Co-Creation of Value in Culturally Diversified Museums: A Research Report

Emma Winston, Ruth Rentschler, Ahmed Shariah Ferdous, Fara Azmat
Deakin University
Acknowledgements

We wish to acknowledge the participants in this study, including the Muslim and non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors as well as the board members and staff of the Islamic Museum of Australia. The study would not have been possible without their support and commitment to it.
# Table of Contents

- Executive Summary ................................................................................................................................. 1
- Key Findings ............................................................................................................................................... 2
- Introduction ................................................................................................................................................ 4
- Background ................................................................................................................................................ 4
- Case Report: Islamic Museum of Australia .............................................................................................. 5
- What the Literature Told us .................................................................................................................................. 6
  - The Australian Muslim Experience ........................................................................................................... 6
  - Defining Social Inclusion .......................................................................................................................... 8
    - Individual Value ....................................................................................................................................... 8
    - Community Value ................................................................................................................................... 9
    - Societal Value ......................................................................................................................................... 10
  - Defining Co-creation of Value .................................................................................................................. 11
  - Resource Integration .................................................................................................................................. 12
  - Conceptual Model .......................................................................................................................................... 13
- Research Approach ......................................................................................................................................... 14
- Findings .......................................................................................................................................................... 16
  - Motivators and Inhibitors of Resource Integration .................................................................................. 16
    - Motivators ............................................................................................................................................... 16
      - Building Cultural Understanding .......................................................................................................... 16
      - Specialised Interests ............................................................................................................................. 17
      - Sharing Knowledge ............................................................................................................................... 19
      - Socialising ............................................................................................................................................. 20
      - Education ............................................................................................................................................... 21
      - Strengthening Religious Faith ............................................................................................................. 22
      - Drive for Belonging .............................................................................................................................. 23
    - Inhibitors .................................................................................................................................................. 24
      - Low Awareness ....................................................................................................................................... 24
      - Limited Cultural Understanding and Knowledge .................................................................................... 24
      - Limited Accessibility ............................................................................................................................... 26
      - Specialised Interests ............................................................................................................................... 26
      - Cultural and Religious Background ...................................................................................................... 27
  - Co-creating Value ....................................................................................................................................... 29
  - Social Resources ......................................................................................................................................... 29
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sharing Knowledge</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Resources</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Background and Religious Knowledge</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecting Religious Knowledge</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building Commercial Knowledge and Skills</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Resources</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthening Religious Faith</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continued Learning and Experiences</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-creating Value for Social Inclusion</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Value</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthening Identity</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pride and Belonging</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Value</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Connections</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial Connections</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Societal Value</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building Cultural Understanding</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecting Specialised Interests</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managerial Implications</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivators and Inhibitors</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-creation of Value</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Inclusion</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant Demographics</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tables and Figures

Tables

Table 1: Focus Group Composition ................................................................. 15
Table 2: Social Inclusion Outcomes ............................................................. 44
Table 3: Participant Demographics .............................................................. 55

Figures

Figure 1: Conceptual Model: Co-creation of Value in Culturally Diversified Museums ........ 14
Figure 2: Empirical Framework: Co-creation of Value in Culturally Diversified Museums .......... 49
Executive Summary

This report presents the findings from the thesis titled: ‘Co-creating value in culturally diversified museums’ that was conducted by Ms Emma Winston for her honours thesis at Deakin University in the Business School in 2015. The report forms part of a larger research project on the Islamic Museum of Australia, also conducted in 2015 by the research team.

The report identifies through a depth report, for the first time, why social inclusion of Australian Muslims remains a challenge, and how culturally diversified museums provide a way forward for creating social inclusion. Diverse museums create social inclusion, using the non-threatening means of the arts—via museum visits, events, exhibitions and school programs—that provide learning experiences and entertainment to overcome prejudice, lack of knowledge, stereotypes and fear of Muslims and Islam.

Overall, the report builds knowledge on the positive means of approaching societal division and exclusion. Non-profit museums are an important part of the cultural and community landscape that provide educational and entertainment opportunities within a cultural framework. Only limited research has been undertaken in the non-profit museum field on the notion of co-creating value in diverse institutions, in order to assist with social inclusion.

The purpose of this report is to explore how visitors co-create value with culturally diversified museums and the value outcomes this achieves for social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels. A case report of the Islamic Museum of Australia (IMA) is used to explore the three aims of the report:

1. Motivators and inhibitors of resource integration for Muslim and non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors
2. Muslim and non-Muslim visitor integrate social, cultural and physical resources to co-create value
3. Value co-creation can lead to social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels
Key Findings

- Motivating factors for Muslim and non-Muslim visitor resource integration include: building cultural understanding; specialised interests; sharing knowledge; socialising; education; strengthening religious faith; and a drive for belonging.

- Inhibiting factors for Muslim and non-Muslim visitor resource integration include: low awareness, cultural understanding and knowledge; accessibility; specialised interests; and cultural and religious backgrounds.

- Muslim and non-Muslim visitors integrate their social, cultural and physical resources to co-create value from their visitor experience by:
  - Integrating social resources evident in visitors’ use of culturally diversified museums as a resource to share knowledge with their family and friends and to educate their children.
  - Integrating physical resources evident in visitors using their emotion to strengthen their religious faith and their energy to pursue continued learning and experiences.
  - Integrating cultural resources evident in Muslim and non-Muslim visitors using their history and specialised knowledge and skills. Muslim visitors integrated their cultural background and religious knowledge of Islam to build and enhance their existing knowledge. Similarly, non-Muslim visitors integrated their religious knowledge of Christianity to connect with the teachings of Islam and used their work roles to enhance their commercial knowledge and skills.

- Co-creation of value between both Muslim and non-Muslim visitors leads to social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels.
  - Individual level:
    Muslim visitors reported enhanced feelings of pride and belonging and a sense of strengthened identity after visiting the museum.
  - Community level:
    Muslim visitors reported using their sense of pride and belonging, achieved at the individual level, to actively share knowledge about their religion and history with non-Muslims in their community. Further, community solidarity and relationship building can occur as a result of arts participation in the context of
culturally diversified museums, which was evident in non-Muslim visitors showing a willingness to establish connections with Muslims in their communities and commercial networks.

- **Societal level:**
  Non-Muslim visitors were able to challenge the stereotypes they held against Muslims by comparing and contrasting their existing knowledge of Muslims, which was predominantly based on messages in the media, to build cultural understanding. Further, the results revealed non-Muslim visitors were able to relate to Muslims living in Australia by connecting their specialised interests with the displays and objects presented in the museum.
Introduction

The purpose of this report is to explore how visitors co-create value with culturally diversified museums and the value outcomes this achieves for social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels. To explore co-creation of value in this context, this report is centred around the Islamic Museum of Australia (IMA), a not-for-profit foundation and the first Islamic Museum in Australia. The IMA was funded in March 2014 as a means of engaging Muslims and non-Muslims in a positive experience of cross-cultural and educational services to challenge the negative stereotypes of Muslims and Islam in the media. This report explores co-creation of value in this context using Arnould, Price and Malshe’s (2006) resource integration framework, to investigate how Muslim and non-Muslim visitors integrate their operant resources, including social, cultural and physical resources, to co-create value with the IMA. Further, this report investigates factors that act as motivators and inhibitors for resource integration and value outcomes of visitors’ experiences that lead to social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels.

Background

Today societies at large are experiencing growth in cultural diversity due to increased global migration. In Australia, almost a quarter of the population was born overseas (24.6%) and 43.1 per cent of people have at least one parent who was born overseas (ABS, 2012), boosting cultural diversity. Increase in cultural diversity sees a “range of groups making their presence felt on the cultural landscape, and claiming the right to express their different cultural identities and allegiances” (Ang, 2005, p. 306). As a result, participation in the arts is considered a critical means of enhancing the cultural identity of diverse ethnic groups at risk of social exclusion (Mulligan & Humphery, 2006). Museums are therefore under pressure to demonstrate their “social purpose” and become agents of social inclusion, due to their social responsibility for representation, participation and access (Sandell, 1998, p. 401). Hence, the “global framework” of the museum has moved towards “help[ing] visitors to understand the works and the world around them” (Mencarelli, Marteaux & Pulh, 2010, p. 335).

Museums can significantly contribute to society and achieve social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000; CCA, 2010; Crooke, 2006; Gibson, 2008; Janes & Conaty, 2005; Message, 2007; 2013; Newman, McLean & Urquhart, 2005; Sandell, 1998; 2003). Museums, as part of the collections sector “contribute directly to
community strengthening and social inclusion” (CCA, 2010, p. 13). For example, research into the social impact of museums suggests, at an individual level, museums can increase self-esteem, confidence and creativity; at a community level they can work as catalysts for social regeneration and empower communities; at the societal level they can promote tolerance and inter-community respect, and challenge stereotypes (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000). Such findings highlight the potential impact of museums in facilitating the inclusion of culturally diverse groups in society. However, while museums have the means to promote inclusion and diversity, there is debate about their ability to be inclusive organisations (Bennett, 1995; Newman, McLean & Urquhart, 2005; Tlili, 2008). For example, museums can have a negative effect on social inclusion by creating barriers through limited accessibility (Newman, McLean & Urquhart, 2005) and a lack of cultural relevance (Tlili, 2008). Therefore, to understand how museums can facilitate value for social inclusion, further exploration is required to understand the motivators and inhibitors for potential and existing visitors to engage with museums and factors that influence the outcomes of their visitor experience.

Case Report: Islamic Museum of Australia

The Islamic Museum of Australia (IMA) was officially opened as a not-for-profit foundation and the first Islamic Museum in Australia in March 2014. The museum was founded by Moustafa and Maysaa Fahour in 2010 as a way of addressing the negative stereotypes of Australian Muslims (Saeed, 2014). The museum aims to promote the rich artistic heritage and historical contributions of Muslims in Australia and abroad through the display of various artworks and historical artefacts. The museum showcases a diverse range of Islamic art forms including architecture, calligraphy, paintings, glass, ceramics and textiles. The museum has five permanent exhibitions that represent five individual themes: Islamic Faith, the Islamic Contribution to Civilisation, Islamic Art, Islamic Architecture, and the Australia Muslim Gallery. Helen Light, Museums and Cultural Exhibitions Consultant explains “the design of the permanent galleries is notable for their impact of clarity and restraint…enabling visitors a measured and informative exploration of what it means to be a Muslim in Australia” (Light, 2014, p. 10).

The IMA strives to challenge perceptions of Islamic culture. The museum addresses many of the current and commonly held misconceptions about Islam. Such misconceptions are addressed, for example, through explaining the role of women in Islam, the history of Muslims
in Australia, and Muslim contributions to fields such as science, literature, astronomy, and engineering. The museum aims to be a cultural centre for Muslims and non-Muslims, while at the same time creating a space where non-Muslims and non-Muslims can learn about Islam. The museum offers cross-cultural and educational services where the “Muslim Australian experience” can be discovered (IMA, 2015). The design of the museum is built around the idea of an “Islamic Exploratorium” and aims to offer “interactive and participatory experiences” for visitors (IMA, 2015). The museum states “the design of the Islamic Museum of Australia aims to challenge ideas of what and how an Islamic museum in Australia should be” (IMA, 2015). Light (2014) explains “the wider community needs to learn what it means to be a Muslim, to break down barriers of ignorance and misunderstanding about this culture and faith so that we can all live together in knowledge and respect for each other” (p. 12).

