

# **Consistent, accurate, high resolution, long time-series mapping of built-up land in the North China Plain**

This is an accepted manuscript version of the following article, accepted for publication in *GIScience and Remote Sensing*:

Wang, Jinzhu, Hadjikakou, Michalis and Bryan, Brett 2021, Consistent, accurate, high resolution, long time-series mapping of built-up land in the North China Plain, GIScience and Remote Sensing, pp. 1-17.

DOI of published version: https://doi.org/10.1080/15481603.2021.1948275

It is deposited under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License (CC BY-NC 4.0), which permits non-commercial re-use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

©2021, Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group

Downloaded from DRO: http://hdl.handle.net/10536/DRO/DU:30154082

- Consistent, accurate, high resolution, long time-series mapping of  $\mathbf{1}$
- built-up land in the North China Plain  $\overline{2}$
- $\overline{3}$
- Jinzhu Wanga,b\*, Michalis Hadjikakou<sup>a</sup>, Brett A. Bryana,b  $\overline{4}$
- <sup>a</sup>Centre for Integrative Ecology, School of Life and Environmental Sciences, Deakin 5
- University, VIC 3125, Melbourne, Australia; 6
- $\overline{7}$ <sup>b</sup>Deakin-SWU Joint Research Centre on Big Data, Faculty of Science, Engineering and
- $8\,$ Built Environment, Deakin University, VIC 3125, Australia
- 9 \*corresponding author at wangjinz@deakin.edu.au; Centre for Integrative Ecology,
- School of Life and Environmental Sciences, Deakin University, VIC 3125, Melbourne, 10
- 11 Australia;
- 12

# Consistent, accurate, high resolution, long time-series mapping of 13 built-up land in the North China Plain 14



33 Keywords: built-up land: urbanization: Fourier transformation: remote sensing: 34 time-series

#### 35 **Introduction**

36 Economic development and population growth have led to drastic changes in the Earth's

37 terrestrial surface, not least through the expansion of built-up lands (Elmore et al. 2012),

- 38 with urbanization continuing to accelerate (United Nations 2019). Built-up land is
- 39 defined as land-use comprising more than 50% human-made structures such as roads,
- 40 buildings, and agricultural and industrial facilities (Schneider and Mertes 2014). Built-
- up land extent is an essential data input for the analysis of water and carbon cycling 41
- 42 (Chen et al. 2020; Hou et al. 2020; Wang et al. 2018), pollution (Shrivastava et al. 2019;



Tracking built-up land over long periods is a significant challenge because 47 random misclassifications compromise the consistency of multi-temporal mapping. For 48 49 example, the soil surface of fallow cropland has similar spectral characteristics to built-50 up land and is commonly reported as a source of confusion in built-up land mapping in 51 mixed urban/agrarian regions (Gong et al. 2020; Li, Gong, and Liang 2015; Li et al. 52 2016). In addition, random noise such as cloud and cloud shadows can also lead to 53 inconsistencies in built-up land mapping (Foga et al. 2017). Therefore, removing these 54 noise sources is essential to maintain consistency in long time-series built-up land 55 mapping and enable the reliable assessment of temporal trends in urbanization and 56 urban land-change dynamics.

57 Open-data policies combined with advances in computation facilities and innovative algorithms have enabled built-up land to be mapped at higher resolution 58 59 across larger extents, at greater temporal frequency, and over longer time periods (Li 60 and Gong 2016). Two strategies are typically used to increase mapping accuracy and 61 reduce inconsistencies over time: 1) integrating multisource data and 2) using temporal 62 consistency correction. For example, Visible Infrared Imaging Radiometer Suite 63 (VIIRS) nighttime light (NTL) data has been used as a binary mask to exclude non-64 urban land (Gong et al. 2020; He et al. 2019; Liu et al. 2019; Guo et al. 2018), Sentinel-65 1 Synthetic Aperture Radar (SAR) data has been merged with Landsat data to increase classification accuracy (Gong et al. 2020; Zhang et al. 2020), and multisource remotely 66 sensed data has been combined to enhance urban land mapping (Cao et al. 2019; Li et 67

68 al. 2020b). The tendency of built-up land to not revert to natural or agricultural land 69 (*i.e.*, its irreversibility) has also been exploited to correct temporal inconsistencies (Li. 70 Gong, and Liang 2015) and produce stable and reliable control points (Liu et al. 2019). 71 Temporal correction has improved the overall accuracy of urban mapping by  $\sim 6\%$  in 72 Beijing from 1985 to 2015 (Li, Gong, and Liang 2015),  $\sim$ 3% in Wuhan from 1987 to 73 2016 (Shi et al. 2017), and  $\sim 6\%$  in Tianjin from 1990 to 2014 (Chai and Li 2018). 74 Spectral features and vegetation indices have been used to map built-up land, but 75 temporal features such as land surface phenology have typically been overlooked 76 (Jönsson et al. 2018). Generally, temporal features are derived from indices such as the 77 normalized difference vegetation index (NDVI) using smoothing methods (Wang et al. 78 2017) such as logistic models (Elmore et al. 2012), Savitzky–Golay filters (Chen et al. 79 2004), quadratic functions (Beurs and Henebry 2004), and Discrete Fourier Transforms 80 (Wang, Azzari, and Lobell 2019). The Discrete Fourier Transform represents time-81 series signals as several periodic components suitable for extracting temporal features 82 from remotely sensed data (Wang, Azzari, and Lobell 2019). Although temporal 83 features have been coupled with change-detection methods to determine the timing of 84 conversion to built-up land (Liu et al. 2019), they have not been widely used as 85 mapping predictors (Zeng et al. 2020). Because temporal features capture relatively 86 predictable greenness patterns following interannual plant growth cycles, we 87 hypothesize that they could reduce the spectral confusion in built-up land mapping from 88 fallow farmland and seasonal bare land. 89 This study aims to make two specific advances on the current state of knowledge

90 on built-up land mapping: 1) to reduce the confusion of fallow cropland and seasonal 91 bare land in mixed urban and agricultural settings by integrating temporal features from 92 dense time-stack remotely sensed data, and 2) to increase the mapping consistency by

applying a cloud-based temporal correction algorithm. The North China Plain region 93 94 was chosen as the study area because of the fierce competition between urbanization 95 and agriculture for land (Jin et al. 2019). First, we used Discrete Fourier Transformation 96 to derive temporal features based on dense time-stack Landsat spectral indices (Odenweller and Johnson 1984; Song et al. 2016). Second, we tested the performance 97 98 improvement of temporal predictor variables over traditional spectral approaches by 99 adding them to the classification. A temporal correction algorithm was then used to 100 remove inconsistent pixel classifications. Finally, we conducted a cross-product 101 comparison to assess our results against other built-up land mapping datasets (Stehman 102 and Foody 2019). We discuss the benefits of consistent, accurate, high-resolution, long 103 time-series built-up land mapping in providing more reliable inputs to understanding 104 regional urban development and linking social-economic change to environmental 105 impacts.

