisted her in creating and establishing her identity as part of that community. There is no resistance demonstrated to the establishment of this identity, just an acceptance and, I feel, a sense of pride in her assertion that, “You’ve known all your life what you are”.
Her future actions, focused on assisting Tasmanian Aboriginal people in need, had their origins in the grounding of Aboriginal identity in the times spent visiting the older members of the community. She confirmed her view of the linkage between her Aboriginal identity and the influence of the old people, when she reflected that, “Maybe from them I got what I am today… I think from those old people I think I learned a lot and I think its been installed in me and its been there all these years”.

Auntie believes strongly in the importance of learning. Her state education finished at age thirteen, though she regarded herself as an excellent school student, and formal education only re-appeared in her life many years later. The learning she advocates as having the most effect upon her is, “What makes the world go round, people in it, the way they act”. Her outlook of learning most from experiences of life is primarily directed towards informal learning, such as the oral learning from the ‘professors’, the ‘old people’ mentioned earlier.

**Age and agelessness: “I’m still a young old age”**

Auntie’s view on age is strongly influenced by her childhood island reflections. As she told me:

…growing up on the island if a person is fifty they had to be an old person. It was almost time to die. They had to be old. Oh yes, tottery, not being able to think, not being able to do anything for themselves. They had to be fifty.

This description of island people reveals her apprehension at the possibility of infirmity and death at what she considers such a young age. Auntie discloses that she doesn’t feel restricted by her chronological age in the way she lives her life. Currently, when pressed, she comments on feeling about 40 or 50 years of age, obviously not the 50 she observed on the island, but she is not conscious of age. She was 77 years of age at the time of the interviews,

Her attitude towards her own age is influenced by observations of aged people who are:

…a lot younger than me and I notice that they keep repeating themselves…I went to a lady on Friday and she’s, I think, she’s about five or six years younger than me, and yet she looked twice the age, maybe I look at them people and think well I’m not going to be like them.

This example illustrates how she develops and refines her identity in terms of age. She distinguishes her characteristics, relating to perception of age, from her comparison of someone else’s in terms of both physical and behavioural attributes. She declared:

I shouldn’t have to think old, I shouldn’t have to be old and I know I’m on a walking stick but I can’t help that but because I’m like that and I am my age, it doesn’t affect me at all. I don’t look at it as being old. I’m still a young old age I think.

I think that this is not a denial of her age but an understanding that she can make choices relating to the way she lives at any age. She doesn’t believe that age matters in the way life is lived, and commented to me that she thought it is possible to live to 150 years of age. Her son, when he became 60, asked whether that made her feel old and received a reply that, “…because you’re 60, I don’t have to be old”.

She refers to inter-generational conflict of the older condemning the younger and thinks this is negatively judgmental: “I think maybe this is why I don’t feel old, that I can relate to them. I don’t think they look at me as though I’m old. No they don’t seem to treat me as though I’m an old woman”.

I wondered whether her view of age and agelessness affects her view of death. Her narrative discussed many changes and difficulties encountered and throughout these she would appear to have displayed a resilient and focused attitude towards acceptance of change. She declared that, “I don’t have any changes …I accept things”. 
Response to change: “The heart that loves is always young”

Throughout her narrative it was clear that there is embedded a sense of cultural involvement and identity of greater complexity. The complex nature of her relationship to the Aboriginal community is underlined by this need for authentication of the cultural experiences of her childhood, and her insistence on telling the truth, as she sees it despite others inaccuracies. Her viewing of the importance of insisting on historical accuracy was illustrated when she declared to me:

We need also to accept that our culture is a living thing that has grown out of the interaction between the past and the present. We ask no more than the basic human right of being given the opportunity to determine our own future.

I understood that self-responsibility was critical for her in her own enunciated modus operandi:

I'm game for each year of my life. In my own way. I feel you've got your own life to live. You make your own decisions. You don't go to anyone to make your decisions for you, do you? You're just an individual and you've got to act like one.

Characteristics that are integral parts of her positive way of viewing her life experiences include determination, involvement and a demonstrated passion for life. She explains further that:

You've got to have that passion that you can do these things, and that you're going to do it. That's very important too. You set your mind to doing these things and you do them. You don't stop and think, “Oh, can I do it?” No, you can do it.

Her positive attitude to life is exemplified by her feeling that she is lucky. It is clear, nevertheless, that her involvement and self-control over the efforts she has made in her life have often influenced her outcomes. As she asserts:


Auntie’s story stands out for the integration of past, present and future. She sees the past, particularly her childhood with its powerful cultural influences, as being salient to her process of identity development. Her perception of Cape Barren is as a place of symbolic and perhaps mythical significance as a representation of the cultural ties to her people. She describes, in her autobiographical writings, her visits after many years of absence and the experienced re-connection with memories of the people in the place. She warmly declared to me, “Cape Barren I think is important to me, I want to go back… the heart that loves is always young”.

Reflections: “There’s always something new for me to do”

The intended focus of this study is on agelessness. For Auntie, the influence of age has not altered her choices, beliefs, or actions. Embedded within Auntie’s narrative is her attitude towards age with striking disregard for, and stated lack of age-related conformity to stereotypical expectations of any age. While she says she doesn’t feel any age on a daily basis, when pressed by a direct question she, after some thought, felt her age to be twenty-seven to thirty-seven years less than the chronological fact. She does display resistance to occurrences of observed island lack of longevity, with age of death often being, as she observed, around fifty. Interestingly, the traditional respect shown to elders, due to age, within Aboriginal communities is not regarded by Auntie as being significant by itself; her deference is for the individual regardless of age.

Auntie’s re-creation of her identity is a central notion of her narrative. Her attitude to change and new learning is that of a vibrant learner unaffected by age. Her view of herself in undertaking change, whether within or outside of her control, is demonstrated by her regarding herself as having the qualities necessary to confidently respond to new situations. In listening to her narrative, an enlargement of understandings of her lived
agelessness was established through epiphanies and the characteristics developed and demonstrated in response to her recounted life experiences.

While being strongly influenced by the past, Auntie has not allowed herself to be stranded in that time period, but has continued to value her present experiences by asserting that she is part of a living culture, as well as continuing to plan for the future. She commented to me that, “There’s always something new for me to do, yes, so at the moment life is wonderful for me”.

Embedded in the narrative of Auntie is her efforts in self-constructing her identity through her understanding of the distinctions between herself and others through the collective interactions of her life. This negotiation of identity could be perceived in Auntie’s visits to the old people on the island, visits that I see as influential in her later involvement in the Aboriginal community. Wenger (1998, p.157) discusses generational encounters as being transformative in identity. He submits that, “If learning in practice is negotiating an identity, and if that identity incorporates the past and the future, then it is in each other that old-timers and newcomers find their experience of history”.

It is posited that Auntie is an agent of change in her own and others’ lives. The inevitability of change is accepted and responded to by the her in terms of what is within her locus of control and what is not. Salient influences on the shaping of identity, such as self-understanding emphasised through lived authenticity, and self-reflection from notable memories, are utilised as a basis for change.

Conclusion

Auntie’s resists the dominant view from other’s on the life experiences on the island. Her response to change and adversity, in particular, are influential in her negotiation of identity, and approaches to age and agelessness, and in the development of agelessness resource characteristics. As Auntie emphasises, "I love living. Life is so important to me, and I feel as though I’m going to go on and on and on. I’m not going to get old.”

References


Krieken, R.V., Smith, P., Habibis, D., McDonald, K., Haralambros, M., & Holborn, M.


Constructing Public Opinion Through Metaphors

Júlia Todolí
Universitat de València

Abstract
Globalisation has increased competition among cities to offer a specific product in order to appeal tourists. One of the most important alternatives to globalisation consists of setting up “theme parks” by redeveloping some neglected areas and by transforming them into a tertiary area.

In this paper we will focus on the “Plan for restoring the Islamic wall”, which affected 200 people (40% of the population of the area) and anticipated the demolition of 16 buildings and the reuse of 17 construction sites. The project was supposed to aim at the restoration of the Islamic wall. However, the real goal of the plan was to redevelop a residential area into a tertiary one by getting rid of the neighbours (‘demographic cleansing’).

The main aim of this paper is to show the discursive strategies used to form public opinion. Specifically we will look into how the authors of the plan use discourse to justify a redevelopment initiative and the discursive resistance that residents, residents’ associations, intellectuals and engaged citizens opposed with to the project, to their protest actions and to the dialectical relationship that those citizens established with the institutional representatives forming a kind of “public sphere” (Habermas 1989). We are particularly interested in showing how metaphors structure our perception and understanding of reality and help promote and legitimise the ideological viewpoints of particular groups.

The data for this study consists of articles form newspapers, campaigns organized by the residents’ associations and round tables. These discourses are analysed through the combination of the approach of critical discourse analyses (i.e. Fairclough 1992, 1995, 2003; Chouliaraki and Fairclough 1999 and van Dijk 1995) and conceptual metaphor theory (g.g. Lakoff and Johnson 1980, Chilton 1996).

Historical background
Globalisation has increased competition among cities to offer a specific product in order to appeal tourists. One of the most important alternatives to globalisation consists of setting up “theme parks” by redeveloping some neglected areas and by transforming them into a tertiary area.

In this paper we will focus on the “Plan for restoring the Islamic wall” in València (Spain), which affected 200 people (40% of the population of the area) and anticipated the demolition of 16 buildings and the reuse of 17 construction sites. The project was supposed to aim at the restoration of the Islamic wall and at the construction of some houses and public equipment. However, the real goal of the plan was to redevelop a residential area into a tertiary one by getting rid of the neighbours (‘demographic cleansing’), since the type of equipments that were to be set up in the area was not specified at all.

The neighbours, who were neither asked nor informed while the plan was being drafted, gathered in associations, organized debates and round tables, launched awareness-

---

52 Research for this article has been undertaken as part of the Project GV05/213, funded by the regional government of Comunitat Valenciana.
raising campaigns for the citizens, wrote press articles and proposed an alternative plan that was sustainable and respectful towards both cultural heritage and neighbourhood. Throughout the campaign they were anonymously menaced, their houses were qualified as *chapapote*,\(^{53}\) they were bought and sold again three or for times by different building societies and their message was labelled as *protest song*. Eventually, in 2004, they achieved that the plan be withdrawn and a new plan be put forward, which is respectful with most of the existing buildings and keeps the population. However, up to now no budget has been approved and no schedule for an action plan has yet been proposed. At the moment, the only activity that can be seen in the affected area is that of the estate agencies, who buy whole buildings, try to throw the inhabitants out through some ’estate mobbing’ and resell these buildings for twice or three times the original purchase price.

**Constructing reality through metaphors**

For a long time metaphors were seen as a rhetorical device and more specifically as a matter of poetry. Today, however, many cognitive linguists recognize that metaphors structure our perception and understanding of reality and that we define our reality in terms of metaphors and proceed to act on the basis of these metaphors.

“When we signify things through one metaphor rather than another, we are constructing our reality in one way rather than another. Metaphors structure the way we think and the way we act, and our systems of knowledge and belief, in a pervasive and fundamental way” (Fairclough, 1992: 195)

In other words, metaphor is a salient feature of discourse whose function is twofold. Firstly, it helps make complex issues understandable to the public, and secondly, it helps promote and legitimise the ideological viewpoints of particular groups. Thus, metaphors are ideal instruments for constructing consensus and public opinion.

**Metaphors we live by**

Most of our metaphors have evolved in our culture over a long period, but many are imposed upon us by people in power (political leaders, religious leaders, business leaders, advertisers, etc.) and people who get to impose their metaphors on the culture get to define what we consider to be true (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980: 159-160). One of the most salient metaphors *we live by* is the metaphor “argument is war” which is why we often talk about arguments in terms of war. Although there is no physical battle, there is a verbal battle and the structure of an argument (attack, defence and counterattack) reflects this.

Another salient metaphor *we live by* is the sickness/health metaphor. But the most interesting thing is that both metaphors have been related to each other for a long time. In the 19th and 20th centuries, for instance, medicine has evoked military metaphors against disease to promote the idea that illness is an *enemy* to be *defeated* and to engage people in a common cause, namely, in a treatment focused on medications. And vice versa, military *operations* are seen as hygienic, as a means to *clean out* fortifications, and bombs are portrayed as *surgical strikes* to take out anything that can serve a military purpose (Lakoff 1991). Both metaphors are still alive in our culture and have an important role in understanding complex matters such as foreign policy.

In the last decades the enterprise culture has spread out among these metaphors and nowadays we talk about war and illness in business terms. The patients have turned into clients (Goldbloom 2003) and the war is seen as a transaction with costs, namely, casualties, and gains or well-being and security (Lakoff 1991). In our point of view, there is indeed a “hypermetaphor”, the business metaphor, invading both the metaphor of war and the sickness/health metaphor or overlapping them. But the fact is that we often use them in contexts where there are two opponents or a transaction from one person to

\(^{53}\) Oil spill that reached the coast of Galicia (north-west of Spain) and caused important environmental damage to the coastline.
another one. The Plan of recovering the Islamic wall allows us to show how these metaphors (the sickness/health metaphor, the war metaphor and the business metaphor) arise together and function as a powerful device of constructing consensus.54

### a) The sickness/health metaphor

Technicians and institutional representatives use the sickness/health metaphor both to defend and attack the plan. The pro project technicians establish a doctor-patient relationship with the affected environment to justify the urban operation. This way, the proposed plan is seen as a therapeutic solution, namely a surgery, to a disease.

The anti project technicians use also the sickness/health metaphor, but this time, they use metaphor to make neighbours aware of the consequences of the operation, namely, the expulsion of the affected neighbours and the redevelopment of the area into a tertiary area without neighbours. For those, the expulsion is seen as an extirpation and the redevelopment as a metastasis.

For the Pro project people, the diagnosis is focused on the area rather than on the neighbours, who are not mentioned at all (they are avoided) or are named using generic expressions such as tissue and hence treating human beings as objects. In a few words, the medical pattern represents an insensitive paternalistic model, focused on the disease rather than on the person or patient who suffers, the neighbours.

(1) “[…] at the time it seemed to us that there were some town planning issues. I can’t now go into the diagnosis, I will come back to it later on […] A 1960s architecture which has now completely deteriorated. Let’s say that there are some heritage reasons and also the old city wall itself. If we walk through the old quarter (barrio) today, it is hard not to see everything as fragmented – and what is more, fragments in a state of severe deterioration […] No, there is no such social engineering here, but what is true is that the characteristics of this concrete tissue are ones which have contributed to the negative image of the neighbourhood […] (Juan Pecourt, Pro project, Author of the plan, Round Table).

On the other hand, the treatment is seen as a sanitising by means of a delicate urban surgery although it entails the demolition of several buildings and the expulsion of their neighbours.

(2) “The redistribution suggests the cleaning up or sanitising of a district in social and economic decline through the delicate application of urban surgery that both respects and adheres to the existing environs.” (Project. “Modification of the PEPRI of the Carmen in relation to the Muslim city wall” 2002).

On the other hand, for the Anti project representatives the plan is a matter of major surgery as it entails extirpation and amputation of urban tissue and metastasis and it is carried out by means of aggressive tools (knives and chisels instead of scalpels)

(3) “But, in addition, I think they travel little, or rather they travel badly. They are incapable of seeing and learning from what is happening in the rest of Europe where, some years ago, they almost completely abandoned the idea of operations of major surgery. That is to say, restructuring on an overwhelming scale, a widespread form of intervention that has been employed to drastic effect in the Cabañal. (Fernando Gaja, Anti Project, Round Table).

(4) “Although it is not acknowledged, the applied strategy is based on what is known as the lineal metastasis formulated in the 1950s by Oriol Bohigas, which consists of a traumatic restructuring, amputation and extirpation of

---

54 The data for this study consists of the urban project outlined by the technical specialists, opinion articles published in press from 2000 to 2005 and round tables where architects, urban planners, archeologists and neighbours have been discussing the project forming a kind of public sphere where citizens deal with matters of general interest and express their opinions freely without being subjected to coercion. The original data are written/spoken in Spanish and Catalan.
urban tissues.” (Fernando Gaja, Anti Project. Round Table).

(5) “It is about working with the *scalpel*, with the *chisel*, and leaving the *butcher’s knife* for other activities.” (Jorge Palacios, Anti Project, affected resident, Levante EMV).

The Anti Project representative also focuses on the neighbours who are referred to as *patients* or *sensitive tissues*, but also as *clients* (an example of the so called *maketization of discourse*, Fairclough 1992).

(6) “For the more enlightened and eminent urbanists it is about a *surgical operation* that tries to kill the *patient*. The patient, in this case, being the hundred families who would have their houses expropriated and would witness the destruction of the economic and social fabric that keeps the Barrio del Carmen (old town) alive.” (Reported speech from the Newspaper *Pueblo*).

(7) “I believe it is important, when one is working with such *sensitive* material, to always be aware of what is known as the ‘caution principle’ and the irreversibility of the interventions. Urban interventions are largely irreversible.” (Fernando Gaja, Anti Project, Round Table).\(^{55}\)

(8) “The neighbours are not a passive element in the interventions, they are the *client* of the interventions” (Fernando Gaja, Anti Project, Round Table).

To sum up, recontextualisation of medical discourse into technical language in general and urban register in particular, make citizens perceive the planned urban intervention as a necessary measure to be taken, on the one hand, but also as an operation that can kill the patient and the square, on the other hand. It will depend on the metaphors used to define the plan.

**b) The metaphor is war**

Some metaphors are so naturalized within a particular culture that people find it extremely difficult to avoid them in their discourse, thoughts or actions. That’s the case of the so called “argument is war” metaphor or the metaphorical construction of argument as war. Though there is no physical battle, there is a verbal battle and the structure of an argument (attack, defence and counterattack) reflects this (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980: 4). This kind of militarization of discourse is also a militarization of thought and social practice (Chilton 1996).

The other intervening party, the neighbours affected by the plan, places the urban plan in a situation involving conflict, and thereby recontextualise the situation into a world of war. They use the words *fight, attack, defence* and *resist* to describe their situation and actions, they organize *barricades* and they claim the plan to be *withdrawn*.

(9) “Participation of the citizens now . . . El Carme at *war*!” (José Luís March, Anti Project, affected resident, headline from Levante-EMV, 28.2.2004).

(10) “We are *fighting* and we will continue to fight, and the administration had better that it too has a *fight* on its hands.” (Josep Campos and Toni Picazo, Residents association, Levante-EMV, 3.5.2004).

(11) “The battle has started, articles in the press, meetings, symbolic barricades, referendums, community suppers, petitions.” (Josep Montesinos, Anti Project, affected resident, Levante-EMV, 28.2.2004).

(12) “Throughout these years, the problems have continued (red-light districts, drug dealing, noise pollution . . .) In spite of all this, the neighbours have *resisted*.” (Josep Montesinos, Anti Project, affected resident, Levante-EMV,

\(^{55}\) There is an implicit metaphor in this paragraph, namely, a metaphor that is not explicitly present in the discourse but is entailed. If we talk about *sensitive tissues* to refer to the neighbours affected by the project we do not talk explicitly about patients but we can draw inferences because in medicine we often match the words *sensitive* and *patient* to describe people whose body or mind are especially receptive to some medications or treatments.
9.3.2002).

(13)"RIVA attacks again" (headline, leaflet).

(14)"Mrs Mayor. We are defending one of our human rights, the right to a home. We are defending our homes, our families, our old people, our right to live our lives with dignity. We hope that our local council and our mayor will defend the same rights." (Josep Montesinos, Anti Project, affected resident, Levante-EMV, 4.4.2003).

(15)"It has been announced that the neighbours are going to reject the plan and demand its withdrawal." (Josep Montesinos, Anti Project, affected resident, Levante-EMV, 1.1.2003).

c) The metaphor is business

Another example of naturalized metaphor we are hardly ever aware of is the business metaphor. As Fairclough (1992: 195) points out, people are not only quite unaware of it most of the time but they find it very difficult to escape from this metaphor in their discourse practices. It is what he calls the *marketization of discourse*, which entails also a marketization of thought and practice. The business metaphor is above all used by the pro project party. We can find words such as low activity, substandard vs. potentiality, improve and beneficiaries to describe the current, real situation and the outcome of the situation.

(16)"It's true that the attributes of this concrete network have, for the reasons that I have given, contributed to the very negative image of the neighbourhood, and also have led to a very level of activity completely at odds with the district's potential. One has to think of the area's value as a cultural image, and also through its central location. It has a heritage of buildings, but many of them are in extremely bad condition and, here, extremely bad conditions mean substandard conditions of the basic facilities with many reasons to improve the situation, to improve it for the honourable people who live in the district […]. People, but particularly neighbours, must be allowed to participate in the process. Particularly neighbours because they are the ones who are going to be most affected by the operation if it turns out well and equally if it turns out badly. (Juan Pecourt. Pro Project. Round Table).

(17)"But the area that we're talking about, being the epicentre of Muslim Valencia, has never realised its full urban potential." (Juan Pecourt. Pro Project, Levante-EMV. 16.2.2003).

(18)"The activity that one sees nowadays in the old quarter [pictured], is low-grade and of poor quality." (Carolina Járrega. Pro Project. Round Table).

The authors talk also about costs, balance, damages and about good business that can arise by means of this operation.

(19)"The first impression is one of large, unoccupied spaces in most of the inner courtyards of the blocks, which permits an intervention with lower social costs." (Project. "Modifications to the PEPRI of the Barrio del Carmen in relation to the Muslim city wall, October 2002).

(20)"The displaced have not been ‘disadvantaged’; consequently an excellent balance." (Juan Pecourt. Pro Project, Levante-EMV. 16.3.2003).

(21)"This is proof that they viewed this [the affected neighbours of other plans carried out in the old historic quarter] as good business." (Juan Pecourt. Pro Project, Levante-EMV. 16.3.2003).

But the most salient business word and indeed the alleged goal of the plan is to assign worth on the wall. The authors don't speak about recovering the wall, but they refer to the operation in terms of worth.

(22)"It’s about re-establishing the worth of archaeological elements. And when one talks of re-establishing worth and value what it means […] Assigning worth
to archaeology is not about the rehabilitation of a particular and placing it in the middle of a park of geraniums, but placing it within the context that gave the original piece its meaning. Through the intervention with the four blocks, what we want to do is assign value to the physical existence of the element.” (César Mifsut. Pro Project. Author. Round Table).

(23) “If one wants to assign worth to the Arab city wall, one cannot intervene just 50 or 100 metres away, even if some of the buildings are empty.” (Juan Pecourt. Pro Project. Levante-EMV. 16.3.2003).

Idiosyncratic metaphorical expressions

Each of the metaphorical expressions we have talked about so fare are fixed by convention and is an example of conceptual metaphors or what Lakoff & Johnson (1980) call metaphors we live by. These metaphors are pervasive in all sorts of language and in all sorts of discourse, not just in language but also in thought and action, as the language is metaphorically structured: “Because of the pervasiveness of metaphor in thought, we cannot always stick to discussions of reality in purely literal terms” (Lakoff 1991).

In addition to these cases, which are part of whole metaphorical systems, there are also idiosyncratic metaphorical expressions or image metaphors. These metaphors have been described as a special ad-hoc case of metaphor seldom used to conceptualise the abstract in terms of the concrete. They stand alone and are not used systematically in our language and thought. In other words, these imaginative expressions or image metaphors are not involved in everyday communication. We have found in our corpus some image metaphors. The most salient and polemical one is undoubtedly the use of an ecological disaster in Galicia, namely, the use of the word chapapote ('tar') to refer to the buildings leaning against the Islamic wall.

(24) “This will only be achieved through a change of image which does away with the tar of the developomental brand and which looks for an agreement of the –necessarily current with a past that can now hardly be guessed.” (Juan Pecourt. Pro Plan, Levante-EMV. 16-2-2003)

Another instance of what we see as an example of idiosyncratic metaphorical expression is the use of the word cançó de protesta ('protest song') to describe the claims of the residents, which means that they are behind the times, that they represent other times and are against progress.

(25) “There has been more reaction: drawings of hawks on the walls threatening the neighbours, a ‘falla’ criticising the administration with echoes of the protest songs of Ana Belén, with its calls of ‘we shall not be moved’.” (Juan Pecourt, author of Pro Project, Levante-EMV, 16-2-2003).

But the most interesting idiosyncratic metaphors are those used in the urban register to hidden the destruction of the urban layout. It is well known, that redevelopments of neglected areas often lead to demolitions of buildings and to the destruction of the urban layout by opening broader spaces. However, there is a strong regulation that forbids such destructive processes in the old cities, as these quarters are the history of the city and have to be protected in order to preserve the collective memory. Thus, the urbanists try to avoid words such as destruction or demolition and instead of these they use metaphors like emptying and sponging.

(26) “And it seems to us an opportune moment to empty those interiors, of which more than 80-90 per cent is taken up by patios, to allow access to these spaces and to be able to view the old Muslim city wall.” (César Misfut. Pro Project. Author, Round table).

(27) “Normally, terminological confusion is symptomatic of a greater far-reaching confusion. The proposals for Valencia, like those for Barcelona, from where they originated, are often described as spongings. But they are absolutely not.
Although these operations have proved resistant to a general identification and definition, I think that these types of projects can be labelled as 'restructuration'.” (Fernando Gaja, Anti Project, Round Table).

The former paragraph is very interesting as the speaker, an anti Project representative, unravels these strategies of naming that aims at masking the reality. And the same speaker uses the word *emptying* as synonym of *destruction* and *demolition* in the following paragraph.

(28)“The unrestricted growth within a demographic paralysis can not take place at the cost of destroying the most fragile urban fabrics. It is self-evident that large scale *emptyings* lead to the *demolition* of the structure of those spaces and accelerates the process of social and demographic deterioration, the depopulation, the ageing and the transformation in the economy of a district.” (Fernando Gaja, Anti Project, Round Table).

Such metaphors (*emptying, sponging*) are typically used in the urban register, where they are quite conventionalized, and they have not reached the media registers or the general language. The media use transparent words such as *demolition* and *destruction*.

**Final Remarks**

If metaphors structure the way we think and the way we act, it is reasonable to assume that metaphors play a central role in the construction of social reality and therefore they can change reality, construct consensus or public opinion. However, there are some differences in the way we perceive metaphors. Conventionalized metaphors (idioms, conceptual metaphors or *metaphors we live by*) are commonly assumed as natural ways of naming the reality, as they are pervasive in all sort of discourses and languages. However, idiosyncratic metaphorical expressions (also called *image metaphors*) and less conventionalized metaphors do not and they can lead to a discursive subversion. This is the case of the innovative metaphors *tar* and *protest song*, drawn upon to describe the affected buildings and the protest actions carried out by the residents. Both metaphorical expressions led to the following reactions:

(29)“On the other hand, the editing team dismissed the neighbours’ actions as *songs of protest*, their legitimate right to defend their houses as ‘confusion in the streets’, and their buildings were described as fit only for demolition and not worth preserving.” (Josep Montesinos, Anti project, affected resident, Levante-EMV, 28-2-2004).

(30)“The term ‘chapapote’ [tar] has now come to be used to define those constructions to follow, a term that wants to find a parallel – from our point of view, not appropriate- with a totally different problem” (Press announcement from the “Colegio de arqueólogos” of Valencia)

And the same happened in the case of the metaphor *delicate surgery*. While the term *operation* is assumed as a natural way of naming the redevelopment of the affected area, the expression *delicate surgery* had a subversive effect and arose a set of discursive reactions: 56

(31)“We are aware of the major management difficulty, not of an economic kind, which implies opting for ‘minor surgery’ and the dialogue and compromise of the neighbours” (Miguel Àngel Piqueras, Anti Project, Residents’ association Amics del Carme, Levante-EMV, 21-02-2004)

Summing up, instead of constructing consensus image metaphors or less conventionalized metaphors can have a subversive effect as it happens in poetry, where the reader does not remain indifferent to these image metaphors. On the other hand, conceptual metaphors function as presuppositions and they are not contested or

56 See also examples 3, 4 and 5, as there is an implicit allusion to this innovative or less conventionalized metaphor.
reactivated by the opponents to counterattack or show disagreement.

References


‘Buy the book before Christmas’: Participants’
capitalisation upon culture in a Hong Kong English
classroom ®

Jimmy Woon Man Tong
Hong Kong Polytechnic University

Abstract

This paper is an attempt to explore how participants’ cultures help construct their identity within a language pedagogical context. The paper is organised and developed around a theme of students forgetting to buy a Reader in a Hong Kong secondary classroom.

The discussion is based upon a video-recorded episode, in which a class of 15-year-olds was having a Reader lesson. Both the teacher and the students were ethnic Chinese sharing the same mother tongue and cultural heritage. The recordings form part of the data sought from a 3-year case study in two Hong Kong secondary schools. In this study, six English class settings taught by two teachers were involved and around 180 students participated. In average, two to four of the eight English lessons ranging from coursebook, listening to writing were observed each week for one school year. In addition to the video-taped lessons, the data corpus consists of classroom observation notes, teacher and student semi-structured interview scripts, informal / opportunistic conversation with the teacher and student participants and school documentation.

While culture tends to be seen as a barrier to educational innovations, this paper focuses on how cultural values are used by the participants as a resource in the formal instruction interactions. The paper will show, triggered by a possible teacher-student miscommunication, how at one time traditional cultural ideology was invoked as a resource to safeguard the teacher’s identity, and how at another time students invoke traditional cultural values to thaw a possible teacher-student confrontation and, the teacher and the students together, to create a harmonious learning environment. The discussion will also involve an examination of how students make use of their limited language resource to renegotiate their student identity with the teacher.

The findings seem to suggest that language classroom is a platform that is co-constructed by all participants, both students and teachers, who bring along cultures of
their own perspectives. The investigation provides insight into how teachers and students capitalise on Chinese cultural values in the discursive interactions and how they engage in identity construction in the language classroom.

**Introduction**

Studies of classroom discourse can be dated back to the forties of last century. Despite researchers' interest, lacking audio-recording equipment seemed to have hampered the research in this area. Following the audio-recording technological advance, the recording of ‘live’ interaction in classrooms has been prompted.

In addition to the fact that classroom situations provide a neat and tidy parameter for study (Edwards & Westgate, 1994), it was also found that they can be very rich. Erikson has rightly reported: ‘much classroom interaction is far messier […] children stumble over each other in conversation. They may complete each other’s clauses and turns at talk. They may take turns away from each other. The pullings and counterpullings, the ebbs and flows of mutual influence in the conversation, are not just between one student and the teacher at a given time but rather among many students – sometimes among teams of students – and the teacher’ (p.32).

This paper is an attempt to show how some Hong Kong Chinese secondary school students and teachers invoke some Chinese ideologies to construct their identity. By Chinese ideologies, I refer to the ones developed by Confucius, who lived at the Period of Spring and Autumn and the Period of Warring States (770BC-256BC). Living through this period of social disturbances and intellectual diversities, intellectuals, including Confucius had promoted very diverse moral and ethical thinking and ideas so as to restore peace and stability. The basic ideology of Confucianism is to advocate a harmonious society and to maintain social order. This is what Confucius called *li* (rites).

Stover (1974) defines *li* as: ‘Right conduct in maintaining one’s place in a hierarchical order …’ (p.246). Within *li*, there are five ‘cardinal relations’ (*lun*) that govern human relationships. The five cardinal relations include ‘duty between emperor and officials, love between father and son (filial piety), distinction between husband and wife, precedence of the old over the young, and faith between friends’ (trans. Lau, 1984, Mencius).

In addition to faith, influencing such relationship as friends, colleagues and classmates can be said to be favour (*renqing*). Hwang (1987) defines favour as ‘a set of social norms by which one has to abide in order to get along well with other people in Chinese society’, either by means of frequent social contact and exchanges, or of offering help when needed (p.954). In other words, if one offers a favour to another, the recipient
must have to do something in return sometime in the future. There is a Chinese saying that 'if one gives you a peach, you should requite his favour with a plum'.

The means of favour and face are major ways of influencing Chinese people in a mixed tie, including classmates, teachers and students, alongside relatives, neighbours and colleagues (Fried, 1969; Jacobs, 1979). The inter-personal relationship of this type is not as strong as that of parents and children, of husbands and wives. According to Hwang (1987), 'both sides of a mixed tie know each other and keep a certain expressive component in their relationship' (p.952). In order to maintain the relations in a social-oriented Chinese community, favour will be considered when offering assistance or granting favour.