What the Literature Told us

The Australian Muslim Experience

The Australian relationship with Muslims and Islam dates back to the 18th century beginning with the trade, socialisation and intermarriage between Indigenous and Muslim communities, followed by the Afghan camel drivers who worked on inter-state transportation in the 19th century (Fahour, 2011). In the late 1960s significant Turkish and Lebanese Muslims migrated to Australia (Yücel, 2011). Between 1991 and 2001 the Australian Muslim population almost doubled and has a total increase of 157% since 1986 (Human Rights & Equal Opportunity Commission, 2004). Australian Muslims consist of at least 1.5% of the population and Australia remains the largest birthplace group (36%) of Australian Muslims according to the 2001 Census (Human Rights & Equal Opportunity Commission, 2004). However, research on the Australian Muslim experience highlights the social difficulties Australian Muslims face as a result of the negative stereotypes and perceptions of Muslims in Australian society (Pedersen et al., 2009; Yücel, 2011; Abu-Rayya & White, 2010). As such, Muslim communities in Australia are confronted with the repercussions of these views in the form of social exclusion, racism and unfair treatment (Abu-Rayya & White, 2010). In 2004, the Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission conducted a research report with the University of Western Sydney to investigate the Australian Muslim experience in both Melbourne and Sydney. The results were described by Dr William Jonas, the then Acting Race Discrimination Commissioner, as “often disturbing” (Human Rights & Equal Opportunity Commission, 2004, p. iii). While the report highlighted that not all Australian Muslim participants experienced discrimination, those
who had, expressed feelings of isolation and fear, and a common response was “I don’t feel like I belong here anymore” (Human Rights & Equal Opportunity Commission, 2004, p. iii).

Exclusion of Australian Muslims draws a relationship between such stereotypes and the representation of Muslims in the media, particularly after events such as September 11, 2001 and the current crisis concerning ISIS (Kabir, 2007; Matindoost, 2015; Pedersen et al., 2009; Saniotis, 2004; Rane et al., 2011). Saniotis (2004) argues there is a “sense of déjà vu” between the way Australian Muslims were represented in the media in the 19th and early 20th centuries to that of media representations today (p. 51). He makes a comparison of 19th century media representations of Muslims as ‘undesirable immigrants’ to that of current ‘Islamophobia’ media representations related to September 11, 2001 portraying Australian Muslims as ‘other’ (Saniotis, 2004). Dunn, Klocker and Salabay (2007) investigated Islamophobia, which he defines as a community fear of Islam, with an Attitudes Towards Islam Survey. The purpose of the survey was to test the extent and forms of Islamophobia in Australia. The survey revealed 736 (66%) Australian respondents stated that Islam posed a threat of some level, 41% perceived a minor threat and 15% perceived a major threat. However, only 255 respondents were able to articulate the form of such a threat (Dunn, Klocker & Salabay, 2007). The threats took two forms, the military threat posed to Australia by Islam (176 respondents) and a cultural threat concerned with the impact of a Muslim presence in Australia (Dunn, Klocker & Salabay, 2007).

Insight into the Australian Muslim point of view is provided by investigating Australian Muslim attitudes, opinions and perceptions concerning social and public policy issues that have been covered in the media such as integration, gender equality, violence and terrorism, democracy and Muslim perceptions of the West. While media representations of Australian Muslims represent the ethnic minority group as resisting integration and holding opposing views to Australian culture, Australian Muslims do seek to integrate into Australian society, support Australia’s democracy and strongly feel it is compatible with Islam (Rane et al., 2011). Similarly, respondents strongly opposed terrorism and expressed that Islam’s teachings supports gender equality. Views held by Australians of both Australian Muslims and Islam often misrepresent Islam (Dunn, Klocker and Salabay 2007), suggesting that education and more transparency between Muslim communities in Australia and the wider Australian public could assist in achieving greater tolerance and social inclusion.
Defining Social Inclusion

Curiously, writings on social inclusion has focused primarily on addressing the social exclusion of disadvantaged groups in society. The concept and language of social exclusion is broad and there are multiple definitions in academic literature (McCall, 2009). The concept originated in France where it was used to describe social disintegration (Sandell, 1998) and used as a euphemism for poverty (Askonas & Stewart, 2000, p. 38), however academic scholars agree the concept more accurately concerns the structural causes of poverty and the disintegration of groups within society (McCall, 2009). There are three main agreed dimensions of social inclusion which, paradoxically, represent the multifaceted meaning of social exclusion: economic (unemployment, poverty); social (homelessness, crime, disaffected youth); and political (disempowerment, low levels of community activity) (Percy-Smith, 2000). Social inclusion is a concept used to explain the actions taken to prevent or resolve dimensions of social exclusion (McCall, 2009). Social inclusion work is defined as “promot[ing] the involvement in culture and leisure activities of those at risk of social disadvantage or marginalisation, particularly by virtue of the area they live in; their disability, poverty, age, racial or ethnic origin.” (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000, p. 11).

There are three levels for social inclusion outcomes: individual, community and societal (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000). Being able to make contributions are three levels gives museums the “potential to empower individuals and communities” and to “contribute towards combating the multiple forms of disadvantage experienced by individuals and communities described as ‘at risk of social exclusion” (Sandell 2003 p. 45). The proceeding discussion will outline evidence of the impact of the arts at each identified level (individual, community and societal) to explore the potential of culturally diversified museums to facilitate social inclusion.

Individual Value

The arts have positive outcomes for the personal development of socially excluded individuals, groups and communities (Barraket, 2005). The literature consistently suggests the arts encourage socialising and creativity, reduce social isolation, increase self-esteem, and make people more happy and confident (Matarasso, 1996; 1997; 1998; Williams, 1997; Long et al. 2002; Goodlad, Hamilton & Taylor, 2002). Further, participation in the arts has proven to diversify and strengthen personal networks (Barraket, 2005). Barraket (2005) explains “at an individual level, people with diverse personal networks have been found to be in relatively better physical and mental health, have higher sustained levels of education and employment
and greater sources of social support than those with very limited networks” (p. 10). Matarasso (1996) conducted a report on the social impact of multicultural arts festivals using a questionnaire of 242 adults and children. The report found the festivals promoted individual and personal development, with 78% respondents reporting that they felt more confident, 79% had developed new skills, 43% felt better or healthier as a result, and 80% felt happier (Matarasso, 1996). Similarly, at an individual level museums and galleries can contribute to personal growth and development (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000). The RCMG report found for individuals at risk of exclusion, visiting museums can produce positive outcomes such as “enhanced self-esteem, confidence and creativity” resulting in individuals having more “active, fulfilled and social” lives (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000, p. 24). For example, the report highlighted outcomes of museum and gallery projects where individuals at risk of exclusion are brought together by theme, not social group, to contribute their skills and experiences. Such activities encourage the integration of people from diverse social groups and “validate” an individual’s skills and experiences, encouraging them to feel “valued” and “their stories and lives appreciated” (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000, p. 24).

Community Value

A review of literature on the social impact of the arts suggests community value is found through cross-cultural community understanding, a stronger sense of ‘locality’, bringing diverse groups together, and community organisational skills (Matarasso, 1996; 1997; 1998; Williams, 1997; Jones, 1988; Lowe, 2000). Williams (1997) highlights the social impact of the arts for communities with a report of 89 public-funded community based arts projects and community members, finding 90% of respondents who participated in arts activities reported better community identity. Further, Lowe (2000) argues participation in the arts can achieve community solidarity and relationship building by allow community members to connect with one another based on similar interests. He explains arts based projects provide opportunities for people to “interact socially” and “discover additional connections and to solidify social bonds” (p. 366). Similarly, at a community level, museums can promote social regeneration and empower communities (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000). The RCMG report found museums have the ability to develop community confidence, experience and skills, inspire pride and interest in a community’s history, and increase self-determination to take control of their lives and neighbourhoods (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000, p. 27). The RCMG report provides evidence of positive outcomes from collaborative work between communities and museums.
For example, a museum in the UK collaborated with community members to develop a local history project, which developed into a local touring exhibition. The report found the project empowered the community and enhanced feelings of belonging (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000). In addition, the community group who worked with the museum reported feeling more “adventurous” and “encouraged …to use the museum as a resource for different projects” (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000, p. 27). An example of social impact for ethnic minorities at the community level is a report conducted by Ang (2005) on cultural diversity in museums. The report used a case report of the ‘Buddha: Radiant Awakening’ exhibition at the Art Gallery of New South Wales. The exhibition incorporated a “Wisdom Room”, where the local Buddhist community were invited to display, in multiple forms, “living Buddhist cultures” (Ang, 2005, p. 8). Ang (2005) explains “the Wisdom Room was a space where groups who normally exist out of sight from the dominant culture gained visibility – if only temporarily – in a very privileged site of that dominant culture itself!” (p. 9). The project was successful in bringing new audiences who were at risk of exclusion, such as Vietnamese migrants from widespread Sydney suburbs, to participate in the activities. The exhibition was described as “interactive” and “empowering” for these communities (Ang, 2005, p. 9). Ang (2005) explains the exhibition showed a commitment from the museum to promote “accessibility” and “representation” (p. 13). In addition, she argues the exhibition was an example of a museum embracing changes in exhibition practice and the repositioning of art from “elitist” to a that which promotes a “diverse range of experiences and relationships” (Ang, 2005, p. 13).

Societal Value

The literature suggests arts and culture can have a social impact on a macro level. While empirical research on the societal value of the arts and cultural institutions is limited, there is evidence that the arts can challenge stereotypes, promote tolerance and inter-community respect (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000; Sandell, 1998, 2003; Williams, 1998). A report conducted by Williams (1998) on the social impact of arts based projects found 86% of respondents reported improved understanding of different cultures or lifestyles and 90% reported increased awareness of an issue. The literature suggests that the arts provide a platform for groups at risk of social exclusion. Bell and Desai (2011) state “…the arts play a vital role in making visible the stories, voices, and experiences of people who are rendered invisible by structures of dominance” (p. 288). Therefore, the arts provide a means for challenging the way people lean and provide “new lenses for looking at the world and ourselves in relation to it”
(Bell & Desai, 2011, p. 288). Bell and Desai (2011) further suggest the arts can be used to “generate dialogue” and to create “temporary or permanent social spaces where people can meet, interact, and connect in order to change the way we see ourselves in relation to others, thereby raising social consciousness and social responsibility” (p. 289). In this way, the arts encourage “active participation”, where the audience can both engage with the artistic product, while considering the messages embedded in the art (Bell & Desai, 2011, p. 290). In the context of museums, Sandell (1998) explains activities in the public area such as “sometimes controversial” exhibitions and events have the potential to act as vehicles of broader social change (p. 414). Sandell (1998) highlights the case of The Migration Museum, which he explains is “committed to promoting greater inter-community tolerance of immigrant minorities” (p. 414). In 1998, the museum held temporary exhibitions to address increasing racism towards immigrant minorities. Sandell (1998) explains the exhibitions, through their use of highly personal stories, aimed to “inform the visitor” as well as “challenge their misconceptions and encourage tolerance and understanding” (p. 414). However, while Sandell (1998) has outlined the museum as a potential facilitator of social inclusion, further research is required to measure the actual impact museums can have on dominant views in society in relation to ethnic minority groups. Sandell (1998) explains “…further analysis is required to identify the particular, and even unique, contributions which museums can make towards the process of social inclusion” (415). He further states “the impact an individual museum may have is likely to depend on a whole range of factors internal and external to the organisation” (p. 415).

