The development of international mindedness in an
Australian primary school

by

Leanne Cause

BA (Ed) MEd

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Deakin University

April, 2012
I am the author of the thesis entitled 'The development of international mindedness in an Australian primary school' submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

This thesis may be made available for consultation, loan and limited copying in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968.

'I certify that I am the student named below and that the information provided in the form is correct'

Full name.......... Leanne Cause ....

(Please print)

Signed . Signature Redacted by Library

Date................. 24 April 2012
I certify that the thesis entitled 'International mindedness: a case study' submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy is the result of my own work and that, where reference is made to the work of others, due acknowledgement is given.

I also certify that any material in the thesis which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by any other university or institution is identified in the text.

Full name......... Leanne Cause ....  

(Please print)

Signed . Signature Redacted by Library

Date................. 24 April 2012  ................................
Acknowledgements

I would not have been able to complete this thesis without the help given by Professor Karen Starr. I sincerely thank her for motivating me to complete this research project and I thank her for her expert guidance and invaluable support throughout this project. Her passion and her enthusiasm for the field of education and my project were inspiring and enabled me to gain a deeper understanding of the field of international education.

Being able to complete this project would also not have been possible without the expert guidance and support of Professor Richard Bates and Dr Athena Vongalis-Macrow, who also supported me throughout the project.

I would also like to thank the staff and students at my school who supported my interest in this project. The regular formal and informal conversations that I had with the teachers involved in this project gave me a deeper understanding of this topic. Their interest in my project and their understanding of ways to develop international mindedness maintained my level of enthusiasm in my project and without doubt contributed to my deeper understanding of the topic. I am also thankful to my professional editors, Mary O’Rourke and Dr Michael Kavanagh for their helpful suggestions, and shepherding of a final draft to a polished thesis.

Finally, I would like to thank Jeff Cause, who was my husband at the time of doing this research, and our five beautiful children, Davis, Thomas, Kristina, Charlotte and Isabel, for tolerating the many hours spent researching and refining the thesis. The understanding that Jeff and my children showed towards my studies was touching and encouraging, and I sincerely thank them for supporting me throughout my entire project.
Contents

ABSTRACT VIII

1 INTRODUCTION 1

1.1 BACKGROUND 2
1.2 THE RESEARCH PROBLEM 6
1.3 THIS PROJECT 7
1.3.1 DIAMOND PRIMARY SCHOOL 9
1.4 THIS THESIS 10

2 LITERATURE REVIEW 12

2.1 INTRODUCTION 12
2.2 INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION AND INTERNATIONAL SCHOOLS 13
2.2.1 INTERNATIONAL SCHOOLS 13
2.2.2 INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION 17
2.2.3 THE NATION–STATE, NATIONALISM AND INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION 22
2.2.4 INTERNATIONALISM AND INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION 24
2.2.5 GLOBALISATION AND INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION 26
2.2.6 THE HISTORY OF INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION 30
2.2.7 THE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE IBO 33
2.2.7.1 Continuity 38
2.2.7.2 Paradox of prosperity 39
2.2.7.3 Marketisation 40
2.2.7.4 The notion of accreditation 41
2.3 INTERNATIONAL MINDEDNESS 43
2.3.1 INTERNATIONALLY MINDED SCHOOLS 52
2.4 CONCLUSION 54

3 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK 56

3.1 BERNSTEIN’S CODE THEORY 56
3.2 BERNSTEIN AND THIS PROJECT 58
3.2.1 RECONTEXTUALISING 60
3.2.2 CLASSIFICATION AND FRAMING 63
3.2.2.1 Classification 63
3.2.2.2 Framing 64
3.2.3 BERNSTEIN’S CRITICS 66
3.3 CONCLUSION 67
4 METHODOLOGY  68

4.1 INTRODUCTION  68
4.2 CASE STUDY RESEARCH  69
4.3 DESIGN  71
4.3.1 DATA COLLECTION  72
4.3.1.1 Semi-Structured Interviews  73
4.3.1.2 Observations (field notes)  73
4.3.1.3 Informal document analysis  75
4.4 ANALYSING THE DATA  76
4.5 ETHICAL ISSUES  78
4.6 SCOPE OF THE STUDY  81
4.7 SUMMARY  82

SECTION TWO  83

5 SCHOOL CULTURE AND POWER  84

5.1 CULTURAL DIVERSITY AND THE INTERNATIONALLY MINDED SCHOOL  84
5.2 CULTURAL DIVERSITY AND FRAGMENTATION  88
5.3 INTERNATIONAL MINDEDNESS – A PARADOXICAL PARADIGM  94
5.4 CONDITIONAL INTERNATIONAL MINDEDNESS  97
5.5 INTERNATIONAL MINDEDNESS AND THE POWER OF THE STATE  102
5.6 SUMMARY  106

6 TOOLS OF THE TRADE  107

6.1 THE IB LEARNER PROFILE – A TOOL  107
6.2 THE IB LEARNER PROFILE – A FACADE  129
6.3 SUMMARY  132

7 THE PYP AND CHAOS  134

7.1 COLLABORATION AND THE IB LEARNER PROFILE  134
7.2 PROFESSIONAL LEARNING OPPORTUNITIES FOR STAFF AT DIAMOND PRIMARY SCHOOL  139
7.3 TEACHERS AND PERFORMATIVITY  146
7.4 CURRICULUM PANDEMONIUM  155
7.5 SUMMARY  158

8 MARKET DISCOURSES  160

8.1 INTRODUCTION  160
8.2 INCENTIVES FOR IMPLEMENTING THE PYP  161
8.3 SYMBIOTIC PARTNERSHIPS  163
8.4 EDUCATIONAL MARKETS AND SOCIAL JUSTICE  167
8.5 EXTERNAL ASSESSMENT AT DIAMOND PRIMARY SCHOOL  169
8.6 THE IB ACCREDITATION PROCESS AT DIAMOND PRIMARY SCHOOL  176
8.7 COMPETENCE AND PERFORMANCE PEDAGOGIC MODELS AT DIAMOND PRIMARY SCHOOL  180
8.8 SUMMARY  184

9 CONCLUSION  186

9.1 REVISITING THE INITIAL RESEARCH QUESTIONS  186
9.2 IMPLICATIONS  191
9.3 RECOMMENDATIONS  192
9.4 REFLECTIONS ON THE PROJECT  198
9.5 FINAL WORDS  199

REFERENCES  202

APPENDIX A  217

APPENDIX B  219

Table 4-1 Data collected for 2010 international mindedness project  77
6-1 The development of attributes of the IB learner profile  117
Table 8-1 Recontextualised knowledge (Bernstein 2000b)  181

Figure 1.1 The IB learner profile that defines an internationally minded person (IBO 2007)  4
ABSTRACT

“International mindedness” is a term that appears in the mission statements of a growing number of declared international schools worldwide, yet educational thinkers have found it difficult to define what this is or how to go about fostering it in children of today. This thesis explores teachers’ understandings of international mindedness and the development of international mindedness through a case study of one Australian primary school that is in the process of implementing the International Baccalaureate (IB) Primary Years Program (PYP).

One of the aims of this study was to understand how teachers within this case study school view and define international mindedness. By analysing semi-structured interviews with ten teachers, findings illuminate that teachers mainly have a shared understanding of international mindedness that is closely associated with multiculturalism. It is argued that their shared understanding has evolved as a result of changes in government policies aiming to promote multiculturalism, with the goal of producing integrated and prosperous mixed communities.

Another aim of the study was to explore what teachers understand about the development of international mindedness. To achieve this, the study explored the initiatives and approaches the school has implemented to promote international mindedness by taking into account the intricacies of Bernstein’s (Bernstein 1975, p. 39) three message systems: assessment, curriculum and pedagogy. Data derived from interviews with teachers, observations and field notes helped to understand that teachers found it difficult to identify what is involved in developing international mindedness. Findings revealed that teachers rely on developing international mindedness by taking advantage of spontaneous opportunities that arise through the school day. However, this is only because teachers do not know any other way to develop international mindedness, causing them to feel frustrated and confused.
Chapter 1: Introduction

1 INTRODUCTION

The influence educators, policy makers and school leaders have in preparing today's students for the future cannot be underestimated (Bagnall 2008). What educators do now has a profound impact on the extent to which children of today are prepared to cope responsibly in a world facing many challenges (Hill 2007). Yet, educators and school leaders looking for ways to respond to the many complex changes and challenges arising from our interdependent, globalised world are currently confronting more questions than answers. Educators and policy makers have responded to these challenges in several ways. One of these ways has been for schools and educational frameworks to introduce the notion of international mindedness in their mission statement or philosophy (Cambridge & Thompson 2004, 2008; Hayden & Thompson 1995a, 2000a; Hill 2007).

The term “international mindedness” received attention after World War I as a political concept (Mead 1929). In efforts to prevent more bloodshed, it was hoped that an ideology of education oriented towards international mindedness would develop more responsible citizens of the world and better prepare children for challenges arising from globalisation. Described as an internationalist approach to education (Cambridge 2003), early educational aims promoting international mindedness encouraged students to celebrate cultural diversity, focused on the moral development of the child and recognised the importance of promoting peace and understanding between nations.

One such educational program that claims to promote peace and understanding, and help students develop the personal, emotional, intellectual and social skills necessary to live in a rapidly globalising world is the International Baccalaureate (IB). Founded in Geneva, Switzerland, in 1968, it now provides an international curriculum for some 3154 schools in 138 countries through three educational programs: the Diploma Program (DP) for students aged approximately 16 – 19 years; the Middle Years Program (MYP), for students aged approximately
Chapter 1: Introduction

12 – 16 years; and the Primary Years Program (PYP) for students aged approximately 3 – 12 (IBO 2011b). ‘Initially designed for international schools with multicultural globally mobile student populations worldwide’ (Hayden & Wilkinson 2010, p. 85), the IB now claims that international mindedness lies central to the design of all three of its programs (IBO 2011c). However, although many IB schools publicise that their main aim is to develop international mindedness, there is little research about what international mindedness is and how to develop it in students (Hayden & Thompson 1998b).

1.1 BACKGROUND

The IB claims that international mindedness is the key to creating a more peaceful world (Benlafguih 2008) and it is this term that sets the tone of its statement:

The International Baccalaureate aims to develop inquiring, knowledgeable and caring young people who help to create a better and more peaceful world through intercultural understanding and respect.

To this end the organisation works with schools, governments and international organisations to develop challenging programs of international education and rigorous assessment.

These programs encourage students across the world to become active, compassionate and lifelong learners who understand that other people, with their differences, can also be right. (IBO 2007, p. 2)

Establishing the mission statement around words such as inquiring, knowledgeable, caring, compassionate and understanding suggests IB aims are not only related to the academic formal curriculum – it suggests the experience within IB programs is ‘a broad one of which the formal curriculum is just one – albeit very important – part’ (Hayden 2006, p. 7). As Strathers (2008, p. 12) argues: ‘While other organisations might talk about “global awareness” or “international relations”, for the International Baccalaureate, the key phrase is “international mindedness”’.

However, there are limited guidelines for teachers instructing in schools for implementing any of the three IB programs on what international mindedness actually is, and how to go about teaching it. Indeed, the IB offers workshops to teachers in IB schools – but, despite international
Chapter 1: Introduction

mindedness being fundamental to the IB mission statement, what international mindedness is and how to teach it is not a focus at IB workshops. Rather, the focus is on planning, assessing and implementing units of inquiry, that is, what students will learn. As Field (2010, p. 10) states: ‘The focus in [IB] training workshops, for example, is on how to design units, how to teach and how to assess...the principles of international education...go unexamined’.

There is very little literature explicitly defining what international mindedness is and how to go about developing it. As Haywood (2007, p. 80) argues: ‘The literature is scanty as regards research to identifying... [internationally minded] learning outcomes and this extends even to authorities that have a stated commitment to these outcomes’. Hence the IB promotes internationally minded ideals through its mission statement despite the fact that there is little research or literature about international mindedness or how to go about developing international mindedness. This is leaving teachers wanting to develop international mindedness (such as teachers instructing in IB schools) floundering. In the absence of a clear definition of international mindedness, school leaders, teachers, students and members of the wider school community are left to assume that they will ‘know it [international mindedness] when they see it’ (Haywood 2007, p. 80). The fact that international mindedness is promoted without clear understandings about what it is or how it may be developed contributes to its consistent obfuscation in school practices, curriculum and policies. Gellar (2000) and Murphy (2000) urge for more research on the development of international mindedness in order to create an argument for clearer research aims.
The IB learner profile – an *internationally minded person*.

**IB learners strive to be:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inquirers</td>
<td>They develop their natural curiosity. They acquire the skills necessary to conduct inquiry and research and show independence in learning. They actively enjoy learning and this love of learning will be sustained throughout their lives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledgeable</td>
<td>They explore concepts, ideas and issues that have local and global significance. In doing so, they acquire in-depth knowledge and develop understanding across a broad and balanced range of disciplines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinkers</td>
<td>They exercise initiative in applying thinking skills critically and creatively to recognise and approach complex problems, and make reasoned, ethical decisions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicators</td>
<td>They understand and express ideas and information confidently and creatively in more than one language and in a variety of modes of communication. They work effectively and willingly in collaboration with others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principled</td>
<td>They act with integrity and honesty, with a strong sense of fairness, justice and respect for the dignity of the individual, groups and communities. They take responsibility for their own actions and the consequences that accompany them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open-minded</td>
<td>They understand and appreciate their own cultures and personal histories, and are open to the perspectives, values and traditions of other individuals and communities. They are accustomed to seeking and evaluating a range of points of view, and are willing to grow from the experience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caring</td>
<td>They show empathy, compassion and respect towards the needs and feelings of others. They have a personal commitment to service, and act to make a positive difference to the lives of others and to the commitment to service, and act to make a positive difference to the lives of others and to the environment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk-takers</td>
<td>They approach unfamiliar situations and uncertainty with courage and forethought, and have the independence of spirit to explore new roles, ideas and strategies. They are brave and articulate in defending their beliefs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balanced</td>
<td>They understand the importance of intellectual, physical and emotional balance to achieve personal well-being for themselves and others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflective</td>
<td>They give thoughtful consideration to their own learning and experience. They are able to assess and understand their strengths and limitations in order to support their learning and personal development.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 1.1 The IB learner profile that defines an internationally minded person (IBO 2007)*
Chapter 1: Introduction

Currently, the closest definition of international mindedness available to educators is that offered by the IB through the IB learner profile (Hill 2007) (see Figure 1 – 1 on page 4). Hill (2002), Deputy Director of the IB since 2000, states that an internationally minded person is a person who demonstrates the ten attributes of the IB learner profile – someone who ‘in the struggle to establish a personal set of values, will be laying the foundation upon which international mindedness will develop and flourish’ (IBO, 2007, p. 4).

However, Haywood (2007) argues that the IB learner profile lacks a concise definition, as it exists as a set of outcomes listed as ten attributes, leaving the work of the definition to the reader. It also lacks guidelines on specific learning experiences to form the basis of international mindedness. As Haywood (2007, p. 80) states:

The IBO has gone some way towards defining international mindedness through the ten attributes of the learner profile and international educators have become familiar with their generic aspirations. Even so, there is scant guidance on assessment and reporting and little formal basis for understanding precisely what outcomes each attribute will lead to or how the profile might be reflected in students at different stages of development through the program.

This lack of direction accompanying the IB learner profile, alongside the absence of a definition, is causing many teachers instructing in IB schools to experience frustration over implementing it (Cause 2008; Haywood 2007; Hurley 2008).

Another problem with the IB’s definition of international mindedness offered through the learner profile is that it states that an internationally minded person must demonstrate all ten attributes of the learner profile, suggesting that this is the only route to acquiring international mindedness and the only way to be internationally minded. But Haywood (2007, p. 85) states that ‘there is no monopoly on the right way to think and act internationally and the educator ought to avoid any form of indoctrination even if well intended’. Recent research (Cause 2009, 2011a) supports Haywood’s (2007) premise and adds that the attributes of the IB learner profile allow little room for students to come to their own realisation of international mindedness.
Chapter 1: Introduction

Haywood (2007) suggests that we need to move beyond the IB learner profile and think of international mindedness in different ways. This research project set out to fill these gaps in current understandings of international mindedness.

1.2 The Research Problem

International education, international schooling, globalisation and international mindedness represent a plethora of terms that are debated and discussed in current educational literature. Yet, even though these terms are topics of debate, there remains much to be learnt about what they actually mean. As international mindedness drives the philosophy of the IB, a clearer understanding of what international mindedness is and how teachers may cultivate international mindedness is necessary in order to negotiate new ways in which teachers can better prepare our children of today to cope and deal with issues stemming from the increase in the intensity, extent, velocity and impact of globalisation. To this end, the aim of this PhD research was to explore what teachers think international mindedness is and how they think it can be developed. One case study school, referred to as Diamond Primary School (pseudonym employed to protect the identity of the school), was chosen for the study. The thesis is based on the following research questions:

- What do Diamond Primary School teachers think international mindedness is?
- How do Diamond Primary School teachers think international mindedness can be developed in students?
- How do Diamond Primary School teachers develop international mindedness through curriculum, pedagogy and assessment?

Although this research focuses on one primary school implementing the PYP (specifically ages 5 – 12) it may have broader applicability, particularly to other schools in Australia or elsewhere.
1.3 This Project

For this particular project, an approach was needed that allowed for deep comprehension of how teachers understand international mindedness and how they go about teaching it. Therefore a qualitative case study was the chosen research approach because, as Eriksson and Kovalainen (2008, p. 117) argue:

Common to various definitions of case study research is the emphasis on the production of detailed and holistic knowledge, which is based on the analysis of multiple empirical sources rich in context (Tellis & Peter 1997). Overall, case study research aims to make room for diversity and complexity and, therefore, avoids overly simplistic research designs.

International mindedness is ‘a conceptual construct in the minds of individuals involved in dialogues already in progress’ (Hurley 2008, p. 54) – it is not something that can be quantified or controlled because it is not a single concept that can be understood or described within an objective reality. Therefore, exploring teachers’ understandings of international mindedness and its development is essentially trying to understand a phenomenon that is constantly in the process of cultural and social negotiation.

The project involved one school as the case: Diamond Primary School. Focusing on one school allowed for deep comprehension of how teachers understand international mindedness and how they go about teaching it. Within this one case study school, nine teachers and one school leader were interviewed. Interviewees were asked what they thought international mindedness was; what dilemmas they faced when teaching international mindedness; and what curriculum, pedagogy and assessment processes or structures they believe to be effective in developing international mindedness. These aspects were then further explored through classroom observations over a period of nine months. Data collected from the analysis of observations helped to describe and illuminate the interview responses. The data intended to reveal teachers’ understandings of international mindedness and how the development of international mindedness may be affected, enhanced, overlooked or could be better understood.
Chapter 1: Introduction

The most recent development of Bernstein's code theory (2000b) provided a framework for the study and describes how teachers understand international mindedness and its development. Bernstein's code theory (2000b) will be discussed in Chapter 4, but briefly, his theory states that interactions, boundaries, timing, place, pacing, selection and the organisation of elements within curriculum, pedagogy and assessment greatly impact on the school environment and student learning. Essentially, the way in which content is interpreted and constructed by the school and teachers is what Bernstein (1975, 2000b) claims influences student behaviour, what they learn, and creates each student's identity. By using his theory as the framework to analyse the data, this project made the assumption that, if student identities are created through the way in which curriculum, pedagogy and assessment are constructed, then the development of international mindedness will also be dependent on the way in which curriculum, pedagogy and assessment are constructed. After all, the content taught in the PYP is more or less a collection of trans-disciplinary themes – themes containing several topics or inquiries with content or learning deemed essential by the IB to be covered throughout the year. How the school interprets and constructs the content at one level and how the classroom teacher interprets and constructs the content at another level is what determines whether or not students can develop international mindedness.

Hence, through the lenses of Bernstein's code theory (2000b), this project explored how teachers understand international mindedness, and how they construct curriculum, pedagogy and assessment to influence its development. Discourses on the development of international mindedness in the sense of what works well, what is ineffective, the struggles, the tensions and confusions teachers experience were the foci. In this way, this project presents one step forward in terms of searching for ways in which international mindedness can be understood and effectively developed, producing new understandings that may be used by interested teaching practitioners and researchers around the world.
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.3.1 Diamond Primary School

Diamond Primary School was the school researched for this project. In total it has just over 940 students and is well-resourced with many newly developed buildings and a welcoming feel. It is situated in a middle-class suburb of Melbourne, Australia. It is a government school well known in its district for its high level of academic achievement. It is also well known for its special hearing-impaired facility within the school, currently with nine staff who support thirty-five hearing-impaired students in developing their language skills.

There are a number of students on waiting lists at each year level to attend the school. However, its population growth is not only a result of its high academic achievement and high level of support for students with special needs – this has also resulted from some external factors. Many students travel from South East Asian countries to attend the local high school in the area, which is sought after due to its high academic outcomes. For local students, Diamond Primary School and its local high school offer a relatively affordable option for families wanting their children to attend a high achieving school, compared to sending students to one of the surrounding elite private schools. Diamond Primary School is also implementing the IB’s PYP. At the time of writing, there were 126 IB schools in Australia opting for one or more of the three IB programs, with 53 of these schools offering the PYP (IBO 2010a). Being a candidate school, the school was anticipating its IB accreditation in 2012 so that it could continue implementing the PYP in order to officially become an IB World School.

The most distinctive feature of the PYP is the six trans-disciplinary themes that represent global significance:

- who we are
- where we are in place and time
- how the world works
- how we express ourselves
Chapter 1: Introduction

- how we organise ourselves; and
- sharing the planet.

These trans-disciplinary themes are each driven by an inquiry based pedagogical approach. Implemented as six ‘units of inquiry’, they are to cover the subject areas of: Language, Social Studies, Science, Arts, Mathematics and Personal, Social and Physical Education. Concepts, knowledge, skills, attitudes and action are five essential elements that give PYP learners the opportunity to gain, develop, acquire and apply their knowledge of each subject area within each trans-disciplinary theme (IBO 2007). Besides the PYP, Diamond Primary School must also teach and report to the Victorian Essential Learning Standards (VELS), Victoria's compulsory curriculum for all state government schools. Hence, there are two frameworks operating within the school. Exploring this one IB school that worked with both the IBPYP and a state curriculum framework offered the opportunity to understand the struggles and positive issues that teachers have when trying to develop international mindedness through the IBPYP, alongside a state curriculum. A number of the teachers in the school had been teaching in the school prior to implementing the PYP, and so were able to offer a range of perspectives on changes that have occurred since the school introduced the program.

1.4 This thesis

This thesis is presented in two main sections. The first section, Chapters 1 to 4, provide a detailed background to the project. Chapter 2 comprises of a literature review associated with international mindedness. It explores the literature that helped shape this study and its research problem. In Chapter 3, the theoretical framework of this project is discussed. In Chapter 4 the focus is on the methodological issues involved in the chosen research approach and analysis, as well as the description of the chosen methods of data collection.

Section 2 presents the findings and conclusions of the study. Chapters 5, 6, 7 and 8 present and discuss the findings in the main themes arising through the research, in light of the theoretical
Chapter 1: Introduction

framework established in Chapter 3. At the end of Chapter 8, a summary of the key findings of the study is provided. In Chapter 9, the key findings and implications of this research at Diamond Primary School, recommendations for action and further research possibilities are discussed.
2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 INTRODUCTION

In literature, the topic of international mindedness is couched in terms of international education and international schooling. Hence, prior to discussing literature on international mindedness, it is essential that literature encompassing international education and international schooling be examined. For this reason, this literature review is divided into two main sections: international education and international schools; and international mindedness.

Themes inherent in the first section on international education and international schools help highlight how and why the development of international mindedness has emerged in the field of education, and why many educational thinkers believe international mindedness should be regarded as an important factor in education today. Attention to understanding the history of international education is essential in this section. Sylvester (2007, p. 11) argues that a lack of attention to the history of international education is ‘one of the major weaknesses in the research for literature for international education’ – a term relevant to this discussion on international mindedness.

The main themes contained in the second section on international mindedness foreground and trace studies on international mindedness to demonstrate how this project is positioned in relation to previous studies on international mindedness. By identifying relationships in the literature that contribute to dialogue on international mindedness, it is possible to plan ways in which this study will enrich, extend or fill gaps in current theories and studies on the teaching of international mindedness.

In each section, it is crucial to remember Hurley's (2008) claim that the literature base of international education, the international school and international mindedness is still evolving and is representative of an ongoing, complex dialogue consisting of newly emergent ideas and themes which often present readers with more questions than answers.
2.2 INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION AND INTERNATIONAL SCHOOLS

In literature, there are varying opinions of what constitutes international education and the international school, many of which lack a strong theoretical framework. Hayden and Thompson (1995a, 1995b, 1996, 1997, 1998a, 2000a, 2000b, 2011), Peterson (1972, 2003), Cambridge (2000, 2002a, 2002b, 2003, 2010, 2011), Hill (2000, 2001, 2002, 2006, 2007), Walker (2000a, 2002, 2007), Bagnall (1997; 1997a; 2005, 2008) and Levy (2007) have made significant contributions to this literature base. Their examinations and propositions seek to define what constitutes international education and the international school as all scholars identify that to this day, no single definition exists for either of these terms. Although these educators unanimously propose that international education and international schools are conceptually intertwined, at the same time, they argue that viewing each under the same umbrella can be problematic and can lead to a very simplistic understanding of both phenomena. In response, this literature review explores both “international education” and the “international school” under separate headings. Discussing international education and the international school individually helps to clarify differences and similarities between these terms – an important aspect of this project, as the terms are used frequently throughout literature encompassing international mindedness.

2.2.1 INTERNATIONAL SCHOOLS

Since the turn of the twenty-first century, the volume of literature written on international schools has risen dramatically, but a growing number of books and international peer-reviewed scholarly journals also offer a current, comprehensive overview of the fragmented and ongoing dialogue regarding definitions of the international school and its evolving nature.

Bates (2011b, p. 2) states that originally, international schools were ‘established in response to a particular segment of the internationally mobile population’. Sklair (2001) terms this population the “transnational capitalist class” as the culturally diverse families constituting this
Chapter 2: Literature review

population typically comprise parents who work in international companies or multinational corporations. Many scholars refer to students belonging to this group as “global nomads” or “third culture kids” (TCKs) (Langford 1998). But the rapid expansion of international schools over the past century is not only related to the growth in multinational bodies. Bates (2011b, p. 2) claims that ‘it is also ideological, for this growth in numbers has coincided with the globalisation of neo-liberal ideologies committed to the reorganisation of societies and social relations’. Bates (2011b) draws from the work of Robertson (2008) to argue that the three main neo-liberal aims behind the expansion of international schools are: to redistribute wealth to the upper class; to transform education in a way which produces workers needed for the global economy, and to break down the public sector of education, transforming it into business-like organisations producing profit.

Although many scholars agree that the term “international schools” denotes the growing population of global educational organisations that serve the transnational class, what actually constitutes an international school is a debatable issue. Hayden (2006, p. 10) argues: ‘Indeed the question of what is and is not an international school would seem to be one where the more one knows, the more complicated it seems to be’. She suggests that one of the many reasons behind this confusion ‘is the fact that no one organisation internationally can grant the right to use the term “international school” in a school’s title’ (p. 10), and that there are no criteria to characterise an international school (Hayden & Thompson 2000a).

Hayden and Thompson (1998b) argue that many international schools claim they are international for a wide range of reasons, making it difficult for anyone to come up with a shared definition. As such, Hayden and Thompson (1998b, p. 3) refer to international schools as a ‘disparate group’. Supporting this idea, Bagnall (2008) has challenged the possibility or desirability of coming to a single definition that categorises international schools. Although international schools may share some similarities, each is individually unique due to its disparate contexts.
Chapter 2: Literature review

Bagnall (2008, p. 1) illustrates international schools as ‘living organisms that continue to develop and change as the world changes’. Like Cambridge and Thompson (2004), Bagnall (2008) proposes that categorising international schools as a ‘whole’ category or under one succinct definition could be problematic and contested. Bagnall (2008) draws from the work of Leach (1969) to support his notion and to indicate how a precise definition could exclude many schools that consider themselves to be ‘international’:

Without doubt, most international schools are unique in many ways to one another. There is, however, a strong argument for classifying international schools loosely into various groups. Leach (1969) was the first writer to mention a hierarchy of international schools. The criteria that he himself applied to international schools left the school that he taught in, the International School of Geneva, as the only true international school. (Bagnall 2008, p. 27)

Hayden and Thompson (1995a) and Hill (2000) argue that some of the confusion behind what defines an international school stems from the fact that international schools are often mistakenly thought of as schools that offer an international education and possibly the teaching of international mindedness. In the following quote, Hill (2000, p. 24) attempts to clarify some common misconceptions about the terms ‘international schools’, ‘international education’ and “international mindedness”:

International education is not necessarily the exclusive domain of international schools. There are a number of national schools which offer programs synonymous with those offered in such institutions. As a consequence, the task of defining just what is international education is facilitated if we treat it separately from trying to define just what an international school is, or should be and think instead of those kinds of schools that are internationally minded.

Although international education or international mindedness may be developed or may take place in an international school, these scholars emphasise that it must never be assumed that an international school is automatically the provider of an international education or is an internationally minded school. Similarly, Hayden and Thompson (1995a) state that a school embracing an international educational philosophy does not necessarily have to exist within an international school – it can operate within a national, international, state or private school.
Chapter 2: Literature review

Supporting this idea, Hill (2000, p. 24) states: ‘International schools are not the only providers of international education’ (p. 24) as there are a growing number of national and state government schools claiming to offer an international education. As Bagnall (2008, p. 4) argues, all schools around the globe have an important role in preparing global citizens ‘who can learn from the past, live in the present and make change into the future’.

Bagnall (1997b; 2008) argues that the international school setting can be an important basis for an international education and international mindedness, providing the school has globally-minded teachers, international students and internationalises aspects of the school curriculum and pedagogy. He also states that, as schools try to respond to the changes of our interdependent world, the differences between many national schools and international schools are diminishing at an accelerating rate. Bagnall (2008, p. 3) proposes that national schools have a lot to learn from international schools:

International schools remain at the forefront of educational experimentation and have much to offer national schools. They represent the frontier for solving global problems of inequality and injustice in the world. (p. 3)

These scholars (Bagnall 2008; Hayden & Thompson 1995a; Hill 2000; McDonald 2002) agree that an international school does not necessarily mean that a school embraces an international education. However, when looking at research undertaken on international education, it is significant to note that many researchers limit the schools involved in their research to international schools. As such, it may be proposed that many educational researchers are making the assumption that an international education is often delivered in an international school (see Hayden, Rancic & Thompson 2000; Hayden & Thompson 1997; Lowe 2000). This may also have implications for international mindedness.

It is also significant to note that many scholars such as Cambridge (2003), Hayden, Rancic and Thompson (2000), Hayden and Thompson (1995a) and Marshall (2007), who have contributed to this literature base worked for the IBO at the time of their research. Bagnall (2008, p. 5)
Chapter 2: Literature review

states ‘individuals working for the International Baccalaureate Organisation (IBO) also write the majority of work written on the International Baccalaureate’. It is the researcher who guides all aspects of the study from the design, selection of participants, data collection, analysis and conclusions drawn (Bagnall 2008). Professional and private backgrounds of any researcher have an impact on their study, as no research is objective. If the majority of research on what constitutes an international school has been conducted by people working for the IBO, then it may be worth looking for more research to be instigated by researchers outside of this organisation, as this may add new perspectives.

This thesis proceeds on Bagnall’s (2008) premise that it is not possible or desirable to come to a single definition that defines the international school. This is because to this day, literature has highlighted that defining an international school has been regarded as problematic and undesirable because its educational goals are not clearly defined. What the fragmented discussions on the international school suggest is that the international school is still in an evolutionary stage and as such, any understanding of what defines the international school and its role in developing international mindedness is unclear.

2.2.2 INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION

Like the international school, the term “international education” is a widely used term in educational literature across the globe, but a concise definition of how it may be defined is also open to debate. Yet, the absence of a concise definition does not by any means imply that the topic lacks attention, is irrelevant, or is a topic of interest to only a small number of people. Bagnall (2008) and Hayden (1998b) argue that it would be doubtful that any reflective educator has not heard of the term ‘international education’ and that many educators would be sure to testify that the field of international education is growing and moving forward at a rapid rate. Hayden (1998, p. 1) metaphorically refers to the growing field of international education as:
a field in which the tiny iceberg tip that is the literature accessible to the uninitiated hides the very large mass beneath the surface that is the large amount of exciting and innovative work being undertaken in many international schools around the world.

In 1995, Hayden and Thompson (1995b) explored undergraduate university students’ perceptions of an international education. They collected surveys from students who had attended international secondary schools and found that students valued being in a school environment with a diverse cultural student mix, with internationally minded teachers. Thompson (1998, p. 237) emphasises that, although these criteria do not guarantee an international educational experience, they certainly help, pointing out that an international education is an experience, not a curriculum and something ‘most likely to be caught, not taught’.

Hurley (2008, p. 41), however, disputes this assertion saying: ‘...if international education was to be caught rather than taught, then it sounded like an educational fluke rather than an educational goal’. However, in taking this view, Hurley (2008) is overlooking Thompson’s (1998) constructivist approach which suggests that international education is an experience rather than a school or curriculum type. She is also overlooking the depth to which Thompson (1998) substantiates his proposition, putting forward a tripartite model comprising cultural diversity, a balanced curriculum and administrative styles that work together in a way that internationalises the educational experience – including developing international mindedness. Hence, Thompson (1998) does not indicate that an international educational experience is created by leaving teachers to their own devices – which is an important point for this project that seeks to find out how teachers believe best to develop international mindedness.

In another project, Hayden and Thompson (1995a) looked closely at the relationship between the international school and an international education. As iterated earlier, they conclude that both have several similarities but are not the same thing and, most importantly, they are not contingent on each other. Hayden and Wong’s (1997) research on the experiences of international school students concludes that, when students embrace an international outlook
Chapter 2: Literature review

and an awareness of the globe, it generally helps to develop a student’s own perception of their identity and cultural heritage. In other words, students develop international mindedness.

Three years later, Hayden, Thompson and Rancic (2000) published the results of a large quantitative research project involving over one thousand students and over two hundred teachers in different international schools on what defines an international education. The researchers confirmed that international education is more of an experience than a particular type of school. They found students and teachers thought the following facets are characteristics of a school embracing an international education: the teaching of at least two languages; international mindedness; global mobility; and student exchange experiences.

Hill (2000) critiqued the recruitment process of this project however, stating that distributing surveys solely to international schools is making the assumption that international schools deliver an international education. Hill (2000) had earlier pointed out that he believed an international education is not necessarily delivered in an international school. He argued that an international education does not rely on a diverse student population and, if anything, is more closely associated with international mindedness than the international school.

In 2000, Hayden and Thompson’s edited book International schools and international education was published. This text explored issues around the relationship between international schools and international education. The book maintained that there was a direct link between international education and international schools, but the authors pointed out that they are not necessarily contingent. However, this idea is not new – Leach (1969) emphasised this concept in his book International schools and their role in the field of international education – yet all too often, both terms are still used synonymously.

In Hayden and Thompson's 2000 publication, they draw some conclusions from their multiple research projects on the topic of international education, and highlight some effects that the notion of diversity can have in terms of internationalising the educational setting through establishing:
Chapter 2: Literature review

- a balanced formal curriculum
- opportunities for celebrating cultural diversity; and
- a range of appropriate administrative styles. (2000a, p. 4)

The authors believe that every international school is unique in terms of its philosophy, school culture and milieu. Hayden and Thompson (2000a) suggest that what a Zimbabwean school believes to be diverse may be quite a different to what a school in New Zealand or Bali believes to be diverse. The authors apply this same concept to the notion of ‘quality’ (p. 6) – quality being a value-laden term with no two schools perceiving it at the same level. They state that this is why it is difficult to give international education one set definition.

Thompson and Cambridge (2004) propose that the word ‘international’ makes the term ‘international education’ an ambiguous term, because ‘international’ has several connotations. Similarly, Haywood (2007, p. 79) states:

Fundamentally, the word ‘international’, whose literal significance refers to interaction between nations, may not be adequate to describe what many educators have really intended when using it as an adjective in the educational context, where they would like to imply a combination of political astuteness, communication skills across languages, elements of multicultural understanding, global awareness and responsibilities involved with national and global citizenship.

Hence, Haywood’s discussion has connotations for international mindedness. Other studies have been completed in an attempt to define what international education is, how participants in schools perceive it, and how it situates itself in different schools (see De Jong & Teekens 2003; Hayden & Wong 1997; Hinrichs 2003; Nilsson 2003). Research by Walker (2000b), Heyward (2002), Bennett (1993) and Westrick (2004) argues that a truly international educational experience may be defined as one where international mindedness or intercultural understanding drive the curriculum and pedagogy of the learning organisation – aspects these authors also claim are not necessarily characteristic of an international school.
Chapter 2: Literature review

Räsänen (2007, p. 54) suggests that international education will vary according to the location and culture of the learning organisation:

Definitions have varied according to the institutions, cultures, organisations and historical events generating them. In some schools more attention is given to Europe and neighbouring nations, in others global citizenship or intra-state multiculturalism gets more emphasis. In some approaches individual development and intercultural competences are the focus of education, in others societal problems and structural inequities are the starting point for action in order to change things for the better.

Räsänen’s study suggests, therefore, that international mindedness may mean different things and may be practiced in different ways. Cambridge and Thompson (2004, p. 162) concur, further stating that the aims of international education have changed over time and will continue to do so. Hence, pinpointing one definition is problematic as its movement has no beginning or predictable outcome. For example, growing interest in international mindedness has recently influenced the nature of international education, moving international education further into the ‘context of international development aid and the transfer of expertise between national systems of education’.

Richards (2002) suggests that rather than devising a definition for what international education may look like, we should focus on what international education should look like by being more outcomes-based. Responding to this call, the IBO has introduced the IB learner profile, which is an outcomes based model defining international mindedness. Hill (2000) proposes that “education for international mindedness” could replace the term “international education” as it may be easier for educators to understand. This notion marks a shift in the focus of attention from the processes of learning to the outcomes of learning. With literature suggesting that confusion surrounds the term “international mindedness” as well as the term “international education”, this proposition may not clear things up for educators at all.

In summary, clarifying the purpose of international education and what it actually is remains a popular topic of interest for researchers in the field. In practice, it appears that many schools claiming to offer an international education justify it by offering an international curriculum,
Chapter 2: Literature review

studies in a different language or exchange programs (Haywood 2007). The emphasis given to any of these aspects can vary greatly between schools that claim to offer an international education. It may be proposed that it is this diversity that has overcome efforts to establish a clear definition of international education.

This review will now turn to literature that focuses on the terms “nationalism”, “globalisation” and “internationalism”; but looking at the term “nation-state” prior to this discussion is important, as these three terms draw from the notion of the nation-state. This discussion will explore their implications on international education today, as many authors believe these themes and issues to be intrinsically related to international education – the topic in which international mindedness is couched in.

2.2.3 The nation-state, nationalism and international education

Bernstein (2000b, p. xxiii) argues that:

Education becomes a crucial means and an arena for struggle to produce and reproduce a specific national consciousness...there are ranges of school practices, rituals, celebrations and emblems which work to this effect and of course there are also the crucial discourses of language, literature and history.

Leach (1969) and Bernstein (2000b) propose that nationalism implicitly motivates different aspects of the school’s overall structures and practices. The degree to which it does so will vary, but for schools offering an international educational philosophy, they should essentially be promoting ways in which groups drawn from a range of nationalities can relate to each other.

Bourdieu (1974, 1977, 1993) argues that nationalism is implicitly produced in the educational organisation. He argues that the school appears neutral because it creates a “trick” which hides hierarchical or conflicting discourses between different social groups by age, culture, class, religion and race:

It is impossible to understand the peculiar characteristics of restricted culture without appreciating its profound dependence on the educational system, the indispensable means of its reproduction and growth. Among the transformations which occur, the quasi-systematisation and theorising imposed on the inculcated content are rather less
Chapter 2: Literature review

...evident than their concomitant effects, such as ‘routinisation’ and ‘neutralisation’. (Bourdieu 1993, p. 123)

Bernstein (2000b) extends this aspect of Bourdieu’s (1993, p. 123) theory terming ‘the trick’ or ‘neutralisation’ a ‘mythological discourse’ (Bernstein 2000b, p. xxiii). He proposes that the mythological discourse implicitly covers up dominant forms of power external to, and within, the school:

I would like to propose that the trick whereby the school disconnects the hierarchy of success internal to the school from social class hierarchies external to the school is by creating a mythological discourse and that this mythological discourse incorporates some of the political ideology and arrangement of the society.