The interactants in a mixed tie could not express themselves as freely as if talking to their parents, close friends, or spouses. Favour and reciprocity are the concepts of maintaining Chinese social relations, and of when to offer assistance.

After having a brief look at the classroom discourse studies and the Chinese ideologies, I shall introduce the study. Then the findings and discussion of the video extracts will be followed. The paper will be ended with an appeal for capitalising upon local cultures as a resource in language classrooms.

The study

The video-recordings to be discussed in this paper have been taken from a 3-year case study in two secondary schools in Hong Kong. In total, six junior secondary class settings taught by two teachers and about 180 students aged between 12-15 have participated in the study. The teachers and the students are ethnic Chinese sharing the same tongue – Cantonese, and cultural ideological heritage. Two to four English lessons were visited each week for one school year. The lessons being observed include coursebook, listening and writing. The data corpus consists of classroom observation notes, semi-structured interviews with the students and the teachers, opportunistic conversation with the participants and video-recordings. Some school documentation, e.g. timetables, worksheet, test and examination papers have been collected as primary data.

In the discussion, the names of the participants, students and teacher have been withheld. As a replacement, while the teacher is referred to ‘T’, the students are referred to ‘S’ plus a number, for example, S6. The gender of the participants is used arbitrarily. For the sake of discussion, the teacher is male whereas the students female.
Findings and discussion

In order to nurture students to become proficient readers, many Hong Kong secondary schools have chosen some simplified Readers that are to be discussed in the Reader lessons. In many cases, students are required to buy and read certain parts of the Reader in advance of the lessons. The lesson in discussion was the first Reader lesson in the Second Term of a school year in January. Since the title and the story-line of the Reader has little impact on the classroom discursive discourse, the information in those regards will hence be unexplained here.

At the beginning of the lesson, the teacher had already noticed that some of the students had not brought (or not bought) the Reader to the lesson. Time had been spent on reprimanding of the students. The teacher-student exchange here is about whether the teacher had reminded the students to buy the Reader before the Christmas holidays.

\[
\text{Excerpt 1: ‘Buy the book before Christmas’}
\]

T: […] Again you haven’t bought this Reader. Have I asked you to buy it before Christmas?
S3: [unintel]
T: Yes, yes, I have. {The teacher turns to and addresses the whole class.} Have I asked you to buy the book before Christmas?
// Sss: Yeah!
// Sss: No!
T: Don’t tell me that I haven’t asked you and I remember I have written the title on the board. The point is that you haven’t copied it down. You’re sitting there doing nothing.
S6: No, you haven’t
T: Don’t argue with me, S6.
S6: No!
{The teacher looks unhappy and stops the conversation. The teacher puts down her book and picks up another one.}

The teacher’s question ‘Have I asked you to buy the book before Christmas?’ may however contain four messages. They include:

(i) The teacher had asked the class to buy the book;
(ii) The teacher had not asked the class to buy the book;
(iii) The teacher had asked the students to buy the book before Christmas;
(iv) The teacher had not asked the students to buy the book before Christmas.

Some of the students might have been responding to any one of these messages when some said ‘Yeah’ and some said ‘No’.
Regarding the teacher’s statement: ‘Don’t tell me that I haven’t asked you and I remember I have written the title on the board. The point is that you haven’t copied it down. You’re sitting there doing nothing.’ It might have carried as many as ten messages. They might include:

(i) The teacher had asked the students to buy the book;
(ii) The teacher had not asked the students to buy the book;
(iii) The teacher had asked the students to buy the book before Christmas;
(iv) The teacher had not asked the students to buy the book before Christmas;
(v) The teacher had written the title of the book on the board;
(vi) The teacher had not written the title of the book on the board;
(vii) The students had copied the title of the book;
(viii) The students had not copied the title of the book;
(ix) The students had done something;
(x) The students had not done anything.

The student, S6, might have responded to any one of the above ten messages when she said ‘No, you haven’t.’ S6 was the only student who responded to the teacher’s statement particularly loudly. S6 might have meant that the teacher had or had not asked them to buy the book. She might have meant that the teacher had or had not asked them to buy the book before Christmas. S6 might have meant that the teacher had or had not written the book title on the board. She might in fact have felt uneasy when the teacher put the responsibility on the students. She showed her feelings and different opinions. Her feelings were strong. The teacher also showed his strong feelings by responding ‘Don’t argue with me.’ This signals that S6 had said something inappropriate and been rude to the teacher. The teacher was not happy. The teacher might have treated S6’s response as a challenge to him, and he could not accept S6 arguing with him. Conversation means that ‘the range of things that counts as “appropriately” “sayable” and “meaning-able” […] in regard to a given topic or theme (e.g. schools, women’s health, smoking, children, prisons, etc.)’ (Gee 1999:37). I interpret the teacher’s response as an attempt to ‘create a moral regulation of the social relations of transmission/acquisition, that is, rule of order, relation and identity’ via ‘pedagogic discourse’ (Bernstein, 1990:184).

Through examining a wide range of ‘classroom texts’ that cover ‘a range of subject areas’ from kindergarten classes to secondary ones, Christie (2002) suggests that teachers tend to use ‘implicit expressions’ to maintain what teachers think to be
‘acceptable pedagogic behaviour’ when students become older because they understand ‘those behavioural routines that are acceptable in a particular teacher’s classroom …’ (p.163). The comparatively ‘audible and consistently apparent’ dimension of ‘establishing […] acceptable [classroom behavioural] patterns’ to be found in a junior secondary English class in discussion, in my view, could perhaps be attributed to teacher’s invoking some traditional Chinese ideology. Wilson’s findings report that Chinese children are not expected to express hostility, especially towards the authority (1970), which may be affected by the traditional Chinese child rearing practice. Children are very often treated in terms of whether their conduct meets some external moral criteria, rather than in terms of sensitivity to their needs and feelings.

In the excerpt, S6 said ‘No’ a second time. This might have meant that S6’s intention was not to argue with the teacher. Alternatively, S6 might have been insisting in her first reply that she was responding to the teacher’s statement ‘Don’t tell me that I haven’t asked you and I remember I have written the title on the board. The point is that you haven’t copied it down. You’re sitting there doing nothing.’ S6 was anyhow not conforming to the request of the senior and did not seem to be bound by some traditional Chinese ideology. S6’s reiteration suggests that she was trying to ‘redefine the local power relations in classroom discourse’ (Kendela 1999:157). This scenario is further telling evidence that students negotiate with the situation and the teacher. This excerpt suggests that there might have been some misunderstandings in the interactions between the teacher and S6, the occurrence of which neither the teacher nor the student had noticed. There are other research findings which show the existence of teacher-student communication problems. Thirty-eight in-service teachers of English were asked to reflect on their classroom practice via reviewing their own audio or video-taped lessons (Tsui, 1996). One teacher reports:

I asked the students to prepare their story in advance before the class. It was a total disaster because only a few of them had done their work. Most of the students did not even read a line in the chapter…I was pretty angry and I even wanted to punish the students. But later I found that the students did not do their preparation work because they did not understand what they were supposed to do (p155).

According to Littlewood (1981), a successful communication process requires senders to verbalise the messages adequately and receivers to understand the senders’ meanings.

The lesson continued and the teacher guided the students through the story. The teaching was however interrupted again when the teacher noticed another student, S9 did not have her book.
Excerpt 2: ‘Are you sure you are doing the right thing?’

T: John, any other, the bus driver, any other? (The teacher suddenly notices that S9 does not have her book.) S9, where is your book?
S5: S9 has lent me her book. I have asked her if she wanted to share the book with me but she refused.
T: (The teacher turns to S5.) You’re not required to read. Return the book to S9!
S5: Are you sure you are doing the right thing?
S10: The female protagonist.
Sss: Katie
T: Who is Katie? His [John’s] wife, right? That means, they are couples. Can anybody tell me where they live? It is mentioned here.

In the section of ‘Buy the book before Christmas’, I discussed how the teacher questioned the students about not bringing the book. This time, S9, who was found not have the book, was supposed to be punished. S5, trying to defend S9, said, ‘S9 has lent me her book.’ From the traditional Chinese ideology point of view, S5’s defence could be interpreted as an example of favour and faith between friends – one of the five cardinal relations within li (rites). S9 lent S5 her book. In turn, S5 defended S9 from being punished. The teacher instructed S5 with ‘You’re not required to read. Return the book to S9!’ I interpret the teacher’s instruction to mean that the teacher might have felt annoyed and frustrated by many students not bringing the books as discussed earlier. It was especially so when the teacher earlier asked one student, S3, who had no book, to share with another students. S3 replied, ‘I don’t want to read.’

In a teacher interview, the teacher expressed his opinion about students’ motivation in learning English:

TEACHER: That’s why the Principal keeps asking us to motivate students. I don’t know how to motivate students. Don’t ask me to do so. It’s really frustrating and I don’t know how to motivate students. I really don’t know how to motivate others because I motivate myself. Rarely I was motivated by somebody else. (Teacher Interview 6)

The teacher’s opinion is shared by the suggestion of the Hong Kong English language syllabus that students’ motivation is one of the difficulties of English learning and teaching in Hong Kong. From the start of the lesson, the teacher had already spent some time on handling the matter of telling the students to ‘buy the book before Christmas’. It seems that this matter had been settled. While the teacher was patiently leading the students to his expected answer, ‘Katie and John lived in New York’, he discovered that S9 did not have her book. The teacher might have made a mistake for which S9 was supposed to be punished. S5 in fact was the student who had not brought the book. Therefore, it might be the case that the teacher’s embarrassment, impatience, annoyance and frustration were being revealed in his response to S5. S5
might have been surprised by the teacher’s instruction. In contrast to my earlier
discussion of students’ ‘little voice’ (2004), S5 hence queried loud and clear, ‘Are you
sure you are doing the right thing?’ I interpret the student’s query to mean that S5
wanted to learn and she could not learn without the book. She did not feel good about it
either. S5 therefore queried the teacher’s decision.

Wilson (1970) observes that Chinese children are socialised not to express hostility,
especially towards authority. The teacher in this excerpt seemed least likely to accept
S5 arguing with him. S10 might have understood that students are not allowed to
express hostility, especially towards their seniors and hence she attempted to direct the
teacher’s attention from a possible confrontation situation back to teaching by providing
a response to the teacher’s earlier question ‘any other [character in the story]?’ S10
replied, ‘The female protagonist.’ Some other students showed their support by saying
‘Katie.’

S10 and some other students were trying to initiate and renegotiate the classroom
interaction patterns. Their initiative might have been a coincidence, and it might also
have been a manifestation of favours, which were aimed at helping one another. They
helped S5 out from being punished anymore by the teacher. The initiative was
successful and teaching was resumed.

The students' suggestions of ‘The female protagonist’ and ‘Katie’ might have hit the
teacher’s expected answer. The teacher’s attention was diverted from classroom
management to teaching again. Instead of demanding that S5 should not read and
should return the book to S9, the teacher continued the lesson. In the rest of the lesson,
the teacher did not mention ‘forgetting to bring the book’ any more. I interpret this to
mean that the teacher did not want to have any more confrontation.

This excerpt of student thawing a possible student-teacher confrontation seems to be an
echo of a collective intervention exercised by a class of Mexican students when they are
asked to supply a kind of answer that is in line with their teacher’s expectation. The
students refuse to comply by producing three kinds of answers, which Kendela (1999)
lists:

1. verbal denial of the requested answer, gradually lowering their voices;
2. use of whispering as a form of resistance and refusal to participate in the
public space;
3. silence as a response to requests for participation.(p.150)

The researcher then summarises that ‘with [the students’] interventions, [the students]
are able to confront institutional authority […] the power asymmetry shifts over to the
students’ side, as they manage to alter the roles and local relationship’ (p.156).

In this ‘Are you sure you are doing the right thing’ case, traditional Chinese ideology might have become the students’ tool or resource to bring about harmony. It is noted that juniors might rarely have chances of this kind in the negotiation process in a hierarchically ranked society. Perhaps the wish for harmony by S10, shared by the teacher and some other students, avoided a confrontation.

**Summary and conclusion**

This paper is an attempt to show how participants make good use of culture as a resource in their discursive interactions in a Hong Kong secondary English classroom. The data in ‘Buy the book before Christmas’ indicate that the students might not conform to the will of their seniors. The teachers’ attempt at being dominant may further confirm Kendela’s observation that in some cases, the teacher did not accept different opinions from the students (1999; also Tong 2002, Chapter 6). The excerpt also indicates that the teacher-student oral exchanges were stalled by a communication problem that had resulted in some misunderstanding. While the student did not appear to conform to their senior’s role expectation, the teacher intended to solve the problem by invoking traditional Chinese ideology, which inhibits children from expressing opinions before their seniors. The teacher thus achieved a dominant role in the classroom. The excerpt of ‘Are you doing the right thing’ suggests that, also invoking such traditional Chinese ideology as giving favours, to help one another, the students execute collective power to resolve teacher-student confrontation - and that although the teacher might have been frustrated, and also had the power, he did not invoke traditional Chinese ideology as a classroom management tool at the later stage. As it happened, the teacher and the students made compromises and worked together to construct a harmonious classroom environment.

The study shows how teachers and students capitalise on Chinese cultural values in the discursive interactions and how they engage in identity construction in the language classroom. The findings seem to imply that language classrooms, or classrooms in general, is very likely to be a ‘local cultural platform’ co-constructed by both students and teachers, who bring along their own perspective of ‘large national culture’ (Holliday 1999). I wish to end this paper with a call for an appreciation of the complex classroom discourses by adopting both quantitative and qualitative research approaches.

**References**

Bernstein, B. (1990), Class, Codes and Control. Vol.4: The Structuring of Pedagogic


Kendela, A. 1999, Students’ power in classroom discourse, Linguistics and Education, 10(2), 139-163.


A Critical Analysis of the Documents and Public Consultation Process on Xenotransplantation (Animal-to-Human Tissue and Organ Transfer)

Ruth Trigg
University of South Australia

Abstract

In 2001 the National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC) established the Xenotransplantation Working Party to provide advice on the scientific, ethical and technical issues relating to xenotransplantation research, produce guidelines for the assessment of animal-to-human transplantation trial proposals, and consult widely with the community about the issues.

This is a critique of the public consultation process conducted by the Working Party, and the persuasive influences encoded within two documents: Animal-to-human transplantation research: a guide for the community and Animal-to-human transplantation research: how should Australia proceed?

The claim by the Working Party that ‘the public consultation promoted a high level of community engagement’ is not a sustainable or acceptable analysis given the issues involved in xenotransplantation and that the topic is new to the public.

The documents prepared for public engagement and discussion of the issues surrounding xenotransplantation exist ‘within’ the discourse of science. By being confined within this discourse, they are not able to adequately address the significant issues for the kind of public examination that these issues warrant. There are other ‘discourse’ fields that should also be engaged, such as sociological, philosophical, ethical (beyond the narrow presentation provided), economic, environmental, narrative and cultural; including traditional and critical perspectives.

The critique of the processes and the documents shows a contradiction between the terms of reference and the processes for review set out in the documents. The problem arises around the work of determining ‘acceptability of proceeding’ and ‘proceeding’ with trials. These processes should be kept separate by process and time, but are conflated within the documents.

The embedded strategies employed within the discourse of science which restrict more transparent scrutiny include the grammatical metaphor of the scientific experiment encoding control and ‘factual’ knowledge; the rhetoric of inevitability of proceeding with the trials; the rhetoric of science as ‘salvation’; the rhetoric of panic; a rhetorical process of qualifying dissent; and use of pathos to focus on individuals under threat of disease, which is not balanced by the logos of the potential threat of the species.

The field for expert consideration and public consultation around the issues of xenotransplantation needs to be broadened to included discourses that have some separation from the dominance of scientific discourse.
Xenotransplantation is a word that has not ‘transplanted’ into Australian usage, despite a public consultation process carried out by the National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC) from 2002 to 2004. The etymology of ‘xeno’ (Gk) is the relationship between the host and the guest, where the guest is a stranger (Concise Oxford Dictionary). The three main processes relating to xenotransplantation will be described briefly. The analysis will examine the adequacy of the consultation process and the documents produced for the consultative process. The nature of the rhetorical and linguistic persuasive strategies employed within the discourse of science at the interface of public engagement with current and future technologies will be explored. Alternative models for scientific and community understanding of ‘health’, and alternative models for public discussion and engagement with ‘health’ technologies will be presented.

Background

In 2000 the NHMRC established the Xenotransplantation Working Party to investigate the scientific, ethical and technical issues surrounding animal-to-human transplantation. There are three animal to human transplantation procedures presented for discussion. Animal cell therapies (ACTs), for example, describe procedures where insulin-producing cells from a pig pancreas could be transplanted into a suitable site in the body of a recipient so that the pig cells produce insulin and avoid the need for further injections. Animal external therapies (AETs), for example, describe procedures where pig liver cells could be used in an external device for the treatment of organ failure. The blood from the patient is purified by passing through the device. The patient may be stabilised while waiting for a human liver transplant. Animal organ transplants (AOTs), for example, could occur by using a pig kidney to replace a kidney in a human. The literature makes a distinction between using living and dead animal tissues, by providing an example of pig heart valves, used to treat humans for many years, which are ‘inert and sterilized, unlike xenotransplants which are living tissue’. (Animal-to-human transplantation research: A guide for the community 2003/04 p2). In this discussion, this use of inert and sterilised tissue is included as being problematic.

In July 2002 the Xenotransplantation Working Party released a discussion paper: Draft Guidelines and Discussion Paper on Xenotransplantation. The role of the paper was to provide background material to promote an informed community discussion. The paper also contained draft guidelines for the conduct of animal-to-human transplantation trials in Australia, if they were to go ahead. There were advertisements placed in all major newspapers in all capital cities and on a website, inviting community comment from Aug-Oct 2002. Public meetings were held in Sydney, Melbourne and Perth, targeted meetings were held in Perth and Adelaide. 97 written submissions were received and 116 participants took part in the public consultation.

Adequacy of consultation process

A community guide published as a follow-up to the first round of public consultation stated

Thus, the public consultation promoted a high level of community engagement and provided considerable information to the NHMRC about community views on animal-to-human transplantation.

The ‘thus’ at the beginning of this statement provides a summative, authoritative prelude to the following statement, ‘the public consultation promoted a high level of community engagement’. This clause is presented as positive affirmation of fact: it mimics the discourse of science in presenting knowledge as fact. In fact, is a highly rhetorical device which embeds analysis as fact. If the rhetorical layer of fact is removed to reveal a partisan presentation of opinion, then this opinion can be analysed as such. My view is that ninety seven written submissions and 116 participants attending public meetings over a three month period across Australia on such a significant issue as
xenotransplantation is nowhere near sufficient to introduce the public to information about technologies that are new; to give people a chance to absorb, discuss and debate the scientific, ethical and technical issues, and form a considered opinion. In my view the analysis that there was a ‘high level of community engagement’ represents an institutional and political practice of ‘facadism’: the appearance, not the substance, of engagement.

The ‘thus’ statement described above, was followed by ‘However’

However, the submissions received indicated considerable concern in the community that the issues of animal welfare and the potential to introduce new diseases from animals to humans had not been adequately addressed. A third issue of concern was how xenotransplantation research would be regulated in Australia. Finally, some respondents felt that much of the information was in a format that did not facilitate community understanding of the complex issues involved.

On the basis of the public response to the document and consultation process, the Xenotransplantation Working Party issued two more documents. One was an attempt to re-present information on the issues and processes of xenotransplantation in language more accessible to the public (*Animal-to-human transplantation research: a guide for the community. Public consultation on xenotransplantation 2003/04*) This document was referred to as the *Community guide*. The other document was a response to the 2002 public consultation on the first document *Draft Guidelines and Discussion Paper on Xenotransplantation*. This document, (*Animal-to-human transplantation research: How should Australia proceed?)* was referred to as *Response Paper*.

Section 2.10 of the *Response Paper* states

From the submissions received, it is clear that the community as represented has significant concerns about animal-to-human transplantation. Fifty six respondents stated that they were opposed to animal-to-human transplantation trials proceeding; 10 stated that they were in favour.

Arguments against animal-to-human transplantation provided by the participants in points 2.12. and 2.13 of the *Response Paper* were

- The risk of infection for the transplant recipient and the whole community
- The violation of animal rights
- Funds and other resources could be better directed elsewhere
- Doubts about the likelihood of patients benefiting
- The risks exceed the benefits
- It is not acceptable to genetically modify source animals, or the ethical implications of doing so have not been explored
- Community education and debate should precede any decisions in this area
- Results of animal-to-animal experimentation cannot be used to reliably infer results in humans
- There are too many unknown factors to allow any confidence in the safety of the procedures
- Recipients may be ostracised by the community
- It is not clear who would be responsible if a new human disease arose and how it would be stopped.

Arguments in support of animal-to-human transplantation provided by the participants in points 2.14 and 2.15 of the *Response Paper* were

- The potential benefit to patients
- The shortage of human tissues for transplantation
The rigorous and comprehensive guidelines proposed by the working party.

**Theoretical framing of critique of publications and consultation process**

In the four hundred years since the development of modern science, western societies science has displaced ‘god’ as the omnipresent, omniscient authority. Science developed particular forms of activity—the scientific method—and particular forms of writing—the scientific report—from the time of Newton and the Royal Society. In the past fifty years, and especially the past twenty years, developments in linguistic theory and analysis and a reconnection with ancient rhetorical analyses have provided new analytical tools to show how ‘science’ works within western culture.

Disciplinary studies in the sociology of science, Aronowitz, Chambers, Latour and Woolgar the history of science, Jacob the philosophy of science, Apple, Bourdieu and Passeron feminist critiques of science, Bleier, Harding, Rossner, Smith, Tuana) and linguistic and rhetorical analyses of science Bazerman, Fairclough, Gee, Halliday and Martin, Hodge and Kress show that science exists within complex networks of educational, political, technological, industrial, public and private institutions. It also exists within frameworks of belief—both within the lay community and the expert scientific community—that its work is factual and value free. Discourse analysis (Halliday and Martin) shows that although this supporting belief is universally pervasive, it is not sustainable. Science exists within social systems that are always mediated by values and beliefs. Language and its persuasive mechanisms operate within and through science as it does through all human activity.

The documents prepared for public engagement and discussion of the issues surrounding xenotransplantation exist ‘within’ the discourse of science. And that by being ‘confined’ within this discourse field, they are not able to adequately address the significant issues for the kind of public examination that these issues warrant. There are other ‘discourse’ fields that should also be engaged—such as sociological, philosophical, ethical (beyond the narrow presentation provided), narrative, futurology, economic, environmental and cultural; both from traditional and critical perspectives.

The field for expert consideration and public consultation needs to be broadened to include discourses that have some separation from the dominance of the scientific discourse. The Australian ethicist of international standing, Margaret Sommerville, along with many others, is engaging with the issue of the adequacy public consultation by posing wider questions than appear in these discussion documents.

We have an obligation to acknowledge cases in the past where a limited focus produced unacceptable risk for the planet, or where scientific interventions did not account for significant social effects. We do not need to create scenarios for regret in the future caused by undue haste in bringing forward new technologies which have not been considered properly and in good faith.

**The limits of the discourse of science**

The boundary for all of the presentation of issues within these documents is‘within’ scientific discourse. The language used is a larger projection of the metaphor of the scientific method—the control of a single variable to ascertain the outcome of the changes by the variable on the other fixed factors. This ‘method’ has expanded into a metaphor of ‘control’. We have come to ‘trust’ science to deliver new knowledge to us safely. Embedded within this metaphor of scientific method is another powerful metaphor—that a single gene change in an organism can have a single, predictable, controllable outcome. This is no longer a tenable position.

An alternative to this ‘mythology’ of science (mythology is used here not as a derogatory term but as a descriptor of the complex interactions by which meanings are constructed and sustained in social contexts—it is employed as a term of critical analysis) is a view...
put by Barbara McClintock, a Nobel prizewinner for genetics.

In the face of a dominant paradigm in the field of molecular biology that posits a linear hierarchy in which genetic DNA encodes and transmits all instruction for cellular development, the research of biologist Barbara McClintock, who spoke to Keller of her scientific approach of ‘letting the material speak to you’ and ‘having a feeling for the organism’ led her to a different view. In this view, DNA is ‘in delicate interaction with the cellular environment’; master control is not found in a single component of the cell; rather ‘control resides in the complex interaction of the whole system.’ The focus of importance is on the organism and its environment, not on a Master Molecule. (Bleir, 1984 p48)

Instead of depending on one model of a ‘single variable’ and a ‘single outcome’ we need to bring alongside the scientific method other conceptual and practical methods which encapsulate the complexity of non-living and living forms and the ways they interact. McClintock’s description: ‘control resides in the complex interaction of the whole’ presents a new metaphor of complexity which encapsulates the cell as metaphor and allows a larger metaphor of community as a locus for complexity. If we reconceptualised scientific work to bring alongside the given new models and metaphors and did this as a serious cultural movement we would start doing ‘different’ kinds of science (Harding). I also envisage a science that is open about its interconnections with economic, political, industrial and military systems.

Contradiction between terms of reference and process

There is a deep-seated problem in these documents and the processes set out within them. The problem arises around the work of determining the ‘acceptability of proceeding’ with clinical trials of xenotransplantation technologies and ‘proceeding’. The consultation stages to determine public response to these two categories should be kept separate by process and time, but in fact they are conflated within the documents. This conflation of assessing ‘acceptability’ and then proceeding regardless of the outcome, is a significant process in public consultation mechanisms involving ‘science’. I have called this the rhetoric of inevitability. This discursive move is constituted from beliefs that science is value free, that it works only for the public good, and therefore that it should be allowed to pursue any end in developing new knowledge.

Analysis of rhetorical and discursive practices in the documents

The rhetoric of inevitability is one of several powerful persuasive constituting features of the documents. It is closely linked to ‘facadism’, where the appearance of public consultation is more significant than an adequate process of consultation. A serious critique can be made about the practice of consultation and engagement with the public in ‘good faith’. Do notions of critical penetration of the population need to be developed, both in the number who can demonstrate some level of familiarity with the issues, and in the time needed to reach satisfactory engagement? The combined number of participants and submissions over a two year period was less than one thousand in a population of twenty million. In 2005, in a small informal sample I conducted of around fifty professional people of various fields, not one knew of the term ‘xenotransplantation’.

I will provide four instances of the rhetoric of inevitability (of the clinical trials proceeding).

Example 1

The first discussion paper, released in July 2002, was called Draft Guidelines and Discussion Paper on Xenotransplantation. The stated role of this paper was to provide background material to promote an informed community discussion, and the paper also contained draft guidelines for the conduct of animal-to-human transplantation trials in Australia, if they were to go ahead. The title of the paper indicates the order of significance: the draft guidelines come before the discussion.
Example 2
The Response Paper to the public submissions and consultation received from the Draft Guidelines and Discussion Paper on Xenotransplantation was titled

Animal-to-human transplantation research: How should Australia proceed?

In contrast, Canada titled its equivalent paper, ‘Should Canada proceed?’ The effect of the rhetorical difference between these two titles needs no explication.

Example 3
In the Response Paper 2003/04, section 2.24 states
Many respondents to the consultation saw the release of draft guidelines with the Discussion Paper as an indication that the NHMRC had agreed to animal-to-human transplantation research.

An ambiguous qualification follows in the same point.

However, the XWP is anxious to clarify that this was not the case and, while the XWP considers that Australia needs to have clear guidelines to regulate animal-to-human transplantation research, it does not regard such research as inevitable.

Example 4
In the Response Paper 2003/04 the scope of the investigation is clearly stated (1.21):

The XWPs terms of reference require consideration of the acceptability of proceeding with animal-to-human transplantatation research.

And yet, under the terms of reference (1.23) only points one and two relate to the above scope.

1. undertake a community education program on xenotransplantation
2. undertake wide consultation to obtain community views on the acceptability of proceeding with clinical xenotransplantation research in Australia and on related issues

Points three, four, five and six assume that clinical tests will proceed.

3. produce guidelines covering the scientific, ethical and technical aspects of xenotransplantation research involving humans
4. consider the issues that xenotransplantation raises in the relation to animals for this purpose
5. undertake wide consultation on proposed guidelines and regulatory mechanisms for clinical xenotransplantation research
6. provide advice to Council (NHMRC) on the scientific, ethical and technical issues related to xenotransplantation research involving humans, including advice on how Australia should regulate xenotransplantation research

If wide consultation showed that the public did not want clinical trials to proceed, then points three to six are redundant.

The persistent use of rhetorical structures of inevitability in the documents is set against the absence of discussion and emphasis on the precautionary principle. This principle states that we do not proceed if we can predict negative outcomes—outcomes which cannot be reversed once they have become embedded in ecological systems.

A ‘science as salvation’ discourse is evident in the documents. This is a deep grammatical metaphor which has a stronger bearing on the persuasive structures than another metaphor, that of science as a practice of forming knowledge. This is subsumed by the ‘science as salvation’ metaphor. The ‘science as salvation’ metaphor is evident in two major structures, firstly in the discourse of ‘hope’ and the second in the discourse of ‘panic’.
The discourse of ‘hope’ is seen in the following example, points 8.13 to 8.16 in *Response Paper*. The more general points offered first affirm the possibility of successful outcomes for xenotransplantation in general terms, while the latter points offer more specific, factual information which emphasise caution.

8.13 The Discussion Paper explained that other major obstacles to AOTs include anatomical problems (eg structural issues, such as the size and growth of the animal organs) and physiological problems (eg biochemical, pharmacological and endocrinological factors that affect whether the transplanted animal products can function properly). However, section 4.2 of the Discussion paper stated that ‘there appear to be no insurmountable physiological barriers to the use of pig hearts and kidneys’ and that ‘life preserving pig heart and kidney transplants have been performed in baboons without obvious major physiological incompatibility’.

8.14 Several respondents thought that this assessment of the issues facing researchers was too simple and that, in fact, very considerable obstacles need to be overcome before whole organ xenotransplantation will be successful:

…the statement in section 4.2 (p36) ‘Life-preserving pig heart and kidney transplants have been performed in baboons without obvious major physiological incompatibility’ glosses over the stark details of mean survival times provided later in section 5.2.2 (p51-52) Ms Elizabeth Usher (Submission X059)

8.15 Indeed, as described in Section 5.2.2 of the Discussion Paper, pig-to-baboon kidney, heart, lung and liver transplants performed to date have all been lost due to immune rejection within short time spans (mostly less than one month, with a maximum of three months), which may not be enough time for anatomical or physiological problems to show up.

8.16 Some respondents described potential anatomical and physiological problems in greater detail.

Incompatibilities in the complex cascade of reactions which leads to blood clotting will also tend to trigger organ failure, with possible fatal consequences. The blood vessel walls of a pig not only activate human clotting factors by more than one process, they also suppress normal ant-clotting mechanisms. This means that as a patient’s blood circulates through the pig xenograft, blood clots may form continually. (Respondent details confidential)

Subtle differences in molecular structures of key proteins may be sufficient to render pig organ transplants in many clinical settings involving complex signals and pathways ineffective. Dr Anthony Raizis (Submission X034)

The discourse of ‘panic’ involves two elements which are linked. The first is the panic of time running out to save individuals who are sick, the second is the privileging of sick individuals over the threat of a species (humankind). Pathos is used to focus on individuals under threat of disease, and it is not balanced by the logos of the potential threat of the species if unforeseen outcomes emerge. Examples are provided by the following two points in *Response Paper*:

6.51 Organ and tissue donations are required to overcome a large range of diseases and conditions.

6.52 Although vigorous efforts are needed to increase the number of human donations to transplantation programs, it is unlikely that such efforts will overcome the extreme shortfall, especially as new therapies are developed that use transplanted cells and tissues.

Throughout the papers there is a rhetorical process of qualifying dissent—as in, we are listening to you (but the trials will continue anyway). This is evident, as one example shows in 7.15 in *Response Paper* with the lead in, ‘Other respondents agreed:….’. This
section is dealt with in a tone of mild mollification, when it is compared to point 7.16 which follows:

7.16 On the other hand, the biotechnology companies themselves would argue that they provide the necessary research funds and incentives to help alleviate a real human problem and that commercialisation of their products is a necessary part of this process.

The lead in ‘On the other hand’...’ is a stronger cue establishing an argument compared with ‘listing’ support, as occurred in points 7.14 and 7.15. This argument structure is one of endorsing support, speaking as a mouthpiece (the biotechnology companies themselves...) for the companies. This structure reveals deep-seated bias towards the biotechnology companies.