**Defining Co-creation of Value**

The concept of ‘co-creation of value’ has multiple definitions and conceptualisations in services marketing literature. The literature refers to the term as in a multitude of ways, including ‘co-creation’ (Prebensen & Foss, 2011; Ramaswamy, 2011), ‘co-creation of value’ (Lusch & Vargo, 2006; Prahalad & Ramaswamy, 2004) ‘value co-creation’ (Grönroos & Gummerus, 2014; Payne, Storbacka & Frow, 2008) and ‘customer value creation’ (McColl-Kennedy et al., 2012). The conceptualisation of SDL holds the view that value can only be co-created by the user in their consumption process through ‘value-in-use’ (Lusch & Vargo, 2006). In this way, the consumer is a critical actor in the process of co-creating value. Similarly, recent conceptualisations of the concept in SL literature define ‘co-creation’ as “the process of creating something together in a process of direct interactions between two or more actors,
where the actors’ processes merge into one collaborative, dialogical process” (Grönroos & Gummerus, 2014, p. 209). Further, they refer to the process of ‘value co-creation’, which is defined as “a joint process that takes place on a co-creation platform involving, for example, a service provider and a customer, where the service provider’s service (production) process and the customer’s consumption and value creation process merge into one process of direct interactions” (Grönroos & Gummerus, 2014, p. 209).

**Resource Integration**

Research on consumer participation highlights the role of consumers in actively using their personal resources in value co-creation (Bowen, 1986; Johnston & Jones 2003; Kelley, Donnelly & Skinner, 1990; Rodie & Kleine, 2000). Similarly, research into consumer culture theory (CCT) suggests dynamic relationships exist between cultural meanings, consumers and the marketplace (Arnould & Thompson, 2005). Arnould and Thompson (2005) explain “the marketplace provides consumers with an expansive and heterogeneous palette of resources from which to construct individual and collective identities (Arnould & Thompson, 2005, p. 871). SDL of marketing builds on CCT and consumer participation research proposing consumers act as resource integrators (Vargo & Lusch 2004; Vargo, Maglio & Akaka, 2008). Arnould, Price and Malshe (2006) present a resource integration framework conceptualising the consumers’ “rich value creating competencies” (p. 91). This framework compliments SDL and suggests consumers co-create value by integrating operand and operant resources. Arnould, Price and Malshe (2006) explain operand resources are considered tangible culturally constituted economic resources, whereas operant resources are considered intangible resources that act on other resources to produce effects. Operant resources are linked to “cultural schemas”, which are defined as “generalised procedures applied in the enhancement of social life” (Giddens, 1984, p. 21). Vargo and Lusch (2004) state “the service-centred dominant logic perceives operant resources as primary, because they are the producers of effects” (p. 3). Arnould, Price and Malshe (2006) supports this view suggesting in addition to firms being concerned with consumers “economic power” (operand resources) they need to be mindful of consumers’ desired values (operand resources) and assist consumers to “create value-in-use” (p. 93).

social resources as “networks of relationships with others including traditional demographic groupings (families, ethnic groups, social class) and emergent groupings (brand communities, consumer tribes and subcultures, friendship groups)” (p. 93). However, classification of social resources within empirical studies refer to social resources as family relationships, consumer communities and commercial relationships (Baron & Harris, 2008; Baron & Warnaby, 2011). Arnould, Price & Malshe (2006) define cultural resources as “varying amounts and kinds of knowledge of cultural schemas, including specialised cultural capital, skills and goals” which are categorised in terms of specialized knowledge/skills, history and imagination (p. 94). Further, Arnould, Price and Malshe (2006) define physical resources as varying “physical and mental endowments” that effect consumers’ “life roles and projects” which are categorised as energy, emotion and strength (p. 93). Empirical research exploring the role of operant resources supports this framework, providing evidence that consumers possess social, cultural and physical resources and that such resources are integrated to co-create value with service providers in certain contexts (Baron & Harris, 2008; Baron & Warnaby, 2011).

**Conceptual Model**

Drawing on the literature relevant to this report, we propose a conceptual model, as shown in Figure 1. The model demonstrates how visitors integrate their operant resources (i.e., social, cultural, physical) to co-create value with culturally diversified museums. The model suggests visitors’ integration of operant resources leads co-creation of value (i.e., between visitors/non-visitors and museums) in a joint sphere. Further, the model highlights that external factors may motivate or inhibit individuals (i.e., visitors and non-visitors) to jointly create value. Additionally, the model suggests that visitor’s integration of their operant resources can result in value outcomes for social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels.
Research Approach

This report uses a qualitative research design to explore how the Islamic Museum of Australia (IMA) co-creates value with Muslim and non-Muslim visitors that leads to social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels. The report investigates motivators and inhibitors for visitor resource integration and how value is co-created from the visitor experience. The report used a resource integration framework, which suggests value is co-created through a joint process between the museum and the visitor through the integration of operant resources (social, cultural and physical resources), to explore how value is co-created in this context. Therefore, the report aims to answer the following three research questions:

1. What factors act as motivators or inhibitors of resource integration for visitors and non-visitors of the IMA?
2. How do visitors integrate their operant resources to co-create value with the IMA?
3. How does co-creation of value between visitors and the IMA lead to outcomes for social inclusion?
To explore the research questions in this report four exploratory focus groups were conducted consisting of 32 respondents: (7) Muslim visitors, (8) non-Muslim visitors, (8) Muslim non-visitors and (9) non-Muslim non-visitors of the Islamic Museum of Australia. The composition of each focus group and the research questions each focus group sought to answer is shown in Table 1. Muslim and non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors of the IMA were selected to explore factors that act as motivators or inhibitors of resource integration. In addition, Muslim and non-Muslim visitors were selected to explore how operant resources are integrated to co-create value with the IMA and how this co-creation of value leads to social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels.

Table 1: Focus Group Composition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus Group</th>
<th>Participant Characteristics</th>
<th>Research Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FG1</td>
<td>Muslim visitors of the IMA</td>
<td>RQ1; RQ2; RQ3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FG2</td>
<td>Non-Muslim visitors of the IMA</td>
<td>RQ1; RQ2; RQ3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FG3</td>
<td>Muslim non-visitors of the IMA</td>
<td>RQ2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FG4</td>
<td>Non-Muslim non-visitors of the IMA</td>
<td>RQ2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the honours thesis, an extensive literature review was undertaken. While not included in full in this report, it is available for any interested reader by contacting the thesis author, Ms Emma Winston. In this report, we provide a high level overview of the literature only.
Findings

Motivators and Inhibitors of Resource Integration

The results of this report reveal external factors act as both motivators and inhibitors of resource integration for Muslim and non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors of the IMA. The results suggest motivating factors include: building cultural understanding, sharing knowledge, socialising, education, strengthening religious faith, and a drive for belonging. Further, the results suggest inhibiting factors include: low awareness, cultural understanding and knowledge, accessibility and cultural and religious backgrounds. Additionally, specialised interests were found to act as both a motivator and an inhibitor of resource integration.

Motivators

Building Cultural Understanding

The results suggest the strongest motivating factor for Muslim and non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors to visit the museum was their drive to build cultural understanding of Muslim communities in Australia. Non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors expressed they were motivated to learn and expand their cultural understanding. One non-Muslim visitor explained she was: “intrigued to see how it would be portrayed”, due to: “the comments I’d heard around the difference between the Muslim culture and the Muslim faith”. One non-Muslim non-visitor explained she was motivated to “break down those barriers that there are to the Islamic religion, just to dispel some of the myths and give a bit of a different insight to the religion”. Similarly, another non-Muslim non-visitor expressed an interest in visiting the museum to challenge some of the emotional resistance she has experienced. She explains she would be motivated to visit the museum to “...take away some of the fear I guess we are supposed to have towards Muslims. I don’t know much of their history so it would be interesting.” Other non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors expressed an interest in being more informed about topics concerning Muslims in the news. One non-Muslim non-visitor said:

I'm more interested from a cultural aspect in how the Muslim religion affects people in Australia. Because it's been in the news and in our politics and they've debated several issues, I'd like to know more about it so I was more informed about those issues.

In addition, the results further demonstrated Muslim visitors and non-visitors were motivated to attend the museum to build more knowledge and awareness of their own cultural and
One Muslim non-visitor explained:

_I would like to see what the actual truth is being portrayed in the Museum. So it’s great to be inspired and to have achievements of Muslim people there, but I would like to know what the actual truth is and have it portrayed in whatever light it can be portrayed in, because the truth is the truth._

Additionally, Muslim visitors and non-visitors were motivated to visit for “_educational purposes_”. One Muslim non-visitor explained: “I’d go by myself, so I’d make sure I know what’s there and take note of things. I’ve been inside The Louvre, The British Museum and in Berlin as well, so it would be interesting for me to compare.”

**Specialised Interests**

The results suggest a motivating factor for Muslim and non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors to visit the IMA is if their specialised interests align with the museum. The results suggest both Muslim and non-Muslim non-visitors who have specialised interests in history and the arts were motivated to use the museum as a resource to further their knowledge and experiences. One non-Muslim non-visitor explained: “I like history, so an exhibition that was spoken about in regard to history would appeal to someone like me”. He further expressed his interest in specific art forms and knowledge of Islamic art that would motivate him to visit the museum, saying:

_I’d be interested to see a lot of the art installations. I’ve seen a variety of Islamic art and stuff like that, just some of the characteristics and some of the colours they use in things always appeal to me… like some of the street art I’ve seen from over there, and things I’ve seen on the internet. They’ve always interested me, and so I like that type of thing, so maybe a little bit of that as well, just that culturist, artistic flair. You can sometimes almost taste it._

Additionally, non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors expressed being motivated to visit the museum if it aligned with their interest in culture and religion. One female non-Muslim visitor explained she was motivated to visit the museum from her “_interest in religion_”. Similarly, one non-Muslim non-visitor explained: “I love culture…I like all religions... [The Islamic museum] would be interesting because I don’t know about it.” Another non-Muslim non-visitor
explained the museum would provide an opportunity to pursue learning about areas of interest he hadn’t “got around to”, saying:

*I've actually read quite a lot of books on many things and about six years ago I thought, I must read the Koran. And I never got around to that. But I was interested in reading about the history and the religion. So maybe especially now I'm thinking about learning more about that.*

Similarly, Muslim visitors expressed an interest in using the museum as a resource to further their knowledge of specialised interests. One Muslim non-visitor explained he was interested to see how the museum would present information aligned with his interests, saying:

*I like to read about Islam and the Crusades actually. SBS has a show every Sunday or every Wednesday and it’s very important that history, the history of religion through the ages. You have to learn Islam from that side, yeah. The Crusades are very, very important, powerful...I would like to visit the museum just to see what they say about the Crusades, like what actually happened then and that kind of thing, I’d like to know.*

Another Muslim non-visitor explained she would be motivated to visit the museum to learn more about her interest in reading about Islamic history, she explains: “*I'm really interested in history, but it's not my subject, I just like to read in my spare time. I know that actually Islam came to Australia a very long time ago. [However] there’s not much literature*”.