#### 106 **Materials and methods**

#### 107 **Study area**

108 Five central and eastern provinces of China (i.e., Henan, Hebei, Shandong, Anhui, and 109 Jiangsu) and two municipalities (*i.e.*, Beijing and Tianjin), corresponding to the North 110 China Plain region, were selected as the study area (Figure 1). The area spans 780,000 111  $km<sup>2</sup>$  and is home to over 450 million people (National Bureau of Statistics of China 112 2019b). The study area is one of China's most rapidly developing regions with the 113 urbanization rate (excluding Beijing and Tianjin) tripling from  $\sim$ 20% in 1990 to  $\sim$ 60% 114 in 2018 (National Bureau of Statistics of China 2019b). The North China Plain is key to 115 China's economic development and food security (Song and Deng 2015), generating  $\sim$ 37% of the gross domestic product and  $\sim$ 35% of China's grain production in 2019 116

- 117 (National Bureau of Statistics of China 2019a). Managing the tension between rapid 118 economic development, urbanization, and food production in the study area demands 119 accurate quantification of built-up land dynamics to support policy formulation and
- 120 decision making (Li et al. 2020a; Liu et al. 2020).





122 Figure 1. Map of the North China Plain.

#### 123 **Method** overview

124 The approach taken in this study is summarized in Figure 2. Due to its high

125 computational performance and vast historical satellite imagery archive, Google Earth

126 Engine was used to process all remotely sensed data and map built-up land (Gorelick et

- 127 al. 2017). Control points were visually checked using Landsat images from 1990–1992
- 128 and Google Earth high-definition images (from GeoEye, WorldView, SPOT, and
- 129 Pleiades) from 2014 and 2019. We randomly withheld 25% of the control points as
- 130 validation samples. Cloud-free Spectral images, normalized Indices (e.g., NDVI),
- 131 Fourier predictors (e.g., Fourier transformation coefficients), Terrain, and
- 132 Meteorological data were sequentially added to a Random Forest (RF) classifier to
- 133 assess the additional benefit for classification accuracy. A temporal correction algorithm
- 134 was then applied to remove inconsistent classifications. Lastly, a cross-product
- 135 comparison was carried out using the withheld control points.







- 147 Data and input predictors
- 148 We used five types of remotely sensed data as predictors to map built-up areas (Table
- 149 1). Spectral predictors comprised cloud-free images computed from Landsat and
- 150 Sentinel 2A. *Indices* predictors were calculated from Landsat cloud-free data, including
- 151 the NDVI, enhanced vegetation index (EVI), and normalized difference built-up index

152 (NDBI). The *Fourier* predictors were derived from the Discrete Fourier Transformation

153 of dense time-stacks of Indices data (NDVI, NDBI, and EVI). Lastly, *Terrain* data was

154 taken from the Shuttle Radar Topography Mission and the Meteorology data was taken

- 155 from the China Meteorological Forcing Dataset (He et al. 2020). The Landsat and
- 156 Sentinel data were subject to geometric and radiometric corrections by Google Earth
- 157 Engine, and all data were resampled to 30m resolution for use in the classification.
- 158 Table 1. Input predictors for built-up land mapping. TM: Thematic Mapper, ETM+:

159 Enhanced Thematic Mapper Plus, OLI: Operational Land Imager, MSI: Multispectral

160 Instrument, NDVI: normalized difference vegetation index, EVI: enhanced vegetation

161 index, and NDBI: normalized difference built-up index. All bands of the

162 Landsat/Sentinel are used in this research. Note the panchromatic band (15 m)

163 resolution) of Landsat ETM+ and OLI, and the thermal bands (which have a resolution

164 of 60 m for Landsat5/7 and 100 m for Landsat 8) are resampled to 30 m. All Sentinel

165 bands are resampled to 30 m.



166

167 The Spectral predictors were cloud-free images produced from Landsat and 168 Sentinel-2A; the data quantity and distribution can be seen in Supplementary Material A 169 (Figure SA 1). Spectral predictors were created using the *simpleComposite* module in 170 Google Earth Engine. For each pixel in the collection of Landsat images, this module 171 assigned a cloud score  $(0-100)$  to it and used the median value from pixels with a cloud 172 score <10 to create a cloud-free image. For the Sentinel 2 Multi-Spectral Instrument 173 (MSI) data, its Quality Assessment band that indicates whether the pixel is covered by

174 cloud and cirrus was used to remove cloudy pixels, and the median value of the

175 remaining pixels was mosaicked to create the Spectral predictors.

176 NDVI, EVI, and NDBI were selected as Indices predictors because NDVI and 177 EVI are robust for delineating land covers (Li, Gong, and Liang 2015), and NDBI suits the purpose of built-up mapping (Li et al. 2018). We calculated these indices as follows: 178

$$
179 \t\t NDUI = (NIR - R) / (NIR + R) \t\t (1)
$$

$$
180 \t\t EVI = 2.5 \times ((NIR - R) / (NIR + 6 \times R - 7.5 \times B + 1)) \t(2)
$$

$$
NDBI = (SWIR1 + NIR) / (SWIR1 - NIR)
$$
 (3)

182 where  $NIR$  refers to the near-infrared band, R refers to the red band, B refers to the blue 183 band, and *SWIR1* refers to the first shortwave infrared band.

184 The Discrete Fourier Transformation approximates a series of discrete values by 185 summing up a linear function and several pairs of sinuate functions. The fitting 186 formulation was as follows:

187 
$$
p_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 t + \sum_{k=1}^n [\alpha_k \cos(2\pi k \omega t) + \theta_k \sin(2\pi k \omega t)] + e_t
$$
 (4)

188 where  $t$  is the time difference in year fractions compared to 1970 following standard 189 practice in data science,  $p_t$  is the pixel value at time t, n is the number of sinuate function pairs,  $\beta_0$  and  $\beta_1$  are the coefficients of the linear function,  $\alpha$  and  $\theta$  are the 190 191 sinuate coefficients,  $\omega$  is the frequency, and  $e_t$  is the error between the actual

192 observation and the fitted value.

193 In practice,  $n$  and the temporal interval were the two variables that should be 194 determined before the fitting. We assessed the impact of different  $n$  and temporal 195 intervals from 1 to 5 and selected 3 for both variables because they did not unduly 196 increase the fitting error (Figure SA 3). Meanwhile, we selected  $\omega = 1$  based on the 197 climate and vegetation life-cycle and seasonality in the study area (Tang et al. 2020).

- 198 Discrete Fourier Transformation was applied to the normalized indices to generate
- 199 Fourier predictors (Figure 3). Eight coefficients were generated per index, and 24
- coefficient bands were created as Fourier predictors. 200





204

202 Figure 3. The Discrete Fourier Transformation of stacked Indices data. Coefficients of 203 the fitting function were derived as Fourier predictors.