The second round of submissions

The written submissions received after the second round were 343, compared to 97 in the first round. The attendees at public consultations in the second round were 377, compared to 116 in the first round.

The XWP recommended to the NHMRC that AOT trials should not be held for five years, and that a strict national oversight system be set up to assess, and allow if judged suitable, trials for ACTs and AETs.

The NHMRC determined that there would be no clinical trials for any of the three procedures for the next five years, and produced a Statement (10 March 2005) setting out its reasons for this decision.

How to proceed?

The discussion papers and the public consultation have raised complex issues about public access to science, technology, health, social practices of determining who can participate in decision making, educating lay people and questions about future directions. The field for expert consideration and public consultation needs to be broadened to include discourses that have some separation from the dominance of scientific discourse.

We have an obligation to proceed by re-examining discourses of health, power and knowledge. Does 'health' reside in community relationships of organisation and well-being, or does it 'reside' in cells and organs? Do we need to restate basic practices such as collecting and disposing of rubbish to manage public health, and restate the significance of diet, and freedom from pollutants in managing health. Are we a culture in denial about the normality of dying? Do we need such highly specific technical interventions, just because we can?

What public education processes are in place now to ensure that many more people are aware of the issues brought forward by the potential technologies of xenotransplantation and that they are able to discuss and debate them in an informed way when the five year moratorium has ended?

References


**References**


Kant’s Contribution to an Ethical Approach in the Application of Aesthetics®

Kate Vickers
Curtin University

Abstract

This paper proposes that a contemporary re-reading of Immanuel Kant’s notion of ‘disinterest’ may bring about a more ethical application of aesthetics in the forums of review and critique that take place in art discourse and education. In the seminal text *Critique of Judgment* (1790) Immanuel Kant (1724-1804) posited that pure aesthetic judgment is disinterested. That is not to say that it is not interesting but that aesthetic judgment is made outside the confines of material, moral, and ethical use or context (Kant 1952, pp. 476-9). Kant proposed that this judgment as to the beauty of an object had also to be making a claim to universal subjective validity. Conversely, Hans-George Gadamer (1900-2002) claimed that Kant, rather than legitimating aesthetics had detached it from the world, resulting in a loss of cognitive purpose. He argued that through Kant’s notion of disinterest, aesthetics existed outside interpretation, as a pure abstraction (Gadamer, 1975, p. 74). Gadamer suggested that [Kant’s] ‘demand for abstraction ran into indissoluble contradiction with the true experience of art’ (Gadamer, 1975, p. 84). Kant’s scientific approach is thus challenged, but his abstraction and ‘disinterest’ may yet be redeemed and made useful for present-day aesthetics.

The notion of ‘disinterest’ has been effaced from contemporary understanding of art and so is not able to be sustained by contemporary artists within the discourse of their practice. Hans-Georg Gadamer’s critique of Kantian aesthetics and his development of a hermeneutic approach to the work of art may be the new, largely unacknowledged, fundament of the process of review and critique. These processes of aesthetic judgment legislate between the artist and the audience—playing out a language game that mediates the work of art. Gadamer claimed that through dialogue the ‘truth’ of a work of art was revealed to the participants. In this there is a notion of a neutral language.

For Jean-Francois Lyotard (1924-98) these conversations could be defined, following Wittgenstein, as ‘language games’ where any claim to an assumed ‘good will’ between participants is far from certain. For Lyotard the performance of rhetoric in any discourse cannot be de-politicized—what takes place is not a neutral ‘truth’ revealed to the participants but a fight between those utterances that would be legislated as ‘truth’ in the future. In art schools internationally students’ work is reviewed and assessed by peers and academics. If, as Lyotard claimed, these forums are political battles, how are students protected from the institutionalised terrorising of discourse? This paper proposes that Kant’s ‘disinterest’ may contribute to an ethical approach in the application of aesthetics.

Introduction

This conference, held by the Faculty of Education, University of Tasmania emphasises an approach to critical discourse analysis that is cross-disciplinary. My doctoral research relies on a dialogic movement between philosophical aesthetics and art. This dialogue evidences a differend that may contribute to paradigmatic change; resulting in more ethical forums of review and critique within art education and discourse. To this
end, I propose that Immanuel Kant’s notion of ‘disinterest’ is useful to a critical analysis of art discourse. I will support this proposition by tracing ‘disinterest’ from its inception through to its contemporary status.

The notion of ‘disinterest’ emerged in Kant’s seminal work on aesthetics—Critique of Judgment (1790). Through the discourses surrounding formalism, modern art and postmodernism ‘disinterest’ has been delegitimated. This is evidenced in the writings of contemporary philosophers and art critics. Hans-George Gadamer rejected the reasons for this rejection of disinterest within art discourse, while continuing to delegitimate the notion in his own exploration of the work of art. Although not credited with direct influence on art criticism and interpretation, Gadamerian hermeneutics may be the underlying, yet unreflexive fundament of the current approaches to art review and critique.

Gadamerian hermeneutics rely on the notion of a neutral language and the goodwill of those reviewing and critiquing a work of art. Jean-Francois Lyotard’s explication of rhetoric challenges these assumptions. Lyotard reminds us of the need to critically analyse the ‘language game’ that is discourse. I contend that Kant’s notion of ‘disinterest’ may contribute to an approach that acknowledges the interests of language when reviewing and critiquing a work of art within art education and discourse.

**Origin of the Concern**

In the mid nineteenth century Frank Sibley, determined to understand the problems in aesthetics, collected lists of words used in the discourse and explored their power relationships. Sibley’s habit was to present an audience with ‘a framed pink curve’. Invariably the audience would respond to the pink curve with delight. He would then remove the frame, revealing that the curve was in fact the curve of a pig’s backside. Sibley was much taken with investigating the seeming reluctance of audience members to argue that: ‘this curve is beautiful: this curve is a pig’s backside: therefore this pig’s backside is beautiful’ (Berys, Gaut, Lopes & McIver, 2001, Routledge Companion to Aesthetics, pp 140-1).

Sibley’s work is still of relevance in the twenty first century. In universities internationally students’ work is reviewed, critiqued and assessed by peers and academics. It is through my own experience of tertiary art education that I came to consider that there was a need to re-think the basis on which aesthetic judgments were made. Once we have critical awareness of the weakness of a discourse, how are we to participate in it with any degree of integrity? This question became central to my art practice. If, as Sibley posited, the languaging of subjective tastes is fickle and equivocal, how may students be protected from the institutionalised terrorising of difference by social agreement?

My initial response to these questions was local and formed by my perspective as a student. I developed a combative response to the processes intrinsic to art education; those of review and critique. While attending an artists’ workshop in Italy I saw that many of the issues I had been addressing at university in Perth also seemed to have a life within Europe. Here too, artists and theorists seemed to be questioning how, with awareness of the weaknesses of art discourse, they could participate in it with integrity. How were their students to be protected from the terrorism of institutionalised subjective aesthetic judgments? This led me to research more widely the interaction that takes place between the artist and the audience, mediated by the work of art. I became more appreciative of the complexities of staff roles as individuals within, yet representatives of, the institution; I could no longer use a polarized ‘you-teacher/judge, me-student/defendant’ simplification to provide a soap-box for my review. The languaging process itself had become integral to the aesthetic investigations of my art practice. I had to trace the discourse back to its beginnings to discover how we had arrived at this point. How had contemporary art discourse become detached from philosophical aesthetics?
Kant and the Abstraction of Disinterest

Alexander Gottlieb Baumgarten (1714-62) introduced the discipline of aesthetics into German philosophy, coining the term ‘aesthetics’ in his Reflections on Poetry (1735). Baumgarten argued that it “provided a different type of knowledge from the distinct, abstract ideas studied by ‘logic’. He derived the term ‘aesthetics’ from the ancient Greek ‘aesthanomai’ (to perceive)” (Levinson, 2003, p. 44). Aesthetics, which has come to be associated with art, is usually thought of as a contemplative experience or a style of perception. As there is no science of cognitive reception of a work of art, aesthetics is often either marginalised as mere subjective opinion or abstracted to democratic agreement, a value applied by the weight of the majority. However, in the first part of his Critique of Judgment Immanuel Kant (1724-1804) argued that the pleasure one felt in regarding an object as ‘beautiful’ had to be a disinterested pleasure. Kant proposed that a judgment as to the beauty of an object had also to be making a claim to universal subjective validity: that in making such a judgment one could justifiably expect others to agree with the principle underlying the judgment. Such a judgment—one element of a suite of aesthetic judgments—is of necessity a judgment of reflection and not a determining judgment. As such it is categorically different from a judgment based on personal preference because there must be an underlying principle, or maxim, on which the judgment is made.

Kant’s approach to philosophical aesthetics appears later in Clive Bell and Roger Fry’s formalism. Put forward most strongly in Bell’s Art (1914), formalism defined art in terms of ‘significant form’. This ambiguous definition was known more for what it excluded than for its substantive claims. Representational content was placed in opposition to this idea of form and was to be considered as strictly irrelevant to a work of art. The ideas of Clement Greenberg (1909-94) continued this notion during the height of modernism. The rise of art criticism and the importance of the art critic during this time lent Greenberg and the disseminators of his ideas much influence throughout Western art. The art critic became a translator of art, interpreting the work of artists for the audience. Works which were visually abstract, that is, containing no representation of what things look like in the physical world, were championed by Greenberg. Taking a lead from the American art critic, modern art’s exemplars were painted by artists defined as abstract expressionists (e.g. Jackson Pollock, Willem de Kooning, Mark Rothko).

Contemporary American philosopher and art critic Arthur Danto (1924-) says Greenberg was ‘incontestably the foremost Kantian art critic of our time’ (Danto, 1997, p. 84). In view of postmodern artists’ reaction against the canons of modern art, Danto argues that ‘aesthetics seems increasingly inadequate to deal with art after the 1960s’ (Danto, 1997, p. 85). So it is that, through Greenberg, Kantian aesthetics are read via the works of the archetypal white Western male painter who dominated modern art; falling out of favour with them. However Kant’s notion of ‘disinterest’, outside this exclusion of ‘representational content’, was never privileged by the politics that legislated the works of modern art. So, justice was not done to the depth of Kant’s ideas—an injustice compounded by Gadamer.

Gadamer and the Contemporary Rejection of Disinterest

(Throwing the Baby Out With the Bathwater)

Danto’s writings confirm that a rejection of Kantian aesthetics took place with the advent of postmodernism. Gadamer had anticipated that the binary of representational content and form was soon to play out its endgame. Hans-George Gadamer (1900-2002) also claimed that this binary was not under the behest of Kant’s aesthetic ideas; confirming that postmodern artists’ rejection of modern art and formalism did not of necessity have also to reject philosophical aesthetics. Prima facie evidence of this may be found in an exploration of the inconsistencies between Kant’s notion of disinterest and the current theoretical understanding of abstraction within performance art.

Gadamer was the leading proponent of hermeneutics in the second half of the twentieth century. For him, ‘to seek the unity of art solely in its form as opposed to its content is a perverse formalism, which moreover cannot invoke the name of Kant. Kant had
something quite different in mind with his concept of form.’ (Gadamer, 2004, p. 80). The discrimination of whether an art work attempts to be a picture ‘of’ something or not, does seem to be an overly simplistic and politically wasteful transposition of ‘disinterest’. In 1975 Gadamer foresaw the exhaustion of the critical ability of the ‘contemporary discussion about abstract art [that] is, in my view, about to run itself into an abstract opposition of “representational” and “non-representational”’ (Gadamer, 2004, p. 100). And so it was that with the anticipated and intentional ‘death’ of modern art and formalism, at the hand of the postmodern artist, the ‘manslaughter’ of the potential of Kant’s notions occurred.

Postmodern artists with their ‘incredulity toward metanarratives’ (Lyotard, 1984, p. xxiv) are certainly skeptical of any singular approach to defining art. Danto suggests that in art now ‘with qualification, anything goes’ (Danto, 1997, p. 47) and that with this ‘art no longer bears the responsibility for its own philosophical definition. That, rather, is the task of philosophers of art’ (Danto, 1997, p. 36). Many artists have themselves been the first to assert that aesthetics has nothing to do with their practice. This antagonist relationship is evident in Barnett Newman’s famous remark of 1952 that ‘aesthetics is for art what ornithology is for the birds’ (Danto, 2003, p. 1).

Legitimating a Place for Art Through Purpose in the Good Society

Gadamer’s criticisms of Kant contribute towards delegitimising the relationship between philosophical aesthetics and the work of art. Gadamer claimed that while Kant had been trying to include aesthetics in a complete philosophical system, he had detached it from the world, resulting in a loss of cognitive legitimacy and purpose. For Gadamer ‘in order to do justice to the experience (Erfahrung) of art we began with a critique of aesthetic consciousness’ (Gadamer, 2004, p. 86). In this critique pragmatic experience is privileged over claims to universal subjective validity.

In *Truth and Method* (1975) Gadamer retrieves the idea of artistic truth. This takes understanding of art beyond subjective experience because an experience of art ‘contains a claim to truth’ (Gadamer, 2004, p. 84) and an art work’s existence was the ‘breaking-off of a creative process’ (Gadamer, 2004, p. 80). After the production of the work ‘art is knowledge and experiencing an artwork means sharing in that knowledge’ (Gadamer, 2004, p. 84). For Gadamer, this becomes the work of art’s purpose, its telos. There is in this an echo of Aristotle’s *Poetics* (c335BC), where the experience of art was useful to society for purposes of moral and emotional catharsis. However, we perhaps should read Aristotle’s *Poetics* against the foil of Plato. Plato’s criticism of the arts denied them a place in ‘the good society’ (*Republic 10*). In *Fire and the Sun: Why Plato Banished the Artists* (1977) Iris Murdoch proposed that it was due to the very importance of beauty that Plato would deny the arts a place; because any artwork was an imperfect copy of the form of the good and so an affront to the Gods. For Gadamer, art has a place in society, but it is on the basis of self-understanding, a cognitive legitimacy that is challenged by Kantian aesthetics. The work of art is not only legitimated by understanding in Gadamer’s hermeneutics, but he further proposes that “only when we understand it, when it is ‘clear’ to us, does it exist as an artistic creation for us” (Gadamer, 2004, p. 79).

Hermeneutic understanding is reached in the medium of language: ‘seeing means articulating’ (Gadamer, 2004, p. 79). Through conversation agreement is reached and an understanding reveals itself to us. In this there is a notion of a neutral language, a process all may participate in to experience the ‘truth’ of a work of art. For Jean-Francois Lyotard (1924-98) these conversations could be defined, following Wittgenstein, as ‘language games’ where any claim to an assumed ‘good will’ between the participants is far from certain. In 1989 a dialogue between Jacques Derrida and Hans-Georg Gadamer was proposed. The exchange was to be based on the direction philosophy should take after Heidegger. Heidegger was a link between Gadamer and Derrida as the former had studied with him and the latter’s ‘deconstruction’ drew on the philosopher’s later works. The dialogue did not progress as no agreement could be
reached on the terms of engagement. Readings of this failure were varied: that Derrida had exposed ‘the limits imposed by hermeneutics’ (Audi, 1999, p. 338); or that ‘any attempt to circumvent the conditions of dialogue specified by Gadamerian hermeneutics is self-defeating’ (Audi, 1999, p. 338). Whatever the reading, the irresolvable conflict in the language game between Derrida and Gadamer is worth exploring and one way to do so is through Lyotard’s differend.

The Ceremonial Performance of Contemporary Art

For Lyotard the performance of rhetoric in any discourse cannot be de-politicized. The ‘event of truth’, that Gadamer’s hermeneutics ascribes to the dialogue of participants experiencing a work of art, becomes the enactment of what Lyotard calls the ‘ceremonial’. That is, the performance of the present commonsense; the ‘ordinary or normal understanding’ (Brown, 1993, p. 454) delivered without philosophical questioning or critical analysis. For Lyotard what takes place is not a neutral ‘truth’ revealed to the participants, but a fight between those utterances that would be legislated as ‘truth’ in the future—for Lyotard the legislation is the past and the future is the political.

The present was referred to by Lyotard as the ‘ceremonial’; that which is not questioned but is acted out. It may be that the contemporary artist and art student acts out a present that is legislated by Gadamer’s critique of Kant, with sustenance from Danto. Although not credited with direct influence on art criticism and interpretation, Gadamerian hermeneutics may be the underlying, yet unreflexive fundament of the current approaches to understanding art. If that is the case, then artists cannot sustain Kant’s notion of disinterest within the discourse of their practice because Kant has been delegitimated. In Lyotard’s terms, the forums of review and critique could be described as a court where artists as plaintiffs are asked to present their case in language that nullifies it. In this language game, the plaintiffs—lacking the means to present their case—become the victim. ‘This inevitably stems from the conflict between the form of argumentation acceptable to the court and the form of argumentation required by the plaintiff to put the case’. (Williams, 1989, pp. 104-5)

Conclusion and Future Directions

From Kant’s writing on aesthetics the notion of ‘disinterest’ emerged. This notion has been effaced from contemporary understanding of art and so is not able to be sustained by contemporary artists within the discourse of their practice. Gadamer’s critique of Kantian aesthetics and his development of a hermeneutic approach to the work of art may be the new, largely unacknowledged, fundament of the processes of review and critique. These processes of aesthetic judgment legislate between the artist and the audience—playing out a language game that mediates the work of art.

A cross-disciplinary approach to the critical analysis of discourse may serve as an ethical underpinning and self-reflexive method for vibrant dialogue between subjects. My continuing research aims to identify the contribution that Kant’s notion of ‘disinterest’ may make to this method within art theory, practice and philosophical aesthetics. The research will also explore the conditions of an approach to aesthetics that is appropriate to contemporary art.

References


Proceedings of the International Conference on Critical Discourse Analysis: Theory into Research, November 2005


Abstract

It has become almost a commonplace to note that asylum seekers are the constant victims of negative, alarmist representations in the press (e.g. Lynn & Lea, 2003; Macken-Horarik, 2003; Refaie, 2001). Not only are they routinely worked up as deviant in nature (Lynn & Lea, 2003) but also, increasingly, asylum seekers are being represented as a threat to the security and stability of the Western ‘civilized’ world (Huysmans, 2000). This is not to suggest that there has been a sudden re-emergence of the blatant racism that accompanied immigration to Britain in the first half of the 20th century. Rather, what emerges is something far more subtle: a type of mundane, yet insidious xenophobia that not only constitutes asylum seekers as ‘other’ but also draws on the rhetoric of asylum to reaffirm and normalise a nationalist, exclusionist imperative. Paradoxically, such rhetoric emerges alongside a populist Western view of the world as post-modern, globalised, pluralist and characterized by a breakdown of ‘old’ identities such as race and class. It is the negotiation of such people/place ideologies and the orientation to the location of asylum that makes anti-asylum rhetoric both interesting and disturbing. Once asylum seeking is recast as a matter of the protection of space rather than the protection of people, a whole range of place warranted discriminatory practices may be dismissed as simply a reflection of the natural shape of the world.

And yet, social psychological work on prejudice typically points to social categories such as ‘race’, ‘ethnicity’ and ‘non-whiteness’ as the main analytic focus. By employing a critical discourse analytic approach, this paper examines extracts from the print media and from political speeches, to show that the anti-asylum case is far more concerned with the ‘where’ of asylum than the ‘who’. Specifically, it aims to investigate a particular strategy of ‘othering’ (Fairclough & Wodak, 1997) employed by the print media and politicians alike that draws on the ideology of nations and national integrity to ‘tell us what kind of object’ asylum seekers are (Wittgenstein, 1953: 373).

Introduction

The conception of human rights, based upon the assumed existence of a human being as such, broke down at the very moment when those who professed to believe in it were for the first time confronted with people who had indeed lost all other qualities and specific relationships – except that they were still human. The world found nothing sacred in the abstract nakedness of being human (Arendt, 1973:299).

It has become almost a commonplace to note that asylum seekers are the constant victims of negative, alarmist representations in the press (e.g. Lynn & Lea, 2003; Refaie, 2001). Not only are they routinely worked up as deviant in nature (Lynn & Lea, 2003) but also, increasingly, those who find themselves unable to survive in their own nations and on the move, are being represented as a threat to the security and stability of the Western ‘civilized’ world (Huysmans, 2000). Nor do politicians appear to do much to discredit sensationalist, derogatory accounts. Kushner (2003: 261) argues that ‘at the
start of the twenty-first century, the government, state, media and public have intertwined in a mutually reinforcing and reassuring process to problematize and often stigmatise asylum-seekers’. Similarly Joly (1992: 117) has pointed to the interplay between ‘the government, the media and the general public’ in producing a generalised negative perception of asylum seekers that has ‘assumed a fantasy life of its own’. Thirty years on, Arendt’s words have lost nothing of their poignancy: The world, it would seem, still finds ‘nothing sacred’ in the ‘abstract nakedness’ of the displaced and dispossessed asylum seeker.

However, it would be misleading to suggest that we are currently witnessing a return to the blatant dehumanising racism of an earlier era. Rather, it is argued that what emerges is something far more subtle: a type of mundane, yet insidious xenophobia that not only constitutes asylum seekers as ‘other’ but also draws on the rhetoric of asylum to reaffirm and normalise a nationalist, exclusionist imperative. Of all the ‘qualities’ that an asylum seeker might lose in leaving home to seek a new life, the one that would seem to inform press and political accounts most acutely is the loss a national homeland. An asylum seeker must seek asylum somewhere and the data discussed here suggest that ‘racist’ talk about asylum seekers may have far more to do with this orientation to the ‘where’ of asylum than the ‘who’. It is this rhetoric of location or the ‘place’ of asylum with which this paper is concerned. Specifically, it is concerned with a particular strategy of ‘othering’ (Fairclough & Wodak, 1997) employed by politicians and the print media that draws on the ideology of nations and national integrity to ‘tell us what kind of object’ asylum seekers are (Wittgenstein, 1953: 373).

This rhetorical orientation to the ideology of the nation state is perhaps paradoxical emerging as it does alongside a populist Western view of the world as post-modern, globalised and pluralist. According to post-modern theory, the global world is characterised by a breakdown of ‘old’ identities such as race, nationality and class (Jencks, 1989), and is dominated by overwhelming lifestyle choice and a ‘consciousness of interdependence’ (Gergen, 1991: 254). In particular, post-modern theory has suggested that state boundaries are becoming increasingly permeable and that nations and nationhood are in decline (Jameson, 1991). And yet, as Sardar (1998) argues, much of the world’s population, including the poor, the landless and the displaced, is not, and cannot choose to be, part of this global interdependence. For them, the post-modern world is just as boundary conscious and just as excluding as any ‘modern’ nation state.

Indeed, as Billig (1995) points out, global interdependence presupposes the modern view of a ‘world of nations’, each nation a discreet entity inhabited by a uniquely eligible group of people. The logic of a global world is internationalist, rather than anti-nationalist and is orientated to the meaning of national borders as powerful symbols of categorisation in terms of who may or may not have access (Newman and Paasi, 1998). Global interdependence (e.g. European asylum agreements) will at best serve national interests and at worst function to close ranks ‘interdependently’ to exclude the unwanted. Certainly, there is no place for post-modernism in stories of asylum seeking. Agnew (1999) argues that it is only inside state boundaries and amongst legitimate members that debates about the permeability of boundaries and the decline of nation states are made possible. For those outside the national border, ‘reason of state rules supreme’ (p.503).

At the same time, campaigners have called for a new ‘moral’ rather than ‘political’ perspective on the issues, urging the British government to rethink discriminatory policies and procedures (Kushner, 2003). And yet, as analysis of political rhetoric has shown, the moral and political are not so easily teased apart (Billig, 1995; Billig & Golding, 1992; Reicher & Hopkins, 2000). Discriminatory practices can always be justified on moral grounds and what better ‘grounds’ for just exclusion than our homeland, our national integrity (see Billig, 1995; Reicher & Hopkins, 2000). In the Home Office White Paper on Immigration (2000), the former Home Secretary stated that the ‘rigorous prevention of the breach of border controls remains a critical element in building up confidence and trust’. The language of breached borders and of ‘confidence and trust’ has obvious moral overtones. Importantly, the working up of border protection as a moral issue provides the framework within which asylum seekers may be
constructed as deviant, while neatly side-stepping the political minefield that is the issue of ‘race’ (Kushner, 2003; Pickering, 2001; Triandafyllidou, 2000). This is why it remains important for critical social scientists to pay attention to what is being said routinely, banally (Billig, 1995; van Dijk, 1997) and to examine rather than assume the ideological basis of the anti-asylum argument (Kushner, 2003).

Locating prejudice

There is by now a well established tradition within the social sciences of the critical analysis of hegemonic discourse (e.g. Billig, 1985, 2005; van Dijk, 1984, 1991; Fairclough & Wodak, 1997). Such work is concerned primarily with the relationship between language, ideology and social action. In the late 20th and at the beginning of 21st centuries, when discrimination against ‘others’ has become an accountable action (Wetherell & Potter, 1992; Dixon & Reicher, 1997), it is an ongoing task to examine how racist sentiments about asylum seekers are managed and voiced within ‘politically aware’ institutions and populations and made to sound reasonable. This is particular so, when as Kushner (2003) points out, the anti-asylum voice is enjoying unprecedented support in the Western world.

Relatedly, there has been an emergence within social psychology of the critical analysis of the national category and the discourse of nationalism (Billig, 1995; Condor, 2003; Reicher & Hopkins, 2000; Wallwork & Dixon, 2004). This work moves away from the concept of ‘the nation’ as an essential, fixed and knowable entity that may act, from time to time, as an independent variable in processes of identity, stereotyping and prejudice. It engages with nationhood as an ongoing project (Reicher & Hopkins, 2000). Whether it is hailed as a group of people, as a political entity or as a historical or geographical fact (see Condor, 2003), the national category is doing business on a daily basis, reminding us of our unique eligibility for membership of a very exclusive club. Further, national identity descriptions do not simply emerge out of particular social or political contexts. Rather they inform us of what kind of ‘national’ context we are in, what our membership means and how we should feel and act.

However, Billig (1995) notes that it is the apparent ‘out-there’ reality of the national category that helps to make nationalism ‘the most successful political ideology in human history’ (Birch, 1989: 3) and gives it such potency when employed in the discourse of persuasion, mobilization and exclusion. When the Home Secretary declares that ‘breaches’ of ‘border controls’ must be prevented, the logical response is ‘how’ not ‘why’. It is simply taken for granted that nations must be protected and further that whatever a nation is being protected against is automatically ‘other’ and problematic. This ability of ‘border’ rhetoric to constitute simultaneously the ‘other’ and the justification for ‘othering’ has important rhetorical effects, captured eloquently in the words of Dixon & Durrheim (2003):

Boundaries do not only reflect pre-existing apprehensions. By insulating ‘us’ from ‘them’, they help to create the kind of environment where outsiders become constructed as dangerous (see Falah & Newman, 1995). In this way they may quickly come to serve as their own antidote (p.597)

Once an issue such as asylum becomes a matter of the protection of a place rather than the protection of people, the moral ground is shifted and a whole new form of classification, explanation and justification is made available.

In social psychology, there has been little critical examination of how the rhetoric of location is being routinely deployed to position asylum seekers as the ‘natural’ recipients of discriminatory action.

Rather, work on prejudice, including prejudice towards asylum seekers typically points to social categories such as ‘race’, ‘ethnicity’ and ‘non-whiteness’ as the main analytic and theoretical foci. As Dixon (2001: 600) points out, this may fail to acknowledge ‘location’ as ‘a fundamental contextual dimension of social life’ (emphasis added) and importantly, how the language of place, such as ‘Britain’s borders’ or ‘our country’, routinely (and subtly) distinguishes one social group from another and informs our self and other
evaluations. Further, the rhetorical orientation to the nation as a category of location (rather than a social group) may achieve the dual function of communicating social similarities and differences and grounding such distinctiveness in a material world that seemingly transcends social interests and identities.

For example, Wallwork and Dixon (2004) have shown how the rhetorical construction of issues and events (such as the protest against a ban on foxhunting) as ‘national’ may have less to do with the identity of people and more to do with the location of the ‘issue’ in a particular national landscape e.g. the English countryside. When, for example, the Countryside Alliance talked of the plight of ‘country people’ before the last Countryside March, they were not simply referencing a type of social group, the members of which may or may not share a common identity, but very much a located group of people who may have nothing more in common than their location within the English countryside. Indeed the very category ‘country people’ – in which ‘the social and the spatial are bound together in an indissoluble unity’ (ibid: 33) - functions to obscure social differences (and perhaps conflicts) by foregrounding an inhabited landscape rather than the inhabitants themselves.

This form of categorization, that has its basis in notions of the ‘mystic’ bonds between people and their ‘natural’ homelands (Jackson & Penrose, 1995) provides a neat linguistic framework for linking human rights to assumptions regarding legitimate whereabouts and would seem to lend particular potency to arguments for warranting claims about social difference or for excluding or marginalizing outsiders. Indeed, a study carried out by Echabe & Castro (1996), shows the powerful effect of manipulating ‘border permeability’ in an experimental situation. Their participants clearly demonstrated that a mere suggestion of tighter border controls served to legitimate prejudiced responses.

Discursive psychologists frequently talk of the way that subject positions may be worked up, undermined and negotiated in talk. However as Dixon and Durrheim (2000: 17) have pointed out, such spatial concepts are ‘used analogically, with little serious attention to their spatial implications.’ What I aim to explore is function of place constructions in the constitution of asylum seekers as a particular kind of ‘natural’ other.

**Background and Method**

The data presented here are taken from a much larger corpus of data that was gathered between 1999 and 2004 to form the basis of a doctoral thesis. The larger research project began with the (perhaps naïve) aim of taking the perspective of asylum seekers themselves. However, it rapidly became apparent that any critical stance on this issue and any hope of producing an emancipatory analysis (Fairclough & Wodak, 1997) must necessarily engage with the dominant form of meaning making around the issue of asylum as well as with the marginalized voices (Fairclough, 2001). Indeed, the asylum seekers’ own narratives are not (and could never be) a ‘pure’ reflection of their own lived experience. Rather they are littered with categories and argumentative strategies that are recognizably orientated to and positioned within the dominant political and media stories of asylum. The extracts presented below as an example are taken from the British tabloid newspapers, The Daily Mail and The Mail on Sunday and Handsard transcripts of House of Commons debates.

**The analytic framework**

This analysis is informed both by the critical agenda of critical discourse analysts (e.g. Fairclough, 2001; Fairclough & Wodak, 1997; van Dijk, 1993) and the work of discourse analysts working ‘critically’ within the sub-discipline of social psychology (e.g. Billig, 2001, 2002, 2005; Dixon, 2001; Wetherell, 1998). Because the analysis is concerned with the relationship between language and power, it is particularly concerned with how accounts work to produce the ‘reality’ of the asylum issue in ways that argue for the protection and maintenance of the status quo in terms of people-place organization.
It is further informed by the work of Dixon & Durrheim (2000), who have drawn on the theory of human and political geography in order to engage with the ecological and geopolitical dimensions of social exclusion. They argue that the discourse of people-place relationships is not simply reflective of the 'natural' shape of the world, but is rather action orientated (Edwards, 1997). In other words talk of people place relationships may function in various ways, e.g. to make territorial claims, to support exclusionary arguments, to justify social action or mobilize populations (Wallwork & Dixon, 2004). This analysis, then, focuses on the function of place categories and people-place formulations in constituting asylum seekers as the 'natural' recipients of discrimination.

**Analysis**

This section gives an overview of the analysis, rather than an in-depth examination. It is divided into two interrelated sections. The first examines the constitution of asylum seekers through the rhetoric of location and the second explores the function of asylum rhetoric in constructions of ‘the nation’.

**Constituting the ‘other’ through location**

The following extracts are taken from two of Britain’s tabloid newspapers.

*Extract 1: Daily Mail 27-01-03 Feature from Ian Sparks*

**Double page headline:** Blair’s bluster in migrant shambles

**Feature headline:** Asylum-on-Sea: How closing Sangatte has merely transferred the problem to a sleepy resort in Normandy

Since the closure of Sangatte refugee centre at Calais, the picturesque fishing port close to the medieval town of Bayeux has become overrun with asylum seekers heading for Britain.

If and when they are rounded up by police, they claim they wish to seek asylum in France.

This guarantees that, instead of being transported hundreds of miles inland to reception centers, they are handed over to social services which provide them with a hotel room in the resort.