The results reveal visitors and non-visitors who had experienced living in Islamic countries or had friends who were Muslim were motivated to further the knowledge they obtained from these experiences by visiting the museum. One non-Muslim non-visitor explains how her experience living in a Muslim country and her interest in Islamic topics, has provoked her interest in visiting the museum, saying:

*I lived in a Muslim country for three years so I've got a little bit more knowledge, but I do know that Islam is different from each country to country. So how it's practised in Indonesia is really quite different to how it's practised in the Middle East. So I'm interested [in learning more about] that. I've also done a lot of reading about India and the Muslim influence in India and I'm interested in [learning more about] that as well.*
Similarly, another non-Muslim non-visitor explained how her life experiences of living in a Muslim country and relationships with Muslim friends has motivated her interest in attending the museum. She explains:

*I do have a Muslim friend, not a practising Muslim friend, and I have spent time in Indonesia, a Muslim country. But I think there's a lot of confusion between culture and religion and I think I would be interested in finding out more about the religion, more than the way different cultures interpret that religion. The basics of the religion.*

**Sharing Knowledge**

The results revel a motivating factor for both Muslim and non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors is to use the IMA as a resource to share knowledge with their friends and people in their communities. One Muslim non-visitor explained she was interested in visiting the museum to share knowledge with her Muslim friends, saying: “Maybe after I visit the museum I will share with my friends and try to promote to them that the museum is a nice museum to visit and share some knowledge with them”. Additionally, Muslim visitors and non-visitors explained they would like to share knowledge about their religion and historical past with non-Muslim people in their communities. One Muslim visitor explained, for her, the museum was a “centre of information to spread ideas and knowledge to people around the country”. Similarly, one Muslim non-visitor explained a motivator for her to visit the museum would be to “share knowledge with the Australian people” and the “Australian community” about what “the real Islam is”. She further explains:

*[non-Muslim people] always relate Islam as a really hard religion or with really bad things like ... with the terrorists [and] about the Halal label here in Australia, how the community here are really very strict about this Halal label. I mean it’s not really what they are thinking, they have the wrong perception of that...And maybe with the information after they come to visit the Islamic Museum they will know the definition of and the meaning of some terms or things they know are not true.*

The results further revealed non-Muslim victors were motivated to visit the museum to gain knowledge about Muslim people that they could share with others in their communities. One non-Muslim non-visitor explained she was interested in visiting the museum to obtain
knowledge that could be shared with people that held “misconceptions” of Islam and Muslim people in Australia. She explains:

If you’ve had personal experience of something and you’re in a group with others who haven't and there's misconceptions, you can counteract that if you've been to a museum. So that's the trickle-down effect.

Similarly, one female non-Muslim non-visitor explained visiting the museum would allow her to better understand and connect with Muslim people in her community, saying: “I report with quite a few Muslim women and I'd like to know more about understanding where they've come from and perhaps a bit more about their perspective on life so I can identify a bit more with them.” One male non-Muslim non-visitor was motivated to visit the museum as a “way of supporting and connecting to the Islamic community in Melbourne”. Another male non-Muslim visitor said visiting the museum would raise his “awareness” and provide him with knowledge and an experience that may encourage him to speak to Muslim people in the community, saying: “I might say "I went out to the IMA" ...."It was interesting". And maybe ask a question”.

Further, the results revealed non-Muslim visitors were interested in sharing their experience with their friends and family using social media. One non-Muslim non-visitor explained following the museum on social media would provide opportunities to start conversations with her family and friends about her museum experience, saying: “I might be inclined to follow them on social media if it exists. You would certainly tell people that you went, so there's new conversations which I think has value.” Similarly, another non-Muslim non-visitor said: “On Facebook, I'd join a mailing list. I always do things with things I attend. And I would tell people that I went.”

Socialising

The results suggest a motivating factor for both Muslim and non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors to visit the museum is if it gave them an opportunity to socialise. Muslim visitors explained a motivator to visit the museum would be “to visit with friends”, to “meet more people” and to “socialise”. One Muslim visitor explained: “I’m very passionate with my friends...friends are very good company and sometimes work colleagues as well I should say”.

One Muslim non-visitor explained she had a sister who enjoys visiting museums, and would be more interested to visit the museum if it was a social outing with her sister. She explains:
My sister, she really likes to visit museums. And she said that when she comes to visit Melbourne, she would like to visit all museums in Melbourne. Because every time she goes overseas she really likes to visit museums. When she is in Melbourne we can go together to visit the museum.

Similarly, the results suggest non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors would be more inclined to visit the museum if they were invited to go along with friends. One male non-Muslim visitor said: “I think I would go if I had friends that said, "Look, this weekend we're going to see the Islamic Museum". Similarly, a female non-Muslim non-visitor explained being “invited” to visit with friends would be a motivator, saying: “if friends said they're going to see such and such and out for dinner, if it's linked with something else, I'd go along.”

**Education**

The results suggest a motivating factor for both Muslim and non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors was to visit the museum with their children. Muslim visitors and non-visitors explained the museum was a place they would like to bring their children to educate them about their religion and historical past. One male Muslim non-visitor explained for his family and friends, educating their children about their religion and past was of importance to them, he said: “our children are not following us and they don’t think about Islam”. He further explained: “they don’t think about what will happen tomorrow if something happens”. Similarly, one female Muslim non-visitor expressed an interest in educating her son about his historical past. She explained she would like to bring her 13-year-old son from Indonesia to visit the museum, saying:

> For me family [is a motivator] ...especially my boy... because he has to understand his past. I feel that 50 years, maybe 40 years from now the world will have changed, but he has to understand what his past is, so I would take my boy.

Similarly, non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors were interested in taking their children to the museum to educate them about people with different cultural backgrounds living in Australia. One non-Muslim non-visitor said she was interested in taking her 11-year-old daughter to visit the museum to educate her about “diversity”, saying:
I'm interested in going as a parent, because I want to teach my daughter about diversity and I think the more we know about other people's cultures, the less frightened we are. And I want to teach her that.

She further explained, she would like to encourage her school to visit the museum, saying: “I would like to take her school [to the museum] as well, particularly being kids from the eastern suburbs, to give them a bit more exposure.

The results further reveal non-Muslim visitors and non-visitors were motivated to attend the museum to further their commercial knowledge and education. One non-Muslim visitor who works as a gallery director of an arts and spirituality centre, explained she was motivated to visit the museum to learn about Islamic traditions from a curatorial perspective. She explains:

In both visits I learned more about how Islamic faith and culture are connected...And that was very good because I’m on a learning curve about Islamic traditions. It was very informative.

Similarly, one non-Muslim non-visitor who works as a pastoral care services manager explained she was motivated to visit the museum as it is related to her work. Saying:

I think it’s related to my work. I work in pastoral care, so a part of that is meeting people with where they’re at in their spirituality. So the more I can learn about different religions, I suppose that’s what the interest for me is.

Strengthening Religious Faith

The results suggest a motivating factor for Muslim visitors and non-visitors to visit the museum was to contribute to their religion and strengthen their religious faith. Muslim visitor’s spoke of wanting to be “inspired” by the museum and for the experience to strengthen their “beliefs” and “ambition” with their religion. One Muslim non-visitor explained, for her, visiting the museum would be associated with her “ambition with the religion”. She further explains “I feel that going to the Museum would add up the knowledge on culture and past historically of the religion, so I think it’s something that I’ll be doing soon.” Another Muslim non-visitor explained she wanted to visit the museum to “be a really good Muslim by visiting your own.” She further explained visiting the museum would provide her with an avenue to ask questions about her “beliefs.” Another Muslim visitor explained she was motivated to visit the museum by her expectation to be “inspired”, saying:
I would feel very interested to visit the museum to look again about my past, about the religious part of me, what I’m practising now...So I hope and I feel that by visiting the Museum, I would be inspired by their success and contribute in the same way to the religion and to the people and nation.

Similarly, one Muslim visitor explained:

*People visit the museum only once and it’s not twice or three times. I’m coming here once and I want to get the best out of it. To get all the positive things and forget about the negative things that exist. I want to step into this place, I want to know that they the Muslims follow the good things not the bad things.*

**Drive for Belonging**

The results reveal a motivating factor for Muslim visitors and non-visitors to visit the museum was a drive to feel a sense of belonging in Australia. One Muslim visitor explained “*maybe after I know all the information I would feel more comfortable here and belong more.*” Another Muslim non-visitor expressed a concern about the Australian public perception of Muslims, saying: “*these people here are not really welcome with the Islam people*”. However, she explains a motivator to attend the museum would be its ability to change her perception of the Australian public’s acceptance of Muslims. She explains:

*Maybe what I can get from the existence of the Islamic Museum in Melbourne is that I can see how the Australian government and Australian community are they are welcoming of other cultures.*

Further, the results suggest Muslim non-visitors view the museum as a place where they can be “*inspired*” by the contributions of Australian Muslims and enhance their sense of belonging. One Muslim non-visitor said:

*[Visiting the museum would be] inspiring, I would be inspired by successes, achievements made by Australian Muslims, wherever they come from, that would be inspiring to see, “Wow, like they’re not all just suicide bombers”* ... *They do other things too.*
Inhibitors

Low Awareness

The results reveal the strongest inhibiting factor for Muslim and non-Muslim non-visitors to visit the IMA was low awareness of the museum. While non-visitors expressed an interest in visiting the museum their low awareness was the most prominent inhibitor for attendance. One Muslim non-visitor who frequently visits other museums explained: “I’ve never really heard about this Museum. For somebody who likes museums, this is the first time that I’ve heard of the Museum”. Another Muslim non-visitor explained: “I’ve been here in Australia for 24 years and in truth, honestly speaking, I didn’t know that there is an Islamic Museum at all.” Similarly, one non-Muslim non-visitor explained she was not aware of the museum, saying: “I'd never heard of it ... I don't get the impression that it's well known at this stage”. One non-Muslim non-visitor explained she wouldn’t expect to hear about it considering she doesn’t live in an area that has large Muslim communities. She explains: “I hadn't heard of it either, but then I don’t expect to living in the eastern suburbs in our little bubble to ourselves of white Australian culture I suppose.” Additionally, non-Muslim visitors had limited awareness of the historical contributions or artistic heritage of Muslims in Australia. One male non-Muslim non-visitor explains:

I didn't realise that there was a significant heritage or historical component to Muslims in Australia. I'm not sure how long they've been here for but I always imagined that they've only come in the last 50 years or something. But I could be wrong.

The results further demonstrate an inhibiting factor for both Muslim and non-Muslim non-visitors visiting the museum was not hearing about the museum through their communication networks. Muslim visitors expressed an inhibiting factor was not hearing about the museum through “flyers”, “email”, “Facebook” and through their university networks in “information sessions” and through their “Islamic society”. Non-Muslim visitors expressed an inhibiting factor was not hearing about the museum through “radio”, “TV”, “weekend newspaper”, or “culture and arts lift outs”.