The mythological discourse works in a way that lures students into success through the form of competitions, rewards, rituals and school practices and structures. In educational organisations, and indeed in wider society, success is seen as something to be earned and respected and rewards and certificates are given to students deemed worthy by those in authority.

Bernstein (2000b, p. xxiii) explains that the conditioning of nationalism in education is constructed through a mythological discourse which becomes a part of a child’s consciousness through a school’s practices: ‘In all modern societies the school is a crucial device for writing and rewriting national consciousness, and national consciousness is constructed out of myths of origin, achievements and destiny’ and through ‘the myth that society is an organism in which groups within a society, but not necessarily groups between societies, relate to each other through interdependence of specialised functions’.

If two mythological discourses are implicitly working in the same arena, one discourse may take a more dominant role, and so they may contest each other, however, this should not imply that these discourses be viewed as dichotomous categories. As Bernstein (2000b) states, sometimes they may work alongside each other and contribute to each other’s operation. For example, as
recent research has shown that students can only understand global issues after they have learnt to deal with issues at a local level (Allen 2000; Cause 2009).

2.2.4 INTERNATIONALISM AND INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION

Leach (1969) points out that, if nationalism has dominated our society for so long, then this has significant implications for schools striving to embrace an international educational philosophy. If each school instinctively projects its own image of nationalism, as Leach (1969) proposes, then each school’s perception of internationalism will be unique. Similarly, Wylie (2011, p. 26) argues: ‘Each school and its community engages in international schooling in a variety of ways, and holds different notions of internationalism’. In the context of the educational organisation, Cambridge (2002b, p. 159) defines internationalism as having:

...a positive orientation towards international relations, with aspirations for the promotion of peace and understanding between nations...It embraces an existential, experiential philosophy of education that values the moral development of the individual and recognises the importance of service to the community and the development of a sense of responsible citizenship.

Contrary to some globalising trends, Thompson and Cambridge (2004) argue that the “internationalist” approach to the practice of international education: “...celebrates cultural diversity and promotes an international-minded outlook’ (Cambridge & Thompson 2004, p. 174).

The extent to which each school promotes internationalism will vary depending on the degree to which each national school projects nationalism. Leach (1969) loosely breaks the “internationalist current” promoted through schools into three broad categories: Unilateral internationalism, bilateral internationalism and multilateral internationalism. Unilateral internationalism he claims refers to schools promoting an international education which are only concerned with their own personnel away from home. Schools falling into this category are usually national schools placed in other countries for the purpose of promoting the ‘home’ country’s culture. Leach (1969, p. 12) describes these schools as “demonstration centres" for
Chapter 2: Literature review

the country represented’ promoting quite a superficial ‘national-type internationalism’ – a type of internationalism through the lenses of their own cultural traditions. This describes schools endorsing an international education at the most basic level.

Bilateral internationalism is viewed as one step up from unilateral internationalism. Leach (1969) reasons that schools trying to promote internationalism through the exchange of students from different countries are examples of schools promoting a bilateral type of internationalism. This could be the case when the country of each school represented in the exchange is the only focus, with other countries being overlooked. This may also occur in schools that strive to be international simply by teaching a second language. It appears that many scholars writing about international schools tend to describe them as having the characteristics just described. Most literature draws attention to meeting the needs of both the international and local students attending the international school and overlooks the fact that there are many countries unacknowledged in that school’s culture or curriculum (Fleming 2003; Tudball 2002; Turnbull 2002). As Turnbull (2002, p. 4) argues: ‘The process of internationalisation must be a “two-way street”, meeting the needs of both local and international students’. The term ‘two-way street’ tends to imply that the needs of the students will be met at the school, overlooking the fact that there are other nations in the world – all with their own cultural identity, political framework and history.

Multilateral schools, Leach’s (1969) third category, share decision making at the administration level between participants from different nationalities, and countries from all over the world are represented throughout the curriculum and culture of the school. While it may be impossible to represent every nation in the world, for schools promoting this type of internationalism Leach (1969, p. 13) proposes that the school would at the very least be funded by a minimum of three different countries, with each country contributing to the overall running of the school. Different national heritages are respected and each national tradition is:
Chapter 2: Literature review

...analysed for its strengths and usefulness. Once this course has been decided upon and the essential unity of mankind therefore underscored, the possibility of achieving a result which will enrich each national heritage is made possible.

Multilateral schools are getting one step closer to what many authors propose to embrace an internationally minded school.

2.2.5 GLOBALISATION AND INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION

Holmes Hughes and Julian (2003, p. 408) describe globalisation as: ‘a complex set of social, economic, political and cultural processes which cut across national boundaries, increasing levels of interconnectedness such that the world is reconstituted as a single space’. Held (1999, p. 7) concurs, arguing that globalisation is ‘a long-term historical process which is inscribed with contradictions and which is significantly shaped by conjunctural factors’. Its dimensions are fluid and are in a state of constant change.

Bagnall (2008, p. 21) proposes that international education is a direct result of economic globalisation:

Internationalism in international education does appear to spring from international relations and the explicit need to foster an aspiration for world peace and understanding between nations. However, it may be argued that, besides harbouring such internationalist aspirations, international education is also part of the process of economic globalisation.

Bates (2011b, p. 2) cautions that it is difficult to make a generalisation about the extent to which an international school is driven by globalisation and nationalism. But he does argue that all schools around the globe will be affected to some degree and so will need:

...to critically address the major issues that shape the contexts and practices of international schools, especially those that arise from tensions between global cultures and local cultures and between the domains of global markets and calls for global citizenship. In particular...the implications for schools in terms of curricula, pedagogies and assessment regimes, and for teachers in terms of their work and careers.

Cambridge and Thompson (2004) also view international education to be a response to globalisation. In particular, they argue that international education is a direct response to
Chapter 2: Literature review

preparing students to enter the global market. Arguing that cultural convergence can be an outcome of globalising international education, Cambridge and Thompson (2004) suggest that many schools claiming to embrace an international educational philosophy, and in particular the IBO, normally follow curriculum models originating from Western countries. It is for this reason that Bagnall (2008) proposes that internationalism within the international educational context does not always embrace universal values. Rather, in this context internationalism can be more closely linked to globalisation and the notion of the global free market.

Cambridge (2003, p. 143) views globalisation and internationalism as competing discourses:

Globalisation is seen as economic integration, achieved in particular through the establishment of a global marketplace marked by free trade and a minimum of regulation. In contrast, internationalism refers to the promotion of global peace and well-being through the development and application of international structures, primarily but not solely of an intergovernmental kind...the essentially pro-democratic logic of internationalism stands in sharp contrast to the logic of globalisation.

Contrasting the internationalist approach with the practice of international education,

Cambridge and Thompson (2004, pp. 173-4) state that the ‘globalist’ approach:

...is influenced by and contributes to the global diffusion of the values of free market economics. These are expressed in international education in terms of an ideology of meritocratic competition combined with positional competition with national systems of education. This is accompanied by quality assurance through international accreditation and the spread of global quality standards that facilitate educational continuity for the children of the globally mobile clientele. Globalised international education serves a market that requires the global certification of educational qualifications. This facilitates education continuity for the children of the host country clientele with aspirations towards social and global mobility. An outcome of globalist international education is global cultural convergence towards the values of the transnational capitalist class.

If international education is linked to economic globalisation (Bagnall 2008; Cambridge 2002a; Cambridge & Thompson 2004) then it becomes difficult to see how international education could ever be closely related to internationalism – the need to foster inclusive and intercultural relations and aspire to world peace (Cambridge 2002b). Since international education functions in a global market (Cambridge 2002a), attention needs to be given to the effects of globalisation
Chapter 2: Literature review

on international education, particularly in relation to recent rapid globalising trends in the development of international mindedness.

Cambridge (2000) discusses how globalisation influences international education through seven cultures of capitalism originally proposed by Hampden-Turner and Trompenaars (1993). Cambridge (2000, p. 182) argues these cultures are ‘values in tension’ and proposes that each school needs to develop their own unique way of resolving them. The tensions comprise:

• making rules and discovering exceptions, contrasting the need for universally applied rules with the need to recognise particular exceptions to them
• constructing and deconstructing, which contrasts integrating (building up a world view by looking at whole patterns, relationships and wider contexts) and analysing (breaking down phenomena into their component parts)
• managing communities of individuals, contrasting the needs of the individual with the needs of the community
• internalising the outside world, contrasting personal judgements, decisions and commitments (inner direction) with the signals, demands and trends of the outside world (outer direction) as guides to action
• synchronising fast processes, contrasting views of time as a sequence and as synchronisation
• Choosing among achievers, contrasting attribution such as age, seniority or gender (status by ascription); and
• sponsoring equal opportunities to excel, which contrasts treating employees with equality with the establishment of authority through hierarchy. (Cambridge 2000, pp. 182–3)
Chapter 2: Literature review

Cambridge (2010) suggests that the growth in global demand for international education can be interpreted as either a pragmatic concern with globalisation or an idealistic concern with internationalism. The problem is, according to Cambridge (2002b, p. 160), internationalist and globalist trends ‘are rarely seen in their pure forms’ and so, idealistic efforts for a school to extend the notion of internationalism are complex. He further argues that: ‘International schools reconcile these contrasting approaches in their practice of international education’. Therefore, schools wanting to embrace an international educational philosophy need to be critically aware of the challenges globalisation presents (such as the seven values in tension) in order to articulate universal values characteristic of their educational philosophy. Bates (2011b, p. 8) concurs, but he further states that this issue is not isolated to international schools:

This is not simply an issue for international schools, although it is perhaps writ large in such schools because of the claims they make to foster international understanding, but an issue of more general importance in education as more and more national schools are caught up in the process of globalisation.

In summary, the boundaries between nationalism, internationalism or globalisation are blurred but they are interrelated. Although each phenomenon is different from the others, all can contribute to each other’s functioning. It may also be argued that the culture of each school striving towards an international educational philosophy will differ due to its unique reconciliation of these trends (Cambridge 2002b).

Before turning to discuss literature and research specific to international mindedness, this review will discuss the history of international education. This helps illuminate when, why and how attempts to extend educational philosophies beyond the nation-state were made. It supports Bagnall’s (2008) and Cambridge and Thompson’s (2004) belief that what characterises an international school or international education is not static. Most importantly, it shows why and how “international mindedness” has become a more commonly used term in schools around the world.
Chapter 2: Literature review

2.2.6 The history of international education

International education in the modern era originated in 1924 when the International School of Geneva and Yokohama International School began (Hayden & Thompson 2000b; Hill 2002; Walker 2000a). Yet, Sylvester (2007) claims that efforts to view education beyond the nation-state first began as early as 1855 when an exhibition was held in Paris to discuss the idea of eliminating national biases from educational content (Potter 1948; Sylvester, R 2002). Sylvester (2007) states that the earliest school that embraced an international educational philosophy was the Spring Grove School in London, which ran from 1866 until 1889. After this, several proposals were made to establish an international school system in Europe, but the outbreak of the Franco-Prussian War slowed progress in this regard.

Thompson (1998, p. 227) argues that people who believe international education has been around for centuries look at international education from a slightly different angle:

...concentrating not so much on the nature of the providing institution but on what kinds of educational transactions and processes go on inside the institutions and inside the minds of the young people within them.

Hill (2007) supports this notion:

In the late nineteenth and early twentieth century international education was understood as students being educated in a school with many different nationalities...or moving between a network of institutions across a number of countries to learn languages and experience different cultures at first hand.

In the nineteenth century, journals and international bodies were established that aimed to promote education beyond the nation-state. For example, in 1891 Herman Molkenboer started the Journal of Correspondence on Foundation of a Permanent and International Council on Education which attracted widespread interest and instigated the need for an international council of education and world peace (Scalon 1960; Sylvester 2007). Towards the turn of the twentieth century, International Bureau of New School was established in Geneva. Although this was established by Adolphe Ferriere (Brickman 1950), Fern Andrews was largely
Chapter 2: Literature review

influential in its development and she later founded the American school Peace League to promote ‘the interests of international justice and fraternity’ (Scalon 1960, p. 8) prompting teachers to ‘build up a new people whose country is the world, whose countrymen are all mankind’ (Stomfay-Stitz 1993, p. 45). Andrews promoted an international educational philosophy that encouraged goodwill and world citizens – not only a culturally diverse population.

As the international education movement gained momentum, the intensity of its philosophy slowly started changing (Cambridge & Thompson 2004). This was most noticeable after the outbreak of World War I, when several influential educators endorsed pedagogies that embraced world citizenship, cooperation, respect and peace, in an effort to ensure such bloodshed would never occur again. These influential educators belonged to the League of Nations (Sylvester 2007) and were instrumental in opening the International School of Geneva. Formed in 1924, this school became known as Ecolint. Walker (2007, p. 404) claims it ‘fulfilled the practical need of providing an education for the multinational children of the new breed of international civil servants working at the League of Nations’. Its mission was to ‘instil into these young people the same values of international understanding and tolerance that were enshrined in the League’s own covenant’.

This second burst of interest in international education was almost adjourned when World War II broke out, but it also gave international education a renewed impetus, as reflective educators saw the importance of fostering ‘a new spirit of international tolerance’ (Walker 2007, p. 404). There was also an obvious rise in the number of research projects on this topic at the university level (Bagnall 2008). Around this time, Kurt Huhn established the Outward Bound Program as he recognised the importance of embracing education of the whole person (Bagnall 2008; Peterson 1987; Sylvester 2007; Walker 2002, 2007). Kurt Hahn then founded the United World Colleges (UWC) (Peterson 1987).
Chapter 2: Literature review

Peterson (2003), who has written extensively on the history of the UWC, states that Hahn’s main goal behind establishing the UWC was to develop world peace, intercultural understanding and students that could learn from others from different nationalities and different cultural, racial or religious backgrounds. His approach was to ensure that schools developed students who were accepting and knowledgeable about their own heritage and cultural background, so that they were then tolerant of other people’s different social, financial, cultural and racial upbringings. Peterson (2003) believes UWCs are exemplary international schools.

Literature from Bullivant (1974) also supports education of the whole person. He proposes that the following attributes should be central in an international education:

- a sense of commitment to maintaining world peace
- cooperation at a global level
- social-cultural origins of human behaviour; and
- cultural diversity.

In agreement, Maclaine (1974, p. 306) suggests students should study and understand the world as a whole and develop attitudes that work towards developing a more peaceful world:

Students should be required to study the world as a whole and habitually to adopt a world frame of reference in thinking about events; they should also understand the machinery of world co-operation; have shared in a rich array of learning experiences which possess an international quality; have identified themselves with the world community; are committed to world values; have extended their sense of citizenship; and are growing into an international philosophy of life.

After World War II, more and more international schools and courses were established – one of them being the IB Diploma Program, which was established as a "curriculum service" (Hill 2007; Walker 2007) in 1962 to cater for secondary students in their final two years of school. This philosophy was greatly influenced by the Outward Bound movement as it recognised the need
to embrace an education that fostered positive attitudes, respect and the skills needed to live harmoniously in an interdependent world (Sylvester 2007).

2.2.7 The establishment of the IBO

The United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) was established in 1946 between 20 countries (Australia, Brazil, Greece, India, Canada, China, Denmark, Czechoslovakia, Dominican Republic, Lebanon, Egypt, France, Mexico, United States, Turkey, South Africa, Saudi Arabia, New Zealand, Greece and Norway). It was a cross cultural effort to develop peace in the minds of people, in an effort to prevent the outbreak of another world war (Sylvester 2007; Walker 2007). Like the Outward Bound movement, the establishment of UNESCO had a big influence over the nature of international education and the formation of the IBO.

In 1951, UNESCO was instrumental in forming the International Schools Association (ISA). The ISA is an international organisation that is still running today. It states that ‘education is the key to the new global economy; from primary school on up to life-long learning. It is central to development, social progress and human freedom’ (UNESCO 2000, p. 2). In 1962, the ISA planned for a group of teachers to meet in Geneva and formally discuss the future and purpose of international education (Sylvester, B 2002). Their meeting was a response to the increasing demand from globally mobile families whose children were enrolled in international schools for the purpose of attaining school-leaving credentials that met the requirements of different universities around the world – not just of the student’s home country (Fox 1998).

Teachers from the ISA prompted the need for a formal international curriculum that embraced education of the whole person and a pedagogy that stimulated the importance of values and attitudes leading to responsible world citizenship, cooperation, tolerance and respect. They collaboratively developed a set of international standards for examining students in their final years of schooling titled the International Schools Examinations Syndicate (ISES). Alec Peterson
Chapter 2: Literature review

(IBO 1985) developed the examination questions into separate areas of knowledge which Gerard Renaud then presented at the UNESCO conference in 1967 (Fox 1985, p. 67). The conference was organised by Edgar Faure, who was the French Minister of Education during the 1960s, who believed ‘that learning how to learn is the key to meaningful education’.

Bagnall (2008) states that it was from these standards that UNESCO decided to give the ISA a grant to hold an information workshop. The Twentieth Century Fund also decided to contribute a grant to the ISA, which then enabled it to explore its standards further. Alec Peterson was instrumental throughout this process. He conducted research at Oxford University that enabled him to design an international curriculum that covered fundamental content across different disciplines that led to an examination with resulting credentials. These credentials were accepted by different universities around the world. With other donations from other interested organisations, in 1967 the IB Diploma Program (DP) was proposed as an experiment (Fox 1998).

The internationalist current in the philosophy of the IBO was greatly influenced by Kurt Hahn’s effects on international education through founding the Outward Bound Program and the United World Colleges (Cambridge 2002a; Peterson 2003). However, in the literature many scholars acknowledge Peterson as the main instigator in the establishment of the IBO in 1965. His efforts to develop and implement the initial experimental IB curriculum undoubtedly acted as a guiding light to the field of international education. Not only was Peterson the main instigator behind the establishment of the IBO, but he was also the first Deputy Director of the IBO. His book The International Baccalaureate (Peterson 1972) provides a comprehensive overview of the early stages of the IBO.

Sylvester (2007) also states that The conference of internationally minded schools, which was originally known as the Conference of principals of international schools, was also influential in establishing the IB philosophy. Like the ISA and UNESCO, it pushed for international education to be understood as an environment and experience rather than just a curriculum or school.
Chapter 2: Literature review

containing a population of a mixture of different cultures. It urged education to embrace internationalism, rather than being a response directly related to pragmatic needs.

Hill (2007) claims that the establishment of the IBO represents one of the most significant advancements in international education in the twentieth century. Its mission statement embodies the notion that "difference" is explored and respected. Hill (2001, p. 51) claims 'the IB is an education for life, a responsible life, open to the problems of our world and encouraging students to give time and to bring about change'.

Towards the end of the twentieth century, the IBO considered ways to further develop its program. Effort was expended into developing an international curriculum that met the needs of students throughout their entire schooling through two new programs. It was proposed that these two programs could be used as a stepping stone to the IB Diploma Program: the Primary Years Program (PYP, from the ages of around 3–12) and the Middle Years Program (MYP, from the ages of around 12–16):

The incorporation of such continuity criteria into the programs of study for each of the phases of student learning, would seem to be an essential ingredient for the creation of specifications and schemes of work that help overcome the effects of the numerous discontinuities experienced by many students, arising from their circumstances. (Drennen 2002, p. 56)

The idea of curriculum continuity was to slightly reframe the purpose and nature of what is understood to be international education, by making the whole child more of an explicit focus throughout all years of education – rather than only the last two years of schooling. This is slightly different to when the IBO initially started out, when one of its main goals was to provide education ‘for international schools with multicultural globally mobile student populations’ (Hayden & Wilkinson 2010, p. 85) and provide an internationally recognised examination outcome that could be recognised anywhere in the world (Peterson 1972). These reasons still remain the main functions of the Diploma today, but the addition of the MYP and the PYP signifies growth in the development of the IBO. Walker (2007, p. 410) states:
Chapter 2: Literature review

It has encouraged them [the IBO] to engage in an extensive study of the key factors that underpin them in a search for a more generic description of what the IB represents.

The IB learner profile was a result of this advancement (see Chapter 1 of this thesis, p. 11). It looked for ways in which the emotional development of the child could be cultivated, enabling each child to embrace international mindedness – not just an understanding of international issues, but a focus on developing students who can be and act with empathy, respect and open-mindedness and with understanding with anybody from anywhere in the world (IBO 2007).

The attitudes of the IB learner profile represent one of the five essential elements of the IBPYP and MYP written curriculum. The IB claim that these five elements, knowledge, concepts, attitudes, skills and action, are to be viewed as interdependent on each other (2007).

Students in an IB school implementing any of the three IB programs are to engage in useful knowledge about:

- languages
- peace and conflict
- cultural diversity
- interdependence
- sustainable development
- social justice and equity
- world issues. (IBO 2007)

This knowledge is to be developed through the global connections in the curriculum. It is not ideological knowledge but, rather, useful knowledge students need to live in an interdependent world (Hill 2007).

Students also develop trans-disciplinary skills of:
Chapter 2: Literature review

- self-management skills: gross motor skill; fine motor skills; spatial awareness; organisation; time management; healthy lifestyle; safety; codes of behaviour and informed choices
- thinking skills: acquisition of knowledge; comprehension; application; analysis, synthesis, evaluation, dialectical thought and metacognition
- social skills: accepting responsibility; respecting others; cooperating, resolving conflict; group decision-making and adopting a variety of group roles
- communication skills: listening; speaking; reading; writing; viewing; presenting and non-verbal communication
- research skills: formulation of questions; collecting data; observing; planning; recording data; organising data; interpreting data and presenting research findings. (IBO 2007)

The IBO proposes that the trans-disciplinary skills ensure focus is on the whole child. These transdisciplinary skills are to be developed throughout the entire curriculum and are proposed to help students to engage in global issues such as:

- cultural literacy
- critical reflection
- problem-solving
- inquiry
- language learning
- working collaboratively
- lifelong learning
- conflict resolution
- transdisciplinary and holistic learning. (Hill 2007)
Chapter 2: Literature review

The concepts are to transcend all subject areas and drive all inquiries. They ‘help teachers and students to consider ways of thinking and learning about the world, and act as a provocation to extend and deepen student inquiries’ (IBO 2007, p. 16):

- function: How does it work?
- causation: Why is it like it is?
- change: How is it changing?
- form: What is it like?
- connection: How is it connected to other things?
- perspective: What are the points of view?
- responsibility: What is our responsibility?
- reflection: How do we know? (IBO, 2007).

Students demonstrate their understanding of their new knowledge in all essential elements through taking action on their new learning.

However, since the establishment of the IBO, many scholars have critiqued it for different reasons. One of these reasons was discussed in the first chapter – the ambiguity associated with the development of the IB learner profile (Haywood 2007). But scholars also claim it has problems with: lack of continuity; the paradox of prosperity; marketisation of education; and the notion of the accreditation or authorisation process (Bunnell 2011; Cambridge 2002a, 2010).

2.2.7.1 Continuity
As discussed in the history of international education, initially, the IB was restricted to students in their final years of secondary schooling – children aged between 17–19 years old (Drennen 2002; Sampatkumar 2007; Skelton 2002). For these reasons, literature points to the establishment of the IBO as a pragmatic concern with globalisation rather than an idealistic
Concern with internationalism. One way to overcome this criticism was to involve students in value-formation (through the development of the attributes of the IB learner profile) throughout their entire schooling career by introducing MYP in 1994 and the PYP in 1997. Helen Drennen, currently the Principal of Wesley College in Melbourne, was the main instigator behind initiating the PYP and the MYP, as she recognised the need for a curriculum with better continuity – a curriculum where international mindedness was not only taught in the IBDP, but much sooner than this (Drennen 2002).

2.2.7.2 Paradox of prosperity
The paradox illuminated in this section points to the growing inequalities around the globe between developed and underdeveloped nations as well as within nations; despite the fact that the philosophy of the IB aims to develop a more peaceful world. For example, given that the majority of IB schools are located in Western countries, the distribution of IB schools throughout the world is uneven. This demographic inequality is mainly because of the costs associated with running IB programs – with costs going directly to the IBO to support their existence. These costs make it difficult for schools in low income areas to adopt any of the IB programs:

In many less developed countries, schools offering international education provide opportunities for the children of the socioeconomic elite of the host country to turn their backs on their own educational system and embrace the values of the economically developed world. (Cambridge & Thompson 2004, p. 170)

Given that the majority of IB schools are located in developed countries, Cambridge and Thompson (2004) argue that the qualifications that the IB offers typically reinforce global capitalist ideals. Fertig (2000) proposes a similar notion, stating that, typically, international schools are private, fee paying educational organisations, and Lowe (1999, p. 230) concurs: ‘schools offering international curricula almost always charge comparatively high fees which ensures that such curricula will be accessible only to the relatively wealthy’. It may be proposed that students in IB schools are privileged as it appears that students in IB schools are not diverse in terms of economic backgrounds. As Bates (2011b, p. 7) argues: ‘international values
Chapter 2: Literature review

and their transmission may be quite problematic and restricted to a particular class identity’. The student population often attending IB schools are the children of transient, expatriate, entrepreneur parents who most likely travel the globe belonging to transnational corporations of some kind (Langford 1998).

Cambridge and Thompson (2004) and Haywood (2002) argue that international education is to some extent responding to the growth in the amount of multinational companies by providing education that suits the needs of children of expatriate parents. They argue that the growth in the number of global companies has directly contributed to the growth in the number of international schools. Given that the majority of these multinational companies are located in developed countries, there remain many countries where international education is underrepresented. Cambridge (2002a) queries the rationale of expatriate families seeking an international education for their children and questions whether these parents are after an international educational philosophy or purely an academic advantage or curriculum continuity. Typically, students leaving school with their IB diploma are recognised as the more competitive university applicants (Cambridge & Thompson 2004). Hayden and Thompson (1998a) agree on this particular notion, highlighting that approximately 95% of graduates from international schools gain entry into universities around the world.

2.2.7.3 Marketisation
Cambridge (2000, 2002a, 2003) argues that international education is market-driven and implicitly promotes capitalist ideologies. Whitehead (2005, p. 4) concurs, claiming that the IBO ‘has been caught up in the growing marketisation of schooling’. Supporting this view, Brown (2006) argues that many critics view international education as one based on market principles, and as an educational market only available to wealthy, expatriate parents who can afford it. Cambridge (2002a, p. 231) explores the relationship between international education (in particular the IBO) and globally branded marketed products. He draws analogies between the
Chapter 2: Literature review

relationships of examination boards providing accredited entry into universities, and
manufacturers and their franchised distributors:

It may be argued that international schools operate in local markets as the franchised
distributors of globally branded international education products and services, such as
the programs of the International Baccalaureate Organisation (IBO)...The
establishment of quality standards through accreditation constitutes an important part
of the franchising process.

Cambridge (2002a) and Whitehead (2005) suggest that the logo of the IBO, introduced in 2001,
makes a symbolic appeal to emotions in the same way that a jingle or logo does for an
advertising company when selling a product. The logo appears on most internet searches
associated with the IBO as well as on brochures, billboards and the internet home pages of
schools implementing any of their three programs, rather than the philosophy of the IB (2005).
Like any company marketing their "product" with a logo, Cambridge (2002a) argues that the
IBO is making an emotional plea to prospective schools wanting to implement any of the IB
programs. Schools then use the logo to lure students. In this way, Cambridge (2002a) argues
that, in many educational organisations, international education can be metaphorically referred
to as the "Big Mac" of education, with the IBO being viewed as a globally branded educational
product (2002a). He urges for more research to be conducted in this area (2002a).
Marketisation and commercialisation is a far cry from notions of developing international
mindedness.

2.2.7.4 The notion of accreditation
International school accreditation processes are intended to give leaders and teachers a better
insight into how they can internationalise their school culture, curricula, philosophy and vision
(Kyriakides & Campbell 2004). The European Council of International Schools (ECIS) has
developed a school accreditation protocol that Haywood (2002) argues is the most well
developed model of good practice around the world. However, even then he argues that it does
not offer a focus for schools striving towards an international educational philosophy, as it lacks
an explicit international dimension through its focus on good practice. The International School
Chapter 2: Literature review

Association (ISA) has focused on developing self-assessment tools for schools striving to develop their international consciousness and the IBO has recently implemented the Program standards and practices (IBO 2011c) guide that provides a self-assessment tool and direction for identifying ways in which to internationalise aspects of the school. But, as with most literature written by the IBO, this guide lacks a theoretical and empirical research basis on which the guidelines can be measured (Wylie 2007).

Hayden (2006) argues that the term “accreditation” is now commonly associated with the field of international education. This may be due to the fact that in order for schools to become an IB World School it is essential that they pass their accreditation process if they are to continue implementing IB programs. To become an IB World School, stages need to be successfully achieved before becoming an authorised IB school. Initially there is the trial implementation period that lasts a minimum of 12 months, where all teaching and administrative staff members are required to complete professional learning carried out by the IBO. A few years later, representatives from the IBO regional office visit the school to determine the school’s readiness to offer the program on a continuing basis. The visiting staff members consider their own evaluation of the school in conjunction with the school’s internal self-evaluation.

Those who have closely examined both internal and external forms of school accreditation recognise that it can offer support for schools striving towards an international educational philosophy; but many also see its drawbacks. Nevo (2001, p. 98) argues that the external accreditation process can be viewed as a way of ‘controlling’ schools. This can lead to uniformity, as it adds ‘commonalities to the uniqueness of the school’. Supporting this notion, Van Damme (2000, p. 15) argues that the accreditation processes at the global level can encourage ‘compliance to that standard of criteria and, hence, to uniformity and homogeneity’.

Although the accreditation process includes the self-evaluation component at the organisational level, it ‘encourages imitation’ (p. 345). In order to avoid homogeneity Fertig (2007, p. 344) suggests schools need to find a balance between the external accountability requirements and
Chapter 2: Literature review

the internal self-evaluation components of the accreditation process arguing that the accreditation process is a result of market conditions:

The distinguishing features of the international school context – the lack of public funding, the need to attract and retain parents and students in what can sometimes be a highly competitive market-place, and their often stand-alone organisational positioning – have, ironically, forced many into a more responsive and transparent desire to display the mark of ‘quality’ provided by the evaluative nature of school accreditation.

Murphy (1998, p. 216) concurs, further proposing that the international school accreditation process has become widespread to the extent that school communities are generally quite comforted to know that their school has passed the rigorous process of evaluation:

In addition more and more peripatetic parents are becoming familiar with the process of accreditation and are beginning to feel that placing their children in an unexamined school is a risk they do not wish to take.

Kyriakides and Campbell (2004) characterise the international school accreditation process as a way of providing quality assurance for parents. Collectively, these scholars link the accreditation process to the marketisation of schooling and a way of providing quality reassurance to the school community.

2.3 INTERNATIONAL MINDEDNESS

Literature on the history of international education suggests that as international education gained momentum over the twentieth century, education for values and attitudes that led to more of an international student profile became a greater focus. The focus for educators has shifted to embrace a curriculum and school culture that does more than merely encourage students to rub shoulders with students from different cultures:

The challenge of the new century is not to bring people of different cultures together, but to address some of the issues that arise when this happens on a daily, hourly, minute-by-minute basis, thanks to the impact of globalisation. (Walker 2007, p. 407)
Chapter 2: Literature review

The key issues that Walker (2007) argues schools need to address are:

- learning to live together in close proximity
- understanding the new realities of the global system itself
- living with and working with difference
- enjoying solving problems from different perspectives
- coping with and accepting cultural differences; and
- being open-minded to new efficient styles of work and institutions.

This view maintains that the role and significance of international education is to develop students with the knowledge, attitudes and skills they will need to confront these issues and other global problems that discount national boundaries to, in fact, develop international mindedness.

Hill (2007, p. 25) points to these reasons behind the term “international mindedness” becoming ‘a concept at the centre of international education’. However, this section illustrates that, in literature on international mindedness, a single narrative account which clearly defines international mindedness and explains developmental ways of developing it, does not exist.

Literature on international mindedness is a relatively new addition to educational discourse. Its appearance has grown considerably over the past fifteen years. For example, in Mary Hayden and Jeff Thompson’s edited book International education: principles and practice, published in 1998, the term “internationally minded” is used only once. Nine years later in The SAGE handbook of international education (Hayden, Levy & Thompson 2007) the term can be found 57 times. Shortly after, the first book titled International mindedness in education (Hurley 2008) was published. Growth in the number of journal articles devoted to international mindedness can also be seen over this time. This modest investigation suggests that this term has certainly gained interest in the field of international education over more recent years, supporting Walker’s (2007, p. 407) premise.
Chapter 2: Literature review


Contributing chapters from Skelton (2007), Gunesch (2007) and Haywood (2007) to The SAGE handbook of international education (Hayden, Levy & Thompson 2007) provide emerging ideas on the definition of international mindedness and some of the problems associated with creating ways of developing international mindedness. These authors’ contributions to the literature base on international mindedness will be discussed shortly, but what Skelton (2007), Gunesch (2007) and Haywood (2007) mainly propose is that the term “international mindedness” is poorly defined in literature and either needs clarification, explicit ways of developing it, or a shared agreement that it needs to be abolished altogether due to its lack of clarity.

Hurley’s (2008) recent research project on international mindedness, which was undertaken in an IB school in Egypt, suggests that teachers want clearer guidelines on how to develop it in students. Hurley (2008, p. 6) views international mindedness to be something under constant negotiation and construction. It is a term that opens up to different meanings, as everybody understands it in relation to their own unique life experience. For this reason, international mindedness should not have one definition because students and educational organisations will make their own sense of the term as they ‘constantly reconstruct their own versions of reality’. Hurley (2008, p. 129) concludes that this absence of a definition is causing teachers considerable frustration. It makes it difficult for teachers to understand ways of developing it:
Chapter 2: Literature review

‘Participants were quite frustrated with their school’s inability to implement, demonstrate, and perform international mindedness’. Hurley highlights that the term is a ‘slippery concept for the purposes of implementation and development in an educational setting’. She urges more research on the development of international mindedness, as: ‘a significant gap exists between theoretical thinking and actual school practice’. Hurley concludes that neither teachers nor students in her study had reflected on the notion of international mindedness and that most of the students and parents supported the school because of its academic rigour in traditional disciplines, combined with English as the language of instruction.

Gunesch (2007) and Marshall (2007) acknowledge the confusion in literature when defining international mindedness and hypothesise that this could be due to the sheer overabundance of terms now circulating in current literature on international education. Gunesch (2007, p. 91) argues that it is time to stop squabbling over terms and trying to further clarify “international mindedness” and its relationship to international education. He proposes that the term international mindedness be abolished altogether and replaced with the model of ‘cosmopolitanism as an alternative or complementary element’:

It may come as a surprise that within the literature on international education, there is no single coherent picture of the ‘internationalism’ or “international mindedness” within the individual that, presumably, international education aims to develop. Indeed, current concerns over international education appear to centre on definitions of the field and of international schools, the nature of an international curriculum...even those contributions that imply aims and outcomes of international education in terms of desirable developments and transformations in the individual learner contain remarkable little in terms of clarification and theorisation of their nature. (p. 90)

Literature around cosmopolitanism, the scope of which falls beyond the aims of this thesis, proposes that the notion of “cosmopolitanism” could provide engagement with different cultural identities and cultural issues within and outside the nation-state. However, the model of cosmopolitanism, like literature on the IB learner profile and other literature on international mindedness, lacks objectives and specific aims and expectations for students of different ages. Gunesch (2007, p. 96) acknowledges himself that cosmopolitanism ‘is only concerned with
Chapter 2: Literature review

cultural diversity’ – yet at the same time he states that ‘cosmopolitanism can soundly and emphatically inspire international education’s internationalism, now and in the future’ (p. 97).

Gunesch (2007) proposes that cosmopolitanism should be viewed as complementary to internationalism but his model leaves many quandaries. Through its strong focus on pluralism, it assumes a position taken to a political context and overlooks the influence that changes in attitude can have in restructuring social relations. Furthermore, given that cosmopolitanism needs to be understood as a term to be amalgamated with internationalism, ensuring educators understand two terms rather than one could be more problematic than understanding international mindedness alone. Furthermore, like the IB learner profile, his model of cosmopolitanism lacks empirical research on its implementation, outcomes and developmental stages – aspects he himself suggests are necessary in order to reduce frustration among teachers implementing it.

Skelton’s (2007) research on international mindedness is also theoretical but he combines theory with recent research by Gardener (see Gardner 1985). Skelton defines international mindedness as ‘a part of the continuum that represents the development of “self”’ and argues there are difficulties with children becoming internationally minded. His central concern is that international mindedness is ‘the most complex development of the relationship between “self” and “other”’ (p. 380) and as such, he proposes its development to be problematic. Skelton (2007, p. 382) states that ‘the development of international mindedness, then, is anything but straightforward...we need to see international mindedness as essentially problematic rather than straightforward’. He argues that its complexity is often overlooked by educators and that they typically comprehend international mindedness with too much optimism in hope that the frightening state of the world’s environment and conflict between nations will be solved if everyone becomes internationally minded. Although Skelton (2007) emphasises the difficulties of becoming internationally minded, he believes it would be very worthwhile to develop a more
Chapter 2: Literature review

sophisticated understanding of how to develop internationally minded children so that teachers and parents can understand it and take a more active part in the process.

Skelton (2007) draws from the work of Gardner (1981) to demonstrate the difficulties of children developing international mindedness. He argues that development is dependent on each child successfully moving from the egocentric stage to a sophisticated understanding of 'self'. He affirms that, until a child reaches this stage, they are not capable of understanding the interdependence and independence of humans at a global level. He offers five suggestions for schools aspiring to develop international mindedness. First, international mindedness needs to be understood as a complex term, so that students do not develop superficial understandings. Second, a deeper understanding of 'curricula that are deeper, more challenging and more related to the continuum of which international mindedness is a part' (p. 388) is necessary. Third, explicit learning outcomes are necessary, as well as realistic targets for students of different ages rather than one model that suits all ages – such as the IB learner profile. Fourth, students need to be scaffolded carefully so that they are not shocked when they experience the 'other' – communication between the teacher and each child plays an integral part in this process. Finally, all of these points need to be embraced at the whole-school level and teachers need to be 'willing to discuss difference in every aspect of school life' (p. 388). Skelton (2007, p. 388) also argues that more research is necessary that focuses on 'the development of curricula that are deeper, more challenging and more related to the continuum of which international mindedness is a part'.

Haywood (2007, p. 88) also appeals for a clearer definition of international mindedness. Haywood’s main concern is:

...to encourage deeper thinking about what we really mean by international mindedness. The term is often used generically in a way that diminishes meaning, but I still believe that it can become the central concept in helping us to determine what we really want international education to be about.
Chapter 2: Literature review

Haywood’s (2007) thesis argues that there is very little guidance on how the IB learner profile may manifest itself in students at different ages, as well as a lack of assessment and reporting guidelines in relation to ways students may demonstrate international mindedness. Twigg (2010, p. 41) agrees, suggesting that more research on international mindedness in schools offering the IBPYP is essential: ‘A gap in the research exists, especially in international schools that offer IBPYP’. In the absence of a clear definition or guidelines as to what international mindedness is, Haywood (2007, p. 80) cautions that teachers are left with no option but to make instinctive speculations as to what it might mean:

Regarding international mindedness, there seems to be a prevailing perception that “we know what we mean” even if the definition is still under construction...we cannot simply assume that “we know what we mean”...It is time that we face these issues and move towards identification of what our educational objectives should really be since the absence of a more articulate position is not helpful to schools or to students.

Ian Hill (2007), Deputy Director of the International Baccalaureate Organisation in Geneva states that the implementation of the IB learner profile is specified clearly in the IBO’s common program standards and practices. However, when discussing literature published by the IBO, Wylie (2007, p. 22) argues that ‘this literature is descriptive rather than critical, lacking a strong theoretical framework’. Haywood (2007) concurs, further claiming that literature by the IBO is not specific enough about how children of different ages can achieve the outcomes of the IB learner profile. This uses the assumption that anyone at any age can be internationally minded. Haywood (2007, p. 81) states:

The IBO has gone some way towards defining international mindedness through the ten attributes of the learner profile and international educators have become familiar with their generic aspirations. Even so, there is scant guidance on assessment and reporting and little formal basis for understanding precisely what outcomes each attribute will lead to or how the profile might be reflected in students at different stages of development through the program.