From there, they plot their next attempt to board a ferry for Portsmouth.

Other ports such as St Malo and Cherbourg are also feeling the Sangatte Effect, but it is most dramatic here in the Ouistreham, 150 miles from Calais.
During 2002, a total of 295 immigrants were arrested trying to sneak aboard ferries at Ouistreham, mostly hidden in the back of lorries. But less than a month in 2003, frontier police have already caught 95.

How many have been missed by the undermanned patrols can only be guessed at.

The town’s mayor Andre Ledran is infuriated by the invasion of asylum seekers...

Once installed in hotels commandeered by the state because they are closed for the winter, the refugees are free to make repeated attempts to breach security at the Ouistreham ferry port, which has two Brittany Ferries per day crossing to Portsmouth.

Extract 2: The Mail on Sunday 9-09-01  Feature by Peter Birkett

Headline: Eurotunnel hires general: Man who was Army’s top officer is drafted in to stem flow of refugees
Sub headline: ‘Hundreds try to break in every night’

Channel Tunnel operator Eurotunnel has hired the man who was the most senior officer in the British Army to spearhead its battle against asylum seekers.

General Sir Roger Wheeler, who saw action in Bosnia and Northern Ireland, and was Chief of Staff in the Falkland Islands in the aftermath of the conflict there, has been drafted in to stem the flow of refugees to Britain from the Sangatte camp near Calais.

He will use expertise gained during a glittering, 26-year military career to tighten the security operation at the Channel tunnel entrance, which has been breached by hundreds of asylum seekers in recent weeks...

He said: ‘I have recommended some extension of the inner perimeter fence, I have recommended some variations on the way they deploy their manpower and I have recommended some changes in the way they, in their terms, manage the situation and, in my terms, command and control it.’

On Friday, the High Court ruled that holding asylum seekers under lock and key at a centre in Britain was unlawful, leaving the way open for asylum seekers to claim compensation.
The ruling was made as the tide of refugees massing in France grows. In the last fortnight, more than 40 asylum seekers risked their lives to walk six miles into the tunnel and dozens more took part in a mass invasion of the Eurotunnel site in France. The invasion was captured in dramatic television pictures.

Eurotunnel says that so far this year it has prevented more than 30,000 would-be asylum seekers from reaching the UK, but the situation has now escalated to unprecedented levels.

No-one reading the above two accounts would be in any doubt that asylum seekers (or refugees) are being worked up, in the words of Lynn & Lea (2003: 426) as a ‘serious social problem’. Not only are they a problem for the keepers of law and order, ‘the frontier police’, ‘the town mayor’, ‘General Sir Roger Wheeler’, but they are also a problem to themselves – ‘40 asylum seekers risked their lives to walk six miles into the tunnel’.

This problematizing is achieved through a variety of discursive strategies most obvious of which is perhaps the employment of a narrative form (Reisigl & Wodak, 2001) that draws on the popular genre of the crime drama, supplying the reader with a series of descriptions of moves and counter moves. For example, asylum seekers ‘overrun’ Bayeaux and are ‘rounded up by the police’, ‘they claim they wish to seek asylum’, and ‘they are handed over to social services’ (Extract 1), ‘they breach the Channel tunnel entrance’ and a General is ‘drafted in ‘to tighten the security operation’ (Extract 2) and so on. The extracts are also littered with evocative war and flood metaphors, - ‘rounded up by the police’, ‘under lock and key’, ‘spearhead its battle’, ‘stem the flow’ and ‘tide of refugees’ - as well as ‘quantification rhetoric’ (Potter, 1996) – ‘295 immigrants were arrested’, ‘30,000 would-be asylum seekers’ - and ‘expert’ opinion.

There is much that could be said about the particular rhetorical tasks being performed by such strategies. However, I focus here on an often neglected aspect of the positioning of the ‘other’ i.e. their constitution through location.

In these extracts, ‘otherness’ and, arguably racial otherness, is being made relevant in the absence of any of the essentialist social identity categories, such as non-whiteness, race, ethnicity, religion or culture that typically form the basis of racist accounts (Verkuyten, 2003). Nor is there anything inherently ‘race’ bound about the activities of ‘overrunning’, ‘plotting’, ‘sneaking’, ‘breaching’ or ‘massing’. Of course, one might argue that that the constitution of asylum seekers as ‘deviant’ is an inherently ‘racist’ activity and there the analysis might end. However this would miss an important link between the constitution of asylum seekers and the construction of their illegitimate whereabouts.

This is perhaps best illustrated by the Feature Headline of Extract 1 - ‘Asylum-on-Sea: How closing Sangatte has merely transferred the problem to a sleepy resort in Normandy’. As van Dijk (1991) has argued, headlines tell the reader what to notice in the following text. This headline is interesting. Although the news story itself is full of accounts of activity, this headlines suggests that what the reader should notice is not so much ‘who’ is doing what but rather where it is happening – a ‘sleepy resort in Normandy’, that has been transformed into ‘asylum-on-sea’. Of the five categories featured here, four are categories of place. This suggests that in the case of ‘the problem’ of asylum, social or people categories are irrelevant. ‘The problem’ is a problem of place.

In fact these extracts are as littered with categories of location as they are devoid of categories of social identity. These accounts do not point to and are therefore not constrained by category bound knowledge about ethnic identity or nation of origin. The identity of asylum seekers is rather worked up through the deviancy of their location: the act of wilfully being and wanting to be where they do not belong (Sibley, 1995) - ‘heading for Britain’, ‘invading’ towns, ‘breaching Euro tunnel fences’.

This absence of social descriptors means that asylum seeker identity can then be
entirely constituted through the language of place violation and the fight to protect it. The rhetorical upshot is that prejudiced talk about asylum seekers looks like benign talk of the occasioned protection of perimeter fences and sleepy resorts in Normandy, rather than a more pervasive nationalist exclusionary practice. Discrimination, then, may be glossed as the ‘natural’ consequences of people out-of-place (Sibley, 1995).

In sum, this positioning of asylum seekers draws upon a pervasive and powerful ideology of people-place relationships, specifically people-nation relationships (Jackson & Penrose, 1995). In the categories ‘asylum-on-sea’, ‘frontier police’ and ‘perimeter fences’ is embedded a powerful symbol of difference and exclusion, namely our national border. These accounts are about ‘others’ heading for ‘our’ Britain. Arguably, it is this indexing of the national boundary that distinguishes the legitimate from the illegitimate and informs and justifies the negative evaluations of the asylum seekers, the ‘other’ (Dixon & Durrheim, 2000). At the same time it is the language of access, breaches and protection that brings into being the boundary as an ‘out there’ reality, an entity that separates ‘us’ from ‘them’ but paradoxically pre-exists invasions and the efforts of police, Generals and authorities to protect it. In other words, these accounts do not simply describe a local landscape and the bad things asylum seekers do in it. Rather they construct national geographies on which asylum seeker deviance and the imperative to protect are already inscribed.

My data suggest that this is pervasive and that even the so-called ‘liberal’ stance on asylum is never free from the appeal to assumptions about the ‘nature’ of nations as exclusionary categories. This is briefly explored in the next section.

The ‘other’ and the making of a nation

The following extract is taken from Handsard transcripts of House of Commons debates.

Extract 3: David Blunkett, the Home Secretary 12-06-02

We want to offer a warm welcome to people from across the world who wish to come to our shores to settle, to work, to be educated, to visit, to be able to integrate through diversity in our society, to bring different cultures, experiences and enterprise, to contribute to the development of our economy and our social life, to make a difference to local communities and to be able to show a different face. This is Britain – a nation that has been built up over the generations and centuries and of which we are proud today.

This section of the analysis attends to the overtly pro-immigration/asylum stance that emerges both from within the pages of our more liberal press and from the floor of parliament. Extract 3 is taken from a speech given by the former Home Secretary at the time of publication of the White Paper on asylum and immigration (2000). Here, he is neatly summing up the openness of today’s liberal Britain. ‘This is Britain’, he announces, a nation that not only offers a ‘warm welcome’ to others, but embraces diversity – ‘a different face’. Similar descriptions of our national tolerance and open-handedness might be found in any number of political speeches or the liberal press. However, boldly, Mr Blunkett takes this a step further and suggests that Britain is, in fact, defined historically by that diversity – ‘built up over the generations and centuries’. Rarely does one find a government spokesperson, particularly a Home Secretary facing a ‘terrorist crisis’, so clearly articulating the link between Britishness and Britain’s immigrant population.

And yet, almost before the ‘welcoming’ speech has begun, the caveat appears. The ‘wish’ in the opening sentence relates not to the infinite ‘to come’ but rather to the list of activities that follow - ‘to work’, ‘to settle’, ‘to be able’, ‘to integrate’, ‘to bring’, ‘to contribute’, ‘to make’. The ‘welcome’ to ‘our shores’ that ‘we’ offer is, after all, conditional and the discursive upshot is that the Britain ‘of which we are proud today’ expects a certain standard of behaviour and activity from people ‘from across the world’. For
example, they must be industrious, productive, community minded and, however diverse
they might be, they must be diverse in a very British way. In short, they must be
prepared to fulfil our ideal image of ourselves and reproduce ‘our’ notion of ‘our’ British
diversity.

One might use and develop the brief analysis above to argue quite simply that even this
apparently pro-asylum stance is in fact discriminatory; that this is not simply an
argument for those who ‘wish to come to’ do but against those who do not (Billig, 1987).
Indeed there is little here that suggests that the ‘warm welcome’ might be extended to
those who may ‘wish to come to our shores’ to seek refuge, rather than ‘to bring’ or ‘to
make’. However, this would take the analysis beyond what is evident in the text and this
is not necessary in order to make the point that what Mr Blunkett is doing in this speech
is not preaching diversity and inclusiveness, but rather nation building.

The short extract is littered with what Billig (1995) calls the deictic language of
nationalism that points to and reaffirms the taken-for-granted ideology of the ‘mystical’
bond between people and nation (Jackson & Penrose, 1995). In his opening sentence,
he draws the metaphorical line – ‘our shores’ that form our island boundary – between
‘we’, who have an unquestionable right to be here and ‘they’, ‘people from across the
world’, who must be invited. Despite David Blunkett’s assertion that Britain is defined by
its diversity – ‘built over the generations and centuries’ – this evocation of our national
boundary ‘our shores’ none-the-less draws attention to and firmly grounds the difference
between ‘us’ and ‘them. This offers a form of distinctiveness that does not necessitate
the spelling out of ‘their’ ethnic or racial difference. Rather that difference is already
deply embedded in the simple category ‘our shores’.

Further, the phrase ‘people from across the world’ might imply a national
broadmindedness and a lack of discrimination in Britain’s welcome to others, but it also
does the work of defining ‘them’ as others. Thus this subtle indexing of the national
boundary functions on two important levels. Firstly, it establishes any talk of ‘different’
faces and cultures as consequential, rather than as an overt orientation to otherness
(Potter, 1996). Second it gives to the national category greater resonance and meaning,
paradoxically, as a place of exclusion. ‘We’ after all have the power to decide who is and
is not given a ‘warm welcome’.

To conclude, I have tried to show that ‘racist’ talk about asylum seekers does not always
draw on social identity categories to work up ‘otherness’. Nor is the rhetoric of place
violation and national integrity simply a ‘natural’ consequence of the asylum context.
Rather, the working up of asylum seekers as deviant place violators or as ‘natural’
others takes discursive work. However, if we challenge such accounts as ‘racist’ without
examining in detail the basis of the ‘other’ classification, then we may simply support
and maintain a status quo based on the fiction of the natural relationship between
people and places.

References

and Movement in World Politics. Millennium: Journal of International Studies 28
(3): 499-521


Billig, M. (1985). Prejudice, categorization and particularization: From a perceptual to a


Billig, M. (2001). Humour and hatred: the racist jokes of the Ku Klux Klan. Discourse and
Society 12 (3): 267-289

time. Discourse and Society 16 (4): 459-480

Billig, M. (2002). Henri Tajfel’s ‘Cognitive aspects of prejudice’ and the psychology of


Intertextuality across Languages and Cultures: a Contrastive Study of Chinese and English Newspaper Commentaries on September 11®

Wei Wang
University of Sydney

Abstract

This presentation explores how Chinese and English newspaper commentaries on terrorism are intertextually constructed. Here it focuses on examining how Chinese and English writers draw on other sources for the writing of their own texts. As a comparable genre realised in different socio-cultural and linguistic contexts, newspaper commentaries responding to the events of September 11 written by Chinese and English writers in China and Australia respectively are used as sample texts for examining the writers’ intertextual practices.

Informed by discussions of intertextuality in critical discourse analysis (Fairclough, 1992; 1995), new rhetoric genre studies (Bazerman, 2004) and appraisal theory (Martin, 2000; White, 2002), this presentation proposes an analytical framework for addressing questions as followed: How do the writers include outside sources in a text? What do the writers use these sources for? How do the writers position themselves as writers in relation to other sources to make their own statements?

It is found that the intertextual practices among the Chinese writers differ greatly while the English writers generally work closely with intertextual sources to support their views. In the most common Chinese rhetorical type in this study – media explanatory exposition, the Chinese writers tend to use attributed but unidentified external sources or sources with high status for keeping a distance from these sources. Thus, the writers take the role of presenters of public opinion and avoid becoming ‘the principal’ of the texts. That means that they attempt to evade responsibility for what has been written by quoting other sources. In the English texts, however, intertextual sources were widely used with the writers attempting to exploit various intertextual sources (attributed or unattributed) in various ways (i.e. as background information, evidence, ideas or issues, etc.) to support their positions. The English writers in this study generally seemed to be working as ‘the author’, ‘the animator’ and ‘the principal’ of the texts, as the one and same person.

The presentation will conclude that the differences and similarities in the intertextual practices in these two sets of texts can be attributed to the particular socio-cultural contexts in which these texts are produced.
Introduction

This paper analyses how Chinese and English writers draw on outside sources for the writing of their own texts by employing the theories of intertextuality. As a comparable genre realised in different socio-cultural and linguistic contexts, newspaper commentaries responding to the events of September 11 written by Chinese and English writers in China and Australia respectively are used as sample texts for examining the writers' intertextual practices.

Informed by discussions of intertextuality in critical discourse analysis (Fairclough, 1992a,b, 1995), new rhetoric genre studies (Bazerman, 2004) and appraisal theory (Martin, 2000; White, 2002), this paper proposes an analytical framework for addressing the following: How do the writers include outside sources in a text? What types of sources do the writers use? What do the writers use these sources for? How do the writers position themselves as writers in relation to other sources to make their own statements? This paper demonstrates the major research findings by characterising one Chinese text and one English text.

The notion of intertextuality offers a perspective for both reading and writing texts as processes of interacting with prior texts, writers, readers, and conventions. Thibault (1994, p.1751) explains this perspective by stating "all texts, spoken and written, are constructed and have the meanings which text-users assign to them in and through their relations with other texts in some social formation".

Kristeva is credited with the notion and term ‘intertextuality’ on the basis of Bakhtin’s work (Kristeva, 1986). According to Bakhtin (1986), every text (or utterance) is dialogical, in the sense that it gains its meaning in relation to other texts. Kristeva (1981, p.36) further points out that a given text is “a permutation of texts, an intertextuality: in the space of a given text, several utterances, taken from other texts, intersect and neutralize one other”. Kristeva’s use of the term aims to describe the complex and heterogeneous nature of the discursive materials which intersect in particular textual production. For her, the text is kind of a ‘productivity’ in which various semiotic codes, genres, and meaning relations are both combined and transformed. Thus, Kristeva sees all texts as being constituted out of, and understood in relation to, other texts in the same social formation (Thibault, 1994).

Models of intertextual analysis

‘Intertextuality’ has been studied from different perspectives for different purposes. It is observed that there is no stable approach to analyse the complex phenomena of intertextuality in writing production and interpretation. The approaches to intertextuality analysis range from focusing on linguistic conventions such as White (2002) to social conventions such as Lemke (1995). The elementary type of analysis is to examine the intertextual composition of a single text, describing both the explicit (e.g. the direct quotation) and the implicit (e.g. mentioning of a belief or issue of the context) instances of intertextual relations. More importantly, most scholars perceive intertextuality not only as a form through which texts are interrelated, but also as a social practice that involves particular socially regulated ways of producing and interpreting discourse (Fairclough 1992, 1995).

According to Fairclough (1992a; 1992b; 1995), intertextuality "points to how texts can transform prior texts and restructure existing conventions (genres, discourses) to generate new ones" (Fairclough 1992b, p. 270). It concerns how texts are produced in relation to prior
texts and how texts help to construct the existing conventions in producing new texts. In his 1995 book *Media Discourse*, Fairclough proposes a three-dimensional framework for analysing intertextuality of media discourse. The model comprises: the analysis of discourse representation, generic analysis of discourse types, and analysis of discourses in texts (Fairclough 1995). To Fairclough (1992a,b, 1995), discourse representation is a form of intertextuality in which parts of specific texts are incorporated into a text and are usually, but not always, explicitly marked with devices such as quotation marks and reporting clauses. Moreover, Fairclough tends to analyse intertextual relations as power relations, suggesting that intertextuality can become a locus of contestation and struggle (see Fairclough, 1992a, b).

Scholars such as Devitt (1991) and Bazerman (1993; 2004) from the new rhetoric genre studies analysed intertextuality in non-literary texts. They approach intertextual relation as social practice, as more or less stable conventions of a particular discourse community. In Bazerman’s 2004 article, he put forward some basic concepts and a basic procedure of analysing intertextuality. The basic concepts he mentions include levels of intertextuality, techniques of intertextual representation, intertextual distance or reach, and translation across contexts/recontextualization. The basic procedure he suggests is briefly summarised below:

- To identify your purpose for doing intertextual analysis and what questions you hope to answer by doing it;
- To identify the specific texts you want to examine; in other words, to identify your set of texts;
- To identify the traces of other texts by examining explicit overt references to other authors first;
- To start making observations and interpretations by considering the reference in relation to the context of what the author is saying;
- To look for more subtle clues to cater for your analytical purpose;
- To start looking for a pattern from which you can start developing conclusion.

Bazerman (2004, p. 94) states that “intertextuality is not just a matter of which other texts you refer to, but how you use them, what you use them for, and ultimately how you position yourself as a writer to them to make your own statement”.

Analysing intertextuality is not simply a matter of charting the ‘voices’ on which texts draw. As Culler (1981, p.103) argues, it is impossible to establish the origins of all intertextual elements in texts, as texts draw not only on specific other texts but on ‘anonymous discursive practices, and codes whose origins are lost’. Hence, analysis cannot aim to explain all the conventions that texts rely on in order to have meaning. Culler (1981, p.105) further argues that restricting the scope of intertextuality for the practical reasons of textual analysis is not inappropriate, but rather questions the claim made for the concept of intertextuality as a whole. Intertextuality is meant to be a general theory, but when it is applied, it is often narrowed down to such a point that the generality of the theory is arguable.

Bazerman (2004) also argues that there are many reasons for conducting an intertextual analysis. For instance, to identify which realm of sources a writer relies on and how, or to
understand how a researcher is attempting to characterise, rely on, and advance prior work in the related fields. Thus, the purpose of this paper for conducting the intertextual analysis was narrowed down to examine how writers draw on outside sources for the writing of their own texts.

For the purpose of analysing intertextuality, White’s (2002) framework for analysing ‘engagement’ is especially relevant to give detailed linguistic grounding to intertextual analysis. Under the framework of ‘appraisal analysis’ in systemic functional linguistics, ‘engagement’ “is concerned with the sourcing of attitude and acknowledgement of alternative voices” (Martin, 2002, p.58) in a text. As an important resource for analysing ‘engagement’, White (2002) considers ‘attribution’ as a resource to analyse the quoting or referencing the statement or points of view of outside sources. In other words, ‘attribution’ is concerned with identifying linguistic resources for including outside sources and looking closely at the choices available for evaluating these sources (Droga & Humphrey, 2002). White’s (2002) framework of ‘attribution’ covers three aspects of analysis, namely: textual integration, source type and endorsement. In other words, it only covers the explicit intertextual sources in Bazerman’s framework. According to White (2002) and Droga and Humphrey (2002), ‘textual integration’ indicates the degrees of integrating the material with paraphrasing or by directly quoting; ‘source type’ refers to the source in more or less personalised, named, specific or authoritative ways; and ‘endorsement’ indicates various degrees of support for the material.

For fulfilling the purpose of the intertextual analysis in this paper, i.e. to examine how the writers draw on outside sources to construct their own texts, White’s (2002) framework to analyse ‘attribution’ is drawn on to incorporate with Bazerman’s framework on intertextuality for developing an analytical framework in this paper. Figure one outlines the analytical framework developed for this purpose.
To further elaborate the intertextual practices in this paper, Goffman's (1974; 1981) classification of the positions that writers may take in relationship to texts was employed as well. In understanding a multitude of positions writers may take in relation to text. Goffman (1974, 1981) points out that there are at least three different positions that a writer could take. The first is as author, the person who crafts the text. The second is as animator, the person who produces the physical instance of the text. Last is as principal, the person who is responsible for the text. These three roles can either be the same one person, or not. This classification can help us to differentiate the different roles that a writer takes in relation to text production.


**Intertextual analysis**

In this research project two comparable sets of sample texts were collected from Chinese and Australian newspapers (see details in Wang, in press). A total of 50 newspaper commentaries were collected as sample texts: 25 Chinese texts and 25 English texts. After an analysis of their rhetorical types (see details in Lee 2001, p.37), the 50 sample texts were categorized into six rhetorical types, i.e. media explanatory exposition, argumentative exposition, hortatory exposition, problem/solution, media challenge and media discussion.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rhetorical type</th>
<th>Media exposition</th>
<th>Problem/solution</th>
<th>Media challenge</th>
<th>Media discussion</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explanatory exposition</td>
<td>Chinese texts</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argumentative exposition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hortatory exposition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English texts</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of rhetorical type of texts the most striking differences found in these two sets of texts was that in the Chinese texts, the most widely found rhetorical type was ‘explanatory exposition’ (20 out of 25 texts), while ‘argumentative exposition’ was the dominant rhetorical type found in the English texts (18 out of 25 texts). In the ‘explanatory expositions’, the writers mainly attempted to explain what ‘terrorism’ is, what ‘terrorist organizations’ are and how to deal with them. Surprisingly, no argumentative exposition was found in the Chinese texts. In the English ‘argumentative expositions’, the writers argued for or against some points, such as the ‘US should now take careful aim’, ‘Punishing bin Laden won’t stop extremists’, and ‘Bush needs to be tough’. At the same time, no explanatory exposition was identified in the English set of data. From each rhetorical type of text, one Chinese and one English text were chosen for detailed intertextual analysis. That is, a total of nine texts were analysed in depth for understanding the intertextual practices of these two sets of texts. For other texts, quick and simple analyses were made to identify the similarities and differences for the sample texts. This analytical strategy was developed for reducing the considerable amount of the detailed analytical work of the project.

The following section demonstrates the major analytical findings by characterising one of the Chinese explanatory expositions and one of the English argumentative expositions, which are the dominant rhetorical type of text found respectively in the two sets of sample texts.

The title of the Chinese text is ‘International terrorism: “The dark power that shakes the international strategic situation” (The China Youth Daily, 22/09/2001). This Chinese text uses no direct or indirect quotations but quite a few of descriptions to illustrate the situation. For instances, *(Thereafter, all the numbers in the brackets indicate the sentence number in the texts.)*

- (4)

  有关资料表明, 世界范围内有组织的恐怖主义活动最早始于20世纪30年代末40年代初

  [Some relevant data show that the earliest international organized terrorist]
activities began in the late 1930s and early 1940s.] (5)

首例恐怖主义事件发生在英国统治下的巴勒斯坦。[The first case of terrorist attack occurred in British governed Palestine.]当时的民族军、斯特恩帮和哈加纳等一些犹太复国主义恐怖集团袭击了英国和巴勒斯坦的目标。[Zionist terrorists organizations such as the National Army, Stan Group and Hagala attacked British and Palestinian targets.]

● (17)

另有统计表明，半个世纪来，已有超过20名总统、总理一级的人物死于恐怖性暗杀。[Other statistics show that more than 20 presidents and premiers have been assassinated by terrorists in the second half of the 20th century.]

● (35) 据悉，1988年本·拉登组织成立的“阿尔-伊达”组织，在其领导机构协商委员会下面，设有军事、财政、宗教、媒体4个委员会，分别担负不同的职能，俨然是一支完善的跨国力量。[It is reported that in 1988 bin Laden established the Al Qaida organization with the leading organ ‘consultation committee’, and four sub-committees with different functions, namely, military, financial, religion and media. This organization is definitely a well-arranged interstate power.]

The writer mainly assimilates the outside sources to fit into the text rather than inserts them as direct quotes. These outside sources are all attributed, but unidentified sources. The writer seems to attribute these sources generally to some impersonal and generic agencies. They are used as used as evidence to show what terrorism is and what terrorists have done. In addition, the writer does not strongly indicate endorsement to the outside sources. It could be argued that the purpose of including such sources is to set some distance between the writer and the text he/she produces, and to avoid any personal responsibility for what is written.

Some unattributed information (implicit intertextual sources) is also used in the text to establish the background of the argument.

● (43) 早在30年前，联合国已经开始为消除恐怖主义而努力。[30 years ago, the UN began to make efforts to eradicate terrorism.] (44)

在联合国及其机构的主持下，于1963、1970、1971年先后起草制定了3个有关空中劫机的国际公约：东京公约、海牙公约、蒙特利尔公约。[Under the guidance of the UN and its organizations, three international pacts against hijacking were constituted respectively in 1963, 1970 and 1971. They are the Tokyo Pact, the Hague Pact and
the Montreal Pact. (45)

联合国大会多次通过决议呼吁各国共同防止、消除恐怖主义，明确地把任何地点所从事的恐怖主义活动谴责为犯罪，并要求所有国家采取有效而果断的措施，加快最终彻底消除国际恐怖主义的步伐。 [The UN General Assembly has passed resolutions several times to call for a joint effort to prevent and eradicate terrorism together, and to classify terrorist activities as crimes and accuse terrorist activities occurred in anywhere as crimes, and request all the countries to take effective and decisive measures for speeding up the pace for eliminating terrorism.] (46)

1988年3月10日，23个国家在罗马签署了一项条约，要求签约国起诉或引渡那些在公海实施暴力行径的恐怖分子。 [On 10 March 1988, 23 countries signed a treaty in Rome to bring accusations against, or extradite all the terrorists conducting terrorist activities in high seas.]

These sources are not attributed to any specific agency, but are taken as some widely circulated information to establish the background of the argument of the text.

In short, this Chinese text uses a number of outside sources to establish a kind of public discourse, from which the writer attempts to keep a distance. The writer often positions himself/herself outside of this public discourse as its presenter, not as a participant within it. Moreover, few arguments or stances of the writer himself/herself are identified in the text. These features are also widely found in other Chinese explanatory expositions.

The text identified in English expositions for the intertextual analysis is ‘Led astray in despair of common humanity’ (The Australian, 19/09/2001). This is one of the argumentative expositions that comprise 18 out of 25 English texts. This text argues that ‘recognising terrorists as human will help reduce their power over us.’ In this text no direct or indirect quotation is found either. Most of the sources used in this text are mainly unattributed.

- Terrorist movements in the Middle East partly emerged from the crisis of post-colonial nationalist regimes such as those in Algeria, Iran and Egypt. In the 1950s and ‘60s, secular nationalist leaders strove to modernise their countries, investing heavily in education and infrastructure. In the ‘60s and ‘70s, those countries found themselves unable to respond to economic globalisation and technological revolutions.

- Increasing numbers of frustrated but educated young people and dispossessed rural populations converged in large cities.

- Terrorist movements are led by educated young people, often trained in elite universities in the US. They use the dispossessed, such as the Taliban in Afghanistan, as their shock troops. Political Islam does not come from traditional religion. It is a relatively recent ideology that emerged in the late 1800s, about the same time as nationalism. But as nationalism has failed, political Islam has
increasingly taken its place, nurtured by the crises of modernising nationalist regimes, military defeat, cultural humiliation and destruction of traditional ways of life.

The writer takes the sources as something that is widely circulated or accepted for supporting the ideas and arguments that he puts forward. At the beginning of the text, the writer introduces the history of terrorism, which orientates the readers to the arguments that he/she attempts to raise. Later on, the writer describes the ‘terrorist movement’ from a more factual kind of argument (i.e. ‘Terrorist movements are led by educated young…’) to more controversial ones (i.e. ‘These movements are similar to sects’; and ‘wars serve to increase the importance of these groups.’). It seems that all the arguments come from the ideas and issues that are commonly circulated and accepted in the particular socio-cultural settings. The writer, thus, establishes quite a few of the arguments out of the widely circulated public discourses.

The English writer tends to obliterate the traces of the outside sources since he/she takes them as widely accepted discourses, and based on those, the writer indicates endorsement and establishes arguments such as ‘when people are subjected to violence, they are robbed of their humanity (Sentence22),’ and ‘part of overcoming the experience of being a victim involves recognising the humanity of the person who committed the crime (Sentence25).’ Further on, the writer establishes the thesis that ‘recognising terrorists as human will help reduce their power over us’. In this case, the writer takes up a role as public commentator. He/she is not working as a reporter or a presenter of public discourse but working with the boarder public discourse for putting forward his/her arguments. These kinds of practices are found widely across the English sample texts in this paper.

Summary

The following table is a brief summary of what are found in these two texts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analytical items</th>
<th>The Chinese text</th>
<th>The English text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intertextual representation</td>
<td>No direct or indirect quotation</td>
<td>No direct or indirect quotation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A few description</td>
<td>A few description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assimilated</td>
<td>Assimilated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source type</td>
<td>Attributed but unidentified, impersonal, generic sources</td>
<td>Unattributed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source function</td>
<td>Background information</td>
<td>Background information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evidence</td>
<td>Beliefs and ideas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Endorsement</td>
<td>Non-endorsement</td>
<td>Endorsement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The analysis above shows that the most striking differences between these two texts is that in the Chinese explanatory exposition, the writer often draws on attributed but unidentified, generic sources, with which he/she does not indicate any endorsement. In other words, the writer is just the presenter of public discourses who keeps a distance with the outside sources. In this case, the Chinese writer works mainly as ‘the author’ or ‘the animator’ of the
text, who attempts to evade direct responsibility for what has been written by quoting other sources. In the English argumentative expositions, the writer does not often attribute the sources to any agencies. Many outside sources are taken as widely circulated ideas or information in the particular social context, and are endorsed directly or indirectly to serve the writer’s argument. Thus, the writer usually works with these sources closely and works out his/her own voices out of the public discourses. In this way, the English writer attempts to work as commentator of public discourses, not only ‘author’ or ‘animator’, but also as ‘principal’ of the text. The intertextual practices found in these two texts are also widely observed in the other Chinese and English texts respectively in this research project.

On considering intertextual practices as more or less conventions of a particular discourse community, this paper suggests that the differences and similarities in the intertextual practices in these two sets of texts can be attributed to the particular socio-cultural contexts in which these texts are produced. These differences could be further explored by examining why the writers tend to position themselves in/outside of the public discourse as presenters or commentators in the different socio-cultural contexts.

References


**Data**


Appendix
The Chinese text

中国青年报/2001年/09月/22日/第002版  [CHINA YOUTH DAILY  Page2  22/09/2001]

国际恐怖主义:撼动国际战略局势的黑暗力量
[International terrorism: The dark power that shakes the international strategic situation]

特约撰稿人  原理 [Yuan Li, Specially Commissioned Writer]

“9·11”是一个标志性事件。按美国的说法,是一场战争。“September 11” is a symbolic event. According to the US, it is a war.

如果说,长期以来一直存在的恐怖主义还以其规模有限、伤亡较小而不能以“战争”来对待的话,这一事件差不多宣告了恐怖战作为一种新战争形式的诞生。If the long existing terrorism cannot be treated as ‘a war’ because of their limited sizes and small casualties, this event almost declared the birth of terrorist war as a new form of war.

是历史还是序言? [Is it the history or prelude?]

有关资料表明,世界范围内有组织的恐怖主义活动最早始于20世纪30年代末40年代初。Some relevant data show that the earliest international organized terrorist activities began in the late 1930s and early 1940s.

首例恐怖主义事件发生在英国统治下的巴勒斯坦。[The first case of terrorist attack occurred in British governed Palestine.]