- 205 The China Meteorological Forcing Dataset (http://data.tpdc.ac.cn/) and Shuttle 206 Radar Topography Mission data were incorporated as additional predictors to reduce 207 interference of different climatic and topographic conditions. The China Meteorological 208 Forcing Dataset includes seven variables: temperature (K), air pressure (Pa), specific humidity (kg kg<sup>-1</sup>), wind speed (m s<sup>-1</sup>), downward shortwave radiation (W m<sup>-2</sup>), 209 downward longwave radiation (W  $m<sup>2</sup>$ ), and precipitation (mm yr<sup>-1</sup>). The Shuttle Radar 210 211 Topography Mission data used in this study included elevation and slope from the year 212 2000.
- 213 **Built-up land mapping**

#### Control point collection 214

215 Control points were collected manually via visual interpretation against high-resolution

216 imagery and Indices images. Built-up and non-built-up control points were collected

- 217 separately. Raw built-up points were taken from the National Settlements Database of
- 218 China (http://www.resdc.cn/). Raw non-built-up points were generated via stratified

219 sampling using NDVI (Figure SB 1). A total of 8,000 control points were verified, with 220 an equal number of built-up and non-built-up points (i.e., 4,000) to reduce bias caused 221 by uneven sample distribution (Stehman and Foody 2019). We took advantage of the 222 irreversibility of built-up land (i.e., built-up land rarely reverts to non-built-up land) to 223 ensure that control points were located in areas where land-use remained stable over 224 time. We used the Indices image for the first period (1990-1992) to verify built-up 225 control points, and the high-definition Google Earth images in the last period (2020) to 226 verify non-built-up control points. We then merged the verified control points for use in 227 classification throughout the analysis period (1990-2019). A sensitivity test showed that 228 using more than 50% of control samples achieved high accuracies that were stable over time (Figure SC 1). Hence, we used 75% of control samples as the training sample for 229 230 the mapping (of these, 70% were employed in classification and 30% to calculate 231 accuracy), while the remaining  $\sim$ 25% were held out as validation samples for the cross-232 product comparison.

#### 233 Classifying built-up land

234 Random Forest (RF) is an ensemble learning algorithm selected for classification due to 235 its flexibility in capturing non-linear patterns between independent and dependent 236 variables (Calderón-Loor, Hadjikakou, and Bryan 2021). The tree-based structure of RF 237 is efficient in classifying high-dimensional data (Wang, Azzari, and Lobell 2019). To 238 grow trees for the RF, we set the split nodes as the square root of the input predictors, 239 the bag fraction to 50%, and the minimum leaf nodes to 1. The number of trees in the 240 RF was set to 100 because no more improvement was possible by increasing tree 241 numbers (Figure SC 1).

242 The input predictors were resampled to 30m resolution and stacked into a single 243 multi-band image in the classification process. The control samples were overlayed

244 upon this image to extract values for each band. These samples were then used to train 245 the RF model. Lastly, the trained model was used to map the spatial distribution of 246 built-up land pixels (allocated a value of 1) versus non-built-up land pixels (allocated a 247 value of 0) based on the input predictor bands.

248 All five types of predictors used in mapping were introduced in the following 249 order: Spectral, Indices, Fourier, Terrain, Meteorology. The incorporation of predictors 250 in this order enabled us to explore how temporal features improved built-up land 251 mapping over the more traditional inputs. We first applied the traditional approach of 252 using Spectral data only, then introduced the Indices data, then the Fourier predictors. 253 Terrain and Meteorology data were added last to reduce interference from topographic 254 and climatic conditions.

255 We classified built-up land using a random selection of control points and 256 repeated this ten times to eliminate bias and capture uncertainty in accuracy metrics. In 257 each classification, 70% of the training samples were randomly selected to train the RF 258 classifier, and the remaining 30% were used to compute overall accuracy. Uncertainty 259 was then calculated as the standard error of the accuracies of the ten simulations. We 260 summed the 10 classifications and identified the built-up land pixels as the pixels with 261 >4 value to derive the final classification of built-up land. Four was chosen as the 262 threshold because it led to the highest classification accuracy (Figure SC 2).

263 Based on the characteristic of the irreversibility of built-up land development 264 and expansion (Gong et al. 2020; Li, Gong, and Liang 2015), we constructed temporal 265 check rules to correct inconsistent pixel classifications over time (Figure 4).

266 Irreversibility was implemented as a check rule such that built-up land extent in earlier 267 years could not expand beyond the built-up land extent mapped in later years. For each 268 built-up land pixel in the map,  $n$  subsequent pixels in the later years were used to check

its consistency: if  $>n/2$  of the subsequent pixel were classified as a built-up land, the 269 270 pixel remained as built-up land; otherwise, it was corrected and specified as non-built-271 up land. The  $>n/2$  threshold was based on a "majority vote" rule (Li, Gong, and Liang 272 2015). This study set  $n = 2$  by balancing the amount of data used as a mask and the resulting improvements in accuracy (Figure SD 1). The temporal correction process was 273 274 iterated eight times to ensure consistency (Figure SD 2).



275

276 Figure 4. Temporal correction for built-up land mapping. Left, the temporal correction process for each iteration; right, the stop condition of the iteration. Here we choose  $n =$ 277 278 2 based on a sensitivity test (Figure SD 1).

#### 279 Cross-product comparison

280 We compared our data to other datasets available for the study area that mapped similar 281 land cover (such as impervious surfaces and human settlements) or including 282 urban/built-up land (Table 2). Built-up area and overall accuracy were used for the 283 comparison. The validation sample (25% of all control samples) was used to compute 284 overall accuracy because it was not used in the original classification of this study, 285 thereby eliminating bias from the comparison (Stehman and Foody 2019). The other 286 data products tended to be global in coverage. In this sense, our aim was not to critically compare our dataset explicitly which was created for the study area against global 287 288 datasets (which is an unfair comparison), but rather to provide a guide for potential 289 users (i.e., planners, policy-makers) of the accuracy of our product compared to other

- 290 available products for this specific region and to provide a basis for understanding the
- 291 potential implications in terms of the urban land area mapped.
- 292
- 293 Table 2. Global built-up land datasets used for comparison with the outputs of this
- 294 study. GAIA: Global Artificial Impervious Area, ESA CCI: European Space Agency
- 295 Climate Change Initiative, GHSL: Global Human Settlement Layer, MCD12Q1:
- 296 MODIS Land Cover Type Product, MERIS: Medium-spectral Resolution Imaging
- 297 Spectrometer, SPOT-VGT: Strategic Planning Online Tool Vegetation Instrument,
- 298 PROBA-V: Project for On-Board Autonomy Vegetation, AVHRR: Advanced Very
- 299 High-Resolution Radiometer, and MODIS: Moderate Resolution Imaging
- 300 Spectroradiometer.