Limited Cultural Understanding and Knowledge

The results suggest an inhibiting factor for non-Muslim non-visitors to visiting the museum was limited cultural understanding of Islam and Muslim communities in Australia. Non-Muslim non-visitors expressed an inhibitor for attendance was a concern towards the museum
being “serious”, “depressing” or a “strong political statement”. Non-Muslim non-visitors integrated their knowledge of Islam or Muslims from the media to their decision, which made them apprehensive to visit the museum. One non-Muslim non-visitor expressed a concern towards the representation of women in the museum, saying:

*Personally, I don’t want to turn up and see women portrayed negatively. I’d like to see women portrayed in a positive light when I go there. So I know this sounds awful, but to me it seems very male dominated, the Muslim culture. So I would be more likely to go if I thought women were well represented.*

Further, the results revealed that a lack of “knowledge” or “awareness” about Islamic history or culture might inhibit visitors from having an interest in visiting the museum. One non-Muslim non-visitor expressed an inhibitor for visiting the museum was “not knowing what to expect when you get there”. Another non-Muslim non-visitor explained: *I have no knowledge because I live in the east and there’s very few [Muslims] this way. I mean if I lived in the north it’d be different. I don’t have any friends who are Muslim.* Similarly, another non-Muslim non-visitor, explained an inhibitor for her would be a limited “connection” with Islamic history, saying:

*...if we had that background with the Islamic history, I'm sure there'd be equally fascinating stories, we just don’t know what they are. They're not part of our education. So that's why you don’t have that connection.*

In addition, one non-Muslim non-visitor expressed limited social connections and understanding of the Australian Muslim community that made her less interested in an Islamic Museum. She explains, she would be more interested in visiting the Jewish Museum, saying:

*I know about the Jewish community, I guess because it seems to me that there are a lot more Jewish people in the community and I'm aware of it...I have friends who are Jewish. I have a lot more friends who are Jewish than Muslim friends. Because they've been here for a lot longer. So I have a better understanding, whereas I don’t have an understanding of the Muslim community in Australia.*
Limited Accessibility

The results reveal an inhibiting factor for Muslim and non-Muslim non-visitors to visit the IMA is the limited accessibility of the museum. Both Muslim and non-Muslim non-visitors expressed a concern about the location and cost of the museum. One Muslim visitor who is currently a student explained “I don’t know whether we have to pay or not for entry to the museum. If we have to pay a high price this would stop me going because I’m a student”. Similarly, one non-Muslim non-visitor who only works part time explained “cost for someone like me would obviously definitely affect things”. Additionally, one Muslim visitor explained the location would inhibit her from attending, saying: “a problem is it’s quite far away”. Similarly, one female non-Muslim non-visitor explained the museum not being in the city would inhibit her from visiting the museum with friends, saying:

Location is a barrier...a lot of the other museums would be in the city or quite central. You plan to go out for dinner, see the museum first. And I know you can do that at Sydney Road and it would be very delicious, but it’s probably the unknown. You'd know the city locations better.

She further explained an inhibiting factor for inviting her friends for a night out to visit the museum would be the “different cultures” that exist in this area. She explains:

I mean I've been out a lot there and it is completely different. If you're from this side of town, it is very different. So for people who are not used to different cultures, that can be overwhelming just to even see it. So I think that might be a barrier as well.

Specialised Interests

The results demonstrate an inhibiting factor for non-Muslim non-visitors to visit the museum is a lack of specialised interests that align with the museum. One non-Muslim non-visitor explained he would be more interested in visiting the Jewish Museum, saying:

I think I'd be more interested in going to the Jewish museum because I have interest in the historical component of the holocaust, just through the trauma. That branches off into another area I'm interested in about psychology, so just thinking about it, that interested me more.

Further, the results show for non-Muslim visitors who have a specialised interest in visiting museums they are hesitant to travel to visit the museum if it is not offering them a different
museum experience. One non-Muslim non-visitor explains she is looking for “something totally different...to other museums or galleries”. She further explains:

Other museums or galleries I go to, they’re fine but I may as well just go to them if they’re closer. I want the experience to be really different.... I want it to be three dimensional, I want there to be things that you can touch, I want things that you can hear, I want there to be different elements to it.

Additionally, the results suggest an inhibiting factor for non-Muslim visitors is visiting a museum in Melbourne and not as a part of a holiday or travelling. One non-Muslim non-visitor explained:

I feel like I visit museums when I travel overseas more than I would at home. I couldn’t tell you the last time I’ve been to the museum in Melbourne. When I have been it’s probably more educational than just to pop in to the museum. But when I’m overseas I wouldn’t hesitate to go to a museum.

Cultural and Religious Background
The results suggest an inhibiting factor for Muslim non-visitors visiting the museum is a limited connection to the history being presented in the museum. One Muslim non-visitor with an Indonesian background, expressed her cultural background would act as an inhibitor for her to attend the museum saying: “I’m a Catholic, now practising Muslim. My knowledge of Islam is very limited, so what is preventing me from going to the Museum is because I have not enough knowledge about the religion.” She further explains:

When you go to museum you go to it because there’s something in the museum that draws you, and it’s what the museum represents for you.... So that is the kind of belonging that I would like, that I feel. If I will go to museum because you are part of the particular history of that museum. So maybe if I go to the Islamic Museum of Australia I would not feel really, really belonging because I have not yet really practised the religion. So there’s an intrinsic motivator to go to museums, because the soul of the museum is your soul.

The results further demonstrate an inhibitor for attendance for Muslim non-visitors may be their limited “sense of belonging” in Australia. One Muslim non-visitor explained “a barrier
may be that being a Muslim is not really inviting.” She expressed a concern with participating in activities that may associate her with being a Muslim. She explains:

A sense of belonging, that’s really, really important, but I think the barrier may be that being Muslim is not really inviting, at this stage of how the media is portraying Islam, what’s happening in Syria, Saudi Arabia, like what’s happening in Kuwait... a student at [my uni] who wears the full burka wears it every single day... she wears it very fluidly and very gracefully, but she catches the bus every day and I think about her all the time, like, is she going to be okay wearing the burka the way she does? She doesn’t wear the veil, but she wears the full burka...I think she’s carried herself that way and she’s fine, but who knows? Like if someone wants to do something, wouldn’t she be a good target right now?

The results further suggest for Muslim non-visitors their experience of religion and cultural influences of Islam can act as an inhibitor for attendance. One female Muslim visitor explained an inhibiting factor would be her concern about certain practices of Islam. She explains:

I have trouble identifying myself as a Muslim in terms of the laws that sort of surround it in terms of whether I should be wearing a hijab, or whether I should be, you know, a lot of things that I should and shouldn’t be doing. I’m not sure if I agree with this...there’s a grey matter there.

Similarly, one Muslim non-visitor from Iran explained how her cultural background and her concern about cultural interpretations Islam would act as an inhibiting factor for her to visit the museum, saying:

Unfortunately, I’m not interested in going. It’s because of my past, because Islam was enforced on my country by people, they attacked Iran and in this way Islam came to Iran. For many years we have all these things, people they told us in my country, and the things that we don’t believe, but they made us believe it. Maybe this is the reason...Because if they want to tell me that Islam is a perfect religion, it’s not acceptable for me as a Muslim.
Co-creating Value

The results of this report reveal operant resources, including social, cultural and physical resources, are integrated by Muslim and non-Muslim visitors to co-create value with the IMA. The integration of social resources is evident in both Muslim and non-Muslim visitors using the IMA as a resource to share knowledge with friends, family and their children. The integration of physical resources is apparent through Muslim visitors using their emotion to strengthen their religious faith and Muslim and non-Muslim visitors using their energy to pursue continued learning. Further, the results suggest visitor integration of cultural resources can act as a facilitator and a barrier to co-creating value with the IMA. The integration of cultural resources is evident in Muslim visitors drawing on their cultural background and religious knowledge to build and enhance their existing knowledge. Similarly, non-Muslim visitors integrated their own religious knowledge to connect with the teachings of Islam and use their work roles to build commercial knowledge and skills. However, the results reveal the cultural background and religious knowledge of Muslim visitors also act as a barrier for visitors to co-create value with the IMA.

Social Resources

Sharing Knowledge

The results show both Muslim and non-Muslim visitors use their personal relationships, including family, friends and their children to co-create value with the IMA. Muslim visitors who visited the museum with friends explained they enjoyed “the gathering” and “sharing knowledge and understanding with friends”. One non-Muslim visitor explained “if had a friend who I thought might like the gallery, I think I’d take them there”. One Muslim visitor explained she would like to bring her family from Malaysia to visit the museum, explaining this would allow them to be better informed about the initiatives of Australian Muslims. She explains:

*I would love to bring my family here to this museum. The thing is it is very far from my family but I would love to bring them here so that they would understand that in Australia there is an attempt by the Muslim community here to show to the Australian public that the religion has many good things.*

Another Muslim visitor explained she would like to bring her family from Malaysia to visit the museum so they could compare and share information with the museum about the Islamic Museum in their country, saying:
I would bring my family too. Because this museum is not totally different, we have an Islamic Museum in Malaysia. So maybe my parents would get some knowledge here and compare with Malaysian information, or give some suggestions.

Further, Muslim and non-Muslim visitors who were parents viewed the museum as a place to share knowledge with their children and educate themselves as parents. One female Muslim visitor explained how the museum would help her son “appreciate” his religion, saying: “If I were to bring my son, who is only 13 to visit this museum, he would probably appreciate his religion. ... for young children this is a good way to tell them”. Similarly, one female non-Muslim visitor explained visiting the museum had made her more informed as a parent, saying: “I can talk to my children in a more informed way. So there’s true value in what museums like that do”. She further explained she would like to bring her family to the museum, saying:

My role as parent has been influenced where I would sometime soon take the children and have told my husband he should go to. Whether we all go together I don’t know. So it’s influenced me enough that I would seek it out to show them.

Cultural Resources
Cultural Background and Religious Knowledge
The results reveal Muslim visitors’ cultural background and religious knowledge can be both a facilitator and barrier to co-created value. The cultural background and religious knowledge of Muslim visitors influence the way they engage with information and objects presented in the museum. One Muslim visitor with an Iranian background explained the information presented in the museum did not reflect her experience or knowledge of Islam, saying:

Honestly, I don’t like [the museum]. This museum is good for the people that are very new to Islam but not for the people who already know what Islam is or who are from countries like mine...the problem is the emergence of Islam in different countries has different ways... the emergence of Islam in Malaysia is completely different from the emergence of Islam in Iran. In Malaysia Islam emerged very peacefully, but in my country Islam was
attacking with fights, with war, with burning the history of our country, burning our library.

She expressed a concern about the accuracy of the information and choice of content presented in the museum, saying: “I think there are some misunderstandings and miss interpretations of knowledge at the museum”. For her, the most important aspects of Islam were not shown in the museum and created a barrier for her to connect to the information or displays. She explains:

...the most important thing in Islam is about the Prophet Mohammad, he is illiterate. Then the gods sent all these messages to him and he started reading and writing. In Islam they say it is the most important miracle that happened. A person starting writing and reading without any knowledge! [The museum] didn’t mention anything like this. These are the positive things. The most important things...If they want to play with the emotions of people, they have to tell these stories. These are the most important stories. Unfortunately, I got no value.

Similarly, one Muslim visitor from Kazakhstan explains that the information displayed in the museum did not meet her expectations, saying: “I expected a little bit more. For me it was a little bit like a mass. The name “Islamic Museum” gives me a signal that it should be about particular information. In reality it is a little bit different.” In addition, one male Muslim visitor expresses that the background music being played in the museum may act as a barrier for some Muslim visitors. He explained:

As a Muslim community, Muslims would be thinking: oh! this establishment is playing music, so it's not a good thing to do. So just for example they'd be saying this is not really Islamic per se. Islamic means no music, no photographs of women and stuff like that.

He further explains, while this was not a barrier for himself, he expressed a concern for people who follow a “strict form of Islam”, saying: “they might not find it a very positive thing.”