Haywood (2007) stresses that teachers need to understand that international mindedness is expressed in different ways among different people and urges educators to move beyond the IB learner profile into new ways of thinking about international mindedness. Central to his thesis
Chapter 2: Literature review

is the concept that international mindedness ‘is actually a multifaceted entity that can be represented in a wide variety of practical forms’ (Haywood 2007, p. 81). To this end, Haywood (2007) proposes a typology with broad categories representing some of the various ways in which international mindedness may be expressed: diplomatic international mindedness; political international mindedness; economic and commercial international mindedness; spiritual international mindedness; multicultural international mindedness; human rights international mindedness; pacifist international mindedness; humanitarian international mindedness; environmentalist international mindedness and globalisation and international mindedness.

Haywood (2007) asserts that his typology is not an exhaustive list of all possible ways that international mindedness can be recognised, but demonstrates that international mindedness can be represented in a variety of ways by different people and at different times. He stresses the need for students from different cultures to be encouraged to each come to their own realisation of international mindedness rather than teachers promoting one set way of being internationally minded:

The educator’s role is not to direct students towards a particular style of international mindedness, but is instead to encourage a predisposition towards international mindedness in general that will allow students to develop their own responses and channels of expression...there can be many distinct ways of educating for international mindedness. We must not be limited by our current cultural conditions but neither must we promote any single model for international learning as universal in relevance or as superior to other forms. (Haywood 2007, pp. 85–6)

Haywood (2007) assumes a close link between international mindedness and international education and believes that, by getting closer to understanding what the term “international mindedness” means, the objectives of international education will become clearer. However, to draw any significant conclusions from Haywood’s (2007) thesis one would need to investigate if his ideas actually reflect school practice. With only the conclusions from Hurley’s (2008) study to verify his supposition, his thesis requires further verification at a practical level.
Chapter 2: Literature review

Conclusions drawn from a recent Masters in Education project on international mindedness (Cause 2008) support Haywood’s (2007) and Hurley’s (2008) view of international mindedness, as its findings suggest that international mindedness is expressed differently in different people:

International-mindedness can be articulated or expressed slightly differently and different priorities may be given to different attributes of international mindedness that may affect the ways in which different people demonstrate international mindedness. Therefore, it is not the teacher’s role to indoctrinate the teacher’s own understanding of international mindedness. Rather, educators need to be open-minded to variations of the interpretation of international mindedness and must not promote their own interpretation of the attributes or values of international mindedness as the only acceptable way of being internationally minded. (Cause 2009, p. 13)

However, the project did not pinpoint any explicit and developmental curriculum, assessment or pedagogical processes that may influence the development of international mindedness – areas currently lacking in research. Nor did the initial project focus deeply on teachers’ understandings of the development of international mindedness, as this particular project does.

Overall, the literature on international mindedness suggests that teachers working towards developing internationally minded students are confused and lack guidance. This suggests that some guidance is necessary, but too much guidance may force students into expressing international mindedness in a way that is “homogenised” or not natural to them (Haywood 2007). With the significant gap in research on international mindedness, literature focusing on it appears to be developing an ‘acceptance’ that international mindedness is too complex to describe. This idea is most evident in the recent discussion on cosmopolitanism – Gunesch (2004, 2007) opting to introduce a new term to replace the terms that have been poorly defined. The risk is that the uncertainty over ways to develop international mindedness may well lead one to think it cannot be achieved. Clearly, further research is necessary before educators can move towards understanding ways of developing international mindedness.
Chapter 2: Literature review

2.3.1 INTERNATIONALLY MINDED SCHOOLS

Most scholars in the field agree that the topic of international mindedness is related to the topics of international education and international schools (Hayden & Thompson 1995a; Heyward 2002; Hurley 2008; Marshall 2007) – but this should not imply that scholars view international mindedness as dependent on the international school context. Hill (2000), Skelton, (2002), Hayden and Thompson (1995a), Haywood (2007) and Walker (2007) all agree that international mindedness is not exclusively developed in the international school. International mindedness may well be related to an international school or a school that embraces an international educational philosophy, but it is certainly not contingent on it. In fact, Gellar (2000) states that schools which do not necessarily label themselves "international schools” could be described as internationally minded schools if they think, act and plan with international mindedness.

Snowball’s (2007, 2009) conception of international education and an internationally minded school concurs with Gellar’s view. She highlights the significant role that teachers play in building an internationally minded school and internationally minded students. Snowball (2009, p. 16) claims that schools need internationally minded teachers who can ‘manage the multitude of intercultural interactions that are typical in an international school’ (p. 16). Simply placing students from different cultures together and expecting international mindedness to develop by itself is not enough. Metaphorically referring to teachers as ‘bridge-builders’ (p. 16), Snowball argues that an international education does not develop internationally minded students simply by having the word “international” in its title, but it can provide a great starting point: 'International education per se is not a bridge to intercultural understanding, merely the building site on which the bridge can be built’ (p. 16). Teachers build the bridge by laying down successful intercultural bridges through knowledge, skills and understandings (Snowball 2009). Hayden and Thompson (1998a) and Bagnall (1997b) support this notion.
Chapter 2: Literature review

Hill (2007) views the fundamental philosophy of the IB to be one of developing internationally minded students. He claims that the establishment of the IB is the biggest step forward in developing internationally minded schools in the history of international education. Education for international mindedness, Hill (2007) argues, could well replace the term “international education” as it puts more of a focus on the outcomes of the learning experience rather than the process (Hill 2000). He proposes that the IB programs seek to do just this (2007).

However, Pearce (1998, p. 45) argues that all curricula are normative – it is how a curriculum is implemented that makes a school internationally minded:

What is variable in one country is uniform in another; what matters in one country is insignificant elsewhere. Among national educational cultures a universal formula in which the observer simply fills in the blanks is attractive but unfeasible.

When discussing the complexities of cultivating an internationally minded school, Pearce (2009) questions just how universal values actually are. He draws from different disciplines (history, philosophy, anthropology and psychology) to consider how one can claim that certain values are universal. He argues that every person sees values differently and interprets and prioritises them according to their own perceptions and life experience. In the context of Pearce’s thesis, one could question the ways in which values are interpreted and experienced among teachers and students at different schools – could an internationally minded school be described as one in which universal values are successfully interpreted by students? How might a school work towards this goal?

Gellar (2000, p. 31) states that an internationally minded school explicates an unambiguous statement of universal values, a unified commitment to compassion, tolerance, peace and justice, and that this is embedded as an explicit and essential part of the program and school culture. He asserts that the whole school needs to be committed to universal values:

International schools, even those offering an IB program, can and do get by without the need to wrestle with or even debate the need for universal values, but internationally minded schools cannot.
Chapter 2: Literature review

Allen (2000) states that in the internationally minded school, nationalism is not viewed as opposed to internationalism. Internationally minded schools promote internationalism through fostering the skills necessary to create greater political and economic cooperation yet at the same time these schools acknowledge the fact that there are boundaries between nation-states and so nationalism still plays a part. In this sense, nationalism plays an important role in internationalising the educational experience and building a school with an internationally minded culture.

In summary, scholars agree that an internationally minded school promotes and acknowledges different cultures from around the world, rather than only the cultural norms and traditions of a home country. It acknowledges and celebrates diversity and differences between nations and promotes the notion that diversity is preferable. The aim of this research is to explore what teachers themselves might think international mindedness might mean. Analysing the development of international mindedness at the school level will help to clarify the concept.

2.4 Conclusion

Analysis reveals a dearth of literature related to what international mindedness is and how to develop it. It appears that many scholars who have contributed to this literature lack evidence to support their proposals. What this small literature base needs is research producing emerging ideas that deal with the issues and concerns arising about the notion and the development of international mindedness, even if this only means clearly underscoring the difficulties in providing answers.

Although the literature on international mindedness has only grown in recent years, it provides a useful base to refer to in the analysis of data for this project. Only a handful of case studies offer in-depth insights into the nature of international education (Wylie 2007) or international mindedness (Cause 2008; Hurley 2008). More case studies are essential in order for it to offer rich understandings which can contribute to this emerging field of study. More research
Chapter 2: Literature review

Contributing to the literature base of international mindedness would allow connections to be made, enabling the existing, fragmented and ambiguous ideas on international mindedness to become constructive key emerging ideas.

In this way, by using Hayden's (1998) metaphorical phrase, slightly more of what lies under the tip of the iceberg can be exposed, closing some of the gaps in research on international mindedness. In the following chapter, the Bernstein's work as the basis of this thesis will be discussed.
3 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The theoretical foundation underpinning this single case study is Bernstein's (2000b) code theory. Fundamentally, Bernstein’s code theory examines the general principles underlying the transformation of knowledge into pedagogic communication. His theory takes into account the actual relay of pedagogic communication – not solely the ideological and philosophical intentions of the school or curriculum imposed. This chapter will begin by briefly outlining the main principles of Bernstein’s code theory. Following will be a discussion on how his theory provided the foundation for this project. Key concepts used in the analysis of this research such as “recontextualising”, “classification” and “framing” will then be defined.

3.1 BERNSTEIN’S CODE THEORY

Bernstein (1975, p. 85) proposes that education is the primary social classifier in society through the three message systems that all schools around the globe have in common: curriculum, pedagogy and evaluation (assessment):

Formal education knowledge can be considered to be realised through three message systems: curriculum, pedagogy, and evaluation. Curriculum defines what counts as a valid knowledge, pedagogy defines what counts as a valid transmission of knowledge, and evaluation defines what counts as a valid realisation of this knowledge.

The school and the teacher control what knowledge is to be learnt and what values and attitudes are acceptable through the way in which knowledge is selected, interpreted and transferred through the three message systems. Through the decisions a teacher makes on what, when and how to teach and evaluate students, each student’s identity and essentially, their intuitive and practical views of the world are formed. In this way, Bernstein (2000b), like Bourdieu (1974, 1979, 1991), views the school as the main site where cultural reproduction and production takes place and where power relations are established: ‘…pedagogic discourse...is a carrier of power relations external to the school, a carrier of patterns of dominance with respect to class, patriarchy, race (Bernstein 2000b, p. 4).
Central to his analysis is power and control. Power can be distinguished from control in that it defines the *boundaries* that a school creates between different categories such as age, gender and the hierarchy of subjects studied (Mathematics, Science and so on). 'Power always operates on the relations *between* categories...power establishes legitimate relations or order' (Bernstein 2000b, p. 5 italics in original). Control, on the other hand, defines the *carrier* of these relationships. It legitimates the forms of communication which separate the categories. In this way, 'control is double faced for it carries both the power of reproduction and the potential for its change' (p. 5). Power creates relations between categories and control constructs relations within categories. Although both power and control operate in different ways within the school to produce power relations, both contribute to each other’s operation. Both power and control differentially distribute different knowledges and their possibilities to different social groups.

However, relations of power and control are disguised in the school by appearing neutral, albeit not inherent possibilities for resistance, as argued above. Bernstein (2000b, p. xxii) argues:

> The school disguises and masks the way power relations, external to the school, produce the hierarchies of knowledge, possibility and value within the school. In disconnecting its own hierarchies from external hierarchies, the school legitimises inequalities between social groups deriving from differential school attainments.

Bernstein (2000b, p. xxiii) proposes 'that the trick whereby the school disconnects the hierarchy of success internal to the school from social class hierarchies external to the school is by creating a mythological discourse'. Mythological discourses within the school essentially arrange society because they produce, legitimise and reproduce hierarchies of class, race, gender and culture. In this way, Bernstein (2000b) argues that the way in which control carries and changes the boundary relations of power through the three message systems is what determines the life chances and educational fate of students.

Mythological discourses may be seen disguising relations of power and control through a school’s rituals. Through rituals such as school assemblies, competitions, awards, rewards,
Chapter 3: Theoretical framework

discipline systems and school groups (such as bands and sporting groups), students learn what
the school values and they learn ways in which to be accepted in the school:

What the school does, its rituals, its ceremonies, its authority relations, its
stratification, its procedures for learning, its incentives, rewards and punishments, its
very image of conduct, character and manner, can modify or change the pupil’s role.
(Bernstein 1975, pp. 48–9)

Through incentives, rituals, rewards and punishments, students learn that success is given to
children that “deserve” it. As students achieve different positions related to a particular
proficiency, this has important socialising consequences. Effectively, relations of power and
control, concealed through mythological discourses, differentiate student success and symbolise
the social order to come. This makes the school ‘a highly bureaucratic organisation’ and ‘a
major instrument of the division of labour through its control over the occupational fate of its
pupils’ (Bernstein 1975, p. 63).

3.2 Bernstein and this project

This project explored how teachers in Diamond Primary School understand and actually
construct curriculum, pedagogy and assessment to influence or impede the development of
international mindedness. Any IB school can claim to promote internationally minded values,
but according to Bernstein (2000b), the way in which power and control are translated through
the three message systems of the school paradoxically works at maintaining, integrating and
ultimately controlling a hegemonic value system favouring the dominant class – which may not
equate to international mindedness.

Although educational chances have improved in terms of gender and class opportunities, in
many schools (and this varies from place to place) race or culture continues to be a major
regulator of unequal student learning outcomes and social chances. This project inquired into
how these discourses were considered and dealt with in relation to international mindedness at
Chapter 3: Theoretical framework

Diamond Primary School. It explored what dominant values may support or undermine the aims and development of international mindedness at Diamond Primary School.

This project made the assumption that if social actors are developed in schools through the three message systems as Bernstein (2000b, p. xix) proposes, then these would also be the message systems that deliver international mindedness. If:

biases in the form, content, access and opportunities of education have consequences not only for the economy [and] read down to drain the very springs of affirmation, motivation and imagination,

then international mindedness must also be able to be produced in the educational organisation – seeping down into the very heart of a developing child’s imagination, affirmation and motivation.

Exploring the three message systems ensured the focus was on how teachers interpret and construct the Primary Years Program (PYP) and Victorian Essential Learning Standards (VELS) to try and develop international mindedness. This is because, when a curriculum moves from one place to the other, it changes. Certain things within the curriculum become selectively prioritised, diminished, emphasised, overlooked or silenced. As Bernstein (2000b) argues, any curriculum is normative – it is how the curriculum is implemented, sustained and constructed that affects the nature of pedagogic knowledge. Without implementation – teaching and learning – there is no curriculum, assessment or pedagogy.

All too often, studies explore the intentions or content of the curriculum, ignoring the actual “relay” itself. As Bernstein (2000b, p. 25) argues: ‘most studies have studied only what is carried or relayed, they do not study the constitution of the relay itself’. This project focuses on the relay, which refers to the process, method or manner in which international mindedness may be interpreted, transferred or impeded through curriculum, assessment and pedagogy – not solely what is proposed to be transmitted or the goals or end product.
Chapter 3: Theoretical framework

The three message systems will be referred to throughout this thesis in order to illuminate the control relations that carry and construct relations of power at Diamond Primary School. For now, further concepts of Bernstein's theory on which the research draws will be discussed, as his theory involves some concepts which require further explanation.

3.2.1 RECONTEXTUALISING

Bernstein's term "recontextualising field" refers to the arena where pedagogic identities and discourses are constructed through relations of power and control. There are two main types of recontextualising fields: the pedagogic recontextualising field and the official recontextualising field. The pedagogic recontextualising field refers to the arena within the school – the place where pedagogic discourse is created and constructed by selectively refocusing, relocating and endorsing curriculum, pedagogical and assessment practices. The power that teachers, leaders, parents and students have over this process varies considerably from school to school, but in all cases, pedagogic identities are constructed through all pedagogical practices of the pedagogic recontextualising field. The main agents who perform this function are the teachers and school leaders through the "regulative" and "instructional" discourses of the school. The regulative discourse defines 'the rules of social order' (Bernstein 2000b, p. 13). It is the dominant discourse of the school. The instructional discourse ‘creates specialised skills and their relationship to each other’ (p. 32). It defines the taught curriculum as well as assessment practices of the school.

The instructional discourse is embedded in the regulative discourse. The following diagram illustrates this as follows:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Instructional discourse} \\
\quad = \text{Pedagogic practices} \\
\text{Regulative discourse}
\end{align*}
\]

In this way, both the regulative and instructional discourses are not distinct discourses operating in isolation of each other. Rather, both are intricately connected. What connects both
Chapter 3: Theoretical framework

the regulative and instructional discourse to result in pedagogic practices, is power relations (Bernstein 2000b). As Bernstein (2000b, p. 32) emphasises:

Most researchers are continually studying the two [regulative and instructional discourse], or thinking as if there are two: as if education is about values on the one hand, and about competence on the other. However, power relations are determined by ethical, social and political decisions; the intercultural nature of social relationships; and, the way in which the school and individual teachers selectively transmit, interpret and prioritise content, values and attitudes through the regulative and instructional discourse. A child’s identity is shaped and regulated according to these power relations.

The "official recontextualising field" refers to the recontextualising field outside of the school that attempts to control the pedagogic recontextualising field. This can often be the state curriculum authority or national curriculum standards. The pedagogic recontextualising field of a school is created by the way in which teachers interpret, construct and implement the official recontextualising field into a manageable pedagogy within the reality of the school’s operations. The strength of control that the official recontextualising field has over the pedagogic recontextualising field of any school varies from state to state and country to country but, in schools that report to a national or state curriculum, the social context and construction of pedagogic discourse are to some degree determined by the official recontextualising field. Any position of the recontextualising field can be examined at three analytically distinguished levels: author, actor and identity. These terms are used in the analysis to analyse and describe the recontextualisation of the PYP and VELS at Diamond Primary School: authors – the writers of VELS and the PYP; the actors – school leaders and teachers at Diamond Primary School; and identities – constructions of identities formed through the recontextualising field, or the outcomes of pedagogical specialisations constructed, distributed and reproduced through the three message systems.
Chapter 3: Theoretical framework

In Diamond Primary School, the official recontextualising field is represented by the Department of Early Education and Childhood Development (DEECD) which dictates that the school, being a part of the Victorian government school system, must report to VELS. As discussed in the introduction, because the school also decided to implement the PYP, there are two authorial origins affecting the discourse of the school, VELS and the PYP, or the Department of Education and Early Childhood Development (DEECD) and the IBO. Bernstein (2000b) proposes that in schools where both the pedagogic recontextualising field and the official recontextualising field exist (which is the case for government schools), there will be some degree of autonomy and struggle over school practices and pedagogic discourse. These may work together as complementary positions or they may contest each other and struggle for dominance.

Diamond Primary School represents the pedagogic recontextualising field where the PYP and VELS (two official recontextualising fields) are distributed, constructed and essentially re-constructed. In doing so, pedagogical identities become changed and produced. Exploring the recontextualising field of Diamond Primary School allowed the conceptual convergence of the PYP and the consequences of recontextualising the PYP and VELS to be opened up and examined. This illuminated the ways in which VELS and the internationally minded intentions of the PYP may complement or oppose each other. How this recontextualisation affects the development of international mindedness was the focus.

In summary, when a curriculum moves from one place to the other, it is recontextualised as it is inevitable that a transformation will take place as it is transferred from the state curriculum authorities (or world authorities, in the case of the IBO), to the school, to the teacher and then to the student. At the school level, it may merge with another pedagogical framework. As every context is different, so every recontextualisation is different. Ideology shapes this process and then ideology becomes shaped by the student when he or she appropriates the discourse. Essentially, this is describing the relay of pedagogic discourse. Utilising this theory for this
Chapter 3: Theoretical framework

project involved focusing on the three message systems. It allowed focus on the actual transformation of international mindedness from the official recontextualising field to the pedagogic recontextualising field of Diamond Primary School.

3.2.2 Classification and Framing

Bernstein (1971, 2000b) introduced the terms “classification” and “framing” to define the translation of power and control relations. The terms provide a means of understanding and describing the varying ways in which the three message systems can be constructed in the pedagogic recontextualising field. In this project, the concepts of classification and framing illuminate the effects that interactions, boundaries, timing, place, pacing, selection and organisation of elements within the message systems have on the development of international mindedness, since the way in which the three message systems are constructed is what creates student identities.

3.2.2.1 Classification

Bernstein (2000b) argues that dominant power relations construct boundaries between groups or categories. The term “classification” examines the relationship between the boundaries and the strength of degree in which categories are kept apart. It refers to ‘the means by which power relations are transformed into specialised discourses’ (p. xvii). As Bernstein (1971, p. 49; emphasis in original) illustrates:

Where classification is strong, contents are well insulated from each other by strong boundaries. Where classification is weak, there is reduced insulation between contents, for the boundaries between contents are weak or blurred. Classification thus refers to the degree of boundary maintenance between contents.

In the educational organisation, classification can refer to the degree of boundary maintained between subject content, but it can also refer to other aspects such as playground areas, assessment strategies, relationships or classrooms. In a school where subject contents are taught in isolation from each other (i.e. Science is clearly distinct from English; Mathematics is
Chapter 3: Theoretical framework

clearly distinct from other subject areas), there is a strong degree of boundary between each discipline, and so, the classification can be described as strong.

Classification can also be referred to within subject areas. For example, classification can be described as weak where a teacher focuses on different reading skills at the same time, such as looking for picture cues and comprehension. Strong classification rules may occur in the class where a teacher assesses several reading skills as separate entities. In this way, classification can vary within the context of one lesson. There can be strong classification over the subject content taught in the class but, where teachers may rotate classrooms to teach within that subject, there can be weak classification depending on the teacher’s delivery of the content. Playgrounds may be strongly classified in a school where certain year levels are each designated their own play area. In some schools, students are able to mingle anywhere in the school grounds regardless of age; in these cases, the playground area of the school can be described as weakly classified.

By analysing the degree of boundary between elements in a school, the educational researcher can be enlightened as to how power relations are produced and reproduced through the three message systems to construct differential categories (Cause 2010a). In the context of this thesis, the concept of classification is used to examine how Diamond Primary School teachers interpret and construct the PYP and VELS. From exploring the strength of boundaries between aspects of the school such as VELS, the PYP and subjects within, relations of power could be explored. This helped to examine the ways in which teachers understand international mindedness and the ways in which the construction of curriculum, assessment and pedagogy may influence or impede the development of international mindedness.

3.2.2.2 Framing

The concept of "framing" is used to examine the different forms of communication constructed in any pedagogic practice. It refers to the controls on communication between any pedagogic relation such as the teacher and the student, the teacher and the parent, or between school
Chapter 3: Theoretical framework

leaders and teachers. It helps to understand ‘the degree of control teacher and pupil possess over the selection, organisation, pacing, and timing of knowledge transmitted and received in the pedagogical relationship’ (Bernstein 1971, p. 50).

In the school, the principle of classification defines the boundary *between* subjects whereas the principle of framing defines *how* meanings in the classroom are constructed and made public and the nature of the social relationships experienced. Using an example of classroom use, it may refer to the relationship between the teacher and the student and the degree of autonomy each person has in that relationship with regard to what the learner has access to, when content is taught, how that content is prioritised and the physiological and environmental factors in which the learning takes place (Bernstein 2000b).

Framing can also refer to the timing of curriculum content delivery in the sense of what content is taught, when and what takes priority. Analysing the strength of framing in an educational organisation can help illuminate the power that particular agencies have over what, when and how knowledge is learnt. Through the strength of framing, students learn what questions can be asked and when and what is more valuable. For example, in a classroom where students are only allowed to speak at a certain time, the framing could be described as strong. However, the same classroom may have weak framing when students exert autonomy over when they can complete tasks. Bernstein (1975, p. 9) claims that ‘the student learns that only certain kinds of questions can be put at any one time, and the teacher learns to provide a certain kind of answer. Thus as frame strength over pacing changes, so does answering and questioning behaviour’.

For the educational researcher, one can draw from Bernstein’s concept of framing to illuminate the effects that control has on influencing the construction of power relations (Cause 2010a).

Where there is strong classification and strong framing between subjects of the curriculum, the curriculum can be described as a ‘collection code’ (Bernstein 1975, p. 91). Where there is weak classification and weak framing, the curriculum can be described as an ‘integrated code’ (p. 93). The intention of VELS and PYP are both supportive of weak classification through their
interdisciplinary integration and focus on the child as an inquirer; but how both programs are relayed determines the actual strength of classification and framing. 

The terms “framing” and “classification” are ‘at the heart of Bernstein’s theory’ (Belle-Isle 1986, p. 14). Exploring the strength of framing and classification helped to analyse the curriculum, pedagogy and assessment of Diamond Primary School as it attempted to foster international mindedness. Specifically, it helped highlight the ways in which international mindedness may have been prioritised, legitimatised, forgotten about or silenced; and how it was controlled, interpreted and implemented in the recontextualising field of Diamond Primary School. As Bernstein (2000b, p. 80) argues, ‘there is nothing intrinsic about how educational time is used, or the status of the various contents or the relation between the contents’.

3.2.3 Bernstein’s Critics

 Bernstein has his critics, which is worth addressing here. Bernstein’s (1975, 2000b) code theory is considered by some to be too complex and difficult to understand. Atkinson (2007, p. 37) argues: ‘his ideas do not translate easily into simple formulae. They demand serious attention’. This could be one of the reasons many researchers avoid using his theory as a theoretical foundation for research.

Pring (1975) questions the structure of Bernstein’s theory, stating that his categories are simple dichotomies – although anyone who views his work as simple dichotomies rather than conflicting forms is overlooking the range of realisations that his concepts embrace. Gibson (1977) questions the whole applicability of his theory, claiming that it is far too ambiguous to the point that its operational levels fail. Walford (1994, p. 118) agrees, and further argues that the recent developments of Bernstein’s earlier theories (see Bernstein 1971, 1975; 1990) are difficult to understand and:

virtually unreadable, and the complexity is such that the original illuminative nature of the concepts has been obscured. The opacity of Bernstein’s writing is also partly responsible for the continued criticism to which it has been subjected. In fact, since the
original formulation, criticisms appear to have been more plentiful than examples of use.

Bernstein’s code theory is indeed complex and at times, difficult to read. However, for the researcher who has the energy and time necessary to understand Bernstein’s work, his literature and empirical research provide a unique and very convincing insight into the ways society reproduces difference and social status through the relationships of the distribution of power, class relations and the principles of control. As Cambridge (2010, p. 211) observes: ‘Bernstein’s theories...offer an heuristic framework for the development of further research questions in this field’. For the purpose of this particular study, his theory provided a framework from which to describe the ways in which teachers understand international mindedness and its development.

3.3 CONCLUSION

Essentially, using Bernstein's theory allowed power relationships to be brought into focus so that significant influences in the shaping of knowledge could be examined, distinguishing rather than dichotomising different transmission structures. It brought into analysis the ways in which a teacher may influence the development of international mindedness through analysing relations of power and control transmitted through pedagogy, assessment and curriculum. The following chapter discusses the rationale and reasons for selecting particular research methodologies in light of the case at Diamond Primary School.
Chapter 4: Methodology

4 METHODOLOGY

4.1 INTRODUCTION

One of the most important steps in carrying out a successful research project is choosing the methodology that best suits the research questions. The qualitative case study methodology was the most appropriate research approach for this project because case study research allows for a deep understanding of complex issues. Using the case study research approach helped define a detailed account of teachers’ understandings of international mindedness and its development. Case study enables the researcher to put him or herself ‘in the place of others’ (Crotty 1998, p. 8) through allowing the researcher to deal with the ‘language, communication, interrelationships and community’ (p. 8) of human behaviour.

International mindedness is not a single concept that can be understood or described within an objective reality or something that can be quantified or controlled. Hurley (2008, p. 54) claims that it is ‘a conceptual construct in the minds of individuals involved in dialogues already in progress’. Therefore, investigating teachers’ understandings of international mindedness and its development required more than analysing simple surveys – it required engaging with teachers in conversations about the ways in which they understand international mindedness and its development. Case studies are useful when describing and understanding complex contexts and situations and providing down-to-earth explanations (Stake 1995). As Eriksson and Kovalainen (2008, p. 116) argue: ‘One reason for the popularity of case study research is its ability to present complex and hard-to-grasp ... issues in an accessible, vivid, personal, and down-to-earth format’.

Case study research helped open up ‘the complexities of the situation [international mindedness]...the fact that not one but many factors contribute to it’ (Merriam 2001, p. 30). This is because case study research:
Chapter 4: Methodology

allows the researcher to concentrate on a...situation and to identify, or attempt to identify, the various interactive processes at work. These processes...may be crucial to the success or failure of systems or organisations. (Bell 1999, p. 11)

In this project, it allowed the complex understandings teachers may have of international mindedness and its development to be revealed and examined.

4.2 CASE STUDY RESEARCH

Stake (1995) claims case study research can serve several purposes in the social sciences, depending on the interests of the researcher. For example, he claims the objective of a case study can focus on trying to understand one particular case, a number of different cases, or a general problem. Hence, Stake (1995) illustrates three main types of case study research: intrinsic, instrumental and collective.

“Intrinsic case study” refers to research where the researcher has an intrinsic interest in one case and wants ‘to catch the complexity of a single case’ (Stake 1995, p. xi). An example of intrinsic case study is when a researcher decides to research a student having difficulties. The student is the case, in whom the researcher is intrinsically interested. By studying the student as the case, the researcher can gain information to create a rich description of that particular case (Guba & Lincoln 1999).

In “instrumental case study”, the researcher has a particular inquiry of which she or he wishes to gain a deeper understanding. The researcher studies the case, examining the complex and specific details of interaction within the context of the case in order to gain a deeper insight. One example could be a researcher who seeks to understand effective ways of assessing spelling. The researcher may choose one or a number of teachers as his or her case(s) to study. The researcher looks at the teaching, but focuses more on exploring the ways in which the teacher assesses spelling. The use of the case in this example is to understand ways of assessing spelling through the case. In the situation of an instrumental case study of a school, the researcher may choose more than one teacher as the case – either from the one school setting or
Chapter 4: Methodology

from several schools – but the primary goal is to understand each case in order to understand the main inquiry (Stake 1995).

When more than one case is involved, it is known as “collective case study”. Although the aim of collective case study is still to gain an in-depth understanding of each case, even by analysing several cases it would be unlikely for the case study researcher to gain a compelling representation for generalising the findings. For example, even if three schools are chosen within the same city, the description or findings remain limited in their applicability to other settings in the city and other points in time (Stake 1995). However, while its description may be limited in its applicability, when enough data is gathered, the researcher can create a deep and rich description of the case or phenomenon being inquired into.

Whether the case study is of instrumental interest or intrinsic interest, the researcher puts aside all presumptions and enters the case study with a genuine interest in learning about how the case functions through its natural environment either because she or he needs to learn about that particular case, or because the case helps him or her to understand phenomena through understanding the case. As Naumes and Naumes (1999, p. 59) assert, case study research helps the researcher to gain knowledge of a complex phenomenon because:

...the researcher can get into the minds of socially interactive human beings who are interacting within their real-life context. It is ideal for investigating and describing an actual situation in a realistic setting.

After all, much of what is not known to one person may have been observed by another. Obtaining a rich description of the case helps discover and portray the multiple viewpoints of the case, helping the researcher to understand the phenomenon being inquired into. In the field of education, the case of interest may be a school, program, child, classroom or teacher. Stake (1995, p. 2) argues that it ‘is a specific, a complex, functioning thing’ and ‘one among others’. Whether the case study is conducted over one single day or an entire year, for the duration of
Chapter 4: Methodology

the case study, the researcher’s main concern is on understanding details and complexities of that case or cases from the participant’s viewpoint.

However, the social surroundings of the case also remain an important aspect of study, as these help in understanding contextual aspects of the case. For this reason, it is vital that the case study researcher carefully considers the function of the case in the project at the beginning of any case study (Schostak 2002; Stake 1978, 1995; Yin 1994). This involves explicitly defining what is and is not the case.

4.3 Design

In this project, a case study served more of an instrumental interest: Diamond Primary School was the case with ten teacher informants located in the school to help understand what international mindedness means to them and how they believe it may be developed. Interviewing informants provided a rich description of each teacher’s understanding of international mindedness and how teachers believe it can best be developed. Observing informants teach and interact in various school activities allowed for deeper understanding of responses in the interviews.

Individual teachers in the study were viewed as complex units of analysis or, as Smith and Henry (1999) and Stake (1995) so well define, a ‘bounded system’ (p. 2) – someone who was interacting with other people through symbols, language, structures, behaviours, values and relationships. Each teacher was understood as a construction of the relationships with these phenomena, as well as with events and activities that surrounded each informant: ‘To study a complex [case] is to study the possibilities for structuring, the possibilities for interaction, for social meanings, for restructuring’ (Schostak 2002, p. 23). Holistic treatment of issues surrounding each informant ensured the focus remained on providing an accurate, rich description of some of the real issues unique to the development of international mindedness in the context of Diamond Primary School.
Chapter 4: Methodology

Holistic treatment of issues surrounding each informant also provided an authentic, rich description of how teachers actively construct curriculum, assessment and pedagogy. Bernstein (2000b) views the school as the fundamental site in which different categories of culture, class, gender and race are reproduced and produced. It is the place where knowledge systems become part of a child’s consciousness to create specific identities. Bernstein (2000b) argues that observing and analysing the ways in which the three message systems are constructed in the school helps to understand how identities are constructed and categories are reproduced and produced. Observing teachers construct curriculum, assessment and pedagogy and discussing with teachers their views on the three message systems allowed for focus on how international mindedness is actually constructed. It allowed for analysis of the actual forms of communication which influence or impede the development of international mindedness.

4.3.1 Data Collection

The collection of data started on the 28 September 2009 and ceased on the 31 May 2010. The main source of data collected was through semi-structured interviews held with nine teachers and one school leader. Focusing primarily on teachers helped to gain an in-depth understanding of what Diamond Primary School teachers think international mindedness is; how they believe it can be developed through Bernstein’s three message systems; and how they believe it is actually impeded through the three message systems.

Interview data were supported by observing each informant teach and general observations made of school meetings, assemblies and other activities (field notes), and informal document analysis. As Bernstein (2000b, p. 4) argues, the inner logic of pedagogic discourse and its practices can only be understood by ‘analysing the forms of communication which bring this about…the rules of its construction, circulation and contextualisation’. Interviews, observations and document analysis allowed for understanding and immersion in how curriculum, assessment and pedagogy are constructed, circulated, contextualised and changed in order to develop international mindedness.
4.3.1.1 Semi-Structured Interviews
In total, nine classroom teachers were interviewed twice and the school leader was interviewed once. The goal was to understand what each informant understands about the notion of international mindedness, its development, and how they experience trying to develop it through the three message systems. Interview questions were issue-oriented and open-ended (see Appendix B), and interviewees were encouraged to feel relaxed enough so that they could express their own experiences and unsolicited personal opinions on all questions and topics raised. They were assured that there were no right or wrong answers to any of the questions, as it was important to encourage each teacher's unique point of view on the questions posed.

Interview questions were designed on the basis of a review of the literature on the development of international mindedness. The semi-structured nature of the interviews allowed for changes in the order of questions when necessary, to assist with the flow of the interview and to unearth maximum information about the main research questions. This also allowed for follow-up when teachers took tangents to responses that were pertinent to understanding the main research questions.

The interviewing process lasted until there was ample data to address each research question. The length of each interview varied according to the number of emergent issues that arose in the interview. The shortest interview lasted for 60 minutes, and the longest one was 120 minutes. Interviews were tape-recorded and then transcribed the day after each interview. The transcription and recording of each interview were given to each teacher within two days of the interview for feedback. Each teacher was invited to check the recording and transcription for accuracy and add or edit the information in order to convey exactly what they wanted to say. Only one teacher modified their transcript by adding some extra information post-interviews.

4.3.1.2 Observations (field notes)
The first interviews were followed up by a full day observing each informant teach and this was maintained once each month for the duration of the research period. Eight out of the possible ten teachers were observed, as the school leader did not teach a class and one teacher
Chapter 4: Methodology

participant requested not to be observed. Observing informants enriched understandings of interview data. It allowed for a richer understanding of how Diamond Primary School teachers embrace and attempt to construct international mindedness through the three message systems as it allowed immersion in the place where teachers were actually assessing and teaching students. As Cambridge and Carthew (2007, p. 294) argue, one way to explore international mindedness in a school is ‘to find ways of looking at how the engine performs while it is in motion’. Being directly in the setting where informants were teaching enabled authentic exploration of the main research questions.

When observing, focus was on maintaining the natural setting in the classroom or area of observation so that relevant issues, problems and situations could tell their own story. The context of the environment surrounding each teacher was regarded as an important aspect of all observations, as relevant interactions between each teacher and his or her students enabled a richer understanding of how each teacher develops international mindedness.

When observing each teacher, an observation table was used (see Appendix A). Observing teachers by using an observation table with explicit questions ensured focus remained on understanding the main research questions in relation to Bernstein’s (2000b) theory. This also helped when categorising the data in preparation for the analysis. In this way, once triangulated and analysed closely with Bernstein’s theory and current and relevant literature, the findings presented data directly related to understanding each research question, through the lens of Bernstein’s theory.

Referring to the IB learner profile helped illuminate how teachers regard the IB’s model of international mindedness, and how they transfer it through the three message systems – an area currently under-represented in research. This should not imply that the project viewed one set definition of international mindedness or that international mindedness can be measured through simple lists of protocol. Haywood (2007) emphasises the importance of remaining open-minded to variations of ways in which international mindedness is understood
Chapter 4: Methodology

and can be expressed. Hence, other notes were also recorded that were believed to be important to understanding how teachers understood and taught international mindedness.

Finally, it is essential to be aware of the dangers of bias and prejudice in observations. Although no research is totally objective, Bell (1999, p. 158) cautiously notes that observations are often criticised as being particularly biased and subjective:

Participant observers are well aware of the dangers of bias...Whether your observation is structured or unstructured and whether you are observing as a participant or a non-participant, your role is to observe and record in as objective a way as possible and then to interpret the data you gather.

Throughout all observations, remaining aware of the dangers associated with observing members of an organisation when the researcher is familiar with the personalities of the participants eliminated any preconceived opinions of each participant.

4.3.1.3 Informal document analysis
In order to understand the research questions in greater depth, informal documents such as lesson plans, inquiry unit plans, school policies and strategic plan documents pertinent to grasping the ways in which international mindedness is comprehended and intended to be developed were analysed. This provided useful supporting data and was carefully triangulated with current literature and data from each interview to ensure reliability and validity.

Stake (1995, pp. 49–50) maintains that the case study researcher needs methods of data collection that lead specifically to understanding the research question – and interviews, observations and document analysis worked to this end:

The experience of the qualitative researcher is one of knowing what leads to significant understanding, recognising good sources of data and consciously and unconsciously testing out the veracity of their eyes and the robustness of their interpretations.

Using more than one method of data collection meant that multiple perspectives could be explored from different viewpoints in greater depth, making the analysis richer and more meaningful (Herriot & Firestone 1993; Stake 1995). These methods also allowed the research
questions to be explored in a non-manipulative and unobtrusive way so that the data is authentic.

4.4 ANALYSING THE DATA

In the analysis, the aim was to:

- let the voices and unique perspectives of each teacher be heard in the clearest and most accurate way
- identify commonalities and differences
- triangulate the data to validate findings and interpretations
- draw from multiple perspectives in order to represent the issues and findings from multiple points of view
- challenge interpretations from observations with data from interviews and vice versa, giving the data more meaning and to seek any contradictions (Stake 1995)
- search for relationships, themes and patterns in the data; and
- answer research questions as posed.

Given the qualitative data gathering techniques used, a large amount of text-based data was collected for analysis – transcripts from interviews and field notes as well as the notes from classroom observations with each teacher. To make as much sense of the data as possible, time was spent preparing for the data analysis. Tables, diagrams and graphs were used to help review the data and organise it into categories that made it easier to interpret and analyse (see Table 4.1 on page 77). This process assisted in locating the main themes, patterns and categories surfacing in the data so they could be analysed in greater depth. Locating themes made it easier to break down the large amount of data in a way that was directly relevant to the research questions.
Chapter 4: Methodology

Table 4.1 represents a document that served as an invaluable tool for analysing the data throughout the project. In the follow up comments column, notes were recorded throughout the analysis. This was a useful auditing document and, when linking this column with the initial main ideas column, it illuminated growth in ideas and issues surfacing in the data.