301

### 302 **Results**

### 303 **Built-up land mapping using different predictors**

- 304 The performance of different predictors is shown in Figure 5. The mapping accuracy of
- 305 2014-2016 and 2017-2019 were significantly higher because the Sentinel-2A MSI data
- 306 was incorporated in the classification, increasing classification accuracy from  $\sim$ 83% in
- 307  $2011-2013$  to ~93% in 2017-2019. Fourier and Indices were the best predictors,
- 308 increasing accuracy by  $\sim 8\%$  and  $\sim 3\%$ , respectively. The addition of Terrain and
- 309 Meteorology predictors further improved the mapping accuracy by  $\sim$ 1%.

310 For classifications in the 1990s and 2000s, incorporating the Fourier predictors 311 raised the overall accuracy to  $\sim 92\%$ , similar to the overall accuracy in 2014–2019 312 achieved using Sentinel-2A MSI data. Hence, incorporating Fourier predictors for the 313 earlier time periods (Landsat 5 TM or Landsat 7 ETM+) enabled the mapping of built-314 up land with an accuracy similar to the classification based on data sourced from more 315 recent and more advanced sensors (i.e., Landsat 8 OLI and Sentinel-2A MSI).



316

317 Figure 5. Accuracy of different predictor combinations for built-up land mapping. Lines 318 show the median value of 10 classifications with varying sample splits; the margins 319 show the standard error.

320

321 Built-up land mapping for the period 1990–1992 was selected to explore the 322 spatial performance of Spectral, Indices, and Fourier predictors (Figure 6). Region 1 323 (row 1, Figure 6) shows villages surrounded by farmland, where the classification using 324 Spectral predictors misclassified large areas of farmland near villages as built-up land. 325 Region 2 (row 2, Figure 6) shows a town surrounded by bare lands. The classification 326 using Spectral predictors misclassified most bare land to build-up land. Regions 3 and 4 327 (rows 3 and 4, Figure 6) were located in more humid areas than regions 1 and 2. Figure

- 328 6 shows that bare lands and farmland rotation confounded built-up land mapping. The
- 329 addition of Indices predictors reduced misclassification in Regions 1 and 3 but
- 330 worsened the classification in regions 2 and 4. However, the Fourier predictors provided
- 331 skilled delineation of built-up land mapping across the four example regions.



332

333 Figure 6. Spatial improvement in built-up land mapping for four selected regions. We 334 used a false-color composite scheme to display predictors and a two-color map to 335 represent the classification results (with yellow indicating built-up land and the dark 336 color non-built-up). Regions 1 and 2 were located in the northern, temperate part of the study area; regions 3 and 4 were located in the more humid southern part. NDVI-cos-2, 337 338 NDVI-sin-1, and EVI-sin-1 are selected to present the Fourier predictors to give 339 maximum visual contrast to built-up land. NDVI-cos-2 refers to the cosine coefficient 340 with a frequency of 2 from the Fourier transformation on NDVI. NDVI-sin-1 and EVI-341 sin-1 are the sine coefficients with a frequency of 1.

#### 342 Accuracy improvements via temporal correction

343 Figure 7a shows classification accuracy before and after temporal correction. Temporal correction increased built-up land classification accuracy, achieving consistently high 344 345 accuracies over the entire study period. The highest accuracy increases  $(1.5\% - 2.5\%)$ 346 occurred in the last two periods, while the accuracy of the first two periods decreased by 347  $0.1\%$ –0.5%. We further inspected spatial improvements in 2011–2013 because the 348 classification in this period had the lowest original accuracy (Figure 7b). The temporal 349 correction process greatly reduced misclassification resulting from striping in the 350 original imagery from the Scan-Line Corrector failure of Landsat ETM+ (regions A and 351 C), correctly removed erroneously classified greenhouses (hazy, light gray patches in

352 region B), and improved classification quality in hilly and barren areas (region D).



354 Figure 7. Improvement in overall accuracy and spatial performance when using 355 temporal correction. True-color maps in b) were obtained from high-definition Google

356 Earth imagery from December 2013.

#### 357 **Spatio-temporal dynamics of built-up land**

- 358 We mosaicked all temporally corrected classifications into one image and used a warm-
- 359 cool color scheme to represent time from 1990 to 2019 (Figure 8). Cities in flatter
- 360 regions (e.g., Baoding, Shangqiu, and Changzhou) tended to expand radially outward.
- 361 Cities near rivers (e.g., Xuyi and Xinyang) grew linearly following the geographical
- 362 constraints, and cities in mountainous areas (e.g., Fengning) expanded along valleys.





364 Figure 8. Dynamic map of built-up areas from 1990 to 2019. Warm colors indicate

365 earlier dates, and cool colors indicate later dates. Hexagonal insets show zoomed-in 366 views of selected cities.

367 The increase in built-up area accelerated over the study period, with all 368 provinces, except for Hebei, tripling their built-up area (Figure 9). Shandong and Henan 369 provinces had the largest built-up area. Jiangsu province rose from the fifth-largest 370 built-up land area to the third after 2004, while Hebei and Anhui had less built-up land 371 area. Beijing and Tianjin showed similar amounts of built-up land area for all periods 372 and both increased rapidly. Tianjin demonstrated the largest change in proportion of 373 built-up land, expanding from 6.3% in 1990-1992 to 25.1% in 2017-2019. The ratio of 374 built-up land increased from 4.7% to 23.7% in Jiangsu and from 8.2% to 20.6% in 375 Shandong. Henan, Beijing, and Anhui shared a comparable growth level of  $\sim$ 5% to 376  $\sim$ 16%. Hebei demonstrated the lowest concentration of built-up land, increasing from 377 3.8% in 1990-1992 to 10.9% in 2017-2019.





379 Figure 9. Built-up land change in the North China Plain from 1990 to 2019. a) The area 380 change. b) The built-up area proportion change; the value shows the percentage of built-381 up area to region total area.

#### 382 **Cross-product comparison**

383 Significant differences were found between the selected datasets because of the 384 differences in classification algorithms, data sources, spatial resolution, and definitions 385 used. (Figure 10). The low-resolution datasets (ESA CCI, Global Urban Expansion, and 386 MCD12Q1) missed built-up land in smaller villages and towns. The Global Urban 387 Dynamics used Landsat imagery as input data and the VIIRS NTL as a mask to map the 388 urban land dynamics but omitted small villages/towns that emit faint nighttime light. 389 However, the GAIA product more skillfully captured built-up land in large cities and 390 smaller villages and towns.

391



392

393 Figure 10. Dynamics of built-up area in four selected cities (1990–2019). The true color 394 maps were taken from Google Earth high-definition images from 2019. GAIA: Global 395 Artificial Impervious Area, ESA CCI: European Space Agency Climate Change

- 396 Initiative, GHSL: Global Human Settlement Layer, MCD12Q1: MODIS Land Cover
- 397 Type Product. Note that the start year for GAIA was 1985, making its city centers look
- 398 darker than our product.