“是历史还是序言?” [Is it the history or prelude?]

当前的民族军、斯特恩帮和哈加纳等一些犹太复国主义恐怖集团袭击了英国和巴勒斯坦的目标。[Zionist terrorists organizations such as the National Army, Stan Group and Hagala attacked British and Palestinian targets.]

发生在1946年7月的“大卫王饭店”事件则是首次震惊世界的恐怖主义活动。[The event that occurred at the ‘King David Hotel’ was the first international terrorist event that shocked the world.]
守卫森严的大卫王饭店是英国军方和文官在耶路撒冷的总部。当地下室的高爆炸药把这座大楼炸成两半儿的时候，人类切实感受到了恐怖主义带来的恐惧。

当今世界上的恐怖组织已知的有大大小小1000个左右，大致可以分为6类：

1. 极左翼恐怖组织。主要活跃在欧美日等发达资本主义国家和一些拉美国家，如意大利的“红色旅”、日本的“赤军”等。

2. 极右翼恐怖组织。主要活动在西欧及美国和拉美地区，是奉行新法西斯主义、极权主义、种族主义的恐怖组织。

3. 民族主义恐怖组织。广泛分布于世界各地，如阿尔伊达组织、“埃塔”组织、“爱尔兰共和军”、“泰米尔伊拉姆猛虎解放组织”。

4. 宗教性恐怖组织。

5. 国际恐怖组织。指某些国家当局直接操控国家机器进行恐怖活动。

6. 黑社会恐怖组织。如意大利的“黑手党”。

据美国兰德公司恐怖活动数据库提供的数字，20世纪80年代全世界发生了近4000起恐怖活动，比70年代增加了30%，死亡人数翻了一番。
另据统计表明，半个世纪来，已有超过20名总统、总理一级的人物死于恐怖性暗杀。[Other statistics show that more than 20 presidents and premiers have been assassinated by terrorists in the second half of the 20th century.]

冷战结束了，恐怖主义却显然得到了迅猛的发展。[After the Cold War, terrorism increased rapidly.]

1995年3月，日本东京地铁发生剧毒气体“沙林”攻击事件，12人死亡，5500多人被送进医院；1998年8月7日，美国驻肯尼亚和坦桑尼亚使馆爆炸，258人死亡，5000多人受伤；1999年10月，亚美尼亚总理萨尔基和一些议员、政府官员在议会内被杀；2000年10月，载有3500名美国海军陆战队队员的“科尔”号驱逐舰在也门亚丁港遇袭，造成17名海军陆战队员死亡，38人受伤……[In March 1995, the deadly sarin gas in the subway system in Tokyo killed 12 people and over 5500 people were sent to hospital. On August 7, 1998, the explosions on the US Embassies in Kenya and Tanzania led to 258 deaths and over 5000 people were injured. In October 1999, the Armenian Premier Sarkisian and parliamentarians and government officials were killed in the parliament. In October 2000, the US Navy destroyer USS ‘Cole’ which was carrying 3500 members of US Marine Corps was raided in Aden Harbour, Yemen. 17 leathernocks were killed and 38 injured…]

而在巴勒斯坦，恐怖活动已成了中东战争的新形态。[But in Palestine, terrorist activities have become a new form of Middle East war.]

“9·11”事件无疑是人类历史上空前的恐怖活动，但是，它也将成为“绝后”的恐怖行动吗？[September 11 has undoubtedly been the unprecedented terrorist activity in the human history, but will it become the ‘never to be seen again’ type of terrorist event?]}

黑暗的力量[The dark force]

对于全世界而言，“9·11”事件都是一个沉痛的教训。[For the world, September 11 is a grief-stricken lesson.]

反恐怖主义行动已成了国际关注的焦点。[Anti-terrorism action has become a focus for the world.]
It symbolises that terrorist groups become non-state powers that can make huge impacts on international security.

When someone despairs of the existing system and thinks that the system has hindered the realization of their important goals, they may take some extreme measures including exterminating themselves. This is terrorist action.

Terrorism pursues its aims fanatically at all costs without obeying any principles. It wages an infinite war with finite means, and aims at infinite ruins with finite costs.

In the 1970s, after political violence such as hijacking and blasts, someone normally claimed responsibility for this action, and hoped that their targets would be included in the world agenda.

But the new terrorists think that the world is already helpless. They do not have explicit agenda and real plans for taking control of power.

They are not politically oriented, and badly organized, but very destructive, and are always more difficult to combat.

Especially after the 1980s, the secret organs that carry out terrorist activities have changed their victims’ targets and have taken measures that have resulted in extreme brutality and large death tolls.

After the end of the 1960s, each terrorist group tended to mobilize human and material resources overseas.

Economic globalisation has enhanced the globalisation of terrorism.
现在，恐怖组织间相互提供武器、交流战术和经验，学习各种武器和攻击系统的制造。[At present, terrorist groups provide weapons to each other, exchange tactics and experiences, learn to make various weapons and attack systems.]

在全球化过程中，恐怖组织正在变得更为严密，但同时也出现了泛化倾向。[In the course of globalisation, terrorist organizations are becoming more rigourous, but at the same time they have become more extensive.]

据悉，1988年本·拉登组织成立的“阿尔·伊达”组织，在其领导机构协商委员会下面，设有军事、财政、宗教、媒体4个委员会，分别担负不同的职能，俨然是一支完善的跨国力量。[It is reported that in 1988 bin Laden established the Al Qaida organization with the leading organ ‘consultation committee’, and four sub-committees with different functions, namely, military, financial, religion and media. This organization is definitely a well-arranged interstate power.]

这种结构严密的组织同松散的小集团乃至单个的个人同时存在，这使得恐怖主义既能通过极为严密专业的组织制造像“9·11”这样空前的恐怖事件，也能通过一两个人制造俄克拉何马那样的大型恐怖事件。[This type of well-structured organization coexists with other loosely structured small groups and other individuals. This makes the unprecedented terrorist attack like September 11, which was rigorously arranged by professionals, and also the Oklahoma terrorist activity made by one or two people possible.]

今天的恐怖分子可能更加不分青红皂白，破坏性更强。[Today’s terrorists are becoming more indiscriminate and destructive.]

20世纪90年代以来的恐怖活动表明，他们袭击的目标既有军政要地，也有与其毫不相干的民用设施。[Terrorist activities in the 1990s show that their attack targets are both important political-military sites and some ‘wide of the mark’ civilian facilities.]

而随着技术和装备水平的提高，他们已经有能力把恐怖主义从战术层次提高到战略层次，“9·11”事件就是典型的一例。[Along with the development of technologies and equipment, they are able to upgrade terrorism from the tactic level to the strategic level. September 11 is a typical example.]

国际社会的共同课题[The common problem of the international community]

美国对恐怖主义宣战早已开始。[The US has already declared war against terrorism.]
迄今为止美国最引人注目的反应是它对恐怖分子基地和嫌疑场所的军事袭击，特别是洛克比空难后对利比亚的打击，以及针对驻肯尼亚使馆被炸，对阿富汗和苏丹的导弹打击。[Up to now, the most remarkable response from the US is military raids to the terrorist bases and suspected sites, especially the attack on Libya after the Lockerbie air crash disaster and the missile attacks on Afghanistan and Sudan after the US Embassy blast in Kenya.]

但利比亚和阿富汗的实例清楚地表明，军事打击并非灵丹妙药。[But the cases in Libya and Afghanistan clearly show that military attacks are by no means a universal remedy.]

早在30年前，联合国已经开始为消除恐怖主义而努力。[30 years ago, the UN began to make efforts to eradicate terrorism.]

在联合国及其机构的主持下，于1963、1970、1971年先后起草制定了3个有关空中劫机的国际公约：东京公约、海牙公约、蒙特利尔公约。[Under the guidance of the UN and its organizations, 3 international pacts against hijacking were constituted respectively in 1963, 1970 and 1971. They are the Tokyo Pact, the Hague Pact and the Montreal Pact.]

联合国大会多次通过决议，呼吁各国共同防止、消除恐怖主义，明确地把任何地点所从事的恐怖主义活动谴责为犯罪，并要求所有国家采取有效而果断的措施，加快最终彻底消除国际恐怖主义的步伐。[The UN General Assembly has passed resolutions several times to appeal to prevent and eradicate terrorism together, accuse terrorist activities occurred in anywhere as crimes, and request all the countries to take effective and decisive measures for speeding up the pace for eliminating terrorism.]

1988年3月10日，23个国家在罗马签署了一项条约，要求签约国起诉或引渡那些在公海实施暴力行径的恐怖分子。[On 10 March 1988, 23 countries signed a treaty in Rome to bring accusations against and extradite all the terrorists conducting terrorist activities in mare liberum.]

为应付不断发生的恐怖活动，世界各国还成立了一些专门对付国际恐怖活动的组织，如意大利的防暴警察，英国的特别空勤联队，奥地利的GGK特警队，法国的GTGN特警队，美国联邦调查局的人质营救队。[In order to deal with continuously occurring terrorist activities, many countries set up anti-terrorism organizations, such as the Italian Riot Police, the British SAS, the Austrian GGK, the French GTGN, and the US FBI Hostage Rescue.]
美国还在伦敦成立了冲突研究所，其海军陆战队增设了特种作战反恐怖主义科。[The US set up an Institute of Conflict Studies in London, and added a special anti-terrorism group in its Marine Corps.]

但是，任何国家力量，不论其多么强大，都难以在一场无规则的游戏中占上风，与恐怖主义的斗争将是一场异常残酷的非常规的战争，它要求各国摒弃彼此间的嫌隙，通力合作，要求各国改变传统的国家安全观，建立多元化的国家安全战略；要求全世界共同努力，减少恐怖活动产生的根源，从根本上消灭恐怖主义。[However, no matter how strong it is, any country is difficult to get the upper hand in a game without regulations. The anti-terrorism war will be an extraordinary cruel unconventional war. It requests all countries to get rid of ill wills between each other and cooperate closely. It requests all countries to change conventional views on country security and establish a multi-dimensional country security strategy. It requests the world to make efforts together to eradicate terrorist activities from their roots.]

这是摆在国际社会面前一道既现实又长期的共同难题。[This is a real and long-term common problem faced by the international community.]

The English text

THE AUSTRALIAN OPINION 19/09/2001

Recognising terrorists as human will help reduce their power over us, writes Kevin McDonald

Terrorist movements in the Middle East partly emerged from the crisis of post-colonial nationalist regimes such as those in Algeria, Iran and Egypt. In the 1950s and ‘60s, secular nationalist leaders strove to modernise their countries, investing heavily in education and infrastructure. In the ‘60s and ‘70s, those countries found themselves unable to respond to economic globalisation and technological revolutions.

Increasing numbers of frustrated but educated young people and dispossessed rural populations converged in large cities.

Terrorist movements are led by educated young people, often trained in elite universities in the US. They use the dispossessed, such as the Taliban in Afghanistan, as their shock troops. Political Islam does not come from traditional religion. It is a relatively recent ideology that emerged in the late 1800s, about the same time as nationalism. But as nationalism has failed, political Islam has increasingly taken its place, nurtured by the crises of modernising nationalist regimes, military defeat, cultural humiliation and destruction of traditional ways of life.
These movements are political, not religious. Their first victims were nationalists – Egyptian president Anwar Sadat was killed by Islamic terrorists – and democrats, such as with the assassination of tens of thousands of people in Algeria.

These movements are similar to sects. They see the world in terms of the pure and the contaminated, a cataclysmic battle between good and evil. Terrorist groups destroy the personal identity of their members and the social institutions of communities, then rebuild in ways we also see in totalitarian societies. They feed on the destruction of traditional ways of life, and on humiliation and a sense that there is no path but destruction. They flourish among cultures that celebrate death through martyrdom and through the increasing importance of honour killings inside the family structure.

Wars serve to increase the importance of these groups. War accelerates social disintegration while integrating military-political sects into the global trade in arms and drugs.

The US and Australia cannot turn themselves into walled zones with military shields or naval patrols. The answer to terrorism, and to the exodus of refugees it generates, is economic development and democracy in countries that spawn international terrorism. This is the lesson from contemporary Iran, whose gradual democratisation and economic development have weakened terrorism by removing its economic, social and cultural roots.

When people are subjected to violence, they are robbed of their humanity. Often their first response, in turn, is to deny the humanity of the aggressor. In the process, they come to see the aggressor as all-powerful, manifested in behaviour such as refusing to go outside or turning their house into a fortress.

Part of overcoming the experience of being a victim involves recognising the humanity of the person who committed the crime. This does not condone the act but it turns an unknowable source of menace into a person. This is why victims of violent crime in Australia are increasingly seeking to confront perpetrators: recognising them as human reduces their power.

US President George W. Bush talks of a war between good and evil. But should we let terrorists become our Great Satan? Viewing terrorists as mindless (that is, we can’t understand them) and all-powerful projects our fear on to them. We remain in trauma but project violence – as we saw in the firebombing of a Brisbane mosque last week. We remain victims while the social destruction that generates terror is further accelerated.

Dr Kevin McDonald, a senior lecturer in sociology at the University of Melbourne, researches social movements and conflicts in Australia and overseas
The Discourse of Euphemism

Xuefeng Wang
University of Tasmania

Abstract

Euphemisms are important aspects of the language used in social contexts. They are not just a manifestation of linguistic prescriptivism or political correctness. Euphemisms play a role in sociolinguistic competence. In second language learning, learners need to develop some linguistic awareness regarding the use of euphemisms and avoidance of dysphemism in the target language. This paper examines some aspects of euphemisms in Chinese and the relationship between euphemisms and the Chinese culture. Some implications to TESOL and teaching Chinese to speakers of other languages are examined in the discussion.

Introduction

A euphemism is the substitution of a delicate or inoffensive term, phrase or register for one that has coarse, sordid, or otherwise unpleasant or harsh associations, as in the use of "lavatory" or "rest room" for "toilet", and "pass away" for "die". A euphemism is defined by Webster's Third New International Dictionary (1971) as "a polite, tactful, or less explicit term used to avoid the direct naming of an unpleasant, painful, or frightening reality". Euphemisms have existed throughout recorded history. They are used among preliterate peoples, and have probably been around ever since recognizably human language developed. Likewise, offensive language, what we call 'dysphemism' has existed.

Sociolinguists examine social and cultural influences on language behavior. Among some important concepts to emerge are those relating to euphemisms and language standards. Euphemisms play a role in sociolinguistic competence and reveal much about a society's morals, apprehensions and taboos. Sociolinguists have documented the presence of euphemisms in every language. These euphemisms are associated with educational, economic, social and historical conditions. The speakers use euphemisms are correlated with their socioeconomic class. Every society has cultural differences, different social levels, young and old problems, gender bias, and some other differences. The use of language is so important that the inappropriate way of talking may cause illegal implication. How not to offend people linguistically in different social contexts is the issue that the language teachers should examine in their teaching. Teaching Chinese euphemisms is one of the ways of imparting Chinese culture when teaching Chinese to speakers of other language (TESOL). Robert Burchfield, for many years the editor of The Oxford English Dictionary, once observed that "a language without euphemism would be a defective instrument of communication." (Murphy 1996, p.16)

This paper centres on some aspects of euphemisms in Chinese and some implications to TESOL. It is difficult to generalize about a whole nation. When referring to Chinese language and culture, we have in mind han language and han culture. China is such a big country and even han language and culture have local variations. Therefore this discussion focuses on Chinese euphemisms in the context of north China around the Yellow River.

Euphemisms in Chinese and the relationship between euphemism and the Chinese culture

Almost all cultures linguistically surround their anxieties in a cloud of euphemisms-- indirect expressions replacing those considered offensive or embarrassing. One of the terms that seem to be almost universally avoided is death. For whatever reason, the use of a number of inoffensive substitutes is required for the word die or si in Chinese.
Consider the following list of such substitutes found in Chinese:

\textit{jia beng, deng xian, xian shi, gui tian, zuo gu, shou zhong; yu shi chang ci, yong yuan li kai le}
\textit{wo men, xin zang ting zhi le tiao dong, chang mian, shi shi, gao bie ren shi, xie shi, an xi; xi sheng; qu qu, qu shi, bing gu: mei le, lao le, chu shi le; qu jian ma ke si le.}

This list is not at all complete. Each substitution of a delicate or inoffensive term or phrase reflects different times, social status, culture, and expressions of Chinese euphemisms. For instance:

- \textit{jia beng} in Chinese only substitutes the death of the emperor in the ancient times
- \textit{yu shi chang ci} is for the death of great people. For example, \textit{wo men jing ai de zong li zhou en lai yu yi jiu qi liu nian yi yue qi ri yu shi chang ci le.} (Our beloved Premier Zhou Enlai passed away on 7\textsuperscript{th} Jan 1976.)
- \textit{xu sheng} is only for people who sacrifice their lives for people or country
- \textit{lao le, mei le, bu zai le} are the ways of the villagers to express the terms of death. Some of them reflect different attitudes towards death and the hereafter. For example, \textit{fan zhen wo guo bu liao ji nian jiu qu jian ma ke si le.} (In a few years I'll be seeing Marx anyway.) He/She is speaking about himself/herself in a joking way. In English it might mean "go to a better world, be with God".
- \textit{shi shi, qu shi, bing gu} are common expressions for death.

A foreign teacher visited his friend who showed him the photos of his family and told him that his father had passed away eighteen years ago. The foreign teacher said in Chinese, \textit{zhen dui bu qi, ni fu qin yi ming wu hu de zhen shi tai zao le.} (I'm really sorry to hear that your father kicked the bucket so early.) After hearing this, his friend was a bit offended and said, \textit{You'd better say ni fu qin qu shi de zhen shi tai zao le}. There are several expressions like \textit{yi ming wu hu, bi ming, qu jian yan wang le, shang xi tian le, sang ming} in Chinese for kick the bucket in English. These might be dysphemisms in Chinese.

The examples above illustrate the general characteristics of euphemisms—the use of a pleasant, polite, or harmless sounding term in the place of those considered unpleasant, rude, or offensive. Different expressions should be used for different persons or situations, or displeasure or offense might be caused.

Besides death, there are a number of other notions often expressed in euphemistic terms. In the late seventieth, euphemism has achieved what it never achieved before and it has become a fit medium for the expression of just about everything, including physical shortcomings, old age, certain functions of the body, professions, women, political area, social phenomena and so on.

Communication with people with disabilities or physical shortcomings care should be given to avoid expressions that many people find offensive, we use the following terms:

- \textit{can ji re} (people with disabilities) instead of \textit{fei ren, can fei} (disabled person) for persons who are with disabilities
- \textit{ruo zhi} (poor in intelligence) instead of \textit{sha zi} for people with mental retardation
- \textit{shi cong} (become deaf) instead of \textit{long zi} for people who are hearing-impaired
- \textit{mang ren} (blind persons) instead of \textit{xia zi} for people who are blind
- \textit{lun yi ren} (people who use wheelchair) instead of \textit{guai zi, que zi} (crippled) for people who use wheelchairs
- \textit{bu zhong yong} (usless) instead of \textit{lao le} for people who are old
- \textit{Ta bu zhong yong le.} (He is old.)
- \textit{fu tai} (wealthy look) instead of \textit{pang, fei} (fat) for people who are fat or over weight
•  zhang zhe (elder) instead of lao ren for elderly people
•  Lao qian bei (the older generation) for one's senior

Because of the one child policy in China, it is really important to use euphemisms of physical shortcomings before the parents whose children have disabilities or they will be terribly hurt. Chinese people like being called lao (old), e.g. lao da ge (elder brother), lao da niang (aunt, granny), lao da ye (uncle, grandpa), Lao Zhang and so on. Lao is a respectful form of address.

Ren men zun cheng ta wei guo lao. (People respectfully called him the venerable Guo.)

Fu tai (wealthy look) is the best expression for Chinese women who are fat and over weight. Chinese women are sensitive to expressions of physical appearance.

Euphemisms for certain functions of the body deserve special mention here, because ignorance of them may cause great embarrassment. As in many other languages, Chinese has a variety of terms in this category.

One does not need to tell the others he/she has to go to toilet, especially in the situation when he/she has dinner with his/her friends. Jie shou; fan bian yi xia; qu xi shou jian; xi shou; qu wei sheng jian instead of shang ce suo, qu mao fang for relieve oneself; go to the toilet; go to the men's/ladies.

In such circumstance, the appropriate expression is: "dui bu qi, qu yi xia wei sheng jian. (Sorry, I'll go to the Ladies/ Men's.)" or "da jia qing man yong, wo ma shang jiu hui lai. (Please enjoy your food and I'll be back soon.)" or just say "dui bu qi (Excuse)".

In some circumstances, Chinese women who are pregnant do not like it to be mentioned that they are pregnant, especially at the formal occasions even though it is a very happy event. They replace word "huai yun (pregnant)" with euphemisms or different expressions as in:

you xi le (have a happy thing); te shu shi qi (special period); fa fu le (grow stout, put on weight); chi liang ge ren de fan (eat for two) instead of huai yun for women who are pregnant or expecting

A lady who was pregnant went to see her boss to report her work. This is the conversation before the report.

Boss:  ni hao, Xiao Zhao. (Hello! Xiao Zhao.)
Xiao Zhao:  ni hao, lao ban. (Hello! Boss.)
Boss:  ni hao xiang fa fu le? (It seems that good fortune is coming to you and you are putting on weight.)
Xiao Zhao:  wo xian zai chi liang ge ren de fan. (I eat for two these days.)
Boss:  gong xi, gong xi. (Congratulations!)
Xiao Zhao:  xie, xie. (Thank you very much.)

Certain trends in Chinese euphemisms should be noted. In recent years, more and more euphemisms are being used in talking about life and social affairs. For example, there are fewer occupations called jobs; many have become professions. The name of some professions can be very misleading; the best examples are:

•  Qing jie gong instead of da sao wei sheng de (cleaners) for garbage collectors or sanitary engineers
•  Ren lei ling hun de gong cheng shi (the engineers of the peoples' soul; teachers); jiao shi (teachers) instead of jiao shu jiang for teachers
•  Iron abacuses for accountants
•  Bai yi tian shi (angels in white) for nurses in the hospitals
•  Hong niang (red ladies) instead of mei ren, mei po for women who work as marriage
matchmakers in Marriage Matchmaker Office or women who are fond of arranging matches of marriage

These professions are very ordinary, but held in a great respect in China. People in these posts normally work very hard, but payment is low. Euphemisms of these professions are normally used.

- Xiao a yi (younger auntie) instead of bao mu (children’s nurses, maids) for baby sitters and housemaids

In old China, only the very rich, big families had maids to help them do their housework. And the maids and their owners were in different social class. Now the situation has changed. Hosts and maids are employers and employees. Euphemism Xiao a yi is used. It indicates a friendship and the maids are considered as family members.

- Bian yuan nu; liu ying; ji (street girls) for sexual service providers and ji nu might be dysphemism to them. Street girls whose work is not permitted by Chinese law, so we use euphemism bian yuan nu to mean that they are on the verge of the law.

- san pei xiao jie; zuo tai nu (girls who work in the restaurants, bars and hotels to keep men’s company to have dinner, drink wine, sing and dance) for (I don’t know the English equivalent)

During the cultural revolution, social status was a sensitive issue. The “street girls” were disappeared. With the reform and open policy, the phenomenon re-emerged and new ways of addressing have been created. Most of the girls are from the countryside or poor areas. In order to keep the tune of the city life, they take the job to be bian yuan nu or san pei xiao jie.

- Tie fan wan (iron rice bowl) for a secure job

- Xia hai le (go to sea) for government officials or teachers who changed their jobs to be in business after the Chinese reform and open policy.

Tie fan wan is the expression for the people who work in the government office and have a secure job.

The term xia hai became popular after the open and reform policy. Cadres from the government, teachers from the universities or people from different work places quit their jobs to do business to try to earn more money.

There are many dysphemisms for professions in Chinese.

- Kao tian chi fan de (those who live on heaven); kang da chu de (those who carry hoes on their shoulders) instead of nong min (farm workers) for farmers or peasants

- Chi jiao yi sheng (bare foot doctors) instead of xiang cun dai fu (village doctors) for the doctors who work in the countryside or village

- Chi xian fan de (those who do not earn their living, just depend on the government’s relief fund or their parents) instead of wu ye zhe (idlers) for persons who lead an idle life

- Hai zi wang (kings of the children) for teachers who work in primary schools or kindergartens

- Tiao zi (a strip of paper) for policemen (Policemen often fine people for an offence and give them receipts.)

- He cha kan bao de (persons who drink tea and read newspapers) for the cadres who work in the government offices.

- Fan tong (rice bucket) for persons who are fat-heads or good-for-nothing

- La pi tiao de (pull the rubber belt) for middleman

Using dyphemisms may show a lack of politeness and respect, for example, hai zi wang for teachers and chi jiao yi sheng for village doctors, but some of them really reflect the social phenomena. People are dissatisfied with some of the government cadres who get payment from the government and do nothing every day except drinking tea and reading newspapers,
so people call them he cha kan bao de.

In times of economic difficulties, such as depression, many factories in China collapsed and stopped production and unemployment was high. Losing one's job has always been a cause for anger and fear. Dismissing from employment is an assault not just on their livelihood but on their identity. Some terms were used to euphemize unemployment, and the more recent and sophisticated euphemisms are:

- **Xia gang** (going off sentry duty); **ba xian** (be dismissed and enjoying leisure); **che di qing xian le** (enjoying leisure completely, unburdened with work completely), **zi you le** (be free) instead of **shi ye**; **jie gu** (out of job, be fired) for unemployment, out of job, out of work

And

- **Diu fan wan le** (lose one's rice bowl) or **bei chao le**(expel) might be the dysphemistic euphemisms for being out of job.
  
  E.g. **wo diu le fan wan le.** (I lost my job.) The speaker might be very unhappy or sad.

- **Ta bei chao le.** (He was fired.)

- **Diu wu sha mao le** (lose one's black gauze cap) for being dismissed from official posts. **wu sha mao** were worn by feudal officials in ancient China.

In old China, **women** had low social positions and the offensive sexist expressions were used. The word **wife** reveals this.

- **Zao kang** (distillers' grains, husks); **jia li de, nei ren** (A wife who was little more than one who did the household chores.); **lao po** (lao--old, po--lady); **hai zi ta ma** (mother of the children);

- **Fu ren zhi jian** (virtually ridicule a woman's point of view)

- **Tou fa chang, jian shi duan** (women have long hair, but they are short of knowledge)

- **Fu chang fu sui** (literally: the husband sings and the wife follows; or: the wife keeps harmony, while the husband sets the tune.)

- **Jia chu qu de gu niang, po chu qu de shui** (married daughter is the water which has been thrown) for married women

- **Tao lao po** (take a wife) for get married

In the past decades, with the great change of women's status in China, certain corresponding changes have taken place in the language. Terms such as **zao kang, nei ren,** and **jia li de** are no longer used. A married woman retains her own surname, rather than losing it and being known simply as **Wang tai tai or Li tai tai** (Mrs. Wang or Mrs. Li) and the wife does not have to take her husband's surname. Women as well as men are addressed as **Comrade;** a husband introduces his wife to others--**zhe shi wo tai tai/ qí zi/ ai ren.** (This is my wife.), and a wife introduces her husband to others--**zhe shi wo xian sheng/ zhang fu/ ai ren/lao gong** (This is my husband). **xian sheng--tai tai; zhang fu--qí zi; ai ren** (sweetheart can refer to either male or female) are husband and wife and they are addressed equally in position. The following euphemisms are used for wives to reflect the equal social status at home and in the society.

- **Xian nei zhu** (virtuous wife; **xian--** good /able/virtuous, **nei--**at home, **zhu--**helper); even though the wife does the household chores at home and she is a housewife, the expressions are quite different from that of old China.

- **Nei dang jia** (the head of the family) for wife. Normally husbands are called the heads of the families, but now husbands call their wives heads of the families.

- **Ban bian tian** (half of the sky); women are half of the sky and men are the other half of the sky in the society and they can do the same jobs and get the same pay. Wife is half of the sky and husband is the other half of the sky at home and they both support the family.

A husband is praising his wife for her virtue before his friends:
Zhe shi wo ai ren, li sha sha. ta shi yu hong xue de lao shi, ye shi wo de xian nei zhu. Zhe ji nian lai dou kuei le ta, mang li you mang wai, zha gu le lao de, you zha gu xiao de, shi wo neng an xin gong zuo , cai qu de le jing tian de cheng ji. Ta zhen shi wo men jia de ban bian tian na.

The English translation is as this, "This is my wife, Shasha Li. She is a teacher in Yu Hong Primary School and also my virtuous helper. I'm lucky to have her help these years so that I can concentrate on myself and achieve the great success in my work. She is not only busy doing housework at home, her teaching at school but also looking after our child and my old parents. She is really the half sky of our family".

Another expression of husband-- lao gong (old man) has become very popular in China in the recent years. Normally a husband would call his wife lao po (old lady), but now a wife calls her husband lao gong without any hesitation. This is also an indication that women's positions have been raised.

With economic development, many socially illegal phenomena have appeared and people do not want to mention them directly and euphemisms have been created to cover the phenomena.

- **Hei qian** (black money) for cash gained illegally or black market money
- **Shui huo** (goods from overseas without customs inspection) for smuggled goods
- **Hei shi** (black market) for illegal dealing in rationed goods
- **Hou men er** (back door) for getting something done through pull or illegally ways
e.g. wo men ying gai jiu zhen"zou hou men er" zhi lei de bu zhen zhi feng. (We should overcome such unhealthy tendencies as "entering by the back door").

  e.g ta shi zou hou men er de dao nei ge zhi wei de. (He got the position by the "back door")

- **Guan xi** (relations; people who know with each other) for nepotism
e.g. zai gong an ju li wo you guan xi. (I know somebody or I have relations in the Police Station.)

- **Da dian** (get luggage, etc. ready) for bribe; bribery
e.g. ta zai pan jue zhi qian da dian le fa guan. (He bribed the judge before the judgement.)

- **Shao xiang** (burn joss sticks) for offering bribes
- **Zou mian er** (show due respect for sb.'s feelings) for offering bribes
- **Zao men er** (look for the door) for offering bribes

These are similarly to English euphemisms, such as back hander; under the table; grease the palm.

There are many different less explicit Chinese expressions to describe different persons.

- **Tie gong ji** (iron cock) for stingy person; miser
- **Hu li jing** (fox spirit) for seductive women
- **San zhi shou** (three hands) for petty thief
- **Dao cha men er** (a married man who lives with his wife's family)
- **Xiao mian hu** (smiling tiger) for outwardly kind but inwardly cruel person
- **Da kuan** (big money) for newly rich person
- **Da hong ren** (big red person) for one who is put in an important position
- **Da ren wu** (big person) for important person
- **Lao huang niu** (willing ox) for one who serves the people wholeheartedly
• *Lao hu li* (old fox) for crafty or cunning person
• *Xiao er ke* (department of paediatrics) for one who is narrow-minded
• *Huo zi dian* (living dictionary) for one who is knowledgeable
• *Lao gu dong* (old-fashioned article; antique) for one who is conservative
• *Da lao cu* (uncouth person) for one who is uneducated; rough and ready
• *Er ba dao* (second knife) for one who lacks skill of doing sth.
• *Hong yan er bing* (pink eyes disease) for one who is jealousy of sth. or sb.
• *Lao you tiao* (old deep-fried twisted dough sticks) for one who has wide social experiences
• *Xiu mu bu ke diao* (a piece of rotten wood and can not be used for carving) for one who is hopeless or good-for-nothing
• *Hao miao zi* (good young plant) for one who has great future
• *Pao long tao* (play a bit role in an opera) for one who works as an assistant or helper
• *Xiao huang di* (young emperor) for the only child in Chinese family

In the West, asking a stranger his/her age might be considered improper. Besides age, other such matters include one's income, marital status, politics and religion. Some people may not mind and will readily talk about such things, but it is not polite to ask unless the other person shows that he/she will not be offended. Thus questions such as the following, although inoffensive to Chinese, should be avoided when conversing with English-speaking people:

> How old are you?
> What's your income?
> Are you married or single?
> How come you're still single?
> So you are divorced? What was the reason?
> Are you a Democrat or a Republican?
> Why did you vote for...?
> What's your religion?
> Are you Catholic?