Table 4-1 Data collected for 2010 international mindedness project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of data</th>
<th>Rationale</th>
<th>Participants involved</th>
<th>Initial main ideas</th>
<th>Follow up comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Observations (field notes)</td>
<td>Served to help understand interview data in greater detail. Enabled a rich description of the school environment and the pedagogical, curriculum and assessment processes that different teachers used (or did not use) to develop international mindedness.</td>
<td>Nine classroom teachers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semi-structured interviews</td>
<td>Helped to understand what international mindedness means to teachers and how they believe it can be developed through assessment, curriculum and pedagogy.</td>
<td>Nine classroom teachers and one school leader</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal documents</td>
<td>Documents such as plans for units of inquiry, lesson plans and strategic plan documents helped to understand how teachers intended to develop international mindedness.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Prior to categorising the data, time was also spent getting to know the data by reading each source several times until it could be viewed as a whole and to understand the main emergent themes. Ensuring all data was read worked to reduce biased interpretation of the data. During this time, maintaining a healthy level of cynicism towards any decisions made in regards to categorising the main themes was essential, as was looking for emerging ideas that possibly contradicted initial ideas or themes.

After becoming familiar with the data, relationships identified in the research questions and consistencies in the data could be explored, allowing for themes to emerge from the data. At this stage, flowcharts and other charts that clearly portrayed connections between the data.
were essential. Continuing to link interpretations to current, relevant literature (see Chapter 2) helped illuminate what was already known about the development of international mindedness and helped pinpoint precisely the new areas of knowledge emerging from the study.

Finally, case study research depends on interpretation but:

standard qualitative designs call for the persons most responsible for interpretations to be in the field, making observations, exercising subjective judgment, analysing and synthesising, all the while realising their own consciousness. (Stake 1995, p. 41)

When locating particulars, personal interpretations were guided by triangulating the data, reflection, being sceptical about first impressions and most importantly, through Bernstein’s (2000) code theory (see Chapter 3). How teachers constructed assessment, curriculum and pedagogy illuminated the varying effects of power and control on the development of international mindedness. It highlighted how aspects of the PYP and VELS were changed and what values and elements of the PYP and VELS were selectively silenced or prioritised through the ways in which the three message systems were constructed.

4.5 ETHICAL ISSUES

The research took place within the school where I am currently teaching, so essentially this project was a teacher–researcher or participant–observer study. Throughout the project, maintaining the well being and learning environment of all students was essential, as was ensuring that students continued to receive effective and high-quality teaching. While the primary aim in the study was to develop a deeper understanding of the research questions, the research needed to be unobtrusive. As Stake (1995, p. 59) illustrates, the case study researcher should aim to be ‘as interesting as wallpaper’.

Respect was demonstrated for all people involved in the study. Informants in the study were not asked any personal information. Furthermore, any information known about informants through existing working relationships with each colleague was not recorded. Pedagogy,
Chapter 4: Methodology

assessment, the curriculum and the unique points of view of the development of international
mindedness were the foci and at no stage did this violate the privacy of participants.

Prior to inviting the principal of Diamond Primary School to consent to the school participating
in the project, approval to conduct the project at Diamond Primary School was formally secured
from the Department of Early Education and Childhood Development as well as the Human
Ethics Committee at Deakin University. On inviting the school to consent to the research, the
research questions and planned methodology were explained in a plain language statement
given to the principal of the school. The principal was assured that he would be regularly
updated throughout the project and was made to feel welcome to ask any questions at any time
throughout the research.

After gaining consent from the principal, teachers from the leadership team and classroom
teachers from the school were invited to participate in the project. The issue of coercion was
considered seriously. As Zeni (2001, p. xii) points out:

   Ethical dilemmas seem to be complicated by the very nature of the practitioner-
   researcher role. The insider has responsibilities and relationships that are
   fundamentally different from those of an outsider doing research in schools.

It was imperative that existing relationships with potential teacher participants did not affect
their decision to join in the project, as teachers and leading teachers should not feel obliged to
participate in the project. This is why letters were distributed to potential teacher participants
and school leaders inviting them to participate in the project. Letters were placed in every
classroom teacher's pigeon-hole at the school. Teachers and school leaders were not obligated
to respond to the letters.

Fourteen out of thirty-six classroom teachers and one school leader out of the three school
leaders responded to the letter either in person or via email. On making their approach, the
teachers were given the plain language statement and consent forms. These provided a clear,
honest and accurate overview of the research project inclusive of the purpose of the project,
Chapter 4: Methodology

background information about the project, the issues being researched, all procedures and a brief statement about the reasons for their involvement. The plain language statement did not conceal any procedures or aspects of the study which may have influenced potential participants’ willingness to participate in the project. These forms also advised them that their involvement or non-involvement in the project would not affect their relationship with me, Deakin University or the school. Ten out of these fifteen people then consented to the project. Consenting teachers were reminded that should they wish to withdraw from the project at any stage, they were free to do so.

In regards to anonymity, the identity of all participants in the study was protected. All data was kept confidential. No personal or sensitive information was recorded in any of the interview transcripts, field notes or observation notes. Any information that could possibly have led to revelation of their identity was deleted from transcripts. Teachers in the study were referred to as ‘Participant A’ through to ‘Participant J’ and a fictitious name was given for the school (Diamond Primary School). Maintaining confidentiality and using pseudonyms in the project were imperative as, given the small sample, there was a high chance that the participants would be able to identify each other if reading the final thesis. This risk was clearly explained to all participants in the plain language statement.

As classroom observations can be intrusive, teacher participants were assured that they could ask me to leave before or during a session. Displaying good manners and a friendly, considerate nature was necessary in order for the project at Diamond Primary School to be concluded ‘having made no one less able to carry out their responsibilities’ (Stake 1995, p. 60).

Finally, persistent self-questioning was required throughout the project, such as: “What benefits do the students and teachers at this school receive from the research?” This project was not purely for my own gain in completing post-graduate study. When the research was completed, teachers and students needed to be the beneficiaries. After all, it is useful if research has an impact.
Chapter 4: Methodology

4.6 Scope of the Study

It would seem best to examine the research questions by selecting several cases from a range of different schools over a large geographical area. However, the aim was not to compare one school’s understanding of international mindedness to that of another. Such a comparison would present an exhaustive range of data rather than a rich description of the development of international mindedness at Diamond Primary School. A single case study is ideal for looking at an issue in great detail (Soy 1997; Stake 1995). By analysing issues relevant to the main research questions through several informants located in the single case study school, the findings from this project are enlightening as issues were explored in-depth rather than in breadth. Therefore, the limitations of the project were warranted. However, although the project relates to one primary school, the findings have broader applicability – particularly to other IB primary schools in Australia. The findings also contribute richly to discovering areas worthy of further research.

Being an active participant in Diamond Primary School also facilitated full immersion in the topic of inquiry for the researcher, as it allowed information that may not have been revealed to ‘outsider’ researchers. This enabled a greater depth of understanding about the topic. Given that my position as a teacher in the school continues, teaching in the school means that the research findings have an immediate impact on the school, as the researcher can more readily share them with other teachers and school leaders. Typically, research findings are generated some time after the research takes place or they simply appear in a scholarly publication that may not filter through to many research participants. This was not the case in this instance. As the project progressed, my own knowledge of the development of international mindedness increased, directly benefiting my own pedagogical strategies for effective student learning.

The sole researcher of the study guides all aspects of the study including the interview questions, the school and participants selected for the study, the analysis, and conclusions
Chapter 4: Methodology

drawn. Bagnall (2008, p. 5) states that often research on IB programs and most literature written on the IBO is carried out by individuals working for the IBO:

The hand of the researcher guides all aspects of the study, the questions asked, the schools selected and the way that the data is collected and later analysed all contribute to the results and conclusions of the studies undertaken.

This project contrasts with other projects in IB schools in that it represents research on an IB program by a researcher not working for the IBO. This may add to a more profound understanding of the development of international mindedness as it enabled data to be sourced without any particular employment allegiance to the IBO

4.7 SUMMARY

Using multiple sources of data collection as explained in this chapter, a substantial amount of data was generated from ten teachers at Diamond Primary School that enabled the research questions to be answered. Rather than choosing a research approach that helped search for one set answer, a single case study was the chosen research method as it allowed in-depth exploration of what teachers think international mindedness is and how they believe it can be developed. Although the findings prove to have broader applicability, the aim was to understand better the ways that Diamond Primary School could work towards further developing and nurturing the notion of international mindedness. The following chapters reveal the findings of this case study research.
SECTION TWO

The data collected represents ten teachers’ understandings of international mindedness and its development during one defined period of time. Chapters 5, 6, 7 and 8 in this section explore and analyse these data in light of the theory presented in Chapter 3. Each chapter is representative of the major themes surfacing in the data. The themes cover a broad range of issues and concerns related to international mindedness and its development at Diamond Primary School. Due to the semi-structured nature of interviews, some themes shifted beyond the scope of the study. However, these themes were relevant to understanding Diamond Primary School’s enactment of international mindedness.

The first theme, as presented in Chapter 5, “School culture” offers a discussion of how teachers understand international mindedness. Tensions between the IB PYP, VELS, school leaders, teachers and parents are discussed by analysing the power and control between these agencies. Chapter 6, “Professional development” continues the analysis of power and control between school leaders and teachers, and discusses how the lack of professional learning at the school has influenced teachers’ levels of motivation and enthusiasm for developing international mindedness. Chapter 7 looks at the implementation of an internationally minded curriculum and the effects it has had on the teachers at Diamond Primary School. It analyses how it has been received and implemented. Chapter 8, “Marketisation” discusses the clash between internationalist and globalist discourses at Diamond Primary School. Chapter 9 presents the main conclusions, implications and reflections.
5  SCHOOL CULTURE AND POWER

This chapter offers a basis for understanding the case of Diamond Primary School. The first half of the chapter examines teachers’ perceptions of the culture of the school. This is because the culture of the school is all too frequently overlooked on the grounds that it is complex and difficult to explain in a coherent manner. Although the scope of this thesis is too limited to deal with the large questions of culture, it does examine how power relations have been transferred and constructed in the context of Diamond Primary School. This is essential for understanding how members of the school community relate to each other and how teachers work together in order to provide the best environment for the learners. It is also helpful for understanding how teachers believe the notion of international mindedness has or has not evolved in the school setting since adopting the PYP two years prior to this study and, what aspects of the school setting teachers believe may promote or hinder the cultivation of an internationally minded school. The second half of the chapter explores how teachers define international mindedness, and how teachers may have developed their own understandings of the term.

5.1  CULTURAL DIVERSITY AND THE INTERNATIONALLY MINDED SCHOOL

When describing Diamond Primary School, all teachers immediately spoke about the diverse cultures representative of the student population: “It’s got such a diverse spread of cultures, really” (Participant F, March 2010). However, four teachers expressed that this diversity was not evident in the staffing profile. As one teacher said:

  There’s not much diversity in the staff...we’re in a community where we’ve obviously got a massive Asian and Indian population, [but] most of our teachers are mainly Anglophone background. (Participant D, October 2009)

Teachers shared the perspective that the staffing profile is mainly representative of staff from an Anglophone background. Participant C explained that, even though the school has two
teachers on staff representing another cultural background, there is a lack of interaction between these two teachers and the large percentage of Anglophone staff:

If you look at our staffing profile even, it’s mainly Anglo. I mean we’ve got two teachers who are Asian and they’re our LOTE teachers and if you look at their interaction with other teachers, there’s not a lot... I mean the friendships aren’t developed there. Even if you look at our staffing, the friendships tend to be in the Year Levels... there’s not a lot of wider movement. You know what I mean? I mean, I find that interesting. If you look at the makeup of the staff, most of us come from a similar background. (Participant C, October 2009)

She believed that if the background of staff is dominated by one culture, rich collaboration between different cultural backgrounds can become inhibited in the school. She embraced the view that the impact of teachers in the school setting cannot be overstated and, in schools wanting to foster a harmonious multicultural community, it is important to ensure that the staffing profile is not dominated by one cultural group.

Bernstein (2000b, p. xxii) argues:

A school metaphorically holds up a mirror in which an image is reflected. There may be several images, positive or negative. A school’s ideology may be seen as a construction in a mirror through which images are reflected. The question is: Who recognises themselves as of value? What other images are excluded by the dominant image of value so that some students are unable to recognise themselves?

It appears that Participants D and C believe that these same questions can be asked about the images reflected through the staffing profile of the school. Given that the majority of Diamond Primary School staff is mainly of ‘Anglophone background’, they believed that the image reflected through the staffing profile is one of uniformity rather than diversity. What these data and literature suggest, is that although a diverse cultural mix of teachers by itself may not create an internationally minded school, a homogenous staffing profile raises questions about who can feel valued and recognised in the school community. It can raise the question of who holds the dominant position in the school community.

Four teachers expressed the view that there is a lack of interaction between different nationalities in the student population:
Chapter 5: School culture

There’s the Asian group… and there’s us, you know. There just doesn’t seem to be the interaction there… there’s just not the opportunity there for the kids to socialise. (Participant H, May 2010)

They believed that the lack of intercultural and international relations is making the school’s endeavour to become internationally minded difficult to achieve. For this reason, they shared the perspective that the diverse cultural groups in the school community make it “very hard to be an international school or even an internationally minded school” (Participant J, October 2009). Consistent with literature by Goeudevert (2002), Hill (2000) and Caffyn (2011), they believed that a school’s appearance of cultural diversity is by itself not an indication that a school is internationally minded: “It doesn’t necessarily mean it’s internationally minded though, that’s for sure. Especially with most of the teachers coming from an Anglophone background” (Participant D, October 2009). This teacher believed that the main image reflected by the school is of Anglophone homogeneity.

Bernstein (1975, p. 39) argues that when people from different cultures have different expectations of each other, there is an increased chance for conflict. There are more opportunities for people to misinterpret each other because: ‘The very image of conduct, character and manner, the moral order itself, may be unclear and ambiguous’. These teachers believe that, with the school portraying the image of Anglophone dominance in the staffing profile, it gives the impression that acceptable behaviour is that as defined by the Anglophone community. This creates a complex situation for a school with a culturally diverse student population, where the potential for confusion, misinterpretation and misunderstanding is increased. Where situations arise that students do not understand or do not conform to, they become influenced by the environment around them. In a school with a culturally diverse student population but homogenous staffing profile, students mainly seek guidance on how to behave and respond to complex situations from the images reflected in the school’s ideology (Berntein, 1975). At Diamond Primary School, these images reflect the Anglophone community.
In contrast, four teachers believed the school has the potential to become an internationally minded school purely because of its diverse student population: “The diverse cultures that we have really makes it feel like it is becoming [internationally minded]” (Participant A, November 2009). However these opinions contrast with literature by Goeudvert (2002), Hill (2000) and Caffyn (2011), who argue that the creation of an internationally minded school is not contingent on an international school or a diverse cultural mix of students. It also contrasts with the aforementioned quotations by Bernstein (1975, 2000b), who as argued, proposes that in a fluid and changing society, there is a greater chance that the moral order, manner, and the image of conduct will be ambiguous. The fact that it gives the appearance of being diverse is merely one aspect of the school’s culture. It does not necessarily mean that everyone is equally valued and that all voices in the school are recognised – particularly if the teacher population is largely representative of one culture.

To create a school environment that opens up the voices of all cultural groups in the school, Bernstein (2000b, p. xx) argues that all people in the school:

Must feel that they have a stake in the school and confidence that the arrangements in the school will realise or enhance this stake or, if not, good grounds are to be given as to why not.

By “stake”, he means that students and teachers are able to not only receive something but are able to give something. For people to feel as though they have a stake, Bernstein (2000b) argues that schools need to ensure that they foster three interrelated rights: enhancement, inclusion and participation. For students to feel enhanced, students need to feel confident. They need to be immersed in an environment where they are encouraged to develop critical understandings that may open up new possibilities. To be included, students need to be included ‘socially, intellectually, culturally and personally’ (p. xx). The right to participate ensures all students have a say in any changes in the construction and maintenance of school practices.
Chapter 5: School culture

If students do not have the rights of enhancement, inclusion and participation, then students from different cultural groups will not feel confident enough to integrate socially, intellectually, culturally and personally (Bernstein 2000b). This demonstrates that diversity by itself is not going to develop internationally minded students. Students and teachers need to have the rights of enhancement, inclusion and participation in order for a multicultural school community to offer a rich resource from which to draw productively.

These findings illustrate that the internationally minded school extends beyond what the eye can see. They suggest that the cultural context created by a monocultural staff and a diverse student population creates tensions around how different cultures can be enhanced, included and participatory in or to create an internationally minded school.

5.2 Cultural diversity and fragmentation

While describing its diverse student population as the salient feature of the school, four teachers collectively referred to the parents in the Asian community of the school as having high expectations of education. As one teacher said: "the parents have really high expectations of their kids" (Participant J, October 2009). Another informant stated that the school had a "strong work ethic, [with] parents overworking their kids in a lot of corners" (Participant D, October 2009). These comments suggest that these teachers believe that the large proportion of Asian students attending the school have parents who are ambitious with high expectations for their children achieving high academic results.

These teachers also argued that they were struggling to come to terms with the high work ethic of the large Asian population at the school. As one participant said: "I mean, we muck around on weekends but they're off with their [private] tuition and that" (Participant H, May 2010). This theme was echoed in field notes. In a staff meeting, all teachers were planning an upcoming school fair to be held on a weekend. While planning, three teachers were heard making comments such as: "Oh they [Asian students] will not be able to come anyway, because they'll all
be at tuition or doing extra homework” (field note, 11 May 2010). All teachers in the meeting laughed and nodded in agreement (field note, 11 May 2010).

Such data suggest that teachers may have formed stereotypical views about their Asian students. As discussed in the literature review, Cambridge (2000) cautions that one of the main challenges for schools trying to build an internationally minded school culture is for teachers not to let personal judgements form stereotypical views. Considering some staff members may hold stereotypical views of the large Asian population attending the school, cultivating a school community that echoes the internationally minded IB mission statement may be a distant proposition for Diamond Primary School. This also suggests that the rights of enhancement, inclusion and participation may be absent (Bernstein 2000b).

When the rights of enhancement, inclusion and participation are missing, Bernstein (2000b) argues that there is a possibility that fragmented groups will form within the school. The social order of the school will form hierarchical relations. The dominant group will ‘label’ (p. 13) the “other”. At Diamond Primary School, the dominant Anglophone group’s expectations about conduct, character and manner have caused labelling to occur. This has caused strong framing between the two groups. Bernstein (2000b, p. 13) argues:

Which labels are selected is a function of the framing. Where the framing is strong, the candidates for labelling will be terms such as conscientious, attentive, industrious, careful, receptive.

Indeed, teachers causing the labelling have achieved their dominant status through assuming that the “other”, the large Asian population, is conscientious and industrious.

It has also caused strong classification. In the case where strong classification occurs between different groups, each group forms ‘its unique identity, its unique voice, its own specialised rules of internal relations’ (Bernstein 2000b, p. 7). It forms its own stereotypical views of the “other”. Indeed, teachers appear to believe that there is strong classification between the Asian population and the Anglophone population at the school. It may be interpreted that this has
been formed by the Anglophone group's interpretation of the Asian population's identity and rules of internal relations. As one participant said: "Here [at Diamond Primary School], they're [the Asian population] not us, they’re somebody else" (Participant D, November, 2009). This suggests that the formation of fragmented groups may be having powerful repercussions in terms of interrelationships between students and teachers: “I mean they’re such a big part of Australian culture, and here, they’re...othered” (Participant D, November, 2009). While teachers appear to believe the school has a diverse student population, at the same time, six teachers said that the large Asian population at the school is “othered”:

Their voices are just not heard you know. They just have to fit in really. I mean, in other countries, international schools teach in different languages. Here, you don’t have a choice. It’s English, and if you don’t speak it, we’ll teach you how because you’ll need to learn here. (Participant A, October 2009)

These teachers appear to believe that the Anglophone group represents the dominant. It establishes and distributes power by controlling what students are to learn, and how they are to learn. This supports Bernstein’s (2000b, p. 5) argument that classifications ‘always carry power relations’. At Diamond Primary School, behaviours, manner and conduct are legitimised by Anglophone culture because it is viewed as the authentic source of power. Changes in the strength of classification dividing the groups thus pose a threat to the superiority of the dominate culture. Maintaining stereotypical views of other cultures and their practices is one way of maintaining the strength of classification between groups. It serves to reinforce the Anglophone group's dominant position – as does maintaining a monocultural context of staff.

While everyone is capable of stereotyping and essentialising individuals in other cultures, being discriminate and judgemental could be interpreted as being racist. Indeed, recent research on racism in Australian schools by Mansuri, Jenkins, Morgan and Taouk (2009, p. 29) suggests that one of the main problems in Australian schools is racism – particularly racism towards people of South East Asian origin: ‘manifest in the language of white Australian youth, especially in the top end of Australia, is the othering of Asians’. However, in light of Bernstein's (2000b) theory, even
Chapter 5: School culture

if some teachers themselves employed their own racist modes of thinking, the cultural hierarchy caused by teachers’ stereotypical views at Diamond Primary School can be better interpreted as a way of extending their monocultural identity, rather than racist practices. Essentially, teachers’ judgemental and stereotypical views of a student population enforces control over the Asian population. However, data suggests that this control was mainly maintained and reinforced through the monocultural staff context rather than through overt subjugation and discrimination. The monocultural staff context collectivises the power and superiority of the Anglophone group.

All informants believed that the school mainly enforces the practices and expressions of the large Anglophone population. As Participant D explained:

All they [students] get is Western culture... you know there’s certain cultures that...come into the community and they become normalised but still, Asian people and Middle Eastern people are not represented very well...they’re still tokenistic and it means that if they’re not visible...they’re not present really, they’re still a mysterious group. (Participant D, November 2009)

Images of Anglophone culture reflected through a range of school practices, rituals and emblems maintains power and control over the large Asian population. These include the homogenous staffing profile, weekly rituals such as the singing of the Australian national anthem and displaying the Australian flag outside the front of the school. These practices help maintain immigrants’ position as ‘other’. They help disseminate power and acknowledge the dominance of the Anglophone nation. It preserves the integrity of the dominant group and helps to control the minority group who do not feel confident enough to integrate intellectually, socially and personally (Bernstein 2000b). The Asian population suffers from being subjugated or forced to conform to the views and practices of the dominant culture. As Bernstein (2000b, p. 4) argues, the construction of pedagogic discourse, its circulation, contextualisation, acquisition and change are the ultimate: ‘...carrier of power relations external to the school, a carrier of patterns of dominance with respect to class, patriarchy, race’. For them, accumulating cultural capital is the only way to gain power and more recognition. Endorsed by the school,
Chapter 5: School culture

these school practices are also mandated by the government. This further compounds the exclusion of different cultural practices at the school and consolidates the ‘rightness’ of monocultural expressions and practices. It could be seen as a relatively hidden, but effective process of establishing Anglophone national order or status quo.

The state regulated and monitored curriculum at the school (VELS) reproduces nationalist discourses through the curriculum. It controls what students are to learn, as all teachers in the study believed that VELS forces teachers to focus more on issues relevant to the home country of the school than other countries in the world. For example, the school leader stated:

I don’t know that our teachers teach from a notion of international curriculum. I think we’re still quite singular, I think we’re still quite Australian focused with the need to assess and report to VELS. I think some of the discussion that teachers have with children is quite limited in the notion of where Australia fits in the world. (Participant C, October 2009)

This suggests that she believes VELS provides an essential discourse from which to preserve the integrity of the Australian culture and propagate national consciousness.

All teachers believed that VELS limits teachers’ ability to internationalise the curriculum. The comments from the following teacher illustrate this:

It’s difficult for us because we have to cover VELS and then we have to cover PYP, so we don’t get to cover much of the PYP, you know, just a little bit to introduce...because we have to report to VELS and there’s so much to cover. (Participant I, March 2010)

The “IB central ideas” (statements illustrating the transdisciplinary themes) are to transcend and articulate all subject content, of any curriculum framework. They are proposed to be open enough to lead teachers and students into issues and topics of global significance (IBO 2010b). However, the view expressed by the majority of teachers is that it is hard to cover aspects of the IB written curriculum (concepts, attitudes, skills and action) because there is so much to cover for VELS. As one teacher stated: “It’s very hard. Sometimes you know, we just can’t do it [internationalise the curriculum]” (Participant I, March 2010).
Chapter 5: School culture

One teacher illustrated an example of how VELS restricts inquiry into international issues:

I mean look at Year 3, you have to fit in Australian Floral Emblems into their units because that has to be assessed at VELS and all that sort of thing...and history and government. I mean by the time they get to Year 5 and 6 you’re assessing against all of these various areas of VELS so it gets even harder, makes it a bit more restricted. (Participant B, October 2009)

Marshall (2007) argues that rather than promoting intercultural understanding within a national context, the internationalist ideals of international education are very much the promotion of global and international understanding and knowledge within the international context. Yet, teachers are struggling with ways of internationalising aspects of the curriculum because of the strength of control that the state has over the school through enforcing nationalist practices through its own mandatory curriculum.

For example, the mission statement of VELS stands in stark contrast to the internationalist current of the IB mission statement (see page 2):

The Victorian Essential Learning Standards identify essential knowledge, skills and behaviours that will assist students to live fulfilling, productive and responsible lives. These goals are intended to support students to build a future based on:

- Sustainability – developing an understanding of the interaction between social, economic and environmental systems and how to manage them
- Innovation – developing the skills to solve new problems using a range of different approaches to create unique solutions
- Building strong communities – by building common purposes and promoting mutual responsibility and trust in a diverse socio-cultural community.

The teaching of these goals is strengthened when it draws on understandings from a range of domains. For example, opportunities for community building can be drawn from domains such as Civics and Citizenship, Interpersonal Development and The Humanities – History. (VELS 2011)

While the mission statement of the IBO is founded on promoting full development of the human personality and a respect for human rights and friendship among all nations, racial or religious
Chapter 5: School culture

groups, the main emphasis of VELS mission statement is on developing industrious, productive people who are fully equipped to add value to the state’s economy. The school’s emphasis is on facilitating ‘...state-promoted instrumentality’ (Bernstein 2000b, p. 61). Levy (2007, p. 218) supports this aspect of Bernstein’s theory, claim that: ‘...many governments state that they value diversity yet practice assimilation.’ For example, VELS makes only one minor reference to promoting trust in a diverse socio-cultural community. This supports Bernstein’s (2000b, p. 3) claim that the school is inseparable from the power of the state and has become ‘a crucial means and an arena for struggle to produce and reproduce a specific national consciousness’, and that school is the ‘fundamental social context through which cultural reproduction-production takes place’. In this way, plus the requirement of displaying the Australian flag and the weekly singing of the national anthem, the state is ensuring that it produces a united, integrated and common national consciousness. As the dominant culture reproduces national consciousness, the classification between cultures at the school strengthens as the minority group becomes further ostracised, unless they conform to the views and traditions of the dominant culture.

In this sense, developing international mindedness clashes with attempts to maintain national consciousness. Due to the strength of control of the state, it may be suggested that for teachers at Diamond Primary School, the development of international mindedness will only be taken seriously if it is facilitated through a reduced emphasis on reporting to VELS.

5.3 INTERNATIONAL MINDEDNESS – A PARADOXICAL PARADIGM

Eight teachers said that international mindedness is about accepting people from different cultures despite their different points of view. For instance, Participant F said:

It’s really about just accepting different people from different cultures, their different ideas and maybe not feeling like you have to necessarily understand them well, but accept their differences no matter where they come from. (Participant F, March 2010)

They claimed that international mindedness is about interacting successfully with people from different cultural groups and accepting that people may have different points of view. As
Chapter 5: School culture

Participant A expressed: “I mean, [international mindedness is] about accepting people’s differences...that it’s okay to be different and do different things... no matter what opinion you have, or what culture you come from” (Participant A, November 2010). These eight teachers appear to believe that international mindedness is about admiring, appreciating and recognising the legitimacy of practices and traditions of other cultures. As one teacher said: “It’s taking an interest in things from other cultures rather than just focusing on your own” (Participant A, November 2009).

Findings discussed earlier illustrate that this is not occurring at Diamond Primary School as from the data presented, teachers appear to have constructed their own judgmental views of the Asian culture at the school. They also believe there is a lack of intercultural relationships at the school. This appears to have created a cultural hierarchy. Yet, Bernstein (2000b) proposes that fairness and tolerance relies on a hierarchical arrangement. After all, one can only become capable of accepting and tolerating others if they themselves feel entitled to be accepted and tolerated. Those who are concerned with embracing the notion of acceptance and tolerance must first of all assume superiority to something or someone they judge as being intolerant. Hence, for teachers at Diamond Primary School, it may be proposed that the notion of international mindedness is a way of controlling and positioning the “other”. The Asian population are a part of the school culture, but only in so far as individuals accept and tolerate them. Their existence is one that relies on approval. The notion of fairness, acceptance and tolerance helps maintain cultural status for the dominant Anglophone cultural group.

Proclaiming that the school develops international mindedness may also be interpreted as a strategy aimed at disguising the relationships of power being produced between the Anglophone group and the Asian group at the school. As argued in Chapter 3, a school disguises hierarchical arrangements through what Bernstein (2000b, p. xxiii) terms ‘mythological discourses’. By promoting the term “international mindedness”, the school is creating a mythological discourse. It gives the impression that the school is promoting fairness,
Chapter 5: School culture

acceptance and tolerance of others. However, the evidence shows that despite the narrative and proclaimed importance of international mindedness, some teachers are persisting with their own stereotypical views of the large Asian population. This suggests that at Diamond Primary School, the term “international mindedness” is masking a reality and illustrates the mythologising around the hierarchies of power and dominance that are evident and reproduced through teachers’ discourses.

Participant H and Participant B viewed the notion of international mindedness as an educational, dichéd “flavour of the month”. As one teacher said: ”I think that it [international mindedness] is quite idealistic. I pretty much view it as kind of a glossy term to throw around” (Participant B, November 2009). She believed the term “international mindedness” to be an idyllic slogan. This teacher perceived education to be preoccupied with using slogans to help sell the latest innovative curriculum and did not view the term “international mindedness” as an innovation worthy of professional investment and more serious attention.

Although both Participants B and H were eager to offer definitions of an internationally minded person they explained that it is not actually possible to be internationally minded: ”But is it actually possible to be internationally minded? I don’t think it’s possible” (Participant H, December 2009). This suggests that these two teachers embrace a more complex understanding of culture and difference than the other eight teachers. They view international mindedness as rhetoric rather than reality. Participant H explained: “You know, the whole idea that we can tolerate each other no matter what our differences are is quite ridiculous” (Participant H, December 2009).

Participants B and H appear to believe that the other eight teachers have not developed a critical understanding of international mindedness. For example, these two teachers said that it is naïve to believe that one can become internationally minded. As Participant H said: “It’s too simplistic to think we can just ‘become’ internationally minded” (Participant H, December 2009). Such a point of view contrasts with literature by the IBO, where it is argued that ‘the
Chapter 5: School culture

attributes described in the learner profile are appropriate to and achievable by all IB students from the ages of 3 to 19’ (IBO 2008, p. 3). For these two teachers, the idea of actively fostering the capacity to accept and tolerate the unique distinctiveness of particular cultures is impossible and international mindedness is nothing but a paradoxical paradigm. Their critical understanding of international mindedness had identified that there is a serious gap between, on one hand, teachers’ shallow understanding of international mindedness, and on the other hand, the realities and problems that are each day becoming increasingly more multidimensional, transnational, and global.

5.4 CONDITIONAL INTERNATIONAL MINDEDNESS

Participant B and H’s view of international mindedness suggests that for the teachers who claimed international mindedness is about appreciating and tolerating different practices and beliefs of other cultures, the notion of international mindedness is “conditional”. It is about accepting the views, traditions and practices of other cultures until the point at which its practices become intolerable. It allows one to selectively respect, approve or tolerate some practices and disapprove of others. It recognises the need to celebrate and accept difference, but only by recognising what one thinks is acceptable, exotic, tolerable, interesting or of value in the dominant culture. As Participant E claimed:

International mindedness, for me, is really about being more than aware of other cultures. Like having a deep curiosity or concern for cultures other than your own, and tolerating things from that culture rather than just your own. (Participant E, November 2009)

This notion of international mindedness focuses on particular differences that cultures may have externally – differences in clothing, language, race, religious practices, artefacts and so on. It selectively chooses which aspects of culture to tolerate and accept. It does not recognise values that mark the “core” of all humanity – only aspects of interest or, as Participant E stated, “concern”. “Core”, as defined by Fish (1997) defines what humans universally share – the right to make choices – regardless of religious beliefs, language spoken and beliefs. By having a deep
Chapter 5: School culture

respect for the core, one overlooks the surface level that differentiates culture. One understands that all humans have rights regardless of gender, nationality, citizenship, culture or race, because we are all human beings.

"Conditional international mindedness" became evident in the way in which the school celebrated Chinese New Year. Although this data represents only one example of the way in which teachers perceive international mindedness, findings suggest that most informants embrace a view of international mindedness that focuses mainly on physical aspects of culture.

To prepare the school community for the whole school activity, a senior member of staff made an announcement to explain details of the day at the whole school assembly held one week prior to the activity. This announcement did not educate the school community about what Chinese New Year is or the significance of the day. It did not appear to excite the school community about the whole school celebration. It was noted that the senior member of staff made the announcement in an uninspiring monotone voice (field note, 1 March 2010). The announcement included the time of assembly on the day of celebrations and a reminder to students that it was not a free dress day but a day where students needed to make sure that they wore either traditional Chinese clothes or colours of the Chinese flag (field note, 1 March 2010).

On the day of the Chinese New Year festival, the school gathered for a special assembly. In the field notes, it was recorded that around one quarter of the students came to school in uniform, approximately another quarter in traditional Chinese clothing and the other half wearing Western clothing in colours of the Chinese flag (field note, 8 March 2010). The themes of colourful costumes, dance and music that dominate the field notes and interview data indicate that there was a strong emphasis on visual aspects of the Chinese culture at the special assembly. Students from Year 6 performed a traditional dragon dance, while some boys from Year 6 played the drums. This was followed by a group of Year 4 girls performing a fan dance in traditional Chinese costumes hired from a nearby costume hire shop. The whole school then
Chapter 5: School culture

took part in a ‘trivia quiz’ which entailed two Year 6 boys asking questions about aspects of Chinese culture (field note, 8 March 2010).

One teacher reflected on the success of the day in her interview:

The Chinese New Year day at the school was good... Students got to actually feel what a celebration was like in another culture. For some kids, they only know Western food, Western clothes and Western music, but because the school stopped to celebrate with another culture on that day they got a good feel of another culture. I think that was really important for the kids. (Participant J, March 2010)

For this teacher, international mindedness is about viewing appealing issues and fascinating events through different cultural lenses. Seven teachers in the study concurred, with the following two comments illustrating this as follows:

And Chinese New Year... it’s about getting the message across to kids that it’s not all just about Easter and Christmas, even though heaps of kids here normally celebrate it [Chinese New Year] anyway, but for the kids that don’t, it’s good I think. (Participant G, March 2010)

The Chinese New Year is really good for the kids that are not Chinese, because heaps of kids here are from China in their special clothes and performing their own dances to different music, so they really get into the day, and you know, the other kids can watch and learn heaps off them. (Participant A, November 2009)

Only what was exciting and of interest to the dominant Anglophone culture of the school was celebrated. These were the immediately visible aspects of culture such as food, flags and clothes. These aspects provided a strong visual image that contributed to the school's mythological discourse of promoting international mindedness. Less noticeable aspects fundamental to understanding Chinese New Year such as religion, history, cultural beliefs and values, were absent.

This suggests that the two Mandarin teachers at the school are unable to assert impact on fostering a deep sense of Chinese culture in students. One Mandarin teacher commented that this was due to the lack of communication between staff members at the school. She tried to integrate Chinese cultural understandings into the curriculum, but felt challenged by the lack of staff collegiality. Specialist teachers were encouraged to attend year level planning meetings,
but they did not attend because they were required to teach during these meeting times. Hence, specialist and classroom teachers planned learning engagements in isolation from each other.

With more collegiality, Participant I believed students could learn about Chinese New Year through other aspects of the curriculum as well – not just once per week in Mandarin class. She stated that this would provide a more profound international experience for students:

It’s so hard. The school is so big and there are only two of us. We don’t really know what the other teachers are doing and they never know what we’re doing really...I think if we all worked together more...much better you know? Students really could get into it then. (Participant I, March 2010).

The outcome of the strong classification of communication between classroom and specialist teachers meant that international mindedness played an insignificant role in the Chinese New Year celebration or in any other aspect of the school’s curriculum.

Thomas and Inkson (2009, p. 28) argue that focusing solely on visible aspects does little to develop an understanding of different cultures:

Understanding cultures involves a lot more than just understanding immediate surface behaviours such as bows, handshakes, invitations, ceremonies, and body language. The invisible elements of culture – the underlying values, social structures, and ways of thinking – are the most important.

Skelton (2007, p. 388) refers to such practices as ‘international mindedness lite’ and cautions that, although cultural celebration days in schools can raise intercultural awareness, they have the potential to portray superficial understandings of international mindedness if not taken seriously:

We need to see international mindedness lite for what it is. Typified in many ways by the often quoted focus on the 4Fs of Food, Festivals, Fashion and Flags, the student experiences that result are often too superficial to enable children and students to develop a sense of the other from them. In fact, there is a real danger that they become opportunities for children and students to find the features of other cultures exotic but not as having deep meaning.
But for the majority of informants, immersing students in the events and activities of another culture was a way of developing each student’s ability to accept the notion of difference. In cases like this, where too much focus is given to the physical aspects of culture, Skelton argues that difference can be accentuated and the ‘other’ culture can become viewed as exotic, polarising difference even further. Deveney (2007, p. 325) concurs: ‘Personal reactions to cultural differences in the classroom can vary from amusement to irritation, from frustration to fascination’.

In a conversation at the Chinese New Year celebration on the day, a colleague jokingly stated that for a large number of students at the school, wearing Asian dress outside of school hours is normal (field note, 8 March 2010), but designating one day of the year for wearing Asian dress rather than the compulsory school uniform makes it appear unusual. She believed that it was possible that students were ‘amused’ by Chinese culture through the focus on Chinese food, flags and fashion on the Chinese cultural day. She was concerned that students from the Chinese culture at the school may have been lead to feel abnormal as certain belittling racist behaviours were tolerated:

> I think it’s good for some, but in a way don’t you think that it’s a little bit offensive for the ones that are getting ‘mimicked’? We just take it for granted that they won’t take offence, and that they’ll actually think we’re being open-minded and all that. (classroom teacher, field note, 8 March 2010)

She believed that students in the Anglophone culture may have developed such a strong sense of difference that they started to perceive cultures other than their own as exotic and amusing. This suggests that she believed that students in the Asian culture may have felt offended.

In this sense, the Chinese culture was being trivialised with teachers’ consent. The Chinese culture was positioned as an exhibition. Students of Anglo descent, bearers of the dominant culture, were positioned in the principle role of the touring subjects, observing and feeling superior to the exotic Asian culture. The role of the Asian culture was to appeal for acceptance. The dominant culture enacted their capacity to accept the Asian culture by participating in the
Chapter 5: School culture

festivities. They applauded themselves for being tolerant of the “other”. “Peaceful coexistence” was only due to the Anglophone culture's efforts to tolerate the "other". Hence, the Asian community was a function of the power of the Anglophone group.

For the touring subjects, the perceived “real" Australians, it may be argued that to participate in the festivities, they had to first be “uninternationally minded” in order to feel “internationally minded”. After all, it is not possible to promote or embrace the power to tolerate and accept the festivities of the Chinese culture without first judging them to be either less tolerable or intriguing. For these teachers, being internationally minded requires something to firstly be deemed as unusual, exotic or even intolerable. If this is the case, then by being internationally minded, one is being equally “uninternationally minded”, and being internationally minded is an imaginary, unachievable fantasy.

Clearly, Diamond Primary School teachers need to reflect seriously on the extent to which international mindedness is reflected in culture of the school. If international mindedness is centred on valuing, respecting and recognising the beliefs, practices and values of different cultures, then the school needs to reflect on how cultural difference and divisions are consolidated through the school's images, rituals and various practices. This would involve rethinking how they understand international mindedness, as merely developing tolerance or a sympathetic attitude towards the beliefs and artefacts of other cultures is at best, superficial and at worst, condescending or as entrenching cultural divisions and lack of understanding.

5.5 INTERNATIONAL MINDEDNESS AND THE POWER OF THE STATE

As argued, all teachers shared the view that international mindedness is about accepting and tolerating cultural difference. Their views did not encompass issues related to globalisation and social trends associated with the transition from modernity to postmodernity. This suggests that teachers embrace a view of international mindedness that is strongly equated to
“multiculturalism”. As Participant E stated: “When I think of it [international mindedness] I just think of multiculturalism” (Participant E, October 2009).