In contrast, the majority of Muslim visitors from an Asian or South Asian background report being “enlightened” and “impressed” with the information and objects being presented. They explain how visiting the museum enhanced their existing knowledge. One male Muslim visitor from Bangladesh said: “I was informed of many things which I really didn't see or know before.” Another female Muslim visitor from Malaysia said the displays were “nicely put
“together” and allowed her to see “an interpretation of what happened in the past that was rethought and looked at differently.” Another female Muslim visitor from Malaysia spoke of using knowledge she obtained from school, saying: “back home we attend the Islamic School, so most of the knowledge in the museum, we try to refresh [our knowledge]...about Islamic history and about the Prophet Mohammed.” One female Muslim visitor with a Malaysian background said she felt the museum was a “good resource”, saying: “I feel very impressed and appreciate what they are trying to do because Australia is not an Islamic country. What they have done is great and it wasn’t easy to get Islamic information. It is a good resource”. Another Muslim visitor with an Indonesian background explained how obtaining new knowledge made her feel “enlightened”, saying:

I felt enlightened because for me I never really knew about the contribution of Islam and the development of the world in medicine, arts and engineering. Our understanding of these things was coming from the West and this is something quite different. Maybe it’s my lack of knowledge of these things, but maybe for many of us we never really knew. For example, I didn’t know that chess comes from Persia. I’m enlightened, it’s new knowledge.

Connecting Religious Knowledge

The results demonstrate non-Muslim visitors integrate their cultural resources by using their specialised religious knowledge of Christianity. Non-Muslim visitors with a religious background explain how they use their knowledge of Christianity to connect with the information being presented on Islam. One non-Muslim visitor explain that she integrated her Christian faith to interpret displays in the museum saying: “When I was reading the 99 different ways of connecting with Allah, I realised it was similar to scriptures in the Christian Bible”. She further explained: “I could link that in with my faith and see where it connected”. Another non-Muslim visitor who identifies as Christian said: “I’m exploring a culture that, at least in terms of faith, has huge connections with my own. There’s a lot of common ground”. She further explains her visitor experience produced a “reinforcement of that connectedness.” She then spoke of reflecting on her pervious experiences teaching religious instruction while visiting the museum, saying:

I have taught Christian religious instruction and I’ve always made a point of being able to explain the common ground to children of Christian
background; to explain to them, actually we’re all worshiping to the same God and that a lot of the stories are common.

Building Commercial Knowledge and Skills

The results demonstrate non-Muslim visitors use their professional work knowledge and skills to co-create value from their visitor experience. One male non-Muslim visitor explained he had some knowledge of Islam through travelling to Indonesia and Malaysia as a travel agent. He expressed that his visit to the museum was for both “pleasure and work”. Similarly, one female non-Muslim visitor who works as a pastoral care manager, explains her visit to the museum provided her with knowledge and skills that she could use in her work. She explained: “I found it interesting for my work... because it’s that spiritual understanding. So the emotion that might come up, if I was to be a pastoral carer to someone who had an Islamic faith.” Similarly, another female non-Muslim visitor who works as a gallery director of an arts and spirituality centre, said her visit to the museum contributes to knowledge that could be used to better interact with others of diverse backgrounds in her line of work. She explains:

I learned more about how Islamic faith and culture are connected, it’s how they’re expressed. And that was very good because I’m on a learning curve about Islamic traditions.... If I’m a better manager- educator here, I’m going to have better dialogue with diverse community members. So if a Muslim walked in the door now, I’d have a better chance at a conversation with them. So there’s a knock-on effect, of course, with that education process.

Physical Resources

Strengthening Religious Faith

The results demonstrate both Muslim and non-Muslim visitors integrate their physical resources, such as emotion and energy, to create experiences that are meaningful and enhance their life projects or roles. Muslim visitors express how their visitor experience strengthens their religious faith. One Muslim visitor explains that visiting the museum was a “meaningful experience”, saying:

For the first time I felt actually drawn to the religion, I don’t feel the same way if I go to a mosque, this is a place for me that evokes a lot of feelings.
It’s a meaningful experience for me. I’m going to tell my family about it. It’s a meaningful thing, being present in an area or place like this.

Similarly, Muslim visitors express that their visitor experience provided a new way of connecting to their religion. One Muslim visitor explains her experience to be a “real connection”, saying: “I’ve never had that connection [to my religion] because I’ve never really been in a place like this. It’s an entirely new connection for me, the meaning for me.” Similarly, another Muslim visitor said: “I really liked the guided tour because it explained every section of the museum. I feel like I connected back to the aspects of the religion and how it has been practiced in a wider context, more than what I normally experience.” Another Muslim visitor explained her visitor experience had “important…personal value”. She explains:

The statue of two people fighting that represents jihad, fighting yourself. I experience this struggle that is something that is real and confirmed by the religion, that we have our own struggles and we need patience. That message was important for me.

The results also indicate that Muslim visitors integrate both energy and emotion to co-create value from their visitor experience. One Muslim visitor explains how her visitor experience makes her reflect on her commitment to her religion. She explains: “I felt lost in my own religion. When I saw the big screening of the pilgrimage, I almost choked!” She continued: “I thought I’m not doing much to learn about my religion. I was choking with that one. That is the feeling, personal, personal”. For Muslim visitors the emotional connection they feel towards their religion motivates them to pursue strengthening their religious faith. Similarly, another Muslim visitor explains:

It reminded me about Hajj, Quran, about the Prophet Mohammed. I thought I have to do more in my religion. To learn more. …there are a lot of things we have to report and try to understand more about our religion.

Continued Learning and Experiences

The results suggest both Muslim and non-Muslim visitors used energy to pursue continued learning and experiences obtained from their visit to the IMA. One Muslim visitor expresses a concern about the accuracy of the information presented in the museum, she expresses interest in researching the topic more to determine its truth, saying: “there is some information that I have to research again, to see if it is true”. Another Muslim visitor explains after visiting the
museum she is “motivated to ask some questions”. Similarly, another non-Muslim visitor, expresses an interest to continue to build on what she has learnt in the museum. She explains how her visitor experience motivates her to consider further education, saying:

   *I did tell myself I really should get out that Quran I bought and read it. And it also reminded me that at some stage in my life I really do need to undertake some formal report in the religious area because I really do find it very, very interesting. So it kind of reinforced that to me, which may or may not result in something happening.*

In addition, she explains a barrier to creating value is not having enough time to read all of the information provided. However, as a result, she expresses interest in purchasing books and a willingness to re-visit the museum to continue her learning. She explains:

   *I was the one standing there reading all of the stuff on the walls and I didn’t have time to finish reading this and this began to irritate me. And, look, I walked into the bookshop and there were a number of books I would have loved to have picked up and taken home. And if I go again that will probably happen.*

Additionally, Muslim and non-Muslim visitors express that they are inspired peruse travel to further their experience. One non-Muslim visitor explains that visiting the museum reminds him of a blue mosque he visited when he was in Turkey. He explains he is inspired to relive this experience, saying: “*I wouldn’t mind going back to Turkey. It’s not the religion but the blue Mosque*”. Similarly, a Muslim visitor who brought his nine-year-old daughter to the museum explains how their visitor experience inspires his daughter to learn more about Islamic history and religion and to visit new places. He explains:

   *One thing my daughter actually loved very much was different mosques in different parts of the world. She was asking me “Dad when are you going to take me to this mosque in Dubai or this mosque in India?”*
Co-creating Value for Social Inclusion

The results of this report reveal co-creation of value between Muslim and non-Muslim visitors of the IMA can lead to social inclusion at three levels: individual, community and societal. Additionally, the results show a relationship between the three identified levels of social inclusion and the three categories of operant resources. Social inclusion at the individual level was achieved for Muslim visitors through their integration of emotion (physical resource) by strengthening their identity as Muslims and producing feelings of pride and belonging. Social inclusion at the community level was achieved for Muslim and non-Muslim visitors through their integration of their personal and commercial relationships (social resources) to create community and commercial connections. Social inclusion at the societal level was achieved for non-Muslim visitors through their integration of their specialised knowledge, skills and interests (cultural resources) to build cultural understanding and tolerance.

Individual Value

The results indicate social inclusion can be facilitated at the individual level through Muslim visitors’ integration of physical resources. Muslim visitors in this report used their emotion (physical resource) to co-create value with the IMA to strengthen their identity and create feelings of pride and belonging.

Strengthening Identity

The results suggest Muslim visitors were able to strengthen their identity as Muslims by integrating emotion into their visitor experience at the IMA. They explained their visitor experience made them feel “humble”, “impressed” and a sense of “appreciation”. One Muslim visitor explained learning about Muslim contributions in history made her feel “humble”, saying:

> It’s like a paradox because the image of identity is very rich and glorious. I feel that the most important thing is how I feel humble. This is not meant to be taken for granted. This is part of our contributions through a period of time through generations. A very humble beginning with the cameleers and the camels that came through Australia. It shows the contribution of our people. It’s really beautiful to see that point of time... Definitely not to be taken for granted so I feel very humble to see all of this in the museum.

Another Muslim visitor explained how learning about the historical contributions of Muslims evoked “a very positive feeling” for him. He explains his experience, saying:
I vaguely knew that Muslims came to Australia long back...but walking in their footsteps and seeing those sort of things I never saw this from my experience. So that was very good information from my end. Such an old mosque is there, it was amazing for me to see....my history and my religion are trying to be showcased here. So it was a very positive feeling I was getting from there.

Pride and Belonging

The results further suggest Muslim visitors’ co-created individual value with the IMA by integrating emotion to connect and relate to the history of Islam and the contributions of Australian Muslims. Muslim visitors explained their visitor experience evoked feelings of “pride”, “belonging” and “happiness”. One female Muslim visitor explained visiting the museum produced feelings of “pride”, saying: “I feel proud as a Muslim. Proud of the Australian Muslim initiative to promote this”. In response to this comment another female Muslim visitor expressed “Yes. I feel so happy today”. Another female Muslim visitor explained having an Islamic Museum in Australia gave her “a feeling of belonging in this country”. She further explains:

It’s the aspect of harmony. Muslim communities supporting other religions, communities, so each community and religion can have their own worshiping places. To learn that you belong to this country in a sense.

The findings further suggest visiting the IMA allowed Muslim visitors to learn about the current contributions of Australian Muslims who hold high profile positions, which enhanced their sense of belonging in Australia. Muslim visitors expressed feeling “impressed” by the representation of high profile Australian Muslims. One Muslim visitor explained “I’m impressed that so many Muslims take high positions in Australia”. Another female Muslim visitor explained she was “surprised” by success of some Australian Muslims. Similarly, a male Muslim visitor explained “I found it was a very good thing how they were individually showcasing people.” He further explained he enjoyed learning more about one particular high profile Australian Muslim, whose articles he reads in the newspaper. He explains:

...he's famous for his critical writing and stuff like that. So when I saw they were showing him there and especially how they showed his family's photo. The combination of his family members was a very interesting thing which I
didn't know as well before. So that was a very good aspect of showcasing individual sectors of Muslim, I thought that was a very good thing.

**Community Value**

The results indicate that social inclusion can be facilitated at the community level through Muslim and non-Muslim visitors’ integration of social resources. Muslim and non-Muslim visitors in this report use their personal and commercial relationships (social resources) to co-create value with the IMA to establish connections with people of different ethnicities to their own in their communities.