414

415 Figure 11. Area and overall accuracy comparison. The middle year of each period in 416 this study was selected as the x-axis value (for example, 1991 was used to indicate the 417 built-up area of 1990-1992).

#### 418 **Discussion**

## 419 Fourier predictors improved built-up land mapping accuracy

420 Landsat has a long and continuous image archive which offers a unique opportunity for 421 global and regional assessment of land-use change processes such as urbanization 422 (Deng and Zhu 2020). However, fallow farmland and seasonal bare land introduce 423 confusion into built-up land mapping (Gong et al. 2020; Poursanidis, Chrysoulakis, and 424 Mitraka 2015). This study used coefficients from a Discrete Fourier Transformation as 425 predictors and achieved an 8% accuracy gain compared to using traditional Spectral and 426 Indices-based approaches. Fallow farmland and seasonal bare land confusion were 427 largely removed following the inclusion of Fourier predictors. Our results captured fine-428 scale built-up features, such as buildings in small villages and towns, rather than just the 429 large-scale features of large cities. As a result of the higher accuracy, our study revealed 430 higher estimates of built-up areas than other datasets (except for GlobeLand30),

431 suggesting that global assessments of urbanization may be underestimated.

432 The effectiveness of Fourier predictors in delineating built-up lands may be 433 because features captured in dense time-stacks of remotely sensed data are less affected 434 by random noise (e.g., cloud, cloud shadow, and seasonal changes in land surface) than 435 snapshot spectral data or indices. Crop phenology and farming rotations lead to regular 436 greenness patterns in cultivated sites over the annual growing cycle that are distinct 437 from built-up lands (Zeng et al. 2020). While it is difficult for Spectral and Indices 438 predictors to separate fallow lands from built-up lands—a common source of built-up 439 land mapping error—Fourier predictors were sensitive to this distinction. Incorporating 440 Fourier predictors reduced this confusion and substantially increased the accuracy of 441 built-up land mapping.

## 442 Temporal correction increases the consistency of long time-series built-up land 443 mapping

444 In addition to incorporating Fourier predictors, we also implemented temporal 445 correction to account for the general feature of irreversibility in built-up land (i.e., once 446 an area is converted to urban land, it tends to remain as urban land (Li, Gong, and Liang 447 2015; Li et al. 2018)). We implemented the rule that built-up land in earlier years was 448 unlikely to occur beyond the extent of built-up land in later years, providing the logic 449 for developing a temporal correction algorithm to remove incorrect pixel classifications. 450 This correction was able to remove misclassified areas resulting from striping caused by 451 the ETM+ Scan-Line Corrector failure. Our method can be deployed on the Google 452 Earth Engine platform and is more straightforward than other temporal correction 453 algorithms. For example, Li et al. (2015) combined a majority vote rule and temporal 454 reasoning to construct a spatio-temporal consistency check algorithm, which required a

455 complicated process to combine transition probabilities and neighborhood

456 characteristics. In comparison, our heuristic method is straightforward to apply and 457 achieved a significant correction effect.

458 Combining Fourier predictors and temporal correction achieved consistently 459 high accuracy in built-up land mapping over 30 years. The overall accuracy of our 460 product was high and consistent across years ( $>94\%$ ), averaging around  $\sim$ 10% higher 461 than the GlobeLand 30 and  $\sim$ 15% higher than GAIA in the 1990s and 2000s (Figure 11).

## 462 Informing sustainability assessment and supporting policy with high-quality 463 data

464 Built-up land occupies only a small portion of the global terrestrial surface but hosts 465 more than half of the world's population (Chen et al. 2020). Indeed, 70% of global 466 anthropogenic greenhouse gas emissions in 2016 and 80% of local natural habitat loss 467 in 2018 have been linked to the development of built-up lands (Hopkins et al. 2016; Ke 468 et al. 2018). Therefore, an accurate understanding of the dynamics of built-up land over 469 time is critical to addressing the social and environmental challenges that threaten a 470 sustainable future in rapidly urbanizing areas, including our study area.

471 Our consistent, high-accuracy data product can be readily used in urban policy 472 and planning. For example, urban growth models based on cellular automata use 473 historical data to project future scenarios, but errors in historical data can propagate 474 throughout the projection, reducing confidence in the results (Clarke and Johnson 2020; 475 Roodposhti, Aryal, and Bryan 2019). This study provides reliable historical data that 476 enables built-up land expansion to be projected with higher confidence. Environmental 477 change can also be quantified more precisely using accurate built-up land maps. For 478 example, the Integrated Valuation of Ecosystem Services and Trade-offs (InVEST) 479 model uses land-use maps as a proxy to calculate carbon sequestration, water yield, crop 480 production, and habitat quality (Tallis et al. 2011). High-quality built-up land mapping 481 data can provide more reliable input data for calculating the anthropogenic impacts of 482 urbanization.

483 Spatially explicit policies and planning are essential for supporting sustainable 484 development, and one requirement for formulating such policies is access to high-485 quality data. The study area is unique in China for its strategic position, rapid 486 urbanization, and high agricultural productivity (Song and Deng 2015). To boost the 487 economy of the study area, the Chinese government has announced a series of 488 development plans, such as the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei Urban Agglomeration 489 development plan (Fang et al. 2019) and the Central Plains City Group development 490 plan (Li et al. 2020a). These plans include mega-infrastructure projects (e.g., high-speed 491 railways and long-distance expressways) to enhance economic flow among cities (Li et 492 al. 2020a). In parallel, to safeguard food security, the Chinese government has also 493 enacted strict farmland protection regulations (e.g., the Basic Farmland Protection 494 Regulations) that prohibit farmland from being converted to built-up lands (Liu et al. 495 2020). An accurate understanding of built-up land dynamics is critical to formulating 496 effective development plans that balance rapid urbanization with increased demand for 497 food production (Zhong et al. 2020). In addition, accurate historical built-up data can be 498 used to project future economic development and derive opportunity costs for future 499 urban expansion (e.g., reduced food security). As a result, urbanization, food security, 500 and sustainability can be coordinated under one framework, promoting the formulation 501 of spatially explicit policies and regulations.

### 502 **Limitations and prospects**

503 Our study has some limitations and uncertainties. We derived temporal features from 504 the Discrete Fourier Transformation based on three years of data. Hence the exact date

505 of built-up land development cannot be determined at a finer resolution than three years. 506 Another uncertainty was introduced by the temporal correction methodology, which 507 assumes that built-up land in 1990–1992 remained unchanged during the study period. 508 Small areas of built-up land could have been converted to other land types over time (Fu 509 et al. 2019). However, such conversions typically only comprise a small portion of the 510 total built-up land area (Gong, Li, and Zhang 2019). Despite these limitations, the 511 results provide the most accurate, high-resolution, long time-series built-up land data 512 product available for the North China Plain.