However, Bates (2011b, p. 5) argues that the term “multicultural” should be thought of as distinct from the concept of “international mindedness”: ‘...which is characterised more by the internationalist ideals of international schools’. The same may be said of schools implementing the IB’s “internationalist” curriculum. The term “international mindedness”, as defined through the IB learner profile alongside the IB mission statement, is proposed to encompass more than multicultural education. Whereas multicultural education focuses mainly on cultural differences, the internationalist aspect of international mindedness also recognises issues related to globalisation and global and international issues related to government, language, the economy and religion.

The term “multiculturalism” was first used in 1971 by John Gorton, Australia’s Prime Minister from 1968 to 1971, while talking about Singapore. He said that Singapore was a nation where people of many cultures were able to live together in harmony. The term “multicultural” was then officially introduced into Australian government policy in 1977 (Barwick & Barwick 2005). Not only did it replace the old idea of assimilation, under which people who arrived to live in Australia were expected to change their way of life to fit in with dominant Anglo traditions, but it was also a way of dealing with rising racial discrimination, which ‘was increasingly unacceptable in a world coming to terms with the consequences of Nazi racial ideology and the collapse of white colonial empires’ (Tavan 2005, p. 2). With attempts to increase the Australian population, strengthen ties with the Asian region and fuel postwar economic growth, immigration increased. Consequently, the focus for education throughout the late twentieth century shifted to the notion of multiculturalism.

However, Hage (1998) argues that in the era following the election of the Bob Hawke’s Labour Government in 1983, the focus of multiculturalism shifted from promoting cultural harmony to productive valuing of ethnic cultures. Hage (1998, p. 128) terms this era the era of ‘productive
Chapter 5: School culture

diversity’ because he argues the notion of multiculturalism started to aim at securing economic efficiency in the increasingly competitive international environment. The Keating Labour Government extended this discourse of productive diversity, with Paul Keating stating the following in an opening speech on productive diversity: ‘We now must take advantage of the potentially huge national economic asset which multiculturalism represents. That is what Productive Diversity is about’ (Keating 1992). Hence, although the notion of multiculturalism appeared to support cultural harmony, it was primarily about increasing Australia's position in the competitive global market.

In this sense, multiculturalism could be said to have become a discourse of exploitation – a mythological discourse. It gave the impression that the Australian government was attempting to create cultural harmony but in reality, it was about seeing what migrant cultures could do for Australia, not the other way around. The migrant culture's function was to enrich the value of the Anglo Australian economy. This discourse of multiculturalism articulates positions of hierarchy that places the Anglo Australian in the centre of the cultural map. It assumes that the function of migrant cultures is to enrich the dominant culture. The dominant Anglo Australian culture exists without questioning and without the need for being tolerant. The aforementioned notion of hierarchy evident in findings on the Chinese New Year celebrations highlights this clearly.

It may be proposed that to cultivate a school culture that promotes enhancement, inclusion and participation (Bernstein 2000b), educational goals need to look beyond multicultural discourses. School leaders and teachers need to explore terms that look beyond national goals, as these findings illustrate that national goals are more about reproducing national solidarity and economic efficiency than encouraging people of the nation to develop and promote universal values common to civilised society. These findings also suggest that viewing international mindedness as a way of building tolerance and bringing nations together is a dated and superficial understanding of the term. The fields of finance, science and technology,
economy, politics, communication and education are all currently experiencing an accelerated process of multidimensional change. Hence, the challenge for the 21st Century has far exceeded the need to merely promote cultural harmony. The fact that all teachers used the term “multicultural” when defining international mindedness suggests that teachers are more familiar with the notion of “multiculturalism” than with “international mindedness”. Hence they are stuck in a paradigm that has since been changed radically through globalisation.

It could be interpreted that Diamond Primary School teachers are less familiar with twenty-first century educational aims. This confirms Bates (2011b, p. 5) claim that:

Much contemporary discussion of multicultural or intercultural education is framed in terms of response to the increasing cultural diversity within national systems under pressure of recognition of historically subjugated minorities and the influx of migrants from developing countries.

Of course, multiculturalism is still a strong part of the political vernacular of Australia. However, evidence indicates that teachers’ efforts to move on from the focus on “multiculturalism” to “international mindedness” have been challenged by a centrally located educational reform some thirty years ago, which is being reinforced through the latest compulsory VELS curriculum framework. This confirms Bernstein’s (2000b) claim that the structure and logic of pedagogic discourse of the school is the means whereby power relations external to the school are exerted. Although the school has embraced an international curriculum in name, these findings suggest that in practice, the control of the state is more powerful in constructing teachers’ perceptions of international mindedness than the autonomous base of the school as teachers have not critically examined what international mindedness means, and how their understandings, or those of state wide curriculum writers, have been influenced by protectionist nationalist agendas.
Chapter 5: School culture

5.6 SUMMARY
Overall, these findings illuminate that the main defining features of the culture of Diamond Primary school are differences between discourse and practice, and difference between the Asian and Anglophone population at the school. Teachers believe the student population represents cultural diversity but a culturally homogeneous staff contingent. While a culturally diverse student and staffing context may not by itself be the prerequisite for creating an internationally minded school culture, when the staffing profile is predominantly represented by one cultural group, it portrays an image of cultural hegemony and hierarchy. The dominant position of the Anglophone group is maintained and reproduced by images, rituals and emblems of national significance, the focus on national issues in the curriculum and the lack of opportunities to explore issues of global and international nature. With the rights of inclusion, enhancement and participation missing, cultural fragmentation is occurring. This is creating tensions in relation to extending the notion of international mindedness throughout the school culture.

The next chapter discusses teachers’ views on how they believe best to develop international mindedness and how they go about developing it at Diamond Primary School.
6 TOOLS OF THE TRADE

6.1 THE IB LEARNER PROFILE – A TOOL
As discussed in Chapter 4, Bernstein (2000b) argues that a child’s identity is largely influenced by all pedagogic practices of the school, which result from power relationships shared between the instructional and regulative discourses of the school. Reiterating briefly, through the regulative discourse, a child’s own set of values and unique outlook of the world is largely determined by teachers’ expectations of manner, conduct and behaviour. Through the instructional discourse, a child’s identity is determined by the way in which content, values and attitudes are interpreted, transmitted or omitted through curriculum, assessment and pedagogical practices.

Stobie (2007) extends this aspect of Bernstein’s (2000b) theory. Stobie argues that for students to develop values or attitudes with an international mindset, it is essential that they develop an understanding of their own and other cultures, and respect for pluralism through all pedagogic practices. As Stobie (2007, p. 143) argues: ‘Internationalism must permeate the ethos of the school, as well as the intended curricula, and be essentially experiential’ for students to develop internationally minded attitudes. In light of Bernstein (2000b) and Stobie’s (2007) theory, it may be proposed that for the regulative discourse to promote international mindedness, internationalism must drive all decisions in the organisational and administrative culture of the school, as well as all curriculum, assessment and pedagogical practices. Teachers’ manner, conduct and attitudes must permeate a strong sense of internationalism. Therefore, in the PYP school, this is vital, as the regulative discourse is founded on the instructional discourse. It is only once the regulative discourse permeates internationalism that the instructional discourse has the chance to deliver teaching and learning processes which foster international mindedness. Afterall, teachers are not going to be able to develop in students respect for difference and a sense of responsibility, or transform students
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.

into critical thinkers and creators of social change if they themselves are not living and demonstrating these characteristics.

Indeed, the IBO claims that the IB learner profile serves this purpose. As outlined in Chapter 1, it offers schools and teachers ‘a clear and concise statement of the aims and values of the IB and an embodiment of what the IB means by international mindedness’ (IBO 2006, p. 1). In agreement with Stobie’s (2007) advice, the IBO (IBO 2006) emphasises the importance of infusing the attributes of the IB learner profile throughout the school’s aims, objectives (regulative discourse) and assessment process, and through a curriculum that encourages students to inquire about global and international issues (instructional discourse). In this way, the profile is not so much discourse by itself, but a model from which teachers can develop a shared vision and the means by which to achieve international mindedness through the regulative and instructional discourse.

Ellwood and Davies (2010) emphasise the importance of all stakeholders in PYP schools – students, parents and educators, – owning, valuing, using and sharing this vision as the means by which to achieve this shared goal. In particular, Ellwood and Davies (2010, p. 86) emphasise the importance of the teacher: ‘The individual teacher is part of the whole school process of developing international mindedness’ and school leaders: ‘...as they [school leaders] are the prime managers of teachers and they are the people who monitor directly what is happening within the classroom’ (p. 94). In concurrence with Bernstein (2000b), Ellwood and Davies (2010) argue that teachers, with school leaders’ attitudes, views, beliefs and actions, have a direct impact on the taught curriculum. Hence, there is a compelling array of literature which indicates that the way in which the IB learner profile is realised by students, is determined by the teacher and school leaders’ attitudes, views, beliefs and actions, that is, the regulative discourse.

Yet, as Chapter 5 highlights, teachers in the culturally homogenous staffing profile at Diamond Primary School labelled the large Asian population as conscientious, ambitious and obsessive in
its work ethic. Teachers’ and school leaders’ attitudes, views, beliefs and actions promoted
cultural capital rather than international mindedness. The dominant Anglophone staff, and
their prejudiced expectations about conduct, character and work ethic caused strong framing
between cultural groups. These factors indicate that international mindedness is not at the
heart of the regulative discourse of the school.

However, nine teachers stated that the attributes of the IB learner profile, the IB’s definition of
international mindedness, do not need to be infused in the instructional discourse. As three
teachers expressed: “I mean I don’t consciously teach them or think about them when I’m
teaching because the attributes...that just happens” (Participant E, October 2009); “It’s not like
we need to think about them [the attributes] when we’re teaching or planning” (Participant G,
October 2009); and:

There’s really no need, I don’t think...the kids are going to develop them (attributes of
the learner profile) no matter what you do, as long as you are making them aware of
them, and pointing them out for them. (Participant J, April 2010)

This implies that teachers did not even consider the attributes when planning learning
engagements. They believed that the development of the attributes of the IB learner profile
occurs with little direct input by the teacher. For example, Participant F believed that her
students developed the attributes naturally while they are working together in groups: “They
always pick them up in group work, because they need to cooperate and respect each other
when they’re working together” (Participant F, March 2010). Teachers shared this belief
despite the aforementioned intentions of the PYP, which specify the importance of teachers and
school leaders devising, owning and sharing the teaching and learning processes which facilitate
the most effective and appropriate ways of developing the IB learner profile (IBO 2007).

This suggests that teachers believed that the instructional discourse plays no role in developing
international mindedness. They believed that students develop international mindedness
naturally through the regulative discourses of the school. Indeed, Haywood (2007) claims that
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.

students immersed in a multicultural environment have the potential to develop a multicultural mindset form which ‘international educators can draw productively’ (p. 83). However, relying on the development of international mindedness to occur from a regulative discourse which has teachers and school leaders who hold judgemental attitudes, views and beliefs is largely problematic.

Even when teachers at Diamond Primary School pointed out the attributes of the IB learner profile through the regulative discourse, the attributes were only used to control classroom behaviour. The following comments illustrate this: "I use it when I’m on yard duty. I reward kids for being caring and that sort of stuff" (Participant J, April 2010):

Incidental opportunities are what really matter. Picking it up when they’re doing it, or pointing it out, using the language when you can throughout the day when you’re talking to the kids; (Participant A, November 2009)

I try to point it out when the kids are doing it, or I use it when I need to pull them into line, so it’s good like that. You know, “hey, [addressing student] you’re not showing respect”; (Participant H, December 2009)

I think it’s good to use to pick them up on it [the attributes]. Like, “fantastic, you were so honest then...you may have thrown a chair at someone, but you were honest about it”. (Participant G, October 2009)

Yet, while a teacher may wish to applaud a student for being honest about throwing a chair at someone, it does not necessarily mean that the teacher is developing international mindedness. Teachers had developed an un-critical understanding of the profile. They were merely using the language of the IB learner profile to regulate their own idea of student conduct, manner and behaviour rather than as a model from which to develop international mindedness.

Field note data reflects this theme, as it suggests that teachers only ever made reference to the attributes of the IB learner profile when managing behavioural issues. For example, while observing one class working together in different groups, one teacher was heard referring to the attributes while guiding her students to stay on task: "Please work cooperatively in your groups" (field note, 8 February 2010). When students spoke out of turn, teachers used the attributes to reprimand students, as the following comments demonstrate: "Excuse me (child’s
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.

name), you’re not showing respect” (field note, 15 February) and: “Please cooperate in this activity, otherwise you’ll be lost this afternoon when you have to report on your findings from this experiment’ (Classroom Teacher, field notes, 11 Feb 2010).

It may be argued that the way in which teachers utilised the IB learner profile at Diamond Primary School exerted authority over students. The IB learner profile became a tool from which the power relations were established between the student and teacher. Power relations were accomplished legitimately, as the IB learner profile is a model endorsed by an official international educational organisation. Power relations were maintained by school leaders continuing to endorse the selected agents and framework for teaching and learning. As Bernstein (2000b, p. 31) argues, power relations are maintained by school leaders selecting curriculum frameworks which 'have previously been legitimately pedagogised'.

In this way, school leaders and teachers were utilising the IB learner profile in a way that is contrary to the way the IB proposes the profile be implemented. At Diamond Primary School, the IB learner profile became a tool which empowered teachers to control student behaviour. It helped shape the very ground which made their Anglophone views and beliefs credible. Hence, the IB learner profile was not a model of international mindedness. It was a strategy to help teachers and school leaders reproduce Anglophone norms.

Yet, teachers' tokenistic reference to the attributes were made alongside a curriculum which provided little opportunities for students to understand their own and other cultures, or develop an understanding of the relation of interdependence between peoples and societies. The following comments illustrate this: “I don’t think that we’re teaching it [international mindedness] really” (Participant E, October 2009):

If developing international mindedness is about internationalising the curriculum then that doesn’t really happen here. I guess it does sometimes, like when you’re looking at issues of global nature, but I know I don’t consciously incorporate it at all. (Participant F, March 2010); and
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.

It’s not like we talk about things that are happening on the other side of the world...it’s not like we really delve into other cultures and find out why things are the way they are. (Participant G, October 2009)

Teachers’ interpretations and implementation of the PYP did not encourage students to learn the attributes of the IB learner profile with an international or global consciousness because teachers did not consciously plan for ways in which to teach the attributes through globalised or internationalised learning experiences. As Gacel-Ávilá’s (2005, p. 123) states: ‘the objective of internationalisation must be focused on an updating of academic content, making global phenomena understandable while promoting intercultural understanding and sustainable human development’. If the attributes are only ever pointed out through an instructional discourse which lacks opportunities for students to become inquirers into global and international issues, founded upon a regulative discourse reproducing cultural hierarchy, then it is most unlikely that students will interpret the attributes with a sense of internationalism in this way.

When discussing the planning of curriculum and assessment with teachers, nine teachers said that they did not focus on the attributes at all. As Participant F stated:

In terms of planning, I don’t even know if we include the attributes. If there’s a question on one of those planning documents then we would, and if we do I’m definitely not aware of it. Someone would have to put them in...I guess the curriculum coordinator does and if she does, then it’s not really like we do anything with them. (Participant F, February 2010)

These teachers claimed that they included the attributes in the curriculum at the start of the year: “We cover them (attributes) at the start of the year when we come up with our class definition” (Participant E, October 2009), but teachers stated that focus on the IB learner profile then declined for the duration of the year: “I mean, it’s [the IB learner profile] so minor...I’m not referring to it constantly throughout the year” (Participant E, October 2009).

Although trivial reference to the attributes of the IB learner profile was a dominant theme, the following three lessons highlight that on these occasions, some teachers attempted to foster a
global consciousness among students. During observations at the beginning of the year, one teacher asked students to place a string on a world map leading each student’s name from the edge of the map to their country of origin. This gave students a visual representation of the diverse backgrounds that their classmates came from. It encouraged an awareness of self and others at a global level. However, when referring to this learning engagement in an interview, Participant E stated that the investigation did not achieve much in terms of developing international mindedness. She explained that this learning experience was isolated from other content covered in the curriculum. It was not used as an impetus from which to actively foster internationally minded attitudes:

From the start of the year we talk about where we were born, where our parents were born, we look at what counties we come from, we look at places where we’ve been. (Participant E, October 2009)

She believed it was easier to internationalise the curriculum at the start of the year, because students wrote about their own diverse backgrounds. This teacher spoke of another lesson where students were required to:

Collect artefacts from around the world and stick them on our world map and when the kids have gone somewhere I stick their photo on the country and they say where they have been. (Participant E, October 2009)

Again, however, she felt this lesson to be “quite tokenistic” (Participant E, October 2009). Aside from these cursory learning experiences, Participant E believed that she does not infuse the attributes of the IB learner profile through the curriculum, or internationalised the curriculum: “I don’t think that we’re using the IB learner profile in the curriculum really, or including a global aspect” (Participant E, October 2009).

In another class, a teacher discussed the differences and similarities of homes and shelters in the various countries students came from (field note, 3 March 2010). This lesson appeared to prompt students to think internationally:
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.

This lesson promoted students to listen to the perspectives of others, share different points of view and engage in topics of a global and internationalised nature. (Field note, 24 March 2010)

It appeared to help students to develop an awareness of unequal wealth distribution in the world because the students were required to contrast the sizes of homes and different materials used to create homes in different geographical locations and conditions, and why this was so.

Participant A, D and E also believed that excursions and in-school visits have potential to foster an international and global consciousness. For example, Participant A said:

Excursions...they often relate to other countries and students thinking about their experiences in other countries. I think it was the Year 4s this year or last year, they did a thing where all parents from other countries could come and talk to the classes and talk about their experiences in immigrating to Australia. I think that as a program that could be really good. (Participant A, November 2009)

These teachers also believed that the International School-to-School Experience (ISSE) program had potential to develop international mindedness: “The ISSE program relates well with the IBO program...the international mindedness and all” (Participant A, November 2009). This program gives approximately ten students from the school the opportunity to visit another country for two weeks. Students are accommodated with a host family and attend the host family’s school for the duration of the visit.

However, these three teachers believed that the program, as it was implemented at Diamond Primary School, did not foster international mindedness. The following comments illustrate this: “I don’t know if it has an impact on our local school community at all” (Participant D, November 2009); and “the ways it’s done here, I don’t think it’s very effective in developing international mindedness at all” (Participant A, November 2009). Participant E explained that students did not engage in enough learning about the country students were visiting before and after the exchange to make it worthwhile, “so I don’t necessarily think that we’re looking at the broader picture” (Participant E, October 2009). Participants A and D agreed, stating that not only did the lack of learning before and after the exchange diminish the impact of the experience
for the students participating, but it also meant that the students who did not get the opportunity to participate gained nothing out of the exchange.

Being a program limited to only ten students, only 1% of the school’s student population are able to participate: “It's hard to make it work for the whole school because only a few kids are involved” (Participant A, November 2009). For the small benefits that the ISSE did have, this teacher believed that the ISSE program was only possible in a school with stakeholders capable of affording such an experience. Participant E explained that even for the students who were able to afford the cost, the lack of learning before and after the exchange meant that the ISSE was not a powerful resource for developing international mindedness because “the majority of the kids that go spend so much time overseas anyway” (Participant E, October 2009). For these reasons, Participant E said that “it’s [the ISSE] really tokenistic” (Participant E, October 2009). These findings suggest that Participants A, E and D believed that the ISSE has potential to be a useful resource from which to develop international mindedness but have concerns about how it is implemented at Diamond Primary School. This suggests that the effectiveness of the ISSE in developing international mindedness hinges on effective implementation, reaffirming Bernstein’s (2000b) claim that the realisation of knowledge depends entirely on pedagogic practices.

Although these lessons as well as the ISSE provided opportunities for students to care about global issues and develop knowledge of the world, on the whole, they represented an anomaly in the data. When opportunities for students to explore global issues or understand cultural traditions of a range of individuals and peoples did occur, it was usually a cursory lesson embedded in a literacy activity or an activity at the start of the year. These were most often isolated from the rest of the unit of work or related to books read in class. Requiring students to think internationally was not fully integrated across all disciplines or year levels of the curriculum.
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.

Hence, these findings indicate that teachers believe that the school has developed a piecemeal approach to developing international mindedness. Although it can be a challenge to include cognitive learning outcomes which address international mindedness in Mathematics and the Sciences, an agreed upon, planned and effective strategy for developing international mindedness was lacking in subjects that can easily incorporate learning outcomes which address international mindedness, such as History and English. Furthermore, when aspects of internationalism did occur, it was accidental, unintended, or, as the Chinese New Year activities demonstrated in Chapter 5, superficial and often, culturally stereotypical or even racist. Its tokenistic inclusion merely made teachers feel as though they were fostering international mindedness but on the whole, students were not encouraged to develop the attributes in a true international sense at all.

This is not to imply that teachers demonstrated inadequate teaching pedagogy. Findings suggest the contrary. Although the profile was not used as a model from which to develop specific learning outcomes leading to the development of international mindedness, data in the following table (Table 6) indicates that teachers’ overall pedagogical approach inadvertently developed all attributes of the IB learner profile. The problem is that even though teachers were encouraging students to develop all attributes of the IB learner profile, students were not developing the attributes with an international mindset because teachers were not internationalising the curriculum. The school leader is not represented in Table 6 as she was not teaching in a classroom at the time of research. The teacher who did not wish to be observed is also not represented in this table.
### Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.

#### 6-1 The development of attributes of the IB learner profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attitudes of IB learner profile</th>
<th>Participant B</th>
<th>Participant D</th>
<th>Participant E</th>
<th>Participant F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inquirers</strong></td>
<td>This teacher often let students show independence in their learning by developing their natural curiosity: ‘That’s a great idea (student’s name). Why don’t we put that question up on our Wonder Board for the whole class to investigate?’</td>
<td>Students were often given open ended tasks that allowed scope to zoom in on a particular inquiry that they were interested in. During one lesson, I watched students inquire about the positive and negative effects that substance use and diet can have on the human body. As a whole class, students shared different views and experiences on substance use, such as alcohol.</td>
<td>Like Participant B, this teacher had a “wonder wall” in her room where students were encouraged to list their own questions, related to the unit of inquiry.</td>
<td>During a guided reading session, this teacher encouraged students to consider their own questions to follow up after reading the text. When necessary, this teacher probed them with ideas, and further areas to inquire: ‘Great idea, think of another one...challenge yourself’ (field note, 18 November 2009).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant G</th>
<th>Participant H</th>
<th>Participant I</th>
<th>Participant J</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In a literacy rotation, this teacher discussed the text they had read with students and probed them to ask open-ended questions about the book. Where possible, she encouraged other students in the group to come up with possible answers. Students that asked open-ended questions were praised.</td>
<td>For this teacher, starting units off slowly was a necessity. Having introduced the unit in the previous week, students were encouraged to think of ‘could, would, how and what’ questions related to the new unit of inquiry on ‘The Human Body’.</td>
<td>This teacher used graphic organisers in a number of lessons. Graphic organisers are a visual representation or knowledge, ideas or concepts. They are used to assist in organising thoughts, promote understanding or clarity information. In one lesson she asked students to explore a type of celebration. Students had to complete a ‘compare</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>This teacher had a wonder wall. This is a place where students write their own questions related to the topic of inquiry. In this teacher’s classroom, this was a regular feature of each unit of inquiry. Students posted questions on ‘post it’ notes and placed them on the wonder wall.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant B</strong></td>
<td>In one lesson this teacher read a book to students on Australia. Students then completed a “compare and contrast” map where they listed the differences and similarities between Tasmania and Victoria. This lesson was weakly framed, as students could list any features about the two states that they wished.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant D</strong></td>
<td>During the inquiry unit on ‘The Human Body’, this teacher encouraged students to look into meaningful, real-life issues about the human body rather than focusing on rote learning of facts about the body.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant E</strong></td>
<td>Students were regularly engaged in tasks that required them to think in-depth. Adjacent to this teacher’s wonder wall was a “what I know” section where students could write answers to the questions they had previously posted on the wonder wall.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant F</strong></td>
<td>In this class, graphic organisers were utilised as a teaching tool in literacy rotations. Students had access to a wide range of texts related to the topic of inquiry. During class, students were able to refer to these whenever necessary. Students read these text voluntarily (most were non-fiction) when they had completed tasks.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant G</strong></td>
<td>Most of the activities in this class were activity-based. Often maths activities involved games related to the learning focus. During an inquiry unit on Australian explorers, students chose their own explorer on which to complete an assignment. Students then presented their findings at an ‘expo’ where wider members of the school community were invited to come and view their presentations.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant H</strong></td>
<td>During one lesson, students reflected on media images that depicted healthy and unhealthy bodies. This encouraged students to reflect on issues that were meaningful and relevant to their own life. Regular teacher prompts throughout the lesson encouraged them to think deeply about different images that they could use for their poster.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant I</strong></td>
<td>As a Mandarin teacher, Participant I often held conversations with students in class that were in Mandarin. In the lower year levels, students sang in Mandarin.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant J</strong></td>
<td>This teacher encouraged students to keep their own journals as a record of what they had learnt in class over the course of the year in the areas of Writing and Mathematics. If students were unsure of something and the teacher believed it was in the journal, she referred the students to the journal to look it up.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thinkers</th>
<th>Participant B</th>
<th>Participant D</th>
<th>Participant E</th>
<th>Participant F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participant B rarely explicitly answered student questions. Often she directed students toward the answer without revealing it herself: ‘Good question. I think that book that you read last week in reading groups might be able to help you out there. Let me get that for you’ (field note, 9 March 2010).</td>
<td>During a lesson, there was a picture of a poster depicting healthy and unhealthy body images. This prompted students to develop their understanding about real life issues. Students were encouraged not to just put pictures of food on the poster, but pictures of bodies as well, and to comment on why they chose certain bodies to go on the healthy side.</td>
<td>Students in this class often began the day with a complex problem solving activity. The activity did not usually take long, but engaged students in critical thinking skills as a whole class.</td>
<td>Students often completed graphic organisers in this class – particularly in literacy rotations. These activities always prompted students to think critically and creatively about different topics.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant G</th>
<th>Participant H</th>
<th>Participant I</th>
<th>Participant J</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participant G suggests she regularly opened up whole class interactive discussions about topics of interest to the students. These conversations were very weakly framed, as students felt comfortable enough to contribute to the conversation whenever they had something to add.</td>
<td>Similar to Participant D’s class, students completed their posters on healthy and unhealthy bodies. Students then had to write a summary about the poster and justify why each picture was on the allocated poster.</td>
<td>In the lead up to the Chinese New Year whole school celebration day, this teacher asked students in the senior year level to design a dragon without a template. Students then made the dragon and it was used at the special Chinese New Year assembly.</td>
<td>Rather than directly answering students’ questions straight away, this teacher encouraged students to follow up their own questions related to the topic of inquiry, making them think deeply about issues that were meaningful to them.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Communicator</th>
<th>Participant B</th>
<th>Participant D</th>
<th>Participant E</th>
<th>Participant F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students were often encouraged to work in groups during class activities. Students were assigned roles in which were rotated to ensure each student</td>
<td>This teacher gave students many opportunities to communicate with a wide range of peers in group activities through inquiry based learning activities. These activities were</td>
<td>During an inquiry about the effects substance abuse and diet can have on the body, students worked collaboratively in groups, listening to each other and</td>
<td>Students regularly shared their findings, stories or assignments with the class upon completion of the unit. Other students were encouraged to direct questions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Experienced each role.</th>
<th>Typically group activities, where students were required to work with peers to develop understanding about real life issues.</th>
<th>Sharing their own ideas. All groups then presented their own poster at the end of the lesson.</th>
<th>To students presenting their work.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant G</strong></td>
<td>Communication between students and the students and the teacher was weakly framed. While completing tasks, students were able to walk around the classroom if they wanted to ask the teacher or a student a question.</td>
<td>A student confidently asked &quot;What do the ribs do?&quot; Participant H listened, and responded by suggesting that the student research this in her computer time in reading rotations. The student then followed through with this inquiry and reported her findings to the class at the conclusion of the lesson.</td>
<td>Students often completed assignments or class activities in groups. The teacher usually chose the groups, but all students were encouraged to contribute equally to the activity, as the teacher was constantly moving from group to group to encourage the less confident children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant H</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>During two units of inquiry that I observed in this class, students were required to prepare a class presentation at the end of the unit to present findings. In one presentation, a student was reluctant to present to the entire class. Participant J responded by asking her to give her presentation to a smaller group of her friends in a nearby room.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant I</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant J</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Principled            | Participant B regularly asked students “hands up if you think that you are working hard” rather than publicly pointing out the students who were not working well. This indicates weak framing, as the teacher was giving control to the students in judging their work manner, | This teacher often allowed students to set their own deadlines to tasks set in class. In this way, the pacing of assignments was weakly framed as the teacher was placing much of the control in the students’ hands. The trust this teacher demonstrated | Participant E regularly asked students to reflect on their own actions when she believed their behaviour to be harmful to others. Honesty was one of the words the class had together agreed on for their Essential Agreement. | Teaching quite a young class, this teacher showed that she trusted the students by allowing them to go to the toilet by themselves, and completing simple errands such as taking forms to the office when necessary. By trusting the students, students | Participant F |
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant G</th>
<th>Participant H</th>
<th>Participant I</th>
<th>Participant J</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It was an expectation that students manage their own working time. Rather than starting a lesson with a rigid timetable of how students were to manage their time, there was an implicit expectation that students in this class would be principled by starting their work on time, finishing it on time and taking care of their own materials and desk management. This seemed to have positive outcomes, as students usually started their work immediately and often had it completed by the end of the lesson. Being an expectation, rather than something that is explicitly instructed and then passively ‘followed’ by each student, it encouraged students to be principled.</td>
<td>This teacher allowed students to collect their own material for their projects. By allowing students to be responsible for collecting their own paper, pens, pencils etc, this teacher was showing students that she trusted them, giving them the opportunity to develop responsibility and honesty, in order to be principled.</td>
<td>This teacher encouraged the school community to act with integrity as they all participated in the Chinese New Year celebrations. Although this inquiry unit did not transfer across disciplines (all planning was undertaken in Mandarin classes) the whole school participated through viewing a traditional dragon dance and other Chinese dances at a school assembly. For many, this was not a celebration in which they had ever taken part. Students were encouraged to develop respect for other groups and communities through this cultural event. This was one learning engagement that did encourage students to think internationally.</td>
<td>Over the course of one month, this teacher worked through a maths topic that required the use of coins. The teacher explained to the class that rather than using pretend money, she wanted them use real money; “because I trust that all of you will not lose the money, and will be honest by putting all of the coins back in the bag at the end of every lesson” (field note, 4 November 2009).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All teachers treated their students with respect and set up an expectation in the learning environment that students would respect others in their class, endorsing each class’s ‘Essential Agreement’ (classroom expectations, or ‘rules’ collaboratively developed by students). Allowing students to be responsible for their own decision making in their learning, and encouraging students to develop a sense of how their own...
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.

decisions affect their learning and lives also encouraged students to be principled

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Risk-Taker</th>
<th>Participant B</th>
<th>Participant D</th>
<th>Participant E</th>
<th>Participant F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>This teacher’s class took part in a swim program. One of her students was scared of water, and was hesitant to attend the program. Two weeks prior to the program, this teacher encouraged the child’s interest in water through inspirational videos on swimming champions, activity books and searching the internet on water safety. The child then was able comfortable enough to take a risk by attending the swimming program, where he took part in all activities with the rest of the class.</td>
<td>Given that this classroom environment was rich with different cultural backgrounds, students were encouraged to be risk takers when contributing to whole class discussions addressing sensitive issues relevant to the human body such as substance use, changes in the body throughout puberty and sex education, (the topic the whole class had previously been reserved about).</td>
<td>In this teacher’s classroom, students were given an exam that many found challenging. The teacher was alerted to this, and responded by offering more encouragement than normal: “Do your best guys...you’re working really well. Keep it up” (field note, 18 February 2010).</td>
<td>For one student in this class, overcoming her fears of taking part in the class cross country was a challenge. Rather than allowing the student to avoid the cross country, this teacher jogged every morning before school with the student. The student then felt confident enough to take part in the cross country.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant G</th>
<th>Participant H</th>
<th>Participant I</th>
<th>Participant J</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participant G took her students out for games every day. She believed this was important for building confidence. Over the course of my observations in this class, I noted that the more timid students appeared to be more interactive in the games at the end of my research period than they were at the beginning.</td>
<td>The teaching strategies Participant H implemented encouraged students to gain confidence in their ability to take risks, as she often used positive language when helping a student rather than looking for their shortfall: ‘I like the way you’ve done this...now you could try thinking about it from a different angle. How else do you think he felt?’ (field note, 10</td>
<td>Rather than asking for volunteers, this teacher chose the students to present at the assembly for the Chinese New Year Celebrations herself. The teacher explained that this was because she wanted to give opportunities to students that were not used to talking in front of the school community at assembly.</td>
<td>This teacher encouraged a student to attempt something they were unsure about; drawing a caricature of her partner. The teacher gave her the confidence she needed to get started on the drawing so that she could take a risk in this task.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Balanced</th>
<th>Participant B</th>
<th>Participant D</th>
<th>Participant E</th>
<th>Participant F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participant B encouraged students to stop for a fruit break every morning after the first 50 minutes. In this way, she was encouraging students to achieve a balance between their intellectual and physical well-being.</td>
<td>The expectation in the learning environment was one of high achievement, yet this was so well balanced by this teacher's use of humour. The environment of the classroom was balanced – deadlines were negotiated with each student rather than passed down from teacher to student.</td>
<td>This teacher was aware of the hard working ethic of students in her class, and often encouraged them to set realistic deadlines themselves for their home learning tasks and assignments. &quot;Just remember that you need to time to have fun as well&quot; (Participant E, field notes, 23 February 2010).</td>
<td>Once a week, this teacher took her class out to play three games together as a class. She believed that this encouraged students to consider a balance between work and play. She rarely set tasks for students to complete at home as she felt it important that students relax after working hard at school. If she set homework, it was always a fun investigation related to the topic of inquiry.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant G</td>
<td>By playing a game with the class every day, this teacher was modelling the importance of intellectual, physical and emotional balance.</td>
<td>When this teacher saw students getting tired in her lessons, she often stopped and moved the students outside for a quick game or jog around the oval. She also encouraged students to set realistic goals for their learning rather than ones that may cause students stress: &quot;Do you think that’s fair on yourself? How about just trying to get this part of the homework done this week, and saving the other side of the sheet for next week? It’s not due for two</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant H</td>
<td>This teacher always started the lesson off with a song or a game in Mandarin. She believes that this taught the students the balance between work, and having fun.</td>
<td>When deciding on a due date for assignments, this teacher allowed students to have a say in when they could submit a task: &quot;Let’s all think about when we can do our presentations. Don’t do them too soon, because you'll want plenty of time to research your chosen topic&quot; (Participant J, field notes, 24 February 2010).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Chapter 6: Tools of the trade.**

<p>| | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Caring</strong></td>
<td>All teachers in the study encouraged a caring learning environment through positive classroom behaviour management such as looking for ways in which students could improve their behaviour rather than pointing out their failures. Students struggling to understand the lines of inquiry in units of work were placed on a modified curriculum. This involves the teacher developing an independent learning improvement plans in liaison with their parents.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reflective</strong></td>
<td>All teachers required students to reflect on their own learning through keeping a &quot;reflective journal&quot;. Through the journal, students were encouraged to look for what they had done well and areas they could improve on. From this, teacher participants stated that they then encouraged students to set goals for their own learning in collaboration with the teacher.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Open-Minded</strong></td>
<td><strong>Participant B</strong></td>
<td><strong>Participant D</strong></td>
<td><strong>Participant E</strong></td>
<td><strong>Participant F</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students were asked to bring in artefacts on communication from either the past or present. They then shared them with the class. This teacher was encouraging students to be open-minded to different types of communication from the past and present.</td>
<td>Both of these teachers encouraged students to bring in an artefact on communication that had significant value to them. Like Participant B, the teachers then asked students to share why their artefact had sentimental value to them. Students shared their thoughts in small groups. They then wrote about their own artefact as well an artefact from a different time era to their own.</td>
<td>This teacher’s use of graphic organisers ensured that students looked at phenomena from different angles. In one task, students sorted homes from different climates in Australia into groups. Working in groups, students were supported to listen to the views of others and be open-minded to each others’ ideas.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Participant G</strong></td>
<td><strong>Participant H</strong></td>
<td><strong>Participant I</strong></td>
<td><strong>Participant J</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>This teacher often encouraged students to think from different points of view. When her students were learning about Australian explorers, she</td>
<td>This teacher often asked students to share ideas together in whole class discussions. On one particular day, students laughed when one boy shared something.</td>
<td>These two teachers believed in giving students the opportunity to present assignments in different formats. Students were not allowed to present an assignment in the same way throughout the course of the year. In this way, these teachers both believed that this encouraged students to be creative and open-minded to</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>encouraged students to be the explorer for one day. They were required to dress like an explorer and abstain from using electricity or other modern luxuries for one day. This encouraged students to think from the point of view of someone who lived in a different time era.</td>
<td>This teacher took control of the whole class discussion and encouraged the class to not only listen to other people’s points of view, but to try and understand and appreciate them rather than just expecting people to have the same opinion as themselves.</td>
<td>the different ways in which they can express their knowledge of a given topic.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade

The data presented in Table 6 suggests that teachers at Diamond Primary School used “inquiry learning” as their pedagogical approach. Inquiry learning ‘can have many starting points and be implemented in many ways’ (Wilson & Wing Jan 2009, p. 6). Generally though, literature characterises it as students building new knowledge onto their prior knowledge base, making connections between ideas and their own personal experiences and building deep conceptual understandings rather than accumulating lists of facts. It involves students creating their own questions about a topic and having the time to explore the answers. Throughout the topic, students are both problem posers and problem solvers (Wilson & Wing Jan 2009).

Data from interviews supports this theme, as all teachers referred to inquiry learning when describing their pedagogical approach. As one teacher stated: “My students do a lot of research instead of [me] telling them...[they do] a lot of inquiry. They help frame the questions they answer themselves” (Participant I, May 2010). She believed that she encouraged students to work through problems and ask questions that were relevant to their own world. They were encouraged to construct new knowledge onto their existing knowledge base through making their own discoveries. In this way, she believed that they had some autonomy over their own learning: “I think it's important to try and get them to have some say in what they're going to learn, and when you can, [and] how they're going to learn it” (Participant B, November 2009).

Reiterating this view, Participant H said:

I just start them slowly and just keep talking about things you know...building up their questions... just keep on mentioning it, and as we build up, it's more just throwing it in at the start so that we can all get an idea of it. (Participant H, March 2010)

From these findings, it may be proposed that without the teacher even considering international mindedness when planning or teaching, through the inquiry learning approach, without even mentioning international mindedness, it is possible for students to demonstrate all attributes of the IB learner profile. For example, through teachers:
• encouraging students to be caring by respecting and tolerating each other’s diverse choices in their learning and listening to each other’s questions

• creating a stimulating learning environment through allowing students to inquire into their own relevant and meaningful real-life problems, developing their natural curiosity: “

• encouraging students to be open-minded when they allow time for students to share ideas with each other and respond to other student’s ideas

• developing thinkers by encouraging students to find solutions to their own problems, while still keeping the students on the line of inquiry

• encouraging students to take risks by encouraging them to try new problem solving techniques, allowing them to inquire topics unknown to them, and “getting kids to try new things that they’re not used to when they’re doing stuff is really important, because it’s teaching them to take a risk” (Participant D, Nov 2009)

• setting up a classroom environment based on trust that encourages students to develop integrity, and so, develop skills to be principled

• allowing students to become knowledgeable by encouraging their curiosity through exploring relevant, real life concepts, ideas and issues

• allowing students to be reflective by planning the ways they engage with efforts to address particular questions and through self-assessment of their strengths and limitations – usually at the closure of lessons and in each student’s reflective journal: “It’s so important for them to share their work at the end of the lesson, and recap what they’ve learnt and done” (Participant B, October 2009)

• establishing a balanced classroom environment, giving thoughtful consideration to sensible deadlines for their assignments related to their own choice of questions, as well as being considerate of each student’s physical, intellectual and emotional needs
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade

- setting up a learning environment that encourages students to be *communicators* by expressing their thoughts, feelings and ideas confidently and effectively in either small group work or in front of their class. Teachers also encourage students to listen to each other’s ideas and feelings in their group and class.