In Chinese culture there are also many taboo words in business and religion. For example, *shui* (water) is avoided. That means money will flow away with the water. *Mei* (mildew) is also avoided because *mei* means bad luck in Chinese. *zhen dao mei, gan dao che zhan che gang kai zou*. (What lousy luck! When I reached the station, the train had just left.)

Some of the numbers are also avoided. Number 4(*si*) is pronounced same as *si* (death) so people do not like their telephone number to have 4 in it, especially 444 that means death, death and death. But 8(*ba*) and 6(*liu*) are good numbers. The pronunciation of 8 is quite similar to the Chinese character *fa* (rich) so 888 is rich, rich and rich. 6 means smooth and without any difficulty, so people like this number. People often say *Liu liu da shun*. (Six, six everything goes smoothly and successfully.)

Pig (*zhu*) and pork (*zhu rou*) are forbidden to the Hui people because they are Moslem and everything relating to pigs and pork is referred to as *da*. For example, *zhu rou* (pork) is changed into *da rou* and *zhu you* (lard) is changed into *da you*. To the Hui people, if one's surname is *zhu*, it has to be changed to *hei*, because the pronunciation of *zhu* is same as pig (*zhu*).

In Chinese, the color **black** is also used in a number of undesirable or negative terms, such as *hei xin* (black hearted) for wicked, evil, *hei bang* (black gang) for counter-revolutionaries, *hei hua* (black talk) for language of the underworld or of counter-revolutionaries, *hei shi* for
black market, *hei qian* for black money.

**Implications of euphemisms to TESOL and teaching Chinese to speakers of other languages**

Learning a foreign language well means more than merely mastering the pronunciation, grammar, words and idioms. It means learning also to see the world as native speakers of that language see it, learning the ways in which their language reflects the ideas, customs, and behavior of their society, and learning to understand their "language of the mind". Learning a language, in fact, is inseparable from learning its culture. No discussion about cultural variables in second language acquisition is complete without some treatment of the relationship between language and thought. Words shape our lives. A euphemism is a prime example of the use of language to reduce the unpleasantness of a term or notion. "Weasel words" tend to glorify very ordinary products into those that are "sparkling", "refreshing".

Sociolinguistics deals with issues such as who speaks (or write) to whom, when, where, how and why. In other words, it is the study of natural language in all its various social and cultural contexts (Pride 1979 p9). Higgs (1990 p74) stated that it is the recognition of an "unbreakable bond between language and culture that motivates our profession's implicit commandment that 'thou shalt not teach language without also teaching culture" (P.74). Brown (1990) questions whether or not language may be value-free or independent of culture background. She concludes by saying:" there are values, presuppositions, about the nature of life and what is good and bad in it, to be found in any normal use of language" (P.13). Such normal language use is exactly what most second language and foreign language instructors aim to teach.

Generally, second language learning is often second culture learning and learning a non-native language in one's own culture with few immediate and widespread opportunities to use the language within the environment of one's own culture. The foreign language situation is more culturally loaded than second language learning in the native culture, since the language is almost always learns in a context of understanding the people of another culture. Second language learning in a foreign culture clearly involves the deepest form of acculturation. The learner must survive within a strange culture as well as learn a language on which he/she is totally dependent for communication.

It is therefore very important for teachers who teach Chinese to speakers of another language to impart culture in their language teaching. How not to offend people when talking with Chinese, euphemisms in Chinese are what we have to teach so that the students who speak a language other than Chinese can express themselves inoffensively in different Chinese social and cultural situations.

Once we understand the relationship between culture and language, along with having an awareness of cultural differences, distances, and similarities and how they affect language learning, the foundation has been laid for the Chinese teachers' inclusion of culture somewhere in their curriculum. Techniques, materials, approaches, methods, and concepts of imparting culture to Chinese teaching are worth studying.

In considering the relationship between second language learning and second culture learning, it is very important to consider several different types of second language learning contexts. Chinese teachers might try to use the following methods to help students learn and use euphemisms in their Chinese language learning.

- Seeing films, watching TV and videos programs in Chinese and asking students to identify euphemisms used and try to guess their meaning.
- Listening to Chinese daily conversations and asking students if they know any words which are considered harsh or "not nice" things to say about another person.
- Reading Chinese newspapers and trying to find the euphemisms used in the news or stories.
• Ask the students to listen to the conversation. How could each word be changed to a nicer synonym.

• Write EUPHEMISM on the board. Students supply the definition and you write it.

• Point out that many body parts, bodily functions, places, jobs, and so on which are considered "not nice" and write the euphemisms of them.

• If appropriate, the words "taboo", "connotation", and "offensive" can be worked into the lesson.

• Chinese conversation class. Invite Chinese students to the classroom to have conversation with Chinese learners.

• Students may be asked to write a short paper using euphemisms to describe a used car, a student with poor behavior to his mother, a funeral, or a set of clothes made for an overweight person.

Conclusion

This article has examined euphemisms of Chinese used in different social contexts and showed the important role of euphemisms in sociolinguistic competence and the relationship between euphemisms and the Chinese culture and the implications to TESOL. Language teaching is a social and cultural process and it involves the transmission of cultural values and social meanings. Foreign language teachers are among the most important mediators. They need to experience a foreign culture as well as analyse it. They need to reflect upon their own and the foreign culture. And they need to understand the implications of cultural learning, both cognitive and affective, for their practices in the classroom as well as for their teaching 'in the field'. Euphemisms in Chinese reflect Chinese culture and society. Teachers who teach Chinese to speakers of other language do need further cultural research and understanding in second and foreign language education so that the learners can communicate with the native speakers successfully and improve their cultural exchange of the world.

References


http://web5.infotrac.galegroup.com/itw...&dyn=17!xrn_12_0_A18676937?sw_aep=utas

10/05/00 21:25


Sun Zhiping & Ye Minghua (1985) *Idioms 1000* Shanghai Literature and Art Publishing House, Shanghai

Intercultural Communication Awareness in a Tertiary Education Context

Yan Jun Wang
University of Tasmania

Abstract
Globalisation is influencing universities worldwide through market competition. Internationalisation of education has become a significant development in Australian universities. With the increase of international students' participation in on-line, in-country and face-to-face teaching modes, universities have promoted intercultural communication competence among their academic and administrative staff members. What does intercultural communication mean to these staff? Is it a new paradigm or a window dressing exercise? What are some of the hurdles in the process and implementation of intercultural awareness?

A case study was conducted to examine the significance of intercultural communication awareness in a tertiary education context. There are two categories of participants for questionnaire and interview: staff members and students at the University of Tasmania. As all staff members/students at the University of Tasmania were directly or indirectly involved in the intercultural life of the university, both administrative and academic staff members/domestic and international students were invited to participate in this study. Participants were invited to participate in informal interviews as well as a questionnaire to present their views on intercultural communication and how it affects their interaction with people from different cultural backgrounds. The paper discussed the results of this study in terms of personal development, intercultural identity, and professional effectiveness.

Introduction
The world has opened numerous doors for people of different cultural and geographical backgrounds to interact. It naturally follows that intercultural contact has become more frequent, more abundant and, therefore, more significant than ever before. Also, public awareness of international education opportunities is becoming more widespread. Today, rapid developments in science and technology, especially advances in transportation and telecommunication, have literally shrunk the world into a “global village”, where people of different cultures and languages can easily transcend the limits of time and space and get in touch with one another. Such increasing waves of intercultural contact have created our diverse yet prosperous world.

Under such circumstances, Australian culture cannot be sheltered from external influences. As a result, internationalisation of education has become a significant development in Australian universities. According to Grove (2004), the most visible and widely publicised indicator of educational globalisation is the increasingly diverse ethnic and linguistic composition of the student population on Western university campuses. In 2002, international students (the term used since the 1990s to distinguish full-fee-paying overseas students from domestic students) composed 20% of the total student enrolment in the Australian university sector (Australian Department of Education, Science, and Training, 2003; Noonan, 2003, cited in Grove, 2004). International students residing in Australia doubled in number from 1997 to 2002, making up a substantial and growing proportion of Australian higher education students (Australian Department of Education, Science, and Training, 2004). With the increase of international students' participation in on-line, in-country and face-to-face teaching modes, universities have found the need to promote intercultural communication competence among their academic and administrative staff members. Based on the increasing awareness of the need for intercultural communication in tertiary education in Australia, this study investigates the problems arising from communication between people of different cultural backgrounds and how best to address them.
Participants from different academic and administrative functions at an Australian university were invited to fill out a questionnaire and to participate in informal interviews to present their views on intercultural communication and how it affects their interaction with international students. The paper discusses the results of this study in terms of personal development, intercultural identity, and professional effectiveness.

**Background**

New trends have transformed the 21st century into the age of the global village in which people must develop a global mindset in order to live meaningfully and productively. They include: (1) technological development, (2) globalization of the economy, (3) widespread population migrations, (4) multiculturalism, and (5) the demise of the nation state (Chen and Starosta, 1998). These dynamics make a strong argument for students to become more proficient intercultural communicators.

The rapid development in every aspect of life in the 21st century, including economic, scientific and technological and global cooperation, brings out the reality that intercultural communication covers an immense area. According to Neulief (2003), “Technological feasibility dramatically reduces the distance between peoples of different cultures and societies”. However, scientific and technological progress not only brings the global villagers into constant contact with one another, but also creates more opportunities for conflict among them. Moreover, because of different social backgrounds, social systems, ways of thinking, norms of behaviour and customs, people have many difficulties and obstacles in understanding one another and communicating with one another. It is therefore important to promote better understanding between people of different cultural groups and consequently, a new field of study, the study of intercultural communication, came into being.

The study of intercultural communication gained acceptance through training and testing practice in the 1960s and 1970s, formed its basic framework in the late 1970s, and has made great achievements in theory and practice ever since the 1980s, both inside and outside the U.S. (Hart, 1996). The subjects of study in intercultural communication are various and research has been carried out at different levels. The chief concern of this discipline is how culture and communication influence one another in the process of intercultural communication and how the researcher can predict and solve the problems that arise. Today, intercultural communication as a field of study is widely acknowledged and extensively researched in all parts of the world. This field of study has proved of value to diplomats, politicians, businessmen, tourists and international students, immigrants and whoever may come into contact with people of different cultural groups. With the increasingly large number of international students, it is very important for educators to pay more attention to intercultural communication.

The types of problems which occur as a result of the globalization of the world include serious aspects of intercultural communication, for example, culture shock and intercultural maladjustment. One of the causes of these phenomena is a lack of adequate knowledge and skills in intercultural communication. This is true for many international students who study at Australian universities. As a result, the study of intercultural communication has drawn considerable interest in Australia. It is of value to tertiary graduates to have the ability to communicate interculturally as “cultural differences are indeed significant, especially in areas of dialogue and public participation” (Gerber and Williams, 2002, p.175).

Byram (1997) proposed a model of intercultural communicative competence which involves four elements: linguistic competence, sociolinguistic competence, discourse competence and intercultural competence. Thus, successfully interacting with someone from a different culture requires a degree of communication competence, including cognitive, affective and behavioural components. In other words, for any kind of successful communication, both sides must share a set of patterns to explain, evaluate and predict communicative behaviours, otherwise efficient communication is impossible.
Significance

Many UNESCO documents (1999) are in favour of better preparing children and young people to effectively meet the challenges of an increasingly complex and interdependent world. Educators should place emphasis on reinforcing the four pillars of Learning for the 21st Century (learning to know, to do, to be and to live together). According to Nieto (2002, p.40), “Developing an intercultural perspective means learning how to think in more inclusive and expansive ways, reflecting on what we learn, and applying that learning to real situations”. It can be seen that it is of great importance to develop students’ actual communicative capacity so that they can apply these skills in their future career and so that after graduation, students can communicate with people and can function well in many professions. Furthermore, competent intercultural communication can help students to ‘learn how to learn’. Students need to acquire the ability to innovate, keeping in mind the needs of lifelong learning, to lay a solid foundation and provide the necessary conditions for future learning.

In conclusion, learning about cultural diversity provides both students and staff members with knowledge and skills for more effective communication in intercultural situations.

Aim and Methodology

The aim of my study is to explore some intercultural aspects of tertiary education, to consider these intercultural aspects in terms of cultural studies and to enable each student to develop their ability to communicate across cultures. This ability helps students to get on well with people from different cultural backgrounds. As a result, they can widen their horizon and develop a far broader outlook on life and insight into the world. All these abilities are conducive to their self-betterment and self-realization so they can become qualified global villagers one day.

This study employs qualitative and quantitative research methods to achieve its objective. The combination of these approaches is important in addressing the aims of the study. In addition, it is important to use several data-gathering techniques to answer a research question. Using a variety of techniques may provide different perspectives on the situation, thereby increasing what is known about it (Bouma, 2000).

Specifically speaking, the data gathering approaches employed in this study are: semi-structured interviews and questionnaire. On the one hand, interviewing is one of the most common qualitative methods employed in social research and provides in-depth information about a particular research issue or question. As a research method, it typically involves the researcher asking questions and hopefully, receiving answers from the people he/she is interviewing (Robson, 1993, p.269). On the other hand, questionnaires are more objective, which can guarantee confidentiality and may elicit more trustful responses than would be obtained with a personal interview (Burns, 2000). Our questionnaire focuses on staff perceptions and views of intercultural communication.

Literature Review

Intercultural studies are becoming increasingly more important in the global environment. This paper aims to give a brief overview of the major theories which are related to culture and communication. Hofstede (1994, p.5) defined culture as “the collective programming of the mind which distinguishes the members of one group or category of people from another”. Another concept of culture was put forward by Hall. Hall (1983) views culture as often subconscious. Spencer-Oatey (2000, p.4) extended the concept of culture, “Culture is fuzzy attitudes, beliefs, behavioural norms, and basic assumptions and values that are shared by a group of people, and that influence each other’s behaviour and his/her interpretations of the “meaning” of other people’s behaviour”. The interpretative role of culture, as introduced by
Spencer-Oatey, is especially crucial when describing intercultural communication in a different cultural context. Furthermore, Schirato and Yell (2000, p.34) argue that communication is concerned with making meanings, and that the kinds of meanings that are made depend very much on the specific cultural contexts. Depending on the context, this may lead to a complete communication breakdown.

As culture is subconscious, people are generally least aware of their own cultural characteristics. Hall (1976) suggested, “Culture hides more than it reveals, and strangely enough what it hides, it hides most effectively from its own participants. Years of study have convinced me that the real job is not to understand foreign cultures but to understand our own”. What Hall meant by “Culture hides much more than it reveals” is similar to the iceberg metaphor of culture.

Change happens all the time, in all places. In late modernity, the pace and extent of change has been greater than during pervious eras (Giddens, 1996; Bauman, 2000) (cited in Stier, 2003). A current trend of the world is globalization, which has been brought about by the rapid development of science and technology, especially those in the areas of transportation, telecommunication, and information systems. It naturally follows that people from diverse backgrounds have come into more and more contact with each other with a regularity that is unique to this period of human history. As Gamble and Gamble (1996) declared, “Society and the world have been transformed into a mobile, global village, much as Marshall McLuhan, a communication theorist, forecast over three decades ago” (p.35). According to Robertson (2003), “Globalization changed the nature of human communities…, generating new dangers and challenges” (p.6). As a result, intercultural communication has become more common and widespread (Tubbs and Moss, 1994).

People need to adapt to this changing world. Being able to communicate with people from other cultures is one aspect of this adaptation, for example, “some people may receive their education in another country, thus taking on the role of foreign student” (Brislin, Cushner, Cherrie and Yong, 1986, p.15). To increase people's cultural fluency, they should be aware of and sensitive to different values, beliefs, attitudes and assumptions in diverse aspects of life as well as culturally different modes of behaviour. Awareness includes the knowledge of the context in which communication occurs and the knowledge of one’s own culture. Any communication is first of all contextual. In any case, competence is not developed in a vacuum---- the situation and cultural context are indispensable to this process. An intercultural person should be well-informed of what behaviour is appropriate and what is not in a particular situation. Byram (1997) described an intercultural person as someone who has “the ability to interact effectively with people from cultures that we recognize as being different from our own”. In addition, Goodacre and Follers (1987) presented, “Successful intercultural communication comes to people who are alert and aware” (p.7).

As cultures vary, misunderstandings and difficulties in intercultural communication arise when there is little or no awareness of divergent cultural values, beliefs, and behaviours. To overcome many of those difficulties, so as to ensure smooth communication with people from different backgrounds, cultural awareness plays a key role, as people tend to assume, though often unconsciously, that the other party of the communication has the same values, beliefs, behaviours, and customs as they themselves. In addition, “the importance of increasing ‘cultural awareness’ has been emphasised by many researchers” (e.g. Brislin, 1990; Chen and Starosta, 1996; Triandis, 1990, cited in Nixon and Bull, 2005). Nixon and Bull also quoted the explanation from Brislin and Yoshida (1994), “Becoming aware of culture and cultural differences would help people to monitor their ethnocentrism, to respect and be sensitive toward culturally different others, and also to become comfortable with the differences”.

Furthermore, Bennett and Stewart (1991) have proposed a culture-general model for the acquisition of intercultural sensitivity, which is made up of “two broad stages: ethnocentrism and ethnorelativism”. Ethnocentrism is defined by Bennett and Stewart as a disposition to view one's own cultural point of view as central to reality, while ethnorelativism is the conscious recognition that all behaviour exists within a cultural framework, including one’s own. Both of them are further divided into three stages which are developmentally ordered. The stages of ethnocentrism are: denial, defence and minimisation. The stages of ethnorelativism are: acceptance, adaptation and integration (cited in Liddicoat, Papademetre, Scarino and Kohler, 2003). According to Brislin et al. (1986), “In adjusting to life in another culture, people are likely to experience a number of emotional reactions due to feelings of
displacement and unfamiliarity, and because of their status as outsiders” (p.39). Therefore, it is useful to look into some important components of intercultural communication competence. This may help people better understand in general what they should know about intercultural competence, and how they should behave in an interculturally competent manner.

Finally, according to Kim (1986), intercultural communication is an interdisciplinary field of study which incorporates research from disciplines such as: social psychology, sociology, cultural anthropology, sociolinguistics, and, of course, communication. The study of intercultural communication can awaken people’s cultural sensitivity, the reflection and unlearning of ethnocentrism and help the cultivation of an open attitude and the general development of a healthy personality. There is no doubt that intercultural communication studies should focus both on the study of cultures, as well as on communication studies. To use Chinese logic, this involves communication to let people learn about other cultures and by learning about other cultures to let people improve their communication (Zhao and Edmondson, 2005).

**Data Collection**

In order to collect substantial data, the study was conducted in the following two steps using qualitative and quantitative research:

1. **Questionnaires** were given personally to the participants. They were asked to expand on the items to ascertain their opinions about intercultural communication at this university. To complete the questionnaire required about 10-15 minutes. A questionnaire was sent to participants individually and they were asked to return within 7 days. An addressed envelop was provided for return of the questionnaire.

2. After the questionnaires were completed, **interviews** were conducted with participants on the basis of purposive sampling and opportunity sampling. Participants from different academic and administrative functions at this university were invited to participate in informal interviews for 30 minutes, to answer questions on intercultural communication and how it affects their interaction with international students. The interviews were audio-recorded for later transcription.

**Data Analysis and Results**

The questionnaires were completed by 90 respondents, and an additional 10 respondents were interviewed. The respondents were students and staff members. The results obtained from the questionnaire and interview data, both quantitative and qualitative are presented as findings in this section.

**Questionnaires**

Data gathering involved the distribution of 90 questionnaires. Demographic information was obtained from the questionnaire which was completed by the following respondents: 70 students and 20 staff members. The demographic data provided background information about the participants, relevant to the reader’s understanding of who the participants were. Quantitative data from the questionnaire is presented in the form of descriptive statistics, such as: means, percentage, and standard deviations. The items in the questionnaire provide an opportunity to gather information on the various participants’ perceptions of intercultural communication. The data are presented in two sections, as follows:

Section 1: Participants’ Demographic Background

Section 2: Views and Attitudes towards Intercultural Communication

**Section 1: Participants’ Demographic Backgrounds**

1. **Student Background Information**

Data were collected from 70 students. Demographic data are found in Table 1 (Appendix),
and data on students’ attitudes to intercultural communication in Table 3.

The sample was almost evenly divided between male (51.40%) and female (48.60%). The majority of all respondents were aged between 20-30 years (51.40%), and the next largest group was between 31-40 years (37.10%). The native language background data indicated that most of the students are from a non-English speaking background (65.20%). Of the group surveyed, the majority (73.10%) are international students, most of whom are doing undergraduate study (64.20%). More than half of the students have studied for less than 2 years (45.70%) and the second largest group of students have studied for 2-5 years (42.90%). The educational specialisation of these students is mainly Sciences and Technology (32.90%), and the second major area of study is “others”, such as commerce and architecture (24.30% respectively). These data are shown in Table 3.

2. Staff Background Information

Demographic data were collected via the questionnaire from 20 staff members at this university. The majority are female (65%) in the range between 31 to 40 years (40%). Of the group surveyed, the majority (65%) are academic staff members and 15% are administrators. The majority of the staff (68.40%) had worked at this university for less than five years. More than half of them (60%) often communicate with international students. Generally the staff members were well-qualified, as the majority (85%) were educated to Master’s degree level or above. These data are shown in Table 2 (Appendix).

Section 2: Views and Attitudes towards Intercultural Communication

Responses to the following items were analysed to determine the means for each item:

Table 3: Data from the Questionnaire
3.1 Theme 1. Meaning of Intercultural Communication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Student</th>
<th>Staff</th>
<th>All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8. Intercultural communication is about communication between people from different cultures.</td>
<td>1.64</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>1.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Intercultural communication happens only when we travel overseas.</td>
<td>4.07</td>
<td>4.70</td>
<td>4.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. When in another country, I try to learn as much about the culture of this country as possible.</td>
<td>1.76</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>1.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Intercultural communication is not important in education, especially for dealing with international students.</td>
<td>4.44</td>
<td>4.80</td>
<td>4.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Intercultural communication enriches our understanding of other cultures.</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td>1.45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data shown in Table 4.3.1 indicate that both staff members and students fully agree with the statement that intercultural communication means to communicate with people from different cultural backgrounds (mean 1.61) (Item 8). Both groups strongly disagree on Items 9 & 11 (means 4.21 and 4.52 respectively) and they are willing to learn from other cultures (mean 1.75) (Item 10). In addition, they consider that intercultural communication is an appropriate way to develop an understanding of other cultures. This view is shared by all respondents, as indicated in the table (mean 1.45) (Item 12).
### 3.2 Theme 2. Perception of Intercultural Communication Competence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Means</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. I feel uncomfortable communicating with people from different cultures.</td>
<td>3.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Establishing a good relationship with people from other cultures is difficult for me.</td>
<td>3.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Intercultural communication involves different communication and interaction styles when communicating with people from different cultures.</td>
<td>1.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. I feel at ease communicating with people from different cultures.</td>
<td>2.37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data shown in Table 4.3.2 indicate that both staff members and students disagree on Items 14 & 16 (means 3.80 and 3.73 respectively) and agree on Items 17 & 34 (means 1.94 and 2.25 respectively). Nowadays, intercultural communication competence has become an important attribute for success people should possess.

### 3.3 Theme 3. Main Strategies of Effective Communication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Means</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Intercultural communication involves acknowledging differences in values and beliefs among cultures.</td>
<td>1.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Intercultural communication involves being skilled in giving feedback.</td>
<td>2.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. Intercultural communication involves having some knowledge of other cultures.</td>
<td>1.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. International students do well if staff values their cultural backgrounds.</td>
<td>2.20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data shown in Table 4.3.3 indicate that both staff members and students generally agree on Items 19, 29 & 30 (means 1.67, 1.95 and 2.16 respectively). All respondents believe that it is of great importance to value and respect other cultures. In addition, the most interesting findings from the data emerged from the responses concerning whether or not intercultural communication involves being skilled in giving feedback (Item 26). There were slight differences of opinion reflected in the means. Staff disagreed about the importance of feedback, while students agreed that feedback was significant (means 2.37 and 2.73 respectively).
3.4 Theme 4. Basis of Successful Intercultural Communication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Means</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Successful intercultural interactions must be based on understanding of equity.</td>
<td>1.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Intercultural communication depends on understanding another language.</td>
<td>3.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Successful intercultural interactions must be based on using the same language.</td>
<td>3.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Successful intercultural interactions must be based on appropriate non-verbal communication.</td>
<td>2.89</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data shown in Table 4.3.4 indicate that both staff members and students agree on Item 18 (mean 1.97). However, both of them disagree on Item 21 (mean 3.34). It can be seen that sharing a common language is important in intercultural communication but not absolute. However, clearly, the respondents indicated that successful intercultural communication is not just based on using the same language. In terms of means attained, each group of respondents expressed disagreement with the statement that “Successful intercultural interactions must be based on using the same language”, reflected in the closeness of the means, i.e., means 3.31 – 3.90 (Item 24). Moreover, staff members do not think appropriate non-verbal communication is related to successful intercultural communication, while students were not certain about this proposition (means 2.89 versus 2.68) (Item 27).

3.5 Theme 5. Elements influence Intercultural Communication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Means</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. To establish good rapport with people from other cultures is not important in intercultural communication.</td>
<td>3.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. Reliance on electronic communication will influence intercultural communication.</td>
<td>2.54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data shown in Table 4.3.5 indicate that both staff members and students commonly accept that a good relationship is of great importance in intercultural communication; therefore they disagree with Item 25 (means 3.80 and 4.36 respectively). In addition, regarding the impact of electronic communication (item 32), the tendency seems to be neutral in terms of gender (means 2.55 and 2.42 respectively).

In order to obtain additional comments, there is an open-ended question at the end of the questionnaire. However, it is complex to analyse because they are all narrative responses. Unfortunately, there is insufficient feedback, as only a few respondents gave their answers. Thus, only a few interesting comments from respondents were explored here:

“I would like to discuss with people who have different points of view or who have different cultural backgrounds which is fascinating.

Adequate patience and respect is important to the person who is in a foreign country
to feel comfortable.
A successful intercultural communication should include the ability for forgiveness."

Interview

- What does intercultural communication mean to staff members or students at this university?

In regard to the definition of intercultural communication, there is a common agreement among all the participants on this point. Basically intercultural communication, to them, means the ability to communicate with people from different cultures, forming friendships, developing and understanding each other, as well as exchanging viewpoints and appreciating the differences.

In addition, three participants commented as follows:

“I guess it means, for me developing new communication skills to be able to communicate more effectively with people from other cultures and it may mean a new skill or just may mean a refocus on a skill I already have, more emphasis on it or less emphasis on it” (Participant 7).

“IC (Intercultural communication) is about communicating verbally, or using your body gestures because people are all from different ethnic backgrounds or cultural backgrounds, of different religions, of different race, different belief system” (Participant 8).

“I travel a lot so I love intercultural communication, and it’s interesting, it broadens your experiences” (Participant 9).

It is interesting that one participant proposed a very different definition of intercultural communication,

“I suppose the negative definition to me would be more powerful, you know it means not to be bounded by your own culture by being Chinese by being English, you can actually sort of synthesize, you can understand a different cultural point of view and relate that to your own experience, and use that as a basis for understanding. I think it’s easy to understand in terms of what it isn’t” (Participant 10).

One of the participants demonstrated the definition of intercultural communication from the perspective of a staff member as follows:

“As a staff member, it means that I have to understand not just the way people talk, but the way in different cultures people will use non-verbal and paralanguage, and also understand culture, the culture of the person that I am teaching, so to have some understanding of that because that has a big impact on the way they learn” (Participant 10).

From the above statements, it can be seen that people from different backgrounds, however, put different interpretations on the same thing.

- The needs of intercultural communication

Each participant seemed to agree that some basic needs should be met, for example: language skills, active listening, patience, good humour and understanding. Not surprisingly, each of these elements plays an important role in intercultural communication. Yet among them, language ability and study skills are most significant for international students to survive. Snow (2002) argued that “Anyone who has ever tried to learn a foreign language knows how uncomfortable and self-conscious people can be when trying to communicate in a new and unfamiliar language, and these feelings add stress to cross-cultural encounters”.

Now it is commonly recognized that many students find reading and writing in English especially difficult, because they have to do every assignment in English. It can be seen that the language barrier may be an important factor, which hinders foreign students’ daily life. As Guntermann (1993, p.138) stated, “Even a short period of time spent abroad has a marked impact on a student’s language competence”. This opinion is illustrated by the following notable comments:
“A lot of people can speak English very well, but reading and writing are different” (Participant 2).

“I think the language skills, big need, learning how to write an essay, essay skill, very big issue, how to analyse and discuss in an essay” (Participant 3).

“And I think once people who pass the language test and come into a course that is enough. But I don’t think it is. I think also their language writing skills particularly, for many people and possibly for international students as well, not well-developed, although many international students have much better understanding of grammar and structure of language, native speakers do” (Participant 6).

“I think the needs to do with the verbal understanding of differences of language” (Participant 10).

In addition, while communicating with people from different cultures, educators should respect other cultures, possess the motivation to communicate with people regardless of their cultures and build up confidence and social understanding. Otherwise, as one participant commented:

“If it is a lack of understanding, then a lot of frustration can occur. Misunderstanding each other’s emotions comes out and can be a blockage to communication” (Participant 4).

Furthermore, to be willing to communicate with people from different cultures is foremost.

“A willingness by people to try and get on with each other and communicate because without some motivation, perhaps sometimes it is difficult for people to bother to communicate, motivation probably, acceptance of difference. A…. willingness to try to get across your meaning, so sometimes you might have to do more than once, being persistent, and try to make sure that the person does really understand, checking full understanding, maybe it is important, too” (Participant 6).

Apart from all the features mentioned above, non-verbal features and some useful techniques are of great importance as well. As Stier (2004) stated, there is no doubt that the linguistic (verbal and non-verbal) aspects of communication are of utmost significance in communicating effectively. Choi (1997) also asserted, “Teaching with more visual materials would also be helpful”. That is to say, providing written support material to supplement lectures (Robertson, Line, Jones & Thomas, 2000). Representative responses to this were:

“I think just be more aware of how I come across and aware of non-verbal sort of thing, non-verbal features of the other person behaviour at the time that I am communicating and sometimes the fact that somebody may say nothing does not mean that they have nothing to say” (Participant 6).

“I think using a lot of learning techniques; you might have verbal communication, using sort of visual information, an overhead, also give students a piece of paper, a handout, so they can hear it, they can see it, and they can also read it. So you are reinforcing the learning skills, all sorts of good things in people’s terms, one of the good things you use is pictures, some articles are really complicated to understand, you might have diagrams or images, a chart, break the information down to simple terms” (Participant 8).

All participants expressed the view that these needs were not adequately dealt with, because the broad community is still not diverse, let alone multicultural. Just as Participant 1 said,

“It is getting better now, but very slowly” (Participant 1).

“I think that is very scattered, I think people really when they come from another culture, what I see on the mainstream of courses, I just expect it to fit in. And nobody really thinks of the way they learn differently” (Participant 10).

Participant 5 and 6 explained this point further,

“People don’t have enough background knowledge about other educational systems in other countries. So they just assume that everybody is coming from the same learning tradition and also because I think they assume that people have a good enough level of English when they come here, which often they don’t
“Perhaps because of lack of understanding by some people, they think what they have to offer should just be one thought and they shouldn’t have to bother with people who are different maybe, so maybe … maybe people don’t understand enough about the differences, don’t want to check and see whether or not people understand” (Participant 6).

In addition, the presence of international students, even in large numbers, is insufficient to promote intercultural interactions, and to result in international understanding.

- In a class—for example lectures, tutorials or seminars, in order to accommodate international students’ needs

It is commonly believed that the teachers should be careful and sensitive to the students’ needs. Obviously, “language accommodation seems to be one of the major requirements of students’ understanding” (Choi, 1997). First and foremost, teachers should speak more slowly, but not too much, in other words, teachers need to be aware of the pace of their talking, to ensure everyone understands what is being said. For example, the use of acronyms is an area where foreign students will have problems understanding what is being talked about. As Participant 9 said,

“I did present differently, so I try to make things simple, but also to give information in different ways, not just speaking, but try to write it and I act it as well”.