**Community Connections**

The results reveal after visiting the museum non-Muslim visitors increased their willingness to connect to ethnic minority groups in their communities. One non-Muslim visitor explained:

> The Muslim community is now a part of our community, and you can't rely on the other people’s experience, you need to experience this yourself and I think the museum will make a contribution to community solidarity.

Other Non-Muslim visitors expressed a willingness to welcome and approach Muslim people in their community. One female non-Muslim visitor explained while she still held reservations towards Muslim men, she had more cultural understanding of Muslim women after visiting the museum, saying:

> It’s made me more open to relating to the women in particular. I am still a bit scared of the men. You don’t know how pushy you should be. It’s not understanding the mores, the behaviours and how they conduct themselves. Yes. I’ve been very conscious of not turning away when I see Muslim women now. I laugh and talk and chat. I have a different appreciation of where they are coming from.

One male non-Muslim visitor explained visiting the museum allowed him to interact with Australian Muslims, which differed from the messages in the media or stories he had heard in his church community, saying:

> I thought it was very nice the way they welcomed us. They were all female, no males, I don't know whether that makes a difference, but yes, they were
extremely friendly, smiling, happy people. And that's how I'd like to think of all of them.

He further explained visiting the museum allowed him to make “a contact” with the Muslim community, which he explains “could lead to others”. Another non-Muslim visitor expressed an interest in sharing his experience with people in his church community, saying:

*It may come up in discussion with people from my church. Certainly on that topic of Islamic faith and all that sort of stuff, it would be quite good to say ‘If you want quite a broader understanding’...go have a look at this place.*

The results further indicate the museum provided opportunities for Muslim visitors to make connections with non-Muslims in their communities. Muslim visitors explained the museum was a good resource for them to share information with their non-Muslim friends. One Muslim visitor explained:

*I have non-Muslim friends. Some of them ask questions about Islam. White people, some of them, are sort of racist. Sometimes it is hard to explain to them. The Islamic Museum is a good initiative and a good place to bring my friends to give them some insight about Islam.*

Another Muslim visitor explained she felt the museum would have a “big effect on people”, and would be a place she would bring non-Muslim friends to share knowledge, saying:

*Maybe if I have an Australian friend who wants to know about Islam. If they talk about this, yes I can bring them here and say if you want to know about Islam this is the place for you to get to know Islam because there are pictures, they are friendly.*

**Commercial Connections**

The results further demonstrate that non-Muslim visitors are driven to make connections with people in their commercial networks. One female non-Muslim visitor who works as a pastoral care manager explained she was driven to explore the way others viewed Muslims and their faith with her colleagues. She explains:

*After visiting the museum, I actually had a discussion with someone at work who I thought was so Catholic and was going to be so narrow-minded. I*
asked her “Imagine if you were born in a Muslim country and you followed Islam” and she said “Well God will let them into heaven, that's their thing, their way to God” and I was just like “What?” I was blown away by what I heard.

Another male non-Muslim visitor explained visiting the museum made him more willing to make connections with Muslims in his workplace. He explains “I work with people who are from Iran, I've had a couple of conversations around the Muslim faith, so it was quite interesting to go there to see more detail, and to see their perspective.” He further explained after visiting the museum he would have an opportunity to make a connection with them, saying “I'll probably have a discussion with them, around going to the museum, which would be interesting.”

**Societal Value**

The results indicate social inclusion can be facilitated at the societal level through Muslim visitors’ integration of cultural resources. Muslim and non-Muslim visitors in this report use their specialised knowledge, skills and interests (cultural resource) to co-create value with the IMA to build cultural understanding, respect and tolerance of Australian Muslims.

**Building Cultural Understanding**

The results suggest a barrier for social inclusion of Muslims living in Australia is the representations of Islam and Muslims in the media. Both Muslim visitors and non-visitors express a concern towards the negative messages portrayed in the media. One Muslim visitor explains: “Nowadays everybody listens to the radio and listen to the news. Many people are hearing about the bad things Muslims are doing.” Another Muslim non-visitor explained “I think people equate Islam with fundamentalism. And you know, the majority of Muslim people aren't like that.” Muslim visitors and non-visitors explained how these negative stereotypes impact their lives in Australia. One Muslim visitor expressed: “As a Muslim it is sometimes a challenge to be in this country. Sometimes people think badly about Islam, some of them are racist.” Another Muslim visitor explained the challenges she faces as a Muslim living in Australia, saying:

I feel like I have been pushed or placed in a situation where you have to defend yourself from the impression people put on you. I feel I need to defend myself. This is not right. The world should never behave or put anyone in a
The results of this report revealed the concerns Muslim visitors and non-visitors expressed around the negative representations of Muslims in the media were evident in the stereotypes non-Muslim visitors held themselves or had observed in their communities. Some non-Muslim visitors expressed while they personally didn’t hold prejudices against Muslims, they had observed negative views held in society, saying: “half the battle at the moment would be lack of respect for Muslim people because of lack of understanding.” However, other non-Muslim visitors expressed they visited the museum with hesitation, not knowing what to expect. One male non-Muslim visitor explained: “I didn't know what to expect and I imagined it being much more a heavier, like a depressive sort of thing. Oppressive is the word, yeah, oppressive.” Similarly, a female non-Muslim visitor said: “I had no idea what to expect, and I think my own prejudices, from what you see in the media was I had that in my mind and I’m thinking “How’s this going to work?”. She further explained, the perception of Muslims in the media made her “quite fearful”, saying: “I’ve always been quite fearful, I know that's terrible, but I have always been quite fearful of especially the guys with the beards.”

Similarly, one male non-Muslim visitor explained how his lack of direct experience with Muslims has resulted in his views being based on messages in the media, saying:

I generally have had a negative attitude towards Islam. Why is that? Well I haven't had any direct experience, so I can only go on what's reported in the press and verbally, and I must say it tends to be negative. I must say that there are a lot of, just as there are in our communities, some secular people, there are religious people, there are fanatics, there are non-fanatics, and I see what's going on in the Middle East, North Africa, convert at the sword or we'll chop your head off. I always worry about that sort of attitude, in a religious sense.

However, the results suggest that non-Muslim visitors integrated their cultural resources, such as knowledge of Islam and Muslim culture obtained from the media, to challenge some of the stereotypes they held and increase their cultural understanding. One non-Muslim woman, who visited the museum holding negative stereotypes of Muslims explained visiting the museum “very quickly broke down that extreme side...I just think I understand a little bit more.” Another
male non-Muslim visitor, who held similar views and negative stereotypes of Muslims, explained how visiting the museum increased his cultural understanding, saying:

\[
\text{I went in there with probably massive prejudice, because that's what I knew.}
\]
\[
\text{So when you go there and you actually start breaking down "So this is why they wear this", "This is why they wear the scarves", to actually get an understanding of not being "You have to" but rather "it's a desire to follow.}
\]

Another non-Muslim visitor explained visiting the museum had an “amazing impact” on her, saying:

\[
\text{My understanding of Islamic faith increased within the first hour of being there. And that can only increase tolerance and understanding. It was just a huge help. By understanding a bit more about the traditions of Islam, it just had an amazing impact ... it was just more of a sense of peace about Islamic people that you see in the community.}
\]

Further, the results suggest that Muslim visitors felt the museum would be successful in educating non-Muslims about their religion. One Muslim visitor expressed how she felt the museum was a good avenue for educating non-Muslim people about her religion. She explains “it is the experiences or engagements that open up others to put things into perspective. People are probably ignorant so the museum is an opportunity to educate people.” She further explains how the museum reflected her own beliefs and the principles she follows as a Muslim, saying:

\[
\text{[The museum] is a very good way to at least open up the avenue for people to engage with the fundamental elements of Islam, what do we believe, what do we practice, certain aspects of unity, solidarity, respect, and tolerance. These are the strong messages that I feel were coming out of the museum.}
\]

She continues to explain how seeing positive and real reflections of her identity as a Muslim was a meaningful experience. She explains: “I felt today the overall experience was a meaningful one. It was like I took myself away for a moment from the messages in the media.”

\textbf{Connecting Specialised Interests}

The results further suggest non-Muslim visitors were able to integrate their specialised skills and interests, to better relate to Australian Muslims. One male non-Muslim visitor explained
how his interest in outback Australia, made him feel more connected to Muslim Australians, saying:

_I love outback Australia, and when you saw the cameleers there, and you realised “Hang on, there has been Muslim heritage in Australia alongside our own” that for me almost set the tone, it almost broke everything down to go “Hang on, all those prejudices they you've got, for me, just went away” because I thought “Okay, it's been existing in Australia for a long, long time._

Another non-Muslim visitor connected to the information and displays in the museum with her interest in religions and her connection with God. She explained by making this connection it helped her to dispel some of the negative stories she reads about Muslims in the newspapers, saying:

_I walked around and I read all of the displays and I was struck - I realised that I was reading the names of terrorists that I had heard about in newspapers as being arrested or involved in things and also other Muslim people I knew or people with Arabic names that I knew - but it just struck me that these are all beautiful names and connected with God and yet we can have a very different impression of them because of what’s going on in the world at the moment. So it was actually nice to go around and think “well that's what that word really means” …” that’s the real origin of that word”. And to take away that sort of impression rather than what we read in the newspaper._

She further explained, by making this connection and drawing on her own cultural resources she was able to humanise Muslim people that she knew or may read about. She explained:

_When I see those names now I will hopefully try to remember that somebody gave them that name with all kinds of hopes for them living up to it. It's like everybody really gives a name to a child and that those names are aspirational._
### Table 2: Social Inclusion Outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Operant Resources</th>
<th>Themes &amp; Operant Resources</th>
<th>Representative Quotes</th>
<th>Quote Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Individual</strong></td>
<td>Pride &amp; Belonging (Physical Resources)</td>
<td>I feel proud as a Muslim. Proud of the Australian Muslim initiative to promote this (Female, Malaysian, Muslim Visitor)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strengthening Identity (Physical Resources)</td>
<td>It’s like a paradox because the image of identity is very rich and glorious. I feel that the most important thing is how I feel humble. (Female, Indonesia, Muslim Visitor)</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community</strong></td>
<td>Community Connections (Social Resources)</td>
<td>It’s made me more open to relating to the women in particular. I am still a bit scared of the men. You don’t know how pushy you should be. It’s not understanding the mores, the behaviours and how they conduct themselves. Yes. I’ve been very conscious of not turning away when I see Muslim women now. I laugh and talk and chat. I have a different appreciation of where they are coming from. (Female, Non-Muslim Visitor)</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commercial Connections (Social Resources)</td>
<td>I work with people who are from Iran, I've had a couple of conversations around the Muslim faith, so it was quite interesting to go there to see more detail, and to see their perspective…. I’ll probably have a discussion with them, around going to the museum, which would be interesting (Male, Non-Muslim Visitor)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Societal</strong></td>
<td>Building Cultural Understanding (Cultural Resources)</td>
<td>My understanding of Islamic faith increased within the first hour of being there. And that can only increase tolerance and understanding. It was just a huge help. By understanding</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecting Specialised Interests (Cultural Resources)</td>
<td>a bit more about the traditions of Islam, it just had an amazing impact … it was just more of a sense of peace about Islamic people that you see in the community. (Female, Non-Muslim Visitor)</td>
<td>33</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I love outback Australia, and when you saw the cameleers there, and you realised “Hang on, there has been Muslim heritage in Australia alongside our own” that for me almost set the tone, it almost broke everything down to go “Hang on, all those prejudices they you've got, for me, just went away” because I thought &quot;Okay, it's been existing in Australia for a long, long time. (Male, Non-Muslim Visitor)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Managerial Implications

There are three managerial implications identified in this report.