This indicates it is possible to encourage students to develop all attributes of the IB learner profile without necessarily encouraging students to be internationally minded at all. As one teacher said:

> I mean, if you can teach a kid to learn the names of the dinosaurs, then you can teach them the attributes. If you’re using the language all of the time, you can hear them saying it as well. They pick up on it all right. (Participant D, May 2010)

Yet this is not the aim of the IB learner profile. The profile aims to provide a model of international mindedness. Its aim is to produce attitudes, recognition, predispositions, empathy, tolerance and care in relation to our inter-connected world. This is vastly different to providing a character building tool. However, because the following opportunities, proposed by the IB, were not evident at Diamond Primary School, any incorporation of the IB learner profile was in contrast to how it is intended to be employed by the IB:

- teachers and school leaders valuing and making productive use of the diversity of cultures and perspectives that exist in the school and in the local, national and global communities
- teachers and school leaders promoting student learning that develops student’s own cultural identity, and celebrates and fosters understanding of different cultures
- teachers providing opportunities for students to learn about issues that have local, national and global significance. (IBO 2011c)

Without internationalism driving the planning of curriculum and permeating every activity within the school, students were not able to learn the attributes of the IB learner profile in
relation to the inter-connected world. In this way, the IB learner profile was no more than a character building tool.

This proposition supports Bernstein's (2000b) aforementioned claim that both the instruction and regulative discourse are not distinct. There is only one discourse resulting from the relationships shared between the regulative and instructional discourses. At Diamond Primary School, the resulting discourse from the instructional and regulative discourse does not develop specific learning outcomes leading to the development of international mindedness because the instructional discourse is not internationalised and is founded upon a regulative discourse which permeates judgemental, stereotypical views of some cultures rather than international mindedness. As Bernstein (2000b, p. 34) argues that the ‘regulative discourse produces the order of the instructional discourse. There is no instructional discourse which is not regulated by the regulative discourse’.

This also confirms Bernstein's (2000b, p. 33) claim that as a curriculum move ‘it is ideologically transformed’. The intentions of the way a curriculum is proposed to be taught can be entirely different to how it is implemented: ‘Skills, tasks or areas of work’ (p. 59) proposed in the curriculum can completely disappear. The curriculum authorities map out the curriculum framework. Teachers then interpret it and teach it according to their understanding. They make selections based on their own values about what is considered to be important. Even though the development of international mindedness lies at the heart of the PYP, when teaching the curriculum, these findings suggest that teachers do not consider it important.

6.2 THE IB LEARNER PROFILE — A FACADE

The findings discussed thus far indicate that there are contrasting messages at Diamond Primary School. The school has adopted an international curriculum which alleges to develop internationally minded students, but the content of lessons and teachers’ pedagogical approach overlooks a host of possibilities for students to make connections with global issues. It may be
interpreted that promoting the IB learner profile creates no more than a mythological discourse (Bernstein 2000b). It makes it appear as though teachers are developing international mindedness, and so, offering a balanced, educational experience that is appropriate to the challenges of the 21st century through the teaching of international mindedness. Beneath the surface, however, international mindedness is not a valued component of the regulative and instrumental discourses of the school.

This mythological discourse was mainly reinforced by promoting glossy posters of the attributes of the IB learner profile in every classroom and corridor of the school. The posters consisted of a photo of a student, or group of students, accompanied by a description of how that student is demonstrating a particular attribute of the IB learner profile. The posters were identical in all rooms of the school, with the exception of Participant F’s classroom (field note, 11 February 2010). This teacher had created her own interpretation of each attributes by turning each attribute into a character from the "Mr Men" series. Her charts had an illustration of a Mr Men character, its name, and words written about each character. For example, "Mr Risk Taker" was described as being ‘someone who is willing to try new things’ (field note, 11 February 2010). "Mr Caring" was ‘someone who helps others when they are hurt or do not have any friends to play with’ (field note, 11 February 2010). In the sense of promoting the development of ‘internationally minded people who, recognising our common humanity and shared guardianship of the plan’ (IBO 2007, p. 4), these charts were futile. Participant F claimed that she referred to the "Mr Men" attributes that were hanging on her wall: “The attributes are on the walls and when I need to, I refer to them” (Participant J, March 2010). Field note data, however, indicates that no reference was made to the charts while observations were underway in that classroom. The charts’ purpose was not of a pedagogical base. They were exhibited in order to give the impression that the teacher was developing international mindedness.

By school leaders making it a mandatory requirement for all teachers to create a visual display of the attributes, the power of this mythological discourse was reinforced. The following
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade

comments illustrate this: “I know I’m required to display them, to make it evident that it’s a part of what we do here. It makes it all look good” (Participant J, March 2010); “I display them in my room, because I know that we’re supposed to do that” (Participant G, February, 2010); and “Everywhere you go in the school, like in the corridors, they’re [the attributes] staring you in the face telling you we’re doing something that we’re not” (Participant H, December 2009). These teachers believed that publicly displaying the attributes was a scheme aimed at creating an illusory impression. It made the school’s teaching practices look superior. It made it appear as though the school had embraced an esteemed educational philosophy that developed respectable, moral individuals. Displaying the attributes was not only ineffective in terms of developing the attributes, but a façade. As Participant H expressed: “It’s [displaying the attributes] just for the sake of it. It’s showy and all a facade” (Participant H, December 2009).

Through promoting the IB learner profile, hierarchical cultural relations created in the regulative discourse were concealed, as it made it appear as though teachers themselves were embracing tolerance, empathy and respect. The IB learner profile covered up teachers’ stereotypical views of the Asian population in the school as it permeated images of a school with an internationally minded ideology. As Bernstein (2000b, p. xxii) argues:

It is clear that conflict, or potential conflict, between social groups may be reduced or contained by creating a discourse which...makes massive attempts to create horizontal solidarities among their staff and students, irrespective of the political ideology and social arrangement of the society.

It was an attempt to create the appearance of a “peaceful coexistence” between different cultures at the school. Yet in reality, as the preceding chapter reveals, the Anglophone culture held the position of cultural dominance in the school.

The mythological discourse which covered up cultural hierarchy was further reinforced in planning documents. When examining planning documents, one, two or three attributes were listed in each unit of inquiry for every year level. Teachers included the attributes in IB planning documents but then did not consider them when teaching. The only reason the
attributes of the IB learner profile were included in planning documents was to give the impression that teachers were using it to foster international mindedness, but in reality, teachers were using it to control student behaviour. In this way, the inclusion of the IB learner profile in planning documents as well as any posters in the school were no more than a masquerade.

6.3 SUMMARY

Findings on how teachers develop international mindedness highlight that the IB learner profile was used in two main ways. First, the IB learner profile was a tool from which teachers and school leaders could control student behaviour. Hence, it was not regarded as a model from which to develop international mindedness. By reinforcing attributes only when reprimanding students, teachers were able to exert authority over students. This helped establish relations of power between students and teachers. This highlights the importance of ensuring that teachers and school leaders understand that the attributes by themselves are not an adequate definition of international mindedness. They are merely a structure from which to develop a shared and effective strategy for fostering international mindedness through the regulative and instructional discourses of the school. In the regulative discourse, international mindedness needs to influence every organisational and administrative decision. The instructional discourse needs to be saturated with opportunities for students to develop a deep understanding of their own and other student's cultural identity.

Secondly, the IB learner profile was used as a façade. It covered up the fact that the school leaders and teachers do not actually value or make productive use of the diversity of cultures and perspectives that exist in the school, or encourage learning that fosters international mindedness. It made it appear as though school leaders, teachers and the school were internationally minded. However, as findings from Chapter 5 indicate, this was not so.
Chapter 6: Tools of the trade

While Chapter 8 explores the second point, why school leaders were interested in creating this façade, the following chapter (Chapter 7) addresses the first point. It reveals why teachers believe that they were unable to provide an effective approach to developing international mindedness and why they developed a piecemeal approach to developing international mindedness through the IB learner profile.
7 THE PYP AND CHAOS

To reiterate, the IB *Program, standards and practices guide* (Bernstein 2000a, p. 1942; IBO 2011c) and the IB *learner profile booklet* (IBO 2006) emphasise the importance of teachers and school leaders collaboratively developing an effective strategy which aims to permeate the attributes of the IB learner profile throughout the school’s aims, objectives, curriculum, and assessment processes. The importance of collaboratively constructing assessment, curriculum and pedagogical approaches which infuse the notion of internationalism is a strong feature of these documents in order to emphasise international values (Hill 2007). These resources are also proposed to offer ‘a consistent structure of aims and values and an overarching concept of how to develop international mindedness’ (IBO 2006, p. 1) for schools implementing either the PYP, MYP or DP. Findings from Chapter 6, however, suggest that the ways in which teachers were able to practically apply these resources to classroom practices was minimal at best.

This chapter sets out to explain why teachers resorted to haphazard ways of developing international mindedness – despite the guidelines suggested in the IB *Program, standards and practices guide* and the IB *Learner profile booklet*. The chapter is illustrative of the actual experiences teachers had while working in a school implementing the PYP.

7.1 COLLABORATION AND THE IB LEARNER PROFILE

Hill (2007, p. 35) states that international mindedness should be promoted through the curriculum via the IB learner profile:

> The implementation of the ‘IB learner profile’ is specified in these standards, which address the nature of the school’s philosophy, organisation, formal curriculum, informal curriculum and interaction with the school’s external community. IB World Schools work towards the attainment of these standards in order to provide a learning environment in which international mindedness can be nurtured.

Specifically, the IB *program standards and practice guide* (IBO 2011c) states that teachers implementing the PYP are required to focus on one, two or three attributes in classroom and
assessment practices of each unit of inquiry. In this way, over the course of the year, the PYP learner should have exposure to all attributes of the IB learner profile. At a whole school level the IB learner profile is to be infused in ‘the daily life, management and leadership of the school’ (IBO 2006, p. 1). The fact that teachers only ever used the attributes of the IB learner profile as a disciplinary tool through incidental, cursory opportunities suggests that teachers were not able to confidently draw from key aspects of the PYP framework.

When teachers expressed why they relied on incidental opportunities to develop the IB learner profile, nine teachers explained that it was because they were required to use the IB learner profile without working together to establish an understanding of how to implement the profile within the context of the Diamond Primary School. The following comments illustrate this: “We can’t really teach the profiles properly because we haven’t learnt how to, or [have not] even worked together to figure it all out” (Participant A, November 2009); and: “We all didn’t really understand the big picture...because we weren’t given any support” (Participant G, March 2010); furthermore:

*The message that came from leadership was that they just wanted to introduce learner profiles and...we actually had to start planning with the planners before we even worked out what they were or what to do with them...I don’t think that we’re teaching it really.* (Participant E, October 2009)

These findings underscore Haywood’s (2007) claim that teachers are unsure of how to develop the attributes of the IB learner profile. However, they extend this aspect of Haywood’s theory by indicating that teachers are confused because they have not collaboratively established clear guidelines, aims and objectives to accompany the IB learner profile that is appropriate for their school community.

Therefore, teachers’ confusion does not necessarily highlight that there is a problem with the IB learner profile itself. Along with the IB mission statement, the IB learner profile provides a structural outline of international mindedness. The attributes provide the outcomes for achieving international mindedness. Providing outcomes without explicitly specifying how to
develop the attributes allows scope from which each student is able to express international mindedness in their own way. It also allows scope for teachers to work together in order to establish clear aims, objectives and expectations accompanying the profile.

Having a prescribed set of guidelines accompanying the IB learner profile may prevent each school from developing their own strategy for its own unique school community (Cause 2009, 2010b; Hurley 2008). The way in which one international school in Victoria supports the teaching of international mindedness may be totally different to the way a school in China, or even another school within Victoria develops international mindedness – but both schools could utilise the same model – the IB learner profile. Haywood (2007) and Cause (2008, 2010b) argue that this is important, because interpretations of attributes of the IB learner profile vary amongst different cultures, making the expression of international mindedness variable in the way students demonstrate international mindedness. As Haywood (2007, p. 81) argues, it is not the teacher’s role to indoctrinate students into their own understandings of international mindedness. International mindedness is ‘a multifaceted entity that can be represented in a wide variety of practical forms’.

Indeed, Bernstein (2000b, p. xxii) argues that in order for teachers to teach effectively, it is essential that teachers are given opportunities to reflect collaboratively on what is to be learnt and how it is to be learnt:

Acquisition requires effectively trained, committed, motivated and adequately salaried teachers with career prospects, sensible to the possibilities and contribution of all their pupils, operating in a context which provides the conditions for effective acquisition, and an education which enables reflection on what is to be acquired and how it is to be acquired.

Where there are inadequate opportunities for teachers to collaboratively reflect on what is required, although some teachers may comprehend some aspects of the curriculum, most teachers ‘will become aware that the mystery of discourse is not order, but disorder, incoherence’ (Bernstein 2000b, p. 11). Teachers will believe it is impossible to successfully
teach the programme. Curriculum incoherence and inconsistency will most likely become the end result. This has occurred at Diamond Primary School. Despite the aforesaid advice and recommendations proposed by the IBO and Hill, the IB learner profile is not implemented in the school's formal curriculum.

Five teachers expressed that they collaborated on the planning of the curriculum, but not the IB learner profile. As one teacher expressed:

We meet to discuss our planners and assessment tasks for the unit of inquiry, but as yet, we haven’t worked together to work out anything about the profile yet. I just ask [name omitted] because she’s doing the diploma course. (Participant J, May 2010)

Four other teachers agreed. These teachers revealed that everything they had learnt about the IB learner profile was from the four teacher colleagues who had recently completed a university diploma on the PYP.

I was fortunate because I was next to someone that was doing an outside course in it [PYP] at the time. So I was able to look in on what she was doing, and see the way she was doing things, because she was doing things for her degree. I don’t know how much my experience is similar to others in the school, in that we needed that exposure from the teachers in the school that were studying externally to the school. (Participant D, March 2010)

During a year level curriculum planning meeting, one teacher was heard saying: "Where's (teacher's name)? We can’t do this without her!" (field note, 17 February 2010). This teacher was referring to one of the teachers who had completed the PYP diploma course. Two other teachers confided: "Having one person in my team who has done that course helps a bit. At least someone knows what they’re doing" (Participant H, March 2010); and:

It seems that the only ones who know anything about what’s going on are the few people that did that course outside of school..that university diploma. If I need to ask anything, I just go and ask one of them because they know a bit. Their classrooms are good to look at and think, “oh, that’s what it’s about”. If it wasn’t for them though, it would be really tough. (Participant J, February 2010)

These comments suggest that these teachers believed that having teacher mentors or coaches to aid them in learning how to implement the PYP would be beneficial. As one teacher expressed:
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

It would be really good to have time set aside, where we can just open up with each other and learn exactly what the profile is all about and how we can work with it, even if it’s just with another teacher from a PYP school or something. (Participant F, February 2010)

At Diamond Primary School, this was not initiated by school leaders. Furthermore, allowing time for the teachers who had completed the diploma on the PYP to share their knowledge in a formal setting, such as a staff meeting, did not occur. Data reveals that staff meetings were consumed by housekeeping matters and other broad topics such as student learning, differentiation, year level planning, anaphylaxis training and first-aid training. At no stage was the topic of international mindedness discussed, and no time to reflect on the IB learner profile was given.

Due to the fact that reflective collaboration and adequate support was not provided on the topic of the IB learner profile, a shared understanding of how to implement the IB learner profile in the context of the school was not established. This has caused teachers to construct their own version of the IB learner profile from the fragmented pieces of information that they understand. Although Haywood (2007) asserts that it is not such a bad thing for teachers to construct their own meanings of the IB learner profile, teachers’ fabricated versions represents a fractured reality of how it is proposed in the IB program standards and practices guide (IBO 2011c).

What is occurring can be best described by Ball (2006a), who extends Bernstein’s (2000b) theory on curriculum incoherence:

Organisations in different market positions are likely to arrive at different forms of strategic response. Those on a weak ‘market’ or performance position may well submit to becoming what ever it seems necessary to become in order to survive... The heart of the educational project is gouged out and left empty. Authenticity is replaced entirely by plasticity. (Ball 2006a, p. 153)

Teachers felt confused because of the lack of opportunities to establish a shared understanding of how to implement the IB learner profile. As a result, teachers resorted to doing whatever was
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

necessary in order to appear as though they were using it in their teaching practices, such as using the attributes to manage behavioural issues. In this way, an internationally minded version of the IB learner profile was replaced by another ‘mythological discourse’ (Bernstein 2000a, p. xxiii). Ball (2006a, p. 153) extends this aspect of Bernstein’s theory, terming it a ‘fabrication’. Fabrications are a teacher’s response to a common problem resulting from a lack of understanding of the aims, philosophy and objectives of the curriculum:

Fabrications are a way of eluding or deflecting direct surveillance [because] they provide a façade of calculation between the organisation and its environment...They are a betrayal...an investment in plasticity.

Teacher constructed versions of the IB learner profile meant that the heart of the PYP was extricated and left hollow. Such versions made visible by using the attributes incidentally throughout the day, and by displaying the attributes in classrooms, concealed the void. Hence, it not only covered up hierarchical arrangements of the school, as Chapter 6 highlighted, but it concealed teachers’ lack of understanding of ways in which to develop international mindedness.

7.2 Professional learning opportunities for staff at Diamond Primary School

Teachers cannot possibly understand what is intended to be taught and how it is meant to be taught when they are not supported in a context which provides them with adequate opportunities to understand (Bernstein 2000b). Hayden (2002, p. 124) extends this aspect of Bernstein’s theory. Hayden emphasises the importance of school leaders providing adequate professional development opportunities for teachers working in international schools:

If teachers in internationally minded schools are, indeed, to play this crucial role [of developing international mindedness] they will need professional development support, provided in such a way as to promote the ideals of international education to which so many international schools aspire.
Yet, nine of the ten informants, the exception being the school leader, commented on the lack of professional learning opportunities to gain knowledge about the PYP in general. The following examples illustrate this: “I don’t know enough about the program as a whole yet or the development of international mindedness in general because we haven’t learnt about it” (Participant E, October 2009); “We have no idea what we’re doing because we haven’t really been taught...it’s so hard to make sense of it all” (Participant A, November 2009); “I don’t think that we have enough understanding of the PYP as a staff” (Participant B, October 2009); and:

During the first two years, I didn't understand a single thing because I didn’t get to go to anything [professional development opportunities]. So I didn’t have any help with knowing what to do with the PYP. None at all really. (Participant H, December, 2010)

These nine teachers claimed that it was not just the IB learner profile that they felt unsure about but the PYP in general: beginning at the school when the PYP was first introduced, this teacher was provided with no introduction to the PYP. Indeed, beginning at any new school can be daunting. As Richards (2002, p. 105) argues:

Adapting to a new school culture can be a painful experience. Changes in routine, regulations, communication and planning are easily accommodated, but less easy to absorb are changes in such things as pastoral approach and responsibility, assessment methodology and pedagogical ‘style’.

However, not only did this teacher have to accommodate unfamiliar routines and regulations of a new school, but she also had to adapt to teaching the PYP concurrently with VELS. To further compound these difficulties, Participant H was placed into the PYP focus group:

For two years, I had no idea what was going on. It was so daunting, and to make matters worse, I was in the PYP focus group... The PYP meetings...I was completely lost. (Participant H, March 2010)

All teachers expressed the view that only one seminar on the PYP had been offered to all staff in the two years since implementing the PYP. This was a compulsory two day workshop administered by the IBO: “Ever since it's been here, we've only had that seminar at the start...That was two years ago now” (Participant F, March 2010); and “There was that one a
couple of years ago that some people went to” (Participant A, November 2009). Although the IBO advises that the workshop is compulsory for all staff in IB schools to attend, due to the workshop being held on a Sunday and Monday in early 2008, of the ten teachers interviewed, only four teachers attended. Six teachers were unable to attend due to travel commitments, religious celebrations and family commitments. As one teacher expressed: “I know there were people who didn’t go because they already had things lined up” (Participant F, March 2010).

Three out of the four participants who attended the full two days claimed that it was helpful: “We had the two day seminar which was over a weekend. That was really good. We needed all of that” (Participant G, February 2010). However, they expressed the view that too much information was covered in the two days. These teachers believed that this saturation of information was overwhelming. As Participant D explained:

I felt like I went into those PDs thinking ‘this may make sense in half an hour, or one day’ and expecting that if I collected all that they said and held onto it until I knew what to do with it, and then go ‘oh, that goes here’. I forgot the fact that nobody else actually knew what was going on as well! I thought everybody else knew something that I didn’t. (Participant D, March 2010)

When expressing why teachers found it overwhelming, three teachers said that it was because the workshop was conducted prior to having experienced teaching with the PYP. The following quotations express this: “It [The IB workshop] was done before we even knew what it [the PYP] really was” (Participant F, March, 2010):

Sitting through the workshop without teaching with the PYP meant that we couldn’t really understand what was going on. It was so early on in the piece so I was still learning. (Participant D, March 2010); and

It would be better if we were scaffolded into it more sequentially…it’s too much to understand at once, which is why I only took away the learner profiles [attributes] because I just had to manage with what I could understand. (Participant G, 2010)

These teachers believed that the workshop would have been more helpful if it had been conducted after teachers had experienced teaching with the PYP for a short time.
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

Participant J was able to attend one of the days of the IB workshop but believed that even if she had attended the full two days, it would not have been enough. She said that more follow up was needed after the workshop:

I think it needs more follow up because it’s just information overload…then you’re back at school just trying really hard to understand what it was all about. A bit of help then would be good I think. (Participant J, February 2010)

Three participants who attended said that they could not recall the information covered in the workshop, given that it took place two years ago: “I can’t even remember what we did at it” (Participant F, March 2010). These findings contest Cambridge’s (2011, p. 128) claim that: ’professional development training workshops accredited by the IBO…all contribute to strengthening shared understandings, values and attitudes related to the curriculum’. The workshops may have strengthened teachers’ understandings of some aspects of the PYP. However, the lack of follow up support meant that teachers soon forgot what they learnt during the workshop. Also, the sheer volume of information delivered caused them to become overwhelmed. Their reaction was to only take a small portion of the information on board.

All teachers interviewed expressed the view that they had requested additional professional learning experiences on the PYP to help understand how to develop international mindedness, but for variable reasons, were unable to go. One teacher said:

I have not had any support or any PD on it [PYP]. I always feel as though I’m struggling to understand everything. I’ve looked into it, but they’re always in the holidays. (Participant J, February 2010)

This teacher explained that it was often difficult to attend professional learning opportunities due to the fact that they are in the holidays or on weekends. Having young children, she believed that it made it difficult to commit to these workshops during these times: “When it comes to the weekends, I just can’t [go to seminars] because I have so many family commitments” (Participant J, February 2010). She further stated that when opportunities arose, the travel expenses involved in attending them made it impossible: “The rare opportunities that
do come along are often in another country and if they're in Australia, then they're in another state” (Participant J, February 2010).

At the time of the interview, more than two years had passed since Participant J had attended one day of the introductory seminar. The school did not offer financial support for any other professional learning opportunities specifically on the PYP or the development of international mindedness. They were only ever offered to senior staff members of the school. Her statement suggests that, when she requested the school’s support for professional learning opportunities of her own choice, school leaders did not consent due to the financial burden on the school. To save money, Participant E explained that only staff members in leadership positions were able to attend the three other professional learning opportunities that were offered at the school since implementing the PYP:

I was lucky to be one of the only three staff members to attend a concept driven curriculum professional development opportunity...So I’ve had that additional few days as well. That was offered to three teachers from the leadership team, and that was really good. But not everyone could do that. (Participant E, March 2010)

On returning, these teachers did not share their new learning with staff in a formal setting:

No one really benefits from it really. When we get back, it would have been good to share with everyone but there’s never the opportunity to do so. We were half way through a busy term, right in the middle of report writing so meeting agendas were snowed under with reports and that. It made it hard. (Participant E, March 2010)

These findings suggest that school leaders have not responded adequately to teachers’ professional development needs. Although the school had implemented an international educational philosophy, school leaders were not investing in opportunities to develop a comprehensive understanding of the PYP in their staff. It was only the staff who accessed professional development opportunities in their own time, and at their own cost, who had the chance to develop an understanding of the programme.

Given that the development of international mindedness is the proposed foundation of the IB mission statement, a school implementing any of the three IB programs should rate these
workshops high on their agenda – particularly in the initial stages of implementing the program. Indeed, the three key improvement strategies of the school’s strategic plan were:

- implementing a whole school approach to teaching and learning through embedding the PYP
- data driven planning in professional learning teams and enhanced reporting practices;
  and
- developing teacher knowledge, understandings and skills to build purposeful instructional capacity to support each student to develop the attributes of the IB learner profile.

Hence, the development of international mindedness played a key role in the school’s strategic plan. However, school leaders’ lack of commitment to these strategies suggests that the school’s strategic plan was no more than an illusion. It gave no more than the impression that the school aimed to educate staff about the IB learner profile. This strengthened the mythological discourse created at the school – the discourse that created nothing more than the impression that the school embraced an internationally minded philosophy. Embedding the attributes of the IB learner profile throughout the school organisation, informal and formal curriculum and through the school’s interaction with the external school community was something participants desired to learn about, but informants believed they were not offered sufficient professional learning opportunities on these topics. School leaders did not provide opportunities for staff to learn about the PYP and so, teachers did not have a chance to acquire a shared understanding of the values and perspectives underpinning the principles of the programme (Bernstein 2000b). This has resulted in teachers being undertrained in the PYP and severely challenged as to how to develop international mindedness through their teaching. This suggests that the development of international mindedness was not a genuine priority for school leaders. Perhaps the cost of such professional development was a significant factor in the
low take-up by senior staff. At the time of writing, it cost the school approximately $500 to replace a teacher to attend a two-day PYP workshop managed by the IBO.

The only other guidance teachers mentioned about professional development was a pink folder containing over one hundred pages of information on the PYP: “I had my pink folder but that was it. Everyone gets given that here...That was our support” (Participant H, March 2010). Participant H made the following comment about the pink folder: “But where do you start with that? I read some bits of it but it was hard to understand how it all fitted together” (Participant H, March 2010). Participant H believed that this handbook, *Making the PYP happen: a curriculum framework for international primary education* (IBO 2007), was overwhelming. She also believed that by itself, this text-book approach of support was inadequate for a teacher new to the PYP. At the very least, this suggests the need to allow time for teachers to be guided through the handbook together and to provide follow-up sessions where staff can collaboratively discuss and learn from each other. Merely assuming that teachers are reading the handbook and are able to make their own sense of it is not enough.

Although Hayden (2002, p. 123) states that there is relatively little professional development for international mindedness available to educators:

> While professional development may be provided with respect to the technical dimension of a teacher’s role, it appears that little support is provided with respect to the ‘international mindedness’ dimension of this role.

The findings from this project suggest that the lack of professional learning available on the teaching of international mindedness does not necessarily mean teachers need to be left in the dark. Findings point to the need for site-based professional learning teams and time for teachers to meet with, collaborate, and learn from each other. Stoll and Fink (1996) and Deveney (2007) concur, explaining that seminars and workshops do not have to be expensive. These opportunities can take place as part of a staff meeting conducted by a teacher who has a particular expertise or interest in a topic. Some of the most powerful professional learning can
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

take place through teachers meeting together and learning from each other through collaborative staff discussions, whether they are at staff meetings or through informal discussions in the workplace. As Deveney (2007, p. 326) asserts:

International schools should actively support teacher collaboration and formalise opportunities for information sharing by creating and developing forums in which teachers can learn from each other. In effect, the whole school culture should be one of cultural responsiveness and this should be reflected explicitly in the school’s ethos.

In summary, these findings highlight the importance of ensuring that all staff members are supported and scaffolded into new programs when they are introduced to a school – regardless of how experienced or senior they are. This would include offering an adequate induction program. It is also clear that to fully understand and implement the principles of the PYP, considerable professional development is essential for all staff. One workshop by itself when commencing the PYP is clearly insufficient. This would also need to be followed up with opportunities for teachers to collaborate and reflect on the new learning to help teachers consolidate and retain the information covered. After all, teachers do not have access to the principles of the PYP when they are not given the opportunity to learn, collaborate and reflect on what is to be learnt (2000b). When adequate opportunities for this to occur are not provided, these findings indicate that the result is, as Bernstein’s (2000b, p. 13) aforesaid quote illustrates, curriculum incoherence as teachers perceive implementation of the PYP as ‘unthinkable’ and are left to explore ‘alternative realities’.

7.3 Teachers and performativity

All teachers expressed the view that classroom teachers were not involved in the decision-making process of whether to implement the PYP in the first place. Only school leaders were able to make this decision. Teachers believed that this exacerbated the difficulties associated with implementing the PYP. The following quotations illustrate this: “It was so hard because it was an idea that we were told we were moving towards and we didn’t get a say in whether it would go ahead or not at all” (Participant E, March 2010); “It [the PYP] just got dumped on us
one day” (Participant D, December 2009); “Our opinions didn’t seem to matter” (Participant J, March 2010); and a school leader was heard saying: “No, you don’t get any say in whether or not your school becomes an IB school. That decision gets made for you” (Senior member of staff, field note, 19 February 2009). These quotations indicate that at Diamond Primary School, teacher input into major decisions was of no value. This suggests that communication between school leaders and teachers was strongly classified. Where this occurs, Bernstein (2000b) argues that a hierarchy of knowledge exists between school leaders and teachers. A dislocation and obstruction is formed. A coercive form of power relations grants teachers with a ‘special quality of otherness’ (p. 10). School leaders direct the power downwards. This creates the impression that school leaders possess ‘the so-called common sense and [teachers] the so-called uncommon sense’ (p. 10), as teachers’ views were not considered or taken into account. It means that significant, whole of school pedagogical issues cannot be open to public discussion and so, cannot be challenged. It was only school leaders who had the power to determine what is worth teaching and how.

This hierarchical leadership structure is evident in the following statement. The school leader, the only informant who did not express the view that there is a lack of support at the school, voiced a far more positive view of the PYP than teachers:

I think that we’re further along the track than where we were...You know, you can’t expect everything to happen at once. Staff are new at this, and we just need to take it one step at a time. It’s unrealistic to expect everything to happen at once, and I think the staff as a whole are getting there. (field note, 24 February, 2010)

Her optimistic view of the implementation of the PYP, regarded as challenging by all other informants, is suggestive of normative control. It could be interpreted as a way of creating a positive identification among teachers with the norms and values of the PYP. It represents her endeavour to cover up strong power relations by internalising teachers’ compliance to accept the PYP and, assume that difficulties associated with implementing the PYP are to be expected because implementing the PYP is the natural and right thing. As one teacher noticed:
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

We have no idea what to do with the PYP really. There's certainly no help in that area. It’s like there’s an assumption that we can do it you know, because we’re teachers, so ‘what’s the problem?’ you know? (Participant B, October 2009)

However, the lack of opportunity for teachers to “buy into” the PYP generated a poor starting point from which to develop a program which relies on collaborative, inclusive dialogue. Hence, the school leader’s efforts for teachers to create a positive identification with the PYP did not work. The following two comments illustrate this: “We’ve been dumped with this massive thing” (Participant F, May 2010); and: “We just found out one day all of a sudden, and thought, how did that come about? We knew nothing about it, so everyone felt a little sceptical about it” (Participant J, May 2010). Along with the lack of opportunities to collaborate the hierarchical leadership structure only worked to strengthen power differentials between school leaders and teachers.

These findings indicate that the coercive way in which structures, expectations and procedures have been reformed since implementing the PYP at Diamond Primary School have caused teachers to be deeply affected by what Lyotard (1984, p. 11) calls the terror of ‘performativity’:

The true goal of the system, the reason it programs itself like a computer, is the optimisation of the global relationship between input and output – in other words, performativity.

Ball (2006a, p. 144) extends this aspect of Lyotard’s theory explaining that the performance of the school ‘serves as measures of productivity, or output, or displays of “quality”’. School leaders believed that the PYP would improve the productivity and quality of the school. Allowing teacher input into major decisions was viewed as a risk to the performance of the school. Beliefs were not important – only the output counted. Bernstein (2000b, p. 73) explains that under regimes of performativity undergoing reform, when making decisions, ‘the past is no necessary guide to the present, let alone the future’. Teachers’ views were a threat as their practices were deemed to be a ‘part of an older, increasingly displaced discourse’ (Ball 2006a, p. 151). This is evident in the following data: “What was wrong with how we used to do
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

things?" (Participant H, December 2009); "There’s just no independence now in what and how you want your students to learn" (Participant F, April 2010); "Where’s the choice about how to do things now? It’s all so directed" (Classroom teacher, field note, 3 May 2010); and "It would be nice to have the autonomy that we used to have" (Participant B, May 2010). Teachers’ practices of the past were a threat to the productivity of the school and so, needed replacing with a discourse which could improve the output of the school. Hence, rather than teachers’ finding their ‘social identity’ (p. 73) in the core of ‘its place in an organisation of knowledge and practice’ (Bernstein 2000a, p. 1942), identity was to become ‘a reflection of external contingencies’. Regardless of whether or not teachers wanted to embrace the PYP, under the regime of performativity, teaching practices were expected to adapt because it was perceived by school leaders as important to meet needs of the educational market. Furthermore, they were expected to adjust without being guided on how.

Teachers were under threat by what Bernstein (2000b, p. 62) terms mechanisms of ‘projection’. Supporting this aspect of Bernstein’s theory, Ball (2006a) explains: ‘What it means to teach and what it means to be a teacher...are subtly but decisively changed in the processes of reform.’ During a staff meeting, teachers struggling to adjust were advised by school leaders in no uncertain terms to find a job elsewhere. This is evident in the following comment: “If you don’t like working in an IB school, then you have the choice to leave” (Senior member of staff, field note, 19 February 2009). Due to the lack of support, teachers struggled to find their new identity. However, such exchanges between teachers and school leaders served to demonstrate the certainty of the leaders’ decision for the school to be an IB World school and the secondary position of teachers in the decision making hierarchy.

This struggle was causing all classroom teachers in the study to feel confused, frustrated and completely overwhelmed, as the following comments illustrate: “We’re all not coping with it at all...It’s so frustrating” (Participant A, November 2009); "It’s frustrating because we don’t know enough about it at the moment” (Participant E, October 2009); and: “The whole thing is
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

completely overwhelming for us all...it would have been good to get some help” (Participant H, March 2010). This supports findings from Hurley’s (2008) study, where she concludes that teachers are frustrated with the lack of direction on how to develop international mindedness. However, these findings also indicate that the severe lack of support was causing at least three teachers to feel guilt, shame and inadequacy due to their lack of confidence in the PYP. This can be illustrated in the following two responses: “You just constantly feel like you’re not doing a good job” (Participant A, November 2009):

I don’t think that we’ve been supported enough...I mean, we were told about it when it was started, but we were not supported and we didn’t talk together openly about it, so we didn’t know really what it was about or what was required of us so you never really feel like you’re on the right track. (Participant E, March 2010)

As a staff everyone needs more understanding of what it [international mindedness] means, and passion and excitement...whereas at the moment it’s just ‘we have to get this done’. That’s a horrible way to think, but secretly, I think everyone thinks it and they blame themselves for it. (Participant B, November 2009).

Six other classroom teachers were so frustrated that they were feeling anxious and resentful towards school leaders for implementing the PYP. The following comments suggest that this has led them to a state of decline: “It actually pisses me off sometimes to be honest” (Participant, J, April 2010); and “I’m over it actually because we just don’t understand it” (Participant H, December 2009). On the one hand, teachers were concerned that their lack of understanding may be judged by others as a poor contribution to the performance and quality of the school and, on the other, they felt resentful towards school leaders for their lack of support. Speaking on behalf of her colleagues, one teacher believed that the lack of opportunity to “buy into” the PYP, was also a major cause of teachers feeling resentment towards the PYP:

I think that there was quite a negative feeling around the place because people...I mean the leadership...had taken on too much. So, we were sort of unsure about whether or not it was actually something everyone wanted...Although we were too overwhelmed to really notice it at the time, looking back it was not a good start at all. I think it made us a little more apprehensive about it. (Participant E, March 2010)
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

This resentment is more obvious in the following comments. The remarks were made by two teachers in a planning meeting while completing some documentation required for a recent unit of inquiry they had taught: “This is ‘f….’. Honestly, where are we supposed to get time to do this?” (Classroom teacher, field note 24 February 2009); and in response, another teacher was heard saying:

I know, I’m jack of it. What’s the point of doing all of this? Most of this is just doubling up. When are we going to get time to do the literacy packs? This is ridiculous! (Classroom teacher, field note 24 February 2009)

These teachers were particularly anxious and resentful about the lack of support in terms of time. They believed that since the implementation of the PYP, their day-to-day practices had become flooded with an overwhelming amount of documentation, such as the IB requirement for teachers to use planners for all units of inquiry (see Appendix C) – in addition to all other planning teachers need to attend to. All classroom teachers believed that more planning time during school hours when initially introducing the PYP may have helped eliminate some of the anxiety. This can be illustrated by quoting the following:

Like, I’m still worried about my ability to teach key numeracy and literacy skills, I mean, that’s really important. It seems like one thing after the other and you end up feeling completely snowed under. And then there’s all the extra stuff like sport and that….I think that I’ve already in two weeks collected eight notices from the class, it’s just so busy. (Participant D, May 2010)

We’re all not coping very well with it all. Being a teacher is full on enough, but when the school takes on these extra things you always feel under the pump to just keep pushing and pushing yourself. There’s so much more paperwork now. Something has got to give in the end because we just do not physically have the hours in the day to do it all one hundred percent. (Participant G, November 2009)

We need to know more, like how to implement it [the PYP]. It gives us more stress because it gives us so much more to do, like all of the planners and documentation that we have to do now. It’s just not easy. Here, because of the PYP we have heaps of things to do in such little time. The work load is very heavy isn’t it? Since the PYP came…we have to work longer hours because we have less time through the day to organise…so we don’t get time to do everything. (Participant I, March 2010)

It’s not like we have not enough material out there to help us understand the PYP, I mean we’ve been given stuff to read about it, it’s just there’s no time to do it all. We’re just so overwhelmed so it is easy to overlook the new [PYP] when it gets like that. (Participant A, November 2009)
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

Clearly, under the pressures of performativity, teachers were doing whatever was necessary to survive. Time constraints meant that teachers had to select and prioritise what they felt comfortable teaching. This caused key skills, regarded by teachers to be numeracy and literacy, to be prioritised over the PYP.

Teachers believed that if more time was made available during working hours, then they would also have more time to seriously consider the PYP in general through professional reading and collaborative discussions with colleagues. Prior to implementation of the PYP, teachers were already experiencing a heavy workload, as the following comment highlights: "It was busy enough before all of this, but now it’s worse" (Participant A, November 2009). They believed that its introduction had exacerbated this problem. Participant I said that she received less student free time to plan at Diamond Primary School than she did at the previous international school she taught at in Singapore. She believed that this made it difficult to set up global opportunities for students:

I used to teach in Singapore, and even though it was still busy, there we had lots of support so that I was able to do things like get the kids in my class to interact with kids in another class in a different country. We would interact with them and find out everything that they were doing, but we don't get support here to get those sorts of things happening. If we did, we could set up networks with other schools from other countries. (Participant I, March 2010)

The fact that this teacher believed that she was able to make global connections through the curriculum in her previous school suggests she does not lack the initiative to set up these connections. She believed teachers need more time – not only for professional reading, but for independent and collaborative planning. She expressed that this would help her to internationalise learning experiences for students as with the extra student free time periods she received throughout the school day at the previous school she taught in. There she was able to set up networks with students from other countries to create a more global classroom environment.
Discussing her ability to cope with the multiple demands on her time, Participant I said that the only opportunities she felt she had to try and comprehend the programme was during her own leisure time.

I actually don't know much about it (the PYP) ... Here, if you want to learn, you have to get all of the resources yourself in your own time. It's quite difficult. We can't get them from other schools because they are doing VELS, so when you start here; you have to start from scratch. I guess that’s why it’s so hard for us all to be excited about it all. (Participant I)

However, not all teachers were willing to use their own leisure time: “Now, with the PYP, I don’t do any extra because there’s just so much to do” (Classroom teacher, field note, 18 May 2010).

Clearly, leaving staff to make sense of the PYP in their own leisure time has contributed to resentment towards the PYP at Diamond Primary School.

These findings reinforce Bernstein’s (2000b) earlier mentioned claim that for teachers to maintain a high level of commitment and motivation, they need to be immersed in a context which provides adequate opportunities to understand the programme (see Figure 1).