Additionally, articulation, positive attitudes and non-threatening behaviour have become wide concerns. Furthermore, group work plays a vital role in class: lecturers should mix international and Australian students together (Robertson et al., 2000), so that they can benefit from each others’ different perspectives on learning and share their knowledge. By using divergent cultural perspectives, the class serves as a ‘pedagogical melting pot’, where students are exposed to varying views, opinions and ideologies, then the concept of integrated classes can be embraced (Stier, 2003). As one participant described,

“I think the classes have to be informal and interactive because then they feel more confident in being able to talk, then they can ask other students if they feel more comfortable, and other students will ask them, and I will ask them, do they understand, what’s happening, do they want to know anything more” (Participant 10).

However, other responses provided interesting insights. According to the comments given by Participants 8 and 9, there is almost no difference while conducting a lecture or tutorial to accommodate international students’ needs.

“No. I tend to use the same style to all my students. If they have a problem of language, English is not their first language; I tend to give them my teaching notes, or give them a copy or notes of power points, then I spend extra time on them. I think as teachers and lecturers we need to be aware we have students in class who need additional help. We need to know what’s available for them out of school, English language centre, student association. And maybe a little bit of extra time for their assignments” (Participant 8).

“To accommodate them, I didn’t actually, I speak quite normally. They were very good students and the biggest difference is motivation” (Participant 9).

All these opinions make sense; views on the issue in question vary from person to person. And consequently it is hard to choose the best of them.

- The problems which international students experience in learning at this university

All of the participants claimed that the international students encounter many issues. As Stier (2003) stated, since international students are away from home, they will undoubtedly struggle with particular problems. Specifically, there are many problems, ranging from personal living issues right through to language, learning and personal concerns: for example, homesickness, loneliness, living problems, racism, financial problems and climate. Three of the participants described international students’ situations in detail,

“They are away from home so it’s quite culturally different most of the time. So I mean
if our native speakers are away from their own home they still have difficulty, because of the different place. They find information is more difficult to know how to access the services and the limitations of those services because of funding. Not being able to get access to those services when they need them, because quite often if they have assignments due, they have limited time to do them. So it may take them longer to do the assignment because they have to think about it and translate it into a language which is not their first language, maybe, and then have to access services to check and see if it is ok” (Participant 6).

“To do with their living, place of living, their family or obviously, people bring their family here and that creates a lot of challenges of expenses and there are people who don’t bring their family here, who have problems of like distance from family, so there are sort of personal issues like safety of the place to live which can be an issue. And there are climatic things, I think. And you don’t know how much people really know about the climate here or they think everywhere in Australia has a hot climate” (Participant 7).

Additionally, racism is one of the problems. It is not uncommon for international students to perceive prejudice and discrimination (Scott, 1998, cited in Ward, 2001). As remarked by two participants:

“There are millions of problems, ranging from the isolation, the loneliness, the need to deeply communicate with others, financial problems, sort of legal problems, like with housing. In some counties you may rent a house- no contract no legal document, while in Australia, we have a legal contract you have to sign, you have to pay the bond, and so you’ve got the problem of not only understanding English, but understanding legal English when you sign the contract. You’ve got problems of racism, they are all Asian students, they know nothing about computers, and it is a sort of stereotype, so I think you need to be aware that this kind of occurs. It is just ignorance, we are different colours, we all look different, but we are all humans, we all understand things happen, need love, food and warmth” (Participant 8).

“So probably this is the other difficulty, the racism. Tasmania is not a multicultural place and there are huge biases in the community” (Participant 9).

Apart from personal matters, international students also have some other problems. As mentioned earlier, language is one of the basic needs of intercultural communication, and sometimes it can be a major barrier.

“Some students have a much bigger battle with language than others who come with pretty amazing English skills, I think. Sometimes I am quite aware that you know, being included in a local community can be a problem. And I just think like for very good reasons, international students would often share a place with other international students, and that’s good in some ways because they can give sort of support and familiarity but on the other hand, unless they are sort of open to others and confident to make an approach to others, they can suffer a very lonely experience. It can also affect the language skills, but I can see positives in whatever way people choose to live and then I think also, like again with the attitudes towards the learning, preferred learning styles” (Participant 7).

It is undeniable that culture shock is a big issue for international students. According to Brown (2000, p.183), “Culture shock refers to phenomena ranging from mild irritability to deep psychological panic and crisis”. The most influential factor is that foreign students are experiencing cultural shock or cultural fatigue, which is a common phenomenon when a person moves from a familiar environment to an unfamiliar one. That is because “if we use our own culture as the standard by which to judge other cultures, there is a strong assumption that our own culture is superior, and a strong negative bias in the way we view other cultures” (Snow, 2002). As stated in Chapter Two, the tendency to judge the customs of other societies by the standards of one’s own is called ethnocentrism. It is a large obstacle in intercultural communication.

Bennett and Stewart (1991) also argued that learners at this stage are in the defence stage, where they tend to polarise the discussion of cultural difference, framing one set of practices as ‘good’ and another as ‘bad’, and therefore are unable to undertake non-evaluative cultural
comparisons. Everything is different, for example: the language, not knowing how to use banking machines. As Andriessen (2002) mentioned, “This period of cultural adjustment involves everything from getting used to the food and language, to learning how to use the telephone”. Participant 6 described this situation specifically and vividly,

“Unfamiliarity with where to shop, where to eat, where to post a letter, how much and how often the buses are– and where they go to” (Participant 6).

Another significant aspect is the different teaching styles and learning environment (for example, the expectation to be an active, independent and autonomous learner), from those encountered in home country. Personally, I found that teaching styles and the learning expectations at universities in China are different from those at Australian universities: for example, making an appointment with your supervisor and always negotiating about your study. This is a remarkable difference, because such personal attention is not possible in Chinese universities, due to the large class sizes. Some students possibly started to feel a reversal of negative feelings about Australian culture at this point. As Bennett and Stewart (1991) stated, a possibility in the defence stage occurs for a reversal of this perception, with an exalted view of the other culture that one wishes to assimilate into and a denigration of one’s own culture.

As stated previously, the way foreign teachers conduct their lessons may be different, compared with that of teachers at home, which increases foreign student’s anxiety. Participating in classroom discussions and asking questions of staff often produce difficulties. Participant 3 talked about her observations that Chinese students can talk a bit more, but Japanese students do not consider saying something in front of the class. It is very hard to get the Japanese students talking. Differences in the style and traditions of learning between Western and Asian countries frequently cause difficulty. Many overseas students find it difficult to adapt to Western notions of independent thinking and learning, i.e. the argumentative style of Western academic work. Moreover, students from some countries may also have difficulty because they lack experience in using well-equipped libraries and laboratories and because they are too scared to ask.

“I think not all international students are going to ask, especially those a bit younger, they won’t ask because they had a bit of cultural shock and they are away from home- probably their first time, there would be other things” (Participant 9).

“They have to be confident enough to be able to disclose that they don’t understand, and that I think it is the biggest thing because you know in some different cultures people don’t like to say, “I don’t understand something”, no, they don’t” (Participant 10).

It is interesting that the participants reached an absolute consensus on the views of strengths and weaknesses in dealing with international students. To their minds, there are several advantages. The first one is that in a small university and due to the small class sizes, the students have access to adequate international services. They are recognized as individuals rather than just one of many. In other words, learning is much more personalized in a small university, and it is very easy for people to form networks, which is a real advantage. Secondly, international students seem to be well-provided for, such as by good access to broadband PCs, library and other facilities. However, in some ways the small number of students can be a weakness as well. It is hard to provide a comprehensive range of services. As Participants 1 and 4 both pointed out,

“Some people lack culture awareness and cultural understanding; as a result we don’t have much support from each other” (Participant 1 & 4).

In addition, it is widely agreed that having international students at the university is beneficial to the local community and classroom teaching.

“There are a lot of international students around, the more students there are, the more people are aware of difference, and they have to do something different from what they would normally do. I think that is the big strength” (Participant 8).

“It is good we have Open Days and things like that, because I think most people these days are a bit more open towards multicultural stuff” (Participant 9).
“Our international students are very serious, usually because they pay so much money, they want standards to be high, and they make you really focus and think about what you do as a lecturer, they bring a richness and diversity to the classroom. And they encourage thinking across the world I suppose” (Participant 10).

Therefore, ignorance about dealing with international students can exist. This may lead to negative interaction. Vogel (2001) stated, “The university is, after all, more than a teaching and research institution. It is a community and, as such, also a cultural entity. Language centres should engage in numerous activities that substantially enrich the cultural life of the institution”. It cannot be denied that, there are still some weaknesses which exist, as some of the participants mentioned,

“I think if you talk about our university as a community, maybe the strength is most people are very accepting here, I think. But I am not sure about outside the university; within the university maybe there is a fairly high acceptance by students of international students” (Participant 6).

“I think one of the biggest weaknesses would be that they are full fee paying; therefore we should actually provide quality services, like the English Language Centre should be a free service, for you already pay your tuition fee for your course, it should just be a year of meeting learning needs” (Participant 8).

“The weakness would be, it doesn’t seem to be a real policy or plan for helping international students, depending on the individual., In reverse it’s another strength, the fact if there is a policy you have to follow, while individual doesn’t have to follow the policy but they can get involved by helping them individual, it all depends on the staff members” (Participant 10).

Lastly, a major problem arises due to differences in cultural expectations. That is the relationship between foreign supervisors and international students. How does the relationship work? In other words, how should the relationship operate appropriately? Australians are very much independent, finding ways by themselves; whereas international students’ background is different, they have different expectations of supervisors. It is important and necessary that proper action be taken to improve this relationship, such as, to identify whether they have the ability to do research and treat them differently. If students have inadequate academic or language skills, supervisors should help them early in the process. For example, they can go to workshops to improve their skills, before they conduct their research study.

**Conclusion**

The discussion of this paper is based on a questionnaire survey and subsequent interview research on staff members and students in this case study. The focus of this study should be on helping students and staff deal with different situations and learn how to recognize and cope with misunderstandings. Seelye (1993) addresses this issue by saying that, “The basic aim of an intercultural communication class is to have the students learn to communicate with people who do not share their hue of cultural conditioning”. He states the important thing to note is that intercultural communication involves many characteristics not often present in classes.

As Bennett argued, at the acceptance stage learners develop an understanding of their own cultural context and so can accept the existence of different cultural contexts. Thus, they can consciously adopt the perspectives of other cultural groups and modify their behaviours when communicating with people from different cultures (cited in Liddicoat et al. 2003).

This study aims to identify and explore some differences of intercultural communication awareness in a tertiary education context. The knowledge gained from undertaking this study, in combination with prior understanding from the literature, offers new insights for students into personal development, intercultural identity, and professional effectiveness in this important area.

The results of this study provide researchers with a broader understanding of intercultural communication in tertiary education settings. It is also noticeable that the study of intercultural
communication can awaken people's cultural sensitivity, reflect on ethnocentrism and help the cultivation of an open attitude and the general development of a healthy personality. In the process of the study of intercultural communication, one can understand one's own culture better from new perspectives, as well as learn about and assimilate the outstanding cultural achievements of other cultures. In sum, an all-round approach to studying intercultural communication should be developed and it is also hoped that the increasing presence of international students on campuses will provide opportunities for the enhancement and development of intercultural communication.

The study may enhance cultural awareness amongst students and staff, and an increased sense of effective communication. As indicated in Chapter One, the aim of this study is to help people develop cultural awareness, and improve their intercultural communication competence. It is impossible to expound all the details of culture and communication, as they cover almost every aspect of a person's life. But armed with this awareness, people can design their own strategies for dealing with many of the problems arising in intercultural communication situations.

References


Appendix

Table 1

Student Background

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>0%</th>
<th>10%</th>
<th>20%</th>
<th>30%</th>
<th>40%</th>
<th>50%</th>
<th>60%</th>
<th>70%</th>
<th>80%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-30 yrs</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40 yrs</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-English</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International students</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate students</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study less than 2 yrs</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 2-5 yrs</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science &amp; technology students</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2

Staff Background

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>0%</th>
<th>10%</th>
<th>20%</th>
<th>30%</th>
<th>40%</th>
<th>50%</th>
<th>60%</th>
<th>70%</th>
<th>80%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40 yrs</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic staff member</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrators</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postgraduate</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work in less than 5 yrs</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Often</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Adolescence, Sense of Identity and Female Risk Taking in a Senior Secondary School in Northern Tasmania

Derris Wood
Education Department of Tasmania

Abstract
This research examines, by means of a questionnaire survey, the risk taking perceptions and participation rates of Senior Secondary female students, aged from sixteen to nineteen years (16-19), in a Northern Tasmanian Senior Secondary School. The questionnaire focusses on the influences upon the females' personal goals and positive and negative risk taking activities within the context of social capital, psychological, social, educational, risk taking and health background theory and in the three domains of family, school and community. Comparisons are drawn between the town and country female participants in the survey. The adolescents' revelations about their personal qualities, sense of self, personal and parental control and future aspirations are compared and contrasted with their risk taking activities. The NUDIST (Numerical, Unstructured, Data, Indexing, Searching and Theorising) software programme is used for the analysis of the qualitative data, and the SPSS (Statistical Programme for Social Sciences) software is used for the statistical analyses. The female participants demonstrate participation rates at varying levels within the selection of fourteen (14) risk taking activities chosen for this study. Both groups of females demonstrate high levels of aspirations in the fields of educational endeavours, professions, training and work opportunities. On a personal level, the positive level of influence and authority of mothers and a negative response to the influence of fathers is noted by both groups. Religious affiliation and church attendance prove to have a diminished influence compared to former studies, whilst community involvement revolves around sport and musical activities. A very high proportion of both groups of females report happy childhoods, resilience to trauma and have a very positive sense of self and personal identity. The students distinguish both positive and negative risk taking activities with the negative focussing on alcohol related risk taking, sexual activity and marijuana use. Perceptions of risk danger and actual participation rates in risky behaviours show distinct variances in both groups of females, therefore strategies for negative risk prevention and modification are outlined. Positive outcomes of the research highlight three categories of influence which curb risk taking amongst adolescent females. These emphasise the sense of self, the impact of the family, and the effect of religious beliefs.

Introduction
The focus for this study evolved during a search for a study which would be useful for educators and counsellors working with adolescents. Following discussions with researchers who had published their findings into adolescent risk taking in Southern Tasmanian Secondary Schools, the need for a Northern Tasmanian study, focusing solely on young females in a Senior College environment, was identified as being more appropriate for a researcher. (Abbott-Chapman & Denholm, 2001). The aims of such a study would be to provide the means for obtaining comparative information about this subject between the two disparate regions, gaining value for a select group of disciplinary views including psychology, sociology, education, counselling and health.
Background to the Study

This project also had its origins in my former study of women, Women and Educational Leadership Early Life Experiences of Tasmanian Women Principals (Wood, 1998), where leadership and the role of women principals and teachers were investigated and where the self of self and identity was a significant finding. In contrast this multi disciplinary study turns its emphasis to the risk taking behaviour of young adolescent women.

Questions, researchers suggest, could be posed as to whether the unique stage of adolescence actually exists. However, Palladino, (1996) suggests that there is overwhelming evidence that teenagers do exist (Jaffe,1998, 3). In the light of this contention, this research justifies its intentions by providing knowledge for educators, teachers, coaches, social workers, justice personnel and any other co-workers with adolescents.

Theoretical and Conceptual Issues

Psychological researchers maintain that the central feature of female development included the tendency to seek out and maintain relationships with others (Bukatko & Dachler, 2004). Females are therefore not on a pathway to becoming independent, autonomous and self reliant, as with males, but on a journey to making connections with others. This is not to be viewed as “dependency” but as a source of discovering gratification and self –fulfilment (Miller 1991; Surrey 1991). It has also been established that boys receive more attention than girls from societal, parental and school perspectives. (Diamant & McNulty, 1995,429).

Sociologists focus primarily on the social, economic and political contexts in which young people grow up and live. However, other studies of society are more concerned with the attitudes, expectations and views about young people, held by very powerful and influential adult groups. These views concern the sociologists who in turn examine adult attitudes to youth, their expectations of them and their place in society (Earle & Fopp, 1999, 404).

The literature on family influences on adolescents emphasises the potential climate within the dynamics of family life for adolescents to progress to identity achievement and an increase of “self” (Papini, Selby &Clark, 1998; Minchin, 1998). The emotional distance which is experienced by parents with adolescents is not a rejection of family connectedness, but an essential prerequisite for adolescent achievement and the experience of “self” (Heaven, 2001, 37).

The peer group has both positive and negative effects on adolescents. The positive attributes of peer relationships improve their social and emotional identity, their independence, ability to relate to others, their levels of satisfaction and again the sense of identity (Hartup & Stevens, 1991; Heaven, 2001). Girls respond to the benefits of close peer and friendship relationships and are known for their preparedness to self disclosure and for being more mutually intimate and understanding (Heaven, 2001, 79).

Education professionals can view adolescents and their behaviours and needs as being more problematic, but adolescence can be a time of normal functioning. Because children of all ages now have legal rights, teachers and other professionals working with them have to be more aware of the views and wishes of their students, so subsequently there needs to be sophisticated models of counselling practices established in education facilities. Counsellors should be aware that friends are often consulted before they are approached, in situations where a degree of appropriateness is an issue (Branwhite, 2000, 18). Teachers should be aware that they are not social workers, yet they are very significant in the lives of their students. Their influence, Galbo (1994) contends is, surprisingly, associated with teachers’ social characteristics as opposed to their cognitive and life skills (Branwhite, 2000, 15).
Risk Taking

The literature is definite about risk taking in adolescence being, not only normal, but an essential part of learning and personal development. Caution is added in that while risk-taking is exploratory, some adolescents will be motivated by poor self esteem and lack of confidence. Impulsive behaviours and recklessness are strategies used by some adolescents to gain the appeal of their peers. Social rejection, or not being “cool” is the suggested cause. The main problem is their seeming inability to evaluate the potential risks and consequences of everyday behaviour as 60% of adolescent deaths are caused by accidents-many of them being the result of risk taking (Corben, 2001, 1). This applies to the cases of alcohol and drug use and driving where adolescents do not perceive them to be as dangerous as do adults. Sensation-seeking individuals differ in their need for stimulation which underlies much risk taking behaviours. The peer group can provoke risk taking activities by providing models of risky behaviour and by competing for group dominance.

Parents and their parenting style, their lack of supervision, failure to set limits, modelling risk behaviours themselves and even parental encouragement can influence risk taking. The relative dominance of peers over parents also increases these behaviours. There are also genetic factors and neuroendocrine processes and the timing of puberty which have to be considered in this debate. Risk taking can also be a coping mechanism for dealing with anxiety, frustration, inadequacy and failure (Booth, 2005, 6). It is important to remember that not all risk taking is bad…risks pose very real dangers … and tremendous benefits (Higbee, 1997, 1). Antisocial acts depend on the interaction between the individual and the environment). Personality traits such as sociability or impulsiveness and temperament are also factors in this behaviour A change in the management of health - related, risk taking is advocated by Cook (2005), whereby information is provided to students about the numbers who are not involved in these activities (Cook, 2005,1).

Risk and Health Issues

It has been recorded that many teenagers experiment with alcohol and illegal drugs and a proportion of them are regular users. Cannabis has been considered as harmless, but now there is good evidence that it can make mental health problems worse in adolescence and can double the risk of developing schizophrenia. Alcohol, despite publicity to the contrary, is the most common drug. Early sexual activity creates a greater risk of early pregnancy and health problems. Sexually transmitted diseases are common as is HIV infection and AIDS are becoming more common (Timms, 2004, 3). Multiple partners and risky, unprotected intercourse are often signs of underlying emotional problems, or they could indicate a risk taking lifestyle.

Social Capital

Adolescents, as with all other groups, operate within a social context and as such, there need to be an examination of the broader social influences on this group. Putman explains that “social capital is an important resource for individuals and it can greatly affect their ability to act and to perceive a quality of life” (Putman, 2000, 319). Parents and children develop social networks where one party is subordinate to the other and where one participant is more powerful than the other. Schools and students also fall into this type of networking social system which develops closure to strengthen the role of the more dominant participants- the parents and the school itself.

The dynamics of the family provide varying views of the characteristics of social capital. In one sense social capital can be seen as existing within “a collectively with people acting selflessly” (Coleman, 1990, 310). This type of social capital assists “ the development of nascent social movement, from a small group of dedicated, inward looking people who work on a common task”, this task being the raising of the children
(Coleman, 1990, 310). Strong and effective sanctions and norms for behaviour can be imposed by parents which can assist in keeping the young adolescents from the desire to use adolescence as a time of experimentation and fun times which could include risk taking. From a negative viewpoint, the social capital inherent in the family can be restrictive, coming from the efforts of the “inward looking” group which influences the children. “Married couples are homebodies”, he observed and contact by family members with external groups and involvement in them is limited (Putman, 2000, 278).

**Methodology**

The Abbott-Chapman/Denholm (2000) study examined this phenomenon using a range of twenty-six (26) risk taking activities and their findings provided a useful model for further exploration by this researcher. This study had only been conducted in a capital city context (Hobart) in southern Tasmania and therefore the need to extend this type of study to other regional areas for comparative findings was identified and became the catalyst for this particular investigation which focused on four main areas - alcohol use, sexual activity, substance abuse and the influence of one aspect of the media, X-Rated videos – and a total of fourteen (14) activities.

**Key Research Objectives**

The former research of the writer and the literature review provided the bases for the following key objectives.

1. The objective is to examine the concept of “self” in adolescent girls?
2. The objective is to determine the amount of personal control evident in adolescent girls’ lives in their younger years?
3. The objective is to examine the need to “sensation seek” in adolescent years.
4. The objective is to determine how influential were the expectations which were placed on adolescent girls by themselves, the family, the school and the community in their early lives?
5. The objective is to examine the attitudes prevalent amongst adolescent girls regarding the law and legal restrictions?
6. The objective is to gauge how informed adolescent girls are regarding their perception of risk taking activities?
7. The objective is to examine the ways adolescent girls’ aspirations for their futures impinge on their risk taking activities?
8. The objective is to determine the resilience of adolescent girls to adversity in their lives

**Sample**

The senior secondary college, chosen as the setting for this survey, had a very suitable enrolment of over two hundred female students in the age group needed for this study. Because many of these students travelled from outlying districts to attend this college, a postal questionnaire survey was used to gain the required information. Each questionnaire was anonymous with no identification of the respondent indicated on the survey. As each one was received back – 91 from 211 in total (43 percent) - the researcher allocated a numerical identification to it and only referred to this number in the analyses and coding processes. The College Counsellors were aware that the survey was to be conducted and were cognisant with the personal nature of the questions, in the event that counselling may be sought by respondents as a consequence of the survey. There were opportunities in the questionnaire to include
both qualitative and quantitative data.

A letter indicating the arrival of this survey was sent one week prior to the posting of the questionnaire, to allow for questions, explanations or refusals to participate. From the respondents’ answers, a wide range of categories for analysis was compiled and coded for later recall and interpretation using a computer software programme named NUDIST 4 - Numerical Unstructured Data Indexing, Searching and Theorising - (Index Free Nodes 212, Free Nodes 378) To support this initial qualitative coding, a statistical approach was added by introducing SPSS-a Statistical Programme for Social Sciences-to recode the data for quantitative results - (221 categories). Deakin (1970) explains the validity of using a statistical approach to test one’s theories gained by qualitative or other means. (Denzin, 1970, 45).

**Design of Questionnaire**

The first set of questions focussed on obtaining general background information regarding the females’ ages, their residential location and family details such as the number of parents or guardians as well as siblings. To establish a socio-economic profile of the students, provisions were also made to record the educational levels of their parents. The accent then turned directly to the young women’s interests and attitudes to religious beliefs, childhood experiences, school acceptance, enjoyment or rejection and the influences of parents other family members, significant others and peer groups. Questions about predicting the future involved the females in disclosing the goals they held for their future education, career and family aspirations. The levels of authority and control from the three spheres of family, school and community became the focus for the next set of questions. Resilience after traumatic experiences was another area of focus as were their opinions of the negative risk involved in the risk taking activities selected for the study, their frequency of engagement in them as well as their reasons for undertaking these negative actions. The original questionnaire was posted to the designated audience of 219 respondents, 8 of which were not applicable.

**Qualitative Findings from the Survey**

a) Objectives

**Objective 1 (“Self”)**

The females from both town and country indicated a multitude of positive personal qualities about their sense of “self” and their characteristics. Being positive, caring and kind were the most prevalent traits. As well they also identified being outgoing, friendly, happy and having a sense of fun. On the negative side there were only few characteristics noted, these including being stubborn, shy, talkative, moody and a few with low self esteem.

**Objective 2 (Personal Control)**

The participants wrote predominantly in favour of their parents' level of authority over them. There was 63 percent of the total survey group, 35 percent from the town group and 28 percent from the country, who offered very positive comments about their parents’ level of control over their lives. Many from both these groups, 65 percent, were consistent with comments indicating that their parents were understanding, fair and that the students could reason with them. Other respondents added that their parents trusted them and treated them like adults. Several also commented that it was good to have advice and a town student indicated that there was no control by parents of their lives. There was also a group of respondents, 20 percent, twelve females from towns and six females from the country, who were very negative in their responses to the control their parents had over them.

Other controls on the participants in this survey included school restrictions with
homework and school rules. There was 12 percent with school restrictions, 4 percent who indicated that work restricted the control on their lives and only 2 percent who indicated that their boarding arrangements in either the school hostel or in a private home reduced their freedom. The legal system was indicated by one student from a town and one from the country, as a control, while Centrelink was nominated by a country student.

**Objective 3 ("Sensation Seeking")**

The responses made by the females, regarding their participation in risk taking, indicated that "sensation seeking" in the form of fun and excitement were the major reasons for choosing these activities. Of the fifty eight students (58) 63.7% who replied to this aspect, thirty three (33), (51.7%) indicated that these factors were the only reason for their participation. Some of the qualifying statements included the facts that becoming drunk reduced one's inhibitions and that seeing others participate created curiosity which led to the initial involvement. For a few participants who found particular activities lacking in fun, caused the tendency for them to try even more dangerous activities to create the desired levels of fun and excitement. This "sensation seeking" created the credibility for the activity and assisted some of the respondents with their decisions. Others put curbs on certain aspects of risk taking such as drinking to excess, but approved of smoking sometimes. Some hated what they were doing, but still continued, even when they felt the activity was wrong, because they liked experimenting. A few females felt they knew the consequences or risk levels of their activities and therefore were confident with their decisions.

**Objective 4 (Expectations)**

Life long values were mentioned by both groups who expected that education and money would set them up for life. The town respondents remarked that they "would have achieved something" Marriage and family were important for some, but children was not always the aim.

**Objective 5 (Legal Restrictions)**

There was a 77 per cent response, forty one town, twenty nine country female to the question regarding the influence of the law and legal restrictions on the females' risk taking activities. The two biggest factors affecting their compliance with the legal system were fear, (nine town, four country) and the possibility of extenuating consequences (eight town, four country) occurring as a result of their involvement in risk taking practices. Another sixteen (nine town, seven country) indicated that the law and the legal system were sometimes a consideration, depending on the context. Only five indicated that they did not consider the law or the legal system and knew immediately that they would engage in the activities.

**Objective 6 (Informed Re Risk Taking)**

It was quite alarming to discover that of the 74 percent of the students who offered responses to this question, only one mentioned the possibility of "death" being a result of her risk taking activities. There was no other reference to any of the health implications that their risk taking activities may cause. Significantly, there were sixteen, (eleven town and five country females) who argued that their risk taking was checked against the fact as to whether it would hurt or affect others or themselves, while another seven (two town and five country females) considered the safety, danger or trouble inherent in the activities. Another nine females (five town and four country) looked at the consequences of their actions, whilst twelve (nine town and three country) considered whether the activities were right or wrong. Only nine females (five town and four country females) gave personal reasons such as valuing oneself, not wanting to have regrets and not wanting to "numb consciences."

**Objective 7 (Aspirations)**

In the survey on Adolescence and Risk Taking conducted on the North-West Coast of Tasmania in 2001, the females’ education aspirations demonstrated their very high motivation levels. Eighty - one percent (74) replied positively to this aspect of the
study, fifty eight (58) females from towns and sixteen (16) country respondents. Many of the girls concerned had multiple reasons for aspiring to higher levels of education, but they were mainly focused on careers and work.

Their educational endeavours were aimed at a wide range of professions. Only five (5) town females had their goals set on the more traditional careers associated with women –teaching and nursing 2 percent (2 each), and child studies, 1percent (1). Four 12.1% of the country females chose the traditional jobs of nursing, teaching, midwifery and child studies - all with one respondent,

Finding work was a high priority for both groups of females. Only 4.3% percent (2) in the town group explained that their higher education involvement was to obtain work for its monetary reward. In the country group four 12.1%) (4) had money as an aim while 15 percent (5) wanted to find a good job. Overall this aspect of the survey was very inspirational and augers well for the respondents’ futures.

**Objective 8 (Resilience)**

The problems experienced by the respondents involved parental cancer, death of grandparents, parents and friends, attempted suicides, broken relationships and divorce, remarriage of parents and personal illness and depression. There was 32 percent of the total survey group, seventeen females from the town group and twelve from the country who indicated that they had coped well with the traumas in their lives. They had done this mainly by talking through their grief and problems with the support of family members and friends. Other methods had involved writing about their problems, putting more effort into their studies using positive thinking and religious teachings. Grieving and taking time were also mentioned, as was the reality of the trauma continuing longer than desired.

On the negative side of facing trauma with resilience, 24 percent, seventeen participants from the town and five from the country, experienced problems. These occurred because there was no one to trust with their difficulties or to talk to, so they kept to themselves, suffering depression, nervous breakdowns and suicidal attempts and becoming anorexic.

**b) Risk Taking Findings**

The females’ perception of the risk factor in each category was compared to the females’ actual risk taking activities with some surprising results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Risk Rating 1-7</th>
<th>Risk Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Binge Drinking</td>
<td>Mode</td>
<td>Mode</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3 (38)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drinking Alcohol</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3 (45)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drink Driving</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1 (85)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex –No Condom</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1 (60)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex – No Pill</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1 (63)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex – Strangers</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1 (81)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing Needles</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1 (88)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smoking Hash</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1 (38)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sniffing Glue</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1 (84)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cocaine Use</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1 (89)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heroin Use</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1 (85)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speeding</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1 (72)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taking Speed</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1 (83)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Whilst the risk ratings were high – at seven for eleven out of fourteen of the risk activities - risk participation has still occurred. These twelve incidences where the risk ratings are high and the risk participation is at one, means that there is no participation. However, there are still young females participating in dangerous risk activities at the three (occasionally) and four rating level (regularly) e.g. ten binge drinking and twenty eight drink driving on a regular basis. It was alarming to see that one participant had used cocaine occasionally and two were regular users of heroin.

c) Cross Tabulation Results

Table 2. Parental / Family Influences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parental Control</th>
<th>Frequency Binge Drinking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parental Control</td>
<td>Frequency Sex with Strangers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental Control</td>
<td>Frequency Smoking Hash</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental Influence</td>
<td>Frequency Binge Drinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental Influence</td>
<td>Frequency Sex with Strangers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental Relationships</td>
<td>Frequency Binge Drinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control by Family</td>
<td>No Contraceptive Pill Use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control by Family</td>
<td>Viewing X-Rated Videos</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 Sense of Identity

| Personal Description Favourable | Frequency of Sex with Strangers |
| Sense of Responsibility | Frequency Viewing X-Rated Videos |
| Aspirations | Frequency of No Condom Use |
| Trauma Reaction | Frequency of No Condom Use |
| Future Goals Family | Frequency No Condom Use |
| *Trauma Reaction | Frequency of No Contraceptive Pill Use |

Table 4 Religion

| Religion Current | Frequency Binge Drinking |
| Church Attendance | Frequency of Drinking Alcohol |
| Church Attendance | Frequency of No Contraceptive Pill Use |
| Church Attendance | Frequency No Condom Use |
| Church Attendance | Frequency of Smoking Hash |

Conclusion

There were many positive factors within this study. The young females were notable in that they had a strong sense of self and personal identity. Their aspirations were high for education, careers and other opportunities. They were very resilient and coped with a wide variety of traumas in their lives. Mothers had a very positive affect
on their lives and there was a good response to parental control and authority, but only a limited response to having families of their own. On the negative side, there was a surprising lack of social capital and a definite participation in dangerous, risk-taking activities. Health issues were not considered and risk prevention was driven by fear, rather than knowledge. Attitudes to fathers were not positive and religious influences were diminished.