513 The cross-product comparison indicates that our built-up land mapping for the 514 North China Plain is more consistent and accurate than other available products that 515 map built-up land. However, while comparing the accuracy of highly-tailored, regional 516 mapping applications against other global datasets enables potential users to evaluate 517 the merits of the products available for a specific region; it is not a reflection on the 518 value of the global datasets as the accuracy of global products is bound to be lower. Our 519 dataset fills a different niche, aimed at users that require consistent, high-accuracy, 520 long-time series data for a specific region rather than global coverage.

#### 521 Conclusion

522 We incorporated temporal features based on a dense time-stack of Landsat imagery and 523 a temporal correction method to map the spatial extent of built-up land in the North 524 China Plain over 30 years (1990–2019). Incorporating Fourier predictors increased 525 overall accuracy by 8% compared to using Spectral and Indices predictors alone. The 526 temporal correction successfully removed incorrectly classified pixels and increased 527 overall accuracy in all periods to a consistently high level (>94%). All provinces and 528 cities in the study region tripled their built-up area over the last three decades,



- 555 Bryan, Brett A., Yangiong Ye, Jia'en Zhang, and Jeffery D. Connor. 2018. "Land-use
- change impacts on ecosystem services value: Incorporating the scarcity effects of 556
- 557 supply and demand dynamics." *Ecosystem services* 32: 144–57.
- 558 doi:10.1016/j.ecoser.2018.07.002.
- 559 Calderón-Loor, Marco, Michalis Hadjikakou, and Brett A. Bryan. 2021. "High-
- 560 resolution wall-to-wall land-cover mapping and land change assessment for Australia
- 561 from 1985 to 2015." Remote Sens. Environ. 252: 112148.
- 562 doi:10.1016/j.rse.2020.112148.
- 563 Cao, Shisong, Deyong Hu, Wenji Zhao, You Mo, Chen Yu, and Yang Zhang. 2019.
- 564 "Monitoring Changes in the Impervious Surfaces of Urban Functional Zones Using
- Multisource Remote Sensing Data: a Case Study of Tianjin, China." GIScience & 565

566 Remote Sensing 56 (7): 967-87. doi:10.1080/15481603.2019.1600110.

- 567 Chai, Baohui, and Peijun Li. 2018. "Annual Urban Expansion Extraction and Spatio-
- 568 Temporal Analysis Using Landsat Time Series Data: A Case Study of Tianjin,
- 569 China." IEEE J. Sel. Top. Appl. Earth Obs. Remote Sens. 11 (8): 2644–56.
- 570 doi:10.1109/JSTARS.2018.2829525.
- Chen, Guangzhao, Xia Li, Xiaoping Liu, Yimin Chen, Xun Liang, Jiye Leng, Xiaocong 571
- 572 Xu et al. 2020. "Global Projections of Future Urban Land Expansion Under Shared
- 573 Socioeconomic Pathways." Nat. Commun. 11 (1): 537. doi:10.1038/s41467-020-
- 574 14386-x.
- 575 Chen, Jin, Per. Jönsson, Masayuki Tamura, Zhihui Gu, Bunkei Matsushita, and Lars
- 576 Eklundh. 2004. "A simple method for reconstructing a high-quality NDVI time-series
- 577 data set based on the Savitzky–Golay filter." Remote Sens Environ 91 (3-4): 332–44.
- 578 doi:10.1016/j.rse.2004.03.014.
- 579 Clarke, Keith C., and J. M. Johnson. 2020. "Calibrating SLEUTH with big data:
- 580 Projecting California's land use to 2100." Comput. Environ. Urban Syst. 83: 101525. 581 doi:10.1016/j.compenvurbsys.2020.101525.
- 
- 582 Deng, Chengbin, and Zhe Zhu. 2020. "Continuous subpixel monitoring of urban
- 583 impervious surface using Landsat time series." Remote Sens. Environ. 238: 110929.
- 584 doi:10.1016/j.rse.2018.10.011.
- 585 Elmore, Andrew J., Steven M. Guinn, Burke J. Minsley, and Andrew D. Richardson.
- 586 2012. "Landscape controls on the timing of spring, autumn, and growing season
- length in mid-Atlantic forests." Global Change Biol. 18 (2): 656–74. 587
- 588 doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2011.02521.x.
- Fang, Chuanglin, Xuegang Cui, Guangdong Li, Chao Bao, Zhenbo Wang, Haitao Ma, 589
- Siao Sun, Haimeng Liu, Kui Luo, and Yufei Ren. 2019. "Modeling Regional 590
- 591 Sustainable Development Scenarios Using the Urbanization and Eco-Environment
- 592 Coupler: Case Study of Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei Urban Agglomeration, China." Sci.