![Figure 1](image-url)
If staff members do not feel valued and supported, they will not commit themselves to a cause fully. At Diamond Primary School, this lack of time alongside a clear lack of support lead to a lack of commitment and motivation (see Figure 2):

![Diagram](image)

**Figure 2**

As Figure 2 illustrates, school leaders’ lack of commitment to teacher training on the development of international mindedness lead teachers to feel unmotivated. This lack of motivation lead teachers toward a state of decline. This then, as previously stated, was the cause of the fabricated version of the IB learner profile. As Ball (2006a, p. 153) argues:

Fabrications are deeply paradoxical. In one sense organisational fabrications are a way of eluding or deflecting direct surveillance they provide a façade of calculation between the organisation and its environment. However, in another sense, the work of fabricating the organisation require submission to the rigours of performativity and the disciplines of competition...Fabrications are both resistance and capitulation. They are a betrayal even, a giving up of claims to authenticity and commitment, an investment in plasticity.

Hence, not only did the displays of attributes represent a mythological discourse, where teachers consciously concealed hierarchical relations at the school (see Chapter 6), but under
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

the pressures of performativity, they were a time efficient way of concealing teachers’ betrayal
of giving up to authenticity and commitment to the PYP. In this way, teachers’ investment in
plasticity helped serve as a superficial measure of the productivity or ‘quality’ of the
implementation of the PYP.

7.4 Curriculum pandemomium

When teachers expressed how they managed teaching the PYP and VELS concurrently, nine
informants said that they felt challenged. These teachers believed that in theory, VELS should
be able to be dovetailed with the PYP. However, they expressed that in the recontextualising
field of Diamond Primary School – the site where the intended VELS curriculum and the PYP
transform into the taught curriculum – VELS and the PYP work as oppositional positions. When
explaining why, teachers shared the view that their lack of knowledge of how to implement the
PYP and then integrate it with VELS was the root of the problem. The following comments
illustrate this as follows: “It’s actually harder than it looks, and quite confusing really”
(Participant J, October 2009); and:

I don’t think that we have enough understanding of the PYP as a staff, or enough
understanding to be able to fully understand the PYP with VELS...I mean we’re pretty
good at VELS, but to fully implement and marry it with the PYP and the planning for it,
and...the action component .. I mean at the moment it seems like ‘oh no, we have to
plan another PYP unit’. (Participant B, October 2009)

You know, you’ve got subjects in VELS, and the PYP pretty much tells you...this is what
you do...but we’re [the IB] not going to say how to. Nobody can tell you that because in
private schools, they don’t even have to worry about that. (Participant H, December
2009)

These nine teachers believed that they might be able to merge the PYP with VELS by
internationalising VELS. However, eight were unsure of how to achieve this due to the lack of
guidance in that area: “I guess we try to blend them [the PYP and VELS] and internationalise the
curriculum, but we haven’t really been guided on how to do that; so it’s hard” (Participant G,
March 2010); “I guess by internationalising the curriculum where you can, but I’m finding that I
just can’t because we don’t know how” (Participant F, May 2010); and another teacher said: “I
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

think that we need to be more global in that respect but we just don’t really know how are you supposed to merge them when you don't know?" (Participant A, November 2009).

Due to these difficulties, nine teachers believed that VELS and the PYP were strongly classified at Diamond Primary School given the PYP and VELS were viewed as two separate entities that are philosophically incoherent and inconsistent: “They're very different...the PYP...and VELS” (Participant H, December 2009); and:

One tells you to teach this, like the students need to learn about Australian heritage and that, and the PYP tells you that you need to cover all of this international stuff as well, and like the concepts, themes and that. Doing all of that while you’re trying to cover all the skills and topics in VELS is impossible. It’s a clash of ideas really. (Participant B, December 2009)

Teachers believed that a focus on Australian issues was an attempt to reproduce national consciousness. Indeed, Bernstein (2000b, p. xxii) argues that the philosophy of many national and state curriculum aims to ‘produce a united, integrated, apparently common national consciousness’. In contrast, the philosophy of the PYP aims to create a discourse which focuses on what groups all around the world share, their communality and their apparent interdependence. This disparity made teaching with both difficult. This supports Bernstein’s (2000b, p. 62) claim that: ‘A pedagogic recontextualising field is composed of positions (oppositional and complementary) constructing an arena of conflict and struggle for dominance’.

Teachers were more confident with teaching content of the mandatory state curriculum so this was the major force. This opinion was expressed by five teachers in the study, as the following comments illustrate: “So, we don’t get to cover much of the PYP, you know, just a little bit to introduce because we are not all that familiar with it” (Participant I, March 2010):

It’s a real juggling act, because you've got your stuff that you have to do for VELS, and then you go, 'oh, 's...", I've gotta' do the whole inquiry PYP stuff as well. You just can’t remember everything all of the time, so international mindedness is usually the last thing on my mind when I’m teaching to be honest. (Participant H, December 2009)
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

I find it hard having the PYP and VELS. I kind of just got my head around VELS and then we got told we were doing the PYP, so I started trying to understand that but we don’t know much about that. (Participant F, October 2009)

Bernstein (2000b) claims that all curricula require a selection to be made. One aspect that implicitly influences this selection is teachers’ understanding. If teachers do not fully understand one component of the intended curriculum, then it can become disregarded. Teachers did not have a strong knowledge base of the PYP. Hence, the development of international mindedness has been elided and VELS has taken the more dominant position.

These findings support recent research on two schools implementing the MYP by Stobie (2007). Stobie’s (2007) research led him to conclude that schools implementing an international curriculum, such as the PYP, alongside a state or national curriculum: “Must provide a supportive environment, which allows teachers time to plan and develop the curriculum individually and collectively” (p. 149). He emphasises that successful implementation of the PYP relies on school leaders supporting teachers with extra time for individual and collaborative planning – particularly in the early stages of implementing the program when teachers are trying to understand it. Stobie (2007, p. 149) argues:

Some curricula, like the IBO programs in general (and particularly the PYP and MYP) require considerable teacher creative professionalism. Since effective creative professionalism requires teachers to understand fully and to support the principles of the programs, and have time to develop these in practice, professional development is critical.

Furthermore, he urges the importance of school leaders working collaboratively with staff to reflect on how the pedagogical philosophy and aims of the new curriculum can be adapted to the mandatory curriculum. Failing to do so will result in the framework teachers are less familiar with playing an insignificant role. It will be incoherent and inconsistent.

In summary, these findings suggest that teachers believe that theoretically, the PYP and VELS are able to integrate. However, in practice, all teachers were unable to merge the two effectively because school leaders invested no time in ensuring teachers understood the philosophy of the
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

PYP. Hence, the PYP was of secondary importance. While fostering international mindedness was the stated goal, poor processes and lack of teacher training meant that it was unable to be developed. This indicates that the PYP is a complex framework requiring ongoing support for staff in order to understand its international philosophy. It illuminates the importance of school leaders providing continual professional development and strong administrative support and, to be aware that successful implementation of the PYP relies on ensuring that all staff member establish a common understanding of, and agreement with, the PYP philosophy, aims and objectives.

7.5 SUMMARY

It is clear that Diamond Primary School teachers believe that introducing the PYP alongside a state curriculum is anything but straightforward. The data indicates that the expectations placed on teachers when implementing two curricula is overwhelming. If the school deems the PYP important enough for teachers to understand, then time should be allocated during school hours to fully understand it so that it is highly valued by staff. This has not occurred at Diamond Primary School. The lack of time has left teachers to feel it a necessity to access resources in their own time, and the lack of support has caused teachers to feel confused about the PYP. Combined with a hierarchical leadership structure which discounts teachers’ views on implementing the PYP, this has caused teachers to feel discouraged and resentful. This has impacted on teachers’ levels of motivation and commitment, harming the implementation of the PYP as teachers are not likely to give maximum effort while feeling confused, undervalued, unsupported and demoralised (Bernstein 2000b).

Of course, it cannot be expected that a new school implementing the PYP can simply proceed immediately into full scale activity of the programme. Every IB Candidate school needs time to adjust and will experience its own unique journey in becoming an IB World School. However, these findings suggest that teachers are not going to adjust or learn effective ways of developing international mindedness if they are not supported with appropriate resources. Mancuso,
Chapter 7: The PYP and chaos

Roberts and White (2010) argue that teachers’ perceived level of input into decisions on such things as departmental issues and the school mission are fundamental predictors of teacher movement in international schools. The risk here is that teaching staff at Diamond Primary School feel so undervalued that they leave the school, resulting in high rates of teacher turnover.
8 MARKET DISCOURSES

8.1 INTRODUCTION

To reiterate, findings discussed thus far illuminate that although the school has embraced a curriculum with an internationally minded philosophy, the school has devoted little attention to extending the notion of international mindedness through a practical application of its aims, philosophy, curriculum and pedagogy. Its regulative discourse is characteristic of cultural hierarchy rather than cultural harmony. The dominant position of the Anglophone group is maintained and reproduced by images, rituals and emblems of national significance and the focus on national issues in the curriculum. Any attempts to internationalise the curriculum have been overcome by teachers’ lack of understanding of ways to internationalise learning experiences for students. School leaders’ effort to resolve these difficulties appears to be negligible.

These findings suggest that original incentives to implement the PYP at Diamond Primary School may not have been to develop internationally minded students. This postulation, however, requires further analysis before this conclusion can be drawn. It requires an examination of data that help ascertain the reasons behind implementing the PYP. This chapter serves this purpose. Essentially, it tests Bernstein’s (2000b, p. 86) following claim: ‘Market relevance is becoming the key orientating criterion for the selection of discourses’. The chapter begins by exploring teachers’ explanations about the rationale behind the PYP. The subsequent sections of the chapter explore implications on the development of international mindedness associated with the marketisation of schooling (Bernstein 2000b). Respectively, these are: symbiotic partnerships; educational markets and social justice; external assessment; and, the IB accreditation process. In closing, the chapter draws attention to two aspects of Bernstein’s sociology of education which provide a common ground for understanding conclusions drawn from these themes. These are, his analysis of the pedagogic models: competence and performance.
8.2 INCENTIVES FOR IMPLEMENTING THE PYP

Nine teachers believed that the PYP was implemented because it offers academic rigour. Three teachers expressed: “I think implementing it [the PYP] is good for our school because the PYP’s got a good reputation for being really good academically” (Participant H, March 2010); “As a high achieving school, [the PYP] is good. It’ll help the kids achieve good results” (Participant I, March 2010); and, “You know, it [the PYP] is all about maintaining a high level and that’s what people like about it” (Participant J, March 2010). This suggests that teachers appear to believe that the PYP is more associated with ‘traditional academic models of schooling’ (Witty, Power & Halpin 1998) and instrumental matriculation than its contribution to the development of international mindedness. This supports research by Hurley (2008, p. 79), who suggests that in many cases, parents are motivated to send their children to IB schools because of the academic rigour provided by IB curricula:

I anticipated more favourable responses about international mindedness in the IB program and curriculum, but my findings produced an unexpected outcome: the stakeholders at AISS-E shared a view of the IB curriculum that was not at all reflective of the IB mission statement of international mindedness. The stakeholders generally did not link IB courses with international mindedness...students all experienced the IB curricula, and yet not one of them viewed their IB courses as internationally minded...IB was more so about academic rigor rather than a global perspective.

Indeed, academic rigour was an aspect school leaders believed would appeal to prospective parents, as findings in Chapter 5 indicated that teachers perceived the parental population to be ambitious and focused on high achievement. This suggests that the PYP was originally implemented in order to produce an educational product that was appealing to prospective student families. Seven teachers made claims to this effect. For example, three teachers said: “People like it [the PYP]...it looks good, you know” (Participant I, March 2010); “It’s all about trying to look attractive to the community. It helps draw attention to people looking for a good school” (Participant F, May 2010); “It’s all about offering what the families want to see” (Participant H, December 2009); and;
Chapter 8: Market discourses

It’s really good because since we brought it in, we just have so many kids wanting to come to the school. I mean, when I started here, there were only about 800 students. Now, we have well over 950.” (Participant B, November 2009)

In all data, there was no mention of the PYP being implemented in order to provide an education for international mindedness. This indicates that the school was not at all interested in embracing the IB because of its social, humanitarian and civic ideals. The implementation of the PYP was a response to the needs of the education market. Indeed, Bernstein (2000b) argues that in many learning organisations the primary focus is on satisfying the needs of the educational market. Pedagogic discourse is selected as one which will optimise exchange value in order to achieve a favourable position in relation to similar educational organisations. This suggests that the incentives for implementing the PYP were not because the school was interested in producing students with the ideals of intercultural understanding and responsible citizenship. Rather, pedagogic practices were ‘contingent on the market’ (p. 69).

For example, two teachers stipulated that the PYP was introduced to keep up with neighbouring private schools who had implemented the PYP:

I think it’s a program for schools wanting to become more like the private schools in the area...or more elite. Without it, a lot of the families would be going to those. Now that we offer the same programme as [name of neighbouring independent school omitted] for example, parents can send their children to our school without the hefty fees. (Participant J, March 2010)

Like, if other schools around us are doing the PYP, I guess the school thinks that it needs to also offer it [the PYP] in case families choose the other school. I think that makes a difference for sure. (Participant E, December 2009)

Although the market of Diamond Primary School is confined exclusively to its locality, that is, students attend the school because they reside in that particular area, these data indicate that teachers believe that many prospective students would chose the local independent school if Diamond Primary School did not offer the same discourse. School leaders believed that providing the mandatory state curriculum alone did not optimise the school’s position in the education market but providing the same curriculum offerings as the local private school did.
Chapter 8: Market discourses

From these data, it may be argued that teachers believe that the school is operating more overtly as a business. As Cambridge (2002a, p. 231) argues: ‘The school derives benefit from their association with the name and reputation of the branded product that they are retailing’. The PYP was considered by teachers to be an appealing “product”. The school was viewed as acting as its retailer in order to attract “clients”, that is, prospective students. With more students, the school could receive more revenue. As the school leader stated:

From the point of view from 950 students, we’re able to resource in ways that smaller schools can’t. You know, we can make the dollars go further because you have got… you know, that many kids to be able to carry it. (Participant C, October 2009)

Though, to test this proposition further, it is necessary to examine data portraying the relationship between Diamond Primary School and the IBO.

8.3 SYMBIOTIC PARTNERSHIPS

Implications for educational organisations arising from the logic of globalisation have received an escalating amount of attention from critics and researchers (Ball 2006b; Cambridge 2002a). Ball (2006b, p. 119) argues that increasingly, the globalising current of international education has led to more and more public schools ‘being targeted by business[es] as an area of expansion where considerable profits are to be made’ for both the school and the business(es) involved. Therefore, it may be proposed that the affiliation between any school offering an international education curriculum, such as any of the three IB programmes, is representative of a ‘symbiotic’ (Cambridge 2002a, p. 241) relationship as both the school and IBO receive monetary yield.

Hence, although findings discussed thus far indicate that teachers believe that the implementation of the PYP was about pursuing future enrolments for the school, the enormous initial and ongoing costs involved with implementing the PYP also contribute to the IBO’s revenue. For example, the highest cost involved with implementing any IB programme (the DP, MYP or the PYP) is associated with the cost of training. IBO requires all teachers in IB schools complete a minimum of two workshops within the first three years of implementing their programme(s). IBO offers three
levels of training. On completion of the two initial required workshops, teachers can complete as many workshops as they wish from the range which IB offers. Each level of training consists of a three day seminar and averages AUS$ 1,500 per teacher, per three day seminar. In addition, the school is required to pay for the workshop leader’s travel, meals and accommodation, as well as any travel, accommodation or meal allowances involved with staff attending. In many cases, the travel and accommodation cost is high as rarely are the workshops held in the school’s home state. There are also application fees involved when initially applying to become an IB World school. In order to apply to implement the PYP, the school needs to pay AUS$ 23,000. This fee has risen from AUS$ 17,000 just one year ago. After paying the initial application fee, the school is required to pay a consideration phase cost which is AUS$ 4,000 for the first year. Over the next two years, the school is required to pay annual instalments of AUS$ 9,500 while preparing for the authorisation visit. During these initial years, as well as from there on, schools are required to pay an IBO annual membership fee which is currently AUS$ 7,500.

During the trial implementation phase, the school is required to undergo three mandatory visits from IBO authorities: the consultation visit (to enter the candidate phase); the preliminary authorisation visit; and, the full authorisation visit. Costs associated with each visit are approximately AUS$ 3,500. On top of this, the school is required to pay any travel or accommodation costs as well as any taxi or car rental costs the IBO visiting team accrue.

To fulfil IBO requirements, new members of staff are often necessary in order to fulfil the role of IB coordinator and the mandatory teaching of a second language. Costs involved with staff time visits to other PYP schools can cost up to AUS$ 10,000 in replacement teachers, dependent on the amount of teaching staff at the school. Initial marketing costs, inclusive of any new equipment needed, new stationary, staff time and mailing costs can accumulate to AUS$ 5,000 (Eaton 2011).

Clearly, the costs involved with implementing the PYP are huge. The IBO claims to be a non-for-profit organisation with its 2010 annual income (which was just over US$ 120, 000 000) reported to be equal to its expenditure. However, 49% of this income was spent on wages for its 643 full
Chapter 8: Market discourses

time staff members. According to these statistics, that equates to an average annual income of US$ 91,000 per staff member. Given that this is an average, estimated wage, it is likely that the 32 board members earn a great deal more than this, with other IBO staff earning slightly less. But, even taken as a conservative estimate, US$ 91000 is nearly double of the current salary for a graduate teacher in the USA and 168 times the current average wage for a factory worker in Cambodia (International Labour Organisation, 2011). These wages appear to provide a prosperous income for an organisation which claims to be a non-for-profit organisation motivated by its mission and focused on the student. Furthermore, the fact that school leaders readily paid these enormous upfront and ongoing fees associated with implementing the PYP, but denied staff of adequate, continual professional learning (see Chapter 7) reaffirms teachers’ belief that the main reason the school implemented the PYP was to attract students in order to finance and extend the school’s reputation.

These findings support Rifkin (2001) and Cambridge’s (2002a) argument that the IBO is representative of a globally franchised curriculum which is commoditised and packaged for mass consumption in the same way in which other branded products are commoditised. Cambridge (2002a, p. 231) proposes that:

International school operate in local markets as the franchised distributor of globally branded international education products and services, such as the programmes of the International Baccalaureate Organisation.

He argues that the marketisation of international education through programs such as those of the IB can be likened to other globally branded products, such as McDonalds and Coca Cola ‘on both the rational and emotional levels’ (p. 241). Just as McDonalds attracts customers by its well recognised logo, advertising the IB logo on school documents, billboards and advertisements offers an enticing, globally branded product which persuades prospective students at a pragmatic level. In the same way in which McDonalds offers toys with children’s meals and publicly donates money to various charities, the IBO mission statement, along with the promotion of the IB learner profile, persuades customers at an emotional level.
Chapter 8: Market discourses

Data indicates that a symbiotic relationship also existed between school leaders and the PYP. Shortly after receiving approval to become an IB Candidate school, two leaders who were instrumental in initiating the PYP both left Diamond Primary School in pursuit of professional advancement offering considerable financial rewards. Field notes taken of some “small talk” during a staff meeting suggests that teachers believed that the implementation of the PYP made both the principal and assistant principal desirable candidates for school leadership vacancies. As two teachers said: “It [the IBO] made his [the principal’s] résumé look good, and he was off” (Classroom teacher, field note, 16 December, 2009): and; “She got it started, got her promotion and here we still are picking up where she left off” (Classroom teacher, field note, 16 December, 2009). In both cases, new leaders were eventually appointed at Diamond Primary School, but these comments suggest that, not only did the implementation of the PYP provide optimal exchange value in the education market, but it created a competitive culture in the job market. Hence, it may be argued that a symbiotic relationship exists between the school, school leaders, and the IBO – by implementing the PYP, the school receives a greater number of enrolments; the IBO benefits by receiving more income; and, school leaders gain a competitive edge in the job market. This supports Bernstein’s (2000b, p. 61) claim that: ‘The management structure has become the device for creating an entrepreneurial competitive culture. The latter is responsible for criteria informing senior administrative appointments’. The implementation of the PYP, based purely on the needs of the market and improving job prospects for school leaders, works to create and maintain an entrepreneurial, competitive culture based on market values.

Peterson (1972, p. 122), one of the main early advocates of the IBO, claims that the establishment of the IBO was a mixture of pragmatism and idealism. These findings indicate that at Diamond Primary School, the IB is more associated with satisfying the pragmatic needs of the education and job market. Yet, the marketisation of schooling has major implications for social justice (Bernstein 2000b). The following discussion explores these implications in light of the case, Diamond Primary School.
8.4 **Educational markets and social justice**

While Reid (2005) argues that schools have always marketed their products to varying degrees, Blackmore and Thorpe (2003) propose that in the last decade or so, the decentralisation of management structures in Australian schools has caused an apacel increase in the marketisation of schools. With schools experiencing greater autonomy over their budgets, schools are focusing more and more on attracting and retaining students in order to increase the school’s revenue, the school’s reputation, and that of its leaders’.

The problem is, that by Diamond Primary School implementing the PYP in order to put the school in a relatively higher position compared to other schools in the area, it fosters the argument that the school is attempting to open up social advantage for students attending the school. Bernstein (2000b) argues, that the school provides the context from which micro differences transform into macro inequalities. Whitehead (2005, p. 5) extends this aspect of Bernstein’s theory:

> Of greater concern are the further segregation of society and the escalation of social injustice as market forces drive schools and their curriculum...there is compelling evidence that a marketised schooling exacerbates class, race and ethnic differences among students, schools and society in general.

It may be proposed that the school is contributing to the reproduction of economic and social stratification. In this way, it is acting as a mechanism for reproducing privilege and ensuring that the interests of the elite are maintained. Whitehead (2005) explains that because the majority of IB schools in Australia are private schools – and that private schools are generally represented as a prerogative of the wealthy upper class – the PYP is viewed as a curriculum for the elite (Bagnall 1997; Whitehead 2005). Therefore, the PYP is viewed as a way in which students can achieve social status. For example, out of the 72 schools in Australia implementing the PYP, 52 of these are private schools. Many low-income families, who most likely attend public schools, do not have access to IB programmes. The withdrawal of government funds to public schools has only worked to intensify social and economic disadvantage. Hence, allowing market forces to influence major curriculum decisions can cause social segregation, leaving low-income families severely
disadvantaged. In the case of Diamond Primary School, only families wealthy enough to live close enough to Diamond Primary School in order for their children to attend the school have chance of gaining – or maintaining – a position in the more privileged social class. This supports Whitehead’s (2005, p. 5) claim that ‘in Australia...schooling is heavily stratified by wealth and area of residence’.

As market forces increasingly drive schools to make major curricular decisions, only government schools in wealthy areas are able to afford IB programmes. Government schools in less affluent areas are most likely to be unable to afford IB programmes, as typically, these schools have a large percentage of student families unable to contribute fully to the school financially. Hence, IB programmes can be interpreted as a curricular discourse for the elite.

It may be argued that by offering the PYP, Diamond Primary School is marketing social advantage rather than social justice. The implementation of the PYP was about selling ‘positional advantage’ (Bates 2011a, p. 159) rather than social justice. Bagnall’s (1997) research on the growth of the IB in Australia supports this conclusion. The growth of the IB as an aspect of the marketisation of education and its implications on social justice has lead him to conclude that many parents choose IB schools because they ‘were interested in gaining global cultural capital that would help put them ahead of the “pack”’ (p. 142). Bates (2011a, p. 161) concurs, arguing that while schools may claim to develop “international mindedness”, parents who choose an international education ‘...for their children do not necessarily do so because of its proclaimed international mindedness’.

Clearly, the aims of the PYP, which are to produce responsible citizens who appreciate and understand cultural and social diversity is problematic in school culture driven by competition and individualism. The commoditisation of the PYP is reinforcing social hierarchy by feeding the problem of social justice in education. Hence, rather than eliminating inequality and supporting the aims proposed in the IBO’s mission statement, the commodification of IB programmes is encouraging families to compete in a way that contributes to disproportional positions in the workforce where typically, minority groups occupy positions leading to least access of power and wealth in society. The school is giving “already privileged” families an advantage, as only students
living close enough to a government school which is wealthy enough to afford an IB programme or only children with families able to afford to send them to an independent school offering an IB programme have access to an IB programme. This culture is in direct opposition to the humanitarian, “socially just” IB ideals.

The way in which the school is contributing to social stratification is also evident in the subsequent discussion on external assessment. Specifically, this section explores how the development of international mindedness can be hindered through a school’s decisions on what and how to assess.

8.5 **EXTERNAL ASSESSMENT AT DIAMOND PRIMARY SCHOOL**

Data shows that Diamond Primary School teachers implement several external examinations. External examinations refer to tests that are designed by both national and international organisations external to the school, as opposed to assessment practices that teachers from the school plan themselves. Some of these tests are compulsory for the school to employ, such as the English Online Interview, the Numeracy Interview and the National Assessment Program – Literacy and Numeracy (NAPLAN). Other standardised examinations, such as the Progressive Achievement Tests (PAT) and The International Competitions and Assessment for Schools (ICAS) are fee based and school participation is optional. Analysing the implications associated with implementing these optional external assessment practices, as well as the significance each examination receives, highlights how the development of international mindedness can be encouraged – or in the case of Diamond Primary School – hindered through the school’s decisions on what and how to assess. This is because exploring the school’s choices on what and how to assess helps to understand the underlying values of the school (Bernstein 2000b).

The school encourages all students in Years 3, 4, 5 and 6 to participate in the PAT and the ICAS. Every year, PAT examinations are implemented in the areas of Mathematics, Comprehension, Spelling, Grammar, Science and Writing. Teachers in Preparatory Year (Prep, and in Years 1 and 2, select students demonstrating high academic achievement to sit for these examinations. ICAS
examinations assess student performance in Computer skills, Science, Reading, Writing and Mathematics. Students sit for these examinations every year between June and August. Ten countries participate in the ICAS, with Australia and New Zealand contributing over 1.7 million students each year (UNSW 2010). Both the PAT and the ICAS provide the school, students and parents a snapshot of what their child can do in comparison with their results from the same time in the previous year. On receiving results, students also receive a diagnostic paper in PAT measuring their level of achievement relative to other students within Australia, and from around the world for the ICAS.

Indeed, results from these tests have potential to provide useful feedback for school leaders to ensure that the teaching and learning practices of the school are consistent and of high quality throughout all subject areas and all year levels of the school (McClelland 2001, p. 49). They can also provide an important tool from which teachers can measure specific learning objectives and key targets or benchmarks (Bates 2011a). Yet, data from this study indicates that nine teachers did not view the tests as a valued component of their assessment practices. As two teachers expressed: "After they're (the ICAS and PAT) done, it's not like we do anything with them" (Participant H, May 2010); and: "All they really show is that these kids are outstanding academically...aside from that aspect of things, they don't serve a specific purpose" (Participant G, November 2009). Despite teachers' belief that the PATs and the ICAS examinations were futile in terms of informing student learning, and besides the fact that these tests represent only a fraction of the school's overall assessment practices, when asked about assessment, all informants initially responded by discussing the PATs and the ICAS examinations rather than assessment processes they themselves designed (such as self-assessment, reporting or student negotiated rubrics for example). For example, when first asked about assessment, one teacher said: "Yes, assessment like the ICAS, PAT and all that, it's a big part of what we do. There is a lot of focus on those" (Participant F, March 2010). This suggests that teachers believe that the PAT and ICAS have a considerable, but not important impact on assessment approaches at Diamond Primary School.
Chapter 8: Market discourses

Part of this reason appeared to be caused by the lack of control teachers had over the examinations. As two teachers said: “In the PAT and all that, we get no say, but we still do them of course” (Participant E, November 2009); and:

“When you get to Year 3, there’s a lot more required of you because the ICAS and PAT don’t come in until then. But you still have to do them. You can’t just choose not to.” (Participant G, November 2009).

When deciding to implement these examinations, school leaders disregarded whether or not the examinations were an authentic measure of student learning. They ignored the fact that the school had implemented a curriculum which views assessment as needing to be: “Authentic, essential, rich, engaging and feasible, and incorporates students in the evaluative process” (IBO 2011a).

What teachers valued in terms of assessment was not important, as teachers had no say in whether or not the tests were implemented. Teachers only implemented the ICAS and PAT because they were required to. Only the school leaders had the power to make this decision as it was their role to control the output of the school.

Another reason for teachers’ lack of enthusiasm for the ICAS and PAT appeared to be because nine teachers believed that too much importance and publicity was centred on the tests. Teachers believed that this caused students to feel anxious:

There’s a big fuss about the ICAS and PAT. It’s almost like there’s a real sense of maybe you’d call it ‘stress’ in the air when they’re on. It’s drawn out too because once they’re over, there’s the results phase. For the kids that do well, it’s great, but for the ones that don’t, it must feel awful because no matter how hard they try, they just don’t get the same acknowledgment as the others. (Participant A, November 2009)

This theme was echoed in field note data. Students achieving high distinctions and distinctions for the ICAS examinations were awarded a certificate at assembly: “The following students received outstanding results in our recent ICCAS test. These students scored in the top 1% of the state” (senior member of staff, in field notes, 26 October, 2009). Students receiving a lower grade were handed their certificates later in class – in a less public environment. Given that there were five
different ICAS examinations, many assemblies during the research period were devoted to awarding high performing students with certificates. Often, it was the same students receiving multiple awards (field note, 26 October, 2009; 4 & 25 November, 2009). As Participant A’s aforementioned statement explained, students did not receive awards for outstanding effort.

Rituals, ceremonies, awards and rewards shape each child's own values, beliefs and practical views of the world (Bernstein 2000b). The ritual of issuing certificates at assembly by a school leader to students achieving outstanding results elevates the status of the award. While on one hand it enhances motivation, commitment and aspiration, it reinforces in the minds of unsuccessful participants their mediocrity. Bernstein (2000b, p.xxiv) argues that this can have devastating consequences:

Failure, especially early school failure, can deaden these attributes. With such failure and personal damage there is resistance and alienation on the one hand and reinforced peer group loyalties and class solidarities on the other.

With this negative reinforcement occurring regularly, students not receiving recognition can be left to feel incompetent and discouraged. This is evident in the following two comments:

Sometimes the kids get so anxious about it, so that’s hard. I try and keep things in perspective, but it’s hard because they really want to do well. It’s hard for the kids that do well, but don’t get the certificate. I’m like, ‘no, you still did great! Don’t worry so much’ but they really take it to heart. (Participant J, April 2010)

I remember one child walking back in tears from assembly once. I asked her what was wrong and she said that she was only one mark off a distinction. I remember that she was so devastated. (Participant A, November 2009)

The fact that it was school leaders handing out the certificates authenticated this shaming ritual. It cultivated the impression that students not receiving certificates do not deserve to be rewarded. In this sense, both the students who received a certificate and those not receiving a certificate were persuaded that this public differentiation was a fair and moral practice.

Clearly, international mindedness does not permeate this assessment practice. Students felt worried and anxious after completing the exams and shame and despair if they did not receive
Chapter 8: Market discourses

public acknowledgement at assembly. For the students receiving recognition, they were encouraged to feel proud and a sense of fulfilment with their academic success. For them, such public success may help them to succeed in capitalist society and so enter or maintain their position in upper class society. Such disciplines and practices reflect an enterprise culture which values quality rather than values. Ball (1997, p. 260) argues: ‘Value replaces values, except where it can be shown that values add value’. Values, how students felt, and the social and economic segregation caused, was not important. What appeared to be important, was gaining defined educational outcomes to produce good results to compete in the educational market. The priorities of the school were rooted in ‘self-interest, that great engine of material progress, [which] teaches us to respect results, not principles’ (Newman 1984, p. 158). As one school leader was heard saying:

The purpose of our planning and teaching needs to consider ways to raise the standard of the current indicative levels in literacy, mathematics and thinking skills. I know that at least 90% are already at and above the indicative level, but we need to keep raising the bar. Our overall goal is to raise that bar. (School leader, in field note, 2 March, 2010)

Maintaining and increasing the school’s academic standards and publically applauding outstanding statistical data through regular school assemblies was perceived as securing the financial future of the school, as well as achieving the parents’ high expectations of their children. As the school leader said: “The strengths of our community are the parents having high expectations of education and their results reflect well on our student population, so that’s good” (Participant C, October 2009). All teachers concurred. They believed that the school community’s high expectations of education were an asset for the school. By advocating the tests, students could gain favourable results that would reflect well on the school. In this way, the school was using the strong work ethic of the school’s population to construct its assessment practices which could then provide the school with optimal position in the market. The kudos the results brought the school also helped maintain a good reputation with existing families. Outstanding results also gave the schools’ perceived “ambitious” parents reassurance that their children were in capable hands. It gave the impression that by attending the school, they were increasing their children’s chances of gaining
access into the competitive global market. As one teacher stated: “The parents like them [external examinations] so that’s good and it keeps them informed and reassured I think” (Participant H, December 2009).

Connecting with the internationalist aims of the PYP, and looking for ways to promote international mindedness through assessment practices and their associated rituals and practices was not perceived as financially rewarding. As Bernstein (2000b, p. 61) argues, where the school’s major focus is upon performance, it is in order to attract and retain students: ‘The emphasis on the performance of students and the steps taken to increase and maintain performance’ is primarily about ‘the survival of the institution’ rather than ‘the intrinsic value of knowledge’.

It may be argued that by school leaders encouraging students to achieve outstanding academic results, it is cultivating a culture which drives competitive individualism. It fosters this competitiveness by publically rewarding high achievers. By doing so, students learn to compete against each other, driving innovation and optimising educational outcomes for the school. This produces a competitive output fit to maintain the school’s position in the education market. As Bernstein (2000b, p. 69) argues:

> We have here a culture and context to facilitate the survival of the fittest as judged by market demands...Focus is on the short term rather than the long term, on the extrinsic rather than the intrinsic, upon the exploration of vocational applications rather than upon exploration of knowledge.

Rather than fostering a sense of community and cooperation, the school is legitimising and motivating ‘appropriate attitudes, dispositions and performances relevant to a market culture’ (p. 68). It is encouraging the notion of competitive individualism. Rewarding high academic achievers and giving the impression that those not measuring up do not deserve to be rewarded highlights the influence of globalised neo-liberal ideologies which are ‘committed to the reorganisation of societies and social relations’ (p. 2). Where these neo-liberal ideals are infused through the school’s focus on producing a competitive output in order to attract students, it produces what Bernstein (2000b, p. 69) terms ‘decentred (market) pedagogic identities’.
Chapter 8: Market discourses

Knowledge is viewed like money. Just as money flows effortlessly to where demand calls, so does knowledge, drawing in new clients to pay for the product. This supports Cambridge's (2010, p. 207) claim, that decentred (market) pedagogic identities:

Are another set of identities that may be produced as an outcome of participation in IB programs. In fact, it may be argued that this is the most rapidly growing set of identities in the current period.

For the school to provide the ICAS and PAT examinations, the financial cost to the school was substantial. For example, for each PAT examination, the school paid approximately AUS$250. This covered the distribution of examination papers to students in each year level. The ICAS tests cost between AUS$12 to AUS$52 each. But, the cost was a small price to pay in comparison to the favourable results the school gained from the examinations. This is another example of how Diamond Primary School is acting as a franchiser of a globally branded product as the ICAS examination boards have created a symbiotic relationship. In return for providing the school with internationally acclaimed comparative data, the ICAS examination board receives a substantial sum of money from the school.

Overall, these findings on external assessment practices at Diamond Primary School suggest that the development of international mindedness was secondary to comparative, statistical performance. The school was not interested in promoting international mindedness through assessment practices as the ways in which these assessment practices were carried out cultivated competitive individualism rather than cooperation and community. As Gellar (1993, p. 6) states:

We would define international by what schools do in nurturing (international) understanding; that co-operation, not competition, is the only viable way to solve the major problems facing the planet, all of which transcend ethnic and political borders.

Competition is distinct from the notion of cooperation – a vital component to becoming an internationally minded person. It is far removed from the notion of international mindedness but was continually and publically reinforced at Diamond Primary School through the ways in which
Chapter 8: Market discourses

the PAT and ICAS were implemented and celebrated. This supports Bates’ (2011a, p. 162) claim that there is a clear need for school leaders and teachers to carefully and collaboratively consider:

Whether their assessment practices (and their associated curricular and pedagogical practices) do indeed promote international mindedness and identification with the global community, for schools can surely only legitimately call themselves international if they are committed to the encouragement of global citizenship and if their curricular, pedagogical and assessment practices demonstrate such commitment.

These findings extend this proposal by indicating that where market relevance is the key orientating criterion for determining what is assessed and how to assess, student identities can be constructed along the lines of individualism and competitiveness. They highlight that the development of international mindedness can be hindered where a school’s major focus is on performance with regards to maintaining optimal position in the market.

The following section discusses how Diamond Primary School’s focus on competing in the education market caused the school to focus heavily on accountability.

8.6 The IB accreditation process at Diamond Primary School

During the research, no school meetings included discussions about international mindedness.

Data from field notes indicates that when the conversation in meetings was directed towards the PYP, it was usually in relation to the school’s pre-authorisation visit (field note, 2 March 2010). In fact, during one meeting, one of the three school leaders stated that the main purpose of the subsequent four meetings were “to see what the school needs to do so that we can get authorisation” (Senior member of staff, field note, 9 March 2010). However, during the research, other meeting agendas also did not allow time for collaborating on ways of extending the internationalist ideals or conceptual pedagogical philosophy of the PYP throughout the school.

At this first meeting designated to the authorisation visit, the school leader further stated:

What we need to be focused on at the moment, in terms of the PYP, is getting the school ready to pass for pre-authorisation next year, so that we’re ready to pass for full authorisation in 2012. (field note, 9 March 2010)
Chapter 8: Market discourses

As detailed in Chapter 2, all IB candidate schools need to participate in an authorisation process. The authorisation process entails a self-evaluation conducted by teachers and an external evaluation. The external evaluation involves one or two IB authorities visiting the school to assess the self-study and the readiness of the school to meet the standards of practice outlined by the IBO (see IBO 2011c). The visit involves follow-up advice, recommendations and assistance specific to the school. This advice helps prepare the school for its full-authorisation visit from the IBO in 2012. Authorisation visits are also ‘aimed at gaining evidence on the extent to which the school has been able to put any recommendations and action plans into operation’ (Fertig, M 2007, p. 337). Diamond Primary School was due to undergo its pre-authorisation visit in 2011. Teachers were informed at a meeting that:

Results from the pre-authorisation visit determine if we’re ready for the full-authorisation visit in 12 months time. All going well, the full-authorisation visit determines whether or not we can become a recognised IB World School. If so, we can all breathe a sigh of relief and celebrate. (Senior member of staff, in field note, 9 March 2010)

This suggests that the authorisation visits were not viewed by the school as an opportunity in which to receive feedback on how the school may improve on extending the notion of international mindedness throughout the school. As Participant H stated: “I thought that it would somehow be about the PYP and international mindedness” (Participant H, November 2009). Rather, the authorisation visits were viewed as an obligatory formality to help the school become an IB World school. This would then improve its marketing prospects. As Cambridge (2002a, p. 231) claims:

The establishment of quality standards through accreditation constitutes an important part of the franchising process. This is evident from the way in which the International Baccalaureate Organisation, for instance, is now promoting ‘IB World Schools’.

Indeed, striving to achieve the status of IB World school may be a worthwhile goal. The problem for Diamond Primary School, was that data suggests that attention was primarily given to completing relevant documentation required for the authorisation visit, as opposed to embedding the philosophy of the PYP throughout the school culture. For example, at one school meeting, staff
members were reminded to keep their unit of inquiry documents up to date in preparation for the pre-authorisation visit. The school leader stressed the importance of ensuring that teachers highlight VELS learning foci and IB attitudes and attributes covered in each unit of inquiry throughout the year (field note 16 March 2010). She expressed that she was not happy with the empty pockets that were currently lying in many folders:

This document is an accountability document that shows the IB examiners whether or not we’re covering everything we should be. If they see things are missing when we go for full accreditation, they’re going to ask where they are. (School leader, field note, 16 March 2010)

Furthermore, when this staff member spoke about these documents, there was no mention of them being a necessity in order to ensure that the school was catering for all learning needs of the students. Teachers were not given the chance to view the authorisation visit as an opportunity ‘to improve the quality of the education offered at the school’ (Murphy 1998, p. 213). Rather, it was stressed that they needed to be kept up to date in order to gain accreditation as an IB World school:

I can’t stress how important it is that you all keep these folders up to date. These are an accountability document. If there are things missing, we will not pass and will not be granted full accreditation. (Senior member of staff, field note, 16 March 2010)

This coercive leadership stance caused staff to feel threatened by the authorisation visit. One teacher was heard saying: “Far out, this [authorisation visit] is full on” (Classroom teacher, field note, 16 March 2010). Several jokes were also made when three staff quietly pointed to empty pockets in their document folders, suggesting that “they were in trouble….watch out” (Field note, 16 March 2010). This suggests that school leaders, who were at the top of the organisational hierarchy, believed that only they themselves possessed the knowledge on how to “pass” the authorisation visit. They believed that teachers needed to be controlled because of their perceived ‘uncommon sense’ (Bernstein 2000b, p. 10). This coercion meant that the authorisation visit was viewed as a daunting test.
Chapter 8: Market discourses

These findings represent a palpable discord with the philosophy of the PYP. Rather than viewing the authorisation visit as a learning opportunity from which to collaborate and reflect on how the school’s central goal of teaching and learning related to the internationalist current of the IB mission, school leaders were encouraging teachers’ pedagogical philosophy and assessment practices to be driven by an array of performance indicators, comparisons and accountability documents. Teachers’ feelings of pride, identification with and passion for teaching and the PYP were replaced with fear and anxiety.