Motivators and Inhibitors

The findings suggest factors can act as both motivators and inhibitors for visitors and non-visitors to integrate their operant resources with culturally diversified museums. This report identifies how external factors influence the consumer decision to engage with a service/service provider and integrate their resources to co-create value. For example, both Muslim and non-Muslim visitors’ and non-visitors’ socio-demographic factors such as education, life-cycle stage, and personality factors are evident in their interest to build cultural understanding, participate in activities associated with their specialised interests, further their education and educate their children and to share knowledge with their families, friends and people within their communities. In addition, socio-cultural factors (i.e. individual group affiliations and identities) were evident in Muslim visitors’ motivation to strengthen their religious faith and their drive for belonging. Further, the findings highlight how factors such as education and personality can act as barriers to participation. This is evident in non-Muslim non-visitors’ limited cultural understanding and knowledge acting as an inhibitor for visiting the IMA. Similarly, socio-cultural factors acting as a barrier to participation was evident in Muslim non-visitors drawing on their cultural and religious background as an inhibitor for visiting the IMA.

Co-creation of Value

The findings reveal Muslim and non-Muslim visitors’ of the IMA integrate their operant resources (social, cultural, and physical) to co-create value from their visitor experience. These findings provide strong support for Arnould, Price and Malshe’s (2006) resource integration framework and propositions from Service Dominant Logic (SDL) suggesting consumers are primarily integrators of operant resources, which they use to co-create value (Vargo & Lusch, 2004). Further, this study supports propositions from Service Logic (SL) which suggest consumers and service providers come together to co-create value in a joint sphere and that the customer can also independently create value in the customer sphere with others in their ecosystem (Grönroos & Voima, 2013). This process is evident in both Muslim and non-Muslim visitors using their operant resources to co-create value from their experience to enhance their life projects and roles. However, the findings of this study expands on empirical research exploring the role of operant resources, suggesting integration of cultural resources can act as
both a facilitator and barrier to co-creation of value. This finding was evident in Muslim visitors from an Iranian background drawing on their cultural background and religious knowledge to question the accuracy and importance of information and displays in the museum, while Muslim visitors with an Asian or South Asian background used their cultural resources to build and enhance their existing knowledge.

**Social Inclusion**

The findings of this report suggest co-creation of value between Muslim and non-Muslim visitors and the IMA can lead to outcomes for social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels. Thus, the findings suggest visitors’ integration of operant resources can lead to positive social impact for ethnic minority groups. Table 2 illustrates how Muslim visitors’ integration of emotion (physical resource) can lead to social inclusion outcomes at the individual level by enhancing feelings of pride and belonging and strengthening their identity. These findings provide strong support for the empirical work of Matarasso (1996) who argues that participation in the arts can promote individual and personal development. Further, the findings provide support for the RCMG report which suggests that for individuals at risk of social exclusion, such as Muslims living in Australia, visiting museums can enhance their self-esteem and confidence (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000). Further, the RCMG report argues arts activities encourage the integration of people from diverse social groups and “validate” an individual’s skills and experiences, encouraging them to feel “valued” and “their stories and lives appreciated” (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000, p. 24). This social impact was evident in the findings of this report as Muslim visitors reported feeling “humble”, “impressed” and a sense of “appreciation” towards the IMA sharing the history and contributions of Islam and Muslim communities in Australia with the wider Australian public.

Table 2 also demonstrates that Muslim and non-Muslim visitor’s integration of personal and commercial relationships (social resources) can lead to social inclusion outcomes at the community level. This social impact at the community level was evident in Muslim visitors of the IMA drawing on their sense of pride and belonging, achieved at the individual level, to actively share knowledge about their religion and history with non-Muslims in their community. Further the findings of this report support and expand on the work of Lowe (2000) who argues participation in arts based projects can achieve community solidarity and relationship building. The findings of this report suggest community solidarity and relationship building can occur as a result of arts participation in the context of museums, which was evident in non-Muslim visitors showing a willingness to establish connections with Muslims in their
communities and commercial networks.

Further, Table 2 shows that non-Muslim visitor’s integration of specialised knowledge and skills (cultural resources) can lead to social inclusion outcomes at the societal level. Empirical literature exploring the social impact of the arts is limited, however there is evidence that the arts can challenge stereotypes, promote tolerance and inter-community respect (Hooper-Greenhill et al., 2000; Sandell, 1998, 2003; Williams, 1998). The findings of this report support and expand on this literature, suggesting non-Muslim visitors were able to challenge the stereotypes they held against Muslims by comparing and contrasting their existing knowledge of Muslims, which was predominantly based on messages in the media, to build cultural understanding. Further, the results revealed non-Muslim visitors were able to relate to Muslims living in Australia by connecting their specialised interests with the displays and objects presented in the museum. These findings support the work of Sandell (1998) who argues that museums have the potential to act as vehicles of broader social change through their ability to “communicate, educate and influence” (p. 412).

The findings of this report predominantly support the conceptual model presented in Figure 1 by demonstrating visitors’ integration of operant resources results in visitors entering a joint sphere with the museum where value is co-created. Further, the findings suggest factors act as both motivators and inhibitors for visitors and non-visitors to enter the joint sphere. In addition, the findings demonstrate how co-creation of value in this context can lead to value outcomes for social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels. However, the findings suggest visitors’ operant resources can result in barriers to co-creation of value. As a result, this has led to the empirical framework in figure 2. The framework shows the motivators and inhibitors on the left hand side interact with the resources (physical, social, cultural) to co-create value. However, it also shows how the value outcomes (individual, community, societal) on the right hand side are only developed if the barriers are removed.
Limitations

This report had several limitations which should be acknowledged. The report was conducted for an honours year, which resulted in limited time and funds to collect and analyse the data. As a result, this report was limited to one data collection method which prevented the findings from being triangulated by two or more sources of information. A triangulated, multi-method approach is typically used in case report research. Further, while this report had a sample size of 32 participants, the sample size of each focus group, being between seven to nine participants, limits the ability to generalise to the population, but enables generalisation to theory. However, the findings were cross-checked between Muslim and non-Muslim groups.
In addition, the sample used a higher percentage of women than men and consisted predominantly highly educated people. Nonetheless, women dominate the arts as audiences so the ratio of women to men is consistent with their representation as audiences in the arts. Further, audiences in the arts are highly educated with education being the variable that consistently suggests which people will attend arts events. Hence, having a highly educated group is also consistent with other arts research.

**Conclusion**

This report has contributed to marketing knowledge in a culturally diversified museum in a multicultural society. The findings provide a basis for future research exploring co-creation of value and consumer integration of operant resources in an arts context. There is an opportunity to examine value retention in depth, which was only a minor part of this study. This could include measuring the extent to which social inclusion at individual, community and societal levels is retained over time. There is also the opportunity to extend some of the sub themes, which could include the role of women in Islam, finding soft answers to the threat of terrorism and radicalisation, and finally examining the contrast between culture and religion. These sub themes remain underdeveloped in this report but emerged from the data. Deep examination could provide answers to some of the contemporary issues plaguing society, thus overcoming stereotypes of Muslims and Islam, which is of value to policy makers, managers, museum directors and their boards of trustees.
References


the dimensions of social inclusion through culture, media & sport: executive summary, report for the Department of Culture, Media and Sport, Leeds Metropolitan University, Leeds.


Matarasso, F 1996, Northern lights: The social impact of the Fèisean (Gaelic Festivals), Comedia, Stroud, UK.

Matarasso, F 1997, Use or ornament: the social impact of participation in the arts, Comedia, Stroud, UK.

Matarasso, F 1998, Poverty and oysters: the social impact of local arts development in Portsmouth, Comedia, Stroud, UK.


Mulligan, M & Humphery, K 2006, Creating community—celebrations, arts and wellbeing within and across local communities, The Globalism Institute, Melbourne, Australia.


Appendices

Participant Demographics

Table 3: Focus Groups Participant Demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Employment status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Muslim Visitors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R1</td>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Malaysian</td>
<td>Undergraduate Degree (Accounting)</td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R2</td>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Malaysian</td>
<td>Undergraduate Degree (Information Technology)</td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R3</td>
<td>45-54</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Indonesian</td>
<td>Postgraduate (Management)</td>
<td>PhD Candidate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R4</td>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Malaysian</td>
<td>Postgraduate (Law)</td>
<td>PhD Candidate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R5</td>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Kazakh</td>
<td>Postgraduate (Mathematics)</td>
<td>PhD Candidate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R6</td>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Iranian</td>
<td>Postgraduate (MBA)</td>
<td>PhD Candidate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R7</td>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Bangladeshi</td>
<td>Postgraduate (Accounting)</td>
<td>Full Time (Accountant)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Non-Muslim Visitors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R8</td>
<td>45-54</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Australian</td>
<td>Postgraduate (Law)</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R9</td>
<td>45-54</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Australian</td>
<td>Postgraduate (Arts Management)</td>
<td>Full Time (Museum Manager)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R10</td>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Australian</td>
<td>Trade Certificate (Carpentry)</td>
<td>Full Time (Facilities Manager)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R11</td>
<td>45-54</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Australian</td>
<td>Diploma (Pastoral Care/ Aged Care)</td>
<td>Full Time (Pastoral Care Manager)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R12</td>
<td>65+</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Australian</td>
<td>Diploma (Engineering)</td>
<td>Retired (Engineer)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R13</td>
<td>65+</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Australian</td>
<td>Undergraduate (Arts)</td>
<td>Retired (Bank Manager)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R14</td>
<td>65+</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Australian</td>
<td>Undergraduate (Social Work)</td>
<td>Retired (Social Worker &amp; Psychotherapist)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R15</td>
<td>65+</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Australian</td>
<td>Advanced Diploma</td>
<td>Retired (Flight Attendant)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Muslim Non-Visitors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R16</td>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Malaysian</td>
<td>Postgraduate (Law)</td>
<td>Student (PhD Candidate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R17</td>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Iranian</td>
<td>Postgraduate (MBA)</td>
<td>Student (PhD Candidate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R18</td>
<td>45-54</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Indonesian</td>
<td>Postgraduate (Management)</td>
<td>Student (PhD Candidate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R19</td>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Bangladeshi</td>
<td>Postgraduate (Engineering)</td>
<td>Full Time (Sales Engineer)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R20</td>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Bangladeshi</td>
<td>Secondary School</td>
<td>Part Time (Family Carer)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R21</td>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Bangladeshi</td>
<td>Postgraduate (Social Science)</td>
<td>Full Time (Student Teacher)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R22</td>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Indonesian</td>
<td>Postgraduate (Management)</td>
<td>Student (PhD Candidate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R23</td>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Malaysian</td>
<td>Undergraduate Degree (Accounting)</td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Author Contact Details

Fara Azmat, Deakin Business School, Deakin University, Geelong, Australia
fara.azmat@deakin.edu.au
M: 0421 461 287

Ahmed Ferdous, Deakin Business School, Deakin University, Geelong, Australia
ahmed.ferdous@deakin.edu.au
M: 0431 260 270

Ruth Rentschler, Deakin Business School, Deakin University, Geelong, Australia
rr@unisa.edu.au
M: 0407 461 287

Emma Winston, Deakin Business School, Deakin University, Geelong, Australia
emma.winston@deakin.edu.au
M: 0430 288 209