593 Total Environ. 689: 820-30. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.06.430.

- Filazzola, Alessandro, Namrata Shrestha, and J. S. MacIvor. 2019. "The contribution 594
- 595 of constructed green infrastructure to urban biodiversity: A synthesis and meta -
- 596 analysis." Journal of Applied Ecology 56 (9): 2131-43. doi:10.1111/1365-
- 597 2664.13475.
- 598 Foga, Steve, Pat L. Scaramuzza, Song Guo, Zhe Zhu, Ronald D. Dilley, Tim
- 599 Beckmann, Gail L. Schmidt, John L. Dwyer, M. Joseph Hughes, and Brady Laue.
- 600 2017. "Cloud detection algorithm comparison and validation for operational Landsat
- data products." Remote Sens. Environ. 194: 379-90. doi:10.1016/j.rse.2017.03.026. 601
- 602 Fu, Yingchun, Jiufeng Li, Qihao Weng, Qiming Zheng, Le Li, Shu Dai, and Biyun Guo.
- 603 2019. "Characterizing the Spatial Pattern of Annual Urban Growth by Using Time
- 604 Series Landsat Imagery." Sci. Total Environ. 666: 274-84.
- 605 doi:10.1016/i.scitoteny.2019.02.178.
- 606 Gong, Peng, Xuecao Li, Jie Wang, Yuqi Bai, Bin Chen, Tengyun Hu, Xiaoping Liu et
- 607 al. 2020. "Annual maps of global artificial impervious area (GAIA) between 1985
- 608 and 2018." Remote Sens. Environ. 236. doi:10.1016/j.rse.2019.111510.
- 609 Gong, Peng, Xuecao Li, and Wei Zhang, 2019. "40-Year (1978–2017) human
- 610 settlement changes in China reflected by impervious surfaces from satellite remote
- 611 sensing." Sci. Bull. (Science Bulletin) 64 (11): 756–63.
- 612 doi:10.1016/j.scib.2019.04.024.
- 613 Gorelick, Noel, Matt Hancher, Mike Dixon, Simon Ilyushchenko, David Thau, and
- Rebecca Moore. 2017. "Google Earth Engine: Planetary-scale geospatial analysis for 614
- 615 everyone." Remote Sens Environ 202: 18-27. doi:10.1016/j.rse.2017.06.031.
- 616 Guo, Wei, Guiying Li, Wenjian Ni, Yuhuan Zhang, and Dengsheng Lu. 2018.
- 617 "Exploring Improvement of Impervious Surface Estimation at National Scale
- 618 Through Integration of Nighttime Light and Proba-V Data." GIScience & Remote
- 619 Sensing 55 (5): 699-717. doi:10.1080/15481603.2018.1436425.
- 620 He, Chunyang, Zhifeng Liu, Siyuan Gou, Qiaofeng Zhang, Jinshui Zhang, and Linlin
- 621 Xu. 2019. "Detecting global urban expansion over the last three decades using a fully
- 622 convolutional network." Environ. Res. Lett. 14 (3). doi:10.1088/1748-9326/aaf936.
- 623 He, Jie, Kun Yang, Wenjun Tang, Hui Lu, Jun Oin, Yingying Chen, and Xin Li. 2020.
- 624 "The First High-Resolution Meteorological Forcing Dataset for Land Process Studies
- 625 over China." Sci. Data 7 (1): 25. doi:10.1038/s41597-020-0369-y.
- 626 Hopkins, Francesca M., James R. Ehleringer, Susan E. Bush, Riley M. Duren, Charles
- 627 E. Miller, Chun-Ta Lai, Ying-Kuang Hsu, Valerie Carranza, and James T. Randerson.
- 628 2016. "Mitigation of methane emissions in cities: How new measurements and
- 629 partnerships can contribute to emissions reduction strategies." Earth's Future 4 (9):
- 630 408-25. doi:10.1002/2016ef000381.
- 631 Hou, Xuejiao, Lian Feng, Jing Tang, Xiao-Peng Song, Junguo Liu, Yunlin Zhang,
- 632 Junjian Wang et al. 2020. "Anthropogenic transformation of Yangtze Plain
- 633 freshwater lakes: patterns, drivers and impacts." Remote Sens. Environ. 248: 111998.
- 634 doi:10.1016/j.rse.2020.111998.
- 635 Jin, Gui, Kun Chen, Pei Wang, Baishu Guo, Yin Dong, and Jun Yang. 2019. "Trade-
- 636 offs in land-use competition and sustainable land development in the North China
- Plain." Technol. Forecasting Social Change 141: 36-46. 637
- 638 doi:10.1016/j.techfore.2019.01.004.
- Jönsson, Per, Zhanzhang Cai, Eli Melaas, Mark Friedl, and Lars Eklundh. 2018. "A 639
- 640 Method for Robust Estimation of Vegetation Seasonality from Landsat and Sentinel-2
- 641 Time Series Data." Remote Sens. 10 (4): 635. doi:10.3390/rs10040635.
- 642 Ke, Xinli, Jasper van Vliet, Ting Zhou, Peter H. Verburg, Weiwei Zheng, and Xiaoping
- 643 Liu. 2018. "Direct and indirect loss of natural habitat due to built-up area expansion:
- 644 A model-based analysis for the city of Wuhan, China." Land Use Policy 74: 231–39.
- 645 doi:10.1016/j.landusepol.2017.12.048.
- 646 Kuang, Wenhui, Ailin Liu, Yinyin Dou, Guiying Li, and Dengsheng Lu. 2019.
- 647 "Examining the Impacts of Urbanization on Surface Radiation Using Landsat
- 648 Imagery." GIScience & Remote Sensing 56 (3): 462–84.
- 649 doi:10.1080/15481603.2018.1508931.
- 650 Lamb, William F., Felix Creutzig, Max W. Callaghan, and Jan C. Minx. 2019.
- 651 "Learning about urban climate solutions from case studies." Nat. Clim. Change 9 (4):
- 652 279-87. doi:10.1038/s41558-019-0440-x.
- 653 Li, Guangyong, Cuihong Jiang, Juan Du, Yunpeng Jia, and Ju Bai. 2020a. "Spatial
- 654 Differentiation Characteristics of Internal Ecological Land Structure in Rural
- 655 Settlements and Its Response to Natural and Socio-Economic Conditions in the
- 656 Central Plains, China." Sci. Total Environ. 709: 135932.
- doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.135932. 657
- Li, Guiving, Longwei Li, Dengsheng Lu, Wei Guo, and Wenhui Kuang, 2020b. 658
- 659 "Mapping Impervious Surface Distribution in China Using Multi-Source Remotely
- 660 Sensed Data." GIScience & Remote Sensing 57 (4): 543–52.
- 661 doi:10.1080/15481603.2020.1744240.
- 662 Li, Songnian, Suzana Dragicevic, Francesc A. Castro, Monika Sester, Stephan Winter,
- Arzu Coltekin, Christopher Pettit et al. 2016. "Geospatial big data handling theory 663
- 664 and methods: A review and research challenges." ISPRS J. Photogramm. Remote
- 665 Sens. 115 (2): 119–33. doi:10.1016/j.isprsjprs.2015.10.012.
- 666 Li, X. C., Y. Y. Zhou, Z. Y. Zhu, L. Liang, B. L. Yu, and W. T. Cao. 2018. "Mapping
- 667 Annual Urban Dynamics (1985-2015) Using Time Series of Landsat Data." Remote
- 668 Sens. Environ. 216: 674-83. doi:10.1016/j.rse.2018.07.030.
- Li, Xuecao, and Peng Gong. 2016. "An "exclusion-inclusion" framework for extracting 669
- 670 human settlements in rapidly developing regions of China from Landsat images."
- 671 Remote Sens. Environ. 186: 286-96. doi:10.1016/j.rse.2016.08.029.
- 672 Li, Xuecao, Peng Gong, and Lu Liang. 2015. "A 30-year (1984–2013) record of annual
- urban dynamics of Beijing City derived from Landsat data." Remote Sens. Environ. 673
- 674 166: 78-90. doi:10.1016/j.rse.2015.06.007.
- 675 Liu, C., O. Zhang, H. Luo, S. H. Qi, S. O. Tao, H. Z. Y. Xu, and Y. Yao. 2019. "An
- 676 Efficient Approach to Capture Continuous Impervious Surface Dynamics Using
- 677 Spatial-Temporal Rules and Dense Landsat Time Series Stacks." Remote Sens.
- 678 *Environ.* 229: 114–32. doi:10.1016/i.rse.2019.04.025.
- 679 Liu, Yilun, Luo Liu, A-Xing Zhu, Chunhua Lao, Guohua Hu, and Yueming Hu. 2020.
- 680 "Scenario farmland protection zoning based on production potential: A case study in
- 681 China." Land Use Policy 95: 104581. doi:10.1016/j.landusepol.2020.104581.
- 682 National Bureau of Statistics of China. 2019a. "Announcement of the 2019 grain
- 683 output." Accessed December 20, 2020. http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2019-
- 684 12/07/content 5459250.htm.
- National Bureau of Statistics of China. 2019b. China Statistical Yearbook. Beijing: 685
- 686 China Statistics Press. Accessed November 06, 2020.
- 687 Odenweller, Julie B., and Karen I. Johnson. 1984. "Crop identification using Landsat
- 688 temporal-spectral profiles." Remote Sens. Environ. 14 (1-3): 39-54.
- 689 doi:10.1016/0034-4257(84)90006-3.
- Poursanidis, Dimitris, Nektarios Chrysoulakis, and Zina Mitraka. 2015. "Landsat 8 vs. 690
- 691 Landsat 5: A comparison based on urban and peri-urban land cover mapping." Int. J.
- 692 Appl. Earth Obs. Geoinf. 35: 259-69. doi:10.1016/j.jag.2014.09.010.
- 693 Roodposhti, Majid S., Jagannath Aryal, and Brett A. Bryan. 2019. "A novel algorithm
- 694 for calculating transition potential in cellular automata models of land-use/cover
- 695 change." Environmental modelling  $\&$  software 112: 70–81.
- 696 doi:10.1016/j.envsoft.2018.10.006.
- 697 Schneider, A., and C. M. Mertes. 2014. "Expansion and growth in Chinese cities, 1978–
- 698 2010." Environ. Res. Lett. 9 (2): 24008. doi:10.1088/1748-9326/9/2/024008.
- 699 Shi, Lingfei, Feng Ling, Yong Ge, Giles Foody, Xiaodong Li, Lihui Wang, Yihang
- 700 Zhang, and Yun Du. 2017. "Impervious Surface Change Mapping with an
- 701 Uncertainty-Based Spatial-Temporal Consistency Model: A Case Study in Wuhan