However, it may be argued that personal feelings of staff were of secondary importance to becoming an IB World school as the authorisation visit was viewed as a necessity in order to maintain optimal position in the market (Fertig, M 2007). The risk is, in the case that the school receives a poor report resulting from the pre-authorisation visit, it may mean that teachers feel that they have made a poor contribution to the school. Where such feelings are engendered, which Bernstein (2000b, p. 55) argues are brought about by ‘the procedures of introjection’, it can cause teachers to develop ‘strong autonomous self-sealing and narcissistic identities’. Ball (2003) extends this aspect of Bernstein’s theory, arguing that it can engender individual feelings of guilt and shame (Ball 2003). Furthermore, by focusing primarily on the authorisation visit, the school risks losing the most important benefits that can come from the accreditation process – where staff can become an integral part of the program of self evaluation and where improvement becomes an ongoing and cyclical process (Murphy 1998).

Findings presented thus far indicate that Diamond Primary School is doing whatever is necessary to flourish in the local education market. This reaffirms Bernstein’s (2000b) aforesaid claim that a school’s choice of curriculum is entirely contingent on the needs of the education market. However, these findings extend Bernstein’s proposition by indicating the extremes that school leaders can go to in order to lure clients. It can cause a dominant focus on accountability and performance. It can create an entrepreneurial business-like culture which facilitates competition and individualism rather than international mindedness. As Bernstein (2000b, p. 69) puts it,
‘contract replaces covenant’. Money becomes viewed most highly, and there must be no impediments to its flow.

8.7 Competence and Performance Pedagogic Models at Diamond Primary School

Discussing the concepts of competence and performance is important for understanding how the development of international mindedness has been inhibited at Diamond Primary School. “Competence” models of discourse focus on what skills and knowledge the student already possesses, rather than what the student cannot do or does not know. They focus on ways of engendering what the student can already do rather than what the student is lacking. Bernstein (2000b, p. 43) argues, that in competence models of pedagogic practice:

There is an in-built procedural democracy, an in-built creativity, an in-built virtuous self-regulation. And if it is not in-built, the procedures arise out of, and contribute to social practice, with a creative potential.

On the contrary, performance models of pedagogic practice are linked to the economy. They focus on what skills and knowledge students are lacking. There is a focus on “deficiencies” rather than “empowerment”. Bernstein (2000b, p. 57) argues:

Performance modes focus upon something that the acquirer does not possess, upon an absence, and as a consequence place the emphasis upon the text to be acquired and so upon the transmitter.

Table 8–1 Recontextualised knowledge” on page 181 outlines the basic pedagogical features of the competence and performance models, as described by Bernstein (2000b). This model should not discount each teacher participant’s individual personality, motivation and commitment or each teacher’s own unique teaching styles. Rather, the characteristics of each model represent a generalisation of pedagogic practice that allows scope from which each teacher imparts their own qualities.
Chapter 8: Market discourses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Performance models</th>
<th>Competence models</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Strongly classified use of classroom space, time and subject content</td>
<td>• Weakly classified use of classroom space, time and subject content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Assessment strategies that focus on what the child <em>can’t</em> do</td>
<td>• Assessment strategies that focus on what the child <em>can</em> do</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Explicit control; teacher in charge of structures, rituals and subject content</td>
<td>• In absence of strongly classified structures of time, space and subject content,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>usually reinforced by explicit rules</td>
<td>control is more implicit and the teacher is viewed more as a facilitator rather</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Knowledge is taught and students are graded according to their performance.</td>
<td>than transmitter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Their grade operates as a tool from which the teacher can diagnose what they</td>
<td>• Knowledge is constructed rather than taught and tells more about the learner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>don’t know</td>
<td>because the teacher relates content more closely to the child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The amount of autonomy teachers have may be suppressed to some degree due to</td>
<td>• Teachers embrace more autonomy over their own pedagogy, curriculum and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>external regulation of curriculum frameworks</td>
<td>assessment strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Transmission costs are usually less than competence models as the theoretical</td>
<td>• Transmission costs high particularly in terms of time because there is more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>base is less elaborate. Planning is not so costly as it is more explicitly</td>
<td>preparation. The teacher spends more time evaluating students’ needs and then</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>defined with less time being needed to plan</td>
<td>constructing pedagogic resources and content accordingly</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8–1 Recontextualised knowledge (Bernstein 2000b)

Bernstein (2000b) argues that the performance model of pedagogic practice arose as the more dominant form of social logic during the 1970s. This was because school funding, management structures, pedagogic practices and criteria for staff employment became increasingly controlled by the state. The state’s control of school performance through standardised testing also increased, as did the degree in which each school’s curriculum was regulated. This caused students and teachers to experience less control over the selection, sequencing and pacing of the curriculum. As Bernstein (2000b, p. 58) states: ‘The shift to performance models and their modes was initiated by the ORF (official recontextualising field) which now more directly regulates pedagogic practices, contents and research’. This recontextualising processes, which caused a move from the competence to the performance model of pedagogic practice illustrates an important aspect of Bernstein’s (2000b, pp. 32-3) theory. As a curriculum moves from the teacher to the child, it becomes ideologically transformed:
Chapter 8: Market discourses

As the discourse moves from its original site to its new positioning as pedagogic discourse, a transformation takes place. The transformation takes place because every time a discourse moves from one position to another, there is a space in which ideology can play. No discourse ever moves without ideology at play. As this discourse moves, it is ideologically transformed; it is not the same discourse any longer.

As a result, the recontextualising process in any school is unique. Hence, schools will differ in the degree in which they produce characteristics of the performance or competence model of pedagogic practice. Depending on the strength of power and control over curriculum, assessment and pedagogical practices, the resulting discourse will most likely give rise to what Bernstein (2000b, p. 56) calls ‘a pedagogic pallet where mixes can take place’. In other words, while it is more than likely that one model will feature more than the other, it is typical for a school to feature aspects from both the competence or performance models of pedagogic practice.

At Diamond Primary, findings indicate that the resulting model of pedagogic practice mainly features characteristics of the performance model through:

- school leaders’ control of school performance through standardised testing which focuses mainly on student deficit and performance
- the strong classification of examinations (such as multiple choice examinations)
- the strong framing of assessment (students do not having any apparent say in what they are assessed on or how they are assessed)
- hierarchical management structures controlling all major curricula decisions, such as the implementation of the PYP
- hierarchical management structures controlling decisions regarding school funding, some assessment practices and professional development
- strongly framed and strongly classified curriculum, as most teachers teach through disciplines rather than by embedding the notion of inquiry in a transdisciplinary way
- pedagogic discourse is dependent on the market and explicitly applied.
Chapter 8: Market discourses

Therefore, even though the philosophy of the PYP embraces a competence model of pedagogic practice, in the recontextualising process at Diamond Primary School, only some features of the competence model were embraced. It may be argued that this is a result of the school’s main interests on performance in order to compete for security and esteem in the education market. School leaders directed the power down. As such, teachers and students experienced a lack of control over curriculum, pedagogical and assessment practices. Simultaneously, the state’s control over curriculum and standardised assessment reduced the autonomy of the pedagogic recontextualising field of Diamond Primary School. Hence, the performance model took the more dominant position.

It may be proposed that it is this focus on the performance model of pedagogic practice that stifled the development of international mindedness, and worked in direct conflict with the internationalist ideals of the PYP, which urges educators and school leaders to:

- use engaging and meaningful assessment tasks that support and encourage student learning
- expect, demonstrate and promote a commitment to international mindedness and responsible citizenship
- encourage learning that fosters international mindedness
- cultivate a staff culture based on respect and understanding
- use assessment to inform, enhance and improve the teaching process
- promote positive student attitudes towards learning
- strengthen students’ own cultural identity and celebrate and foster understanding of different cultures
- develop an inquiring mind about global and international issues
Chapter 8: Market discourses

- promote the development of higher-order cognitive skills through open-ended learning engagements
- value and make productive use of the diversity of cultures and perspectives that exist in the school and in the local, national and global communities to enhance learning in a variety of cultural and linguistic contexts
- support the holistic nature of the PYP that takes account of the development of the whole student.

These findings support Bernstein’s (2000b, p. 66) claim that ‘any one educational reform can then be regarded as the outcome of the struggle to produce and institutionalise particular identities’.

New power relations develop as subjects in the curriculum compete for resources and influence. When performance, accountability and competition influence curricular, assessment and pedagogical practices, a culture built from feelings of uncertainty, guilt and instability rather than international mindedness is constructed. At Diamond Primary School, developing internationally minded students is not perceived as offering the school a higher position in the education market, maximising students’ academic performance is perceived to do so.

8.8 SUMMARY

Findings discussed in this chapter indicate that original incentives to implement the PYP at Diamond Primary School were not to develop internationally minded students. This reaffirms Bernstein’s (2000b) claim that a school’s selection of discourse is contingent on the market. From analysing the case of Diamond Primary School, it may be argued that the PYP was viewed as a product from which the school could retail its reputation and good results in order to increase its position in the education market. Alongside rigorous assessment practices and a school culture which focused primarily on performance and competition, the PYP offered potential student families a valuable package.
These factors have resulted in the fostering of international mindedness receiving little attention. Achieving impressive statistical results and doing whatever it takes to become an IB World school was perceived as a more worthwhile investment than extending the internationally minded philosophy of the PYP throughout the school. Simultaneously, Diamond Primary School provided a considerable income for the IBO through its mutually beneficial business partnership.

The development of international mindedness, therefore, is not dependent on the school’s curricular, pedagogical and assessment practices. These findings indicate that how the notion of international mindedness is embraced and developed largely depends on original incentives for implementing the PYP. It depends on the school’s underlying values. Where implementation of the PYP is driven by attempts to gain a favourable position in the market, the notion of international mindedness becomes overpowered by market values, such as accountability, performance, competition and efficiency. In a market driven culture, schools are not interested in extending the notion of international mindedness. Rather, findings demonstrate that the PYP can be perceived as an education for the elite offering its customers social and economic advantage.
9 CONCLUSION

In this final chapter, the main findings from this study will be summarised and discussed.

Conclusions will be drawn, and ways in which Diamond Primary School can best deal with some of the demanding challenges facing the development of international mindedness will be recommended. Throughout the discussion, areas needing further study and development will be proposed.

9.1 REVISITING THE INITIAL RESEARCH QUESTIONS

An escalating amount of schools around the globe are adopting one or more programmes from the International Baccalaureate Organisation: the Primary Years Programme (PYP), the Middle Years Programme (MYP) or the Diploma Program (DP). The mission statement of the IBO claims that its fundamental aim is to develop internationally minded students. However, by exploring a single case, namely Diamond Primary School, the findings from this study indicate that schools may not necessarily implement an IB programme in order to embrace the notion of international mindedness.

First and foremost, it has been indicated that within the context of a global era, a school’s decision to implement a curriculum with an internationally minded vision can be largely determined by the needs and wants of the education market. With the IB recognised by Diamond Primary School teachers as an education for the elite offering social and academic advantage, the implementation of the PYP was viewed as a way of luring in prospective students at a pragmatic level. At another level, the IBO provided its retailer (Diamond Primary School) with an internationally minded mission statement, which worked as an emotional appeal for prospective clients (students). It gave the impression that the school is responding positively to the complex changes of the global era.

However, in the case of Diamond Primary School, such appeal is paradoxical. Teachers are focused on developing compassionate, caring and humanitarian people fit to survive and excel in the new age yet, at the same time, the school’s focus on academic rigour sells academic and social
advantage. Culminated with the school’s lack of interest in extending international mindedness throughout the school’s ethos, curricular, assessment and pedagogical practices, the PYP creates no more than a ‘mythological discourse’ (Bernstein 2000b, p. xiii). That is, the promotion of the IBO’s value laden mission statement is no more than a fictitious enticement helping to maintain and enhance the survival and reputation of the school and, cover up cultural hierarchy.

The problem that has been indicated revealed that such focus on market contingencies can construct a hierarchy of power. These relations of power are deemed a necessity in order to ensure that the school moves from one point to the next – and that it does so as efficiently as possible. For example, allowing teacher input into major curricular decisions, such as implementing the PYP was the prerogative of only school leaders. This is because teachers’ personal beliefs and views are of secondary importance to the school’s security and esteem in the market.

However, such a form of hierarchical power is deeply paradoxical. On the one hand, disallowing teachers’ input into major curricular decisions displays a hierarchy of low-trust as it denies teachers’ autonomy and initiative. But, on the other hand, the assumption and expectation that teachers will comply suggests school leaders have faith in teachers’ commitment and problem solving to make curricula work. This research indicates that this paradox can encourage resistance and work towards deteriorating the personal dedication and commitment of teachers (Bernstein 2000b). Consistent with research by Ball (2000), this instigates new discourses of control. Ball argues that these new forms of control require ‘a new general mode of less visible regulation, a much more “hands-off”, self-regulating regulation’ (p. 145). These new discourses of control are the fundamental reason for Diamond Primary School teachers developing fragmented understandings of the development of international mindedness. The self-regulated distribution of the “pink folder” (see Chapter 7) and other IB documents and checklists required teachers to individually read and think for themselves. They provided the opportunity from which teachers could silently access the information required. Social relations and collaboration become replaced by ‘information structures’ (Lash & Urry 1994, p. 11). Information structures replaced
opportunities for teachers, faculty groups, school leaders and administrators to reach a shared agreement on how the school could express and develop international mindedness. Hence, teachers developed their own piecemeal understandings of international mindedness. These were made evident through teachers’ tokenistic reference to the IB learner profile, posters of the attributes in each classroom and inclusion on unit planners, ‘fabrications’ (Ball 2000, p. 9) are the result. Fabrications give the impression that teachers understand and are effectively transmitting the values and principles of the PYP. Hence, as ever, the impacts of these less visible forms of control or information structures appear to ensure compliance. This research confirms Bernstein’s (2000b) claim that deep down, teachers can feel high levels of anxiety and resistance because by resorting to fabrications, teachers are actually admitting to defeat. In this way, these findings appear to support Hurley’s (2008, p. 133) conclusion that:

Educational thinkers have been involved in the process of developing international mindedness for the purposes of education, and yet schools...have not been able to import effective ways of fostering international mindedness in their learning environments.

However, this thesis’ findings extend this conclusion by indicating that in market driven cultures, schools cannot make international mindedness evident in classroom practices because of invisible new forms of “self-regulated” control which replace collaboration. In this way, these findings challenge Haywood’s (2007) claim that the IB learner profile offers an ambiguous model of how to achieve international mindedness. They indicate that the IB learner profile, by itself, is not the problem. Rather, successful development of international mindedness relies on collaboration. It relies on teachers, faculty groups, school leaders and administrators working together to establish effective ways of expressing and promoting international mindedness through classroom and assessment practices, the daily life, management and leadership of the school.

This research demonstrates that in conjunction with the IBO mission statement, the attributes of the IB learner profile provides a resource – not a strategy in itself – from which schools can develop their own shared strategy for making international mindedness an essential element of classroom and assessment practices, the daily life, management and leadership of the school. The *IB Program,*
Chapter 9: Conclusion

*standards and practices guide, Making the PYP happen: A curriculum framework for international primary education* and the *IB Learner profile booklet* provide a useful basis from which schools can collaboratively establish this strategy – not an information package to replace teacher collaboration.

This project also indicates that in a PYP school, the development of international mindedness relies on school leaders providing adequate formal and informal professional learning opportunities for teachers needing to know more about:

- the internationally minded objective of the IB learner profile
- the philosophy of the IB
- ways to internationalise the curriculum.

Because inadequate attention was given to these areas at Diamond Primary School, teachers were unable to promote a deep understanding of the world and of the interdependence of nations and cultures. Any incorporation of the IB learner profile was therefore, superficial.

In regards to defining international mindedness, the majority of teachers at Diamond Primary School associate international mindedness with multiculturalism. It has been argued that teachers' insufficient understanding is mainly due to the infusion of the political vernacular of multiculturalism in federal and state political agendas. Multiculturalism, infused in the state curriculum, has caused teachers to associate international mindedness with multiculturalism, overlooking other aspects lying at the core of the PYP such as tolerance, cooperation and peace within the international context. Hence, teachers' views of international mindedness have to large degree been influenced by the state and the school is performing a vital role in the formation of the nation-state (Bernstein 2000b; Green 1990). Teachers had a poor knowledge base of the PYP. Their familiarity of the VELS meant that essentially, the three message systems work towards satisfying the requirements of the state curriculum – the VELS. By focusing solely on teaching and reporting to the state curriculum, whose aim is primarily to produce loyal national subjects, the school encourages assimilation rather than international mindedness. Nationalism becomes
Chapter 9: Conclusion

instinctively conditioned through the teaching of historical, political and economic issues relevant to the school’s own country.

Using Leach’s (1969) classification of international schools, the school fits into the ‘unilateral internationalist’ category as the social base of the recontextualisation process is not the internationally minded philosophy of the IB. It is one of teaching and reporting to the VELS – the curriculum with which teachers are more familiar. Indeed, developing a sense of nationalism is a necessary part of the development of international mindedness (Allen 2000; Ellwood 2010; Kandel 1952). However, at Diamond Primary School, nationalism was not used as a stepping stone from which to develop international mindedness. This thesis has argued that the school’s focus on national issues means that Diamond Primary School teachers are promoting the development of “national mindedness” rather than “international mindedness”.

Hill (2006, p. 107) claims that IB programs are ‘flexible enough to accommodate local educational needs if it is to exist in national systems’. The IBO (1969) and Peterson (1972) concur, arguing that IB programmes can complement state and national curricular and be ideal for pedagogical innovation. Indeed, this may be the optimist’s intention of all IB programmes. However, this research indicates that one of the major difficulties with implementing the PYP can lie in the context of any school reporting to a state or national curriculum framework. Where core components of the mandatory curriculum require teachers to focus on issues of national significance rather than issues of a global or international nature, the resulting curriculum can be entirely different to the internationalist ideals of the international curriculum. This supports Holderness’s (2002, p. 87) claim that:

One of the most challenging aspects of international education is finding texts, activities and materials that are genuinely international and not tied to some narrow national agenda or view of learning.
Chapter 9: Conclusion

Teachers are faced with either relinquishing the PYP altogether, or making significant efforts to collaboratively explore creative ways of using the state or national curriculum as a springboard from which to understand global and international issues.

For teachers and school leaders to be able to dovetail the PYP with a state or national curriculum, a substantial amount of support and guidance in understanding the objectives, aims and philosophy of the PYP appears to be essential. Specifically, support for each staff member is essential in terms of continual professional development, time for individual and collaborative planning, and time for collaborative discussions and reflection (Bernstein 2000b). Without this, it is evident that teachers may feel isolated from their colleagues and end up disregarding the overall central vision of international mindedness, with the mandatory state or national curriculum taking the more dominant position.

Every IB school is on a journey, and it must be acknowledged that this case study was conducted at one point in time when the school was relatively new to the PYP. However, this research demonstrates that school leaders appeared to make no effort to work with teachers to extend the notion of international mindedness throughout the school's culture, curriculum, assessment and pedagogy. As such, at Diamond Primary School, the PYP was adopted, but not adapted. It was nothing more than a mythological discourse. The PYP was introduced as a marketing tool and hence, it was no more than "smoke and mirrors".

9.2 IMPLICATIONS

The implications from this study are clear. For teachers to feel committed to the PYP, then it follows that all employees need to be personally involved in its implementation. Following from this, teachers need to reach a shared agreement on how international mindedness can be understood within the context of school. Without this occurring at Diamond Primary School, participants have developed piecemeal understandings of international mindedness and lack knowledge of how to make international mindedness evident in classroom and assessment
Chapter 9: Conclusion

practices and the daily life of the school. Hence, despite key targets projected in school strategic plans, the three message systems do not reflect or promote international mindedness.

During the research, topics and issues worthy of future research surfaced. All teachers believe there is a lack of known strategies for implementing the IB learner profile in teaching practices. Other IB investigations could explore effective ways of embedding the IB learner profile in learning and assessment practices. Multiple case studies could provide information about what worked well and what was ineffective in different schools. The IBO could then provide advice, training and preparation for teachers in IB schools on possible strategies which schools and teachers may use from which to develop the IB learner profile.

This study and Hurley’s (2008) study represent the only projects ever conducted whose domains are exclusively on the topic of international mindedness in IB schools. They also represent two of only a small handful of projects conducted on IB schools by researchers independent of the IBO, as most people researching the programs of the IB are people working for the IBO itself. Indeed, there is nothing wrong with IBO employees researching the effectiveness of their programmes. However, in order to contribute richly to the many emerging themes in international education, it is important that research is conducted by a wide range of representatives from all over the world, from different contexts and backgrounds (Bagnall 2008; Bunnell 2011). This may serve to identify ways in which other IB schools may be using their mission statements as a competitive marketing tool rather than as an educational philosophy. By identifying the underlying reason behind implementing international educational curricula, it could also assist IB schools in reflecting on and developing their effectiveness as a learning organisation.

9.3 Recommendations

One of the main recommendations from this project is that Diamond Primary School collaboratively reflects on why it is implementing the PYP. If the school is serious about reflecting and promoting international mindedness through the three message systems, then together, staff and senior
Chapter 9: Conclusion

leaders will need to collegially reach a shared agreement regarding the school’s mission, aims and philosophy. Following from this, they will need to reflect on ways in which the school’s culture and its assessment, pedagogical and curriculum practices are in line with these aims. Teachers will need to be aware of the effects globalisation may have on infusing international mindedness throughout the culture of the school. Globalising and internationalist aspects of the school would need to be reflected on and a distinction clearly made between them (Cambridge 2002b).

It may be difficult to implement the PYP alongside a state or national curriculum – but schools need to try – at the very least. The importance of having supportive school leaders throughout this process cannot be over emphasised. These findings, consistent with Bernstein’s (2000b) theory, suggest that it is more likely that the PYP will merge more effectively with the state or national curriculum if school leaders:

- model and explicate what is to be achieved (Powell 2000)
- facilitate and encourage ongoing professional development that engages all staff in the process of continual school improvement
- develop a team approach (Powell 2000)
- model and sustain strong and active leadership and administrative support (Powell 2000)
- work collaboratively with teachers to help understand effective ways of infusing international-mindedness in the daily life, classroom and assessment practices, management and leadership of the school (IBO 2006)
- work collaboratively with teachers to help understand effective ways of internationalising the curriculum
- encourage formal collaboration among teachers both within the school and in other PYP schools; and
- work collaboratively with teachers to develop an agreement about the school’s mission (Mancuso, Roberts & White 2010).
Chapter 9: Conclusion

These tentative suggestions allow a balance between externally and internally organised professional development as each opportunity ‘has its own valuable contribution to make’ (Hayden 2007, p. 227) to the school.

It is essential that school leaders work with teachers to establish an agreed approach for developing attributes of the IB learner profile. This includes an understanding of the purpose of the IB learner profile, its objectives and expectations of what is to be achieved at different stages of development and knowledge of ways in which to achieve these aims. School leaders and teachers need to work together in order to develop this strategy and become aware of ways in which to focus on subject specific curriculum content based around the identification of knowledge, understanding and skills which are seen to contribute to an international mindset.

Teachers and school leaders need to reflect deeply on the meaning of international mindedness rather than using the term and attributes of the IB learner profile generically, or in a way that diminishes the overall purpose of the IB learner profile. When planning learning engagements, teachers need to delve deeply into international or global issues rather than merely skimming the surface of cultural difference and looking only at superficial aspects. Teaching about other cultures and encouraging students and teachers to experience different cultures through cultural celebrations are a great start, but teachers would need to realise that these experiences are not enough to develop a deep sense of international mindedness. As Snowball (2009) (p. 16) asserts: ‘As evidenced by a plethora of ongoing conflicts worldwide, intercultural understanding is not created simply by putting people of different cultures together in one place’ (p. 16).

From the findings from this project and by the exploration of Snowball’s proposal for developing a deeper understanding of culture (2009), it may be proposed that a deep sense of international mindedness may be able to surface when the following five levels of cultural engagement are experienced:

- individual – students developing knowledge and confidence about their own personal sense of cultural identity that is open to change
Chapter 9: Conclusion

- identifiable – acknowledging and appreciating the Australian born and immigrant cultures representative of the school community, building strong bridges between school and home cultures. As Haywood (2007, p. 88) argues, ‘there ought to be...much greater interaction across cultures’ in order to educate for international mindedness

- international awareness – understanding of cultures outside the school community that are perhaps not represented in the school community

- inter-national awareness – students developing tolerance and appreciation for difference, and a developing understanding that each nation may have its own unique cultural traditions, languages and practices and that it is okay to be different

- general – a developing open-minded attitude to the notion of culture, the development of culture and the effects it may have on people.

School leaders and teachers would need to understand that these aspects will not transpire by themselves. Teachers would need to be supported by the following elements, which should take place across the whole school:

- staff collaborating on the structure and purpose of the IB learner profile

- staff collaborating on how the IB learner profile can be nurtured and promoted through all three message systems

- pedagogy is based on the inquiry learning approach to learning alongside curriculum and assessment practices which consistently promote and celebrate global awareness and internationalism across the whole school

- all three message systems are weakly classified allowing students to make deep, conceptual connections throughout all subject areas

- assessment, classroom communication, sequencing and pacing are weakly framed
Chapter 9: Conclusion

- teachers collaborate and reflect on whole school events across all year levels and all areas of the curriculum.

These structures, all worthy of future research, would require ongoing reinforcement, action, reflection and strong administrative support to enable them to be adapted, implemented and sustained creatively throughout the whole school.

However, overhauling curriculum, assessment and pedagogical practices is only the start. These structures would need to be supported by school leaders who recognise the importance of supporting staff in continual professional development. Snowball (2004) offers a professional development model presented as seven standards for International Teacher Certification (ITC). In this model, teachers submit a portfolio of evidence demonstrating their own achievement of each standard of international educational experiences. Teachers at Diamond Primary School would need to be individually supported in their professional development plan but this plan could offer a foundational course for each teacher wanting to understand what an effective international teacher may look like. Senior leaders may even like to work from this plan to develop their own model for professional development to suit the needs of their school.

By using the ITC plan proposed by Snowball (2004), teachers could have an experienced mentor guide them through the plan. Mentors would need to be recognised for their specialised knowledge, but at Diamond Primary School, this may not cause a financial burden to the school as there are many experienced teachers who are required to take on mentoring or leadership roles as part of their state award agreement. Given that the school already has a small number of teachers knowledgeable in the PYP, these particular teachers could offer in-school professional development opportunities for peers. Some experienced teachers could also be trained or coached into the mentoring program. Diamond Primary School also employs an experienced teacher known as a “coach” for the sole purpose of providing time relief for teachers so that they can observe peers teaching in order to improve teaching and learning processes. Deveney (2007, p. 326) argues that
teachers can learn a lot from their colleagues through informal classroom observation and collaboration:

You learn a lot from your colleagues. Experienced teachers (mentors) should be paired with new members of staff to provide them with opportunities to discuss problems and day-to-day classroom issues. Close collaboration between teacher and mentor could be encouraged through informal classroom observations, team teaching and providing ‘earmarked’ time during non-contact periods.

Deveney (2007) highlights the importance of a sound mentoring program for new members of staff in international schools. She argues that when implementing a new curriculum, it is important to provide a regular induction time for all staff – not just new staff, but longstanding ones as well: ‘these sessions might be in a more informal setting to allow for open and honest discussions between “old” and “new” staff members’ (p. 326). Powell (2000) also asserts that collaborative reflection can provide teachers with a rich source of professional growth. He suggests that a team approach, strong leadership and effective support from school leaders, prolonged focus and clear expectations on what is to be achieved are all features evident in a school culture promoting effective professional development. Less experienced teachers could observe their mentors teaching while the coach teaches their own class in order to provide teaching release for the observation. Discussions shared between the observer and his or her mentor after the observations would provide rich emerging ideas on the development of international mindedness for both teachers involved. Teachers could also make use of the IBO Online Curriculum Centre (OCC), which is readily available to all teachers in schools implementing any of the IB programs. This website contains a section on implementing the IB learner profile and offers the opportunity for teachers to share experiences and exchange resources.

It is important that Diamond Primary School reassesses the status of external examinations. While it is important to have some data that indicates school performance, findings from this project, when linked with Bernstein’s code theory (2000b), suggest that relying heavily on strongly framed and strongly classified modes of assessment challenge the IB philosophy and can develop a paranoia about competitive individualism. More weakly framed forms of assessment, pedagogy
and curriculum are essential reforms for Diamond Primary School, because when assessment is weakly framed, the behaviour and ‘inner attributes’ of the child can be opened up. As Bernstein (1975, p. 109) states:

The weak frames enable a greater range of the student’s behaviour to be made public, and they make possible considerable diversity between students. It is possible that this might lead to a situation where assessment takes more into account ‘inner attributes’ of the student. Thus if he [sic] has the ‘right’ attitudes, then this will result later in the attainment of various specific competencies.

If teachers have more understanding of the weak classification or transdisciplinary nature of the PYP framework, then the concepts and attributes of the IB learner profile may become embedded in the planning of the curriculum, assessment and pedagogy. Teachers could make links across the domains of the VELS in order to embrace the transdisciplinary approach of the PYP – and this would not necessarily prevent teachers from reporting to the VELS as required.

9.4 REFLECTIONS ON THE PROJECT

Being a teacher at the school of research granted the following advantages:

- it allowed full immersion in this project
- it allowed information to be transmitted that an external researcher may not have been privy to
- having access to a constant supply of data to add to field notes allowed the analysis of information to be a continuous process
- previous relationships built on trust with all teacher informants encouraged all interviewees to share their unique perspectives in an honest and open.

However these advantages also instigated the need to remain on guard against bias at all times.

It was notable that many teachers at Diamond Primary School did not express interest in joining in the project. To non-participants, joining the project may have been seen as increasing their workload or exposing their vulnerability if they were not totally familiar with the PYP. It may also
be proposed that the initial lack of response to the first distribution of letters was because teachers felt self-conscious about opening up to their lack of understanding on the topic “international-mindedness” within the PYP.

The main disappointment was the lack of interest senior leaders had in the project. Given the lack of expertise in the school on the development of international mindedness, it was initially anticipated that school leaders would show more interest in this project. On the odd occasion, school leaders politely asked how the project was progressing but this was always done at an inopportune moment which hindered any in-depth discussion. Despite teacher entitlements to a certain amount of peer observations per month, any time needed for observations was also completed in personal planning hours. The lack of support and lack of interest in receiving feedback when the project was complete may be interpreted as further confirmation that the notion of international mindedness was a low priority for the school or that they are incredibly busy with their own performativity – or both.

9.5 Final Words

The recontextualising process at Diamond Primary School has been examined through exploring teachers’ understandings of international mindedness as well as the construction and relay of the three message systems. The project demonstrates that, just as Bernstein (1975, 2000b) claims knowledge is shaped through the ways in which teachers, school leaders and authorities construct and relay the three message systems, so too is international mindedness. In the recontextualising field of Diamond Primary School, market discourses and the PYP compromise each other and in their struggle for the more dominant position, the school’s own interest in maintaining and increasing its reputation through rigorous curricular and assessment practices has taken preference. While it is expected that the discourse of the PYP is to nurture the development of international mindedness, this has not been made possible due to the school’s emphasis on maintaining optimal position in the education market and, lack of training for teachers on the IB philosophy and implementation of the PYP.
Chapter 9: Conclusion

While Hurley (2008) concludes that implementing an IB programme (or programmes) offers a promising opportunity for students at the school – as it indicates that the school is placing some value on international mindedness – findings from this project differ as they reveal that the implementation of the PYP can be misappropriated as a way of enhancing a school’s academic reputation and marketing new enrolments.

The fact that teachers expressed a lack of knowledge of how to implement the program and a lack of understanding on how to develop international mindedness meant that the internationally minded philosophy behind the IB was suppressed. Furthermore, when staff requested support through attending professional learning opportunities to learn how to embed the notion of international mindedness in their teaching, they were denied. The risk for Diamond Primary School is that if school leaders fail to rethink the school’s structures, practices and educational philosophy, and adapt them to suit the philosophy of the IB, then the development of international mindedness will remain stagnant.

This study indicates that in schools implementing the PYP, it is vital that senior leaders support staff with ongoing professional learning opportunities. Ongoing training needs to cover specific knowledge and skills required in order to understand the philosophy of the IB, the framework, structure and purpose of the PYP, and its implementation with a focus on embedding the attributes of the IB learner profile in curriculum, assessment and pedagogical processes of the classroom.

What the development of international mindedness appears to be dependent on, is a shared commitment to extending it through an international curriculum and internationally minded assessment practices. Where national and state curricula instil the values, perspectives and histories of a particular society, extended efforts and a collaborative strategy for reaching beyond the local context is essential. This needs to involve critically examining the central concepts of internationalism within the context of the international educational programme. It is only once internationalism becomes more meaningful to teachers that they will be able to make connections between the international curricular and the state or national curricula.
Chapter 9: Conclusion

Following from this, a deep sense of international mindedness needs to become the impetus of everything the school leader and teacher does. International mindedness should not be an add-on subject. It needs to be infused in all learning and assessment processes. Rather than purely transforming students of today intellectually with the occasional lesson promoting food, flags and festivals of other cultures, teachers need to encourage students to become active inquirers into the beliefs, histories and cultures of others. The three message systems need to be weakly framed and weakly classified and transdisciplinary in nature to encourage and celebrate democracy, creativity and self-regulation (Bernstein 2000b). Teachers need to encourage students to develop interpersonal, critical thinking and communication skills that encourage them to become open-minded, reflective and inquiring people. All learning opportunities should be rich, meaningful and varied.

This preparation may not solve all problems, but it may help students develop the skills, knowledge and values necessary to confront future global challenges. It may also help change Haywood’s (2007, p. 80) claim that teachers and educational thinkers do not understand what international mindedness is: “The definition is not under construction in any profound way and that we cannot simply assume that "we know what we mean". With hope and more research, more organisations like the IBO and UWC may continue to grow in a way that richly contributes to promoting internationally minded values in more national and state run schools.
References


References


References


References


Cause, L 2010a, 'Bernstein's code theory and the educational researcher', Asian Social Science, vol. 6, no. 5, pp. 3-9.


Crotty, M 1998, The foundations of social research: meaning and perspective in research process, Allen and Unwin, St Leonards, N.S.W.


References


Field, J 2010, 'Middle school music curricula and the fostering of intercultural awareness', *Journal of Research in International Education*, vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 5-23.

Fish, S 1997, 'Boutique multiculturalism, or why liberals are incapable of thinking about hate speech', *Critical Inquiry*, vol. 23, no. 2, pp. 378-95.


References


Green, A 1990, Education and state formation: the rise of education systems in England, France and the USA, Macmillan, Basingstoke.


References


References


References


IBO 2011c, *Programme standards and practices*, International Baccalaureate Organisation, Wales, United Kingdom.


References


References


Merriam, S 2001, Qualitative research and case study applications in education: revised and expanded from case study research in education, Jossey-Bass Publishers, San Francisco, CA.


Peterson, ADC 1987, Schools across frontiers. The story of the International Baccalaureate and the United World Colleges, Open Court, La Salle, Illinios.
References


References


Smith, P & Henry, J 1999, *Case studies in new learning technologies, stage two: an initiating research project for generalising from case studies; a research approach for investigating the application of new learning technologies: final report*, Research Institute for Professional and Vocational Education and Training, Victorian Institute of Technology, Melbourne.


Soy, S 1997, 'The case study as a research method', University of Texas.


References


Tavan, G 2005, End of White Australia, Perspective, Australian Broadcasting Corporation, Australia.


References


### APPENDIX A
Observations Template for Observation Journal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date / Time:</th>
<th>Teacher:</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teacher Talk / Pedagogy</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teacher Talk</strong></td>
<td><strong>Direct Influence</strong> on attributes of IB learner profile</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Influence</strong> on attributes of the IB learner profile</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Indirect influence</strong> on attributes of the IB learner profile</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assessment</strong></td>
<td><strong>Direct Influence</strong> on attributes of IB learner profile</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Influence</strong> on attributes of the IB learner profile</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Indirect influence</strong> on attributes of the IB learner profile</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Direct Influence</strong> on attributes of IB learner profile</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Curriculum</th>
<th><strong>Influence</strong> on attributes of the IB learner profile</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Indirect influence</strong> on attributes of the IB learner profile</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Other influences:**

- ...
- ...
- ...
- ...
- ...
- ...
- ...

**Direct Influence on attributes of the IB learner profile:** *Pedagogy, curriculum or assessment is explicitly aimed at developing an attribute or attributes of the IB learner profile.*

**Influence:** *Through processes, structures and rituals in the curriculum, assessment and pedagogy, the teacher influences a student or many students’ development of the IB learner profile, without necessarily meaning to. For example, I may observe a student to watch the teacher reflect on his or her own mistake, and then comment to a peer. If I believe that the teacher has influenced the development of international mindedness (or what’s more unlikely, impeded it) through her own behaviour, decision making or language, then this is where I will make notes. This may also include the framing in the curriculum, where the teacher decides what, how and when curriculum content will be taught.*

**Indirect influence:** *Through processes, structures and rituals in the curriculum, assessment and pedagogy, a student’s development of attributes of the IB learner profile is implicitly influenced. This may include influences that are outside of the classroom teacher’s control, such as the classification of content in the curriculum.*
APPENDIX B

The following questions were asked in the first interview to keep the interview process on task and to collect ample data to address the three research questions:

- Describe your school.
- What is international mindedness?
- Is Diamond Primary School an internationally minded school? If so / not...then how and why?
- Describe how the IBPYP is viewed at Diamond Primary School.
- What is the most important factor in developing international mindedness?
- What changes could be made to your school that may help students develop international mindedness more effectively than they are now?
- How do you think teachers work to develop international mindedness?
- What role do you believe the classroom teacher plays in developing internationally minded students?
- What are your views about the IB learner profile?
- What role do you think the IB learner profile plays in developing international mindedness?
- Describe the main pedagogical approach at Diamond Primary School.
- Describe assessment at Diamond Primary School.
- What role does international mindedness play in assessment at Diamond Primary School?
- What role does international mindedness play in curriculum at Diamond Primary School?
- What role does the IB learner profile play in curriculum at Diamond Primary School?
- What role does international mindedness play in pedagogy at Diamond Primary School?
- Do you believe the curriculum is internationalised at Diamond Primary School? Explain.

In the second interview, after observing teachers for eight months, the following questions were asked:
Appendices

- Do you think the teaching of international mindedness better prepares students for life? Would you mind explaining?

- Where does one find international mindedness at Diamond Primary School?

- How is international mindedness reflected in the curriculum?

- How well has the PYP been embraced and implemented at Diamond Primary School?

- Through what pedagogical practices is international mindedness taught?

- What factors are important in developing international mindedness in students?

- What do you think is the most effective way of helping a student to become ‘internationally minded’ in a school implementing the PYP of the IBO?

- How do you assess learning for international development?

- How do you find teaching the IBPYP and VELS together? Are they compatible? If not, how do you deal with this? How do incompatibilities manifest themselves?

- Do you find the IBPYP helps provide an international educational experience?

- Is VELS an international program in any way?

- How do VELS and the PYP develop international mindedness?

- How do you think Diamond Primary School can promote international mindedness more effectively?

The school teacher was asked the same questions, with the following additional questions:

- What changes could be made to the school that may help students develop international mindedness more effectively?

- In what ways does the IBPYP help develop international mindedness?

- As a leader in a school implementing the PYP, what do you believe is your role?