References


Diamant, L. and R. McAnulty (eds) Psychology of Sexual Orientation, Behaviour and Identity, USA

Earle, L. and R. Fopp (1999) Introduction to Australian Society, Harcourt Brace, Australia


http://www.rcpsych.ac.uk/info/help/ado/index.asp (4/06/05)

English and its Power in the Thai Discourse

Sita Yiemkuntitavorn
Rangsit University

Abstract

English has gained its international status as a global language. It is the most widely known language outside its native language territory. Like the Internet, English is metaphorically a linguistic superhighway crossing many big cities as well as small towns in many parts of the world. Thailand is no exception. English has permeated many aspects of Thai urban activities, particularly tourism. English is not just a language. Its presence in Thailand creates its strong impacts socially and culturally. English is the most popular foreign language among those taught in schools and universities. This paper presents a quantitative and qualitative study of university students' views and attitudes towards English as a foreign language in Thailand. The focus is how English is perceived and valued by Thai students in terms of cultural identity, linguistic imperialism, cultural interference, and competing discourses.

Thailand and Thai language

Thailand is a country in Southeast Asia with a population over 60 million people. Thailand covers an area of 514,000 square kilometers. It shares borders with Myanmar to the west and north, Laos to the northeast, Kampuchea to the east and Malaysia to the south. Topographically the country is divided into four distinct areas: the mountainous North, the fertile Central Plains, the semi-arid plateau of the Northeast, and the south peninsula distinguished by its many beautiful tropical beaches and offshore Islands.

In Thailand there is only one official language that is Thai language. “Thai” is the national language of Thailand, spoken by around eighty percent of the sixty million residents of the South-East Asian country. Linguists consider it an “uninflected, primarily monosyllabic, tonal language” in the “Ka-Tai group.” The spoken language is believed to have originated in the area which is now the border between Vietnam and China, an idea which provides clues to the origin of the Thai people, an area of continued scholarly debate. Linguistically, the language is related to languages spoken in eastern Burma, northern Vietnam, and Laos.

The written Thai Language was introduced by the third Sukothai period king, Ramkamhaeng, in 1283. This writing system has undergone little change since its introduction, so inscriptions from the Sukothai era can be read by modern Thai readers. The writing was based on Pali, Sanskrit, and Indian concepts, and many Mon and Khmer words entered the language.

Within Thailand, there are four major dialects, corresponding to the southern, northern (“Yuan”), northeastern (close to Lao language), and central regions of the country; the latter is called Central Thai or Bangkok Thai and is taught in all schools, is used for most television broadcasts, and is widely understood in all regions. Nowadays, English is also taught in all public schools. There are a few minor Thai dialects such as Phuan and Lue, spoken by small populations. Also within Thailand, small ethnic minority groups (including so-called “hill tribes”) account for around sixty languages which are not considered related to Thai.

The four primary dialects of Thai should not be confused with four different "languages" used by Thais in different social circumstances. For example, certain words are used only by Thai royalty, creating a royal language. There are also languages used for religious figures, polite everyday interactions, and gruff or crude communications.
The importance of Thailand and Thai language in the world

Thailand, nowadays, play the integral role in Southeast Asia. Thailand is the first Asian country to have signed the Treaty of Amity and Commerce with the United States nearly 170 years ago in 1833. Given our many common interests and values, the Kingdom is one of the United States’ closest allies in Asia. Thailand has fought side by side in many wars, such as the Korean and Vietnam Wars, and has been close partners in other fields. Especially, after the tragic events of September 11, the Thai Government has stepped up the intelligence efforts, implemented various security measures, taken legal actions, and promoted public participation and awareness to combat terrorism. Thailand is also working with the United States and other countries in the region to address this and many others of the region’s transnational problems, including the illicit trade in narcotic drugs and human beings. Relations between the United States and Thailand are also close in the economic sphere. The United States is Thailand’s second largest trading partner. The United States is also one of the largest investors in Thailand, with many American Fortune 500 companies conducting business in Thailand. All this has also made Thailand known as the Detroit of the East. The Kingdom is also politically stable with an educated and skilled work force. Thailand is endowed with abundant natural resources. Thailand is also strategically located in Southeast Asia, making it the natural gateway for mainland Southeast Asia and South China. The Kingdom of Thailand has been playing a more active role in Asia commensurate with its position.

In Thailand, there is only one official national language spoken by almost 100 per cent of the population. Only 0.7 percentage of the population speak English in Thailand. However, English is also a foreign language, not used for any national purpose, but used only for international purposes. The background of teaching English language in Thailand is discussed below. In Thailand, the system of teaching English is TEFL—Teaching of English as a Foreign Language. It means English is only one subject in school, and it is taught only about six hours a week. Thai students are taught only simple conversational and grammatical lessons in classrooms. All of the teachers are almost always Thai and they certainly have a Thai accent when speaking English because they were taught English by their Thai teachers in Thailand. Moreover, in Thailand there is only one language as a standard language or official language, which is taught in school, Thai students have no chance to practice their English skills at all. These are very big issues for the Education department and Thai students. As a result of that, whenever Thai students go to study abroad, they cannot have very good accents like English native speakers. (Yiemkuntativorn, 2003) Furthermore, because they are not able to use English to communicate with foreigners, it seems to be a problem for the foreigners who come to Thailand to do Business. As a result, there seems to be a number of foreigners studying Thai language for specific purposes around the world. There are a large number of Universities in the United States adding a study of Thai to their programs. They also provide Thai culture lessons for their students.

Nevertheless, Thai language is totally different from English language ranging from writing to speaking. In general, Thai is a tonal language, there are five different tones all together. There are some groups of words that are written exactly the same way but they are pronounced completely different and they certainly have a different meaning. Conversely, there are some groups of words that are written in a different way but they are pronounced in the same way. There are also a number of words that have similar meaning but are used on various different occasions. This is a reason why Thai language is unique. Moreover, Thai language is also part of the heritage of historical events in the country. As a result of that the government tends to keep the language as a standard language that is used throughout the country.

Methodology

This study makes use of qualitative method and quantitative method. The researcher uses the semi-structured interview and open—ended questionnaires to explore this study. Making use of two methods of collecting data will improve the triangulation.
Interview

The interview is a well-established method of data collection which is used widely. One of the most aspects of interviewing is that it is flexible. There are three types of interviews: Unstructured, Semi-structured and Structured interview. (Burn, 1994) The structured interview is used predominantly in surveys and opinion polls with consequent qualitative analysis. The researcher asks the same specific questions in order to compare the defined groups and to make the comparable statistics. However, there is no flexibility allowed to interviewers. Semi-structured interviewing permits a more valid response from the informant’s perception of reality. There is a greater length of time spent with the participants. Moreover, the researcher has the same equal status with the interviewers. The unstructured or the open-ended interview is the most flexible method. There is no standardized list of questions. It is also a free-flowing conversation and there is no time limit.

In this study, the researcher uses semi-structured interview to collect the data. This is because the flexibility is needed in exploring this study. However, the researcher has to have some specific questions and some relevant questions to ask the interviewees. The questions for each participant are similar. That will help the researcher to analyse all data. The length of time has to be limited but there should be enough to finish the task. That means it should be enough for the participants to think and answer all questions. The participants should feel more comfortable to talk and tell their opinions toward English language. The participants are allowed to talk on Thai language if they wish for.

In this study, the researcher interviews three Thai lecturers about their attitude toward English language. The researcher makes appointment for an interview in their free time such as lunch time or after class. The interview will take approximately 30 minutes for each participant. The researcher starts a conversation by asking the common questions to ask some particular topic on participants’ daily life. Then the researcher asks question about their attitude toward English language. (See appendix 1) Tape recorder will be used though out this task.

Questionnaire

Direct contact with participants involved is time- consuming and expensive. Much of the information can be gathered by means of written questionnaires presented to the participants. Moreover, questionnaires are commonly used to gain information about participants’ attitudes. Participants will see the actual questions and they can also have plenty of time to answer those questions. Fear and embarrassment which may result from direct contact are avoided. (Burn, 2000)

There are two types of questionnaires: a structured questionnaire and an unstructured questionnaire (Ary et al, 1979). A structured questionnaire is straightforward for scoring and the results lend themselves readily to analyse. However, this type of questionnaire has the disadvantage of forcing participants into choosing alternatives that do not really present their attitudes. The unstructured questionnaire on the other hand has the advantage of giving the participants freedom to reveal their opinions and attitudes. But the data is difficult to analyse. The unstructured questionnaire is chose to collect the data though out this study because the researcher expects to have the real opinion of the participants. The participants of this study are university students ranging from first year to fourth year. The questionnaire will be constructed in English and then translated into Thai language. The researcher will make 50 copies of questionnaires and expect about 30 copies returned. There are about 5 questions on biographical information of the participants and 6 questions on the attitude about English language (See appendix 2).

Data analysis

The data analysis in this study is divided into two sections according to methodology of this study which are interview and questionnaire.
Interview analysis

The researcher uses the interview method to interview three Thai teachers in a University to explore their attitude towards English language in Thailand. All teachers have been teaching English language for more than ten years. Therefore, they have had lots of experience in teaching English language and learnt lots of Thai student's problems of learning English language. All teachers said that most Thai students do not like English language. This is because they did not have a good start since the beginning. Lots of Thai students start leaning English when they are in Pratom five or grade five in school. However, there are many students who start leaning English since kindergarten and Pratom one or grade one but they all have to study in private schools. They of course have to pay a lot more tuition fee than the students in the government schools. As Thailand is a developing country and the main popularity is poor, they cannot afford for their own kids to study in private schools. As a result of this, lots of students have to start leaning English language when they are about 10 years old and can speak their first language fluently because they acquire their first language all the time. This means students will be interfered by the first language when they are leaning the second language. The other problem is that most Thai teachers use the grammar translation method to teach English language to the students. Therefore, Thai students have much writing skill more than speaking skill. Some students have such a beautiful written paper and they of course are grammatically correct but they do not dare to speak in public or even with their teachers, family and friends especially with foreigners. One of the teachers said that, she knew the problem but it was very hard for her to motivate students to speak English in class because the students were aware of grammar mistakes.

Besides starting to pick up English language lately, there is the other important point. All of students said that Thai students were not interested in English language. There is only one official language in Thailand that is of course Thai standard language. Thai language is very important and has to be used in official places and schools. They also do not have many chances to speak with the foreigners. Most of people seem not to use English language in Thailand; therefore, they ignore to pay attention to English language and try to avoid speaking English with foreigners. Moreover, when they have to learn English language in university as a foundation subject, they just want to pass the compulsory unit; otherwise, they cannot graduate their degree.

Again, lots of Thai students must learn and acquire English when they have to further their study to master degree or go to study abroad. This is because they have to have to pass the English tests before entering to the university in Thailand and abroad. However, there are not so many students to have a chance to further my study abroad or even in the country. This is the other factor why the students seem not to like to study English language.

Nevertheless, all teachers want to motivate their students to study English language. There are lots of advantages of speaking English nowadays even in the country which has only one official language as in Thailand. In the present days, Thai people have to communicate with lots of foreigners. There are lots of big foreign companies come to invest in Thailand; so they need lots of people who have English ability to work with them. People who have English skill will have more chance to get a better job and get much more money. Moreover, nowadays the government wants to promote Thailand as a tourism country, they want Thai people to welcome all foreigners and show them how beautiful Thailand is. The government needs Thai people to be able to speak English with the foreigners.

Questionnaire Analysis

There are six main questions about Thai students’ attitude towards English Language.

1. When did you start leaning English language?
From the chart above shows that most students have started learning English language since they were in kindergarten. However, there were a lot of students who started learning English in Pratom 5. There were a few who started when there were in Pratom 1.

2. Do you think that English language is important to your life?

All of them agree that English language is very important to them ranging from studying to working. There are many reasons why they think English language is very important in their country. First of all, English language is the international language. People around the world have to use English as a standard language to communicate with others who are not from the same country and cannot speak the same language. Secondly, nowadays Thai people run business with foreigners; therefore, Thai people certainly have to contact with them. Moreover, English is necessary to use to apply for a job and work with the foreigners. Last but not least, in the present days English seems to be used in daily life. There are lots of labels written in English. They also have to read English language through the computer and the internet. Thai students are assigned to read English textbooks and write essay in English.

3. What do you think when you see someone who uses English fluently?

All of them are amazed when they see Thai people who can speak English fluently and they are certainly want to be as same as them. Most students believe that people who can speak English very well must be educated people or they may come from abroad. Some students mention that Thai people who learn English in Thailand cannot have a native speaker accent and may not speak English as fluent as ones who were born abroad or ones who come from English native speaker countries.

4. What is your attitude towards the using of English language in Thailand?

The answers of this question are contrast with the answers in question number two. All of them think English language is still unnecessary in Thailand. There are a few reasons. Firstly, as there is only one official language in Thailand that is Thai standard language; Thai people do not need to speak English when they are in their own country. It is very strange to speak English with Thai people in Thailand. Secondly, Thai people are not very good at English language especially speaking skill. Most of them mention that they do not dare to speak English because they are aware of using the ungrammatical sentences. They feel embarrassed all the time that they have to speak English even with their English teachers. Last of all, although English is very important for work and study in Thailand nowadays, there are not so many people who can speak English fluently in Thailand. Someone states that there are only a few groups of people who have to speak English and it also depends of each situation to speak the second language.
5. What do you think about the tendency of using English language in the future in Thailand?

Most of them agree that Thai people will use much more English language in the future because they have to contact with the foreigners. Thai government wants to improve the economics, politics and tourism in Thailand. They give lots of scholarship to Thai students to study abroad and they have to come back to help their own country. However, someone states that Thai students have to pay a lot more attention to English language. They have to be interested to improve their English skill; otherwise, English language will not be improved in the future.

6. Do you want to improve your English ability and Why?

They all want to improve their English skill according to many reasons. For example, they want to get a good job and salary, some students also want to further their study abroad and some want to move to other countries which have English as a first language. Nevertheless, they do not think to improve their English skill immediately. Some students want to improve their English when they graduate their first degree. Some want to study English when they have to go abroad to further their study. And some want to study when they have to work with foreigners or before they have to apply for a job.

Discussion and Conclusion

English is an international language and it has become very important in Thailand long ago. Although Thai students have been taught English since they were young but the English skills of lots of Thai students are still poor. This is because there is only one official language in Thailand that is Thai standard language; so, Thai people do not have an opportunity to speak English. Moreover, the method of teaching English in Thailand is always “Grammar Translation”, that means teachers teach English words and grammar and then they translate those to students in Thai language. As a result of that they do not dare to speak. Their writing skill is much better than the other skills especially speaking skill. Moreover, English is used in some groups of people; it also depends on the situation. Therefore, there are numbers of people who can speak English but they are not many comparing to the proportion of people in the country.

However, Thai students are still interested in English language. Most of them think English is very important nowadays around the world even in Thailand. Lots of them want to study and improve their English skill according to many reasons such as for their work and their study. People who can speak English will have many more advantages than other people who cannot speak English. They are also impressed when they see Thai people who can speak English very well; they think those people are well educated and are from abroad. The prestige of people who can speak English fluently is getting higher in Thailand. The problem is that how we can motivate Thai people to speak English and how to improve their English skills.

References


http://www.asiatour.com/thailand/content1.htm
http://www.sawadeethailand.com/aboutlanguage/Language.html
http://thaiembdc.org/index/htm
(Honours) dissertation, University of Tasmania.
Appendix 1

The interview is divided into 2 parts: the personal information and attitude towards English language questions. The interview will be taken about 20 minutes to complete and it will be in Thai language. The researcher will record the conversation in the tape recorder.

Interview for Thai instructors

Part 1: Personal information

Part 2: Attitude towards English language

1. Is English language important in Thailand?
2. What is your attitude towards the using of English language in Thailand?
3. How do you feel about people who can speak English fluently?
4. What do you think about students’ English ability?
5. What do you think about the tendency of using English language in the future in Thailand?
6. Do you think Thai students like English language
7. Do they think English is necessary for them?
8. Do you have any ways to motivate your students to learn English?
Appendix 2

Questionnaire

This questionnaire contains two parts; Part A: Personal information and Part B: Attitude towards English language questions.

Part 1: Personal Information

1. Gender: □ Male □ Female

2. Age: □ 15-20 years □ 21-25 years □ 25-30 years

3. Which year are you studying?
   □ First year □ Second year
   □ Third year □ Fourth year
   □ Fifth year □ Sixth year

4. Faculty: ……………………………. majoring in ……………………………

5. Which is the most appropriate description of your language ability?
   □ Poor □ Fair
   □ Good □ Excellent

Part 2: Attitude towards English language

1. When did you start studying English?
   □ Pre-school/ kindergarten □ Prathom 1
   □ Prathom 5 □ Less than Prathom 5

2. Do you think that English language is important to your life? (Support your idea)
   ………………………………………………………………………………………
   ………………………………………………………………………………………
   ………………………………………………………………………………………
   ………………………………………………………………………………………
   ……………………………………………………………………………

3. What do you think when you see someone who uses English language fluently?
   ………………………………………………………………………………………
   ………………………………………………………………………………………
   ………………………………………………………………………………………
   ………………………………………………………………………………………
   ……………………………………………………………………………
4. What is your attitude towards the using of English language in Thailand?
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   …………………………………………………………………………………………

5. What do you think about the tendency of using English language in the future in Thailand?
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   …………………………………………………………………………………………

6. Do you want to improve your English ability? And Why?
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   ……………………………………………………………………………………………
   …………………………………………………………………………………………
Appendix 3

แบบสอบถาม
แบบสอบถามนี้ประกอบด้วยสองส่วน ส่วนที่หนึ่งคือข้อมูลส่วนบุคคล และส่วนที่สอง คือคำถามเฉพาะเกี่ยวกับความคิดเห็นต่อภาษาอังกฤษ

ส่วนที่ 1: ข้อมูลส่วนบุคคล
1. เพศ □ ชาย □ หญิง
2. อายุ □ 15-20 ปี □ 21-25 ปี □ 25-30 ปี
3. คุณเรียนอยู่ปีอะไร?
   □ ปี 1 □ ปี 2
   □ ปี 3 □ ปี 4
   □ ปี 5 □ ปี 6
4. คณะ  ........................................................................
   สาขา........................................................................
5. ระดับความสามารถทางภาษาอังกฤษ
   □ แบ่ □ พอใช้
   □ ดี □ ดีมาก

ส่วนที่ 2: ความคิดเห็นต่อภาษาอังกฤษ
1. คุณเรียนภาษาอังกฤษเมื่อใด?
   □ อนุบาล □ ประถม 1
   □ ประถม 5 □ หลังจากประถม 5
2. คุณคิดว่าภาษาอังกฤษมีความสำคัญต่อชีวิตของคุณหรือไม่อย่างไร?
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

3. คุณคิดอย่างไรเมื่อคนจ่อคนที่ใช้ภาษาอังกฤษก่าง?
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

4. คุณมีทัศนคติอย่างไรต่อการใช้ภาษาอังกฤษในประเทศไทย?
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

5. คุณมีความคิดเห็นอย่างไรเกี่ยวกับการใช้ภาษาอังกฤษในอนาคตของประเทศไทย?
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................

6. คุณคิดจะเรียนเพิ่มเติมเพื่อพัฒนาทักษะทางภาษาอังกฤษของคุณหรือไม่อย่างไร?
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................
Difficulties in the Implementation of Student-centred Learning in English Teaching in Chinese Universities

Zhiqin Zhang
Taiyuan Teachers’ University of Shanxi, China

Abstract
There are two broad orientations in teaching: the teacher-centred orientation and student-centred oriented conception. In teacher-centred orientation teaching, teachers are didactic implementers of the curricula and materials produced by outside experts, according to their guidance and inspection. Teachers are giver of information. In the view of those who support student-centred learning, education is a negotiation process between the curriculum and the learner, a dialogue between the student and the teacher. Compared with the student-centred learning, the traditional teacher-as-information-giver, textbook-guided classroom has failed to bring about the desired outcome of producing-thinking students, so the foreign language teaching is developed towards the notion of learner education. Despite its popularity and effectiveness, student-centred learning is not without critics. Geraldine O'Neill et al summarized the difficulties in its implementation in light of the resources needed to implement it, the belief system of the students and staff and students’ lack of familiarity with the term. O’Sullivan described student-centred learning as a western approach to learning and may not necessarily transfer to the developing countries, where there are limited resources. The paper illustrates the difficulties Chinese universities face in implementing student-centred learning by detailing the situation of English departments of average Chinese universities from the perspective of the first two factors mentioned by Geraldine. In the conclusion, the paper suggests that it is important to take the specific context into account when trying to adopt a teaching approach.

Keywords: student-centred learning, teacher-centred orientation, Chinese universities

Introduction
Nowadays, with the globalisation of the capital markets and the increased mobility of work force, students and specialists will increase cross-cultural contacts. In Europe the current integration processes are moving the whole continent towards a multilingual and multicultural political and economic union. Contacts are facilitated enormously by the new information technology. It will make vast amounts of information services readily available to more and more people through international networks. The developments will create new demands for global communication and tolerance for intercultural diversity. They will certainly open new opportunities especially for language learning through an easy access to authentic data in a variety of languages, so the concept of the learning society is used to describe our society.

As far as education is concerned, it requires a paradigm shift. The term paradigm shift has been used to describe the ways in which new belief systems emerge and how and why they are also resisted for some time. A new paradigm is a distinctly new way of thinking, a more comprehensive theory than its predecessor opening new doors and means for the exploration (Ferguson, 1982). The foreign language teaching is developed towards the notion of learner education.
The term student-centred learning (SCL) is very popular in learning and teaching as a foreign language. Many terms have been connected with student-centred learning such as experiential learning (Burnard, 1999, Viljo Kohonen et al., 2001), self-directed learning, flexible learning (Taylor, 2000), and etc.

**What is student-centred learning?**

Kember (1997) described two broad orientations in teaching: the teacher-centred orientation and student-centred oriented conception. In teacher-centred orientation teaching, teachers are didactic implementers of the curricula and materials are produced by outside experts, according to their guidance and inspection. The top-down management of administration restricts their growth as independent and autonomous professionals. Implicitly, this also encourages them to use a similar power relationship with their students. Teachers are giver of information. There is thus one-way movement from the teacher to the student who is supposed to learn the facts, concepts, skills and values in rather a passive role as the recipient of information. It is the teacher’s responsibility to control that the student has learned the knowledge.

In the views of those who support student-centred learning, education is a negotiation process between the curriculum and the learner, a dialogue between the student and the teacher. In this orientation the individual is seen as rational and capable of intelligent problem-solving. Teachers and learners are partners interacting with each other. Instead of right or wrong answers, knowledge is open to interpretive understanding, in which the student constructs knowledge through an interactive process. Burnard interprets the idea as “Students might not only choose what to study, but how and why that topic might be an interesting one to study” (1999:244)

Harden and Crosby (2000:335) describe student-centred learning as focusing on the students learning and “what students do to achieve this, rather than what the teacher does.”

Compared with the student-centred learning, obviously, the traditional teacher-as-information-giver, textbook guided classroom has failed to bring about the desired outcome of producing-thinking students. So the focus of the classroom is changed to the student-centred using a constructivist approach.

Constructivism has its roots in philosophy and has been applied to sociology and anthropology as well as cognitive psychology and education. Kant elaborated it by asserting that human beings are not passive recipients of information. Learners actively take knowledge, connect it to previously assimilated knowledge and make it theirs by constructing their own interpretation (Cheek, 1992). The goal is for the learner to play an active role in assimilating knowledge onto his existing mental framework. The ability of students to apply their school-learned knowledge to the real world is valued over memorizing bits and pieces of knowledge that may seem unrelated to them. The constructivist approach requires the teachers to abandon their role as sole information-dispenser and instead to methodologies. Perhaps the best quality for a constructivist teacher to have is the “instantaneous and intuitive vision of the pupil’s mind as it gropes and fumble to grasp a new idea” (Brooks and brooks, 1993: 20). Clearly the constructivist approach opens new roads for learning as well as challenges for the teacher trying to implement it.

Despite its popularity and effectiveness, SCL meet with lots of critics. Geraldine O’Neill et al summarized the difficulties in its implementation in light of the resources needed to implement it, the belief system of the students and staff and students’ lack of familiarity with the term. O’Sullivan (2003) described student-centred learning as a western approach to learning and may not be necessarily suitable to the developing countries, such as Namibia, where there are limited resources and different learning cultures. Here I analyse the difficulties Chinese universities face in implementing the student-centred learning in light of the belief system of the students and staff and the limited resources.
Difficulties Chinese universities face in implementing SCL

The belief system of the students and staff

Culture influences language learning and teaching. The Western thinking dates back to Socrates. At the heart of the Socratic method is Dialogue. (Scollon, S. 1999:15) Socrates thought his role to the youth is to lead them to the truth by posing questions. His expectation of the students is that, being subordinate in relation to their dominant teachers, they are to exhibit erudition in order to earn his praise. In order to reach the truth, Socrates asks a line of questions. In the course of "refuting and being refuted" (Scollon, 1999:19), truth is establishment. While Chinese people are deeply influenced by Confucian thinking and method of lecturing, Confucius does not pursue a line of questioning. The typical way is that students ask a question, and then he answers. He sometimes responds to a student’s question with a question. This method of asking a rhetorical question and then answering it is common in Chinese classrooms as well as in Chinese textbooks. The students accept the knowledge from the text book uncritically, even if they have their own thinking. They hesitate to express this thinking because their culture of learning includes the notion that one should be modest. In the classroom, students most often expect a teacher to answer their own questions, and “it may feel like pulling teeth to get a student to answer a question unless he really believes it is an open question.” (Scollon, 1999:19) Many Chinese students believe that if they ask questions, there is a high risk of wasting time or being thought foolish. The teacher should, while preparing and teaching the lessons, predict learners’ questions, so some students feel they have no need to ask questions but to wait for the anticipated explanations. Other students think carefully before they ask. Even if they have good questions, they ask the teacher individually after class is over. One reason is not to disturb the class, the other is to minimize the loss of face if the question seems foolish. In the view of the students, voluntary comments is showing off, thus is negatively evaluated, because it is the teacher, not students, who transmits knowledge (Cortazzi et al, 1999). In many Western teachers’ eyes, Chinese students are unwilling to speak, passive and reluctant to do pair or group work.

Another influence of Confucius thinking on Chinese lies in the fact that Chinese put priority on consequences. One obvious manifestation of Chinese students’ concern for consequences is their seeming obsession with marks grades. They take great effort to prepare class presentations that will be evaluated as well as to understand what is required for written assignments and tests. By the same token, little effort goes into getting at the truth unless it is clear what the consequences will be. Teachers sometimes suspect that every little action is done for grades. A number of learners seem to expect that it is the teacher’s duty to teach the material to them by frontal instruction and their role is one of being a recipient of the instruction in other words they expect learning to be an easy way of getting the information in a digested form, rather than being involved in an active process of discovering and organising it for themselves. Their assumption of effective language learning is thus one of teacher-directed frontal instruction. “While one student becomes a ratified speaker, other students begin to engage in byplay, often acting like bystanders, who are ordinarily obliged to enact a show of disinterest, by disattending and withdrawing ecologically to minimize our actual access to talk” (Goffman 1981: 132)

As far as teachers are concerned, many teachers tend to use traditional and objectivist techniques. It may prove a difficult transformation. It “requires a paradigm shift” and “requires the willing abandonment of familiar perspectives and practices and the adoption of new ones” (Brooks & Brooks, 1993:25). Besides, they are overwhelmed be the rigor of the job, and they tend to feel vulnerable, so they retreat to the more familiar form of lecture.

The limited resources

In Chinese universities, at the level of logistics, English teaching settings often involve large classes and limited contact hours. In non-English departments, although there is considerable variation in class size, it is common to have at least 40 students in a class, and in some cases, even a hundred. Since English is generally treated as a compulsory subject, the contact hours is similar to those of other subjects. Such conditions are not conducive to successful language learning; let lone applying student-centred learning strategy. In English department, generally, there are 4-6 classes in one year, consisting of about 35-40 students. In the first two years, the students are offered so-called elementary subjects such as listening,
speaking, reading, writing and grammar, which are respectively taught by different teachers. For every subject, they have a textbook, the content of which the teachers are supposed to finish at the preset pace. In theory, the lecturers should address the needs of students who may be at different starting points. Students' ideas and questions are welcomed, valued and encouraged. But if teachers spend much time and energy on an individual learner, the others have to be ignored. Meanwhile, the teachers can't finish their teaching task as scheduled.

Conclusion
In general, student-centred learning has been seen to be a positive experience and successfully used in teaching by many western universities, but it is not an easy task, given present teaching situations of Chinese universities. It is a great challenge for teachers to implement it effectively.

References
Burnard, P. (1999). Carl Rogers and Postmodernism: Challenged in Nursing and Health Sciences. Nursing and Health Sciences 1
Kember, D. (1997). A Reconceptualisation of the Research Into University Academics Conceptions of Teaching. Learning and Instruction 7(3)

1 For a critique of the ‘new museology’, see also Ross, 2004.
2 Meaning, ‘instance of language use’ (Titscher 2000:147). Ernesto Laclau has also commented: ‘By ‘the discursive’ I understand nothing which in a narrow sense relates to texts but the ensemble of phenomena of the social production
of meaning on which society as such is based. It is not a question of regarding the discursive as a plane or dimension of the social but as having the same meaning as the social as such...Subsequently, the non discursive is not opposite to the discursive is if one were dealing with two different planes because there is nothing societal that is determined outside the discursive. History and society are therefore an unfinished text’ (1981).

1 Produced in 1996 by the company A Slight Shift for Verdant Works, running time: 13 min, Edinburgh.


3 Due to space limitations, the whole script can not be included in this paper. After request, a copy can be sent to the readers.

4 In linguistic terms, lexicalisation means the choice of words being used.

5 Italics are used in order to give emphasis to words or phrases of particular interest for the analysis.

6 Even though the jute history of Dundee is dominated by women’s labour –it was a ‘woman’s town’ after all (Whatley, 1993)— a male narrator was chosen for this documentary video. Further, at numerous times throughout the duration of the film, ‘men’ are the protagonists of this gendered history. The history of jute in Dundee is gendered indeed; it is a women’s history.

7 It is ironic that “cruel[ty]” and “brutality”, which are orientalist traits of the Other, here describe America’s own actions.

8 Using Hallidayan systemic functional linguistics (Egginis, 1994; Halliday, 1994), the concept of verb (be, have, and action) is replaced by six types of processes.

9 The actor (the person / thing doing the ‘action’ in the verb) does not always appear in the subject position because in passive voice the actor occurs in the indirect object: e.g. “5000 tonnes of bauxite were mined by Comalco”.

10 Another means of securing the New World Order is by defending it through war (see Lazar and Lazar, forthcoming a).

11 During the administration of G.H.W. Bush, Saddam Hussein was the named threat, whereas in the Clinton administration Osama bin Laden gradually filled the major role. Since 11 September 2001, Osama bin Laden has continued to be a leading threat, subsequently extended to also re-include Saddam Hussein.

12 It is ironic that “cruel[ty]” and “brutality”, which are orientalist traits of the Other, here describe America’s own actions.

13 As we have witnessed in the historical events concerning Afghanistan and Saddam Hussein’s Iraq, the nature of the payback has been punishment by force.

14 Using Hallidayan systemic functional linguistics (Egginis, 1994; Halliday, 1994), the concept of verb (be, have, and action) is replaced by six types of processes.

15 The actor (the person / thing doing the ‘action’ in the verb) does not always appear in the subject position because in passive voice the actor occurs in the indirect object: e.g. “5000 tonnes of bauxite were mined by Comalco”.

16 Words in the concept map appear on the basis of co-occurrence with other concepts in the same 3-sentence segment, rather than on the basis of frequency. Thus, ‘targets’ (n=154) did not appear on the concept map initially. This indicates that it co-occurs with many other concepts. We inserted it ‘manually’ to investigate its impact as a concept.

17 The coding [JL/JH 30/8/04] indicates the initials of the interviewer (JL), initials of the interviewee (JH), followed by the date of the interview.

18 The number of references to the institutional role of Prime Minister are similar in both Howard interviews (1.8 references per interview) and Latham interviews (1.6 references per interview). However, references to the Leader of the Opposition were minimal across all interviews (only 0.07 references per interview). Any references to Latham tended to use his name, Mark Latham or Mr Latham.

19 Anecdotal evidence indicates that the Prime Minister’s office staff are not permitted to use Howard’s first name when addressing him.