702 City Using Landsat Time-Series Datasets from 1987 to 2016." Remote Sens. 9 (11):

703 1148. doi:10.3390/rs9111148.

- 704 Shrivastava, Manish, Meinrat O. Andreae, Paulo Artaxo, Henrique M. J. Barbosa, Larry
- 705 K. Berg, Joel Brito, Joseph Ching et al. 2019. "Urban Pollution Greatly Enhances
- 706 Formation of Natural Aerosols over the Amazon Rainforest." Nat. Commun. 10(1):
- 707 1046. doi:10.1038/s41467-019-08909-4.
- 708 Song, Wei, and Xiangzheng Deng. 2015. "Effects of Urbanization-Induced Cultivated
- 709 Land Loss on Ecosystem Services in the North China Plain." *Energies* 8 (6): 5678–
- 710 93. doi:10.3390/en8065678.
- 711 Song, X. P., J. O. Sexton, C. Q. Huang, S. Channan, and J. R. Townshend. 2016.
- 712 "Characterizing the Magnitude, Timing and Duration of Urban Growth from Time
- 713 Series of Landsat-Based Estimates of Impervious Cover." Remote Sens. Environ. 175:
- 714 1-13. doi:10.1016/j.rse.2015.12.027.
- 715 Stehman, S. V., and G. M. Foody. 2019. "Key Issues in Rigorous Accuracy Assessment
- 716 of Land Cover Products." Remote Sens. Environ. 231. doi:10.1016/j.rse.2019.05.018.
- 717 Tallis, H. T., T. Ricketts, A. D. Guerry, E. Nelson, D. Ennaanay, S. Wolny, N. Olwero,
- 718 K. Vigerstol, D. Pennington, and G. Mendoza. 2011. InVEST 2.1 beta user's guide.
- 719 the natural capital project: Stanford.
- 720 Tang, Jia, Jingyu Zeng, Qing Zhang, Rongrong Zhang, Song Leng, Yue Zeng, Wei
- 721 Shui, Zhanghua Xu, and Qianfeng Wang. 2020. "Self-Adapting Extraction of
- 722 Cropland Phenological Transitions of Rotation Agroecosystems Using Dynamically
- 723 Fused NDVI Images." Int. J. Biometeorol. 64 (8): 1273-83. doi:10.1007/s00484-020-
- 724  $01904 - 1$ .
- 725 United Nations. 2019. "World Urbanization Prospects 2018: Highlights." Population
- 726 Division. United Nations 32. doi:10.18356/6255ead2-en.



- 728 "Analysis of Differences in Phenology Extracted from the Enhanced Vegetation
- 729 Index and the Leaf Area Index." Sensors (Basel, Switzerland) 17 (9): 1982.
- 730 doi:10.3390/s17091982.
- 731 Wang, Jinzhu, Qian Zhang, Taoji Gou, Jianbing Mo, Zifang Wang, and Ming Gao.
- 732 2018. "Spatial-temporal changes of urban areas and terrestrial carbon storage in the
- 733 Three Gorges Reservoir in China." Ecol. Indic. 95: 343–52.
- 734 doi:10.1016/j.ecolind.2018.06.036.
- 735 Wang, S., G. Azzari, and D. B. Lobell. 2019. "Crop Type Mapping Without Field-Level
- 736 Labels: Random Forest Transfer and Unsupervised Clustering Techniques." Remote
- Sens. Environ. 222: 303-17. doi:10.1016/j.rse.2018.12.026. 737
- 738 Ye, Yangiong, Brett A. Bryan, Jia'en Zhang, Jeffery D. Connor, Lili Chen, Zhong Qin,
- 739 and Mingqian He. 2018. "Changes in land-use and ecosystem services in the
- 740 Guangzhou-Foshan Metropolitan Area, China from 1990 to 2010: Implications for
- sustainability under rapid urbanization." Ecol. Indic. 93: 930-41. 741
- 742 doi:10.1016/j.ecolind.2018.05.031.
- Yue, Huanbi, Chunyang He, Qingxu Huang, Dan Yin, and Brett A. Bryan. 2020. 743
- 744 "Stronger Policy Required to Substantially Reduce Deaths from PM2.5 Pollution in
- 745 China." Nat. Commun. 11 (1): 1462. doi:10.1038/s41467-020-15319-4.
- 746 Zeng, Linglin, Brian D. Wardlow, Daxiang Xiang, Shun Hu, and Deren Li. 2020. "A
- 747 review of vegetation phenological metrics extraction using time-series, multispectral
- 748 satellite data." Remote Sens. Environ. 237. doi:10.1016/j.rse.2019.111511.
- 749 Zhang, Xiao, Liangyun Liu, Changshan Wu, Xidong Chen, Yuan Gao, Shuai Xie, and
- 750 Bing Zhang, 2020. "Development of a global 30 m impervious surface map using
- 751 multisource and multitemporal remote sensing datasets with the Google Earth Engine
- 752 platform." Earth Syst. Sci. Data 12 (3): 1625-48. doi:10.5194/essd-12-1625-2020.
- 753 Zhong, Chao, Ruifa Hu, Mingyue Wang, Wenhao Xue, and Linfeng He. 2020. "The
- 754 impact of urbanization on urban agriculture: Evidence from China." J. Cleaner Prod.
- 755 276: 122686. doi:10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.122686.
- 756